Ordinary Representations as the Basis for Shaping Future Educators’ Scientific-pedagogic Knowledge about Personal Identity

Marina Viktorovna Shakurova*

Voronezh State Pedagogical University, 394043, Lenin St. 86, Voronezh, The Russian Federation. *Email: shakurova@mail.ru

ABSTRACT

The author substantiates the necessity of taking into consideration teacher training university students’ ordinary representations of identity as a component of intensive way of professional-pedagogic training in shaping different kinds of social and cultural identity in schoolchildren. Use of ordinary representations ensures providing continuity, strength, personal significance of acquired scientific and professional knowledge. The research methodology involves socio-cultural approach, intersubjective approach towards interpretation of identity, as well as approach focused on personal activity in the analysis of pedagogic practices. The author determines the peculiarities of “framework theories” spontaneously formed in world outlook of students of the teacher training university in the process of their professional training, using materials of empirical research (questioning techniques, as well as association and cinquain techniques). The differences between senior students’ ordinary-professional representations of identity and younger students’ ordinary representations of it are revealed. Typical (invariant) and singular (variational) characteristics, used by students for describing identity on conceptual, associational, and systemic-descriptional level, are defined. Unidimensionality of perceiving identity as sameness, similarity, belonging; the use of this concept for characterizing the human being, her self-determination; the presence of a certain share of statements with negative connotations in which identity is regarded as antipode of singularity, originality, unique personality; abstractedness, isolation from professional practice are all referred as the typical characteristics. The conclusion is drawn that unsystematic approach towards giving professional knowledge to future educators in the field of identity studies is invalid.

Keywords: Teacher Training, Identity, Social and Cultural Identity of Personality

JEL Classifications: I200, I210, Z130

1. INTRODUCTION

It is impossible to solve such topical problem for Russian education system as building different kinds of identity, first and foremost, civic identity without the educator specially trained to carry out such activity. This kind of training is not typically available in the Russian system of higher professional education. It is necessary to bear in mind use of intensive logic instead of extensive models (the latter means just introducing corresponding courses to curriculum) to organize such training on massive scale. This logic suggests diagnostics of future educators’ ordinary representations of identity and using these representations (personalized and lucid in their meaning) for “nurturing” professional knowledge, using the capacities of different courses (philosophy, social-cultural and social-economic disciplines, subjects of psychological-pedagogical section), extracurricular activity, internships and active personal and professional reflection.

Ordinary cognition is traditionally regarded as an initial (basic) phase of forming integral multilevel subject’s knowledge of the world, nature, society, the human being and herself. Its meaning and sense are defined by its rootedness in ordinary life activities and by direct connection with everyday human actions. Such cognition is based on different kinds of observation including unintended and uncontrolled ones; it is guided by immediate milieu’s as well as one’s own experience; it is realistic and based
on learning the ways of the world. Experts note such shortcomings of ordinary cognition as metaphority and excessiveness of used concepts, indivisibility and semantic vagueness of related concepts; usage of trial and error method as the main way of forming and testing knowledge; lack of distinctiveness in research logic; the act of inferring wider aggregates from features of individual facts; non-reflexiveness Pukhansky (Pukhansky, 1989); Markova (Markova, 1996); Filippova, Khamatnurova (Filippova and Khamatnurova, 2013).

Trend towards contrasting ordinary knowledge to scientific one has been overcome by now. It is replaced by trend towards taking into consideration complementarity - inevitable and productive in terms of results (Baksansky, 2002; Nyedysh, 2011; Yurevich, 1999).

Ordinary cognition is regarded in pedagogic context as the initial mechanism of accumulating experience at most associated with personal needs and interests.

2. RESEARCH TECHNIQUE

We made an attempt to determine the presence and significant characteristics of future educators’ ordinary representations of identity.

99 bachelor students of Humanities Department and Psychologic-Pedagogic Department of Voronezh State Teacher Training University participated in the survey as respondents including 52 first and second year students, and 47 third and fourth year students. The choice of department was determined by the content of educational programs: Disciplines of philosophic, social-economic, social-cultural, psychologic-pedagogic fields were represented in their curricula on wider scale in comparison with educational programmes used by other university departments. Division of the sample into two subgroups (younger students and senior students) enabled us to define initial ordinary representations (residual knowledge gained at school, philosophic, historical and cultural adjustments acquired by respondents during the 1st year of attending the university) and ordinary - professional representations (residual knowledge is added due to studying psychologic-pedagogic disciplines, reflections upon different kinds of pedagogic internship) which are “framework theories” per se to be used by graduates in their professional activity.

The research programme included such techniques as answering questions, cinquain, associations. The central question of the survey was “What did you hear of/do you know about identity?”; responses to it enabled the author to define direct indicators of respondents’ ordinary representations of identity. Didactic technique “cinquain” was used in its classic version (the respondent needs to write five lines on the suggested topic): (1) A word, usually a noun expressing the main idea; (2) two words, adjectives, describing the main idea; (3) three words, verbs, referring to actions within the suggested topic; (4) phrase consisting of a few words related to author’s attitude towards the topic; (5) one word, as a rule, association, synonym, descriptive expression reflecting emotional attitude towards the topic. The use of this technique enabled the author to specify and to gain the detailed picture of respondents’ ordinary representations of identity. Association technique (the task to draw and/or write associations with the word “identity”) allowed the author to find out meaningful and unconscious mindsets in the relevant understanding of identity by respondents.

Results processing, taking into consideration the research design, suggested, first and foremost, qualitative analysis of obtained data, selection of the typical and the invariant (more than 15% respondents) as well as the singular and the variational (1-5% respondents) responses.

3. RESEARCH FINDINGS

3.1. Conceptual and Associative Levels

Future educators’ ordinary representations of identity reflect classic perception of identity as: Sameness (such perception is shared by respondents of both groups). Younger students’ typical responses included: “Identity - is something similar, alike according to some criteria;” “Identity is the set of certain traits which can be used to compare a thing/a person with another one;” “In fact, it is similarity of something. When things are similar they are called identical;” “Identity is resemblance; or resembling is identical; absolute sameness;” “Something is very alike something.” Senior students’ responses typically involved the following answers: “Identity is similarity, something stereotypical;” “Resemblance to something, analogousness;” “Similarity, the absence of differences, replication.” Associative network is reflected in the Figures 1 and 2.

Figure 1: Identical

Figure 2: Identity
Belonging (this concept is present in the responses of both groups, though senior students use it more frequently). Younger students give the following typical responses implying this concept: “Everybody expresses her belonging to entities or matches herself to another person;” “Identity means correspondence (with), some kind of wholeness.” Typical senior students’ responses were as follows: “This is subject’s belonging to some stable and large something (ethnos, people, religion and others);” “feeling of kinship and person’s realization of this kinship, of her belonging to some groups;” “belonging, similarity, copying image;” associative network is reflected in the Figures 3 and 4.

One can refer to singular (invariant) responses in which the identity is regarded as:

- A result of comparing and juxtaposing (there is such idea in both groups of respondents’ opinion). For instance, “comparing something to something,” “juxtaposing oneself with somebody else;”
- Continuity, duration (there is such idea in both groups of respondents’ opinion). For instance, “Constancy,” “Identity is the feeling of continuity of one’s existence as substance different from all others;”
- Characteristics of human psyche, the aggregate human characteristics (there is such idea in both groups of respondents’ opinion). For instance, “identity is ability to achieve self-realization, to settle into the adult life. The aggregate person’s characteristics and her ability to express her emotions properly;”
- The result of self-determination (such perception is specific only to the subgroup of senior students). For instance, “self-consciousness. Self-determination”
- Difference (such perception is specific only to the subgroup of senior students). For instance, “this is the difference from other people and unlikeness of a personality to others. Something one can use to distinguish one thing from another. Something related to some group and has the distinctive property of this group;”
- Acceptance of norms and rules the group you belong to (such perception is specific only to the subgroup of senior students). For instance, “identity implies the person’s feeling of being part of some society, group and the person accepts rules, norms and traditions of this society;”
- Juxtaposing oneself with some pattern (such perception is specific only to the subgroup of senior students).

Associative network of variational characteristics is reflected in the Figures 5 and 6.

What draws attention is that considerable number of respondents have superficial ordinary representations (up to the absence of them per se) (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: The absence of informative responses (percentage of respondents in the subgroup)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Group of respondents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents (younger students)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents (senior students)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Figure 3: Belonging](image)

![Figure 4: Copying the pattern](image)

![Figure 5: Who am I?](image)

![Figure 6: Mirror](image)
3.2. Systemic-descriptive Level

While we were analyzing the results of Cinquain task, position 5 (a word reflecting the meaning) and position 3 (verbs describing actions within the suggested topic) attracted our special attention.

Such words as similarity, homogeneity, sameness, kinship, analogue (24 choices, 24.2% of total number of respondents) can be referred to typical semantic associations.

Singular but noteworthy semantic associations with the term “identity” included such words as human being (5 choices, 5.1% of total number of respondents), copy (5 choices, 5.1% of total number of respondents), ethnicity (5 choices, 5.1% of total number of respondents), twins (4 choices, 4.0% of total number of respondents), belonging (3 choices, 3.0% of total number of respondents).

Certain original authors’ positions also deserve special attention because they enable us to distinguish some ideas different from opinion shared by many other respondents:

a. The subgroup of younger students:
   - Verity (identity - identical, partaking - to express, to identify, to belong - identification of oneself with some person);
   - To be like everyone else (identity - similar, almost the same - to be like somebody, to belong to something, to identify oneself with something - to belong to some social group, to be like others);
   - One root (identity - alike, comprehensible - to regard, to understand, to accept - profound proximity of something to me);
   - Analysis (identity - similar, special - to test, to take, to compare - analysis of a certain action);

b. The subgroup of senior students:
   - Mirror (identity - similar, alike - to compare, to seem to understand - to look as twins);
   - Respect for traditions (identity - similar, involved - to join, to juxtapose, to be associated - it is necessary to identify oneself with the society bearing in mind the need to develop individual properties);
   - Necessity (identity - important, evident - to be proud of, to develop, to observe - everybody must have her own identity);
   - Self-concept (identity - modern, new - to compare, to equate, to associate - to be like somebody);
   - Commonness (identity - similar, precise - implemented, reflected, agreed - mutual understanding);
   - As a crowd (identity - similar, alike, indistinguishable - not to differ, to identify, to do in the same way - as like as two peas, with similar faces);
   - “Absence of originality” (identity - alike, familiar - to wear clothes, to understand, to correspond - completely neutral); (identity - alike, analogous - to resemble, to compare, to be identical - people are not identical).

Evidently, identity is assessed both positively and pejoratively, negatively from the point of view of personal development.

Attention to the used verbs is determined by the fact that pedagogic context of using identity assumes organization of interaction, backing for, support of the process of acquiring and developing of her own identity by the child; forming group (corporate) identity in the groups and entities of different levels. At everyday level it is important for future educator “to see” the diversity of approaches, kinds of activity, one way or another providing formation and development of identity (within the framework of this research we deliberately do not address the issue of mastering these kinds of activity).

Typical respondent’s answers included the verbs: To compare, to juxtapose and to identify (17 choices, 17.2% of total number of respondents).

Respondents also used the following group of verbs: To belong (9 choices, 9.1% of total number of respondents); to equate (9 choices, 9.1% of total number of respondents); to be alike, to resemble (8 choices, 8.1% of total number of respondents); to copy, to imitate (7 choices, 7.1% of total number of respondents); to express (6 choices, 6.1% of total number of respondents); to be associated (6 choices, 6.1% of total number of respondents); to be identified with (6 choices, 6.1% of total number of respondents).

Occasionally, respondents used such verbs as to relate (5 choices, 5.0% of total number of respondents); to accept (5 choices, 5.0% of total number of respondents); to correspond (4 choices, 4.0% of total number of respondents); to realize (4 choices, 4.0% of total number of respondents).

Only 1-2 responses included such important in terms of shaping identity verbs as to develop, to nurture, to see, to understand, to become involved, to join, to be proud, to adhere to, to unite, to act, to interact. Respondents do not mention such verbs as to choose, to check, to defend, to actualize, to problematize and so on.

4. DISCUSSION

4.1. The Meaning of Ordinary Representations in Professional Training

The current period of reforms in the Russian system of education is associated, inter alia, with interest towards ordinary knowledge as the basis for organizing systematic training. This position is peculiar to all stages of education including professional one. The core of this approach is to reveal and actualize subject’s ordinary representations of different objects, phenomena and processes. Reliance on these representations ensures continuity, solidity, personal importance of newly acquired knowledge. Juxtaposing ordinary representations and scientific knowledge is becoming the basis of problematization and the stimulus to profound systematic work on the emerged inconsistencies.

Ordinary representations are actively studied by psychologists, sociologists and education experts (Gulevich, 2012; Dikevich, 1999; Osipenko, 2014).

For instance, Yurevich notes such inevitable transformation of ordinary thinking mechanisms into the mechanisms of scientific
cognition. He points out: “Mechanisms of scientific thinking are formed within the realm of ordinary conscience because this is exactly where the beginnings of intellectual process genetically originate” (Yurevich, 1999).

The mechanism of interfacing and transition between ordinary and scientific per se is examined by many authors. Social representation theory by Moscovici became one of the first such attempts. According to Baskansky’s estimation the dynamics of social representations developed by S. Moscovici given in two aspects is of interest:

External processes (personification of scientific and/or ordinary phenomena; selection and decontextualisation of elements of scientific theory, their transformation into the norms of perceiving ordinary reality, into the knowledge about ordinary reality; the formation of “figurative scheme,” containing significant concepts, properties of objective phenomenon and elementary structure of their interactions, embodied in the figurative form (“figurative nucleus”); “ontologisation” of “figurative scheme” and elements which form it i.e., isolation of representation from real phenomenon and acquisition of the quality of objective character by this representation (equation of representation with phenomenon existing in reality) (Baksansky, 2002, 283);

- Internal processes, associated with the necessity to explain “strange” ideas which must be interpreted. According to S. Moscovici (Moscovici 1988) this involves ideas which are (a) External and distant for subject, (b) not corresponding to norms and rules accepted by the subject, (c) excessive, subjectively new. Transition occurs based on subject’s experience. The mechanism itself can be represented as several transformations including “acceptance - ordering - integration into the system of already known - employment for interpreting reality” (Baksansky, 2002, 283-284).

It is necessary to take into consideration peculiarities of ordinary representations and ordinary thinking while regarding the transition and interfacing of ordinary and scientific. For instance, Kulikov focuses on the perception of the world distinctive from other forms of cognition: “Ordinary conscience perceives the world naively (literally), naturally i.e., seeks perception of pure existence, diverting from the process of ideation, search for hidden essences and their relationships” (Kulikov, 2014).

American scholar Keil names, in particular, the illusion of having detailed and coherent knowledge. But, at the same time, there are distinctive properties of folk science that create a specially strong impression of detail and completeness to knowledge. “The rush of insight we often get in our attempts to understand the world around us may be at just the right level to provide sufficient constraints to build a much more detailed theory when in a relevant situation and at just the right level to allow us to ground our shallow understandings in much deeper and appropriate areas of expertise in other minds” (Keil, 2003).

As a result, one can consider developing “framework theories” which integrate facts in a certain realm and give sense to them without deep insight into details as being a stage of shaping ordinary representations. Here, the very attempt of explaining strange ideas matters.

### 4.2. Initial Scientific Representations of Identity

The topicality of ordinary knowledge about identity essence for modern Identity Studies is determined, on the one hand, by the initial (to a considerable degree, search-metaphorical) stage of developing scientific knowledge on personal, group and community identity; on the other hand, by the fact that essential properties of identity are embedded in various fields of scientific knowledge, by their decisive role for cognition, what is expressed in frequent use of the term “identity” in a broader context during teaching different disciplines at schools and universities. It is important to note that by now the problem of using ordinary knowledge about identity as the basis for professional pedagogic knowledge has been actively studied neither by foreign nor Russian scholars.

While interpreting identity we take into consideration intersubjective approach developed by representatives of cognitive (Piaget), sociocultural (Cooley) approaches, social identity theory (Tajfel), social representations (Moscovici), epigenetics theory (Erikson), self-categorization (Turner), impression management theories (Tetlock and Manstead), theory of intersubjectivity (Shutz), model of the internal-external dialectic of identification by Jenkins, theory of social identity by Yadov, et al.).

Interdisciplinary interest to the phenomenon of identity has been evident during the last decade. No other construct but the one of “identity” is better suited for describing the man as a subject/an object of changing social-cultural processes, systems of communications, needed acts of motivated and deliberate choice, self-determination and self-actualization. It is an objective challenge that no single interpretation, coherent description of this phenomenon has been developed by anthropology, social sciences and humanities. For educational studies this situation is complicated by the fact that conceptions and theories of identity developed by philosophers, psychologists, sociologists, cultural studies scholars, political scientists are worth being considered as only the basis, material for understanding, bearing in mind the subject of certain field of scientific knowledge. The conception of pedagogic support in shaping and developing social-cultural identity in schoolchildren, developed by us between 2000 and 2007 is being extended in our works (Shakurova, 2014; 2015).

The following aspects are topical for Educational Studies (Dvornikova, 2007; Makhin, 2014; Chugaeva, 2013):

a. Methodology of shaping personal, group, community identity under the influence of partially controlled socialization processes which may include social-nurturing and educational ones. More precise definition of methodology will enable to determine the language of description which will be interdisciplinary per se, but it will have to contain, first and foremost, pedagogical emphases and meanings;

b. Personal, group, community identity as a purpose-result-effect of pedagogical process;

c. The process of developing personal, group, community identity as fundamental process which can and must be
supported by properly organized pedagogical process;

d. Natural framework limiting pedagogical intervention (not all kinds of identity respond to pedagogical support and can be described using pedagogical language);

e. Essence, principles, content, infrastructure of techniques and tools of pedagogical process aimed at shaping personal, group, community identity;

f. Diagnostic tools available and valid to pedagogical context, ensuring the opportunities to follow and estimate the efficiency of pedagogical process directed at shaping different kinds of personal, group, community identity;

The following positions reflecting understanding of the essence of identity are significant for current research:

a. Personal, group, corporate identity encourage, first and foremost, to pay attention to the following positions: The nature of relationship between subjects; the presence of referents among subjects of educational relations and/or established practice of attracting referent representatives of the environment to solving problems formulated by the subjects of educational system; the presence of basic set of identities as established, understandable and accepted human-images; active use of human-aligned, culture-aligned and society-aligned examples demonstrating and confirming human-images constituting the basic set of identities; conscious and unconscious (at the level of being affected by other kinds of activity and communication) determining and articulating identity policy;

b. Socio-cultural identity is composed on the basis of juxtaposing, comparing and referring oneself to a referent (group, person, entity). This is what distinguishes this level from personal identity based on mechanisms of search for being different from referents (in case human-images and models suggested by them are accepted and followed);

c. Distinguishing between “child” and “adult” identity is valid. Here, we are also guided by Erikson’s theory (Erikson, 1996). Normally, transition to adult identity takes place during adolescence, the indications of the transition include:

• Orientation towards the “the generalized other” through adopting common social standards of thinking and activity;
• Orientation towards the system of social roles (the need to take into consideration all set of roles and their coordination with each other);
• Relationships with referents are mostly of practical nature, regard the picture of interaction between social roles what makes the process or shaping identity more complicated. “To find such identity means to be able to arrange different expectations and to reconcile them with social order which is simultaneously constructed by other people. The maintenance of such identity suggests that you want and can participate in a certain social order keeping your identity” - notes H. Abel’s (Abel’s 2000, 133);
• The nature of identification is being changed: Social ways of individual identification are more or less successfully matched with individual ways of identification (Erikson). Self-determination based on reflection limits “social identification;”

Need for identity is combined with the need to regulate one’s life activity, to bring elements of order in it, but this is impossible without belonging to some community inevitably representing an example of the wished self, type of person and norms of living the life. According to Grushewitskaya (2002) the essence of socio-cultural identity is impossible to understand taking into consideration only assessment of belonging to a social group. Cultural markers also matter: Acceptance (with subsequent realization) of certain cultural norms and behavioral models by the man, value orientation and language; strengthened understanding of self, reflection on manifestations of self, viewed considering cultural characteristics peculiar to chosen (referent community); self-identification with cultural models of this community.

Above-mentioned science-based ideas were considered within the framework of the current research as model propositions which were compared to ordinary opinions given by the respondents.

4.3. Distinctive Properties of Ordinary-professional Representations of Identity

Despite Russian system of education faces such topical problem as the task of developing schoolchildren’s identity, modern practice of teaching pedagogical disciplines in Russia does not include established mechanism of training in the field of identity studies. As a result, ordinary representations of identity and the process of its development are being filled spontaneously, ordinary representations are combined with fragmented pieces of scientific knowledge, ordinary-professional representations are shaped (“framework conceptions”).

The findings of the current research enabled us to establish certain distinctive properties of future educators’ ordinary-professional representations of identity. They are as follows:

• Unidimentionality of representations of identity as sameness, resemblance and belonging. Reference to difference as the basic property of identity is singular. There is no reference to the property of being realistic as basic one in respondents’ replies;

• Use of such concept for characterization of person, her self-identification. As a rule, students do not associate identity with self-consciousness which prevents them from neatly placing this concept in the system of representations of self-concept, from specifically defining the essence of identity through finding differences between identity, self-concept and sameness and, consequently, from replacing metaphorical and purely theoretical representation of identity by operational one;

• In some cases regardless of education stage the students demonstrate negative perception of “identity” concept as being opposed to individuality, originality, idiosyncrasy;

• During university years the amount of the information increases, but it does not contribute to clear understanding: The process of spontaneous development of ordinary-professional representations of identity takes place determined.
by accumulation of random information and by the absence of clear pedagogical interpretation. Younger students relying on school knowledge, information from disciplines of general scientific and general cultural blocks, quite easily formulate overall understanding of identity but find it difficult to define it more specifically and to clarify its meanings. Senior students better cope with the latter, though in considerable number of cases they have difficulty with clear answering the question “What is identity?”;

- A considerable disadvantage of ordinary-professional representations of identity is their isolation from practice of application which is indirectly indicated by verbs used by respondents to describe identity. Pedagogical actions themselves are extremely rarely used, which is typical even for senior students.

5. CONCLUSION

Thus, if the current practice of teaching identity issues, lacking orientation towards specially organized training based on intensive logic, remains the same, it can lead to the situation where future educators have only ordinary-professional knowledge of identity. Peculiarities of students’ ordinary-professional representations of identity do not provide the basis for regarding them as being sufficient for solution of professional tasks. Goal-oriented scientific-professional training in the field of Identity Studies is necessary.

Preparation of educators for developing different kinds of social-cultural identity in schoolchildren requires organization of special training which can be implemented within the framework of either specially developed course (extensive way), or be based on interdisciplinary and milieu approach, as well as on concentration and specially organized integrative system of knowledge on identity (intensive way). We understand concentration here as multiple reference to analogous information; each time deeper and more detailed knowledge is given in the process of teaching different disciplines step by step in the course of professional training. In the latter case the use of identity phenomenon and the process of its development is specially carried out several times during the process of university training at the expense of actualization of certain curricular disciplines’ sections, reflection on experience, extracurricular practices and reliance on students’ ordinary representations of identity. Precisely these aspects - content of education of future teachers on identity, building up learning modules taking into consideration the entire period of training and teaching basic academic disciplines, developing the syllabus (probably, as an integrative interdisciplinary workbook designed to be used for 4 years of training), ways of correcting negative representations of identity - constitute the main directions of further scientific research.

The article was prepared in the framework of implementation of state task No. 2014/310 on carrying out state work in the sphere of scientific activity with in the basic part of state task of the ministry of Education and Science on fulfilment of scientific-research work No. 1511 "Preparation of teacher training university students to developing social-cultural identity in schoolchildren".

REFERENCES

Nizhny Novgorod. p215-221.