

Journal of Analptic Dibinity International Refereed Journal Volume 1/1, p. 22-33 DOI Number: ISSN: 2602-3792 ANKARA-TURKEY. This article was checked by iThenticate.



EFFORTS TO SIMILARIZE RELIGIOUS GROUPS DURING THE OTTOMAN REFORMATION AGE: EXAMPLE OF TADKÎK AL- MUALLAFAT COMMISSION

Zekeriya IŞIK *

ABSTRACT

In Ottomans, the efforts for modernization took place under external pressures trying to Westernize the dynamics of the state and society and internal difficulties presented by the historical adventure of Ottoman State. In particular, disposition of the Janizary-Bektashi spiral did not only led to significant changes and transformations in military terms, but also in religious and cultural aspects too. Rather than the insight traditions with a wide ontological and epistemological area with no borders, the state has preferred the Sunni/academic Islam which was in a more preferable condition in terms of legitimizing the secular pressures of reformation and the society was tried to be made religiously and culturally similar around it. This was done with policies limiting the faiths and minds of certain groups, trying to pull them towards academic Islam, rather than disposing those groups. These policies, also projecting to homogenise ulama and meshayeh, madrasa and monastery, started to take shape with Mahmood II, and continued in the following periods with variations. This report is about the activities of Tadkîk al-Muallafat Commission, one of the most obvious indicators of that period and established under the roof of Bâb al-Mashîhat.

Keywords: Ottomans, Sect, Sheikdom, Tadkîk al-Muallafat Commission

^{*} Asst. Prof., Hitit University, Department of History, zekeriyaisik@hitit.edu.tr

Bu makale 18-24 tarihleri arasında İspanya'da 1. Uluslararası Sosyal Bilimler Kongresinde bildiri olarak sunulmuş, gözden geçirme, ekleme ve yeni belgelerle zenginleştirilerek makaleye dönüştürülmüştür.

OSMANLI REFORM ÇAĞINDA DİNÎ ZÜMRELERİ AYNILAŞTIRMA ÇABALARI: TEDKÎK-İ MÜELLEFAT ENCÜMENİ ÖRNEĞİ

ÖZET

Osmanlı modernleşme çabaları bir taraftan devlet ve toplum dinamiklerini Batı ile aynılaştırmayı amaçlayan harici baskılar diğer taraftan da Osmanlı Devleti'nin kendi tarihi serüvenin dayattığı dâhili zorunluluklar eşliğinde gerçekleşmiştir. Özellikle Yeniçeri-Bektaşi sarmalının tasfiyesi, askeri açıdan olduğu değişim kadar dini ve kültürel açılardan da ciddi ve dönüşümlere yol açmıştır. Devlet, sınırları belli olmayan geniş bir ontolojik ve epistemolojik alana sahip olan irfan gelenekleri yerine tarihi birliktelik tecrübesinin de etkisiyle reformun seküler baskılarını meşrulaştırma hususunda Sünni/kitabi İslam'ı tercih etmiştir. Başka bir deyişle Toplum, İslam'ın bu yorumu etrafında dinî ve kültürel olarak aynılaştırılmak istenmiştir. Bu durum söz konusu çevrelerin tasfiyesinden ziyade onların inanç ve zihin dünyalarını sınırlandıracak, kitabi İslam dairesine çekilmelerini sağlayacak politikalar eşliğinde yapılmaya çalışılmıştır. Ulema ile meşayihin, medrese ile tekkenin homojenleştirilmesini de öngören bu politikalar II. Mahmut döneminden itibaren şekillenmeye başlamış ve sonraki dönemlerde çeşitlendirilerek devam etmiştir. İşte bu makale söz konusu sürecin en açık göstergelerinden birisi olup Bâb-1 Meşîhat çatısı altında kurulan Tedkîk-i Müellefat Encümeni'n faaliyetlerini konu almıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Osmanlı, Tarikat, Meşihat, Tedkîk-i Müellefat Encümeni

EFFORTS TO SIMILARIZE RELIGIOUS GROUPS DURING THE OTTOMAN REFORMATION AGE: EXAMPLE OF TADKÎK AL- MUALLAFAT COMMISSION

INTRODUCTION

In modern industrialized societies, religion has become increasingly marginalized in the process of secularization, urbanization, and pushed to the edge of normal day life forms. At the same time, it has also been observed that different communities and denominational interpretations in this process have a more homogeneous structure in the face of a churchoriented understanding of religion (Luckmann, 2003: 32-33; Turner, 1997: 93). The continuation of the traditional forms of the Church's religion, the lack of an institutionalized church antagonism in the West, has also given Christianity a significant influence in shaping the modern Western world (Luckmann, 2003: 34-35). Religion has turned into a riddle in the construction of a civilized civilization, as Arnold Joseph Toynbee says (Transcript: Gencer, 2012: 281). Religion has taken on different forms in the new period, both in daily life and in political and social organizations. Thus, the effect becomes a new instrument that decreases in proportion to the cyclical developments. For example, it has been suggested that Christianity has evolved into a rally that prioritizes the ability to act in harmony as a unified social and legal community that the cities of the West consider are very important (Turner, 1997: 175).

By the means of the specialized institutions established in the process of industrialization and urbanization, the differences between the social textures have decreased and a homogeneous society has begun to emerge. True religion that will provide the happiness of mankind from the old religions that are useless in the same process (Barbier, 1999: 296), which will provide the happiness of mankind from the old religions which are useless. Thus, the church religion, industrialization, urbanization, even on modern trends such as nation-building has played a central role. Religion industrialized, secular, religion contrary to the thesis would in no modern society; in this process both affected and sustained by being influenced (Okumuş, 2009: 329).

It has been noted that since Émile Durkheim emphasized the importance of religion in the provision of social cohesion and that denial of grace is the cause of an anomaly by weakening the unity, integrity, and solidarity in society, religion has been as a serious obstacle to social change as a factor of stability (Transcript: Okumuş 2009: 328). In this case, while religion is a priority in integrating society in modern societies, it stands out as an element that should be shifted to social and public life in terms of preventing social change. However, as Okumus pointed out, contrary to the claims of modernist theories, there is no inversely proportional relationship between modernization and religion, science-technology and religion, but on the contrary, there is an increase in spirituality, religious rituals and religious revivals (Okumuş 2005: 90-124; Okumuş 2003: 146-169). Indeed, the official religion in the Ottoman society and the pressures of the reform of religious institutions and all change, despite efforts to transform religious sects, some groups described as pagan religious beliefs has managed to survive. In fact, as Kemal Karpat had said, some facts such as Naqshi-Kadirî-Rifai have been the main driving forces in the history of Turkish modernization (Karpat, 2010: 193).

These developments in Europe can be traced to the Ottoman Empire, especially since the Second Mahmut deeprooted reform initiatives. In this new period religion, especially the official Islam in the Ottoman Empire was not only influenced by reforming the social change in other words and integrating the society but also by its functions such as mentality, configuration, socialization, organization, and motivation (Okumuş, 2009: 335; Işık 2017: 127-129). In the same way that religion is a system of beliefs, an ideology has been in this process, as Shiism has been transformed into a civilian dynasty integrated with the historical past of Iran as far Zoroastrianism (Gencer, 2012: 478), as well as a civilians, which overlaps with its historical texture in the Ottoman society, it can be said that religion has been tried to be transformed.

In this context, it known that the religious rituals such as Friday prayer and sermon which are very important in terms of Islam are followed up by the state from the classical period and whether it is applied or not (BOA MD. 7, 1999: Hük. 2705; Refik, 1932: 46; İmber, 2004: 74-75; Arslan, 2012: 78-82). However, it's seen that the Alevi Shiite circles (Selçuk, 2011: 74), which are accused of being Rafizi during the process of modernization, are attempted to be separated to bring about the Bektashism, which is allegedly opposed to Sharia in many points, into the official Islamic circle (BOA. HAT. Nr. 293/17474-B, 7 Ra 1242/M. 9 October 1826). On the other side it was ordered that the subjects should open the places for the "correction of the blessings and the blessings of men" in the places where the surrounding areas are located (BOA. BEO Nr. 2582/193576, Lef 1, 9 Ra 1323/14 May 1905; BOA. Y. A. Hus. Nr. 462-44; Es'ad Efendi, 2005: 182). In addition, Sunni scholars were assigned to these schools and preparations were made to prepare simple science books to be taught there (BOA. HAT. Nr. 293/17474-B, 7 Ra 1242/M. 9 October 1826; BOA. HAT. Nr. 293/17474-B, 7 Za1242/M. 2 June 1827; BOA. DH. MKT. Nr. 285/ 25, 19 Ra 1312/ 18 November 1894). It can be clearly seen that the state has tried to classify the surrounding places through formal Islamic centered education and cultural policies.

Control mechanisms have also been developed on other Sufi circles, and these religious institutions have been tried to prevent them from acting out of Sharia. The application of the Central Lodges, the establishment of the Majlis al-Mashâvh (a council formed by sheikhs chosen by the Mashihat), the application of the examination to appoint to the Lodges and the Zakiya sheikh (Özer, 2007: 131; Işık, 2017: 267, 370; Varol, 2011: 471-474) It is clear that the control of the Sharia conformity of the works which they have copyrighted through the Tadkik al-Maallafât Commission as it is to be pointed out, clearly shows this. In this process, it is understood that the state's the Lodges and the Madrasahs, the attempts of bringing the Mashihhat and Zashhihi close together, are transformed into places such as mosque's and which represent the modern institutions of the Islam, (BOA. HAT. Nr. 293/17474-B, 7 Ra 1242/M. 9 October 1826; C. MF. 184/9179, Nr. 29 Z 1242/ 24 July 1827; A. MKT. MVL. Nr. 57-A/72-34, 6 M 1269/ 20 October 1852; İ. EV. 57/1331-L-7, 27 L 1331/ 29 September 1913).

2. Tadkîk al-Muallafât Commission (The board that reviews the works and decides to get out)

As a result of efforts to integrate the society around the Orthodox and institutionalized interpretation of religion in the Ottoman Empire from the second quarter of the 19th century, it had seen that the Shariah is tried to be widened and controlled more deeper and more thoroughly. Most of this process was especially influenced by the religious groups which were excluded from the Shariah period and which were denominated with Rafizi and the mystical environments which had a wide ontological and epistemological area. The state wants to systematically control the publishing activities of the circles, which mean the propaganda of the world belief of the mind.

For this purpose, in 1889 (1306), the Ottoman State established the Tadkîk al-Muallafât Commission under the Meshîhat Circle, in order to control the religious works. Actually, this institution is a product of Ottoman political thought of the period. It is understood that this institution also cooperated with another assembly named as Encuman al-Taftish and Muâyana in the Ministry of Maârif Nazârati (Aydın, Vd., 2006: 150). Actually, the religious works of the state can be seen from the recordings carried out by the institution through the institution in the Ministry of the Nazarath before this structure in the Meshîhat quarter.¹ Thus, it thus appears that the views linking the establishment of the (Court of Cassation) to the auditor press policies of the Second Abdulhamit Period, irrespective of the political perception that the state continues to be, are unfounded (Aydın, Vd., 2006: 150).

The duty of the establishment itself is in the form of a memorandum of intent (titled "The Book of Mystery") (MA, TMM, No. 1784, No. 45). In another record, it is stated that "the books of the verses are not subject to "Referred books bi-l-tedkîk şâyân tab', to examine the books to be printed and the utterance of the word. Nevertheless, that the committee had passed the findings of the committee somewhere in detail (MA, TMM, No. 1784, Num 49). It is noted that the formation of the Council is composed of a chieftain and three chiefs (Aydın, Vd., 2006: 150). In 1892, the Assembly of Teftish-i Mesahif-i Sherif' was established in order to control the printed Qur'anic manuscripts. Later on, this institution, which works close to each other, was reorganized with the name of Tadkîk al-Masahif and

Muallafat al-Shariyya Majlisi (Aydin, Vd., 2006: 150) by combining Tadkîk al-Muallafât Anjumani.

3. The efforts of the Tadkîk al-Muallafât Commission

(The board that reviews the works and decides to get out to control the press activities of religious groups)

The various and colorful beliefs and mentalities of the mystical circles seem to have frequently confronted with the Tadkîk al-Muallafât Commission the possibilities to lead them in the direction of the mystic, by resorting to the tautology in almost every subject.² Particularly in the case of sharia being sensitive, such as the principles of faith, it seems that the control over a number of religious groups is more strict. Furthermore, written works bearing official ideology, attitudes and attitudes, and acting against the rule were also seen as needy areas for other control. The state has requested from time to increase the inspection of books and treaties belonging to Sharia and Tariqats in order to increase the effectiveness of such

¹ As a matter of fact, it is seen that such audits have been carried out before the establishment of the Court of Accounts in the absence of the Supreme Majesty. For example, it is seen that The books which the Uzbaklar Takkasi Shayhi Salih Efendi in Uskudar Sultantepesi wanted to print were published in the Assembly-i Maârif and they are requested to be punished in case of opposition to the ruling of the sheikh (BOA, A. MKT, MHM, 183/44, 29 L 1276/20 May 1860).

 $^{^2}$ Even attempts to read the works of the mystical circles that reflect their own beliefs and minds in official schools have been linked to the state's sharia-centered control and control. For example, it is stated in a register that the treatise on the mysticism of Sofia's Raşid Rüşdü can not be read in the room, and thus the author can not be paid a salary (A.M.9 / 49, H.1267 / M.1851).

audits. It was tried to increase the motivation of the bureaucracy working in this area (BOA, Y.MTV 27/13, H.1304 / M.1887). For example, Cabbarzâde Mehmed Arif's Secaniye has a sense of sensitivity in the subjects of faith. The work was allowed first, and some was printed. However, the examinations were forbidden on the grounds that some of the subjects attributed to Abdulkâdir Geylani were sheriffs and that the settlement would be disadvantaged by the sufistic language, and the prints were also confiscated. It is also noted that it is not possible to compensate the costs incurred (BOA MF. MKT. 94/80, 5 Z 1304/ 25 August 1887).

There are two important points to note here. The first to be called by Lisan abstract mysticism of Sufi order they spring, is voiced displeasure with the spread of the esoteric beliefs and thoughts. The second is to emphasize the calligraphy and to point out the necessity of confusion with the beliefs and minds of the people and the necessity of the conquest of the conquest of Islam in the book of Islam. From here it is possible to understand how marginalized the orders are for the state. It is seen that, even in the most marginal appearances as a way out of the process, the tribes are trying to get rid of the books with correct interpretations in the palace. For example, in order to be able to print the work claimed by Bahaeddin Efendi in Konya in favor of the Hanafi Sect in terms of "Wahdat al-Vujud" (it is a term belonging to this mystic. It is the belief that the only being that exists is God.) belief it is stated that the auditor should be made in the case of the defendant (BOA, MF. MKT, No. 667/49).What is important here is that the Wahdat al-Vujud belief, which has an ontological depth and scope beyond sects, is adapted by adapting to the Hanafi Sect. This is interesting from the point of view that the belief that has been discussed since Ibn al-Arabi is the last point where the corpse comes from turpentine. It can also be said clearly that the tradition of the Qur'an has long been condemned to the perspective of the state and the ruler in a long history by losing blood seriously in the long historical period.

Apart from this, it is seen that even the most simple poem, such as the principles of reading the Qur'an can not exceed the rhetoric. This leads to the wisdom of both the point of deterioration and corruption in the lodge and the orders, and the dimensions of insecurity between ulemâ and ââyih.³ Moreover, the determination of the differences between the outer covers and the headings and contents of some works indicate that some escape routes are being tried to get rid of the control of the Mischief. It is an interesting example of how the confinement is used because it contains provocative stories of a work distributed in the name of prayer book (BOA, MKT, No. 81/107, 23 Z 1300/25 October 1883).

It is seen that the council takes an active role in the control and prohibition of the works which are perceived as official ideology muhalafat. For example, it has been noted that the books published in the name of "Yanâbi all-Mawadda" prepared the Shia sect for incitement, the verses were interpreted as Shia, and there were many false hasiths with false beliefs. As a result, it has been stated that this type of Islam is not contradictory and that books which are "mazarr" (Formatting) are being treated in the Islamic countries and the Ottoman Empire, and that spreading these books will be disadvantageous to "Department of Religion and Politics". As a result, it is ordered that this book, where it is found, be collected immediately and sent to Bâb al-Fatva (MA, TMM, No. 1784, No. 28, 4 Ra 1307 / October 29, 1889). Tadkik al-Muallafât Commission works as fully as close to the official ideology of the state and perspectives of scholars for centuries are maintained, it is possible to move the system protection concerns. For example, in a book "Risala al-Husayniyya" Mecidiye Barracks in Kabil that ranks in kolağası regarded as harmful to the Üsküdar quietest Lord Sheikh Farid Efendi has been to Rhodes. Said book barracks as into allowing the Christian era and publishing the Kabil Lord no military sectional cut decorations and medals are dismissed has been sentenced to kalebentlik five years in Sinop (BOA. DH. MKT. 961/47, H. 1323 / M. 1905-6). The book "Cevâhirü's-seniyye Fî'l Ahâdîsi'l-Kudsiyye" as opposed to the Ahl al-Sunnah Faith is prepared for the promotion of Imami sect and banned by a highly fabricated hadith grounds where the content and were asked to be seized wherever found.⁴

³ For a record in the Tecvid Risale, written by Sheikh Ismail Efendi, the first branch of the Jerusalem ibtidāī mosques, the first corrections were made and the necessary corrections were made and there were no disadvantages. (BOA, MF, MKT, No. 295/24, 8 C 1313 / November 26, 1895).

⁴ For more information on this topic, Light, Sheikhs and Shahs, p.As a matter of fact, in some cases where the educational activities of Rumeli and Anatolia were lacking in a record, the state expressed its disturbance in this situation by recording that some people from the Bektashi Ordinance had published their works and published their works (BOA, Y.A.HUS, 462/44, 8 N 1321 / November 28, 1903; Işık, 2015: 191-208).

They want now to take care of mentioned this incident to be heretics it said artifacts that Sharia and the official ideology of the opposition and accused of being contrary Jaafari, Bektashi, associated with Kezelbash environmental Shiite, is related to the propaganda of the Imami sect. Indeed, the same Tuesday with Ahmed Sameh Bektashi penned by the Secret also shows that banning the publication of his book (BOA. MF. MKT. 1153/59, H. 1328 / M.1908). In view of the violation of the official ideology, they are not allowed for reasons such as having had the hadiths and false beliefs generally adapted to the publication of the books and the Risets, abandoning the shar'i records, opposing the Ahl-i Sunnah aqid and the believer, and opposing the shar'i serife (1784, Numbers 28, 24, 55, 55, 31).

Sometimes, anti-government propaganda has opened up problems per se. For example, Erzincan Mevlevî Sheikh Kemahî Ibrahim al-Efendi, who wrote a treatise against the Constitution, was expelled to Kemah for a lifetime by Dersaadet Divan-i Harb-i Martial (BOA, DH 41/3, H.1318 / M.1900-1). It is forbidden to have the Risalah, which is understood to be the political content of the "Islam is the Everlasting Veteran" published in Cairo, by Al-Sheikh Mehmed Tevfik Al-Bekri (BOA, MKT, 719/57, H.1321 / M.1903-4).

The works coming from the periphery were not related to the Shari's, but rather to the way and principles of their own orders. What is interesting here is that the state should examine the books that describe their original worlds as well as the works written in the Shar'i texts with the same meticulousness. The main point of interest in the works of the first kind is that they are not deducted from the mistakes. In the works of the second kind, the Shar'i sought is the absence of shouting. In this context being examined Mardin Naqshbandiyyah, Kadiriyy and Rıfaivve from Sheikh Abdurrahman Efendizade in al-Savvid Ali al-Hamid al-Hüseynî'n Muhammed which copyright "Hayretü'l-İrfân" and "Fevâidü'l-Hamidiye"license to print the named epistle (MF, MKT 550/38, H.1318 / M.1901). However, no license has been issued for the publication of the "Evrâd-1 Usbuiyye" title, which is requested to be printed by Sinop Seikh İbrahim Fehmi Efendi (BOA, MF, MKT, 846/22, H.1323 / M.1905). Denizli Şahin Dede Lodge Sheikh Hacı Mehmet Sirri Efendizade Ahmed Muhlise wants to allow Lord to be published "Zeynü'z-Zakir" is seen as objectionable the book (BOA. MF. MKT. 523/29, H.1318 / M.1901). All of these could lead to an inquiry about the Sheikhs who sometimes write and write works for which the license is required. For example, in verse written by Sunni Sheikh Mehmedüs-Ahmedeş-Sharif and Syed's written "Rıhlet" it has been asked to investigate the cause of the mischievous treatise written (BOA. Y.MTV. 271/92, H.1322 / M.1905). It is also evident from the records that they went to a way of preserving the books that they wrote the Mashiyhi and thought that the oshit would follow. For example, on the determination of the presence of forbidden books in the belonging to Seikh Ibrahim Lord in the Lieutenant's house in Fatih, the depot was closed and the proprietor was consummated (BOA, DH, MKT, 552/86, H.1320 / M.1902).

CONCLUSION

A number of changes and transformations in the Western modernization process have begun to emerge from the first quarter of the 19th century in Ottoman state conception. Religion (official Islam), which assumes a legitimizing and protective role in the understanding of the Ottoman state, has embodied a new security with a mission that justifies reform in this new period and unifies and integrates society around the same religious and cultural values. The realization of this mission has been through political, administrative, and reforms in the field of education and culture, and newly instituted institutions. Thus, it was aimed to homogenize the religious groups, which were brought into conflict with the orders and official Islam, by drawing them to the official Islamic circle. Tedkîk-i Müellefât Commission, who came to mind as one of the institutions established for this purpose, has acted with the protection ideology of the official ideology because of the sharia against the press publishing activities reflecting the whole religious field, belief and mind world. The board supervised all parties operating in the field of religion from the one side in order to comply with the Sharia and from the other side not to produce written materials contrary to sharia and stipulation. Especially in terms of scrolls, this situation meant that the tradition of the Irfan was condemned to the shari'a, and that the world of the vast faith and mind was surrounded by the religious interpretation of the ulama. Undoubtedly the developments in question, when considered together with other social and cultural policies applied in this period, led to the lowering of the walls between the Lodge and the Madrasa, Ulemâ and Meşâyih

REFERENCES

Sadaret Mektûbî Kâlemi, Mühimme (A. MKT. MHM)

Sadaret Mektûbî Kâlemi, Meclis-i Vâlâ (A. MKT. MVL)

Bâbıâlî Evrak Odası (BEO)

Maarif (C. MF)

Hatt-1 Hümâyûn Tasnifi (HAT)

Dâhiliye Nezareti Mektubi Kalemi (DH. MKT)

Dâhiliye Siyasî Evrak (DH. SYS)

İbnülemin Tasnifi (İ. EV)

Maarif Nezareti Mektûbî Kâlemi (MF. MKT)

Yıldız Sadaret Hususi Maruzat Evrakı (Y. A. HUS)

Mütenevvî Maruzât Evrakı (Y. MTV)

BOA (1999). MD. 7 (975-976 / 1567–1569), (Prepared Hacı Osman Yıldırım, Muhammed Safi Vahdettin Atik, Dr. Murat Cebecioğlu, Mustafa Serin, Osman Uslu, Numan Yekeler), Publication number 37, Divân-1 Hümayûn Sicilleri Dizisi V, Ankara: BOA

Meşihat Arşivi Tedkîk-i Müellefat Müzekkire ve Tedkîk-i Mesâhif-i Şerîfe Kayıt Defteri, Number 1784. (Briefly in the text: MA. TMM).

ARSLAN, Ihsan (2012), "The First Turkish Reign and Sovereignty of the Islamic State Symbols" EKEV Academy Magazine, 16/51, 73-92.

BARBIER, Maurice (1999). Religion and Politics in Modern Western Thought, (Translation Özkan Gözel), Istanbul: Kaknüs Publications.

ES'AD EFENDİ (2005). Üss-i Zafer, (Prepared Mehmet Arslan) Istanbul: Book house Publications.

GENCER, Bedri (2012). Islamic Modernism, Ankara: Eastern Western Publications.

IŞIK, Zekeriya (2017). Sheikhs and Shahs Development and Change Processes of State-Sutra Relations in Ottoman Society, 2nd Edition, Konya: Çizgi Bookstore. IMBER, Colin (2004). Ebussuud from Sharia Law and Islamic law in the Ottoman Empire, Istanbul: History Foundation Dorm Publications.

LUCKMANN, Thomas (2003). Invisible Problem of Religion in modern society, (Translated by Ali Coskun and Fuat Aydın), Istanbul: Ragbet Publications.

Okumuş, Ejder(2009). "Social Change and Religion", Electronic Journal of Social Sciences, <u>www.esosder.org</u> Electronic Journal of Social Sciences <u>info@esosder.org</u>, Fall-2009 C.8, S.30, 323-347.

SELÇUK, H. (2011). "XX. The Perspective of the Ottoman State to the Alevi Society in the Century (Army Example) ", Turkish Culture and Hacı Bektaş Veli Research Journal, p. 59, 71-90.

S. TURNER, Bryan (1997). Max Weber and Islam, (Translated by Yasin Aktay), Ankara: Vadi Publications.

ÖZER, Ekrem (2007). Lodge and Sect Reforms in the Ottoman Empire II. Mahmut Period and its After-, AUSB, Doctoral Thesis, Erzurum.

VAROL, Muharrem (2001). Sectical Politics of the Ottoman State after the Interest of Bektashism (1826-1866), MUTA, Doctoral Thesis, Istanbul.