NO. XVII / 2014 ISSN 1301-2746

ADALYA

(AYRIBASIM/OFFPRINT)



SUNA-İNAN KIRAÇ AKDENİZ MEDENİYETLERİ ARAŞTIRMA ENSTİTÜSÜ SUNA & İNAN KIRAÇ RESEARCH INSTITUTE ON MEDITERRANEAN CIVILIZATIONS

ADALYA



SUNA-İNAN KIRAÇ AKDENİZ MEDENİYETLERİ ARAŞTIRMA ENSTİTÜSÜ YILLIĞI The Annual of the Suna & İnan Kiraç research institute on mediterranean civilizations

ADALYA

Vehbi Koç Vakfı Suna - İnan KIRAÇ Akdeniz Medeniyetleri Araştırma Enstitüsü Yıllık Dergisi Yönetim Yeri: Barbaros Mh. Kocatepe Sk. No. 25 Kaleiçi 07100 Antalya Tel: +90 242 243 42 74 Faks: +90 242 243 80 13 E-posta: akmed@akmed.org.tr

> Yayın Türü: Yerel Süreli Yayın Sayı: XVII - 2014 Yayıncı Sertifika No: 25840

Sahibi: Vehbi Koç Vakfı Adına Erdal YILDIRIM

Sorumlu Müdür: Kayhan DÖRTLÜK

Yapım: Zero Prodüksiyon Ltd.

Abdullah Sokak No. 17 Taksim 34433 İstanbul Tel: +90 212 244 75 21 www.zerobooksonline.com *Baskı*: Oksijen Basım ve Matbaacılık San. Tic. Ltd. Şti.

100. Yıl Mah. Matbaacılar Sit. 2. Cad. No: 202/A Bağcılar-İstanbul

Tel: +90 (212) 325 71 25 Fax: +90 (212) 325 61 99

Sertifika No: 29487

ISSN 1301-2746

Yayıncı Sertifika No: 25840

Bilim Danışma Kurulu / Editorial Advisory Board

Hâluk ABBASOĞLU Frank KOLB

David ABULAFIA Wolfram MARTINI Ara ALTUN Gönül ÖNEY

Oluş ARIK Mehmet ÖZSAİT

Cevdet BAYBURTLUOĞLU (C) Urs PESCHLOW Jürgen BORCHHARDT Felix PIRSON

Thomas CORSTEN

Jacques DES COURTILS

Thomas CORSTEN

Scott REDFORD

Denis ROUSSET

Vedat ÇELGİN Martin Ferguson SMITH

Nevzat ÇEVİK Oğuz TEKİN

İnci DELEMEN Gülsün UMURTAK

Refik DURU Burhan VARKIVANÇ Serra DURUGÖNÜL Michael WÖRRLE Hansgerd HELLENKEMPER Martin ZIMMERMAN

Adalya, **A&HCI** (*Arts & Humanities Citation Index*) ve **CC/A&H** (*Current Contents / Arts & Humanities*) tarafından taranmaktadır.

Adalya is indexed in the **A&HCI** (Arts & Humanities Citation Index) and **CC/A&H** (Current Contents / Arts & Humanities).

Hakemli bir dergidir / A peer reviewed Publication

Editörler / Editors

Kayhan DÖRTLÜK Tarkan KAHYA Remziye BOYRAZ SEYHAN Tuba ERTEKİN

İngilizce Editörleri / English Editors

İnci TÜRKOĞLU Mark WILSON

Yazışma Adresi / Mailing Address

Barbaros Mah. Kocatepe Sk. No. 25 Kaleiçi 07100 ANTALYA-TURKEY

Tel: +90 242 243 42 74 • Fax: +90 242 243 80 13 akmed@akmed.org.tr www.akmed.org.tr



İçindekiler

Nikos Efstratiou – Paolo Biagi – Elisabetta Starnini The Epipalaeolithic Site of Ouriakos on the Island of Lemnos and its Place in the Late Pleistocene Peopling of the East Mediterranean Region	1
Süleyman Özkan – Mücella Erdalkıran Yeni Buluntuların Işığında Çukurkent Neolitik Yerleşimi	25
Hale Güney Same Type, Different Legend: Anchiale or Soloi?	45
H. Asena Kızılarslanoğlu – Erkan Alkaç Elaiussa'da Ele Geçen Hellenistik Dönem Rhodos Amphora ve Amphora Mühürleri	55
Deniz Kaplan Doğu Dağlık Kilikia'da (Olba Bölgesi) Erken İmparatorluk Dönemi'nde İmar Hareketliliğindeki Durgunluk ve Isodom Kuleler: Dağlık Kilikia-Isauria İsyanları	69
Hamdi Şahin — Aşkım Özdizbay Dağlık Kilikia Kurşun Kalesi Tapınağı ve Stoasına İlişkin Yeni Öneriler	85
İnci Delemen – Emine Koçak The Dancing Attis: A Bronze Statue from the Macellum / Agora of Perge	123
B. Ayça Polat Becks – Hüseyin Metin Pisidia'dan Plouton-Kore Betimli Bir Adak Steli ve Yöre Kültü Hakkında Düşündürdükler	i 145
Filiz Cluzeau An Homeric Dream Oracle from Termessos	159
Emma L. Baysal – Hugh Elton A tomb with a view: the rock-cut cemetery at Alahan in Isauria	181
Mehmet Oktan – Gülcan Şaroğlu Eine neue Widmungsinschrift des Statthalters Valerius Diogenes für Konstantin den Großen aus dem pisidischen Antiochia	209
Nevzat Çevik – Süleyman Bulut Andriake Doğu Hamamı: Bölgenin Hamam Mimarlığına Işık Tutan Yeni Bir Örnek	221
Eric Laufer – Johannes Lipps Eine frühbyzantinische Kirche beim pisidischen Pednelissos und ihre kaiserzeitlichen Spolien	263
Çiğdem Gençler-Güray – Nilüfer Peker A Figure-Engraved Glass Bowl from the Early Byzantine Period	281

IV	İçindekiler

Hatice Durgun XIX. yy.'da Elmalı Abdal Musa Dergâhı Şeyhliği ve Vakıflarına Yönelik Müdahaleler	295
Mehmet Ak Antalya'da İdari Yapı ve Nüfus (1915)	311



Prof. Dr. CEVDET BAYBURTLUOĞLU (1934-2013)

"...Yaşamınızı arkeolojiye bağladınız. Arkeolojiyi içten gelen duygularla sevdiniz ve onu Türk kamuoyuna sevdirdiniz. Örnek bir bilim adamı olarak Türk arkeolojisinde seçkin bir yeriniz vardır. Sevecen bir hoca, özverili bir kazı yönetmeni, barışı, dostluğu yaşatan bir aydın olarak hizmet görüyorsunuz. Sizin bundan sonra Türkiye ve dünya arkeolojisiyle turizmine olan büyük hizmetlerinizi başarıyla sürdüreceğiniz inancındayım. Sizi sevgiyle, saygıyla selamlarım. *"

Ord. Prof. Dr. Ekrem Akurgal İzmir, 2001.

"...You have dedicated your life to archaeology. You have loved archaeology with the most sincere of feelings and made society love it. You have a special elite place among Turkish archaeological academia. You have been serving as a role model for the embracing teacher, the self-sacrificing excavation director and the enlightened person reviving peace and friendship. I believe that you will continue your great services to Turkish and world tourism and to archaeology. I salute you with love and respect.*"

Ord. Prof. Dr. Ekrem Akurgal İzmir, 2001.

Adalya'nın bu sayısı, bir vefa ve saygı gereği Bilim Danışma Kurulu üyemiz, AKMED Kütüphanesinin nazik ve cömert bağışçısı Cevdet Bayburtluoğlu'nun aziz hatırasına armağandır.

This issue of ADALYA is dedicated, in fidelity and respect, to the dear memory of Cevdet Bayburtluoğlu, a generous and kind donor to the Library and member of the Academic Advisory Board of AKMED.

^{*} E. Akurgal, "Cevdet Bayburtluoğlu'nun Anadolu Arkeolojisine Katkıları", in: C. Özgünel et al. (eds.), Cevdet Bayburtluoğlu İçin Yazılar – Essays in Honour of Cevdet Bayburtluoğlu (2001) 1.

A Figure-Engraved Glass Bowl from the Early Byzantine Period

Çiğdem GENÇLER-GÜRAY* - Nilüfer PEKER**

Excavations initiated at Elaiussa Sebaste by Roma "Sapienza" University in 1995 have brought to light many public structures as well as shed light onto the historic development of the city and its urban extension¹.

Fragments of the bowl presented here were uncovered in an area that was part of the residential palace of civic or military administrators of Elaiussa Sebaste in the Early Byzantine Period. The palace was built about mid-5th century A.D. and fell out of use after a fire and plundering in the first half of the 6th century A.D.

In the 2011 campaign work focussed in the area where one of the palace gates was probably located, and excavations there brought to light traces of damage that took place around the 530s A.D. The traces of damage were identified in closed-context layer PN137. Alongside the remains of this glass bowl were uncovered sherds of daily-use wares, terracotta unguentaria and various metal objects. After 13 fragments of bluish colourless glass were joined, a shallow bowl with a diameter of 15.7 cm. was formed. This blown-glass bowl has a cut and unworked rim. With respect to the fragments in hand, nearly half of the bowl has been identified and an engraved figurative composition was detected in the outer surface of the bowl.

The decoration and form of the bowls are typical for such bowls of the Late Roman period, but its cut and unworked rim is noteworthy². In addition to undecorated plain examples, some examples have a thick groove right below the rim³, while some other examples have engraved figural scenes covering the entire exterior of the vessel⁴.

Dr. Çiğdem Gençler-Güray, Başkent Üniversitesi, Güzel Sanatlar, Tasarım ve Mimarlık Fakültesi, Bağlıca Kampüsü, Eskişehir Yolu 20 km. Bağlıca 06530 Ankara. E-mail: cigdemgencler@gmail.com

^{**} Dr. Nilüfer Peker, Başkent Üniversitesi, Güzel Sanatlar, Tasarım ve Mimarlık Fakültesi, Bağlıca Kampüsü, Eskişehir Yolu 20km. Bağlıca 06530Ankara. E-mail: nilufer@baskent.edu.tr

We would like to express our gratitude to Prof. Dr. E. Equini Schneider for her permission and support for the publication of this article, to E. Casagrande for presenting us with all the information on the layer in which the bowl was uncovered, and to Marco Ricci for providing us with information on the pottery finds from the excavations. The ancient city of Elaiussa Sebaste is located at Ayaş-Kumkuyu on the Mersin-Silifke highway; it was a port city of Rough Cilicia. Excavations under the direction of Prof. Dr. Equini Schneider have brought to light entirely and published the following: theatre, agora, harbour baths, temple, Byzantine palace, production and residential areas and necropolis. For more information, see Schneider 1999; Schneider (ed.) 2003; Schneider (ed.) 2010.

Dussart 1995, 343 ff.; Price 1995, 26, fig. 4 (England, 4th century); Sternini 2001, 24, fig. 5.15 (Rome-Palatin Hill, 4th -5th century); Foy 2003, 71-72, fig. 36 (Tunis, early 5th century).

³ Examples with grooves are frequently encountered at Jalame; see Weinberg 1988, 94-95.

⁴ It is thought that the glass engravers called *diatretarii*, like the gem cutters, used metal points and wheels fixed on

Figure-Engraved Glass Vessels in the Eastern Mediterranean

The cutting technique seen on the Elaiussa Sebaste example is attested in Roman glass technology in the Early Imperial period⁵. This technique became more common in the 3rd-4th centuries, and figural decoration became frequent in addition to a geometric pattern⁶. Scenes of daily life, mythology, and Christian liturgical symbols with a dating after the 4th century were engraved on vessels⁷, and production of such vessels had increased in the western parts of the empire, particularly in England, Italy and the Rhine region⁸.

The situation is somewhat different in the eastern parts of the empire. Syria-Palestine and Egypt, particularly Alexandria, which all had a prominent place in the history of glass technology, remain quite weak compared to the western parts when it comes to glass vessels with figure-engraved.

During the Middle Imperial period some examples indicate that this technique was part of production in Egypt, although not certain⁹, and glass bowls with cut decoration such as the "Lynkeus Group", "Contour Grooves Group" and Karanis examples are proposed as Egyptian production¹⁰. On the other hand, very few examples of glass vessels with cut decoration have been recovered in Egypt from the Late Roman period¹¹. During this period in Egypt, examples of glass vessels that contain geometric patterns and inscriptions became more common than figurative examples¹².

Regarding the Syria-Palestine region, examples with a geometric pattern were much more popular during the Roman period; however, this situation changed in the Byzantine period when Christian symbols became more common¹³. Very few figurally engraved examples are known from this region, and the best-preserved example comes from Gerasa. According to Baur, this vessel, which is decorated with a cross on one side and a palm tree surrounded with

a coil and abraded the cold glass by turning such apparatuses. Details of motifs were rendered by freehand. For more information, see Charleston 1964, 83-100; Caron 1997, 20.

Facet cut vessels of colourless glass from the last quarter of the 1st century and first half of the 2nd century A.D. are the first engraved examples of the Roman Imperial period. These initial examples of colourless and smooth glass with facet-cut, reminiscent of rock crystal, remained in use during the Middle Imperial period as well. For more information see Harden 1987, 180-181; Weinberg - Stern 2009, 51-52.

⁶ The earliest figural example in cut technique dates to the beginning of the second century. For more information see Caron 1997, 19. For examples from the 2nd and 3rd centuries, see Harden, 1987, 197-200; Caron 1997, 22.

Scenes of daily life such as hunting and chariot races, various mythological and Christian scenes are seen; see Caron 1997, 19-50; Harden 1960, 23-32; 179-188; Hayes 1928, 23-32; Painter 1971, 41-50; Sagui 1997, 337-358.

⁸ Caron 1997, 19. Although it is known that such vessels were produced in the western part of the Empire there is no clear evidence for the cities of production. However, based on the frequency of examples from certain regions and stylistic characteristics, it is possible to state that Cologne and Rome were the cities of cut-glass vessel production during Late Antiquity (Caron 1997, 22-34; Sagui 1997, 337-358).

 $^{^9}$ For glass vessels with cut decoration of the 1^{st} through 4^{th} centuries A.D. from Egypt see, Nenna 2003, 359-374.

Harden states that vessels, like the Lynkeus vessel, on which the figures have their names engraved in Greek next to them, were produced in the East Mediterranean, especially in Egypt (Harden 1987, 181-182, 198-199). However, Fremersdorf claims that these vessels were produced at Cologne, and perhaps this form was produced both in the East and the West through engravers of Egypt origin (Weinberg - Stern 2009, 97-98). The Karanis examples resembling Contour Grooves Group are claimed to have come from a workshop in Egypt and possibly date to the same period; see Nenna 2003, 363.

¹¹ The fragment from Ain at-Turba and Bagawat is identified as a late example of the Lynkeus group, dating to the 4th or 5th century (Hill - Nenna 2001, 90).

¹² It is stated that examples with geometric decoration and double-line inscriptions might have been produced in Egypt; see Nenna 2003, 372.

¹³ Clairmont 1963, 56-86; Gorin-Rosen - Winter 2010, 177. An example with double-line inscription in cut technique stated to have come from Syria-Palestine is noteworthy; see Ross 1962, 78-79, pl. 52.

sheep on the other, might have been produced in the Eastern Mediterranean, particularly at Antioch¹⁴. Apart from this example, a fragment from Israel containing a head with halo is another rare find from the region¹⁵.

Regarding research on the glass from Anatolia, the high number of glass vessels with cut geometric pattern from the Middle Imperial period is worth noting¹⁶. Another group to be considered part of this technique is the "Double-Line Inscribed" glass vessels. Harden states, based on the provenance of most examples of this group, that one production area could be Anatolia¹⁷.

Roman examples of glass vessels with figure-engraved decoration are found very rarely in Anatolia, and all the published examples belong to the Late Roman - Early Byzantine period. One of these examples comes from Arycanda in Lycia, and it is decorated with four peacocks placed within a geometric composition¹⁸. Others are bowls of the 6th-7th centuries uncovered at the Marmaray excavations in Istanbul, which were possibly produced by the same engraver. These bowls have orans figures accompanied with Christian motifs¹⁹. There are no other figure-engraved examples found in the publications on glass from Anatolia.

Elaiussa Sebaste Bowl (Fig. 1)

This glass bowl is decorated with an engraved figurative composition on the outer surface. The restored part of the bowl has a female figure seated on a throne on the right and holding a child on her lap. Its iconographic features indicate that she is the Virgin Mary with Christ Child. The Virgin is depicted in profile seated on a throne with a grid pattern at its back. She is holding the Christ Child with her left hand. Fragments, which should contain the face and legs of the Virgin, are missing. The head and halo of the Virgin are partially seen, and she is dressed with a *chiton* and *maphorion*. The body of the Christ Child is rendered in full profile, while his head is three-quarters. His left arm is raised, but his other hand is missing. It is highly likely that the figure was depicted with a raised hand in blessing. The figure wears a *chiton*, and his feet are given in profile.

Above the heads of the figures is a cross motif with an elongated lower arm. On the left lies part of a building with columns and whose roof is closed with a vaulted or domed superstructure. On the ground extending before the feet of the figures is a tree motif with thin branches discernible. Along the rim of the bowl is a narrow band with a series of stylised leaf motifs that face and frame the figural composition.

¹⁴ Baur 1938, 505-512.

Besides, another engraved specimen has been discovered in the burial cave tombs at Shelomi in the western Galilee (Gorin-Rosen - Winter 2010, 177).

Facet-cut vessels are seen in almost all publications on glass finds from excavations. Furthermore, examples with cut filling motifs like volutes, rosettes and hatching are also seen, albeit few. See Rumscheid 1996, 263-269.

The majority of examples in private collections and museums are recorded with an Anatolian origin, particularly Afyon-Dinar, and those without a record of origin are considered to have an Anatolian production based on similarities of production and decoration. See Harden 1967-68, 43-55; Harden 1987, 183, 203-204.

¹⁸ Tek 2007, 158-159.

The first example is decorated with a figure flanked with cross motifs of almost the same size with the figure. The dressed figure with headgear is rendered with arms stretched both sides, body facing, face in profile. Letters of A and ω are found between the cross and the figure. The second example also features a central dressed figure, arms stretched out on both sides, body facing and face in profile. The figure is flanked with a branch of laurel leaves (?), and three crosses crown the head. See Saklı Limandan Hikayeler 2013, 125-126, figs. 70-71. It must be kept in mind that there should be more examples from the Marmaray excavations other than these two published ones.

The bowl from Elaiussa Sebaste has a decoration and cutting technique different from the above-mentioned examples. The composition is limited with a narrow band formed by two parallel lines. The lines seem to have been engraved using a point on a wheel, and this band of two lines is flanked with symmetrical leaves, which are cut more superficially. On some fragments the lines and leaves have turned invisible due to abrasion for they are not cut deeply, while at some places the leaves were not even cut.

It is believed that points of various sizes were used for the cut decoration on this bowl. On the left are five columns of the building. The columns comprise two bands representing the capital and base, while the shaft is shown as a thick band²⁰. Thick points were used to render the roof of the building. Where the roof meets the column capitals is a wavy line incised by a finer point. The lines beneath the columns suggest that the building rose on a podium.

In the composition of the Virgin Mary with Child Christ, the gridded back of the throne is rounded and confined with a thick point. The drapes of the Virgin Mary's clothes are divided into sections using a thick point and then detailed with incisions. These incisions are also seen on the Virgin's hands. Although the face of the Virgin is missing, parts of her hair and halo are visible, while the Christ Child's face and halo are clearly visible. Details of his clothes are rendered by cuttings and incised lines: eyes and mouth by cutting their surrounding area; eyebrows, nose and hairs by incised lines. The feet of the Christ Child are worked by cutting the interior of the contours. The cross above the heads of the figures which its tip of the upper arm is abraded.

The Iconography of the Elaiussa Sebaste Bowl and a Proposal for its Function

Since the Early Christian period, the iconography of the enthroned Virgin Mary with Christ Child on her lap has been found within the Adoration of the Magi scenes. The iconographic evidence of the Elaiussa bowl suggests that it was actually decorated with the Adoration of the Magi. The Adoration of the Magi that has been referenced by Isaiah (49:7, 60:1-6), The Book of Psalms (68: 32, 72:11) and Matthew (2:1-12), tells about the three Magi who travelled from the Orient following the leading of a star and presented gold, myrrh and frankincense to the Child²¹. Iconographic variations of this scene are found in monumental paintings, reliefs and small objects from the Early Christian period²². With respect to iconography this scene has two basic compositions differentiated by the depiction of the enthroned Virgin Mary with Christ Child on her lap. In one variation, the Virgin is depicted facing in the centre while in the other she is presented in profile, either on the right or the left side of the composition²³. The scheme presenting the Virgin in profile has been detected in many examples since the early centuries just like this bowl from Elaiussa. On two sarcophagi of the 4th century at Arles, the Virgin is depicted in profile with the Christ child on her lap and the Magi presenting their gifts before

Another example with comparable column capital and base is a bowl of dated possibly to the 4^{th} century by Caron and produced in Germany; see Caron 1997, 28-30.

²¹ The number of the Magi and where they came from were two points much discussed among the church fathers during the 4th and 5th centuries; see Carr - Kazhdan 1991, 22-23.

 $^{^{22}\,}$ For the variations see, Schiller 1968, 100 ff.; Weis 1968, 539-549.

It is stated that the variation with the Virgin in the centre developed from the impact of imperial ideology; see Grabar 1980, 81. Two examples of the 6th century from the Eastern Mediterranean are of importance for they provide us with this variation. For the Monza ampulla, see Grabar 1980, fig. 209; for the ivory plaque, see Weitzmann (ed.) 1979, 531-532, cat. no. 476.

them²⁴. More examples can be found on other sarcophagi²⁵. Furthermore, in the catacombs of the Early Christian period, there are scenes of the Adoration of the Magi depicting the Virgin in profile²⁶. An example of a mosaic containing this scene was formerly found at the Church of Nativity in Bethlehem, as reported by a council's text²⁷. On the objects carried by many pilgrims – ampullae, tokens, encolpia, etc. – this scene is depicted as described above during the 6th-7th centuries. On a gold encolpion dated to 584 A.D. the scene is found together with the Nativity, and the Virgin is seated on a throne with rounded back²⁸. A similar depiction is also seen on another gold encolpion of the same century found at Adana²⁹. Three terracotta pilgrim tokens and a bronze fibula from Palestine dated to the same period as well as a bread stamp and a gold encolpion from Delphi feature this scene alone on their entire surfaces³⁰. The throne on the above-mentioned encolpion is formally parallel to the one on the Elaiussa bowl (Fig. 2).

The building in the left part of the scene on the bowl is not fully visible due to missing fragments. The scene is interpreted as the Adoration of the Magi based on the depiction style of the Virgin Mary and Christ child. Thus the building on the left should be the Church of the Nativity indicating the birthplace of Christ. The scenes of the Adoration of the Magi from earlier centuries do not usually include the cave of Christ's birth or the Church of the Nativity. Nevertheless, two illuminated manuscripts of the 11th century, namely the Menologion of Basil II (f. 137r) and the Jerusalem manuscript of the Homily of Gregory of Nazianzus (f. 98v), show the cave in their depiction of the Adoration of the Magi³¹. On the other hand, western medieval examples have architectural depictions sometimes accompanying all the figures, sometimes only the Virgin and the Child³². The deviation of the Elaiussa bowl from the Early Byzantine iconographic tradition in the above-mentioned details is worth giving serious consideration.

The other figures expected in this composition are the three Magi, who should have been depicted opposite the Virgin enthroned with the Christ Child and before the building representing the Church of Nativity. The space on the Elaiussa bowl is large enough to accommodate the figures of the Magi presenting gifts to the Child; however, this part of the bowl is missing.

Examples with a cross motif above the heads of the Virgin and Child are found on pilgrims' tokens produced in the Eastern Mediterranean in the 6th-7th centuries. One such token, which closely parallels the others, is now in the British Museum. The iconographic characteristics of

²⁴ For the examples, see Weitzmann 1979, 400-401, figs. 55-56.

For a sarcophagus fragment dated to c. 320 at Rome, see Weitzmann 1979, 418, cat. no. 375; for an example from the 4th century at the Vatican, see Schiller 1968, fig. 246.

For the example at Priscilla, see Schiller 1968, fig. 245; for the one at Domitilla, see Schiller 1968, fig. 560; for the example at Vigna Massimo, see Grabar 1980, fig. 26. For an example of this scene engraved on a ring stone of the 4th century, see Weitzmann 1979, 436 cat. no. 393.

In the Acts of the synod at Jerusalem in 836, the scene of Adoration of the Magi is described. It is stated that the mosaic was built in the Church of the Nativity by the Empress Helena. On the other hand, Mango states that the scene might have been added in the course of Justinian's restoration; see Mango 2007, 114.

 $^{^{28} \ \, \}text{Ross 1962, 33-35, pl. A, XXVIII; Ross 1957, 247-261; Weitzmann, 1979, 312-313, cat. no. \, 287.}$

²⁹ Grabar 1980, 98, fig. 248.

³⁰ For the pilgrims' tokens, see Rahmani 1979, 34-36, pl. 8: B, C, D; for the fibula, see Vikan 1990, 104-105, fig. 24; for the bread stamp, see Petridis 2012, 83, cat. no. 01, fig. 2; for the gold encolpion, see Entwistle 2010, 228-229, cat. no. 170.

³¹ Beaud 2012, figs. 19, 21.

³² For two ivory plaques at the British Museum dated to the 7th-8th and 11th centuries, see Cutts 1876, figs. 1-2; for an ivory relief of the 9th century, see Schiller 1968, fig. 260.

the scene on this token closely parallel that of the Elaiussa example (Fig. 3) 33 . Besides, on the pilgrims' tokens produced in the Eastern Mediterranean during the same period, the Virgin and Child have been depicted in profile within the compositions that are similarly defined as the Adoration of the Magi, and above the heads of these figures there lies cross motifs as a part of the design. The terracotta token in the collection of the Metropolitan Museum is one of the best-preserved examples of this group (Fig. 4) 34 . In these examples the star motif expressing the divinity of Christ, an important iconographic motif of the scene, is replaced by the cross. It seems that the engraver of the Elaiussa bowl similarly preferred not to incorporate the star motif in the composition.

Based on the data at hand, it is possible to propose several ideas regarding the use of the Elaiussa bowl. At the beginning of the Early Christian period, in regions with limited economic power and possibly outside the sphere of imperial production, glass bowls used in ecclesiastical liturgy usually lacked ornaments. Besides, the bowls made from more durable and precious materials were much more favoured³⁵.

The depiction on the Elaiussa bowl is among the most important data to present us with clues regarding its function. The scene, which we have identified as the Adoration of the Magi, was a preferred theme for burial depiction and pilgrim objects. That this story symbolizes the incarnation of the Saviour was an important support for the believers. From this point of view, this scene took its place on sarcophagi and catacomb paintings depicting almost the infancy cycle of Christ³⁶. Yet its presence on pilgrim objects arises from the fact that the Magi presenting gifts were a prototype for the believers. The Magi were the archetypal pilgrim, who came to the Holy Land from the Orient to venerate the Christ Child³⁷. The pilgrims, at the same time, hoped to obtain from Magi's eulogia³⁸. Thus objects decorated with the Adoration of the Magi became popular among pilgrims, for they were reminiscent of their own experience. However, the absence of a similar pilgrim object makes it difficult for us to suggest that the Elaiussa bowl was produced as a pilgrim souvenir. Nevertheless, as mentioned in a chapter of Romanos's Kontakion, which was chanted in the 6th century, the story of the Magi was an example for the believers. Teteriatnikov states that this text invites the faithful to be like the Magi who presented gifts³⁹. Due to this self-identification feature of the story, it was used to decorate objects commissioned by the emperor and other wealthy notables⁴⁰. It looks as if the wealthy patrons

³³ For another token at the Detroit Institute of Arts, see Vikan 1990, fig. 23.

³⁴ The examples in this group have St. Simeon Stylite placed in the centre of the composition. The Adoration of the Magi comprises only the enthroned Virgin and Child depicted in profile.

Caron emphasizes the particular absence of cut glass vessels used in liturgy and argues that a few rare examples are not enough for the hypothesis. He further claims that the proposal that the glass vessel with cut décor uncovered in the Antonine baths in Carthage was used for bread at the baptism ceremony of a fresh convert at Easter morning could be mere speculation. For more information, see Caron 1997, 21-22 and n. 39.

 $^{^{36}}$ For more information, see Grabar 1980, 12.

³⁷ Vikan states that the Magi set a prototype for the pilgrims and that they desired to travel to reach Christ, just like the Magi did. For more information, see Vikan 1990, 103-104.

³⁸ Vikan 1982, 24.

Teteriatnikov publishes the English translation of "The Resurrection VI" from Romanos the Melod's Kontakion. She states that this kontakion stresses the importance of the Magi: they will be offered resurrection. The kontakion was read during Christmas in Hagia Sophia in Istanbul and the image of the Magi was propagated by the clergy in sermons for major feasts to encourage donations; see Teteriatnikov 1998, 385-387.

⁴⁰ An example of the Magi on the hem of Empress Theodora's mantle is found in the mosaic panel of San Vitale in Ravenna. Teteriatnikov noted that the depiction is altered to enhance the significance of the donatrice, Theodora. The Magi are shown here in such a way that the first one is half hidden behind a fold of Theodora's mantle, metaphorically suggesting that Theodora herself is the first Magus. It has been noted by scholars that the Magi are

and emperors of Byzantium considered themselves as gift-givers like the Magi who presented gifts to the Christ Child. The gold encolpion of 584 mentioned above is thought to have been produced in relation with the gift-giving of the Magi⁴¹. In addition, Caron states, based on inscribed examples, that glass vessels engraved were produced as gifts, in order to commemorate an important celebration such as the *vicennalia* (twenty years of rule) of an emperor or the nomination to office of high-ranking civil servant⁴². In our opinion the Elaiussa bowl was produced for such an occasion. Perhaps it was commissioned by a high official of the city, and the find spot of the bowl actually supports this hypothesis.

Conclusion

The engraved glass bowl uncovered in the building identified as the Early Byzantine palace of Elaiussa Sebaste was possibly commissioned by or presented as a gift to the administrator of the city, on the occasion of a probable event unknown to us today.

Although the bowl is not fully completed, extant pieces suggest the engraved figural depiction was the Adoration of the Magi, a story from the infancy of Christ. However, it must be kept in mind that this identification based on iconography is only a proposal.

Publications on ancient glass from the Eastern Mediterranean to date do not provide us with a parallel or closely related example to the figurally engraved Elaiussa bowl; thus our bowl is considered to be a rare example. As there is no known example regarding the technique and composition, it is only possible to suggest some centres as its production site.

It is observed in previous publications on glass finds from Elaiussa Sebaste that there has been enough archaeological evidence to indicate glass production in the city during the first half of the 7th century A.D.⁴³. However, data regarding glass from the mid-5th to the first half of the 6th century when the palace was in use does not suggest any glass production in the settlement. Based on the present evidence and the bowl being the only example of its kind, it is plausible to suggest that it was not produced locally.

Yet, studies on glass production and typology of the religiously and politically important Cilician centres, such as Tarsus, Antioch and Seleucia, are very few, and this causes lacunae in the evaluation of the Elaiussa bowl⁴⁴.

As mentioned above, we are not able to establish a parallelism between the Elaiussa bowl and the few examples known in the Eastern Mediterranean. In addition, the situation is not any different regarding the examples from the West.

As for the pottery finds of the Early Byzantine period from Elaiussa Sebaste, there is a continuity of commercial relations of the city with the Eastern Mediterranean, particularly Palestine,

juxtaposed with Theodora's aspect as a donor to the church, but they also emphasize her imperial significance. See Teteriatnikov 1998, 382.

⁴¹ See supra n. 28. It is worth noting that the gold encolpion was used for the birth ceremonies of a *porphyrogenitos* as it establishes a parallelism with the story depicted on it. Similarly, gifts are presented to the newborn imperial child just like the Magi presented gifts to the Christ Child. See Grierson 1961, 221-224; Weitzmann 1979, 313.

⁴² Caron 1997, 21

Detailed and archaeometric studies on glass ingots, production wastes and numerous glass fragments seem to prove the evidence of production. Based on these data it was proposed that lamps and perhaps window glass were produced during the first half of the 7th century (Gençler-Güray 2012, 292-298).

⁴⁴ In the relevant publications Roman-period glass finds are overwhelming, but there are also examples from the Early Byzantine period. See Olcay 1998, 169-177; Stern 1983, 1985, 35-64; Stern 1989, 583-605; Yağcı 1999, 169-183 pl. 35-37; Yağcı 1990, 30-36; Erten 2003, 145-154, pl. 20-26.

Cyprus and North Africa, and the Aegean⁴⁵. Thus, it is plausible to think that this bowl might have come from one of these regions.

The archaeological layer in which the bowl was uncovered contains traces of damage in the 530s A.D. along with numerous pottery fragments of the same date. In spite of the fact that the bowl was found in a closed context, considering the possibility that it was kept as a souvenir, it is possible to propose the period when the palace was in use, from the mid-5th to the first half of the 6th century, as the period when the bowl was produced. The concerned period corresponds to the reigns of Emperor Leo I through Justinian I. Certainly the contributions of Leo I (457-474) and Zeno of Isaura (474-491) to the construction projects in the region have to be taken into consideration⁴⁶. Perhaps we should also consider this period when the region was active for arts and architecture as the possible time for the production of the bowl.

⁴⁵ The imported wares of the city include fine table wares, cooking pots and numerous amphorae for high quality wine and special oils. See Ferrazzoli - Ricci 2007; Ferrazzoli - Ricci 2008a, 153-163 and Ferrazzoli - Ricci 2008b, 1567 1578

Grant states that Leo I, who provided jobs to officers and soldiers from Isaura, the land of bandits, effectively encouraged the construction of new churches and monasteries in the region; see Grant 2000, 2. Zeno of Isauria married the daughter of Leo I and ascended the throne in 474 together with his son Leo II. With his son's untimely death later in 474, Leo ruled as sole emperor. Although the Byzantines did not accept Zeno, who came from barbarous Isaurians, his constructions in the Cilicia and Isaura contributed to the development of the region. For the history Zeno's reign, see Ostrogorsky 1991, 56-59 and Gibbon 1994, 7-8.

Bibliography and Abbreviations

Baur 1938 P. V. C. Baur, Gerasa, City of the Decapolis - Glass Ware (1938).

Beaud 2012 M. Beaud, Iconographie et art monumental dans l'espace féodal du Xème au

XIIème siècle: le thème des Rois Mages et sa diffusion (University of Bourgogne

Unpublished PhD Thesis 2012).

Caron 1997 B. Caron, "Roman Figure-Engraved Glass in the Metropolitan Museum of Art",

MetrMusJ 32, 1997, 19-50.

Carr - Kazhdan 1991 A. W. Carr - A. Kazhdan, "Adoration of Magi", The Oxford Dictionary of

Byzantium I (1991) 22-23.

Charleston 1964 R. J. Charleston, "Wheel-Engraving and Cutting: Some Early Equipment - I

Engraving", JGS 6, 1964, 83-100.

Clairmont 1963 C. W. Clairmont, The Excavations at Dura Europos. Final Report 4, 5. The Glass

Vessels (1963).

Cutts 1876 E. L. Cutts, "Traditions of Christian Art, Chapter III, Byzantine Ivories", The Art

Journal, New Series 3, 1876, 268-272.

Dussart 1995 O. Dussart, "Les Verres de Jordanie et de Syrie du Sud du IVe au VIIe siècle nou-

velles données chronologiques", in: D. Foy (ed.), La verre de l'Antique tardive et

du Haut Moyen Age (1995) 343-359.

Entwistle 2012 C. Entwistle, "Enkolpion", Byzanz: Pracht und Alltag, Kunst- und

Ausstellungshalle der Bundesrepublik Deutschland (2010) 228-229.

Erten 2003 E. Erten, "Glass Finds from Olba Survey - 2001", Olba VII, 2003, 145-154.

Ferrazzoli - Ricci 2007 A. F. Ferrazzoli - M. Ricci, "Gli scambi e le rotte commerciali nel bacino

del Mediterraneo orientale in epoca romana e primo bizantina sulla base del materiale anforico proveniente dallo scavo di Elaiussa Sebaste in Cilicia (Ayash, Turchia)", in: J. Pérez – G. Pascual (eds.), Comercio, redristibucion y fondeaderos. La navegacion a vela en el Mediterraneo. Actas V Jornadas Internacionales

de Arqueologia Subaquatica (2007) 303-312.

Ferrazzoli – Ricci 2008a A. F. Ferrazzoli – M. Ricci, "Scambi commerciali fra l'Africa settentrionale e la

Cilicia in età tardoromana e protobizantina sulla base del materiale ceramico dallo scavo di Elaiussa Sebaste", L'Africa romana XVII, 2008, 1567-1578.

(ed.), Elaiussa Sebaste - Doğu ile Batı Arasında Bir Liman Kenti (2008) 153-163.

Ferrazzoli – Ricci 2008b A. F. Ferrazzoli – M. Ricci, "Seramik Üretimi ve Ticareti", in: E. Equini Schneider

Foy 2003 D. Foy, "Le verre en Tunisie: L'Apport de fouilles récentes tuniso-françaises", JGS

45, 2003, 71-72.

Ayaş), in: D. Ignatiadou – A. Antonaras (eds.), Annales du 18^e Congrés de l'Association internationale pour l'histoire du verre - 2009 (2012) 292-298.

Gibbon 1994 E. Gibbon, Roma İmparatorluğu'nun Gerileyiş ve Çöküş Tarihi, IV, Bizans.

A. Baltacıgil (transl.) (1994).

Goren-Rosen – Winter 2010

Y. Goren-Rosen - T. Winter, "Selected Insights into Byzantine Glass in the

Holy Land", in: J. Drauschke - D. Keller (eds.), Glas in Byzanz - Produktion,

Verwundung, Analysen (2010) 165-182.

Grabar 1980 A. Grabar, Christian Iconography: A Study of Its Origins (1980).

Grant 2000 M. Grant, Roma'dan Bizans'a. Z. İlkgelen (transl.) (2000).

Grierson 1961 P. Grierson, "The Date of the Dumbarton Oaks Epiphany Medallion", DOP 15, 1961, 221-224. Harden 1960 D. B. Harden, "The Wint Hill Hunting Bowl and Related Glasses", JGS 2, 1960, 23-32. Harden 1967/68 D. B. Harden, "Late Roman Wheel-Inscript Glases with Double-Line Letters", KölnJb 9, 1967/68, 43-55. Harden 1987 D. B. Harden, Glass of the Caesars (1987). W. C. Hayes, "An Engraved Glass Bowl in the Museo Christiano of the Vatican Hayes 1928 Library", AJA 32.1, 1928, 23-32. Hill - Nenna 2001 M. Hill - M. D. Nenna, "Glass From Ain Et-Turba and Bagawat Necropolis in the Kharga Oasis, Egypt", in: Annales du 15e Congrès de AIHV (2001) 88-92. C. Mango, The Art of The Byzantine Empire (312-1453), Sources and Documents Mango 2007 (2007).Nenna 2003 M. D. Nenna, "Verre gravés d'Égypte du I^{er} au V^e siècle ap. J.-C.", in: D. Foy – M. D. Nenna (eds.), Échanges et commerce du verre dans le Monde antique, Actes du colloque de l'Association française pour l'archéologie du verre, 2001 (2003) 359-374. Olcay 1998 B. Y. Olcay, "Tarsus Cumhuriyet Alanı Kazısı Cam Buluntuları", Adalya III, 1998, 169-177. Ostrogorsky 1991 G. Ostrogorsky, Bizans Devleti Tarihi. F. Işıltan (transl.) (1991). Painter 1971 K. S. Painter, "Six Roman Glasses with Cut Decoration from Amiens", BMQ 36-1/2, 1971, 41-50. Petridis 2012 P. Petridis, "Holy Bread Stamps from Early Byzantine Delphi", in: B. Böhlendorf-Arslan - A. Ricci (eds.), Byzantine Small Finds in Archaeological Contexts, Byzas 15, 2012, 81-90. Price 1995 J. Price, "Glass Tablewares with Wheel-cut, Engraved and Abraded Decoration in Britain in the Fourth Century AD", in: D. Foy (ed.), Le verre de l'Antiquite tardive et du Haut Moyen Age (1995) 25-34. Rahmani 1979 L. Y. Rahmani, "Adoration of the Magi", IEJ 29, 1979. M. C. Ross, "A Byzantine gold medallion at Dumbarton Oaks", DOP 11, 1957, Ross 1957 247-261. Ross 1962 M. C. Ross, Catalogue of the Byzantine and the Early Medieval Antiquities in Dumbarton Oaks Collection, vol. 1. Metalwork, Ceramics, Glass, Glyptics, Painting (1962).Rumscheid 1996 F. Rumscheid, "Eine Schliffverzierte Glasschale aus Didyma", IstMitt 46, 1996,

263-269.

Sagui 1997 L. Sagui, "Un piatto di vetro inciso da Roma: Contributo ad un inquadramento delle Officine Vetrarie Tardoantiche", Studi Miscellanei 30, 1997, 337-358.

Saklı Limandan Hikayeler 2013

Saklı Limandan Hikayeler - Yenikapı'nın Batıkları [Stories from the Hidden Harbour -Yenikapı Shipwrecks] (2013).

Schiller 1968 G. Schiller, Iconography of Christian Art I (1968).

Schneider 1999 E. Equini Schneider, Elaiussa Sebaste I. Campagne di scavo 1995-1997 (1999).

Schneider 2003 E. Equini Schneider (ed.), Elaiussa Sebaste II. Un porto tra oriente e occidente (2003).

Schneider 2008 E. Equini Schneider (ed.), Elaiussa Sebaste - Doğu ile Batı Arasında Bir Liman Kenti

Schneider 2010 E. Equini Schneider (ed.), Elaiussa Sebaste III. L'Agora Romana (2010). Stern 1985 E. M. Stern, "Ancient and Medieval Glass from the Necropolis Church at Anemorium", Annales du 9e Congrès international d'ètude historique du verre, Nancy (France), 22-28 mai 1983 (1985) 35-64.

Stern 1989 E. M. Stern, "Adana Bölge Müzesinde Sergilenmekte Olan Cam Eserler - The Glass Vessels Exhibited in the Bölge Museum-Adana", Belleten 53/207-208 (1989) 583-605.

Sternini 2001 M. Sternini, "Reperti in Vetro da un deposito Tardoantico sul Colle Palatino", JGS 43, 2001, 21-75.

Tek 2007 A. T. Tek, "Arykanda'da Bulunan Antik Cam Eserlere Genel Bir Bakış", Seres 2007 - Uluslararası Katılımlı Seramik, Cam, Emaye, Sır ve Boya Semineri 26-28 Kasım 2007 (2007) 158-159.

Teteriatnikov 1998 N. Teteriatnikov, "The Gift Giving' Image: The Case of the Adoration of the Magi", Visual Resources 13, 1998, 385-387.

Vikan 1982 G. Vikan, Byzantine Pilgrimage Art, Vol. 5 (1982).

Vikan 1990 G. Vikan, "Pilgrims in Magi's Clothing: The Impact of Mimesis on Early Byzantine Pilgrimage Art", in: R. G. Ousterhout (ed.), The Blessings of Pilgrimage, vol. 1 (1990) 104-105.

Weinberg 1988 G. D. Weinberg, "The Glass Factory and Manufacturing Processes", in: G. D. Weinberg (ed.), Excavations at Jalame, Site of a Glass Factory in Late Roman Palestine (1988) 24-37.

Weinberg - Stern 2009

G. D. Weinberg - E. M. Stern, The Athenian Agora, XXXIV, Vessel Glass (2009).

Weis 1968 A. Weis, "Drei Könige", LCI (1968) 539-549.

Weitzmann 1979 K. Weitzmann (ed.), Age of Spirituality: Late Antique and Early Christian Art, 3rd to 7th
Century: Catalogue of the Exhibition at the Metropolitan Museum of Art, November
19, 1977 through February 12, 1978 (1979).

Yağcı 1990 E. E. Yağcı, "Hatay Müzesi'ndeki bir Grup Cam Eser", I. Uluslararası Anadolu Cam Sanatı Sempozyumu 26-27 Nisan 1988 / 1st International Anatolia Glass Symposium 26-27 April 1988 (1990) 30-36.

Yağcı 1999 E. E. Yağcı, "Kilikya'da Cam", Olba II, 1999, 169-183.

Özet

Erken Bizans Dönemi'nden Kesme Tekniğinde Bir Cam Kâse

Mersin-Silifke yolu üzerinde yer alan Ayaş-Kumkuyu'daki Elaiussa Sebaste antik yerleşimi, Dağlık Kilikya Bölgesi içinde yer alan liman kentlerinden biridir. 2011 kazı sezonunda, sarayın kuzey doğusunda, olasılıkla saraya giriş kapılarından birinin olduğu alan üzerine yoğunlaşılmış ve bu alanda yapılan kazılar sonucunda, 530'larda yapıda gerçekleşen tahribata dair izlerle karşılaşılmıştır. Tahribatı gösteren katmanda ele geçen mavimsi renksiz camdan 13 parça birleştirildiğinde çapı 15.7 cm. olan yarım daire biçiminde, ağzı kesilmiş ve işlenmemiş bir kâse ortaya çıkmıştır. Eldeki parçalarla, kâsenin yarısına yakın kısmı tamamlanabilmiş ve kâsenin dış yüzünde, kesme tekniği ile yapılmış figüratif bir kompozisyonun yer aldığı tespit edilmiştir.

530'lara tarihlendirilmiş kapalı konteksten gelen Elaiussa kâsesi, Doğu Akdeniz cam teknolojisi için teknik ve kompozisyon açısından ender bir örneği oluşturur. Kâse üzerinde betimlenen, kucağında Çocuk İsa ile birlikte tahtta oturan Meryem ikonografisi, erken Hıristiyanlık döneminden itibaren İsa'nın çocukluk dönemi öykülerinden biri olan "Kahinlerin Tapınması" sahnelerinde yer alır. Meryem ve Çocuk İsa'nın betimleniş biçimi ve ikonografik özellikleri nedeniyle, Kahinlerin Tapınması olduğunu düşündüğümüz sahnenin solunda görülen mimari yapı, olasılıkla İsa'nın doğum yerini işaret eden Beytüllahim'deki Doğum kilisesi olmalıdır.

Elaiussa kâsesinin üzerindeki betim belki de kabın işlevi için bize ipuçları sunabilecek en önemli verilerden biridir. Kahinlerin Tapınması olabileceğini öngördüğümüz sahne Bizans için özellikle de erken yüzyıllardan itibaren hem gömü betimlerinde hem de hacılık objeleri üzerinde tercih edilen bir konu olmuştur. 6. yy.'da ayinlerde okunan Romanos Kontakionu'nun bir bölümünde sözü edildiği gibi Kahinlerin Tapınması öyküsü inananlar için bir örnek niteliğinde idi. Öykünün hediye sunma yanı, inananlar için öykünme konusu olmuş, imparator ve varlıklı kimselerce sipariş edilen eserlerde betimlenmiştir. Öyle görünüyor ki Bizans'ın varlıklı patronları ve imparatorları Çocuk İsa'ya hediyeler sunan Kahinler gibi kendilerini hediye vericiler olarak kabul ediyorlardı. Bu nedenle, Elaiussa Sebaste'nin erken Bizans sarayında ele geçen kâse, olasılıkla kentin yöneticisi tarafından sipariş edilen ya da ona hediye olarak gelen bir eser olmalıdır.

Bugüne kadar yapılmış Doğu Akdeniz antik cam yayınlarına bakıldığında, Elaiussa Sebaste'de bulunmuş figüratif kesme bezemeli kâsenin benzeri ya da yakın benzeriyle karşılaşılmamaktadır. Bunun yanı sıra, Batı örnekleriyle de durum çok farklı değildir. Hem kesim tekniği hem de kompozisyon olarak hiçbir örneği bulunmadığı için nerede üretilmiş olabileceği üzerine sadece öneriler getirmek mümkündür.

Kilikya Bölgesi'nin erken Bizans Dönemi için dini ve siyasi açıdan öne çıkan Tarsus, Antakya ve Silifke gibi kentlerinde cam üretimine ve cam tipolojisine dair çalışmaların az sayıda olması da Elaiussa kâsesinin değerlendirilmesinde boşluklar oluşturur. Kentin erken Bizans Dönemi ticaretini anlayabilmek için seramik buluntularına bakıldığında, Doğu Akdeniz (özellikle Filistin, Kıbrıs, Kuzey Afrika) ve Ege Bölgesi ile ticari ilişkilerinin süreklilik gösterdiği dikkat çeker. Buna dayanarak, cam kâsenin sözü edilen bu bölgelerin birinden gelmiş olma olasılığını göz önüne alabiliriz.





Fig. 3 Terracotta pilgrim's token (http://www.britishmuseum.org/research/collection_online/collection_object_details.aspx?objectId=62931&partId=1, Access date: 30.12.2013).



Fig. 4 Terracotta pilgrim's token (http://www.metmuseum.org/exhibitions/view?exhibitionId= %7b60853040-AE7E-4162-8FA7-525505D6B633%7d&oid= 477460&pg=1&rpp=100&pos=73&ft=*, Access date: 30.12.2013).