



Determination of aflatoxin M1 levels by elisa method in örgü (Knitted) cheese produced by traditional methods in Diyarbakır, Turkey

Diyarbakır'da geleneksel yöntemlerle üretilen örgü peynirlerinde aflatoksin M1 düzeylerinin elisa metodu ile belirlenmesi

Omer Faruk YESİL^{1,*} , Abdulkerim HATIPOGLU² , Aydın VURAL³ , Mehmet Emin ERKAN³ , Abdunnasir YILDIZ⁴ 

¹Department of Food Processing, Diyarbakır Agricultural Vocational High School, Dicle University, PO box TR-21280, Diyarbakır, Turkey.

²Department of Nutrition and Dietetics, Faculty of Health Sciences, Mardin Artuklu University, PO box TR-47200, Mardin, Turkey.

³Department of Food and Nutrition Hygiene, Faculty of Veterinary Medicine, Dicle University, PO box TR-21280, Diyarbakır, Turkey

⁴Department of Biology, Faculty of Science, Dicle University, PO box TR-21280, Diyarbakır, Turkey

MAKALE BİLGİSİ

Geliş Tarihi: 13.05.2019
Kabul Tarihi: 23.09.2019
Elektronik Yayın Tarihi: 25.09.2019
Basım: 27.09.2019

ABSTRACT

In this study, the contamination levels of Aflatoxin M1 were determined on 184 Diyarbakır Örgü Cheese (DÖC) samples between May and December 2013 were taken from randomly selected markets of Diyarbakır centrum by ELISA method. Since there is only one study about the presence of AFM1 in DÖC, the results were mostly compared with other types of cheese. On the other hand, results of the study were compared with the European Commission's AFM1 level. The average AFM1 values of the samples were determined as 167.58 ng/kg. The minimum and maximum AFM1 values were detected as 50 and 800 ng/kg, respectively. The number of samples exceeding the limit specified for AFM1 in the European Commission are 32 (17.39%) samples. AFM1 contamination levels of 53 (28.80%), 73 (39.67%) and in 26 (14.13%) samples were determined as 51-250 ng/kg, 51-150 ng/kg and 0-50 ng/kg, respectively. The results of the analysis show that the AFM1 levels of the DÖC offered for sale at different points in Diyarbakır have a potential risk for consumers.

Keywords: Diyarbakır Örgü Cheese, knitted, ELISA, AFM1.

ÖZ

Bu çalışmada, 2013 yılı Mayıs ve Aralık ayları arasında Diyarbakır merkez pazarlarından rastgele seçilmiş olan 184 Diyarbakır örgü peyniri örneklerinin aflatoksin M1 kontaminasyon seviyeleri Elisa yöntemi ile araştırılmıştır. Diyarbakır Örgü Peyniri'nde AFM1 varlığı ile ilgili tek bir çalışma olduğundan, sonuçlar çoğunlukla diğer peynir türleriyle karşılaştırıldı. Öte yandan, çalışmanın sonuçları Avrupa Komisyonu'nun AFM1 düzeyi ile karşılaştırıldı. Örneklerin ortalama AFM1 değerleri 167.58 ng / kg olarak belirlenmiştir. Minimum ve maksimum AFM1 değerleri sırasıyla 50 ve 800 ng / kg olarak tespit edildi. Avrupa Komisyonunda AFM1 için belirlenen sınırı aşan örnek sayısı 32 (% 17.39)' dir. AFM1 kontaminasyon seviyeleri; 53 (% 28.80), 73 (% 39.67) ve 26 (% 14.13) numunede sırasıyla 51-250 ng / kg, 51-150 ng / kg ve 0-50 ng / kg olarak belirlenmiştir. Analiz sonuçları, Diyarbakır'da farklı noktalarda satışa sunulan Diyarbakır Örgü Peynirinin AFM1 seviyelerinin tüketiciler için potansiyel bir risk taşıdığını göstermektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Diyarbakır Örgü Peyniri, örgü, ELISA, AFM1.

1. INTRODUCTION

Presence of aflatoxins is one of the major food safety concerns in tropical and subtropical countries [1]. *Aspergillus*, *Fusarium*, *Penicillium* and *Alternaria* species produce mycotoxins called zearalenone, ochratoxins, verotoxins, patulin, trichothecene, fumonisin and aflatoxins in animal feed and food under suitable climatic conditions. Aflatoxins among mycotoxins are toxic, mutagenic, teratogenic, immunosuppressive compounds for human and animals [2-7]. They cause especially on skin diseases and liver disorders [6].

Aflatoxins can be produced by *Aspergillus flavus*, *Aspergillus parasiticus* and rarely by *Aspergillus nomius*. *Aspergillus flavus* produces only B aflatoxins, while the other two species produce both B and G aflatoxins. Aflatoxin M1 (AFM1) and M2 (AFM2) are the hydroxylate metabolites of Aflatoxin B1 (AFB1) and B2 (AFB2) (22; 31). The mammals which digest AFB1-contaminating diet convert AFB1 to AFM1 known as "milk toxin" [7].

AFM1 is mainly soluble in the aqueous phase of milk or adsorbed to casein particles; a small ratio of AFM1 in milk is carried-over to cream. The remainder of AFM1 in milk, however, remains in skim milk and buttermilk (8). In other words, the stability of AFM1 determines its persistence in foodstuffs such as butter, yogurt, cheese, cream and ice cream. However, this toxin is not inactivated by the thermal processing (pasteurization and ultra-high-temperature (UHT) treatment) used in the dairy industry [9].

Human exposure to AFM1 is due to the consumption of contaminated milk and dairy products of which daily intake could be highly variable in the world. Infants represent the most susceptible exposed population due to their high consumption of dairy products either as animal's milk and related by-products in their diet or from breast milk where the mycotoxin can be excreted (10). The Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives reported that the intake of AFM1 from milk was 6.8 ng/person/day for the European diet, 0.7 ng/person/day for the Middle Eastern diet, 12 ng/person/day for the Far Eastern diet, 3.5 ng/person/day for the Latin American diet and 0.1 ng/person/day for the African diet [11]. Therefore, many countries have set legal regulations to control aflatoxin M1 level in milk and dairy products.

In this study, AFM1 contamination levels of DÖC were determined. DÖC, which is a traditional Anatolian cheese, is produced mostly in the Karacadag Basin situated in the South of the province of Diyarbakır. Due to the small arable areas of the basin and the presence of large meadow-pasture areas, animal husbandry,

especially sheep farming, is carried out in general [12]. DÖC is widely consumed in Diyarbakır and surrounding provinces, and is sold just above the cost in markets in cities such as Istanbul, Ankara and İzmir. The production process of DÖC is similar to that of pasta-filata cheeses such as Mozzarella, Caciocavallo and Povola dei Nebrodi. Additionally, it has been received Protected Denomination of Origin certificate (certificate of geographical origin) since 2010.

The results of the study were compared with the European Commission's AFM1 level [13].

2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

2.1. Collecting of samples

In this study, 184 traditional DÖC samples (each sample about 250 g) between May and December 2013 were taken to sterile sampling bags from randomly selected markets of Diyarbakır centrum. By the sampling procedure, attention was paid to collect different brands and lots. The samples were delivered to the laboratory by preserving the cold chain.

2.2. Preparation of the samples

It was conducted according to the method reported by Ardic et al. (2009) [14]. 40 mL of dichloromethane was added to 2 g of DÖC, which had been thoroughly shredded and crushed into a stomacher bag, and homogenized on a stomacher for 2 minutes. After the obtained suspension was filtered, 10 mL of the extract was taken and evaporated at 60 °C. The residue, with the addition of 0.5 mL of methanol, 0.5 mL of PBS buffer and 1 mL of heptane, was centrifuged at 2700 rpm for 15 min (15 °C). One-hundred microliters of this aliquot brought up to a 10% methanol content by addition of 400 µL Ridascreen buffer 1 and 100 µL was used per well in the test.

2.3. Aflatoxin M1 test procedure

100 µL of the prepared sample and the standards were incubated for 60 minutes. Plates were washed 2 times in the automatic washer, then 100 µL of enzyme conjugate was added and incubated for 60 minutes in room temperature. After 3 washes in the automatic washer, 100 µL of substrate/chromogen was added to each well, thoroughly mixed, and incubated for 30 minutes in the dark at room temperature. After adding 100 µL stock solution to each well, it was thoroughly mixed and read at 450 nm with a packet program. Dilution factor was accepted as "10" for cheese samples.

2.4. Determination of the presence of Aflatoxin M1 by ELISA method

The presence of aflatoxin M1 was determined by the ELISA method using Ridascreen® Aflatoxin M1 Art. No. ELX 50 Automatic Microplate Washer and ELX 800 Microplate Reader (Bio-Tek Instruments,

Winooski, VT, USA) devices with the ELISA test kit R1101 (RBiopharm AG, Darmstadt, Germany). The results were evaluated in the RIDAWIN Package Program (RIDA@SOFT Win, RBiopharm AG, Darmstadt, Germany).

2.5. Statistical analysis

The results were analyzed by SPSS statistical program for Windows developed by IBM (IBM® SPSS® Statistics Version 21). Results were expressed as mean and also as minimum and maximum concentration of AFM1.

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Table 1. Different range distribution of Aflatoxin M₁ contents in DÖC samples.

Aflatoxin M ₁ Level (ng/kg)	The Number of Samples (n=184)	AFM ₁ Detected Sample
	<u>n</u>	<u>%</u>
ND ^a <50	26	14.13
51-150	73	39.67
151-250	53	28.80
250<	32	17.39

ND: Not detected (Aflatoxin M1 level less than 50 ng/kg).

Table 2. Aflatoxin M₁ levels in DÖC samples.

The Number of Samples			Concentration (ng/kg)			
Positive	Negative	Exceeding the Acceptance Limit ^b	Total Sample Mean <u>±SEM</u>	Positive Sample Mean <u>±SEM</u>	Min.	Max.
158 ^a (%85.87)	26 ^a (%14.13)	32(%17.39)	164.73 _{±18.2}	183.61 _{±24.3}	51.73	800

^a: The number of samples.

^b: European Commission limit (250 ng/kg).

Since there is only one study (15) about the presence of AFM1 in DÖC, the results were mostly compared with other types of cheese.

Some researchers could not detect the presence of AFM1 in their studies on the Beyaz, Tulum, and Cheddar cheese samples (16-18). On the other hand, different researchers determined AFM1 contamination level was over 650 ng/kg as well as below 50 ng/kg in the Beyaz, Kashar, Tulum and Cream cheese (2; 19; 20). In this study, the AFM1 contamination rate (85.87%) in DÖC was higher than the results obtained in many studies about Beyaz, Cream, Kashar, Tulum, Civil, Lor, Halloumi and Feta cheese (2; 16; 19-26). On the other hand, was determined lower the values of Beyaz (100%) reported by (27) and the values of cream cheese (99%) reported by (28).

Many investigators reported that AFM1 contamination rates exceeding the European Commission tolerance limit (250 ng/kg) in DÖC, Beyaz, Kashar and Cream cheese samples were 14%; 10%, 12%, 20%, 21%, 27%, 28%; 30%, 33%, 34%; 10%, 17%, 19%, respectively (2; 15; 18; 21- 23; 29). On the other hand, other researchers determined that AFM1

The cheese samples AFM1 values are presented in Table 1 and Table 2. According to the results, AFM1 was detected in 158 samples of 184 (85.87%). The average AFM1 value was 164.73 ng/kg; the minimum and maximum values were determined as 51.73 ng/kg and 800 ng/kg. 17.39% of the samples (32 samples), were found to exceed the limit for AFM1 (250 ng/kg) of the European Commission (13). 28.80% of the samples (53 samples) AFM1 values were between 151-250 ng/kg. 39.67% of the samples (73 samples) were between 51-150 ng/kg and 14.13% of the samples (26 samples) were between 0-50 ng/kg.

concentration was less than 250 ng/kg in cheese samples including the Kashar, Beyaz, Tulum, Civil and Lor cheese (25; 28; 30). In our study, the number of samples exceeding the maximum values (250 ng/kg) accepted by the European Commission (17.39%) is lower than the values reported by (2; 18; 29; 31); whereas higher than the values reported by (23).

As seen above, the contamination levels of cheese by AFM1 vary from one study to another. This variability can be explained by different factors: cheese-making procedures, conditions of cheese ripening, type of cheese studied, geographical region, analysis methods and degree of milk contamination according to seasonal changes (26; 32-36).

4. CONCLUSION

Analysis results show that AFM1 levels of DÖC are a potential risk for consumers. It is especially important to keep humidity and temperature levels (temperature <12 °C or > 42 °C, humidity <80%) under control in storage areas of animal feed (especially silage), from where raw milk/cheese to prevent the risk (12; 37; 38). Feed storage has to be designed

appropriately. On the other hand, can be suggested the establishment of sustainable modern milk production farms. Moreover, training of feed and cheese producers/employees should be required in terms of hygiene and sanitation rules during their production. As the last sentence, consumers' awareness about this issue should be enhanced.

5. AKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The research is financed by Scientific Research Project Coordinatorship of Dicle University (Project No: DUBAP-12-MYO-73).

6. REFERENCES

- [1] Skrbic, B., Antic, I., Zivancev, J. (2015). Presence of aflatoxin M1 in white and hard cheese samples from Serbia. *Food Control*, 50, 111-117.
- [2] Fallah, A., Jafari, T., Fallah, A., Rahnama, M. (2009). Determination of aflatoxin M1 levels in Iranian White and cream cheese. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 47, 1872-1875.
- [3] Herrman, T. (2002). Mycotoxins in Feed Grains and Ingredients, Feed Manufacturing. Kansas State University MF-2061, Kansas, 1-3.
- [4] Soyoz, M., Ozcelik, N. (2002). Toxic Effects and Elimination of Ochratoxin A. *T. Klin. J. Med. Sci.*, 22, 421.
- [5] Tanker, M., Soner, O., Sahin, A.A., Kaya, S., Dulger, G., Ersoy, O., Omurtag, G., Yurdun, T. (1995). Aflatoxins and Hazards of Aflatoxins That May Be Caused By Foods On Our Health. *Pharmacists Journal*, 4,16.
- [6] Peña-Rodas, O., Martinez-Lopez, R., Hernandez-Rauda, R. (2018). Occurrence of Aflatoxin M1 in cow milk in El Salvador: Results from a twoyear survey. *Toxicology Reports*, 5, 671-678.
- [7] Durakovic, L., Mrkonjic, F.M., Skelin, A., Durakovic, S., Redzepovic, S. (2012). Incidence of aflatoxin M1 in milk used for the production of Istrian cheese. The 47th Croatian and 7th International Symposium on Agriculture, Opatija, Croatia, pp. 679-683.
- [8] Atasever, M.A., Atasever, M., Özturan, K., Urcar, S. (2010). Determination of Aflatoxin M1 Level in Butter Samples Consumed in Erzurum, Turkey. *The Journal of Kafkas Univ.Vet.Fac.*, 16(Suppl-A), 159-162.
- [9] Aksoy, A., Atmaca, E., Yazıcı, F., Güvenç, D., Gül, O., Dervişoğlu, M. (2016). Comparative Analysis of Aflatoxin M1 in Marketed Butter by ELISA and HPLC. *The Journal of Kafkas Univ. Vet. Fac.*, 22(4), 619-621.
- [10] Langat, G., Tetsuhiro, M., Gonoi, T., Matiru, V., Bii, C. (2016). Aflatoxin M1 Contamination of Milk and Its Products in Bomet County, Kenya. *Advances in Microbiology*, 6, 528-536.
- [11] Anonymous (2001). Fifty-Sixth Meeting of the Joint FAO/WHO Expert Committee on Food Additives. Safety Evaluation of Certain Mycotoxins in Food. Food Additive Series, World Health Organization, Geneva, 47.
- [12] Hatipoglu, A., Celik, S. (2012). Traditional Cheeses Produced in Karacadag Basin in Diyarbakır Province and the Problems Encountered. 3rd Traditional Food Symposium Book, 10-12 May, Konya, pp. 89-92.
- [13] Anonymous. (2010). Setting maximum levels for certain contaminants in foodstuffs As Regards Aflatoxins. European Commission (EC) Regulation: Commission Regulation No. 165/2010 of 26 February 2010. Amending Regulation (EC) No. 1881/2006. Official Journal European Union L 50/8.
- [14] Ardic, M., Karakaya, Y., Atasever, M., Adiguzel, G., (2009). Aflatoxin M1 levels of Turkish Brined cheese. *Food Control*, 20, 196-199.
- [15] Erkan, M E., Vural, A., Guran, H.S. (2009). Searching the presence of Aflatoxin M1 and verotoxin 1 and 2 in Diyarbakır örgü cheese. *The Journal of Dicle University Veterinary Faculty*, 1 (1), 19-25.
- [16] Demirer, M.A. (1973). Research on Aflatoxin M1 and B1 in Milk and Dairy Products. *The Journal of Ankara University Veterinary Faculty*, 36, 85-107.
- [17] Gurbuz, U., Nizamlioglu, M., Nizamlioglu, F., Dinc, I., Ogruer, Y. (1999). Searching for Aflatoxin B1 and M1 in Some Meat, Dairy Products and Spices. *Veterinariam*, 10(1), 34-41.
- [18] Kirecci, E., Savasci, M., Ayyildiz, A. (2007). Determination of the presence of aflatoxin M1 in milk and cheese products consumed in Sarikamis. *Turkish Journal of Infection*, 21(2), 93-96.
- [19] Hampikyan, H., Bingol, E.B., Ceti,n O., Colak, H. (2010). Determination of Aflatoxin Levels in Turkish Beyaz, Kaşar and Tulum Cheeses. *Journal of Food, Agriculture & Environment*, 8(1), 13-15.
- [20] Mohamadi, H., Alizahed, M., Rahimi, J., Qasri, S., (2010). Assessment of aflatoxin M1 levels in selected dairy products in North-western Iran. *International Journal of Dairy Technology*, 63(2), 262-265.
- [21] Aksoy, A., Yavuz, O., Guvenc, D., Das, Y.K., Terzi, G., Celik, S. (2010). Determination of Aflatoxin Levels in Raw Milk, Cheese And Dehulled Hazelnut Samples Consumed in Samsun Province, Turkey, *The Journal of Kafkas University Veterinary Faculty*, 16(Suppl-A), 13-16.

- [22] Atasever, M.A, Adiguzel, G., Atasever, M., Ozturan, K. (2010). Determination of Aflatoxin M1 Levels in Some Cheese Types Consumed in Erzurum, Turkey. *The Journal of Kafkas University Veterinary Faculty*, 16(Suppl-A): 87-91.
- [23] Filazi, A., Ince, S., Temamogullari, F. (2010). Survey of the occurrence of aflatoxin M1 in cheeses produced by dairy ewe's milk in Urfa city, Turkey. *The Journal of Ankara University Veterinary Faculty*, 57, 197-199.
- [24] Gurses, M., Erdogan, A., Cetin, B. (2004). Occurrence of Aflatoxin M1 in Some Cheese Types Sold in Enzurum, Turkey. *Turk Journal Veterinary Animal Science*, 28, 527-530.
- [25] Ozturk, B., Celik, F., Celik, Y., Kabaran, S., Ziver, T. (2014). To Determine the Occurrence of Aflatoxin M1 (AFM1) in Samples of Cyprus Traditional Cheese (Halloumi): A Cross-Sectional Study. *Kafkas University The Journal of Veterinary Faculty*, 20(5), 773-778.
- [26] Pitter, A. (1998). Natural Occurrence Of Mycotoxins in Foods and Feeds an Updated Review. *Revue de Medicine Veterinaire*, 149(6), 479-492.
- [27] Alkan, Y., Gonulalan, Z. (2006). A study on aflatoxin M1 moisture and acidity values in Beyaz cheeses offered for sale in Amasya. *Journal of Health Sciences*, 15(2), 91-98.
- [28] Tekinsen, K.K., Ucar, G. (2008). Aflatoxin M1 levels in butter and cream cheese consumed in Turkey. *Food Control*, 19, 27-30.
- [29] Dincoglu, A.H., Gonulalan, Z., Kok, H. (2012). Determination of Aflatoxin M1 Levels in Cheese Sold in İzmit Province., e-Journal of New World Sciences Academy, *NWSA -Veterinary Sciences*, 3B0019, 7(1), 1-6.
- [30] Yurt, B., Ulucay, B. (2016). Determination of Some Chemical Properties and Aflatoxin M1 of Raw Cow Milk Produced on Iğdir and Region. *International Conference on Natural Science and Engineering (ICNASE'16)*, March 19-20, Kilis, pp. 3624-3635.
- [31] Gunsen, U., Buyukyoruk, I. (2003). Determination of bacteriological quality and AFM1 levels of fresh Kashar cheese supplied from the market. *Turk Journal Veterinary Animal Science*, 27, 821-825.
- [32] Barrios, M.J., Gualda, M.J., Cabanas, J.M., Medina, L.M., Jordano, R. (1996). Occurrence of aflatoxin M1 in cheeses from the South of Spain. *Journal of Food Protection*, 59, 898-900.
- [33] Blanco, J.L., Dominguez, L., Gomez, L.E., Garayzabal, J.F.F., Goyache, J., Suarez, G. (1988). Behaviour of aflatoxin during manufacture, ripening and storage of Manchego type cheese. *Journal of Food Science*, 53, 1373-1376.
- [34] Galvano, F., Galofaro, V., Galvano, G. (1996). Occurrence and stability of aflatoxin M1 in milk and milk products: a world wide review. *Journal of Food Protection*, 59(10), 1079-1090.
- [35] Kamkar, A., Karim, G., Shojaee Aliabadi, F., Khaksar, R. (2008). Fate of aflatoxin M1 in Iranian Beyaz cheese Manchego type cheese processing. *Food and Chemical Toxicology*, 46(6), 2236-2238.
- [36] Tavakoli, H.R., Riazipour, M., Kamkar, A., Shaldehi, H.R., Nejad, A.S.M. (2012). Occurrence of aflatoxin M-1 in Beyaz cheese samples from Tehran, Iran. *Food Control*, 23(1), 293-295.
- [37] Cassel, E.K., Campbell, B., Draper, M., Epperson, B. (2001). Aflatoxins, Hazards in Grain / Aflatoxicosis and Livestock. South Dakota State University, Open PRAIRIE: Open Public Research Access Institutional, FS 907. South Dakota, USA.
- [38] Demirel, M., Yildirim, A. (2000). Determination of Aflatoxin Level of Roughage Stored in Farm Conditions in Van District. *Yuzuncu Yil University Journal Agriculture Science*, 10(1), 77-83.