

Seleucia

Sayı VI -2016



Olba Kazısı Serisi

Seleucia VI

Olba Kazısı Serisi

Olba Kazısı Serisi
Seleucia VI

Seleucia, uluslararası hakemli dergidir ve her yıl Mayıs ayında bir sayı olarak basılır. Yollanan çalışmalar, giriş sayfalarında belirtilen yazım kurallarına uygunsa yayınlanır, çalışması yayınlanan her yazar, çalışmanın baskı olarak yayınlanmasını kabul etmiş ve telif haklarını *Seleucia* yayınına devretmiş sayılır. *Seleucia* kopya edilemez ancak dipnot referans gösterilerek yayınlarda kullanılabilir.

Seleucia, uluslararası hakemli dergidir ve her yıl Mayıs ayında bir sayı olarak basılır. Yollanan çalışmalar, 7. sayfada belirtilen yazım kurallarına uygunsa yayınlanır, çalışması yayınlanan her yazar, çalışmanın baskı olarak yayınlanmasını kabul etmiş ve telif haklarını *Seleucia* yayımına devretmiş sayılır. *Seleucia* kopya edilemez ancak dipnot referans gösterilerek yayınlarda kullanılabilir.

Editörler

Emel Erten
Diane Favro
Murat Özyıldırım
Tuna Akçay

Bilim Kurulu

Prof. Dr. Salim Aydın
Prof. Dr. Halit Çal
Prof. Dr. Çiğdem Dürüşken
Prof. Dr. Efrumiye Ertekin
Prof. Dr. Emel Erten
Prof. Dr. Diane Favro
Prof. Dr. Turhan Kaçar
Prof. Dr. Gülgün Köroğlu
Prof. Dr. Erendiz Özbay
Prof. Dr. Aygül Süel
Prof. Dr. Harun Taşkiran
Prof. Dr. Fikret K. Yegül
Doç. Dr. Sedef Çokay-Kepece
Doç. Dr. Sema Sandalcı
Doç. Dr. Hacer Sibel Ünal
Doç. Dr. Mehmet Fatih Yavuz
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Figen Çevirici-Coşkun
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Merih Ereke
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Deniz Kaplan
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Fikret Özbay
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Hüseyin Murat Özgen
Yrd. Doç. Dr. Muammer Ulutürk
Öğr. Gör. Dr. Tuna Akçay
Dr. Vujadin Ivanisevic

Seleucia
Olba Kazısı Serisi VI
Sayı: 6

ISSN: 2148-4120

Kapak Tasarım

Tuna Akçay

Yazışma Adresi

Okt. Murat Özyıldırım
Mersin Üniversitesi Fen - Edebiyat Fakültesi
Arkeoloji Bölümü, Çiftlikköy Kampüsü, 33343,
Mersin - Türkiye
Tel: 00 90 324 361 00 01 - 4735
E – posta: muratozyildirim@mersin.edu.tr

Adres

Homer Kitabevi ve Yayıncılık Ltd. Şti.
Yeni Çarşı Caddesi, No: 12/A
Galatasaray, Beyoğlu, 34433, İstanbul
Tel: 0212 249 59 02
www.homerbooks.com
e-mail: homer@homerbooks.com

Baskı

Altan Basım San ve Tic. Ltd. Şti.
Yüzyıl Mah. Matbaacılar Sitesi No: 222
Bağcılar/İstanbul
Sertifika No: 11968

Dağıtım

Homer Kitabevi ve Yayıncılık Ltd. Şti.
Yeni Çarşı Caddesi, No: 12/A
Galatasaray, Beyoğlu, 34433, İstanbul
Tel: 0212 249 59 02

Seleucia | Sayı 6 | Mayıs 2016

The Question of Romanization – To Be or not To Be (Roman): An Introductory Study

Romalılaşma Sorunu - (Roma) Olmak ya da Olmamak: Bir Ön Değerlendirme

Fikret K. Yegül

11

Olba'da Kremasyon

Cremation Burials in Olba

Tuna Akçay

21

Yelten Asklepiosu

Asclepius of Yelten

Ünal Demirer - Ahmet Yaraş

45

Olba 2015 Kazılarında Yeni Bir Buluntu:

Roma Mozaïği

A New Discovery from Olba Excavations: The Roman Mosaic

Emel Erten

61

Edirne Müzesi'nden Figürlü Madalyona

Sahip Cam Kulp

Glass Handle with Figured Medallion from

Edirne Museum

Emre Taştemiş

93

Olba: Tapınak Devletinden Şehir

Devletine

Olba; From Priest State to City State

Mustafa H. Sayar

107

Olba'da Yahudi Varlığının Kanıtı: Menorah

Kabartmalı Sunak

Evidence of Jewish Presence in Olba: Altar with

Carved Menorah

Murat Özyıldırım

119

Olba Kazısında Ele Geçen Erken Bizans Dönemine Ait Bir Tılsım

An Amulet of Early Byzantine Period from Olba Excavations

Gülgün Köroğlu

137

Kuva-yi Milliye Müzesi'nde Yer Alan

Artuklu Beyliği'ne Ait Figür Tasvirli

Sikkeler

Figural Coins of the Artuqids from Kuva-yi

Milliye Museum/Balıkesir

Ceren Ünal - Betül Teoman

161

Olba Manastırı 2015 Yılı Kazıları

ve Kuzey Kilisesi'ndeki Çalışmaların

Değerlendirilmesi

2015 Excavations at Olba Monastery and

the Evaluation of the Fieldwork at the North Church

Murat Özyıldırım

181

Olba Manastırı'nda İşlik Kazısı ve

Sonuçların Değerlendirilmesi

The Excavations at the Workshop in Olba

Monastery and its Results

Yavuz Yeğin

203

Kurul Kalesi (Ordu) VI. Mithradates

Dönemi Yerleşimi Üzerine Ön

Değerlendirmeler

Kurul Castle (Ordu) Preliminary Assessment on

the Mithradates VI Period Settlement

S. Yücel Şenyurt - Atakan Akçay

221

Klazomenai Buluntusu Pişmiş Toprak

"Oturan Kadın" Figürinlerine İlişkin

Düşünceler

Considerations on the "Seated Woman" Terracotta

Figurines from Klazomenai

Aslıhan Özbay

249

Doğu Dağlık Cilicia Mezarları, Olba'dan
Yeni Mezar Tipleri ve Terminoloji
Önerileri
*Tombs in Eastern Rough Cilicia, New Burial
Types from Olba and Suggestions of Terminology*
Tuna Akçay - Burak Erdem
261

Ziyaret Tepe Kalesi ve Nekropolisi'nden
Küçük Arkeolojik Buluntular
*Small Archaeological Finds from Ziyaret Tepe
Castle and Necropolis*
Akın Bingöl
287

Kars-Anı'de Tespit Edilen Savunma
Sistemleri Üzerine Öneriler
*Suggestions on Defense Systems Identified in
Anı, Kars*
Ayhan Yardımcıel
301

Cıngırt Kayası Erken Bizans Dönemi Cam
Buluntuları
*Early Byzantine Glass Findings from Cıngırt
Kayası*
Ayşe Fatma Erol - Deniz Tamer
319

Mersin Deniz Müzesi'nden Osmanlı
Çeşmesine Ait Taş Tekne
*Ottoman Stone Basin from the Naval Museum
of Mersin*
Candan Ülkü
361

Mersin Olba Antik Kenti - Zooarkeoloji
Çalışmaları
Zooarchaeological Research in Mersin Olba
Okşan Başoğlu
381

Olba Tuğla Örneği: Arkeolojik ve
Arkeometrik Yaklaşım
*Olba Brick Samples: Archaeological and
Archaeometric Approaches*
Murat Özyıldırım - Ali Akın Akyol
395

Olba Kazısı Seramik Buluntuları
Arkeometrik Analizleri
*Archaeometric Analysis of Ceramic Finds from
Olba Excavations*
Ali Akın Akyol - Mahmut Aydın
413

Kitap Tanıtımı Book Review

İnanca Yolculuk Mersin
Ahmet Emirhan Bulut
433

Arkeolojik Veriler Işığında Türkiye'nin En
Eski Kültürleri
Yavuz Yeğin
439

Geçmişten Günümüze Bir Geçit Zeugma
Emel Erten
443

Bizans Sikkelerinde Kutsal Kişi Tasvirleri
Murat Özyıldırım
447

Milas Yazıtları Rehberi
Hüseyin Üreten
451

PRAEFATIO

Seleucia dergisinin altıncı sayısını (2016) sizlere sunmaktan gurur duyuyoruz. Her geçen gün dergimize gösterilen ilginin artışından dolayı teşekkürlerimizi sunarız.

Olba kazılarını 2015 dönemi çalışmaları bizim için heyecanlı geçti. Sezonun ödülü hiç beklemediğimiz bir yerde ve hiç beklemediğimiz bir anda ortaya çıktı. Bu, manastır kazıları sırasında açığa çıkartılan ve daha erken tarihli bir Roma yapısına ait olan Roma mozağıydı. Önce genç bir hanım görünümüyle Tryphe (lüksün personifikasyonu), sonra genç adam Bios (yaşamın personifikasyonu), son olarak da ilk banyoyu temsil eden bir diğer genç hanım görüldü. Onları biri lir, ikincisi çifte aulos çalan, üçüncüsü de kavalıklarda köpeğiyle koşan eroslar izlediler. Bu mozaik taban Olba'da Severuslar Dönemi'nde yaşanan lüks yaşamı yansıtmaktaydı.

Mozaik taban ile ilgili olarak yapılan değerlendirme ile birlikte Olba kazılarında elde edilen yeni bulguların yer aldığı çalışmalar ve diğer birçok değerli makale bu sayıda yer almaktadır. Meslektaşlarımıza çalışmalarını bizimle paylaşmaktan çekinmedikleri için şükran borçluyuz. Ayrıca, Homer Kitabevi'nin sahibi Ayşen Boylu'ya ve *Seleucia*'yı yayına hazırlayan Sinan Turan'a da teşekkürlerimizi sunarız.

Editörler:

Prof. Dr. Diane Favro

Prof. Dr. Emel Erten

Okt. Murat Özyıldırım (MA)

Dr. Tuna Akçay

PREFACE

We are proud to present the sixth issue (2016) of *Seleucia* and wish to express our gratitude for the growing interest to our journal.

The 2015 season of Olba excavations was an exciting one. We were awarded with a spectacular find at a very unexpected location and at a very unexpected moment. That was a Roman mosaic pavement belonging to an earlier Roman building discovered during the excavations at the monastery. First appeared Tryphe (as a young lady, personification of luxury), later Bios (as a young man, personification of life) came along. The third figure was the personification of the "first bath" represented by another young lady. They all were followed by erotes, one with a lyre, the other playing double aulos, third running with a dog. The mosaic pavement was a reflection of sumptuous life at Olba during the reign of Severans.

The evaluation of the mosaic pavement along with other recent discoveries from Olba excavations as well as many valuable studies on various topics will be presented in this issue. We appreciate our colleagues for not hesitating to share their works with us. Finally, Ayşen Boylu, owner of Homer Books and Sinan Turan who prepared *Seleucia* for publication deserve special thanks from us.

Editors:

Prof. Dr. Diane Favro

Prof. Dr. Emel Erten

Okt. Murat Özyıldırım (MA)

Dr. Tuna Akçay

Olba Kazısı Serisi

Seleucia

Makale Başvuru Kuralları

Seleucia, Olba Kazısı yayını olarak yılda bir sayı yayınlanır. Yayınlanması istenen makalelerin en geç Şubat ayında gönderilmiş olması gerekmektedir. *Seleucia*, arkeoloji, eski çağ dilleri ve kültürleri, eski çağ tarihi, sanat tarihi konularında yazılan, daha önce yayınlanmayan yalnızca Türkçe, İngilizce çalışmaları ve kitap tanıtımlarını yayınlır.

Yazım Kuralları

Makaleler, Times New Roman yazı karakterinde, word dosyasında, başlık 12 punto, baş harfleri büyük harf, metin 10 punto, dipnot ve kaynakça 9 punto ile yazılmalıdır. Çalışmada ara başlık varsa, bold ve küçük harflerle yazılmalıdır. Türkçe ve İngilizce özetler, makale adının altında 9 punto olarak ve en az iki yüz sözcük ile yazılmalıdır. Özetlerin altında İngilizce ve Türkçe beşer anahtar sözcük, 9 punto olarak “anahtar sözcükler” ve “keywords” başlığının yanında verilmelidir.

- Dipnotlar, her sayfanın altında verilmelidir. Dipnotta yazar soyadı, yayın yılı ve sayfa numarası sıralaması aşağıdaki gibi olmalıdır.
Demiriş 2006, 59.
- Kaynakça, çalışmanın sonunda yer almalı ve dipnottaki kısaltmayı açıklamalıdır.

Kitap için:

Demiriş 2006 Demiriş, B., Roma Yazınında Tarih Yazıcılığı, Ege Yay., İstanbul.

Makale için:

Kaçar 2009 Kaçar, T., “Arius: Bir ‘Sapkın’ın Kısa Hikayesi”, Lucerna Klasik Filoloji Yazıları, İstanbul.

- Makalede kullanılan fotoğraf, resim, harita, çizim, şekil vs. metin içinde yalnızca (Lev. 1), (Lev. 2) kısaltmaları biçiminde “Levha” olarak yazılmalı, makale sonunda “Levhalar” başlığı altında sıralı olarak yazılmalıdır. Bütün levhalar, jpeg ya da tift formatında 300 dpi olmalıdır. Alıntı yapılan levha varsa sorumluluğu yazara aittir ve mutlaka alıntı yeri belirtilmelidir.
- Latince - Yunanca sözcüklerin yazımında özel isimlerde; varsa Türkçe ek virgülle ayrılmalı, örneğin; Augustus’un, cins isimler italik yazılmalı, varsa Türkçe ek, italik yapılmadan sözcüğe bitişik yazılmalıdır, örneğin; *caveanın*.
- Tarih belirtilirken MÖ ve MS nokta kullanılmadan, makale başlıkları ile yazar ad ve soyadlarında sadece baş harfler büyük harf olarak yazılmalıdır.

Olba Excavations Series

Seleucia

Scope

Seleucia is annually published by the Olba Excavations Series. Deadline for sending papers is February of each year. *Seleucia* features previously unpublished studies and book reviews on archaeology, ancient languages and cultures, ancient history and history of art written only in Turkish or English.

Publishing Principles

Articles should be submitted as word documents, with font type Times New Roman, font sizes 12 points for headings (first letters should be capitalized), 10 points for text, and 9 points for footnotes and references. Abstracts written in both Turkish and English should appear below the name of the article, should be of size 9 points and the minimum word count is 200 words. Below the abstracts, a minimum of 5 keywords for both languages should be included (of size 9 points) below the headings “anahtar sözcükler” and “keywords”.

- Footnotes should be given under each page. The ordering of author surname, year of publication and page number should be as follows:
Demiriş 2006, 59.
- The reference list should appear at the end of the study and should explain the abbreviation given in the footnote.

Book format:

Demiriş 2006 Demiriş, B., Roma Yazınında Tarih Yazıcılığı, Ege Yay., İstanbul.

Article format:

Kaçar 2009 Kaçar, T., “Arius: Bir ‘Sapkın’ın Kısa Hikayesi”, Lucerna Klasik Filoloji Yazıları, İstanbul.

- Photographs, pictures, maps, drawings, figures etc. used in the article should be referred to in the text as (Fig. 1), (Fig. 2) as abbreviations, and an ordered list of these items should appear at the end of the article under the heading “Figures”. All figures should be in JPEG or TIFF format with 300 dpi. If there are figures cited, the responsibility lies with the author and citation should be explicitly given.

The Question of Romanization – To Be or not To Be (Roman): An Introductory Study

Fikret K. Yegül*

Abstract

The issue of 'Romanization' has inspired a long, and occasionally controversial, discourse in classical studies. The straightforward dictionary meaning of the word, "making non-Romans Roman" has positive and negative connotations. In a world where we cherish our "differences" we view the eroding of individual, tribal or racial cultures through military conquest, as an undesirable aspect of imperialism. Conversely, there are many instances where the Roman presence has brought the advantages of peace and prosperity to nations and the created opportunities for the masses. In sum, Romanization is a complex process which is hard to define in simple, unilateral, or polarized views. The process and its results were far different in Roman Britain than in Roman Greece or Asia Minor. Geography, history and local tradition mattered. At best, Roman conquest and annexation resulted in a gradual amalgamation of Roman and native traditions—not in a seamless whole—but, a reasonably harmonious coexistence of the conquered and the conqueror with shared benefits and shared pains.

Keywords: Romanization, Roman empire, imperialism, native cultures

Romalılařma Sorunu - (Romalı) Olmak Ya da Olmamak: Bir Ön Deęerlendirme

Öz

Klasik dönemlerle ilgili olarak yapılan çalışmalarda, 'Romalılaşma' kavramı üzerine uzun ve kimi zaman tartışmalı açıklamalar yapılmıştır. Basit anlamıyla,

* Fikret K. Yegül, Professor, Greek and Roman Architecture, University of California, Santa Barbara, CA. 93106, USA. Department of the History of Art and Architecture. E-posta: fyegul@gmail.com.

“Romalı olmayanların Romalılaştırılmaları” diye tanımlanabilen bu sözcüğe pozitif veya negatif açıdan yaklaşabiliriz. Farklılıklarımızı beslediğimiz, el üstünde tuttuğumuz bir dünyada, bireysel, kabileye ait veya etnik kültürlerin askeri fetihler yoluyla eritilmesi ya da tamamen yok edilmesi, emperyalizmin istenmeyen özelliklerinden birisidir. Buna karşılık, Roma varlığı ve idaresi birçok topluma barış ve refah getirmiş, emekçi kitlelerine yeni bir yaşam için imkân oluşturmuştur. Bu imkân çok defa Roma'nın teknolojik ve idari becerisinin paylaşılmasıyla gerçekleşmiştir. Kısacası, Romalılaştırma basit ve kutuplaşmış tanımlamalara sığmayacak kadar çok yönlü ve kompleks bir sosyo-politik yapıdır. Bu gelişim imparatorluğun bütünü içinde, Britanya'da başka, Yunanistan ve Anadolu'da başka türlü olmuştur. Coğrafya ve tarihe dayalı gelenekler fark yaratırlar. En olumlu anlamıyla Romalılaştırma, Roma ve yerli kültürlerin sızdırmaz bir bütünleşmesi değil; makul ve gerçekçi bir uyum ve ortaklaşa gelişen fayda ve zarar çerçevesi içinde birleşmesi, beraber yaşayabilmesidir.

Anahtar Sözcükler: Romalılaştırma, Roma İmparatorluğu, emperyalizm, yerel kültürler.

Few issues in current Roman scholarship proved more engaging and enduring (and occasionally controversial and disruptive) than the discourse on Romanization.¹ The perception of being Roman, or not Roman, in a world that was dominated, or at least administered by the Roman state, is a question of central importance to all aspects of Roman studies in art, architecture, literature, history. The concept not only opens the door for politically relevant discourse on the nature of cultural and national identities, but defines the way we look at art and architecture made by groups with different identities, Romans or others. It seems opportune to add our voice to the chorus here in a generalized and introductory way to offer an overview, although this resourceful subject will continue to be discussed and developed in many historical and regional contexts in future studies, including my own.

A state which ruled from Syria to Scotland, which called the entire Mediterranean its own, and organized and urbanized vast communities of

1 This is the introductory part of a larger study on the subject. As a general, thematic essay based mainly on my own thoughts and ruminations, I prefer not to give specific footnotes, except when I quote a source or give a direct reference, I include it in the text in parenthesis. Instead, I give a fairly wide bibliography on the subject, some of which helped me to formulate my ideas. See, forthcoming book by Yegül and Favro.

The Question of Romanization – To Be or not To Be (Roman): An Introductory Study

peoples of different religion, language and background under its sway in impersonal ways, is bound to attract considerable criticism, both ancient and modern. This is particularly true in our times when our more liberal sensibilities find world empires and colonial practices distasteful and disdainful, although often basing judgement, inappropriately, on nineteenth century models from the great era of Western colonialism. Romanization, or the process of becoming Romanized has positive as well as negative connotations. To take the straightforward dictionary meaning of the word, Romanization is about “making non-Romans Roman,” or subjecting them to the influence of Roman culture and technology. The process is faintly suspect: in a world where we celebrate and cherish our *differences*, the goal of eroding the individual or tribal culture in order to consolidate unity, appears anything from insensitive to oppressive. It becomes all the more so when the attempt of “making Roman” was imposed on a group, as it often was, as a result of military conquest. This was clearly the view expressed by Calgacus, the Briton chieftain, when he lashed out against the Roman armies conquering Britain:

Robbers of the world, now that their universal plunder exhausted the land, they rifle even the sea. If the enemy be rich, they are rapacious; if he be poor, they lust for his country. Neither the East nor the West has been able to satisfy their lust. Alone among mankind they covet with equal glut poverty and riches. To plunder, robbery, slaughter—they misname as empire; they make desolation and call it peace (excerpts from Tacitus, *Agricola* 30).

One can add many more unfortunate and tragic consequences of military conquest and occupation by the expanding Empire—loss of life, property, liberty, identity. Not just the Britons of Britain but also the Marcomanni of Germany, Gauls of France and Belgium, Berbers of Africa, Bedouins of Syria, and nomads of everywhere had their tale of woe to tell—those tales resonate in our childhood memories of the delightful stories of Asterix the Gaul and his brave friends fighting and outsmarting Caesar’s cloddish legions.

There are, however, many stories also that represent Romans in a positive light. Roman conquest and presence often brought the advantages of peace and prosperity to Romans and locals alike. In terms of agriculture, there is hardly a land which did not enjoy substantial increases in productivity under Roman administration as a result of Roman

technological know-how, admittedly, in many cases in cooperation with local traditions. In an atmosphere of expanding economy, hard-work promoted social mobility. Consider the story of an unexceptional native laborer from Mactar (in modern Algeria):

I was born of poor parents. My father had neither money nor his own house. From the day I was born I lived cultivating my land; neither I nor my plot of land had any rest. When harvest time came, I was always the first to lead the gangs of harvesters who came to hire themselves out as far as Cirta, the capital of Numidia. Leaving my home, for twelve years, I toiled in fields under a fiery sun; for eleven years I was the chief harvester of my gang all over the Numidian plains. Thanks to my hard labor, and my thrift, I finally became the master of a house and a well-equipped farm. Today I live comfortably. I have even achieved honors: I was called to sit in the Senate of my city, and even though I was once a modest peasant, I became a municipal censor. I have watched my children and grandchildren grow up around me; my life has been well spent, peaceful, and honored by all. (ILS, no.7457).

This rags-to-riches story of the ‘Mactar Harvester,’ who started his life as a day-laborer and ended it as a member of his local Senate—and proudly inscribed his tale on stone—may be an exception, but underscores what was possible. In Timgad, where an entire semi-nomadic city of local tribes grew around the orderly veteran’s colony, the opportunities were shared by many, while allowing individual choices. In all of the provinces intermarriage between Roman veterans and local aristocracy brought mutual benefits: the advantages of Roman citizenship to the natives and the acceptance into local high society and wealth to the retired soldiers, who often came from unexceptional Italian backgrounds.

It is true that evidence for rapacious soldiers and tax collectors harassing villages is widespread. So is the evidence for the opposite: an unprivileged Jewish widow in Judea (c 130 CE) could seek her rights and ask for justice in a complex legal case by presenting before the Roman judges a maze of documents going back in time half-a-century (known as the Babatha Archives they were found in a cave west of the Dead Sea where Babatha had taken refuge, and died, during the turbulent years of the Bar Kokhba rebellion). As commented by G. Bowersock, “the most striking feature of the evidence is the thorough Roman character of the law which is being applied in this frontier territory of Semitic and

The Question of Romanization – To Be or not To Be (Roman): An Introductory Study

Hellenic traditions (Bowersock 1983, 79; see also Yadin 1962, 239-244; idem, 1971, 222-253). A local governor of Syria would send a letter to a village in the Hauran (volcanic area in southwestern Syria) offering protection against any wrongdoing by marauding soldiers and officials, and encouraging them to stand up for their rights, and exhibit the decree in a public building for all to see.

(From the governor) Julius Saturninus, to those of Phaena, the ‘mother-village’ (*metrocomia*) of Trachon, greetings! If a soldier, or even a civilian, should try by force to secure lodgings in your village, notify me and your right shall be protected. For neither do you owe any contribution to strangers, since you have public guest-houses. Display this communication of mine in a prominent location at your village, so that no one may plead ignorance as an excuse. (*I.G.R.* III, no. 1119; see, also H. I. MacAdam, 1986, 55).

Imposing legal and administrative standards across the land, offering unrestricted access to and equal protection before law—privileges not many are lucky to enjoy in our world, especially in the lands that Babatha and her friends lived—were also what Romanization was about.

Romanization followed a complex scenario involving the play of numerous indigenous and imported sources, a multi-directional *process* of integration, experimentation and exclusion across a large landscape. Especially in the Hellenized provinces of Greece, Asia Minor and the eastern Mediterranean it was far from being a unilateral and deliberate imposition of the culture of the conqueror upon the conquered. Geography mattered. Regarding the city of Sagalassus and the larger Pisidia as a “case study,” M. Waelkens offers a closely observed narrative of how the Roman conquest of this remote region in southern Asia Minor resulted in a gradual but steady amalgamation of Greek and Roman traditions of administration, governance, law and civic structure into—not perhaps a seamless whole—but, a reasonably harmonious integration and coexistence of the willing (Waelkens 2002, 311-368; Yegül 2000, 133-153). As argued by G. Woolf (whose work generally illuminates some of the negative consequences of Roman conquests), Greek identity was founded on common history, origins, language and literary self-definition and reasonably immune to the material world created by Romans; they could “become Roman while staying Greek” (Woolf 1994, 116-143). Staying Greek, they could assimilate and enjoy the material benefits of Roman

rule: the reorganization of land and agriculture; the creation of good roads, bridges, harbors, emporia; the establishment of institutions of justice, order and security (while keeping the hard military in the background); the encouragement of social mixing of the local élite with imported Roman populations; the foundation and development of cities and urban structures to a fault—and, most cogently, to make all this possible, the creation of a porous society through the granting of Roman citizenship first to individuals, groups, and then to masses—these were some of the key concerns of the multifarious agenda of what we call Romanization.

While reflecting on the peace and prosperity of the countryside (where well-to-do urbanites could take occasional refuge), Romans ultimately believed that civilization and civilized life was synonymous with cities. They conquered vast territories, and for the most part strove to build cities to carry their civilizing mission, as they understood it, even in the farthest corners of their empire. Law, order, technology were among the fundamental aspects of Romanization, but so were the temples and basilicas, markets and libraries, theaters and baths. “God made the country, human art built the town,” Varro wrote (*De re rustica*, 3.1), and that is the sense in which we best understand the essence of Romanization—as urbanization. And that is basically how Aelius Aristides, a Sophist from Smyrna in Asia Minor, must have seen it:

... Neither does the sea nor the great expanse of land keep one from being a citizen regardless of whether it is Asia or Europe. All is open to all men. No one is a foreigner who deserves to hold office or to be trusted, but there has been established a common democracy of the world, under one man, the best ruler and leader, and all men assemble here as if were at a common meeting place, each to obtain his due. What a city is to its boundaries and territories, so Rome is to the whole inhabited world, as if it had been designated its common town (Aelius Aristides, *To Rome* 26.60-2).

These are powerful words. Aristides of Smyrna was as much a “foreigner” to Rome as Calgacus the Briton was, but his city and land were not under Roman attack. Furthermore, as mentioned above, the province of Asia, especially its western coast was a special case of Romanization where the seller and the buyer were in agreement. As a primary exponent of the literary-rhetorical Sophist culture of Asia, he enjoyed his privileges and used his pulpit to reiterate the loyalty of the provinces (or, at least of Asia)

to the Emperor. Deeply rooted in the Hellenized culture of the land, Aristides and his friends could be and feel like Romans without any loss of their Greek identity and *paideia*: for them, Rome had created an urban culture in which it was difficult to feel like an outsider. Up to a point this was true for Annobal Tapapius Rufus or Iddibal Kafada Aemilius of Africa, or Malé, son of Yarhai, of Palmyra, and perhaps, for the children and grandchildren of Calgacus, all ordinary native sons, who lived in Roman cities far from Rome, owned land in the country, prospered under Roman law, and became leaders of their provincial communities—and left a record of their achievement in proud, bi-lingual inscriptions.

Ours is not an encomium to Rome, nor an obloquy to its denigration. As architects and architectural historians (writing a book on architecture and cities), we unabashedly admire the many benefits Roman cities and urban life offered to its denizens—the heated toilet seat, the standard of weights and measures in the market, the tribunal in the basilica, and the “speakers-podium” in the forum—were all real and symbolic parts of the city defining this civilization. We recognize the lasting and transformative value of granting Roman citizenship, legal rights and equal protection, to native populations—a privilege of real and symbolic significance from the earliest, legendary days of Romulus to Septimius Severus, which smoothed the way to “becoming Roman” (Beard 2015, 66-69, 233-241). Yet, we are also aware that these benefits sometimes came at a price. They did not reach all; many people experienced poverty, inequality, and oppression. Clearly, there was a world less fortunate, less Romanized, less explored by scholars beyond the reach of the aqueducts. A tribal chieftain who rebels against the outrage of Roman occupation, an élite philosopher who extols the virtues of the life he has known under Roman rule—these represent extreme positions born of special conditions. For most people, from native Italians to foreign-born of all cultural and racial backgrounds on the borderlands, the satisfaction index must have been somewhere in between, changing over time, place, and circumstance—and for the most part, the benefits and misfortunes of life under a great ecumenical umbrella, shared alike. Italo Calvino’s Despina is a city that can be reached either by ship or camel. What the camel driver sees and takes away from it are quite different from what the sailor does though each perceives it as a “border city between two deserts”—of land and of sea. Ultimately, even the fundamentally different perceptions of Romanization by Calvino’s camel-driver and sailor must have merged in the everyday concerns of their everyday lives (Calvino 1974, 17-18).

Bibliography

Aelius Aristides 1950

ΕΙΣ ΡΩΜΗΝ. *To Rome* (Çev. S. Levin), Glencoe, Ill, Free Press, 1950.

Beard 2015

Beard, M. SPQR, *A History of Ancient Rome*. New York: Norton & Company, 2015.

Bowersock 1983

Bowersock, G.W. *Roman Arabia*, Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1983

Calvino 1974

Calvino, I. *Invisible Cities*, Çev. W. Weaver. New York: Harcourt Brace and Co., 1974.

IGR

Inscriptiones Graecae ad res Romanas pertinentes.

ILS

Inscriptiones Latinae selectae.

MacAdam 1986

MacAdam, H.I. *Studies in the History of the Roman Province of Arabia*. The Northern Sector (B.A.R. no 295), 1986.

Waelkens 2002

Waelkens, M. "Romanization in the East. A Case Study: Sagalassos and Pisidia." *IstMitt* 52 (2002), 311-368.

Woolf 1994

Woolf, G. "Becoming Roman, Staying Greek: Cultural Identity and the Civilizing Process in the Roman East," *ProcCambPhilSoc* 40 (1994), 116-143.

Yadin 1962

Yadin, Y. "Expedition D—The Cave of Letters," *IEJ* 12 (1962), 227-257.

Yadin 1971 Yadin, Y. "The Life and Trials of Babata," In Bar-Kokhba, New York: Random House, 1971, 222-253.

Yegül 2000

Yegül, F.K. "Memory, Metaphor and Meaning in the Cities of Asia Minor," *Romanization and the City*. Creation, Transformations and Failures (JRA, Suppl. 38), E. Fentress, ed., 2000, 133-153.

Further Readings:

Ando, C. *Imperial Ideology and Provincial Loyalty in the Roman Empire*, Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000; **Alcock, S.** *Graecia Capta. The Landscapes of Roman Greece*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993; **Alcock, S.** “The Problem of Romanization. The Power of Athens.” *The Romanization of Athens: Proceedings of a Conference held at Lincoln, Nebraska (April 1996)*, M.C. Hoff and S.I. Rotroff, eds. Oxford: Oxbrow Books, 1997, 1-7; **Barrett, J.C.** “Romanization: A Critical Comment.” *Dialogues in Roman Imperialism. Power, Discourse and Discrepant Experience in the Roman Empire* (JRA, Suppl. 23), D. Mattingly and S.E. Alcock, eds. 1997, 51-64; **Brunt, P.A.** “The Romanization of the Local Ruling Classes in the Roman Empire,” *Assimilation et résistance à la culture gréco-romaine dans le monde ancien. Travaux du 6. Congrès international d’Etudes Classiques, Madrid 1974*, Bucarest: Editora Academiei, D.M. Pippidi, ed., 1976, 161-173; **Freeman, R.W.M.** “Romanization and Roman Material Culture,” *JRA* 6 (1883), 438-445; **Dench, E.** *From Barbarians to New Men*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995; **Devijver, H.** “Local Elite, Equestrians, and Senators: a Social History of Roman Sagalassos,” *AncSoc* 27 (1996), 105-162; **Edlund-Berry, I.** “Early Rome and the Making of ‘Roman’ Identity through Architecture and City Planning,” *A Companion to the Archaeology of the Roman Republic*, J.D. Evans, ed., Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013, 406-426; **Gruen, E.** “Romans and Others.” *A Companion to the Roman Republic*, N. Rosenstein ve R. Morsten-Marx, eds., Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2010, 459-477; **Habinck, T ve A. Schiesaro,** *The Roman Cultural Revolution*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997; **Hanfnmann, G.M.A.** *From Croesus to Constantine*, Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1975, Ch 3, 41-56; **Keay, S.J. ve N. Terranato,** eds., *Italy and the West: Comparative Issues in Romanization*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001; **Laurence, R.** “Introduction.” *Cultural Identity in the Roman Empire*, R. Laurence and J. Berry, eds., London: Routledge, 1998, 1-9; **Laurence, R., S. Esmonde Cleary ve G. Sears,** eds., *The City in the Roman West, c. 250 BC-c. AD 250*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011; **Levick, B.** *Roman Colonies in Southern Asia Minor*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1967; **Lomas, K.** “Roman Imperialism and the City in Italy,” *Cultural Identity in the Roman Empire*, R. Laurence ve J. Berry, eds., London: Routledge, 1998, 64-78; **MacMullen, R.** *Romanization in the Time of Augustus*, New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000; **MacMullen, R.** “Notes on Romanization,” *BASP* 21 (1984), 161-177; **Mattingly, D.** “Introduction.” *Dialogues in Roman Imperialism. Power, Discourse and Discrepant Experience in the Roman Empire* (JRA, Suppl. 23), D. Mattingly and

S.E. Alcock, eds., 1997, 7-24; **Mattingly**, D. "Becoming Roman: Expressing Identity in a Provincial Setting," *JRA* 17 (2004), 5-25; **Millar**, F. "Introduction," *Roman Architecture in the Greek World* (London: The Society of Antiquaries of London, X), S. Macready ve F.H. Thompson, eds., 1987, ix-xiv; **Millett**, M. "Romanization: Historical Issues and Archaeological Interpretation," *The Early Roman Empire in the West*, T.C. Blagg ve M. Millett, eds., Oxford: Oxbrow Books, 1990, 35-41; **Millett**, M. *The Romanization of Britain: An Essay in Archaeological Interpretation*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990; **Mitchell**, S. "Greek Epigraphy and Social Change. A Study of Romanization of Southwest Asia Minor in the Third Century A.D.," *XI Congresso internazionale di epigrafia Greca e Latina, Roma 18-24 settembre 1997, Atti*, Rome: Quasar, 1999, 419-433; **Morley**, N. "Cities in Context: Urban Sy...? in Roman Italy," *Roman Urbanism. Beyond the Consumer City*, H.M. Parkins, ed., London: Routledge, 1997. 42-58; **Purcell**, N. "The Creation of Provincial Landscape: The Roman Impact on Cisalpine Gaul," *The Early Roman Empire in the West*, T. Blagg and M. Millett, eds. Oxford: Oxbrow Books, 1990, 7-29; **Revell**, L. "Romanization," *A Companion to Roman Architecture*, R.B. Ulrich ve C.K. Quenemoen, eds., Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2014, 381-398; **Revell**, L. *Roman Imperialism and Local Identity*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009; **Webster**, J. "Creolizing the Roman Provinces," *AJA* 105 (2001), 209-225; **Welles**, C.B. *et. al.*, "The Romanization of the Greek East," *BASP* 2 (1964), 42-77; **Whittaker**, C.R. "Imperialism and Culture: The Roman Initiative," *Dialogues in Roman Imperialism. Power, Discourse and Discrepant Experience in the Roman Empire* (JRA, Suppl. 23), D. Mattingly and S.E. Alcock, eds., 1997, 143-163; **Wilson**, R.J.A. "Becoming Roman Overseas? Sicily and Sardinia in the Late Roman Republic," *A Companion to the Archaeology of the Roman Republic*, J.D. Evans, ed., Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell, 2013, 485-504; **Woolf**, G. "Romans as Civilizers. The Ideological Pre-Conditions of Romanization," *Integration in the Early Roman West. The Role of Culture and Ideology*, J. Metzler, ed., Luxembourg: Musée National d'Histoire et d'Art, 1995, 9-18; **Woolf**, G. "Urbanization and Its Discontents in Early Roman Gaul," *Romanization and the City. Creation, Transformations and Failures* (JRA, Suppl. 38), E. Fentress, ed., 2000, 115-131; **Woolf**, G. "Beyond Romans and Natives," *World Archaeology* 28 (1997), 339-350; **Yegül**, F.K. "Roman Architecture in the Greek World," *JRA* 4 (1991), 344-355; **Yegül**, F.K. and D. Favro, *Roman Architecture and Urbanism*, New York: Cambridge University Press. Forthcoming; **Zanker**, P. "The City as Symbol: Rome and the Creation of an Urban Image," *Romanization and the City. Creation, Transformations and Failures* (JRA, Suppl. 38), E. Fentress, ed. 2000, 25-41.