

BİBLİYOGRAFYA

EMİN BİLGİÇ — HÜSEYİN SEVER — CAHİT GÜNBATTI
SABAHATTİN BAYRAM

Ankara Kültepe Tabletleri (Ankaraner Kültepa Tafeln) AKT I.

page 125 plates, TTKY VI, Dizi-s. 33, Ankara 1990

ISBN 975 - 16 - 0246 - 7 TK — ISBN 975 - 16 - 0247 - 5

Price : 40.000 TL.

The book under review is the first volume of the Kültepe Publishing Committee (consisting of four authors and myself). I would like to extend my thanks to the present authors, for completing this book and presenting it to the field of Assyriology, since this had been long awaited from the very day the tablets have been unearthed in 1948. Peleasing the first volume of the series, the curiosity of the foreign scholars may indeed be ceased. Hopefully it will continue with the forthcoming volumes which will definelty put an end to the speculations on the publication plea.

The book has a preface -also in German- and includes 82 texts with transliterations, translation and comments on some debated terms and phrases. An indice of personal names, toponyms, *lim-mum* and *hamuštum* have also been presented. Autograph copies have also been given at the end of the book. The volume is presented with glassy paper and looks very handsome.

However, I would like to call attention on some matters which no doubt does not aim the authors as the focus of criticism, since I am also a member of the same committee.

The name of the series, even without the German translation gives the impression that the documents under review have been

unearthed at Ankara. As everybody knows with precision Kültepe is the major findspot of the Cappadocian tablets, and therefore a title which may reveal the truth should have been «Ankara'da Bulunan Kültepe Tabletleri» which expresses Ankara as the housing institution (Anatolian Civilization Museum). Nevertheless, this is not the main factor for the comment, but it is the selected documents which makes the volume. The numbers 19-29 are from İstanbul Archaeological Museums with inaccurate inventory numbers, and to our surprise these documents have been published by myself (see FAOS Beiheft 2 (1989) Nrs. 1-11, and also received reviews (cf. J. C. Dercsen, Bi. Dr. So it will cause the readers confusion as to the exact location of the tablets. I wish most of the Cappadocian tablets may have the chance of a second treatment in the same way and this of course is not possible.

Another point of interest is that some initiative numbers of the publication have been purchased from an antique dealer-their probable provenance is presumably Kültepe. I can not understand how it will match with the title of Ankara Kültepe Tablets, and we were not informed about the case.

I congratulate the authors for their meticulous efforts and attention bringing up a volume as that and would like to call attention to a few minor points, surely meant for the completeness of the study. Despite the fact that the book nicely binded but it is not without blame of printing errors.

- Nr. 1, page 16: 1 na-ru-uq ba-pi-ru-um «1 sack of beer-bread» delete «bira mayası» See M. Stol, Bi. Or. XXVIII 3/4 (1971) p. 169; A. L. Oppenheim L. F. Hartman, "On Beer and Brewing Techniques in Ancient Mesopotamia" (JAOS Suppl. 10) 1950; M. Civil, "A Hymn to the Beer Goddess and a Drinking Song" (Studies presented to A. Leo Oppenheim, 1964 pp. 67-89); V. Donbaz, "Old Assyrian Terms for Bread" (dumu. é. dub. ba. a, 1989, p. 92 ff.). Further, *alabhinum* GAL (p. 16) is also to be corrected see K. Veenhof, Tahsin Özgüç'e Armağan (1989) p. 525; V. Donbaz - K. Veenhof, "New Evidence for Some Old Assyrian Terms" (Anatolica XII, p. 148 ff. «as major dome»).

Read Ē. GAL mu-šī-e delete Mu-zi-e «the exit dues of the palace (see CAD N I p. 382 mūše-kà).

- Nr. 6, 1-4: «Its excise added, its levy having been paid» delete «Önden ilave edilmiş, sonradan eklenmiş».
- Nr. 7, 14: i qá-ra-bi-tim i-na-dí «will be/has been deposited in the storeroom» see CAD p. 125 f) delete «evin içine konacak». Here in this text the term perhaps should be understood as *ina qerbum/qerbitu* «interior» (see CAD Q p. 214) 1. 15: «two bundels each one mina of silver as *nishatum* and *šaddū'atum* toll». 1.17: The first sign looks ša not ŠĀ.
- Nr. 10 1-16: ša IGI : should be understood as «in the possession of PNs, under the care taking of PNs». So the translation: «The tin and garments which are in the possession of PNs, the representative(s) of PN, which you have entrusted to me in GN. These items (wares) I have released for you, for that goods send them to us». Delete ta-tù-ra-nim (1.17). Lines 15-16 have been repeated.
- Nr. 11, lines 7 and 21: read a na-ru-qí-im i-dí-nu (see Nr. 68,2) «which he has given for *naruqqu*-venture/ investment», delete a-na ru-qí-im. There may be a loan of *ana rūqim nadānu* as stated in page 29, but this is not the case here. This is a *naruqqu*-venture/share holding (see. CAD N I p. 381a).

Lines 8-13: perhaps 2/3 mina 9 shekels of gold, demanding payment of PN₁ (cf. CAD K p. 252 kasû) and the same amount, the share of PN₂. Both of these separate shares will stand (be present) for me» (see CAD *ibid.* p. 381b) therefore he is holding (plr.) their sealed documents. See also lines 23-24. Lines 14, 15, 24-25 *uzuzzum*.

a-ḫi-a (lines 23, 35-36, 37 perhaps should also be understood as co-partner, colleague (see CAD A p. 200 ff) see especially lines 35-36.

Line 38: «since the gold will stand for me». The text could not be understood properly.

Nr. 12, lines 7-12: «My tin which you have forwarded from the city of (Assur), let your message come to me, about the place where you have entrusted (it). Translation omits a-šar ta-ap-qi-du.

Lines 13-19: «Getting the names of your witnesses in a tablet written (for me), and you also keep the record of the names of the witnesses on your (own) copy of the document (prepared in the presence of the witnesses)».

Nr. 13, 9, 11: an-na AN.NA (10) PN «Indeed/this tin» delete the first AN.NA (cf. CAD A II p. 125a; see KTS I 47b, 6: AN.NA a-ni-am.

Mr. 14, a-ḫi-i-a (lines 5,9) «my colleagues».

line 13: read ta in et-ta-mu «spirit of the dead» *eṭemmu* (CAD E p. 397). a-ma (lines 18, 25, 28) it is a technical term like *aputtum* «please». line 18: ta-zi-zi-a-ma, perhaps not to be separated as ta-zi-zi- and a-ma. line 20: read en, in the name Pu-šu-ke-en. The name is also written with normal -en. The reading in, for the normal -en is not also convincing, since this sign has always kept its value as *en* even from the earlier document. Lines 30-31: «As for the price of *hulukānnu* do not demand my brother/colleague» delete «Kardeşimden».

Nr. 15, 12: e-li-a-am: Since this word has not been attested as a common name, it should simply be understood in the frame of the verb *elû* (cf. CAD E p. 116; further see CAD N I p. 382a: *kaspum ša naruq mera' PN lu ina ekallim uššam lu ina PN₂ elliam... paḫḫirama*. So it means «it will come into the *naruqqu*-investment» The copy shows a clear *a* sign *a na-ru-uq e-li-a-am* (see. *Nr. 11*) delete 3. It can not be three.

Line 14: In comparison with line 10 É Ku-tù-pí-iš (11) ub-lu-nim perhaps É-kà ú-ba-a (see ú-ba-a-šu-nu AFO 31, 1984, p. 17).

20-21: «There existed your shares, now, they have taken them away». 31-33:» Today three months have (already) elapsed».

- 33: read «e-ší-e ma-ma- <an> ú-la iš-a-am» Nobody bought the timber(s).
- Nr. 16, 25: i-ni-kà la-mu-ur «det me see you personally».
- Nr. 18, 13: read qá-dí «with, including».
33-35: 3 TÚG ku-ta-nu ša kà-ša-ri-im (34) ša IR ša Ší-li-
IM (35) 2 TÚG ku-ta-nu ša ma-sà a ká-ša-ri-im (36) kà-
ša-ri-im. The transliteration is different. *massu massū'um*
refers to a kind of textile (CAD M p. 344); or a local ruler
(Veenhof, Aspects.P. 243 ff and 291).
- Nrs. 19-20 I have no comments on these texts, since I have published them earlier (see KTS II Nrs. 1-11). Reviews concerning these sections, see J. G. Dercksen. Bi. Or. 48 1/2, 1991, pp. 179-183; Renate Wernisch, ZKM 80, 1990, pp. 277-279; W. Farber, Aula Orientalis 8, 1990, pp. 142-145; Joachim Oelsner, BSOAS, Vol. 54/2, 1993.
- Nr. 30, 12: ù ša a ba-ri-im, see GAG 115 q ša bārī/ana bārīni.
- Nr. 31, 8: read *sarādum* not *sarrādum*.
- Nr. 33, 1-3: um-ma Ištar-pì-la-aḥ-ma (2) ĪR (?) ša A-mur-Ištar. Delete -ma following Amur-Ištar.
- Nr. 35, 10: try 'DINGIR' 5 u-mì-im (11) i-za-az «The God/moon will stay/rise five days» (see Balkan, AS 16, p. 170; -Anum-Hirbi, p. 59, n. 90 ff: DINGIR ša-pá-támi-li-ik-ma ICK II, 45. Delete *ana* it is never used in OA cf. NA legal documents, the allusion is «after the fullmoon».
- Nr. 36, 5: delete paranthesis at least for the sign Š[í-,
- Nr. 38, 10:... a-na (10) 'ša' ma-na-im... delete X and 1. The copy shows clearly ša . . ma sign is written over erasure.
- Nr. 39, 3: Ḥa-pì-a ša Kà-la-tù-a «PN offspring of K. Delete a definition of a GN for K.
15-16: read ra-dí-ú (16) ša ḥa-ra-na-ri perhaps meant for *ḥarrā(n) nāri* «waterways driver». The second last sign looks a bit -an(?). For *rādī'um* «Geleiter» see K. Hecker, Matouš Festschrift p. 138. Read i-na ad-ri-im «at the threshing

- floor» in a/k 842 (p. 59). See Donbaz, lately AfO 35, p. 56a and n. 19; K. Veenhof, *Matouš Festschrift* pp. 279-310. Delete all the explanation on at-ri-im and *watrum*. Delete also *ana rūqim nadānu* «to give for empty/nothing» See my comments on Nr. 11 a na-ru-qí-im.
- Nr. 41, 15: Perhaps has to be read Pu-A. A (Ea) otherwise confirms Balkan, Anum-Hirbi, p. 66, n. 95 ša Bu-a-i-ú. BU-A. A looks allright.
- Nr. 44, 11: read i-ta-ḫi-ši-na-tí «no one will claim anything for them». See Kt 88/k 1102, 13-14 :... a-na GAL sí-mì-il₅-tim (14) ù ta-ḫe-e-šu la i-da-an «He will not give anything to r. s. and those who are supporting for him».
- Nr. 45, 4-5: read ga-ma-ar er-ší-im. (env. 3) i-na kà-ba-ar(?) er-ší-tum.
- Nr. 49, 7: Try ZU-pá-la-li.
10: read Il(ī)-ba-ni cf. KTS. II 20, 6, delete[i]-li...
- Nr. 50, 5: read Ku-uz-ku-zi-im, (env. 8) ša Šu-ma-li-bi₄-li-a.
- Nr. 52, 6: Read DUB/ṭup-pu-šu delete *tup*.
10: i-tù-ra-ma «If they come back for any claim».
11: «This agreement will be invalid/void».
- Nr. 53, 3; (env. 3.5.8) read Šar-Adad. Env. 12: The personal name looks I-ku-pì-we-iš in the copy. Try I-pá-a in lines 12 (tab and env.)
- Nr. 58, env. 3: G[E₆-lá]-^dIM and line 6 (tab.) should also be reconstructed as such.
- Nr. 64, 7: lu i-šé-i/em (8) lu li-im both of the phrases should be interpreted under the verbs *šē'um* and *lē'um* (GAG p. 106 t. See the names I-šé-em-Sú-en (Kt k/k 15a); and Ší-ma-li-im (Kt J/k 233,1).
- Nr. 66, 2 (env.) -kál; tab. 5: .. i-ša-kà < -an > - ma see env. 8; read ši in the word šál-ší-šu.
9, (env.) 12: URUDU SIG₅ šabu-ra-um. For burā'um (cf. Veenhof, *Aspects*, p. 173 ff. The attestation with TÚG is

well documented, but a definition of fine quality of copper is attested here as in CCT I 20b, 2.

- Nr. 69, 15-20 (env. 11-15): «Kārum Kanesh entrusted us with the duty of solving these matters, we have given our testimony in the presence of dagger-holder of Aššur» different than the translation given in the book. A paper dealing with the topic IGI GÍR ša A-šur has been read at the XI. Turkish Historical Association Meetings with reliable proofs by myself. The writing pá-at-ri-im is one of the few syllabic writing of the word (see L. Oppenheim, AFO 13 p. 346: pá-at-ra-am.)
- Nr. 75, 6. 11. 13 (env. 6. 9. 11): read °IM-ANDUL/AN.DUL/Adad-šulūli see °IM-šú-lu-li in texts stated in the indices. Delete du-ri. dūru (BĀD) is hardly ever used in OA, and look at the syllabic writing ofdu-ri in the name A-šur-du-ri (Nr. 63).
- Env. 1-2: KIŠIB kà-ri-im Kà-ni-iš (2) ša-ḫe-er GAL... ša-ḫe-er GAL remains, since this was the seal of the primary essembly of kārum Kanesh. So the translation should be: «Seal of the primary Essembly of kārum Kanesh, the primary essembly has given its verdict».
- Env. 9. 11: °IM-<ANDUL> should be reconstructed for the name Adad-šulūli (tab. 12 also omits ANDUL).
- Nr. 76, 12: Copy has A-šur-aḫ-i-lí not A-na-aḫ-i-lí.
env. 7: Delete GÍG-li read GE₆-li (see Nr. 58). GÍG stands for *aršatum* «barley». Env. 12: e-tí-zi-ib- <ší>.
- Nr. 77, 11 (env. 12): *nuwa'um* «an indogenous Anatolian» for *nuwa'um* see D. Edzard, *altassyrisch nuwa'um*, T. Özgüç'e Armağan (1989) pp. 107-109.
- Nr. 78, No special effort has been given in drawing the signs *la* and *at*. 8: If this is a PN (line 27 is certainly a PN) the last sign perhaps should be read -la/Šulūala, as it stands *šuluat* calls for a fem. Pn. Names ending with -la passim. See Ušunala 1. 14.,; Ša-ar-la etc.

12-16: The translation is different than the publication : «Including the prince of Puruṣhattum, Uṣunala, and the r.s. of Wahṣušana they have taken an oath (they have made a sworn treaty».

17 : .. i-la-kam should be written together.

22: .. a-na-ku-^rma^r i-la-áp-ta «I shall book them myself» see line 29: a-na-ku-ma ú-ša-ba-šu-nu.

32: The translation is a bit different: «Even he is worried/unwilling he is to come».

Nr. 79, 2-3: .. še-a-am-kà-ar-pa-at (3) ma-ti «n sacks of barley, less one *karpatu* -measure» see *maṭi'um/maṭu*. This text was treated by myself at the 34th R. A.I of İstanbul (see its proceedings (in print).

6: Lá-ḫu-ta-aḫ-šu, delete IGI ḫu-[r]a-aḫ-šu.

7: ù Be-li-ú-ma not Ta-li-ú-ma.

Nr. 81, This text also was one of the texts I have read at the 34th R. A. I. see the Proceedings of 34th R. A. I. of İstanbul (in print).

Veysel Donbaz

RENFREW, C., *ARCHAEOLOGY AND LANGUAGE. The Puzzle of Indo-European Origins*. XIV + 346 sayfa, iki harita, 14 levha, 45 resim, 14 tablo, önde teşekkürler, içindekiler ve resim listesi, arkada notlar, bibliyografya ve index. Penguin, Middlesex 1989.

Bugün dünyanın pek çok bölgesinde konuşulan ve bazılarını da bize bırakmış oldukları yazılı belgelerden tanıdığımız Hint-Avrupa (:H.A.) dillerinin kökeni sorunu, dilbilimsel ve arkeolojik araştırmaların oldukça tartışmalı konuları arasında yer almaktadır, ve bu sorunun altında hangi tarih ve tarih öncesi olayların yattığı da tartışmaların ana konusunu oluşturmaktadır.