WHOSE VOICE IS LOUDER?

INFLUENCER AND CELEBRITY ENDORSEMENT ON INSTAGRAM

Deniz ZEREN [1]
Nilüfer KAPUKAYA [2]

Abstract

The main purpose of this research is to compare influencers' and celebrities' posts exposing a brand name according to a few metrics which are ad type, number of likes, number of comments, post type, number of page views for videos, product/service category of exposing brands in posts and engagement rates. With this purpose, this paper examines influencer and celebrity endorsement on Instagram by a content analysis focusing on posts exposing a brand name. Results of the content analysis of 126 posts of six Turkish celebrities and six Turkish influencers revealed that the total number of posts shared by influencers are doubled the total number of posts shared by celebrities. On the other hand, the total number of posts with a brand exposed by celebrities is more than influencers'. In terms of product category, fashion/clothing/apparel products are shared mostly for both groups. Another important result of this study is about ad type used by celebrities and influencers in their posts. According to the results, the most used ad type by both celebrities and influencers is sharing the brand while using the product.

Keywords   *: Influencer marketing, Celebrity endorsement, Instagram marketing, Content analysis.*

Jel Classification   *: M31.*

[1] Doç. Dr., Çukurova Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi İşletme Bölümü Pazarlama Ana Bilim Dalı, dzeren@cu.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0003-1197-5375.

[2] Arş. Gör., İstinye Üniversitesi İktisadi İdari ve Sosyal Bilimler Fakültesi, ngokdagli@istinye.edu.tr, ORCID: 0000-0003-1229-3456.

KİMİN SESİ DAHA YÜKSEK? INSTAGRAMDA SOSYAL MEDYA FENOMENİ VE ÜNLÜ DESTEKÇİ KULLANIMI

Öz

Bu çalışmanın esas amacı sosyal medya fenomenlerinin ve ünlülerin bir marka adı içeren paylaşımlarının reklam türü, beğeni sayısı, yorum sayısı, paylaşım sayısı, video paylaşımları için sayfa görüntüleme sayısı, paylaşımlardaki markaların ürün/hizmet kategorileri ve etkileşim oranı gibi bazı metriklere dayanarak karşılaştırılmasıdır. Bu amaç doğrultusunda, bu çalışma, bir marka adını içeren gönderilere odaklanan bir içerik analizi çalışması ile Instagram'daki sosyal medya fenomeni ve ünlülerin ürün destekçiliğini incelemektedir. 6 Türk ünlü ve 6 Türk sosyal medya fenomeninin 126 gönderisinin incelendiği içerik analizi sonuçları, sosyal medya fenomenlerinin paylaştığı toplam gönderi sayısının, ünlülerin paylaştığı toplam gönderi sayısının neredeyse iki katına yakın olduğunu ortaya koymaktadır. Ancak, ünlüler tarafından paylaşılan toplam marka içerikli gönderi sayısının sosyal medya fenomenlerinin toplam marka içerikli gönderi sayısından daha fazla olduğu da görülmektedir. Ürün/hizmet kategorisi açısından, her iki grup için de en çok moda ve giyim ürünleri ile ilgili marka adlarının paylaşıldığı görülmektedir. Bu çalışmanın bir diğer önemli bulgusu ise sosyal medya fenomenleri ve ünlülerin paylaşımlarında kullandıkları reklam türü ile ilgilidir. Buna göre, hem ünlüler hem de sosyal medya fenomenleri tarafından en çok kullanılan reklam türünün, "ürünü kullanırken markanın paylaşılması" olduğu görülmektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler   *: Etkileyici pazarlama, Ünlü kullanımı, Instagram pazarlama, İçerik analizi.*

Jel Sınıflandırması   *: M31.*

INTRODUCTION

Technological advances and their reflections on daily habits of consumers make social networks turn a fresh medium for consumers. In line with these developments, social media and social network platforms have started to gain an increasing interest for marketing managers and researchers in the last decade. Therefore, the use of social network platforms has rapidly increased nowadays, companies have tended to use social network sites as a marketing tool to build awareness and recognition for their brand and interact with their actual customers and attract potential customers. Instagram is one of the fastest-growing platforms that provide marketing practitioners with the opportunity to interact with their audience and also have a huge chance of online shopping. According to statistics put forward by "We are social" and "Hootsuite" (Bayrak, 2019), Instagram has one of the highest numbers of registered users in Turkey (38 million). In addition to this, Instagram remains as a user database of more than 200 million active users monthly and a high engagement rate (Maeve Duggan, 2013), which makes marketing effects immediate. Thus, Instagram is not just an application for capturing and sharing photo/video, but also a medium for business activities such as brand endorsement. Influencer marketing on Instagram is getting more popular year by year. According to Feldman (2019), the global influencer marketing market was evaluated around 137 million U.S. dollars in 2018, while it is expected to increase to 162 million in 2020 and to 370 million dollars in 2027. Furthermore, Instagram is considered to be the most effective social media channel for influencer marketing campaigns (Feldman, 2019). According to Brown & Hayes (2008), influencer marketing is defined as the identification and use of appropriate individuals who hold influence over potential purchasers of a brand or product to assist the marketing activities of the brand (Evans, Phua, Lim, Jun, 2017). This study has adapted a wide metric set to understand the differences between influencer and celebrity posts exposing a brand name. This article demonstrates the conclusions of a content analysis that analyzed the posts exposing brands by the top six Turkish influencers and the top six celebrities on Instagram. Although there are limited number of papers written about blogger posts (Cılızoğlu &

Çetinkaya, 2019; Yağcı, 2019; Aktaş & Şener, 2019; Sabuncuoğlu-İnanç & Yağlıcı, 2018; Alikılıç & Özkan, 2018; Çelen & Tuna, 2018; Aktaş, 2018; Öztürk, Şener, Süher, 2016) and brand accounts (Aksoy, 2018; Ashley & Tuten, 2015; Tafesse, 2015; Erkan, 2015; Swani, Milne, Brown, 2013; Parsons, 2013; Shen & Bissell, 2013; De Vries, Gensler, Leeflang, 2012; Cvijikj, Spiegler, Michahelles, 2011) by using content analysis, no studies could be found comparing the performance of influencer and celebrity posts exposing a brand on Instagram. Thus, this paper could be seen as one of the earliest efforts about its topic of interest.

I. LITERATURE REVIEW

McCracken (1989) defines celebrity endorser as "Any individual who enjoys public recognition and who uses this recognition on behalf of a consumer good by appearing with it in an advertisement". Accordingly, celebrity endorsement can be defined as a marketing strategy that endorsers used and influencer marketing can be thought of like a digital form of celebrity endorsement.

Meyrowitz (1986) states that personal recommendation and celebrity endorsements for brands have been used since the early times of advertising. Social media have facilitated the emergence of distant, online "important others" who have gained immense influence by building a pseudo-friendly relationship with their online followers (Hejlova, Schneiderova, Klabikova Rabova, Kulhanek, 2019). These "important others" could be called as social media influencers or micro-celebrities. Influencers or micro-celebrities are indeed common people who become popular with their high number of followers on social network sites. They state a new sort of independent third-party endorser who creates a new attitude and/or changes the attitudes of audiences via blogs, tweets, and the use of other social media (Freberg, Freberg, Mcaughey, 2010). Like celebrities, influencers have also started to endorse brands on social media like a recommendation. The influencers have an extreme impact on lifestyle and life aspirations of people, especially of digital natives, and they also serve as role models for them (Hejlova et al., 2019).

According to Wiley (2014), knowledge coming from a non-marketing source is more credible than coming from a marketing source. Nandagiri (2018) states that the negative or positive reviews about products/brands by influencers impose on the viewer's opinion about buying products/brands. Korotina & Jargalsaikhan (2016) have revealed that particularly teenagers are easily affected by influencers when they make their purchase decision and consumers' attitude towards influencers is mostly positive. Furthermore, De Veirmann, Cauberghe, Hudders (2017) expressed that endorsement by influencers who have quite a lot of followers is considered as a more reliable e-WOM than a paid ad. Dean & Biswas (2001)'s study showed that celebrity endorsement can lead in more favourable attitudes to producer of product and purchasing behaviour of consumers. Djafarova & Rushworth (2017) have realized that followers desire to the life-styles of some celebrities and they try to copy their life style to themselves. Therefore, endorsed brands by celebrities affect followers' buying intentions (Erdoğan, 1999). It is also stated by Apeyoje (2013) that celebrity endorsement has an impact on students' buying intentions.

Lee and Hong (2016) stated that social network ads would conceivably encourage positive feelings and reactions, and in this way, would build WOM outcome and greater sellings for brand. According to Priambada (2016), marketing activities via Instagram can motivate the consumers to on-line purchasing (Vionasafira & Sjabadhyni).

Biaudet (2017) has emphasized that the commercial posts of influencers have lower engagement rate than their other personal posts, but the engagement rate can be a bit higher than average, in posts with certain campaigns.

A study conducted by Sabuncuoğlu-İnanç and Yağlıcı (2018) using content analysis about food pages and female food/cooking influencers revealed that the most used ad type is sweepstake method

which is related to try to direct to the sales page on Instagram. The study also revealed that food influencers have shared content with brand names about food which is related to their field of interest. Similarly, Cılızoğlu, Çetinkaya (2019) have claimed that Danla Biliç, an influencer, has shared content with a brand related to beauty sector. Additionaly, Alikılıç and Özkan (2018) have carried out a content analysis in corporate in 30 opinion leaders' Instagram posts in beauty industry. According to results of this study, it has been expressed influencers who are examined in this study promote at the least one product and use hashtags related to product in their sharings. Furthermore, they have deduced that number of influencers' post which is related to brand is more than the number of their personal posts. According to a content analysis conducted by Gulamali and Persson (2017), it was found that the opinion leader was frequently influential because of his/her expertise in the product category.

II. METHODOLOGY

This study aims to analyze and compare influencer and celebrity endorsement on Instagram, as means of engagement rate and other metrics like product category, ad type, etc. In order to understand the unique properties and performance of influencer and celebrity endorsement on Instagram, a content analysis of each Instagram post exposing a brand shared by influencers and celebrities was conducted over the first 10 months of 2019. Data were obtained from Instagram accounts of top six Turkish influencers and celebrities. Influencer accounts are @cznburak, @cagritaner, @cezmikalorifer, @reynmen, @aykutelmas, and @danlabilic. Celebrity accounts included into analysis are @nusr_et, @m10_official, @burakozcivit, @handemiyy, @hadise, and @muratboz.

Before analyzing the posts; coding units, coding scheme and code book were developed by two coders. Revisions were made throughout the coding process in order to make sure that coded categories were exploratory and consistent as possible. Judgments were made by one coder for all the posts included in the sample. %50 of the all posts were randomly selected and independently coded by the second coder. Coding units in the study such as type of influencer, sector of endorsed brand and ad type were created during revision. There are several ways to measure scientific quality in content analysis. As the purpose of the research method is to carry out Reliability is very important in the content analysis because the goal of this research method is to achieve describing and recording the features of messages in an unbiased manner (Neuendorf, 2002). Reliability in content analysis is about intercoder reliability or the degree of agreement. Intercoder reliability means the degree to which independent coders evaluate a characteristic of a message or artifact and achieve the same outcome (Lombard, Snyder-Duch, Bracken, 2002). In addition to this, according to Lombard et al. (2002), the most used method to evaluate intercoder reliability is considered as Holsti's, Scott's pi, percent agreement, Cohen's kappa, and Krippendorff's alpha. Scott's pi index was used to evaluate intercoder reliability in this current research because this index is merely suitable for situations of nominal data and two coders. According to the formula of Scott's pi reliability (Scott, 1955) "$\pi = (Po - Pe)/ (1 - Pe)$", two independent coders achieved $\pi = 95$ average in this research (Po: Observed percentage of agreement, Pe: Proportion agreement, expected by chance). As Neuendorf (2002) specified that above 80% of scores would be commonly acceptable for inter-coder reliability, the percentage is enough.

Since any Instagram users may have an access to publicly open accounts, the number of likes and messages, even the rank of the influencers and celebrities can change instantly. To avoid this variability and potentially large number of postings the data set were collected between January the 1st and October the 30th, 2019.

Total of 4653 posts was reviewed and the total number of posts exposing a brand name was 126 included in the sample. These posts were analyzed using a criteria set that was gathered from related researches (Cılızoğlu & Çetinkaya, 2019; Yağcı, 2019; Aktaş, 2018; Sabuncuoğlu-İnanç & Yağlıcı,

2018; Alıkılıç & Özkan, 2018; Vignisdóttir, 2017; Ashley & Tuten, 2015; Shen & Bissell, 2013; Cvijikj et al., 2011).

III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The six influencer accounts chosen for this current study are @cznburak, @cagritaner, @cezmikalorifer, @reynmen, @aykutelmas, and @danlabilic. Table 1 indicates the names, account names, professions and the numbers of followers of the influencers.

Table 1. List of 4 Turkish Influencers who have the Most Followers on Instagram

Names	Account Names	Professions	Number of Followers*
Burak Özdemir	@cznburak	Influencer, Businessman	12 million
Çağrı Taner	@cagritaner	Entertainment influencer	10.4 million
Cezmi Kalorifer	@cezmikalorifer	Entertainment influencer	6.8 million
Reynmen	@reynmen	Influencer, Singer	6.3 million
Aykut Elmas	@aykutelmas	Entertainment influencer	4.6 million
Danla	@danlabilic	Makeup influencer	3.9 million

Source: (Boomsocial, 2020).

*Reviewed on October the 31st, 2019

When Table 1 is examined, it could be observed that the first three influencers' type (profession) is about entertainment. One of the influencers is a businessman, one them is a lately singer. The last account included is about makeup. Their number of followers is respectively 12 million for @cznburak, 10.4 million for @cagritaner, 6.8 million for @cezmikalorifer, 4.3 million for @reynmen, 4.6 million for @aykutelmas and 3.9 million for @danlabilic. According to Table 1, most of the influencers are mainly male and share posts about entertainment.

The six celebrities chosen as a sample for this study are @nusr_et, @m10_official, @burakozcivit, @handemiyy, @hadise and @muratboz. Their names, account names, professions, and numbers of followers are presented in Table 2.

Table 2. List of 4 Turkish Celebrities who have the Most Followers on Instagram

Names	Account Names	Professions	Numbers of Followers*
Nusr_et#Saltbae	@nusr_et	Businessman	23.6 million
Mesut Özil	@m10_official	Footballer	21 million
Burak Özçivit	@burakozcivit	Actor	13.5 million
Hande Erçel	@handemiyy	Actress	11 million
Hadise	@hadise	Singer	10.2 million
Murat Boz	@muratboz	Singer	9.8 million

Source: (Prusahaber, 2019).

*Reviewed on October the 31th, 2019

Looking at Table 2, it is clearly observed that the professions of the celebrities with the highest number of followers are varying. Their numbers of followers are respectively 23.6 million for @nusr_et, 21 million for @m10_official, 13.5 million for @burakozcivit, 11 million for @hamdemiyy, 10.2 million for @hadise and 9.8 million for @muratboz. Regarding the gender of the celebrities, it is clearly stated that is mostly male.

Celebrities have larger number of followers than influencers. Even the celebrity with the lowest number of followers has more followers than most of the popular influencers.

Table 3. Number of Posts with a Brand Shared by Influencers

Name	No of Brand Name Mentions	No of Branded Posts (BP)	No of Different Brand Names	Total Posts in 2019 (TP)	BP/TP (%)
Burak Özdemir	-	-	-	169	-
Reynmen	-	-	-	14	-
Çağrı Taner	4	4	3	2432	0,16
Cezmi Kalorifer	7	7	6	1165	0,60
Aykut Elmas	5	5	5	112	4,46
Danla	27	18	20	80	22,5
TOTAL	43	34	34	3972	

Upon the consideration of Table 3, when posts of "Danla" are reviewed, it is observed that she has the largest number of brand names in her posts. "Danla" has mentioned 27 brand names where other influencers have mentioned less than seven brand names in their posts. When the branded content sharing ratio is considered among the total shares in 2019, it is revealed that the "Danla" has the account to share the most post with a brand. Two of influencers didn't mention any brand name in their posts. When Table 3 examined, it could be seen that generally only one brand is mentioned for each post but for instance, "Danla" has 18 branded posts, but she has 20 different brand name mentions. It means "Danla" has sometimes endorsed more than one brand in her posts. On the other hand, the total number of different brand name mentions of "Çağrı Taner" and "Cezmi Kalorifer" is lower than the number of branded posts of these influencers which means they have endorsed the same brands in their more than one post.

Table 4. Number of Posts with a Brand Shared by Celebrities

Name	No of Brand Name Mentions	No of Branded Posts (BP)	No of Different Brand Names	Total Posts in 2019 (TP)	BP/TP (%)
Nusr_et#Saltbae	1	1	1	217	0,46
Mesut Özil	19	19	5	120	15,83
Burak Özçivit	10	10	3	40	25
Hande Erçel	11	7	10	50	14
Hadise	72	33	29	168	19,64
Murat Boz	22	22	3	86	25,58
TOTAL	135	92	51	681	

As it is seen in Table 4, "Hadise" has the largest number of posts with a brand than the other celebrity accounts, while "Murat Boz" share more posts with a brand in his total posts 2019. In addition, differently from the other celebrities and influencers, "Danla", "Hande Erçel" and "Hadise" accounts have mentioned more than one brand name at least in their one post. "Nusr_et#Saltbae" account that has the highest number of followers has the fewest branded content sharing ratio in its total shares of 2019. According to Table 4, the total number of different brand names of celebrities is much lower than the number of their branded posts. When the posts of each celebrity are examined in detail, it could be seen that some celebrities like "Mesut Özil", "Burak Özçivit" and "Murat Boz" have mentioned very few different brand names in their posts in contrast with the number of their branded posts. In other words, they have mentioned the same brand names in their more than one post.

Table 3 and Table 4 indicate metrics according to posts related to brand by influencers and celebrities on Instagram included in content analysis. According to the findings, while influencers have 43 brand mentions in total, celebrities have 135. The findings revealed the total number of posts

of the influencers (3972) is nearly six times of the total number of posts shared by celebrities (681) for the given time period. Nevertheless the total number of posts exposing a brand name shared by celebrities is more than the number of posts with a brand shared by influencers (92 for celebrities; 34 for influencers). Only by looking at this finding, it could be said that influencers are more active than celebrities according to the total number of shared posts, but celebrities are more active than influencers according to shared posts related to brand on Instagram in reviewed time period.

Table 5. Number of Posts with a Brand According to Post Type

	Influencers	%	Celebrities	%	TOTAL
Photo	20	58,8	69	75	89
Video	14	41,2	23	25	37

According to the post type, both influencers and celebrities have mostly tended to share photos instead of videos. Shared total post number as photo is 89, and video is 37. Considering the rate of the posts of celebrities and influencers in total photo and video sharing, it could be seen celebrities have shared more photos and more videos than influencers. Photo and video ratios shared by celebrities and influencers within themselves were also examined. Findings revealed that influencers shared more photos than videos but the total number of photos and videos shared by influencers are close. On the other hand, the number of photos shared by celebrities is 3 times the number of videos shared by celebrities.

Table 6. Engagement Rate (ER) of Posts with a Brand According to Post Type

Name	ER	Post Type	Name	ER	Post Type	Name	ER	Post Type
Çağrı Taner	0,04%	Photo	Hande Erçel	11,92%	Photo	Murat Boz	2,13%	Photo
Çağrı Taner	0,55%	Photo	Hande Erçel	11,09%	Photo	Murat Boz	3,09%	Photo
Cezmi Kalorifer	1,79%	Photo	Hande Erçel	15,17%	Photo	Murat Boz	3,25%	Photo
Danla Bilic	6,88%	Photo	Hande Erçel	14,26%	Photo	Murat Boz	1,79%	Photo
Danla Bilic	9,49%	Photo	Hande Erçel	10,86%	Photo	Murat Boz	1,56%	Photo
Danla Bilic	6,88%	Photo	Hande Erçel	6,15%	Photo	Çağrı Taner	0,03%	Video
Danla Bilic	8,91%	Photo	Hande Erçel	13,61%	Photo	Çağrı Taner	0,44%	Video
Danla Bilic	9,11%	Photo	Hadise	3,02%	Photo	Cezmi Kalorifer	1,66%	Video
Danla Bilic	9,03%	Photo	Hadise	2,15%	Photo	Cezmi Kalorifer	0,20%	Video
Danla Bilic	8,80%	Photo	Hadise	2,14%	Photo	Cezmi Kalorifer	1,68%	Video
Danla Bilic	10,70%	Photo	Hadise	2,43%	Photo	Cezmi Kalorifer	0,53%	Video
Danla Bilic	11,03%	Photo	Hadise	1,84%	Photo	Cezmi Kalorifer	0,29%	Video
Danla Bilic	7,96%	Photo	Hadise	2,44%	Photo	Cezmi Kalorifer	0,03%	Video
Danla Bilic	9,09%	Photo	Hadise	1,3%	Photo	Aykut Elmas	4,74%	Video
Danla Bilic	10,20%	Photo	Hadise	2,28%	Photo	Aykut Elmas	5,13%	Video
Danla Bilic	6,41%	Photo	Hadise	2,02%	Photo	Aykut Elmas	7,21%	Video
Danla Bilic	8,07%	Photo	Hadise	2,25%	Photo	Aykut Elmas	3,99%	Video
Danla Bilic	26,12%	Photo	Hadise	2,59%	Photo	Aykut Elmas	2,91%	Video
Danla Bilic	8,72%	Photo	Hadise	1,66%	Photo	Danla Bilic	4,22%	Video
Danla Bilic	9,68%	Photo	Hadise	2,05%	Photo	Nusret	0,62%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,01%	Photo	Hadise	3,36%	Photo	Mesut Özil	0,42%	Video
Mesut Özil	4,57%	Photo	Hadise	2,2%	Photo	Mesut Özil	0,99%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,14%	Photo	Hadise	1,38%	Photo	Mesut Özil	1,17%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,74%	Photo	Hadise	3,04%	Photo	Mesut Özil	2,21%	Video
Mesut Özil	5,06%	Photo	Hadise	1,62%	Photo	Burak Özçivit	2,89%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,73%	Photo	Hadise	3,43%	Photo	Burak Özçivit	2,82%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,48%	Photo	Hadise	2,16%	Photo	Burak Özçivit	2,11%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,05%	Photo	Hadise	2,66%	Photo	Hadise	0,39%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,09%	Photo	Hadise	2,85%	Photo	Hadise	0,76%	Video
Mesut Özil	1,43%	Photo	Hadise	2,47%	Photo	Hadise	0,55%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,01%	Photo	Hadise	3,59%	Photo	Hadise	0,61%	Video
Mesut Özil	3,22%	Photo	Hadise	2,3%	Photo	Hadise	0,89%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,30%	Photo	Hadise	2,91%	Photo	Hadise	1,27%	Video
Mesut Özil	2,29%	Photo	Hadise	2,67%	Photo	Murat Boz	1,04%	Video
Mesut Özil	1,19%	Photo	Murat Boz	3,2%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,61%	Video
Burak Özçivit	2,54%	Photo	Murat Boz	3,19%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,7%	Video
Burak Özçivit	4,43%	Photo	Murat Boz	2,7%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,84%	Video
Burak Özçivit	4,52%	Photo	Murat Boz	3,41%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,8%	Video
Burak Özçivit	6,24%	Photo	Murat Boz	2,26%	Photo	Murat Boz	1,25%	Video
Burak Özçivit	5,87%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,74%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,77%	Video
Burak Özçivit	7,21%	Photo	Murat Boz	1,9%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,54%	Video
Burak Özçivit	5,16%	Photo	Murat Boz	2,15%	Photo	Murat Boz	0,41%	Video

Audience engagement is one of the key determinants for influencer marketing effect. Engagement is an indicator of how interactive an Influencer's audience is with the content (Biaudet, 2017). Blaschke & Veh (2015) expressed empirical studies reveal that engagement performance significantly affects the financial performance of a company (Bughin & Chui, 2010; Engagementdb, 2009; Nagle & Pope, 2014; SugarCRM, 2011). In the literature, commonly used metrics for measuring engagement rate are the number of likes and comments, views, and shares (Perreault & Mosconi, 2018). Also, engagement rate (ER) can be calculated as total engagement (the measurement of which is dependent on the platform) divided by total number of followers, multiplied by 100 (Corporate Finance Institute, 2019). For this reason, like, comment and number of followers were used as engagement rate metrics in this study.

By looking at engagement rate (ER) of posts in Table 6, it can be assumed that average engagement rate of influencers is higher than average engagement rate of celebrities. In detail, engagement rate of "Danla" and "Hande Erçel" is higher than the engagement rate of the other influencers and celebrities. Moreover, when Table 6 is examined in detail, it is observed that photos mostly have more ER than videos for both influencers and celebrities in general. The same result could be seen within posts shared by the same celebrity and/or influencer.

Furthermore, an inverse relationship could be stated between the number of followers of both celebrities and influencers and the engagement rates of their posts. In other words, engagement rates of posts shared by celebrities and influencers who have the highest number of followers are lower than celebrities and influencers who have fewer followers.

Table 7. Number of Brand Name Mentions from the Point of Product Category

Product/Service Category	Influencers (n)	Celebrities (n)	Total
Fashion/Clothing/Apparel	22	77	99
Make-up/Beauty	3	32	35
Food, FMCG	9	14	23
Personal care	3	7	10
Other	6	5	11

As could be reviewed in Table 7, from the point of product category, findings reveal that as a product category, fashion/clothing/apparel products are the mostly used product category for groups. Yet, second most endorsed product category is food for influencers and personal care products for celebrities.

Table 8. Number of Brand Name Mentions from the Point of Advertising Type

Ad Type	Influencers (n)	Celebrities (n)	Total
Ad with storytelling	5	-	5
Ad with free gift or discount code	5	1	6
Ad by product placement	5	-	5
Ad using the product by herself/himself	22	86	108
Directly posted ad	5	2	7
Ad only under a personal post	-	8	8
Ad of brand as a spokesperson	-	36	36
Ad with expressing social responsibility	1	2	3

According to Table 8, the most used ad type by both influencers and celebrities is "Ad of a brand as a spokesperson". The second most used ad type by celebrities is "Ad of a brand as a spokesperson". From this point of view, it can be inferred that celebrities are also trying to be effective in influencer marketing and want to be perceived as trustworthy since audiences expect to hear about

the real experiences of influencers. If celebrities could share an experience or an instance using the product/brand, that could be more persuasive for their followers.

Apart from these findings, another important one is although engagement rate of posts with a free gift or discount code by "Danla" is seemed incoherent, it was noticed that she offered a gift card of high amount in one of her high engagement rated post. Furthermore, it is seen that one influencer ("Çağrı Taner") have started to use brand name in his posts after his number of followers considerably increase.

In this study, the most popular influencers and celebrities according to their number of followers were identified and their posts reviewed in order to understand whose voice is higher on Instagram. Instagram is an effective marketing medium with a high engagement rate and active users more than 200 million (Maeve Duggan, 2013). Turkey is a young consumer market with 38 million registered Instagram users (Bayrak, 2019). Therefore, the results from this sample in this study supports the academic literature mainstream by establishing brands have discovered the importance of Instagram as a marketing communication tool.

Findings revealed that celebrities have more followers than influencers. Both influencers and celebrities with large number of followers are mainly male. Most of influencers, in this study, mainly share posts about entertainment. Celebrities generally share posts about themselves such as their selfies, their daily activities etc.

It could be expressed that influencers are more active than celebrities by just looking at the total number of shared posts. On the contrary celebrities are more active than influencers when the shared posts related to brand on Instagram are examined in reviewed time period. So it could be said that brands still prefer to choose celebrity endorsement over influencer endorsement.

When the branded content sharing ratio is considered among the total shares in 2019, it is revealed that "Danla", who is a makeup influencer, has the account to share the most post with a brand. Two of influencers have not mentioned any brand names in their posts yet.

While the total number of brand mentions in posts of some celebrities and influencers is higher than the total number of brand mentioned posts. This could be interpreted as they are sharing more than one brand in one post. This should be indicated deeply to understand how followers perceived this combination and evaluate the communication and sales effectiveness of this strategy.

According to the post type, both influencers and celebrities have mostly tended to share photos instead of videos. However, when comparing the two groups, it can be said that celebrities share more photos than videos. In addition, considering the rate of the posts of celebrities and influencers in total photo sharing, celebrities have shared more photos than influencers. This finding could be indicated with engagement rate. Considering photos have more ER than videos, celebrities are following a better strategy in order to achieve a higher ER.

Audience engagement is one of the key determinants for influencer marketing effect. Engagement rate (ER) is an indicator of how interactive an Influencer's audience is with the content (Biaudet, 2017). Average ER of influencers is higher than average engagement rate of celebrities. Moreover, photos mostly have more ER than videos for both influencers and celebrities in general. The same result could be seen within posts shared by the same celebrity and/or influencer.

Celebrities and influencers who have the highest number of followers have lower ER than some of celebrities and influencers who have fewer followers. This is interesting and could be interpreted as accounts with fewer number of followers put more effort to gain followers. Nevertheless, large number of followers cannot guarantee success in Instagram marketing communication. As in the case De Veirmann et al. (2017) expressed when the number of followers of influencers is high, endorsed brand with a divergent design by these influencers could reduce the perceptions of uniqueness and eventually attitudes towards the brands. Thus, when marketing practitioners use influencer marketing

as a marketing strategy, they must pay attention, not only to the number of followers, but also, to many things such as features of their products, credibility of influencers, etc. to be successful.

The most endorsed product/service category is fashion/clothing/apparel for both influencers and celebrities. The most used ad type by both celebrities and influencers is "Ad using product/brand by herself/himself". It can be inferred that celebrities could try to be more effective in influencer marketing by sharing the real experiences and perceived more trustworthy for their followers.

Findings show that there is no one strategy to fit for every firm on Instagram. However, the number of followers might be expressed not so important unless company's strategy is just "to be known". Moreover, despite celebrities have lesser number of post in sum, they have more sharings with a brand. This could be clarified by companies' tendency to use old school tactics about marketing communications on a new medium. Companies could try to understand and evaluate the new media and new ways of communication in its own necessities, actors, users and terms of conditions.

Like every research in literature, this paper has limitations as well. Because of scarce resources in the field and inconveniences to reach expanded spare time out of overloading teaching schedules, the number of cases is restricted in this study. Using larger sample could demonstrate enhanced insights for conclusions of future studies. It could be needed for future studies to explore different useful metrics for performance of influencers and celebrities. In terms of measures, in addition to content analyses, surveys and/or in-depth interviews with audiences could be aided for tomorrow researches.

REFERENCES

Aksoy, E. (2018). *Sosyal medya içeriklerinin marka takipçileri ile bağ kurma üzerine etkisi: Markaların facebook gönderileri üzerine bir içerik analizi (Master thesis).* Anadolu University, Eskişehir, Turkey.

Aktaş, A., & Şener, G. (2019). Nüfuz pazarlamasında (Influencer marketing) mesaj stratejileri. *Erciyes İletişim Dergisi, 6*(1), 399–422.

Aktaş, A. (2018). *Nüfuz pazarlamasında (Influencer marketing) kullanılan mesaj stratejilerine yönelik bir içerik analizi (Master thesis).* Bahçeşehir University, İstanbul, Turkey.

Alikılıç, İ., & Özkan, B. (2018). Bir sosyal medya pazarlama trendi, hatırlı pazarlama ve etkileyiciler: Instagram fenomenleri üzerine bir araştırma. *Uluslararası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 1*(2), 43–57.

Apeyoje, A. (2013). Influence of celebrity endorsement of advertisement on students' purchase intention. *J Mass Communicat Journalism, 3*(3).

Ashley, C., & Tuten, T. (2015). Creative strategies in social media marketing: An exploratory study of branded social content and consumer engagement. *Psychology & Marketing, 32*(1), 15–27.

Bayrak, H. (2019, February 15). Türkiye'nin Dijital Haritası (2019) [Web log post] Retrieved from http://www.blogteb.com/turkiyenin-dijital-haritasi-2019/.

Biaudet, S. (2017). *Influencer marketing as a marketing tool: The process of creating an influencer marketing campaign on Instagram* (Unpublished Degree thesis, Yrkeshögskolan Arcada, Finlandiya). Retrieved from theseus.fi/handle/10024/134139.

Blaschke, S., & Veh, A. (2015). Strategies for the use of social media in stakeholder conversations. *Strategien für den Einsatz sozialer Medien in Stakeholderkonversationen, 75*(6), 401–412.

Boomsocial (2019, October 31). Instagram - Fenomenler Sektörü Hesapları [Web log post]. Retrieved from https://www.boomsocial.com/Instagram/UlkeSektor/turkey/fenomenler.

Brown, D., & Hayes N. (2008). *Influencer marketing: Who really influences your customers?*. United Kingdom: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Bughin, J., & Chui, M. (2010, December). The rise of the networked enterprise: Web 2.0 finds its payday [Web log post]. Retrieved from https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/technology-media-and-telecommunications/our-insights/the-rise-of-the-networked-enterprise-web-20-finds-its-payday.

Cılızoğlu, G.Y., & Çetinkaya, A. (2019). Selfie'den reklama: Instagram'da e-kaynakların paylaşımları üzerine bir inceleme. *Arel İletişim Çalışmaları Dergisi, 12*, 71–106.

Corporate Finance Institute. What is the Engagement Rate? [Web log post]. Retrieved from https://corporatefinanceinstitute.com/resources/knowledge/ecommerce-saas/engagement-rate/.

Cvijikj, I.P., Spiegler, E.D., & Michahelles, F. (2011). The effect of post type, category and posting day on user interaction level on Facebook. in *IEEE International Conference on Privacy, Security, Risk, and Trust, and IEEE International Conference on Social Computing* (p. 810–813).

De Veirmann, M., Cauberghe, V., & Hudders, L. (2017). Marketing through Instagram influencers: The impact of number of followers and product divergence on brand attitude. *International Journal of Advertising*, *36*(5), 798–828.

De Vries, L., Gensler, S., & Leeflang, P.S.H. (2012). Popularity of brand posts on brand fan pages: An investigation of the effects of social media marketing. *Journal of Interactive Marketing*, *26*(2), 83–91.

Dean, D.H., & Biswas, A. (2001). Third-Party organization endorsement of products: An adver-tising cue affecting consumer prepurchase evaluation of goods and services. *Journal of Advertising*, *30*(4), 41–57.

Djafarova, E., & Rushworth, C. (2017). Exploring the credibility of online celebrities' Instagram profiles in influencing the purchase decisions of young female users. *Computers in Human Behavior*, *68*, 1–7.

Engagementdb. (2009). The world's most valuable brands. Who's most engaged? [Web log post]. Retrieved from http://www.engagementdb.com/downloads/ ENGAGEMENTdb_Report_2009.pdf.

Erdoğan, Z. (1999). Celebrity endorsement: A literature review. *Journal of Marketing Management, 15*(4), 291–314.

Erkan, İ. (2015). Electronic word of mouth on Instagram: customers' engagements with brands in different sectors. *International Journal of Management, Accounting and Economics*, *2*(12), 1435–1444.

Evans, N.J., Phua, J., Lim, J., & Jun, H. (2017). Disclosing instagram influencer advertising: The effects of disclosure language on advertising recognition, attitudes, and behavioral intent. *Journal of Interactive Advertising, 17*(2), 138–149.

Feldman, S. (2019, October 4). Instagram is a favorite for influencer marketing [Web log post] Retrieved from https://www.statista.com/chart/19551/instagram-for-influencer-marketing/.

Freberg, K., Freberg, L.A., & Mcaughey, K. (2010). 'Who are the social media influencers? A study of public perceptins of personality', *Public Relations Review*.

Gulamali, A., & Persson, J. (2017). *The social media influencer and brand switching* (Unpublished Degree thesis, Lund University, Sweden). Retrieved from http://lup.lub.lu.se/luur/download?func=downloadFile&recordOId=8910352&fileOId=8910354.

Hejlova, D., Schneiderova, S., Klabikova Rabova, T., & Kulhanek, A. (2019). Analysis of presumed IQOS Influencer marketing on Instagram in the Czech Republic in 2018–2019. *Adiktologie, 19*(1), 7–15.

Hobson, R. (2016). *The Integration of influencer marketing into social media strategies* (Unpublished Master thesis, University of Cape Town, Cape Town, South Africa).

Jargalsaikhan, T., & Korotina, A. (2016). Attitudes towards instagram micro-celebrities and their influence on consumers' purchasing decisions (Unpublished Master thesis, Jönköping University, Sweden). Retrieved from https://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:950526/FULLTEXT01.pdf.

Kassarjian, H.H. (1977). Content analysis in consumer research. *Journal of Consumer Research*, *4*(1), 8–18.

Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology (2nd ed.).* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Lee, J., & Hong, I.B. (2016). Predicting positive user responses to social media advertising: The roles of emotional appeal, informativeness and creativity. *International Journal of Information Management*, *36*(3), 360–373.

Lombard, M., Snyder-Duch, J., & Bracken, C. C. (2002). Content analysis in mass communication: Assessment and reporting of intercoder reliability. *Human Communication Research*, *28*(4), 587–604.

Maeve Duggan, J. B. (2013, February 14). The demographics of social media users [Web log post]. Retrieved from: http://www.pewinternet.org/2013/02/14/thedemographics-of-social-media-users-2012/.

McCracken, G. (1989). 'Who is the celebrity endorser? Cultural foundations of the endorsement process. *Journal of Consumer Research*, *16*, 310–321.

Meyrowitz, J. (1986). *No sense of place: The impact of electronic media on social behavior*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Mogaji, E. (2019). Content analysis of female athlete endorsers in UK sports magazine advertisements. *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 55–73.

Nagle T., & Pope A. (2014). Understanding social media business value, a prerequisite for social media selection. *Journal of Decision Systems*, 22, 283–297.

Nandagiri, V., & Philip, L. (2018). Impact of influencers from instagram and youtube on their followers. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Modern Education*, *4*(1), 61–65.

Neuendorf, K. A. (2002). *The content analysis guidebook.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Öztürk, E., Şener, G., & Süher, H.K. (2016). Sosyal medya çağında ürün yerleştirme: Instagram ve instabloggerlar üzerine bir içerik analizi. *Global Media Journal TR Edition*, *6*(12), 355–386.

Parsons, A. (2013). Using social media to reach consumers: A content analysis of official Facebook pages. *Academy of Marketing Studies Journal*, *17*(2), 27–36.

Perreault, M. C., & Mosconi, E. (2018). Social media engagement: content strategy and metrics research opportunities. In *Proceedings of the 51st Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences, Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences* (p. 3568–3577).

Priambada, A. (2016). Survei DailySocial: Iklan Facebook dan Instagram berperan besar dalam mendorong keputusan berbelanja online di Indonesia [Web log post]. Retrieved from https://dailysocial.id/post/survei-dailysocialiklan-facebook-dan-instagram-berperan-besar-dalammendorong-keputusan-berbelanja-online-diIndonesia.

Prusa Haber. (2019, September 19). Instagramda en çok takipçisi olan Türk ünlüler (25.09.19) [Web log post]. Retrieved from https://www.prusahaber.com/instagramda-en-cok-takipcisi-olan-turk-unluler-25-09-19/.

Rakuten Marketing, (2019). Influencer marketing global survey consumers [Web log post]. Retrieved from: https://www.iab.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Rakuten-2019-Influencer-Marketing-Report-Rakuten-Marketing.pdf .

Rosenberry, J., & Vicker, L.A. (2009). *Applied mass communication theory: A guide for media practitioners.* Boston: Pearson Allyn and Bacon.

Sabuncuoğlu-İnanç, A., & Yağlıcı, M. (2018). Mahrem mekanlarını reklam alanına dönüştüren kadınlar: Instagram'ın yemek fenomenleri üzerine bir araştırma. *Uluslararası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, *1*(2), 166–180.

Shen, B., & Bissell, K. (2013). Social media, social me: A content analysis of beauty companies' use of Facebook in marketing and branding. *Journal of Promotion Management*, *19*(5), 629–651.

SugarCRM (2011). SugarCRM reveals results of 2010 Social CRM Survey [Web log post] Retrieved from http://www.sugarcrm.com/crm/about/press-releases/ 20110118surveyscrm.html.

Swani, K., Milne, G., & Brown, B. P. (2013). Spreading the word through likes on Facebook: Evaluating the message strategy effectiveness of Fortune 500 companies. *Journal of Research in Interactive Marketing, 7*(4), 269–294.

Tafesse, W. (2015). Content strategies and audience response on Facebook brand pages. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*, *33*(6), 927–943.

Vignisdóttir, A. (2017). Customer engagement on instagram brand pages in the make-up cosmetics industry (Unpublished Degree thesis) Reykjavik University, Iceland. Retrieved from: https://skemman.is/bitstream/1946/26717/1/MAR0117_Thesis_Annika_Vignisdottir_Customer%20Enga gement%20on%20Instagram%20Brand%20Pages%20In%20the%20Make-up%20Cosmetics%20Industry.pdf.

Vionasafira, V., & Sjabadhyni, B. (2018). Choose celebrity or common people? The influence of endorser type on instagram user's purchase intention. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research*, 139, 182–189.

Wiley, D. (2014). Why brands should turn to bloggers instead of celebrity spokespeople marketing land [Web log post]. Retrieved from https://marketingland.com/brands-turn-bloggers-instead-celebrity-spokespeople-75971.

Etik Beyanı : *Bu çalışmanın tüm hazırlanma süreçlerinde etik kurallara uyulduğunu yazarlar beyan eder. Aksi bir durumun tespiti halinde ÖHÜİİBF Dergisinin hiçbir sorumluluğu olmayıp, tüm sorumluluk çalışmanın yazarlarına aittir.*

Yazar Katkıları : *Theory of Constraints: The Application of Wine Production Facility çalışmada. 1. yazarın katkı oranı: %50, 2. yazarın katkı oranı: %50.*

Çıkar Beyanı : *Yazarlar arasında çıkar çatışması yoktur.*

Ethics Statement : *The authors declare that ethical rules are followed in all preparation processes of this study. In case of detection of a contrary situation, ÖHÜİİBF Journal has no responsibility and all responsibility belongs to the authors of the study.*

Author Contributions : *In this study 1st author's contribution rate: 50%, 2nd author's contribution rate: 50%*

Conflict of Interest : *There is no conflict of interest between the authors*