

# ADALYA

23 2020



**AKMED**

KOÇ UNIVERSITY

Suna & İnan Kırac

Research Center for

Mediterranean Civilizations



23 2020

ISSN 1301-2746

# ADALYA

The Annual of the Koç University Suna & İnan Kırac Research Center  
for Mediterranean Civilizations

(OFFPRINT)



**AKMED**

KOÇ UNIVERSITY

Suna & İnan Kırac

Research Center for

Mediterranean Civilizations

# ADALYA

The Annual of the Koç University Suna & İnan Kırac Research Center  
for Mediterranean Civilizations (AKMED)

Adalya, a peer reviewed publication, is indexed in the A&HCI  
(Arts & Humanities Citation Index) and CC/A&H (Current Contents /  
Arts & Humanities)  
Adalya is also indexed in the Social Sciences and Humanities Database of  
TÜBİTAK/ULAKBİM TR index and EBSCO.

<i>Mode of publication</i>	Worldwide periodical
<i>Publisher certificate number</i>	18318
ISSN	1301-2746
<i>Publisher management</i>	Koç University Rumelifeneri Yolu, 34450 Sarıyer / İstanbul
<i>Publisher</i>	Umran Savaş İnan, President, on behalf of Koç University
<i>Editor-in-chief</i>	Oğuz Tekin
<i>Editors</i>	Tarkan Kahya and Arif Yacı
<i>English copyediting</i>	Mark Wilson
<i>Editorial Advisory Board</i>	(Members serve for a period of five years) Prof. Dr. Mustafa Adak, Akdeniz University (2018-2022) Prof. Dr. Engin Akyürek, Koç University (2018-2022) Prof. Dr. Nicholas D. Cahill, University of Wisconsin-Madison (2018-2022) Prof. Dr. Edhem Eldem, Boğaziçi University / Collège de France (2018-2022) Prof. Dr. Mehmet Özdoğan, Emeritus, Istanbul University (2016-2020) Prof. Dr. C. Brian Rose, University of Pennsylvania (2018-2022) Prof. Dr. Charlotte Roueché, Emerita, King's College London (2019-2023) Prof. Dr. Christof Schuler, DAI München (2017-2021) Prof. Dr. R. R. R. Smith, University of Oxford (2016-2020)
©	Koç University AKMED, 2020
<i>Production</i>	Zero Production Ltd. Abdullah Sok. No. 17 Taksim 34433 İstanbul Tel: +90 (212) 244 75 21 • Fax: +90 (212) 244 32 09 info@zerobooksonline.com; www.zerobooksonline.com
<i>Printing</i>	Fotokitap Fotoğraf Ürünleri Paz. ve Tic. Ltd. Şti. Oruç Reis Mah. Tekstilkent B-5 Blok No: 10-AH111 Esenler - İstanbul / Turkey Certificate number: 47448
<i>Mailing address</i>	Barbaros Mah. Kocatepe Sok. No. 22 Kaleiçi 07100 Antalya - TURKEY Tel: +90 (242) 243 42 74 • Fax: +90 (242) 243 80 13 https://akmed.ku.edu.tr
<i>E-mail address</i>	adalya@ku.edu.tr



**KOÇ ÜNİVERSİTESİ**



**AKMED**

KOÇ UNIVERSITY

Suna & İnan Kırac

Research Center for

Mediterranean Civilizations

# Contents

Burçin Erdoğan	
<i>Capturing the Seen and Unseen in the Beldibi Rock Art</i> .....	1
Özlem Çevik – Murat Dirican – Aydın Ulubey – Osman Vuruşkan	
<i>The Galena Objects from Neolithic Ulucak: The Earliest Metallic Finds in Western Turkey</i> .....	7
Abdullah Hacı – K. Aslihan Yener	
<i>Anatolian Pot Marks in the 3rd Millennium BC: Signage, Early State Formation, and     Organization of Production</i> .....	25
A. Tuba Ökse	
<i>Reflection on the Sunrise Positions in Early and Middle Bronze Age Extramural     Cemeteries in Anatolia</i> .....	59
Sevgül Çilingir Cesur	
<i>The Timing of Ritual Performance in Hittite Texts: The “Morning” Rites</i> .....	87
Dries Daems	
<i>Reassessing the Origin of Polis in Lycia and Southwest Anatolia</i> .....	111
Fatma Şahin – Erkan Alkaç	
<i>Banded Bowls from Tepebağ Höyük (Cilicia Pedias)</i> .....	133
Özgün Kasar – Kaan İren	
<i>Leaded Bronze Arrowheads at Daskyleion</i> .....	175
Hazar Kaba	
<i>An Elite Tomb from Soloi: New Evidence for the Funerary Archaeology of Cyprus</i> .....	205
Erkan Alkaç – Ulus Tepebaş	
<i>The Gem Stamp on the Handle of a Mushroom-rimmed Amphora from Knidos:     An Assessment of the Centauromachy in Terms of Stamps and Iconography</i> .....	239
Hüseyin Sami Öztürk – Ögül Emre Öncü	
<i>Olympos in Lycia: A Novel Assessment of its History and Localization in Light of Recent     Archaeological and Epigraphical Research</i> .....	253
Nihal Tüner Önen	
<i>Two New Inscriptions from the Claudian Period at Perge</i> .....	277
Handegül Canlı	
<i>A Unique Roman Folding Knife Handle with Eagle Ornament from Philadelphia in Cilicia</i> .....	289

Şenkal Kileci – Birol Can	
<i>A New Honorific Inscription from Blaundos: Tiberius Claudius Lucius, the Priest of</i>	
<i>Dionysos Kathegemon</i> .....	297
Ahmet Tolga Tek – Hacer Sancaktar	
<i>A Numismatic Riddle from Arykanda: The God of the Water Spring</i> .....	311
Mark Wilson	
<i>The Discovery of a Menorah in Attalia (Kaleiçi, Antalya) and its Significance for</i>	
<i>Jewish Communities in Pamphylia</i> .....	343
Özgü Çömezoglu Uzbek	
<i>A North African Plate Unearthed in the Andriake Excavations</i> .....	361
Philip Bes	
<i>Early Byzantine Pottery from Limyra's West and East Gate Excavations</i> .....	377
Nilgün Elam	
<i>Ecclesiastical Personages of Side (Σίδη) of Pamphylia according to Literary and Sphragistic Data</i> .....	409
Ömür Bakırer	
<i>Window Glass from the Excavations in the Seljuk Palace at Alanya</i> .....	451
Mahmut Demir – Terrance Michael Patrick Duggan – Erkan Kurul	
<i>Observations and Assessments of Some Epigraphic Graffiti Found on Entrances in</i>	
<i>Kaleiçi/Antalya</i> .....	479
Ayşe Ozil	
<i>A Traveller in One's Homeland: Local Interest in Archaeology and Travel Writing in the</i>	
<i>Ottoman Greek World in 19th Century Anatolia</i> .....	497
Alex Rodriguez Suarez	
<i>Two Church Bells from Antalya: Traces of the Religious Soundscape of the Late Ottoman Period</i> .....	517

## Ecclesiastical Personages of Side (Σίδη) of Pamphylia according to Literary and Sphragistic Data

NİLGÜN ELAM\*

### Abstract

Combining the hagiographic and historiographic data with sigillographic evidence, this article aims to contribute to our understanding of the ecclesiastical personages once active in Side of Pamphylia. It derives from my ongoing work on Byzantine seals, for which I received funding for my on-site and library research project on the “History of Byzantine Side of Pamphylia in the Light of Sigillographic Sources (4th-14th centuries) from the Anadolu University Scientific Research Projects Commission under grant no: E1105E98 (2011). Using old and new sigillographic evidence, duly complemented by relevant references in literary and hagiographic sources, prosopographic lists of the Byzantine officials, courtly and ecclesiastical figures are compiled and presented.

**Keywords:** Side, Pamphylia, Byzantine sigillography, Byzantine lead seals, metropolitan, bishop

### Öz

Bu makalenin amacı, hagiografik ve historiografik kaynakların verilerini sigillografik delillerle birleştirerek Bizans Dönemi’nde Pamphylia’nın Side kentinde aktif görevde bulunan ekklesiyaistik şahsiyetler konusundaki bilgilerimize katkıda bulunmaktır. Bu makale, Anadolu Üniversitesi Bilimsel Araştırma Projeleri Komisyonu (proje no: E1105E98) (2011) tarafından desteklenmiş olan “Sigillografik Kaynaklar Işığında Side (Pamphylia)’nin Bizans Dönemi Tarihi (4-14. Yüzyıllar)” konulu proje kapsamında saha ve kütüphane araştırmaları sırasında Bizans mühürleri üzerine yaptığım araştırmaların sonuçlarına dayanmaktadır. Yazılı ve hagiografik kaynaklardaki ilgili referanslarla desteklenen eski ve yeni sigillografik kanıtları kullanarak, Bizans Dönemi’nde sarayda ve Side metropolitliğinde görev yapmış ekklesiyaistik figürlerle ilgili prosopografik listeleri ortaya koymaktır.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Side, Pamphylia, Bizans sigillografisi, Bizans kurşun mühürleri, metropolit, piskopos

### Introduction

As metropolis of Pamphylia Prima, Byzantine Side was the seat of many metropolitans who can be traced by literary sources and sigillographic material preserved in several collections all over the world. There are five episcopal seals in the Dumbarton Oaks collection (Washington, DC), three seals in the Vienna Museum, two seals in the Institute Française des Études Byzantines (IFEB/Paris), one seal in the Numismatic Museum at Athens, and one seal in the Fogg Museum at Harvard University. These have already been published by scholars. One other seal from the Side Museum, found during excavations carried out in 2010 in the city, also was probably of a

\* Assist. Prof. Dr. Nilgün Elam, Anadolu Üniversitesi, Edebiyat Fakültesi, Tarih Bölümü, Eskişehir.  
E-mail: nelam@anadolu.edu.tr ; <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6966-4778>

bishop of Side. I have recently identified in the Alanya Museum and the Amasya Museum two unpublished lead seals which formerly belonged to Ioannes, metropolitan of Side (11th cent.). The aim of this article is to make a prosopographical contribution to the episcopal personnel of Byzantine Side through this unpublished sigillographical material and to present them along with those already attested by published material as well as by Byzantine historiography. In the course of this research I am grateful to receive the valuable support of the academic and administrative staff of the Anadolu University as well as the museum directors, the archaeologists who are responsible for the sigillographic inventory at the museums, and a number of colleagues and friends.<sup>1</sup>

Side is located approximately 60 km east of Attaleia (modern Antalya). The city was situated in Roman Pamphylia. After the administrative reform under Emperor Diocletian (284-305), the large territory of the diocese of Asia, or Asiana, was subordinated to the Prefecture of the East, which covered the richest part of Asia Minor. The Prefecture was divided into seven provinces: Asia, Hellespontos, Lydia, Caria, Lycia, Pamphylia, some Aegean islands, Pisidia, Lycaonia, Phrygia Pacatiana, and Phrygia Salutaria. As a part of the Diocletianic reform the administration of Lycia and Pamphylia was united under a Praeses (ἡγεμῶν, ἄρχων).<sup>2</sup> The capital of Pamphylia was probably Perge<sup>3</sup> while that of Lycia was Myra.<sup>4</sup> After 312 the Constantinian administrative

<sup>1</sup> I own many thanks to personnel of these institutions without whose permission I could not have conducted my research project. First of all, I would like to express my gratitude to the Anadolu University Project Office for financing my research project. Their support made it possible for me to visit the museums named below to examine their seal collections. I wish to thank Mr. Güner Kozdere, Director of the Side Museum, Ms. Seher Türkmen, the Director of the Alanya Museum and Mr. Celal Özdemir, the Director of Amasya Museum, for kindly permitting me to work in their seal collections. I would also like to thank Ms. Gülcan Demir, Mr. Süleyman Atalay and Mr. Melih Kılıncı respectively for their friendly assistance as archaeologists of the Numismatic Departments in these museums. I wish to express my sincere thanks to Prof. Dr. Hüseyin Alanyalı, former director of the excavations at Side, and Prof. Dr. Feriştah Soykal Alanyalı, current director of the archaeological team, for encouraging me to include the seals found during the excavations in my project. I owe many thanks to Dr. Georgios Kakavas, director of the Numismatic Museum at Athens, and Ms. Giorga Nikolaou, for permitting me to examine only lead seal of Side in the museum collection. I thank Mr. Panagiotis Sotiropoulos for helping me to measure the only piece while I was taking its photographs. I express my gratitude to Ms. Anna Stavrakopoulou, Program Director of Byzantine Studies, Ms. Carla Galfano, Registrar and Collections Manager, and Mr. Jonathan Shea, Associate Curator of Coins and Seals, all at the Dumbarton Oaks Institute, for kindly providing photographic material of the seals of Sidetan bishops along with permission to include them in this article. I am grateful to Prof. Dr. Jean Claude Cheynet and Mme Vassa Kountoumas Conticello, Presidente de l'Association de l'Institut Français d'Études Byzantines (IFEB) for providing the photographic material of two seals from the collections of the IFEB (Paris) and giving me permission to publish them along with the other material of Side. I owe many thanks to Mr. Michael Alram, Director of the Vienna Museum, who generously provided the photographic data of two seals and gave me permission to publish them. Prof. Jean Claude Cheynet has kindly and generously helped with his suggestions based on many years of experience in Byzantine Sigillography. Attendance at Prof. Cheynet's conferences on Byzantine sigillography (Pera Museum, Istanbul, 2008) and seminars during the summer schools organized by Prof. Dr. Basileios Katsaros from the Aristotle University of Thessaloniki (AUTH) and Prof. Dr. Paolo Odorico from the EHESS (Serres-Thessaloniki, Greece, 2011, 2012) led me to work in this extremely interesting area. Prof. Werner Seibt has also made a significant contribution to my work with his professional opinions from the moment that I met him at the Vienna Dialogues: Conversation and Cooperation: Byzantine Research in Central, Eastern and Southern Europe, held in the Department of Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies in April 2013 and on. I am also thankful to Associate Prof. Dr. Alexandra-Kyriaki Wassiliou-Seibt for her mentorship and sharing her precious scholarly expertise from the beginning of my quest for the ecclesiastical seals of Side in more than forty Turkish museums. I am very grateful to Father John (Ioakeim) Cotsonis for his esteemed suggestions on iconographic matters. I would also like to express my gratitude to Dr. Olga Karagiorgou and Dr. Pantelis Charalampakis for their suggestions and help on sigillographic matters, and of course for their friendship. Finally, I am very thankful to Dr. Suna Çağaptay and Dr. Günder Varinlioğlu who were very kind and patient with me to discuss on Byzantine architectural matters.

<sup>2</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 109 n. 167, 403-4, Appendix A in Appendix C.

<sup>3</sup> Hierocles 1939, 6; Chrysos 1966, 100; Roueché 1989, 216; Nollé 1993a, 315; 1993b, 135; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 109 n. 169.

<sup>4</sup> Hierocles 1939, 684.2; Ioannes Malalas 2000, 286; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 109 n. 168.



reform divided again the double province of Lycia and Pamphylia when the two different ethnic groups of the Lycians and Pamphylia jointly petitioned the emperor Maximinus Daia and Eusebius, Praeses of Lycia and Pamphylia.<sup>5</sup> This new status quo was also reflected to the ecclesiastical administration. At the first Ecumenical Council in Nicaea in 325, Pamphylia was represented independently first time.<sup>6</sup>

According to the *Notitia Episcopatum Ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae*, at the end of the 3rd century two Metropolitan<sup>7</sup> sees were created in Pamphylia. The Metropolis of Side was head of sixteen Eastern Pamphylia dioceses, while Perge of eighteen Western Pamphylia dioceses.<sup>8</sup> The famous competition that flared up between the two cities in Antiquity continued in the 4th century. This competition was evident in the religious leadership as well.<sup>9</sup> This is indicated by this unusual ecclesiastical organization of the newly created province of Pamphylia at the beginning of the 4th century.<sup>10</sup> This double-headed organization was unusual since, according to the 4th Canon of the First Council (Nicaea, 325), each province should have only one metropolitan with full authority.<sup>11</sup> However, in the list of participating ecclesiastical leaders at the second Ecumenical Council in Constantinople in 381, Perge and Side were still represented in the rank of metropolis.<sup>12</sup>

According to Nollé, “such legislation was a temporary solution, since there should only be an ecclesiastical metropolis in each province, which usually coincides with the secular metropolis, i.e. the ‘capital-city’ of the province.”<sup>13</sup> If, however, several metropolitan seats emerged in a secular province, as Nollé emphasizes, the province of Bithynia which had three metropolitan seats should be remembered. These cities were Chalcedon (Kadıköy) and the two traditionally hostile cities of Nikomedeia (Izmit) and Nicaea (Iznik) which had constant competition and violent disputes.<sup>14</sup> The Council of Nicaea had already determined in its 4th canon that there should be only one metropolitan with full authority in each province.<sup>15</sup>

<sup>5</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 109 n. 163.

<sup>6</sup> Honigsmann 1935, 47-48; Ruggieri 1993, 340; Brandt 1992, 169; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 109; Brandt and Kolb 2005, 26.

<sup>7</sup> Metropolitan (μητροπολίτης): authority and title. Metropolitans were the ecclesiastical administrators of Byzantine provinces. The metropolitan resided in a metropolis (capital of the province). As head of the diocese (the region under his authority) or bishopric, he had the authority to approve the election of the bishops. The *ἀρχιεπίσκοποι* (archbishops) of some cities such as Thessaloniki, the second city of the Empire in importance, used to be mentioned with this title; see Papadakis 1991a.

<sup>8</sup> Darrouzès 1981, no. 1.15: ἡ ἐπαρχία Παμφυλίας ὁ Σίδης (“The 10th eparchy of Pamphylia, the [the metropolitan] of Side”) n. 30: κε’ ἐπαρχία Παμφυλίας ὁ Πέργης (ἦτοι Συλαίου) (“25th eparchy of Pamphylia the [metropolitan] of Perge [that is of Syllaion]”). For the details of the ecclesiastical division and conjectures about the date of its establishment. cf. Ramsay 1890, 415 n. 101; Ruge 1949, 375-78; Nollé 1993a, 313-14.

<sup>9</sup> Roueché 1989, 205-28. Ramsay 1890, 415; Nollé 1993a, 313-14. Pekman 1973, 98, claims that the dispute between Perge and Side was not settled after the establishment of two metropolitan seats.

<sup>10</sup> For the time of the separation of Pamphylia and Lycia see Nollé 1986, 202 n. 24 (with the older literature).

<sup>11</sup> *ACO II*, 1: τὸ δὲ κῦρος τῶν γινομένων διοίσει καθ’ ἐκάστην ἐπαρχίαν τῷ μητροπολίτῃ ἐπισκόπῳ (“The confirmation of the modification [episcopal election and ordination] should be the responsibility of the metropolitan in every eparchy”). Generally, for the expansion of the Metropolitan Constitution at this council see Beck 1959, 29 n. 104.

<sup>12</sup> Turner 1913, 170; Michel le Syrien 1899, 318; Ruggieri 1993, 349; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 142.

<sup>13</sup> See Lübeck 1901, 38-45; Beck 1959, 27-32; Herrmann 1980, 56-57; Nollé 1993a, 314.

<sup>14</sup> The dispute was dealt with at the Council of Chalcedon (451); The conciliar documents (*ACO II*, 1) are compiled by Şahin and Merkelbach 1987, 37-41, T 26; Nollé 1993a, 314 n. 105.

<sup>15</sup> Cf. n. 11; Nollé 1993a, 314 n. 106.

Thus, the double-headed ecclesiastical organization of Pamphylia was still in valid in the forthcoming councils. In the episcopal lists of the councils held in Ephesos in 431 and in Chalcedon in 451, the mention of Side before Perge indicates that the city probably was the true metropolis of Pamphylia.<sup>16</sup> At the Council of Ephesos (431) Eustathios appears as “metropolitan” (of Pamphylia).<sup>17</sup> A bishop represented Side at the councils in Ephesos and Chalcedon along with five suffragan bishops.<sup>18</sup>

The provision of the 4th Canon of Nicaea, which accepted the rule “one metropolitan with full authority in each province,” was again impressed at the Council of Chalcedon (451).<sup>19</sup> It stated that the other metropolitans would have only his title (ὄνομα) and full rights (τιμή).<sup>20</sup> In 458 the rank of Side is attested higher than Perge in a letter written by the ecclesiastical leaders to Emperor Leo I (457-474). In this, the metropolitan of Perge seems to have signed the letter along with the fourteen bishops attached to his metropolis.<sup>21</sup> The Synekdemos of Hierokles also states that in the 4th and 5th centuries all the neighboring cities depended on the metropolis of Side.<sup>22</sup>

This status quo seems to have changed in the 6th century. As attested by the Ekthesis of Epiphanius, a revision of an earlier Notitia Episcopatum probably compiled by Patriarch Epiphanius (520-535) under Justinian I (527-565), Pamphylia was divided into two ecclesiastical dioceses within the province of politically undivided Pamphylia. Side became the “metropolitan” center of Pamphylia Prima, and Perge became the center of Pamphylia Secunda. Also, the number of dependant bishoprics of Side seems to have had risen to sixteen.<sup>23</sup>

In the council of 536 ὁ ἐπίσκοπος τῆς Πέργης appears in the 20th row and ὁ ἐπίσκοπος τῆς Σίδης in the 24th.<sup>24</sup> However, in the episcopal list of the council in 553, the episkopos of Perge appears in the 36th row and his Sidetan colleague in the 14th row. This information confirms the idea that Perge had lost its leading position to Side.<sup>25</sup>

Side was represented at all the councils of the 7th and 8th centuries.<sup>26</sup> But when the Persian occupation started early in the 7th century, which was followed by Arab invasions, Side faded like all the Pamphylian cities. Earthquakes and epidemics accelerated its decline.<sup>27</sup>

<sup>16</sup> Chrysos 1966, 162-165; Nollé 1993a, 315 nn. 113-14.

<sup>17</sup> ACO I, 1.7, 8, 123-24 and I.5, 536; Schultze 1926, 211-12; Disdier 1931, 148-49; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 142 n. 45.

<sup>18</sup> Honigmann 1942-1943, 50 nn. 400-3.

<sup>19</sup> ACO II, 1: ὁ κανὼν οὕτως διαγορεύει ὥστε ἐν μίαι ἐκάστη τῶν ἐπαρχιῶν τὸ κῆρος ἔχειν τὸν τῆς μητροπόλεως καὶ αὐτὸν καθιστᾶν πάντα τοὺς ὑπὸ τὴν αὐτὴν ἐπαρχίαν ὄντας ἐπισκόπους (The canon thus declares that in each of the provinces the power belongs to the head of the metropolis, who presides over all the bishops of the province.)

<sup>20</sup> Smyrna (modern Izmir) was also one of the honorary metropolitans of Lydia, which had been in continuous competition with Ephesos. The constant rivalry between Hieropolis and the neighboring city of Laodikeia in Phrygia Pacatiana also was well-known. See Feissel 1989, 810-11; Nollé 1993a, 314 n. 108.

<sup>21</sup> ACO II, 5, 60; Amphilochios 1864, 1515; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 142 n. 48, 145 n. 73.

<sup>22</sup> Hierocles 1939, 29, 30; Papadopoulos 1963, 448; Darrouzès 1977, 506-7; Le Quien 1740, 995-1002; Ruge 1923, 2208-209; Schultze 1926, 215-17; Laurent 1963, 293-97; 1972, 78-79.

<sup>23</sup> Darrouzès 1981, 417.26 (Notitia 20): ὁ Συλαίου, ὃς καὶ Πέργης λέγεται, δευτέρως Παμφυλίας (“[The bishop of] Syllion who is called also as of Perge, of Pamphylia Secunda”); Gelzer 1900, 538, nos. 190-205; Ruge 1949, 377.

<sup>24</sup> Mansel 1963, 24-25; Foss 1977, 169-70; Nollé 1993b, 88-91; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 142 n. 47.

<sup>25</sup> Chrysos 1966, 162; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 143 n. 44.

<sup>26</sup> Mansi 1765, 380D, 689C; 1767, 381B; cf. Darrouzès 1975, 62-76; Brandes 1989, 128 n. 12.

<sup>27</sup> Brandes 1989, 179-88; Ruggieri and Nethercott 1986, 143.

At the end of the late 7th century, the Metropolitan of Perge moved to mountainous Sillyon, which kept a certain importance until the Turkish period.<sup>28</sup> Like other mountainous cities, Selge left the ecclesiastical federation led by the metropolitan of Side and became an independent bishopric (autokephale diocese).<sup>29</sup> Finally, the population of Side decreased and was forced to restrict the urban area. In that period, the eastern part of the Episkopeion was abandoned. As the ecclesiastical metropolis of Pamphylia Prima and Secunda, Attaleia succeeded Perge/Syllaion and Side.<sup>30</sup>

### A) Side as a City of Christian Martyrs

The hagiographic tradition dedicated to the holy martyrs consists of the most ancient sources testifying to the existence of the Christian community in Side. The hagiographical sources attest that Side was the home of several saints with the Christian community being created there in the 3rd century. More martyrdoms in Side and other Pamphylian cities like Attaleia, Magydos and Perge are testified under the emperors Decius (249-251), Aurelian (270-275), Diocletian (284-305) and Maximian (286-305). The conversion of the population in the Pamphylian cities and villages is attributed to St. Lucian of Antioch († 312 Nicomedia).<sup>31</sup>

Tension in the relationship between the Roman civic religion and Christianity is reflected in an inscription dated to 312. From the inscription, it is understood that the pagans complained to the emperor Maximinus Daia (308-313) about the insanity of Christians, who insisted on their “illness” until that time, and requested them finally to be stopped.<sup>32</sup>

In the reign of Decius (249-251) St. Konon Hortulanus (“the gardener”) (Κόνων ὁ Κηπουρός) was from Side. It is understood that he was living in Magydos but may have also been affiliated with Side. In the Synaxarium his memory is commemorated on 5 March.<sup>33</sup> However, the “Nine Martyrs” - Leontios, Attes, Alexander, Kindaios, Mnesitheos, Kyriakos, Minnaios and Katunes - are very likely to be a part of the hagiographic tradition of Side and Perge. A short version of their martyrion has been affiliated erroneously only with Perge, despite indications about the Sidetan origin of some of these saints.<sup>34</sup> In any case, in his martyrion the homeland of presbyter Kindaios is located in Talmenia,<sup>35</sup> which was one of the villages of Side. According to hagiographic tradition, the saints were executed in the theater, and their memory is commemorated on 1 August.<sup>36</sup> In the Synaxarion and the Passio SS. Severi, Memnonis et Aliorum, Severus suffered martyrdom with Memnon in Bizye of Thrace in 308. Severus was half Thracian from his paternal side and half Sidetan from his maternal side: Σευῆρος δὲ ἅγιος πρὸς μὲν πατρός ἦν Θραξ, πρὸς δὲ μητρός Σιδήτης ἐκ Παμφυλίας, ἐκαλεῖτο δὲ ὁ μὲν πατήρ αὐτοῦ Πετρόνιος, ἡ δὲ μητήρ Μυγδονία.... When the persecution started against Christians, he was forced to leave Side and

<sup>28</sup> Yetkin 1974, 861-62; Ruggieri and Nethercott 1986, 132-56; Brandt 1992, 170-71; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 142, 362; see also 139-51 for the ecclesiastical history of Pamphylia.

<sup>29</sup> Foss 1991, 1980; Nollé and Schindler 1991, 39 n. 51, T17, 29-35 n. 2.

<sup>30</sup> Flemming 1964, 17-27; Nollé 1993a, 316; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 151 n. 136.

<sup>31</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 140 nn. 29, 30.

<sup>32</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 140 n. 33; For a critics on the complaint of the pagans and the responde of the emperor see Wilson 2018, 21-23.

<sup>33</sup> Papadopoulos-Kerameus 1898, 388-89; von Gebhardt 1902, 133; Delehaye 1902a, 511-12; Halkin 1935, 369-74; 1969, 49; 1985, 5-34; 1987, 264; ACO III, 115.24; Zanetti 1998, 345; Musurillo 1972, 186-92; Nollé 2001, 505.

<sup>34</sup> Delehaye 1902a, 860-92; Nollé 1993b, 131, 190-94; Haensch 1997, 293.

<sup>35</sup> Delehaye 1902a, 814; Nollé 1993b, 131, 192-93. For Talmenia see Zgusta 1984, 1288.

<sup>36</sup> Delehaye 1902a, 860-92; 1912a, 288; Nollé 1993b, 131, 190-91; Haensch 1997, 293.

move to Thrace. St. Severus and Memnon's feast day is 24 August.<sup>37</sup> Probos was also a Sidetan, who was martyred in Anazarbos of Cilicia with his companions Tarachus and Andronicus during the reign of Diocletian (284-305). Their feast day is 12 October.<sup>38</sup> The martyria and chapels in the theater of Side are considered as proof for the creation of a martyr cult in the city in the 4th-5th centuries. Although no epigraphical material has been found in the theater excavations, two small structures, dated to the 5th-6th centuries and described as martyria, can be associated with the nine martyrs who had attacked the Temple of Artemis in the territory of Side and destroyed its statues.<sup>39</sup> The hagiographical works, or the Lives of the Saints, reveal that the efforts of the clergy played a role in the development of a martyr culture in the city. Even Hilarion, a 12th century metropolitan in Side, writes that high-ranking priests were still conducting religious ceremonies in this area.<sup>40</sup>

## B) Side as an Ecclesiastical Seat

The earliest evidence about the existence of Christian leaders of Side can be traced to the hagiographic tradition. The information about the ecclesiastical leaders of the Christian population is also based on epistles as well as council records. From the 10th century, the main information comes from sigillographic material belonging to Sidetan bishops which is scattered in the museums and collections all over the world. The aim of this section is to gather information of written sources about ecclesiastical personnel who functioned in Side between the 3rd and 10th centuries.

ΞΕΝΟΦΩΝ. Xenophon lived during the Diocletianic period (284-305) and is the first bishop of Side mentioned in Byzantine hagiography.<sup>41</sup>

ΕΠΙΔΑΥΡΟΣ. Epidauros attended the Homoousian synod of Ankyra in 314. His attendance is attested by his signature as Epidauros Pisidensis Pamphyliae or, more correctly, Epidauros Sidensis Pamphyliae.<sup>42</sup>

ΕΥΣΤΑΘΙΟΣ. The late Arif Müfit Mansel, who directed the archaeological excavations in this Pamphylian city between 1947-1966, stated that "in the 4th century Side was impoverished and it became quite insignificant, but still showed a portrait of a Christian city. Therefore, Side was

<sup>37</sup> Migne 1894a, 593A; Delehaye 1902a, 909, 920-22; Sauget 1968, 1005; Delehaye 1912b, 192-94; Nollé 1993b, 193.

<sup>38</sup> Delehaye 1902b, 131-32; Schultze 1926, 216; Hild and Hellenkemper 1990, 8-9; Nollé 1993b, 131, 194.

<sup>39</sup> These small structures constructed on the orchestra level at both ends of the lower cavea are located in the north and south of the theater. Though described as chapels by Mansel 1962, 54, they are apparently martyria, which may have been built during the architectural changes in the 5th-6th centuries when the theater started to be used as an open-air church. See Mansel 1978, 210-11, figs. 238-39; cf. also figs. 21-22 in the Appendix. It is not possible to define these structures as chapels because of the absence of an apse, niche, and other liturgical elements in those areas; one might suggest that these small structures were transformed to martyria during the above-mentioned period. For the necessary elements of church/chapel see Koch 2007, 69-70, 88-89; this hypothesis seems conceivable when combined with data from hagiographic texts narrating that at the end of 3rd century many Christians fell victim to the persecutions of the Roman emperors. The place of martyrdom of the nine martyrs is noted as Perge in the *Martyrologium Romanum*; cf. Delehaye 1940, 317-18 n. 7, and as Pamphylia in the *Menologium Basilianum* 1894b, 568; Delehaye 1902a, 860-62; Schultze 1926, 216. According to Nollé, this mention is consistent with Side, a city significant for the cult of Artemis. A temple of Artemis is attested in the territory of Side, located nine stadia east of the mouth of Melas (Manavgat çayı). It is reasonable to think that the Christian zeal of the nine martyrs, eight of whom were peasants, directed them against the rural sanctuary. For hagiographic texts and their critics, see Nollé 1993b, 15-23, 190-93.

<sup>40</sup> Halkin 1975, 287-311; Nollé 1993b, 186 n. 170.

<sup>41</sup> Delehaye 1912b, 192; Nollé 1993b, 193 n. 189; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 375.

<sup>42</sup> Le Quien 1740, 997; Turner 1907, 32. Ruggieri and Hellenkemper and Hild, based upon Mansi's edition, claimed that Epidauros served as the first bishop of Perge as attested in the synod of Ankara (314); cf. Mansi 1759, 528, 534; Ruggieri 1993, 351; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 141.

not represented in the first Ecumenical Council".<sup>43</sup> However, the council held in Nicaea in 325 was most probably presided over by Eustathios, the bishop of Antioch.<sup>44</sup>

Eustathios was born in Side (ca. 280)<sup>45</sup> and thanks to his charismatic personality, his education, his eloquence, and his dedication to the institutions of the church became one of the greatest faces of the Eastern Church in the 4th century.<sup>46</sup> The statements of prominent church leaders praising Eustathios reveal his abilities. St. Athanasios of Alexandria described Eustathios as ἀνὴρ ὁμολογητῆς καὶ πίστην εὐσεβῆς ("a person tortured and martyred because of his faith") and ὁμολογητῆς καὶ ὀρθόδοξος ("Confessor and Orthodox").<sup>47</sup> Ioannes Chrysostomos wrote an encomium for Eustathios describing him as a wise man (σοφός τις ἀνὴρ).<sup>48</sup>

Eustathios was assigned as bishop of Beroea (modern Aleppo)<sup>49</sup> at some point (ca. 311/312)<sup>50</sup> before the outbreak of the Arian controversy. He was transferred to the bishopric of Antioch, perhaps at the Synod of Antioch in 324/325.<sup>51</sup> As a great defender of Orthodoxy, Eustathios condemned Arius and his followers during the sessions of the Council of Nicaea in 325. After Nicaea, he produced extensive anti-subordinationist polemic writings in which Eusebios of Caesarea was among his major opponents. Despite having worked hard to spread Orthodox doctrine, he was deposed in 327-328 in circumstances related to the emperor Constantine I's change of mind in favor of the Eusebian party. He was declared a heretic by his enemies at the Council of Antioch in 330 and exiled to Bizye of Thrace

<sup>43</sup> Mansel 1978, 16.

<sup>44</sup> Concerning Eustathios' position in the Council of Nicaea, modern scholarship is divided into two groups. The first group relies on the account of Theodoret of Cyrus 1864, 920C-921C, who describes Eustathios as the only one who took the presidency of the Council: τὴν προεδρείαν λαχόν. The second group, citing a phrase in *Vita Constantini* written by Eusebios of Caesarea 1857, 1069B: παρεδίδου τὸν λόγον τοῖς τῆς συνόδου προέδροις, think that Eustathios was one of the presidents of the Synod but not the only one. For example, Tanner 1990, 2, unsure about Eustathios' presidency, assumes that archbishop of Antioch or Athanasios of Alexandria presided over the sessions. According to Φειδάς, Eusebios, the pro-Arian bishop of Caesarea, had personal reasons not to mention the name of his opponent Eustathios as president. In this logic, Eustathios as the first archbishop of Syria was undoubtedly the "main figure" at Nicaea, and the "first one" who addressed to the emperor, as testified by Theodoret of Cyrus. An independent source strengthens this point of view. A letter of Pope Felix III (483-492) to the Emperor Zenon, in which Eustathios is described as the president of the Council of Nicaea, should be also taken into consideration. For all these reasons, Eustathios seem to have been in the primary position as the "speaker" towards the emperor on behalf of the synod. This means that he chaired the sessions, so he was the first prelate to sign the conciliar decisions. For the discussions on the presidency of the Council, see Φειδάς 2002, 437-39.

<sup>45</sup> Jerome 1895, 85: "Eustathius, genere Pamphylus Sidetes, primum Veria Syriae, deinde Antiochiae episcopus (Eustathius from a Sidetan family of Pamphylia, first [bishop] Veria of Syria and then bishop of Antioch)."

<sup>46</sup> Sozomenos 1960, 76.6-10: Εὐστάθιος ἀνὴρ τὰ τε ἄλλα καλὸς καὶ ἀγαθός, καὶ ἐπὶ εὐγλωττία δικαίως θαυμαζόμενος ὡς ἐκ τῶν φερομένων αὐτοῦ λόγων συνιδεῖν ἔστιν, ἀρχαϊότητι φράσεως καὶ σωφροσύνῃ νοημάτων, καὶ ὀνομάτων κάλλει καὶ χάριτι ἀπαγγελίας εὐδοκιμούντων (Eustathios was in general a handsome and good man, and deservedly admired for his eloquence as one may judge from the verses attributed to him, the archaic style of his speech and his prudence, as well as the beauty of the words he uses and the grace of his orations. As hinted by Sozomenos, the style in his writings points out Eustathios' level of education since he was familiar with the works of Plato, Homer, Hesiod, Aristophanes, Demosthenes and other ancient writers. Therefore, it is not excluded that he studied in the School of Antioch. He was known as a good rhetor and mature scholar in his circle. Eustathios' continuous zeal for writing produced many works. He was apparently not educated only in theology, but also in ancient philology and philosophy; see Παπαδόπουλος 1951, 634.

<sup>47</sup> Athanasios 1857a, 697D-698A; 1857b, 648B; Sozomenos 1960, 76.7.

<sup>48</sup> Ioannes Chrysostomos 1862, 601C, describe him as martyr (Οὗτος ὁ μάρτυς [μάρτυρα γὰρ ἦμιν]). In his letter addressed to the emperor Zenon, Pope Felix III (483-492) describes Eustathios as homologetes. See Pope Felix 1862, 920; Delehaye 1933, 96-97.

<sup>49</sup> Athanasios 1857b, 648C; Devreesse 1945, 163.

<sup>50</sup> Nicephorus Constantinopolitanus 1863, 1053C; Devreesse 1945, 115, κορυφαίος.

<sup>51</sup> In 320, Alexander of Alexandria sent letters to bishops, including Eustathios, informing them of the appearance of the heresy of Arius, and warning them about Arianist teaching. See Theodoret of Cyrus 1864, 921C.



(modern Vize).<sup>52</sup> He was canonized not long after his death (sometime between 337 and 380),<sup>53</sup> and his epiphany date is February 21.<sup>54</sup>

Another important ecclesiastical personage related to Side is Amphilochios, bishop of Iconium and metropolitan of Lycaonia. He was Cappadocian and lived in retirement at Ozizalis in Cappadocia. He was assigned to the seat of Iconium in Lycaonia, or Pisidia Secunda in 373/374. He was a cousin of Gregory of Nazianzos and had a friendship with Basil of Caesarea, who wrote an epistle related to his assignment.<sup>55</sup> He chose Side to convene twenty-five Lycaonian and Pisidian bishops for a synod around 390 against the Messalian heretics, who were then active in Pamphylia and neighboring regions. As reported in Photios's *Bibliotheca*, the synod at Side condemned the Messalians.<sup>56</sup>

ΙΩΑΝΝΗΣ (1st). The prelate is the first one among his namesake successors. In his *Historia Ecclesiae*, Socrates Scholasticus (ca. 380–450) mentions a Ioannes as the bishop of Side, who is described as a pen master: τὰ πολλὰ τῷ ἐπισκόπῳ Ἰωάννῃ σῶκῳ, ἐφιλονεῖκει καὶ περὶ λόγους.<sup>57</sup>

ΑΜΦΙΛΟΧΙΟΣ. Amphilochios participated in the Council of Ephesus in 431 which condemned Nestorios. He was also present at the Council of Chalcedon (Καδικὸς) in 451. His name is mentioned in the conciliar records as episcopus Sidae and καὶ Ἀμφιλοχίου του εὐλαβεστάτου ἐπισκόπου Σίδης (“the most revered bishop of Side”). Side was represented as metropolis of Pamphylia Prima in the Councils of Ephesus and Chalcedon, and in the conciliar lists it is mentioned before Perge.<sup>58</sup>

ΚΟΝΩΝ. From the acts of the synod held in Constantinople in 536, we meet the signature of a Sidetan bishop, namely Conon Sidae (Κόνων ἐπίσκοπος Σίδης). Konon is the 24th on the list of bishops who attended the council: Κόνων ἐλέῳ Θεοῦ ἐπίσκοπος τῆς Σιδητῶν μητροπόλεως διὰ τῆς ἀναγνώσεως τοῖς πεπραγμένοις ἐπιστὰς ὀρίσας ὑπεσημάνην.<sup>59</sup> In this council the rank of Perge seems to have been elevated.<sup>60</sup>

<sup>52</sup> Le Quien 1740, 998; Sozomenos 1960, 255.1-2; Jülicher 1907, no. 9, 1448-449. For the ecclesiastical discussions during the Council of Nicaea see Migne 1837, 613-74. For the fate of Eustathios, see Socrates Scholasticus 1995, (council of 359) 154.7; 169.8; 47.27; 70.7, 70.15-71.20; 98.17-19; 244.11-12; 244.22, 334.14; Gwatkin 1882, 76-77. For discussions on Eustathios's deposition see Chadwick 1948, 27-35; Barnes 1978, 53-75; Hanson 1984, 171-79; 1988, 210; Burgess 1999, 191-96; 2000, 150-60; Parvis 2006a, 89-95; 2006b, 101-7; Cartwright 2013, 465-66.

<sup>53</sup> The date of Eustathios' death is problematic. The silence of the sources caused a confusing chronology for his death, thus prompting scholars to place it in various years between 330-380. See Atiya 1967, 175; Τσάμης 1992, 153; Χρήστου 1984, 331; Kelly 1968, 281; Neale 1873, 89; Παπαβασιλείου 2004, 61; Μπαλάνου 1942, 156; Παπαδόπουλου 1951, 437, 28.

<sup>54</sup> Delehay 1902a, 480-81 n. 2; Ελευθεριάδης 1959, 96; Mandouze 1987, 25.

<sup>55</sup> Smith 1844, 150.

<sup>56</sup> Amphilochios of Iconium 1863, 9-10; Migne 1864, 1515; Photios 1959, 36-38; cf. Ficker 1906, 266-68; Tillemont 1713, 798 n. 2; Dörries 1964, 78-94; Stewart 1989, 243-49; Nollé 1993b, 139-40, 170-71.

<sup>57</sup> Le Quien 1740, 997-98, and Socrates Scholasticus 1995, 376.3-7, mentions other ecclesiastical personages related to Side. For example, a Philippus Sidenses is a deacon, then a presbyter (priest). For the text concerning Philippus see also Socrates 1859, 800-1: Περί Φιλίππου πρεσβυτέρου τοῦ ἀπὸ Σίδης. Φίλιππος Σιδίτης μὲν ἦν τὸ γένος, Σίδη δὲ πόλις τῆς Παμφυλίας, ἀφ' ἧς ὄρμητο καὶ Τρώϊλος ὁ σοφιστής, οὗ καὶ συγγενῆ ἑαυτὸν εἶναι ἐσεμνύετο. Διάκονος δὲ ἦν, ἐπεὶ τὰ πολλὰ τῷ ἐπισκόπῳ Ἰωάννῃ συνῆν (About Philippus, the presbyteros from Side. Philippus was a Sidetan by origin, and Side is a city in Pamphylia, from where Troilos the sophist also originated; and he (Philippus) was proud to be his (Troilos) relative. He was a deacon when many things happened to Bishop Ioannes. For Philippus' Christian History see Photios 1860, nos. 35, 67-68; Nollé 1993b, 140; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 376-77.

<sup>58</sup> ACO I, I.7, 112; I, 1, 2, 4, no. 19; I, 1, 7, 85, no. 21; II, 3, 2, 50, no. 22; II, 1, 3, 4, no. 21; Le Quien 1740, 998; Photios 1959, Epistle no. 52, 37-38.4-5: ... ἐν Παμφυλία ἐπισκόποις ... and 386-87: ... αὐτὸς καὶ πρὸς Ἀμφιλόχιος τὸν Σίδης ...; Grumel 1972, 34, nos. 46, 47, 49; Laurent 1971, nos. 47, 49; Nollé 1993b, 172; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 144-45, 374-75.

<sup>59</sup> ACO III, 115, 183, nos. 22 and 24; Le Quien 1740, 999; Fedalto 1988, 239; Nollé 1993b, 172.

<sup>60</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 374-75.

ΠΕΤΡΟΣ. In council in Chalcedon in 553 (for the second time) another bishop of Side is called Petrus: *episcopus Sidetorum metropoleos Pamphyliae*.<sup>61</sup> In this council Perge is also mentioned before Side. However, in later councils Side appears to have taken a higher rank than Perge.<sup>62</sup>

ΙΩΑΝΝΗΣ (2nd). Ioannes represented Side at the 6th Ecumenical Council held in Constantinople in 680/681 and signed the acts as *Ioannes episcopus metropolis Sidae provinciae Pamphyliae* (Ἰωάννης ἐλέω Θεοῦ ἐπίσκοπος Σιδητῶν μητροπόλεως τῆς Παμφύλων ἐπαρχίας). He was also present at the Quinisext Council held in 692 at Constantinople.<sup>63</sup> This is Ioannes II<sup>64</sup> who is considered to be identical to the metropolitan of Side whose name is depicted on a lead seal as Ἰωάννης μητροπολίτης Σ(ι)δης.<sup>65</sup>

During the excavations in Side A.M. Mansel found a monogram (fig. 1) located on a long horizontal marble (architrave) of the sanctuary's gate in the episkopeion chapel, separating the naos from the bema. It has been discussed by many scholars who have tried to date the episkopeion.<sup>66</sup> Ruggieri readed it as ΙΩΑΝΝΟV and thought it indicated one of the Sidetan bishops named Ioannes who served in the mid to late 6th century. He considered that "the letters indicate the period of Justinian I (527-565), or immediately after, and this coincides with the use and location of the monogram."<sup>67</sup> I assume that Bishop Ioannes who participated in the 6th Ecumenical Council can be identified with the person mentioned by the monogram (fig. 1).

<sup>61</sup> *ACO* IV, 1, 226, no. 40; IV 1, 4, no. 42; IV 1, 21, no. 42; IV 1, 33, no. 42; IV 1, 40, no. 42; IV 1, 204, no. 42; Nollé 1993b, 173; Le Quien 1740, 999; Fedalto 1988, 252.

<sup>62</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 374-75.

<sup>63</sup> Mansi 1765, 669, 989; Le Quien 1740, 999; Fedalto 1988, 252.

<sup>64</sup> *PmbZ*, no. 2727; Ohme 1990, 274.

<sup>65</sup> Zacos and Veglery 1972, no. 2030; *PmbZ*, no. 2880.

<sup>66</sup> Situated in the episkopeion complex in Side, this chapel (room no. VI) has generated much discussion among scholars. They have examined its construction technique and related small finds, and suggested a range of dates varying from the Early Christian to the Middle Byzantine periods. Some scholars have considered the chapel as a natural part of the design of the building complex and proposed suggestions on dating, ignoring features of its plan. Others, based on the argument that the plan features should be a determining factor in dating, have stated that it was added at a later period into the main complex. Mansel 1978, 277-84 made an initial assessment on the structure claiming that Room VI was the bishop's private chapel. In her study on the episkopeia of Anatolia, Ceylan 2007, 175 follows Mansel's proposal. Mansel also thinks that the structure of the chapel had two phases of construction. He dated the first phase to the same period as the episkopeion complex, that is, the 5th-6th centuries. He suggested that Room VI, described as a private episcopal chapel, might have taken its final version in the 9th-10th centuries without stating anything on its probable shape in the first stage. Feld 1977, 165 dates the construction to the 5th-6th centuries, observing that four supported domed structures such as in this chapel began to appear in that period. Müller-Wiener 1989, 683, follows Mansel's view, suggesting also that the entire episkopeion complex designed and built at once, and the chapel could be dated only to the early Middle Ages. Foss 1996, 41, compares the chapel with the domed basilicas of the 5th-6th century, especially those of the Justinian era (527-565). Apart from the architectural data, a monogram engraved on the templon architrave is another important material which may give an clue to dating; cf. Mansel 1978, 275-76, photo no. 309 (not interpreted). The monogram is now exhibited in the garden of the Side museum. Foss, because of this monogram, dates the chapel between the mid-6th and mid-7th centuries. He suggests that a reasonable dating for the entire episkopeion complex could be made through the chapel. It reads ΙΩΑΝΝΟV (of Ioannes) which indicates a bishop Ioannes whose seat was Side. Ruggieri 1995, 112, dates the monogram back to the 6th-7th centuries and suggests that Ioannes could be the founder of the structure. He also notes that the period in which Ioannes participated in the council of 680-681 is not compatible with the plan of the chapel. Gliwitzky 2005, 371 thinks that the monogram may have belonged to the 8th-9th centuries. Buchwald 1984, 199-204, 227 n. 94 proposed a later chronology underlining that the use of spolia in the chapel was a 9th-century inclination to the ancient period. Ruggieri 1991, 140, suggests the 9th century, so he disagrees with Mansel who claims that the chapel belongs to the same period as the episkopeion. Ruggieri underscores that it also has important differences, such as there are no apses in its corner rooms and it resembles the basilical planned churches.

<sup>67</sup> Ruggieri 1995, 98, see map 9, Room VI.

The cruciform monograms presenting the name, title and/or office of their owner are quite common during the 7th century and up to the end of the 8th century. The old-fashioned alpha (Α) is also characteristic mostly of the 7th and 8th centuries. The use, however, of the genitive case indicates a date within the 7th century, possibly its second half.<sup>68</sup>

ΓΕΩΡΓΙΟΣ. The information about the existence of the bishop Georgios is based on a monogram (fig. 2) (size 23 to 18 cm), located on a reused large slab made of gray tuff. It now functions as the lintel of the door (fig. 3) leading into Room VIb in the episkopeion of Side. Ruggieri paid attention to the monogram for the first time and read it - albeit erroneously - as Theodoros. The correct reading must be Georgios.<sup>69</sup> I agree with Ruggieri's chronology which dated the monogram to the 7th century.



FIG. 2 Monogram ΓΕΩΡΓΙΩΣ  
(of Georgios, dated to the 7th cent.).



FIG. 1 Monogram ΙΩΑΝΝΩΣ  
(of Ioannes, dated to between 550-650,  
photo: N. Elam, 2012).



FIG. 3 Episkopeion, Chapel, Room VIb,  
West Gate (Photo: N. Elam, 2012).

<sup>68</sup> Taking into consideration the dating suggestions of Zacos and Veglery 1972, nos. 356, 360-64, 367-68, 374-79, 384-86, 388-89, 399, pl. 236, no. 249, that are based on architectural data and on the monogram similar to those on many lead seals dated to 550-650, the production of the architrave with monogram may be put into the second half of the 7th century, especially 670-690. Therefore, the Ioannes on the monogram is identical to the prelate who participated in the council of 680/681 and is the founder of the chapel. Metcalf 2004, XV, places seal legends in the genitive before ca. 725. For the dating of monogrammatic seals, see also Seibt 2016, 1-14; Seibt 1999, 590-616. Ruggieri 1995, 98, see map 9, Room VI.

<sup>69</sup> Mansel 1978, 277, 280, did not pay any attention to this monogram ("ve başka semboller"), and photo 314; cf. Ruggieri 1995, 98 and picture no. 32. I believe that the letter on the left of the cruciform monogram is Γ; on the right E; above P and V and below (possibly) an Ω. See Zacos and Veglery 1972, pl. 231, no. 73.



During the reign of Constantine V (741-775), the metropolitan seat of Side remained empty for undetermined period because a Leon, an ek prosopos of the metropolitan, existed.<sup>70</sup>

ΑΝΩΝΥΜΟΣ. This anonymous individual attended the council held in Nicaea in 787.<sup>71</sup>

ΘΩΜΑΣ ΟΜΟΛΟΓΗΤΗΣ. Thomas Homologites (Confessor) is also attested as bishop of Side and attended the 2nd council of Nicaea (787). He may have replaced his anonymous forerunner and represented Side in the last session of the council held in Constantinople in October 787. The prelate held the seat until the years of 813-814. Only one text (scholion) has survived about him. He also participated in the synods summoned by the patriarch Nikephoros I (806-815).<sup>72</sup>

ΜΑΡΚΟΣ. Markos was a participant of the Photian council in 867. The council accused Pope Nicholas I (858-867) of being a tyrant and excommunicated him. The pope was blamed for the crisis caused by the activities of Catholic missionaries in Bulgaria. The Sidetan bishop signed the acts as Marcus Sides in Latin and Μάρκος Σίδης in Greek.<sup>73</sup>

ΕΥΣΤΑΘΙΟΣ. Eustathios lived in the 10th century. His name is not included neither in the list of Le Quien nor of Fedalto. Ruggieri mentions that he relied on the correspondance between Eustathios and Aretas of Caesarea (860-932). Eustathios of Side asked Arethas of Caesarea for a transfer to another bishopric. The exact reason for the request remains unknown. It is suggested that “his diocese may have not offered to him a sufficient subsistence.” Although the letters do not reveal more details about Eustathios’s life, they may be considered as evidence of his canonical residence of Side, although it is not stressed in the text.<sup>74</sup> Ruggieri thinks that during the period Eustathios resided in Constantinople, he was a member of the permanent synod, because Alexander of Nicaea addressed him in the same period.<sup>75</sup>

ΘΕΟΔΩΡΟΣ (2nd). In 10th century in the time of Patriarch Photios (858-867, 877-886) a Theodoros, homonymous and uncle of the bishop of Sebastia, is mentioned by Byzantine historian Georgios Kedrenos as Θεόδωρος ὁ Σίδης, καὶ ὁ τοῦτου ὁ ὁμώνυμος and Θεόδωρος ὁ τοῦ Σίδης ... καὶ ὁ τοῦτου ἀνεπιὸς καὶ ὁμώνυμος ὁ τῆς ἐν Σεβαστείᾳ.<sup>76</sup>

ΚΩΝΣΤΑΝΤΙΝΟΣ. Constantine appears as metropolitan of Side in the Synods which were held in 1027, 1028 and 1029 under Patriarch Alexios Studites (1025-1043). He signed the synodal acts as Κωνσταντῖνος Σίδης, and during the last synod he defended the Orthodox party against the Bogomils.<sup>77</sup>

<sup>70</sup> Le Quien 1740, 999-1000: Λέων πρεσβύτερος τῆς ἀγιωτάτης τοῦ Θεοῦ μεγάλης ἐκκλησίας, καὶ ἐκ προσώπου τοῦ θρόνου τῶν Σιδητῶν μητροπόλεως.

<sup>71</sup> Mansi 1767, 381.

<sup>72</sup> *PmbZ*, no. 8466; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 375.

<sup>73</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1000; Mansi 1772, 373; see also for Markos *PmbZ*, no. 24994.

<sup>74</sup> Comperness 1935, 87-125; Darrouzès 1960, 89-93; Laurent 1971, 1240; Ruggieri 1995, 98-99; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 377 n. 73.

<sup>75</sup> Darrouzès 1960, 89-93; Gautier 1971, 262; Ruggieri 1995, 99.

<sup>76</sup> Ioannes Skylitzes 1973, 4.28; Georgios Kedrenos 1838-1839, 4.9; Le Quien 1740, 1000. Fedalto 1988, 239 mentions this prelate without giving a date; cf. Ruggieri 1995, 98 n. 11 and map 9; for Theodoros see also *PmbZ*, no. 27814.

<sup>77</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1000; Ficker 1911, 19.16; Πάλλης and Ποτλής 1855, 5.24, 5.32: μητροπολιτῶν... Σίδης; Zepos 1962, 434, 519; Grumel 1989, nos. 833, 835, 850.

ΑΝΩΝΥΜΟΣ. In his *Synopsis Historiarum*, Ioannes Skylitzes mentions a bishop of Side, whose name remains anonymous, in his narration of the events of the 1030s.<sup>78</sup>

ΑΝΘΙΜΟΣ. Metropolitan Anthimos was present in the schismatic synod of 1054 held in Constantinople. He signed the acts as Ἀνθίμου Σίδης. As known, the synod was summoned by Patriarch Michael Cerularios (1043-1059), and its decisions were cursed by Pope Leo IX (1049-1054).<sup>79</sup>

ΘΕΟΔΩΡΟΣ (2nd). Georgios Kedrenos, who compiled his *Historia* in the midst of the 11th century, mentions Theodoros as Θεόδωρος ὁ τῆς Σίδης ἡγουμένος πρόεδρος.<sup>80</sup>

ΙΩΑΝΝΗΣ (3rd). During difficult times the Sidetan metropolitans resided in Constantinople. For example, Ioannes III was protosyncellos of the patriarchs of Constantinople in the second half of the 11th century. At the same time, he functioned as counselor of Emperor Michael VII Dukas (1071-1078). According to Michael Attaliates and Ioannes Zonaras, Ioannes, ἀρχιερεὺς τῆς Σίδης, maintained his position under Nikephoros III Botaniates (1078-1081).<sup>81</sup> An imperial chrysobull dated to 1079 confirms Attaliates' information.<sup>82</sup> Michael Psellos, who was the consultant of the Emperor Michael VII Dukas, also talks about him as metropolitan of Side.<sup>83</sup> Ioannes was present for the trial at which Ioannes Italikos was condemned as a heretic in 1082.<sup>84</sup>

Michael Attaliates describes him as a great personality with extraordinary rank. Thus he enjoyed in 1071 the title of protopredros of protosyncelloi.<sup>85</sup> In 1079 the title hypertimos was given to him. Ioannes was the victim of the eunuch Nikephoritzes' intrigues under Alexios I Komnenos (1081-1118) and dismissed from his position in 1081.<sup>86</sup>

Ioannes appears as metropolitan of Side during the synod of 1094.<sup>87</sup> Byzantine historians Michael Glykas, Ioannes Skylitzes Continuatus, and *Zonaras* mention him as metropolitan of Side.<sup>88</sup> He is attested as metropolitan of Side in a semeioma (note) on Leon of Chalcedon, who opposed the appropriation of church treasures by Alexios I Komnenos between 1081 and 1091.<sup>89</sup> As metropolitan of Side, Ioannes is attested in a letter of Theophylactus of Ohrid (written actually as speech) addressed to Emperor Alexios I Komnenos (1081-1118).<sup>90</sup>

ΘΕΟΔΟΣΙΟΣ. An order (praxis) from Lucas Chrysoberges, Patriarch of Constantinople (1156-1169), testifies to the existence of Theodosios. In the document dated to 1147 Niketas, the next μητροπολίτης Σίδης, when appointed to his position, asked about the works of his

<sup>78</sup> Ioannes Skylitzes 1973, 401.69: ὁ τῆς Σίδης.

<sup>79</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1000-1; Grumel 1989, no. 869; Will 1861, 156.5.

<sup>80</sup> Georgios Kedrenos 1838-1839, 4, 6; Le Quien 1740, 1000; Lamberz 2008, 43 (B12, C13, D13, E13, F12); cf. 19.

<sup>81</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1001; Michael Attaliates 1853, 180.6-14; Ioannes Zonaras 1897, 725.1.

<sup>82</sup> Gouillard 1959-1960, 30.1.

<sup>83</sup> Michael Psellos 1876, 83.321.

<sup>84</sup> Gouillard 1985, 133-69, esp. 141.69.

<sup>85</sup> For the prelate's seal see Laurent 1972, no. 1720; 1963, 407-8.

<sup>86</sup> Michael Attaliates 1853, 180.6-17; Ioannes Skylitzes 1839, 705.16-706.4; Le Quien 1740, 1001; Oikonomidès 1960, 69, no. 8; For the Ioannes's seals see Laurent 1963, 295-97, no. 407-8; 1972, no. 1720; Gouillard 1959-1960, 30.

<sup>87</sup> Gautier 1971, 218.

<sup>88</sup> Michael Glykas 1836, 613.5; Ioannes Skylitzes Continuatus 1968, 155.8; Ioannes Zonaras 1897, 707.8; 708.3.

<sup>89</sup> Sakellion 1878, especially 127.6-7; Ruggieri 1995, 99 is suspicious of the Ioannes's very powerful and influential character.

<sup>90</sup> Gautier 1986, 519.7: ...τοῦ ἱερωτάτου μητροπολίτου Σίδης.

forerunner Theodosios (μητροπολίτης Σίδης Θεοδώσιος) who died in the time of the same praxis.<sup>91</sup> A second order dated to 1166 also mentions Theodosios. This patriarchal order reveals that kouropalates Basileios Pekules is expected to make a decision on the appeal of a lawsuit brought by the new metropolitan of Side, Niketas, for donations by the late Metropolitan Theodosios.<sup>92</sup>

ΝΙΚΗΤΑΣ. In the *Jus Graeco-Romanum*, the synodical text of 1147 mentioned above, Niketas is called μητροπολίτης Σίδης. Niketas, when assigned to this position, asked about the work of his metropolitan forerunner. A patriarchal order dated to 1166 testifies to his existence in Side as well. According to this document, Niketas, the new metropolitan of Side and successor of Theodosios, appealed three times to complain to the patriarchal court concerning donations made during the period of his predecessor. This is evidence of a property of immovable estate (and proasteia) from the part of the episcopal church of Side. It also testifies that during the second half of the 12th century there was a Christian community in Side, albeit in trouble.<sup>93</sup>

ΑΝΩΝΥΜΟΣ. An anonymous metropolitan of Side is mentioned on the title of an epistle written by Ioannes Tzetzes, the Byzantine poet and grammarian who lived at Constantinople during the 12th century.<sup>94</sup> The metropolitan is considered to have had been in charge between the late 11th to the mid 12th century. In the 12th century, the Arab geographer Idrisī, who visited Side in 548 of the Hegira (AD 1154), gives some brief information about the conditions of Side. He states that in that time few people lived in the ruined city. Most of its inhabitants had already been settled on a hill in “New Adalia”.<sup>95</sup>

ΙΩΑΝΝΗΣ (4th). A council, summoned in 1156/1157 under the presidency of Lucas Chrysoberges (1156-1169), deposed Soterichos Panteugenos. In the meetings held in the Blachernai palace, the patriarch of Jerusalem was present as well as Ioannes, metropolitan of Side, mentioned as Ioannes Sidae.<sup>96</sup>

ΑΝΩΝΥΜΟΣ. An epistle written by an unknown metropolitan of Side in the early to mid 12th century was sent to Georgios and Dēmētrios Tornikes. It indicates the existence of a Christian community as well as an ecclesiastical authority in charge.<sup>97</sup> The aforementioned anonymous metropolitan and this individual seem to be identical.

ΙΛΑΡΙΩΝ. A manuscript of the 12th century attributed to a Hilarion and mentioning the martyrion of Saints Eustathios, Thespesios and Anatolios of Nicaea under Diocletian is the evidence of this prelate as metropolitan of Side.<sup>98</sup>

<sup>91</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1002; Papadopoulos-Kerameus 1897, 108-9, no. 32; Πάλλης and Ποτλής 1852, 206; Grumel 1989, no. 1058; Migne 1881, col. 901D-904A; Dölger and Wirth 1995, no. 1464a/1484 (ca. 1164/early 1167); *PmbZ*, no. 1464a/1484; Ruggieri 1995, 99; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 378; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>92</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1002; Papadopoulos-Kerameus 1897, 108-9, no. 32; Grumel 1989, no. 1058; Dölger and Wirth 1995, no. 1464a/1484 (ca. 1164/early 1167); *PmbZ*, no. 1464a/1484; Fedalto 1988, 252; Ruggieri 1995, 99; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 378; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>93</sup> Cf. nn. 91, 92.

<sup>94</sup> Ioannes Tzetzes 1972, 1-4: τοῦ Σίδης.

<sup>95</sup> Idrisī 1975, 134.

<sup>96</sup> Le Quien 1740, 1002; Fedalto 1988, 239; Grumel 1989, no. 1043; Niketas Choniates 1887, 180: τοῦ Σίδης Ἰωάννου; Σάκκος 1966, 149, 155; Sakellion 1890, 317: τοῦ Σίδης.

<sup>97</sup> Darrouzès 1970, 211.1: ὁ Σίδης.

<sup>98</sup> Halkin 1975, 287-311; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 375.

After the Seljuk conquest of Kalon Oros in 1221 together with the coastal area, Side came under Turkish control. Consequently, the metropolitan seat was left temporarily empty.<sup>99</sup>

ΝΙΚΟΛΑΟΣ. Towards the end of the 13th century (1285), Nicholas, Metropolitan of Monemvasia and Exarchos of whole Peloponnese, obtained the episcopal throne of Side.<sup>100</sup>

In 1298 by the chrysobull from the Emperor Andronikos II Palaeologos (1282-1328), Nicholas received the honorary title of metropolitan and the throne of Side (= τὸν τόπον ἔχων τοῦ Σίδης).<sup>101</sup> It means “he got only the rank of the metropolitan of Side in the hierarchy” but was not full metropolitan of Side. In 1300 the ecclesiastical presidency (προεδρεία) of Side was entrusted to Nicholas, the metropolitan of Monembasia. In 1313 the Pamphylian metropolitan see still seems under the control of the Peloponnesian metropolis. Nicholas did not receive the tops of Side until 1302. This regulation was cancelled in 1328 when the names of the territories of all the ecclesiastical dioceses were renewed.<sup>102</sup>

In the records of July-September 1315, the Christians in Side together with Syllion/Syllaion were described as without a shepherd. Most likely when the patriarch and the synod decided to appoint the bishop of Sinope to Side as metropolitan, it was more like its neighbor Myra, which was governed by the metropolitan of Attaleia. The neighboring metropolitan city Syllaion (or Perge) and the archbishopric of Leontopolis (Alaçam of Pontus) were also to be included in the metropolitan city of Side. The first document of July-September 1315<sup>103</sup> indicates that the bishop of Sinope, after being expelled from his see,<sup>104</sup> was assigned in terms of performance (κατὰ λόγον ἐπιδόσεως) as metropolitan of Side and Syllaion as well as archbishop of Leontopolis.<sup>105</sup> He seems obviously to receive these sees for reasons of financial support. But Side and Syllaion were in Pamphylia, while Leontopolis was in Pontus.<sup>106</sup> However, in December 1315 Gregorios, the metropolitan of Pisidia, reclaimed two Pamphylian metropolitan sees. A patriarchal synod separated the bishop of Sinope from the archbishopric of Leontopolis, which underlines the distance and the offensiveness of the foreigners (i.e., Turks). It also recognizes the bigger difficulty for him to reach the churches of Side and Syllaion, and the extreme hardship of doing his duty as bishop “over the people of the Lord (i.e., Christians)” in Leontopolis.<sup>107</sup> After that, the patriarch and the synod agreed to bestow upon the metropolitan of Pisidia, whose diocese (Antioch of Pisidia)<sup>108</sup> bordered those

<sup>99</sup> Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 379.

<sup>100</sup> Laurent 1927, 145, no. 8 (Synode of Blachernes held in 1285); *PLP*, no. 20491; Ruggieri 1995, 100, no. 17.

<sup>101</sup> Laurent 1933, 318 (= Miklosich and Müller 1887, 155-61); Binon 1938, 308-9; Grumel 1948, 182; Ruggieri 1995, 100 n. 18.

<sup>102</sup> Laurent 1971, no. 1580; Darrouzès 1977, no. 2016 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 403.7-8): Κῦρ Νικόλαε, χαρτοφύλαξ τῆς ἀγιοτάτης μητροπόλεως Σίδης... and Miklosich and Müller 1860, 403.18: ...τὸν κύριον Νικόλαον, τὸν χαρτοφύλακα (τῆς Σίδης)... For the dating of the document see Darrouzès 1977, no. 2413, ca. 1359 (-1361) (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 405-7). For Nicholas, chartophylax of Side, see *PLP*, no. 20421 (ca. 1360).

<sup>103</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2034, 25; Hunger and Kresten 1981, nos. 6, 24; Vryonis 1971, 315; Korobeinikov 2005, 7 n. 75.

<sup>104</sup> Darrouzès 1979, 146-51 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 34). The bishop of Sinope was Meletios in 1302 in the Synaxarion of Sougdaia (Suroz). It is not evident if he was alive in 1315; cf. Νυσταζοπούλου 1965, no. 115, 128; Korobeinikov 2005, 7 n. 76.

<sup>105</sup> Bar Hebraeus 1976, 377, 1.74, 455-56. See Darrouzès 1977, no. 2034 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 39-41). Leontopolis was given the rank of autocephalous archbishopric at the end of the 12th-beginning of the 13th centuries; cf. Korobeinikov 2005, 7 nn. 14, 77.

<sup>106</sup> Bryer and Wienfield 1985, 89-90; Korobeinikov 2005, 7 n. 78.

<sup>107</sup> Hunger and Kresten 1981, no. 24, 238; 1995, nos. 20-25; Korobeinikov 2005, 7 n. 79; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>108</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2051, 38; Hunger and Kresten 1981, no. 24; Korobeinikov 2005, 7 n. 80; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

of Side and Syllaion, the supervision over Side and Syllaion as well as the archbishopric of Leontopolis.<sup>109</sup>

ΚΥΡΙΑΛΟΣ. A patriarchal act of 1338 assigned Kyrillos as metropolitan (ἀρχιερέυς) of Side. He probably started his pastoral duty towards the end of 1339. The patriarch ordered him to remain in Side and not to leave the city for Constantinople.<sup>110</sup> The prelate seems to have had been in charge on his seat for three years, because in 1342 he appears in Constantinople to take part in the patriarchal synod.<sup>111</sup> In April of 1343 Kyrillos was still in the Byzantine capital city where he participated in another synod.<sup>112</sup>

Kyrillos probably returned to his seat in 1343 and for unknown reasons left for Cyprus in 1355. As for the political situation of that period in Pamphylia, in 1316/1317 Attaleia was already conquered by Dündar Beg, the Turkish ruler of the Hamidoğullari who had donated the city to his brother, Yunus Beg. Yunus was the first ruler of the Tekeogullari who controlled the Attaleia<sup>113</sup> - Side - Kalon Oros<sup>114</sup> axis. Kyrillos may have left because of his inability to cope with the conditions of the new status quo.<sup>115</sup> I think rather than Turkish attacks on his diocese, Kyrillos may have left Side because of the lack of attention from the Christian community. The Arab geographer Idrisî, who visited Side in 1154, informs us that most of the Christian community of the city had already been moved to Attaleia.<sup>116</sup>

After Byzantine rule ended and at least until the first quarter of the 14th century, a small Christian community may have continued to exist in Side, which no longer looked like a city. Similarly, Ruggieri also calls attention to an expression (“living with pagans”) in the patriarchal texts (already mentioned above) that reveals the conditions in the city.<sup>117</sup> The statements of the

<sup>109</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2034 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 39-41); Hunger and Kresten 1981, no. 24, 236-41. The document does not explain why the bishop of Sinope did not manage to stay in his see. However, at that time the ruler of Sinop, Gazi Çelebi, waged war against the Empire of Trebizond and could have easily expelled the bishop of Sinope from his see. In the 14<sup>th</sup>-15<sup>th</sup> centuries, it was a common Ottoman practice to oust the bishop or metropolitan from his see during conflicts with the Byzantine Empire. No bishop of Sinope is mentioned in the documents of the Patriarchate; see Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 379; Korobeinikov 2005, 7 nn. 81-83; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>110</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2184 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 182); Ruggieri 1995, 100 n. 20; Hunger and Kresten 1995, no. 115; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408; For Kyrillos see also *PLP*, no. 14044.

<sup>111</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2227 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 226-27); Hunger and Kresten 1995, no. 136; Ruggieri 1995, 100 n. 22.

<sup>112</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2243 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 235-37); Hunger and Kresten 1995, no. 131; Ruggieri 1995, 100 n. 22.

<sup>113</sup> For the Turkish attacks towards the region and Turkish rule, first the Hamidoğullari and afterwards the Tekeogullari, see Planthol 1986, 132-33; Kofoğlu 1997, 471-76, esp. 472. For the Tekeogullari see Leiser 2000, 412-13; Kofoğlu 2011, 348-49.

<sup>114</sup> Kalon Oros (today Alanya) was conquered by the Seljuks in 1221. In 1293, Karamanoğlu Mece al-din Mahmud Bey seized Kalon Oros. El Ömerî (Al Umarî) 1991, 202-3 reports that the city was subjected to Ermenek, capital city of the Turkish emirate Karamanoğullari. Ibn Battuta 1939, 123-24, who traveled to the city in 1333, notes that the Turkomans were settled in Kalon Oros which was under the administration of the Karamanoğlu, Yusuf Beg. See Bostan 1989, 339-41; Taeschner 1986, 354-55; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 379.

<sup>115</sup> This included all the coastal region between Side and Kalon Oros after the Turkish conquest of the latter; cf. Vryonis 1971, 315. As a result, the metropolitan seat was temporarily left empty. Until 1315, no bishop was appointed to Side again. When the newly appointed bishop of Side came to the city, he also took over the administration of Syllaion and Leontopolis, due to the bad economic situation; cf. nn. 97-103 in this article. See also Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>116</sup> Idrisî 1975, 134, writes that Idrisî found Side in a ruined and devastated state where few people lived, and the people of the city already settled on a hill in “New Attaleia/Antalya”.

<sup>117</sup> Ruggieri 1995, 102.

ecclesiastical documents, even if they express discontent, show that the new and old inhabitants of Side, though coming from different traditions and religious affiliations, had managed to adapt to the new conditions and were able to create a symbiosis.

In 1359-1361 the metropolitan had some doctrinal problems with the patriarch Kallistos I (1350-1355; 1354-1363). In 1359/60, when he was still in Cyprus, Kyrillos deposed the cleric of the Metropolis Side, Sabbas, and sent a antipalamite letter (which was later considered a forgery) his chartophylax,<sup>118</sup> named Nicholas.<sup>119</sup> Kyrillos tried to clarify his doctrinal position, as evidenced by a document dated to around 1359 (-1361). From the same document it is understood that Kallistos threatened to depose Kyrillos and issued an anathema against him in 1359-1360.<sup>120</sup> This patriarchal document immediately is followed by another addressed to the clerics and believers in Side, beginning: οἱ ἐν τῇ ἀγιωτάτῃ μητροπόλει Σίδης εὐρισκομένοι κληρικοί, ἱερωμένοι καὶ ὁ λοιπὸς ἅπας χριστῶνυμος τοῦ Κυρίου λαός. The patriarch asked the parish of Side to expel Kyrillos because of his strange ideas and threatened him with excommunication.<sup>121</sup> At the end of 1364 or the beginning of 1365, Kyrillos was rehabilitated, and perhaps died in 1365. Until the end of this year the Pamphylian metropolitan was managed by Heracleia Pontica.<sup>122</sup> The eventful story of Kyrillos illustrates the presence of a Christian community still resident in the city - clerics, people and a treasurer (oikonomos). Especially the document dated to 1359-1361, in which a man called Manuel is said to be oikonomos in the metropolis of Side, is evidence of the presence of ecclesiastical authorities functioning under a metropolitan as well as of an active church organization in Side.

<sup>118</sup> The chartophylax (pl. χαρτοφύλακες) was an ecclesiastical official in Constantinople and the provinces. From the 6th century the chartophylax was usually a deacon who was responsible for archival and notarial duties. By the 10th century the chartophylax was head of the office (chartophylakeion) where he functioned as the principal assistant of the patriarch. The importance of his functions increased and far exceeded his rank in the ecclesiastical hierarchy. In the 11th century, the chartophylax was of the fourth rank. Except for his archival and secretarial duties, the chartophylax acted in an intermediary role between the patriarch and clergy, introducing clerics in the presence of the patriarch and in conciliar meetings. He received letters, sent to the patriarch, examined the candidates for priesthood and prepared testimonials for them; see Παλλῆς and Ποτλῆς 1853, 440-44; Παλλῆς and Πότλης 1852, 587. The chartophylax replaced the patriarch in his absence by presiding over the synod. In the reign of Alexios I Komnenos (1081-1118), a prostagma dated to 1094 confirms the right of chartophylax to this position. This indicates that it was not a new privilege but a controversial one disputed by the bishops of the synod; see Zepos 1931, 649-50. The functions and rights of the protekdikos and chartophylax were asserted by Theodoros Balsamon in his treatise. The chartophylax had judicial competence and presided over a court; see Παλλῆς and Ποτλῆς 1854, 530-41. According to Kazhdan, "this claim appears to have more to do with Balsamon's need to bolster the office that he held than with the actual functions of the chartophylax". From the reign of Andronicus I Komnenos (1183-1185), the title was transformed to that of megas chartophylax. Among the officials of some monasteries chartophylakes or chartophylakisses appeared. These were monks or nuns who were responsible for the security and conservation of monastic records, and kept track of borrowed documents; see Darrouzès 1970, 334-53, 508-25; Macrides 1991.

<sup>119</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2417 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 404.17-18); Kresten 2000, 25-28; Hunger and Kresten 2001, no. 245; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408; For Sabbas see *PLP*, no. 24590.

<sup>120</sup> Darrouzès 1977, nos. 2413, 2014, 2417 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 405-7, 409-10, 404.7-10); Kresten 2000, 25-28; Koder et al. 2001, no. 246-47; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>121</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2414 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 409-10). Koder et al. 2001, nos. 245, 248, 250; In this document a certain Manuel is mentioned as oikonomos (accountant) in the metropolitan office of Side (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 403.32-33: ... κὺρ Μανουὴλ, τὸν οἰκονόμου ...). This in fact indicates the presence of a Christian community living in Side; see Ruggieri 1995, 100, no. 23; Kresten 2000, 25-28, claimed that this letter is a forgery; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408. For Manuel see *PmbZ*, no. 16717; *PLP*, no. 17717; Darrouzès 1977, no. 2184 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 182-83); Hunger and Kresten 1995, no. 115; Koder et al. 2001, nos. 248, 250.

<sup>122</sup> Darrouzès 1977, nos. 2469-470 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 404); Koder et al. 2001, nos. 246, 247; Ruggieri 1995, 101 n. 26.



At the beginning of 1366 a Metropolitan seems to have been appointed to Side, according to a synodal act dated to December of 1369. The Metropolitan of Side (ἔξαρχος πάσης Παμφυλίας) was granted to the metropolis of Rhodes together with all that depended on it, and the Cyclades.<sup>123</sup> Two years later in 1371, the episcopal authority in Larissa, Greece, seems to have governed Side for an unknown duration. All this information shows that in that period there was no one elected or appointed to Side as a full metropolitan authority. Neilos, who was metropolitan of Larissa (1371-1388) as indicated on an inscription, is attested also as proedros of Side (1371-1381 or 1382) as indicated on another inscription.<sup>124</sup> In June and August of 1372, the metropolitan of Side, whose name remains unknown (but might be Neilos), was present in two synods held in the capital.<sup>125</sup> In the same year the rank of metropolitan of Side seems to have been transferred to the Metropolitan of Sozopolis of Pisidia.<sup>126</sup>

On March 1397 a synodical act disengaged Side from the jurisdiction of Myra and was subjugated to the metropolitan see of Attaleia. Hieronymous Theophylaktos was ordained as metropolitan of Attaleia and proedros of Side. At the same time the union of two metropolitan sees was declared. The patriarch was to watch over the needs of the Christians, particularly those who lived “among the pagans” (ἔθνεσι). Thus, the patriarch identified the poverty in Side, and how much spiritual teaching (πνευματική διδασκαλία) remained for the few Christians who lived there.<sup>127</sup>

In 1400 the Metropolitan of Perge and Attalia was at the same time the administrator of Side.<sup>128</sup> At the Council of Ferrara in Florence (1438-1448), Dorotheos, Metropolitan of Mitylene held the *topos* of Side.<sup>129</sup> Side reappears in an ulterior act of 1570, which depended on Macarios, metropolitan of Monemvasia.<sup>130</sup>

In the absence the metropolitan there were still ecclesiastical officials in this office, and they continued their activities. Herrin points out that whatever the nominal control of the civil officials (like megas dux) and their claims, the ecclesiastical administration was probably the most efficient in the provinces. As Constantinople’s grasp over the outlying regions of the empire diminished through the 12th century, churchmen increasingly took over the difficult task of maintaining imperial authority. This evaluation, made especially for the cities of Greece, is also valid for regions like Pamphylia, which was likewise far enough away from Constantinople.<sup>131</sup>

<sup>123</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2565; Vryonis 1971, 334, 338; Ruggieri 1995, 101 n. 27; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>124</sup> Darrouzès 1977, no. 2630 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 587-88): Ἐπεὶ ὁ ιερώτατος μητροπολίτης Λαρίσσης, ὑπέρτιμος καὶ ἔξαρχος δευτέρας Θεσσαλίας καὶ πάσης Ἑλλάδος καὶ τὸν τόπον ἐπέχων τῆς Σίδης... This means that Neilos obtained the rank of the metropolitan of Side in the hierarchy but was not the full metropolitan of Side; cf. Preger 1899, 486; Papachryssanthou 1967, 484. For Neilos see *PmbZ*, no. 20043.

<sup>125</sup> Darrouzès 1977, nos. 2652, 2654. Neilos, metropolitan of Larissa, was proedros of Side from 1371 to 1381; cf. *PLP*, no. 20043; Ruggieri 1995, 101 n. 28.

<sup>126</sup> Darrouzès 1977, nos. 2565, 2649, 2652, 2654; (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 511 [unedited], 593-94, 367-68); Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 380; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>127</sup> Darrouzès 1979, nos. 2940, 3042, 3043 (= Miklosich and Müller 1862, 276-77, 285); also in *PLP*, no. 2350. For Theophylaktos see also *PLP*, no. 7665; Ruggieri 1995, 101; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 380.

<sup>128</sup> Darrouzès 1979, no. 3132 (= Miklosich and Müller 1887, 175-77); cf. Vryonis 1971, 294-95, 315; Ruggieri 1995, 101 n. 29; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 380; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>129</sup> Darrouzès 1979, no. 3373 (= Miklosich and Müller 1860, 276-77, 285-86); *PLP*, no. 5929; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 380.

<sup>130</sup> Miklosich and Müller 1887, 175-77; cf. Vryonis 1971, 294-95, 315; Ruggieri 1995, 101 n. 29; Preiser-Kapeller 2008, 408.

<sup>131</sup> Herrin 2013, 67.

## C) Published Sigillographic Evidence

**1) Anastasios I, Metropolitan of Side (2nd half of 10th Cent.)**

Dumbarton Oaks (ex DO 58.106/59) no. BZS.1958.106.58.D2012 D: 28 x 21 mm. W: 11.25 gr. Cracked along channel. No parallel. Ed(s): Laurent 1963, no. 406; Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.1. According to Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, 178, this seal, which illustrated the plate volume of Laurent's corpus, is incorrectly ascribed to the Vienna Museum. Although Laurent mentioned that this piece was in the collection of Vienna Museum (MK248), I have been informed by the director, Mr. Michael Alram, that it is not in the Vienna collection. Werner Seibt and Alexandra Wassiliou-Seibt informed me that this was a mistake made by Laurent. It is possible, however, that it was included in the Zacos Collection if it was a seal of the former Diamantis Collection. Diamantis was a Viennese who emigrated to Istanbul in the 1930s and started only there to collect seals, so his collection was never in Vienna. I owe many thanks to W. Seibt and A. Wassiliou-Seibt for this information.

Obv: Bust of a beardless saint, or of the Archangel Michael,<sup>132</sup> surrounded by a circle of dots, around which circular inscription:

..ROHΘEITΩCΩΔOYΛΩ: [+K(ύρι)ε] βοήθει τῷ σῷ δούλῳ. A border of pellets within two concentric circles of dots.

Rev: Inscription of four lines. Border of pellets within two concentric circles of dots.

ΑΝΔΑCΤ | ΑCΙΩΜΗΤ | ΡΟΠΟΛΙΤΗ | CΙΔΗC

Ἀναστασίῳ μητροπολίτη Σίδης.

Theotokos (Mother of God), aid your servant Anastasios, metropolitan of Side!



FIG. 4 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1958.106.58.

On the obverse of this seal (fig. 4) what is depicted in the inner circle of the outline cannot be discerned. I am grateful to A. Wassiliou-Seibt for her kind help to get all this updated information.

Oikonomides believed the seal published by Laurent belonged to a different Anastasios and was struck in a later period than this seal preserved at Dumbarton Oaks. Pursuing the point of view of Nesbitt and Oikonomides, I also think that an unknown Anastasios, different from the owner of no. 2, may be added to the list of known metropolitans of Side, which begins with

<sup>132</sup> Alexandra Wassiliou Seibt thinks that the figure on the obverse is bust of a beardless saint, or of the Archangel Michael. Nesbitt and Oikonomides suggested for the representation of the Virgin or St. Michael.



Xenophon (4th cent.) and ends with Kyrillos (14th cent.). These two Anastasioi then had followed each other holding the episcopal scepter in Side.

## 2) Anastasios II, Metropolitan of Side (1030-1060)

Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien MK248. D: 23 mm. Field: 20 mm. W. 6,83 gr. Fine example slightly trimmed on the circumference of the left side; lower edge is bulged. No parallel. Ed. Laurent 1963, no. 405.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, wearing imperial robe, holding in his right hand a balled scepter brought back in front of the chest and a globus (without cross) in his left hand (raised in front of his chest). Border of dots.

Sigla: On the left I, at top of M, on the right A at top X: Μι(χαήλ) ἀ(ρ)χ(άγγελος). Between the acronyms I.

Rev: Inscription of four lines: + ΑΝΑC|ΤΑΑCΙΟΜΗ|ΤΡΟΠΟΛ,Τ,|CΙΔΗC| - ∴ -

Ἀναστασί(ω) μητροπολι(ι)τ(η) Σίδης

Michael Archangel/Anastasios metropolitan of Side



FIG. 5 Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien MK248.

Vitalien Laurent had claimed that Anastasios, owner of this seal (fig. 5), was already known.<sup>133</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides pointed out that the two Anastasioi who appeared on the DO seal (fig. 4) and on the Vienna seal (fig. 5) are different persons who served in Side as metropolitans at different times. Following Nesbitt and Oikonomides and considering the criteria based on their iconographic and epigraphic characteristics, it is clear that these seals came from different bulloteria. So one may reasonably add a second Anastasios to the name lists of Sidetan bishops. Consequently, the first Anastasios functioned in the city at the end of the 10th century and his namesake at the beginning of the 11th century.

## 3) (Ioannes) Protoproedros of (Protosynkelloi and Metropolitan of) Side (1071-before 1079)

a) Numismatic Museum Athens, no. 143<sup>a</sup>. D: 23,5 mm. W: 9,8 gr. Parallel(s): Fogg 1334; (ex DO 55.1.4993); (ex. DO 58.106.194); IFEB 213A and 213B (two copies); formerly Zacos (photo in Vienna). Ed(s): (except the last two pieces) Κωνσταντόπουλος 1917, no. 1334; Laurent 1963, no. 407; Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1996, no. 78.3; Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 1688, mentions one parallel seal from the Thierry collection and another from former Zacos collection.

<sup>133</sup> Laurent 1963, 294.

Obv: Corroded. The figure and the other details can be discerned thanks to parallel seals. Bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, holding the labarum (r. hand) with a long pole and the globus (l. hand) without cross. On either side the inscription: Μ | Ι on left and Χ | Α on the right: Μι(χαήλ) ἄ(ρ)χ(άγγελος): Archangel Michael. Border of dots between two linear borders.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Border of dots.

+ ΟΡΑ | ΣΦΡΑΓΙ | ΔΑΠΡΩΤΟ | ΠΡΟΕΔΡ | ΣΙΔΗΣ | - · -

+ Ὅρα σφραγίδα πρωτοπροέδρου Σίδης

Behold the seal of the protoproedros of Side!



FIG. 6 Athens Numismatic Museum 143<sup>a</sup>.

The legend does not contain the name of the owner of the seal (fig. 6), but only the title protoproedros of Side. The owner of the seal must be Ioannes of Side who, under Michael VII Dukas (1071-1078) and Nikephoros III Botaneiates (1078-1081), held a key position in the state and church, as the protoproedros of the protosynkelloi<sup>134</sup> and metropolitan of Side in 1071.<sup>135</sup> In December 1079, Ioannes is attested with the higher ranking title of hypertimos. A seal with great stylistic similarity to the seal type above cites an Ioannes metropolitan of Side and protosynkelloi. It has evoked various hypotheses regarding his assignment.<sup>136</sup> Ioannes should have used this seal in a bit earlier period than the others mentioned below. This Ioannes must be identified to the prelate mentioned below (no. 4c).<sup>137</sup>

<sup>134</sup> Synkellos (σύγκελλος) was a title referring to a monastic cellmate of a bishop and who served him. Over time, however, as with many such titles from the Byzantine Empire, it shifted from referring explicitly to literal roles and became associated with clerical rank, sometimes including an office. A cellmate of the bishop (who may often be a monk) is styled the protos (first) among the synkelloi. Protosynkellos (πρωτοσυγκελλος, first cellmate) was a honorific title given by the bishop to a high-ranking cleric in a diocese, usually a priest. This so-titled person was often the most highly ranked cleric in the diocese after the bishop. Sometimes only persons who had the most seniority attained it, but it probably also was a post, a chancellor, a chief bishop's chaplain or a episcopal vicar. Protosynkelloi still exist and often act as a chancellor to the bishop or simply are the highest in seniority. For the title protoproedros protosynkelloi, see Savaville 1930, 420-22; Ioannes Skylitzes 1839, 705. For synkellos see Papadakis 1991b,

<sup>135</sup> Michael Attaleiates 1853, 180.11; Ioannes Skylitzes Continuatus 1968, 139.15-16; Oikonomides 1960, 69-70, A.8; Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.5.

<sup>136</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.5.

<sup>137</sup> Oikonomides 1960, 69, no. 8 and 70; For the city of Side see the corresponding lemma at Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 373-94; Wassiliou-Seibt 2011, 130-31.

b) (ex DO 51.31.3.1333) BZS.1951.31.5.1333. D: 21 mm. W: 7.71 gr. Parallel(s): BZS.1958.106.194 and BZS.1955.1.4993; Thierry collection no. 30; former Zacos collection (photo in Vienna). Eds.: (except the last two pieces) Κωνσταντόπουλος 1917, no. 1334; Laurent 1963, no. 407, along with three specimens from outside the Dumbarton Oaks collection, one from the Numismatic Museum at Athens (143<sup>a</sup>); and two from the IFEB collection (213A and 213B); Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.3(a); Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 1688 (mistakenly numbered as Fogg 1334), refers to one parallel seal from the Thierry collection and another from former Zacos collection.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, holding the labarum (r. hand) with a long pole and the globus (l. hand) without cross. On either side the inscription: Μ | Ι on left and Χ | Α on the right: Μι(χαήλ) ἄ(ρ)χ(άγγελος): Archangel Michael. Border of dots between two linear borders.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodekasyllabic. A decoration below. Border of dots between two linear borders.

+ ΟΡΑ | ΣΦΡΑΓΙ | ΔΑΠΡΩΤΟ | ΠΡΟΕΔΡΗ | ΣΙΔΗΣ | - · -

+ Ὅρα σφραγίδα πρωτοπροέδρου Σίδης

Behold the seal of the protoproedros of Side.



FIG. 7 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1951.31.5.1333.

c) (ex DO 58.106.194) BZS.1958.106.194. D2012. D: 24 mm. Field: 19 mm. W: 11.66 gr. Cracked along canal. Parallel(s): BZS.1955.1.4993; BZS.1951.31.5.1333; Thierry collection no. 30; former Zacos collection (photo in Vienna). Ed(s): (Except the last two seals) Κωνσταντόπουλος 1917, no. 1334; Laurent 1963, no. 407, mentions, along with three specimens from outside the Dumbarton Oaks collection, one from the Numismatic Museum at Athens (143<sup>a</sup>) and two from the IFEB collection (213A and 213B); Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.3b. Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 1688, refers to one parallel seal from the Thierry collection and another from former Zacos collection.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, holding the labarum (r. hand) with a long pole and the globus (l. hand) without cross. On either side the inscription: Μ | Ι on left and Χ | Α on the right: Μι(χαήλ) ἄ(ρ)χ(άγγελος): Archangel Michael. Border of dots between two linear borders.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodekasyllabic. A decoration below. Border of dots between two linear borders.

+ ΟΡΑ | ΣΦΡΑΓΙ | ΔΑΠΡΩΤΟ | ΠΡΟΕΔΡΥ | ΣΙΔΗΣ | - · [-]

+ Ὅρα σφραγίδα πρωτοπροέδρου Σίδης

Behold the seal of the protoproedros of Side!



FIG. 8 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1958.106.194.

d) (ex DO 58.106.4993) BZS.1951.1.4993. D2012. D: 18 x 18 mm. Field: 18 mm. W: 5.50 gr. Parallel(s): BZS.1958.106.194; BZS.1951.31.5.1333; Thierry collection no. 30; former Zacos collection (photo in Vienna). Ed(s): (except from the last two seals) Κωνσταντόπουλος 1917, no. 1334. Laurent 1963, no. 407, mentions along with three specimens from outside the Dumbarton Oaks collection, one from the Athens Numismatic Museum (143<sup>a</sup>) and two from the IFEB collection (213A and 213B); Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.3c. Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 1688, mentions one parallel seal from the Thierry collection and another from former Zacos collection.

Obv: Corroded. On its parallel or similar pieces: bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, wearing imperial robe, the labarum (r. hand) with a long pole and the globus (l. hand) without cross. On either side the inscription: Μ | Ι on left and Χ | Α on the right: Μι(χαήλ) ἄ(ρ)χ(άγγελος): Archangel Michael. Border of dots between two linear borders.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodekasyllabic. A decoration below. Border of dots between two linear borders.

... | ΣΦΡΑΓΙ | ΔΑΠΡΩΤΟ | ΠΡΟΕΔΡΥ | ΣΙΔΗΣ | - · -

+ [Ὅρα] σφραγίδα πρωτοπροέδρου Σίδης

Behold the seal of the protoproedros of Side!



FIG. 9 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1951.1.4993.

According to Nesbitt and Oikonomides, all three of these Dumbarton Oaks seals (figs. 7-9) seem to come from the same bouleterion, which was retooled before striking the specimen and are edited jointly. They suggested that Ioannes of Side, who is represented as protoproedros of the protosynkelloi on this seal, received this title in 1071. They considered that “it was not necessary for him to spell out his name because he was the only protoproedros of the protosynkelloi”.<sup>138</sup> The identical features of the Athens seal (fig. 6) as compared to three Dumbarton Oaks seals (figs. 7-9) indicate that they all come from the same bullotereion and would have been used by the metropolitan of Side in the same period.

e) IFEB 213A. Parallel(s): IFEB 213B; Numismatic Museum at Athens (143<sup>a</sup>); BSZ.1958.106.194; BZS.1951.31.5.1333; Thierry collection no. 30; Thierry collection no. 30; former Zacos collection (photo in Vienna). Ed(s).: (except the last two pieces) Κωνσταντόπουλος 1917, no. 1334. Laurent 1963, no. 407, mentions, along with three specimens from outside the Dumbarton Oaks collection, one from the Numismatic Museum in Athens (143<sup>a</sup>) and one more from the IFEB collection (213B). Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 1688, mentions one parallel seal from the Thierry collection and another from the former Zacos collection; cf. Oikonomides 1960, 69, no. 8 and 70.

Obv: Corroded. On its parallel or similar pieces: bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, wearing imperial robe, holding the labarum (r. hand) with a long pole and the globus (l. hand) without cross. On either side the inscription: Μ - Ι on left and Χ - Α on the right: Μι(χαήλ) ἀ(ρ)χ(άγγελος). Border of dots between two linear borders.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodekasyllabic. A decoration below. Border of dots between two linear borders.

+ ΟΡΑ | ΣΦΡΑΓΙ | ΔΑΠΡΩΤΟ | ΠΡΟΕΔΡΗ | ΣΙΔΗΣ | - · -

+ Ὅρα σφραγίδα πρωτοπροέδρου Σίδης.

Behold the seal of the protoproedros of Side!



FIG. 10 Collection of Institut Français d'Études Byzantines (IFEB), IFEB 213A.

f) IFEB 213B. D: 19 mm. Parallel(s): BZS.1951.31.5.1333; BSZ.1958.106.194; BZS.1955.1.4993; Thierry collection no. 30; former Zacos collection (photo in Vienna). Eds.: (except the last five pieces) Konstantopoulos 1917, no. 1334. Laurent 1963, no. 407, mentions, along with three specimens from outside the Dumbarton Oaks collection, one from the Athens Numismatic

<sup>138</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, 178-79.



Museum (143<sup>a</sup>), and one more from the IFEB collection (213A) (fig.10). Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 1688, mentions one parallel seal from the Thierry collection and another from former Zacos collection; cf. Oikonomides 1960, 69, no. 8 and 70.

Obv.: Corroded. On its parallel or similar pieces: bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, wearing imperial robe, holding the labarum (r. hand) with a long pole and the globus (l. hand) without cross. Sigla: M - I (invisible) on left and X - A on the right: Μι(χαήλ) ἄ(ρ)χ(άγγελος).

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodecasyllabic. A decoration below. Border of dots between two linear borders. Dodecasyllabic.

+ ΟΡΑ | ΣΦΡΑΓΙ | ΔΑΠΡΩΤΟ | ΠΡΟΕΔΡΟ | ΣΙΔΗΣ | - · -

+ Ὅρα σφραγίδα πρωτοπροέδρου Σίδης.

Behold the seal of the protoproedros of Side!



FIG. 11 Collection of Institut Français d'Études Byzantines (IFEB), IFEB 213B.

The term protoproedros, which appears on the reverse of the above-mentioned seals (figs. 6-11) separate from the competing title of civil titlature,<sup>139</sup> appears here as the poetic equivalent of metropolitan.<sup>140</sup> He had used it on the occasion in the sense of a single abbot of the monastery.<sup>141</sup> Here it is something else, having been honored with the most significant title of protoproedros of the protosynkelloi (πρωτοπρόεδρος των πρωτοσυγκέλλων). According to Skylitzes, this title was given in 1071 to Ioannes, metropolitan of Side, who was once a prominent political and religious figure.<sup>142</sup> This prelate was promoted to be an imperial minister but, not being content with this distinguished honor, aspired to a higher one, that is, hypertimos. Ioannes of Side seems to have been the first bishop honored with this title, as attested by the sigillography.

#### 4) (Ioannes), Proedros (= Metropolitan) of Side and Hypertimos (ca. 1079)

a) (ex DO 58.106.1149). BZS.1958.106.1149. D. 22 mm. Field 19 mm. W. 8.29 gr. Lead of deep gray color. Parallel(s): BSZ.1958.106.3647; Vienna MK249; Hermitage (= Pančenko 1903, no. 63) (incomplete); Eds.: Pančenko 1903, no. 63, dates it to 12th/13th cent.; Laurent 1963, no: 408; Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.4a; Date ca. 1079/1082; Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, no. 2779.

<sup>139</sup> Cf. Diehl 1924, 105-17.

<sup>140</sup> On this meaning see Savaville 1930, 420-22.

<sup>141</sup> For an example see Laurent 1932, no. 264.

<sup>142</sup> Ioannes Skylitzes 1839, 705.16-17.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, holding the labarum (r. hand) and the globus (l. hand). On either side the inscription: Μ | Ι - Χ | : Μιχα(ήλ). Border of dots between a linear border.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodecasyllabic. A decoration above. Border of dots between a linear border.

- · - | + CΦΡΑ|ΓΙCΠΡΟΕ|ΔΡΥΤΗC C I | ΔΗC V ΠΕΡ|ΤΙΜΘ

+ Σφραγίς προέδρου τῆς Σίδης ὑπερτίμου

Seal of the proedros of Side (and) hypertimos.



FIG. 12 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1958.106.1149.

b) (ex DO 58.106 3647) BZS.1958.106.3647. D: 24 mm. Field: 19 mm (obv.), 20 mm (rev.). W: 8.58 gr. Lead of whitish color. Parallel(s): BZS.1958.106.1149; Vienna MK249. Ed(s): Laurent 1963, no. 408, edited two similar specimens issued by the same man, one in the Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien MK249 (fig. 14), the other in the Hermitage Museum (= Pančenko 1903, no. 63 Ioannes, metropolitan of Side and hypertimos); Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.4b; Wassiliou-Seibt 2016, 2779.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, holding the labarum (r. hand) and the globus (l. hand) without cross. On either side the inscription: Μ | Ι - Χ | : Μιχα(ήλ). Border of dots between a linear border.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Dodecasyllabic. A decoration above. Border of dots between a linear border.

- · - | + CΦΡΑ|ΓΙCΠΡΟΕ| . . ΥΤΗC C I | ΔΗC V ΠΕΡ|ΤΙΜΘ

+ Σφραγίς προέδρου τῆς Σίδης ὑπερτίμου.

Seal of the proedros of Side (and) hypertimos.



FIG. 13 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1958.106.3647.

Nesbitt and Oikonomides point out that both seals (figs. 12-13) had been struck by the same bouleterion and are edited jointly. Their blanks come from the same mold but have been cast with lead of a completely different quality. A similar piece, preserved in the Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien (fig. 14) and published by Laurent (no. 408), was issued by the same prelate. Another piece is preserved in the Hermitage Museum and published by Pančenko (no. 63) who mistakenly attributed it to Sebaste instead of Side. Laurent completed its reading and correctly considered that it is parallel to the other seals and that the owner of these seals is the same as Ioannes of Side. Once again he was the only hypertimos and did not need to spell out his name. Ioannes used here the title proedros within the meaning of metropolitan and preferred not to give his name. Ioannes used here the title proedros within the meaning of metropolitan and preferred not to give his name. Wassiliou-Seibt thinks that because he was also honored as hypertimos, a title generally given to very few people, the seal should be attributed to the notorious Ioannes, the metropolitan of Side. He held a key position in the Byzantine church and its administration until his dismissal in 1082 under Alexios I Komnenos (1081-1118). Ioannes is mentioned with this title in December 1079.<sup>143</sup>

c) Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien MK249 D. 19 mm. W. 8,50 gr. Similar(s): BZS.1958.106.1149; BZS.1958.106.3647. Ed(s): Laurent 1963, no. 408; Pančenko 1903, no. 63 (photo pl. 3, no. 8).<sup>144</sup>

Obv: Bust of Archangel, facing, winged, holding the labarum (r. hand) and the globus (l. hand). On either side the inscription: On the left M-I and on the right X-A: Μιχα(ήλ). Border of dots between a linear border.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. Border of dots.

- · - | + ΣΦΡΑ|ΓΙΣΠΡΟΕ|ΔΡΥΤΗCΣΙ|ΔΗCΝΠΕΡ|ΤΙΜΘ

+ Σφραγίς προέδρου τῆς Σίδης ὑπερτίμου

Seal of the proedros of Side (and) hypertimos.



FIG. 14 Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien MK249.

<sup>143</sup> Oikonomides 1960, 69-70, A.8; For the commentary see Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.5. See also seals nos 3a-f, also without a name, with the title *πρωτοπρόεδρος* (i.e. *τῶν πρωτοσυγκέλλων*). Father Laurent has already corrected the incomplete reading of the former piece in Pančenko 1903, no. 63.

<sup>144</sup> Laurent 1963, no. 262.



Russian sigillographer Pančenko read the end of the third line on the inscription of a parallel seal from the Hermitage Museum as **CE** and supposed, starting from this syllable, that it could be Sebaste there. Papadopoulos-Kerameus conjectured: **Σε[ρρῶν]**.<sup>145</sup> According to Laurent, the most evident feature of the inscription is the presence of the title “hypertimos”. Grumel’s previous article did not reveal any employment/usage of this title (which can be dated to an earlier period than 1173) as for its collation to the members of the high-ranking clergy (bishop or higher ones).<sup>146</sup> One could find the date assigned by Laurent to this seal as too late, if a recently published document did not reveal its true owner. In a time when the honorary title of hypertimos was carried by statesmen such as Michael Psellos,<sup>147</sup> it might seem surprising that their successor in imperial favor, Ioannes the metropolitan of Side, would not have been granted it. Thanks to a discovery,<sup>148</sup> one fact is now certain: the aforementioned prelate, full-power Minister of Nikephoros III Botaniates (1078-1081), had the benefit of it in December 1079. There is therefore every chance for the seal presented here to have belonged to same Ioannes. Moreover, the prelate is also Ioannes, whereas he was the only protoproedros of the protosynkellos,<sup>149</sup> which must be restored to the preceding pieces (figs. 6-11). The similarity of the metric legends of an unusual turn clearly invites it, no less than the choice of the same iconographic features - Archangel Michael, facing, holding, in addition to a globe (without cross), the labarum instead of the traditional scepter. The striking of these three seals (figs. 12-14) must also be dated to a period before the accession of the Komnenian dynasty in 1081, which terminated Ioannes’s authority. He continued to be the minister under the Emperor Nikephoros III Botaniates. The pieces (figs. 6-11), on which he is honored as protoproedros, had to be engraved during the reign of Michael VII (1071-1078). The second type of his seal (figs. 12-14), on which Ioannes appears with the title hypertimos, had to be struck later, i.e. during the reign of Nikephoros III (1078-1081).<sup>150</sup>

### 5) Ioannes, Metropolitan of Side and Protosynkellos (2nd half of 11th Cent.)

(ex DO 55.1 4845) BZS.1951.1.4845.D2012. D: 21 mm. W: 8.51 gr. No parallel. Ed(s): Laurent 1972, no. 1720; Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.5.

Obv: Half-length representation of Archangel Michael, facing, winged, in imperial robe with the fringes of loros, crossed on the chest, holding the trilobe scepter (r. hand) and globus (l. hand) (without cross). On either side the inscription: **M - X : M(ι)χ(α)ῆλ**. Border of dots between a linear border.

Rev: Inscription of five lines, a decoration above. Border of dots between a linear border.

- · [-] | **+ΚΕΡ,Θ,|ΙΩΜΡΟΠΟ|ΛΙΤ,ΣΙΔ,Σ | ἌΣΥΓΚΕ | ΛΛΩ**

+ Κύριε βοήθει Ἰω(άννη) μ(ητ)ροπολίτ(η) Σίδ(ης) (καί) (πρωτο)συγκέλλω.

Lord, aid Ioannes metropolitan of Side and of the protosynkellos!

<sup>145</sup> Pančenko 1903, no. 63 (photo pl. 3, no. 8) = Papadopoulos and Kerameus 1907, 509-10, no. 85.

<sup>146</sup> Grumel 1948, 163.

<sup>147</sup> Michael Attaliates 1853, 296.20-22: καὶ Μιχαὴλ μοναχὸς ὁ ὑπέριμος, ὁ ἐπὶ τῶν πολιτικῶν πραγμάτων προστάς, τὸ γένος ἔλκων Νικομηδείας ... (and monk Michael, the hypertimos, a man who was in charge of political affairs, and originated from Nikomedeia). The title of hypertimos was established for Psellos, namely when he returned from Bithynia as a monk, but again took over political duties as a monk. He was called by Theodora (1055-1056). See also Karpozilos 2009, 73

<sup>148</sup> Gouillard 1959-1960, 30, no. 1.

<sup>149</sup> Grumel 1945, 105.

<sup>150</sup> Laurent 1963, 296-97.



FIG. 15 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1951.1.4845.

According to Laurent, the signatory of this seal had been presented as the owner of the anonymous seals (figs. 6-11) or referred to by his rank of proedros and of protoproedros.<sup>151</sup> This piece (fig. 15), where the name is added to the honor, dignity fully gives reason to the attribution made to the prelate-minister of those just been mentioned or questioned.<sup>152</sup> Here, as there, the title of protoproedros, eminently ecclesiastical, must be understood as protoproedros of the protosynkelloi, as Ioannes had already done in 1071.<sup>153</sup> In December 1079, Ioannes had been honored by the more significant title of hypertimos.<sup>154</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides claim that the person mentioned on this seal may be Ioannes of Side, a powerful minister of Nikephoros Botaniates. He was protoproedros of the protosynkelloi in 1071<sup>155</sup> and then, before December 1079, he was honored by the title of hypertimos.<sup>156</sup> By the enthronement of Alexios Komnenos in 1081, he had lost his administrative seat. Since the title protosynkellos is inferior to the other two, this seal (fig. 15) is considered to have been made prior to 1071. In the *History* of Georgios Kedrenos, one Ioannes titled protosynkellos, is mentioned as metropolitan of Side. He also appeared in the patriarchal synod of March 1082. Guillard supported the idea that this was the same person. Nesbitt and Oikonomides proposed that he may have been a homonymous successor of the minister of Botaniates.<sup>157</sup> By comparing their weights, Nesbitt and Oikonomides considered that “the blanks used for the seals of hypertimos (ca. 1079-1081)<sup>158</sup> come from the same mold as the present one (fig. 15) whereas the protoproedros seals<sup>159</sup> come from different molds.”<sup>160</sup> Thus they related this specimen to Ioannes of Side of 1082 who, they think, could be the same person as the hypertimos, after having been demoted.

<sup>151</sup> Laurent 1963, no. 408; Laurent 1963, no. 407.

<sup>152</sup> Laurent 1963, 295.

<sup>153</sup> Ioannes Skylitzes 1839, 705.16-17.

<sup>154</sup> Gouillard 1959-1960, 29-30, esp. 30, 38-41.

<sup>155</sup> Michael Attaliates 1853, 180.11; Le Quien 1740, 1001. Also Ioannes Skylitzes 1839, 705, mentions an Ioannes with the title of protoproedros of the protosynkelloi in 1071. See also Oikonomides 1960, 76.

<sup>156</sup> Gouillard 1959-1960, 30.

<sup>157</sup> Grumel 1945, 111. One may wonder if this person was not the same as the previous one. The reason we distinguish these two persons is that the second person has a lower rank than the first. It is difficult to admit that a person who was protoproedros of protosynkelloi in 1071 would become in 1082 a simple protosynkellos; cf. Laurent 1972, 78-79; Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, 179-80.

<sup>158</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.4.

<sup>159</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.3.

<sup>160</sup> Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, 179-80.

### 6) Basileios, Metropolitan of Side (2nd half of the 12th Cent.)

(ex DO 58.106.366) BZS.1958.106.366.D2012. D: 17 mm. W: 4.06 gr. Chipped along circumference. Poor craftsmanship. The inscription is dodecasyllabic. The first word, σφραγῆς, is an error for γραφῆς. No parallel(s). Eds.: Nesbitt and Oikonomides 1994, no. 78.2.

Obv: Inscription of three lines. **CFPA | ΓICCΦP, | ΡΙΖΩ**. Border of dots.

Rev: Inscription of three lines. **ΤΗCI | ΔHCRA | CΙΛΦΘ**. Border of dots.

Σφραγῆς σφραφίζω τοῦ Σίδης Βασιλ(ε)ίου.

I seal the letters of Basileios (metropolitan) of Side.



FIG. 16 Dumbarton Oaks Collection BZS.1958.106.366.

Nesbitt and Oikonomides read the word σφραγῆς as σφραγῆς, apparently wrongly, as stated by Wassiliou-Seibt, who believes that the second letter in the second line of the obverse is a pressed Iota, not an Alpha.<sup>161</sup>

### D) Unpublished Sigillographic Evidence

#### 7) Ioannes Metropolitan of Side and Synkellos (ca. 1055-1070)

Alanya Museum 2006.22A. D: 22 mm. H: 3 mm. W: 9.25 gr. Provenance: Alanya, Byzantine Korakesion or Kalon Oros.<sup>162</sup> Parallel(s): Amasya A75.35.25. Unpublished.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, in profile turned to left, winged, holding a trefoil scepter (r. hand) and globus (l. hand.). Invisible inscription. Border of dots between linear border.

Rev: Inscription of five lines. - \* - | † ΚΕΡ,Θ, | ..Μ̄ΡΟΠΟ | ...CΙΔ,Σ | ..ΓΚΞΛ | Λ, - Border of dots.

+ | Κ(ύρι)ε β(οή)θ(ει) Ἰω(άννη) μητροπολίτη Σίδ(η)ς <καὶ> [συγκέλλ.]φ

Lord, aid Ioannes, metropolitan of Side and [synkellos]!

<sup>161</sup> Wassiliou-Seibt 2011, no. 2916.

<sup>162</sup> Alanya is located 65 km east of Side. The city was named Korakesion in ancient times. In his *De Thematibus*, Konstantinos Porphyrogennitos (913-959) identifies the city as Kalon Oros, a supply port for the fleet of the naval theme of Kibyrraiotai, and also as Kalliston Oros between Selge and Anemourion (modern Anamur). See Konstantinos Porphyrogennitos 1829, 659; Konstantinos Porphyrogennitos 1952, 79; Hellenkemper and Hild 2004, 587 n. 21.



FIG. 17 Alanya Museum 2006.22A (photo: N. Elam).

This seal may have belonged to the same person as Ioannes, metropolitan of Side, and was apparently identical to the owner of the next seal. Ioannes apparently used this seal when he was only *synkellos*, that is before he promoted as *hypertimos*. I think that the provenance of the seal (the castle of Byzantine Kalon Oros) may be evidence of his residence in his post as well as his correspondence activity with the neighboring Pamphylian cities.

On one hand, the different iconographic and epigraphic characteristics of the seal from others (of later period) on which Ioannes appears with higher titles than *synkellos*, indicates that the prelate may have used this type of seal in a period before having become *hypertimos*. On the other hand the bust of archangel Michael on the obverse of the Alanya seal follows exactly the type of the others on which Ioannes appears as *hypertimos*. If it is the same Ioannes, it may indicate that he used this seal in a period before he promoted as *hypertimos* or in a period after he downgraded (after 1081, the year of the accession of Alexios I Komnenos), but was allowed to remain metropolitan of Side. It is not impossible that Ioannes who mentioned on the seals as *protosynkellos* may have been his name-sake successor.

### 8) Ioannes, Metropolitan of Side and *Synkellos* (ca. 1055-1070)

Amasya Museum. A75.35.25. D: 22 mm. Kal: 3 mm. W: 9.30 gr. Provenance: Alanya 2006.22A. Parallel(s): Alanya Museum no: 2006.22A. Unpublished.

Obv: Bust of Archangel Michael, in profile turned to left, winged, holding on his right hand a trilobe labarum on his right shoulder and the globus (without cross) in his left hand (raised in front of his chest). Border of dots. On either side the inscription: On the left I, at top of M, on the right A at top X: Μιχα(ῆ)λ).



FIG. 18 Amasya Museum A75.35.25 (photo: N. Elam).

Rev: Inscription of five lines. - \* -|+ΚΕΡ,Θ,|ΙΩΜΡΟΠΟ|ΛΙΤ,ΣΙΔ,Σ|CVΓΚΕΛ|-Λ,-

+ Κ(ύρι)ε β(οήθει) Ἰω(άννη) μητροπο(λίτη) Σίδ(η)ς <καὶ> συγκέλλω

Lord, aid Ioannes metropolitan of Side and synkellos!

This seal seems to have belonged to the same person as Ioannes, metropolitan of Side, and was apparently identical to the owner of the previous seal. Ioannes apparently used this seal when he was only synkellos, that is, before he was promoted as hypertimos. The provenance of the seal may indicate his connections with Byzantine Amaseia and its surroundings. In other words, that the seal was found around modern Amasya shows that the prelate had a correspondent in the Pontic city. Unfortunately, in the literary sources, I could not find any clue to whom Ioannes's letter may have been addressed in Amaseia. Depending especially on the different iconographic and epigraphic characteristics of the seal from others (of later period) on which he is mentioned with higher titles than synkellos, one may assume that the prelate used this different type of seal in a period before having been promoted as hypertimos.

That the bust of the Archangel Michael follows exactly the type as hypertimos may indicate that Ioannes used this seal in the period before he was promoted as hypertimos or in the period after he was downgraded (after 1081) but still allowed to remain metropolitan of Pamphylia city. A possibility cannot be excluded that Ioannes, who is mentioned on the seals as protosynkellos, may have been his name-sake successor.

### 9) Abundantios or Abundios or Bodianos or Danoubios, Bardanios or Obodianos (1st half to last 3rd of 7th Cent.)

Side Museum no: 1229. Provenance: Side. D: 21 mm. Field: 21 mm. W: 8.3 gr. Chipped at the top and the bottom. No parallel. Unpublished.

Obv: Bust of the Theotokos with bust of Christ, between crosses.

Rev: Cruciform monogram: Α-Β-Δ-Ν-Θ-Ω-Υ. The monogram can be in the dative or genitive. In the genitive it could be Bodianou, if the first O is written as Omega. But we have the name only in omicron on a seal. It could be a name and a title or office, perhaps Ἰωάννου βαιουλου. In the dative it could be Danoubios, a name attested in Zacos,<sup>163</sup> or



FIG. 19 Side Museum 1555 (photo: N. Elam).

<sup>163</sup> Zacos 1972, no. 1845: "Danoubios comes."



Aboundios attested in Mansi.<sup>164</sup> The feast day of the martyr St. Abundantios or Aboundios, is commemorated on 27 February.<sup>165</sup> If it is in the genitive, which would be better for the type, I prefer the first half of the 7th century. If it is in the dative, not impossible, then it would date to the final third of the 7th century. Obodianos is the name of an individual who was from a famous blood-line from Syria. The first Obodianos is attested as an Antiochan ambassador who went to Constantinople in 360.<sup>166</sup> The Sidetan prelate may have been called Abundantios or Abundios, Bodianos or Danoubios, Bardianos or Obodianos.

One may assume that the owner of this seal may be a metropolitan who chose Abundantios or Aboundios (or the other possible ones) as his cleric name after his assignment to the Sidetan see.

## Conclusion

The metropolis of Side declined after the 7th century and was seemingly abandoned in the 11th century because of the Arab invasions, probably in favor of Attaleia which was promoted from a bishopric to a metropolitan seat in 1084 and only "titular" metropolitans of Side continued to be appointed. The sigillographic data of Dumbarton Oaks, Numismatic Museum of Athens, Institut Français des Études Byzantines and Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien collections show that there was still a bishop on duty in Side until the 80s of the 11th century. The presence of Side as the location of function on their reverses indicates that these seals had been used for documents addressed to their recipients in Constantinople. It can be assumed that particularly the seals from the collections of Dumbarton Oaks and the Kunsthistorisches Museum Wien had probably been found in Istanbul, since all the titles of the owners are mentioned on the seals. Depending on two new seals, discovered in Alanya Museum and Amasya Museum, which are examined in this study, the presence of the metropolitans in Side in the second half of the 10th century is attested. These two seals, which apparently coming from the same bullotereion, should have been used by famous metropolitan Ioannes, who was all-powerful minister of Nikephoros III Botaneiates (1078-1081), in a period before he promoted as hypertimos (before December 1079) or in a period after he demoted, but he was allowed to remain metropolitan. According to another possibility, the owner (Ioannes) of the seals on which he appears as protosynkellos may have been his name-sake successor.

Another new seal whose provenance is Side, was probably belonged to a prelate, who preferred to use a monogrammatic seal, which accompanied a document, whose addressee may have had been functioning in the Pamphylian city between a period from 1st half to last 3rd of 7th century. That is why his owner may have not use a seal holding all his titles, especially in Pamphylia, in a region he was very well-known person. The last Dumbarton Oaks seal, belonged to Basileios reveals that there may have been still ecclesiastical officials in charge in Side as head of an -albeit decreased- Christian community even in the 12th century.

<sup>164</sup> Mansi 1761, 143-44, no. 21: "Abundantius Episcopus Ecclesia Comensis." I owe many thanks to Professor Werner Seibt for sharing this information as well as his opinion on the possible names of the prelate.

<sup>165</sup> AASS III, 676-77.

<sup>166</sup> Cabouret 2006, 352-57.

## Appendix

### Two martyria in the theater of Side



FIG. 20 Side Theater Martyrion 1  
(The photographic archive of the  
Side excavations).



FIG. 21 Side Theater Martyrion 2  
(The photographic archive of the  
Side excavations).

## Bibliography

### Primary Sources

- Amphilochios of Iconium. 1863. "Notitia ex Bibliotheca Gallandii." *Patrologia cursus completus. Series Graeca* 39, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 9-10.
- Amphilochios, 1864. "Fragmentum - Notitia." *Patrologia cursus completus Series Graeca* 77, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 1515.
- Athanasios 1857a. "Historia Arianorum." *Patrologiae cursus completus, Series Graeca* 25, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 698-99.
- Athanasios 1857b. "Apologia de fuga sua." *Patrologiae cursus completus, Series Graeca* 25, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 648B-649A.
- El Ömerî (Al Umarî) 1991. *Çoban-oğulları Beyliği - Candar-oğulları Beyliği. Mesalikü'l - Ebsar'a Göre Anadolu Beylikleri*. Translated by Y. Yücel. Anadolu Beylikleri Hakkında Araştırmalar 1. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu.
- Eusebios of Caesarea 1857. *Historia Ecclesiastica, Vita Constantini. Patrologiae cursus completus. Series Graeca* 20. edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 910-1233.
- Georgios Kedrenos 1838. *Σύνοψις Ἱστοριῶν*, 1, edited by I. Bekker, *Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae*. Bonn: E. Weber.
- Hierocles, 1939. *Le Synekdemus d'Hiérokles et l'opuscule géographique de Georges de Chypre. Texte, introduction, commentaire et cartes*, edited by E. Honigmann. Brussels: Editions de l'Institut de philologie et d'histoire orientales et slaves.
- Ibn Battuta. 1939. *Travels in Asia and Africa 1325-1354*. Translated and selected by H.A.R. Gibb. London: Routledge.
- Idrisî, 1975. *La géographie d'Edrisi = Kitāb Nuzbat al-musbtāq fī kbtirāq al-āfāq*. Translated by P.A. Jaubert. Amsterdam: Philo Press.
- Ioannes Chrysostomos, 1862. "Laudatio (Εγκώμιον)" *Patrologia cursus completus. Series Graeca* 50, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 597-606.
- Ioannes Malalas, 2000. *Chronographia Ioannis Malalae*, edited by J. Thurn. Berlin/New York: Walter de Gruyter.
- Ioannes Skylitzes, 1839. *Breviarum Historicum (Σύνοψις Ἱστοριῶν)*. Vol. 1, edited by I. Bekker. Bonn: E. Weber.
- Ioannes Skylitzes, 1973. *Ioannis Scylitzae Synopsis Historiarum*, edited by I. Thurn. Berlin/New York: Walter de Gruyter.
- Ioannes Skylitzes Continuatus, 1968. *Ἡ συνέχεια τῆς Χρονογραφίας τοῦ Ἰωάννου Σκυλίτση*, edited by, E.T. Τσολάκης. Thessalonike: Εταιρία Μακεδονικῶν Σπουδῶν.
- Ioannes Tzetzes, 1972. *Ioannis Tzetzae Epistulae*, edited by P. Leone. Leipzig: Teubner.
- Ioannes Zonaras, 1897. *Epitome Historiarum*. Vol. 3, edited by T. Büttner-Wobst. Bonn: Weber.
- Jerome 1895. Hieronymus und Gennadius, *De Viris Illustribus*, edited by C.A. Bernoulli. Freiburg/Leipzig: Akademische Verlagsbuchhanlung von C.B.R. Mohr.
- Konstantinus Porphyrogennitos 1829. *Constantini Porphyrogeniti Imperatoris De Ceremoniis aulae Byzantinae libri duo: Graece et Latini*. Vol. 1, edited by J.J. Reiske. Bonn: Weber.
- Konstantinos Porphyrogennitos 1952. *Constantino Porfirogenito De Thematibus*, edited by A. Pertusi. Studi e testi 160. Città del Vaticano: Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana.
- Michael Attaliates, 1853. *Historia, Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae*, Vol. 36, edited by I. Bekker. Bonn: Weber.
- Michael Glykas, 1836. *Annales*, edited by I. Bekker, *Corpus Scriptorum Historiae Byzantinae*. Vol. 24. Bonn: Weber.



- Michael Psellos, 1876. *Μιχαὴλ Ψελλοῦ ἱστορικοὶ λόγοι, ἐπιστολαὶ καὶ ἄλλα ἀνέκδοτα*, ἐκδ. Κ.Ν. Σάθας, Μεσαιωνικὴ Βιβλιοθήκη 5. Venice: Τύποις του Χρόνου [καὶ ἄλλων].
- Michel le Syrien 1899. *Chronicle of Michael the Syrian*. Vol. 1, edited and translated into French by J.-B. Chabot. Paris: Ernest Leroux.
- Niketas Choniates. 1887. "Synodus Graecae Ecclesiae." *Patrologia cursus completus. Series Graeca* 140, edited by J.P. Migne, col:180.
- Nicephorus Constantinopolitanus 1863. "Chronographia Brevis." *Patrologia cursus completus. Series Graeca* 100, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 1001-60.
- Photios, 1959. *Bibliothèque*. Texte établi et traduit par R. Henry. Vol. 1, Codices 1-84. Paris: Les Belles lettres.
- Photios, 1860. "Philippi Sidetae Christianae Historiae." *Patrologia cursus completus Series Graeca* 103, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 67-68.
- Socrates 1859. "De Philippo Presbytero Sidensi." *Historia Ecclesiastica. Patrologia cursus completus. Series Graeca* 67, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 30-842.
- Socrates Scholasticus 1995. *Hist. eccl. Sokrates Kirchengeschichte*, edited by G.C. Hansen. Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- Sozomenos, 1960. *Hist. eccl. Sozomenus Kirchengeschichte*, edited by J. Bidez and G.C. Hansen. Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- Theodoret of Cyrus, 1864. "Historia ecclesiastica." *Patrologia cursus completus. Series Graeca* 82, edited by J.P. Migne, coll. 879-1279.

### Modern Works

- ACO I-IV *Acta Conciliorum Oecumenicorum* (Concilium Universale Constantinopolitanum Iustiniano Habitu 1949), edited by E. Schwartz and J. Straub, 1914-1984. Berlin/Leipzig: Walter de Gruyter.
- AASS *Acta Sanctorum* (Februarii 3). Vol. III, edited by I. Bollandes and G. Haensch, 1658. Antwerp (repr. 1966 Bruxelles): Societe Bollandiste.
- Atiya, A.S. 1967. *A History of Eastern Christianity*. London: University of Notre Dame Press.
- Bar Hebraeus (Gregory Abul-Faraj), 1976. *The Chronography*. 2 vols. Translated from the Syriac by E.A.W. Budge. London: APA - Philo Press.
- Barnes, T.D. 1978. "Emperor and Bishops, A.D. 324-344. Some Problems." *AJAH* 3:53-75.
- Beck, H.G. 1959. *Kirche und theologische Literatur im Byzantinischen Reich*. Munich: C.H. Beck.
- Binon, S. 1938. "L'histoire et la légende de deux chrysobulles d'Andronic II en faveur de Monembasie." *EchOr* 37:274-311.
- Bostan, İ. 1989. "Alanya." In *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* 2:339-41.
- Brandes, W. 1989. *Die Städte Kleinasiens im 7. und 8. Jahrhundert*. Berliner byzantinistische Arbeiten 56 Berlin: Akademie Verlag.
- Brandt, H. 1992. *Gesellschaft und Wirtschaft. Pamphyliens und Pisidiens im Altertum*. Asia Minor Studien 7. Bonn: Rudolph Habelt.
- Brandt, H., and F. Kolb. 2005. *Lycia et Pamphylia. Eine römische Provinz im Südwesten Kleinasiens*. Orbis Provinciarum. Mainz am Rhein: Philipp von Zabern.
- Bryer A., and D. Winfield. 1985. *The Byzantine Monuments and Topography of the Pontos*. 2 vols. Dumbarton Oaks Studies 20. Washington D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection.
- Buchwald, H. 1984. "Western Asia Minor as a Generator of Architectural Forms in the Byzantine Period. Provincial Back-wash or Dynamic Center of Production?" *JÖB* 34:199-234.
- Bulgurlu, V. 2007. *İstanbul Arkeoloji Müzesi'ndeki Bizans Kurşun Mübürleri*. Istanbul: Arkeoloji ve Sanat Yayınları.

- Burgess, R.W. 1999. *Studies in Eusebian and Post-Eusebian Chronography*. Historia Einzelschriften 135. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner.
- Burgess, R.W. 2000. "The Date and Deposition of Eustathius of Antioch." *JThS* 51.1:150-60.
- Cabouret, B. 2006. "Les Argyrioi, une famille de notables d'Antioche au IVe siècle." In *Topoi. Orient-Occident* Suppl. 7:343-60.
- Cartwright, S. 2013. "Eustathius of Antioch in Modern Research." *Vox Patrum* 33:465-85.
- Ceylan, B. 2007. "Episkopeia in Asia Minor." In *Housing in Late Antiquity. From Palaces to Shops*, edited by L. Lavan, L. Özgenel, and A. Sarantis, 169-94. Late Antique Archaeology 3.2. Leiden: Brill.
- Chadwick, H. 1948. "The Fall of Eustathius of Antioch." *JThS* 49 no. 147-148:27-35.
- Chrysos, E. 1966. *Die Bischofslisten des V. Ökumenischen Konzils (533)*. Bonn: Habelt.
- Χρήστου, Π. 1984. *Εκκλησιαστική Γραμματολογία*. Vol. 1, *Πατέρες και θεολόγοι του χριστιανισμού*. Thessalonike: Αφοί Κυριακίδη.
- Comperness, J. 1935. "Zwei Schriften des Arethas von Kaisareia gegen die Vertauschung der Bischofssitze." *StBiz* 4:87-125.
- Darrouzès, J. 1960. *Épistoliers byzantins du Xe siècle*. Paris: Institut français d'études byzantines.
- Darrouzès, J. 1970. *George et Démétrios Tornikès: Lettres et discours*. Paris: Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique.
- Darrouzès, J. 1975. "Listes épiscopales du concile de Nicée (787)." *RÉByz* 33:5-76.
- Darrouzès, J. 1977. *Les Regestes des actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople. Les Regestes des actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople*. Vol. 1, *Les actes des patriarches*. Fasc. 5, *Les Regestes de 1310 à 1376*. Le patriarcat byzantin 1. Paris: Institute français d'études byzantines.
- Darrouzès, J. 1979. *Les Regestes des actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople. Les Regestes des actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople*. Vol. 1, *Les actes des patriarches*. Fasc. 6, *Les Regestes de 1377 à 1410*. Le patriarcat byzantin 1. Paris: Institute français d'études byzantines.
- Darrouzès, J. 1981. *Notitiae episcopatum Ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae*. La Géographie ecclésiastique de l'Empire byzantin 1. Paris: Institute français d'études byzantines.
- Darrouzès, J. 1992. "Notes de littérature et de géographie ecclésiastiques." *RÉByz* 50:87-112.
- Delehaye, H. 1902a. *Synaxarium Ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae e Codice Sirmondiano Nunc Berolinensi*. Brussel: Société des Bollandistes.
- Delehaye, H. 1902b. "Catalogus codicum hagiographicorum graecorum Bibliothecae Nationalis Neapolitanae." *AnalBoll* 21:381-400.
- Delehaye, H. 1912a. *Les origines du culte des martyrs*. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes.
- Delehaye, H. 1912b. "Saints de Thrace et de Mésie." *AnalBoll* 31:161-300.
- Delehaye, H. 1933. *Les origines du culte des martyrs*. 2nd ed. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes.
- Delehaye, H. 1940. *Propylaeum ad Acta sanctorum decembris: Martyrologium Romanum ad formam editionis typicae scholiis historicis instructum*. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes.
- Devreesse, R. 1945. *Le patriarcat d'Antioche depuis la paix de l'Église jusqu'à la conquête arabe*. Études Palestiniennes et Orientales. Paris: J. Gabalda et cie.
- Diehl, Ch. 1924. "De la signification du titre de proèdre à Byzance." In *Mélanges offerts à M. Gustave Schlumberger, membre del'Institute, à l'occasion du quatre-vingtième anniversaire de sa naissance (17 octobre 1924)*. Vol. 1, 104-17. Paris: Paul Geuthner.
- Disdier, M.Th. 1931. "Attalia." In *Dictionnaire d'histoire et de géographie ecclésiastiques* 5:148-49.
- Dölger, F., and P. Wirth. 1995. *Regesten der Kaiserurkunden des Oströmischen Reichs von 565-1453. Regesten von 1025-1204*. Vol. 2. 2nd ed. Munich: Verlag C.H. Beck.
- Dörries, H. 1964. "Urteil und Verurteilung. Ein Beitrag zum Umgang der Alten Kirche mit Häretikern." *ZNTW* 55:78-94.

- Ελευθεριάδης, Ε. 1959. "Ο άγιος ιερομάρτυς Ευστάθιος επίσκοπος Αντιοχείας." *Εκκλησία* 6:94-96.
- Fedalto, G. 1988. *Hierarchia Ecclesiastica Orientalis*. Vol. 1, *Patriarchatus Constantinopolitanus*. Padova: Messagero.
- Feissel, Z.B.D. 1989. "L'évêque, titres et fonctions d'après les inscriptions grecques jusqu'au VIII<sup>e</sup> siècle." In *Actes du XI<sup>e</sup> Congrès International d'Archéologie Chrétienne. Lyon, Vienne Grenoble, Geneve et Aoste 21-28 Septembre 1986*. Vol. 1, 801-28. Collection de l'École française de Rome 123. Rome: Publication de l'École Française de Rome.
- Feld, O. 1977. "Kleinasien." In *Spätantike und frühes Christentum*, edited by B. Brenk, 155-71. Propyläen Kunstgeschichte Suppl. 1. Frankfurt: Propyläen.
- Ficker, G. 1906. *Amphilochiana*, 1. Leipzig: J.A. Barth.
- Ficker, G. 1911. *Erlasse des Patriarchen von Konstantinopel Alexios Studites*. Kiel: Kommissionsverlag der Universität Kiel.
- Flemming, B. 1964. *Landschaftsgeschichte von Pamphylien, Pisidien und Lykien im Spätmittelalter*. Abhandlungen für die Kunde des Morgenlandes 35.1. Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner.
- Foss, C. 1977. "Bryonianus Lollianus of Side." *ZPE* 26:161-71.
- Foss, C.F.W. 1991. "Syllaion." *Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*, 1980.
- Foss, C. 1996. "The Cities of Pamphylia in the Byzantine Age." In *Cities, Fortresses and Villages of Byzantine Asia Minor*, 1-61. Collected Studies 538. Aldershot: Variorum Collected Studies Series.
- Gautier, P. 1971. "Le synode des Blachernes (fin 1094). Étude prosopographique." *RÉByz* 29:213-84.
- Gautier, P. 1986. *Theophylacte d'Achrida*: Lettres, Introduction, texte, traduction et notes. Corpus Fontium Historiae Byzantinae. Series Thessalonicensis 16.2. Thessaloniki: Association de recherches byzantines.
- Gelzer, H. 1900. *Ungedruckte und ungenügend veröffentlichte, Texte der Notitiae Episcopatum: ein Beitrag zur byzantinischen Kirchen- und Verwaltungsgeschichte*. Munich: Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Gliwitsky, C. 2005. "Die Kirche im sog. Bischofpalast zu Side." *IstMitt* 55:337-409.
- Gouillard, J. 1959-1960. "Un chrysobulle de Nicéphore Botaneiatès à souscription synodale." *Byzantion* 29/30:29-41.
- Gouillard, J. 1985. "Le procès officiel de Jean l'Italien. Les actes et leurs sous-entendus." *TravMém* 9:133-74.
- Grumel, V. 1945. "Titulature de Métropolités Byzantins. I. Les métropolités syncelles." *ÉtByz* 3:92-114.
- Grumel, V. 1948. "Titulature de Métropolités Byzantins. II. Métropolités Hypertimes." In *Mémorial Louis Petit. Mélanges d'histoire et d'archéologie byzantines*. Archives de l'Orient chrétien 1. Bucharest: Institut français d'études byzantines.
- Grumel, V. 1972. *Les Regestes des Actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople*. Vol. 1, *Les Actes des Patriarbes*. Fasc. 1, *Les Regestes de 381 à 715*. 2nd ed. Le Patriarcat byzantin 1. Paris: Institut français d'études byzantines.
- Grumel, V. 1989. *Les regestes des Actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople*. Vol. 1, *Les Actes des Patriarbes*. Fasc. 2 et 3, *Les Regestes de 715 à 1206*. 2nd ed. Le Patriarcat byzantin 1. Paris: Institut français d'études byzantines.
- Gwatkin, H.M. 1882. *Studies of Arianism. Chiefly Referring to the Character and Chronology of the Reaction which Followed the Council of Nicaea*. Cambridge: D. Bell.
- Haensch, R. 1997. *Capita Provinciarum: Statthaltersitze und Provinzialverwaltung in der römischen Kaiserzeit*. Mainz am Rhein: Philipp von Zabern.
- Halkin, F. 1935. "Publications récentes de textes hagiographiques grecques." *AnalBoll* 53:366-81.
- Halkin, F. 1969. *Auctarium Bibliographia hagiographiae graecae*. Subsidia hagiographica 47. Brussels: Société des Bollandistes.

- Halkin, F. 1975. "La Passion inédite des saints Eustathe, Thespésius et Anatole." *AnalBoll* 93.3/4:287-311.
- Halkin, F. 1985. "Vie de St. Conon d'Isaurie." *AnalBoll* 103.1/2:5-34.
- Halkin, F. 1987. "Hommage a l'historien A. N. Stratos." *AnalBoll* 105.3/4:264.
- Hanson, R.P.C. 1984. "The Fate of Eustathius of Antioch." *Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte* 95:171-79.
- Hanson, R.P.C. 1988. *The Search for the Christian Doctrine of God: the Arian Controversy 318-381*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark.
- Hellenkemper, H., and F. Hild. 2004. *Lykien und Pamphylien*. 3 vols. Tabula Imperii Byzantini 8. Denkschriften, Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften: Philosophisch-historische Klasse 320. Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Herrmann, E. 1980. *Ecclesiae in Re Publica. Die Entwicklung der Kirche von pseudo-staatlicher zu staatlich inkorporierter Existenz*. Europäisches Forum 2. Frankfurt: Lang.
- Herrin, J. 2013. *Margins and Metropolis: Authority across the Byzantine Empire*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Hild, F., and H. Hellenkemper. 1990. *Kilikien und Isaurien*. 2 vols. Tabula Imperii Byzantini 5. Denkschriften, Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften: Philosophisch-historische Klasse 215. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Honigmann, E. 1935. "La liste originale des Pères de Nicée. A propos de l'Évêché de « Sodoma » en Arabie." *Byzantion* 14.1:17-76.
- Honigmann, E. 1942-1943. "The Original Lists of the Members of the Council of Nicaea, the Robber-Synod and the Council of Chalcedon." *Byzantion* 16.1:20-80.
- Hunger, H., and O. Kresten, eds. 1981. *Das Register des Patriarchats von Konstantinopel*. Pt. 1, *Edition und Übersetzung der Urkunden aus den Jahren 1315-1331*. Corpus Fontium Historiae Byzantinae Band: 19.1. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Hunger, H., and O. Kresten, eds. 1995. *Das Register des Patriarchats von Konstantinopel*. Pt. 2, *Edition und Übersetzungen der Urkunden aus den Jahren 1337-1350*. Corpus Fontium Historiae Byzantinae 19.2. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Jülicher, A. 1907. *RE* 6.1, 1448-449, s.v. "Eustathios."
- Karpozilos, A. 2009. *Βυζαντινοί ιστορικοί και χρονογράφοι, Τόμος III: (11ος-12ος αἰ)* [*Byzantine Historians and Chronographers*. Vol. III (11th-12th c.)]. Athens: Kanake.
- Kelly, J.N.D. 1968. *Early Christian Doctrines*. 4th ed. London: Adam and Charles Black.
- Koch, G. 2007. *Türkiye'deki Erken Hıristiyanlık Dönemi Önemli Merkezleriyle Birlikte Erken Hıristiyan Sanatı*. Translated by A. Aydın. Istanbul: Arkeoloji ve Sanat Yayınları.
- Koder, J., M. Hinterberger, and O. Kresten, eds. 2001. *Das Register des Patriarchats von Konstantinopel*. Pt. 3, *Edition und Übersetzungen der Urkunden aus den Jahren 1350-1363*. Corpus Fontium Historiae Byzantinae Band: 19.3. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Kofoğlu, S. 1997. "Hamidoğulları Beyliği." *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi* 15:471-76.
- Kofoğlu, S. 2011. "Tekeoğulları Beyliği (Merkezi Antalya olan Türkmen Beyliği 1321-145)." *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi* 40:348-49.
- Korobeinikov, D. 2005. "Orthodox Communities in Eastern Anatolia in the Thirteenth to Fourteenth Centuries. Pt. 2, The Time of Troubles." *Al Masaq* 17.1:1-29.
- Kresten, O. 2000. *Die Beziehungen zwischen den Patriarchaten von Konstantinopel und Antiocheia unter Kallistos I und Philotheos Kokkinos im Spiegel des Patriarchatsregisters von Konstantinopel*. Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag.
- Κωνσταντόπουλος, Κ.Μ. 1917. *Βυζαντιακά μολοβδόβουλλα του εν Αθήναις Εθνικού Νομισματικού Μουσείου*. Athens: [χ.ό.]
- Lamberz, E. 2008. *Acta Conciliorum Oecumenicorum*, Series Secunda, Vol. 3 *Concilium Universale Nicaenum Secundum*, pt. 1, *Concilii actiones I-III*. Berlin/New York: Walter de Gruyter.

- Laurent, V. 1927. "Les signataires du second synode des Blakhernes (Été 1285)." *EchOr* 26.146:129-49.
- Laurent, V. 1932. Reprint. *Les bulles métriques dans la sigillographie byzantine*. Athens: Typographeion Estia. Reprint and offprint from *Hellenika* 4 (1931):191-228.
- Laurent, V. 1933. "Mélanges de géographie ecclésiastique." *EchOr* 32:311-24.
- Laurent, V. 1963. *Le Corpus des Sceaux de l'empire byzantin*. Vol. 5, *L'Église*, pt. 1, *L'Église de Constantinople. A, La Hiérarchie*. Paris: Éditions du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique.
- Laurent, V. 1971. *Les Regestes des Actes du Patriarcat de Constantinople*. Vol. 1, *Les actes des patriarches*, Fasc. 4, *Les Regestes de 1208 à 1309*. Le Patriarcat byzantin 1. Paris: Institut français d'études byzantines.
- Laurent, V. 1972. *Le Corpus des Sceaux de l'Empire byzantin*. Vol. 3, *L'Église*. Supplément. Paris: Éditions du Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique.
- Le Quien, M. 1740. *Oriens Christianus: in quatuor patriarchatus digestus: quo exhibentur ecclesiae, patriarchae, caeterique praesules totius Orientis*, Vol. 1. Paris: Ex Typographia Regia.
- Leiser, G. 2000. "Teke-oghullari." *Encyclopaedia of Islam*. 412-13. 2nd ed. Leiden: Brill.
- Lübeck, K. 1901. *Reichseinteilung und kirchliche Hierarchie des Orients bis zum Ausgang des vierten Jahrhunderts. Ein Beitrag zur Rechts- und Verfassungsgeschichte der Kirche*. Münster: Verlag Schöningh.
- Macrides, R.J. 1991. "Chartophylax", *Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*, 415-16.
- Mandouze, A. 1987. *Histoires des saints et de la sainteté chrétienne*. Vol. 3, *Des évêques et des moines reconnus par le peuple (314-604)*. Paris: Hachette.
- Mansel, A.M. 1962. "Side Tiyatrosu." *Belleten* 26.101:45-56.
- Mansel, A.M. 1963. *Die Ruinen von Side*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Mansel, A.M. 1978. *Side. 1947-1966 Yılları Kazıları ve Araştırmalarının Sonuçları*. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu.
- Mansi, J.D. 1759. *Sacrorum Conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*. Vol. 2. Florence: Antonium Zatta.
- Mansi, J.D. 1761. *Sacrorum Conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*. Vol. 6. Florence: Antonium Zatta.
- Mansi, J.D. 1765. *Sacrorum Conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*. Vol. 11. Florence: Antonium Zatta.
- Mansi, J.D. 1767. *Sacrorum Conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*. Vol. 13. Florence: Antonium Zatta.
- Mansi, J.D. 1772. *Sacrorum Conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio*. Vol. 17. Venice: Antonium Zatta.
- Metcalf, D.M. 2004. *Byzantine Lead Seals from Cyprus*. Vol. 1. Texts and Studies of the History of Cyprus 47. Nicosia: Cyprus Research Center.
- Migne, J.P., ed. 1837. "Sancti Eustathii. Episcopi Antiocheni. Allocutio ad Imperatorem Constantinum in Concilio Nicaeno." *Patrologia cursus completus Series Graeca* 18, coll:613-76.
- Migne, J.P., ed. 1881. "Συνοδικαὶ ἀποκρίσεις εἰς τὰ τῷ Σίδης ἐρωτηθέντα." In *Sententiae synodales et sanctiones pontificiae*, *Patrologia cursus completus Series Graeca* 119, coll:726-1300.
- Migne, J.P., ed. 1894a, "καὶ ἀθλισῆς τῶν ἁγίων ἑπτὰ καὶ τριάντα μαρτύρων (Et certamen sanctorum septem et triginta martyrum)", *Patrologia cursus completus Series Graeca* 117, coll: 593A.
- Migne, J.P., ed. 1894b. "Ἀθλιῆσις τοῦ ἁγίου μάρτυρος Λεοντίου καὶ τῆς συνοδίας αὐτοῦ." In *Menologium Basilianum*, *Patrologia cursus completus Series Graeca* 117, coll:568.
- Miklosich, F., and J. Müller. 1860. *Acta et diplomata graeca medii aevi sacra et profana*, 1. Vienna: C. Gerold.
- Miklosich, F., and J. Müller. 1887. *Acta et diplomata graeca medii aevi sacra et profana*, 5. Vienna: C. Gerold.
- Μπαλάνος, Δ. 1942. *Μεγάλοι μορφαί της Αρχαίας Εκκλησίας*. Athens: Αετός Α.Ε.
- Musurillo, H.A., trans. 1972. *The Acts of the Christian Martyrs*. Early Christian Texts. Oxford: The Clarendon Press.



- Müller-Wiener, W. 1989. "Bischofsresidenzen des 4-7. Jhs. im östlichen Mittelmeer-Raum." In *Actes du XIe Congrès International d'Archéologie Chrétienne, Lyon, Vienne Grenoble, Geneve et Aoste 21-28 Septembre 1986*. Vol. 1, 651-709. Collection de l'École française de Rome 123. Rome: Publication de l'École Française de Rome.
- Neale, J.M. 1873. *A History of the Eastern Church. The Patriarchate of Antioch*, I. London: Rivingtons.
- Nesbitt, J., and N. Oikonomides. 1994. *Catalogue of Byzantine Seals at Dumbarton Oaks and in the Fogg Museum of Art*. Vol. 2, *South of the Balkans, the Islands, South of Asia Minor*. Washington D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection.
- Nesbitt, J., and N. Oikonomides. 1996. *Catalogue of Byzantine Seals at Dumbarton Oaks and in the Fogg Museum of Art*. Vol. 3, *West, Northwest, and Central Asia Minor and the Orient*. Washington D.C.: Dumbarton Oaks Research Library and Collection.
- Nollé, J. 1986. "Pamphyliche Studien." *Chiron* 16:199-212.
- Nollé, J., and F. Schindler. 1991. *Die Inschriften von Selge*. Inschriften griechischer Städte aus Kleinasien 37. Bonn: Dr. Rudolph Habelt.
- Nollé, J. 1993a. *Die feindlichen Schwestern - Betrachtungen zur Rivalität der pamphyllischen Städte*. In *Die epigraphische und altertumskundliche Erforschung Kleinasiens: Hundert Jahre kleinasiatische Kommission der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Hundert Jahre Kommission der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Akten des Symposiums vom 23. bis 25. Oktober 1990*, edited by G. Dobesch and G. Rehrenböck, 297-317. Ergänzungsbände zu den Tituli Asiae Minoris 14. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften
- Nollé, J. 1993b. *Side im Altertum. Geschichte und Zeugnisse*. Vol. 1, *Geographie, Geschichte, Testimonia, griechische und lateinische Inschriften*. *Inschriften griechischer Städte aus Kleinasien* 43. Bonn: Dr. Rudolph Habelt.
- Nollé, J. 2001. *Side im Altertum. Geschichte und Zeugnisse*. Vol. 2. Inschriften griechischer Städte aus Kleinasien 44.2. Bonn: Habelt.
- Νυσταζοπούλου, Μ.Γ. 1965. *Η εν τη Ταυρική χερσονήσῳ πόλις Σουγδαία από του ΙΓ' μέχρι του ΙΕ' αιώνας. Δημοσιεύματα του Αρχαιολογικού Δελτίου* 7. Athens: Ταμείο Αρχαιολογικών Πόρων.
- Ohme, H. 1990. *Das Concilium Quinisextum und seine Bischofsliste. Studien zum Konstantinopeler Konzil von 692*. Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte 56. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Oikonomidès, N.A. 1960. "Un décret synodal inédit du patriarche Jean VIII Xiphilin concernant l'élection et l'ordination des évêques." *RÉByz* 18:55-78.
- Oikonomidès, N. 1972. *Les listes de préséance byzantines des IXe et Xe siècles. Introduction, texte, traduction et commentaire*. (Le monde byzantin. Paris: Centre National de la Recherche Scientifique.
- Pančenko, B.A. 1903. "Kollekcii Russkago Archeologičeskago Instituta v Konstantinopolě. Katalog Molidovulov." *Izvestija Russkago Archeologičeskago Instituta v Konstantinopolě* 8.3:199-246.
- Παπαβασιλείου, Α.Ν. 2004. *Μητρῶν Αγιονυμίας της Ορθοδόξου Εκκλησία*. Λευκωσία: [χ.ό.]
- Papachryssanthou, D. 1967. "A propos d'une incription de Syméon Uros." *TravMém* 2:483-88.
- Papadakis, A. 1991a. "Metropolitan", *Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*, 1359.
- Papadakis, A. 1991b. "Synkellos", *Oxford Dictionary of Byzantium*, 1993-994.
- Papadopoulos, S. 1963. "Αττάλεια." *Θρησκευτική και Ηθική Εγκυκλοπαίδεια* 1:448.
- Papadopoulos-Kerameus, A. 1897. *Ανάλεκτα ιεροσολυμιτικής σταχυολογίας: ή Συλλογή ανεκδότων και σπανίων ελληνικών συγγραφών περί των κατά την Εωαν ορθοδόξων εκκλησιών και μάλιστα της των Παλαιστινών* 4. St. Petersburg: B. Κιρσπάουμ.
- Papadopoulos-Kerameus, A. 1898. *Ανάλεκτα ιεροσολυμιτικής σταχυολογίας: ή Συλλογή ανεκδότων και σπανίων ελληνικών συγγραφών περί των κατά την Εωαν ορθοδόξων εκκλησιών και μάλιστα της των Παλαιστινών* 5. St. Petersburg: B. Κιρσπάουμ.
- Papadopoulos-Kerameus, A. 1907. "Διορθωτικά εις Χριστιανικὰς ἐπιγραφὰς." *Journal du Ministère Russe de l'Instruction Publique* 11:482-516.



- Παπαδόπουλος, Χ. 1951. *Ιστορία της Εκκλησίας της Αντιόχειας*: Alexandria: [χ.ό.]
- Parvis, P. 2006a. "Constantine's Letter to Arius and Alexander?" In *Historica, Biblica, Ascetica et Hagiographica*, edited by F. Young, M. Edwards, and P. Parvis, 89-95. *Studia Patristica* 39. Leuven: Peeters.
- Parvis, S. 2006b. *Marcellus of Ancyra and the Lost Years of the Arian Controversy 325-345*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Pekman, A. 1973. *History of Perge*. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Basimevi.
- Φειδάς, Β. 2002. *Εκκλησιαστική Ιστορία* Vol. 1. Athens: Δ. Μόσχου.
- Planthol, X. de. 1986. "Hamid-oghullari." *Encyclopaedia of Islam*. 2nd ed. 8:132-33.
- Pope Felix 1862. "Epistola V ad Zenonem imperatorem." *Patrologia Latina*, edited by P. Migne, 58:889-979.
- Preger, Th. 1899. "Inscripfen aus Konstantinopel." *ByzZeit* 8.2:485-89.
- Preiser-Kapeller, J. 2008. *Der Episkopat im späten Byzanz. Ein Verzeichnis der Metropoliten und Bischöfe des Patriarchats von Konstantinopel in der Zeit von 1204 bis 1453*. Saarbrücken: VDM Verlag Dr. Müller.
- PLP *Prosopographisches Lexikon der Palaiologenzeit*, edited by E. Trapp, R. Walther, H.-V. Beyer. 12 vols. Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1976-1996.
- PmbZ *Prosopographie der Mittelbyzantinischen Zeit*, edited by R.J. Lilie 1999-2001. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Ράλλης, Γ.Α., and Μ. Ποτλής. 1852. *Σύνταγμα των θείων και ιερών κανόνων των τε αγίων και πανευφήμων Αποστόλων, και των ιερών και οικουμενικών και τοπικών Συνόδων και των κατά μέρος αγίων Πατέρων*. Vol. 2. Athens: Γ. Χαρτοφύλακος.
- Ράλλης, Γ.Α., and Μ. Ποτλής 1855. *Σύνταγμα των θείων και ιερών κανόνων των τε αγίων και πανευφήμων Αποστόλων, και των ιερών και οικουμενικών και τοπικών Συνόδων και των κατά μέρος αγίων Πατέρων*. Vol. 5. Athens: Γ. Χαρτοφύλακος.
- Ramsay, W. 1890. *The Historical Geography of Asia Minor*. Royal Geographical Society Supplementary Papers 4. London: John Murray.
- Roueché, Ch.M. 1989. "Flore at Perge." In *Images of Authority. Papers Presented to J. Reynolds on the Occasion of her 79th Birthday*, edited by M.M. Mackenzie and Ch. Roueché, 206-28. Supplementary Vol. (Cambridge Philological Society) 16. Cambridge: Cambridge Philological Society.
- Ruge, W. 1923. "Side." *RE* 2.4/II.A2:2208-209.
- Ruge, W. 1949. "Pamphylia." *RE* 18.3:354-407.
- Ruggieri, V.S.J., and F. Nethercott. 1986. "The Metropolitan City of Syllion and its Churches." *JÖB* 36:133-56.
- Ruggieri, V.S.J. 1991. *Byzantine Religious Architecture (582-867): Its History and Structural Elements*. *Orientalia Christiana Analecta* 237. Rome: Pont. Studiorum Orientalium.
- Ruggieri, V.S.J. 1993. "The IV Century Greek Episcopal Lists in the Mardin Syriac. 7 (olim Mardin Orth. 309/9)." *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* 59.2:315-56.
- Ruggieri, V.S.J. 1995. "Appunti sulla continuità urbana di Side in Panfilia." *Orientalia Christiana Periodica* 61:95-116.
- Sakellion, I. 1878. "Documents inédits tirés de la bibliothèque de Patmos. Décret d'Alexis Comnène portant déposition de Léon, métropolitain de Chalcédoine." *BCH* 2:102-28.
- Sakellion, I. 1890. *Πατμιακή βιβλιοθήκη*. Athens: Εκ του Τυπογραφείου Αλεξάνδρου Παπαγεωργίου.
- Σάκκος, Στ. Ν. 1966. "Ο πατήρ μου μείζων μου ἐστίν. Κριτική κειμένου καί ἐρμηνεία." *Ἐπιστημονική Ἐπετηρίδα θεολογικῆς Σχολῆς Πανεπιστημίου Θεσσαλονίκης* 1:13-208.
- Sauget, J.M. 1968. "Sisinnio." In *Bibliotheca Sanctorum* 11:1246-247. Rome: Citta Nuova Ed.
- Savaville, S. 1930. "Le titre ecclésiastique de 'proedros' dans les documents byzantins." *EchOr* 29.160: 416-36.

- Schlumberger, G. 1884. *Sigillographie de l'Émpire byzantin*. Paris: E. Leroux.
- Schultze, V. 1926. *Altchristliche Städte und Landschaften*. Vol. 2, Kleinasien. Gütersloh: C. Bertelsmann.
- Seibt, W. 2016. "The Use of Monograms on Byzantine Seals in the Early Middle-Ages (6th-9th Centuries)." *Parekbolai* 6:1-14.
- Seibt, W. 1999. "Monogramm." *Reallexikon zur byzantinischen Kunst* 6: 590-616.
- Smith, W. 1844. *Dictionary of Greek and Roman Biography and Mythology*. Vol. 1. London: Taylor and Walton.
- Stewart, C. 1989. "New Perspectives on Messalian Controversy." *Studia Patristica* 19:243-49.
- Şahin, S., and R. Merkelbach. 1987. *Katalog der antiken Inschriften des Museums von Iznik (Nikaia)* 2.3, T1-69. *Testimonia*. Inschriften griechischer Städte aus Kleinasien 10.3. Bonn: Dr. Rudolf Habelt GmbH.
- Taeschner, F. 1986. "Alanya." In *Encyclopedia of Islam*. 2nd ed. Vol. 1:354-55.
- Tanner, N.P.S.J. 1990. *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*. Vol. 1, *Nicaea I to Lateran V*. London/Washington: Georgetown University Press.
- Tillemont, L.S. Lenain de. 1713. *Mémoires pour servir à l'histoire ecclésiastique des six premiers siècles*, 8. Paris: Charles Robustel.
- Τσάμης, Δ. 1992. *Εκκλησιαστική Γραμματολογία*, 4η εκδ. Thessaloniki: Πουρναρά.
- Turner, C.H. 1907. *Ecclesiae Occidentalis monumenta iuris antiquissima*. Vol. 2. Oxon: Clarendon.
- Turner, C.H. 1913. "Canons Attributed to the Council of Constantinople, A.D. 381, Together with the Names of the Bishops from Two Patmos MSS POB' POΓ" *JThs* 15/58:161-78.
- von Gebhardt, O. 1902. *Acta Martyrum Selecta: Ausgewählte Martyreracten und andere Urkunden aus der Verfolgungszeit der christlichen Kirche*. Berlin: A. Duncker.
- Vryonis, S. 1971. *The Decline of Medieval Hellenism in Asia Minor and the Process of Islamization from the Eleventh through the Fifteenth Century*. Publications of the Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies 4. Berkeley/London: University of California Press.
- Wassiliou-Seibt, A.K. 2011. *Corpus der byzantinischen Siegel mit metrischen Legenden*, Teil 1, *Einleitung, Siegellegenden von Alpha bis inklusive My*. Wiener Byzantinistische Studien 28.1. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Wassiliou-Seibt, A.K. 2016. *Corpus der byzantinischen Siegel mit metrischen Legenden*, Teil 2, *Siegellegenden von Ny bis inklusive Spbragis*, edited by C. Rapp and C. Gastgeber. Wiener Byzantinistische Studien 28.2. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Will, C. 1861. *Edictum Pseudosynodi Constantinopolitanae, in Acta et Scripta quae de Controversis Ecclesiae Graecae et Latinae Saeculo undecimo composita extant*. Leipzig/Marburg: Elwert Bibliopola Academica.
- Wilson, M. 2018. "Jews and Christians in Ancient Lycia: A Fresh Appraisal." In *Aziz Nikolaos Kilisesi Kazıları 1989-2009*, edited by S. Doğan and E.F. Fındık, 11-34. Istanbul: Homer Kitabevi.
- Yetkin, Ş. 1974. "The Turkish Monuments in Sillyon (Yanköy Hisar)." In *Mélanges Mansel*. Vol. 2, edited by, E. Akurgal and U.B. Alkım, 861-72. Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Basımevi.
- Zacos, G., and A. Veglery. 1972. *The Byzantine Lead Seals*. Vol. 1.1-3. Basel: J.J. Augustin.
- Zanetti, U. 1998. "Les 'Grands Ménées' de Macaire de Moscou: Inventaire et sources grecques (1-11 mars)." *AnalBoll* 116.3-4:331-53.
- Zepos I.P. 1931. "Ecloga Privata Aucta." In *Jus Graecoromanum* 2, edited by K.E.Z. von Lingenthal. Athens: Fexis.
- Zepos, I.P. 1962. *Jus Graecoromanum*. Vol. 1, *Novellae et aureae bullae imperatorum post Justinianum*. Aalen: Scientia.
- Zgusta, L. 1984. *Kleinasiatische Ortsnamen*. Beiträge zur Namenforschung neue folge Suppl. 21. Heidelberg: C. Winter, Universitätsverlag.