

Content Analysis of the Textbooks of Pakistan Studies for 8th, 9th and 10th Classes

Nasir RIAZ*

Makale Bilgisi	ÖZET
Makalenin geliş tarihi: 10.12.2020	ABSTRACT Pakistan, when came into existence, was geographically a divided country composed of two wings- East and West and was an amalgamation of various ethnic nationalities. Being ethnically a pluralist state, Pakistan faced a plethora of problems but was convinced to give top priority to nation-building process. However, all attempts at creating a unified citizenship ended in futile in 1971 when we lost our eastern wing which came out in the shape of an independent state of Bangladesh. After 1971 we still face the problems arising out of plurality which necessitates inculcating national unity and patriotism among Pakistanis. This can be possible only by bringing changes in national curriculum. The education system and specifically Syllabus designing is given due importance in this struggle for nation building. Pakistan Studies is one of the various subjects where the contents of the books for various classes are specially designed and controlled. The main objective of teaching Pakistan Studies is to promote the knowledge of an individual regarding the history, geography, economy of Pakistan and her relations with other states. An analysis of the contents of the subject shows that it tries to impart a manufactured patriotic sense of Pakistani citizenship and promotion of Islamic values. The present analysis gives special attention to analyze the textbooks of Pakistan Studies for 8th, 9th, and 10th classes. The main purpose of the paper is to fully evaluate the target books for their contents, pinpoint shortcomings, if any, how far they have been helpful in nation building and suggest areas for improvements. Keywords: Pakistan, Pakistan Studies, Syllabi, Nation Building and Religious Minorities
Makalenin kabul tarihi: 27.12.2020	

8., 9. ve 10. Sınıf Pakistan Çalışmaları Ders Kitaplarının İçerik Analizi

ÖZET

Pakistan ortaya çıktığında coğrafi olarak Doğu ve Batı olmak üzere iki kanattan oluşan bölünmüş bir ülkeydi ve çeşitli etnik milliyetlerin bir karışımıydı. Etnik olarak çoğulcu bir devlet olan Pakistan, çok sayıda sorunla karşılaştı, ancak ulus inşa sürecine en büyük önceliği vermeye ikna oldu. Ancak, bağımsız bir Bangladeş devleti şeklinde ortaya çıkan doğu kanadı 1971'de kaybedilen, birleşik bir vatandaşlık yaratmaya yönelik tüm girişimler boşa çıktı. 1971'den sonra, Pakistanlılar arasında ulusal birliği ve vatanseverliği telkin etmeyi gerektiren çoğulculuktan kaynaklanan sorunlarla hala karşı karşıyadır. Bu ancak ulusal müfredatta değişiklik getirerek mümkün olabilir. Bu ulus inşası mücadelesinde eğitim sistemine ve özellikle Müfredat tasarımına gereken önem verilmektedir. Pakistan Çalışmaları, çeşitli dersler için kitapların içeriklerinin özel olarak tasarlandığı ve kontrol edildiği çeşitli konulardan biridir. Pakistan Çalışmalarını öğretmenin temel amacı, bir bireyin Pakistan'ın tarihi, coğrafyası, ekonomisi ve diğer devletlerle ilişkileri hakkındaki bilgilerini geliştirmektir. Bu analiz, Pakistan Araştırmaları ders kitaplarını 8., 9. ve 10. sınıflar için analiz etmeye özel

* Doctorate Student Department of History, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Karabuk University, Karabuk, Turkey.
Email: nasirwazir2003@gmail.com

önem vermektedir. Makalenin temel amacı, hedef kitapları içeriklerine göre tam olarak değerlendirmek, varsa eksiklikleri, ulus inşasında ne kadar yardımcı olduklarını belirlemek ve iyileştirme alanları önermektir.

Anahtar kelimeler: Pakistan, Pakistan Çalışmaları, Müfredat, Ulus İnşası ve Dini Azınlıklar

INTRODUCTION

Pakistan came into existence on August 14, 1947 as a result of a struggle of the Muslims in India for a separate homeland where they could lead their lives according to the principles of Islam. Pakistan, being a divided country, is composed of two wings-East and West and is a society of various ethnic nationalities prominent among them are Punjabis, Bengalis, Pakhtuns, Baloch, Sindhis and Muhajirs. Being ethnically a pluralist state, Pakistan faces a plethora of problems. She struggles to give top priority to nation-building processes. However, all attempts at creating a unified citizenship have ended in futile and in 1971, the country lost its eastern wing which came out as an independent state now called Bangladesh. After 1971 the country is still faced with the problems arising out of plurality so there is an urgent need to inculcate national unity and patriotism among Pakistanis which can be possible only by bringing changes in national curriculum. The education system and specifically Syllabus designing, which is a provincial subject under the constitution of 1973, is given due place in this struggle for nation building. In the Education Policy 1972, the subject of Pakistan Studies was introduced for the first time at the different levels of education and was made a compulsory subject in 1985 (Shahid, 2007: 77). Pakistan Studies is one of the various textbooks where the contents of the books for various classes are specially designed and controlled. Pakistan Studies is taught to promote the knowledge of an individual regarding the history, geography, economy of Pakistan and her relations with other states and the importance of nation buildings (Khan, 2010).

The second section deals with the analysis the contents of the Pakistan Studies book for 8th, 9th and 10th classes. An analysis of the contents of the subject shows that it tries to impart a manufactured patriotic sense of Pakistani citizenship and promotion of Islamic values. It shows that the besides various strengths, the books provide partial information; the analysis are subjective and superficial, the services and efforts of many of the nationalist leaders have been ignored; religious minorities have not been fairly represented; and have gender biases. The last section concludes the paper with some optimal recommendations.

An Evaluation of the Textbooks of Pakistan Studies for 8th, 9th and 10th Classes:

Pakistan Studies is a compulsory subject at school and college level in Pakistan which equips the students not only of the historical events in the formative phase of Pakistan but also of the socio-cultural, economic and political developments in Pakistan. The subject is mainly intended to impart a Pakistani vision and narratives of not only the pre-partition political developments leading to the creation of Pakistan but also of the post partition happenings. These periods have been thoroughly analyzed by scholars both local and foreign (see for example Burki, 1986; Callard, 1957; Cohen, 2004; Jaffrelot, 2002; Jalal, 1985; Jalal, 1995; Kapur, 1991; Malik, 2008; & Sayeed, 1996 & Talbot, 1998). These scholars have critically analyzed the constitutional and political history of Pakistan and have pinpointed the main areas for further research.

The present analysis shows that the Pakistan Studies books for the 8th, 9th and 10th classes have been mainly engineered for making nation building. The book for 8th class gives a pre-partition history of Pakistan. It equips the students of the main events and movements which contributed to the creation of Pakistan in 1947. The knowledge of these developments is so essential in creating a sense of patriotism and loyalty to the nations among the students at early stage of their learning. The book starts with the War of Independence, 1857 and shows how this war and its aftermath affected the Muslims of subcontinent (name given to the pre-partition India) so badly. The struggle of Sir Sayed Ahmad Khan, as a great Muslim hero, in reminding the Muslims of their responsibilities has been discussed. The emergence of political

parties in the form of Congress (mainly a Hindu party) and Muslim League and their political struggle and conflicts have been given proper space in the book. It shows that before partition the main players in the Indian subcontinent were the Britons, Hindus and Muslims and all the politics revolved around them. The views and reaction of all the three actors on the various reforms like those of 1909, 1919, and 1935 and missions like Cripps Mission, Shimla Conference and Cabinet Mission have been briefly discussed giving an understanding to the students of the role of Muslims and Hindus in these events. The narratives developed in the book shows that the students are imbued with understanding that Hindus had never been their friends and that all the hurdles in their progress were created by Hindus in the pre- partition era. The book tries to show the justification of the “Two Nation Theory”, a theory expounded by Sir Sayed Ahmad Khan and later by Allama Iqbal, the national poet of Pakistan, showing that the Muslims and Hindus are two separate nations by any definition of the word (see for example Ahmed, 1997 & Cohen, 2004). It shows how this theory was given a practical shape by Muhammad Ali Jinnah, Quaid-e-Azam, the founder of Pakistan on August 14, 1947.

Similarly, the book for 9th and 10th class tries to equip the students of the socio-economic, cultural, constitutional and political developments since the creation of Pakistan. The students are made familiar with the constitution of Pakistan and the role of various institutions like parliament, executive and judiciary. An awareness of their fundamental rights is given to them. The portion regarding the fundamental rights is especially important in creating a sense of belonging to the nation. Its knowledge informs them that all are equal citizen of Pakistan regardless of language, religion, sex and place of birth. Similarly, an understanding of the principles of policy (a non-judicial part of the constitution) enables the students of the policies of the government.

The book highlights the contribution of Pakistan towards maintaining peace and stability both at regional and global level. The role of Pakistan in the various international organizations like SAARC, ASEAN, ECO, OIC and UN has been given due place. The students are enabled to know the main objectives, role and achievements of these organizations. Furthermore, they are made aware of the main objectives of the foreign policy of Pakistan and how far the government has been successful in achieving those objectives. An understanding of Pakistan’s relations with western countries like US and UK, Muslim countries like Iran and Saudi Arab and regional countries like Afghanistan, India and China is very important for the students at the initial stages of their learning. It shows the students who are their friends and who are not. The book has shown that China has always rendered help to Pakistan while India has been their arch enemy.

The book also gives a sketch of the socio-economic and political problems of Pakistan like poverty, trade deficit etc. and creates an awareness of the main causes of these problems among the students. However, these problems have been dealt with superficially and no analytical deep explanation has been given.

Thus both the books have tried to inculcate in the students a sense of loyalty and belonging to their country. An attempt has been made towards nation building. The books have struggled to impart a Pakistani identity and nationalism upon the people so diverse on the basis of language, culture, traditions and ethnicity. To manage diversity in Pakistan, federalism with provincial autonomy and decentralization of authority has been considered as a natural structure for a country. However, this Pakistani national identity has not been developed so far which has resulted in strong ethnic, cultural and tribal identities. To cope with this menace, Islamic ideology has been instrumentally used to reject the ethnic minorities a fair power sharing and legitimate rights in the name of national integration and homogeneity.

However, there are many areas for improvement in the books. The first issue with them is that they have been written in Urdu. The students at lower level of education have serious problem in understanding Urdu which is the national language of Pakistan. Majority of the terms like federation (*wafaq*) and Dominion (*nowabadiyat*) used in the books are not understandable to the students. This phenomenon results in rote learning which seriously affect the performance of the students. Urdu as a national language has a long

history in the politics of Pakistan. It was chosen to be the national language of Pakistan to facilitate inter-provincial communication between the country's diverse linguistic populations, though only about 7.5 percent of Pakistanis speak it as their first language. Urdu was considered to performed two purposes firstly, as a neutral language rather than the dominant Bengali or Punjabi, and secondly, its association with the Muslim nationalist movement in Northern India⁵ (Adeney, 2007: 101; Ayres, 2009: 189). Jinnah insisted on making Urdu as the national language which was resented by many ethnic groups. Ian Talbot (1998: 1) argues that "Urdu and Islam, rather than providing a panacea for unity in plural diversity, have opened a Pandora's Box of conflicting identities. The elite of Pakistan thought of regional and linguistic identities as inherently dangerous and as undermining the national project which was based on Islam.

According to Talbot (1998: 26) "Attempts at strengthening Urdu as part of nation building enterprise proved counterproductive as was demonstrated most clearly in East Bengal". The riots in East Bengal in the 1952 and Urdu-Sindhi controversy leading to brutal riots in June 1972 are illustrative of the fact. Language was the main issue which brought the division of the country in 1971 (Ayres, 2009: 41). Most of the Muslim League leaders came from the Muslim minority provinces like UP and Bombay (Waseem, 1994: 62-5) and Urdu was their first language, so they made it the national language for their own convenience. For the centrist political elites Urdu as a national language and Islam as identity became the foundation for engineering a common national outlook within the multi-national state of Pakistan. The policy pursued by the government as stated by Jinnah was the policy of one state, one government, one economy, one language and one culture which marginalized many groups (Chowdhury, 1988: 50-2; Amin, 1993: 73). In connection of the state language Jinnah said to Bengalis "Ultimately it is for you, the people of this province, to decide what shall be the language of your province. But let me make it very clear to you that the State Language of Pakistan is going to be Urdu and no other language. Anyone who tries to mislead you is really the enemy of Pakistan" (Jinnah, 1962: 86). Rightists and national elite particularly Punjabis have always looked through the prism of national integration with the application of Islam and Urdu as tools to achieve it.

Secondly, the books have lost objectivity. They mostly represent the rightist, orthodox and traditional vision while totally ignore the vision of the liberal sections of the society. Another important area of concern is the total exclusion of the services and efforts of the local nationalist leaders for the cause of Pakistan. Many nationalist leaders like Khan Abdul Ghafar Khan alias Bach Khan and Abdul Samad Khan Achakzai have not been represented. Again, the explanation is one-sided. Major portion of the book for 8th class has been reserved for the role of Quaid-e-Azam. All the events in the pre-partition period and in the first year of Pakistan's independence revolve around Jinnah who has been shown as the man of the match. Bacha Khan has been mentioned only once in the portion related to the formation of interim government in the book for 8th class and has been depicted as against the cause of the Muslim League and Pakistan. Similarly, Sir Muhammad Shafi has been shown as the critic of Quaid- e-Azam creating hurdles in the way of Pakistan's independence as shown on page 93 of the book.

Both the textbooks have gender biasness. Only males who worked in the struggle for Pakistan have been given representation while women have been completely ignored. Similarly, strong cultural and religious biasness is visible in the books. Pakistan is a multicultural society and has many linguistic, cultural, ethnic and religious groups. Government statistics show that 96.28 percent of Pakistan's population is Muslim {Sunni 77% and Shia 23% (Adeney, 2007: 138)}, Christians 1.59 %, Hindus 1.6%, Ahmadis 0.25%, Scheduled castes 0.25% and 'others' are 0.07(www.census.gov.pk/religion.htm).

⁵ For more on this issue see Ayres, A. (2009). *Speaking Like a State Language and nationalism in Pakistan*. Cambridge & New York: Cambridge University Press, chapter 1.

However, only dominant culture has been dealt with. Religious minorities have not been given due place in both the books. In the book for 8th class only 1.5 pages while in the book for 10th class only five lines have been reserved for religious minorities and even these portions have been put at the end of the books (page 131-2 in book for 8th class and page 125 in book for 9th and 10th class). This is a major issue as the minorities studying this subject would be isolated and would develop a feeling of exclusion, ignorance and negligence in them. Their culture and religion should be given fair representation in the syllabi and their contribution to the cause of national solidarity and integrity should be fairly acknowledged and appreciated.

Another major issue is the repeated use of outdated factual data and statistics which needs immediate revision. Both the books are very short and deficient in detail. The textbook for 8th class is composed of only 132 pages while that of 9th and 10th of 125 pages. Each book is for one year. Again, materials of the content are extremely short for both the teachers and the students. Teachers are unable to get the desired results with such reduced information like these. Too many topics have been included in the books with superficial and sometime least information about them. Consequently, the teachers will provide superficial and insufficient information to the students. With such reduced information the major objectives of the education policy can never be materialized.

The books are mainly descriptive. They give only historical description of the main events in the pre and post- partition Pakistan. The description is mainly one-sided. For example, while discussing the relations of Pakistan with other countries no attempt has been done to pinpoint the areas of conflict between these relations as shown on pages 48-54. Only some hurdles in the way of establishing good neighboring relations between India and Pakistan have been very briefly highlighted. Similarly, the relations with the Central Asian Republics (CARs) have been explained positively with absolutely no area of conflicts between them. The discussion has not shown why the relations of Pakistan with CARs are so cold. Why trade and exchange have not been developed so far? What are the main hurdles in the way of establishing friendly neighboring relations of Pakistan with CARs .

Similarly, Pakistan's relations with Afghanistan are not as good as the book for the 10th class shows. Pakistan has many areas of conflicts with Afghanistan particularly in relation to Durand Line issue. Similarly, its relations with Iran have become strained recently. The book has not mentioned these facts. Again, the books have made no attempt to develop in the students the habit of critical thinking and analysis. They are compelled to rote learning and no attempt has been made to provide opportunities to the students to analyze the material offered. Again, the book for 8th class also gives superficial knowledge to the students. All the important events have only been described without any analysis. For example, it has been given that the Congress ministries during 1937-39 violated parliamentary principles and adopted many unconstitutional practices but is silent on what those unconstitutional practices were? No example of the non-parliamentary principles has been mentioned. The book is also silent on why the practices, if any, were unconstitutional. Again, the disintegration of Pakistan in 1971 is a major event in the political history of Pakistan. The book for 9th and 10th class provides no objective information regarding the event and does no justice with it. The major causes and the lesson readers should draw from events so great as this have not been highlighted. Keeping in view these changing scenarios there is need to update these books with new facts and figures and give them a thorough review.

Again, the books have shown an outdated explanation of the Pakistan society. It has been shown as conservative, traditionalist and fundamentalist. However, Pakistani society is passing through a transitional stage. There are many tolerant, accommodative and liberal trends in it. One of the areas is the amelioration of the status of women in the society. Women in Pakistan are increasingly enrolled in educational institutions, health departments as well as arm forces of Pakistan. They are given fair representation in

state institutions including parliament and judiciary. Special emphasis has been given to safeguard their rights. They have got the courage to stand for their rights and resist any move injuring their position in the society. Many of the social evils which were once considered as beyond criticism are now put to the test of public opinion. The book of 9th and 10th classes which is especially reserved for the post-partition period ignores these emerging trends in the Pakistani society as shown on page 111. So, it is recommended that the book should be given a thorough review so as to accommodate these new trends in the society.

Though the book for 9th and 10th classes has discussed the multicultural nature of Pakistani society, it is so brief to defeat the purpose. Ethnic groups of Pakistan have been very briefly discussed. Again, only the major ethnic groups have been highlighted while the smaller ones have been completely ignored. In order to secure the stability of the country, these ethnic groups should be fairly represented in the book. The book also ignores the major religious minorities in Pakistan and their contribution to the national cause .

The book for 9th and 10th classes gives a description of the Islamization process of Zia-ul Haque, a military dictator of Pakistan (1977-88). General Zia made concerted efforts to Islamize Pakistani state and society with the political rationale to legitimize his regime that was not a popularly elected one hitting many groups including religious minorities⁶. The regime ensured to make Islamic education a compulsory subject till graduation. However, the book has not given a critical analysis of the Zia regime. Jinnah vision of Pakistan has been ignored. He was portraying a tolerant vision of Pakistan. Jinnah made it clear that "In any case, Pakistan is not going to be a theocratic state to be ruled by priests with a divine mission. Pakistan has many non-Muslims—Hindus, Christians and Parsees but they are all Pakistanis. They will enjoy the same rights and privileges as any other citizens and will play their rightful part in the affairs of Pakistan" (Merchant 1990: 12; also, in *Dawn*, 15 February 1948).

CONCLUSION

Education is the main drive in imparting a sense of nationalism and is the main instrument in the nation building process. Every state controls the syllabi of the educational institutions mainly to inculcate a sense of integrity and patriotism in the students. In many of the cases the syllabi are engineered, and events are subjectively mentioned to serve the purpose. Pakistan, being a multicultural and multilingual society, has also tried to manage the contents of the syllabi to manufacture a Pakistani nationalism. Pakistan Studies books at various levels have been designed for that cause. The book for 8th class gives a pre-partition history of Pakistan. It equips the students of the main events and movements which contributed to the creation of Pakistan in 1947. The knowledge of these developments is so essential in creating a sense of patriotism and loyalty to the nations among the students at early stage of their learning. Similarly, the book for 9th and 10th classes tries to equip the students of the socio- economic, cultural, constitutional and political developments since the creation of Pakistan. The students are made aware of their fundamental rights which are especially important in creating a sense of belonging to the nation. They have tried to inculcate in the students a sense of loyalty and belonging to their country. An attempt has been made towards nation building. The books have struggled to impart a Pakistani identity and nationalism upon the people so diverse on the basis of language, culture and traditions and ethnicity.

However, there are many areas for improvements. The books have been written in Urdu. The students at lower level of education have serious problem in understanding Urdu. Majority of the terms are not understandable to them. This phenomenon results in rote learning which seriously affect the performance

⁶ To further understand the rationales and both internal and external considerations that impelled Zia to initiate the process of Islamisation see Chengappa, B. M., (2004). *Pakistan Islamisation, army and foreign policy*.

of the students. Hence, it is recommended that various terms used should be defined and explained in simple Urdu.

The books give a partial and subjective assessment of the events with no critical evaluation. Many events and assessment in the books can be subjected to critical thinking. The information of the students regarding the major events has been partial and one-sided. The books have lost objectivity and mostly represent the rightist, orthodox and traditional vision while totally ignore the vision of the liberal sections of the society. There is also gender biasness. Only males who worked in the struggle for Pakistan have been given representation while women are ignored. Similarly, the services and efforts of the local nationalist leaders for the cause of Pakistan have not been fairly represented.

Again, religious minorities have also not been given due place in both the books. This is a major issue, as the minorities will feel isolated and develop a feeling of exclusion, ignorance and negligence in them. Accordingly, it is recommended that objectivity should be ensured, and a balanced approach should be adopted in assessing the role of various personalities. Linguistic and religious minorities, local nationalist leaders and women should be given fair representation in the syllabi and their contribution to the cause of the national solidarity and integrity should be fairly acknowledged and appreciated.

The books also use outdated factual data and statistics which need immediate revision. Both the books are very short and deficient in detail. The teachers are unable to get the desired results with such reduced information. Again, the books have shown an outdated depiction of the Pakistani society. It has been shown as conservative, traditionalist and fundamentalist. However, the fact is that Pakistani society is passing through a transitional stage. There are many tolerant, accommodative and liberal trends in Pakistani society. Therefore, it is recommended that the books should be revised and so designed as to rectify all the above shortcomings.

Ideological Basis of Pakistan Women's Empowerment Population, Society and Culture of Pakistan.	The Pakistan Movement: Historical Perspective. History of Pakistan (1971- till now).	Land and Environment. Pakistan in World Affairs. Economic Development.
--	---	--

Note: The above table reflects contents of the textbooks of Pakistan Studies.

REFERENCES

- Adeney, K. (2007). Federalism and ethnic conflict regulation in India and Pakistan. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Ahmad, F. Javid, A. & Saeed, M. (2009). Pakistan Study, Grade 10th (Textbook) N.W.F.P. Textbook Board, Peshawar, Pakistan.
- Ahmed, A. S. (1997). Jinnah, Pakistan and Islamic identity: The search for Saladin. London & New York: Routledge.
- Amin, T. (1993). Ethno-national movements of Pakistan: Domestic and international factors. Islamabad: Institute of Political Studies.
- Ayres, A. (2009). Speaking like a state: Language and nationalism in Pakistan. Cambridge & New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Bakhtiar. (2006). Tareeh. Peshawar. KPK TextBook Board.

- Burki, S. J. (1986). *Pakistan: A nation in the making*. Boulder: Westview Press.
- Callard, K. (1957). *Pakistan: A political study*. London: George Allen and Unwin.
- Chowdhury, M. (1988). *Pakistan: Its politics and bureaucracy*. New Delhi: Associated Publishing House.
- Cohen, S. P. (2004). *The idea of Pakistan*. Washington D.C.: Brookings Institution Press.
- Jaffrelot, C. (2002). Nationalism without a nation: Pakistan searching for its identity. In C. Jaffrelot (Ed.), *Pakistan: Nationalism without a nation? (7-48)*. New Delhi: Manohar Publishers.
- Jalal, A. (1985). *The sole spokesman: Jinnah, the Muslim League and the demand for Pakistan*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jalal, A. (1995). *Democracy and authoritarianism in South Asia: A comparative and historical perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Jinnah, M. A. (1962). *Quaid-i-Azam Mahomed Ali Jinnah: Speeches as governor-general of Pakistan, 1947–48*. Karachi: Pakistan Publications.
- Kapur, A. (1991). *Pakistan in crisis*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Khan, K. (2010). *Alamzeb Umerzai and his political career until his martyrdom*. Peshawar: Pakistan Study Centre.
- Malik, I. H. (2008). *The history of Pakistan*. London: Greenwood Press.
- Merchant, L. H. (1990). *Jinnah: A judicial verdict*. Karachi: East & West Publishing Company.
- Sayeed, K. B. (1996). *Pakistan: The formative phase, 1857-1948 (2nd Edition)*. Karachi: Oxford University Press.
- Shah, S. R. A. (2006). *Mutalia Pakistan*. Peshawar. KPK TextBook Board.
- Shahid, S. M. (2007). *The history of South Asia*. Lahore: Munir Publications.
- Talbot, I. (1998). *Pakistan: A modern history*. London: Hurst and Company.
- Waseem, M. (1994). *Politics and the state in Pakistan*. Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research.