# Educational Transition Forced by the Implementation of Covid-19 Social Distancing and Quarantine Procedures: A Case Study From Turkey

## B. Çağla Garipağaoğlu[1]

Drawing upon the pandemic experience in Turkey, this case study attempts to broaden our understanding about the pandemic revolution in K-12 private education sector. Focusing on the benefits, burdens, opportunities and threats experienced during the pandemic education, the study's results are expected to offer some invaluable insights to K-12 educational leaders in private education sector both for the pandemic and post-pandemic education. The data for the study was collected by a semi-structured Zoom interviews from a total of thirty-two participants consisting of one private school principal, three vice principals, eight department heads, eight teachers, six parents and six students. Data was analyzed through content analysis. The findings of the study were reported under five main themes: educational innovations during the Covid-19 pandemic and consequences pandemic education through the lenses of students, parents, teachers and administrators. Research findings revealed that although home-schooling during the Covid-19 pandemic have certainly caused some degree of inconvenience such as increased workload for teachers and parents, and connection problems etc., it also prompted new examples of educational innovations by changing our approach to education entirely. Findings also showed us that there is an immediate need to create a new code of ethics for online education as soon as possible. It was revealed that despite all the glitches and inconvenience experienced during Covid-19, Covid-19 induced educational transition is likely to have a lasting impact on education. Despite some overzealous futurists, online education is not for everyone or the substitute for on-site education. Yet, blending the two modes of education in a balanced way (hybrid education) seems to be a viable alternative for tomorrow's schooling system.

## INTRODUCTION

The Covid-19 emergency had an impact on the whole world by spring 2020. Parents, students and educators found themselves learning new technologies while trying to shift learning from face-to-face to online pandemic learning (Fisher et al, 2021). Pandemic education (i.e., distance learning, e-learning, pandemic learning, or distance education) may be considered as a typical, regular online learning that was already available in higher education; or instead, it may just be considered as a form of emergency e-learning (Nordmann et al., 2020). While some see the innovations developed in online learning as an opportunity to improve education (Knysh & Dudziak, 2020), others caution that emergency e-learning should not be normalized as a substitute for face-to-face learning (Murphy, 2020). There are five types of barriers to online learning: 1) barriers in the form of technology, training, and digital competence (Lloyd, Byrne, & McCoy, 2012); 2) social context (Henderikx, Kreijns, & Kalz, 2018; Coyne, Ballard, & Blader, 2020); 3) interpersonal barriers that reduce the basic values of face-to-face teaching and learning principles where lecturers and students can interact one another directly (Lloyd, Byrne, & McCoy, 2012; Surahman, & Sulthoni, 2020); 4) design and development of online courses that take a lot of time, and effort; and 5) institutional barriers such as policies, facilities, budgets, motivation, and institutional support (Lloyd, Byrne, & McCoy, 2012). Despite the widespread admiration for how the schools handled the Covid-19 crisis, the impact of it on education is still largely unknown (Urban, 2020). In the midst of this Covid-19 crisis, educators are wondering what kind of benefits and burdens are awaiting schools, students, teachers, parents and school administrators. By delving into the views of the most important stakeholders (teachers, parents, students and administrators), this study aims to shed light on the benefits, burdens, opportunities and threats at the face of Covid-19 crisis and offer insights to educational leaders about the future of the education after the pandemic.

Education is full of discussions about how and when the next revolution/the next great breakthrough in schooling will happen. For a long time, people tended to create a straw man claiming that "all the problems in education are due to not making a particular breakthrough, without ever really saying how that

[1] Bahçeşehir Üniversitesi, burcakcagla.garipagaoglu@es.bau.edu.tr, orcid.org/0000-0003-4618-7846

breakthrough will solve the problem" (Tam & El-Azar, 2020). According to many, Covid-19 might just be the time for the much-needed educational breakthrough that everyone was waiting for. Andreas Schleicher, Director of Education and Skills at the OECD, urges education leaders to use the momentum created by Covid-19 pandemic to rethink what and how students should learn to prepare for the needs of an interconnected 21st century (OECD, 2020). As pointed out by Schleicher, simply perpetuating the prescriptive approaches to teaching is not up to the challenge at the face of Covid-19 crisis, which demands from teachers not just to replicate their lessons in another medium, but to find entirely new responses to how students learn (Broom, 2020). The Covid-19 crisis may teach us about how education needs to be changed to be able to better prepare our young learners for what the future might hold (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020). It is our collective responsibility to foster engaging and meaningful environments in the new era of pandemic and post-pandemic education (Almazol & Tennant, 2020).

For the past few months, educators, students and families have been making their best to handle and manage the hurdles of the Covid-19 pandemic (Finefter-Rosenbluh, 2020). Widespread school closures have highlighted the dreadful reality of social inequities in the lives of disadvantaged children particularly on the issues of uneven internet and technology access (Finefter-Rosenbluh, 2020), but at the same time, it also shifted our attention from obsessing over test scores and accountability to an entirely different paradigm of physical, mental, and emotional well-being for students and teachers (Almazol & Tennant, 2020).

Many experts believe that it is just the time for our school leaders to generate a new compelling philosophy of education and an innovative educational architecture for a world that does not exist yet (Almazol & Tennant, 2020). "According to a Dell Technologies report, 85% of the jobs in 2030 that Generation Z and Alpha will enter into have not been even invented yet" (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020). In a world where knowledge is a mouse-click away, the notion of an educator as the knowledge-holder and the student as the knowledge receiver is no longer fit for the purpose of a 21st-century education. With students being able to gain access to knowledge, and even learn a technical skill, through a few clicks on their phones, tablets and computers, the role of the educator and the student must be re-defined (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020).

The Covid-19 pandemic compelled educational institutions and educators across the world to suddenly harness and utilize the suite of available technological tools (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020). It urged educators to create content for remote learning for students and helped them experience new possibilities to do things differently with greater flexibility resulting in potential benefits such as increased accessibility to education for students. These are new modes of instruction that have previously been largely untapped particularly in the kindergarten to Grade 12 arena (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020). Many experts still believe that online learning cannot completely replace face-to-face learning (Surahman, & Sulthoni, 2020). They caution that online learning only has advantages in the form of easy provision and search for access to information quickly and can provide peer-to-peer learning services; however, most other competencies are better taught face-to-face. Moreover, some experts also claim that maintaining mental health of teachers and students are harder when the learning is online (Lakhan, Agrawal, Sharma, 2020). Surahman & Sulthoni (2020) also asserts that the most basic obstacle to online learning is the lack of face-to face synergy of parties involved in designing, developing, implementing, and measuring quality learning online.

Although it is too early to judge how reactions to Covid-19 will affect education systems all around the world, there are signs suggesting that it could have a lasting impact (Tam & El-Azar, 2020). Drawing upon the pandemic experience in Turkey, this case study attempts to broaden our understanding about the pandemic education in K-12. Focusing on the perspectives of all stakeholders, the study's results are expected to offer some invaluable insights to the educational leaders both for the pandemic and post-pandemic education.

More specifically, the study attempts to illustrate how educational stakeholders are affected from the Covid-19 crisis and how this corona-related pedagogical shift in history might affect our approach to education. Hence, the study will specifically address to the following research questions:

(1) What are the educational innovations that define the new educational shift during the Covid-19 pandemic?

(2) How do educational stakeholders (parents, students, teachers and school administrators) interpret the pandemic education in terms of its benefits & burdens?

(3) Through the lenses of all stakeholders, what are the opportunities & threats at the face of Covid-19 crisis.

**Research Design and Method**

As the purpose of this study is to provide an in-depth description of the experiences of parents, teachers, students and school administrators at private K-12 schools during the pandemic education and to reveal the threats and opportunities of this crisis to the private K-12 schools; a qualitative case study technique was used as the main research approach. In general, case studies are the preferred when ¨how¨ or ¨why¨ questions are being posed and when the researcher has little control over events, and when the focus is on a contemporary phenomenon within some real-life context (Yin, 2003).

At the beginning, a conceptual framework was prepared by the researcher. A conceptual framework is a guideline that explains, either graphically or in narrative form, the main things to be studied and the presumed relationships among them (Miles & Huberman, 1994).

*Research Sample (Study Group)*

A six-year-old, young, private K-12 school from Istanbul, Turkey was chosen as a 'typical case' for this study. The chosen case was considered as typical because the school was a member of Private Schools Association in Turkey and a member of a large Turkish school chain. Therefore, the school can be considered as a typical K-12 private school. Participants were chosen by purposeful sampling. Purposeful sampling is widely used in qualitative research for the identification and selection of information-rich cases related to the phenomenon of interest (Palinkas, et al., 2015). In this research, to delve into the views of different stakeholder, the study group was chosen from administrators, teachers, parents and students. The study group was composed of 32 Turkish people in total: one school principal (female/42), three vice principals one from the kindergarten (female/40), one from the primary school (female/44), and one from the middle school (male/38); department heads from each of the eight different departments (Math (male/36), Science (female/45), Turkish (female/41), Social Sciences (female/43), English (female/33), Second Language Department (female/35), Art & Music & Psychical Education (male/34), Coding & Robotics (female/32)), eight teachers from different departments (three males /28/30/36; five females 23/27/29/32/51), six people (one male/43; five females /34/36/38/40/43) from the school-parent association and six students (two males 5/12; four females 5/7/9/11) from the student council -each two are from the three different school levels (kindergarten, primary school and middle school).

*Research Instruments and Procedures*

Ethics Committee permission was taken from Bahçeşehir University with issue number 26.01.2021-E.1133. Participants were sent a letter of invitation informing them of the purpose of the research and asking that they certify their informed consent. The data was collected from a total of thirty-two participants via one-to-one, semi-structured Zoom interviews (see the Appendix). The participants were interviewed upon availability during the months of January and February in 2021. Due to pandemic regulations, all interviews were conducted via one-to-one, semi-structured Zoom interviews. All zoom interviews are recorded with the consent of the participants. Only four participants did not consent for audio-recording, so the researcher used the interview notes instead of audio-recordings. Audio-recordings were saved at the researcher's hard-disk separately and deleted immediately from the cloud.

*Validity and Reliability*

Maxwell (2005) asserts that there are two main types of threats to the validity and reliability: 1) researcher bias and 2) the effect of the researcher on participants. Maxwell (2005) argues that the researcher bias occurs as the researchers tends to select data that fit their existing theory or preconceptions and select data that stand out to themselves. On the other hand, Maxwell (2005) suggests that instead of trying to eliminate the influence of the researcher on participants-which is simple impossible, the goal in a qualitative study should be to explain the data collection procedure as detailed as possible.

In this research, to overcome the validity and reliability threats, all recordings were transcribed verbatim and inter-coder agreement was sought. To achieve this end, as suggested by Miles & Huberman (1994), the researcher followed the following procedure: 1) The interview guideline is structured by

introducing the purpose and outlining the procedure. 2) the interviewees were inquired if they had any questions, 3) the researcher repeated her interpretation of what she heard to get confirmation or disconfirmation from the interviewees, 4) as soon as an interview was over, a contact summary sheet summarizing the participant's interview was filled. Finally, 5) at the end of each day, the researcher transcribed the recordings of the day that an interview was held.

Reliability refers to the degree of consistency with which instances are assigned to the same category by different observers or by the same observer on different occasions (Silverman, 2000). Therefore, the researcher asked one of her experienced colleagues to create codes for one of the transcriptions and the two sets of codes were compared. For inter-coder reliability, the formula of Consensus/ (Consensus + Disagreement) x100 proposed by Miles & Huberman's (1994) was used. The inter-coder reliability of the study was calculated to be %93,10 (P = 54/ (54+4) x 100), which is an acceptable rate for inter-coder reliability. The findings are then presented with illustrating excerpts in the form of narrative for in-depth insight. Name of the organization and the participants kept confidential. Instead of real names, nicknames were used throughout the reporting process.

*Data Analysis*

Data was analyzed through the content analysis. As the number of interviews was small, instead of a software package, MS Excel was preferred to enter the coding. The main purpose of content analysis is to reach the concepts and relations, which will explain the data collected. Content analysis involves conceptualizing the data, then organizing them according to those concepts and determining the themes. In other words, concepts will drive the researcher to the themes and with the help of those themes, the issues will be more accurate and manageable (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 1999). Throughout the analytical process, the researcher tried to ensure thematic connections within and across the transcripts (Seidman, 1998).

**FINDINGS**

The findings of the study are organized under five main themes: 1) Educational innovations of the Covid-19 experience, 2) Pandemic experience of teachers, 3) Pandemic experience of students, 4) Pandemic experience of parents, and 5) Pandemic experience of administrators. The themes are then explored and illustrated by incorporating selected excerpts from the interviews for in-depth insight and discussed in the light of existing literature. Since most of the subthemes are self-explanatory with codes on their related tables, only the most striking excerpts will be presented in the findings part to illustrate the subthemes.

Theme 1 addresses the first research question that was specifically concerned with the educational innovations defining the new educational shift during the Covid-19.

**Theme 1: Educational innovations of the Covid-19 experience**

During Covid-19, we all witnessed a heavy reliance on educational technologies on online education. Theme 1 addressing the first research question is concerned specifically with the educational technologies employed during Covid-19.

**Table 1.** *Theme 1: Educational innovations of the Covid-19 experience*

| Subthemes | Codes | SP | VP | DH | T | P | S |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| synchronous technologies | more reliance on interactive apps | | 2 | 3 | 6 | | |
| | conferencing apps like Zoom & MS Teams | 1 | 3 | 8 | 8 | 5 | 3 |
| asynchronous technologies | TV broadcasts by the state | | | 1 | 4 | | 2 |
| | school-based educational platforms | 1 | 3 | 6 | 7 | 3 | 3 |
| | School-free educational platforms | | | 4 | 5 | 2 | 2 |

SP: School Principal, VP: Vice Principal, DH: Department Heads, T: Teachers, P: Parents, S: Students

Theme 1 is organized under two sub-themes: synchronous vs asynchronous technologies. While conferencing apps like Zoom and Teams are classified as synchronous technologies, educational platforms providing academic materials for students are classified as asynchronous technologies. During the Covid-19,

conferencing apps like Zoom and Teams are used both to deliver lessons to students and have meetings with peers, colleagues and parents. As pointed out by one of the department chairs, educational innovations that define the new educational shift during the Covid-19 changed the classroom dynamics altogether:

> *Teachers daring to delve into the endless possibilities of technology discovered new ways of teaching. We have learned how to split a zoom meeting into several sessions and manage the breakout rooms to allow group learning. We all learned that Kahoot is a great thing to make learning fun. While Kahoot used to be a thing used only by language teachers… during the pandemic, we all learned that it is a great tool that can be used by every one of us. Now almost every teacher in our school is integrating Kahoot into his/her daily lesson plans. From youngest to eldest, everyone is now more interested in using interactive applications. I think even after pandemic, these new learning will remain with us and this pandemic will leave us with a brand-new repertoire of teaching methods (Hakan, 36 years old, head of Mathematics department).*

Findings in this theme also revealed us that the less experienced teachers reacted more positively than their more experienced colleagues to the new technologies and they also had less trouble in classroom management during their online classes.

> *It was interesting to see that in remote learning, the more experienced the teacher is, the more struggle they experienced. Technology turned everything upside-down. While the younger staff felt more confident and experienced less classroom management problem during their online tutoring, the ones with years of experience felt like a fish out of water across the computer screen (Hande teacher, 41 years old, the head of Turkish department).*

To sum up, the findings indicated that while the younger staff felt more confident at new technologies during the Covid-19, older teachers felt less confident and resisted to the change until they understood that they have no other choice.

The second research question, on the other hand, addresses the parents', students', teachers' and school administrators' interpretation of their Covid-19 educational experience and specifically focuses on the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities and threats at the face of the Covid-19 education.

**Theme 2: Pandemic experience of teachers**

Under this theme, five subthemes emerged: 1) disappearance of work-life balance, 2) changes in classroom management dynamics, 3) changing relations with parents and administrators, 4) technology-related issues and 5) finance-related issues (see Table 2).

**Table 2.** *Theme 2: Pandemic experience of teachers*

| Subthemes | Codes | SP | VP | DH | T |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Disappearance of work-life balance | blurred working hours (Weakness) | 1 | 2 | 8 | 6 |
| | increased workload (Weakness) | | 3 | 8 | 5 |
| | more preparation time (Weakness) | | | 5 | 7 |
| | burn-out / exhaustion (weakness) | | 1 | 1 | 2 |
| Changes in Classroom Management Dynamics | Lack of class privacy (Threat) | | 2 | 6 | 3 |
| | Lack of face-to-face interaction (Threat) | | 1 | 2 | 5 |
| | Lack of socialization (Threat) | | 1 | 3 | 4 |
| | Less classroom management problems (Strength) | | 1 | 2 | 6 |
| Changing relations with parents, students and administrators | cynical parents and administrators (Threat) | 1 | 3 | 4 | 3 |
| | too much connectedness (Threat) | | | 1 | 5 |
| 5Technology-related issues | Enhanced technology literacy (Opportunity) | 1 | 3 | 7 | 5 |
| | Technology-driven creativity (Opportunity) | | 2 | 4 | 5 |
| | Insufficient tech. & internet infrastructure (Threat) | | 1 | 1 | 3 |
| Finance-related issues | Increasing internet expenses (Weakness) | | | 2 | 5 |
| | Need for new technological infrastructure (Burden) | | 1 | 1 | |
| | Increasing phone bills (Weakness) | | | 1 | 2 |
| | Increasing expenses (Weakness) | | | | 1 |

SP: School Principal, VP: Vice Principal, DH: Department Heads, T: Teachers

As Urban (2020) pointed out, "during the lockdown, teachers grappled with the new ways of communicating with students away from classrooms and lecture theatre". In this study, teachers interpreted their Covid-19 experiences from different lenses. While some focused more on the benefits and opportunities presented by Covid-19 experience, others focused more on the burdens/weaknesses and threats of Covid-19 induced distance-learning. In the following excerpts, for instance, while Mert and Nazlı teachers addressed the changing classroom dynamics with the use of available technology at unprecedently accelerated rate and mostly focused on the benefits of on-line teaching by highlighting the importance of technology literacy, Hande teacher drew our attention more onto the increased workload and disappearance of work-life balance for teachers.

*I have to become more creative for my online classes. Since we lack speechless communication and rely more on the visual material, we try to be prepared for every single detail. Preparation time for lessons has increased enormously and it is much harder than ever. But I do not have any complaints about it. Indeed, I enjoy it. It is fun and I believe it makes me stronger as a teacher. I see this as an investment on myself and it makes me happier. I am a learner myself now and I realized that I am more creative than ever (Mert, 28 years of old English teacher).*

*It is a totally new experience for all of us. We have learned new and more fun ways of teaching. Classroom management became incredibly easier with technology. Not only the interactive apps but also facilities of conferencing apps made the classroom management increasingly convenient. I use all my creativity and I experience much less classroom management problems during the online classes. As you know we are dealing with teenagers and sometimes it can be really hard to manage them in class especially when their only goal is to impress others by being different. You know playing the bad guy or being the rule-breaker makes you an attention magnet at these ages. Yet, online system doesn't let any student to show off this way. Of course, kids are always kids. Especially at the first weeks of the remote learning, for instance, they all wanted to show their homes, their rooms, their pets and etc. but this is a different kind of show off and I find it adorable. Moreover, you, as a teacher, there to decide for how long for this little chit-chat will continue. Our new*

*classroom management tools presented us by zoom is really impressive and unprecedented. It makes the teacher totally in charge and allow students to learn in a less disruptive environment. Academically, I believe remote learning is even better. There is nothing there to disturb genuine learners. But I know that students also need their friends, and they want to socialize... When the schools re-open, I will definitely miss some parts of remote learning, but continue to use my newly acquired technological skills in my classes (Nazlı teacher, 32 years of science teacher).*

Before the lockdown, school process was already in motion. Teachers had gotten to know their students, imparted their expectations and developed mutual dynamics both with students and the parents. When the Covid-19 first hit, teachers and school administrations had shared with students and parents a sense of determination to make the best of an extraordinary situation. Yet, when the new academic year started, online education was no longer an emergency exception but what may be the norm in coming years. So, the mutual tolerance witnessed at the first days of the Covid-19 gradually got lost, neither parents nor the teachers were willing to be as tolerant as they used to be when the Covid-19 first hit. The following quote from Hande teacher illustrates how the nature of relationship between parents and teachers has changed over the time during Covid-19.

*Our workload increased enormously. Preparing for on-line classes are much more time-consuming than for face-to-face classes. Parents and school administration are all more demanding and cynical than ever. We have to be there for all students all the time via WhatsApp or over phone calls. Our working hours are not limited to 8 am to 5 pm any longer. At the first week of the remote teaching, everything was pretty chaotic, and we had accepted to give our cellphone numbers to every single parent and student. Because they were all mad about the new normal... Although the hurdles of first weeks are long gone, I guess the habits remains. Parents are still calling me at any time that they wish. They send their questions via WhatsApp and wait for an immediate answer. It is more like one-to-one tutoring. When the Covid-19 first hit, as teachers we all tried to comfort our students and parents and worked really hard and selflessly. But now, this situation is no longer extraordinary, it is our new normal. And I think we have to find a way to balance our working-load and working hours. I really miss the old times with clear working hours and clear boundaries… Now, everything is blurred, and I feel like I am working 7/24. There is no such thing like work-life balance for teachers any longer. Schools may schedule meeting at any time. Parents and students may call for every single thing and I feel like I have no privacy at all. I miss 8 am 5 pm working time schedule with less workload. This is too much connectedness. We are burning out (Hande teacher, 41 years old, the head of Turkish department).*

Online teaching came with its own new set of challenges for teachers. Halide teacher (43 years old, head of social science department) for instance, complains that how online teaching might be more stressful and demanding than face-to-face teaching and points out the stressing nature of online teaching by focusing on the lack of privacy of online classes.

*Online teaching is more demanding and stressful. We are pretty much exposed and vulnerable to unknown threats. For example, you never know who is on the other side of the connection and who is waiting for you to make a mistake. We no longer have the classroom privacy. We always have uninvited guests on the other side of the connection. Parents are monitoring every single thing and they always have a better idea for everything. They even try to teach you how to teach online. In class, when you make a mistake, you laugh about it and move on, but when you are online and make a mistake, it is hard to predict its aftershocks... (laughs…) Sometimes I feel like some parents are really waiting for you to make a mistake and ready to attack or demand more and more. We are pretty much exposed. It really kills the flow of the class and the enthusiasm. We are not artificial intelligence and treating us like one is a mood-killer. It is like… everyone wants a piece from you. I have to deal with silly and trivial questions of parents on a daily base now… "Why didn't you give my son permission to talk? My daughter raised his hand, but you did not let her talk, but you let Ali talk twice". They are always in a constant comparison and competition. It is really annoying… Trying to soothe parents' egos and rat-race enthusiasm and concentrate on your real job at the same time is really challenging.  It was always hard to balance parents' clashing demands, but now with online learning with no classroom privacy at all, not the classroom management but the parent management became the real problem for us. Parents are complaining about each other now, they are in constant comparison of their kids with others, and*

*they are racing with each other. It is really frustrating… (Halide teacher, 43 years old, head of social science department).*

Covid-19 showed us that different ways of teaching are possible. But it also made it evident that distance learning is not a substitute for face-to-face learning especially for younger students and some teachers. Being a good teacher requires to learn each student's sense of humor, their favorite colors, their shy way of asking for help, the plaintiff look in their eyes for speechless communication, but distance learning presents barriers to accomplishing this critical part of good teaching (Almazol & Heider, 2020). As pointed out by Meryem, being away from students physically, not being able to touch them or look into the eyes directly hinders some of the most fundamental role of teacher.

*I am a kindergarten teacher and I believe that nothing can substitute for face-to-face teaching. Academic-wise, compensation for the losses is always possible but education is not only about academy. We are making difference in the lives of children. We touch to their souls and spirits. But we cannot do that through the screens. We can teach them online, but we cannot educate them. Part of our job is about love and care. How can one achieve it through online? I am really looking forward re-opening of schools. Distance learning will always be incomplete for me because it lacks the most important part of schooling. Children need our love and our caress, and we cannot do it through a computer screen (Meryem, 29 years old, kindergarten teacher).*

No matter how creative schools strive to be whether they schedule half day or full-day online courses or alternative face-to-face days for some specific grades, there were significant challenges to every model. Following quote from the kindergarten vice principal explains these challenges vividly:

*At some grades, remote teaching might be even more effective than face-to-face teaching especially academic-wise, but it is certainly not better than face-to-face education when it comes to socialization. The teacher-student and student-student relationship is an essential part of the school program. Remote learning certainly lacks this merit of socialization and the speechless communication. Particularly the kindergarten and primary school kids need teachers' affection and compassion more than they need their teachers' academic guidance. Teachers and students need time to get to know each other, they need to get together, see their eyes and feel each other in K-12 especially at the earlier grades. Maybe everything is much easier at the university level, but at K12 we need a physical contact for a healthier education. Currently, our first graders, kindergarten students and eight graders are coming to the school and receive face-to-face education. There are significant challenges to this model, but this is a risk that we need to undertake. First of all, kindergarten kids and first graders are all too small to attend and benefit from online classes. And eight graders, at the end of this year will have the national examination. (Fatma, 40 years old, kindergarten vice principal).*

We all know that pandemic education created enormous inconvenience in our lives and changed our lives altogether. Adjusting to new normal did not happen at a finger snap for anyone. Teachers faced with totally new set of concerns, more skepticism from parents, and more demands coming from their supervisors… At the following excerpt, Nur teacher explained the changing attitudes of their parents and supervisors during the Covid-19 and complained the fact that parents did not give teachers and their own kids enough time to adjust distance learning.

*Especially during the first two weeks everything was chaotic. We were all new to this new era of pandemic education. We all needed time to adjust. Students were much better than their parents during this time. But parents were the worse. They were generally cynic and negative. The reason for their negativism was mostly due to the fact that they were stuck at their home with their kids with increased workload. They had to provide meals three times daily, wash the dishes, and do all the cleaning without assistance on their own while also doing their own jobs home-office. Moreover, they needed to supervise their own kids at home, to check if they were joining to their virtual classes, or if they are having a connection problem. First two weeks passed quickly with all those naggings coming from parents. We all dealt with parents' parenting problems more than the students' academic problems. We all became like therapists. We were all suffering from the same issues, but we were the ones giving condolences to all. Some parents were joining virtual classes with their kids and criticize every single thing. Suddenly, every single parent became a professor in education, trying to teach us how to do our jobs. First two*

*weeks, they did not even give us and their own kids enough time to adjust. They complained about everything from the class schedule to the duration of the online classes. They all had their own great idea about how to plan online classes. Parents were hovering around their kids during the online courses and swooped in the most unexpected time. They were joining the classes, giving cues to their kids and answering the teachers' questions instead of their kids. They were also helping them during the online examinations and blaming teachers for not letting their kids to take part in the class as much as the other kids. Our supervisors were all like 'do not come up with problems but with solutions'. Everyone was pretty tense. Nobody was willing to listen to problems. I guess it was because everyone had his/her own problems enough on his plate. So, I spent most of my time on the phone, trying to ensure parents that everything will be alright without knowing whether if it will ever be alright for myself (Nur teacher, 51 years old, primary school teacher)*

The head of counselling department told her own experience with kids and parents and the school's counselling studies during the pandemic as follows:

*We have started online therapy sessions after the second week of the lockdown. At first, isolation and worry seemed to make many of my students very unhappy and silent, but as the precautions get more flexible and as they started seeing people other than their family members, they seemed to feel much better. They all missed the school, they missed us and their friends. But then they learned to socialize with their friends on zoom. Of course, it is not as same as playing on the playground with friends. But zoom was the shiny new toy for them, and they enjoyed it for couple of weeks. Now they are not using zoom for chat as frequently as they used to in the first few weeks. I guess, it is not a new toy any longer…(laughs). We also made therapy sessions to the parents. They were all exhausted and overwhelmed with the homeschooling responsibilities and daycare. Some parents' relationships with their kids started to get worse. Particularly the parents of younger kids are looking forward for the re-opening of the schools (Serpil, head of school counsellors, 32 years old).*

Apart from the issues discussed above rising internet and phone call expenses, increased need for better hardware, general increase in the home expenditure arises as the finance-related problems experienced by teachers.

### Theme 3: Pandemic experience of students

During Covid-19, our youth experienced different and more empowering forms of learning (Urban, 2020). However, they also have experienced many challenges. Pandemic experience of students was classified under two subthemes: 1) lack of socialization, and 2) convenience of homeschooling. While the first subtheme focuses more on the weaknesses, the second subtheme focuses more on the strengths of online education.

**Table 3.** *Theme 3: Pandemic experience of students*

| Subthemes | Codes | KGS | PSS | MSS |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Lack of socialization (weaknesses) | Longing for peer-to-peer interaction (weakness) | 1 | 2 | 2 |
| | Longing for teachers and school itself (weakness) | 1 | 2 | 2 |
| | Bored at home (weakness) | 1 | 2 | 1 |
| | Feeling of isolation (weakness) | | 1 | 1 |
| Convenience of homeschooling (strengths) | More time for sleeping (strength) | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| | No more time wasted in the traffic (strength) | | | 2 |
| | more time after school (strength) | | | 2 |
| | Breakfast at home (strength) | 1 | 1 | |
| | Comfort of home (strength) | | 2 | 2 |

KGS: Kindergarten Students, PSS: Primary School Students, MSS: Middle School Students

Findings in this theme give us mixed results. It was revealed that while some students see the pandemic as a blessing in disguise, others were looking forward to re-opening of their schools. It seems that students agree that both mode of education has its own unique merits and disadvantages. In the following

excerpts, for instance, Celal points out the superiority of face-to-face education to online education in terms of the socialization it allows for, while Mira focuses more on the merits of online education in terms of the convenience it provides.

> *I miss my friends and I am really bored at home. I really want schools to re-open. Attending classes online is very convenient but most of the time I feel like it is a waste of time for some classes. I do not even bother to attend sport, art and music classes. These classes are definitely not for remote learning. Sometimes I join them just for a little chit-chat with friends and my teachers. But other classes like English, Math and Science are equally effective and even more fun in some ways… Sometimes half of the class time is passing by teachers asking us to turn on our cameras, asking for our excuses for being late, connection problems and etc... but I guess, this too is no different than face-to-face class environment. In face-to-face classes too, there has been always a time wasted by questions like "where were you? Why are you late? etc." but I think I would prefer the classic old version of the time wasted. At least that way we used to have fun during that time with our friends, but online and at home, alone…there is no fun in it at all… Just an awkward silence and awaiting…" (Celal, 7th grader).*

In the following excerpt, on the other hand, Mira explains the convenience of online learning at home focusing on the time-related benefits of online learning and comfort of homeschooling:

> *I am actually glad that I do not have to suffer all the traffic of going to school and back home. It saves time. But I still prefer going to the school. I miss being with my friends. On the other hand, online classes are really fun and helpful. I have no problem with my online classes. Not much different than face-to-face education at all. We are always in contact with our teachers. If I don't understand, I ask. I send a WhatsApp message and my teachers immediately reply back. It is even more convenient than being at school. I wake up later than I used to and have my breakfast at home's convenience… and I like all this freedom (Mira, 6th grader).*

**Theme 4: Pandemic experiences of parents**

Theme 4 revealed three subthemes: 1) difficulties of homeschooling, 2) rise of homeschooling as an alternative, 3) shift to public schools from private schools

Table 4.*Theme 4: Pandemic experience of parents*

| Subthemes | Codes | KGP | PSP | MSP |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Difficulties of homeschooling | Balancing housework, workload and schooling (Weakness) | 2 | 2 | 2 |
| Rise of homeschooling as an alternative | Homeschooling is possible (Strength) | | | 2 |
| | No waste of time on traffic (Strength) | | 1 | 2 |
| | No risk of bullying and mobbing (Strength) | | | 1 |
| | Increased demand for one-to-one tutoring (Strength) | | 1 | 2 |
| | More reliance on ed. tech. (Opportunity) | | | 2 |
| Shift to public schools from private schools | Parents started to question the need for private schooling (Threat) | | 1 | 2 |
| | less differentiation between public and private education (Threat) | | 1 | 2 |
| | Without the superiority of physical facilities and security of private schooling (Threat) | | 1 | 2 |

KGP: Kindergarten Parents, PSP: Primary School Parents, MSP: Middle School Parents

Home-schooling during Covid-19 have certainly caused an enormous inconvenience in our lives. Parents had to stay at home with their kids, supervise them, take care of their home and do their own work online at the same time. They became overloaded with unexpected turn of events. People had to reset their own priorities, started to question everything from the scratch and their attention shifted heavily to the schooling problems of their kids. They fell right into the midst of schooling and become more involved in the school processes than ever. Most of them even started to question whether they have chosen the right school for their kids. In this respect, the president of the school-parent association expressed the changing work-life dynamics of parents after Covid-19 pandemic.

*All rooms in the house are occupied by one of the family members. We are all on the internet in separate rooms doing our own work. We are all attending our meetings but also have to prepare meals for three times a day, do our own cleaning ourselves and supervise our children during the day. We have to help them join online classes, find their homework on the online educational platform, check their homework instead of their teachers. This is too much to handle. Even the trafficking on parents' WhatsApp groups is a hurdle in itself. It is very time-consuming. If you leave kids on their own… it is a burden on your conscience… if you do not leave them on their own but help, then it drains all your energy and also deteriorates your relationship with your own child. I am not happy with this situation at all. For older kids, remote learning might be even better, but it is definitely not suitable for younger kids who needs adult supervision and support all the time. So, most parents like me relied mostly on private tutoring. (Tan, 43 years old, president of the school-parent association)*

On the other hand, another parent from school-parent association expressed a more positive view about the turn of events caused by the Covid-19. She felt that teachers, administrators and students are connected to each other more than ever and due to the lack of outside distraction, she even thinks online education is even superior to on-site education:

*The Covid-19 became a real eye-opener for me. It became an opportunity for us to bond more than ever with our school. Our school held frequent online meetings for parents. Teachers were all very helpful and just a phone-call away during this time. We can call them anytime and ask for help. They even became more available, approachable and accessible online. My son and I are very happy with online courses. He just cares about the academics now, no mobbing, no bullying, no traffic, no time lost on the way to school. He also benefits from online education platforms and thinks that these platforms are pretty useful. I know of many parents who got used to homeschooling and thinking to transfer their kids to public schools next year (Melek, 40 years old, member of school-parent association).*

**Theme 5: Pandemic experience of administrators**

Four subthemes emerged in this theme: 1) Raising parent skepticism towards private schooling, 2) Increasing training and communication needs on online platforms, 3) Dealing with uncertainty and 4) Dealing with social media.

**Table 5.** *Theme 5: Pandemic experience of administrators*

| Subthemes | Codes | SP | KVP | PVP | MVP |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Raising parent skepticism towards private schooling | Refund requests from parents (Threat) | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| | Student withdrawals (Threat) | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| | Transition to public schools (Threat) | | | | 1 |
| | Blurring relations (Threat) | 1 | | 1 | 1 |
| | Increased demands for transparency (Threat) | 1 | | 1 | 1 |
| Increasing training and communication needs on online platforms | Training of teachers (Web 2.0 tools) (Opportunity) | 1 | | 1 | 1 |
| | Training of students for technology literacy (Opportunity) | 1 | | 1 | 1 |
| | Training of parents for technology literacy (Burden) | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| | Training of parents about the pro and cons of technology (Burden) | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| | Trainings held by/for the counseling and guidance (Opportunity) | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| | Instagram live conferences on social media (Opportunity) | 1 | | | |
| Dealing with uncertainty | Frequent changes in school openings/closures (Weakness) | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |
| | On-site scheduling vs online scheduling (Threat) | 1 | 1 | | |
| | Frequent changes in examinations & daily functioning (Weakness) | 1 | | | 1 |
| | Dealing with pandemic regulations (measures taken for the spread of virus in school buildings, increased focus on hygiene related issues in schools) (Burden) | 1 | 1 | 1 | |
| Dealing with social media | Social media rumors (Threat) | 1 | | | |
| | Attacks from social media (Threat) | 1 | | | |

SP: School Principal, KVP: Kindergarten Vice Principal, PVP: Primary School Vice Principal, MVP: Middle School Vice Principal

Our education system is characterized by intense, rat-race competition and materialistic pursuits. Therefore schools, especially the private schools tried really hard not to let students and parents think that they have been left alone or harmed by this lockdown. Following excerpt from the school principal illustrates efforts of schools to comfort parents, students and teachers about online education:

> We started Live Instagram meetings to inform parents, teachers and students about the current situation and possibilities ahead of us. Our counselors arranged frequent online meeting to inform and comfort students and parents. We also held frequent trainings to introduce our teachers with Web 2.0 tools.

Private schools had to fight too many battles at the same time. While trying to do their best on online education, they also dealt with student withdrawals and refund requests from parents. Given the extraordinary circumstances, parents have demanded private schools to reduce the tuition fees and also refund for the meals and daily expenses that can be charged only when the students are physically present in the school (Huixian, Jia, & Shen, 2020). The school principal summarizes the Covid-19 experiences of private schools from a managerial perspective:

> During the Covid-19, parents were all alarmed. They all started to question the tuition fees they have paid for the private schools. They become gradually uncomfortable about the payments they have made to us. They had paid the tuitions for face-to-face, on-site education but now students were at home, and they were paying the same money for remote education. Many parents thought if they were stuck at home with their own kids with all the responsibility and the burden of the homeschooling, it wasn't wise for them to send their kids to private schools just for the online education. There were many online educational platforms like Khan Academy or Tonguç, and if they cannot benefit from the schools' 5-star hotel-like services such as meals and nursing facilities, why pay more? Why send the kids to the private schools instead of public schools for free? Most parents started to re-calculate the pros & cons of sending their kids to private schools while the schools are now robbed off their nursing facilities. Many parents

*are sending their kids to private schools not only because they are better at academy but also better at nursing and caring. For most parents, schools are the safest places for their kids to socialize. Now without all those benefits, they became more scrutinizing, more demanding and more cynic than ever. There have been a flock of parents taking their kids from private schools to state schools (Canan, the school principal, 42 years old).*

During the pandemic, many parents demanded schools to continue to follow the same time schedule they used to apply for on-site education. Yet, they also complained that equivalent number of class hours on online, created an "overwhelming" burden especially for parents of younger kids as they have to sit through the classes with their children. Moreover, although some parents insisted on the same number of teaching hours equivalent to pre-pandemic education, some others were worried because it was not healthy to keep students across the computer screen for such long hours. Following excerpt illustrates this very dilemma experienced during the Covid-19 pandemic from the lenses of the secondary school's vice principal:

*After the pandemic we have started online courses for half day. Parents have gone mad. They demanded more hours of online teaching. They said that they had paid for full-day education and now receiving only a half day. So, when the schools re-opened this semester, we have started the full day education as we used to do during pre-pandemic. But they are still complaining. Because they believe that keeping children across the screen all day long is not healthy at all. And I sincerely agree with them at that point. They are right about it. But some parents still insist on the exact replica of face-to-face education on online. Trying to meet all the expectations at the same time is really tiresome (Selim, 38 years old, secondary school vice principal).*

The school principals had to deal with many difficulties during the first weeks of the Covid-19 pandemic. Chief among these difficulties was the overwhelming demands from worried parents and resistance of teachers towards online teaching. Once again pandemic proved that revolutions are characterized by blurred boundaries, mute conversations, conflicting interests and voices raising from everywhere. When something is new and yet undefined, people get alarmed and starts to question everything from the scratch. During pandemic, we witnessed parents to question from the security and effectiveness of conferencing tools to the reliability of online examinations. Many schools had a hard time in drawing the line between parents and themselves due to the over-communication and over-connectedness with parents. Following quote from the school principal explains how the Covid-19 induced public skepticism and increased expectations coming from parents compelled schools to invest more time and energy on their technological infrastructure and training needs of their students, teachers and parents.

*First two weeks was really hard. We had online training sessions for teachers and students. We held parent meetings online. Everyone was worried and were asking about when and how the schools would re-open. Convincing both parents and teachers for online learning was the hardest part. Everyone came up with a complaint. Teachers were complaining because they had kids at home with no nanny and it was hard for them teaching online while they have their own kids at home, some also complaint because they had no or weak internet connection. Parents were complaining because they had to help their kids connect to internet, join virtual classes and supervise them. Students were the only ones not complaining at all… they were much more positive and willing to adapt. Maybe the students were the only ones able to see the glass half full. At first, teachers resisted a lot by claiming the worst. Some argued that it was nonsense and useless trying to teach online especially at the primary school level. To get rid of the burden of online teaching, some teachers even disguised their selfish concerns and lazziness as the genuine worry for students' learning by claiming that keeping kids online were both physically and pedagogically unhealthy. Both parents and teachers raised questions about the safety of conference apps like zoom. Sharing students' videos or using apps like zoom said to be dangerous as it poses a threat to privacy and may lead to the identity theft and fraud etc. Parents were cynic about every single thing from the preferred conferencing method to the teachers' teaching methods online. They were now free to monitor everything online and they thought they had every right to interfere the school's business. Most discussion were really mute. We dealt with every single problem individually and our workload increased enormously. Two weeks after the lockdown, we had started online examinations and my mailbox was about to explode. Complaint and thanking letters were raining down to my mailbox. Some*

*were thanking because we had started online examinations faster than everyone else, some were complaining because we had some technical problems (Canan, the school principal, 42 years old).*

Findings in this theme also revealed that schools had to become more transparent both in their academic and financial processes. Increasing demands and skepticism from parents made schooling processes subject to closer scrutiny from the parents:

*Parents started to share their own calculations about the refunds for meals and daily expenses they have paid for on social media… State subsidies given to schools for teacher salaries or alleged reductions in the daily expenses of schools suddenly became a topic of hot debate on social media. Parents asking for discounts and refunds started to attack schools on the social media. Dealing with social media rumors and attacks became really tiresome for school administrators.*

**Discussion and Conclusion**

As Covid-19 started to spread and schools began to close in the 2020 spring, many families struggled. But some discovered that they really liked homeschooling. The pandemic-induced test drive of home-based education gave millions of parents a chance to reassess the factory model (Deangelis, 2020). Some families reported that their children were less anxious, more engaged with learning materials, and learning more in a fraction of the time. Other families realized that homeschooling did not work for them and maybe for the first time they realized how lucky they were just because they were able send their children to the school to socialize and get face-to-face education.

Findings revealed that despite all the glitches and inconvenience experienced during the Covid-19, the Covid-19 induced educational transition is likely to have a lasting impact on education. It is predicted that due to the rapid increase in world population, global mobility and transformation in our diets, global pandemics like Covid-19 are likely to repeat itself every decade (Arkan, 2020). This indicates that homeschooling and online education will spread in coming years. Therefore, if the right conditions are provided, homeschooling may emerge as a viable alternative for Turkey as it is for USA, Canada and Norway. However, our findings also showed that despite some overzealous futurists, online education or homeschooling is not for everyone or the substitute for on-site education. Yet, blending the two modes of education in a balanced and flexible way (hybrid education) or giving a choice to students by providing both alternatives (online vs on-site education) might be the key to achievement for tomorrow's schooling system. SWOT analysis of Covid-19 education from the lenses of different stakeholders can actually shed light on a proper hybrid education system that is capable of blending the best parts of on-site and off-site education.

While there have been glitches and maybe there are much more needs to be done in terms of online education, for the most part, we can take pride in our response to teaching at the face of Covid-19. We all, indeed, have been surprised by the ease of transition to the online education. Our youth and teachers experienced different and more empowering forms of learning. In general, training and support programs for students, parents and educators initiated during the Covid-19 pandemic were successfully designed and effectively implemented. New measurement and evaluation methods compatible with digital education was developed. Tutorials that help educators create new digital educational materials were developed, and short videos that help students adjust to digital education were produced. As argued by Arkan (2020), trainings and experience-sharing platforms that will help educational leaders be prepared for their new role in this new era must be planned and organized. Yet, the most important of them all is to design a new code of ethics for the online and hybrid education system. Our findings showed that teachers and administrators feel overwhelmed by blurring boundaries between parents and teachers; teachers and students; administrators and parents; administrators and teachers. Changing dynamics in the ways and the frequency of communication and working hours signal that there is an immediate need to create a new code of ethics for online education that re-defines the boundaries between schools and parents/students and help re-balance the work-life balance for teachers.

The Covid-19 pandemic proved us that there is no longer such a thing as isolated issues and actions and we are all interconnected; and in this ever-changing environment, resilience, adaptability, empathy and emotional intelligence are the most important skills essential to navigate effectively through this pandemic (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020). The educational technologies employed during the Covid-19 crisis are likely to

have a lasting impact on how we teach and how we learn, but most importantly, coronavirus-related experiences of isolation and remote learning away from peers, teachers and classrooms will always serve as a cautious reminder of the importance of face-to-face social interaction for Generation Z, Alpha and the generations to come (Luthra & Mackenzie, 2020).

Our research findings revealed that although home-schooling during the Covid-19 have certainly caused some degree of inconvenience such as increased workload for teachers and parents, connection problems etc., it also prompted new examples of educational innovations by changing our approach to education entirely. Online education compelled teachers and students to use endless possibilities of technology creatively and presented a rare gift to all students and teacher: no more traffic and more time at home. Yet, at the same time, it also showed us that not only the medium that we use for delivery of education but also the philosophy of education must change (Göçmen, 2020). The Covid-19 experience proved us all that online education has its own limitations and advantages and presents us unique challenges that must be confronted.

Findings of this research study also showed us that remote learning poses significant threats to the soft part of schooling. Online education left students deprived of peer-to-peer interaction. We all know that socialization in schools is an important part of growing up and crucial to a child's development. If we let the soft part of schooling fly out of the window and everything starts to be about the bottom line and let human side of the education disappear, we may end up with a more antiquated system than ever, but this time in the most innovative package. At the bottom-line almost all stakeholders seemed to agree that academic-wise, online classes are no significantly different than face-to-face classes and what makes the real difference is socialization and daycare. More specifically, our research findings showed that transition to online education seemed to be easier and faster for older kids as compared to the younger ones and for reasons not only related to intellectual or technological capacity but because older kids were simply more disciplined. Moreover, this transition became harder for the parents of younger kids because, for the parents of younger kids, schools are not merely education-providers, but they are also daycare centers. Our findings imply that especially for younger children, online schooling cannot be considered as a viable alternative to face-to-face education as it fails to meet the daycare needs of kids whose parents are working and cannot provide an environment for children to socialize.

Although it is too early to judge the effects of isolation during the pandemic, it is certain that parents are very worried, and students are longing to get together with their school friends again. Researchers are just beginning to gather data on how the pandemic will affect the relationships of kids with their peers, parents and teachers and it's still too early to know how this will impact children years down the road (Dangerfield, 2020) but our research findings showed us that children are not happy at being at home all day long with their family and it also seems to deteriorate family relationships at a great deal. Given all of these findings, we can conclude that although technology can well substitute the hard parts, it lacks the emotion needed for the soft part. Given the right infrastructure (internet, tablets and computers) online learning might be a viable and convenient alternative for the hard, linear part of the schooling, but there seems to be no alternative for the soft parts of schooling other than face-to-face education.

Another important finding stemming from this research indicates the fact that the Covid-19 pandemic encouraged parents to re-consider their choices of schools for their children. As argued by Ries & Trout (2001) each choice is a trade-off and requires a sacrifice; and the real challenge is to make a choice at the expense of all other options. During the Covid-19, parents re-calculated the pros and cons of public vs private schools. Many parents asked for refunds and disenrolled from private schools (Huixian, Jia, & Shen, 2020). They thought that if they were not going to send their kids to schools physically and cannot benefit from private schools' hotel-like social facilities like library, backyard and swimming pool, then neither those facilities nor the better safety and security measures provided by private schools should no longer be taken into consideration in the choice of a school. Without all those benefits provided by the private schools, parents seemed to start considering home-schooling, private-tutoring and digital educational platforms as viable alternatives to private schooling. Given all of these changes in the parents' attitudes and choices, private schools seem to be compelled to re-consider their marketing strategies in the market. Considering the parents' demands to decrease the student tuition fees for online education, private schools should consider re-

arranging their tuition fees for different modes of education (on-site, online and hybrid) and re-allocate their investment to deliver instruction in three different modes.

In fact, it is best to think of online education as a different way of teaching -not better, not worse-just different (Weir, 2020). It has its own set of advantages and disadvantages. So, it is plausible to assume that after the pandemic, many K-12 schools may embrace a hybrid approach utilizing both the benefits of online education and on-site education. As we all know, there is a continuum in schooling between "hard" and "soft" effectiveness. The "hard" is the easy one to define. It is the linear part of schooling that makes plans, sets up structures and monitors performance. Soft effectiveness, on the other hand, represents the non-linear part of schooling that is tough to sell to anyone convinced that quantifiable measures like standardized achievement test scores are the best way to judge a school as "good," "excellent," "high performer," or "effective" (Cuban, 2019). Considering that this pandemic has a remarkable potential to shift the focus of schooling from hard part to the soft part, the Covid-19 can even be considered as a blessing in disguise. For those who realize that an overemphasis on the hard side of schooling can at best achieve a linear increase in performance, but a focus on the soft, non-linear side can lead to an exponential improvement in performance (Freifeld, 2013), pandemic is considered as a rare gift that likely to compel all schools to re-position themselves in the marketplace by stretching "hard" effectiveness into a broader, more humane, and realistic purpose of schooling and integrate both modes of learning in a hybrid system for any contingencies.

## Limitations and Recommendations

This work was subject to five main limitations. First, data analysis was limited to thirty-two participants. Although this number provided great insight into the experiences of these individuals, the small sample size limits the generalizability of the results. Second, under Covid-19 restrictions, instead of face-to-face interviews, all the interviews were conducted on zoom. So, the rapport that must be built between the researcher and the participants was hard to obtain. Third, participants lacked certain forms of diversity that limits the representation of certain populations (e.g., ivy league schools, boutique schools, vocational schools, public schools, higher education institutions or special education schools). Forth, the semi-structured interview guideline was both a benefit and a limitation. By leaving it loosely structured, participants were free to interpret the questions and respond according to personal resonance; however, this also meant that responses varied widely, making analysis interesting but challenging. Finally, the timing of the study focused only on the initial pandemic transition. This provided excellent insight into early experiences but did not include later changes. Therefore, we recommend that further research should include a wider variety of backgrounds and include later changes. Including a wider variety of backgrounds will allow for pinpointing the differences between different types and levels of schools and portray a more holistic picture of pandemic education. Further research may also focus on the effect of pandemic education after the re-opening.

## References

Almazol, K. & Heider, D. (2020, August 25). *Back to school with Covid-19; Ethical questions for teachers*. Markkula center for applied ethics. https://www.scu.edu/ethics-spotlight/the-ethics-of-going-back-to-school-in-a-pandemic/back-to-school-with-covid-19-ethical-questions-for-teachers/

Almazol, K. & Tennant, P. (2020, May 6). *Back to school: Rethinking education after the pandemic*. Markkula center for applied ethics. https://www.scu.edu/ethics-spotlight/covid-19-ethics-health-and-moving-forward/back-to-school-rethinking-education-after-the-pandemic/

Arkan, A. (2020, April 22). *Koronavirüs sonrası eğitim.* SETA. https://www.setav.org/koronavirus-sonrasi-egitim/

Binkley, C. E. (2020, August 25). *The moral question of school reopening: Benefit, burden and cura personalis.* Markkula center for applied ethics. https://www.scu.edu/ethics-spotlight/the-ethics-of-going-back-to-school-in-a-pandemic/the-moral-question-of-school-reopening-benefit-burden-and-cura-personalis/

Broom, D. (2020, April 3). *Homeschooling during the coronavirus pandemic could change education forever, says the OECD.* The world economic forum. https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2020/04/coronavirus-home schooling-technology-oecd/

Coyne, C., Ballard, J. D., & Blader, I. J. (2020). Recommendations for future university pandemic responses: What the first Covid-19 shutdown taught us. *PLOS Biology, 18*(8), 1–6. doi.org/10.1371/ journal.pbio. 3000889.

Cuban, L. (2019, February 6). *Hard and soft  effectiveness in schools.* School reform and classroom practice. https://larrycuban.wordpress.com/2019/02/06/hard-and-soft-effectiveness-in-schools/

Dangerfield, K. (2020, July 9). *Coronavirus: How a lack of socialization could impact a generation of kids*. Global news. https://globalnews.ca/news/7156863/coronavirus-children-isolation-socialization/

Deangelis, C. A. (2020, December).  *Covid-19 didn't break the public school system. It was already broken.* Reason. https://reason.com/2020/11/03/covid-19-didnt-break-the-public-school-system-it-was-already-broken/

Finefter-Rosenbluh, I. (2020, July 14). *Schools and Covid: Rethinking educational ethics during a pandemic.* Lens, Monash University. https://lens.monash.edu/@education/2020 /07/14/1380818/ schools-and-covid-rethinking-educational-ethics-during-a-pandemic

Fisher, M. E., Dorner, M. A., Maghzi, K. S., Achieng-Evensen, C.,Whitaker, L.C., Hansell, F.,Amant, J. S., & Gapinski, S. M. (2021). Liminality, disruption, and change. A prismatic look at pandemic education. *Prospects:Comparative Journal of Curriculum, Learning, and Assessment,*1-18. doi.org/10.1007/s11125-021-09563-9

Freifeld, L. (2013, March 26). *Hard vs. soft management.* Training.https://trainingmag.com /content/hard-vs softmanagement/#:~:text=There%20is%20a%20continuum%20in,friendly%20management%20based%20on%20emotions

Göçmen, A. *Covid-19 sonrası eğitime dair senaryolar: Yeni eğitim nasıl olacak?* Evrim ağacı. https://evrimagaci.org/covid19-sonrasi-egitime-dair-senaryolar-yeni-egitim-nasil-olacak-9001

Henderikx, M., Kreijns, K. & Kalz, M.(2018). *A classification of barriers that influence intention achievement in MOOCs.* LifelongTechnology-EnhancedLearning. https://link.springer.com/chapter/10.10 07/978-3-319-98572-5_1

Huixian, S., Jia, D., & Shen, T. (2020, April 15). *Frustrated Beijing parents demand refunds from pricey private schools*. Caixin.  https://www.caixinglobal.com/2020-04-15/frustrated-parents-demand-refunds-from-expensive-private-schools-101542690.html

Knysh, O., & Dudziak, O. (2020). Overcoming the challenges: The impact of Covid-19 on agricultural higher education in Ukraine. *Romanian Journal for Multidimensional Education, 12,* 162 -167. doi.org/10.18662/ rrem/12.2Sup1/302.

Lakhan, R., Agrawal, A., & Sharma, M. (2020). Prevalence of depression, anxiety, and stress during Covid19 pandemic. *Journal of Neurosciences in Rural Practice, 11*(4), 519–525. doi.org/10.1055/s0040-1716442.

Lloyd, S. A., Byrne, M. M. & McCoy, T. S. (2012).  Faculty-perceived barriers of online education. *J. online Learn. Teach., 8*(1), 1-12.

Luthra, P. & Mackenzie, S. (2020, 30 March). *4 ways Covid-19 could change how we educate future generations.* The world economic forum. https://www.weforum.org/ agenda/2020/03/4-ways-covid-19-education-future-generations/

Maxwell, J. A. (2005). *Qualitative research design: An interactive approach* (2nd Ed.). Applied Social Research Methods Series, Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *An expanded sourcebook: Qualitative data analysis* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage

Murphy, M. P. (2020). Covid-19 and emergency eLearning: Consequences of the securitization of higher education for post-pandemic pedagogy. *Contemporary Security Policy, 31*(3), 492-505. doi.org/10.1080/ 13523260.2020.1761749

Nordmann, E.,Horlin, C.,Hutchison, J.,Murray, J.A.,Robson, L.,Seery, M.K., & MacKay, J.R.(2020).Ten simple rules for supporting a temporary online pivot in higher education. *Computational Biology, 16*(10),1-18. doi.org/10.1371/journal.pcbi.1008242.

OECD (2020). *School education during Covid -19: Were teachers and students ready?* OECD country notes/Chile. http://www.oecd.org/education/Chile-coronavirus-education-country-note.pdf

Palinkas, L.A., Horwitz, S.M., Green, C.A., Wisdom, J.P., Duan, N., & Hoagwood, K. (2015). Purposeful sampling for qualitative data collection and analysis in mixed method implementation research. *Adm. Policy Ment Health, 42*(5), 533-544. doi.org/10.1007/s10488-013-0528-y

Ries, A., & Trout, J. (2001). *Positioning: The battle for your mind*. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Seidman, I. (1998). *Interviewing as qualitative research: A guide for researchers in education and the social sciences*. NY: Teachers College Press.

Silverman, D. (2000). *Doing Qualitative Research.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Surahman, E., & Sulthoni, S. (2020, October). *Student satisfaction toward quality of online learning in Indonesian higher education during Covid-19* [Paper presentation]. 6th International Conference on Education and Technology (ICET), Malang, Indonesia. https://ieeexplore.ieee.org/stamp/stamp.jsp?tp=& arnumber = 9276630

Tam, G. & El-Azar, D. (2020, 13 March). *3 ways the coronavirus pandemic could reshape education.* The world economic forum Covid action platform. https://www.weforum.org /agenda/2020/03/3-ways-corona virus-is-reshaping-education-and-what-changes-might-be-here-to-stay/

Urban, R. (2020, August 20). *Lessons from the pandemic: A rethink of schooling has become more urgent in the wake of COVID-19.* The weekend Australia. https://www.theaustralian.com.au/subscribe/news/1/?SourceCo de=TAWEB_WRE170_a&dest=https%3A%2F%2Fwww.theaustralian.com.au%2Finquirer%2Fcoronavir us-and-education-lessons-from-the-pandemic%2Fnewsstory%2Fd14fe8370d6b3c6570053abad8a319 37

Weir, R. (2020, July 8). *Not all online experiences are equal.* Inside highered education. https://www. inside highered.com/advice/2020/07/08/advice-rethinking-online-education-no-longer-emergency-exception-what-may-be-norm

Yin, R.K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods*. Sage. Thousand Oaks, California.

*Appendix. Semi structured interview form*

1) *Can you please share your experience of education during the Covid-19 Pandemic? (specifically on educational technologies employed during the pandemic, problems experienced, etc.)?*

2) *Can you please share the glitches and inconvenience that you have experienced during the Covid-19?*

3) *Can you please share the opportunities at the face of the Covid-19 disease in the field of education?*

4) *Can you please share the threats presented by Covid-19 disease in the field of education?*

5) *Can you please share your experience with parents, teachers, students, and administrators during Covid-19 pandemic with specific examples?*

6) *Can you please tell us the challenges you have experienced during Covid-19 pandemic (specifically in the field of learning/teaching processes, communication, financial issues, technological issues and etc.)?*