ORIGINAL ARTICLE



A new index for the assessment of distal radius fractures involving the ulnar styloid

Haldun ORHUN, Muhsin DURSUN, Volkan GÜRKAN, Ender SARIOĞLU, Güray ALTUN, Ozan AKÇA

Department of Orthopaedics and Traumatology, Dr. Lütfi Kırdar Kartal Training and Research Hospital, İstanbul, Turkey

Objective: The aim of this retrospective study was to evaluate the relation between a new index we created for the assessment of distal radius fractures involving the ulnar styloid, and the clinical outcome.

Methods: We devised a radiographic separation index (RSI), to evaluate the displacement of the ulnar styloid. We used this index in 44 patients (28 men and 16 women; mean age: 43.2 years; range: 24-64 years) with distal radius fractures involving the the ulnar styloid. In all cases, the distal radius fracture was fixed using a volar locking plate. The styloid fracture was treated conservatively. The relation between the RSI value and clinical results was then investigated.

Results: In the 44 patients there were clinically 38 excellent, 4 good, and 2 moderate results. RSI ratios ranged from 2% to 11%. The patients with an excellent result had an RSI ratio of less than 5%. We found a significant correlation between the RSI ratio values and the clinical outcomes.

Conclusion: Our results suggested that the RSI can be used as a predictor of the clinical outcome in patients with distal radius fractures involving the ulnar styloid.

Key words: Distal radius fracture; RSI; TFCC; ulnar styloid.

Distal radius fractures are the most common wrist fractures.^[1-3] These fractures may also involve the distal ulnar styloid process, which is important in wrist function. The ulnar styloid process supports the triangular fibrocartilaginous complex (TFCC) and its fracture may be an indicator of an intrasubstance tear of the TFCC in displaced distal radius fractures.^[3-6] Thus, treatment of the ulnar styloid process must be considered in the surgical treatment plan of radius fractures.^[6] Ekenstam et al. believed that ulnar styloid fractures do not affect the function of the wrist after distal radius fracture treatment.^[7] However, Yanagida et al. and Shaw et al. stated that the treatment of ulnar styloid fractures should be included in distal radius fracture treatment.^[8,9]

We devised a radiographic separation index (RSI) to evaluate the displacement of the ulnar styloid in patients with distal radius fractures involving the ulnar styloid. The aim of our retrospective study was to evaluate the relation between our new index and clinical outcomes.

Patients and methods

We reviewed the records of patients who underwent surgical treatment for distal radius fractures at our institution between February 2006 and December 2007. All fractures resulted from a fall and no patients had osteoporosis or soft tissue injuries associated with the fractures. Patients with distal radius fractures treated conservatively, and patients with

Correspondence: Haldun Orhun, MD. Cumhuriyet Cad. G-8 Sok. Yeşil Konaklar Sitesi F-3 Yenişehir Mah. Kurtköy, Pendik, İstanbul, Turkey. Tel: +90 532 - 267 69 63 e-mail: haldunorhun@hotmail.com

Submitted: June 10, 2010 Accepted: January 1, 2011

^{©2011} Turkish Association of Orthopaedics and Traumatology

fractures of both wrists or with pathologies due to fractures other than those involving the wrists were excluded from the study.

Our study consisted of 64 patients, 44 (28 men and 16 women; mean age: 43.2 years; range: 24-64 years; side: 21 right, 23 left) of which had a concurrent distal ulnar styloid fracture. Of these 44 patients, 24 had fractures involving the ulnar styloid edge (Type 1), and 20 the fovea (Type 2). Patients with styloid fractures extending to the metaphysis and with specific surgical indications were excluded from the study. According to the Frykman classification, 37 of the 44 ulnar styloid fractures were Type 8 (84.1%) and 7 were Type 4 (15.9%).

The 20 patients (6 men and 14 women; mean age: 48 years; range: 38-57 years; side: 17 right, 3 left) without accompanying ulnar styloid fractures comprised our control group.

Osteosynthesis was performed on all distal radius fractures using locking volar titanium plates. The anatomical reposition of the distal radius fracture was confirmed by intraoperative fluoroscopy. After the fixation of the radius fracture, the distal radioulnar joint (DRUJ) stability was evaluated. During surgery, the radioulnar joint was restored and stabilized. After surgery the wrist was immobilized in a splint, with the wrist in flexion and ulnar deviation to stabilize the ulnar styloid fracture. All styloid fractures were followed conservatively.

Splint immobilization was maintained for 6 weeks. After 3 weeks, an exercise and rehabilitation program was introduced. Hyperflexion and extreme ulnar deviation were not allowed before 12 weeks. At the postoperative 6th, 12th, and 18th weeks, clinical outcomes were evaluated using Gartland and Werley's evaluation scores and radiological controls conducted according to the radiological assessment criteria of Stewart et al. (Table 1).^[10,11]

During the operation, an anteroposterior radiograph with the forearm in pronation was taken before and after osteosynthesis. We devised an RSI, to evaluate the displacement of the ulnar styloid (Fig. 1).

We measured the distance between the ulnar styloid and a longitudinal line through the shaft of the radius for both the intact and injured wrists, X_1 and X_2 respectively and calculated their difference. We calculated the RSI as the ratio of this difference to X_1 distance.

Dorsal angulation	The loosening of radial length	The loosening of radial angulation	Score	
Neutral	<3 mm	0-4	0	
1-10	3-6 mm	5-9	1	
11-14	7-11 mm	10-14	2	
>14	>11 mm	>14	4	

Table 1. Stewart's radiological assessment criteria.

Results: Excellent: 0 point, Good: 1-3 points, Intermediate: 4-6 points, Fair: 7-12 points.

The correlation between the RSI values and Gartland and Werley clinical outcome scores was then analyzed. All results were statistically evaluated with Pearson's chi-square (χ^2) test.

Results

The RSI values and the clinical results of the patients with Type 1 and Type 2 styloid fractures and without styloid fractures are presented in Tables 2, 3 and 4, respectively. Return to work or ability to perform daily routine activities was possible at an average of 56 postoperative (range: 30-150) days.

Examination at a mean follow-up of 18 weeks showed that of the 44 patients with ulnar styloid



Fig. 1. 18th week postoperative images of the wrist showing distal radius and ulnar styloid fractures and the uninjured wrist: The distance between the ulnar styloid and the longitudinal midline of the radius of the fractured arm is shown as (X₂), and the distance between the ulnar styloid and the longitudinal midline of the radius of the normal arm is shown as (X₁).

Patient with styloid tip fracture (Type 1)		Radiologic separation value (RSV)										
		2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	
Clinic	Excellent	7	3	5	3	2		1		1		
(Patient)	Good Intermediate					2						
Radiologic	Excellent	7	3	5	3	3						
(Patients)	Good					1		1		1		
	Intermediate											

 Table 2.
 Radiological separation indexes of patients with styloid tip fractures (Type 1) taken following surgery of the distal radius fractures.

 Clinical and radiological results are shown in the same period.

 Table 3.
 Radiological separation indexes of the patients with styloid fovea fractures (Type 2) taken following surgery of the distal radius fractures. Clinical and radiological results are shown in the same period.

Patient with styloid fovea fracture (Type 2)		Radiologic separation value (RSV)											
		2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11		
Clinic	Excellent	10	5	1									
(Patient)	Good					1					1		
	Intermediate										2		
Radiologic	Excellent	10	5	1									
(Patients)	Good					1					2		
	Intermediate										1		

fractures, 38 had excellent results, 4 good results, and 2 had moderate results according to the Gartland and Werley clinical evaluation criteria. Because no significant differences were observed between the postoperative and 18th week RSI values, the final patient evaluation was based on the RSI obtained at the last follow-up. RSI was 2% in 17 patients, 3% in 8 patients, 4% in 6 patients, 5% in 3 patients, 6% in 5 patients, 8% in 1 patient, 10% in 1 patient, and 11% in 3 patients (Tables 2 and 3). An RSI of less than 5% was found in 34 of the patients (77.2%) with excellent clinical results. Seven patients (15.9%) had RSIs between 5% and 10%, and 3 patients (6.9%) an RSI of more than 10%.

Fractures were evaluated according to Stewart's radiological scoring method, which yielded excellent results for 37 patients, good results for 6, and a moderate result for 1. Of patients with excellent results, the RSI was less than 5% in 34 and ranged from 5% to 10% in 3 patients; the correlation with the Stewart score was significant (p<.05).

 Table 4.
 Radiological separation indexes of the patients without styloid fractures taken following the distal radius fractures. Clinical and radiological results are shown in the same period.

Patient without styloid		Radiologic separation value (RSV) can not be calculated										
fracture		2	2 3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	
Clinic	Excellent	17										
(Patient)	Good Intermediate	3										
Radiologic	Excellent	19										
(Patients)	Good	1										
	Intermediate											

Seventeen of the 24 patients with ulnar styloid fractures had a non-union. In these patients, the outcome was evaluated as good in 2 and excellent in 15. Union was observed in all 20 styloid process fractures involving the fovea.

According to the Gartland and Werley criteria, the outcome for the control group of patients without ulnar styloid fractures, was judged as excellent in 17 patients (85%) and good in 3 (15%) (Table 4).

There was no intraoperative neurovascular injury complication. One patient suffered an infected incision during the early postoperative period which was treated on the twelfth postoperative day with wound debridement and oral antibiotics. Three of the patients developed reflex sympathetic dystrophy. Although the duration of postoperative follow-up was short, no arthritis was observed, either clinically or radiologically.

Discussion

Ulnar styloid fractures accompany distal radius fractures in an average of 50% of cases,^[12] although Frykman reported a rate of 66%.^[13] The TFCC provides a continuous gliding surface across the entire distal face of the two forearm bones for flexionextension and translational movements and its dorsal and palmar ligaments stabilize the DRUJ.^[5,12-20]

If adequate tension in the ligaments is achieved during the surgical reduction of the ulnar fragment of the radius, functionality might not be impaired and surgical repair of the styloid may not be needed. In this situation, osteosynthesis with a locking screw plate provides a more stable anatomic fixation of the region and stabilizes the DRUJ.

We devised the RSI to assess the DRUJ stability, which may be affected during distal radius fractures. The results according to the Gartland and Werley criteria were excellent in patients with RSI values lower than 5%. In addition, radiological evaluation results of the same group were found to be perfect. This proportional relationship was significant (p<.05). The relation between a low RSI value and good results suggests the importance of styloid displacement.

In the control group, 17 cases (85%) showed excellent and 3 cases (15%) good clinical results. The clinical results in the control group were signif-

icantly different from the results in patients with ulnar styloid fractures.

Styloid non-union developed in 17 of our patients, 3 of whom had a moderate result with an RSI of >10%. Clinical results of the remaining 14 patients were either good or excellent. Contrasting with reports stating that non-union is the source of wrist pain due to DRUJ instability, we observed that even in cases of non-union, the outcomes of treatment in patients with RSIs of <5% were excellent.^[20-22]

We believe that using a radius reference point enables the assessment of the TFCC ligaments and DRUJ integrity along with the styloid displacement.^[23] Whereas Yanagida's measurements assess the relation between the styloid process and the ulna, they do not assess the DRUJ and TFCC.^[8] However, Sammer et al. determined that the main criterion of the deviations in numeric measurements is the ulnar diaphysis.^[24] Our measurement criterion was the straight line passing through the middle of the radial diaphysis.

Sammer at al. deduced, based on measurement results, that ulnar styloid fractures have no effect on function after the fixation of distal radius fractures.^[24] In our study, however, the displacement of the ulnar styloid correlated significantly with worse results (p < .05). This difference can be explained by the different reference points used in these studies. We believe that any measurement for the styloid fracture should use a radial reference point. The relation between the styloid fracture and the results of radius fractures should be assessed with such a measurement. Our conclusions are consistent with the clinical evaluation criteria of Gartland and Werley and the correlations were shown to be significant (p<.05). In addition, the RSI is correlated to Stewart's radiological evaluation criteria.

With our case series, we can not form a conclusion on the surgical implications of RSI values. However, our results suggested that values between 6% and 10% may be considered good and surgery in this group may be necessary for symptomatic TFCC tears. Values greater than 10% may suggest an inadequate DRUJ or ulnar styloid reposition and may be an indication for surgical treatment. Thus, RSI may be an important tool affecting and directing treatment choice. In short, our results suggested that the RSI can be used as a predictor of the clinical outcome in patients with distal radius fractures involving the ulnar styloid.

Conflicts of Interest: No conflicts declared.

References

- Abid A, Accadbled F, Kany J, de Gauzy JS, Darodes P, Cahuzac JP. Ulnar styloid fracture in children: a retrospective study of 46 cases. J Pediatr Orthop B 2008;17:15-9.
- Chung KC, Spilson SV. The frequency and epidemiology of hand and forearm fractures in the United States. J Hand Surg Am 2001;26:908-15.
- Zenke Y, Sakai A, Oshige T, Moritani S, Nakamura T. The effect of an associated ulnar styloid fracture on the outcome after fixation of a fracture of the distal radius. J Bone Joint Surg Br 2009;91:102-7.
- Haugstvedt JR, Berger RA, Nakamura T, Neale P, Berglund L, An KN. Relative contributions of the ulnar attachments of the triangular fibrocartilage complex to the dynamic stability of the distal radioulnar joint. J Hand Surg Am. 2006;31:445-51.
- Souer JS, Ring D, Matschke S, Audige L, Marent-Huber M, Jupiter JB; AOCID Prospective ORIF Distal Radius Study Group. Effect of an unrepaired fracture of the ulnar styloid base on outcome after plate-and-screw fixation of a distal radial fracture. J Bone Joint Surg Am 2009;91: 830-8.
- May MM, Lawton JN, Blazar PE. Ulnar styloid fractures associated with distal radius fractures: incidence and implications for distal radioulnar joint instability. J Hand Surg Am 2002;27:965-71.
- Ekenstam F, Jakobsson OP, Wadin K. Repair of the triangular ligament in Colles' fracture. No effect in a prospective randomized study. Acta Orthop Scand 1989;60:393-6.
- Yanagida H, Ishii S, Short WH, Werner FW, Weiner MM, Masaoka S. Radiologic evaluation of the ulnar styloid. J Hand Surg Am 2002;27:49-56.
- Shaw JA, Bruno A, Paul EM. Ulnar styloid fixation in the treatment of posttraumatic instability of the radioulnar joint: a biomechanical study with clinical correlation. J Hand Surg Am 1990;15:712-20.
- Gartland JJ Jr, Werley WC. Evaluation of healed Colles' fractures. J Bone Joint Surg. 1951;33:895-907.
- 11. Hanel DP. Treatment of intraarticular fractures. In: Trumble TE, editor. Hand surgery update. Hand, elbow

and shoulder. 3rd ed. Rosemont, IL: American Society for Surgery of the Hand; 2002. p. 105-21.

- Cooney WP 3rd, Dobyns JH, Linscheid RL. Complications of Colles' fractures. J Bone Joint Surg Am 1980; 62:613-9.
- Frykman G. Fracture of the distal radius including sequelae—shoulder-hand-finger syndrome, disturbance in the distal radio-ulnar joint and impairment of nerve function. A clinical and experimental study. Acta Orthop Scand 1967;Suppl 108:1-153.
- Mirarchi AJ, Hoyen HA, Knutson J, Lewis S. Cadaveric biomechanical analysis of the distal radioulnar joint: influence of wrist isolation on accurate measurement and the effect of ulnar styloid fracture on stability. J Hand Surg Am 2008;33:683-90.
- Nolan WB 3rd, Eaton RG. A Darrach procedure for distal ulnar pathology derangements. Clin Orthop Relat Res 1992;(275):85-9.
- Paley D, McMurtry RY, Murray JF. Dorsal dislocation of the ulnar styloid and extensor carpi ulnaris tendon into the distal radioulnar joint: the empty sulcus sign. J Hand Surg Am 1987;12:1029-32.
- Ekenstam F, Hagert CG. Anatomical studies on the geometry and stability of the distal radio ulnar joint. Scand J Plast Reconstr Surg 1985;19:17-25.
- 18. Garcia-Elias M. Soft-tissue anatomy and relationships about the distal ulna. Hand Clin 1998;14:165-76.
- Walker LG. Stabilization of the distal radioulnar joint after ulnar styloid nonunion using Mitek anchors. Orthop Rev 1994;23:769-72.
- Ward LD, Ambrose CG, Masson MV, Levaro F. The role of the distal radioulnar ligaments, interosseous membrane, and joint capsule in distal radioulnar joint stability. J Hand Surg Am 2000;25:341-51.
- 21. Lindau T, Hagberg L, Adlercreutz C, Jonsson K, Aspenberg P. Distal radioulnar instability is an independent worsening factor in distal radial fractures. Clin Orthop Relat Res 2000;(376):229-35.
- Axelrod TS. Management of complex dislocations of the distal radioulnar joint. Clin Orthop Relat Res 1997;(341): 183-91.
- 23. Adlercreutz C, Aspenberg P. Peripheral tears of the triangular fibrocartilage complex cause distal radioulnar joint instability after distal radial fractures. J Hand Surg Am 2000;25:464-8.
- 24. Sammer DM, Shah HM, Shauver MJ, Chung KC. The effect of ulnar styloid fractures on patient-rated outcomes after volar locking plating of distal radius fractures. J Hand Surg Am 2009;34:1595-602.