# On the Solutions of a Fourth Order Difference Equation 

Raafat Abo-Zeid ${ }^{1}$<br>${ }^{1}$ Department of Basic Science, The Higher Institute for Engineering \& Technology, Al-Obour, Cairo, Egypt

## Article Info

Keywords: difference equation, invariant set, forbidden set, convergence. 2010 AMS: 39A20.
Received: 16 April 2021
Accepted: 18 June 2021
Available online: 30 June 2021


#### Abstract

In this paper, we solve and study the global behavior of the well defined solutions of the difference equation $$
x_{n+1}=\frac{x_{n} x_{n-3}}{A x_{n-2}+B x_{n-3}}, \quad n=0,1, \ldots
$$


where $A, B>0$ and the initial values $x_{-i}, i \in\{0,1,2,3\}$ are real numbers.

## 1. Introduction

In [1], we determined an explicit formula for the solutions of the fourth order difference equation

$$
x_{n+1}=\frac{x_{n} x_{n-2}}{a x_{n-2}+b x_{n-3}}, n=0,1, \ldots
$$

where $a, b$ are positive real numbers and the initial conditions $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_{0}$ are real numbers.
In [2] and [8], we determined the forbidden set and introduced an explicit formula for the solutions of each of the two fourth order difference equations (respectively)

$$
x_{n+1}=\frac{a x_{n} x_{n-2}}{-b x_{n}+c x_{n-3}}, n=0,1, \ldots
$$

and

$$
x_{n+1}=\frac{a x_{n} x_{n-2}}{b x_{n}+c x_{n-3}}, n=0,1, \ldots
$$

where $a, b, c$ are positive real numbers and the initial conditions $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_{0}$ are real numbers.
In [10], the authors studied the qualitative analysis of the fourth order difference equation

$$
x_{n+1}=a x_{n-1}+\frac{b x_{n-1}}{c x_{n-1}-d x_{n-3}}, n=0,1, \ldots
$$

where $a, b, c, d$ are positive real numbers and the initial conditions $x_{-3}, x_{-2}, x_{-1}, x_{0}$ are arbitrary real numbers.
In [15], the authors obtained the solutions of the fourth order difference equation

$$
x_{n+1}=\frac{x_{n} x_{n-3}}{x_{n-2}\left( \pm 1 \pm x_{n} x_{n-3}\right)}, \quad n=0,1, \ldots
$$

where the initial conditions are arbitrary real numbers.
In [24], the author studied the boundedness character of the positive solutions of the fourth order difference equation

$$
x_{n+1}=\max \left\{A, \frac{x_{n}^{p}}{x_{n-3}^{p}}\right\}, n=0,1, \ldots
$$

where the parameters $A$ and $p$ are positive real numbers. For more on difference equations (See [3]- [7], [9], [11]- [14], [16]- [23]) and the references therein.

In this paper, we study the difference equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
x_{n+1}=\frac{x_{n} x_{n-3}}{A x_{n-2}+B x_{n-3}}, \quad n=0,1, \ldots \tag{1.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $A, B>0$ and the initial values $x_{-i}, i \in\{0,1,2,3\}$ are real numbers.
The transformation

$$
\begin{equation*}
z_{n}=\frac{x_{n-1}}{x_{n}}, \text { with } z_{-2}=\frac{x_{-3}}{x_{-2}}, z_{-1}=\frac{x_{-2}}{x_{-1}} \text { and } z_{0}=\frac{x_{-1}}{x_{0}} \tag{1.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

reduces Equation (1.1) into the difference equation

$$
\begin{equation*}
z_{n+1}=\frac{A}{z_{n-2}}+B, n=0,1, \ldots \tag{1.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

During this paper, we suppose that

$$
\theta_{j}=\frac{\lambda_{+}^{j}-\lambda_{-}^{j}}{\sqrt{B^{2}+4 A}}
$$

where $\lambda_{-}=\frac{B}{2}-\frac{\sqrt{B^{2}+4 A}}{2}$ and $\lambda_{+}=\frac{B}{2}+\frac{\sqrt{B^{2}+4 A}}{2}, j=0,1, \ldots$.
Let $\mu_{l}(j)=A x_{l} \theta_{j}+x_{l-1} \theta_{j+1}, l \in\{0,-1,-2\}$ and $j=0,1, \ldots$.
We give the following Lemma without proof:
Lemma 1.1. The following identities are true:

1. $A \theta_{j}+B \theta_{j+1}=\theta_{j+2}, j=0,1, \ldots$.
2. $A \mu_{l}(j)+B \mu_{l}(j+1)=\mu_{l}(j+2), l \in\{0,-1,-2\}$ and $j=0,1, \ldots$.

## 2. Solution of Equation (1.1)

In this section, we shall give two invariant sets and introduce the solution of Equation (1.1).
Consider the sets

$$
D_{+}=\left\{\left(u_{0}, u_{-1}, u_{-2}, u_{-3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{4}:-\frac{u_{0}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{3}}=\frac{u_{-1}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2}}=-\frac{u_{-2}}{\lambda_{+} / A}=u_{-3}\right\}
$$

and

$$
D_{-}=\left\{\left(u_{0}, u_{-1}, u_{-2}, u_{-3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{4}:-\frac{u_{0}}{\left(\lambda_{-} / A\right)^{3}}=\frac{u_{-1}}{\left(\lambda_{-} / A\right)^{2}}=-\frac{u_{-2}}{\lambda_{-} / A}=u_{-3}\right\}
$$

Theorem 2.1. The two sets $D_{+}$and $D_{-}$are invariant sets for Equation (1.1).
Proof. Let $\left(x_{0}, x_{-1}, x_{-2}, x_{-3}\right) \in D_{+}$. We show that $\left(x_{n}, x_{n-1}, x_{n-2}, x_{n-3}\right) \in D_{+}$for each $n \in \mathbb{N}$. The proof is by induction on $n$. The point $\left(x_{0}, x_{-1}, x_{-2}, x_{-3}\right) \in D_{+}$implies

$$
\left.-\frac{x_{0}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{3}}=\frac{x_{-1}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2}}=-\frac{x_{-2}}{\lambda_{+} / A}=x_{-3}\right\}
$$

Now for $n=1$, we have

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{1} & =\frac{x_{0} x_{-3}}{A x_{-2}+B x_{-3}}=\frac{-\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2} x_{-2}\left(A / \lambda_{+}\right) x_{-2}}{A x_{-2}-B\left(A / \lambda_{+}\right) x_{-2}} \\
& =-\frac{1}{A^{2}} \frac{\lambda_{+} x_{-2}}{1-B / \lambda_{+}}=-\frac{1}{\left(A / \lambda_{+}\right)^{3}} x_{-2}
\end{aligned}
$$

Then we have

$$
-\frac{x_{1}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{3}}=\frac{x_{0}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2}}=-\frac{x_{-1}}{\lambda_{+} / A}=x_{-2}
$$

This implies that $\left(x_{1}, x_{0}, x_{-1}, x_{-2}\right) \in D_{+}$.
Suppose now that for a certain $n \in \mathbb{N},\left(x_{n}, x_{n-1}, x_{n-2}, x_{n-3}\right) \in D_{+}$. That is

$$
-\frac{x_{n}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{3}}=\frac{x_{n-1}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2}}=-\frac{x_{n-2}}{\lambda_{+} / A}=x_{n-3}
$$

Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{n+1} & =\frac{x_{n} x_{n-3}}{A x_{n-2}+B x_{n-3}}=\frac{-\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2} x_{n-2}\left(A / \lambda_{+}\right) x_{n-2}}{A x_{n-2}-B\left(A / \lambda_{+}\right) x_{n-2}} \\
& =-\frac{1}{A^{2}} \frac{\lambda_{+} x_{n-2}}{1-B / \lambda_{+}}=-\frac{1}{\left(A / \lambda_{+}\right)^{3}} x_{n-2}
\end{aligned}
$$

Then we have

$$
-\frac{x_{n+1}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{3}}=\frac{x_{n}}{\left(\lambda_{+} / A\right)^{2}}=-\frac{x_{n-1}}{\lambda_{+} / A}=x_{n-2}
$$

This means that the point $\left(x_{n+1}, x_{n}, x_{n-1}, x_{n-2}\right) \in D_{+}$. Therefore, $D_{+}$is an invariant set for Equation (1.1).
By similar way, we can show that $D_{-}$is an invariant set for Equation (1.1).
This completes the proof.

Theorem 2.2. Let $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ be a well defined solution of Equation (1.1). Then

$$
x_{n}=\left\{\begin{align*}
\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}\left(\frac{n+2}{3}\right) \mu_{-1}\left(\frac{n-1}{3}\right) \mu_{0}\left(\frac{n-1}{3}\right)}, & n=1,4, \ldots  \tag{2.1}\\
\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}\left(\frac{n+1}{3}\right) \mu_{-1}\left(\frac{n+1}{3}\right) \mu_{0}\left(\frac{n-2}{3}\right)}, & n=2,5, \ldots \\
\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) \mu_{-1}\left(\frac{n}{3}\right) \mu_{0}\left(\frac{n}{3}\right)}, & n=3,6, \ldots
\end{align*}\right.
$$

where $v=x_{0} x_{-1} x_{-2} x_{-3}$.
Proof. We can write the given solution (2.1) as

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{3 m+1} & =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m+1) \mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)} \\
x_{3 m+2} & =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m+1) \mu_{-1}(m+1) \mu_{0}(m)}
\end{aligned}
$$

and

$$
x_{3 m+3}=\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m+1) \mu_{-1}(m+1) \mu_{0}(m+1)}
$$

When $m=0$,

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{1} & =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(1) \mu_{-1}(0) \mu_{0}(0)}=\frac{v}{\left(A x_{-2}+B x_{-3}\right) x_{-2} x_{-1}} \\
& =\frac{x_{0} x_{-3}}{A x_{-2}+B x_{-3}}, \\
x_{2} & =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(1) \mu_{-1}(1) \mu_{0}(0)}=\frac{v}{\left(A x_{-2}+B x_{-3}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+B x_{-2}\right) x_{-1}} \\
& =\frac{x_{1} x_{-2}}{A x_{-1}+B x_{-2}}
\end{aligned}
$$

and

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{3} & =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(1) \mu_{-1}(1) \mu_{0}(1)}=\frac{v}{\left(A x_{-2}+B x_{-3}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+B x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{0}+B x_{-1}\right)} \\
& =\frac{x_{0} x_{-3}}{A x_{-2}+B x_{-3}} \frac{x_{-2} x_{-1}}{\left(A x_{-1}+B x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{0}+B x_{-1}\right)} \\
& =\frac{x_{1} x_{-2}}{A x_{-1}+B x_{-2}} \frac{x_{-1}}{A x_{0}+B x_{-1}}=\frac{x_{2} x_{-1}}{A x_{0}+B x_{-1}} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Suppose that the result is true for $m>0$.
Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{x_{3 m} x_{3 m-3}}{A x_{3 m-2}+B x_{3 m-3}} & =\frac{\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m) \mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)} \frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m-1) \mu_{-1}(m-1) \mu_{0}(m-1)}}{\frac{A v}{\mu_{-2}(m) \mu_{-1}(m-1) \mu_{0}(m-1)}+\frac{v v}{\mu_{-2}(m-1) \mu_{-1}(m-1) \mu_{0}(m-1)}} \\
& =\frac{\frac{v}{\mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)}}{A \mu_{-2}(m-1)+B \mu_{-2}(m)} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Using Lemma (1.1), we have

$$
A \mu_{-2}(m-1)+B \mu_{-2}(m)=\mu_{-2}(m+1)
$$

Then

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \frac{x_{3 m} x_{3 m-3}}{A x_{3 m-2}+B x_{3 m-3}} \\
& =\frac{\frac{v}{\mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)}}{A \mu_{-2}(m-1)+B \mu_{-2}(m)} \\
& =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m+1) \mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)}=x_{3 m+1}
\end{aligned}
$$

Similarly we can show that

$$
\frac{x_{3 m+1} x_{3 m-2}}{A x_{3 m-1}+B x_{3 m-2}}=x_{3 m+2} \text { and } \frac{x_{3 m+2} x_{3 m-1}}{A x_{3 m}+B x_{3 m-1}}=x_{3 m+3}
$$

This completes the proof.

## 3. Global behavior of Equation (1.1)

In this section, we introduce the forbidden set and determine the global behavior of Equation (1.1). Clear that, if $x_{0}=0$ and $x_{-1} x_{-2} x_{-3} \neq 0$, then $x_{4}$ is undefined. If $x_{-1}=0$ and $x_{0} x_{-2} x_{-3} \neq 0$, then $x_{7}$ is undefined. If $x_{-2}=0$ and $x_{0} x_{-1} x_{-3} \neq 0$, then $x_{6}$ is undefined. Finally, if $x_{-3}=0$ and $x_{0} x_{-1} x_{-2} \neq 0$, then $x_{5}$ is undefined.
The following result provides the forbidden set of Equation (1.1).
Theorem 3.1. The forbidden set of equation (1.1) as

$$
\begin{aligned}
F= & \bigcup_{i=0}^{3}\left\{\left(u_{0}, u_{-1}, u_{-2}, u_{-3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{4}: u_{-i}=0\right\} \cup \bigcup_{m=1}^{\infty}\left\{\left(u_{0}, u_{-1}, u_{-2}, u_{-3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{4}: u_{0}=-\frac{u_{-1}}{A} \frac{\theta_{m+1}}{\theta_{m}}\right\} \cup \\
& \bigcup_{m=1}^{\infty}\left\{\left(u_{0}, u_{-1}, u_{-2}, u_{-3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{4}: u_{-1}=-\frac{u_{-2}}{A} \frac{\theta_{m+1}}{\theta_{m}}\right\} \cup \bigcup_{m=1}^{\infty}\left\{\left(u_{0}, u_{-1}, u_{-2}, u_{-3}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{4}: u_{-2}=-\frac{u_{-3}}{A} \frac{\theta_{m+1}}{\theta_{m}}\right\} .
\end{aligned}
$$

Theorem 3.2. Assume that $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ is a well defined solution of Equation (1.1). Then the following statements are true:

1. If $A+B>1$, then the solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ converges to zero.
2. If $A+B<1$, then the solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ is unbounded.

Proof. We can write $\theta_{j}=\lambda_{+}^{j} \frac{\left(1-\left(\frac{\lambda_{-}}{\lambda_{+}}\right)^{j}\right)}{\sqrt{B^{2}+4 A}}$.

1. If $A+B>1$, then $\lambda_{+}>1$. That is $\theta_{m} \rightarrow \infty$ as $m \rightarrow \infty$. This implies that

$$
x_{3 m}=\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m) \mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)} \rightarrow 0 \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty
$$

Similarly, we can show that

$$
x_{3 m+1} \rightarrow 0 \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty \text { and } x_{3 m+2} \rightarrow 0 \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty
$$

For (2), it is enough to note that $\lambda_{+}<1$ when $A+B<1$. This completes the proof.

Theorem 3.3. Assume that $A+B=1$, then every well defined solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ of Equation (1.1) converges to a finite limit.
Proof. When $A+B=1$, we have $\lambda_{+}=1$. Then

$$
\mu_{-j}(m)=A x_{-j} \theta_{m}+x_{-j-1} \theta_{m+1} \rightarrow \frac{A x_{-j}+x_{-j-1}}{\sqrt{B^{2}+4 A}} \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty, j \in\{0,1,2\}
$$

This implies that

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{3 m} & =\frac{v}{\mu_{-2}(m) \mu_{-1}(m) \mu_{0}(m)} \rightarrow \\
& \frac{v\left(B^{2}+4 A\right)^{\frac{3}{2}}}{\left(A x_{0}+x_{-1}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{-2}+x_{-3}\right)} \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty .
\end{aligned}
$$

Similarly, we have that

$$
x_{3 m+1} \rightarrow \frac{v\left(B^{2}+4 A\right)^{\frac{3}{2}}}{\left(A x_{0}+x_{-1}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{-2}+x_{-3}\right)} \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty
$$

and

$$
x_{3 m+2} \rightarrow \frac{v\left(B^{2}+4 A\right)^{\frac{3}{2}}}{\left(A x_{0}+x_{-1}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{-2}+x_{-3}\right)} \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty
$$

Therefore, the solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ of Equation (1.1) converges to

$$
\frac{v\left(B^{2}+4 A\right)^{\frac{3}{2}}}{\left(A x_{0}+x_{-1}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{-2}+x_{-3}\right)} \text { as } m \rightarrow \infty
$$

This completes the proof.
Example (1) Figure 1. shows that, if $A=0.2, B=0.4(A+B<1)$, then a solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ of equation (1.1) with $x_{-3}=3, x_{-2}=2$, $x_{-1}=-1$ and $x_{0}=3$ is unbounded.
Example (2) Figure 2. shows that, if $A=1.6, B=0.3(A+B>1)$, then a solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ of equation (1.1) with $x_{-3}=3, x_{-2}=2$, $x_{-1}=-1$ and $x_{0}=3$ converges to zero.
Example (3) Figure 3. shows that, if $A=0.62, B=0.38(A+B=1)$, then a solution $\left\{x_{n}\right\}_{n=-3}^{\infty}$ of equation (1.1) with $x_{-3}=-1, x_{-2}=1.2$, $x_{-1}=2.5$ and $x_{0}=1.7$ converges to

$$
\frac{v\left(B^{2}+4 A\right)^{\frac{3}{2}}}{\left(A x_{0}+x_{-1}\right)\left(A x_{-1}+x_{-2}\right)\left(A x_{-2}+x_{-3}\right)} \simeq 8.666
$$



## Acknowledgements

The authors would like to express their sincere thanks to the editor and the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments and suggestions.

## Funding

There is no funding for this work.

## Availability of data and materials

Not applicable.

## Competing interests

The authors declare that they have no competing interests.

## Author's contributions

All authors contributed equally to the writing of this paper. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

## References

[1] R. Abo-Zeid, On a fourth order rational difference equation, Tbilisi Math. J., 12 (4) (2019), $71-79$.
[2] R. Abo-Zeid, Global behavior of a fourth order difference equation with quadratic term, Bol. Soc. Mat. Mexicana, 25 (2019), 187 - 194.
[3] R. Abo-Zeid, Global behavior of two third order rational difference equations with quadratic terms, Math. Slovaca, 69 (1) (2019), $147-158$.
[4] R. Abo-Zeid, Behavior of solutions of a higher order difference equation, Alabama J. Math., 42 (2018), 1-10.
[5] R. Abo-Zeid, On the solutions of a higher order difference equation, Georgian Math. J., DOI:10.1515/gmj-2018-0008.
[6] R. Abo-Zeid, Forbidden sets and stability in some rational difference equations, J. Difference Equ. Appl., 24 (2) (2018), 220 - 239.
[7] R. Abo-Zeid, Global behavior of a higher order rational difference equation, Filomat 30(12) (2016), 3265 - 3276.
[8] R. Abo-Zeid, Global behavior of a fourth order difference equation, Acta Comment. Univ. Tartu. Math., 18(2) (2014), 211 - 220.
[9] R. P. Agarwal and E. M. Elsayed, Periodicity and stability of solutions of higher order rational difference equation, Adv. Stud. Contemp. Math., 17 (2) (2008), 181-201.
[10] H. S. Alayachi, M. S. M. Noorani and E. M. Elsayed, Qualitative analysis of a fourth order difference equation, J. Appl. Anal. Comput., 10 (4) (2020), 1343-1354.
[11] A.M. Amleh, E. Camouzis and G. Ladas On the dynamics of a rational difference equation, Part 2, Int. J. Difference Equ., 3(2) (2008), $195-225$.
[12] A.M. Amleh, E. Camouzis and G. Ladas On the dynamics of a rational difference equation, Part 1, Int. J. Difference Equ., 3(1) (2008), 1 - 35.
[13] F. Balibrea and A. Cascales, On forbidden sets, J. Difference Equ. Appl. 21(10) (2015), 974 - 996.
[14] E. Camouzis and G. Ladas, Dynamics of Third Order Rational Difference Equations: With Open Problems and Conjectures, Chapman \& Hall/CRC, Boca Raton, 2008.
[15] H. El-Metwally and E. M. Elsayed, Qualitative study of solutions of some difference equations, Abstr. Appl. Anal., Volume 2012, Article ID 248291,16 pages, 2012.
[16] M. Gümüş, The global asymptotic stability of a system of difference equations, J. Difference Equ. Appl., 24 (6) (2018), 976 - 991.
[17] M. Gümüş and Ö. Öcalan, Global asymptotic stability of a nonautonomous difference equation, J. Appl. Math., Volume 2014, Article ID 395954, 5 pages, 2014.
[18] E.A. Jankowski and M.R.S. Kulenović, Attractivity and global stability for linearizable difference equations, Comput. Math. Appl. 57 (2009), 1592-1607.
[19] C.M. Kent and H. Sedaghat, Global attractivity in a quadratic-linear rational difference equation with delay, J. Difference Equ. Appl., 15 (10) (2009), 913-925.
[20] R. Khalaf-Allah, Asymptotic behavior and periodic nature of two difference equations, Ukrainian Math. J., 61 (6) (2009), 988 - 993.
[21] V. L. Kocic, G. Ladas, Global Behavior of Nonlinear Difference Equations of Higher Order with applications, Kluwer Academic, Dordrecht, 1993.
[22] M. R. S. Kulenović and M. Mehuljić, Global behavior of some rational second order difference equations, Int. J. Difference Equ., 7 (2) (2012), $153-162$.
[23] M.R.S. Kulenović and G. Ladas, Dynamics of Second Order Rational Difference Equations: With Open Problems and Conjectures, Chapman and Hall/HRC, Boca Raton, 2002.
[24] S. Stević, Boundedness character of a fourth order nonlinear difference equation, Chaos, Sol. Frac., 40 (2009), 2364-2369.

