



# Turkish Journal of Diaspora Studies

ISSN: 2717-7408 (Print and Online)  
Journal homepage: [tjds.org.tr](http://tjds.org.tr)

## Book Review

Gül Ecem Çam

**To cite this article:** Gül Ecem Çam (2021) [Review of the book *Exporting Workers: The Turkish Case*, by Suzanne Paine], *Turkish Journal of Diaspora Studies*, 1(2), 162-164, DOI: 10.52241/TJDS.2021.0029

**To link to this article:** <https://doi.org/10.52241/TJDS.2021.0029>



© 2021 Gül Ecem Çam. Published with license by Migration Research Foundation



Published online: 30 September 2021




Submit your article to this journal [↗](http://tjds.org.tr)

Full Terms & Conditions of access and use can be found at  
[tjds.org.tr](http://tjds.org.tr)

## Book Review

Suzanne Paine, **Exporting Workers: The Turkish Case**, Cambridge University Press, London, 1974, pp. 227, \$43.88 (Hardcover), ISBN 0521098793

Gül Ecem Çam 

German-Turkish Masters Program in Social Sciences, Humboldt University of Berlin, Berlin, Germany

Since 1961, worker export flows have been a prominent aspect in most European countries, notably Germany, in the case of Turkey (p. 111). These flows mainly occurred from less developed countries to developed countries (p. 13) and most foreign workers were temporarily imported with no promise of permanent settlement (p. 5). *Exporting Workers: The Turkish Case* by Suzanne Paine uses surveys and reports to examine the social and economic situations of workers who migrated to Germany as guest workers under the *Gastarbeiterprogramm* labor migration contract signed between Turkey and the Federal Republic of Germany. The book widely reviews the process of migration and contains aspects of before, during, and after their migration. The German Federal Labor Office and the Turkish State Planning Organization are the two main reference sources. This research aims to analyze the impact of the worker export contract between Turkey and Germany on Turkey's economic development and on the life of migrant workers (p. 8). The research combines quantitative and qualitative analysis with coherent methodology throughout its five chapters.

Chapter 1 focuses on the labor migration policy in Western Europe and Turkey in chronological order, explaining the background policies, post-war migration dynamics in Western Europe, and the need for labor migrants. The chapter covers the procedures of the temporary workers' export system and the magnitude of migration flows from 1961 until 1973. The evaluation of Turkish economic progress in line with the state development plans from the 1960s through the 1970s are briefly explained and include tables, but the outcomes of the period were not discussed in the chapter. The author claims that Turkey's labor exports, especially temporary migrant workers' exclusion from the unemployment rate calculations in Turkey and the inflows of remittances to the country made this policy appealing for the state (p. 73).

The second chapter focuses on the economic effects of a developing country expor-

ting workers by examining the case of Turkey (p. 75). The author uses numerical analyses in this section and argues that the economic effects of exporting the labor force on the home country should not only be considered with macroeconomic variables but also political, social, and cultural variables (p. 104).

The third chapter contains an in-depth analysis of the social, cultural, demographic, and economic aspects of migration and constitutes the core part of the book. It examines the disparities between exported workers and workers in Turkey between 1960 and 1974, focusing on the socio-economic aspects of the Turkish experience (p. 105). First, the author gives brief information about current worker exports and those who returned to their home countries. She discusses the socio-economic situation in following aspects: (1) stocks and flows of Turkish migrant workers, (2) the process for potential migrant workers, (3) socio-economic features, (4) living standards and careers, and (5) details about Turkish immigrants returning to their homeland. In these categories, 52 aspects are addressed with relevant data. These aspects are necessary, not only for living standards and socio-economic status of exported workers (population information, etc.), but also for specific factors such as, the type of investments and workplaces of workers, knowledge of German, and comparisons between women and men workers. During their stay in the host country, unskilled migrant workers mostly worked in the manufacturing and construction sectors (p. 235). This condition shifted from unskilled and unemployed workers to skilled and high-income workers as the procedures for immigration applicants evolved over time. Paine criticizes the workers' professional and educational conditions who migrate to Germany: "skilled and high-income workers rather than unemployed and unskilled workers" (p. 131). According to Paine, this policy led to educated and trained Turkish workers being in the migration flow to Germany at a time when German workers were not educated and trained (p. 132). Moreover, there was no age limitation for women, which increased the number qualified women workers (p. 131), and more than three-quarters of women were employed in the manufacturing sector (p. 235).


The fourth part of the book addresses the book's central theme, the impact of labor exports on the Turkish economy. In this section, socio-economic factors in the third section are combined with the macroeconomic factors examined in the second section, and the effects of labor export on economic development in the homeland is examined in a broader way. As mentioned in the first chapter, the attractiveness of decreasing the unemployment rate and increasing foreign currency entering the country positively affected Turkey's economic development, and many other home countries were willing to export workers (p. 73). In this chapter, Paine begins to discuss the effects of exporting labor, especially skilled labor, and the problems it began to cause with losing skilled labor in Turkey in 1973, because it takes up to ten years to educate and train workers (p. 247). Another argument made by the author on this

issue is that educated immigrants can earn higher wages in the host country and save more money for their families, but it also reduces the likelihood of workers returning to their homeland (p. 251).

The last part of the book covers the problems, policies, and lessons learned from Turkish labor exports between 1961-1973 (p. 287). This chapter considers the negative impact on the GDP parallel with the decreasing amount of remittances, as family unifications increased in the recipient country. Paine points out a shortage in this process because the current situation of the workers who returned to their homeland is unknown (p. 287). There is no data on returning workers in the content of the book, so observations are based on assumptions (p. 288) and the assumptions do not clearly answer how returning workers are integrated into Turkey's economy (p. 296).

Even though the book accomplishes its goal effectively, it does have a few shortcomings. Paine portrays labor migration as a hypothetical phenomenon resulting from post-war circumstances rather than an enduring feature of the Western order. Despite the absence of a coherent conclusion, the book is essential reading for those interested in labor migration and its effects that should be considered by policymakers, on both the home and host countries. Another limitation of the research is that it only examines the first ten years of the migration experience. The methodological approach used in this book can be an excellent example for further studies that are needed to analyze current third-generation migrants in Western Europe, who continue to live in Germany. Authorities had plans for the first and second generations to return, however, most third-generation migrants are German citizens. Research can be done with prospective and up-to-date that includes three migration generations and their interactions with other segments of society. The quality of life for immigrants living in Germany today can be examined with a comparison to the countries' economies and with respect to currency exchange and inflation rates, as well.

## Orcid

Gül Ecem Çam  <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6062-2360>