

Evaluation of Values Education in the Preschool Curriculum during the Pandemic through Illuminative Evaluation Model

Pandemi Döneminde Okul Öncesi Eğitim Programındaki Değerler Eğitiminin Aydınlatıcı Değerlendirme Modeli ile Değerlendirilmesi

[Corresponding Author](#)

Mehmet Altın / ORCID ID: 0000-0002-3825-6728
mehmet.altin@adu.edu.tr

Fatma Altın / ORCID ID: 0000-0002-8503-5186
fatnaaltin09@gmail.com

Abstract	Özet
<p>Every society has its own values, and individuals adapt to society by realizing their social and emotional development with these values. While realizing the acquisition of values, many unexpected difficulties may be encountered. Undoubtedly, one of the biggest events of this century is the pandemic, which has an impact on the world. In this study, it was aimed to evaluate values education in the preschool curriculum during the coronavirus (COVID-19) pandemic through "Illuminative Evaluation Model". In the research, case study method was employed. The study group of the research consisted of a preschool located in a disadvantaged area in Incirliova district of Aydın province and the preschool teachers working at this school during the 2020-2021 academic year. The school had a total of 56 students and nine teachers. The data was collected through triangulation method. Researchers made observations to describe the case, analyzed the lesson plans and interviewed with the teachers at school. The data was analyzed and interpreted by applying the content analysis method. The data collected from the research were interpreted according to the steps of "observation", "inquiry" and "explanation", which were the steps of the illuminative evaluation model. When a general evaluation of values education in distance education was made, it was concluded that the lack of technological infrastructure caused the students to miss the lessons and activities. In addition, the fact that the parents did not support the students to attend the lessons and to fulfill the activities negatively affected children's learning experiences. Thus, the problems experienced in the content and methodology elements prevented the full implementation of the evaluation of students' progress.</p> <p>Keywords: Illuminative evaluation model, preschool curriculum, values education</p>	<p>Her toplumun kendine özgü değerleri vardır ve bireyler sosyal ve duygusal gelişimlerini bu değerlerle gerçekleştirerek topluma uyum sağlarlar. Değerlerin kazanılması gerçekleştirilirken pek çok beklenmedik zorluklarla karşılaşılabilir. Bu yüzyılın en büyük olaylarından biri de kuşkusuz dünyayı etkisi altına alan pandemidir. Bu çalışmada, koronavirus (COVID-19) pandemisi sürecinde okul öncesi eğitim programında yer alan değerler eğitiminin "Aydınlatıcı Değerlendirme Modeli" ile değerlendirilmesi amaçlanmıştır. Araştırmada durum çalışması yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Araştırmanın çalışma grubunu 2020-2021 eğitim öğretim yılında Aydın ili Incirliova ilçesinde dezavantajlı bir bölgede bulunan anaokulu ve okulda görev yapan okul öncesi öğretmenleri oluşturmuştur. Okulun toplam 56 öğrencisi ve 9 öğretmeni vardır. Veriler, çeşitleme yöntemiyle toplanmıştır. Araştırmacılar vakayı betimlemek için gözlemler yapmış, ders planlarını analiz etmiş ve okuldaki öğretmenlerle görüşmeler yapmıştır. Veriler içerik analizi yöntemi uygulanarak analiz edilmiştir. Araştırmadan elde edilen veriler, aydınlatıcı değerlendirme modelinin basamakları olan "gözlem", "sorgulama" ve "açıklama" adımlarına göre yorumlanmıştır. Uzaktan eğitimde değerler eğitimi ile ilgili genel bir değerlendirme yapıldığında teknolojik altyapı eksikliği öğrencilerin ders ve etkinlikleri kaçırmalarına neden olduğu sonucuna ulaşılmıştır. Ayrıca velilerin öğrencilerin derslere katılımını ve etkinlikleri gerçekleştirmelerini desteklememesi çocukların öğrenme deneyimlerini olumsuz etkilemiştir. Dolayısıyla içerik ve eğitim durumları unsurlarında yaşanan sorunlar, değerlendirme unsurunun tam olarak uygulanmasına engel olmuştur.</p> <p>Keywords: Aydınlatıcı değerlendirme modeli, okul öncesi eğitim programı, değerler eğitimi</p>

Extended Summary

Giriş

Her toplumun kendine özgü değerleri vardır ve bireyler sosyal ve duygusal gelişimlerini bu değerlerle gerçekleştirerek topluma uyum sağlarlar. Toplumlar bu değerlerin bireylere kazandırılması için büyük emekler vermektedir. Bu yolda başarıya ulaşmanın temel yolu ise eğitimden geçmektedir. Özellikle okul öncesi dönem çocuklarda bu değerlerin kazandırılması ve ileride sürdürebilmeleri için kritik bir dönemdir. Çocukların geleceğini belirleyecek olan toplumsal ve ahlaki değerlerin oluşması yaşamın ilk yıllarında başlar. Bu yüzden okul öncesinde değerler eğitimi ile ilgili çalışmaların önemi büyüktür.

Değerlerin kazanımı gerçekleştirirken birçok beklenmedik zorlukla karşılaşılabilir. Farklı yüzyıllarda meydana gelen büyük olaylar eğitim politikalarını ve anlayışını da etkilemektedir. Şüphesiz bu yüzyılın da en büyük olaylarından biri dünya geneline etkisi altına alan koronavirüs (Covid-19) pandemisi. Bu salgın ülkelerin sağlık, ekonomik, eğitim gibi birçok yapı ve sistemine doğrudan veya dolaylı olarak zarar vermiştir. Ülkeler bu zararı en aza indirmek için birçok önlem almıştır. Türkiye’de ise salgından en çok etkilenen sistemlerden biri de eğitim sistemidir. Pandemi döneminde okulların kapanmasıyla birlikte eğitim-öğretim sürecini devam ettirebilmek için en uygun yol olarak uzaktan eğitim seçilmiştir.

Uzaktan eğitimle verilen eğitimlerin başarıya ulaşip ulaşmadığının belirlenmesi programların güncel tutulabilmesi ve eksiklerinin giderilmesi açısından önemlidir. Bir programın, öğretimin veya etkinliğin etkililiğinin belirlenebilmesi için değerlendirme yapılması gerekmektedir. Değerlendirmede amaç; programın değeri üzerinde verilen kararlarda kullanılan verilerin başarılı bir şekilde toplanması ve analiz edilmesidir. Değerlendirmede araştırmacılara rehber olması ve değerlendirme işlemini daha bilimsel ve nitelikli hale getirmesi için birçok model önerilmiştir. Bu modellerden biri de aydınlatıcı değerlendirme modelidir. Bu model üç aşamadan oluşmaktadır; gözlem, sorgulama ve açıklama. Aydınlatıcı değerlendirme modeli farklı kademelerdeki programları değerlendirmek için kullanılabilir.

Okul öncesi dönemde değerler eğitimi ile ilgili çalışmalar büyük önem taşımaktadır çünkü okul öncesi eğitimin çocuklara istenilen değerleri kazandırmada kritik bir rolü vardır. Bu nedenle okul öncesi eğitimde değerler eğitiminin değerlendirilmesi, değerler eğitiminin etkililiğinin ve eğitimin uygulanması sırasında ortaya çıkan sorunların belirlenmesi açısından önemlidir. Literatür incelendiğinde değerler eğitiminin aydınlatıcı değerlendirme modeli ile değerlendirilmesine yönelik bir çalışmaya rastlanmadığı görülmüştür. Ayrıca literatürde pandemi sürecinde öğretim programlarının değerlendirilmesine yönelik çalışmalara ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır. Sonuç olarak, pandemi sürecinde değerler eğitiminin değerlendirilmesine yönelik bir çalışma literatüre katkı sağlayacaktır. Bu yüzden, bu çalışmada koronavirüs pandemisi sürecinde okul öncesi eğitim programında yer alan değerler eğitiminin Aydınlatıcı Değerlendirme Modeli ile değerlendirilmesi amaçlanmıştır.

Yöntem

Araştırmada nitel araştırma desenlerinden biri olan durum çalışması yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Durum tek bir kurum üzerine odaklandığı için araştırma bütüncül tek durum çalışması şeklinde desenlenmiştir. Araştırmanın çalışma grubunu 2020-2021 eğitim öğretim yılında Aydın ili İncirliova ilçesinde dezavantajlı bir bölgede bulunan anaokulu ve bu okulda görev yapan okul öncesi öğretmenleri oluşturmuştur. Okulun toplam 56 öğrencisi ve 9 öğretmeni vardır. Veriler çeşitleme yöntemiyle toplanmıştır. Araştırmacılar; gözlemler yapmış, ders planlarını analiz etmiş ve okuldaki öğretmenlerle görüşmeler yapmıştır. Ayrıca görüşmelerde kullanılmak üzere yarı-yapılandırılmış görüşme formu hazırlamış ve pilot uygulaması yapılmıştır. Veriler, içerik analizi tekniği uygulanarak araştırmacılar tarafından ayrı ayrı analiz edilmiş ve incelemeler karşılaştırılmıştır. Aydınlatıcı değerlendirme modelinin basamakları olan "gözlem", "sorgulama" ve "açıklama" adımlarına göre analiz edilmiş ve yorumlanmıştır.

Sonuç ve Öneriler

Hedefler belirlenirken tüm değerlere yer verilmediği, belli başlı değerler üzerinde durulduğu görülmüştür. Bunun sebebi olarak ise okul öncesinde bazı değerlerin öğrenciler tarafından anlaşılabilmesinin güç olduğu için programda yer verilmemesi yorumu yapılmıştır. Programda en çok sorunun içerik ögesinde özellikle donanım ve alt yapı anlamında olduğu anlaşılmıştır. Değerler eğitimi derslerinin eğitim durumları değerlendirilmesinde uzaktan eğitim esnasında öğretmen-öğrenci etkileşiminin çok az olduğu sonucuna ulaşılmıştır. Öğrenme sürecine aktif katılım sağlaması gerektiğine vurgu yapmıştır. Bu çalışmada öğrencilerin değerler eğitimi etkinliklerini ihmal etmelerinin en büyük sebebi olarak ailelerin öğrencilerinin eğitimini ihmal etmesi olarak belirlenmiştir. Öğrencilerin derslere katılmaması ve etkinliklerin çoğunu yansız bırakması öğretmenlerin öğrenimi değerlendirmesini yetersiz kılmıştır. Araştırma sonuçlarından bazı öneriler yapılabilir:

- Okul öncesinde ihmal edilen diğer değerlerin de kazanımına ilişkin etkinlikler yaptırılmalı,
- Dezavantajlı bölgelerde öğrencilerin uzaktan eğitime katılımlarını artırmak için donanım ve alt yapı sağlanmalı veya yüz yüze eğitimin gerçekleştirilmesi için tüm şartlar sağlanmalı,

Altın, M. & Altın, F. (2021). Evaluation of values education in the preschool curriculum during the pandemic through illuminative evaluation model. *Journal of Educational Reflections*, 5(2), 24-32.

- Pandemi döneminde diğer kademelerde de değerler eğitiminin değerlendirilmesiyle ilgili çalışmalar yürütülebilir.

INTRODUCTION

Every society has its own values, and individuals adapt to society by realizing their social and emotional development with these values. The most suitable environment to increase this development is school where values education is given (Pahl & Barrett, 2007). Values education is the process of helping individuals with gaining aimed values (Hökelekli & Gündüz, 2007). Teaching basic values so that the individual can have a healthy personality is an issue that must be addressed in preschool education, which is the first step of education (Oktay, 1999). Preschool period is the years when the development of affective behaviors of a child begins to increase. Behaviors acquired in childhood shape the personality, attitudes, habits, beliefs and value judgments of the individual in adulthood (Tanriverdi, 2012). The formation of social and moral values that will determine the future of children begins in the first years of life.

Value education should begin from early childhood in order for the desired values to be formed. In this respect, values education in preschool education has a critical role in terms of adopting values and developing positive personality by living in accordance with these values (Karakaş, 2015). Therefore, studies on values education in preschool are of great importance. Many studies have been carried out on values education in preschool level: Yazar and Erkuş (2013), Ogelman and Sarıkaya (2015), Uzun and Köse (2017), Kozikoğlu (2018) and Smilgiene, Masiliauskine and Lenkauskaitė (2020) tried to determine the attitudes of preschool teachers towards values education and their opinions about values education in preschool education; Ülavere and Tammik (2017) aimed to determine the values of preschool education institutions and teachers' and parents' conception of value education; Aljabreen and Lash (2016) examined value education in preschool education in Saudi Arabia while Mustafa and Azman (2013) investigated value education in preschool education in Malaysia. Gündüz, Aktepe, Uzunoğlu and Gündüz (2017) researched how educational games were effective on adoption of values by preschool children; Oruç (2010) examined moral development and values education in the preschool period; Karakuş (2015) studied to learn whether cartoons that target preschool-age contribute to the values education; Yaka, Yalçın and Denizli (2014) determined parents' views related to preferential values in preschool education; Sigurdardottir and Einarsdottir (2016) realized an action research in Iceland in order to develop consensus about values and value education.

While realizing the acquisition of values, many unexpected difficulties may be encountered. Major events that took place in different centuries also affect education policies and understanding. Undoubtedly, one of the biggest events of this century is the pandemic, which has an impact on the world. This epidemic has directly or indirectly damaged many structures and systems of countries such as health, economy and education. One of the systems most affected by the epidemic in Turkey is the education system. With the closure of schools during the pandemic period, distance education has been chosen as the most appropriate way to continue the education process. On 23rd March 2020, distance education was implemented at all education levels, from preschool education to universities. Thus, values education was given to preschool children through distance education.

To determine the effectiveness of a curriculum, instruction or activity, evaluation process is required. According to Uşun (2012), evaluation can be defined as the decision-making process about any feature of a curriculum which is developed by using scientific research processes based on systematic data collection and analysis such as its accuracy, actuality, adequacy, suitability, efficiency, effectiveness, usefulness and success. Evaluation in education emerges as a criterion used to reveal whether the desired behavioral changes achieve the expected results (Yüksel and Sağlam, 2014). Evaluation is an indispensable tool for determining needs, correcting errors, reorganizing and updating curriculums, as innovations are inevitable and the curriculums should be able to meet the demands of the age (Bantwini, 2010).

Illuminative Evaluation Model

The purpose of the evaluation is to successfully collect and analyze data in order to decide the value of the curriculum (Wood, 2001). One of the evaluation models used in curriculum evaluation is the illuminative curriculum evaluation model developed by Parlett and Hamilton (1972). The purpose of the model is to reveal the process of a new curriculum, positive and negative aspects of the curriculum and effects of the curriculum on students (Uşun, 2012). Cahapay (2020) asserts illuminative evaluation model to effectively uncover concealed aspects that indicate discrepancies within the curriculum.

Illuminative evaluation is carried out in three stages as observation, inquiry and explanation (Sönmez and Alacapınar, 2015). During the observation phase, observations can be made, while pre-interview and document analyses are performed. During the inquiry phase, the ideas and thoughts of the participants can be received through observations, interviews and questionnaires. In the explanation phase, raw data are classified and comments are made. At this stage, explanations are made by reaching general principles and revealing cause and effect relationships (Parlett and Hamilton, 1972).

Altın, M. & Altın, F. (2021). Evaluation of values education in the preschool curriculum during the pandemic through illuminative evaluation model. *Journal of Educational Reflections*, 5(2), 24-32.

The illuminating evaluation model can be used to evaluate curriculum at different levels. By using the illuminative evaluation model, Chirwa (2013) evaluated expressive arts curriculum, Çalışkan (2014) evaluated Science Teaching Methods curriculum, Alderman (2014) evaluated high school curriculum, Gunio (2015) evaluated hidden curriculum in preschool education, Garwood (2015) evaluated special education curriculum, Özüdoğru and Adıgüzel (2016) evaluated the second grade English curriculum of primary school and Yoon, Park and Mcmillan (2017) evaluated the flipped learning experiences of 3rd grade students at Nursing Program.

As mentioned before, studies on values education in preschool are of great importance because preschool education has a critical role for children to adopt desired values. Thus, the evaluation of value education in preschool education is crucial to determine the effectiveness of the value education and problems emerging during the implementation of the education. When literature was reviewed, it was seen that there was no study on the evaluation of the values education via illuminative evaluation model. In addition, there is a lack of studies on evaluation of curriculums during the pandemic. As conclusion, a study on evaluation of values education during pandemic would contribute to the literature. Hence, this study aimed to evaluate values education in the preschool curriculum during the coronavirus pandemic through Illuminative Evaluation Model.

METHOD

In the research, the case study method was employed. The case study, one of the qualitative research methods, is a study aiming to describe and reveal current situations in real life (Creswell, 2013). The case study is a research method that examines the researched phenomenon in its own life context, and is used in situations where the boundaries between the phenomenon and its environment are not clearly defined, and there is more than one source of evidence or data. In the case study, which constitutes the research design, longitudinal and in-depth analysis is made on an event or situation, instead of dealing with a limited number of variables in accordance with strict rules by using large samples (Flyvbjerg, 2006). In case studies, the case differs from an individual to a community at a village, from an event to a specific curriculum (Glesne, 2013). In the current study, "the case of values education curriculum at the time of the pandemic" was discussed as the case of the study. There are several types of case studies that are used to provide in-depth information about the truth and to provide practical benefits in practice (Akar Vural & Cenkseven 2005). As the case of the present research was a case in a single school (Yin, 2009), the research was designed through a holistic single-case study method.

Study Group

The study group of the research consisted of a preschool located in a disadvantaged area in Incirliova district of Aydın province and nine preschool teachers working at the school in the 2020-2021 academic year. The school administration allowed the research to be carried out at the school, and all of the teachers voluntarily participated in the study. More details about the school and the area were given in the observation stage of chapter "Findings and Interpretation".

Data Collection and Analysis

The data was collected through triangulation method. Researchers made observations to describe the case, analyzed the lesson plans and interviewed with the teachers at school. For face-to-face interviews with teachers, a semi-structured interview form was developed by researchers, and a pilot study was realized. After the pilot study, two questions had minor revisions in order to prevent misunderstandings. The data collected during main implementations was analyzed by every researcher using the content analysis method. The main goal of content analysis is to reveal the concepts and relationships in order to explain the obtained data (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2016). Also, findings were compared for the consistency of the findings, and several samples of the raw data were given below the findings. Analyzed data were presented with frequency distributions (f), which was used to quantify the findings (Balci, 2015). Then, the findings were interpreted in terms of three elements of illuminative evaluation model; observation, inquiry and explanation.

Findings and Interpretations

The data collected from the research were analyzed and interpreted according to the steps of "observation", "inquiry" and "explanation", which are the stages of the illuminative evaluation model.

Observation Stage

The school where the study was conducted was in a region where there were families with low socio-economic status. Thus, the budget allocated by families for education was also low. The main livelihood of the families was agriculture and marketing, which families made their living by overworking. From the observations, it was, also, determined that when the economic level of the families was low, they did not have the necessary infrastructure for distance education. Most families did not have computers or internet at home. During distance education, children generally attended their lessons with their families' mobile phones and mobile data. Teachers communicated with

Altın, M. & Altın, F. (2021). Evaluation of values education in the preschool curriculum during the pandemic through illuminative evaluation model. *Journal of Educational Reflections*, 5(2), 24-32.

families and children mostly via WhatsApp. The lessons were carried out through the activities that the teachers uploaded to the "Educational Information Network (EBA)" or sent from "WhatsApp". They sometimes supported their activities with educational content on Youtube and interactive games. In addition, teachers held lessons and meetings on "Zoom".

When lesson plans used during the pandemic period were examined, it was determined that a total of nine lessons were related to values education. The topics and the highlighted values of these courses are given below;

- **Ant with cicada**; responsibilities, empathy
- **I keep my environment clean**; environmental protection, responsibilities
- **Love nature, protect the tree**; environmental protection
- **Elmer**; tolerance
- **Differences**; tolerance,
- **Sharing is good**; sharing,
- **Love overcomes all barriers**; love, benevolence, tolerance
- **Butterflies of love**; empathy, love
- **I love my country**; love, patriotism

The views of preschool teachers on how the pandemic affects pre-school values education are given in Table 1.

Table 1. The effect of pandemic on pre-school education

The effect	f
Negative effect	7
No much effect felt	2
Total	9

When Table 1 is examined, it is seen that most of participants suggested that the pandemic had negative effect on education. Samples of the raw data were given below.

Teacher 3: *"Like every level of education, preschool education was negatively affected. Children had to spend the most effective and permanent period of their development at home, away from social life."*

Teacher 5: *"I think it doesn't affect much because preschool are open, however, parents preferred not to send their children to us."*

Inquiry Stage

The findings obtained from the interviews with the teachers about the problems they encountered during values education are given in Table 2.

Table 2. Problems encountered during distance education

Problems encountered	f
Technological infrastructure	6
Insufficient family support	3
Students' not fulfilling activities	3
Lack of students' motivation	3
No problem	1

According to Table 2, technological infrastructure, insufficient family support, students' not fulfilling activities and lack of students' motivation are problems encountered during distance education. Samples of the raw data were given below.

Teacher 9: *"In addition to the internet connection problems, the technological inadequacies of our parents, the lack of the child's motivation in front of the screen, the lack of feedback from the activities, etc.; there were many problems."*

Teacher 1: *"Technological impossibility and parents not being with the child as they are constantly working are challenges we encountered."*

The teachers' actions to solve the problems they experience during distance education are given in Table 3.

Table 3. How to overcome problems

How to overcome problems	f
Constant communication with parents	5
Activities with students when parents are with them	2
Endeavoring to reach students	2
I had no problems	1

Altın, M. & Altın, F. (2021). Evaluation of values education in the preschool curriculum during the pandemic through illuminative evaluation model. *Journal of Educational Reflections*, 5(2), 24-32.

As for Table 3, it is seen that in order to overcome problems teachers made constant communication with parents, made activities with students when parents are with them and endeavored to reach students. Samples of the raw data were given below.

Teacher 4: *“I contacted my parents and supported them on how to use the programs. By sending the training links via Whatsapp, I made them easier to reach.”*

Teacher 6: *“I tried to arrange it according to the available time of the parent and sent short and concise videos.”*

Information about people from whom teachers got help to solve the problems is given in Table 4.

Table 4. People from whom teachers got help to solve the problems

From whom getting help	f
Colleagues	6
Administration	3
Parents	1
No	1
Total	11

Table 4 shows that teachers got help from colleagues, administration and parents to solve the problems. Samples of the raw data were given below.

Teacher 8: *“I am in constant communication and sharing with my groups. We also supported each other (colleagues) psychologically.”*

Teacher 7: *“Colleagues and administration help me whenever I cannot overcome challenges.”*

The teachers' suggestions on how to overcome the problems are given in Table 5.

Table 5. Teachers' suggestions on overcoming problems

Suggestions on overcoming problems	f
Technological support should be given to families	6
Family should support children's education	2
Face-to-face education should be ensured	1
Content in “EBA” should be increased	1
Total	10

When Table 5 is examined, it is obvious that most of the teachers suggest that technological support be given to families. The other suggestions to overcome problems are that family should support children's education, that face-to-face education should be ensured and that content in “EBA” should be increased. Samples of raw data were given below.

Teacher 2: *“Internet and computer can be provided to disadvantaged areas.”*

Teacher 6: *“A technological infrastructure should be provided... students should be easily reachable, and parents should support their children's education.”*

Explanation Stage

Values education given through distance education during the pandemic period was examined with the illuminative evaluation model. The general evaluation of values education in terms of four basic elements of curriculum is given below:

Objective: When the lesson plans were examined, it was seen that the acquisition of values such as justice, friendship, honesty, self-control and patience was not included, and certain values such as responsibility, empathy, environmental protection, tolerance, sharing, love, benevolence and patriotism were emphasized. The reason for that situation can be explained as some values are not included in the curriculum because they can be complicated for preschool children.

Content: It was determined that the most disruptive part of the curriculum was in the content element because the students did not have the necessary equipment for distance education. Most of the children did not have computers and internet at home, so the students tried to carry out the activities through their parents' mobile phones and mobile data. It can be commented that the content element of the curriculum is directly related to parents' income. As parents' income was low, the content was insufficient because parents could not afford expenditures on education.

Methodology: Although the teachers might have the necessary competence for distance education, the lack of equipment and infrastructure greatly reduced the teacher-student interaction. Moreover, as the parents focused on

Altın, M. & Altın, F. (2021). Evaluation of values education in the preschool curriculum during the pandemic through illuminative evaluation model. *Journal of Educational Reflections*, 5(2), 24-32.

earning money by overworking, they neglected their children's education during the distance education, and the students, unfortunately, missed most of the lessons and did not fulfill the activities.

Evaluation: As the students missed too many lessons, student-teacher communication in distance education remained at a very low level, which prevented teachers to make correct evaluations and to give feedbacks to children. In other words, the fact that the students did not attend the lessons and fulfill the activities made the teachers' evaluation impossible.

When a general evaluation of values education in distance education was made, it was clearly seen that the lack of technological infrastructure caused the students to miss the lessons and activities. In addition, the fact that the parents did not support the students to attend the lessons and to fulfill the activities negatively affected children's learning experiences. Thus, the problems experienced in the content and methodology elements prevented the full implementation of the evaluation element.

CONCLUSION, DISCUSSION AND RECOMMENDATION

Values education given through distance education during the pandemic period was examined with the illuminative evaluation model. It was observed that not all values were included, but certain values were emphasized. Similar to the results of this study, Uzun and Köse (2017) concluded that values such as love, responsibility, sharing and solidarity were given in preschool education more than other values. Yalçın, Aggöl Yalçın, Zehir and Zehir (2020) suggested that acquisition of some values such as respect, affection, and welfare-sharing were preferred more than other values in preschool education. Karakuş (2015) also stated in the study that some values were given more weight than others in a cartoon prepared for values education. However, values education focuses on teaching and modeling certain values such as honesty, courage, perseverance, loyalty, care, civic virtues, justice, respect, responsibility and reliability (Sunal & Haas, 2003; cited in Ömeroğlu, 2016). Ogelman and Sarıkaya (2015), on the other hand, concluded that values such as love, responsibility, sharing and tolerance were given more importance than values such as justice, sacrifice, empathy and patriotism in preschool education; they explained the reason for that situation was that some values were not included in the curriculum because they were complicated for pre-school children.

It was understood that the most problems in the curriculum were in the content element, especially in terms of technological equipment and infrastructure. Similarly, Duran (2020) stated that teachers failed to find the required materials in values education. Kozikoğlu (2018) and Balım (2020) concluded that activities could not be realized due to the lack of material and insufficient conditions. Çalışkan (2014) concluded that the Science Teaching Methods course should be improved in terms of content after the study by illuminative evaluation model. Özüdoğru and Adıgüzel (2016) and Kozikoğlu (2018) emphasized that physical facilities should be improved for an effective education in the conclusion of their studies.

In the evaluation of the methodology of values education lessons, it was concluded that there was insufficient teacher-student interaction during distance education. At the end of curriculum evaluation study, Çalışkan (2014) stated that the students were not active and the practices were not made in the Science Teaching Methods course. Demirel (2012) emphasized that learners should actively participate in the learning process for effective learning. In this study, it was, also, determined that the most prominent reason why students ignored values education activities was that families neglected their students' education. Similarly, Duran (2020), Güzelyurt (2020), Yalçın, Aggöl Yalçın, Zehir and Zehir (2020) concluded that there was an inadequate cooperation with families during values education. Yazar and Erkuş (2013), Ogelman and Sarıkaya (2015) and Kozikoğlu (2018) also stated that the lack of family support was one of the reasons for not reaching the goals in values education. The fact that the students did not attend the lessons and fulfill activities made the teachers' evaluation for learning inadequate. Also, Chirwa (2013) evaluated the Expressive Arts Program with the illuminative evaluation model and concluded that the students failed to reach the goals.

In conclusion, it was determined that many problems emerged during values education practices in Turkey, especially during the pandemic period. Yenen and Ulucan (2021), in their comparative study with a different country, stated that there were relatively more problems in values education practices in Turkey compared to that country. Regarding the conclusions reached at the end of the study, some suggestions can be made to both practitioners and researchers:

- Activities related to the acquisition of other values neglected in preschool curriculum such as justice, friendship, honesty, self-control and patience should be done,
- In order to increase the participation of students in distance education in disadvantaged regions, equipment and infrastructure should be provided, or all provisions should be provided for the realization of face-to-face education,
- Studies on the evaluation of values education during the pandemic period can be carried out at the other educational levels.

REFERENCE

- Akar Vural, R. & Cenkseven, F., (2005). Case studies in educational research: definition, types, stages and reporting of case study research. *Burdur Journal of Education Faculty*, 6(10) 126-139.
- Alderman, G. (2014). *From policy borrowing to implementation: An illuminative evaluation of learning and teaching in higher education in Australia (2002 to 2008)*. Queensland, Australia. https://eprints.qut.edu.au/75865/1/Gwendolyn_Alderman_Thesis.pdf
- Aljabreen, H. H. & Lash, M. (2016). Preschool education in Saudi Arabia: Past, present, and future. *Childhood Education*, 92(4), 311-319. DOI: 10.1080/00094056.2016.1208011
- Balcı, A. (2015). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Araştırma Yöntem, Teknik ve İlkeler [Research Methods, Techniques and Principles in Social Sciences]* (11th Ed.). Pegem Academy.
- Balım, D. (2020). *Beşinci Sınıf İngilizce Ağırlıklı Öğretim Programının Aydınlatıcı Değerlendirme Modeliyle Değerlendirilmesi [An Evaluation of Fifth Grade English Curriculum within an Illuminative Evaluation Model]*. Unpublished master's thesis, Pamukkale University Institute of Educational Sciences, Denizli.
- Bantwini, B. D. (2010). How teachers perceive the new curriculum reform: lessons from a school district in The Eastern Cape province, South Africa. *International Journal of Development*, 30, 83-90.
- Cahapay, M. B. (2020). The responsiveness of Bachelor of Elementary Education curriculum: An illuminative evaluation. *International Journal of Evaluation and Research in Education* 9(3), 743-750. DOI: 10.11591/ijere.v9i3.20649
- Chirwa, G. W. (2015). *An Illuminative evaluation of the standard 7 and 8 expressive arts curriculum in Malawi*. Malawi.
- Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Beş Yaklaşımına göre Nitel Araştırma ve Araştırma Deseni [Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches]* (Translating Eds. M. Bütün and S. B. Demir). Ankara: Siyasal Bookstore Publishing.
- Çalışkan, I. (2014). Identifying the needs of pre-service classroom teachers about science teaching methodology courses in terms of Parlett's Illuminative Program Evaluation Model. *International Journal of Education in Mathematics, Science and Technology*, 2(2), 138-148.
- Demirel, Ö. (2012). *Eğitimde Program Geliştirme [Curriculum Development in Education]*. Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.
- Duran, M. (2020). Attitudes of preschool teachers towards values education. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 12(5), 271-286. DOI: 10.15345/iojes.2020.05.019
- Flyvbjerg, B. (2006). Five misunderstandings about case study research. *Qualitative Inquiry*. 12 (2), 219-245.
- Garwood, J. (2015). *Identification of specific learning disability in New Jersey: an illuminative evaluation*. Theses and Dissertations, 513. <http://rdw.rowan.edu/etd/513>
- Glesne, C. (2013). *Becoming Qualitative Researchers* (4th Ed. Translating Eds. Ali Ersoy & Pelin Yalçinoğlu). Anı Publication.
- Gunio, M. J. D. (2015). *Determining The Influences of A Hidden Curriculum On Students' Character Development Using The Illuminative Evaluation Model*. University of the Philippines Diliman.
- Gündüz, M., Aktepe, V., Uzunoğlu, H. & Gündüz, D. D. (2017). The values obtained through the educative games to preschool children. *MSKU Journal of Education*, 4(1), 62-70. DOI: 10.21666/muefd.303856
- Güzelyurt, T. (2020). Okul öncesi öğretmenlerinin değerler eğitimine ilişkin görüşleri. *Eğitim Kuram ve Uygulama Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 6(3), 278-284. DOI: 10.38089/ekvad.2020.27
- Hökelekli, H. & Gündüz, T. (2007). Üstün yetenekli çocukların değer yönelimleri ve eğitimleri [Value orientations and education of gifted children in *Değerler ve Eğitimi [Values and Education]* 371-396. Dem Publications.
- Karakaş, H. (2015). Değerler eğitimi etkinliklerinin okul öncesi öğretmenlerine göre değerlendirilmesi: Nitel bir çalışma [Evaluation of values education activities according to preschool teachers: a qualitative study]. *Dünden Bugüne Türkiye'de Beceri, Ahlak ve Değerler Eğitimi [International Symposium of Skill, Moral and Values Education in Turkey from Past to Present]*, volume I, p. 623.
- Karakuş, N. (2015). Evaluating the Cartoons That Appeal to Preschool Age in Terms of Their Contribution into the Values Education (The Niloya Case). *Journal of Values Education*, 12(30), 251-277.
- Kozikoğlu, İ. (2018). Investigation of preschool education teachers' attitudes and opinions concerning values education. *International Journal of Turkish Literature Culture Education*, 7(4), 2698-2720.
- Mustafa, L. M. & Azman, M. N. A. (2013). Preschool education in Malaysia: Emerging trends and implications for the future. *American Journal of Economics*, 3(6), 347-351. DOI: 10.5923/j.economics.20130306.15
- Ogelman, H. G. & Sarıkaya, H. E. (2015). Views of preschool teachers about education of values: case of Denizli province. *Sakarya University Journal of Education Faculty*, (29), 81-100.
- Oktay, A. (1999). *Yaşamın Sihirli Yılları: Okul Öncesi Dönem [Magical Years of Life: Preschool Period]*. Epsilon Publication.

- Altın, M. & Altın, F. (2021). Evaluation of values education in the preschool curriculum during the pandemic through illuminative evaluation model. *Journal of Educational Reflections*, 5(2), 24-32.
- Oruç, C. (2010). Education of children's moral values in the preschool period. *Journal of Education and Humanities: Theory and Practice*, 1(2), 37-60.
- Ömeroğlu, E. (2016). Karakter ve değer [Character and value](Ö. Sapsağlam [Ed.], in *Okul Öncesi Dönemde Karakter ve Değerler Eğitimi: Teoriden Uygulamaya [Character and Value Education in Preschool Period]* 3-18). Pegem Akademi. DOI 10.14527/9786053187073
- Özudođru, F. & Adıgüzel, O.C. (2016). The analysis of the views of English teachers about 2nd grade English language teaching curriculum. *E-International Journal of Educational Research*, 7(2), 16-35. DOI: 10.19160/e-ijer.12341
- Pahl, K. M. & Barrett, P.M. (2007). *The development of social-emotional competence in preschool aged children: the fun friends program*. Australia: Brisbane, Queensland
- Parlett, M. & Hamilton, D. (1972). Evaluation as illumination: a new approach to the study of innovatory programs. *U.S. Department of Health, Education & Welfare. National Institute of Education*. 2-35.
- Sigurdardottir, I. & Einarsdottir, J. (2016). An action research study in an Icelandic preschool: Developing consensus about values and values education. *IJEC*, (48),161–177. DOI: 10.1007/s13158-016-0161-5
- Smilgiene, J., Masiliauskine, E. & Lenkauskaite, J. (2020). The development of a culture of children's behaviour in preschool education institutions: analysis of preschool teachers' experience. *CBU International Conference on Innovations in Science and Education*, March 18-20, Prague, Czech Republic.
- Sönmez, V. & Alacapınar, F. G. (2015). *Örnekleriyle Eğitimde Program Değerlendirme [Curriculum Evaluation in Education with Examples]*. Anı Publication.
- Tanrıverdi, Ö. (2012). *Yaratıcı Drama ile Verilen Eğitimin Okul Öncesi Öğrencilerin Çevre Farkındalığına Etkisi [The Effect of the Education Implemented by the Creative Drama Method on the Environmental Awareness of Pre-School Students]*. Unpublished master's thesis, Muğla Sıtkı Koçman University Institute of Educational Sciences, Muğla.
- Uşun, S. (2012). *Eğitimde Program Değerlendirme: Süreçler, Yaklaşımlar ve Modeller [Curriculum Evaluation in Education: Processes, Approaches and Models]*. Anı Publication.
- Uzun, M. & Köse, A. (2017). Teachers' Opinions about the Application of Values Education during Preschool Education. *Bayburt Faculty of Education Journal*, 12(23), 305-338.
- Ülavere, P. & Tammik, A. (2017). Value education in Estonian preschool child care institutions. *Journal of Teacher Education for Sustainability*, 19(1), 129-146.
- Wood, B. B. (2001). Stake's countenance model: evaluation an environmental education professional development course. *The Journal of Environmental Education*, 32(2), 18-27.
- Yaka, Ş., Yalçın, D. & Denizli, E. (2014). Parents' views on preferential values in preschool education. *Journal of Values Education*, 12(28), 169-192.
- Yalcin, M., & Yalcin, F. A., & Zehir, H., & Zehir, K. (2020). The views of preschool preservice teachers, in-service teachers and parents on pre-school education of values. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 12(4), 260-277. DOI: 10.15345/iojes.2020.04.018
- Yazar, T. & Erkuş, S. (2013). The evaluation the opinions of pre-school education teachers about the values education in pre-school education programme. *Dicle University Ziya Gökalp Faculty of Education Journal*, 20, 196-211.
- Yenen, E. T. & Ulucan, P. (2021). Values education practices in preschool: the case of Turkey and the United States. *Participatory Educational Research*, 8(4), 385-408. DOI:10.17275/per.21.96.8.4
- Yıldırım, A. ve Şimşek, H. (2016). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri [Qualitative Research Methods in the Social Sciences]* (10. Ed). Seçkin Publication.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods (4th Ed.)*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- Yoon, S., Park, M. Y. & Mcmillan, M. (2017). An illuminative evaluation: Student experience of flipped learning using online contents. *Journal of Problem-Based Learning*, 4(1), 47-54.
- Yüksel, İ. & Sağlam, M. (2014). *Eğitimde Program Değerlendirme [Curriculum Evaluation in Education]*. Pegem Academy.