Analyzing the Scholarly Personality of a Commentator: Ibn 'Abd al-Barr and His Commentaries

*Rahile KIZILKAYA YILMAZ**

Abstract

Imām Mālik's (d. 179/795) *Muwatta'* is made up of different components: Prophet Muhammad's words and actions, and opinions, rulings of the Prophet's companions, their successors and some subsequent authorities. Imām Mālik constantly revised this work and cropped the contents of it. For that reason, it contains a number of transmissions by Imām Mālik's students. In addition, many important commentaries have been written about *Muwatta'*. The most famous of these were created by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (d. 463/1071) who compiled the two commentaries: *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār*. Full name of the first book is *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*; the full name of the second book is *al-Istidhkār li madhhab 'ulamā' al-amsār fī mā tadammanahu al-Muwatta' min ma'ānī al-ra'ī wa al-āthār*. Abū Umar al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, commonly known as Ibn 'Abd al-Barr was an eleventh-century Mālikī judge and scholar. He has an important standing as specialist in discipline of hadīth and a Mālikī jurist. In this article, I will lay out the purpose of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr in writing *al-Tamhīd* and in *al-Istidhkār* and the structure of these two commentaries.

This article will start by introducing the subject and its importance in the hadīth literature. In addition, it will provide essential information about Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's life based on primary sources about him. Then, his works and their importance will be discussed. The article will specifically focus on his scholarly personality based on the accounts by his teachers and his students, and his books. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's reasoning behind and purposes of writing two commentaries on the same book, *Muwatta'*, will be examined. The article will compare his two commentaries, *al-Tamhīd* and in *al-Istidhkār*, in the context of their contents, their authentic aspects, and their process of writing according to scholars' arguments. This will help us understand why the author of *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār* needed to write two commentaries on the same book.

Keywords: Hadīth, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd, al-Istidhkār*, Commentary, Isnād.

1. Introduction

Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, commonly known as Ibn 'Abd al-Barr was born in Cordoba in 368 (November 10,

* Asst. Prof., Marmara University Faculty of Divinity, rahile.yilmaz@marmara.edu.tr, orcid.org/0000-0003-2711-7914, Research Article/Araştırma Makalesi, Received/Geliş Tarihi: 10.01.2022, Accepted/Kabul Tarihi: 10.03.2022, Published/Yayım Tarihi: 18.03.2022.

978). He was also called Namarī referring to his grandfather Namir b. Kāsit. His predecessors along with Arab tribes and Barbarī Muslims came to al-Andalus and settled in the city of Raiyo/Rayyo.[1] His grandfather Muhammad was one of the well-known sūfīs of his time and his father Abū Muhammad 'Abd Allah b. Muhammad b. 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī (d. 380/990) was one of the leading scholars in the field of qirā'at, tafsīr, history,[2] Islamic law and hadīth. They both had a significant impact in the development of his scholarly approach and moral personality.[3]

Scholars and academics studying history of Andalusia are usually surprised by the flourishing of scientific movement that prevailed in the period of Mulūk al-Ṭawā'if.[4] Despite the very low political conditions in the period of Mulūk al-Ṭawā'if, literature and the disciplines of Sharī'a had a high status. What helped enrich them were the encouragement of the rulers and princes of the time; who, in turn, were no less in science and literature than other scholars and poets of Andalusia.[5] In addition to the official encouragement from the ruling classes, a large number of scholars in the era of sects helped flourish the atmosphere of reverence and appreciation for scholars and literary classes. This was to the advantage of the people of Andalusia. In this atmosphere a scholar would be properly honored and social life would be facilitated for him.[6]

In fact, many scholars of Andalusia wrote poetries. On the authority of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Alī Ibn Mūsā Ibn Sa'īd al-Maghribī (d. 685/1286) said: "If you look at the impact he left after him, and it is enough to see this while looking at his books, you don't need anything else. For example, look at *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār*, and you will clearly see this. Even his scholarly depth about genealogy (discipline of ansāb) can be understood from his work called *al-Istī'āb*. After all, he is an expert of literature, and his work called *Bahjat al-majālis wa uns al-mujālis* is

---

[1]   Abū Ja'far Ahmad b. Yahyā b. Ahmad al-Andalusī al-Ḍabbī, *Bughyah al-multamis fī tārikh rijāl ahl al-Andalus*, 2 Volumes, Second Edition, critical ed. Ibrahim al-Ebyārī (Cairo: Dār al-Kitāb al-Mısrī; Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-Lubnānī, 1989/1410) 1/364.

[2]   See for a study that evaluates Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's historian identity in detail Leys Suūd Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh* (Mansūrah: Dār al-Wafā, 1988).

[3]   Leys Suūd Cāsim, "İbn Abdülber en-Nemerī", *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1999), 19/269. For further information about Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's life see Nāsır Güzeşte, "İbn 'Abdilber", *DMBI (Dā'irah al-ma'ārifi Büzürgī Islāmī)* (Teheran, 1990), 4/181-183.

[4]   It is a term referring to the petty kingdoms that arose on the ruins of the Umayyad caliphate in al-Andalus in the early 11th century (1031-1090). For further information about *Mulūk al-Ṭawā'if* see Mehmet Özdemir, *Endülüs Müslümanları: Siyasi Tarih*, Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2016, 165-182.

[5]   Muhammad Abd Rab al-Nabī, *Manhaj al-hāfiz Ibn 'Abd al-Barr fī al-jarh wa al-ta'dīl min khilāl kitāb al-Tamhīd* (Makkah al-Mukarramah-Saudi Arabia: Umm al-Qura University, PhD Thesis, 2009), 12.

[6]   Abū al-Abbās Shihāb al-Dīn Ahmad b. Muhammad al-Makkarī al-Tilimsānī, *Nafh al-tīb min ghusn al-Andalus al-ratīb* (Beirut: Dār Sader, 1388/1968), 1/220.

sufficient as evidence for you. His name has spread all over the world".[7] Abū Nasr al-Fath b. Muhammad b. Khāqān (d. 529/1135 [?]) also said on the authority of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr: "As for his literary personality, the meaning of most of his poems cannot be fully understood. However, it cannot be denied that all of them are evidence of his literary expertise. Each of his poems is full of inspiration and contains deep meaning".[8]

In the 4th century A.H. the Caliphate of Córdoba was very rich in terms of scholarship due to the society's and administrators' commitment to the scholarship along with the favorable economic and political developments. These scholarly developments continued despite the political chaos that emerged at the outset of 5th century A.H., followed by the division of the country into chiefdoms. After the revolt, having left Cordoba, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr traveled the East and West regions of Andalusia for a time. Meanwhile, he served as kāḍī of Lisbon and Cintra. During this travel, he called for the union among seigniories that construct the "Tawāif al-Mulūk".

2. An Overview His Scholarly Personality

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr did not leave al-Andalus like other scholars who went to the East to seek knowledge and learn from there. Instead, he listened and learned from the elders of Cordoba and the strangers who traveled there. Many of his sheikhs used to do *rihlas* (travel to seek out hadīth) outside Andalusia, and as for his domestic *rihlas*, he moved between western and eastern cities of Andalusia.[9] Some of the cities he traveled to seek out hadīth are: Ishbīliyyah, Dāniyyah, Valencia, Baṭalyaws (Badajoz), Jativa (Xativa), Ushbūna (Lizbon), Santarem.[10]

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr took lessons from 'Abbās b. Asbagh al-Hamadānī (d. 386/996) and Abū Bakr Abdurrahman b. Abān (d. 379/989) during his primary education. Then, he studied tafsir, hadīth, jadal and sīrat. He didn't leave al-Andalus for the purpose of education. He took *al-ijāza* from 107 scholars and 100 of them were Andalusī.

---

[7] Alī Ibn Mūsā Ibn Saʿīd al-Maghribī, *al-Mughrib fī hula al-Maghrib* (Cairo: Dār al-Maʿāref, Third edition, 1955), 2/407-408.

[8] al-Tilimsānī, *Nafh al-tīb min ghusn al-Andalus al-ratīb,* 4/29-30.

[9] Abū al-Abbās Shihāb al-Dīn Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Muhammad al-Miknāsī Ibn al-Qāḍī, *Jazwah al-iqtibās fī dhikri man halla min al-aʿlām bi al-madīnah Fās,* First Edition (Rabat: Dār al-Mansūr, 1973/1393) 367; Abū al-Qāsim Khalaf ibn 'Abd al-Mālik ibn Masʿūd ibn Musa ibn Bashkuwāl ibn Yūsuf al-Ansārī, *al-Sila fī tārīkh aʾimmat al-Andalus* (Dār al-Mansūr, Rabat, 1973), 2/679.

[10] al-Qāḍī ʿIyāḍ, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li maʿrifat aʾlām madhhab Mālik* (Maghrib: Wizārah al-Awqāf wa al-Shuʾūn al-Islāmiyyah, Second Edition, 1403/1983), 8/127-130. See also Pellat, Ch. "Ibn 'Abd al-Barr". *Encyclopaedia of Islam, Second Edition.* ed. P. Bearman. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/1573-3912_islam_SIM_3027 (Accessed 26.08.2021).

2.1 His Teachers

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr was keen on enhancing his knowledge, and since he did not leave Andalusia, he was concerned to keep it so. This concern was doubled by not leaving Andalusia, and that is why his sheikhs multiplied. His prominent teachers were Abū al-Qāsim Ibn ad-Dabbāgh (d. 393/1003), Khalaf b. Qāsim b. Sahl b. al-Azdī (d. 393/1003), 'Abd al-Wārith b. Sufyān (d. 395/1004), Ahmad b. Qāsım al-Bazzār (d. 395/1004), Sa'īd b. Nasr (d. 395/1004), Abū 'Umar Ahmad b. 'Abdullah b. Muhammad b. Ali al-Bājī (d. 396/1006), Abū 'Umar Ahmad b. 'Abd al-Mālik b. Hāshim al-Ishbīlī who was also known as Ibn al-Makwī (d. 401/1010), Ahmad b. Muhammad al-Jasur [Jisr] (d. 401/1010), Abd Allah b. Muhammad b. Abd al-Mu'min (d. 401/1010?), Ibn al-Faradī (d. 403/1013), 'Abdullah b. Muhammad b. Yusuf b. Nasr al-Azdī (d. 403/1013), Muhammad b. Yahyā b. Ahmad al-Tamimī (d. 410/1019), Abū al-Walīd Yunus b. Abdillah b. Mughis (d. 429/1038), Abū 'Umar Ahmad b. Muhammad al-Ma'āfirī al-Talamankī (d. 429/1037), Yunus b. Abd Allah (d. 429/1037), and Abū Muhammad Abdullah b. Muhammad al-Baṭalyawsī (d. 521/1127).[11]

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr found the opportunity to benefit from the accumulation of knowledge in the centers of the world where he couldn't travel, via a large number of disciples and scholars who came to Cordoba from various countries and he took *al-ijāza* from the following teachers: Abū Muhammad 'Abdulgānī al-Azdī (d. 409/1018) and Abū Muhammad Ibn al-Nahhās (d. 511/1117) from Egypt, one of the famous narrators of *Sahīh al-Bukhārī* Abū Zar al-Harawī (d. 434/1043) from Mecca, Abū Nasr al-Dāwūdī (d. 402/1011) from Kairouan. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr reached to *Sunan of Abū Dāwūd* with just two rāwīs (transmitters) that is called *ālī isnād* (the shortest chain of transmission), and he reached to *Muwatta'* of Imām Mālik through this isnād Abdulwāris b. Sufyān (d. 395/1004) – Abū Muhammad Kāsim b. Asbagh (d. 340/951) – Muhammad b. Vaddāh (d. 287/900) – Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī (d. 234/849) which is called "al-Sanad al-Andalusī".[12]

In addition to Islamic disciplines, he studied geography, medicine, math and astrology, he gave lectures on many works of different scholars for which he took permission to transmit them. *Fahrasa* of Ibn Khayr al-Ishbīlī (d. 575/1179) shows that the works which he transmitted are almost nearly enough to form a library.

---

[11]   al-Qādī 'Iyād, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li ma'rifat a'lām madhhab Mālik*, 8/127-130; Abū al-'Abbās Shams al-Dīn Ahmad b. Muhammad Ibn Khallikān, *Wafayāt al-a'yān wa anbā'u abnā'i al-zamān* (Beirut: Dār Sader, 1972), 7/66-72. See also Nevzat Tartı, *İbn Abdi'l-Berr ve et-Temhid'indeki Şerh Metodu* (Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 1994), 19-23.

[12]   al-Qādī 'Iyād, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li ma'rifat a'lām madhhab Mālik,* 8/127-130.

2.2 His Students

As his fame and anecdotes of him spread in various corners, it was not surprising that students of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr increased. Major scholars and pioneers of knowledge would come and travel to him to learn from him. It was narrated that the number of his students reached as far as 92. Among his students, there are famous scholars such as Abū Ja'far Ahmad b. Sa'īd al-Lahmī (d. 416/1025), Ibn Hazm al-Andalusī (d. 456/1064), Tāhir b. Mufawwaz al-Ma'āfirī (d. 484/1091), Abū Abdullah Muhammad b. Abū Nasr al-Humaydī (d. 488/1095), Abū 'Ubayd Abdullah b. Abdilaziz b. Muhammad al-Bakrī al-Andalusī (d. 487/1094), Abdussamad b. Mūsā al-Bakrī al-Kurtubī (d. 495/1102), Abū Alī Husayn b. Muhammad b. Ahmad al-Ghassānī (d. 498/1105), and 'Abdurrahman b. Muhammad b. Attāb (d. 520/1126).[13] Although Ibn Hazm was his contemporary and they took lessons from the same teachers, Ibn Hazm learned the discipline of hadīth and transmitted hadīth from Ibn 'Abd al-Barr with the method of *al-samā'* (direct hearing/recording the speech of the teacher) and sometimes with *al-ijāza* (licensing, permission for transmission).[14]

2.3 His Works

Among Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's books, there are published works and there are also manuscripts. It is also stated that some of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's books are missing.[15] Below, firstly Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's published books, then his manuscripts and finally his lost books will be mentioned.

1. **al-Intiqā fī fadāi'l al-thalāthat al-ai'mmat al-fuqahā Mālik wa al-Shāfi`ī wa Abī Hanīfah**[16]

This book was written on the merits of Imām Mālik (d. 179/795), Imām Shāfi'ī (d. 204/820), Imām Abū Hanīfah (d. 150/767), and their leading disciples. Shaykh 'Abd al-Fattāh Abū Ghudda (d. 1997) said that the order in the title as "The Hand-Picked Excellent Merits of

---

[13] al-Qādī 'Iyād, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li ma'rifat a'lām madhhab Mālik*, 8/127-130; Tartı, *İbn Abdi'l-Berr ve et-Temhid'indeki Şerh Metodu*, 24-28.

[14] al-Qādī 'Iyād, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li ma'rifat a'lām madhhab Mālik*, 8/127-130; Ibn Khallikān, *Wafayāt al-a'yān wa anbā'u abnā'i al-zamān*, 7/66-72.

[15] Leys Suūd Cāsim mentions Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's ten lost works on hadīth while listing his works in his historiography work. See Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214.

[16] Published in Cairo, 1931; Beirut, 1997, 2005. The name of book means "The Hand-Picked Excellent Merits of the Three Great Jurisprudent Imāms: Mālik, Shāfi'ī, and Abū Hanīfah". It was mentioned by al-Qādī 'Iyād in *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li ma'rifat a'lām madhhab Mālik*, 8/129. And Ibn Khayr al-Ishbīlī (d. 575/1179) in his *Fahrasa Ibn Khayr al-Ishbīlī*, critical ed. Mahmoud Bashshār 'Avvād, First Edition, (Tunisia: Dār al-Gharb al-Islamī, 2009), 28, and Ibn 'Abd al-Barr had indicated his intention to write this book in *Jāmi' bayān al-'ilm wa fadlihī wa mā yanbaghī fī riwāyatihī wa hamlihī*, 2 Volumes, First Edition, critical ed. Abū al-Ashbāl al-Zuhaiyrī (Dammām: Dār Ibn al-Jawzī, 1414/1994), 2/148.

the Three Great Jurisprudent Imāms: Mālik, Shāfiʻī, and Abū Hanīfah" reflected the precedence of Madīna over Makka and that of Makka over al-Kūfa.

2. al-Istīʻāb fī maʻrifat al-ashāb[17]

It is a comprehensive compilation of the Prophet's companions. While giving biographies of the companions, Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr mentioned their names and their kunyas and also mentioned the conflicts between them.

3. al-Inbāh alā qabāil al-ruwāh[18]

This book is an introduction of *al-Istīʻāb fī maʻrifat al-ashāb*. This work was first published independently at the end of the author's *al-Qasd wa al-umam fī al-taʻrīf bi usūl ansāb al-ʻarab wa al-ʻajam* in Cairo 1350/1931), then by Ibrāhim al-Abyārī, with various indexes.

4. al-Durar fī Ikhtisār al-Maghāzī wa al-Siyar[19]

It is a work in which Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr deals with the wars in the period of the Prophet through narrations. It is a compendium of *al-Istīʻāb*. While mentioning the narrations, he also indicates the degree of soundness of the narrations.

5. Kitāb al-Insāf fī mā bayn al-ulamā min al-ikhtilāf[20]

Fairness among those who differ in the name of Allah, the Most Gracious, the Most Merciful derives from disagreement:[21] and this was a publication entitled "Fairness among scholars from disagreement." It dealt with the justification of difference of opinion among the ulamā.

This book is also known as *al-Inṣāf fī mā baynaʼl-mukhtalifīnah (ʻulamāʼiʼl-muslimīne) fī (ḳirāʼati) bismillāhiʼr-raḥmāniʼr-raḥīm fī Fātiḥatiʼl-kitāb min al-ikhtilāf*. It is a work of Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr on fiqh. He wrote it at the request of some of his students. It is about whether the basmala at the beginning of al-Fātiha should be read in prayer or not. It is a small treatise in

---

[17] Published in Baghdad, n.d.; Cairo, n.d.; Cairo, 1976; Beirut, 1995. Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr mentioned him in *al-Tamhīd* many times, including 1/129; 1/341; 23/8, and *al-Istidhkār*, 1/228.

[18] Published in Beirut, 1985. The title of book (الإنباه على قبائل الرواة) means "Drawing Attention to the Nomenclature of the Narrators' Tribes". Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr mentioned it in *al-Tamhīd*, I, p. 91, and in *al-Istidhkār*, I, p. 25. And he mentioned that he made it an entry into *al-Istidhkār*, I, p. 237.

[19] Published in Cairo, 1983; Damascus, 1984; Beirut, 1984. The name of book means "The Battles". Ibn al-Qādī, *Jazwah al-muqtabes fī dhikri man halla min al-aʻlām bi al-madīnah Fās*, 368; al-Ḍabbī, *Bughyah al-multamis fī tārikh rijāl ahl al-Andalus*, 490; al-Qaḍī ʻIyāḍ, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li maʻrifat aʻlām madhhab Mālik,* Second Edition, 8 Volumes (Maghrib: Wizārah al-Awqāf wa al-Shuʼūn al-Islāmiyyah, 1403/1983), 8/130; Abū Bakr Muhammad b. Khayr al-Ishbīlī, *Fahrasa Ibn Khayr al-Ishbīlī*, critical ed. Mahmoud Bashshār ʻAvvād, First Edition (Tunisia: Dār al-Gharb al-Islāmī, 2009), 232.

[20] Published in Cairo, 1343/1924; Riyāḍ, 1998.

[21] This was also mentioned in *al-Istidhkār* and he mentioned that he called him by this name *al-Istidhkār*, 2/182, and he mentioned it in *al-Tamhīd, 2/231*.

which the views of the companions, successors and some later authorities are compiled on this subject.

6. al-Qasd wa al-umam fī al- taʻrīf bi usūl ansāb al-ʻarab wa al-ʻajam[22]
7. al-Kāfī fī furūʻ al-Mālikiyyah[23]

This book[24] is also known as *al-Kāfī fī al-fiqh, al-Kāfī fī al-ikhtilāf wa aqwāl Mālik wa al-ashābihī*,[25] *al-Kāfī fī al-fiqh ʻalā madhab Mālik wa al-ashābihī*, and *al-Kāfī ʻalā madhab Mālik*.[26]

8. Ikhtilāfāt aṣḥāb Mālik b. Anas wa ikhtilāf riwāyatihim ʻanh[27]

Although the entire work has not survived, Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr referred to it in *al-Istidhkār* by saying:[28] "We mentioned it in the book on the differences of Mālik and his companions."

9. al-Ziyādāt al-latī lam taqaʻ fī al-Muwaṭṭaʼ ʻinda Yaḥyā b. Yaḥyā wa ravāhā ghayruhū fī al-Muwaṭṭaʼ

In this small risālah[29] Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr compiled sixty-four transmissions that were not included in *al-Muwaṭṭa*'s Yaḥyā b. Yaḥyā narration, although they were transmitted by Imām Mālik from his seventeen teachers.[30]

10. al-Ajwiba al-mūʻiba fī al-masāʼil al-mustaghribah fī kitāb al-Bukhārī[31]

---

[22]   Published in Cairo, 1350/1931. The title of book means "The Endeavors and the Nations: Genealogies of the Arabs and Non-Arabs".

[23]   Published in Riyāḍ, 1978; Cairo, 1979; Beirut, n.d. It was mentioned by Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr in *al-Tamhīd*, 14/257; 17/267. The title of book means "The Sufficiency in Mālikī School of Jurisprudence".

[24]   A master thesis has been prepared about this book. For detailed information about the book, see Nur Zengin, *Endülüslü Fakih İbn Abdilberr en-Nemeri ve el-Kafi fi'l-fıkh isimli muhtasarı* (İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 2017), especially 54-95.

[25]   al-Qaḍī ʻIyāḍ, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li maʻrifat aʼlām madhhab Mālik*, 3/130.

[26]   Shams al-Dīn Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Osman Dhahabī, *Siyar aʻlām al-nubalā*, critical ed. Shuʻayb al-Arnaʼūt, Husayin al-Asad (Beirut: Muassasah Risālah, 1985/1405), 18/159.

[27]   Published in Beirut, 2003.

[28]   al-Istidhkār, 2/33. And see Ibn al-Qāḍī, *Jazwah al-iqtibās fī dhikri man halla min al-aʻlām bi al-madīnah Fās*, 368, al-Ḍabbī, *Bughyah al-multamis fī tārikh rijāl ahl al-Andalus*, 490.

[29]   Published in Cairo, 1350/1931 and Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-ʻIlmiyyah, no date. The risālah was published at the end of *al-Taqassī li hadīth al-Muwaṭṭaʼ wa shuyūkh al-Imām Mālik*.

[30]   Cāsim analyzed this risālah in his article titled "Ẓāhir al-ziyādāt fī turāth al-Islāmī" See Leys Suūd Cāsim, "Ẓāhir al-ziyādāt fī turāth al-Islāmī: dirāsah taḥlīliyyah taṭbīḳiyyah min khilāl kitāb al-Istīʻāb li Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr al-Qurtubī", *Majallah al-Jāmiʻat al-Islāmiyyah al-ālamiyyah* 4 (Islāmābād, 1416-17/1996-97).

[31]   Published in Riyāḍ, 2005. *al-Ajwiba al-mūʻiba fī al-masāʼil al-mustaghribah fī kitāb al-Bukhārī* and *al-Ajwiba al-mūʻiba min al-masāʼil al-mustaghribah* are same books. Ibn ʻAbd al-Barr mentioned it in *al-Tamhīd* in three places with the name: "Answers to Strange Issues," and added in the recollection: "From the Book of al-Bukhārī." *al-Tamhīd*, 6/481; 7/107; 18/115, and *al-Istidhkār*, 1/265. The name of book means "The Comprehensive Answers/Informed answers to surprising issues".

11. Jāmiʿ bayān al-ʿilm wa fadlihī wa mā yanbaghī fī riwāyatihī wa ḥamlihī[32]

This is a collected statement of *ʿilm*, its virtues and what should be narrated and carried.[33]

12. al-Jāmiʿ[34]

This risālah discusses the good habits and etiquette rules that Muslims and especially students should have.

13. al-Istighnāʾ fī asmāʾ al-mashhūrīn min hamala al-ʿilm bi al-kunā[35]

It is also known as *Kitāb al-Istighnāʾ fī maʿrifah al-kunā*. In Dhahabī's works, the name of this work is mentioned as *al-Kunā*.[36]

14. al-Ihtibāl bi mā fī shiʿr Abī al-ʿAtāhiyya min al-hikam wa al-amsāl

It is about poetries of Abī al-ʿAtāhiyya on wisdom and proverbs.[37]

15. Bahjat al-majālis wa uns al-mujālis wa shahdh al-dhāhin wa al-hājis[38]
16. Nuzhat al-mustamteʿīn wa rawdat al-khāʾifīn[39]

---

[32] Published in Madīnah, 1968; Dammām, 1994; Beirut, no date. The title of book means "Compendium Exposing the Nature of Knowledge and Its Immense Merit, and What is Required in the Process of Narrating and Conveying it".

[33] Published. Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr mentioned it in *al-Tamhīd*, 7/222; 21/36, and elsewhere.

[34] Published. Cairo, 1398/1978; Beirut, 1407/1987.

[35] Published in Riyād, 2013. Dispensing in the knowledge of the famous surnames campaign. Published in 3 Volumes, critical ed. Abdullah Marhūl al-Sawālimah (Riyād: Dār al-ʿĀsimah, 1405/1985).
The origin of the book is a doctoral thesis in Islamic law at Umm al-Qura University in Makkah al-Mukarramah by Dr. Abdullah Marhūl al-Sawālimah.
https://waqfeya.net/book.php?bid=12541 (Accessed 10.09.2021).

[36] Dhahabī, *Siyar aʿlām al-nubalā*, 23/159.

[37] Published in Abu Dhabi, 2010.
Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr referred to it by saying: "The poems of Abū al-ʿAtāhiyya in condemning the world are many, and I have collected them as poetry on the letters of the lexicon from what he said in sermons and judgment." Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr, *Bahjat al-majālis wa uns al-mujālis wa shahd al-dhāhin wa al-hājis*, 3/293.

[38] Published in three volumes in Cairo, 1962. It was mentioned by Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr in *al-Istidhkār*, III, p. 1165; III, p. 1305; *al-Tamhīd*, XXI, p. 36.
Title of the book means "the highest of the councils, the best of companions, and the work of those who think and comprehend deeply".

[39] Manuscript: It was mentioned by Khayr al-Dīn al-Ziriklī (d. 1976) in *al-Aʿlām*, 8 Volumes, Seventh Edition (Beirut: Dār al-ʿIlm li al-Malāyīn, 1986), 8/240, and *Bahjat al-majālis wa uns al-mujālis wa shahd al-dhāhin wa al-hājis*, 26/1. He mentioned that the manuscript is in the Vatican. Brockelmann, Carl, *GAL Suppl.*, 1/629. See Cāsim, "İbn Abdülber en-Nemerī", 19/271.
The title of book means "An excursion for those who want counsel, and a book to avoid for those who are afraid".

17. al-Inṣāf fī asmā' Allah[40]

This book is attributed to Ibn 'Abd al-Barr.[41] This is a literary work and one of his lost works.[42]

18. Kitāb al-Shawāhid fī ithbāt khabar al-wāhid[43]

19. al-Bayān 'an tilāwat al-Qur'ān[44]

20. al-Iktifā' fī Qirā'at Nāfi' wa Abī 'Amr b. al-'Alā' bi tawjīh mā ikhtalafā fīh[45]

21. al-'Aql wa al-'uqalā' wa mā cā'a fī awsāfihim 'an al-'ulamā'i wa al-hukamā'[46]

22. Wasl mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-mursal wa al-munqati' wa al-mu'dal[47]

Some of the books[48] of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr received significant attention by some authors. Because of the preciousness of these books, and the status of their author and his scholarly fame, some scholars composed his works as poetry, some summarized them, collected them, or commented on them. Among some of these writings about Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's books are as follows:

1. *al-Taqrīb li kitāb al-Tamhīd* by Abū Abdullah Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Abī Bakr b. Farh al-Qurtubī al-Ansārī (d. 671/1273).[49]

2. *Kitāb fī ikhtisār al-Tamhīd* by Abū al-Qāsim bin al-Jadd (d. 515/1121).

---

[40] See Cāsim, "İbn Abdülber en-Nemerī", 19/271. The title of book means "The Book of Fidelity: On the Names of Allah".

[41] Dhahabī, *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā*, 23/159.

[42] Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214.

[43] This is one of his lost works and it is a book on the hadīth al-wāhid. The name of book means "The Supporting Evidence for Maintaining Lone-Narrator Reports [a source for legal rulings]". Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214.

[44] It is attributed to Ibn 'Abd al-Barr. This is one of his lost works. See Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214.
The name of the book means "The Exposition Concerning the Recitation of Qur'ān".

[45] This is also one of his lost works. Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214. The title of book means "The Contentment in Nāfi' and Abū 'Amr's Reading".

[46] It is attributed to Ibn 'Abd al-Barr. This is one of his lost works. See Cāsim, "İbn Abdülber en-Nemerī", 19/271; Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214. The title of book means "Reason and the People of Wisdom".

[47] This is one of his lost works. Cāsim, *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*, 214.
al-Suyūtī (d. 911/1505) mentioned it in *Tadrīb al-rāwī fī Sharh Taqrīb al-Nawawī*, critical ed. Abū Qutayba Nazar Muhammad al-Fāryābī, 2 Volumes, Second Edition (Riyād: Maktaba al-Kawsar, 1415/1994), 1/212, and he transmitted from him the number of eloquence in *Muwatta'*, and that it is sixty-one hadīths... all of them are not supported by Mālik, except for four hadīths that are not known.

[48] For a detailed list of Abd al-Barr's books see Yusuf Acar, *Endülüs Hadisçiliği ve İbn Abdilber* (Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2020), 175-190.

[49] It is a study on *al-Tamhīd*. Its copy is in the Moroccan Karaviyyīn Library. Brockelmann, *GAL Suppl.*, 1/298.

3. *Mukhtasar kitāb al-Istidhkār* by Muhammad bin Abdullah bin Ahmad bin Abī Bakr al-Ishbilī (d. 543/1148). This is a summary of the book *al-Istidhkār*.

4. *Mukhtasar kitāb al-Istidhkār* by Alī bin Ibrahim bin Alī al-Jazāmī (d. 632/1234). This is a summary of *al-Istidhkār*.

5. *Mukhtasar kitāb al-Istidhkār* by Abū Bakr al-Qurtubī (d. 630/1232). It is summary of the book of *al-Istidhkār*.

6. *Muqaddimat kitāb al-Istidhkār* by Abū Tāhir Sadr al-Dīn al-Silafī (d. 576/1180). This is an introduction to the book *al-Istidhkār*.

7. *al-Jam' bayn kitābay al-Tamhīd wa al-Istidhkār* by Abū al-Walīd Hishām bin Ahmad al-Faqīh (d. 509/1115).[50] This combines the two books: *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār*.

8. *Qasīdah al-Dāl*[51] by Abū Muhammad (Abū al-Qāsim) Qāsim bin Fīrruh al-Shātibī (d. 590/1194). This is for Qāsim bin Fīrruh al-Shātibī who wrote a poem based on the Arabic letter of Dāl (د)[52] in five hundred verses from his memory. While writing, he took notes from *al-Tamhīd* by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr.[53]

2.4 His Scholarly Status

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr was known as "the imām of his era".[54] He was a trustworthy hāfiz narrator and a jurist who opposed to taqlīd, and he eventually reached the level of mujtahid (a person who is qualified for independent reasoning). Although he was previously associated with Zāhirī school of law, he later became a Mālikī.[55] Ibn 'Abd al-Barr progressed in the science of hadīth and fiqh as far as he could, and he also became prominent in the fields of Qirā'at, Tārikh, Nasab, Literature, Poetry. He created massively significant treatises for each one of these areas. But he didn't delve deep into the discipline of Kalām ('ilm usūl al-dīn, the

---

[50]   He died before it was over.

[51]   The manuscripts of the work in libraries of Turkey are as follows: Süleymaniye library, Ayasofya no. 67; Millet Feyzullah Efendi no. 295.

[52]   It means a kind of classification in Arabic poetry, a poem by Arabic letter of Dāl (د). It means sealing each couplet with the letter of Dāl (د).

[53]   Ibn Khallikān, *Wafayāt al-a'yān wa anbā'u abnā'i al-zamān*, 4/71. See Abdurrahman Çetin, "Şâtıbî, Kâsım b. Fîrruh", *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* (İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 2010), 38/376.

[54]   Burhān al-Dīn Ibn Farḥūn al-Andalusī al-Mālikī, *al-Dībāj al-mudhhab fī ma'rifat a'yān 'ulamā' al-madhhab* (Cairo, 1972), 2/293.
        Ibn 'Abd al-Barr was also known as "Shaykh 'ulamā' al-Andalus". See Ibn Farḥūn, *al-Dībāj al-mudhhab fī ma'rifat a'yān 'ulamā' al-madhhab*, 2/293.

[55]   Acar, *Endülüs Hadisçiliği ve İbn Abdilber*, 206-207.

discipline of basic doctrines of Islam).[56] He died in Shāṭiba (Jativa/Xàtiva)[57] at the age of 95 on a Friday night in 463 AH / 1071 CE. Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr taught and inspired a lot of students, and he was later referred to as "there came no one equal to him in the area of hadīth in Andalusia".[58]

All scholars who wrote about him praised Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr, and they said he was superior and precedent in knowledge, and described his books as grand masterpieces.[59] Ibn al-Jawzī (d. 597/1201)[60] and Muhammad Bāqir al-Mūsawī al-Khānsārī (d. 1313/1895)[61] also joined the rest in the consensus of praise for his books. What Ibn Hazm al-Andalusī (d. 456/1064) and al-Dhahabī (d. 748/1348) said about the book *al-Tamhīd*, the largest of his books, suffices alone; as will be seen in the next section.

It is quite a compliment for Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr to be praised as "an imām of the science of hadīth" by Ibn Hazm, who was known for his aggressive comments against well-known scholars and their explanations.[62] It is remarkable that Ibn ʿAyyād (d. 575/1180), described V. (XI.) century as "the time of Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr" in his work *Tabaqāt al-fuqahā fī ʿasri Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr*.[63] Besides, al-Dhahabī talked of him as a knowledgeable person, and al-Suyūtī (d. 911/1505) said that he was a leading muhaddith of his time in terms of *hifz* (memory) and *itkān* (trustworthiness).[64] Based on his ideas defending that Alī -may Allah pleased with him- is superior to other companions, Ibn Taymiyya (d. 622/1225) described him as a supporter of Shīʿa, but this was not accepted due to his loyalty to hadīth and sunnah, which eventually led him to be characterized as "atharī".[65] He said in the introduction of *al-Istīʿāb* that Prophet

---

[56]   Acar, *Endülüs Hadisçiliği ve İbn Abdilber,* 191.

[57]   It is a town in the East of Spain, in the province of Valencia. See E. Lévi-Provençal, "Shāṭiba", *Encyclopaedia of Islam*, First Edition (1913-1936), edited by M. Th. Houtsma, T.W. Arnold, R. Basset, and R. Hartmann. (Accessed 03.09.2021). doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/2214-871X_ei1_SIM_5342).

[58]   For further information about Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr's contribution to science of hadīth in Spain see Abū Nayeem Md. Raisuddin, "Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr and his Contribution to the Study of Ḥadīth Literature in Spain", *Muslim Education Quarterly* 7/3 (1990), 28-34.

[59]   Abū al-Fiḍā ʿImād al-Dīn Ismāʿīl b. ʿUmar Ibn Kathīr, *al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah* (Beirut: Maktabah al-Maʿārif, 1410/1990), 104.

[60]   ʿAbd al-Raḥmān b. ʿAlī b. Muḥammad Abū al-Faraj b. al-Jawzī, *Sayd al-Khāter* (Beirut, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyyah, 1992), 64.

[61]   Muhammad Bāqir al-Mūsawī al-Khānsārī, *Rawdāt al-jannāt fī ahwāl al-ʿulamā' wa al-sādāt*, 8 Volumes (Teheran-Qum: Maktabah Ismāiliyyān, 1390), 8/222.

[62]   Abū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd b. Hazm al-Andalusī al-Ẓāhirī, *Fadāil al-Andalus wa ahlihā* (Beirut, 1968), 13-14.
    For further information about connection of Ibn Hazm with Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr see Acar, *Endülüs Hadisçiliği ve İbn Abdilber*, 193-195.

[63]   al-Ziriklī, *al-Aʿlām*, 8/240.

[64]   Ibn Khallikān, *Wafayāt al-aʿyān wa anbāʾu abnāʾi al-zamān*, 7/71.

[65]   Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd,* 1/2; 1/7.

Muhammad didn't narrate any hadīth about the superiority of any companion to others, which indicated that he didn't prefer Alī –may Allah pleased with him- to other three khalīfas and companions. On the other hand, he left the opinions of Imām Mālik and adopted the opinions of Shāfi'ī in some cases, frequently used statements in some of his works such as "That's the correct one for me", "That is the most correct of narrations", "That is closer to the correct one", "That is more appropriate for me".[66] These statements prove that he reached the level of mujtahid.

3. His Commentaries on *Muwatta'*

Imām Mālik's *Muwatta'* includes transmissions of the Prophet and legal opinions of early scholars of Madina. *Muwatta'* is not a purely hadīth book, it contains traditions of the Messenger of Allah, legal decisions of the companions, successors and some later authorities. Imām Mālik steadily revised his *Muwatta'* and reduced the narrations in it. *Muwatta'* has more than eighty versions, and the most famous of them belongs to Yahyā b. Yahyā. A vast literature is available on *Muwatta'*. There are a significant number of commentaries on it;[67] but the most famous commentaries are by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr.

3.1 A Resource that Gathers Different Variations Together: *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta'*[68]

The book of *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd* is considered as one of the most important books of clarifications of the noble hadīth, and one of the most important books that explained the "*Muwatta'* of Imām Mālik". Even if *al-Tamhīd* was not the most important at one point, its importance formed over time. Because Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, combined the hadīth and jurisprudential industries in a solid and sustainable scholarly manner. In addition, it was an integrated approach to explaining the hadīth, adding to this his commentary about the narrators with criticism and approval (hadīth transmitter criticism – *al-jarh wa ta'dīl*) a wound and an amendment. For example, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr gave the example of Ibn Shihāb al-Zuhrī (d. 124/742) who sometimes quoted the narrators, sometimes

---

[66]   "هذا هو الصحيح بالنسبة لي" ، "هذا هو أصح الروايات" ، "الأقرب إلى الصحيح" ، "هذا الأنسب لي أو الأقرب إلى ما أرى"

For an example of "أصح حديث في الباب" see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 1/330; for "أصح عندي" see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 3/10; for "أَصَحّ شَيْءٍ" see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 1/174; 1/185; 3/136.

[67]   Muhammad Mustafa al-A'zamī, *Studies in Hadīth Methodology and Literature* (Indianapolis: American Trust Publications, 1977), 82-83. Some of them follows Abū Walīd Sulaimān b. Khalaf al-Bājī (d. 474/1081) compiled two commentaries: *al-Istifā'* and *al-Muntaqā*,

Muhammad b. 'Abd al-Bāqī al-Zurqānī (d. 1122/1710) wrote *Sharh al-Muwatta'*,

Muhammad Zakariyya al-Kandahlawī (d. 1982) wrote *Awjaz al-Masālik ilā Muwatta' Mālik*.

[68]   The title of book means "The facilitation to the meanings and chains of transmissions found in Mālik's *Muwatta'*".

combined them, sometimes mentioned the names of several narrators and transmitted from them, and sometimes cited only one of the sources of information. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr said that this situation was not a problem for Ibn Shihāb while narrating the hadīth about the event of *ifk*.[69] He also provided an explanation of the strange (gharīb / الغريب) words found in *Muwatta'* or in its explanations.[70]

The most comprehensive work of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr is *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*.[71] Ibn 'Abd al-Barr was certainly interested in this book, but it took him thirty years to write it. It is a compilation work on *fiqh al-hadīth*. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr wrote this treatise, which was one of the most important commentaries on *Muwatta'*, with the purpose of showing the soundness of musnad (supported), mursal (isnād without companion narrator, lacking the mention of the first transmitter),[72] munqati' (interrupted or broken-chain of report)[73] types of hadīths and trustworthiness of narrators found in *Muwatta'*. He also wrote it to facilitate accessing the chain of hadīths arranged in his work in accordance with alphabetic order of Imām Mālik's teachers.

In *al-Tamhīd* Ibn 'Abd al-Barr evaluated the text as well as the chains of narrators in Imām Mālik's *Muwatta'*. It is a commentary of *Muwatta'* which was written on the basis of hadīth attributed to Prophet directly in the narration of Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī (d. 234/849). Ibn 'Abd al-Barr used a total of 44 (45 with Yahyā b. Yahyā's narration) narrations of *Muwatta'* except the narration of Yahyā b. Yahyā while writing *al-Tamhīd*. However, he took narrations that can be *mutābi'* (supportive chain, corroborative chain) and *shāhid* (auxiliary narration) which he found in other hadīth corpus, even though they were not found in Yahyā b. Yahyā's copy.[74] Firstly, he undertook intensive research on the text of *Muwatta'* from a specific perspective aimed at finding out significations (ma'ānī) of every hadīth in the work. The result was startling, in that the ahādīth of *Muwatta'* not only served as a basis for Mālikite fiqh, but also for other school of law.

---

[69]   Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 7/45.

[70]   Zişan Türcan, *Hadis Şerh Geleneği: Doğuşu Gelişimi ve Dönüşümü* (Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2011), 165-166.

[71]   Nevzat Tartı has written a master thesis named *İbn Abdi'l-Berr ve et-Temhid'indeki Şerh Metodu* (Ibn 'Abd al-Barr and the Method of Sharh in his *al-Tamhīd*). Nevzat Tartı, *İbn Abdi'l-Berr ve et-Temhid'indeki Şerh Metodu* (Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 1994). And also Harun Apaydın wrote a master thesis named *İbn Abdilberr'in (ö. 463) Hadis Usulcülüğü (et-Temhīd Çerçevesinde)*. See Harun Apaydın, *İbn Abdilberr'in (ö. 463) Hadis Usulcülüğü (et-Temhīd Çerçevesinde) (Methodology of Hadīth of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (d. 463) in the Framework of al-Tamhīd)* (Malatya: İnönü Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 2017).

[72]   For a mursal tradition see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 11/78; 16/253.

[73]   For a munqati' tradition see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 16/247.

[74]   For a *mutābi* chain of hadīth see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd* (Rabat, 1992), 23/432.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr called this book "*al-Tamhīd*", referring to what is in *Muwatta'*: meanings and isnāds. His intention in writing this book was to explain everything that was attributed to the Prophet in *Muwatta'* of Imām Mālik, whether they were a chain of transmission, categorized, or mursal in the book's introduction. "I wanted to gather in my book everything that was included in *Muwatta'* of Mālik bin Anas, may Allah have mercy on him, in the narration of Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī al-Andalusī from the hadīth of the Messenger of Allah, may peace be upon Him, its chain of musnad (uninterrupted), and maqtū' (sub-companion report), and mursal (lacking the mention of transmitter), and all that could be attributed to the Messenger of Allah, may Allah's prayers and peace be upon Him."[75]

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr elaborated the chains of hadīths within *Muwatta'* by the introductory information he gave about narrators.[76] By doing this, he tried to show how trustworthy they were and to prove that some narrators were wrongly accused. For example, some scholars said that the chain was from Mālik > Zayd b. Aslam (d. 136/754) > 'Atā b. Yasār (d. 103/721) > Abdullah al-Sunābihī (d. 75/694) > Messenger of Allah is munqati'. But Ibn 'Abd al-Barr stated that Abdullah al-Sunābihī was a companion, so this narration should be mawsūl.[77] He also touched upon all the variants outside *Muwatta'* that he could get his hands on. He categorized ahādīth as muttasil (uninterrupted), munqati' (interrupted) and mursal respectively. He also mentioned maqtū' (intersected hadīth) and mursal narrations came from different tarīqs/chains with muttasil isnād. For the marāsīl (plural of mursal) he bridged the gap by mentioning the name of the transmitter that was dropped, or he pointed out an alternative chain of narrator for that hadīth which was muttasil.[78]

It is appropriate to give the following examples for the isnād evaluations in *al-Tamhīd*. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr refers to the attribution of one of the narration as mursal,[79] and it is understood that he used this expression, that is, the word "mursal", in the sense of munqati'. Because this hadīth requires evaluation as mu'dal.

---

[75]   Introduction to the book *al-Tamhīd*. See Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*, critical ed. Muhammad Bashshār 'Avvād, 17 Volumes, First Edition (London: al-Furqān Islamic Heritage Foundation, 1439/2017), 1/160.

[76]   Türcan, *Hadis Şerh Geleneği: Doğuşu Gelişimi ve Dönüşümü*, 160-164.

[77]   Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*, critical ed. Sa'īd Ahmad A'rab, 4/1-2. For another example see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 23/16. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's explanation is that this is *musnad (ie. marfū' muttasil) muttasil* tradition "وهو حديث مسند متصل".

[78]   For name of the transmitter that was dropped see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd* (Rabat, 1992), 2/134-135.

[79]   Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 5/42; 11/201-202; 23/32.

وَحَدَّثَنِى عَنْ مَالِكٍ عَنِ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ عَنْ سَعِيدِ بْنِ الْمُسَيَّبِ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ -صلى الله عليه وسلم- قَضَى فِى الْجَنِينَ يُقْتَلُ فِى بَطْنِ أُمِّهِ بِغُرَّةٍ عَبْدٍ أَوْ وَلِيدَةٍ فَقَالَ الَّذِى قُضِىَ عَلَيْهِ كَيْفَ أَغْرَمُ مَا لاَ شَرِبَ وَلاَ أَكَلْ وَلاَ نَطَقَ وَلاَ اسْتَهَلَّ وَمِثْلُ ذَلِكَ بَطَلْ. فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ -صلى الله عليه وسلم- « إِنَّمَا هَذَا مِنْ إِخْوَانِ الْكُهَّانِ ».[80]

This is translation of hadīth: "Yahyā related to me from Mālik from Ibn Shihāb from Sa'īd b. al-Musayyab that the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless Him and grant Him peace, gave a judgement that the compensation for a foetus killed in its mother's womb was a slave or slave-girl of fair complexion and excellence. The one against whom the judgement was given said, "Why should I pay damages for that which did not drink or eat or speak or make any cry. The like of that is nothing." The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless Him and grant Him peace, said, "This is only one of the brothers of the diviners." He disapproved of the rhyming speech of the man's declaration."

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr stated that this hadīth was transmitted by Ibn Shihāb al-Zuhrī both as mursal and mawsūl chain. It is narrated by Mālik > Ibn Shihāb al-Zuhrī > Sa'īd b. al-Musayyab > Prophet as mursal chain and also it is narrated by Abū Salama b. Abdirrahmān > Abū Huraira > Prophet as mawsūl chain. He gives this information in his two commentaries, both in *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār*.[81]

The following example can be given of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's meticulousness in mentioning the additional isnāds of the related narrations and making evaluations about the chains:

وَحَدَّثَنِى عَنْ مَالِكٍ عَنْ زَيْدِ بْنِ أَسْلَمَ عَنْ عَطَاءِ بْنِ يَسَارٍ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ -صلى الله عليه وسلم- قَالَ « اللَّهُمَّ لاَ تَجْعَلْ قَبْرِى وَثَنًا يُعْبَدُ اشْتَدَّ غَضَبُ اللَّهِ عَلَى قَوْمٍ اتَّخَذُوا قُبُورَ أَنْبِيَائِهِمْ مَسَاجِدَ ».[82]

"Yahyā related to me from Mālik from Zayd ibn Aslam from 'Atā b. Yasār that the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless Him and grant Him peace, said, "O Allah! Do not make my grave an idol that is worshipped. The anger on those who took the graves of their Prophets as places of prostration was terrible."

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr states that he does not know of a reserved concluding book of this narration, which is included in the *Muwatta'* with a mursal sanad. He also makes good use of terms. For example, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr evaluates the isnād of the hadīth by saying " وبهذا الإسناد عن ابن شهاب خاصة منقطع وهو في الموطأ مسند متصل من طريق ". But in this evaluation, he means dispatch with the expression "منقطع/munqati'".

---

80   *Muwatta'*, 'Uqūl (7), 5/201.

81   Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 6/477-478; 6/481.

82   *Muwatta'*, Qasr al-salāt, 2/37.

While he interpreted hadīth, he provided with the life stories of the narrators.[83] He furnished his narration with full biographical data, critical estimates and other relevant matters with regard to the individual narrator that was mentioned in every chain of transmissions. He built his narrations starting from his teacher and ending with the companions of the Prophet. By providing examples from verses of Qur'ān, hadīths, and sayings of linguists, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr tried to ensure a better understanding of literal meanings of hadīths. He sometimes provides explanations on Arabic grammar of Sarf and Nahw.

It is possible to obtain information about Imām Mālik's writing of *Muwatta'* from *al-Tamhīd*. Because *al-Tamhīd* contains the largest number of *Muwatta'* versions known so far. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr used forty-four versions (forty-five with the narration of Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī) while writing *al-Tamhīd*. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr cites the consensus that Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī is one of the last narrations of *Muwatta'* (samā': hearing it from Imām Mālik himself) copies.[84]

'Abd al-Barr tried to reconcile the ahadīth that seemed to be in contradiction as much as he could. He used the same method while dealing with the seemingly contradicting Qur'ānic verses. He resorts to abrogation as an ultimate solution. He approves the view that the abrogator (*nāsikh*) hadīth should be at least equal or powerful than the abrogated hadīth.[85]

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr explains different subjects that hadīths touched upon by giving examples from verses from Qur'ān, hadīths, actions of companions and successors, poems, historical and geographical information.[86] To clarify some aspects of the subject he asks himself possible questions about the issue and answers them.[87] While elaborating the points on which scholars concord or contend, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr gave all the views about the topic, sometimes with their evidence. Occasionally, he mentioned his own opinions, but also criticized the views that he didn't approve. Because every hadīth were commented separately in *al-Tamhīd* depending on its theme, integrity cannot be achieved and citations were made frequently to reach broader information about the subject. To detect the place of citation of

---

[83] The work in which Ibn 'Abd al-Barr arranged the teachers of Imām Mālik in Maghrib in alphabetical order and exhibited his accumulation of knowledge within its characteristics of encyclopedia, was published with an index which consisted of two volumes added by Sa'īd Ahmad A'rab and others. See Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*, critical ed. Sa'īd Ahmad A'rab, I26 Volumes (Titwān: Wizārat al-Awqāf wa al-shu'ūn al-Islāmiyyah, 1387-1412/1967-1992).

[84] Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 19/264.

[85] For some examples of *nāsikh* tradition in *al-Tamhīd* see Apaydın, *İbn Abdilberr'in (ö. 463) Hadis Usulcülüğü (et-Temhîd Çerçevesinde)* (Malatya: İnönü Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 2017), 71-74.

[86] Türcan, *Hadis Şerh Geleneği*, 160-168.

[87] Tartı, *İbn Abdi'l-Berr ve et-Temhid'indeki Şerh Metodu*, 98-109.

any hadīth, the names of the narrator within the chain should be known. Otherwise, the reader could have difficulty to reach hadīths.[88]

al-Tamhīd is accepted as one of the most important works in the field, and admitted as an encyclopedia of hadīth and Mālikī fiqh due to its diligence and extensive commentary. However, it was difficult to utilize so much from such an important work because its traditions existed in different places.[89]

3.2 A Compendium: Tajrīd al-Tamhīd[90]

This book is a compendium of *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta'*. *Tajrīd al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'āni wa al-asānīd* and *al-Taqassī li hadīth al-Muwatta' wa shuyūkh al-Imām Mālik*[91] are the same books. It is a comprehensive study on the ahādīth of *Muwatta'* of Imām Mālik. It serves as an introduction for *al-Tamhīd*, the author's most important work. He focused on marfū' transmissions (hadīth attributed to the Messenger of Allah) of Prophet Muhammad. It is also like a dictionary for *al-Tamhīd*. In this work, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr divided the hadīth of *Muwatta'* as musnad, muttasil, mursal and munqati', which according to Mālikī school of law was guaranteed. The author gave the names of the shuyukh of Imām Mālik and arranged them alphabetically. Every alphabet was treated as a section. He did this for easy access to the book. While talking of the shuyūkh (teachers, people from whom the hadīth is related) he mentioned the number of ahādīth they transmitted and their categories: musnad, mursal and munqati'.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, at the end of *al-Taqassī*, states that there are sixty-eight abrogated narrations of *Muwatta'* available in the others, although they are not included in Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī version, and he mentions them one by one.[92] *al-Taqassī* that gained recognition especially in al-Andalus was interpreted with the name of *Takrīb li-Kitāb al-Tamhīd* by Abū Abdullah Muhammad b. Husain al-Ansārī in V. (XI) century. A copy of this commentary and an ikhtisār edited by Muhammad b. Ahmad al-Kurtubī is found the library of Qaraviyyin in Morocco.[93] The work was also written in the form of poetry with 500 verses. Muhammad b. Abdurrahman al-Maghrāwī reorganized it again in his work *Fath al-bar fī al-tartīb al-fikhī li Tamhīd Ibn 'Abd al-Barr* according to fiqh topics. After he compiled the hadīth (takhrīj), it was publihed as an introduction and twelve volumes.[94] Mustafa Sumaida

---

[88]   An index section would make the usage of treatises easier.

[89]   After its publication, however, the opportunity to benefit will increase.

[90]   Published. The title of book means "The Detailed Study in the Abridgment of *Muwatta'*". Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, *Tajrīd al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd* (Beirut, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, no date).

[91]   Published. Cairo, 1350/1931 and Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, no date.

[92]   Ebubekir Sifil, *Muvatta Nüshaları Muhteva Analizi* (İstanbul: Rıhle Kitap, 2017), 162.

[93]   Cāsim, "İbn Abdülber en-Nemerī", 19/270.

[94]   12 Volumes (Riyād, 1996/1416).

organized *al-Tamhīd* in a different way than in his work *Fath al-Mālik bi tabwīb al-Tamhīd li Ibn 'Abd al-Barr 'alā Muwatta' Mālik*[95] and he compiled the hadīth.

3.3 As A Source Concentrating on the Contents of Narrations: *al-Istidhkār*[96]

Another work whose name was determined in this way in the last editions was called as *al-Istidhkār li madhhab 'ulamā' al-amsār fī mā tadammanahu al-Muwatta' min ma'ānī al-ra'ī wa al-āthār or al-Istidhkār fī sharh li madhhabi 'ulamā' al-amsār fī mā tadammanahu al-Muwatta' min ma'ānī al-ra'ī wa al-āthār.* It is a re-evaluation of the ahādīth of *Muwatta'* of Imām Mālik, showing a wide scope of adhering to various schools of law, as adopted by different Muslim countries. The author explained *mawqūf* [halted-chain (companion) report] and *maqtū'* [severed-chain (sub-companion)] narrations which are found in *Muwatta',* he also explained sayings of scholars who belonged to different madhabs and lived in various regions.[97]

The book that Ibn Abd al-Barr commented on arranged the hadīths according to the jurisprudential order. In arranging these material, he applied a method based on the chains of transmissions. And this method is summarized as follows:

1. He arranged the hadīths of the book according to the letters of the lexicon based on the names of the sheikhs (teachers) of Mālik.

2. He transmitted all munqati' (interrupted) and mursal traditions through muttasil (uninterrupted) chains[98] through isnād that did not directly come from Mālik. For example, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr stated that all narrators of *Muwatta'* transmitted a hadīth by mursal chains. He added that some narrators transmitted this hadīth by mawsūl chains. He mentioned the names of these narrators who transmitted the hadīth by mawsūl chains.[99]

3. For that, he relied on the transmission of the imāms and what was narrated by the trustworthy narrators of this ummah.

---

[95] 10 Volumes (Beirut 1418/1998).

[96] The title of book means "The memorization of the doctrine of the scholars of world concerning juridical opinions and the narrations found in Mālik's *Muwatta*"".

[97] Two volumes of the work were published by Alī an-Najdī Nāsif. The work was published completely by Abd al-Mu'tī Amīn Kal'ajī with three-volume index and totally as thirty volumes.

[98] For example see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Istidhkār,* 15/301; 21/262.

[99] Abū Āsım Dahhāk b. Mahlad (d. 212/828), 'Abd al-Mālik b. Mājishūn (d. 212/827), Yahyā b. Ibrāhim al-Sulamī (d. ?), Abū Yūsuf (d. 182/798) and Sa'īd b. Dāvūd al-Zanbarī (d. 220/835). All of these five narrators transmitted this hadīth by a musnad chain through Abū Huraira. This chain is Mālik > Ibn Shihāb (d. 124/742) > Sa'īd b. al-Musayyab (d. 94/713) and Abū Salama (d. 94/712-13) > Abū Huraira (d. 58/678) > Prophet. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Istidhkār,* 21/261-262.

For another example see Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd,* 24/161-165.

4. He explained some sayings of the scholars regarding the interpretation of hadīths, abrogating and abrogated ones,[100] their abrogation rules and their meanings. This approach would heal the reader, make him visible, keep him on alert and in this world.

5. He derived the meanings and the chains of transmission from evidence, including the impact he received in his time.

6. He explained what he used as a metaphor for words, confining himself to the sayings of the scholars of the language.

7. He referred to some narrators' conditions, their lineages, and their status in terms of science of *al-jarḥ wa al-taʿdīl* (discrediting and accrediting).

8. In the introduction to the book, he put many rules and benefits in the sciences of hadīth.[101]

This book was praised by a group of scholars. On it, Ibn Hazm said, "I do not know of any speech on the jurisprudence of hadīth like it (this book), so how can I be better than it?". While al-Dhahabī said, "It is a book that no one has presented the like of it",[102] al-Qaḍī ʿIyāḍ said, "It is a book with a very unique method".[103]

It is possible to give the following examples about evaluation and explanations according to Islamic law by Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr. For example, it is possible to cite the following evaluation made in terms of Islamic law from *al-Istidhkār* as an example. Two examples will be given below:

Regarding the title in the *Muwatta'* that is "things that are not halāl for a person in ihrām to eat from the hunted", Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr says that Imām Mālik did not randomly put the phrase "not halāl" as a title in the narrations he quoted. According to him, Imām Mālik, with this title, both says that it is not permissible to eat the meat of an animal hunted by someone else while in ihrām, and also responds to those who say that it is permissible with the narrations under this heading.[104]

In the same way, it would be appropriate to give the following example for an example in which an evaluation is made in terms of Islamic law in *al-Istidhkār*. Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr stated that using the word tahrīm in the title of the chapter "باب تحريم أكل كل ذي ناب من السباع / It is forbidden to eat all predatory animals with canine teeth" indicates harām. According to him,

---

[100] Abū al-Khayr Shams al-Dīn Muhammad bin Abd al-Rahmān bin Muhammad Sakhāwī, *al-Tawdīh al-abhar li tadhkirat Ibn al-Mulaqqin fī ʿilm al-athar*, critical ed. Abdullah b. Muhammad Abd al-Rahīm b. Husayin al-Bukhārī (Riyāḍ: Adwa' al-salaf, 1418/1998), 38, 39.

[101] Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 1/35.

[102] Dhahabī, *Siyar aʿlām al-nubalā*, 18/158.

[103] al-Qadī ʿIyāḍ, *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li maʿrifat aʿlām madhhab Mālik*, 8/129.

[104] Ibn ʿAbd al-Barr, *al-Istidhkār*, 4/139.

Imām Mālik created the title in this way, expressing his own opinion clearly and also responding to those who had the opposite opinion with this title.[105]

3.4 Distinctive Features of *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār*: A Comparison From Different Points

The history of the commentary in *al-Istidhkār* indicates that it was written later than *al-Tamhīd* because it refers to more information than we see in *al-Tamhīd*. One of his most important purposes in writing *al-Tamhīd* is to show the correction of the narrations of Imām Mālik's *Muwatta'*. The isnād and rijāl evaluations are more intense in *al-Tamhīd*.[106] It is quite rich in terms of giving different chains and differences of variants of *Muwatta'*. It especially endeavored to connect the mursal and munqati' narrations. This is one of the main features of the commentary and explanation. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's approach also includeed identifying all the known variants of hadīth narrations.[107] His explanations in *al-Istidhkār* also reached an advanced point in this regard.

The main reason why Ibn 'Abd al-Barr cited various narrations in *al-Tamhīd* was to emphasize the connection between the mursal and munqati' narrations in *Muwatta'*. Although *Muwatta'* prioritizes evaluating the attribution and the narration, it has been reported that it did not place much importance on the contents of the narrations. In fact, it explains the narration texts in terms of content just like an interpretation for the hadīth. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's approach for analyzing the content, therefore, did not differ from his approach in *al-Istidhkār* as he explained the odd words in the hadīth. He cited these by referring to the verses, hadīths, poetic verses, as well as the Arabic quotations.

The grammatical interpretations that he uses in commenting and explaining the narration texts do not differ from content analysis of texts in *al-Istidhkār*. Still in *al-Tamhīd*, he sometimes mentions some interpretations that are not found in *al-Istidhkār*. For example, in *Muwatta'* in the book of sadaqa (Kitāb al-Sadaqa/كتاب الصدقة), there is a hadīth about a companion. It narrates Abū Talha al-Ansārī's [d. 34/654-55], may Allah be pleased with him, love of property. In this hadīth[108] the phrase "property which profits/مال رابح " is used. The Messenger of Allah used it while defining the date palms that Abū Talha al-Ansārī chartered.

---

[105]   Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Istidhkār*, 5/291.

[106]   Zişan Türcan defines *al-Tamhīd* as a commentary in which isnād and narrators evaluations are intense. See Türcan, *Hadis Şerh Geleneği*, 159-160.

[107]   Türcan, *Hadis Şerh Geleneği*, 160-177.

[108]   The full version of hadīth is as follows:

Mālik related to me that Ishāq ibn Abdullah bin Abī Talha heard Anas ibn Mālik say, "Abū Talha had the greatest amount of property in palm-trees among the Ansār in Madīna. The dearest of his properties to him

One of the important formal differences is that in *al-Istidhkār*, he only mentioned the narrations without attribution, while he mentioned all attributions in *al-Tamhīd*. It can be said that Ibn 'Abd al-Barr provided these interpretations to understand the content of the texts more broadly than in *al-Istidhkār* and more compactly in *al-Tamhīd*. Although there is less intellectual information in *al-Tamhīd* than in *al-Istidhkār*, there is no separate section explaining the objectives of the book because it was arranged according to the names of sheikhs. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr narrated the same hadīth about many sheikhs, and therefore the same hadīth was discussed in different chapters. In *al-Tamhīd*, it is not possible to deal with the issue of intellectual objectivity in a comprehensive manner, as the unity of the topic is divided between sections of the book.

As for *al-Istidhkār*, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr deals with jurisprudence issues, fiqh, in a more comprehensive manner, because the jurisprudential issues are not distributed among the chapters; they are combined with all kinds of subject matters in one place. The intellectual issues are examined in different dimensions until the essence of the issue is revealed, so the narration could come from two different sheikhs. Related to this, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr always mentions the most correct opinion in his view, and chooses his favorite among the different sayings of the narrations. He does not only transmit the intellectual views, but also expresses his opinion on jurisprudential issues.[109]

Commentaries of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr are the primary sources about *Muwatta's* narartions, narrators, chapters and content. For example, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr states the following when talking about the documents of *Muwatta'*: "Mālik is the first person to make the name *al-jāmi'* the title of books in *Muwatta'*."[110]

---

was Bayruhā' (بَيْرُحَاءَ) which was in front of the mosque. The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless Him and grant Him peace, used to go into it and drink from the pleasant water which was in it."

Anas continued, "When this ayat was sent down 'You will not obtain rightness of action until you spend of what you love/لَنْ تَنَالُوا الْبِرَّ حَتَّى تُنْفِقُوا مِمَّا تُحِبُّونَ' (Surah Āli 'Imrān (3), verse no: 92), Abū Talha went to the Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless Him and grant Him peace, and said, 'Messenger of Allah! Allah, the Blessed, the Exalted, has said, "You will not obtain until you spend of what you love/لَنْ تَنَالُوا الْبِرَّ حَتَّى تُنْفِقُوا

مِمَّا تُحِبُّونَ" The property which I love the best is Bayruhā'. It is sadaqa for Allah. I hope for its good and for it to be stored up with Allah. Place it wherever you wish, Messenger of Allah.'"

"The Messenger of Allah, may Allah bless Him and grant Him peace, said, 'Well done! That is property which profits! That is property which profits. I have heard what you said about it and I think you should give it to your relatives.' Abū Talha said, 'I will do it, Messenger of Allah!' Abū Talha therefore divided it among his relatives and the children of his paternal uncle." *Muwatta'*, Sadaqa, 1.

109   Türcan, *Hadis Şerh Geleneği*, 157-179.

110   Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī, *al-Kāfī fī fıkh ahl al-Madīnah al-Mālikī*, 1/71.

3.5 Ibn 'Abd al-Barr Between Two Books: *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār*

The most common view on *al-Tamhīd* is that it is valuable because it pays attention to the science of narrators (*'ilm al-rijāl*) and attribution in a detailed manner. As seen until now, another valuable book by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr in explaining the jurisprudence "Fiqh" is *al-Istidhkār*. Ibn 'Abd al-Barr wrote *al-Tamhīd* before *al-Istidhkār*.[111]

He arranged *al-Istidhkār* in relation to the sheikhs/narrators of hadīths of Imām Mālik who narrated them in *Muwatta'*. He mentioned narration for each sheikh, arranging them in the Moroccan letters.[112] In this arrangement form, the narrations were *muttasil*, *munqati'* and *mursal*. He included the narrations that were not mentioned in *Muwatta'*. But in *al-Tamhīd*, he was limited to the narrations that were attributed to the Messenger of Allah only. He said in the introduction that he thought about writing an explanation of the musnad, maqtū' and mursal. He also thought of writing all types of hadīth that could be attributed to the Messenger of Allah. This is why *Muwatta'* includes the narrations of Yahyā b. Yahyā al-Laythī. The main feature that distinguishes *al-Tamhīd* from *al-Istidhkār* is that it deals only with the narrations that existed in *Muwatta'*. The hadīths mentioned in *al-Istidhkār* contained all kinds of narrations, sayings and hadīths that are somewhat related to the topic. Thus, the expressions of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr in *al-Tamhīd* shows that the munqati' narrations[113] in *Muwatta'* could be subject to amendments. This was his primary goal. He found that all munqati' or mursal hadīth mentioned in *Muwatta'* were narrated by the Imāms from other isnād/variants outside *Muwatta'*.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's *al-Tamhīd* began with a primary introduction, which directly serves this purpose. The introduction contains information about the science of hadīth terms. He wrote about the approaches on who narrated what in *Muwatta'*. He rejected the opinions of those who do not accept the *al-āhād* (solitary report) or *al-'adl* (trustworthy transmitter). He began *al-Istidhkār* with a short introduction explaining the reasons for this category: it is a work that focuses on the chains of transmissions and narrators. In addition, it was arranged according to the sheikhs of Imām Mālik.

In his commentaries, Ibn 'Abd al-Barr made important evaluations about the hadīths that were in conflict between them. In this regard, it would be appropriate to look at his evaluations about the issue of abrogation between the narrations that various beings will

---

[111] Sheikh Abd al-Karīm al-Khudheir said on the book of *al-Tamhīd* that, due to the length of time that Imām Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (may Allah have mercy on him) spent on writing it - and it was more than thirty years -, we cannot say that he wrote it before *al-Istidhkār*. Because *al-Istidhkār* refers to *al-Tamhīd* in most of the hadīths. And there are references from *al-Tamhīd* to *al-Istidhkār* in some places and they are not many. But they are present, and most often they are references from *al-Istidhkār* to *al-Tamhīd*.

[112] They are the letters of "أبجد هوز حطي كلم نصع فضق رست ثخذ"

[113] See examples of munqati' narration from *al-Tamhīd*, 5/42; 11/201-202; 23/432.

invalidate the prayer and the hadīths stating that the prayer will not be disrupted in any way.[114] Ibn 'Abd al-Barr states that the narrations that a woman, dog and donkey would break the prayer if they passed in front of a person praying. He stated that they were abrogated by the hadīth narrated from Aishah that nothing would invalidate the prayer.[115]

Conclusion

Most of Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's life coincided with deep political disturbances within the country, having been born in the Córdoba in year 368 AH / 979 CE. He was educated in many fields, by many teachers, which led to him being an exceptional scholar of Cordoba. What made him unique was that he achieved this even though he never went out of Andalusia, in an era which scholarly travels were very prevalent.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's commentaries contain very important information for variants of *Muwatta'* and their differences. Some of the narrations in *Muwatta'* versions are muttasil/marfū ', some are mursal, mawqūf etc. There are many examples in *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār* regarding its inclusion in various forms.

The versions of *Muwatta'* used by Ibn 'Abd al-Barr in *al-Tamhīd, al-Taqassī* and *al-Istidhkār,* contain important information about the number of narrations and the differences in narrations of *Muwatta'*.[116] In *al-Tamhīd,* Ibn 'Abd al-Barr reflects his scholarship and mentions all the legal provisions deduced from the hadīths of law. He occasionally brings evidence for these provisions from the verses of Qur'ān, hadīths, and views of scholars.

The two commentaries, *al-Tamhīd* and *al-Istidhkār* of the same book by the same author demonstrate that Ibn 'Abd al-Barr wrote these commentaries for different purposes, in different methods, with different contents, and for different ways of use. In addition, these commentaries influenced the development of the science of hadīth in their time and after. They affected other classical commentaries of *Muwatta'*. It is because of these reasons why the author needed to write two commentaries on the same book.

al-Istidhkār has been mentioned among the commentaries with more explanations on Islamic law, while *al-Tamhīd* has been mentioned as an example of annotations with a weight of isnād and rijāl. Although there are isnād and rijāl evaluations in *al-Istidhkār,* these evaluations are mostly pointed out to indicate the value of the relevant text in terms of Islamic law. However, the isnād and rijāl evaluations are more intense in *al-Tamhīd,* and it is quite rich in terms of giving different chains and differences of variants of *Muwatta'*.

---

[114] Ali Osman Koçkuzu, *Hadiste Nâsih-Mensûh Meselesi*, Second Edition (İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Yayınları, 2016), 251-52.

[115] Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, *al-Tamhīd*, 21/168.

[116] Sifil, *Muvatta Nüshaları Muhteva Analizi*, 162.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's commentaries about *Muwatta'* demonstrate that the commentaries were quite original and had an immense impact on its followers and in the later eras of hadīth science. The originality of them come from the meticulous way he researched all aspects of hadīth that he included in his commentaries, and his diligent work on Imām Mālik's approach to hadīth sciences. Especially when looked at his unique scholarly personality, it is seen how his commentaries influenced the development of the science of hadīth. He proved that even without the scholarly travels to other corners of 'ilm, it was possible to create an authentic work and become a leading scholar. When we closely examine Ibn 'Abd al-Barr's books, especially his commentaries, we see that they have had a continuous influence on the development of hadīth sciences, and on other classical commentaries of *Muwatta'* as well.

References

Acar, Yusuf. *Endülüs Hadisçiliği ve İbn Abdilber*. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2020.

Apaydın, Harun. *İbn Abdilberr'in (ö. 463) Hadis Usulcülüğü (et-Temhīd Çerçevesinde)*". Malatya: İnönü Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 2017.

al-A'zamī, Muhammad Mustafa. *Studies in Hadīth Methodology and Literature*. Indianapolis: American Trust Publications, 1977.

Brockelmann, Carl. *Geschichte der arabischen Litteratur (GAL)*. 2 Volumes. Leiden, 1943-1949.

Cāsim, Leys Suūd. *Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Andalusī wa juhūduhū fī al-tārikh*. Mansūrah: Dār al-Wafā, 1988.

Cāsim, Leys Suūd. "İbn Abdülber en-Nemerī". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*. 19/269-272, İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1999.

Cāsim, Leys Suūd. "Ẓāhir al-ziyādāt fī turāth al-Islāmī: dirāsah taḥlīliyyah taṭbīḳiyyah min khilāl kitāb al-Istī'āb li Ibn 'Abd al-Barr al-Qurtubī". *Majallah al-Jāmi'at al-Islāmiyyah al-ālamiyyah* 1, Islāmābād, 1416-17/1996-1997.

Çetin, Abdurrahman. "Şâtıbî, Kâsım b. Fîrruh". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*. 38/376-377, İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 2010.

al-Ḍabbī, Abū Ja'far Ahmad b. Yahyā b. Ahmad al-Andalusī. *Bughyah al-multamis fī tārikh rijāl ahl al-Andalus*. 2 Volumes. Second Edition. critical ed. Ibrahim al-Ebyārī. Cairo: Dār al-Kitāb al-Mısrī. Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-Lubnānī, 1989/1410.

Dhahabī, Shams al-Dīn Muhammad b. Ahmad b. Osman. *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā*. critical ed. Shu'ayb al-Arna'ūt, Husayin al-Asad. 25 Volumes. Third Edition. Beirut: Muassasah Risālah, 1985/1405.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī. *Jāmi' bayān al-'ilm wa fadlihī wa mā yanbaghī fī riwāyatihī wa ḥamlihī*. critical ed. Abū al-Ashbāl al-Zuhaiyrī. Two Volumes. First Edition. Dammām: Dār Ibn al-Jawzī, 1414/1994.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī. *Tajrīd al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*. Beirut, Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyyah, no date.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr, Abū Umar Yūsuf ibn Abdallah ibn Muhammad al-Namarī al-Andalusī al-Qurtubī al-Mālikī. *al-Tamhīd li mā fī al-Muwatta' min al-ma'ānī wa al-asānīd*. critical ed. Muhammad Bashshār 'Avvād. 17 Volumes. First Edition. London: al-Furqān Islamic Heritage Foundation, 1439/2017.

Ibn Bashkuwāl, Abū al-Qāsim Khalaf ibn 'Abd al-Mālik ibn Mas'ūd ibn Musa ibn Bashkuwāl ibn Yūsuf al-Ansārī. *al-Sila fī tārīkh a'immat al-Andalus*. Rabat: Dār al-Mansūr, 1973.

Ibn Farḥūn, Burhān al-Dīn al-Andalusī al-Mālikī. *al-Dībāj al-mudhhab fī ma'rifat a'yān 'ulamā' al-madhhab*. critical ed. Muḥammad al-Ahmadī Abū al-Nour. 2 Volumes. Cairo, 1972.

Ibn Hazm, Abū Muḥammad ʿAlī ibn Aḥmad ibn Saʿīd al-Andalusī al-Ẓāhirī. *Fadāil al-Andalus wa ahlihā*. critical ed. Salahuddīn al-Munjid. First Edition. Beirut, 1968.

Ibn al-Jawzī, 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. 'Alī b. Muḥammad Abū al-Faraj b. al-Jawzī. *Sayd al-Khāter*. Beirut, Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyyah, 1992.

Ibn Kathīr, Abū al-Fiḍā 'Imād al-Dīn Ismāʿīl b. 'Umar. *al-Bidāyah wa al-Nihāyah*. 15 Volumes. Beirut: Maktabah al-Maʿārif, 1410/1990.

Ibn Khallikān, Abū al-ʿAbbās Shams al-Dīn Ahmad b. Muhammad. *Wafayāt al-aʿyān wa anbāʾu abnāʾi al-zamān*. 8 Volumes. Beirut: Dār Sader, 1972.

Ibn Khayr al-Ishbīlī, Abū Bakr Muhammad b. Khayr. *Fahrasa Ibn Khayr al-Ishbīlī*. critical ed. Mahmoud Bashshār ʿAvvād. First Edition. Tunisia: Dār al-Gharb al-Islamī, 2009.

Ibn al-Qādī, Abū al-Abbās Shihāb al-Dīn Ahmad b. Muhammad b. Muhammad al-Miknāsī. *Jazwah al-iqtibās fī dhikri man halla min al-aʿlām bi al-madīnah Fās*. Two Volumes. First Edition. Rabat: Dār al-Mansūr, 1973/1393.

al-Khānsārī, Muhammad Bāqir al-Mūsawī. *Rawdāt al-Jannāt fī ahwāl al-ʿulamā' wa al-sādāt*. 8 Volumes. Teheran-Qum: Maktabah Ismāiliyyān, 1390.

Koçkuzu, Ali Osman. *Hadiste Nâsih-Mensûh Meselesi*. Second Edition. İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Yayınları, 2016.

Lévi-Provençal, E. "S͟hāṭiba". *Encyclopaedia of Islam, First Edition* (1913-1936). ed. M. Th. Houtsma, T.W. Arnold, R. Basset, and R. Hartmann. (Accessed 03.09. 2021).

al-Maghribī, Alī Ibn Mūsā Ibn Saʿīd. *al-Mughrib fī hula al-Maghrib*. Third Edition. Cairo: Dār al-Maʿāref, 1955.

al-Nabī, Muhammad Abd Rab. *Manhaj al-hāfiz Ibn 'Abd al-Barr fī al-jarh wa al-taʿdīl min khilāl kitābih al-Tamhīd*. Makkah al-Mukarramah-Saudi Arabia: Umm al-Qura University, Ph.D. Thesis, 2009.

Nāsır Güzeşte. "İbn 'Abdilber". *DMBI (Dā'irah al-Maʿārifi Büzürgī Islāmī)* 4/181-183. Teheran, 1990.

Özdemir, Mehmet. *Endülüs Müslümanları: Siyasi Tarih*. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2016.

Pellat, Ch. "Ibn 'Abd al-Barr". *Encyclopaedia of Islam, Second Edition*. ed. P. Bearman. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1163/1573-3912_islam_SIM_3027 (Accessed 26.08.2021).

al-Qādī 'Iyād, Abū al-Fadl 'Iyad b. 'Amr b. Musa b. 'Iyād b. Muhammad al-Yahsubī. *Tartīb al-madārik wa taqrīb al-masālik li maʿrifat aʾlām madhhab Mālik*. 8 Volumes. Second Edition. Maghrib: Wizārah al-Awqāf wa al-Shuʾūn al-Islāmiyyah, 1403/1983.

Raisuddin, Abū Nayeem Md. "Ibn 'Abd al-Barr and his Contribution to the Study of Ḥadīth Literature in Spain". *Muslim Education Quarterly* 7/3. Cambridge, 1990. 28-34.

Sakhāwī, Abū al-Khayr Shams al-Dīn Muhammad bin Abd al-Rahmān bin Muhammad. *al-Tawdīh al-abhar li tadhkirat Ibn al-Mulaqqin fī 'ilm al-athar*. critical ed. Abdullah b. Muhammad Abd al-Rahīm b. Husayin al-Bukhārī. Riyād: Adwa' al-Salaf, 1418/1998.

Sifil, Ebubekir. *Muvatta Nüshaları Muhteva Analizi*. İstanbul: Rıhle Kitap, 2017.

al-Silafī, Abū Tāhir Sadr al-Dīn. *Muḳaddimah al-Istidhkār*. Dār al-Kutub al-Zāhiriyyah. Majmū', nr. 71, vr. 12, 120.

al-Suyūtī, Jalāluddīn. *Tadrīb al-rāwī fī Sharh Taqrīb al-Nawawī*. critical ed. Abū Qutayba Nazar Muhamad al-Fāryābī. 2 Volumes. Second Edition. Riyād: Maktaba al-Kawsar, 1415/1994.

Tartı, Nevzat. *İbn Abdi'l-Berr ve et-Temhid'indeki Şerh Metodu*. Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 1994.

al-Tilimsānī, Abū al-Abbās Shihāb al-Dīn Ahmad b. Muhammad al-Maḳḳarī. *Nafh al-tīb min ghusn al-Andalus al-ratīb*. Beirut: Dār Sader, 1388/1968.

Türcan, Zişan. *Hadis Şerh Geleneği: Doğuşu Gelişimi ve Dönüşümü*. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2011.

Zengin, Nur. *Endülüslü Fakih İbn Abdilberr en-Nemeri ve el-Kafi fi'l-fıkh isimli muhtasarı*. İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi, Master Thesis, 2017.

al-Ziriklī, Muhammad Khayr al-Dīn. *al-A'lām*. 8 Volumes. Seventh Edition. Beirut: Dār al-'Ilm li al-Malāyīn, 1986.

https://waqfeya.net/book.php?bid=12541 (Accessed 10.09.2021).

https://www.al-furqan.com/event/id/2658. (Accessed 26.08.2021).