

**AN ANALYSIS ON PR (PUBLIC RELATIONS) STUDIES
CONDUCTED BY COMPANIES IN TURKEY ABOUT
ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT**

Uzman Güzin KIYIK

Anadolu University, Media Center
gkiyik@anadolu.edu.tr

Abstract

Referring an environmentally responsible management approach in the enterprises, the concept of “Environmental Management” has roots in 1980s. Initially comprising reactions against environmental protection and a number of rules, environmental management is now perceived from perspective of PR, the public relations, by ever increasing body of companies. Purpose of this study is to analyze the extent environmentalist activities performed under title of social responsibility (forestry, efficient use of natural resources, contribution to ecological balance, protection of endangered species, developing new technologies manufacturing environment-friendly products) are sincerely and honestly implemented. Four large-scale enterprises, which operate in different sectors and completed institutionalization process, in Turkey were enrolled into the study. News published in media in relation with those companies and their corporate web pages were screened and findings in accordance with pre-defined criteria were undergone content analysis. As a result of the study, it was observed that in Turkey, even large-scale enterprises had deficiencies in social responsibility awareness and they developed strategies overlapping with the concept “green washing”.

Key Words: Environmental Management, Environmentalist Public Relations Approach

**TÜRKİYE’DE ÇEVRE YÖNETİMİ KONUSUNDA ŞİRKETLERİN
GERÇEKLEŞTİRDİĞİ PR ÇALIŞMALARI ÜZERİNE ANALİZ**

Öz

İşletmelerdeki çevreye duyarlı yönetim anlayışını ifade eden “Çevre Yönetimi” 1980’lerden günümüze gelen bir kavramdır. Başlangıçta çevre korumaya yönelik tepkiler ve bir dizi kuraldan oluşan çevre yönetimi anlayışına son zamanlarda, PR yani halkla ilişkiler faaliyetleri boyutundan yaklaşan kurum sayısı gittikçe artmaktadır. Bu çalışmanın amacı, sosyal sorumluluk başlığı altında gerçekleştirilen çevreci faaliyetlerin (ağaçlandırma, doğal kaynakları etkili kullanma, ekolojik dengeye katkı, nesli tükenen türleri koruma, çevre dostu ürünler üreten yeni teknolojiler geliştirme vb.) ülkemizdeki işletmelerce ne derece etkili ve samimi şekilde yürütüldüğünü analiz etmektir. Türkiye’de farklı sektörlerden kurumsallaşma sürecini tamamlamış dört büyük işletme (OPET, ETİ, MNG, Garanti Bankası) araştırma kapsamına dahil edilmiştir. Basında bu şirketler

hakkında konuyla ilgili çıkan haberler ve şirket web sayfaları taranmış önceden belirlenen kriterler doğrultusunda bulgular içerik analizine tabi tutulmuştur. Araştırma sonucunda Türkiye’de örnekleme dahil edilen büyük işletmelerin dahi sosyal sorumluluk bilincini taşıma konusunda eksikleri olduğu ve adına “yeşil aklama” denilen kavramla örtüşen stratejiler geliştirdikleri görülmüştür.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Çevre Yönetimi, Çevreci PR (Halkla İlişkiler) Yaklaşımı

1. Introduction

It is probed that enterprises not only consider themselves, but they should also take care of the society and the environment under titles of corporate social responsibility and sustainable development, while convergence efforts between enterprise and the environment recently accelerated. The reason is that the environment is not only common problem, but also common responsibility of the whole world¹. Enterprises should involve in solution of environmental problems and they should integrate all businesses with environmental issues². In this study conducted in the end of the question “How efficiently the environmentally conscious management approaches are used in Turkey?”, it is addressed whether environmentalist management is confused with public relations activities. The most important task in inheritance of the un-polluted world to future generations should be undertaken by enterprises which manufacture goods and services and market them³. Purpose of the study is to analyze efficiency and honesty of environmentalist PR implementations performed by enterprises in our country. Within scope of the study, four large-scale corporate companies, which operate in different sectors in Turkey, were included in the study sample. As a result of the study, it was observed that ever large companies included in the sample in Turkey had drawbacks on having sense of social responsibility and they developed strategies matching with the concept referred as “green washing”.

2. The Environment and Human

On one hand, the human being dominates the nature via rapidly advancing science, technology and industry, while it also destroys the nature on the other

¹ M., Karabıçak and Armağan R., “Emergence Process of Environmental Problems, Foundations and Economic Influences of Environmental Management”, *Süleyman Demirel University, School of Economics and Administrative Sciences*, Vol.:9, Issue:2, 2004, pp. 203-228.

² H., Yüksel, “Assessment of Environmentally Responsible Manufacturing Activities via Empirical Study”, *Journal of Industrial Engineering*, Vol.:14, Issue:2, June, 2003.

³ N., Ener, *Alternative Method in Use of Natural Resources, New Approaches*, Marmara University, Turkish Economy Research Center and Friedrich Naumann Foundation, Ankara, 1997, pp. 325.

hand⁴. Therefore, our old Earth, hosting billions of people, is now tired. Ability to remove damages to the environment caused by global warming, incorrect use of natural resources, ecologic imbalance and many other grounds by both corrective and prevention actions is increasingly getting more importance. Therefore, it is now inevitable for governments, non-governmental organizations and corporations to fulfill tasks naturally assigned to them.

Environment is defined as biological, physical, social, economic and cultural settings where human and other live beings have continuous inter-relations and mutual interactions throughout their lives⁵. To date, the impact of human on the environment had played non-negligible role in occurrence of many damages. Tasks required to be undertaken by human being, such as restoring natural balance and improvement of deteriorated environmental conditions, are performed under title of environmental management. Environment management is a concept which minimizes impact of human on the environment, allows restoration of natural balance and increases environmental awareness of the public by revealing environmental problems out⁶. Environmental Management is not only a control system, but it also has functions for responding to environment-oriented responsibilities and also reducing risks⁷. This concept, which aims to contribute to the protection and improvement of the environment and to ensure strict adherence to laws, regulations and resolutions enacted for above mentioned purposes, is comprised of organizational structures. Activities related with environmental management are performed by the government, non-governmental organizations and corporations. In current study, environment-oriented activities were addressed in the dimension of PR and such activities were examined over enterprises.

Business Charter for Sustainable Development issued by International chamber of commerce in 1991 and CERES principles issued by various groups and companies in the U.S. and Canada for protection of the environment as well as guidance-like charters such as Principles of Responsible Care had played significant role on creation of environmental awareness at corporate level⁸. One of most significant reasons for ignorance of environmental problems at corporate level following '90s is that scope of the "environment" concept in the business literature had been inadequately defined. In other words, from the perspective of companies, the environment is comprised of several elements including clients,

⁴ A.R., Karacan, "Environmental Protection Consciousness and Liabilities in Enterprises, Environmental Protection Policies for Enterprises in Turkey and European Union", Ege University, *Aegean Academic View Journal*, Vol.:2, Issue:1, 2002.

⁵ <http://www.genbilim.com/content/view/6276/39/>, Access Date: 12.12.2008.

⁶ <http://www.genbilim.com/content/view/6276/39/>, Access Date: 03.04.2011.

⁷ *ISO, Environmental Management System Guidance*, İstanbul Chamber of Industry Publications, İstanbul, 2008.

⁸ E., Nemli, "Environmentally Responsible Management Approach", *İ.Ü. Journal School of Political Sciences*, No: 23-24, October 2000-March 2001.

competitors, employees, government and supplier and it does not certainly involve the ecologic environment, that is air, water and soil⁹.

Rapid deterioration in environmental conditions and the concerns about being close to the end of the world led administrators of enterprises immediately changing their views on ecologic environment and taking ecologic environment into consideration as a significant factor in the decision-making process on operations of the enterprise¹⁰. Requests of clients about protection of the environment had also directed enterprises towards being more responsible to the environment¹¹. The most outstanding factor increasing awareness of consumers on the environment is the ability to rapidly share information all around the world via several means such as media (television, radio, newspaper etc.) and internet. Being instantly aware of events occurred all around the world, people may have more conscious and precise reactions and they may even direct those events by active or passive resistance. The public, having increased awareness on the environment, will concentrate their consumption preferences on products responsible to the environment. This preference will provide advantage to products manufactured by environment-friendly enterprises. Such a consequence will lead enterprises to undertake whatever they can about the environment or to promote environment-related issues¹².

3. Environmentally Responsible Management Approach in Corporations

Economic advances originating from operations of companies are associated with many social and economic problems including but not limited to environmental pollution, destruction of natural resources and deterioration of urban life¹³. Target of environmental policies include ensuring an environment where human may live in health and well-being, protecting air, water and soil against hazardous effects of the plant and the animal kingdom and removing damages and losses due to human activities¹⁴. In order to overcome environmental problems, a concept of environmentally responsible management approach is recently emerged

⁹ Ö., Dinçer and Fidan, Y., *Introduction to Business Management*, 3rd Edition, İstanbul: BETA Basım, Yayım, Dağıtım A.Ş., 1997.

¹⁰ E., Nemli, "Environmentally Responsible Management Approach", *İ.Ü. Journal School of Political Sciences*, No: 23-24, October 2000-March 2001.

¹¹ W.E., Stead and Stead J. G., *Strategic Management for a Small Planet, Business and the Environment*, Eds: Richard Welford, Richard Starkey, London: Earthscan Publications, 1996, pp.78.

¹² http://www.danismend.com/konular/kaliteyon/klt_cevreye_duyarlilik.htm, "Can Environmental Responsibility be a Differentiation Strategy at Corporate Level?", Access Date: 15.10.2009.

¹³ S, Vural, *Market Economy and the Government*, Beta Publications, Sermet Printing House, İstanbul, 1978.

¹⁴ S., Budak, *European Union and Turkish Environmental Policy*, İstanbul, Buke Yayınları, 2000.

in enterprises under title of environmental management which is far away from traditional management approaches. Environmentally conscious management is an approach adopted by enterprises which involve ecological environment as an important factor in decision-making processes, aim to minimize or completely remove the damage on environment caused by business operations, amend design, packaging and manufacturing process within this scope, strive for introducing the philosophy of protecting the ecological environment in corporate culture and fulfills responsibilities owed to the society within scope of the social responsibility¹⁵. The view that not only nature will gain benefits, but also the enterprise will also win if the environment is protected is now the dominant idea in many enterprises. The most remarkable factor enabling the enterprise gain high scores in the opinion of the public is now the respect to the environment¹⁶. First steps of environmentalist movements are characterized with reinforcing corporate image and concerns about gaining sympathy of the society. Today, perception of an enterprise polluting the environment substantially by customers or public opinion significantly varies from that of an enterprise with no effect on the environmental pollution¹⁷.

When we compare environmentally responsible management approach with traditional management structure, differences are attracting attentions in terms of products, organization, environment and corporate functions. In Table 1, it is possible to see differences between aforementioned two management approaches.

¹⁵ E., Nemli, "Environmentally Responsible Management Approach", *İ.Ü. Journal School of Political Sciences*, No: 23-24, October 2000-March 2001.

¹⁶ B., Mckee, "American Companies Developed Interesting Methods in The Protection of The Environment", *News from U.S.*, Issue: 11-12, Ankara, 1992.

¹⁷ A. R., Gökbnar, "Journal of Ecology, Social Responsibility of Enterprises in the Protection of the Environment", *D.E.Ü. Soc.Sci. Ins. Dept. of Financial Law – Sayı 14*, İzmir, 1995.

Table 1. Comparison between Traditional Management and Environmentally Responsible Management

TRADITIONAL MANAGEMENT	ENVIRONMENTALLY RESPONSIBLE MANAGEMENT
<p>Aims: Economic growth and profit Benefits provided to shareholders</p>	<p>Aims: Sustainability and life quality Welfare of shareholders</p>
<p>Products: Products designed for functionality, style and price Packaging creating redundant waste</p>	<p>Products: <input type="checkbox"/> Environment-friendly products designed for the environment</p>
<p>Organization: Hierarchic structure <input type="checkbox"/> Up-to-down decision making mechanism <input type="checkbox"/> Centralism in the decision making process</p>	<p>Organization: Non-hierarchic structure Participatory decision making Non-centralism in the decision making process</p>
<p>Environment: Dominating the environment <input type="checkbox"/> Managing the environment as a resource <input type="checkbox"/> Regarding pollution and wastes as external factors</p>	<p>Environment: Harmonization with the environment Recognizing that natural resources are not unlimited Managing and minimizing pollution and waste</p>
<p>Enterprise functions: Aims to enhance marketing and consumption. Finance desires to maximize the profit within short term. Accounting focuses on traditional costs. Human resources management targets to increase efficiency of worker.</p>	<p>Enterprise functions: Marketing is present for training the consumer. Finance targets long-term sustainable growth. Accounting focuses on environment related costs. Human resources management endeavors to ensure occupational health and safety.</p>

Source: Shrivastava P., "Ecocentric Management for a Risk Society", Academy of Management Review, Vol 20, No 1, 1995, s.130.

Shrivastava¹⁸ compares traditional management approach with environmentally responsible management approach as indicated in the above table. As it can be understood, classical approach allows profit- and cost-oriented activities, while profits gained in environmental approach are evaluated from long-term perspectives. Moreover, enterprises fulfill their ethical and social responsibilities in the solution of environmental problems. Following principle elements can be mentioned within scope of social responsibilities adopted by enterprises with environmentally responsible management approach:¹⁹

- ✓ To manage programs that aim to minimize wastes and to ensure compatibility to legal regulations,
- ✓ To minimize use of energy and water,
- ✓ To coordinate efforts that aim to produce more environment-friendly goods and services,
- ✓ To prepare balance sheets that estimates benefits and costs and environmental programs to be performed within the company as precisely as possible,
- ✓ To monitor advances in the ecologic views and environmental policies of the government and to comprehend warnings signs from them as earlier as possible,
- ✓ To monitor recently released products in order to replace products used in manufacturing other processes in the company with more environment friendly ones,
- ✓ To collaborate with unions on the environmental issues,
- ✓ To participate to environment related public organizations and to emphasize presence of the company in such organizations,
- ✓ To organize information and training programs within the company,
- ✓ To introduce environment policy of the company to the public via PR studies.

4. Public Relations and Environmentally Responsible Management Approach

The concept of public relations is a continuous and organized managerial task performed for gaining apprehension, sympathy and support of individuals,

¹⁸ P., Shrivastava, *The Greening of Business, Business and The Environment: Implications of The New Environmentalism*, Ed: Denis SMITH, London: Paul Chapman Publishing, 1993, pp.27-39.

¹⁹ E. Callenbach, vd., *Ecomanagement: The Elmwood Guide To Ecological Auditing And Sustainable Business*, San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, 1993, pp 85-86.

whom an enterprise, institution or organization already had contacted or may contact with, and for maintaining such benefits²⁰. Enterprises in fact strive to have better and efficient communication with target population they serve within scope of public relations. It aims to make external and internal clients and also the people in contact with the enterprise like the enterprise or adopt a particular attitude.

Public relations may assist to activate social consciousness of organizations²¹. However, it operates in a manner somewhat different from rational of corporate social responsibility. When the company is marketed, it operates on the basis of benefit to the company and following this point, one of the justifications presented is the social benefits, which imply “You should give something in order to take as much as you want”²². This approach leads to dishonest efforts by enterprises under environmental consciousness. Recently, inter-penetrated appearance of PR studies and corporate social responsibility projects in Turkey somewhat support this finding.

In this study, examinations are directed towards whether studies undertaken by companies are in fact PR studies conducted for creating “environment-friendly enterprise” in the opinion of consumers and communicating messages about the product and the company within envelope of the environment or they are efforts sincerely directed to fulfill social responsibility task in the broader sense. The view that whether public relations activities involve efforts for advertising the enterprise and emphasizing the benefits of the company rather than the nature is addressed in the implementation phase of the study.

5. Research Method

In the implementation part of the study, four large-scale enterprises which operate in Turkey in different sectors and completed institutionalization process were enrolled into the study with simple random sampling method. For news published in Internet and printed in the media in relation with aforementioned enterprises, archive scanning was performed, which covered one-year period within the study period. Moreover, corporate web pages were included in the assessment in order to make comparisons and add dimensions to the analysis. Findings of the study were examined with content analysis method. Content analysis is a method where data collected is first conceptualized and then, resultant concepts are logically arranged and the themes explaining the data are revealed out²³.

²⁰ http://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Halkla_ili%C5%9Fkiler Access Date: 18.09.2009.

²¹ <http://www.sosyalhizmetuzmani.org/hitoplum.htm> Access Date: 28.03.2011.

²² <http://www.sosyalhizmetuzmani.org/hitoplum.htm> 2010 Access Date: 02.04.2011.

²³ A., Yıldırım and Şimşek H., *Qualitative Research Methods in Social Sciences*, Seçkin Publications, 2006.

In the study, questions required to be answered for companies conducting environment-oriented studies are principally examined over six criteria. Those criteria are titles of attempts performed by enterprises for charity purposes towards the commercial targets of the enterprises, as defined by Kotler and Lee²⁴. We may list those titles as follows:

1. Social purpose incentives
2. Social aim connected marketing
3. Corporate social marketing
4. Corporate charity
5. Social voluntariness
6. Business applications with social responsibility

In addition to all above, a seventh factor is green washing efforts undertaken by companies desiring to justify corporate operations. Greenwashing is defined as utilizing the environmental consciousness as an advertising and marketing material, the false environmentalism²⁵. The principal aim of this concept is to hide errors and mistakes made in relation with the environment.

Activities of environmentally responsible enterprises, which are examined within scope of totally seven factors, are analyzed over four different sectors and companies. Selection of sector and companies was performed with simple random sampling method, one of probabilistic sampling techniques. Simple random sampling technique is the sampling method, where each element in the population identified has “equal” and “independent” chance of being selected²⁶. Opet from Energy Sector, Garanti Bank from banking sector, MNG Courier Service from service sector and finally Eti Gıda A.Ş. from food sector are companies included in the study sample. Public relation activities performed by those companies under title of social responsibility are multi-dimensionally examined using content analysis. In conclusion, answers were looked up to following questions in the study:

- How is the overall appearance of environmental PR approaches in companies, which were included in the sample in Turkey?
- Why do companies integrate public relations activities with environmental management?
- How do environment-oriented public relations activities leverage environment-friendly impression of companies?
- What should be done for efficient environmental management?

²⁴ P., Kotler, & Lee, N., *Corporate Social Responsibility*. İstanbul: MediaCat., 2006.

²⁵ <http://www.seslisozluk.com/nedir/Greenwash> Access Date. 25.03.2011.

²⁶ R., Altunışık, Coşkun R., Bayraktaroğlu S., Yıldırım E., *SPSS Applied Research Methods in Social Sciences*, Sakarya Yayıncılık, 2007.

6. Implementation

In the implementation part of the study, research questions were independently answered and thus, the study subject was examined.

Question 1: How is the overall appearance of environmental PR approaches in companies, which were included in the sample in Turkey?

This question is answered over four companies included in the study sample and based on six criteria, of which we had addressed. Each criterion is assigned letter codes ranging from A to F. According to the letter codes, implementations of enterprises are interpreted via tables.

OPET

Values determined by OPET, the third largest fuel distribution company in Turkey, introduce us a customer-oriented, reliable, transparent, creative, environmentally and socially responsible and a dynamic company that continuously promotes development of employees and respects to the corporate values, environment and the community. Social responsibility approach of the OPET is also towards those aims. In this regard, the ongoing 3 environmental projects of the enterprise are remarkable.

“Green Road Project”, the environment oriented study of OPET, has been continuing since 2004 in order to attract attentions to the importance of gradually decreasing world’s green areas in our life. Started with the motto “One losing the green will lose the life”, the project initially aimed to forest fuel stations and the 1.5 km area in close proximity of those stations. Under recent conditions where life of human is endangered due to global desertation and drought, OPET serves for the community and the nature thanks to this long-term forestation project. More than 445 thousand trees, suitable for climate and soil condition of the region, are planted in 504 stations and treeless lands determined by municipalities thanks to the the “Green Road” project realized with supports of State Highway General Directorate and Tema Vakfi (A charity foundation)²⁷. We may examine this project within scope of 5th criteria “social voluntariness”. This project, in general terms, refers to the fact that the company shares time for environmental activities.

²⁷ Letter authored by Şule Yüksel Öztürk Özmen and titled “Is Contribution of the Public Relations to the Environment an Illusion” from the book compiled by Derya Telan titled “Theory and Practice of Public Relations., Ütopya Printing House, June 2009, pp 167-193.

Table 2. Example of OPET

OPET		
Criteria:	Implementation:	Letter Code(s):
Social Aim Incentives (A)	“Green Road Project”	D
Social Aim Related Marketing (B)	(Yeşil Yol Projesi)	
Corporate Social Marketing (C)	“Role Model Village Project”	A
Corporate Charity (D)	(Örnek Köy Projesi)	
Community Volunteering (E)	“Respect-to-History Project”	A
Business Applications With Social Responsibility (F)	(Tarihe Saygı Projesi)	
Greenwashing (G)		

In addition, “Role Model Village Project” initially targeted to create a conscious society increases awareness of education level and environment in rural communities, while “Respect to the History Project” started in February 2006 aimed to ensure a substantial change within borders of Gelibolu Peninsula Historical National Park. In this project, physical and social efforts were made to enable domestic and foreign tourists travel villages affiliated to Eceabat without any problems. The general view of the district and villages, where the Dardanelles War was experienced, is substantially changed. Village squares, museums, modern WCs, renewed sale stores having a modern image due to renewal studies have refreshed regional tourism and thus, it increased income level of local administrations. This project with both cultural and environment-oriented aspects can be examined pursuant to 1st criteria titled “Incentives with social aims”. As a result, expenditures made in those villages aim to increase awareness on problems experienced in the region and to attract attentions to environmental issues.

GARANTI BANK

Incorporated in 1946 and became second largest private bank of the Turkey due to ever increasing success rate, Garanti Bank is producing many projects in terms of social responsibility including culture, art, nature, sports and education. Considering particularly environment related issues, it has been main sponsor of WWF Turkey- World Wild Life Fund- for last 15 years and it is the only Turkish company won Golden Panda Award due to long-term support and thus, the company is awarded same reward for the second time.

In relation with global warming, Garanti Bank provided corporate support to Al Gore’s, the Vice President of United States, documentary titled “An

Inconvenient Truth” with 2 Oscars and conference held by participation of Al Gore. As this support is financial, it may be examined within scope of 4th criteria titled “Corporate Charity”.

Table 3. Example of Garanti Bank

GARANTI BANK		
Criteria:	Implementation:	Letter Code(s)
Social Aim Incentives (A)	“Unfortunate Reality Documentary”	D
Social Aim Related Marketing (B)	(Uygunsuz Gerçek Belgeseli)	
Corporate Social Marketing (C)	“101 Measures Handbook”	C
Corporate Charity (D)	(Garanti 101 Önlem Kitapçığı)	
Community Volunteering (E)	“Area Protection Program”	A
Business Applications	“Green Atlas Journal”	D
With Social Responsibility (F)	“Other Publications on Environment”	D
Greenwashing (G)	“International Environment-oriented Films Festivals”	D
	“Environmental-oriented News Competition”	C
	“Environmentally Responsible Bonus Card”	B D F
	“Recyclable Mat. (Envelope, Brochure)”	B D F
	“E-mail Extract”	B D F

Besides, a booklet was issued which included 101 measures to be taken at work place, home, garden, mall and holiday to stop global warming and they were distributed to all employees of Garanti Bank which reflects efforts of the corporate to change social attitudes against environmental problems. This activity can be included in 3rd criteria titled “Corporate Social Marketing”.

Another project titled “Area Protection Program” is comprised of efforts towards sustainable use and protection of Turkey’s natural resources. Thanks to this project where snowdrop will be planted in two villages located on Toros Mountains by voluntary farmers, it is aimed to protect biological diversity in Küre Mountains National Park and to manage sustainable natural resources. With this study, the corporate practiced 1st criteria titled “Social Purpose Incentives”. Moreover, Garanti Bank provides corporate support to publications about environmental issues. “Books titled “Turkey and Birds of Europe”, “Our Footprints on the Nature”, “Significant Vegetation Areas of Turkey” and “Adventure of Water on the Surface” as well as Green Atlas, the environment-oriented specific issues printed by Atlas Journal in order to strengthen environmental awareness are all among publications of Garanti Bank. As those supports are characterized with financial promotions, they are examined within scope of 4th criteria titled “Corporate Charity”.

Besides being main sponsor of International Environment Films Festival organized by TURSAC Charity under supervision of WWF Turkey and Ministry of Culture held between 1997 and 2002, Garanti Bank also organized a competition titled Environmental News. The aim was to support media members contributing to the protection of the environment by increasing environmental awareness due to printed news and to keep the topic of environment in the agenda of the public via media. Due to this purpose, the study is related with the principle of “Corporate Social Marketing”, but it is in close proximity with principle of “Corporate Charity” with regards sponsorship.

Final studies of Garanti Bank on environment related issues is about practices on banking products. The first one realized in 1994 is the credit card practice granting a part of income to the World Wild Life Fund without any obligations on the credit card holders. An environmentally responsible Bonus Card is offered to the use of credit card holders desiring to make contributions to the protection of the environment in February 2007. Environmentally responsible Bonus Card holders make contributions to the efforts of WWF Turkey for the protection of the environment using 10 to 30 percent of the bonus awarded to the holders based on the expenditure and type of credit card. During production of this card, least possible PVC material is used and this allows rapid destruction of the card in the nature. Moreover, recyclable paper is preferred for all printed materials such as envelope, letter and brochures used for communicating environmentally responsible Bonus. Account abstracts regularly sent to the card holder in every month are delivered via e-mail and thus, paper saving is ensured. In addition, obtained income is granted to WWF-Turkey as extra grant. All those practices are within scope of “Social Purpose Connected Marketing”, “Business Practices with Social Responsibility” and “Corporate Charity” criteria.

ETI

Starting the production first in 1962, ETI had turned into a tremendous company thanks to the almost 300 products produced at 5 factories under 54 brand names and exportation to all over the world. And, the company also undertakes many projects within scope of social responsibility. Among those projects, environment-related “Konya Basin Modern Irrigation Project” undertaken in collaboration with WWF-Turkey and processed in the media via advertisements and news is a significant study.

Table 4. Example of ETI

ETI		
Criteria:	Implementation:	Letter Code(s):
Social Aim Incentives (A) Social Aim Related Marketing (B) Corporate Social Marketing (C) Corporate Charity (D) Community Volunteering (E) Business Applications With Social Responsibility (F) Greenwashing (G)	“Konya Basin Modern Irrigation Project” (Konya Havzası Modern Sulama Projesi)	B

Konya Basin is the cereal warehouse of our country and the region is much more prone to the drought arising from global warming, and support provided by each client purchasing the product named ETİ Burçak to the modern irrigation project aims protection of water resources in the basin. This project is addressed according to "Social purpose connected Marketing" criteria.

MNG

Providing services in Turkey for more than 30 years based on huge projects, domestic and foreign air Courier Company, a subsidiary company of MNG Holding, has many social responsibility projects completed. Among them, environment related project titled “Put Cargo Packagings into the Collection Boxes, Let the Children go to School ” is a study aims responsibility to global problems by collecting and recycling cargo packages. Thanks to this project, it is targeted to prevent damage on the environment by plastic package consumption of 20 million packages per month in the cargo sector. Added value to be gained by recovery of those packages to the economy will be spent in education fields in regions with education related needs and thus, opportunity equality is provided to the school aged children. Due to this project, MNG acts pursuant to “Corporate Social Marketing” principle.

Table 5. Example of MNG

MNG		
Criteria:	Implementation:	Letter Code(s):
Social Aim Incentives (A) Social Aim Related Marketing (B) Corporate Social Marketing (C) Corporate Charity (D) Community Volunteering (E) Business Applications With Social Responsibility (F) Greenwashing (G)	“Put Cargo Packagings into the Collection Boxes, Let the Children go to School” (Kargo Poşetleri Kutuya Çocuklar Okula)	C

As it can be seen in above findings, enterprises included in our study sample sometimes used more than one criteria and they may sometimes employed single criteria. When we examined projects performed by those companies in relation with the environment within context of content analysis, it can be seen that model companies of Turkey has not realized a world standard project and that those projects are characterized with national dimensions. Under recent conditions where social responsibility awareness is in its infancy age, environmentally responsible management activities performed even by large companies included in the study sample are undertaken from a narrow perspective based on PR approaches. This comment can be concluded based on the fact that none of the companies included in the sample applied all of six criteria and no practices were evidenced that a project involving all criteria has been efficiently maintained. Companies are requires to take more comprehensive and multi-dimensional steps in terms of environment-oriented public relations.

Question 2: Why do companies integrate public relations activities with environmental management issue?

When we answer this question over companies included in the study sample, we may speculate that common concern of those companies was to display the social responsibility project. Corporations are exhibited via public relations or in other words by PR approaches and they are enabled to have higher scores in the opinion of the public. PR studies enabling companies market their sustainable social responsibility projects are performed via both advertisements in the media, sponsoring activities undertaken for organizations and news published and printed in the media in relation with the company. At this point, efficient use of new media tools is very important. While ETI was the most outstanding corporate in the study sample due to Burçak Tarlası (Vetch Field) and Konya Basın projects, Garanti Bank is among huge banking corporations of Turkey due to the environment-friendly cards and other projects. Garanti Bank gains benefits of various channels

such as cinemas, television advertisements and printed media for introducing projects to the public. It is observed that MNG and OPET, other companies included in our study sample, performed those projects in order to strengthen corporate image and due to public reactions. Based on the quality of the project and analysis on the PR studies, it is observed that environmental public relation activities are rather used by those companies due to desire to gain sympathy of the public. In conclusion, the aim of PR studies is to reach clients who are principal factors for the success and profitability of the enterprise and to better market social responsibility projects undertaken by the company to the public.

Above mentioned comments apply to the companies included in the study sample. OPET, Garanti Bank, ETI and MNG Cargo are corporations having the view to share the values they possess in the community with consumers. The aim of marketing underlies the corporate desire to publicize projects referred as sustainable social responsibility by companies via media tools.

Question 3: How do environment-oriented public relations activities leverage environment-friendly impression of companies?

There are high standards, ethical values and corporate principles imposed by globalizing world on business life. Sustainable social responsibility concept is also among those which were recently attached importance. Companies previously adopting the profit as main aim started to adopt new aims referred as social responsibility. Developing environmental management approach in time, companies were initially satisfied with planting trees, but now they started to produce green products within context of social responsibility and they shifted to environment-friendly systems and designs. Number of companies amending locations, technical equipments and even organizational structure in this end is ever increasing. We add other criteria to the content analysis performed for evaluating degree of sincerity and advertisement related purposes in the environment oriented activities. “Green Washing” criterion defines activities of a company to wash operations under risk of attracting consumers’ reactions in order to leverage image of the company in the opinion of consumers. “Greenwashing” is symbolized with Letter G in the table.

Table 6: Comparison on Qualification of Implementation

OPET		MNG	
Implementation	Qualification	Implementation	Qualification
D A A criteria are detected	Criterion G is present. Since number of other aim criteria is low, qualification of implementation is low.	C criteria are detected.	Criterion G is present. Since other aim criteria involve only one criterion, it is unidirectional and qualification of implementation is low.
Garanti		ETİ	
Implementation	Qualification	Implementation	Qualification
D C A D D D B B D E B D F B D F criteria are detected	Criterion G is not present. Since other aim criteria are multi-direction and they are often observed, qualification of implementation is high.	B criteria are detected	Criterion G is not present. Since other aim criteria involve only one criterion, studies are unidirectional and qualification of implementation is normal.

When we considered companies in the study sample from this perspective, media news about those companies are included in the content analysis. For example, although a corporate image is drawn by the huge project undertaken by OPET in Gelibolu Peninsula Historical National Park of Çanakkale that the company is such beneficial to the region, but in fact it is aimed to suppress environmentalist reactions and protests against the damage of oil tankers passing from the Dardanelles on the strait and regional ecologic balance. Similarly, when we continue to examine media news, we may also evidence an example for MNG Cargo. Undertaking a environment oriented project by collecting and recycling used nylon cargo packages, MNG Cargo in fact filled a bay with rough filling material in order to construct a five star hotel in Çomça bay, Pina Peninsula of Muğla Province without obtaining approval from any agency or the ministry and the company had deteriorated natural view of the bay by cutting coastline trees. Therefore, the aim of the project for recycling nylon packages is more about making the public completely forget reactions of environmentalists and regional community and relieving the reactions rather than a environmentally responsible management approach. When we scanned media tools and news sites, we could not evidence above mentioned types of examples within context of greenwashing criterion for other two corporations included in the study sample, namely ETİ and Garanti Bank.

Question 4: What should be done for efficient environmental management?

For companies to conduct efficient studies within context of environmentally responsible management approach, first they should completely get out of their traditional perspectives. Enterprises with a particular advance in institutionalization should honestly strive for environmental management. For this purpose, it is important to reflect environment-friendly practices in all processes in the enterprise. Moreover, ISO 14001 Environmental Management System is also among the elements to aid the enterprise getting standardized. Importance should be attached to particular issues that all products should be green products and green designs requiring less energy for production, having no damage on the environment due to the use of the product and allowing recycling processes and technical systems producing those products should also be green manufacturing systems. Required to act towards differentiation strategies within context of environmental responsibility, those corporations should make senior level decision in accordance with the awareness of environmental responsibility. Those decisions may range between purchasing fixed assets for the company and selecting the incorporation site. It is strictly important that public relations should be sustained via long-term projects rather than short-term and seasonal efforts. Companies are required to have proactive approach to the environmental issues and thus, consistency of corporate activities and policies is important within context of efficient environmental management.

Activities undertaken by companies manufacturing products hazardous to the environment or causing adverse effects on the environment via processes such as production and distribution shall never be beyond PR studies clearly characterized with advertorial footprints. At this point, oil products sold by OPET can be shown as an example. No matter how environmentalist the corporate image is, it will continue to damage the world. R&D departments are under a heavy responsibility in terms of converting all petroleum and derivative products into environment-friendly green products. Moreover, business processes such as transportation of fuels bearing risk of explosion or leakage are required to be performed via green designs and solutions. It should be kept in mind that this uncontrolled progression deteriorating balance of the world can be only prevented from sincere, comprehensive and realistic perspectives. At this point, the principle aim required to be adopted by companies should be the future of the world rather than short-term profits.

7. Conclusion

This study was conducted in order to clarify targets of environmentally responsible management approaches in the PR activities and to examine the extent of sincerity of those companies. The PR studies, which were examined over the sample including four companies in Turkey, were analyzed by comparing reactions obtained by those companies from public opinion and the way they reflect themselves. While more and sincere efforts made by two companies included in the study sample, namely Eti and Garanti Bank, same conclusion could not be drawn for Opet and Mng Cargo. It is found in this study, where image creation efforts and hollow studies were evidenced, that companies operating in Turkey are not still sincere in their PR activities. When we consider that the conclusion is true even for half of large companies, more outstanding outcomes can be reached when SMEs are examined. Although environment oriented PR approaches reached a better point in comparison to the classical management approach where nothing would be done for the environment, it is a fact that the optimum point has not been reached yet. In this study, where issues required to be addressed by companies for efficient public relations are underlined, enterprises are required to get away from short-term benefits and to learn performing corporate works oriented to the long-term benefits including the future of the world.

REFERENCES

- Altunışık R., Coşkun R., Bayraktaroğlu S., Yıldırım E., *SPSS Applied Research Methods in Social Sciences*, , Sakarya Yayıncılık, 2007.
- Budak S., *European Union and Turkish Environmental Policy*, İstanbul, Buke Yayınları, 2000.
- Callenbach, E. vd., *Ecomanagement: The Elmwood Guide To Ecological Auditing and Sustainable Business*, San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, 1993, pp. 85-86.
- http://www.danismend.com/konular/kaliteyon/klt_cevreye_duyarlilik.htm “Can Environmental Responsibility be a Differentiation Strategy at Corporate Level?”, Access Date: 15.10.2009.
- Diñer, Ö., Fidan, Y., *Introduction to Business Management*, 3rd Edition, İstanbul: BETA Basım, Yayım, Dağıtım A.Ş., 1997.
- Ener N., *Alternative Method in Use of Natural Resources, New Approaches*, Marmara University, Turkish Economy Research Center and Friedrich Naumann Foundation, Ankara, 1997, pp. 325.
- <http://www.genbilim.com/content/view/6276/39/>, Access Date: 12.12.2008.
- <http://www.genbilim.com/content/view/6276/39/> Access Date: 03.04.2011.
- Gökbunar, A. R., “Journal of Ecology, Social Responsibility of Enterprises in the protection of the environment”, *D.E.Ü. Soc.Sci. Ins. Dept. of Financial Law – Sayı 14*, İzmir, 1995.
- ISO, *Environmental Management System Guidance*, İstanbul Chamber of Industry Publications, İstanbul, 2008
- Karabıçak M., Armağan R., “Emergence Process of Environmental Problems, Foundations and Economic Influences of Environmental Management”, *Süleyman Demirel University School of Economics and Administrative Sciences*, Vol.:9, Issue:2, 2004, pp. 203-228.
- Karacan A.R., “Environmental Protection Consciousness and Liabilities in Enterprises, Environmental Protection Policies for Enterprises in Turkey and European Union”, Ege University, *Aegean Academic View Journal*, Vol.:2, Issue:1, 2002.
- Kotler, P., & Lee, N. *Corporate Social Responsibility*. İstanbul: MediaCat., 2006.
- Letter authored by Şule Yüksel Öztürk and titled “Is Contribution of the Public Relations to the Environment an **illusion**” from the book compiled by Derya Telan titled *Theory and Practice of Public Relations.*, Ütopya Printing House, June 2009, pp. 167-193.

Mckee, Brandford, "American Companies developed interesting methods in the protection of the environment", *News from U.S.*, Issue: 11-12, Ankara, 1992.

Nemli E., "Environmentally Responsible Management Approach", *İ.Ü. Journal School of Political Sciences*, No: 23-24, October 2000-March 2001.

<http://www.seslisozluk.com/nedir/Greenwash> Access Date. 25.03.2011.

Shrivastava, P., *The Greening of Business, Business and The Environment: Implications of The New Environmentalism*, Ed: Denis SMITH, London: Paul Chapman Publishing, 1993, pp. 27-39.

<http://www.sosyalhizmetuzmani.org/hitoplum.htm> Access Date: 28.03.2011.

<http://www.sosyalhizmetuzmani.org/hitoplum.htm> 2010 Access Date: 02.04.2011.

Stead W.E., Stead J. G., *Strategic Management for a Small Planet, Business and the Environment*, Eds: Richard Welford, Richard Starkey, London: Earthscan Publications, 1996, pp.78.

Vural, S, *Market Economy and the Government*, Beta Publications, Sermet Printing House, İstanbul, 1978.

http://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Halkla_ili%C5%9Fkiler Access Date: 18.09.2009.

Yıldırım A., Şimşek H., *Qualitative Research Methods in Social Sciences*, Seçkin Publications, 2006.

Yüksel H., "Assessment of Environmentally Responsible Manufacturing Activities via Empirical Study", *Journal of Industrial Engineering*, Vol.:14, Issue:2, June 2003.

Corporate web pages monitored within scope of the research:

http://www.etietieti.com/bizden_etkinlikler.aspx

http://www.garanti.com.tr/tr/garanti_hakkinda/toplumsal_paylasim_projeleri/dogay_a_destek_projeleri.page?gbid2=200311

http://www.garanti.com.tr/tr/garanti_hakkinda/toplumsal_paylasim_projeleri/dogay_a_destek_projeleri/dogayi_koruma_calismalari.page?

<http://www.mngkargo.com.tr/page.asp?pg=Sorumluluk&menu=SosyalSorumluluk>

<http://www.opet.com.tr/tr/Icerik.aspx?cat=83&id=15>

Web page utilized for scanning press and internet news:

<http://www.prnet.com.tr/>