

ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ

LÂHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ DERGİSİ

ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ İLÂHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ
TARAFINDAN YILDA BİR ÇIKARILIR

Cilt : XXI



Yayın Komisyonu:

Prof. Dr. Necati ÖNER (*Dekan*)

Prof. Dr. Hüseyin YURDAYDIN

Prof. Dr. İbrahim A. ÇUBUKÇU

Prof. Dr. Talât KOÇYİĞİT

Doç. Dr. Gültekin ORANSAY

Doç. Dr. Esat COŞAN

ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ

LÂHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ DERGİSİ

ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ İLÂHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ
TARAFINDAN YILDA BİR ÇIKARILIR

Cilt : XXI



ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ

İLÂHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ

DERGİSİ

ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ İLÂHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ
TARAFINDAN YILDA BİR ÇIKARILIR

Cilt : XXI



ANKARA ÜNİVERSİTESİ BASIMEVİ - ANKARA - 1976

İÇİNDEKİLER

	<u>Sayfa</u>
Prof. Dr. İsmail CERRAHOĞLU, <i>Tefsirde Mukâtil İbn Süleyman ve Eserleri</i>	1
Prof. Dr. İbrahim Ağâh ÇUBUKÇU, <i>İslâmda Kadın Hakları</i> ..	37
Prof. Dr. İbrahim Ağâh ÇUBUKÇU, <i>Rights of Woman in Islam</i> ..	45
Prof. Dr. Talât KOÇYİĞİT, <i>Ibn Şihâb Ez-Zuhurî</i>	51
Prof. Dr. Cavit SUNAR, <i>Allah-İnsan İlişkisi</i>	85
Prof. Dr. Hikmet TANYU, <i>Dinî Folklor veya Dinî-Manevî Halk İnançlarının Çeşit ve Mahiyeti Üzerinde bir Araştırma</i>	123
Doç. Dr. Neda ARMANER, <i>Şahsiyet Terbiyesinde Dinî Kültürün Rolü</i>	143
Doç. Dr. Gültekin ORANSAY, <i>Türk Din Musikisi Tür, Makam ve Usullarının Kodlanması</i>	151
Doç. Dr. Mehmet S. HATİBOĞLU, <i>İslâm Mükellefiyet Anlayışı ve Buna Aykırı Bir Mâlikî-Hanefî Kıyâsı</i>	185
Doç. Dr. Halûk KARAMAĞARALI, <i>Kaysrideki Hunad Camiinin Restitüsyonu ve Hunad Manzûmesinin Kronolojisi Hakkında Bazı Mülâhazalar</i>	199
Doç. Dr. Beyhan KARAMAĞARALI, <i>Anadolu'da XII-XVI. Asırlardaki Tarikat ve Tekke Sanatı Hakkında</i>	247
Doç. Dr. Beyhan KARAMAĞARALI, <i>The Order and Convent Art From XIIth to XVIth Centuries in Anatolia</i>	277
Dr. M.Rami AYAS, <i>Mehmed İzzet Bey'in Bir Yazısı</i>	285
Dr. Mehmet AYDIN, <i>Farabi'nin Siyasi Düşüncesinde Sa'âdet kavramı</i>	303
Dr. Beyza BİLGİN, <i>İmam Hatip Lisesinde Uygulama Dersleri</i> ..	317
Dr. Etem Ruhi FIĞLALI, <i>İbâdiye'nin Siyasi ve İtikâdî Görüşleri</i>	323

	Sayfa
Dr. Abdulkadir ŞENER, <i>İslâm Hukukunda Hacr</i>	345
Dr. Ahmet UÇUR, <i>Yavuz Sultan Selim ile Kırım Hanı Mengli Giray ve Oğlu Muhammed Giray Arasında Geçen İki Konuşma</i>	357
Dr. Ahmet UÇUR, <i>Yabancı Bir Yazarın Atatürk Hakkındaki Düşünceleri</i>	363
Çeviren: M. Turhan ÖZDEMİR, Hartmut SCHÖKEL <i>Sumer Dinî</i>	367
Çeviren: Dr. Günay TÜMER, Lewis HODOUS <i>Konfüçyüs Dini</i>	391

KİTAP TANITMA VE TENKİTLER

Prof. Dr. İsmail CERRAHOĞLU, <i>Er-Râzî Müfessiren</i>	411
Dr. Mehmet AYDIN, <i>Modern Dünyada İslam Vahyi</i>	415
Dr. Mustafa FAYDA, <i>Kitâbu'l-Cihâd</i>	421
Dr. İsmet KAYAOĞLU, <i>L'Identité Culturelle de l'Islam</i>	425
Dr. Günay TÜMER, <i>Beyrunî'ye Armağan</i>	429

THE ORDER AND CONVENT ART FROM XIIIth to XVIth CENTURIES IN ANATOLIA

Beyhan KARAMAĞARALI

The Mongol invasion of Anatolia caused a great impact on all branches of Islamic art as well as political, social and economic changes. As a result of the new elements from east and west Turkestan, Mongolistan, Central Asia and Iran, Anatolian Seljuk style gained a new character¹.

The great Turkoman masses escaping from the Mongols passed through Horasan and Iran and took refuge in Anatolia. With the entry of the Mongols into Anatolia, the moral and economic Collapse of the people began. Because of this, the people gathered round the sheikhs and dervishes in search of salvation and security. During this, the most turbulent time in Anatolia, some perverted sects came into existence and thus many convents were built. Following the destruction of Almut Castle by Hulagu, the *batinî* sheikhs and dervishes took refuge in Anatolia and among the newly converted ignorant refugees from Horasan, these esoteric customs and beliefs quickly spread. In this respect, this period of Anatolian history is most confused time. Many *batinî* sheikhs and dervishes travelled from village to village and town to town to spread their own beliefs and ideas. Paralell to this, the sect literature, music, ritual dance, plastic and drawing art and architecture come into being. Up to the present, few studies have been carried out on *Order art*². However no serious study has been made on plastic art.

1- Halûk Karamağaralı, Anadolu'da Moğol İstilâsından Sonra Yapılan Dinî Mimarlık Eserlerinin Plân ve Form Özellikleri, unpublished habilitation thesis. 1964; Halûk Karamağaralı, Erzurum'daki Hatuniye Medresesi'nin Tarihi ve Bânîsi Hakkında Bazı Mülâhazalar, (Review of Selçuklu Araştırmaları III, Ankara 1971) pp. 235-239.

2- Semevî Eyice, Osmanlı-Türk Mimarîsinin Bir Cami Tipi Hakkında, (First International Congress of Turkish Art 1959, Ankara 1962), pp.187-188; Semevî Eyice, İlk Osmanlı Devri-

Those studies which have been made do not stress that this art is related to the order. Because of this they have been evaluated from a different angle. Literature, music and costumes of the order are not included in our studies.

Among these orders many artists were trained whose works reflect their customs and beliefs. Because the artists did not add their signature to their work, it is extremely difficult to decide to which artists the works belong. However we only come across the names of these artists.

The sculptured tombstones mostly made by unknown artists in Anatolia are typical examples on the order-art. The lion and sun composition seen on Kırşehir, Sivas and Tokat tombstones represent Hz. Ali (Şir u Hurşid) (Fig. 1); the pigeon (Fig. 3), goose, stork (Fig. 2), falcon motifs are connected with the loved and respected people of the sect³. The cock is also a sacred animal in the *Bektaşî* order. The tombstone in the Tokat Museum has a double-headed cock figure⁴ (Fig. 4). Rosettes on the tombstones have a symbolic meaning for the *Alevîs*. The number of rosettes from 3 to 17, seen on the various tombstones, represent some of the deeply respected personalities. 3 is connected with the trinity of Ali-Allah-Muhammed; 5 is connected with Muhammed, Ali, Hasan, Hüseyin, Fatıma (*Ehl-Beyt*); 12 rosettes for the twelve *İmams* called *İsnaaşeriye*, 14 indicates the fourteen *Masum-ı Pak*, namely martyrs of Kerbela and 17 shows the seventeen *Kemberbest* (The saints of Ahî). Also 4, 6, 7, 8, 9, 32 numbers have a sacred meaning⁵ (Fig. 5-6). Further, the striking hasish (opium poppy) leaf engraved on one of these tombstones, represents the holy plant which transports the *batunî* believers

nin Dinî-İçtimai Bir Müessesesi, Zaviyeler ve Zaviyeli Camiler (Review of İ.Ü. İktisat Fakültesi, XXI, 1963) pp.1-64; Semavî Eyice, Trakya'da İncecik'te Bir Tabhaneli Cami (Review of Tarih Encümeni, Nu: I, 1970) pp. 171-196; Semavî Eyice, Boyalıköy Hanıkâhı (Review of Türkiye XVI, İstanbul 1971) pp.39-56; Yılmaz Önge, Bilinmeyen Bir Selçuklu Medresesi: Konya Ali Gav Zaviyesi ve Türbesi, (Magazine of Önasya, Nu.28, 1967).

3- Beyhan Karamağaralı, Sivas ve Tokat'taki Figürlü Mezartaşlarının Mahiyeti Hakkında (Review of Selçuklu Araştırmaları II, Ankara 1970) pp.89-109; Beyhan Karamağaralı, Ahlat Mezartaşları, Ankara 1972, pp.2-20.

4- Beyhan Karamağaralı, Sivas ve Tokat... pp.92-93; Beyhan Karamağaralı, Ahlat... pp.12-15.

5- Beyhan Karamağaralı, Sivas ve Tokat... p.96; Beyhan Karamağaralı, Ahlat... pp. 17-18; Cavit Sunar, Melâmîlik ve Bektaşîlik, Ankara 1975, pp.133-134, 144, 147, 150, 184.

to heaven⁶ (Fig. 7-8). We can show that this belief continued in to the XVIIIth century by the tombstones (Fig. 9). These symbols occupy an extensive place in *bektaşî* which accept Hacı Bektaş Velî as a *pîr* (saint) who was connected with Ahmed Yesevî of Horasan. The tombstone in the Konya Taş ve Ahşap Eserler Museum (Inv. nu. 892) depicts Ahî Ahmed Şah and his *feta* who devoted himself to him. Ahî Ahmed Şah was the leader of *futuvvet* and he had thousands of devoted young followers. He was called *Sultanu'l-Feta* in those times⁷ (Fig. 10).

Among the stoneworks are the fountain spouts. The lion-shaped marble spout at the Hacı Bektaş convent near Kırşehir and the writing "يا علي Ya Ali" and the Zülfikâr (Double-spiked sword) show us that the lion represenes Ali⁸ (Fig. 11). These symbols occupy an important position in the *Bektaşî*, *Batîni* and *Ahî* sects. The April bowl (*Nisan Tası*) bequeathed to the Konya *Mevlevî* Convent which has figures of humans, cocks and double-headed lions on it, can be considered as an example of the order⁹ (Fig. 12).

Wooden doors found in the Ethnographical Museum in Ankara, originally made for a convent or for a sympathiser of the sect also have lion-sun compositions, representing Hz. Ali exactly as on the tombstones. A wooden door from Karaman now found in the Istanbul Türk ve İslâm

6- The circumstance of the opium leaf representing Paradise is not part of the *bektaşî* beliefs. However in Tokat it became popular enough to be used to decorate the tombstone of one of the prominent personalities of the period. Barak Baba, who was the sheikh of Taptuk Emre, the novice of Sarı Saltuk and loved and respected by the Mongol rulers, smoked opium (A. Gölpinarlı, Yunus Emre ve Tasavvuf, İstanbul 1961, p.23). Kaygusuz Abdal in his poem.

Allah Tangrı yaratan gel içegör cur'adan.

Yar ile yar olagör ağyar çıksun aradan.

makes known his liking for opium. Here opium is a means to be united with God (A. Gölpinarlı, Yunus Emre ve Tasavvuf, pp.120-121); Muhyeddin Abdal in his poem.

Muhyeddinim haşhaşım

Ehl-i vahdedim hoşum

Tarikat fakrım oldu

Anın için traşım

explains the importance of opium (S. Nüzhed Ergun, Bektaşî Şairleri ve Nefesleri. İstanbul 1957, p.153).

7- Beyhan Karamağaralı, Sivas ve Tokat. . . , pp.101-102; Beyhan Karamağaralı, Ahlat. . . pp.3-4.

8- Bedri Noyan, Hacı Bektaş, Pirevi ve Diğer Ziyaret Yerleri. İzmir 1969, p.19.

9- M. Zeki Oral, Nisan Tası. Ankara 1954.

Eserleri Museum, has two lions on the upper portion, a sun composition in the middle part and under this are two imaginary figures at the sides. Under the sun composition is an ellipse shaped inside which is the figure of a crouching women¹⁰ (Fig. 13). The lion and peacock figures engraved on the wooden door panel found in the Ethnographical Museum Ankara came from one convent of Ankara. A cock and dragon engraved cupboard door which was transported to Kileci Masjid in Akşehir can be explained as belonging to the order art (Fig. 14).

There were special shapes for the metal *alems* (flags) of every order and sheikh. These are examples showing us the beliefs of these in the convent to which they belong. The flag nu. 5432 from Seyyid Gazi in the Ethnographical Museum Ankara is made of brass. Under the "الله God" writing at the top are two facing cocks. Under these again are motifs resembling two cock heads. On the sides at the bottom are two lions, under feet are two very stylized figures of deer or rabbits (Fig. 15-16). The 487 numbered flag is made of copper and iron in parts. At the sides of the forked sword ended flag are two encircling dragons (Fig. 17). The flag numbered 5438 has been brought from a *Mevlevî* convent in Afyonkarahisar. It is in three sections. Above, encircling the "يا الله Ya Allah" writing are two dragons (without heads) in an elliptic form. Under this is another ellipse ending in two larger dragons. Within this are the words "محمّد ، حسين ، حسن ، ابو بكر ، محمد" Muhammed, Ebû Bekr, Hasan, Hüseyin". Under this again is an ellipse ending in dragon heads. In the upper part of this ellipse is the word "عثمان Osman" "under this is" "الله ولي الله على ولي الله La ilahe il'l-Allah Ali veliyu'l-Lah" writing (Fig. 18)¹¹. This flag together with the 5432 numbered flag are taken from two very similar chablons. Another convent flag to be found in the Ethnographical Museum in Ankara is in the *Pençe-i Al-i Abâ* form known popularly as the *Hand of Mother Fatîma* (Fig. 19). There is a seal very similar to this flag's form (Fig. 20).

10- The figure of a crouching women is found in eastern countries from prehistoric times onwards (Hans Henning von der Osten, Ancient Oriental Seal in the Collection of Mrs. A.B.Brett. Chicago, Vol. 37, pl.9, Nu.91; Ward, Seal cylinders of W. Asia. Washington 1910, p.196; L.L. Legrain, Ur Excavation, Vol. III, Newyork 1936, pl.14). But in South East Asia and India, this motif has entered Brahmanism ad Buddhism as a goddess.

11- H.Z.Koşay-P. Çetin, Etnografya Müzesindeki Alemler (Magazin of Türk Etnografyası, III 1958, Ankara 1959) pp.84-85.

The staffs and axes of the convents which have some motifs on them are not to be forgotten examples of the craft art (Fig. 21).

Health mirrors also must be considered as part of order art, as must some lamps which have motifs and some branched candlesticks. The fourtybranched candlestick (*Kırkbudak*), which belong to the Hacı Bektaş convent symbolizes the fourty *Imams*. All the metal examples mentioned above are part of order art.

The two carvings on the walls of the convent of Sheikh Mekkûn in Tokat, one depicting two deers pulled by a dervish (Fig. 25) and the other showing the shrine of Sheikh Şihâbüddin Sühreverdî who was the saint of *Ahîs*, explain the relation of this convent with *Fütüvvet* (Fig. 23-24). Çöreği Büyük Convent in Niksar has also a deer figure on its gateway (Fig. 26). The deer is also a holy and respected animal in the *Bektaşî* order. Hacı Bektaş Velî was represented by a deer and a lion on his lap (Fig. 27). The deer horns, were also put in shrines and convents. One of the dervishes connected with *Yesevî* and *Bektaşî* called Geyikli Baba (Sheikh of deer) helped in the conquest of Bursa¹².

Except for the *Mevlevîs*, illustrated manuscripts, scrolls and panels showing the ritual dance, customs and costumes of the order have not yet been found. The *batınî* dervishes in order to spread their beliefs and costoms to the people who expected help from them and also to perform their ceremonies travelled from village to village. These travellers who were known as wellwishers and leaders showed scrolls and panels in order to explain their rites, because these pictures were easily transportable.

The albums known as Fatih Album found in the Topkapı Sarayı Hazine Library (Inv. Nu. 2153, 2160) have some miniatures which enlighten this problem. Some of these pictures have been cut from some scrolls and big panels and their original form has been lost¹³. Most of these miniatures seem to be connected with the orders. However, we can only guess to which sect the figures in the pictures belong. As we stated above, from the middle of the XIIIth century, among the esoteric orders of Anatolia, *Barakî*, *şamanî* beliefs and customs continued

12- Beyhan Karamağaralı, Ahlat. . pp.16-17; M. Neşri, Kitab-ı Cihan Nüma (Neşre hazırlayanlar: F.R.Onat-M.A.Köymen), I, Ankara 1949, pp.168-169; Evliya Çelebi, Seyahatname, Vol. II, p.49; H. Tanyu, Ankara ve Çevresinde Adak ve Adak Yerleri, Ankara 1967, pp. 187-188.

13- Beyhan Yörükân (Karamağaralı), Topkapı Sarayı Müzesindeki Albümlerde Bulunan Bazı Rulo Parçaları, (Annual of Sanat Tarihi, İstanbul 1964-65) pp.187-188.

under the cover of Islam. The founder of the order, Barak Baba from Tokat, is one of the followers of Sarı Saltuk and related to the *Yesevi* sect. He travelled nude except for a short skirt like the dervishes of *kalenderîs*. He put horns on his head and wandered from village to village with a group of eight to ten people, who carried tambourines, *kudüm* (flute) and horns, shouting like a bear and acting like a monkey¹⁴. This information fits closely to the figures in some of the miniatures signed "Muhammed Siyah Kalem". The miniature Inv. Nu. 2153/64 B because of its size was originally a scroll or panel. In this picture there is a group of people playing instruments and dancing in ecstasy. They wear only short skirts and have horns on their heads (Fig. 28). In the picture Inv. Nu. 2153/29 B there is a group of people in a circle composition performing a ceremony. One on the left has a cup in his hand. In the middle, a figure with a short skirt doing also something with a horse which is unknown to us. In the foreground a woman is seen also in ecstasy and making a sign of the trinity with her fingers (Fig. 29-30). This trinity must be Allah-Muhammed-Ali. Moreover in the picture Inv. Nu. 2153/38 B are seen two *kalenderî* dervishes. These figures have short skirts and leopard skins on their backs. The figure on the right has a bag with fringes on the top, bottom and on both sides (Fig. 30). This bag was possibly used for carrying opium. The *kalenderî* dervishes, among their many esoteric customs, smoke opium to get into a trance. The figures have long beards. Even if most of the *kalenderîs* shave their beards, moustaches and heads, all of them did not. Sarı Saltık and Barak Baba did not shave¹⁵. In the picture Inv. Nu. 2153/129 B are also seen two barefooted and shaven-headed dervishes with short skirts. One has a bowl (*keşkül*) in his hand. These figures represent also *kalenderî* dervishes called *Abdalan-ı Rûm* or *Divane* (ecstatic). According to the information of the sources, the *Abdalan-ı Rûm* wore animal skins with the fur outward on their backs, fairly high felt hats called *börk* and they wore also circular necklaces and earrings and smoke hashish¹⁶

14- Hüseyin Hüsameddin, *Amasya Tarihi, Dersaadet 1328-1330*, pp.460-464; A. Gölpınarlı, *Yunus Emre ve Tasavvuf*, pp.22-23.

15- A. Gölpınarlı, *Yunus Emre ve Tasavvuf*, p.44; H. Hüsameddin from the *Aynî History* gives the description of Barak Baba as being an abundant haired brunette, with a long moustache and beard, thick eyebrows, thick nose of large buld and verydir ty.

16- See note 6 and Reşat Ekrem Koçu, *Esrar, İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, p.5357, İstanbul 1969, for the importance of opium in Bektaşî and Batınî Orders.

(Fig. 32). In the picture Inv. Nu. 2153/128 A the figures with circular necklaces and having rods in their hands also represent *kalenderî* dervishes (Fig. 33).

It was believed that these dervishes cured the sick. One of the Anatolian *Abdal* called "Kaygusuz" wrote a poem for Abdal Musa who was the saint of the Anatolian *abdals*. This poem mentions a sick person coming to the dervishes to be cured. In the picture Inv. Nu. 2153/55 A is seen such a group of dervishes who drawn with their rods, bowls and high felt hats (*börk*) and simple costumes. An old man riding on a donkey in the middle of this picture represents one of the wandering dervishes and the others around him are his followers. On the left, the figure carries a sick woman on his back to the dervish with a hope of a cure (Fig. 34).

In all these pictures large-boned faces, stout deformed figures, simple and modest dress in an arid environment were illustrated. The miniatures as a whole were not rich in colour and composition which consists of one, two or three figures. In these miniatures a genre or dancing scene was preferred. Red and dark blue are the main colours. The skirts and dresses fitting to the actions of the subject and were full of folds drawn with lines. These works concerned with the life of common people were made by a different concept from the palace painting school of XVth to XVIth century which produced richly coloured gold decorated and idealized figures and elaborate drawings. At the palace painting studio the themes of the pictures were drawn court life and court women, love, heroic and hunting stories with crowded and rich compositions.

The problem of the origin and date of these miniatures have not yet been solved. Although they have already been classified into the different groups;¹⁷ in my opinion, to consider these group of miniatures together with the other paintings of Fatih Albums and starting from this point to identify their origin and date, may lead us to a wrong conclusion, as there is no relation between these miniatures except

17- Beyhan Yörükân (Karamağarab), Topkapı Sarayı Müzesindeki Albümlerde Bulunan Bazı... pp.188-199; O. Aslanapa, Türkische Miniaturmalerei am Hofe Mehmed des Eroberers in İstanbul, (Ars Orientalis I, 1954) pp.77-84; R. Ettinghausen, Some Painting in Four Istanbul Albums, (Ars Orientalis I, 1954) pp.92-103; Z. V. Togan, Topkapı Sarayında Dört Cönk, (Review of İslam Tetkikleri Enstitüsü, I, 1953, İstanbul 1954) pp.73-74.

bearing the same signature which was put afterwards and being in the same collection. The second half of XIIIth century until the middle of the XVth century was the time during which the activities of the *tekkes* and orders were most intensive. As I said above, the *tekkes* and *zaviyes* and many of the figured tombstones were built in this time. This period in which the order and convent art came into existence was the most suitable time for these group of miniatures due to the social conditions. For this reason I suppose that these pictures must have been made in the first half of the XIVth up to the middle of the XVth century. East and west Turkestan, Iran and Anadolia were the regions where the dervishes with their followers wandered. Even though the source books which mention Anadolia, have descriptions of the figures seen in the miniatures, it would be incorrect to consider a single centre where these travelling painters worked. The painters would start a painting while at one stopping place and probably finish it in another place. In this way, they would show these panels and scrolls which they carried with them to the people when necessary. These pictures were taken to Topkapı Sarayı Library during the time of Sultan Yavuz Selim. This is understood from his seal on the albums¹⁸. The pictures were brought to the İstanbul Palace in one of two ways. Either during Sultan Yavuz Selim's return from the Çaldıran battle when he closed down some of the convents and killed nearly fourty thousand *alevis* who were making propaganda for Shah Ismail of Iran, brought their possessions, including perhaps these paintings to Topkapı Sarayı. Or they were taken to Istanbul by Bediüzzaman Mirza, the son of Hüseyin Baykara who with a group of *kalenderî* welcomed Sultan Yavuz Selim at Tebriz and was himself also a *kalenderî*¹⁹. For these reason this collection came to Mirza's hand through the *kalenderîs*.

Order and convent art, architecture, handicrafts and paintings must occupy a special place. Order architecture, order figured plastic and painting have not been studied separately in Islamic Art. Actually some problems when regarded from the viewpoint of the orders gain another meaning. In our studies of historical culture, if we take into consideration the history of the orders and convents, we will reach better and more fruitful results.

18- Beyhan Yörükân (Karamağaralı), Topkapı Sarayı Müzesinde Bulunan Dört Albüm ve Albümler üzerindeki Çalışmalara Toplu Bakış, (Magazin of Türk Etnografya, 1964-65) pp.1-9.

19- Lûtfi Paşa Tarihi, İstanbul 1341, pp.235-236.