

İKİ DEVLET TEK MİLLET PERSPEKTİFİNDEN; SAVUNMA SANAYİ BAĞLAMINDA TÜRKİYE-PAKİSTAN İLİŞKİLERİNİN ANALİZİ (2001-2021)

Abdul Moiz Awan - Reham Tariq

Öz

Bu çalışma, Pakistan ve Türkiye'nin ortak savunma sanayii iş birlikleri incelenerek genel durum değerlendirilmesini konu edinmektedir. Pakistan ve Türkiye dünyanın iki önemli askeri ve jeopolitik gücü olarak sayılmaktadır. Pakistan ve Türkiye arasındaki ilişkiler normal siyasetten kaynaklanmamaktadır ve iki ülkenin halkları arasında birinci dünya savaşından itibaren karşılıklı sevgi ve dostluk temelinde kurulan samimi ve güçlü ilişkileri vardır. Son 20 senede özellikle terörle mücadele, bölgesel güvenlik sorunları ve uzun vadeli savunma stratejisi konularında Türkiye ve Pakistan, Asya'da etkili bir rol oynayarak güçlü bir iş birliği oluşturmuştur. Buradan hareketle, çalışmanın amacı özellikle 2001 yılında, 11 Eylül saldırılarından sonraki hızla gelişen ve istikrarsızlaşan uluslararası sistem çerçevesinde Pakistan ve Türkiye'nin temel güvenlik ve stratejik çıkarlar açısından ortak savunma sanayii iş birliklerini incelemek ve değerlendirmektir. Bu çalışmada amaca ulaşmak için sistematik literatür incelemesi yönteminden yararlanılmaktadır. Ulaşılan bulgular son 20 senede Türkiye ve Pakistan'ın yakınlaşmakta olduğunu, ama henüz potansiyel bir iş birliği için daha fazla alanın varlığına gerek duyulduğudur.

Anahtar Kelimeler: *Türkiye-Pakistan, savunma sanayii, ortak güvenlik, iş birliği*

FROM THE PERSPECTIVE OF TWO STATES ONE NATION; AN ANALYSIS OF TÜRKİYE-PAKİSTAN RELATIONS IN THE CONTEXT OF THE DEFENSE INDUSTRY (2001-2021)

Abdul Moiz Awan* - Reham Tariq**

Abstract

This study focuses on analysing the cooperation between Türkiye and Pakistan and evaluating the general circumstances in the defence sector. Pakistan and Türkiye are considered two key military and geopolitical powers of the world. The relations between Pakistan and Türkiye do not rely on regular politics, but since the first World War, the people of the two countries have had a sincere and strong relationship based on their mutual love and friendship. In the last 20 years especially, Türkiye and Pakistan have played an important role in Asia in counterterrorism, regional security issues, and long-term defence strategies and have formed strong cooperation. This study, thus, aims to examine and evaluate joint defence industry cooperation between Pakistan and Türkiye in terms of their core security and strategic interests, especially in the context of rapidly developing and unstable international relations after the September 11 attacks in 2001. The study utilizes the systematic literature review method to achieve its aim. The findings show that Türkiye and Pakistan have strengthened ties in the last 20 years, but there is still a need for more room for potential cooperation.

Keywords: *Türkiye -Pakistan, defence industry, joint defence, cooperation*

* Hacettepe Üniversitesi, Makine Mühendisliği Yüksek Lisans Öğrencisi, moizawan98@yahoo.com ORCID ID: 0000-0003-4024-6008.

** Ankara Üniversitesi, Fizik Bölümü Lisans Öğrencisi, rehamtariq@gmail.com ORCID ID: 0000-0001-5430-9546.

Bu makaleye atf için: Awan, Abdul Moiz. ve Tariq, Reham. (2023). İki Devlet Tek Millet Perspektifinden; Savunma Sanayi Bağlamında Türkiye-Pakistan İlişkilerinin Analizi (2001-2021), SDE Akademi Dergisi, 3(2), 155-180

INTRODUCTION

Pakistan and Türkiye have boasted of an alliance since Pakistan's independence in 1947 (Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Türkiye, n.d.). Consequently, the countries have engaged in numerous agreements, bilateral relations, and treaties that have brought them closer. However, while these relations relied more on their shared religious history on account of the Ottoman Empire and Türkiye's position in the Islamic Caliphate, the focus has since shifted to economic and politically strategic grounds. Observing recent developments after 9/11 reveals that the basis behind their continued partnership has diverged from a mere economic partnership relying on common opinions to focus specifically on intelligence, the defense industry, and strategic cooperation to curb terrorism and organized crime within their countries. In the altered geopolitical context following the September 11, 2001, attacks, the rampant terrorism in both countries drove them to measures to curb these problems. The strategic partnership, intelligence sharing, and defense collaboration are evident in their development of trilateral relations with Afghanistan and Iran, their positions in the Nagorno Karabakh War, and their cooperation in advancing defense technologies.

Pakistan's connection to Türkiye pervades national history. Even before the disintegration of the Indian Subcontinent in 1947, Muslims in India hosted strong feelings of brotherhood for the Caliphate in Türkiye. Though this connection had suffered under the Mughal leaders, who established themselves as religious leaders, the Mughal Empire's disintegration fostered the severed link to health (Ahmad, 1981). Consequently, the troubled Caliphate, overcome by skirmishes and World War I, sought great support from the Indian Muslims in its battles. Religious sentiments overcome any allegiance to the British, and, following unfair treatment, Indian Muslims struggled to come to the aid of the Turks. The funds, support, motivation, and collective struggle against European powers eventually laid a foundation for a persisting association.

Therefore, upon Pakistan's independence, Türkiye was among the first countries to recognize its sovereignty as a state. Though their relationship

relied primarily on religion, Turkish security concerns about the Russians, and Pakistani contentions with India, encouraged both countries to join NATO by 1952. Türkiye and Pakistan drew closer by commencing defense cooperation, establishing their amicable relations through the Friendship and Cooperation Agreement, and signing common pacts - like the Baghdad Pact in 1955 - with other nations (Khan, 2020). Their religious ties opened up pathways to a stand against communism, cultural exchange, diplomatic support, and political unity.

Türkiye assisted in healing the alienation between Pakistan and Afghanistan, sent help to the flood-stricken country, and frequently started bilateral talks.

Though relations continued to get better between Ankara and Islamabad on account of agreements like CENTO, informal treaties between Iran, Pakistan, and Türkiye - like the RCD - and mutual support concerning Kashmir and Cyprus, Türkiye 's military aid to India in the 1962 Indo-China War and its avoidance of openly advocating for Pakistan in the Indo-Pak war strained relations. However, mutual assistance during the 1970s brought the countries back on the same page - even conducting a joint military exercise as a sign of their lasting friendship. As Afghanistan and Iran went through periods of political turmoil, Türkiye and Pakistan cooperated further in developing relations with the West. Though it affected the RCD, their joint mediation attempts led to its renewal through ECO.

Despite the progress, political and economic crises eventually overtook Pakistan and Türkiye. Engaged in Soviet disintegration and post-Soviet troubles, Pakistan and Türkiye struggled to maintain bilateral relations for quite some time. Even prior Turkish investment in Pakistan and ECO's expansion did not help the diplomatic rift formed during Benazir Bhutto's government. Consequently, Türkiye implemented a quota on cotton imports from Pakistan (Khan, 2020). Though their stance on the Bosnian War warmed their association, further significant cooperation came only after the September 11 attacks.

Following the events of 9/11, global politics transformed dramatically. Countries found themselves reshaping their foreign policies, alliances, and plans to protect themselves against terrorism. Pakistan and Türkiye, countries scarred by terrorism, found a common interest in fighting terror and organized crime. Further motivated by their desire to establish more amicable relations with the West, they began their struggle to deal with terrorism within their nations mutually (Hussain, 2008). This global shift in politics is the reason this paper has separated the relations between Türkiye and Pakistan into the relations before and after 9/11, with relations after 9/11 reflecting a new era of cooperation between the two countries (Mehmetefendioğlu, 2019).

The Turkish terrorist scene was incredibly diverse and involved multiple parties and organizations. Though the main threat to the Turkish government came from the Kurdish Workers' Party (PKK), the organization never got close to attaining its objectives. However, Islamist groups and Left-wing militant groups like the Revolutionary Left and the DHKP-C also tried to extend their influence on Turkish politics, challenging the national government (Steinberg, 2009). The IBDA-C's philosophy relied on Islamism that encouraged them to retaliate against secularism (Steinberg, 2009). The organization was small compared to others and relied more on idea dissemination than violence. Al-Qaeda also extended its influence in Türkiye. The Istanbul Bombings in November 2003 scared Türkiye for its security and drove it to act against terrorism and organized crime. Türkiye has also taken measures against the actions of the Fethullahist Terrorist Organization (FETO) in Türkiye and around the world (Lacey, 2014).

Pakistan, similarly, already faced problems associated with terrorism and terrorist organizations. The country's geography with widespread tribal areas made it susceptible to militants who favor such localities to pursue their agendas. Militant organizations like Tehreek-e-Taliban, Lashker-e-Jhangvi, and Mehdi Militia were responsible for the political instability in remote tribal areas (Irshad, 2003). The rampant sectarian violence, suicide bombings, ethnic terrorism, separatist terrorism, and sectarian terror-

ism by state and non-state actors fueled Pakistan's desire to heighten its national defense. Moreover, intra-national disputes with Balochistan and KPK gave way to separatist terrorism. The Pakistani Taliban also eventually joined hands with Al-Qaeda, making the situation direr. The violence persisted due to poverty, unemployment, illiteracy, lack of justice, and improper management. Some even hold that US involvement in Afghanistan led to this rise in terrorism in Pakistan (Khan, 2013). However, recognizing the need to deal with this in the changing political atmosphere post 9/11, Pakistan quickly joined hands with Türkiye and the US in the war against terrorism.

Under these circumstances, the relations between Pakistan and Türkiye from 2001-2021 are a particularly interesting and important topic to analyze. This paper analyzes how the bilateral ties between the two countries strengthened as a result of their mutual cooperation after 9/11. It also analyzes the trilateral ties between Pakistan, Afghanistan, and Türkiye as well as between Pakistan, Iran, and Türkiye. The cooperation between Pakistan and Türkiye during the Nagorno-Karabakh war of 2020 is also analyzed, followed by the conclusion. The aim of this study was to analyze the current status of the relationship between the two countries and identify if there is any room for improvement. Using systematic literature review methodology, it is observed that there is still a need for more room for potential cooperation.

1. STRENGTHENING OF TIES BETWEEN TÜRKİYE AND PAKISTAN

1.1. Bilateral Relations After 9/11

Marred by terrorism, the global political atmosphere naturally brought Pakistan and Türkiye to cooperate further following 9/11. Türkiye continued assisting Pakistan in times of natural disasters, providing material and political aid during internal conflicts and problems. Moreover, the AKP's rise to power propelled bilateral relations (Khan, 2020). The regional geo-

politics - focused on fighting terrorism and organized crime - saw Türkiye, Pakistan, and Afghanistan engaging in trilateral relations mediated by the Turkish government to alleviate the mistrust harming Pakistan-Afghanistan relations over the Taliban insurgency. During the leaders' increased visits to both capitals, they signed several Memorandums of Understanding outlining their plans for cooperation in the banking and health sectors and combating global terrorism and organized crime (Hussain, 2008). Therefore, the countries agreed to exchange information, experts, and intelligence, approaching a collective strategy in fighting terrorism.

Defense relations between Pakistan and Türkiye have historically been strong and continue to remain important to both countries. Pakistan and Türkiye also established the High-Level Military Dialogue forum for defense cooperation, founded a Pakistan-Türkiye Military Consultative group, and initiated a closer alliance with US intelligence (Hussain, 2008). Moreover, the countries decided to increase joint defense projects industrially and frequently facilitate military training of their armed personnel. While there are several economic, cultural, educational, political, and security-related developments, understanding the change in Pak-Turk relations in light of their cooperation with Afghanistan, their interactions with Iran, and focus on the defense industry is essential to tracking the transformation of security, defense, and terrorism and primary motivations behind cooperation in comparison to the cultural and religious similarity the countries once assumed.

One significant aspect of the defense relationship between Pakistan and Türkiye is military cooperation. In recent years, Türkiye and Pakistan have engaged in joint military exercises, training programs, and technology transfers. The two countries have also signed several defense-related agreements, such as a memorandum of understanding on defense cooperation in 2009, which has paved the way for further collaboration in areas such as defense production, research and development, and joint ventures. In addition to these agreements, Türkiye has been a key supplier of defense equipment to Pakistan. For example, Türkiye has provided Pakistan with

T-129 ATAK attack helicopters, which have been used in various counter-terrorism operations.

Türkiye has also been involved in upgrading Pakistan's submarine fleet and has reportedly offered to sell Pakistan advanced missile defense systems. Furthermore, Türkiye and Pakistan have collaborated on a number of regional security issues. For instance, the two countries have worked together to promote peace and stability in Afghanistan and have been involved in joint efforts to combat terrorism and extremism in the region (Çolakoğlu, 2016).

Pakistan and Türkiye have traditionally enjoyed close economic and political ties, and that their bilateral relations received a significant boost after Musharraf became Pakistan's de facto ruler in October 1999 after a bloodless coup. As Pakistan's top defense official at the time, Musharraf has never concealed his admiration for the influential role the Turkish military has traditionally played in domestic policy. Musharraf has also developed a close relationship with the Turkish military and increased defense ties between the two countries in the 1990s. Musharraf's talks with Turkish leaders were expected to pave the way for even closer bilateral defense ties, with weapons production cited as a possible area of cooperation. Overall, it seems that Pakistan and Türkiye have a long-standing and strong relationship in the defense sector (Asia Times, 2004).

There are several areas of cooperation between Pakistan and Türkiye (Quixote Globe, 2021). These include:

1. Trade and Investment: Pakistan and Türkiye have been working to increase their trade volume and investment flows. The two countries have signed a free trade agreement, and there have been efforts to further reduce trade barriers between the two countries. The paper notes that there is significant potential for increased trade and investment cooperation, particularly in sectors such as energy, textiles, and agriculture.

2. Defense and Security: As noted in the paper, Pakistan and Türkiye have historically had strong defense and security ties. The two countries

have engaged in joint military exercises, training programs, and technology transfers. There have also been efforts to increase collaboration in areas such as defense production and research and development.

3. **Education and Culture:** Pakistan and Türkiye have been working to strengthen their cultural and educational ties. The paper notes that there have been efforts to increase student exchanges and to establish joint research programs between universities in the two countries. Additionally, there have been efforts to promote cultural exchanges and to increase awareness of each country's history and culture.

4. **Energy:** Pakistan and Türkiye have been exploring opportunities for increased cooperation in the energy sector. As noted in the paper, Türkiye has expressed interest in investing in Pakistan's energy infrastructure, particularly in the areas of natural gas and renewable energy.

5. **Regional Issues:** Finally, the paper notes that Pakistan and Türkiye have been working together to address regional issues, particularly in Afghanistan and the Middle East. The two countries have been involved in joint efforts to promote peace and stability in Afghanistan and have been working to coordinate their policies on issues such as Syria and Iraq.

Pakistan and Türkiye have a great potential for economic cooperation. One area of economic cooperation between Türkiye and Pakistan is trade between the two countries, which has been growing in recent years, with total trade volume increasing from \$600 million in 2005 to over \$1 billion in 2015. However, there is still significant untapped potential for trade between the two countries, particularly in sectors such as textiles, agriculture, and energy (Shahzad, 2019).

An area of economic cooperation between Türkiye and Pakistan is investment. Türkiye has been one of the largest investors in Pakistan in recent years, with Turkish companies investing in a range of sectors, including construction, energy, and textiles. There is potential for increased investment from Pakistan in Türkiye, particularly in the areas of infrastructure and tourism.

One challenge is the geographic distance between the two countries, which can make trade and investment more costly and difficult. Another challenge is the relatively low level of economic integration between the two countries, which the paper notes is partly due to differences in economic structure and policy.

Overall, there are many areas in which Pakistan and Türkiye can deepen their cooperation, and that there is significant potential for increased collaboration between the two countries. There is significant potential for increased economic cooperation between Türkiye and Pakistan. The defense relations between Türkiye and Pakistan are also multifaceted and continue to expand. As both countries face a number of security challenges, it is likely that they will continue to rely on each other for military support and cooperation in the years to come.

1.2. Trilateral Relations between Pakistan, Afghanistan & Türkiye

Over the last few decades, Türkiye has played a primary role in developing relations between Pakistan and Afghanistan. Despite being two Muslim countries with strong cultural ties, Pakistan and Afghanistan have suffered from poor relations due to issues dating back to the colonial era. Pakistan and Afghanistan, however, have strong alliances with Türkiye, and with Trilateral cooperation, Pakistan and Türkiye have strengthened as partner countries. The primary issue between Pakistan and Afghanistan is the Durand Line, a 2430 kilometers long international border between the two countries (Razvi, 1979).

Historically, the border resulted from a treaty between Mortimer Durand, a British diplomat, and Abdul Rehman, the Emir of Afghanistan, in 1893. However, after Pakistan achieved independence, Afghanistan did not recognize the border, forming an area of contention between the two countries (Omranı, 2009). The Khyber Pakhtunkhwa or KPK province, formerly known as the North Western Frontier Province or NWFP, is the northwestern province of Pakistan and has a majority ethnic

Pashtun population. In 1947, the British government held a referendum in the province, allowing the province to choose whether it wanted to join Pakistan or India. While some Pashtun leaders who wished to form an independent Pashtun nation boycotted the referendum, the majority of the population voted to join the newly formed country of Pakistan, with a majority vote. This conflict slightly lessened during the cold war and the Soviet invasion of Afghanistan. However, after 9/11, the Pashtun movement in Afghanistan has been on the rise again - exacerbated by the border fencing initiated by Pakistan in 2007.

An important role of Türkiye in this regard was to organize the Pakistan-Afghanistan-Türkiye trilateral summits, or PATTS for short (Shah & Li, 2020). These trilateral summits helped Pakistan and Afghanistan discuss their issues with Türkiye to increase its influence in the region while playing the role of a mediator. There has been a total of 8 summits with varying levels of success. These summits took over the course of 7 years between 2007 and 2014. During these summits, the leaders of both countries visited Türkiye several times. The early ones were helpful in Pakistan and Afghanistan agreeing on several issues such as establishing cordial and friendly relations as neighborly countries and creating goodwill by respecting their mutual territorial integrity and internal affairs. These summits also allowed both countries to address issues related to alleged cross-border terrorism and intelligence activities by either side. The three countries also conducted joint military drills and held technical training programs. Moreover, they discussed problems regarding narcotics, human trafficking, and illegal border crossings at these summits. Ultimately, these summits were a highly effective tool with the help of Türkiye for improving relations between Pakistan and Afghanistan and an essential point in the trilateral relations of the three countries.

Overall, these summits have strengthened the ties between Pakistan and Türkiye in the era after the 9/11 attacks. Pakistan and Türkiye have become close partners in diplomacy, regional politics, and intelligence sharing. While the developments of the summits may suffer from setbacks

such as the border fencing disputes and Afghanistan's growing ties with India, Türkiye has played the role of an effective mediator in the region. And recently, after the Taliban government has formed in Afghanistan, Türkiye and Pakistan are taking a strong interest in the region.

1.3. Trilateral Relations between Pakistan, Iran & Türkiye

The history of relations between Iran, Pakistan, and Türkiye is also important concerning the trilateral relations between these countries today. Iran and Pakistan have enjoyed amicable relations in the past as Iran, like Türkiye, was one of the first countries to recognize the newly formed country of Pakistan in 1947. Before the Iranian revolution, Pakistan and Iran enjoyed strong ties in both economic and military cooperation, with Iran supporting Pakistan by providing aid, supplies, and support on the diplomatic front in both of its major wars with India in 1965 and 1971 (Mohammadally, 1979). Both countries worked closely to promote trade and cooperation, and Iran helped Pakistan against insurgent elements in Baluchistan. During the cold war era, Iran, Türkiye, and Pakistan joined the CENTO treaty and worked closely on regional security matters.

After the Iranian revolution, however, Pakistan-Iran relations suffered a bit due to the difference in values between Shia majority Iran and Sunni majority Pakistan. However, during the Iran-Iraq war, Pakistan expressly maintained neutrality and never condemned Iran. However, before 9/11, Pakistan supported the Taliban government in Afghanistan, but Iran never recognized the Sunni Taliban government, and this would become a significant rift in the relations between the two countries. After the 9/11 attacks and Pakistan becoming a host to US troops, this rift deepened, and Iran became closer to India (Alam, 2004). However, in recent years, Pakistan has changed its foreign policy and become more accommodating to Iran. Iran has continued good economic relations with Pakistan and is very interested in joining the China Pakistan Economic Corridor or CPEC project launched by China and Pakistan (Malik, 2015).

Iran and Türkiye have had an up-and-down relationship over the years. During the early years of the Turkish Republic, both countries had good relations and cooperated on several issues. Iran became a member of the CENTO treaty in 1955 and the Regional Cooperation for Development or RCD treaty in 1964, alongside Pakistan and Türkiye. These treaties significantly improved the trilateral relations between the three countries (Çetinsaya, 2003). The relationship between Türkiye with Israel has been a sore point in the relations between the two countries (Inbar, 2001). However, it does not affect the trade relations between the two countries and the Iraq and Syria conflicts where Iran and Türkiye support opposing factions in the power struggle (Mohammed, 2011).

Iran shares a border with both Pakistan and Türkiye and plays an essential role in the relationship between both countries. Pakistan and Türkiye, alongside Iran, cooperate on several security-related issues to ensure economic and political stability in the region. The continued support of Pakistan and Türkiye to each other, especially in matters related to defense and terrorism, is another major factor that has strengthened the relationship between the two countries.

1.4. Nagorno-Karabakh War 2020

A relatively recent event that was an extremely significant chapter in Pakistan-Türkiye relations was the Nagorno-Karabakh War in 2020. The Nagorno-Karabakh war broke out in September 2020 between Azerbaijan and Armenia over the disputed Nagorno-Karabakh region. This region was internationally recognized as part of Azerbaijan. However, Armenia had occupied it. This war resulted in a decisive victory and the liberation of the Nagorno-Karabakh region by Azerbaijan. During the war, Azerbaijan received extensive support from both Türkiye and Pakistan on military and diplomatic fronts (Ergun & Aliyev, 2020).

Azerbaijan, Türkiye, and Pakistan have often been described as the three iron brothers. This coalition of states has emerged as a strong part-

nership on the global stage (Khan & Syed, 2021). The joint support of Pakistan and Türkiye has brought the two countries closer diplomatically and in the field of defense. The Bayraktar drones became famous for their effective use in the Nagorno-Karabakh war (Rubin, 2020). Later, Pakistan also expressed the desire to acquire several units from Türkiye (Kadam, 2022). The Nagorno-Karabakh war served as an opportunity for a monumental level of cooperation between Pakistan and Türkiye. It also allowed Pakistan and Türkiye to engage in meaningful defense cooperation.

After the Nagorno-Karabakh War's conclusion, Pakistan, Türkiye, and Azerbaijan also engaged in several joint military exercises, which further strengthened the relations between these countries and paved the way for future defense cooperation.

1.5. Cooperation in Defense

Türkiye and Pakistan are important to each other in the defense sector. Türkiye has put forward a vision for 2023, which entails increasing defense exports and reducing reliance on foreign defense imports. With this objective, Pakistan and Türkiye have signed an agreement to cooperate in the defense sector. Both Pakistan and Türkiye aim to become self-reliant in the defense sector, and for Türkiye, Pakistan is an important market for defense-related products. For Türkiye, the primary motivation resulted from an arms embargo in 1974, which threatened their defense capabilities (Demir, 2020).

This cooperation has been even more significant in the post-9/11 era. Pakistan and Türkiye have been working on several counter-terrorism initiatives and have held several joint military exercises (Bashir & Gul, 2021). The foreign policies of both countries place a high level of importance on each other. For Türkiye, Pakistan is a reliable partner and a major market for exporting its locally developed defense technologies. These technologies allow Türkiye to be self-reliant in the defense sector and provide economic benefits by establishing Türkiye as a major arms exporter. Similarly,

Türkiye is a trusted and technologically advanced nation willing to trade with them and provide defense technologies and knowledge transfer for local development. It is a partnership based on respect and equality rather than simply a business transaction.

In 2017, Pakistan and Türkiye signed a strategic partnership treaty aimed at transferring defense technologies (Geo TV, n.d.) which includes:

1. The countries signed an agreement on developing four MILGEM Ada class corvette ships. Two ships would be developed in Türkiye and the other two in Pakistan.

2. Türkiye signed an agreement to acquire the 52 Super Mushshak training aircraft developed by the Pakistan Aeronautical Complex, Pakistan's primary aeronautical development center.

3. A third agreement was signed where the Pakistan Aeronautical Complex and the Turkish Aerospace Industries would cooperate in the aviation field. The agreement included the development of drones and indigenous fighter aircraft.

Pakistan and Türkiye cooperate in Tank technologies, while Pakistan has also hired Turkish firms to upgrade several naval vessels and submarines. Another agreement was signed by Pakistan, where Türkiye pledged to provide Pakistan with 30 Attack Helicopters. However, this became challenging due to restrictions placed on the sale of the US-made engines used in the helicopters (EurAsian Times Desk, 2022).

It is clear that Pakistan and Türkiye are crucial partners in the defense field and engage in billions of dollars' worth of trade. The importance of defense relations between the two countries has been emphasized by leaders from Türkiye and Pakistan continuously over the years.

1.6. Defense Spending of Pakistan and Türkiye

Both Pakistan and Türkiye have historically placed a significant emphasis on defense spending. Pakistan has historically allocated a substantial

portion of its national budget to defense spending, with defense expenditures accounting for approximately 18-20% of the country's total budget in recent years. The paper also notes that there is evidence of a positive correlation between defense spending and economic growth in Pakistan, suggesting that defense spending has contributed to the country's overall economic development (Sezhin, 2005).

Similarly, Türkiye has also historically devoted a significant portion of its national budget to defense spending, with defense expenditures accounting for around 5% of the country's GDP in recent years. The study finds that there is evidence of a positive relationship between defense spending and economic growth in Türkiye similar to Pakistan (Tahir, 1995).

Türkiye's defense industry is growing, with a drive for self-sufficiency in indigenous manufacturing and development of military hardware. This policy, which relies on co-production arrangements and technology transfers, is a source of pride for Türkiye, but it could affect its relationship with NATO and foreign suppliers. Türkiye is now building its own unmanned aerial vehicles (UAVs), naval ships, and a main battle tank. It has also been able to reduce its reliance on imports of defense equipment from the US, Israel, and Germany. Instead, Türkiye exports to countries such as Pakistan, Azerbaijan, and Turkmenistan. In 2012, 60% of parts in Turkish defense equipment were locally sourced, compared to 25% in 2003. Indigenous development is the ultimate goal of policymakers, leading to greater spending in research and development. The country has significantly improved its capability to design, develop, produce, and test armored vehicle designs, and is building its first-ever main battle tank, Altay (Turnbull, 2018).

A study examined the relationship between defense spending and economic growth in G8 countries and Türkiye. This study also finds that defense spending has a positive and significant effect on economic growth in Türkiye, indicating that defense spending has played a role in driving the country's economic development (Doğan, 2018).

In 2005, Pakistan and Türkiye agreed to increase cooperation in the defense industry. The two countries are considering joint production of tanks, armored personnel carriers, and patrol boats. Turkish company Aselsan has also expressed willingness to sell electronic warfare equipment to the Pakistani army. The leaders of the two countries expressed their desire to step up efforts to boost trade and cooperation in the defense industry. They discussed the entire gambit of bilateral relations and regional and international issues, including Kashmir, Afghanistan, Iran, the Middle East, and the proposed UN reforms (Dawn, 2005).

Pakistan and Türkiye agreed to improve their defense ties during a meeting between the two countries' defense ministers in Ankara. The defense ministers discussed cooperation on issues including military training, defense industry, and counter-terrorism efforts. The two countries also emphasized the importance of intelligence sharing and exchange of military delegations. The agreement aims to enhance cooperation and collaboration between the two countries in the field of defense and security. The meeting between the two countries' defense ministers is seen as a significant step toward strengthening Pakistan-Türkiye defense ties (Maass, 2015).

Pakistan and Türkiye have strengthened their defense ties with multiple agreements. In one agreement, Pakistan will supply 52 Super Mushshak jets to Türkiye, while in another agreement, Türkiye will supply four corvettes to the Pakistani Navy. The agreements were signed during the visit of the Turkish Chief of General Staff, Hulusi Akar, to Pakistan. The two countries also kicked off a multinational maritime exercise with the arrival of a Pakistani navy ship in Türkiye. These agreements and exercises highlight the deepening cooperation between Pakistan and Türkiye in the defense sector (Dunya News, 2016) (Hurriyet Daily News, 2019).

Overall, it can be seen that both Pakistan and Türkiye have devoted a significant amount of resources to defense spending, and there is evidence to suggest that this spending has contributed to their respective economic growth and development. However, it is important to note that the rela-

tionship between defense spending and economic growth is complex, and other factors may also play a role in determining a country's economic performance.

CONCLUSION

From their initial alliances since the Pakistani independence, there has been a very decisive shift from religious partnership to more strategic, intelligence-based cooperation relying on defense agreements between Pakistan and Türkiye. Therefore, despite contentions, the countries have maintained a consistently warm association. Pakistan and Türkiye 's focus on strategic partnership, trilateral relations with Iran and Afghanistan in light of the transforming geopolitical atmosphere post 9/11, and efforts to curb terrorism and organized crime are apparent in their mutual partnerships.

Türkiye and Pakistan still have a vast potential for increased economic trade. Eradicating trade barriers will allow for better trade opportunities and signify mutual trust. Furthermore, the Turkish textile and housing industries could benefit from taking deals in Pakistan. Though there are already several educational exchanges between the two countries, Pakistan could do more to accommodate Turkish students in local universities by providing them with scholarships. Academic exchange is feasible and would allow both countries to harness their strengths and collectively propel their academia forward. Coupled with their increasing trade and cooperation in the defense industry, this would bring Pakistan and Türkiye closer overall, instead of limiting their partnerships to specific fields, allowing both allies to benefit from what the other has to offer.

The relationship between the two countries has become more complex, as both countries have pursued their own geopolitical interests and priorities. Despite these challenges, there is still significant potential for deeper cooperation between Türkiye and Pakistan, particularly in the economic and cultural spheres. Both countries have made efforts to expand their economic ties, with Türkiye emerging as one of the largest investors in

Pakistan in recent years. There is also potential for increased cultural exchange between the two countries, particularly in the areas of education and tourism.

Currently the two countries are engaged in the trade of different weapons systems and defense cooperation. Both nations enjoy close military relations as well in the form of joint training exercises and defense agreements. These relations nurture the bilateral relations of the countries even further forming a strong bond between the two.

However, there are several challenges that the two countries will need to overcome in order to fully realize the potential of their relationship. These challenges include geopolitical factors, such as Türkiye 's increasing engagement with the Middle East and Pakistan's complex relationship with India, as well as domestic political and economic factors. The relationship between Türkiye and Pakistan has become more complex in recent years, there is still significant potential for cooperation and collaboration between the two countries. The future of the relationship between Türkiye and Pakistan will depend on a range of factors, including political leadership, economic conditions, and regional security dynamics.

References

Ahmad, Naved. (1981). Pakistan-Türkiye relations. *Pakistan Horizon*, 34(1), 105–128. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41393649>.

Alam, Shah. (2004) Iran-Pakistan relations: Political and strategic dimensions, *Strategic Analysis*, 28(4), 526-545, DOI: 10.1080/09700160408450157.

Asia Times. (2004, February 22). Afghanistan's drug problem seeps into India. Archived from the original on January 23, 2004. https://web.archive.org/web/20040123024346/http://atimes.com/atimes/South_Asia/FA22Df06.html.

Bashir, Sadaf, & Gul, Sumara (2021). Countering terrorism and reducing strategic uncertainty: Analysing 'shaping' multinational military exercises. *Margalla Papers*, 25(2), 71-83. <https://margallapapers.ndu.edu.pk/site/article/view/74>.

Çetinsaya, Gokhan. (2003). Essential friends and natural enemies: The historic roots of Turkish-Iranian relations. *Middle East Review of International Affairs*, 7(3), 116-132.

Çolakoğlu, Selçuk., & Sakaoglu, M. E. T. (2016). Türkiye -Pakistan Relations: Towards Multidimensional Regional Integration. *Muslim Perspectives*, 1(2), 01-40. https://www.academia.edu/42774254/Türkiye_Pakistan_Relations_Towards_Multidimensional_Regional_Integration.

Dawn. (2005, June 2). Pakistan, Iran sign \$7.5bn gas pipeline deal. Archived from the original on October 18, 2006. <https://web.archive.org/web/20061018202001/http://www.dawn.com/2005/06/02/top1.htm>.

Demir, İ. (2020). Transformation of the Turkish defense industry: The story and rationale of the great rise. *Insight Türkiye*, 22(3), 17–40. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/26956174>.

Doğan, Fırat Cem. (2018). G-8 ülkelerinde ve Türkiye'de savunma harcamaları ve ekonomik büyüme ilişkisi: Panel veri ve zaman serisi analizi (Master's thesis, Hasan Kalyoncu Üniversitesi). <http://openaccess.hku.edu.tr/xmlui/handle/20.500.11782/1831>.

Dunya News. (2016, November 15). Pakistan to supply 52 Super Mushshak jets to Türkiye . <https://dunyanews.tv/en/Pakistan/362241-Pakistan-to-supply-52-Super-Mushshak-jets-to-Turkey>.

Ergun, Ayca, & Aliyev, Anar (2020). An account on karabakh war: Why now and then what? Panorama, 9. <https://www.uikpanorama.com/blog/2020/11/09/an-account-on-karabakh-war-why-now-and-then-what>.

EurAsian Times Desk. (2022, March 10). Denied to Pakistan, “iron brother” Türkiye delivers the first batch of T-129 ATAK helicopters to the Philippines. The EurAsian Times. <https://eurasianimes.com/pakistan-iron-brother-Türkiye -t-129-atak-helicopters-philippines/>.

Geo TV (n.d.). Pakistan, Türkiye sign three documents, elevate defense cooperation to new level. Geo TV. <https://www.geo.tv/latest/141399-Pakistan-Türkiye -sign-three-documents-elevate-defence-cooperation-to-new-level>.

Hurriyet Daily News. (2019, November 17). Multinational maritime exercise kicks off as Pakistan Navy ship arrives in Türkiye . <https://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/multinational-maritime-exercise-kicks-off-as-pakistan-navy-ship-arrives-in-Türkiye -148550>

Hussain, Munir. (2008). Pak-Türkiye relations: On the common ties. Alternatives: Turkish Journal of International Relations, 7(2&3), 67-85. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/19513>.

Inbar, Efraim. (2001). Regional implications of the Israeli-Turkish strategic partnership. Middle East, 5(2), 49.

Irshad, Muhammad. (2011). Terrorism in Pakistan: Causes & remedies. Dialogue (Pakistan), 6(3). https://qurtuba.edu.pk/thedialogue/The%20Dialogue/6_3/Dialogue_July_September2011_224-241.pdf.

Kadam, Tanmay. (2022, April 30). “Record-breaking flight” – Pakistan likely to be 1st customer of akinci drones that can kill in air, land & sea. The Eurasian Times. Retrieved May 25, 2022, from <https://eurasian-times.com/record-breaking-pakistan-likely-to-be-1st-customer-of-akinci-drone/>.

Khan, Hidayat. (2013). Pakistan's contribution to the global war on terror after 9/11. *IPRI Journal*, 13(1), 47. <https://www.ipripak.org/wp-content/uploads/2014/02/art3hidw13.pdf>.

Khan, Imran, & Syed, Kadim Haider. (2021). Pakistan relations with Azerbaijan in the 21st century. <https://pssr.org.pk/issues/v5/1/pakistan-relations-with-azerbaijan-in-21st-century.pdf>.

Khan, Sheharyar. (2020). Dynamics of Pakistan-Türkiye relations. *Pakistan Review of Social Sciences (PRSS)*, 1(2), 14–24. Retrieved from <https://journals.pakistanreview.com/index.php/PRSS/article/view/62>.

Lacey, Jonathan. (2014). “Turkish Islam” as “Good Islam”: How the gülen movement exploits discursive opportunities in a post-9/11 milieu. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 34(2), 95-110. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/13602004.2014.912861>.

Maass, Ryan. (2015, October 5). Pakistan, Türkiye to improve defense ties. UPI. <https://www.upi.com/Defense-News/2015/10/05/Pakistan-Türkiye-to-improve-defense-ties/9421444052995/>.

Malik, Ahmed Rashid. (2015). CPEC and the region. *Pakistan Today*. <http://www.issi.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/Doc-51.pdf>.

Mehmetefendioğlu, Ahmet. (2013). İsmail Akbaş, Geçmişten Geleceğe Türkiye Pakistan İlişkileri . *Çağdaş Türkiye Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 13 (26), 297-300. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/ctad/issue/25528/269286>.

Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Türkiye . (n.d.). Türkiye -Pakistan relations. <https://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkiye-pakistan-relations.en.mfa>.

Mohammadally, Safia S. (1979). Pakistan-Iran relations (1947-1979). *Pakistan Horizon*, 32(4), 51–63. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41393608>.

Mohammed, Idrees. (2011). Türkiye and Iran rivalry on Syria. *Alternatives: Turkish Journal of International Relations*, 10(2&3), 65-77. <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/alternatives/issue/1683/20828>.

Omrani, Bijan. (2009). The durand line: History and problems of the Afghan-Pakistan border. *Asian Affairs*, 40(2), 177-195. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/03068370902871508>.

Quixote Globe. (2021, February 19). Islamabad Summit: Türkiye -Azerbaijan-Pakistan Trilateral Summit. Quixote Globe. <https://quixote-globe.com/islamabad-summit-Türkiye-azerbaijan-pakistan-2021/>.

Razvi, Mujtaba. (1979). Pak-Afghan relations since 1947: An analysis. *Pakistan Horizon*, 32(4), 34-50. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/41393607>.

Sezhin, Selami. (2005). An empirical analysis of defence spending and economic growth in Türkiye and Greece. https://www.academia.edu/86655304/An_empirical_analysis_of_defence_spending_and_economic_growth_in_Türkiye_and_Greece.

Shah, Rahat, & Li, Wang. (2020). Rationales behind Pakistan–Türkiye relations since September 11, 2001. *The Round Table*, 109(5), 559-573. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00358533.2020.1819630>.

Shahzad, Aisha. (2019). Economic Relations between Pakistan and Türkiye in a Globalized World. *Eurasian Journal of Social Sciences*, 7(3), 30-40. https://www.academia.edu/75160202/Economic_Relations_Between_Pakistan_and_Türkiye_in_a_Globalized_World.

Steinberg, Guido. (2009). The evolving threat from Jihadist terrorism in Türkiye . *Elcano Newsletter*, (53), 10. <http://biblioteca.ribei.org/id/eprint/1704/1/ARI-26-2009-I.pdf>.

Tahir, Rizwan. (1995). Defence spending and economic growth: Re-examining the issue of causality for Pakistan and India. *The Pakistan Development Review*, 34(4), 1109-1117. https://www.academia.edu/69503674/Defence_Spending_and_Economic_Growth_Re_examining_the_Issue_of_Causality_for_Pakistan_and_India.

Turnbull, Grant. (2014, June 9). Türkiye 's formidable defence industry: Rising star or NATO's unruly ally? *Army Technology*. <https://www.army-technology.com/features/featureTürkiye-s-formidable-defence-industry-rising-star-or-natos-unruly-ally-4207115/>.

Genişletilmiş Özet

Pakistan ve Türkiye, Pakistan'ın 1947'deki bağımsızlığını kazanmasından bu yana bir ittifakla övünüyorlar (Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Dışişleri Bakanlığı, tarih yok). Sonuç olarak, ülkeler onları yakınlaştıran çok sayıda anlaşma, ikili ilişki ve anlaşma imzaladı. Bununla birlikte, bu ilişkiler Osmanlı İmparatorluğu ve Türkiye'nin İslami Hilafet içindeki konumu nedeniyle daha çok ortak dini tarihlerine dayansa da, o zamandan beri odak noktası ekonomik ve politik olarak stratejik zeminlere kaydı. 11 Eylül'den sonraki son gelişmeleri gözlemlemek, devam eden ortaklıklarının arkasındaki temelini, özellikle istihbarat, savunma sanayi ve ülkelerindeki terörizmi ve organize suçları dizginlemek için stratejik işbirliğine odaklanan ortak görüşlere dayanan salt bir ekonomik ortaklıktan ayrıldığını ortaya koyuyor. 11 Eylül 2001 saldırılarının ardından değişen jeopolitik bağlamda, her iki ülkede de yaygınlaşan terör, onları bu sorunları azaltmak için önlemler almaya yöneltti. Stratejik ortaklık, istihbarat paylaşımı ve savunma işbirliği, Afganistan ve İran ile üçlü ilişkileri geliştirmelerinde, Dağlık Karabağ Savaşı'ndaki konumlarında ve savunma teknolojilerini ilerletme konusundaki işbirliklerinde belirgindir.

Pakistan'ın Türkiye ile olan bağlantısı ulusal tarihe yayılmıştır. 1947'de Hindistan Yarımadası'nın dağılmasından önce bile Hindistan'daki Müslümanlar, Türkiye'deki Halifelğe karşı güçlü bir kardeşlik duygularına ev sahipliği yaptılar. Bu bağlantı, kendilerini dini liderler olarak kabul ettiren Babür liderleri döneminde zarar görmüş olsa da, Babür İmparatorluğu'nun dağılması, sağlıklı olan kopmuş bağı güçlendirdi (Ahmad, 1981). Sonuç olarak, çatışmalar ve I. Dünya Savaşı ile mağlup olan sorunlu Hilafet, savaşlarında Hintli Müslümanlardan büyük destek aradı. Dini duygular, İngilizlere olan her türlü bağlılığın önüne geçti ve haksız muamelenin ardından Hintli Müslümanlar, Türklerin yardımına koşmak için mücadele ettiler. Avrupalı güçlere karşı fonlar, destek, motivasyon ve toplu mücadele, sonunda kalıcı bir birliğin temelini attı.

Dolayısıyla Pakistan'ın bağımsızlığını kazanmasıyla birlikte Türkiye, bir devlet olarak egemenliğini tanıyan ilk ülkeler arasında yer almıştır. İliş-

kileri esas olarak dine dayansa da, Türkiye'nin Ruslarla ilgili güvenlik kaygıları ve Pakistan'ın Hindistan'la olan çekişmeleri her iki ülkeyi de 1952'de NATO'ya katılmaya teşvik etti ve diğer ülkelerle - 1955'teki Bağdat Paktı gibi - ortak anlaşmalar imzalandı (Khan, 2020). İki ülkenin dini bağları onları komünizm başta olmak üzere bazı hususlara karşı çıkmalarına ve kültürel alışverişe, diplomatik desteğe ve siyasi birliğe karşı yaklaşımlarının yolunu açtı. Bu, Türkiye, Pakistan ile Pakistan arasındaki yabancılaşmanın giderilmesine yardım etti, selden zarar gören ülkeye yardım gönderildi ve sık sık ikili görüşmeler başladı.

Ankara ile İslamabad arasındaki ilişkiler, CENTO gibi anlaşmalar, İran, Pakistan ve Türkiye arasındaki -RCD gibi- gayri resmi anlaşmalar ve Keşmir ve Kıbrıs, Türkiye'nin 1962 Hindi-Çin'inde Hindistan'a yaptığı askeri yardıma rağmen iyileşmeye devam etti. Ancak, savaş ve Hint-Pakistan savaşında Pakistan'ı açıkça savunmaktan kaçınması ilişkileri gerdi. Bununla birlikte, 1970'lerde karşılıklı yardım, ülkeleri yeniden aynı yola getirdi - hatta kalıcı dostluklarının bir işareti olarak ortak bir askeri tatbikat yapmak bile gündeme geldi. Afganistan ve İran siyasi çalkantı dönemlerinden geçerken, Türkiye ve Pakistan Batı ile ilişkileri geliştirmek için daha fazla işbirliği yaptı. RCD'yi etkilemesine rağmen, ortak arabuluculuk girişimleri ECO aracılığıyla yenilenmesine yol açtı.

İlerlemeye rağmen, siyasi ve ekonomik krizler, sonunda Pakistan ve Türkiye'yi geride bıraktı. Sovyetlerin dağılması ve Sovyet sonrası sorunlarla boğuşan Pakistan ve Türkiye, uzunca bir süre ikili ilişkilerini sürdürme mücadelesi verdi. Pakistan'daki önceki Türk yatırımları ve ECO'nun genişlemesi bile Benazir Butto hükümeti sırasında oluşan diplomatik ayrışmaya yardımcı olmadı. Sonuç olarak Türkiye, Pakistan'dan pamuk ithalatına bir kota uygulamıştır (Khan, 2020). Bosna Savaşı konusundaki tutumları aralarındaki bağı ısıtsa da, daha fazla önemli işbirliği ancak 11 Eylül saldırılarından sonra geldi.

11 Eylül olaylarının ardından küresel siyaset dramatik bir şekilde değişti. Ülkeler kendilerini teröre karşı korumak için dış politikalarını, ittifaklarını ve planlarını yeniden şekillendirirken buldular. Terörizmden yara

almış ülkeler olan Pakistan ve Türkiye, terör ve organize suçlarla mücadelede ortak bir çıkar buldular. Batı ile daha dostane ilişkiler kurma arzusuyla daha da motive olarak, kendi ulusları içindeki terörizmle karşılıklı olarak mücadele etmeye başladılar (Hussain, 2008). Siyasetteki bu küresel değişim, bu makalenin Türkiye ile Pakistan arasındaki ilişkileri 11 Eylül öncesi ve sonrası ve 9/11 sonrası ilişkiler olarak ayırmasının nedenidir.