



# FIRAT ÜNİVERSİTESİ İLAHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ DERGİSİ

FIRAT UNIVERSITY JOURNAL OF THE FACULTY OF THEOLOGY

Sayı: 27/2 (Aralık / December 2022), 375-392

*The Collection Of The Qur'ân* Özelinde John Burton'un Kur'ân Tarihine Bakışı<sup>1</sup>

The Views Of John Burton On The Qur'anic History In The Context Of His Work *The Collection Of The Qur'ân*

**Şeyma METE**

Arş. Gör. İstanbul Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Kur'ân-ı Kerim Okuma ve Kırâat İlmi Anabilim Dalı

Research Assistant, Istanbul University, Faculty of Theology, Department of Qur'anic Recitation and Qirâah Science, Istanbul, Türkiye  
seymamete34@gmail.com ORCID: 0000-0001-6636-3232

**Nesrişah SAYLAN**

Doç. Dr. Fırat Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Kur'ân-ı Kerim Okuma ve Kırâat İlmi Anabilim Dalı

Asst. Prof. Fırat University, Faculty of Theology, Department of Qur'anic Recitation and Qirâah Science, Elazığ, Türkiye

nsaylan@firat.edu.tr ORCID: 0000-0002-5805-8630

**Makale Bilgisi / Article Information**

Makale Türü / Article Types: Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article

**Makale İşlem Süreci / Article Processing**

Geliş Tarihi / Date Received: 27 Eylül/September 2022 Kabul Tarihi / Date Accepted: 28 Kasım/November 2022

Yayın Tarihi / Date Published: 31 Aralık/December 2022 Yayın Sezonu / Pub Date Season: Aralık/December

**Atf / Cite as**

Mete, Şeyma – Saylan, Nesrişah. " *The Collection Of The Qur'ân* Özelinde John Burton'un Kur'ân Tarihine Bakışı".

*Fırat Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 27/2 (Aralık 2022), 375-392.

DOI: 10.58568/firatilahiyat.1181122

**İntihal / Plagiarism**

Bu makale, iTenticate yazılımınca taranmıştır. İntihal tespit edilmemiştir. This article has been scanned by iTenticate. No plagiarism detected.

**Etik Beyan/Ethical Statement**

Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur. It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited (Şeyma Mete – Nesrişah Saylan).

**Yayıncı / Published by**

Fırat Üniversitesi/ Fırat University

**Lisans Bilgisi / License Information**

Bu makale, Creative Commons Atf-GayriTicari 4.0 Uluslararası Lisansı (CC BY NC) ile lisanslanmıştır.

This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY NC).

<sup>1</sup> Bu çalışma "Kur'ân Tarihine Oryantalist Bir Yaklaşım: John Burton Örneği" adlı yüksek lisans tezinden üretilmiştir. (Fırat Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Temel İslam Bilimleri, 2021)/ This work was produced from master thesis which titled "An Orientalist Approach To The History Of The Qur'ân: The Example Of John Burton". (Fırat University, Institution of Social Science, Department of Basic Islâmic Science, 2021)

## **The Views Of John Burton On The Qur'anic History In The Context Of His Work *The Collection Of The Qur'an***

**Abstract:** This study was prepared to evaluate the English orientalist John Burton's views based on his book *The Collection of The Qur'an*. Burton was a prominent figure known for his works on the history of the Qur'an, in the context of the Qur'anic history in particular, and his efforts to explore the nature of the comments which included the process of the development of the Qur'anic texts and its far-reaching history after the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh). In contrast to the other orientalists, Burton had a different approach in some topics. From time to time, he criticized other orientalists and tried to connect the issue of jam al-Qur'an with the naskh (abrogation) and attended to separate Qur'an and Mushaf concepts in a sharp contrast. This study basically aims to examine and explain John Burton's opinions about the history of the Qur'an, in other words, the issues related to the textualization and the authenticity of the Qur'an.

**Keywords:** History of Qur'an, jam al-Qur'an, Mushaf, Orientalist, John Burton.

### ***The Collection Of The Qur'an* Özelinde John Burton'un Kur'an Tarihine Bakışı**

**Öz:** Bu çalışma Kur'an Tarihi araştırmalarıyla öne çıkan İngiliz Oryantalist John Burton (1929-2014)'un *Kur'an'ın Cem'i* adlı eserinin Kur'an tarihi bağlamında değerlendirilip, özellikle Hz. Peygamber'den (s.a.v.) sonra Kur'an'ın metinleşme sürecinin şümûllu tarihini ihtiva eden görüşlerinin mahiyetini tespit amacıyla ortaya konmuştur. Burton'un diğer oryantalistlerin aksine bazı konularda farklı bir tutum içerisinde olduğu görülmüştür. Burton, *Kur'an'ın Cem'i* adlı eserinde Kur'an'ın tedvini meselesini nesih konusuyla irtibatlandırmaya çalışmıştır. Bu konuda diğer oryantalistlerin nesih olgusunu gereği gibi kavrayamadıklarından ötürü yanlış sonuçlara ulaştıklarını ifade edip onları eleştirmiştir. Ayrıca Burton, Kur'an ve Mushaf kavramları arasında keskin bir ayrıma gitmiştir. Bu çalışmada temel olarak Burton'un Kur'an tarihi (Kur'an'ın metinleşme süreci ve Kur'an'ın otantikliğine dair meseleler) hakkında öne sürdüğü görüşler izah edilip incelenmiştir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Kur'an tarihi, Kur'an'ın cem'i, Mushaf, Oryantalist, John Burton.

**Extended Summary:** Our Almighty Creator has sent down the Qur'an, which is the source of salvation and guidance, to all humanity through the Messenger of Allah (pbuh). The Prophet (pbuh) conveyed this revelation he received from Gabriel to his Companions in the best way possible. After the demise of the Messenger of Allah (pbuh), the Companions showed a attentive sensitivity in preserving the Qur'an. This preservation appeared as a double preservation. The authenticity of the Qur'an has been preserved both by memorization and by writing it down. The fact that the Qur'an was revealed on seven letters has appeared some reading differences. Especially the martyrdom of the qurrā in the battle of Yamāmā accelerated the process of the Qur'an's mushaf. As a result of this situation, with the encouragement of Umar (May Allah will please with him), Hazrat Abū Bakr (May Allah will please with him) assigned Zayd b. Dhabit and Umar at the door of the mosque. In order not to cause conflict in the Kitāb (Book), the differences in recitation that emerged with the expansion of the Islamic geography due to the increasing conquests, During the reign of Hazrat Uthman (May Allah will please with him), this mushaf was duplicated and sent to various cities by a commission under the chairmanship of Zayd b. Dhabit. Along with the mushafs sent to the amsār cities, qurrā Companions were sent to each city for the purpose of performing the Qur'an recitation in

an authentic way. All these studies provide evidence for the authenticity of the Qur' ān. The generation after the Companions continued the same delicate feeling about preserving the Qur'ān. The activities carried out in the name of activating and punctuating the Qur'ān are a manifestation of this situation. However, Western Orientalists have put forward some studies that the Qur'ān has not reached the present day in a correct and complete manner. It is possible to start the orientalist's attempts to understand the Holy Book of Islām with translation activities. However, this attempt to understand has the aim of melting and destroying the religion of Islām rather than a mere intellectual effort. Orientalistic studies in this context show the effect of almost all Islāmic sciences. It is a well-known fact that there has been progress in all disciplines in the Western world in the 19th century. First of all, after the Orientalist studies based on philology were made, the course of these studies showed its effects in many fields such as sociology, religion and anthropology. Especially in the field of the history of the Qur'ān, orientalist works have been revealed. Because the Western powers considered that the most basic values of Muslims were the Qur'ān in the geographies they targeted for their exploitation activities, and they mainly focused their studies on the subjects such as the Qur'ān's source, internal integrity, language and textual history. Orientalist Qur'ān researchers based their studies on two basic problems. These; It is the question of the authenticity of the Qur'ān and the sources that carry the Qur'ān to the present day and the authenticity of these resources. The background in their work is to try to raise doubts about the authenticity of the Qur'ān and adapt the historical adventure of their holy book to the Qur'ān. Our duty is to examine their works and evaluate them with right and wrong. In this study, we explained the British Orientalist John Burton's views on the relationship between naskh and the jam al-Qur'ān and the distinction between revelation and mushaf. In particular, we have extensively discussed how the the subject of jam al-Qur'ān connects with abrogation, the distinction between the concepts of revelation and mushaf, and the style of handling Islāmic narrations. According to Burton, the phenomenon of naskh was created by Fuqāha with the aim of eliminating some contradictions. Especially, naskh al-tilawa duna al- hūqm indicates the incompleteness of the Qur'ān, which is the type of naskh. While the concepts of Qur'ān and Mushaf correspond to revelation in the eyes of Muslims, according to Burton, although the Qur'ān is the entire revelation, the Mushaf is a book containing only a certain part of the revelation. Because the abrogated verses do not exist in the Qur'ān. John Burton has an important place among orientalists in terms of addressing this important relationship between naskh and the jam al-Qur'ān. In addition to this, the way of handling Islāmic narrations is also different. He did not refrain from using an authentic narration mentioned in our sources as evidence on a completely different issue by taking it out of its context for the purpose of forming a basis for his own thought. In this study, we tried to determine Burton's views on the history of the Qur'ān (the source of the Qur'ān, its authenticity, the collection of the Qur'ān and its textualization process, Burton's approach to the companions' mushafs and recitations). According to John Burton' opinion is that it is the mushaf that Mohammad (pbuh) compiled the mushaf which Muslims already have. Burton, like other orientalists, did not express a definite opinion on which caliph period the Qur'ān was compiled. Burton, who thinks that the narrations about the history of the Mushaf are fictional and that these narrations are in perfect harmony.

## Introduction

Orientalism means the study of the East.<sup>2</sup> Its scientific definition is “the academic studies of literature, history, creed or belief, law structure and civilization of East Muslim’ world carried out by Western researchers”.<sup>3</sup> To clarify this definition, an orientalist has knowledge about the language, tradition, history, religion and literature of the people of the east.<sup>4</sup> Edward William Said (1935–2003) defined the orientalist as the person who writes and investigates the East in all its parts within the educated-cultivated class institutions rather than lower classes.<sup>5</sup> The West has desired or demanded in person to create the East using the concept orientalism. The worlds of the East and West are in a continuous war of hegemony.<sup>6</sup> Attempts of orientalists to comprehend the Holy Book of Islām were through the translation movements<sup>7</sup>. However, this attempt was not merely an entellectual effort, on the contrary, it included the purpose of eliminating or abolishing the religion of Islām.<sup>8</sup> In this context, orientalist studies had an effect on almost all of the Islāmīc disciplines. It is obvious that all disciplines improved in the Western world in the 19th century.<sup>9</sup> First of all, philology-based<sup>10</sup> orientalist studies were carried out, after that, the progress of these works showed their effect in the various of field such as sociology, religion and antropology.<sup>11</sup> Orientalist works were especially produced in the field of the Qur’ānic history.<sup>12</sup> It is because Western powers recognized that the Qur’ān is the most basic value of Muslims in the geographies they had targeted for their exploitation activities. Thus, they focused their studies on a basis of the topics such as the origin, language, inner integrity and textualization history of the Qur’ān.<sup>13</sup> Orientalist Qur’ānic history researchers based their studies on two basic problematics: (i) the questions about the reality of the Qur’ān, and (ii) the sources which carried the Qur’ān to the present day and the issue of the authenticity of these sources.<sup>14</sup>

One of the most important works of the British Orientalist John Burton,<sup>15</sup> known for his works on the Qur’ānic history,<sup>16</sup> is *The Collection of The Qur’ān* which is also called *The Jam al-Qur’ān*. According to John Wansbrough, this extraordinary work is the result

---

<sup>2</sup> Mahmud Hamdi Zakzūk, *Oryantalizm veya Medeniyet Hesaplaşmasının Arka Plânı*, çev. Abdülaziz Hatip, (İzmir: Işık Yayınları 1993), 8; Yücel Bulut, *Oryantalizmin Kısa Tarihi* (İstanbul: Küre Yayınları, 2019), 3.

<sup>3</sup> Zakzūk, *Oryantalizm veya Medeniyet Hesaplaşmasının Arka Plânı*, 8.

<sup>4</sup> Bulut, *Oryantalizmin Kısa Tarihi*, 4.

<sup>5</sup> Edward William Said, *Şarkiyatçılık* (çev. Berna Yıldırım) (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları 2017), 12.

<sup>6</sup> Said, *Şarkiyatçılık*, 15.

<sup>7</sup> There is no definite information about the author of the translation of the Qur’ān that took place in 1143. Look. Hüseyin Yaşar, *Avrupa ve Kur’ān* (İstanbul: İz Yayıncılık, 2019) 136-137; The first known translation of the Qur’ān is in Latin. Look. Abdurrahman Çetin, “Kur’ān Kırâatlarına Yönelik Oryantalist Yaklaşımlar”, *Marife* 3(2002), 74; İsmail Cerrahoğlu, “Batıda Kur’ān Tetkikleri”, *Vakıflar Dergisi* 11, 327; Zakzūk, *Oryantalizm veya Medeniyet Hesaplaşmasının Arka Plânı*, 14.

<sup>8</sup> İsmail Cerrahoğlu, “Oryantalizm ve Batıda Kur’ān ve Kur’ān İlimleri Üzerine Araştırmalar”, *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 31/1(1990), 97; Naif Yaşar, *Oryantalistlere Göre Kur’ān’ın Kaynağı ve Metinleşmesi* (Ankara: Ankara Okulu Yayınları, 2017), 148; Cerrahoğlu, “Batıda Kur’ān Tetkikleri”, 329.

<sup>9</sup> Yaşar, *Avrupa ve Kur’ān*, 277.

<sup>10</sup> It is obligation to know a language to criticize the creed rules of Islām. Look. Bulut, *Oryantalizmin Kısa Tarihi*, 49.

<sup>11</sup> Yaşar, *Oryantalistlere Göre Kur’ān’ın Kaynağı ve Metinleşmesi*, 148.

<sup>12</sup> Çetin, “Kur’ān Kırâatlarına Yönelik Oryantalist Yaklaşımlar”, 75.

<sup>13</sup> Yaşar, *Oryantalistlere Göre Kur’ān’ın Kaynağı ve Metinleşmesi*, 148.

<sup>14</sup> İshak Kızılaslan, *Çağdaş Oryantalizm ve Kiraat İlimi-The Encyclopaedia of the Qur’ān Örneği-* (Ankara: İlahiyat Yayınları, 2021), 16.

<sup>15</sup> British Orientalist John Burton was born in 1929. There is no information about his birth place and primary education in the sources. The first knowledge we have obtained about his education life consists of doctoral studies. Burton completed his doctorate at the University of London in 1969 under the supervision of Charles Fraser Beckingham (d.1998). Burton was continued his academic career at the University of St Andrews after his doctorate. He is a Professor in Islāmīc Studies at the same university and also chaired the Department of Arabic Studies at the University of St Andrews. Also, although it stated that Burton was a priest, we could not find any data to prove this information.

<sup>16</sup> Yaşar Çolak, *Batı’da İslam Tarihinin Erken Dönemine İlişkin Farklı Metodolojik Yaklaşımlar: John Wansbrough, Michael Cook-Patricia Crone ve Lawrence I. Conrad Örneği* (Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs University, Institute of Social Sciences, An Unpublished Phd Thesis, 2007), 161

of many years of work and it is the product of negotiation and great tenacity.<sup>17</sup> The issues addressed in this book are the comprehension of the Islāmic resources.<sup>18</sup> Burton's book were discussed both in Western and Islāmic debates of the jam al-Qur'ān reaching many different results.<sup>19</sup> The purpose of compiling Burton's work is to reopen the issue of the collection of the Qur'ān as Muslims see it, and to investigate their narrations to reevaluate in the light of the studies of Goldziher (d.1921) and Schacht (d.1969).<sup>20</sup> In accordance with this purpose, Burton mentioned the contributions of Goldziher to the science of Hadith and Schacht's studies which are related to the Prophet Muhammad's (pbuh) legal tradition.<sup>21</sup> On the other hand, another aim of Burton is to further refine the findings of Goldziher and Schacht in detail by considering the role of the Fiqh method, the thought of the Islāmic source, in the wide range of the Islāmic traditions. In this manner, Burton's main purpose is to examine whether and how the Islāmic tradition of Fiqh shaped Islāmic traditions and to investigate the part that narrates the history of the collection of Qur'ānic texts.<sup>22</sup> In the first part of the work titled "Qur'ān and Islāmic Legal Sciences", Burton discusses the topic in detail under these sub-topics: "Islāmic sciences", "Abrogation", "Types of naskh", "The background of naskh and its emergence", and "The incomplete record of the Qur'ān", which is called Mushaf.<sup>23</sup> In the second part of the work, Burton examines the collection of the Qur'ānic texts' history. The first collection includes: "The compilation of Uthman (May Allah be pleased with him)", "The Qur'ān compilations: A review", "The isnād of the Qur'ān and general results"<sup>24</sup>, where Burton scrutinizes these questions: "Whenever, wherever, and by what method was the Qur'ān compiled as a book with a clear beginning and end considering the scattered verses that were revealed at different times and places?", "Did the Prophet of Islām Muhammad (pbuh) himself carry out and control this important task, or the generations after him, that is, the Caliphs do this?", and "How did naskh and juridical judgments affect the Qur'ān's collection?".<sup>25</sup>

### 1. The Views of John Burton on the Qur'ānic History

One of the significant works of English orientalist John Burton, prominent with his works on the history of the Qur'ān<sup>26</sup>, is *The Collection Of The Qur'ān*. According to John Wansbrough, this extraordinary work is the product of the labour of many years, too much negotiation and the great ambition.<sup>27</sup> The issues Burton addresses in this study are based on the comprehension of Islāmic sources.<sup>28</sup> Burton's work examines the jam al-Qur'ān along with combining both Western and Islāmic disputes, reaching many different

<sup>17</sup> John Wansbrough, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* 41/2 (1978), 370.

<sup>18</sup> John Wansbrough, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", 370.

<sup>19</sup> Richard C. Martin, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 47,/3, (1979), 460.

<sup>20</sup> John Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 5.

<sup>21</sup> John Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 5-6.

<sup>22</sup> John Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 6.

<sup>23</sup> Look. John Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, "Contents".

<sup>24</sup> Look. John Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, "Contents".

<sup>25</sup> Hamed Purrostami, "Examination of the View of John Burton Concerning the Relationship between Abrogation and Collection of the Qur'ān", *Review of European Studies* 9/11 (2017), 254.

<sup>26</sup> Yaşar Çolak, *Batı'da İslam Tarihinin Erken Dönemine İlişkin Farklı Metodolojik Yaklaşımlar: John Wansbrough, Michael Cook-Patricia Crone ve Lawrence I. Conrad Örneği* (Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs University, Institute of Social Sciences, An Unpublished Phd Thesis 2007), 161.

<sup>27</sup> John Wansbrough, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London* 41/2 (1978), 370.

<sup>28</sup> John Wansbrough, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", 370.

conclusions.<sup>29</sup> To Wansbrough's way of thinking, despite some misfortunes, we can welcome his work a valuable contribution to the Qur'anic Studies.

In this work, Burton examines Legal Islāmic Sciences, Naskh, the kinds of abrogation and the important topic of Qur'anic history such as the jam al-Qur'ān, and its first compilation, Mushafs, attributed to the Companions.<sup>30</sup> It is claimed that some of his ideas contradict with those of other orientalists. One of the most important ideas of John Burton is that the present text of the Qur'ān was compiled by Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) himself.<sup>31</sup> Burton thought that the conception of Naskh was suggested or propounded by Muslims. According to the Muslims, Qur'ān was compiled after the demise of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh).<sup>32</sup> After the Prophet's demise, Qur'ān was turned into a form of Book (Kitab), so the abrogated Qur'anic verses were not included in Mushaf. Therefore, Muslims asserted that the jam al-Qur'ān and its formation to the Book occurred after the era of the Prophet for evidence in such their opinions. According to Burton, the narrations<sup>33</sup> showing us the compilation of Qur'ān that appeared after the era of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) were distorted by some Muslim jurists. The jurists used the theory of Naskh to attribute some legal judgments, which were not included in the Qur'ān, to the Qur'ān. This approach necessitated the absence of the role of the Prophet in the jam al-Qur'ān and that the Qur'anic history was postponed after the demise of the Prophet. Burton regards the Naskh as a reason why Qur'ān compilation was not attributed to the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh).<sup>34</sup> In addition, Burton tried to show that narrations arose from the discussions of usūlī scholars, and such aforementioned discussions were about two basic sources of Islāmic Law, namely, the authority of the Qur'ān and Sunnah of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) and the issue of the abrogation of the Qur'anic verses. Therefore after the demise of the Prophet (pbuh), all the narrations relevant to jam al-Qur'ān were fabricated.<sup>35</sup>

According to C. Martin, Burton's argument is scientific and logical. Burton was against relying on the narrations of the exegetes without taking an account any critical method in the early period.<sup>36</sup> Burton distinguished the conceptions of Mushaf and Qur'ān in his work, an important study on the history of Qur'ān.<sup>37</sup> According to him, while Qur'ān

---

<sup>29</sup> Richard C. Martin, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 47/3, (1979), 460.

<sup>30</sup> For details also look. Haluk Songur, "John Burton (1929- ) -The Collection of the Qur'ān Adlı Eseri Özelinde-", 204.

<sup>31</sup> "Burton was assumed that Qur'ān was prepared in its currently situation by Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) himself." Look. Harald Motzki, "Kur'an'ın Cem'i: Son Dönem Metodolojik Gelişmeler Işığında Batılı Görüşlere İlişkin Yeni Bir Değerlendirme", trans. Selim Türkan ", *Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 5/10(2006/2), 142. Alan Jones stated that "Burton asserted that Prophet Muhammad (pbuh) compiled and disseminated the Mushaf (the written text) which revealed to us by himself. Look. Alan Jones, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by J. Burton", *The Journal of Theological Studies* 29/2(1978), 625. "Currently Qur'ān which is in our hand discovered by Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) himself." Look. Martin, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", 460. Madelung explained that the basic thesis of John Burton's book which entitled *The Collection of the Qur'ān* is "The copy of Qur'ān which named Uthmanic Mushaf gathered in together by Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) himself instead of third Caliph Uthman". Look. Wilferd Madelung, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 10/3(1979), 429.

<sup>32</sup> "The labour of compilation of the revelation postponed after the demise of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh)." Look. John Wansbrough, *Qur'anic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977), 46.

<sup>33</sup> Burton was presented the detail examination of narrations which are related to Muslims." Look. Motzki, "Kur'an'ın Cem'i: Son Dönem Metodolojik Gelişmeler Işığında Batılı Görüşlere İlişkin Yeni Bir Değerlendirme", 141.

<sup>34</sup> Purrostami, "Examination of the View of John Burton Concerning the Relationship between Abrogation and Collection of the Qur'ān", 255. Also look. Madelung, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", 430.

<sup>35</sup> Motzki, "Kur'an'ın Cem'i: Son Dönem Metodolojik Gelişmeler Işığında Batılı Görüşlere İlişkin Yeni Bir Değerlendirme", 141.

<sup>36</sup> Martin, "The Collection of the Qur'ān by John Burton", 460.

<sup>37</sup> Cerrahoğlu, "Oryantalizm ve Batıda Kur'ân ve Kur'ân İlimleri Üzerine Araştırmalar", 122.

includes the phenomenon of revelation or act which consists some Sunnah portion, Mushaf is the part of the revelation; in other words, revelation is not God's speech.<sup>38</sup> Undoubtedly, Burton follows this method for the purpose of criticizing the defectiveness of the Qur'ān, and defines the Mushaf as an incomplete record of the Qur'ān.<sup>39</sup> Additionally, he discusses the topic of naskh within the issue of jam al-Qur'ān in detail. His style to examine the issue is unusual in some aspects. Sometimes Burton does not avoid giving evidence to the narration which is not related the issue as a context of historical ground. He also does not refrain from giving the explanations that damage the authenticity of the Qur'ān. According to Burton, who focuses on the relation of jam to naskh, naskh is clearly affirms the deficiency of Qur'ān because the Qur'ān is the whole of revelation. The verses whose provisions were abolished when the Qur'ān was prepared in the form Mushaf were not included in it.

## 2. The Approach of John Burton to Jam al-Qur'ān and Its Textualization

Contrary to other orientalist, Burton's outstanding idea about jam al-Qur'ān is that the current Qur'ān was edited by Prophet Muhammad (pbuh).<sup>40</sup> Schoeler stated that the theory of John Burton revealed that The Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) was responsible for the last compilation of the Qur'ān and every single Islāmic narrations were fabricated.<sup>41</sup> Burton explains the hadiths related to jam al-Qur'ān: "Western Qur'ān historians examined the narrations related to jam al-Qur'ān. Ultimately, they regarded or considered that only one hadith is sound (sahih)." This statement is not true from one aspect. In fact, Islāmic narrations are not in disagreement, on the contrary, hadiths are in harmony with each other."<sup>42</sup> Burton assigned the second chapter of his work (*The Collection of the Qur'ān*) to the history of the Qur'ānic texts' collection. In this chapter, he classifies jam al-Qur'ān after demise of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) as (i) the first collection of the Qur'ān, and (ii) the compilation of Hazrat Uthman. Regarding the Qur'ānic compilations, Burton asserts that Qur'ānic texts were collected in the era of Hazrat Abu Bakr and Hazrat Umar (May Allah will please with them); however, they did not attempt to copy the texts. Accordingly, Companions' Mushafs emerged.<sup>43</sup> The aim of the first compilation of Hazrat Abu Bakr and Umar (May Allah will please with them) was to collect the personal revelation pieces in one place. Hazrat Uthman (May Allah will please with him) wanted to gather Muslims around one Qur'ānic text.<sup>44</sup> Orientalists did not state any accurate opinions about when the caliph completed Qur'ān's compilation. Similarly Burton also has no accurate opinions about the time when the caliph's collection of the Qur'ān emerged.<sup>45</sup> Burton asserts that the narrations regarding the Qur'ānic compilations are contradictory following the demise of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh).<sup>46</sup>

---

<sup>38</sup> Haluk Songur, "John Burton (1929- ) -The Collection of the Qur'ān Adlı Eseri Üzerinde-", *İslām Hukuku Araştırmaları Dergisi* 4 (2004), 208. According to Burton's view; while the Qur'ān is corresponding to all divine revelation, on the other hand The Book (Kitab) is attributing to the form or style of a thought. Mushaf was also named inherited Book or written suhufs (pages). Look. Kızılaslan, *Çağdaş Oryantalizm ve Kıraat İlmi-The Encyclopaedia of the Qur'ān Örneği*-, 147.

<sup>39</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, s.105.

<sup>40</sup> Motzki, "Kur'ān'ın Cem'i: Son Dönem Metodolojik Gelişmeler Işığında Batılı Görüşlere İlişkin Yeni Bir Değerlendirme", 142; Purrostami, "Examination of the View", 254.

<sup>41</sup> Gregor Schoeler, "The Codification of the Qur'ān: A Comment on the Hypotheses of Burton and Wansbrough", *The Qur'ān in Context* ed. Angelika Neuwirth-Nicolai Sinai-Michael Marx, Brill: 2009, 779.

<sup>42</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 160.

<sup>43</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 212.

<sup>44</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 212.

<sup>45</sup> Kızılaslan, *Çağdaş Oryantalizm ve Kıraat İlmi-The Encyclopaedia of the Qur'ān Örneği*-, 131.

<sup>46</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ān*, 229.

### 3. Burton's Approach to Naskh (Abrogation)

According to Burton, the jurists invented the types of naskh which were called "naskh al hûqm wa al-tilawa", as well as "naskh al-tilawa duna al- hûqm" for the reason of the incompleteness of the Qur'anic evidence due to aiming of the attributing of the legal (hûqmî) judges to the Qur'ân. If jurists had accepted that Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) compiled the Qur'anic verses in the same Book (Kitab) and edited Qur'anic Mushafs, they would have stayed away from stating that some pieces of Qur'anic revelations were omitted from the current Qur'ân. Thus, jurists' solution was to deliberately ignore the arising the role of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) from the history of jam al-Qur'ân and to postpone the compilation of Qur'ân after the demise of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh); accordingly, they made up or distorted the revelations.<sup>47</sup> Burton makes an effort to assure the incompleteness of Qur'ân by citing some narrations related to naskh via naskh theory.<sup>48</sup> Burton states that the narrations which he has cited are sahih (sound), being an example to the issues of naskh al hûqm wa al-tilawa and naskh al-tilawa duna al- hûqm, and all of these examples are the evidence of the omissions of the Qur'ân (revelation) from Mushaf.<sup>49</sup> Burton's approach attributing naskh to the incompleteness of Qur'ân is far away from an objective attitude. The fiqhî (legal) rulings can change along with the changes of the people's need because of the circumstances of the era except creed rulings. This is natural. Cerrahoğlu states some opinions to explain this: "Ultimately, the purpose of naskh is juridical (hûqmî). There is no aspect that concerns principles (basics) of Islâmic creed. However, hûqmî (legal) doctrines differ in accordance with eras and situations. With the removal of a necessary situation, the legal principle also changes."<sup>50</sup> Namely, it is a matter of time and ground.<sup>51</sup>

Based on all these explanations, Burton's attempt to make an easy to understand issue so ambiguous and to create question marks in minds is no more than a vain or futile effort. If either caliph Hazrat Abû Bakr who had achieved the Qur'ân' compilation and Zayd b. Thabit (May Allah will please with him) who has deep knowledge about Qur'anic sciences had recognised a defect in the Qur'ân which Burton asserted, wouldn't they have gone straight to fix it? Or did the caliph Hazrat Uthman also not realize the deficiency in the Qur'ân when he copied it and sent Mushafs to the Amsar (precedent) cities?

According to Burton, the contradictions in the theory of naskh are not intertextual but rather those among the absolute texts of the Qur'ân and the scriptures which were established by the juridical (legal) doctrines. Burton's main idea about the improvement of the naskh theory lies on the development of the Islâmic Jurisprudence. Because of this situation, the relationship between both thoughts led to naming the title of Burton's work.<sup>52</sup> Burton's main idea, follows general theorem of Schacht and other orientalisists. Burton was advocated that Islâmic Jurisprudence was developed as an independent local Islâmic sects in the first stage.<sup>53</sup>

Burton discusses his ideas related to the naskh under the title of "The sub-science of naskh." According to him, the term of "naskh" or "al-nasikh wa al mansûkh" did not

<sup>47</sup> Purrostami, "Examination of the View", s.258.

<sup>48</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, s.130.

<sup>49</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 131.

<sup>50</sup> İsmail Cerrahoğlu, *Tefsir Usûlü* (Ankara: TDV Yayınları,1997), 124.

<sup>51</sup> M. Sait Şimşek, *Kur'ân'ın Anlaşılmasında İki Mesele* (İstanbul: Hikmetevi Yayınları, 2021), 100.

<sup>52</sup> *The Sources of Islâmic Law: Islâmic Theories of Abrogation* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990).

<sup>53</sup> Yasin Dutton, "The Sources of Islâmic Law: Islâmic Theories of Abrogation by John Burton", *Journal of Islâmic Studies* 4/2, (1993), 237.



imply one but three characteristic principles contrary of *usûlis*.<sup>54</sup> Burton explains the three types of naskh as a sub-titles. Burton addresses the first type of naskh, naskh al hûqm wa al tilâwa, to provide evidence for the idea that some pieces of Qur'ân were omitted. According to him, the first type of the naskh was the suppression of both the hûqm and tilâwa. This type of the naskh is related to only Qur'anic studies. Thus, it is impossible to think of any hadiths whose both hûqm and tilâwa have been abrogated.<sup>55</sup> Furthermore, apparently, some pieces of the revelation were omitted from Mushaf in the beginning.<sup>56</sup> Based on all these, with the collection of Burton's abrogation of the Qur'ân, criticizing the incompleteness of the Qur'ân, the main motive in the connection of the Qur'ân to undermine its legitimacy. Burton ends the chapter of naskh in *The Collection of the Qur'ân* with the following sentences: "It seems that we have the words of the Qur'ân at present, the Mushaf is not complete, it is incomplete and the naskh has been fulfilled."<sup>57</sup> While Burton explains these sub-branches of naskh, he does not discuss abrogation; on the contrary, with provisions he states that he would deal with the related discussions in the context of the Qur'ân and its history.<sup>58</sup> Burton also states that Muslims abstain from using the word "omission", because this word probably suggests either negligence or carelessness. He also expresses that they especially stay away from using this word.<sup>59</sup>

Burton subsequently strengthens his claim about the incompleteness of the Qur'ân by giving examples from the Qur'ân about the Prophet's (pbuh) forgetting verses.<sup>60</sup> The examples are as follows:

17.86: If we wish, we will take away what we have revealed to you.<sup>61</sup>

87.6-7: We will teach you to read the Qur'ân and you will not forget –Allah's request exceptional that.<sup>62</sup>

2.106: None of our revelations do we abrogate or cause to be forgotten, but we substitute something better or similar.<sup>63</sup>

According to Burton, "The study of Tafsîr (Exegesis) clearly shows that the interpretation of these verses individually concentrated to the notion of the punctual relationship between the verses about forgetting and the duty of the Prophet (pbuh)."<sup>64</sup> He further argues that the verses of the entire Qur'ân at once descended to the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) as part of his revelation. However, these verses were removed from the Mushaf, that is, from the collected texts of the Qur'ân. This is by no means merely Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) did not occur with his forgetting. Allah's will and in Qur'ân 87 (Surah Al-Al'â) and in Surah Al-Baqarah the root of "n s y" refers to this condition as the cause. Allah (swt) caused Hazrat Mohammad (pbuh) to forget as the unseen holy pursuant to its purpose regarding the final content of the Book.<sup>65</sup> If we evaluate Burton's statements, as he claims, the "forgetting" in the verse 106 of Surah al-Baqara did not appear as Allah's making the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) forget and in parallel within the form of Prophet Mohammad's (pbuh) forgetting. Several comments have been made

<sup>54</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 46.

<sup>55</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 46.

<sup>56</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 46-47.

<sup>57</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 67.

<sup>58</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 47.

<sup>59</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 47.

<sup>60</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 47-48.

<sup>61</sup> Surah Al-Isrâ 17/86.

<sup>62</sup> Surah Al- A'lâ 87/6-7.

<sup>63</sup> Surah Al-Baqarah 2/106.

<sup>64</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 47-48.

<sup>65</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, 48.

about what is meant by the verb “nunsi (hâ)” that we translate “in case we make it forget”. Based on the information provided by al-Shawkani, according to those who read the verb in question is as “nense (hâ), this verb in the verse is used meaning “if we postpone” (the abrogation). According to the pronunciation, we prefer “nunsi (hâ)”, which means that “if we leave the verse as it is” (without changing or without abrogation), or “if that verse is described as if we allow it to be removed. Al-Shawkani says that the last comment is the interpretation on which the majority of the people of lexicon and eye-view agree (for other interpretations see Shawkani, I, 138-139). With the expression of “forgetting” here, in the books of the past religions it may also be meant to make the divine messages in the past be forgotten, that is, not to be transferred to the next books and narrations.”<sup>66</sup> If the Holy Book containing the previous shari’a has been distorted, that shari’a must be abrogated altogether. In this case, the old shari’a is replaced with a new one.<sup>67</sup> In a way, this “forgetting” of Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) is not about making the revealed revelation forget, but on the contrary, the forgetting of information and narrations about the old Holy Books. As a matter of fact, the holy books before the Qur’ân were falsified, whereas there is no falsification for the Qur’ân. If we look at the subject of Allah’s will in the verses 6-7 of Surah Al- A’lâ. “According to us, you only by the will of your Lord, you may wish” (as in the verse 30 of Surah Al-Insan) here, too, a reference is made to a divine law, a principle. Allah is the one who shapes and equips the servant in accordance with the purpose of creation. Man would not be like this if Allah had not done so; men could not think, speak, remember, nor forget. According to the verse 6, the Messenger of Allah would never forget what was taught (the Qur’ân); but this is so because Allah wills it; if he wanted him to forget, of course he would have forgotten.” As seen, these verses in Surah Al- A’lâ and verse 106 of Surah Al-Baqarah, as Burton claims, do not prove that Allah (swt) caused the Prophet (pbuh) to forget in a real sense.

When we have a look at the hadith narration of the Prophet (pbuh) about forgetting asserted by Burton, it is clear that this hadith does not constitute evidence for the Prophet’s (pbuh) forgetting the verses. When the Prophet (pbuh) received a revelation from Jibril, he was afraid that he would forget it and then Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) would hurry. Allah (swt) said that the Prophet (pbuh) should not hurry because of this and also stated that it was not possible for the Prophet (pbuh) to forget the revelation. In addition, until the Prophet (pbuh) memorized the revelation, Jibril was obliged to repeat the revelation to him.<sup>68</sup> Burton cited a narration based on his own opinion that had nothing to do with the context. However, the mentioned hadith is related to Prophet’s (pbuh) revelation, it is not about forgetting. On the contrary, Allah declares that the Prophet’s (pbuh) forgetting the revelation is not possible.<sup>69</sup>

The second type of naskh, whose text remains and its hûqm abrogated, is an early form of naskh is the replacement of a provision with a later provision.<sup>70</sup> According to Burton, the concept of abrogation is literally only corresponds this naskh.<sup>71</sup>

#### 4. Burton’s Approach to the Mushaf

<sup>66</sup> *Kur’ân Yolu Türkçe Meâl ve Tefsir*, Komisyon (Ankara: Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı Yayınları, 2007 ), 1/179-180.

<sup>67</sup> M. Sait Şimşek, *Kur’ân’ın Anlaşılmasında İki Mesele*, 130.

<sup>68</sup> Buhârî, Ebû Abdillâh Muhammed b. İsmâîl b. İbrâhîm el-Cu’fî, *Fedâilu’l- Kur’ân*, 62.

<sup>69</sup> “We will make you read it and you will not forget it unless Allah wills it so.” Look. *Kur’ân Yolu Tefsiri*, Komisyon, 5/603-604.

<sup>70</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 49.

<sup>71</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 49.

Burton explains his ideas about the Mushaf around two basic arguments: (i) the incompleteness of the Qur'an; and (ii) the uncertainty of who first collected the Qur'an.<sup>72</sup> Burton states it is possible that the Qur'an was collected firstly by the caliph Abû Bakr or caliph Omar or Salim or even caliph Ali (May Allah will please with them). When we inquire the source of Burton's assertion, we can easily see that the situation is totally different. In his work *Kitâb al-Masâhîf*, Ibn Abû Dâwûd (d.316/929) states that one of the narrators named Ashas was "layyinul' hadith"<sup>73</sup> and that the purpose of jam al-Qur'an is to complete the memorization of the Qur'an. In addition, he notes that it is possible to use the phrase "he/she collected the Qur'an."<sup>74</sup> Jam al-Qur'an meant memorizing the Qur'an in that era. Al-Qastallani explains the state of "jamaal Qur'an" as a memorization of Qur'an (istazharahû hifzân) in the *Manaqib al-Zayd b. Thabit*.<sup>75</sup>

This report shows that Burton endeavours to stay away the narration which is not related to the topic from its context for the attribution to his idea. In addition to this, Burton cites the narration related to this issue in *Kitaab al-Masaahif*:

أَتَمُّ جَمَعُوا الْقُرْآنَ مِنْ مُصْحَفِ أَبِي، فَكَانَ رِجَالٌ يَكْتُبُونَ بِمَلِي عَلَيْهِمْ أَبِي بْنُ كَعْبٍ، فَلَمَّا انْتَهَوْا إِلَى الْآيَةِ الَّتِي فِي سُورَةِ بَرَاءَةَ: {ثُمَّ انصَرَفُوا صَرَفَ اللَّهُ قُلُوبَهُمْ بِأَهَمِّ قَوْمٍ لَا يَفْقَهُونَ} [التوبة: 127] أَتَشَاءُ أَنْ هَذِهِ الْآيَةُ آخِرُ مَا أَنْزَلَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى مِنَ الْقُرْآنِ، فَقَالَ أَبِي بْنُ كَعْبٍ: "إِنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَدْ أَقْرَأَنِي بَعْدَ هَذَا آيَتَيْنِ: {لَقَدْ جَاءَكُمْ رَسُولٌ مِنْ أَنْفُسِكُمْ عَزِيزٌ عَلَيْهِ مَا عَنِتُّمْ حَرِيصٌ عَلَيْكُمْ بِالْمُؤْمِنِينَ رَءُوفٌ رَحِيمٌ} إِلَى آخِرِ السُّورَةِ قَالَ: فَهَذَا آخِرُ مَا نَزَلَ مِنَ الْقُرْآنِ قَالَ: فَحُتِّمَ الْأَمْرُ بِمَا فَتَحَ اللَّهُ بِهِ: يَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ يَقُولُ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى: {وَمَا أَرْسَلْنَا مِنْ قَبْلِكَ مِنْ رَسُولٍ إِلَّا نُوحِي إِلَيْهِ أَنَّهُ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا أَنَا فَاعْبُدُونِ} [الأنبياء: 25]"<sup>76</sup>

Burton comments this narration in this way: "We can say that the name of Ubay was not replaced to the name of Zayd, thus Ubay's statement about the verses was the evident of the incompleteness of the Qur'an (the first argument) in this context. The verse which Ubay contributed implies the incompleteness of the Qur'an and Ubay was the only witness of this ayah (verse). Whereas Hazrat Umar and Hazrat Uthman (May Allah will please with them) demanded two witnesses."<sup>77</sup>

Immediately afterwards, it is obviously seen that Burton behaved according to two tendencies while trying to detect the confusion that he thinks exists in the hadiths although there is not.

The first: "Mushaf is incomplete. The work of jam al-Qur'an was not started until the after demise of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh)."<sup>78</sup> Burton continues his insistence, and asserts that the Holy Qur'an was not collected in the era of the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) and that this situation is attributed to the fact that the Qur'an is incomplete. Due to the ongoing revelation process, the Qur'an was not in the form of the Kitab (Book) in the era of the Prophet (pbuh). However, the divine revelation was registered through methods of hifz (memorization), kitâbât (writing) and arzâ (submission) by the Prophet (pbuh) himself.<sup>79</sup> Moreover, the Holy Qur'an was recorded before the the Islâmic State in

<sup>72</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, s.121.

<sup>73</sup> "The jarh (criticism) term which used for the weaknees of the narrator." Look.

<sup>74</sup> Sicistânî, Ebû Bekr Abdullah b. Ebî Dâvûd Süleymân b. Eş'as, *Kitâbü'l-Mesâhîf*, thk. Muhammed b. Abduh, (Kahire: El-Fârûku'l Hadîse, 1403/2002), 59.

<sup>75</sup> Mehmet Emin Maşalı, *Kur'an'ın Metin Yapısı-Mushaf Tarihi Ve İmlâsı-* (Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2015), 49; Look also. Kızılaslan, İshak, *Çağdaş Oryantalizm ve Kıraat İlmî-The Encyclopaedia of the Qur'an Örneği-*, 124.

<sup>76</sup> İbn Ebû Dâvûd, *Kitâbü'l-Mesâhîf*, 112.

<sup>77</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 125.

<sup>78</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 126.

<sup>79</sup> Muhsin Demirci, *Kur'an Tarihi* (İstanbul: MÜ İlahiyat Fakültesi Vakfı Yayınları, 2017), 146.

al-Madinah al-Munawarah was established.<sup>80</sup> Historical documents show us that the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) had one of the literate Companions write the revealed verses almost immediately after the divine revelation came.<sup>81</sup>

The second: "The Qur'anic texts represent the universal Qur'anic tradition in the hand of the Muslims."<sup>82</sup>

### 5. Burton's Approach to the qirāats

Differences in qirāat are a reality. It is supposed that the hadith of "The Holy Qur'an was revealed in al-ahrûf sab'a is the source of the qirāat differences. However, there is no consensus on these letters. In this context, according to Burton, qirāats were affected from these factors: dialect differences, annexes (involving to the Mushafs), coice of vowel, synonyms.<sup>83</sup>

Burton concludes his comments about qirāats: "The Prophet Mohammad (pbuh) was not aware of these various recitations himself and thus He did not insist on general recitation."<sup>84</sup> Although Burton states it this way, the Prophet Mohammad's (pbuh) main reason for permitting other various qirāats was the differences in dialects in that era because the Holy Qur'an was revealed in Quraysh dialect. However, there were too many clans that were maintaining or sustaining their lives in Arabian Peninsula besides Quraysh. "These warrior powers formed by different clans and regions spoke various dialects and the Prophet (pbuh) taught them to recite the Qur'an in their own dialects, otherwise, it would be a challenge to make them leave their native tongue."<sup>85</sup> After citing the well-known narration<sup>86</sup> (relevant to al-ahrûf sab'â) which had emerged between Hazrat Umar and Hazrat Hisham b. Hâkîm (May Allah will please with them), Burton comments this hadith: "This hadith led to a broad and comprehensive comments in the literature in the issue of seven letters. For that reason, Muslims have endeavoured to verify that various Qur'anic recitations are accurate and valid."<sup>87</sup> Al-ahrûf sab'â (Seven Letters) allows liberty and easiness for the Qur'anic recitation. Accordingly, the Companions followed qirāats which they had learned from the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh). This situation is quite natural and all of the Qur'anic recitations are valid and true. "This narrarion refers to two aspects: The first one is that Hisham b. Hakîm recited the surah Furqan differently from how Umar had learned. It means that the inconsistency between them is not due to the meaning or the hûqm (ruling) of the Qur'an but the recitation of the Qur'an. The second point is that both Companions had learned qirāats from the Prophet (pbuh) and Prophet (pbuh) had verified both Qur'anic recitations. That's why, qirāats were not ijihadî, on the contrary, they were learned from the Prophet Mohammad (pbuh)."<sup>88</sup>

Burton mentions the (narration reported from Ibn A'rabi from Ibn Shiab from Urwa, may Allah will please with them) which is about verse 158 of surah Baqara. According to this report, Urwa (May Allah will please with him) asked Hazrat Aisha (May

---

<sup>80</sup> Muhammed Hamidullah, *Kur'ân-ı Kerim Tarihi* (İstanbul: Beyan Yayınları, 2018), 41.

<sup>81</sup> Hamidullah, *Kur'ân-ı Kerim Tarihi*, 42.

<sup>82</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 127.

<sup>83</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 37.

<sup>84</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 150.

<sup>85</sup> Muhammed Mustafa El-A'zami, *Vahyedilişinden Derlenişine Kur'ân Tarihi* çev. Ömer Türker-Fatih Serenli (İstanbul: İz Yayıncılık, 2018), 129.

<sup>86</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 151.

<sup>87</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur'an*, 152.

<sup>88</sup> Abdurrahman Çetin, *Kur'ân'ı Kerim'in İndirildiği Yedi Harf Ve Kıraatler* (İstanbul: Ensar Neşriyat, 2013), 47.

Allah will please with her) : “What is your opinion about the verse 158 of surah Baqara (There is no blame upon him performing tawaf between as-Safa and al-Marwah)”. Hazrat Aisha answered: “This ayah may also be recited like that: “There is no blame upon him who did not perform tawaf”; however, Ansâr hesitated to perform this tawaf.<sup>89</sup> The reason why the Sahâbâ (Companions) hesitated was: Muslims eschewed from sa’y (running between Safa and Marwa) because there were some idols in the Safa hill before the emergence of Islâm, then, the Qur’ânic verse had been revealed about the permissibility of the sa’y between Safa and Marwa.<sup>90</sup> According to Ibn A’rabi’, Urwa took this ayah to show that tawaf was not obligatory. In fact, in the qirâah of Hazrat Aisha there is an evidence that the tawaf is permissible or allowable.<sup>91</sup> Burton comments this narration in a different way. According to him, tawaf is an obligation in the Islâmic Jurisprudence and because this hadith refers to the permission of tawaf, there is an accurate contradiction or dilemma between Fiqh (Islâmic Jurisprudence) and Sunnah or Qur’ân and Sunnah.<sup>92</sup> Whereas, the verse 158 of Surah Baqarah does not allude to performing tawaf of Kaaba. On the contrary, the tawaf phrase of the ayah corresponds to running between Safa and Marwa, and this deed or practice is stated a word of “sa’y” as the topics related to those of hajj (pilgrimage) and umra.<sup>93</sup> As seen clearly, Burton takes apart the hadith relevant to the ayah from its context and carries it to an unusual course. However, Qur’ân and Sunnah, which are bound to each other by tight and unbreakable ties, are two basic precious sources of Islâm.<sup>94</sup> Talking about any contradiction between these two sources is impossible, it is not even a question.

Burton touches on the narration of Farra’ within the context of this issue.<sup>95</sup> Ferrâ reported: “Some Muslims recited verse 158 of Surah Baqarah like that: “There is no sin for anyone who does not perform tawaf”. Ferrâ commented this qirâah in two ways: The first one is: The negative is linguistically invalid. The Verse 12 of Surah al-A’raf “What is retaining you from prostrating?” is in the meaning of “prostrate”. The second one is: Different from this, Tawaf is completely on-demand; however, the first explanation is the rule.”<sup>96</sup> In accordance with our aim to evaluate this narration soundly, first, it is beneficial to look at how Farra’ interpreted the verse in his book *Ma’ânil Qur’ân*. Farra’ interpreted the ayah: “Due to existence of two idols in the hill of Safa and Marwa, Muslims did not appreciate the tawaf. They regarded this bad because it glorified two idols. As a result of this misconception, Allah (swt) clarified this situation with ayah: “Indeed, the hills of Safa and Marwa are among the signs of Allah, that’s why whoever performs the pilgrimage or umra there is no blame or sin.”<sup>97</sup> Some people recited this verse in the form of ألا يطوف أن and لا أن abolish the meaning when they come together as Allah (swt) commands: “What is refraining you from prostrating?”, namely, what is that restrains you from sajdah? The other angle is giving liberty or permit for abandonment of the tawaf between the hills of Safa and Marwa. It is practiced in

<sup>89</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 12.

<sup>90</sup> *Kur’ân Yolu Türkçe Meâl ve Tefsir*, Komisyon, 1/243.

<sup>91</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 12-13.

<sup>92</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 13.

<sup>93</sup> Komisyon, *Kur’ân Yolu Türkçe Meâl ve Tefsir*, 1/243.

<sup>94</sup> Raşit Küçük, “Kur’ân-Sünnet İlişkisi ve Birlikteliği”, *Tartışmalı İlmî Toplantılar Dizisi, “Sünnetin Dindeki Yeri”* (İstanbul: Ensar Neşriyat 31), s.126.

<sup>95</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 31.

<sup>96</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 31.

<sup>97</sup> *Kur’ân Yolu Tefsiri*, Komisyon, 1/243.

accordance with the first angle.”<sup>98</sup> In fact, what Farra’s states in his tafsîr is the tawaf between the hills Safa and Marwa, which is the sa’y. It is not related the tawaf performed around the Kaa’ba as Burton asserts. Burton propounds the opinions of Tabârî, Shaff’î,<sup>99</sup> Malik, Sawrî, Hanafîs<sup>100</sup> and Ata<sup>101</sup> for the purpose of certifying or supporting his idea: “There is no doubt that some practices contradict with the Qur’ân. The supporters of the accurate juridical idea applied to the Sunna, on the other hand, the opponents of them consulted the Qur’ân. This caused the followers of a’mâal (actions) to apply to the Qur’ân. As the dispute focused on the words of the Qur’ân, the two sides accepted the common qirâat as a disagreement in tafsîr. At this point, it is not obvious that the action represents the basic meaning of the verse.”<sup>102</sup>

According to Burton, the verse 6 of Surah Al-Ma’idah<sup>103</sup> allows to recite two types of qirâat in consequence of punctuation difference depending on the time.<sup>104</sup> The qirâah of ارجلکم (Arjulakum) commands to clean down the feet whereas the qirâat of ارجلیکم (Arjulikum) permits to anoint the feet. After showing the Ubay qirâat as an example for the ahâd qirâats, Burton says: “The scholars were in agreement with the use of Qur’anic recitations. They agreed on the opinion of “Ahâd qirâat is quite unlawful and this recitation invalidates the prayer.” This stance of scholars creates a gap between the Qur’ân and the Sunnah and it shows that these two sources are actually similar in nature or function, which reveals the awareness that it is not.”<sup>105</sup> According to Burton, ahâd recitations are also like ahâd hadiths reported from the Companions.<sup>106</sup>

### Conclusion

The British orientalist John Burton researched Qur’anic history by taking Islâmic narrations as reference. While he examines Islâmic narrations for the purpose of proving his argument which is “the Qur’ân is incomplete”, he takes the narrations out of context. Burton adapts the historical process of his holy book to the Qur’ân and makes a connection between the collection of the Qur’ân and the naskh. His most striking allegation about his claim is that Muslims formulated the concept of naskh in order to remove the discrepancies or contradictions between the narrations. He alleges that the surviving types of naskh indicate that some parts were removed from the Qur’ân with regard to the types of abrogation, which are “naskh al hûqm wa al-tilawa” and “naskh al-hûqm dûna al-tilawa” especially regarding the text of the Qur’ân. Therefore, the Mushaf did not correspond to all revelations that came to the Prophet (pbuh), Fuqaha (jurists) neglected the active participation of the Prophet’s in the arrangement of Qur’ân and the

<sup>98</sup> Ferrâ, Ebû Zekeriyya Yahya b. Ziyad b. Abdullah b. Manzur ad-Deylemi, *Meâni’l Kur’ân*, thk. Ahmed Yusuf Necati, Muhammed Ali Neccar, Abdu’l-Fettâh İsmail Şalebi, (Mısır: Daru’l Mısriyye li-te’lif ve-tercüme, trs.), 1/ 95.

<sup>99</sup> “According to Shaff’î, tawaf is essential and essential for the obligation of hajj (pilgrimage) and those who do not fulfill this tawaf must return to Mecca and perform tawaf.” Look. Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 31.

<sup>100</sup> “Malik, Thawri and Hanafîs, on the other hand, did not insist on returning to Mecca and performing tawaf, but they imposed a special expiation sacrifice for the person who did not perform this tawaf.” Look. John Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 31.

<sup>101</sup> “Ata, on the other hand, considered tawaf completely optional. Tabârî explained this view as follows: “This view has been obtained from the different readings of the 158th verse of Surah al-Baqarah, which is clearly narrated from the mushaf of Abdullah Ibn Mas’ud.”” Look. Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 31.

<sup>102</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 31-32.

<sup>103</sup> “O you who believe! When you start to pray, wash your faces and your hands up to the elbows; Wipe your heads and (wash) your feet up to the ankles” Look. *Kur’ân Yolu Türkçe Meâl ve Tefsir*, Komisyon, 2/223-227.

<sup>104</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 37.

<sup>105</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 39.

<sup>106</sup> Burton, *The Collection of the Qur’ân*, 39.

issues of the istinsakh (jam al-Qur'ān), especially because of the second type of abrogation.

According to Burton, the Qur'ān is not only a document for the Muslims but also it has an important place in the context of the origin of the Islāmic Jurisprudence as being the basic resource. The most important opinion of Burton about the origin of the Qur'ān is that the current Qur'ān text was arranged by the Prophet (pbuh) himself. The purpose of Burton's idea is to involve the Prophet (pbuh) in the work of the jam al-Qur'ān because according to Burton, the current Qur'ān scripture is the Mushaf of the Prophet (pbuh). Accordingly, some orientalists deliberately prefer to use the phrase of "Mohammedanism" instead of "Islām" to indicate that this word introduces Islām as the religion established by the Prophet (pbuh) himself. Regarding the textualization of the Qur'ān, Burton proposes that the conceptions of the Qur'ān and Mushaf are different from each other in terms of their nature. According to him, the Qur'ān should be classified as a document and a source. This baseless or groundless claim is indeed for the purpose of attributing his assertion which is "The Qur'ān is incomplete".

Although Burton's opinions about the jam al-Qur'ān and the istinsakh of the Holy Qur'ān in the era of the third caliph Hazrat Uthman (May Allah will please with Him) parallel with the Islāmic conception, he does not have a precise opinion about in which era of the caliphate the Qur'ān was compiled. Burton asserts that the Companions' Mushaf contradict with that of Uthman, that the Prophet (pbuh) was aware of the various qirāats, and that He did not have arigid attitude on reciting in one qirāat. John Burton differs from other researchers of the Qur'ānic history because of his ideas about some issues. He does not agree with the other orientalists who reject all the hadiths except one. According to Burton, the Muslims ideated the narrations in total harmony as fictive for the aim of eliminating the Prophet's role in the jam al-Qur'ān. He also criticizes other orientalists who expressed wrong opinions as they comprehended the issue of naskh insufficiently. Especially, Nöldeke-Schwally did not comprehend the importance of the third type of naskh which only the text (mātn) abrogated.

<b>İntihal Taraması</b> <b>Plagiarism Detection</b>	Bu makale intihal taramasından geçirildi/ <i>This paper was checked for plagiarism</i>
<b>Etik Beyan</b> <b>Ethical Statement</b>	Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.   <i>It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited.</i>
<b>Etik Komite Onayı</b> <b>Ethical Approval</b>	Fırat Üniversitesi Etik Kurulu Başkanlığının ... tarihli ... sayılı kararıyla gerekli etik izinler alınmıştır. Ayrıca, çalışmada Helsinki Bildirgesi'ndeki araştırma ilkelere bağlı kalınmıştır.   <i>An application for ethical approval was made to Fırat University Ethics Committee and the necessary ethical permissions were obtained with the decision numbered .... dated ...2022. In addition, the study adhered to the research principles of the Declaration of Helsinki.</i>
<b>Yazar Katkıları</b> <b>Author Contributions</b>	<b>Çalışmanın Tasarlanması   Design of Study:</b> ŞM (%50), NS (%50) <b>Veri Toplanması   Data Acquisition:</b> ŞM (%50), NS (%50) <b>Veri Analizi   Data Analysis:</b> ŞM (%50), NS (%50) <b>Makalenin Yazımı   Writing up:</b> ŞM (%50), NS (%50) <b>Makale Gönderimi ve Revizyonu   Submission and Revision:</b> ŞM (%50), NS (%50)
<b>Finansman</b> <b>Grant Support</b>	Yazarlar bu çalışma için finansal destek almadığını beyan etmiştir.   <i>The authors declared that this study has received no financial support.</i>
<b>Çıkar Çatışması</b>	Yazarlar çıkar çatışması bildirmemiştir.   <i>The authors have no conflict of interest to declare</i>

<b>Conflict of Interest</b>	
<b>Açık Erişim Lisansı Open Access License</b>	Bu makale, Creative Commons Atıf-GayriTicari 4.0 Uluslararası Lisansı (CC BY NC) ile lisanslanmıştır.   <i>This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution- NonCommercial 4.0 International License</i>
<b>Telif Hakkı Copyright</b>	Yazar(lar)   Author (s): Şeyma Mete – Nesrişah Saylan

## References

- Alshahri, Mohammed S. H. *A Critical Study of Western Views on Hadith with Special Reference to the Views of James Robson and John Burton*. England: University of Birmingham, PhD, 2011.
- Âşıkkutlu, Emin. "Leyyin". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi*. 27/168-169. Ankara: TDV Yayınları, 2003.
- Bulut, Yücel. *Oryantalizmin Kısa Tarihi*. İstanbul: KüreYayınları, 2019.
- Burton, John. "Abrogation", *Encyclopedia of the Qur'ân*, 1. Brill. 2001.
- Burton, John. *Al Nasikh Wa al Mansukh*. London: SOAS, University of London, PhD, 1969.
- Burton, John. *An Introduction to The Hadith*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1994.
- Burton, John. "Notes towards a Fresh Perspective on the Islâmic Sunna". *British Society for Middle Eastern Studies* 11/1(1984), 3-17.
- Burton, John. *The Collection of the Qur'ân*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977.
- Burton, John. *The Sources of Islâmic Law: Islâmic Theories of Abrogation*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990.
- Cerrahoğlu, İsmail. "Batıda Kur'ân Tetkikleri". *Vakıflar Dergisi*. 11(1978), 323-342.
- Cerrahoğlu, İsmail. "Oryantalizm ve Batıda Kur'ân ve Kur'ân İlimleri Üzerine Araştırmalar", *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31/1(1990), 95-106.
- Cerrahoğlu, İsmail. *Tefsir Usulü*. Ankara: TDV Yayınları, 1997.
- Çetin, Abdurrahman. "Kur'ân Kırâatlarına Yönelik Oryantalist Yaklaşımlar". *Marife* 2/3(2002), 65-106.
- Çolak, Yaşar. *Batı'da İslam Tarihinin Erken Dönemine İlişkin Farklı Metodolojik Yaklaşımlar: John Wansbrough, Michael Cook-Patricia Crone ve Lawrence I. Conrad Örneği*. Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, DoktoraTezi, 2007.
- Demirci, Muhsin. *Kur'ân Tarihi*. İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Vakfı Yayınları, 2017.
- Dutton, Yasin. "The Sources of Islâmic Law: Islâmic Theories of Abrogation by John Burton". *Journal of Islâmic Studies* 4/2(1993), 237-240.
- El' Azami, Muhammed Mustafa. *Vahyedilişinden Derlenişine Kur'an Tarihi-Eski ve Yeni Ahit ile Karşılaştırmalı Bir Araştırma*-çev. Ömer Türker-Fatih Serenli İstanbul: İz Yayıncılık, 2018.
- El- Buhârî, Ebû Abdillâh Muhammed b. İsmâîl b. İbrâhîm el-Cu'fî. Camiu's Sahih, *Fedâilu'l Kur'ân*.
- Es-Sicisânî, Ebû Bekr Abdullah b. Ebî Dâvûd Süleymân b. Eş'as. *Kitâbü'lMesâhif* thk. Muhammed b. Abduh Kahire: El- Fâruku'l Hadîse, 1403/2002.
- Ferrâ, Ebû Zekeriyya Yahya b. Ziyadb. Abdullah b. Manzured-Deylemi. *Meâni'l Kur'ân* thk. Ahmed Yusuf Necati-Muhammed Ali Neccar-Abdu'l-Fettâh İsmail Şalebi Mısır: Daru'l Mısriyye li-te'lif ve-'tercüme, 1, trs.
- Hamidullah, Muhammed. *Kur'ân-ı Kerim Tarihi* çev. Abdülaziz Hatip-Mahmud Kanık İstanbul: BeyanYayınları, 2018.



- Hıdır, Özcan. "Oryantalizmin Günümüzde İslâmî Metinleri (Kur'ân ve Sünnet) "Yeniden Okuma" daki Düşünsel ve Metodolojik Etkisi". İstanbul: Sultanbeyli Belediyesi Kültür ve Sosyal İşler Müdürlüğü Dinî ve Felsefî Metinler Yirmi birinci Yüzyılda Yeniden Okuma, Anlama ve Algılama Sempozyumu Bildiri Kitabı 1(2012).
- İba Çınar, Ayşe Nur. *Kırâat Alanında Öne Çıkan İngilizce Oryantalistik Çalışmalar*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2019.
- Jeffery, Arthur. *Materials for the History of the Text of the Qur'ân*. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1937.
- Jones, Alan. "The Collection of the Qur'ân by J. Burton". *The Journal of Theological Studies* 29/2(1978), 625-626.
- Karimi, Morteza&Nia. "The Historiography of the Qur'ân in the Muslim World: The Influence of Theodor Nöldeke". *Journal of Qur'anic Studies* 15/1(2013), 46-68.
- Kızılaslan, İshak. *Çağdaş Oryantalizm ve Kiraat İlmi-The Encyclopaedia of the Qur'ân Örneği*. Ankara: İlahiyât Yayınları, 2021.
- Komisyon. *Kur'ân Yolu Türkçe Meâl ve Tefsir*. Ankara: Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı Yayınları, 2007.
- Küçük, Raşit. "Kur'ân-Sünnet İlişkisi ve Birlikteliği". *Tartışmalı İlmî Toplantılar Dizisi Sünnetin Dindeki Yeri* 31. İstanbul: Ensar Neşriyat, 125-164.
- Madelung, Wilferd. "The Collection of the Qur'ân by John Burton". *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 10/3(1979), 429-430.
- Martin, Richard C. "The Collection of the Qur'ân by John Burton". *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*. 47/3(1979), 460-461.
- Maşalı, Mehmet Emin. *Kur'ân'ın Metin Yapısı-Mushaf Tarihi Ve İmlâsı*. Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2015.
- Maşalı, Mehmet Emin. "Mushaf". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslâm Ansiklopedisi* 31/242-248 Ankara: TDV Yayınları, 2020.
- M. Sait Şimşek, *Kur'ân'ın Anlaşılmasında İki Mesele*. İstanbul: Hikmetevi Yayınları, 2021.
- Motzki, Harald. "Kur'ân'ın Cem'i: Son Dönem Metodolojik Gelişmeler Işığında Batılı Görüşlere İlişkin Yeni Bir Değerlendirme" çev. Selim Türcan ". *Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 5/10(2006/2), 131-163.
- Neuwirth, Angelika. *Studien zur Komposition der mekkanischen Suren*. Berlin: 1981; 2nd, revised edition, Berlin: 2008.
- Okuyucu, Nail. "Şâfiî'nin Kaynak İçi Nesih Teorisi ve Şâfiî Fıkıh Geleneğinde Yorumlanmış Biçimleri". *İslam Araştırmaları Dergisi* 43(2020). 1-44.
- Purrostami, Hamed. "Examination of the View of John Burton Concerning the Relationship between Abrogation and Collection of the Qur'ân". *Review of European Studies* 9/1(2017), 254-260.
- Rippin, Andrew. "The Sources of Islâmic Law: Islâmic Theories of Abrogation by John Burton". *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies University of London* 54/2(1991), 362-364.
- Said, Edward William. *Şarkiyatçılık* çev. Berna Yıldırım. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2017.
- Schoeler, Gregor. "The Codification of the Qur'ân: A Comment on the Hypotheses of Burton and Wansbrough". *The Qur'ân in Context* edt. Angelika Neuwirth-Nicolai Sinai-Michael Marx. Brill:2009, 779-794.
- Songur, Haluk. "John Burton (1929- ) -The Collection of the Qur'ân Adlı Eseri Özelinde-". *İslâm Hukuku Araştırmaları Dergisi* 4 (2004), 203-217.
- Wansbrough, John. *Qur'anic Studies: Sources and Methods of Scriptural Interpretation*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Wansbrough, John. "The Collection of the Qur'ân by John Burton". *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies University of London* 41/2 (1978), 370-371.

Weiss, Bernard. "The Sources of Islāmic Law: Islāmic Theories of Abrogation by John Burton", *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 113/2(1993), 304-306.

Zakzuk, Mahmud Hamdi. *Oryantalizm veya Medeniyet Hesaplaşmasının Arka Plânı* çev. Abdülaziz Hatip. İzmir: Işık Yayınları, 1993.