63. Devler Arasında Bir Gezinti: Ovid, Kafka, Auden ve Bruegel'de "Cezalandırma" üzerine karşılaştırmalı bir araştırma

Derya ORUÇ¹

APA: Oruç, D. (2022). Devler Arasında Bir Gezinti: Ovid, Kafka, Auden ve Bruegel'de "Cezalandırma" üzerine karşılaştırmalı bir araştırma. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, (30), 1022-1031. DOI: 10.29000/rumelide.1188777.

Öz

Dönüşüm kavramını hikayelerinde birleştirici bir unsur olarak kullanan Ovid'in "Metamorphoses" kimlik, ölümsüzlük, şiddet, cezalandırma, ödüllendirme ve erdem gibi birçok sayıda temayı inceler. Yaygın motiflerinden biri olan cezalandırma, Daedalus ve Icarus efsanesinde babasının tavsiyesini dinlemeyen oğulun bir trajedi ile karşı karşıya kalma örneklemesi ile bilhassa dikkat çeker. Bununla birlikte, Franz Kafka'nın *The Metamorphosis*'ında gezici satış temsilciliği yapan Gregor Samsa'nın bir haşarata dönüşmesi, W.H. Auden'ın "Musee des Beaux Arts"'da kayıtsızlık ve cezalandırma motifinin ön plana çıkması ve son olarak da Pieter Bruegel'in *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus* tablosunda tepkisizliğin bir cezalandırma olarak tasvir edilmesi, Daedalus ve Icarus hikayesindeki dönüşüm ve cezalandırma motiflerinden esinlenildiğine işaret eder. Bu makale'nin amacı Ovid'in "Metamorphoses"'ında yaygın olarak görülen cezalandırma motifini Franz Kafka'nın *The Metamorphosis* kısa romanında, W.H. Auden'ın "Musee des Beaux Arts" şiirinde ve Pieter Bruegel'in *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus* tablosunda incelerken, Kafka'nın *The Metamorphosis* ve Auden'ın "Musee des Beaux Arts" adlı eserlerindeki başkahramanların davranışsal özelliklerini analiz ederek Sigmund Freud'un kazaların aslında olmadığını addeden "kazalar" teorisinin cezalandırma motifi ile arasındaki bağlantıyı ortaya çıkarmaktır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Cezalandırma, Kazalar, Dönüşüm, Dönüşümler, Musee des Beaux Arts, İkarus'un Düşüşü Sırasında Bir Manzara

A Walk Among the Giants: A comparative study on "Punishment" in Ovid, Kafka, Auden and Bruegel

Abstract

Ovid's "Metamorphoses" which holds transformation as a unifying element in his stories examines a large number of themes including identity, immortality, violence, punishment, reward and morality. Punishment which is one of the most common motifs, particularly stands out in the myth of Daedalus and Icarus where a son faces tragedy for not taking his father's advice. Similar motifs of change and punishment appear in Franz Kafka's novella *The Metamorphosis* in which a salesman named Gregor Samsa turns into a verminous bug, W.H. Auden's "Musee des Beaux Arts" poem where indifference and punishment go hand in hand and finally in Pieter Bruegel's *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus* painting wherein unresponsiveness is depicted as punishment. The aim of this article is to analyse the common motif of "punishment" in Ovid's "Metamorphoses", Franz Kafka's *The Metamorphosis*, W.H. Auden's "Musee des Beaux Arts" with Pieter Bruegel's *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus* and to investigate behavioural characteristics of the protagonist in both Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* and

Öğr. Gör. Dr., Dr., İstanbul Medeniyet Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi, İngilizce Öğretmenliği (İstanbul, Türkiye), derya.oruc@medeniyet.edu.tr, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-3045-1385 [Araştırma makalesi, Makale kayıt tarihi: 27.07.2022-kabul tarihi: 20.10.2022; DOI: 10.29000/rumelide.1188777]

W.H. Auden's "Musee des Beaux Arts" according to Sigmund Freud's theory of "accidents" in order to uncover a connection between the common motif punishment and the theory of accidents in which essentially assume there are none.

Keywords: Punishment, Accidents, The Metamorphosis, Metamorphoses, Musee des Beaux Arts, Landscape with the Fall of Icarus

Motifs which are elements that recur throughout literary texts have different purposes. In Franz Kafka's *The Metamorphosis*, the author uses the motif of punishment in order to accentuate the themes like alienation in modern life, mind and body disengagement, and family relationships. Throughout the text, alienation and modern life style is associated with the 20th c. work world which creates a punishment of unhappiness for the protagonist Gregor Samsa. On the other hand, a major punishment of mind-body disengagement by an unexpected transformation into an insect occurs. Moreover, the responsibility of the family's livelihood is forced upon Gregor which creates distress and mixed emotions, turning love into resentment. However, in order to have a comprehensive understanding of the motif punishment the reception of the literary classic should be analysed.

The reception of Kafka's The Metamorphosis can be divided into three basic notions: "the extended metaphor, the inverted fairy tale and the parable of human irrationality" (Sokel, 1954, p.203). Sokel believes that the first two are inadequate to describe and explain the entire work and the third one is based on a misunderstanding. In order to strengthen his idea, Sokel calls attention to Günther Anders' claim which indicates that Kafka's most important characteristic in *The Metamorphosis* is based on conventional figures of speech and the way he enriches them with specific detail. Kafka's tales exercises metaphors which are from German idioms. For instance, the transformation of Gregor Samsa into a vermin is an illustration that stands out. In German the phrase "dreckiger Kafer" which means "dirty bug" indicates a filthy person (Sokel, 1954, p.203). Kafka converts this metaphor into a story with a comprehensive upper-middle class setting. However, Kafka's work cannot only be seen as an extended metaphor since the text is too long for a tale and full of statements. In addition, this assertion overlooks the part before the "metamorphosis". In order to elucidate the concept of "inverted fairy tale" Sokel evaluates the view of Clemens Heselhause who argues that Kafka's work is a "parodistic inversion" of the story "The Beauty and the Beast" (Sokel, 1954, p.204). If we are to consider the beast as Gregor Samsa, and the beauty as the sister Grete Samsa, Kafka's story allows an analysis as an inverted fairy tale. In the story love is not able to conquer fear, and beauty which is Grete, convicts the beast Gregor to die rather than re-transforming him with a kiss. In such a case, the kiss would be Grete being nicer to her brother. Sokel believes that this idea is relevant since Gregor seems to test his family with his actions. However, his greatest heartbreak lies in their failure to pass the test which is to acknowledge and love the son and brother in the monster. This evaluation is similar to the "extended metaphor" which also fails as it does not take into account the background of Gregor's metamorphosis or his relationship to his work and employer. In addition, the idea neither takes into consideration Gregor's rejection by the family nor it explains the fact that Gregor dies without anger or bitterness towards his family (Sokel, 1954, p.204). Finally, with regards to the notion "parable of human irrationality" Sokel responds to F.D. Luke who transfers the responsibility of the misfortune from the family to Gregor. According to Luke, Gregor's daydream about her sister is aggressive, egotistical and has an incestuous nature. The daydream indicates the absurd state of mind that Gregor is in with his already irrational circumstance. However, "Luke detects in Kafka's tale the dichotomy between art and life, disease and health, refined perversion and insensitive normality" (Sokel, 1954, p.204). He believes that Luke only looks at specific details like the contrasts as in black and white and dismisses the grey areas. Although it is overt that

Kafka's work does not allow itself to be defined or explained with one particular analysis, Sokel furthers the third concept by inspecting the reasons of Gregor's metamorphosis. The narrative starts with the failure of Gregor's father and the debt to Gregor's employer which is contracted to him. Therefore, the pre-history of the metamorphosis is to be examined while considering the role of the chief clerk. Apart from this examination, the insect shape that Gregor changes into must be contemplated on.

In the story Gregor thinks about his job more often than his own transformation even though he hates his boss and has rebellious plans. However, he supresses them since his only option is to work off his father's debts. Hence, in the beginning of the story the only thing Gregor thinks about is to get ready for his work as he is already late. Nevertheless, the metamorphosis makes it impossible and the impossibility of the situation sets him free which enables him to stay "innocent" (Sokel, 1954, p.206). When the chief clerk from his firm comes for an investigation on why Gregor is not at work, Gregor reacts in an interesting way. He first feels anger and wishes that someday the chief clerk would have the same thing happen to him. Then, when the chief clerk threatens the family, Gregor puts his anger aside and finally shows himself. The metamorphosis creates an effect of rage as it functions as aggression against the chief clerk. However, Gregor is not in the realization of this function which terrorizes the chief clerk who runs away in horror, leaving his cane behind. Therefore, the metamorphosis satisfies Gregor's concealed wish for rebellion and his wish to humiliate his superior. More importantly, the metamorphosis does not implicate Gregor's conscious mind but fulfils his desire of rebellion. The conscious aim of Gregor's pursuit of the chief clerk is not to frighten him but is to reconcile with him. As Gregor chases the chief clerk who runs away speechless in fright, he begs him to put a good word for him at work. Yet he uses the word "pursuit" to describe his advance toward the chief clerk which reveals what actually is happening. The discrepancy between the actual result of Gregor's action and his own explanation of it has a comical effect upon the reader. A similar effect is found in the early part of the story where Gregor tries to assure the chief clerk that he'll get dressed, pack his collection of samples and catch the first train for work. In this comic discrepancy, between the actual situation and Gregor's rationalizations F.D. Luke sees this satiric parable as the "irrationality of the human mental process" (Sokel, 1954, p.209).

The metamorphosis essentially reveals Gregor's repressed desire as his outward look is perceived threatening which is parallel to what he feels about his job and his superiors. The chief clerk who runs away from Gregor, reacts to his true desire, seemingly understanding better than Gregor does himself. This situation is similar to Gregor's father's reaction to the metamorphosis. He seems to believe that the metamorphosis which Gregor has no control over is a trick to avoid work and a refusal to his duty. He is closer to the truth than Gregor who seems to believe that the situation is a mistake just as the reader might have. Considered in this way, the metamorphosis discloses a design of Freud's study of "accidents". Freud illustrates in his many collection of examples that the root cause of accidents are motives which the unconscious mind keeps carefully unaware (Freud, 1901, p.191-216). "Accidental injuries are often self-punishment rationalized by hidden guilt feelings. Accidents in which one person injures another may be caused by unconscious hostility" (Sokel, 1954, p.209). Gregor Samsa's metamorphosis seems fitting for both types of "accidents"; the one in which a person fulfils the repressed aggression by "accidentally" hurting another person, and those in which one harms oneself.

While Gregor's metamorphosis suggests the hidden aggression toward his work and superiors, it also expresses his guilt and the punishment for this guilt. Although the metamorphosis appears to generate an innocence in his relationship with his parents, it imprisons him in a sense of guilt which he withholds toward his family. Kafka, in the beginning of the story tells us that Gregor awakes to find himself

transformed into a giant vermin. The term 'vermin' actually has a double stance with regards to the metamorphosis. While 'vermin' connotes to being parasitic and aggressive, it can also suggest vulnerability to any attempt of destruction. It looks offensive while defenceless in fact. As soon as Gregor's appearance fails to intimidate, he becomes defenceless which creates an opportunity for anyone who would want to exploit his condition. Thus, the metamorphosis associates punishment with aggression. The metamorphosis that allows Gregor to cause the chief clerk to run away makes him defenceless towards his father's rage.

In the story there are other examples which can be considered as punishment. After the metamorphosis Gregor sees his father's savings, and realizes that the family could have lived on it for at least two years. Instead of paying off his debt and shortening Gregor's "sentence", his father hides the money. In addition, his father does not use the saved money even after the metamorphosis occurs; either in paying Gregor's debt or spending it for the expenses. He makes the household work. Another punishment which reveals physical injury happens before the "famous" apples are thrown at Gregor. Gregor steps out of his room and his father acts mean towards him as he trapps and crushes him at the door, making him bleed. Gregor's room which is not being cleaned enough is also used as a storage. Probably the biggest punishment Gregor comes across is his door being closed in the evenings. It closes as the tenants dine at the living room which is right opposite to Gregor's room. Until that time Gregor watches his family eat dinner in his dark room which is the only time he feels a part of the family.

The punishment motif which is seen in Kafka's work is also a common motif in Ovid's "Metamorphoses". In Ovid's work gods punish in occasions caused by anger, jealousy, lust or simple cruelty. While Daphne self-punishes herself to escape Apollo by turning herself into a tree, Arachne is punished by Athena and turned into a spider because she weaves as beautiful as Athena. In addition, there are women like Calisto and Scylla whose only "fault" is being beautiful. While Calisto is raped and turned into a bear, Scylla is transformed into a monster by a powerful enchantress out of jealousy. Another story which entertains the motif of punishment is Daedalus and Icarus. "As one of the most powerful artist figures in the Metamorphoses, Daedalus uses his inventive powers both for constraint, by constructing the labyrinth to contain the Minotaur, and for release, by fashioning wings to escape from Crete" (Pavlock, 1998, p.141). The main story is of young Icarus who disobeys his father Daedalus and tries to fly closer to the sun. As he flies higher, the wax which holds the feathers together melt from the heat of the sun and causes him to eventually fall and drown in the sea. Ovid situates Daedalus' connection to the gods "in a negative light by echoing the Ars when he advises Icarus not to fly with the aid of the constellations" (Pavlock, 1998, p.153), reminding that the gods have power and authority over human life, particularly when punishment is considered. Although most stories have gods as saviours, Ovid does not allow any god to interfere with Icarus' fall which points out gods reaction to insolence. The indifference of the gods towards arrogance becomes the silent punishment.

Related to Ovid's story of Daedalus and Icarus, W.H.Auden's "Musee des Beaux Arts" poem and Pieter Bruegel's *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus* painting employ the same punishment motif. Bruegel, who is known for his landscapes and peasant scenes captures a moment in time that depicts Icarus' punishment. According to Bruegel, the story of the myth takes place in spring as there is a ploughman tilling his land, a shepherd attending his herd who seems to be enjoying the beautiful day and a man fishing at the edge of the cliff. There are also some sailboats in the distance and a ship closer to land which indicates that she has left the port at a very close time. The painting does not disclose anything out of the ordinary when looked from afar. However, a closer inspection reveals a pair of legs close to the ship which may easily be confused with the splashing foam of the sea.

The name of the painting and the way it is executed uncovers an irony as it is clear that the painting is focused on economy; the tilling of the field, the shepherd and his herd, a fisherman fishing and the ships rather than the fall of Icarus. They are "unaware of the double tragedy – the loss of a life and the defeat of man's free spirit attempting to escape the restrictions of humanity" (Kinney, 1963, p.529). Icarus becomes insignificant as the painter chooses to draw his legs at the corner of the painting, small in size. The rest of the body is not in the picture which is an indication that it is not important how Icarus looks. In addition, the legs are so small that it is easy to confuse them with the foam of the sea. It is as though Bruegel is telling the observers that Icarus is irrelevant when the whole painting is considered. Moreover, Bruegel makes the people in the painting indifferent to the situation. Nobody looks at the event and there are no reactions. Taking notice of where Icarus falls, the spectator hopes to see an acknowledgment from the closest to the scene which is the newly sailed ship but does not get any. A great tragedy lies in front of all the people in the painting where a young man drowns but no one is inclined to take notice. Icarus' punishment lies in the fact that Bruegel paints him as insignificant as possible. Bruegel minimizes the event to maximize the everyday life.

Another punishment motif which is connected to Icarus can be seen in a famous poem by W.H. Auden. Auden who has spent his winter of 1939 in Brussels (Kinney, 1963, p.529) seems to have been influenced by the paintings of Pieter Bruegel the Elder when he wrote his poem "Musee des Beaux Arts" in 1940. Some critics believe that the source of the poem is the three Bruegel paintings: *The Census at Bethlehem, The Massacre of the Innocent* and *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus*². Therefore, the poem could be divided into three parts after the introduction.

The first section is the introduction part which praises the old masters who were experts in the description of the human conduct and its ordinariness.

About suffering they were never wrong, The old Masters: how well they understood Its human position: how it takes place

While someone else is eating or opening a window or just walking dully along; (II. 1-4)

In view of the title of the poem and the 'old Masters' in the second line, the use of the pronoun 'they' in the first line points towards the paintings in the museum. Auden who uses a conversational tone points out how "the old Masters" were good at depicting the human condition as in mundane actions like eating, opening a window or simply walking.

The next lines refer to Bruegel's *The Census at Bethlehem*. Bruegel treats a biblical story (Luke ii:1-5)³ as a contemporary event. Mary and Joseph are in Bethlehem to be counted for taxation but Bruegel has painted them as Flemish peasants so they are hard to recognize. Mary who is in the centre of the painting is on a donkey. She creates a contrast to everything else in the picture. Apart from one other person in the far left, she is the only one to be on a donkey. In addition, she seems to be the only one who is calm since everyone else is performing some kind of an action. Nevertheless, she is almost passed unnoticed. "A major event nearly hidden in a chock-full of daily occurrences" (Kinney, 1963, p.529). Once again the

² According to Arthur F. Kinney, Bruegel has two paintings of the myth. One of them is not signed but is believed to be Bruegel's. The other painting has Daedalus in it who is horrified by his drowning son.

www.biblia.com - Luke ii: 1-5: In those days a decree went out from Caesar Augustus that all the world should be registered. 2 This was the first registration when Quirinius was governor of Syria. 3 And all went to be registered, each to his own town. 4 And Joseph also went up from Galilee, from the town of Nazareth, to Judea, to the city of David, which is called Bethlehem, because he was of the house and lineage of David, 5 to be registered with Mary, his betrothed, who was with child.

indifference of the people around her becomes of importance which points out the motif of punishment. Although situated in the middle of the painting, Mary and Joseph are somehow downgraded from being holy to ordinary figures.

How, when the aged are reverently, passionately waiting For the miraculous birth, there always must be Children who did not specially want it to happen, skating On a pond at the edge of the wood: (II. 5-8)

Auden juxtaposes Mary who is a miracle with the mundane human conditions occurring around her. "The miraculous birth" which Auden draws attention to is the birth of Christ. He indicates that while some people respectfully wait for significant events to occur, like the birth of Christ, others are either not aware of the situation or not interested which could also be linked to punishment.

The following lines refer to Bruegel's *The Massacre of the Innocent* painting which was inspired by the biblical story "The Massacre of the Innocents" from the New Testament. Bruegel's 16th century painting makes references to contemporary events, especially the civil wars that had spread across Europe. In addition, it is important to bear in mind that Auden wrote this poem in the year of 1939 which was before the WWII. Therefore, Both Auden and Bruegel draw a parallel between the ancient and the contemporary barbarity which revolve around the same idea. Interestingly, it is noticed after the painting is x-rayed that it was altered. In the original painting Bruegel had drawn slaughtered children and infants. However, it was painted over because it was found to be very disturbing (Royal Collection trust, n.d).

They never forgot

That even the dreadful martyrdom must run its course

Anyhow in a corner, some untidy spot

Where the dogs go on with their doggy life and the torturer's horse

Scratches its innocent behind on a tree. (II. 9-13)

The short line 'They never forget' (I. 9) puts emphasis on the painters who disclose reality that reminds both the good and the bad parts of humanity as in the 'dreadful martyrdom' which is a reference to the death of Jesus Christ and is connected to the 'miraculous birth' mentioned before. Thenceforward, the conversational tone appears once more to put emphasis on the fact that the animals are unaware of the brutality done by the humans themselves to their fellow creatures.

Another example of punishment and indifference can be seen in the last part of Auden's poem where he directly discusses Bruegel's *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus*.

In Breughel's Icarus, for instance: how everything turns away
Quite leisurely from the disaster; the ploughman may
Have heard the splash, the forsaken cry,
But for him it was not an important failure; the sun shone
As it had to on the white legs disappearing into the green

www.biblia.com: According to the Gospel of Saint Matthew 2:16-18, King Herod orders his men to kill all the infants under two years old after he is provided with the information of the birth of Jesus by the Magi.

Water, and the expensive delicate ship that must have seen Something amazing, a boy falling out of the sky, Had somewhere to get to and sailed calmly on. (II. 14-21)

The painting illustrates the myth of Daedalus and Icarus from Ovid's "Metamorphoses". According to Ovid's "Metamorphoses", Daedalus, the inventor of the labyrinth for the Minotaur, is kept in a tower with his son Icarus by King Minos in order to keep the secrets of the labyrinth safe. Since it is not possible to escape by land or sea, the inventor constructs wings with the feathers of birds and candlewax. He warns his son not to fly very low or very high since the mist of the sea or the heat of the sun would dissolve the wax. However, Icarus does not listen to his father's advice and flies higher, wanting to be closer to the sun. The wax which holds the feathers together melts and he falls into the sea and drowns. Auden describes how Bruegel depicts the indifference of the human kind facing this true tragedy. He points out how people simply turn away from the incident as if there is nothing happening. Although the farmer who tills his land might have heard the cry for help and the splash, he does not act on it which reveals the importance of harvest over life. The sun which is simply unconcerned, shines on Icarus' white legs that vanish into the sea. The fisherman who is actually close to the scene and the shepherd who seems to be day dreaming are indeed unbothered by the situation. Finally, the people on the luxurious ship who undoubtedly have seen the fall, do not react at all to the astonishing event but rather sail towards their destination. Auden truly depicts the indifference of the people in the painting while Bruegel exposes the insignificance of Icarus by portraying him small in size and at the bottom right corner which can easily be unnoticed since neither the feathered wings nor the body is painted and the legs are similar to foam. If Bruegel had not named the painting Landscape with the Fall of Icarus, the spectator would not be able to understand that the sinking legs belonged to Icarus. It is as though Icarus is being punished with insignificance for not listening to his father's advice and for excessive selfconfidence, or one might say, vaulting ambition.

Established in all the works mentioned above, punishment is a shared concept. While self-punishment is nurtured by Kafka's Gregor Samsa along with external punishment from his family and business, Ovid's myth of Daedalus and Icarus is based on a similar notion. Furthermore, Auden's poem refers to different paintings of Bruegel which emphasizes indifference, pain, and punishment that are essential to their depictions. Following the analysis of the punishment motif in these works, a question lies in how punishment is connected to mistakes or so-called "accidents".

In Kafka's *The Metamorphosis* Gregor hates his work and this hostility towards his work has literally appeared in his whole body. Although his conscious mind does not comprehend or participate in this transformation, his reasoning for his situation cannot pass on to others. On the other hand, through the statements of the chief clerk, Gregor has been seen as a bad employee who does not fulfil the requirement of his job and worse, he is suspected of embezzlement. Although Gregor denies this accusation, he comes to a point that he needs to ask for a sick leave. Thus, it is overt that the stress of his situation builds up to create the metamorphosis. As it is stated many times in the story, Gregor covertly wishes to humiliate his boss in front of others because he detests his job and feels the heavy burden on his shoulders to finish his father's debt. Similarly, the reaction of Gregor's father to his transformation, thinking it as some kind of a treacherousness or a defiant act not to do his duty, is more relevant to the truth than Gregor's belief. However, Gregor finds his metamorphosis to be an accident. Conversely, Freud believes that there are no accidents.

In Freud's Psychopathology of Everyday Life in the 8th chapter titled "Erroneously Carried-out Actions", Freud quotes from Rudolf Meringer and Carl Mayer in which he agrees: "Lapses in speech do not stand entirely alone. They resemble the errors which often occur in our other activities and are quite foolishly termed 'forgetfulness'" (Freud, 1901, p.130). According to this statement the slips of the tongue can be compared to the actions of forgetfulness. Freud elaborates this by stating that "If the lapse in speech, which is without a doubt a motor function, admits of such a conception (that there is sense and purpose behind this slight functional disturbance), it is quite natural to transfer the lapses of our other motor functions the same expectation" (Freud, 1901, p.130). He divides actions into two; "erroneously carried out actions" and "symptomatic and chance actions". Freud believes that the first one is done by the unconscious mind and hides itself under the pretext of awkwardness. The latter disregards the assistance of a conscious intention and does not need pretext. The entire action appears inappropriate to the purpose.

To make it easier to understand, Freud explains "erroneously carried out actions" by placing it under "ataxia" which is the failure of muscular coordination. He provides an example of his own experience. He talks about the time he makes house calls. In most of his experiences he finds himself taking out his home key when he arrives at the door of his patient instead of ringing the bell. As he investigates his action deeper he figures out that his faulty action signifies a compliment to the house. He feels at home. The motor action which occurs in front of his own door becomes an equivalent action that he repeats in front of his patient's house. Therefore, it can be said that Freud has a reason behind his action. In connection with Freud's explanation, it may be stated that Gregor's transformation into a verminous bug is not an accident. The reason lies behind the fact that Gregor is full of wrath in his unconscious against his work, his father and probably towards himself. This negativity built inside him finds a way to discharge which captures his physical appearance. Gregor who is not aware of the consequences of his appearance, runs after the chief clerk literally forgetting that he looks like a bug and tries to communicate with him by asking to put a good word for him when he speaks with the boss. He also insists that he would get ready as soon as possible and catch the soonest train. It is as though he has accidentally forgotten about his situation. As stated before, Freud assumes that there are no accidents. Gregor Samsa's fear of losing his job and his responsibility to pay off his father's debts overcomes the situation he is in. His anxiety blocks his awareness of his appearance.

Another so-called accident is seen in W.H. Auden's "Musee des Beaux Arts". The last part of the poem is about the fall of Icarus that is depicted from Bruegel's *Landscape with the Fall of Icarus* which is according to Ovid's myth that insinuates the event of being an accident. Despite this view, there can be other explanations to his fall. If Icarus' fall is put under the pretext of awkwardness, as he is constantly warned by his father Daedalus of the consequences, his disobedience may be examined under the title of Freud's "erroneously carried out actions". Unfortunately, neither Ovid nor Auden provides information on why Icarus chose to fly closer to the sun. Nonetheless, there are different possibilities. If it is to be assumed that Icarus' act is of the unconscious, this means that he is unaware of his situation and the reason may be connected to his hubris which was probably there in the background of his thoughts since he was a child. The desire to ascend to the gods with the wings which made it possible for the action to proceed, could have made him forget about the warnings of his father. On the other hand, Icarus may have had enough of the hardships that he has been facing for a long time and might have wanted to feel free but unconsciously wanting to punish himself. In the end, it can be said that punishment to self or punishment of others cannot be perceived as accidents since there is always a background story that effects the action according to Freud.

To conclude, the punishment motif in Ovid's myth Daedalus and Icarus has found its way into Kafka's The Metamorphosis, W. H. Auden's "Musee des Beaux Arts" and Pieter Bruegel the Elder's painting Landscape with the Fall of Icarus. Although, primarily Icarus' fall seems to be a mechanical failure that causes the accident (the wax that holds the feathers together melts from the heat of the sun), it could be interpreted as a punishment by the gods because of his arrogance in connection with his wish to become closer to the gods or merely his desire to be like them. However, the reason behind the need to fly closer to the sun despite the warnings of Daedalus may be connected to Icarus' desire to punish himself. While this may explain why the gods were not eager to help Icarus, the reason for the indifference of the human kind both in Bruegel's painting and Auden's poem which comes in the form of punishment as well, is difficult to understand. The indication is that human beings are indifferent to suffering if it does not have an impact on them directly. Thus, the unsympathetic reaction to the fall in Bruegel's painting transforms into words in Auden's poem. Auden not only conveys the indifference of the fall of Icarus in his "Musee des Beaux Arts", but he also draws attention to the unresponsiveness as a punishment in Bruegel's other paintings; The Census at Bethlehem, and The Massacre of the Innocent. In addition, Gregor Samsa's transformation into an insect gives the impression of being connected to internal and external punishment with the function of the unconscious mind which compliments Freud's ideas on accidents. According to Freud's "erroneously carried out actions", Gregor Samsa's transformation is associated with his unconscious anger towards his father, boss and himself. The rage that builds up inside discharges by transforming into his new physical appearance which is in a way punishing himself for his own thoughts.

As a final point, Ovid's Icarus and therefore Auden's and Bruegel's Icarus is punished by the indifference of the gods and his fellow humans. However, there is a possibility that Icarus might have punished himself as well since he chooses to fly closer to the sun although warned which makes the decision a choice rather than an accident. The external and internal punishments which demonstrate Freud's idea on accidents may also be observed in Kafka's *The Metamorphosis*. Gregor bears the stress of a job that he hates in which he needs in order to pay for his family's debt while he takes care of them. The internal chaos and the external indifference to his state causes his physical transformation into a bug which is another demonstration of Freud's idea of accidents as well.

References

- Auden, W. H. (1995), Auden Poems, Musée des Beaux Arts, New York: A.A. Knopf, 72 Biblia. (n.d.), Herod Kills the Children: Matthew 2:16-18, https://biblia.com/books/esv/Lk2.1-5 —. The Birth of Jesus Christ: Luke 2:1-5, (n.d.), https://biblia.com/books/esv/Lk2.1-5
- Bruegel, P. (1555), Landscape with the Fall of Icarus (Painting). Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium, Brussels, Belgium. https://www.bl.uk/collection-items/landscape-with-the-fall-of-icarus —. The Census at Bethlehem (Painting). (1566), Royal Museums of Fine Arts of Belgium, Brussels,
- Belgium. https://artsandculture.google.com/asset/the-census-at-bethlehem-pieter-bruegel-the elder/JwGxiyxYTZZEog —. Massacre of the Innocents (Painting). (1565-67), Windsor Castle, Windsor, U.K. https://www.rct.uk/collection/search#/3/collection/405787/massacre-of-the-innocents
- Freud, S. (1901), The Psychopathology of Everyday Life, (A. A. Brill, Trans.), The Psychology E-Book Collection, Hogarth Press, www.all-about-psychology.com
- Kafka, F. (2013), Metamorphosis, Tr. David Wyllie, Maryland: Serenity Publishers.
- Kinney, A.F. (1963), Auden, Bruegel, and "Musée des Beaux Arts", National Council of Teachers of English, 24(7), 529-531.
- Ovid, (1955), Metamorphoses, Tr. Mary M. Innes, London: Penguin Books.

Devler Arasında Bir Gezinti: Ovid, Kafka, Auden ve Bruegel'de "Cezalandırma" üzerine karşılaştırmalı bir araştırma / D. Oruç

- Pavlock, B. (1998), Daedalus in the Labyrinth of Ovid's "Metamorphoses", The Johns Hopkins University Press on behalf of the Classical Association of the Atlantic States, 92(2), 141-157.
- Royal Collection Trust, (n.d.), Massacre of the Innocents. https://www.rct.uk/collection/405787/massacre-of-the-innocents
- Sokel, W. (1954), Kafka's "Metamorphosis": Rebellion and Punishment, The University of Wisconsin Press, 48(4), 203-214.