

93. Extralinguistic cultural references (ECRs) rendered into subtitling: The case of the historical film series *Diriliř: Ertuęrul*

Blent AKAT¹

Tuba KMBL²

APA: Akat, B. & Kmbl, T. (2022). Extralinguistic cultural references (ECRs) rendered into subtitling: The case of the historical film series *Diriliř: Ertuęrul*. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Arařtırmaları Dergisi*, (30), 1447-1467. DOI: 10.29000/rumelide.1193110.

Abstract

This article concerns itself with various aspects of subtitling as a form of Audiovisual Translation (AVT), with special focus on the constraints the subtitler works under, the difficulties involved in rendering cultural references, and different kinds of strategies that have been proposed to deal with them. The study is mainly centered on the taxonomy of strategies proposed by Jorge Daz-Cintas, Aline Remael, and Santamaria Guinot. In the first stage, the English subtitles corresponding to the Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) selected from the sound track of the Turkish film series *Diriliř: Ertuęrul* have been analyzed in the light of these strategies. Then, the subtitler's methods of dealing with ECRs have been evaluated in order to find out to what extent the translation of ECRs in subtitles have been able to create an effect on target viewers similar to the one created on viewers of the film in the source culture. The analysis of the ECRs selected from the film series generally pointed to an inclination on the part of the subtitler towards keeping close to the norms of the target language and culture, an approach that seems to have been adopted when this did not give rise to a distortion in the meaning of the original expression.

Keywords: Interlingual subtitling, extralinguistic cultural references (ECRs), constraints in audiovisual translation, strategies for subtitling; *Diriliř: Ertuęrul*

Altyazı evirisinde dildıřı kltrel referansların aktarılması: Tarihi dizi *Diriliř: Ertuęrul* zerine bir alıřma

z

Grsel-İřitsel eviri'nin bir tr olan altyazının eřitli ynleriyle ilgili olan bu makale, zellikle altyazı evirmenin karřılařtıđı kısıtlamalara, kltrel referansların erek dilde sunulmasında karřılařılan zorluk ve sorunlarla bařa ıkmak iin nerilen farklı stratejilere odaklanmıřtır. alıřmanın merkezinde Jorge Daz-Cintas, Aline Remael ve Santamaria Guinot tarafından nerilen altyazı eviri stratejileriyle ilgili sınıflandırma bulunmaktadır. İlk ařamada, *Diriliř: Ertuęrul* adlı Trke dizinin İngilizce versiyonunun altyazılarından seilen Dildıřı Kltrel Referanslar bu stratejiler iřıđında analiz edilmiřtir. Daha sonra, altyazılardaki dildıřı kltrel referansların evirisinin, kaynak kltrdeki filmin izleyicileri zerinde yarattıđı etkinin bir benzerinin hedef izleyiciler zerinde ne lde yaratabildiđini tespit etmek iin altyazı evirmenin bu referansları tercme etmede uyguladıđı yntemler deđerlendirilmiřtir. Diziden seilen Dildıřı Kltrel Referansların analizi, genel

¹ đr. Gr. Dr., ankaya niversitesi, Fen Edebiyat Fakltesi, Mtercim ve Tercmanlık Blm (Ankara, Trkiye), blnt3264@gmail.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0001-7079-4852. [Arařtırma makalesi, Makale kayıt tarihi: 12.09.2022-kabul tarihi: 20.10.2022; DOI: 10.29000/rumelide.1193110]

² đr. Gr. Dr. Hitit niversitesi Ortak Zorunlu Dersler (İngilizce) Blm (orum, Trkiye), tubakumbul@gmail.com, 0000-0002-1795-8253.

olarak altyazı çevirmenin hedef dil ve kültür normlarına yakın olma eğiliminde olduğuna işaret etmiş ve bu yaklaşımın daha ziyade transfer esnasında orijinal ifadenin anlamında bozulma olmayacağı durumlarda ağırlık kazandığı gözlenmiştir.

Anahtar kelimeler: Dillerarası altyazı çevirisi, dildışı kültürel referanslar; görsel-ışitsel çeviride kısıtlamalar; altyazı çevirisinde stratejiler; *Diriliş: Ertuğrul*

1. Introduction

This study is based on the taxonomy of strategies proposed by three translation scholars -Jorge Díaz Cintas, Aline Remael, and Santamaria Guinot- for the translation of what Jan Pedersen calls Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) in subtitling. The analysis of culture-based references taken from the film series attempts to bring out the basic orientation of the subtitler - whether a source-oriented or target-oriented approach has been adopted. The present article is centered on the subtitled version of the film series *Diriliş: Ertuğrul* (translated into English as *Resurrection: Ertugrul*) displayed on Netflix. The scope of the study will be limited to the 20 episodes of the film series. Broadcast between 2014-2019, *Diriliş: Ertuğrul* is a Turkish television series produced in the genre of historical fiction. Set in the 13th century, the series build around the life and adventures of Ertugrul Gazi, the father of Osman I, the founder of the Ottoman Empire. *Diriliş: Ertuğrul* has been shown in 71 countries and translated into more than 25 languages, among them English, Urdu, Arabic. Before going into a discussion on this topic, it would be highly relevant to offer some insight into the specific features of Audiovisual Translation.

2. Audiovisual translation (AVT)

Audiovisual translation (AVT) is a generic expression that comprises terms such as *media translation*, *multimedia translation*, *multimodal translation*, and *screen translation*, each of which is closely interrelated with the others. AVT has been a professional activity since the advent of cinema in the late 19th century; however, it did not receive due consideration in academic milieu until late 20th century. In fact, it was only after the 1990s that AVT became one of the most widely studied topics in the field of translation studies. Prior to audiovisual translation were silent films accompanied by intertitles and music. The first subtitled film, *Uncle Tom's Cabin*, was produced in 1903, when subtitles were called *intertitles*. Beginning from the late 1920s, silent movies were gradually transformed into talking movies (called “talkies”) as the spoken word started to become an integral part of the image on the screen. After sound was introduced to cinema, the first subtitled film with French subtitles, *The Jazz Singer*, came into vision in 1929. With the rise of the movie industry in the United States, it became necessary to provide people speaking different native languages with the opportunity to understand audiovisual material, which proved to be a challenge more demanding than the requirements of literary translation (Díaz Cintas, 2008, p. 2).

Over the last two decades, AVT has become a well-established type of translation as well as an academic field of research (Yves Gambier, 2003, as cited in Valentini, 2008, p. 37). In an increasingly globalized world, subtitle translation has proven to be one of the most common forms of AVT - an effective means of communication among societies having different languages and cultures. While films provide a unique opportunity to learn about other cultures, they may also create problems when viewed in a different cultural context, for movies are products of the cultures they stem from (Nedergaard-Larsen,

1993, p. 207). This brings into focus the role of the translator as "a cultural mediator" (Katan, 2003, p. 16), an agent who has to bridge the linguistic and extralinguistic gap between two cultures.

Various scholars have voiced their views on AVT in general and subtitling in particular, among them the Spanish translation scholar Jorge Dıaz-Cintas, professor of translation at the Centre for Translation Studies (CenTraS), University College London. He is known mainly for his work on Audiovisual Translation, particularly on subtitling. Dıaz Cintas argues that within the wider realm of Translation Studies, AVT is an autonomous field in its own right. According to him, the most useful studies on AVT are marked by two major ideas: AVT as an "autonomous discipline" and the dependence of AVT on other disciplines that are connected with it (Romero Fresco, 2006, as cited in Dıaz Cintas, 2009, p. 5). Dıaz Cintas claims that though the two perspectives seem to be incompatible, there is no contradiction between them. On the other hand, Susan Bassnett and Mary Snell-Hornby consider dubbing and subtitling to be part of the larger field of literary translation, placing them on an equal footing with "cinema translation" and "film translation" (2009, p. 5).

3. Research on audiovisual translation

In recent years, there has been a growing interest in AVT, which can be attributed to technological advances as well as to "the proliferation and distribution of audiovisual materials" (Dıaz-Cintas & Remael, 2021, p. 1). A significant body of research on audiovisual translation has focused on how the medium of the translation influences translators' decision-making process (e.g. subtitling as opposed to dubbing). A common research topic in AVT is one that attempts to answer the question of how to deal with the problem of achieving synchrony between the subtitle written in target language (TL) on the one hand, and spoken words in source language (SL) and visual images on the other. Another subject widely studied in the field is the question of how translators tackle problems related to social, cultural and geographical differences in SL texts (e.g. in films) (Palumbo, 2009, p. 13).

The Spanish translation scholar Frederic Chaume calls attention to one of the most common misunderstandings that can be noted in the whole body of reseach done on audiovisual translation: to regard it as a 'genre,' when in fact it should be seen as a 'text type,' one that encompasses a wide range of genres. This is an idea already present in Katharina Reiss's model, which is known as the 'audio-medial text type. (Dıaz Cintas, 2009, p. 5). In fact, audiovisual translation includes not only film translation, but also translation of a wide range of audiovisual programs, such as corporate videos, documentaries, TV series, reality shows, video games etc. As Dıaz Cintas points out, it would be wrong to use the terms "film translation" and "TV translation" interchangeably. Here, the genre (film) should not be confused with the medium (TV, as opposed to cinema or flash disk) through which it is presented. Dıaz Cintas argues that several types of AVT such as dubbing, subtitling, and voiceover are not only different forms of literary, drama, or poetry translation, but rather "translational modes" that fall under a "superordinate" text type – the audiovisual one – that functions in opposition to "the written-only and spoken-only types" (2009, p. 5-6).

Chaume's work on AVT stands apart from what is considered to be the mainstream in the field. He lists ten codes, the first being linguistic, the others non-linguistic by nature. Chaume suggests combining translation studies and film studies for the purpose of developing an "integrated" model for analyzing "rules" and "norms" that will form a sound basis for any kind of research into 'the signifying codes of cinematographic language'(Chaume, 2004, as cited in Munday, 2016, p. 283). In his discussion on the linguistic code, Chaume calls attention to one important point: problems that arise when translating

word play and culture-specific items in the source text, as well as difficulties involved in dealing with “multiple languages” are common to many other types of translation. In fact, these issues should not be regarded as peculiar to audiovisual translation alone. According to him, the characteristics of the linguistic code in audiovisual texts are such that they are generally converted into written form, but “written to be spoken as if not written”, which necessitates that the translator “conform to a similar register” (Chaume, 2004, as cited in Munday, 2016, p. 284).

The combination of “visual, auditory, text, and images” has special characteristics that have been a major focus of subtitling research since early years (Guillot, 2019, p. 34). In the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, AVT was often been discussed from a professional point of view, with most research addressing issues related to the mechanics of AVT, as well as to technical matters such as constraints of time and space, lip synchronization, spotting or cueing of subtitles, etc. But in recent years, topics of study have been expanding and diversifying significantly, a trend manifested by a remarkable move away from technical and linguistic aspects of AVT toward the societal and cultural parameters involved in it. The pioneering works of scholars like Susan Bassnett and André Lefevere (1998) have contributed significantly to raising consciousness about the interdependence between translation and culture. This has paved the way for bringing Translation Studies closer to the field of Cultural Studies. Notably, studies on AVT are marked by a stronger emphasis on the cultural aspect of AVT (Díaz Cintas, 2009, p. 8).

In recent years, a good deal of research on AVT has been noted by a new approach based on the way the language used in the translation of spoken word shapes or is shaped by social parameters such as “race, class, gender and economic status”, as well as “censorship and the manipulation and control of meaning by various institutions” (2009, p. 8). In the modern world, the media have permeated into every aspect of our lives, with the result that AVT has become not only a powerful platform for communicating information, but also an important instrument through “which the assumptions and values of a society are filtered and transferred to other cultures” (2009, p. 8). In fact, films and other audiovisual productions are now among the major ways of telling the audience about “commonplaces, stereotypes and manipulated views” (2009, p. 8), as well as about various segments of society (women, blacks, Arabs, homosexuals, religious minorities). Dubbing, voiceover, and subtitling become instrumental in making the audience aware of these perspectives, retaining the language of the original work (2009, p. 8).

4. Subtitling as a form of audiovisual translation

There are mainly two methods used for translating works produced for the screen: *subtitling* and *dubbing*. Subtitling is a visual technique that involves a written translation displayed on the screen, whereas dubbing is a technical and artistic procedure that relies on sound and hearing as a channel for translation (Chiaro, 2009, p. 141). Subtitling can be described as “a printed statement or fragment of dialogue appearing on the screen between the scenes of a silent motion picture or appearing as a translation at the bottom of the screen during the scenes of a motion picture or television show in a foreign language” (Merriam-Webster). Also called *captions*, subtitles can be briefly defined as “transcriptions of film or TV dialogue, presented simultaneously on the screen” (Gottlieb, 1998, p. 244-245). In the rendering of subtitles, translators often tend to create a more “faithful” translation, as the audience will always have access to the original in the form of spoken word (Sánchez, 2004, p. 12). Díaz Cintas (2013) and Remael (2007) introduced an elaborated definition of subtitling in their respective books:

a translation practice that consists of presenting a written text, generally on the lower part of the screen, that endeavours to recount the original dialogue of the speakers, as well as the discursive elements that appear in the image (letters, inserts, graffiti, inscriptions, placards and the like) and the information that is contained on the soundtrack (songs, voices off) (as cited in Guillot, 2019, p. 33).

To come up with an original term for subtitling, one that will eliminate oppositions such as literal/free translation, translation/adaptation, etc., the French translation scholar Yves Gambier introduced the term *transadaptation*. He did so in the hope that the new term would take target audiences into account more directly. So far, the term *transadaptation* has not found wide acceptance; even Gambier himself uses the terms ‘audiovisual’ and ‘screen’ translation more often (Munday, 2016, p. 277-278).

Among the first scholars who laid the foundations of *subtitling* as a subcategory of AVT is Roman Jakobson (1959), who classified translation into three categories: *intralingual* (rewording), *interlingual* (translation proper), and *intersemiotic* (transmutation, which includes subtitle translation). Intralingual subtitles, also called same language subtitles (SLS), are real time subtitles that are transcribed and displayed on screen just seconds after spoken words. This type of subtitling generally refers to television subtitles for the deaf or hard of hearing. Intralingual subtitles can also be accessed on an optional basis by immigrants, refugees, foreign students, and others –i.e. by people who have literacy problems (Vanderplank, 1988, as cited in Liu, 2014, p. 1105). Interlingual subtitling, on the other hand, involves a rendition from source language into target language. This form of subtitling is marked by three interrelated elements: “source text speech, written text, visual footage” (Guillot, 2019, p. 34). These three phenomena determine the process of interlingual subtitling: “representation through language, in cross-cultural mode” (p. 34). Another scholar working on AVT, Luis Pérez-González (2009) defined interlingual subtitling as a form of translation that aimed “to provide viewers with a written rendition of the source text speech, whether dialogue or narration, in their own language” (as cited in Guillot, 2019, p. 33). Interlingual subtitling is often characterized by “cultural a-synchrony”, which refers to cultural discordances related to source/target language and culture (Guillot, 2019, p. 36).

Katherina Reiss emphasized the importance of integrating into translation studies “the multimodal nature” of the original text. She proposed a text typology in which source texts are initially classified into three categories, namely, informative, expressive, and operative. In addition to these three text types, she introduced a fourth type, “audiomedial texts” as she called them. According to Reiss, this all-embracing category includes the kinds of texts that “are distinctive in their dependence on non-linguistic (technical) media and on graphic, acoustic, and visual kinds of expression. It is only in combination with them that the whole complex literary form realizes its full potential” (as cited in Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2021, p. 4), as in radio and television scripts, songs, musicals, operas, and stage plays. The Swedish translation scholar Jan Pedersen suggests that subtitles are an example of an ‘extra-diegetic translation technique’, (cf. e.g. Genette 1988 or Cronin 2010), which means that they are not part of the story, but necessary for the reader/viewer to comprehend it (2011, p. 8).

5. Technicalities of subtitle translation

Subtitling is more complicated than other kinds of translation because it takes place in different phases; namely “viewing, reading and note taking, segmentation of the original work, translation and synchronization, and finally, subtitles edition” (Talaván, 2016, p. 67). This form of AVT differs from other types of translation in that it has an “additive” aspect in itself. Emphasizing this particular feature of subtitling, the Danish translation scholar Henrik Gottlieb used the terms “diasemiotic” subtitling as it involves a transfer from one language to another, coupled with a change from verbal to written mode

of expression (as cited in Pérez-González, 2014, p. 16). Since written text is added to spoken words, subtitling gains a “diasemiotic” quality, a concept that can be defined as “the use of different channels, while the number of channels (one or more) is the same as in the original text” (p. 4). This is a feature that provides viewers with total access to the exotic original, while the communication of the spoken track is ensured by captions in the domestic language (Gottlieb, 2005, p. 21). For this kind of translation, Gottlieb (1994) also used the terms “diagonal” and “intermodal” subtitling, as opposed to the traditional “horizontal” transfer that takes place in interpreting (speech by speech) and in interlingual translation (written text by written text) (Munday, 2016, p. 277). He considered subtitling as a form of AVT that

operates within the confines of the film and TV media, and stays within the code of verbal language. The subtitler does not even alter the original; he or she adds an element, but does not delete anything from the audiovisual whole (Munday, 2016, p. 277).

In subtitling, the speech act - an utterance defined in terms of a speaker's intention and the effect it has on a listener - is always foregrounded; hence, intentions and effects take precedence over isolated lexical items. The pragmatic aspect of subtitling allows the subtitler to enjoy a certain degree of freedom in the use of language, keeping in mind that each subtitle should be “phrased” and “cued” as part of a broader “*polysemiotic framework” in order to ensure unhindered audience reception.

With regard to synchronization, the emerging and vanishing of the subtitles must occur at the same time as utterances of the characters; that is, the subtitle must become visible when the actors begin speaking and disappear when they stop and/or take a pause. This kind of synchronization necessitates that subtitles become a shortened version of the original dialogue. In fact, subtitlers do not make a literal and precise translation of the spoken dialogues, but rather they render a “reduction” and “condensation” of the messages presented in them. By so doing, subtitlers give viewers enough time to read the subtitles while at the same time seeing whatever appears on screen. To accomplish this, translators adopt a number of principles designed to determine the highest possible number of characters and spaces that can be fitted onto the screen in relation to the duration of each subtitle. Even though researchers have different views about the subject, and minor variations may occur due to the very nature of the medium in question (film, video, DVD...), subtitlers generally adopt a principle known as the “six-second rule”. This principle requires that the audience be able to read and process the message included in a two-line subtitle with a maximum of 35 characters and spaces each, in a matter of six seconds (Talaván, 2016, p. 67).

Subtitle translation is carried out in a few stages. At the outset, the subtitler/translator is often given a ‘dialogue list’ -a transcription of all the film's spoken words. Then, s/he decides which parts of the text should be cut off. Next, the subtitler analyzes the movie on “a viewing/editing table”, determining how long each phrase, sentence, and shot will remain on the screen to see when the titles should begin and end. This procedure is referred to as ‘*spotting’. The technical details involved differ depending on whether the subtitler is engaged in movie or videotape, but the basic principles remain the same:

- A single-line title requires at least two seconds’ viewing time.
- A double-line title requires at least four seconds.
- Never show a title for less than two seconds or more than six seconds.
- Make every title a clear statement. Avoid ambiguity (unless the ST is significantly ambiguous): viewers have little time to take in the message, and cannot turn back as they can with a book or a newspaper.

- Do not use “telegraphese” (a terse, abbreviated style of language used in telegrams): viewers rarely have time to work it out (Hervey and Higgins, 2002, p. 64-65).

6. Constraints involved in AVT and interlingual subtitling

AVT is marked by several restrictions that set it apart from other types of translation. In fact, subtitling is often referred to as “constrained translation” - a term first coined by Christopher Titford (Pedersen, 2011, p. 18). Most of the problems that one may encounter in translation proper can occur in subtitle translation as well. However, in subtitling, the problems might be of a different nature, for there are extra obstacles related to media that must be overcome (Nedergaard-Larsen, 1993, p. 212). As Titford puts it, all obstacles encountered during the subtitling process “derive essentially from the constraints imposed on the translator by the medium itself” (as cited in Díaz Cintas, 2004).

Subtitle translation is particularly difficult because visual and auditory messages are so tightly interwoven that they form a whole entity whose components cannot be separated. In this process, translation occurs solely on the verbal level; that is to say, the subtitler can only change the words of an audiovisual product. However, subtitling is closely linked with the film's visuals, which stay unchanged all the way through (Chiaro, 2009, p. 154-155). Dialogues in a film always occur in a certain context, and in AVT, this is a specific situation “in time, captured and frozen by the camera” (Díaz Cintas, 2009, p. 9). Hence, it would be inappropriate to make a translation merely at a linguistic level. When rendering words or phrases from one language to another, special consideration must be given to non-linguistic components such as gestures, visuals, music, etc.. (Chiaro, 2009, p. 163). The audience has to deal with a large amount of written text displayed on the screen, along with the visual and auditory material presented in the source language. Therefore, subtitling necessitates the reduction of dialogues in such a way that they can fit into brief captions emerging on the screen and remaining visible only for a short time. In fact, this reduction is necessary for viewers because they must have enough time to follow the action of the film while at the same time reading the captions. (Chiaro, 2009, p. 154-155; 230).

Subtitling does not consist in a total and detailed translation of the soundtrack. In fact, a thorough translation is neither necessary nor desirable because there is a constant interaction between the subtitle signs (captions) and the visual and oral codes of the film (Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 145). Subtitles can be no more than two lines. In television subtitling, captions often form one third of the soundtrack. In fact, the length of a subtitle is determined by the amount of time available, the speed of reading exercised by the viewer, and the speed at which the ST is actually uttered by the characters on the screen (p. 146). Reduction of the spoken word takes two forms: total reduction and partial reduction. Partial reduction is made through the strategy of condensation and a shorter translation of the ST, while ‘total reduction’ is carried out by deleting lexical elements. Subtitlers usually bring together the two procedures, which leads to rewriting, so characteristic of subtitling. After deciding on how much time and space are available for the translated text and feeling certain that the spoken word needs to be condensed, the subtitler goes on to “eliminate what is not relevant for the comprehension of the message, and/or reformulate what is relevant in as concise a form as is possible or required” (p. 146).

Another important constraint with subtitling is that, when rendering the spoken word, it may not always be possible to achieve one-to-one equivalence between cultural references in the source language and the specific manner in which they are communicated in the target language (Díaz Cintas, 2009, p. 8-9). In other fields that are closely related to AVT (e.g. drama translation or film remakes), some productions use “geographical relocation or new models of cultural hybridity” to close the cultural gap and to get the new audiences to become actively involved in what is being presented. By contrast, AVT always operates

under the constraint of the original production, which “lives on semiotically through images (and sound)” in the target culture (p. 9). The task of the translator is particularly difficult when rendering “identities and stereotypes” that are part of the source culture, for it may not always be possible to precisely convey in the target language “the locations and dislocations of identity that are present, whether explicitly or implicitly, in the source language” (p. 8-9).

Basically, subtitlers are confronted with three different types of difficulties: (1) culture-bound lexical items such as place names, references to sports and celebrations, famous personages, financial systems, institutions, and so on; (2) linguistic lexical items such as phrases of address, taboo language, etc.; (3) areas in which linguistic and cultural elements overlap such as songs, rhymes, jokes, etc. Obviously, the difficulties cited above can cause problems for interpreters and translators as well. However, in an audiovisual setting, viewers have the chance to compare what they see on screen (the visuals) with what they read in a subtitle. In a work of fiction, for example, regardless of the manner in which such aspects are transmitted to the target reader, the idea behind what has been depicted will stay in the reader's memory and imagination. However, in screen translation a large number of auditory and visual items are clearly visible on the screen, giving the translator little chance to act freely. This leads Díaz Cintas to call subtitling “vulnerable translation”. The rationale underlying the use of this label is that the audience has the chance to match soundtrack with subtitles, which causes this form of translation to become subjected to criticism by viewers who have a certain degree of familiarity with the original language. The audience can easily detect “what they perceive to be discrepancies, omissions and unexpected equivalents” (Chiaro, 2009, p. 154-155).

Writing to the same effect and adopting Juliane House's terminology (1981), Gottlieb states that “subtitling is an overt type of translation, retaining the original version, thus laying itself bare to criticism from everybody with the slightest knowledge of the source language” (as cited in Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 56-57). Having said this, however, Gottlieb argues that, in subtitle translation, constraints are not always obstacles to negotiate through; rather, they are “stepping stones in the river of transmission”. Working under a wide range of formal and textual constraints, the translator converts utterances that accompany visuals into condensed forms of expression to give maximum amount of “semantic and stylistic information” (1992, p. 166). According to Gottlieb, the subtitler (consciously or unconsciously) employs specific methods in this balancing act, yet as with any sort of translation, the purpose of adequacy - and much less equivalence - is not always achieved. In the process of translation, the subtitler employs various methods; yet, as with any other kind of translation, there are cases in which it proves rather difficult to achieve the objectives of adequacy and equivalence (p. 166). In the book chapter, ‘You Got the Picture? On the Polysemiotics of Subtitling Wordplay’, Gottlieb discusses the constraints involved in subtitle translation within the framework of the losses that take place in translating wordplay, as well as those that occur in any kind of translation. He argues that these losses are caused by three factors:

- (1) language-specific constraints: the presence of ‘untranslatable’ elements in the original which fail to have linguistic counterparts in the target language; (2) media-specific constraints: linked with the type of language transfer used, in this case subtitling; (3) human constraints: lack of talent, interest, or experience in the translator, time pressure, lack of incentives, etc. (1997, p. 216).

7. Various models for categorizing cultural references in subtitling

The term *culture* originated from the Latin words *cultus*, *cultura*, and *colere*, which mean *to nurse*, *to cultivate*, and *to care for*, respectively. Culture is a generic term that involves the social patterns of

behavior and values cherished by human societies, along with the knowledge, attitudes, goals, beliefs, arts, laws, customs, capabilities, practices, and habits of the people in these societies. Each text, whether spoken or written, is the outcome of a specific extralinguistic circumstance and is shaped by the cultural, historical, and social settings surrounding it. Accordingly, translation is the process of communicating messages across linguistic and cultural boundaries. (Pavlović and Poslek, 1998, p. 158-159).

Cultural references are culturally specific items that are “either exclusively or predominantly visual (an image of a local or national figure, a local dance, pet funerals, baby showers), exclusively verbal or else both visual and verbal in nature” (Chiaro, 2009, p. 156). Such references are always concerned with culturally relevant features such as geography, sociolinguistics, history etc. Naturally, a culture-specific item includes both verbal and non-verbal (visual and auditory) features that may constitute a barrier to communication between different cultures. This is primarily because culture-specific items are closely associated with materials or concepts peculiar to the film's "original sociocultural context", ones that suggest different connotations from similar objects and concepts in the target culture, or simply do not exist in it (Ramière, 2006, p. 155).

In the history of translation studies, various scholars have presented different kinds of taxonomies for classifying cultural references. In his seminal book *A Textbook of Translation* (1988), Newmark lists five cultural categories: (1) ecology; (2) material culture; (3) social culture; (4) organisations, customs, activities, procedures, concepts; (5) gestures and habits (p. 95). Another translation scholar, Nedergaard-Larsen (1993) proposes four cultural classifications: (1) Geography; (2) History; (3) Society (4) Culture. The Swedish translation scholar Jan Pedersen (2011) classifies what he calls 'Extralinguistic Cultural References' (ECRs) into twelve different groups: (1) Weights and measures; (2) Proper names; (3) Professional titles; (4) Food and beverages; (5) Literature; (6) Government; (7) Entertainment; (8) Education; (9) Sports; (10) Currency; (11) Technical material; (12) Other (Pedersen, 2011, p. 59 – 60). Pedersen claims that as there is so much interaction between cultural categories, a faultless taxonomy seems “utopian”. He further points out that certain domains in his categorization overlap with other domains, particularly those in the category of proper names and in some others -like government and education. Drawing on these classifications, our taxonomy of cultural references consists of six categories: (1) religious references, (2) historical and cultural references, (3) material culture, (4) proper names (personal names and geographical names), (5) address patterns, (6) professional titles.

8. Jan Pedersen's notion of extralinguistic cultural reference (ECR)

In his seminal work *Subtitling Norms for Television* (2011), Jan Pedersen discusses cultural references in two categories: Extralinguistic Cultural References (ECRs) and Intralinguistic Cultural References (ICRs). Pedersen describes ECRs as “references to people, places, customs, institutions, food etc. that are specific to a certain culture, and which you may not know even if you know the language in question” (2-3). More specifically, Pedersen (2011) defines an ECR

as a reference that is attempted by means of any cultural linguistic expression, which refers to an extralinguistic entity or process. The referent of the said expression may prototypically be assumed to be identifiable to a relevant audience as this referent is within the encyclopaedic knowledge of this audience (p. 43).

The other category - ICRs - involves expressions such as “idioms, proverbs, slang and dialects” (Pedersen, 2005, p. 2). ECRs have to do with anything that lies outside the realm of language, but when a person starts talking about them, they need to use a linguistic sign that is part of the language, one that

is related in meaning to other linguistic signs. Even though ECRs are extralinguistic, they are still communicated through words. Since there is no other way of expressing ECRs than using linguistic items; they are intralinguistic in all situations. What is extralinguistic about an ECR is “the entity it refers to” in a given context. By their very nature, ECRs are part of culture, but culture is a more comprehensive concept than ECRs. In fact, culture is a broad notion that encompasses “intralinguistic culture, value systems, text selection, belief systems, paralinguistics and so much more” (Pedersen, 2011, p. 48).

9. Strategies for translating cultural references in subtitling

One of the major challenges that translators are supposed to cope with is to implement appropriate strategies for rendering cultural references. In their discussion on this topic, Hatim and Mason point out that translators must possess “not only bilingual ability but also bi-cultural vision. Translators mediate between cultures (including ideologies, moral systems and sociocultural structures); seeking to overcome those incompatibilities which stand in the way of transfer of meaning” (Hatim & Mason, 1990, p. 223). Another problem involved in rendering cross-cultural elements has to do with the cultural incongruity between what appears on the screen and the target audience's reception – their “pragmatic expectations and perceptual frames” as produced by the subtitled text (Guillot, 2019, p. 41). In fact, translating cultural references is rather difficult in all kinds of translations, but it is all the more so in the translation of subtitles. In other kinds of translation, there are strategies such as footnotes, glosses, etc. that can be employed to clarify cultural references, whereas in subtitle translation it is not possible to use any of these strategies.

Over the last few decades, several translation scholars have proposed various taxonomies involving different kinds of strategies that can be employed for rendering subtitles. By their very nature, these categories have certain features in common. (Cintas and Remael, 2007, p. 201). The Italian translation scholar Rachele Antonini introduced three main procedures that the translator must perform in order to produce efficient subtitles: elimination, rendering and condensation. The strategy of elimination is at work when the translator changes the form of the source-text message by removing certain items from the original utterance (e.g. hesitations, false starts, redundancies, etc.) without changing the basic message being communicated. Apart from deleting part of the source text, the translator cuts off any information that can be grasped from what is seen on the screen (e.g. a particular facial expression or gesture). The strategy of rendering, on the other hand, involves handling (often deleting) certain aspects of discourse such as “slang, dialect and taboo language”. The third strategy, condensation, suggests simplifying and dividing the original syntax into smaller parts to ensure an easier reading (Chiaro, 2009, p. 148). Henrik Gottlieb (1992) suggested an elaborate taxonomy involving ten subtitling strategies: transfer, imitation, transcription, deletion, expansion, paraphrase, dislocation, condensation, decimation, and resignation (p. 166). In a similar vein, Birgit Nedergaard-Larsen (1993) proposed a set of strategies for translating cultural references in subtitles; namely, verbatim transfer, culturally neutral explicitation, paraphrase, target language adaptation. Also, the Polish translation scholar Teresa Tomaszkiwicz (2001) introduced a number of strategies for rendering subtitles: omission, transfer direct, adaption, substitution. Another model for the translation of cultural references in subtitles was suggested by Jan Pedersen (2011), who proposed a comprehensive taxonomy subdivided into two categories. Each of the subdivisions is composed of six strategies: ST-oriented procedures (retention, specification, and direct translation); TT-oriented procedures (generalization, substitution, and omission). Among the taxonomies formulated for subtitle translation, the strategies proposed by Díaz Cintas and Aline Remael (2007), and Santamaria Guinot (2001) have been found to be one of the most elaborate, hence selected for this study. The scholars proposed a full-fledged categorization comprised

of 11 strategies: (1) loan, (2) calque, (3) explicitation, (4) substitution, (5) transposition, (6) lexical recreation, (7) compensation, (8) omission, (9) addition, (10) condensation, (11) reformulation.

(1) A *loanword* is employed when a word or phrase is transferred to the target text as it is, mostly because both languages use the same word and there is no way to translate it. The strategy of keeping cultural references untouched in subtitles tends to be common practice in subtitling, which gives rise to concerns about “comprehensibility” (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 205). Examples include words and phrases regarding food, drinks, place names, historical events, etc. (for instance; muffin, bergamot, and baklava.)

(2) *Calque (loan translation)* is a literal translation of an original word or phrase - a strategy that is employed “when there is no exact equivalent in the target language” (Ranzato, 2016, p. 82). [e.g., deep state (derin devlet), honeymoon (balayı), skyscraper (gökdelen), white collar (beyaz yaka) etc.]

(3) *Explicitation* refers to the process of bringing the target audience closer to the subtitle either through specification or generalization. ‘Specification’ involves the use of a hyponym (a word or phrase with a more specific meaning) in rendering the original ECR. This can be done in several ways; among these techniques, two are the most common. Sometimes, the translator leaves the cultural reference untranslated, but adds information that is not present in the source text. Alternatively, the translator replaces a more general cultural reference in the source text by a specific cultural reference in the target language. In the process of ‘Generalization’, on the other hand, the subtitler substitutes a hypernym for the original item; i.e. a superordinate term (a word with a broader meaning that makes the reference more transparent). For instance, daisy and rose are hyponyms for flowers, while colour is a hypernym for red (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 203).

(4) *Substitution* describes a situation in which technical constraints make it necessary to employ a word or phrase that is somewhat different from the original reference. This strategy is regarded as a different form of explicitation, a procedure by which a long reference that can be rendered literally is replaced by a shorter one to save space and reading time (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 204). For example, general references in English such as ‘fried flour’ and ‘fried fish’ can be “chunked down” (Chiaro, 2009, p. 157) to ‘gözleme’ and ‘tavada hamsi’ in Turkish (a type of food that is typically Turkish), respectively. In this procedure, a general expression in the source language is replaced by a hyponym (a more specific reference) in the target language. Conversely, ‘Spaghetti Carbonara’ and ‘Fettuccine Alfredo’, typically Italian foods, can be “chunked up” (p. 157) to Turkish as makarna. This is a procedure by which a CSR in the target language is rendered more general than the one in the source language through the use of hyperonymy. There is a third procedure called “chunking sideways” (p. 158), through which a CSR is substituted for by an equivalent item in the target culture, one that is neither more general nor more specific than the original. For instance, the famous Mexican dish ‘fajita’ (a specific cultural reference in SL) can be matched by ‘biberli et sote’ in Turkish (a specific reference in TL); or, the Italian food pasta (a general cultural reference in SL) is rendered into Turkish as makarna (a general reference in TL).

(5) *Transposition* is the process of replacing a cultural notion that is part of one culture by a notion from another. This strategy is used in cases where the audience cannot understand the cultural reference if loan or calque are employed, or where the strategy of explicitation cannot be used due to lack of space (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 204). Sándor Hervey & Ian Higgins describe this strategy as “the various degrees of departure from literal translation that one may resort to in the process of transferring the contents of a ST into the context of the target culture” (2002, p. 28). The strategy of cultural

transposition aims to produce translations with notions that are less exotic and more comprehensible to target readers. This strategy also suggests a certain degree of explanation or clarification. Transposition produces the best result when the notions being rendered aren't too different from each other. Measurements and currencies are frequently, but not always, adapted to the target culture's system (5.3.4.4); for instance, 'the British department store Marks & Spencer' might be replaced by the 'Dutch HEMA' (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 204).

(6) *Lexical recreation* refers to a procedure in which the translator produces a newly coined word or expression that is acceptable in the target language. The use of this strategy is particularly appropriate when the character in the scene utters a word or phrase made up in the SL. In this case, a correspondence can be achieved by using a made-up word in the subtitle. For instance, the Spanish neologism *rarezametro* [oddity-meter] can be translated into English as 'weird shit-o-meter' (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 206).

(7) *Compensation* is a strategy that comes into play when the subtitler attempts to make up for a loss in one utterance by making an overtranslation or addition in another situation (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 206). Ian Higgins and Sándor Hervey (2002) define translation loss as "non-replication of the ST in the TT - that is, the inevitable loss of culturally relevant features which are specific to the SL and the source culture", ones that "make the ST what it is" (p. 21). They point out that this procedure is applied "where any conventional translation (whether literal or otherwise) would entail an unacceptable translation loss, (*which*) is reduced by the freely chosen introduction of a less unacceptable one, such that important ST effects are rendered approximately in the TT by means other than those used in the ST" (p. 43). Though widely employed in subtitling, compensation is not always feasible due to the necessity of achieving synchrony between spoken dialogue and written track (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 206).

(8) *Omission*, one of the most common strategies in subtitle translation, is used due to the lack of a corresponding reference in the target language or because of the restrictions of time and space in the audiovisual setting. For instance, rendering references to ranks or occupational positions - e.g. with the police force or in medical circles - can be very hard to translate, which may necessitate the use of elimination as the last resort (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 206). Subtitlers must try to answer a few questions before applying the strategy of omission: "Will viewers be able to comprehend the message or scene with little difficulty, and is there any possibility that they may misunderstand it?". In line with these questions, subtitlers must recognize the difference between what is necessary and what isn't (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 162).

(9) The strategy of *addition*, which is often used for the purpose of clarification, is applied in situations where target viewers cannot understand a cultural reference in the source text. In such cases, an extra word or phrase is inserted in order to ensure that the idea behind the original reference is clearly comprehended (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 207). For example, in the phrase "you can send him to the chair," the word "chair" is rendered into Turkish as "elektirikli sandalye" to preclude comprehension problems. It must be noted, however, that this strategy is not widely used in subtitling as it causes the target text to be extended further.

(10) *Condensation* refers to the partial shortening of the text to be translated at lexical, phrasal, or syntactic level to present the source-text message in a more compact manner (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 146, 151).

(11) *Reformulation* refers to a procedure in which the subtitle describes an ECR in a totally different way. A case in point is translating idioms or proverbs that do not have direct correspondence in other languages (Díaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, p. 150). Subtitlers should try to be creative in reformulating spoken words, particularly in rendering idioms or cultural references (Talaván, 2016, p. 45).

Analysis of the ECRs selected from *Diriliş: Ertuğrul*

For practical purposes, the tables below have been designed in such a way as to include a limited number of samples selected from the film, which have been presented alongside the strategies and categories associated with the references.

Table 1. Loanword (no change / partial change)

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(1) Zülfikardan ayrı kılıç ... olmaz.	There's no sword other than Zulfiqar ...	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	Religious References
(2) Hadi bismillah , buğur	Come on, Bismillah . Eat up.	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(3) Alpi diri tutan avdır.	... hunting keeps the Alps fit.	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	Historical & Cultural References
(4) Sonra onların adını kullanarak diğer Türkmen obalarından biat topladılar.	... then used their names to get support from other Turkmen tribes for an uprising.	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(5) Halep'te tanıştığımız Bedevinin adı neydi?	What was the name of Bedouin we met in Aleppo?	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(6) Yani Kayılar	I mean Kayis	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(7) Karatoygarın Selçuklu sarayında üst düzey vazife alması bize rahat nefes aldıracaktır.	Karatoygar becoming a high officer in the Seljuk court will relieve us.	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(8) Şerbet	Sherbet	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	Material Culture
(9) Burası Halep , Burası Bağdat , Burası da Sultanın sarayının olduğu Konya .	This is Aleppo . This is Baghdad .. And this is Konya , where the Sultan's palace is.	Loanword: Aleppo (<i>partial change</i>); Baghdad (<i>partial change</i>); Konya (<i>no change</i>)	Proper Names (Personal Names & Geographical Names)
(10) Halime Abla'nın çadırını taşladılar.	They stoned Halime Abla's tent.	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(11) Ahlat	Ahlat	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(12) Sultan Alâeddin	Sultan Aladdin	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(13) Selahaddin Eyyubi	Saladin Ayyubi	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(14) Endülüs	Andalusia	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(15) Sultan İzzettin Kılıçarslan	Sultan Izzeddin Kilicarslan	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	

(16) Şah İbrahim Ethem misali tacı tahtı terk edip ermek midir muradın?	Is your desire leaving behind the throne like Shah İbrahim ibn Adham and to reach enlightenment?	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(17) Leyla Sultan	Leila Sultan	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(18) Musa'yı Nil 'den..	... Moses from the Nile ...	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(19) Eyüp 'ü yarasını kemiren kurttan...	... Hiob from the worms eating his wounds ...	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(20) Şeyh Efendi	Sheikh Efendi	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	Address Patterns
(21) Halime Abla 'nın çadırını taşladılar.	They stoned Halime Abla 's tent.	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(22) Bu adam benim emmi dediğim...	This man is someone who I call Emmi ...	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(23) Turgut abi	Turgut Agabey	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(24) Üstad	Ustad	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	Professional Titles
(25) ... Burası da Sultanın sarayının olduğu Konya.	And this is Konya, where the Sultan 's palace is.	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(26) Süleyman Bey	Suleyman Bey	Loanword (<i>no change</i>)	
(27) Şehzade	Shahzade	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(28) Halep Emiri	Ameer of Aleppo	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(29) Halife	Khalifa	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(30) Şeyh Efendi	Sheikh Efendi	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	
(31) Şah İbrahim Ethem misali tacı tahtı terk edip ermek midir muradın?	Is your desire leaving behind the throne like Şah İbrahim ibn Adham and to reach enlightenment?	Loanword (<i>partial change</i>)	

In line with its religious atmosphere, *Resurrection: Ertugrul (Diriliş: Ertuğrul)* includes a good many ECRs related to religious beliefs and customs. Notably, some of these ECRs have been rendered through loanwords. As previously stated, a loanword refers to a word or phrase adopted from a foreign language with little or no modification. In the translation of the expression 'Bismillah' in extract 2, the subtitler has left the ECR untouched, which is a typical example of a loanword used with no change. An alternative rendering of the ECR (e.g. 'I begin by the name of God') would make the message more understandable to the target audience. Yet, this kind of translation may be considered impractical due to limitations of space in subtitling. Similarly, In extract 8, the ECR 'şerbet' has been transliterated into English as 'sherbet', which is a typical example of a loanword used with partial change. Alternatively, this ECR could be translated as 'sweetened fruit juice', which would be self-explanatory to the target audience. However, such a descriptive rendering of the original word could be problematic due to restrictions of space on the screen. Likewise, in extracts 22-23, the strategy of loanword is employed in two ways: 'emmi' (no change) or 'agabey' (partial change).

Table 2. Calque

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(32) Sabah ezanı yla birlikte Halep'e yola koyulacağız.	We shall set on the road to Aleppo at the morning prayer .	Calque	Religious References
(33) Müşrikler de peşindedir.	The heretics were after them.	Calque	
(34) Parmağındaki zihgir, ... kefereye ok atmaktan yıpranmış.	The ring on your thumb. ... your thumb is damaged due to shooting arrows to infidels .	Calque	
(35) Gücüm de imanımdadır .	My power is in my belief .	Calque	
(36) Hepimiz Tanrı'nın kuzusu uğruna çarpışan havariler gibiyiz.	We are all like apostles fighting for God's lamb	havariler (calque)- Tanrı'nın kuzusu God's lamb – calque	
(37) El Adil olan, El Müntekim olan, El Kahhar olan, El Rahman olan Allah'ın adıyla...	In the name of God Who is The Just, The Avenger, The Prevailer, and The most Gracious...	Calque	
(38) Halis bir mümin	Devoted believer	Calque	
(39) Babamı bu obada beyliği için bizi tehlike görenler öldürdü.	Your father was killed by those who see us as a threat to their seignior .	Calque	
(40) Göçerlerin çileli hayat hikâyelerini, kahramanlık destanlarını , onun ağzından dinleyelim...	We shall listen to the myths, stories and sagas of the nomads from him...	Calque	
(41) Yeni yurdumuz şerefine Alpler kılıç kalkan oynasın...	The Alps shall play sword and shields in the honor of our new land...	Calque	
(42) Endülüüs diye bir boy mu vardır?	Is there a clan called Andalusia?	Calque	
(43) ... heybeyi aç	... bring the saddlebag	Calque	Material Culture
(44) Pekmez getirdim baba.	I brought you molasses , father.	Calque	
(45) Parmağındaki zihgir	The ring on your thumb	Calque	
(46) ... biz de seni ne ersiz bıraktık ne de pusatsız we never let you be without soldiers or weapons .	Calque	
(47) Burası da Şam .	And this is Damascus .	Calque	Proper Names (Personal Names & Geographical Names)
(48) Kudüs 'ümüziün kurtuluşu için tarikatımızın servetini harcamaktan da çekinmemeliyiz.	We should not refrain from using our order's wealth to save Jerusalem .	Calque	
(49) Biz, birimiz ölüme giderken öteki ardından baksın ... diye mi kan kardeşi olduk zamanında?	Did we become blood brother(s) for one to stay behind ... while the other one is going for a certain death?	Calque	Address Patterns
(50) Yakup Nebi	Prophet Jacob	Calque	Professional Titles
(51) Atabey Şehabettin Tuğrul	Vizier Sahabettin Tuğrul	Calque	

One of the major strategies used to deal with ECRs is calque (loan translation), which is a source-oriented modality. Calque is a literal translation of a foreign word or phrase, the original expression

being rendered and incorporated into another language. It is a strategy that is employed "when there is no exact equivalent in the target language". In fact, calque is considered to be a 'non-creative' strategy as it does not require any real effort to convey the ECR to the target audience in a creative manner. The table above includes quite a few examples of calque; among them several can be selected for comment. Each of the calques in the table creates an idea/image in the mind of the target-text audience similar to the one created in the mind of the source-text audience. In extract 32, the subtitler has followed the source-text form as closely as possible and literally translated the ECR 'sabah ezanı' as 'the morning prayer' - a typical example of calque. Damascus (extract 47) and Jerusalem (extract 48) are examples for a different type of calque: they are proper names that match 'Şam' and 'Kudüs', respectively.

Table 3. Explication (Generalization & Specification)

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(52) Zülcelali vel ikram	The One Who Blesses	Generalization	Religious References
(53) İbnü'l Arabî'nin bir hayır duasını almak istemiştim.	I wanted a blessing from Ibn Arabî.	Generalization	
(54) Efendimiz Hz. Muhammed S.A.V. Efendimizin şefaati	For our Great Prophet Mohammed's assistance	Generalization	
(55) Dergâhta bekleyenlerimiz vardır	People are waiting for us at the lodge .	Generalization	
(56) Tevhithaneyeye geçelim.	We should go to the hall .	Generalization	
(57) Çaresiz kaldıkça, Rabbin El-Kadir olduğunu hatırla.	As you get desperate, remember that God is The Ultimate Decider .	Generalization	
(58) Aç kaldıkça, O'nun Er-Rezzak olduğunu tekrar et kendine.	While you starve, recite that He is The Giver of Prosperity .	Generalization	
(59) Ümmet-i Muhammed	The Muslim world	Generalization	
(60) Efendimiz Hz. Muhammed S.A.V. 'in şefaati	For our Great Prophet Mohammed's assistance	Generalization	
(61) Beylerin basireti bağlanmış.	The elders are having a dumb moment.	Generalization	Historical & Cultural References
(62) Bana verdiğin beratı Halep'e götürmem lazım, Baba.	I need to take the signed letter back to Aleppo, father.	Generalization	
(63) Burası aynı zamanda Süleyman Şah'ın mahremidir .	This place is also the private quarters of our Suleyman Shah.	Generalization	
(64) Sonra onların adını kullanarak diğer Türkmen obalarından biat topladılar.	... then used their names to get support from other Turkmen tribes for an uprising.	Generalization	
(65) Rabbim kimseyi evladü iyaliyle imtihan etmesin.	May God never test anyone with their children .	Specification	
(66) Bu kandiller neden yanmıyor?	Why are these oil lamps not lit?	Generalization	Material Culture
(67) Gamlı baykuş gibi tüner, durur otağında .	He just sits in his tent like a worrier not a warrior	Generalization	
(68) Burada kara gündeki ak akçe bitmiştir.	Even our money for bad days is finished.	Generalization	
(69) 72 parça yemeni	72 pieces of kerchief	Generalization	
(70) Şehzadem, börkünüz .	My Shahzade, your cap .	Generalization	
(71) Getirdin mi basmaları ?	Did you bring the drapes ?	Specification	

The strategy of Explicitation falls into two categories: Generalization and Specification. ‘Generalization’ refers to a procedure in which the subtitler uses a more general or neutral lexical item in the target language for an ECR that has a more specific meaning in the source language. For instance, the subtitler's rendering of the ECR ‘El-Kadir’ (excerpt 57) as ‘the Ultimate Decider’ is a typical example of generalization, which suggests the use of a word or phrase that sounds more general than the ECR in the source text. Here, an alternative strategy might be to literally translate the ECR as ‘All powerful, Almighty’ - another example of calque. Similarly, in extract 68, the subtitler has translated the word ‘akçe’ as ‘money’, replacing the source-text ECR by a word with a broader meaning. Another form of explicitation, ‘Specification’ refers to replacing a general source-text ECR by a more precise and concrete word or phrase in translation. For example, in extract 65 the ECR ‘evladü iyal’ is an Ottoman Turkish word that means ‘children and wives’. However, the subtitler has translated this ECR as ‘children’, thus limiting the scope of the original phrase. This is a typical example of ‘specification’, a strategy based on narrowing down the potential connotations of a general lexical item into a specific one. Likewise, in extract 71, the subtitler has rendered the ECR ‘Basma’ as ‘Drape’, using a specific lexical item. Here, the word ‘basma’ could be matched by a general word like ‘cloth’, which would be an example of generalization.

Table 4. Addition

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(72) Ali'den gayrı yiğit olmaz.	... and no valiant other than His Holiness Ali.	Addition	Religious References
(73) Allah rızası için El Fatiha.	For God's mercy... recite Al Fatiha prayer.	Addition	

Though not widely used in subtitling, the strategy of addition is sometimes employed to make sure that the target audience will clearly understand the meaning of an otherwise ambiguous ECR in the spoken track. In excerpt 72, the subtitler has rendered the proper name ‘Ali’ into the target language by adding the expression ‘Holiness’ to let the target viewer know that Ali is a blessed person in Islam. Likewise, when dealing with the ECR ‘El Fatiha’ in excerpt 73, the subtitler has used the expression ‘prayer’ as an extra word to indicate that ‘El Fatiha’ is a holy verse from the Koran.

Table 5. Omission & Condensation & Compensation

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(74) Babanı bu obada beyliği için bizi tehlike görenler öldürdü.	Your father was killed by those who see us as a threat to their seigniory.	Omission / Condensation	Historical & Cultural References
(75) Elin kevaşesi	Outsider	Omission /Condensation	Address Patterns
(76) Amin. Ya Şafi. Rabbim şifalar ihsan buyurur inşallah.	Amen. She shall recover. May God bestow a speedy recovery upon her.	Omission + Compensation	
(77) Rabbim kimseyi evladü iyaliyle imtihan etmesin. Ederse de Eyüp sabrı nasip etsin.	May God never test anyone with their children. If He does, may He grant them the patience to overcome the pain.	Omission	Proper Names (Personal Names & Geographical Names)

One of the most widely used procedures in subtitle translation is the strategy of omission, which can be defined as leaving out one word or several words in the target text because they are redundant or

misleading. This strategy is often applied due to cultural differences between the source and target language. In extract 74, the ECR ‘oba’ has been omitted from the subtitle probably because the use of the word ‘seigniority’ is considered to eliminate the necessity of searching for a word in TL that corresponds to ‘oba’. This is also a good example of ‘condensation’; i.e. a concise rendering of the sound track. The omission device is at work once again in the rendering of the expression ‘elin kevaşesi’ in excerpt 75. The subtitler has translated this ECR with the word ‘outsider’, choosing not to render the word ‘kevaşe’ at all (arguably because it is an obscene word). If the strategy of omission were not used, the sense behind the word ‘kevaşe’ could be conveyed euphemistically through an expression like ‘indecent woman’. Similarly, in extract 77, the proper name ‘Eyüp’ has been omitted from the subtitle. In the source culture, Eyüp is believed to have been a prophet known for his patience; in fact, there is an expression in Turkish as ‘Eyüp Sabrı’, which means ‘Eyüp’s patience’. When dealing with this ECR, the subtitler has deleted the proper name, yet tried to communicate the sense behind this expression with the word ‘patience’. Sometimes, the strategy of omission is supplemented by the technique of ‘compensation’, as a result of the attempt to make up for any kind of loss that may occur in translation. A case in point is the rendering of the ECR ‘Ya Şafi’ in excerpt 76. Here, the translator has used the expression ‘She shall recover’ to compensate for the absence of ‘Ya Şafi’ in translation.

Table 6. Transposition

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(78) Selamün aleyküm Aleyküm selam	Peace be upon you And peace be upon you	Transposition	Religious References
(79) Bundan sonrası takdiri ilahi	It is up to God from now on	Transposition	
(80) Yusuf Aleyhisselam da bir rüya görmüştü.	His highness Joseph also had a dream.	Transposition	Address Patterns
(81) Hz. Peygamber’in dostu, Hazreti Ebu Bekir hicret ederken...	While his highness the Prophet and his highness Abu Bakr was migrating...	Transposition	Professional Titles

The strategy of transposition is at work when a cultural item in the source language is subtitled into an equivalent cultural concept in the target language. For instance, in the translations of the ECRs ‘Selamün aleyküm, Aleyküm selam’ (Peace be upon you / And peace be upon you - extract 78) and ‘takdiri ilahi’ (It is up to God - extract 79), the subtitler has applied the strategy of transposition, transplanting the ECRs into the target culture. In fact, the English versions of the ECRs presented in the table above represent a typically target-oriented approach manifested in the use of expressions peculiar to the target language and culture. Another example is the ECR ‘Aleyhisselam’ (excerpt 80), which has been replaced by a cultural reference familiar to target viewers. Here, the subtitler has adapted the ECR to target norms, translating it with the word ‘highness’, an expression that is part of the target language and culture.

Table 7. Substitution

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(82) O ancak yarınki toydan çıkar.	That can only be decided on the headquarter(s) tomorrow.	Substitution (chunked up)	
(83) Sonra onların adını kullanarak diğer Türkmen	... then used their names to get support from other Turkmen tribes for an uprising	Substitution (chunking sideways)	

obalarından biat topladılar.			Historical & Cultural References
(84) Oğuz Kavlince yeni yurdumuza yürüyeceğiz!	... as an Oğuz tribe , we shall walk to our new homeland.	Substitution (chunked up)	
(85) Akçe	Coins	Substitution (chunked up)	
(86) Süleyman Şah'ın otağı	Suleyman Shah's marquee	Substitution (chunking sideways)	Material Culture
(87) Ocağımız size her zaman açık	Our tents are always open for you	Substitution (chunked down)	
(88) Sabah aşına gel	Come to the breakfast table	Substitution (chunked down)	
(89) Turgut'un yavuklusu	Turgut'un sweetheart	Substitution (chunking sideways)	Address Patterns
(90) Rahman ve Rahim olan Allah'ın adıyla	... in the name of God, most Merciful and most Graceful	Substitution (chunking sideways)	
(91) Sen şimdi ... emirlerin sarayını boş ver de...	Let go of the palaces of ... and khans...	Substitution (chunking sideways)	
(92) Yaverin kendini kurtarmak için çırpırır.	Your head of guard is struggling to save himself.	Substitution (chunked up)	Professional Titles
(93) Bir otak başını soracaktım.	I wanted to ask about a sergeant.	Substitution (chunked down)	
(94) Efendi Titus.	Commander Titus	Substitution (chunked down)	
(95) Allameye bak!	Look at the scholar	Substitution (chunked down)	

The strategy of substitution represents a situation in which the subtitler replaces an ECR in the spoken track by a cultural item in TL that has a meaning similar to the SL cultural item. When dealing with the ECR 'akçe' in excerpt 85, the translator has used the strategy of substitution (chunking up the ECR), matching it with the 'word 'coin(s)', its functional equivalent' in the target language. Conversely, in extract 87, the subtitler has translated the word 'ocak' as 'tent', thus replacing a general ECR in the source language by a specific word in the target language. This is a typical example of substitution in the form of chunking down the ECR, a strategy used for the purpose of adapting the source-text ECR to the target culture. On the other hand, in excerpt 86, the subtitler has employed the strategy of substitution (chunking sideways): the ECR 'otağ' has been rendered into English as 'marquee' -the functional equivalent of the ECR in the target culture.

Table 8. Reformulation

SOUND TRACK	SUBTITLE	STRATEGY	CATEGORY
(96) Deli Demir	Wild Demir	Reformulation	Address Patterns

Reformulation describes a strategy in which the subtitler significantly changes the form of the ECR while keeping its original meaning unchanged. A case in point is the rendering of the ECR 'Deli' in extract 96 with the word 'Wild', where the subtitler might have been motivated by the desire to express the idea behind the source-text ECR in a completely different way.

10. Conclusion

Besides the technical constraints arising from the very nature of subtitling, translators need to deal with differences between the source and target culture, which may give rise to misunderstandings if distortions occur in transfer. As with other types of translation, rendering cultural references is one of the major challenges in audiovisual translation. In order to cope with potential problems, various translation strategies have been proposed - among them the categorization formulated by Díaz Cintas, Aline Remael, and Santamaria Guinot. *Diriliş: Ertuğrul (Resurrection: Ertugrul)*, involves a large number of ECRs, the translation of which is likely to pose special problems. In this study, the above-mentioned taxonomy of strategies has been applied to the subtitles in the film series to find out the subtitler's basic orientation in translating the ECRs in the spoken track. Correspondences have been established between these strategies and the subtitler's methods of dealing with problems related to translating ECRs. The analysis of the ECRs taken from the film series has revealed that the subtitler generally followed the norms of target language and culture through various receptor-oriented strategies: *explicitation, substitution, transposition, reformulation, addition, omission, condensation, and compensation*. Along with this predominant tendency, the subtitler also employed source-oriented strategies (*loanword* and *calque*), which created an exoticizing effect. In the subtitles under discussion, no example has been found for the strategy of *lexical recreation*.

References

- Chaume, F. (2004). Film studies and translation studies: Two disciplines at stake in audiovisual translation. *Meta*, 49(1), 12–24. <https://doi.org/10.7202/009016ar>
- Chiaro, D. (2009). Issues in audiovisual translation. In J. Munday (Ed.), *The Routledge companion to translation studies* (pp. 141-163). Oxon, Routledge.
- Díaz-Cintas, J. & Remael, A. (2007). *Audiovisual translation: subtitling*. Manchester: St Jerome Publishing.
- Díaz Cintas, J. (2008). Audiovisual translation comes of age. In Chiaro, D., Heiss, C., and Bucaria, C. (Eds.), *Between text and image: Updating research in screen translation* (pp. 1–9). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Díaz Cintas, J. (Ed.). (2009). *New trends in audiovisual translation*. Multilingual Matters.
- Díaz-Cintas, J. & Remael, A. (2021). *Subtitling: concepts and practices*. Routledge.
- Gottlieb, H. (1992). Subtitling - A new university discipline. In C. Dollerup, & A. Loddegaard (Eds.), *Teaching translation and interpreting: Training, talent and experience* (pp. 161-169). Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
- Gottlieb, H. (1997). You got the picture? On the polysemiotics of subtitling wordplay. In D. Delabastita (edt.), *Essays on punning and translation*. Routledge: London&New York.
- Gottlieb, H. (1998). Subtitling. In M. Baker (edt.), *Routledge encyclopaedia of translation studies* (pp. 244-248). London: Routledge.
- Gottlieb, H. (2005). *Multidimensional Translation: Semantics turned Semiotics*. MuTra 2005 – Challenges of Multidimensional Translation: Conference Proceedings. (pp.1-29).
- Guillot, Marie-Noëlle (2019). Subtitling on the cusp of its futures. In Luis Pérez-González (edt.), *The routledge handbook of audiovisual translation*.
- Hatim, B. & Mason, I. (1990). *Discourse and the translator*. Longman: London&New York.
- Higgins, I. & Herve, S. (2002). *Thinking French translation: A course in translation method: French to English*. Routledge: London and New York.
- Internet: <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/subtitle> retrieved on February 01, 2022.

- Katan, D. (2003) *Translating cultures: An introduction for translators, interpreters and mediators*, Routledge: London & New York.
- Liu, D. (2014). On the classification of subtitling. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, Vol. 5, No. 5, pp. 1103-1109.
- Munday, J. (2016). *Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications*. Routledge: New York.
- Nedergaard-Larsen, B. (1993). Culture-bound problems in subtitling. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 1:2, 207-240.
- Palumbo, G. (2009). *Key terms in translation studies*. Continuum.
- Pavlovic, N. & Poslek, D. (1998). British and Croatian culture-specific concepts in translation. In J. Ciglar-Zanic (Ed.), *British cultural studies: Cross-cultural challenges* (pp.157-168). Zagreb: The British Council Croatia.
- Pedersen, J. (2005). How is culture rendered in subtitles? In MuTra Conference Proceedings. Retrieved September 5, 2022, from http://www.euroconferences.info/proceedings/2005_Proceedings/2005_Pedersen_Jan.pdf
- Pedersen, J. (2011). *Subtitling norms for television: An exploration focussing on extralinguistic cultural references*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.
- Pérez-González, L. (2014). *Audiovisual translation: Theories, methods and issues*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Ramière N. (2006). Reaching a foreign audience: Cultural transfers in audiovisual translation. *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 152-166.
- Ranzato, I. (2016). *Translating culture specific references on television: The case of dubbing*. London & New York: Routledge.
- Sánchez, D. (2004). Subtitling methods and team-translation. In Pilar Orero (Ed). *Topics in audiovisual translation*. (9-17). John Benjamins Publishing.
- Talaván, N. (2016). *A university handbook on terminology and specialized translation*. Universidad Nacional de Educación a Distancia Madrid.
- Valentini, C. (2008). Forlì 1 – the forlì corpus of screen translation exploring macrostructures. In Delia Chiaro, Christine Heiss & Chiara Bucaria (Eds.), *Between text and image: Updating research in screen translation* (pp. 37-50).

Endnote

*The term ‘polysemiotic’ refers to the presence of two or more parallel channels of discourse constituting the text in question. The most prominent polysemiotic text type is the audiovisual text, defined by Chaume as “a semiotic construct comprising several signifying codes that operate simultaneously in the production of meaning” (Chaume, 2004, p. 16).

**‘Spotting’, is an operation in subtitling, where the translator has to calculate the time at which the subtitles will appear and disappear from the screen, so that the subtitles are synchronized with the audio.