# An Attempt to Understand Islamic Arts with Deconstruction

Araştırma Makalesi

Gelis Tarihi: 20 Ocak 2024 Kabul Tarihi: 05 Haziran 2024

### Yasar Özrili

Dr. / PhD. https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4495-0705 yozrili@gmail.com

#### Öz

Yapısöküm bir bütünü yok etmek değil, onun nasıl inşa edildiğini anlamaktır. Önce onu parçalara ayırmak ve sonra bütünü anlamaya çalışmaktır. Paradoksal durumlar yaratmak ve onu yeniden inşa etmek için yapıbozuma uğratılan sanat eserine yönelik bir tür özeleştiri olarak da düşünülebilir. Köktenciliğin, kliselerin yıkılması, geleneksel düsünce kalıplarının kırılarak İslâm sanatının ilham jargonunda yeni yollar ve farklı motivasyon metodolojileri aranmasıdır. Bu çalışma, İslâm sanatlarında dekonstrüksiyon uygulamalarının nasıl vapılacağına va da İslâm sanatlarında dekonstrüksiyonun hangi yöntemlerle gerçekleştirilebileceğine dair teknik bir yol haritası değildir. Aksine 21. yüzyıl bilincinin düşünme, algılama, dünyayı yorumlama gücü vb. perspektifinden İslâm sanatlarının mimari, metal, ahşap, taş, tuğla, çini, seramik, hat, minyatür, tezhip, cilt, ebru vb. süsleme ve bezeme unsurlarının veniden değerlendirilmesi ve yapıbozuma uğratılmasıyla bazı düşünsel boşlukların, çelişkilerin ve bilgi kirliliklerinin bulunabileceği hipotezine dayanmaktadır. Kült, kanonik klişelerin, yapıların, kompozisyonların tersine çevrilmesidir. Nitekim kültürel ve sanatsal etkileşim üzerine yapılan bir yapıbozum örneğinde, farklı sorularla yeni cevaplar elde edilebileceği ortaya çıkmıştır.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Sanat Tarihi, Yapısöküm, İslâm Sanatları, Selçuklu, Mimari, İkonografi.

<sup>\*</sup> Bu makale CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.

# An Attempt to Understand Islamic Arts with Deconstruction\*

Research Article

Received: 20 January 2024 Accepted: 05 June 2024

#### Abstract

Deconstruction is not about destroying a whole, but about understanding how it is constructed. It is first taking it apart and then trying to understand the whole. It can also be considered as a kind of self-criticism towards the work of art, which is deconstructed to create paradoxical situations and reconstruct it. It is the breaking down of fundamentalism, of stereotypes, of traditional thought patterns, and the search for new ways and different motivational methodologies in the inspiration jargon of Islamic art. This study is not a technical roadmap on how to apply deconstruction in Islamic arts or the methods by which deconstruction can be realized in Islamic arts. On the contrary, it is based on the hypothesis that some intellectual gaps, contradictions and information pollution can be found by re-evaluating and deconstructing the ornamental and decorative elements of Islamic arts such as architecture, metal, wood, stone, brick, tile, ceramic, calligraphy, miniature, illumination, illumination, binding, marbling, etc. from the perspective of the 21st century consciousness thinking, perception, power to interpret the world, etc. Cult is the reversal of canonical clichés, structures, compositions. Indeed, in an example where cultural and artistic interaction is deconstructed, it is demonstrated that new answers can be found with different questions. Deconstruction in Islamic art is a movement that shows that art is not only an aesthetic experience, but also carries historical, cultural and political meanings, since it is the acknowledgment of the influences of different cultures and traditions rather than a single universal art form.

**Keywords:** Art History, Deconstruction, Islamic Arts, Seljuk, Architecture, Iconography.

<sup>\*</sup> This article is published under the CC BY-NC 4.0 licence.

#### **Summary**

The works of art created are shaped by the intellectual reality and social acceptance of the artist of each period. The works that the authority transforms into an anthology of ideas through standardization efforts are also condensed by moving in a certain line. According to deconstruction, it states that one should not be prejudiced and preconceived, that one should act with common sense, and that trying to understand an exhibited work to the extent of its comprehensibility is akin to reconstructing that work.

Deconstruction is a series of poststructuralist procedures applied in various fields from philosophy to literature. When deconstructing a finding, the aim is to reconstruct that finding. Ouestionable meanings and concepts can be more clearly identified through deconstruction. In this way, differentiation and contradictions in concepts are identified. With deconstruction, concepts are evaluated descriptively within the framework of Derrida's ideas. Derrida's well-known proposition "there is nothing outside the text" forms the backbone of the proof. Derrida also tried to deconstruct the concepts of belief and absolute truth through deconstruction. Another point Derrida emphasized was to examine the Kantian distinction between aesthetics and non-aesthetics.

Deconstruction in Islamic art deals with traditional Islamic art forms or motifs by analyzing or transforming their traditional meanings. It questions and reinterprets the norms and patterns of traditional Islamic art. This approach is usually accomplished by dismantling existing structures or motifs, then reorganizing or transforming them.

Deconstruction helps to develop a more nuanced understanding by questioning stereotypes and examining the historical, cultural and political contexts of art. In this way, one can better see how Islamic art has developed and carried different meanings in different geographies and time periods. Deconstruction in Islamic art can involve the use of ambiguous or contradictory meanings and forms, often without clear boundaries or definitions. This can cause viewers or observers to have an unorthodox experience, which can lead them away from certain norms or expectations of traditional Islamic art. In deconstruction, it is possible to rediscover the original logic of construction of an architectural structure. In this context, the experience of putting together the fragments of tile and ceramic art allows new insights to be gained during the realization of this opening. The arrangement of the bricks and the combinations reconstructed with these bricks are meant both to understand the logic of the mechanical installation and to test new ways of thinking in the way ornamental forms are created. Because, as the name suggests, a tear can be sewn back together, but it is difficult to rebuild a torn or badly damaged whole. The process of reconstruction is also an attempt to create a different signification.

In this research, examples of deconstruction Seljuk Period metal art, manuscripts, tile ceramic art and various materials of the Ottoman Period are discussed. In the processes of restoration, repair, maintenance, etc., it can be learned more clearly how these works were created during the renovation. The relationships between artistic signs and signifiers, the temporal and spatial definitions of the elements that make up the whole point to the basic logic of deconstruction. Islamic arts are an artistic tradition influenced by the fundamental principles and teachings of Islam. These arts reflect the values of Islam such as tawhid, justice, equality and beauty. The structural characteristics of Islamic arts show how these arts are influenced by the fundamental principles of Islam. Geometric motifs, floral motifs, arabesque, writing, pencil work and architecture will be discussed in this section.

This study is not a technical roadmap on how deconstruction can be applied in Islamic arts or the methods by which deconstruction can be carried out in Islamic arts. It is based on the hypothesis that some intellectual gaps. contradictions and information pollution can be found by re-evaluating and deconstructing the ornamental and decorative elements of Islamic arts such as architecture, metal, wood, stone, brick, tile, ceramic, calligraphy, miniature, illumination, binding, marbling, etc. from the perspective of the 21st century consciousness' thinking, perception, power to interpret the world, etc. In these selected works, how deconstruction will be realized and the intellectual importance of these practices in art history are tried to be mentioned. Then, the relationship between deconstruction and art, the prohibition of depiction and the views put forward by some orientalist circles about Islamic arts were re-evaluated and the necessity of considering them as an argument against deconstruction was emphasized.

Deconstruction in Islamic art is an important movement that shows that art is not only an aesthetic experience, but also carries historical, cultural and political meanings.

# Yapısöküm ile İslâm Sanatlarını Anlama Denemesi

# Genis Özet

Oluşturulan sanat eserleri, her dönemin sanatçısının düşünsel gerçekliği ve toplumsal kabulleri ile sekillenir. Otoritenin standartlastırma çabalarıyla bir fikir antolojisine dönüstürdüğü eserler de belli bir çizgide hareket ederek yoğunlastırılır. Yapıbozumu, önvargılı ve pesin hükümlü olmamak gerektiğini, sağduyu ile hareket edilmesi gerektiğini, sergilenen bir eseri anlaşılabilirliği ölçüsünde anlamaya çalışmanın o eseri yeniden inşa etmeye benzediğini belirtir.

Yapısöküm, felsefeden edebiyata kadar çeşitli alanlarda uygulanan bir dizi postyapısalcı işlemdir. Bir bulguyu yapıbozuma uğratırken, o bulguyu yeniden inşa etmek amaçlanır. Şüpheli anlamlar ve kavramlar yapıbozum yoluyla daha net bir şekilde tespit edilebilir. Bu sayede kavramlardaki farklılasma ve celişkiler tespit edilir. Yapısöküm ile kayramlar Derrida'nın fikirleri çerçevesinde betimsel olarak değerlendirilir. Derrida'nın çok bilinen "metnin dışında hiçbir şey yoktur" önermesi ispatın omurgasını oluşturur. Derrida yapıbozum yoluyla inanç ve mutlak hakikat kavramlarını da yapıbozuma uğratmaya çalışmıştır<sup>1</sup>. Derrida'nın üzerinde durduğu bir diğer nokta ise Kantçı estetik ve estetik olmayan ayrımını irdelemek olmustur.

İslâm sanatında yapısöküm, geleneksel İslâm sanatı formlarını veya motiflerini, onların geleneksel anlamlarını çözümleyerek veya dönüştürerek ele alır. Bu, geleneksel İslâm sanatının normlarını ve kalıplarını sorgulayarak, onları veniden vorumlar. Bu vaklasım, genellikle mevcut yapıları veya motifleri parçalara ayırarak, ardından bunları yeniden düzenleyerek veya dönüştürerek gerçekleştirilir.

Yapısöküm, klişeleri sorgulamak ve sanatın tarihsel, kültürel ve politik bağlamlarını inceleyerek daha nüanslı bir anlayış geliştirmeye yardımcı olur. Bu savede, İslâm sanatının farklı coğrafyalarda ve zaman dilimlerinde nasıl geliştiğini ve farklı anlamlar taşıdığını daha iyi görülebilir. İslâm sanatında yapısöküm, eserlerin genellikle belirgin sınırları veya tanımları olmayan, belirsiz veva çelişkili anlamlar ve formlar kullanmasını içerebilir. Bu, izleyicilerin veya gözlemcilerin alışılmışın dışında bir deneyim yaşamasına neden olabilir ve bu da onları geleneksel İslâm sanatının belirli normlarından veya beklentilerinden uzaklaştırabilir.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Hayrullah Yanık, "Yapısöküm Üzerine Birkaç Not", Abant Kültürel Araştırmalar Dergisi (AKAR) 1/2 (2016), 91-98.

Yapısökümde, mimari bir yapının ilk inşa mantığını yeniden keşfetmek mümkündür. Bu bağlamda, çini ve seramik sanatının parçalarını bir araya getirme denevimi, bu acılısın gerçeklestirilmesi sırasında veni bilgiler edinilmesini sağlar. Tuğlaların dizilişi ve bu tuğlalarla yeniden oluşturulan kombinasyonlar, hem mekanik tesisatın mantığını anlamak hem de süsleme formlarının oluşturulmasında izlenen vol sırasında veni düsünme biçimlerini test etmek içindir. Çünkü adından da anlaşılacağı üzere bir yırtık yeniden dikilebilir ancak yırtılmış ya da ağır hasar görmüş bir bütünü veniden insa etmek zordur. Yeniden insa süreci aynı zamanda farklı bir anlamlandırma yaratma girişimidir.

Yapısöküm, İslâm sanatlarında kült ve kanonik kabul edilen yerleşik zihnivetlerin, kalıpların, yapıların ve dekoratif kompozisyonların tersine çevrilmesi gerekliliğine ve bunu etkileyen faktörlerin altında yatan motivasyon ve denklemin divalektik bir bakıs acısıyla sökülerek gözden geçirilmesi gerekliliğine dikkat çekmek yeni bir çözümleme gayretidir.

Bu araştırmada İslâm mimarisi, Selçuklu Dönemi maden sanatı, el yazmaları, çini seramik sanatı ve Osmanlı Dönemi'nin çeşitli malzemeleri ele alınmıştır. Eserlerin restorasyon, onarım, bakım vb. süreçlerinde, bu eserlerin nasıl oluşturulduğu yenileme sırasında daha net öğrenilebilmektedir. Sanatsal göstergeler ve gösterenler arasındaki ilişkiler, bütünü oluşturan unsurların zamansal ve mekânsal tanımları yapıbozumun temel mantığına işaret etmektedir. İslâm sanatları, İslâm'ın temel ilke ve öğretilerinden etkilenen bir sanat geleneğidir. Bu sanatlar İslâm'ın tevhid, adalet, eşitlik ve güzellik gibi değerlerini yansıtır. İslâm sanatlarının yapısal özellikleri, bu sanatların İslâm dininin temel ilkelerinden nasıl etkilendiğini göstermektedir. Geometrik, bitkisel motifler, arabesk, yazı, kalem işi ve mimari bu bölümde ele alınacaktır.

Bu çalışma, yapışökümün İslâm sanatlarında nasıl uygulanacağına ya da İslâm sanatlarında yapısökümün hangi yöntemlerle gerçekleştirilebi leceğine dair teknik bir vol haritası değildir. İslâm sanatlarının mimari, metal, ahsap, tas, tuğla, cini, seramik, hat, minyatür, tezhip, cilt, ebru vb. süsleme ve bezeme unsurlarının 21. yüzyıl bilincinin düşünme, algılama, dünyayı yorumlama gücü vb. perspektifinden yeniden değerlendirilmesi ve yapıbozuma uğratılmasıyla bazı düşünsel boşlukların, çelişkilerin ve bilgi kirliliklerinin bulunabileceği hipotezine dayanmaktadır. Ayrıca yapısöküm ve sanat ilişkisi, tasvir yasağı ve bazı oryantalist çevrelerin İslâm sanatları hakkında ileri sürdükleri görüşler yeniden değerlendirilmiş ve bunların yapısöküme karşı bir argüman olarak ele alınmasının gerekliliği vurgulanmıştır.

Yapısöküm, sanat eserlerine yeni ve farklı bakış açıları sunarak, sanatçıların ve tasarımcıların ilham almasına ve yeni eserler üretmesine

katkıda bulunabilir. Bu sayede, İslâm sanatının günümüz sanatında ve tasarımda yeni yorumlar kazanmasına ve canlı kalmasına yardımcı olabilir. Yapısöküm, sanat eserlerinin sadece estetik değerinden öte, daha derin anlamlar ve mesajlar da taşıyabileceğini ortaya çıkarabilir. Sembolleri, motifleri ve formları analiz ederek, sanatçının nevi iletmeye çalıştığının ve eserinin hangi bağlamlarda yorumlanabileceğinin daha iyi anlaşılmasını sağlayabilir. Bu sayede, İslâm sanatının sadece dinî değil, aynı zamanda sosyal, politik ve felsefî boyutları da keşfedilebilir.

İslâm sanatında yapısöküm, sanatın sadece estetik bir deneyim olmadığını, aynı zamanda tarihî, kültürel ve politik anlamlar taşıdığını da gösteren önemli bir akımdır.

#### Introduction

In the broadest context of use, it is the subjection of almost all kinds of disciplines such as philosophy, literature, art, politics, law, ethics, etc. to an act of deconstruction and reconstruction through the interpretation of their internal and external structure. Deconstruction is a concept and approach used in Continental European philosophy since the middle of the 20th century, first by the German philosopher Martin Heidegger (d. 1976) and later by the French philosopher Jacques Derrida (d. 2004) with new and different meaning contents.<sup>2</sup> With Derrida's philosophy, there are conditions for deconstruction, for a whole to have unity. These are "to emphasize what is thrown out, inevitable dissolution, double meaning, polysemy, plurality of meaning, plural origin, generative repetition, repetition"<sup>3</sup>

"Derrida agrees with the structuralist approach by talking about the structure of a language based on opposites. Derrida states that opposing views will lose their original meaning that they were conceived in the work on the contradiction of each other. There is also a relationship between dominance with the contrast between concepts. While one of the two ideas is dominant, the other is assembled as a concept. The dominant idea has built its meaning on the contrast of the other intellectual concept.<sup>4</sup> By drawing attention to these contrasts, Derrida was one of those who argued that Western opinion constructs itself on contrasts of the entire historical dimension. Opposite concepts such as North-South, East-West, being-absence, male-female, white-black, etc. attain their ultimate meaning in about a state of domination within the composition.<sup>5</sup> It can be said that many of Derrida's works contain criticisms against Husserl (phenomenology) Saussure (linguistics) Lacanian (psychoanalysis) and Levi Strauss (structuralism). 6

As practiced by Jacques Derrida, deconstruction avoids mistakes. It is the result of Krauss' critical methodology. First of all, deconstruction constantly problematizes its own status. Derrida's concepts are unstable statements about sign, meaning and signification are open reinterpretation and reconstruction. Derrida's terms such as "difference", "blind origin", "anguistia" and "force" have multiple and often contradictory sets of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Erdal Yıldız, "Yapısöküm Nedir", *Tübitak Ansiklopedisi* (Erişim: 12 Kasım 2022), 12.

Zeynep Direk, "Derrida ve Laiklik Temaşa", Erciyes Üniversitesi Felsefe Bölümü Dergisi 1 (2014), 39-60.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ömer Demir, İktisat Metodolojisi (İstanbul: Sentez Yayınları, 2015), 204.

Cahide Bayraktar, "Postmodernizm ve Ekonomideki Uzantıları", Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi 1 (2014), 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Türkan Orman, "Jacques Derrida'nın Düşüncesinde Dil", Yeditepe Üniversitesi Kilikya Felsefe Dergisi 1 (2015), 61-81.

referents. Second, Derrida suppresses neither history nor the real world as possible places<sup>7</sup> Deconstruction was born out of and was a reaction to the modernist style. In literary criticism in the 1940s, 50s and 60s, modernist criticism was called formalism (Eastern Europe). New Criticism (US and UK) or, especially, structuralism (France).

Alpyağıl has identified a sequence of items regarding deconstruction: Deconstruction is carried out to ask different and new questions, to create deeper possibilities and perspectives to the previous questions. In this respect, deconstruction is a new attempt rather than a conclusion. In addition, deconstruction, which is based on certain conventions, is to produce new ideas subject to tradition and to try to put these ideas back into action. In another article on deconstruction, it means creating new openings by considering both attitudes without struggling with the dualistic alternatives that arise from behaviors with one aspect.8

Re-reading Islamic arts theoretically with the theory of deconstruction and dialectical interpretations through works of art can open new horizons for those interested in this field. By deconstructing Islamic arts in each of the fields of art such as architecture, miniature, calligraphy, tile, metal, etc. intellectual, analytical reasoning can be handled by retrospective, deductive method. In addition to this, concrete results can be obtained through deconstruction by filling in some question marks and gaps by extracting and questioning the actors of different beliefs, culture, art, etc. that shape and nourish Islamic arts. Especially the prohibition of depiction and the views put forward by some orientalist circles about Islamic arts have been considered as real information by readers for many years. However for these views to have the value of truth, they need to be deconstructed fundamentally to eliminate some unfounded and exaggerated considerations.

In terms of the climate of Islamic thought, the issue of orientalism, which is also considered to be deconstructed, requires a revision of some of its texts by making use of retrospective history, philosophy, sociology, etc. sciences. Many foreign academics are a bit sentimental in their studies of Eastern culture with their sympathy for the ancient Greek world. The art of the classical period takes reference from nature and adapts man to this environment. The attitude of these orientalists is to consider Eastern society as insufficient in terms of civilization. In this respect, the culture of the classical era, seen as more affluent in the memory of some orientalist

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Matthew Biro, "Art Criticism and Deconstruction: Rosalind Krauss and Jacques Derrida", Art Criticism 6/2 (1990), 33-47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Recep Alpyağıl, *Din Felsefesinde Yapıbozum* (İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2006) 78.

circles, is the main source of depiction. Therefore, these scholars point to classical art as the best constructor of the figure.9

Deconstruction explores the basic motivation for the formation of Islamic arts in different ways. In addition to this, the aim is to offer a wide selection of stimuli to the viewers while introducing the works of Islamic art exhibited in museums, and to re-evaluate the consciousness that shaped Islamic arts, taking into account the fact that the consciousness that shaped Islamic arts may have been structured by a cognitive experience mixed with various ethnic environments, geographies, cultural backgrounds, beliefs, value judgments, as well as sacred texts.

From an iconographic point of view, some examples of Seljuk Period mining art, manuscripts, tile and ceramic art, and then examples of ornamental elements in various materials of the Ottoman Period are mentioned. In these selected works, it has been tried to touch upon how deconstruction will be carried out and the importance of the results of these applications in terms of art history, both technically and philosophically. In addition, this review draws attention to the relationship of deconstruction with art, the prohibition of depiction and the necessity of considering the views put forward by some orientalist circles about Islamic arts as a counter-argument for their re-evaluation and deconstruction.

In this research, since the splendor of Islamic arts and their appeal in international art circles are mostly on the agenda with their architectural works and some handicraft objects, it is foreseen that deconstruction in these areas may yield important results. Deconstruction can reveal new findings for the iconographic analysis of ornamental compositions in architecture and some handicraft works. In short, it can be said that deconstruction in art is asking new questions and touching unseen points.

#### 1. Deconstruction and Art

The most distinguished event that makes art different from non-art is the need to insist that it has an environment. Artists such as Dan Graham, Francis Bacon, Marcel Duchamp, Valerio Adami, Jasper Johns, etc. have also argued that art, which they call accessing beyond the visible, has a deconstructive attitude. Because these artists are among the artists who interpreted Derrida's deconstruction system and adapted it to their Works. 10 According to Derrida, he emphasizes that the limits of works of art should be evaluated from a philosophical point of view, and in this sense there can be no difference between them and art. In this respect, Derrida believes in

Erica Cruikshank Dodd, "The Image of the World: Notes on The Religions Iconography of Islam", ed. Eva R. Hoffman, Late Antique and Mediavel Art of The Mediterranean World (Wiley-Blackwell Publishing, 2007), 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Nimet Keser, *Sanat Sözlüğü* (Ankara: Ütopya Yayınevi, 2009). 22.

the necessity of deconstructing works of art. The logic of deconstruction, which treats artistic findings as a signifier, the discourse of the work as a signifier, and the enriched world of meaning as a signified, tends to eviscerate the signifier by reducing the signified to the signifier in order to disrupt the logic of structure by analyzing and disassembling works of art.<sup>11</sup>

In this context, the things expressed by the signifiers used in the field of art can have many meanings. In this context, Derrida's deconstruction theory is to reveal new meanings with a multiplication and expansion of meaning in terms of meaning. This enriches human perception and comprehension. For example, a black dog can depict not only an animal but also loyalty and aggression. Derrida's deconstruction and similar subject examples are envisioned as a source of production for artists.<sup>12</sup>

According to the author, he "draws on a close reading of these texts to question the widespread tendency to treat allegory as a static dichotomy between deconstruction and dialectic, between allegory and symbol. The problem of allegory, and implicitly the problem of symbol, has been an important feature of the art historical debate in recent decades, and is relevant in debates about modernism and postmodernism, as well as in debates about method, among others. The argument takes into account the claim - common to both supporters and detractors - that allegory is an "unmediated structure" against the "immediacy" of a symbol. In art theory polemics, the opposition of symbol and allegory often reproduces a methodological argument between dialectics and deconstruction, respectively expresses."13

The principle that any part of deconstruction entails the whole deconstruction should influence the philosophical understanding of art, which is usually subsumed under the rubric of aesthetics. In principle, there can be no deconstructive aesthetics (no more than there can be a deconstructive ethics or epistemology. Aesthetics in general is mortgaged to sensory perception, and from Derrida's very early days "there is no perception". Hence his interest in the blink, blindness and the property of drawing.14

Deconstruction is a series of poststructuralist procedures in various fields from philosophy to literature. While deconstructing a finding, it is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Meryem Uzunoğlu, "Dekonstrüktif Çağdaş Sanat Uygulamaları", YEDİ: Sanat, Tasarım ve Bilim Dergisi 21 (2019), 21-31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Semih Aytekin, *Resim Sanatında Yaratıcı Bir Tutum Olarak Yapısöküm* (Kastamonu: Kastamonu Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2020), 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Gail Day, "Allegory: Between Deconstruction and Dialectic", Oxford Art Journal 22/1 (1999), 103-118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Geoffrey Bennington, "Interrupted Aesthetics: The Art of Deconstruction", Oxford Literary Review 36/1 (2014), 19-35.

aimed to reconstruct that finding. Doubtful meanings and concepts can be identified more clearly through deconstruction. In this way, differentiation and contradictions in concepts are identified. With deconstruction, concepts are evaluated descriptively within the framework of Derrida's ideas. Derrida's well-known proposition "There is nothing outside the text" forms the backbone of the proof. Derrida also tried to deconstruct the concepts of belief and absolute truth through deconstruction. <sup>15</sup> Another point Derrida emphasized was to examine the Kantian distinction between aesthetic and non-aesthetic 16

Derrida argues, as a relatively new academic trend, that artistic research lacks a coherent basis in terms of methodological definition. He prefers artistic research as a term for practice-based research. Accordingly, documenting the research process as well as supporting some form of textual analysis or positioning and demonstrating critical thinking, provides a pragmatic definition for artistic research. Research involving artistic practice creates other problems to solve some problems. <sup>17</sup> <sup>18</sup> In other words, art and language demand this: Not only must works of art be defensible, but they must also be believed to be defensible. A critique must be provided that can show that such a work is defensible in the first place.<sup>19</sup>

Deconstruction goes beyond routine understanding and allows the work to be viewed from an objective point of view. It advocates an attitude that favors an oppositional approach to traditional interpretation. Against sociological, political and cultural erosion, it has also pursued new discourses, original ideas and multidisciplinary fusion in art. The 20th century's most decisive feature in terms of aesthetics and creativity was undoubtedly the rapidly spreading technology. As a result of these transformations, it has directly affected the artistic agency and the artist's interpretation by separating from the art forms that art had undertaken before it. Deconstruction and criticism, which emerged with postmodernism, have strengthened the dialog in art environments.

The social relationship is very important in artistic deconstruction. Carrying cultural, temporal and physical elements, art is a multifaceted

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Yanık, "Yapısöküm Üzerine Birkaç Not", 91-98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Megill Allan, *Prophets of Extremism*, trans. Tuncay Birkan (Ankara: Ayraç Kitapevi, 2008), 121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Biggs Michael, Modelling Experiential Knowledge for Research In The Art of Research: Research Practices in Art and Design (Helsinki: The University of Art and Design, 2006), 204.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Harrison Charles - Orton Fred, A Provisional History of Art & Language (Paris: E. Fabre, 1982), 87.

<sup>19</sup> Schwab Michael, The Power of Deconstruction in Artistic Research (Working Papers in Art and Design, 2009), 34.

and multidimensional act. Therefore, art is a phenomenon with rich characteristics. The connection between art and society is continuous and reciprocal. This relationship is of the nature of the connection between the total and those who create the total. In the relationship between culture and art, one is both supportive of the other and an indicator of the current dimension. In other words, it is impossible to think of one separately from the other 20

Zaha Hadid, one of the most important names of contemporary architecture, exhibited important examples of deconstruction architecture in her projects after the exhibition organized at Moma (Metropolitan Museum of Art).<sup>21</sup> Hadid's designs have been characterized as hyperrealistic and not easily constructed. On the other hand, Hadid's project "The Peak" at the Moma Exhibition is noteworthy for its elevated location and the freshness with which it adapts interesting land forms and shapes to building interiors.<sup>22</sup>

According to Encin (2022), who mentions that this process can be realized in some steps while talking about an application practice related to deconstruction in contemporary arts. First of all, identifying the goal, examining the project and the platform, applying the principles of deconstruction and understanding the meaning, describing and organizing the work.

What are the main components and ingredients that make it up?

The subject, Van Gogh, is slightly out of frame. It looks 3/4 at us and is illuminated by a single key light.

What special qualities make it effective?

The regular rhythmic brushstrokes, the subtle, muted, divided palette of complementary colors and the high contrast in the focal point: Her eyes and expression.

How did the person achieve this?

Van Gogh created his self-portrait using oil paint, repeating brushstrokes that follow the contours of the subject's shapes. Reversing."23

#### 2. Deconstruction in Islamic Architecture

Islamic arts are an artistic tradition influenced by the fundamental

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Erinc Seymen, "Bireysel ve Toplumsal Kimlik Arayısında Kültür ve Sanatın Rolü, Sanat Yazıları", Hacettepe Üniversitesi GSF Yayınları 2 (1987), 47-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Emine Oğuz, Küreselleşme Mimarlık İlişkisi ve Uzakdoğu Uygulamaları (Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi, Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2019), 74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Hakan Ilıkoba, "Zaha Hadid'in Mimarlık Sahnesine Çıkışı", *Arkitera* (Erişim 12 Eylül 2022).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Matthew Encin, "The Art of Deconstruction" (Access 01 November 2022).

principles and teachings of Islam. These arts reflect the values of Islam such as monotheism, justice, equality and beauty. The structural features of Islamic arts show how these arts are influenced by the basic principles of the Islamic religion. Geometric motifs, vegetal motifs, arabesque, writing, pencil work and architecture will be discussed in this section. It shows how these arts are influenced by the basic principles and teachings of the Islamic religion. These features reveal the aesthetic value and importance of Islamic arts. Islamic arts are one of the richest and most diverse art traditions in the world. Although these arts are influenced by the basic principles and teachings of Islam, they also reflect the influences of different cultures and geographies.

To make a brief literal assessment in this section:

- deconstruction theory is used to understand and interpret Islamic arts.
- The study presents the rationale for deconstruction to reveal the meaning relations of Islamic arts.
- The study emphasizes the importance of interpreting Islamic arts in a different way as an alternative to traditional ways of interpretation.

An attempt to understand Islamic arts through deconstruction can be an important study in order to offer a new perspective on the interpretation of Islamic arts.

Deconstruction in Islamic architecture is a method that helps us to better understand the basic elements and meaning relations of this architecture. By examining the individual elements that make up a structure or text, deconstruction reveals the relationships and meanings between these elements.

Deconstruction in Islamic architecture is particularly important for the following reasons:

- It reveals the diversity and richness of Islamic architecture. Islamic architecture developed in different parts of the world under different cultural and geographical conditions. Therefore, Islamic architecture contains a wide variety of elements and relations of meaning. Deconstruction helps to reveal this diversity and richness.
- It provides an understanding of the basic principles and teachings of Islamic architecture. Islamic architecture is influenced by the fundamental principles and teachings of the Islamic religion. Therefore, it helps to understand the structural elements and meaning relations of Islamic architecture.
- It enables Islamic architecture to be adapted to the present day. Islamic architecture is still interpreted and used in different ways today. Deconstruction helps to develop new approaches that enable Islamic

architecture to be adapted to the present.

Deconstruction in Islamic architecture can be practiced using the following methods:

- Analysis of architectural elements: The basic elements of Islamic architecture can be listed as geometric motifs, plant motifs, arabesques, pencil work and architectural elements. By analyzing these elements one by one, the relationships and meanings between these elements can be revealed'
- Analysis of architectural composition: In Islamic architecture, elements are often brought together in a specific composition. By analyzing these compositions, the meanings of these compositions can be revealed.
- Analysis of architectural texts: In Islamic architecture, religious texts are often inscribed on or inside buildings. By analyzing these texts, the meanings of the buildings can be revealed.

Deconstruction in Islamic architecture is an important method that helps to better understand and interpret this architecture.

The most effective way to examine the elements that make up a work, especially from a technical point of view, is to understand how this work was built. For this reason, combining the parts of an architectural structure in a meaningful way, such as lego pieces, and analyzing its original texture both technically and in other ways is one of the ways to have information about how this building was built.

Derrida has unfinished texts, unfinished buildings, distorted surfaces, reduced angles, chaos and asymmetrical elements.<sup>24</sup>

In the 21st century, apart from Pre-Islamic Turkish Arts and archaeology, while Turkish Islamic Arts are studied in detail, all artistic productions within the religions in question are accepted as belonging to peoples other than Islamic circles, and the great contributions of Turkish Islamic nations and states in civilization and art history are not sufficiently valued.<sup>25</sup> The rift, disagreement and chaos between contemporary and classical relations are also reflected in works of art. Naturally, these works oscillate between good and evil, right and wrong, beautiful and ugly. Because in modern life, where all asymmetrical objects such as ugly, strange evil, etc. are not ignored, on the contrary, they are increasingly legitimized.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Murat Soygeniş, "Mimarlıkta Biçimsel Arayışlar, Dekonstrüktivizm", *Mimarlık* 2 (1989), 96-98.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Yaşar Çoruhlu, "Türk Sanatının Ermeni Sanatına Etkileri", Türk Dünyası Araştırmaları 122/241 (2019), 313-350.

It is also not possible to achieve clarity<sup>26</sup> Since deconstruction has principles especially in the context of justice, rationality and consistency, it is an effort to remain objective within the framework of these concepts and to obtain its ontological argument by deconstructing it without deviating from its line. Instead of knowing what is as it is, it is to approach the event by interpreting it in a bowl of illusions or speculations. Deconstruction is not to destroy but to reveal how it is done, to categorize, to understand determinations, to examine the findings revealed by meaning backwards towards the source. It is to shake the general assertion attributed to meaning. Therefore, it is to reconsider the artist's technique, the artist's intention, the artist's emotional motivation.

Mülayim "The new tendency to underline Islamic motifs in culture and art in bold."he says, "manifests itself in architecture and handicrafts as a way of separating from the 'others': "Every shape and color supposedly belonging to Islam, regardless of whether it is of Indian, Andalusian or Mamluk origin, is hastily appropriated, and a strange Esperanto is born in the name of the new Islamic internationalism. Since this eclectic tendency in art emerged during a panic-stricken search, it offers serious but mostly ironic indications in terms of scale, harmony and principles."27

Derrida's concept of "Aporia" carries meanings such as contradiction, impasse, puzzle. The word Aporia has a history dating back to ancient philosophy. Derrida points out that there can definitely be aporia in texts. Therefore, the possibility of aporia in an art composition is very high. By believing in the existence of hidden paradoxical interpretations in architectural forms, he supports an argument that contradictory and vicious perspectives are possible in architectural designs and in the interpretation of ornamental ornaments.

The Islamic artist sought unity in multiplicity, completely loval to the principle of tawhid and wisdom. In addition, he also realized designs that were mostly based on the mathematical understanding of ornamentation and within its limits. Namely, the Islamic artist endeavored to show the transfer of unity to the object through the decorative arts. Here, in particular, miniature, illumination and pencil work have tried to be named in such practices<sup>28</sup> To apply a deconstruction of this paragraph;

Text analysis: This technique aims to examine the linguistic elements in the text and their meanings. For example, how the concept of "Islamic artist" is defined, how the concepts of "tawheed" and "wisdom" are used.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Cemal Şakar, "Modern Zamanlarda İslam Sanatı ve Estetiği Ne Diyor?", Hece (Haziran-Temmuz-Ağustos) 198.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Selçuk Mülayim, İslam Sanatı (İstanbul: İsam Yayınları, 2010), 197.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Ahmet Çaycı, İslam Mimarisinde Anlam ve Sembol (Konya: Palet Yayınları, 2017), 8.

Contrast analysis: This technique aims to reveal contrasts and contradictions between different elements in the text. For example, the Islamic artist's use of both religious and secular elements, how the concepts of monotheism and unity are interpreted.

Reader-centered analysis: This technique relates the meaning of the text to the perspective of the person reading the text. For example, how people from different religions and cultures would interpret the text.

The question arises whether the Turks imposed an identity on Islamic culture after the 10th century. Did the Turks change the Islamic culture or did they leave the content of Islamic culture and even with what remained. it shows that many of the elements that characterize Islam emerged after the 10th century.<sup>29</sup> It is argued that Seljuk architecture developed within the Iranian-Central Asian-Islamic architectural cultures due to its top cadres. However, it would be an incomplete assessment to think that the architectural construction style flourished only at the initiative of the rulers of the country. Considering that Anatolia, which was authorized for reconstruction works, had its own architects, the presence of local influences is more evident. In order to impress the Seljuk rulers, the national masters who wanted to show their talents applied the forms they thought they would like. Another concept of Derrida's, "Difference", is meant to mean the translation of meaning, and it is envisaged that it also means separation and differentiation. Here, if an interpretation is to be made about a work of art, the feelings, political stance and value judgments of the interpreter will be involved phenomenologically. Because it is necessary to see the chaotic structure of multiple identities where moral situations may be in question in deconstruction. In this context, it is thought that Muslim artists' phenomenological reflection of their own experiences and feelings on their works may have been realized independently of authority.

Architects from different cultures were present at the construction site of a building. The master inscriptions and stylistic features of the buildings show that there was no marginalization between the craftsmen from different faith circles such as Muslims, Christians, etc. due to differences of opinion. From a practical point of view, the application of decorative elements with stone in the works created with brick material led to some changes, and thus they managed to reveal the forms of an example that could set a precedent nowhere else.<sup>30</sup> Therefore, the function of re-evaluating, deconstructing and making sense of even works of art that can be considered cult for Islamic arts on an objective plane, independent

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Doğan Kuban, Ortaçağ Anadolu-Türk Sanatı Kavramı Üzerine (Malazgirt Armağanı) (Ankara: 1972), 12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Kuban, Ortaçağ Anadolu-Türk Sanatı Kavramı Üzerine, 16.

of authority, will offer new perspectives to interpreters, art lovers and the world of science.

Seljuk art has created a unique line within the ancient period, Central Asia, Byzantine, Byzantine, Arab and Iranian cultures.<sup>31</sup> Various opinions have also been put forward regarding the claims that Seljuk Age art was heavily inspired by Greek, Hellenistic, Roman stylistic and formal elements or that it was an art heavily influenced by Iran.<sup>32</sup> It is not possible to accept the statement that Seliuk art does not consist of a collection of buildings in the forms of mosques, madrasahs, caravanserais, baths and tombs as true. Certainly, the employment of artisans from different cultures was on the agenda. However, logical reasoning leads to the conclusion that even the construction of these buildings would not have been possible without a deep-rooted perception of civilization. The cultural identities of the craftsmen, architects and artists employed may be valuable for today's researchers. The Seljuks were a civilization that attached great importance to universal values. For them, it was not the ethnic origin that mattered, but the quality of the work. Civilizations with high self-confidence did not delay in creating an artistic synthesis in their own cultural and belief geographies by allowing open views to innovations and differences.<sup>33</sup> The deconstruction of architectural works through renovation activities can be easily adapted in some wooden construction buildings in Anatolia. Wooden designs have found a wide range of applications in the columns. column heads, consoles and beams of the mosques called "wooden pillar mosques", as well as in the mimber, lectern, priest, door, window parts, railings, networks, cists and priests in religious architecture.<sup>34</sup> Aslanapa "Afyon Great Mosque (671-1272), Sivrihisar Great Mosque (673-1275), Ankara Arslanhane Mosque (689-1289-90), Beysehir Esrefoğlu Mosque (696-1297), which were built in the XIIIth century in Anatolia, give a good idea about wooden mosques.35 The deconstruction of wooden buildings can easily be examined technically retrospectively. The renovation of buildings can provide experts with different ideas in this analysis. Derrida did not use deconstruction only as a negative concept or criticism. On the contrary, he thought and used it as a new method that uses it positively to destroy anything negative. In short, he saw deconstruction as the first step

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Gönül Öney, Beylikler Sanatı XIV-XV. Yüzyıl (1300-1453) (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Basımevi, 1989), 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Friedrich Sarre, Reise in Kleinasien. Berlin. Friedrich Sarre (1998). Küçükasya Seyahati / Yazı, çev. Dara Çolakoğlu (İstanbul: Pera, 1895).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Başak Burcu Eke, "Selçuklu Sanatı ve Sentez Arayışları", *Fikir Coğrafyası* (Erişim 22 Eylül 2022).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Öney, Beylikler Sanatı XIV-XV. Yüzyıl (1300-1453), 20.

Oktay Aslanapa, *Türk Sanatı* (İstanbul: Remzi Kitabevi, 1997), 131.

towards understanding or constructing something new. 36 It is necessary to think of ornamentation as it is used in Islamic decorative forms beyond the Western meaning of "mimesis." This is because the materials used. especially in architecture, were used in such a way as to overlap with the ground and ornaments to be applied. The ground and the material find meaning with the quality of the decoration. Some Western materialist circles have attempted to create their own movements because they consider mimes as a weakness in art from the perspective of their world view. However, in the Seljuk period, where important architectural works of Islamic arts were created, mimes is full of examples that often apply it with architectural elements in order to symbolize the present and eternity.<sup>37</sup> In the Ottoman period, Sinan's own style, both the plan features and the ornamental decorations, which also have cosmological meanings, can be cited as examples. Ottoman mosques were not only places of worship. The splendor of these mosques were important symbols of the might of their owner. In this sense, mosques also had a political and religious mission.<sup>38</sup>

Therefore, in Islamic arts, every object found in nature, tools and equipment used in daily life, and objects have been the subject of art. As an example in deconstruction works, he used worldly objects such as chairs, cars and houses that people frequently use in daily life. Purposively, it is not a matter of creating a creation by bringing together a number of objects conceptually. Ontologically, the final form of the architectural structure is important.

## 3. Deconstruction from an Iconographic Perspective

When iconographic research on the art of Islamic depiction is examined, it is seen that these research questions and methods of examination are evaluated by addressing the subjects in different ways. One of these methods, after determining the subject to be researched, is to collect examples related to this subject and to reveal the program related to the period by examining the historical process and changes.<sup>39</sup> While providing a theoretical relationship with depiction and aesthetics in general is a philosophical endeavor, the study of material culture and works of art is the work of art history. It is necessary to bring together and discuss these two interrelated fields, the theory and practice of art, through the heritage of Islamic visual culture. Studies should be conducted on the issue of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Richard K. Malcom, *Derrida, çev.* Zeynep Talay (İstanbul: Kolektif Kitap Yayınları, 2014), 10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Ömer Lekesiz, "Neden Selçuklu Sanatı?", *Yeni Şafak* (Erişim 12 Aralık 2022).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> N. Çiçek Harmankaya, "Mimar Sinan Camilerinde Sembolizm Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme", Sanat Tarihi Yıllığı 27 (2018), 1-37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Gülsen Tezcan, "İslam Tasvir Sanatında İkonografik Çözümleme", *Türk Dünyası* Araştırması 183 (2009), 451-458.

depiction from different disciplines.<sup>40</sup> The method to be employed in the iconographic research of a subject is to find visual examples of the subject and to discuss the reasons for its illustration by making use of historical, religious and literary sources related to the subject, since manuscripts are not available in the text. Contemporary artifacts of the time, notebooks, records, sacred texts, travelogues are very important sources that determine social norms and desires, political and religious ideas, economic situation.<sup>41</sup> Some manuscripts, when analyzed, provide the most authentic data about the nature of the narratives of their time. Of course, in many countries, artistic interaction can also be read through the artifacts produced. In this way, answers can be found to a number of questions about focal points and distinctive traces of phases, conditions and situations. As an example of this issue, it can be shown that the heirs of the rulers who took refuge in neighboring states due to differences of opinion as a result of political issues took successful aides from the art scene with them during their transfer. 42 Deconstruction, which defines the work of art as the signifier, the discourse of this work as the signifier, and the condensed iconographic world as the signified, is an attempt to empty the signifier by analyzing the work of art, distributing it into its elements and breaking down the backbone of the work, that is, its main structure, and carrying the signified to the signifier. To put it in a simpler form, it can be mentioned as the reexperiencing of signs in a different context through the semiotic pairings of form and letter, concept and meaning, essence and form, the semiotic pairings of signifiers to signifieds.<sup>43</sup>

Although the material aspect of Islamic art is known as concrete, it also contains abstract features. The mystery of the abstract dimension of Islamic art is still evident. For this reason, Islamic art is admired. The disclosure (expression) of the pure side of Islam through objects has developed with civilization. Islamic philosophy's search for deep meaning, its questioning and critical interventions, and its moves resembling deconstruction are still one of the issues that still need to be worked on in Islamic art. 44

One of the issues that needs to be deconstructed on behalf of Islamic arts is the problematic of the prohibition of depiction in Islamic arts. Figurative signifiers (figuration) in Islam have been debated by a large mass of people

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Ferrari N. Kancal - Avse. Taskent. Tasvir. Teori ve Pratik Arasında İslam Görsel Kültürü. (İstanbul: Babil Yayınevi, 2017). 187.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Serpil Bağcı, "Giriş Minyatürlerinde Farklı Bir Konu: Hz. Süleyman'ın Divanı", Sanat Tarihinde İkonografik Çalışmalar, Güner İnal'a Armağan (Ankara: 1993), 33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Tezcan, "İslam Tasvir Sanatında İkonografik Analizi", 455.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Sevim Kantarcıoğlu, *Platon'dan Derrida'ya Edebi Akımlar* (İstanbul: Paradigma Yayıncılık, 2009), 15.

Caycı, İslam Mimarisinde Anlam ve Sembol, 171.

in the Islamic geography, from figh experts and art historians to visual art practitioners. The debates on the issue of depiction have escalated from time to time. While there is still no clear conclusion, there have been many moments when orientalists have become more vocal. The issue of boycotting depiction through sacred texts (Qur'an and Sunnah) has been discussed theologically, iconographically, philosophically and aesthetically by art history theorists. In addition to these, the issue of depiction has been brought up with nationalist racist tendencies, and it has been argued that it is the product of the efforts of a group coming from the Semitic tradition to base it on Islam. 45 Another important issue that needs to be deconstructed in this sense is the prohibition of depiction in Islamic arts. It is essential that the issue of depiction is purified from its political, ethnic, and political elements and interpreted only from the perspective of Tawhid and revelation. Therefore, the essence of this issue should be tried to be reached through sociological and philosophical evaluations in the deepest waters with authentic Sunnah sources and Qur'an-centered interpretations. It is precisely in this respect that Derida's criticism of structuralism makes itself felt. It is a matter of intellectual rethinking of what is readily available, of general opinion. With deconstruction, one of the different ways of thinking put forward by contemporary philosophy, it is essential to ask unasked questions. By problematizing this issue, it is necessary to prepare the ground for perspectives and differences that are conceived as certainty and absolute. This is especially possible through a critique of the determinations of authority.

One of the most important issues of deconstruction concerning Islamic art is the proposal to deconstruct orientalism. In the Islamic civilization, due to the lack of a national mindset that investigates Islamic art in a holistic way, the study of Islamic art has been structured according to the foreign conception. For many years, Orientalists have conducted research in the Middle East and compiled a large number of works on Islamic art. These works express the principles of the medieval world through the norms of Christian and Byzantine art. Byzantine art and Islamic art are considered as the transition period between Asia Minor and the East and West from Antiquity to the Middle Ages. After this time, discourses turn towards the west and continue in the west after the Middle Ages. The Orientalist perspective confines Islamic art to the Middle Ages. After the Orientalist narratives, some in the contemporary art community characterize the modern forms used in Islamic Art as a betraval of traditional arts. Why these traditionalist evaluations are objected to is a separate issue. Criticism on the grounds of "corrupting the method" and criticism by a group of people

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Avse Taşkent, "İslam Sanatı Her Zaman Değişime Açıktı", *Nihayet Dergisi* (Erişim 12 Ekim 2023)

who insist on the prohibition of depiction constitute clusters of ideas that need to be seriously deconstructed. 46 If the general judgment confirms the existence of the prohibition of description, deconstruction opposes it and thinks the opposite. One of the principles is to be skeptical of interpretations and to oppose even the most radical ideas. Social convictions are the most fundamental problems in the way of truth. According to Derrida, cultural prejudices are the ideas that appear naturally in the most slippery ground.

"The presence of many paintings of men, women, animals, plants and zodiac signs in the Amra Palace of Ousavr, one of the most important examples of early Islamic art architecture; likewise, the presence of relief drawings of many living beings, including humans, in palaces such as Kasru'l-Havru'l-Garbi, Mishatta and Hırbetü'l-Mefcer led orientalist art historians to think that there was no prohibition of depiction in the early history of Islam. These paintings, made as early as 705-900, became the basis for Lammens (1915) and his followers Arnold and Creswell to argue that figurative depiction was not forbidden in early Islam and that the ban on painting came later as a result of the iconoclasm movement that emerged in the Christian world and Byzantium."47

One of the ornamental elements commonly used in Islamic arts is geometric forms. One of the symbols of Islamic science is geometric ornaments. The reflections of the philosophy of antiquity on the artistic field after its evaluation with Islamic philosophers have come to life mostly with geometry. Pythagoras and Hermetic phenomenology was finalized with mathematical forms and metaphysical dimension, penetrating the material and the ground. Geometric shapes were frequently used in periods when thinking was given importance. The journey of the mind in the metaphysical realm was expressed in the material realm with geometric forms. These motifs, which can be applied on all kinds of materials, are considered as one of the important instruments in concretizing the abstract world of Islam by creating a rich ornamental repertoire.<sup>48</sup>

The anti-icon stance of the Islamic faith in the Middle East and Western civilizations supports a basic understanding that the creation of figural elements and three-dimensional sculptures is almost impossible. However, when the Qur'an is analyzed, it is noteworthy that there is no direct doctrinal explanation in this sense. In fact, according to the Qur'an's most specific and comprehensible communiqué, only the idolatrous practices that can constitute shirk are dealt with harshly. The use of images that are considered idols is rejected because unbelieving circles base their beliefs

Taşkent, Tasvir, Teori ve Pratik Arasında İslam Görsel Kültürü, 79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> Archibald Cameron Creswell, "The lawfulness of painting in early Islam", ed. Jonathan M. Bloom, Early Islamic Art and Acrhitecture. Burlington: Ashgate 2002) 111.

Caycı, İslam Mimarisinde Anlam ve Sembol, 90.

on nature as the main source of reference.<sup>49</sup> Islam, where revelation is accepted as a criterion, constitutes the essence of the paradigm that guides art. Another issue that gets its share from the unsupported interpretations of the Orientalist consciousness finds itself in the definition of the arabesque motif. The circles with limited knowledge, who found this arabesque concept appropriate to tawhid, thought they were doing the right thing by attributing the term arabesque to Islam in their artistic interpretations based on general tendencies and ignorance of the basic dynamics of Islam. Perhaps deliberately or perhaps out of ignorance, they have continued their investigations with generalizations.50

Another interpretation by Orientalists of the ornamental features of Islamic art is to deconstruct the argument that dense ornamentation was applied for fear of leaving gaps in the ground. The main counterargument to this argument is that dense ornamentation is not present in every work. If the artists were concerned about space, they would not have left any space in all their works. Important examples of the Mudjjar conception can also be seen in some Jewish and Christian architectural structures in Spain, Portugal and Italy. According to Altın, to give examples of these, "Kurtuba Synagogue (1315) Prague Spanish Synagogue (19th-20th century), Seville Alcazar Ambassadors Hall (14th century) Kurtuba Great Mosque Puerta Del Perdon (Donation Gate) (18th century), Bologna Rocchetta Mattei Palace (19th century) Portugal Sintra National Palace Arab Hall."51 Can be counted. In religious architecture, coins, and public buildings, the use of living beings has been replaced by a tradition of deliberate alteration of text or prototypes. Despite some changes, there is still an iconographic content in works of art. Despite the obvious differences, the depiction of living beings, an element that is a must in the traditions of both the past and the present, has been avoided. 52 It is also an attempt to overcome the idea of revealing what is going on behind the curtain of some distorted information, based on statements that focus on contradictions, confusion, inconsistencies and hidden things that are inherent in deconstruction. Texts in philosophical, literary, legal works suppress and conceal opposing concepts that exist in reality, and deconstructive thought uses them as a means to reveal the real truthr.53

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Senav Özgür, *Oleg Grabar ve İslam Sanatı Yorumu* (İzmir: DEÜ Sosval Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2007), 68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Çaycı, İslam Mimarisinde Anlam ve Sembol, 170.

<sup>51</sup> Alper Altın, "İslam Sanatına Atfedilen Korku Boşluğuna, Araştırmalarına Bir Eleştiri", Ortaçağ ve Türk Dönemi Kazılarına ve Sanat Tarihi, 23, (2021), 18.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Oleg Grabar, *The Formation of Islamic Art*, trans. Yavuz, N. (İstanbul: YKY, 1998), 112.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Ahmet Cevizci, *Felsefe Sözlüğü* (İstanbul: Paradigma Yayıncılık, 1999), 56.

In his deconstructionist method, which emerged as a reading proposal, J. Derrida emphasized the method of critical reading to the interpreter in his inquiries and wanted to express that he does not see the artist as a sacred being and that artists can also make mistakes. Derrida, with his skeptical attitude, frequently examines and dissects texts or paintings until he finds the main thought hidden in them. Because according to him, there is no truth and certain knowledge imposed by composition, and there is no certain meaning. For this reason, the thinker, who emphasizes polysemy and polyphony, has tried to realize the destruction of western metaphysics. But Derrida's deconstruction, also called deconstruction, is the work of dismantling structures without destroying them.

According to O. Grabar, it was not a doctrinal, intellectual, faithbased, ideological or mystical influence that led Islamic artists to this kind of attitude, but, in his words, "sheer historical circumstances". Early Islam's pessimistic attitude towards images and its efforts to create visual symbols through alternative channels should be considered within a boundary that provides cognitive and social connotations. In this sense, Grabar notes that some questions are no longer just questions about Islamic art, but much broader questions, such as the forms that the formal and social nature of visual perception assumes under different conditions, should be raised.<sup>54</sup> At this point, if it is necessary to think independently of certain prejudices, it is necessary to evaluate the work according to the conjuncture of the day. However, new perspectives can also be obtained by deconstructing in the sense of reasoning in reverse with contemporary thinking practices.

Among the handicrafts produced during the Mamlūkid period between 1250-1517 AD, it can be said that the art of mining occupied an important place. Among the precious objects of the Turkish rulers and emirs, there are serfs with their names and labels. It can be seen that the created metal objects of the era were influenced by its contemporaries and its older arts. These influences are largely due to Seljuk art. When we look at some of the works of Mamlūkid metal art, it is seen that it emerged more in the Bahri Mamlūkid period and the Burci Mamlūkid period. To list this interaction in items:

1. Due to the continuous conflicts of the Seljuk state with the Mongol armies, some craftsmen went to neighboring states with the obligation to migrate in order to maintain their livelihood conditions and professions and contributed to the artistic activities of these countries. They worked under the protection of rulers and emirs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Grabar, *The Formation of Islamic Art*, 89.

- 2. The artifacts and objects acquired by the Mamluk notables and sultans caused the Seljuk art to influence the Mamluk mining art in the Mamluk country.
- 3. One of the most abundant themes in Seljuk art is hunting scenes. These hunting stories were also the subject of Mamluk metal works. This interaction also bears great similarities in terms of both technique and content in the hunting scenes depicted in Seljuk handicrafts.
- 4. The scenes of entertainment in Seljuk manuscripts are similar in many respects to the scenes of entertainment in Mamluk art.
- 5. The figural faces depicted in Seljuk metalwork resemble the faces of characters depicted in Mamluk Age metal objects. The human characters have arched eyebrows, round faces, large, slanted and small eyes, long and braided hair
- 6. Cosmological elements are another theme in Seljuk Age metal art. The zodiac signs and planets, which are also the subject of Mamluk Age metal objects, and characters holding a crescent moon are depicted separately. In the Seljuk Age coins, they are abundantly seen in coins produced during the reigns of the Atabids and Zengis.
- 7. Bird and animal figures in Seljuk metal arts There are depictions of mythological animals such as dragons, birds, etc. in Mamluk metal arts. When these mythological characters are analyzed, it is obvious that there was an interaction especially in terms of style and iconographic features.<sup>55</sup>

In the example of the interaction with the art of mining in the 7 items here, some questions about deconstruction can be posed. Namely: Compatibility with both cultures, the dimension of human interest, the possibility of close examples in different civilizations of the era, the possibility of similar examples of nature depictions in many cultures, etc. questions can create some cracks in the clichés. Because according to the established understanding, the idea of a new innovation cannot exist without tradition. In deconstruction, there is a constant mobility and an emergence to the surface in the form of reflections of what is inside the unstructured structure. According to Derrida's understanding, text and structure are incomplete. Calling it 'incomplete structures', Derrida states that there are brand new ideas and structures emerging from every text and structure from the past.

Tile ceramics Tile and ceramic materials, which are very important decorative elements for Turkish art, contained very valuable examples in architectural areas in the Anatolian Seljuk Age. Figured stories are a

<sup>55</sup> İbrahım Hassaneın, Seljuk Influences in Mamlūklu Mining Art (İstanbul: Istanbul University Social Institute of Sciences, Doctoral Thesis, 2015), 16.

tradition that continues from Central Asian culture. However, it later took on the character of a special style in the Seljuk Age. The double-headed eagle figure was widely used in tile iconographic depictions and mythological themes. Human faces and different characters on tile material show portrait characteristics. Snapshots of everyday life constitute the subjects of Kubad Abad Palace tiles. In many squares of the tiles, figures sitting cross-legged in the so-called Turkish type of sitting hold some plants in their hands, such as pomegranates, poppies, goblets and flowers. Fish are some of the figures included. Some tiles feature hunting scenes and mythological themes. The characters on the tiles are among the subjects also depicted on stone, wood, textile and other materials. In addition to some symbols and fantastic characters based on the belief in Shamanism, some figures are also known to be related to the twelve-animal calendar of the Turks. While fulfilling the tasks assigned to them, tile and ceramic artists have not moved away from centuries-old traditions. Supernatural beings have inspired painters and sculptors among the Turks since early times. The stories are characteristic of the Central Asian Animal style.<sup>56</sup> It supports the view that viewers with different individual backgrounds; perceptions that change with sociocultural environment, geography and time; and even the physical space where the work is located/exhibited will allow for different readings and multiply the meaning. The deconstruction method, which deals with what is not in the composition and what is not said in iconographic analysis, has been influential on art practices and deconstructive works have been produced both to reveal the dilemmas in life and to decipher the ambiguous areas between the referent-signifier and the signifier-signified by focusing on the process of constructing the work of art.

The fact that Ottoman rulers respected foundations and other fields of art along with the art of writing is an important step in the art of calligraphy reaching the present day. The neglect and neglect of the art of calligraphy during the Republican period delayed the creation of new forms. The analysis, iconographic evaluations, and the meaning of the message that calligraphy wants to convey were already the work of experts who traditionally worked in the field of calligraphy. However, deconstructing and reinterpreting a calligraphic work both technically and in terms of the stylistic characteristics of the designed text opens new doors of meaning for interpreters. Especially during the renovation activity carried out during the repairs of the writing belt, one can obtain more experiential and original data about how this work is constructed by empathizing with both

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> H. Hilal Büyükçanga, Anadolu Selçuklu Seramiklerinde Figürlerin Dili ve Resim Eğitimi Açısından İncelenmesi (Konya: Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2006), 55.

the technical possibilities of this art and its creator. Dialectical reasoning with the signs of writing, i.e. symbols, are allegories of thinking that create in-depth polemics with unasked questions and offer deconstructive alternatives in order to reread the rare works of Turkish Islamic arts with 21st century consciousness.

The Yemis Room is an extremely spectacular area in terms of its decoration features located in the Harem section of Topkapı Palace. The Yemiş Room contains diversity with its historical phases and stylistic nature. Today, it is one of the favorite sections of the palace in this multipurpose section. In order to retrospectively interpret the ornamentation and decoration logic in the Yemiş Room, it is necessary to examine the records of the renovation and maintenance works carried out in Topkapı Palace during the Imperial and Republican periods. In this respect, deconstruction allows us to understand the elements that have been secondary throughout history and trivialized by ideologies from a different perspective by dismantling them from their positions.<sup>57</sup> Thus Derrida tries to reach a more unlimited meaning. In this context, the things shown by the signifiers used in the field of art can have many meanings. The aim here is to produce new meanings with different and deep questions. Because J. Derrida uses the theory of deconstruction to create a diversity of ideas and richness of meaning. Therefore, it diversifies one's perception and convictions. For example, a cute dog not only reminds one of an animal, but it can also depict loyalty and friendship. The traffic of reasoning provided by the logic of deconstruction offers both a rich variety of interpretations and different sources of inspiration for artists.<sup>58</sup> Another example is the construction and repair inscriptions of the Nevsehirli Damat Ibrahim Pasha Complex. The fact that the inscriptions in the mosque of the complex were finalized on plaster means that the original version could not be preserved. Research has revealed that the mosque has been subjected to renovation processes in historical periods and has completely lost its artistic quality. This example is a simple deconstructive thinking to produce a diversity of meanings by evaluating the reasons for the reasons and intentions with the sociological realities of their own periods.<sup>59</sup>

#### Conclusion

In this article, in deconstruction practices, examples different types of works in Islamic architecture, as well as some examples of Seliuk Period

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Samet Doğan, "Feminist Sanatta Eleştirel Bir Model Olarak Yapısöküm", UBCAK, 8. Uluslararası Işık Bilimsel Kongresi (15- 17 Mart 2022), 92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Aytekin, Resim Sanatında Yaratıcı Bir Tutum Olarak Yapısöküm, 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Betül Doğruer, Nevşehir Damat İbrahim Paşa Külliyesi Yazıtlarının Estetik Değerlendirilmesi (Konya: Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2022), 34.

mining art, manuscripts, tile ceramic art, ornamentation and technical parts in various materials of the Ottoman Period were touched upon. In these selected works, an effort has been made to refer to how deconstruction will be realized and the intellectual importance of these practices in the history of art. Then, the relationship between deconstruction and art, the prohibition of depiction and the views put forward by some orientalist circles about Islamic arts are re-evaluated and the necessity of considering them as a counter-argument to deconstruction is emphasized.

There are many materials, architectural surfaces, iconographic scenes, ornamental areas, aesthetic decorative facades, unique portable artworks of handicrafts, everyday objects, tools of war, sacred objects, etc. that can be subject to deconstruction in Islamic arts. Since this study cant cover all the types of works of Islamic art, this research has tried to cover the most basic subjects of Islamic arts. This is because the architectural features focused on in this study can create similar results in terms of what is meant by deconstruction in Islamic arts belonging to different civilizations in different geographies. Likewise, since iconographic narratives are common topics in Islamic arts and contain details suitable for deconstruction, they are among the examples discussed in this study.

Deconstruction is a criticism of clichés in Turkish Islamic arts. It also seeks to offer alternative channels for accessing newer and more qualified information about this art world. It is a dialectical thinking method. To make evaluations about the findings of Turkish Islamic art spread across different continents, it is necessary to analyze the cultural codes of the geographies in question. An important task here falls to museums. Museums should reach the stage of displaying the works they exhibit together with their stories and myths with fictionalizations that allow the audience to discuss, question and make judgments about the work by touching on previously unspoken and untouched points. Therefore, it is the process of trying to learn through reasoning which social and philosophical norms it feeds on. One of the principles of philosophy is the need to shake the foundations of ultimate certainties. Challenging structures whose meaning can never be changed, which is also seen as certain in Turkish Islamic art, can have new intellectual consequences.

It even supports the view that the physical space where the work is located/exhibited will allow for different readings and multiply the meaning.

In deconstruction, it is possible to rediscover the initial construction logic of an architectural structure. In this context, the experience of putting together the fragments of tile and ceramic art allows new knowledge to be acquired during the realization of this opening. The arrangement of

the bricks and the combinations reconstructed with these bricks, both to understand the logic of the mechanical installation and to test new ways of thinking during the path followed in the creation of ornamental forms. Because, as the name suggests, a rupture can be re-sewn, but it is difficult to reconstruct a whole that has been torn or severely damaged. The process of reconstruction is also an attempt to create a different signification.

## Bibliography

Alpyağil, Recep. Din Felsefesinde Yapıbozum. İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2006.

Aslanapa, Oktay. *Türk Sanatı*. Istanbul: Remzi Kitabevi, 1997.

Aytekin, Semih. Resim Sanatında Yaratıcı Bir Tutum Olarak Yapısöküm. Kastamonu: Kastamonu Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2020.

Bağcı, Serpil. "Takdim Minyatürlerinden Farklı Bir Konu: Süleyman Peygamber'in Divanı". Sanat Tarihinde İkonorafik Araştırmalar, Güner İnal'a Armağan. Ankara: 1993.

Bennington, Geoffrey. "Interrupted Aesthetics: The Art of Deconstruction". Oxford Literaryreview 36/1 (2014),19-35.

Biggs, Michael. Modelling Experiential Knowledge For Research, in The Art of Research: Research Practices in Art and Design. Helsinki: The University of Art and Design Heksinki, 2006.

Biro, Michael. "Art Criticism and Deconstruction. Rosalind Krauss and Jacques Derrida", Art Criticism 6/2 (1990), 33-47.

Büyükçanga, Hilal H. "Anadolu Selçuklu Seramiklerinde Figürlerin Dili ve Resim Eğitimi Açısından İncelenmesi". Konya: Selçuk Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2006.

Cruikshand, Erica D. "The Image of The World: Notes on The Religions Iconography of Islam". ed. Eva R. Hoffman. Late Antique And Mediavel Art of The Mediterranean World Wiley-Blackwell Publishing. 2007.

Çaycı, Ahmet. İslam Mimarisinde Anlam ve Sembol. Konya: Palet Yayınları, 2017.

Çoruhlu, Yaşar. Türk Sanatının Ermeni Sanatına Etkileri. Türk Dünyası Araştırmaları 122/241 (2019), 313-350.

Day, Gail. "Alegori: Between Deconstruction and Dialectic". Oxford Art Journal 22/1 (1999), 102-118.

Demir, Ömer. İktisat Metodolojisi. İstanbul: Sentez Publications, 3rd Edition, 2015.

Direk, Zeynep. "Derrida ve Laiklik Temasa". Erciyes Üniversitesi Felsefe Bölümü Dergisi 1 (2014), 39-60.

Doğan, Samet. "Feminist Sanatta Eleştirel Bir Model Olarak Yapısöküm". UBCAK 8. Uluslararası KongresiBilimsel Çalışmalar Bölümü (15 - 17 Mart 2022). 21-28.

Doğruer, Betül. Nevşehir Damat İbrahim Paşa Külliyesinin Kitabelerinin Estetik Açıdan Değerlendirilmesi. Konya: Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2022.

Erinç, Seymen M. "Bireysel ve Toplumsal Kimlik Arayışında Kültür ve Sanatın Rolü. Sanat Yazıları". Hacettepe Üniversitesi GSF Yayınları 2 (1987), 47-53.

Grabar, Oleg. The Formation of Islamic Art. trans. Yavuz, N. İstanbul: YKY, 2nd ed, 1998.

Harmankaya, N. Çiçek. "Mimar Sinan Cami Sanatında Sembolizm Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme". Sanat Tarih Yıllığı 27 (2018), 1-37.

Harrison, Charles - Orton, Fred. A Provisional History of Art & Language. Paris: E. Fabre, 1982.

Hassanein, İbrahim. Seljuk Effects in Mamlūklu Mining Art. Istanbul: Istanbul Üniversity Sos. Institute of Lean Sciences, Ph. D. Dissertation, 2015.

Kantarcıoğlu, Sevim. Platon'dan Derrida'ya Edebi Akımlar. İstanbul: Paradigma Yayınları, 2009.

Keser, Nimet E. Sanat Sözlüğü. 2. Basım, Ankara: Ütopya Yayınevi, 2009.

Kuban, Doğan. Ortaçağ Anadolu-Türk Sanatı Kavramı Üzerine (Malazgirt Armağanı). Ankara: 1972.

Megill, Allan. Prophets of Extremism, Second Edition. Trans. Birkan, T. Ankara: Ayraç Kitap Evi, 2008.

Mülayim, Selçuk. İslam Sanatı. İstanbul: İsam Yayınları, 2010.

Oğuz, Emine. Küreselleşme Mimarlık İlişkisi ve Uzakdoğu Uygulamaları. Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2019.

Orman, Türkan. Language in the Thought of Jacques Derrida. Yeditepe Üniversitesi Kilikya Felsefe Dergisi 1 (2015), 61-81.

Öney, Gönül. Beylikler Sanatı XIV-XV. Yüzyıl (1300-1453). Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu Basımevi, 1989.

Özgür, Şenay. Oleg Grabar ve İslam Sanatı Yorumu. İzmir: DEÜ Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2007.

Richard, K. Malcom. Derrida. çev. Talay, Z. İstanbul: Kollektif Kitap Yayınları 2014.

Sarre, Friedrich, Reise in Kleinasien, Berlin, Friedrich Sarre (1998), Kücükasya Seyahati / Yazı, çev. Dara Çolakoğlu. İstanbul: Pera, 1895.

Schwab, Michael. The Power of Deconstruction in Artistic Research. London: Working Papers in Art and Design 5, 2009.

Soygeniş, Murat. "Formal Searches in Architecture, Deconstructivism". *Mimarlık* 2 (1989), 96-98.

Şakar, Cemal. "Modern Zamanlarda İslam Sanatı ve Estetiği Ne Diyor?". Hece. Haziran-Temmuz-Ağustos 2 (2013), 198-199-200.

Ferrari N. Kançal-Taşkent, Ayşe. (ed.) Tasvir, Teori ve Pratik Arasında İslam Görsel Kültürü. İstanbul: Babil Yayınevi, 2017.

Tezcan, Gülsen. "İslam Tasvir Sanatında İkonografik Analiz". Türk Dünyası Araştırmaları 183 (2009), 451-458.

Uzunoğlu, Meryem. "Dekonstrüktif Çağdaş Sanat Uygulamaları". YEDİ: Sanat, Tasarım ve Bilim Dergisi 21 (2019), 21-31.

Yanık, Hayrullah. "Yapısöküm Üzerine Birkaç Not". Abant Kültürel Araştırmalar Dergisi (AKAR) 1/2 (2016), 91-98.

#### Internet Bibliography

Eke, Başak Burcu. "Selçuklu Sanatı ve Sentez Arayışları", Fikir Coğrafyası. Erişim 12 Eylül 2022, http://fikircoğrafyaso.com/mak/selcuklu-sanati-ve-sentez-arayisi.

Encin, Matthew. "The Art of Deconstruction", The Futur, Access 01 September 2022 https://thefutur.com/content/art- deconstructinn-reverse-engineer-success.

Lekesiz, Ömer. "Neden Selçuklu sanatı?". Yeni Şafak. Erişim 12 Kasım 2022 http:// www.yenisafak.com/yazarlar/omer-lekesiz/neden-selcuklu-sanati-40872.

Ilıkoba, Hakan."Zaha Hadid'in Mimarlık Sahnesine Çıkışı", Arkitera. Erişim 18 Eylül 2022, http://www.arkitera.com/ haber/ 29445/zaha-hadidin-mimarlik sahnesinecikisi.

Taşkent, Ayşe. "İslam Sanatı Her Zaman Değişime Açıktı". Nihayet Dergisi Erişim 12 Ekim 2022. http://www.gzt.com/nihayet/islam-sanati-her-zamandegisimeacikti-3580636.

Yıldız, Erdal. "Yapıbozum Nedir? Sanat". Tübitak Ansiklopedisi. Erişim 8. Temmuz. 2022. https://ansiklopedi.tubitak.gov.tr/ansiklopedi/yapisokum.