



Muslim Turcophobia: A Study of Two Missionary Authors

Murat Köylü^{1,*}

¹ Çağ Üniversitesi Meslek Yüksekokulu

*Corresponding author

Research Article

History

Received: 15/07/2024

Accepted: 05/11/2024

Plagiarism: This article has been reviewed by at least two referees and scanned via a plagiarism software.

Copyright: This work is licensed under Creative Commons AttributionNonCommercial 4.0 International License (CC BY NC)

Ethical Statement: It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited

ABSTRACT

Among Turks, major religions with universal messages have always been welcomed with tolerance. The fact that Turks generally did not convert to religions other than Islam led to the interpretation of Islam as the most suitable religion for the character and national culture of Turks, and for this reason, Turks accepted Islam voluntarily, not by force. The proximity of the Turks to the Muslim regions made it easier for them to become Muslims and they became Muslims in groups. The statement in the Qur'anic Ayat âl -Kursi; *His pulpit has encompassed the heavens and the earth* السَّمَاوَاتِ كُرْسِيُّهُ وَالْأَرْضَ الْعَظِيمِ الْعَلِيِّ وَهُوَ حِفْظُهُمَا يَوْمَ دُودٍ لَّيْلٍ وَالْأَرْضَ the similarity in the fact that *Gök Tengri*, which they have believed in since the beginning of their existence, is both in the sky and much closer to them (closer than their jugular veins) has facilitated the change of belief in the Turks. The seven stories of the sky, which their ancestors saw as *Uçmak*, the fact that hell is seven stories below the earth, free thought and tolerance in both religions and the fact that there is only one God religion. The compatibility of the belief in God with hundreds of years of customs and traditions facilitated the acceptance of the idea that Islam was a suitable religion for them. The enmity against Muslim Turks, which started in the Christian world with the progress of Turkish tribes towards the West after the adoption of Islam, has increased the efforts of fanatical missionary Christian writers to create prejudice with their publications, which are far from historical facts, to demonize Turks in the Western public opinion. The common characteristics of these writers are that they fictionalize alleged inhumane crimes against Christians and present them as if they were true, and that they unconditionally support Greeks and Armenians, whom they see as the real owners of Anatolia. In this way, they accelerated the spread of "Islamophobia" in Western public opinion, and the persecution and massacres of Muslims were ignored. However, neither the Holy Qur'ân, the Turks, nor the Prophet Muhammad deserve these accusations and slanders. However, the literature review revealed that no specific research (thesis, book, article) has been conducted on the subject. In this context, although Muslim-Turkish enmity has been used in different ways in original studies conducted by researchers, the impact of missionary activities that started especially in the 19th century and the main reasons for this enmity have not been investigated specifically by missionary writers. The publications of the two missionary authors researched in this study have not been translated into Turkish until today. As a methodology, the literature review on the impact of missionary and missionary activities on Muslim Turcophobia was applied in the form of the publications and analysis of the missionary authors taken as an example for the study during the period. The study aims to investigate the root causes of Muslim Turcophobia and to draw the attention of researchers to the issue in the context of two missionary writers (George Horton (d. 1942), Sir Edwin Pears (d. 1919)) who insulted, slandered, and attacked Muslims and saw Muslims as a threat to Christianity in the Turkish nation.

Keywords: History of Religions, Muslim Turkophobia, Missionary, Sir Edwin Pears, George Horton

Müslüman Türk Düşmanlığı: Misyoner İki Yazar Üzerinden Bir Araştırma

Süreç

Geliş: 15/07/2024

Kabul: 05/11/2024

İntihal: Bu makale, en az iki hakem tarafından incelendi ve intihal içermediği teyit edildi.


Telif hakkı: Yazarlar dergide yayımlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmalarını Creative Commons Atıf-GayriTicari 4.0 Uluslararası Lisansı (CC BY NC) kapsamında yayımlanmaktadır.


Etik Beyan: Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.

ÖZ

Türkler arasında evrensel mesajlar içeren büyük dinler her zaman hoşgörü ile karşılanmıştır. Türklerin genellikle İslamiyet dışındaki dinlere geçmemeleri, İslamiyet'in *Türklerin karakterine ve milli kültürüne en uygun din* olarak yorumlanmasına yol açmış, bu nedenle Türkler İslamiyet'i zorla değil, gönüllü olarak kabul etmişlerdir. Türklerin, Müslüman Bölgelerine yakınlığı onların Müslüman olmasını kolaylaştırmış, topluluklar halinde Müslüman olmuşlardır. Kur'an Ayet'i-âl-Kürsi'deki ifadesi ile; *Onun minberi gökleri ve yeri kuşatmıştır* *أَلْعِظْ لَهُمُ الْعَلِيِّ وَهُوَ حَفِظَهُمَا ۚ يَوْمَ لَا وَاللَّارِضِ السَّمَوَاتِ كُرْسِيَهُ* varoluşlarının başlangıcından beri inandıkları *Gök Tengri'nin* hem Gök'te hem de onlara çok daha yakın (şah damarlarından daha yakın) olmasındaki benzerlik Türklerdeki inanç değişimini kolaylaştırmıştır. Atalarının *Uçmak* olarak gördükleri yedi kat gök, cehennem yerin yedi kat altında olması, her iki dinde de özgür düşünce ve hoşgörü olması, tek Tanrı'lı bir din olması. Allah inancının yüzlerce yıllık örf ve adetlerle uyumluluğu İslamiyet'in kendilerine uygun bir din olduğu fikrinin kabulünü kolaylaştırmıştır. Türk kavimlerinin İslamiyet'i kabulünden sonra Batı'ya doğru ilerleyişi ile de Hristiyan dünyasında başlayan Müslüman Türk düşmanlığı, fanatik misyoner Hristiyan yazarların, Türkleri, Batı kamuoyunda şeytanlaştırmaya yönelik, tarihi gerçeklerden çok uzak yayınlarıyla önyargı yaratma çabalarını artırmıştır. Bu yazarların ortak özellikleri; Hristiyanlara yönelik, insanlık dışı olduğu iddia edilen suçları kurgulayarak, gerçekmiş gibi sunmaları, Anadolu'nun gerçek sahibi olarak gördükleri Rum ve Ermenilere, koşulsuz destek vermeleridir. Böylelikle batı kamuoyunda *İslamofobinin* yayılmasını hızlandırmış, Müslümanlara yapılan zulüm ve katliamlar görmezden gelinmiştir. Oysa bu itham ve iftiralara ne Kur'an, ne Türkler, ne de Hz. Muhammet hak etmektedir. Ancak, yapılan literatür taramasında konuyla ilgili özel olarak bir araştırma (tez, kitap, makale) yapılmadığı görülmüştür. Bu bağlamda, Müslüman Türk düşmanlığı, araştırmacılar tarafından yapılan özgün çalışmalarda farklı şekillerde kullanılmış olsa da düşmanlığın, özellikle 19. Yüzyılda başlayan misyonerlik faaliyetlerinin etkisi ve temel nedenleri misyoner yazarlar özelinde araştırılmamıştır. Hatta çalışma kapsamında araştırılan iki misyoner yazarın yayınları bugüne kadar Türkçeye çevrilmemiştir. Metodoloji olarak, misyonerlik ve misyonerlik faaliyetlerinin Müslüman Türk düşmanlığına olan literatür taraması, dönem içinde çalışmaya örnek olarak alınan misyoner yazarların yayınları ve analizi şeklinde uygulanmıştır. Çalışmanın amacı, Müslüman Türk düşmanlığı yapan misyoner yazarların Müslümanlığa karşı hakaret, iftira ve saldırılarının bulunduğu ve Türk milleti özelinde Müslümanlığı, Hristiyanlık karşısında bir tehdit olarak gören iki misyoner yazar (George Horton (öl. 1942), Sir Edwin Pears (öl. 1919)) özelinde Müslüman Türk düşmanlığının temel nedenlerini araştırmak ve araştırmacıların konuya dikkatini çekmektir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Dinler Tarihi, Müslüman Türk Düşmanlığı, Misyonerlik, Sir Edwin Pears, George Horton

 muratkoylu@cag.edu.tr

 0000-0001-7759-7675

Citation / Atıf: Köylü, Murat. "Muslim Turcophobia A Study of Two Missionary Authors". *Cumhuriyet İlahiyat Dergisi* 28/3 (Aralık 2024), 1115-1137. <https://doi.org/10.18505/cuid.1516405>

Introduction

When the study was examined in terms of literature review, doctoral and master's theses prepared so far were examined, but studies specific to Muslim and Turkophobia could not be found. It was observed that the researchers only concluded by examining the relations between Muslims and Christians within missionary activities. It was observed that there were 147 (doctoral and master's) theses on missionary work in the National Thesis Center and these theses were partially used in the preparation of the study. On the other hand, when academic studies (books, articles) were analyzed, it was observed that there was no study specifically on Muslim-Turkish hostility. The publications of the missionary authors taken as examples for the study have not been translated into Turkish until today, nor have they been researched. On the other hand, within the scope of the studies on Muslim Enmity and missionaries, the issue of Muslim Turkophobia was partially touched upon. Relevant sources were utilized in the study. This study, which is a first in the literature, is important in terms of setting an example for future research.

The famous American historian Justin McCarthy wrote the following in the foreword of his book *Death and Exile*, in which he describes the massacres of Muslim Turks by imperialist states during the last period of the Ottoman Empire with material and moral support and historical documents:

This translation appears on the seventeenth anniversary of the publication of *Death and Exile*. *Death and Exile* was not the last word on the atrocities inflicted on the Muslims of the Balkans, Anatoly, and the Southern Caucasus. In the past seventeen years we have learned of others who endured massacre and exile, but were not included in *Death and Exile*: More than three-fourths of the Turks of the Dobruja, for example, died or were forced from their land in the period of the 1877-78 war, as were one-third of the Bosnian Muslims. I and others have written of them elsewhere. Others, especially in Turkey, have written in detail on the fate of the Turks in the wars and deportations in separate regions. New information is being found constantly in the Prime Minister's Archives and the Military Archives. Indeed, the amount of new information on the suffering of the Turks is overwhelming. It will take another, younger, scholar to bring it together into a new and more complete study. Sadly, that scholar also will be able to include new massacres and new Muslim exiles, for Bosnia, Kosovo, and Karabağ have taught us that the death and exile of the Muslims is not over.¹

The Turks, whose living conditions in Central Asia had deteriorated, were introduced to Islam during their westward raids and soon became the guardians (swordsmen) of Islam. After the battle of Malazgirt in 1071 between the Muslim Oghuz Turks and the Eastern Roman Empire, the Oghuzs' homelandization of Anatolia and their dominance over the Middle East (especially Jerusalem) was perceived as a threat to Christianity, and this was the beginning of a war that continues to this day.

The Byzantine Emperor Alexi Komnen (d. 1118), to prevent the settlement of the Turks in Anatolia, had started the Crusades.² *Under the pretext that the Muslim Turks prevented Western pilgrims from traveling freely to the Holy Land*, also the Pope launched the Crusades to retake and hold Jerusalem. With this statement, Muslim Turks were shown as the cause of the Crusades with a

¹ Justin McCarty, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, (İstanbul: İnkılap Kitapevi, 1998), 15- 16.

² İsmail Hakkı Uzunçarşılı, *Büyük Osmanlı Tarihi*. 1. Cilt, (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu), 2.

negative perception of Turks, the east-west distinction was emphasized with the expression *Western pilgrims and Muslim Turks*, and with an expression shaped through the element of religion with the perception of *friend and enemy*, the Turks were made enemies by creating the perception of an "infidel society" that prevented Westerners from pilgrimage.³

After the fall of the Anatolian Seljuk State, the settlement of the Turks in Anatolia and the expansion of their lands by turning their direction to the west was destined to Osman Gazi, the head of the Kayı tribe, and his sons, who were an end principality in the Söğüt region after the collapse of the Anatolian Greek Seljuk State. The Osmanoğulları Principality ensured the growth of the state and its transformation into an empire in a short time with the justice, tolerance, and freedom of belief it showed against the massacres committed by the Crusaders in the Christian lands it conquered in the wars it won. For the West, however, the fall of Constantinople, the capital of the Eastern Roman Empire, in 1453, and the Hagia Sophia, which was built by Emperor Justinian I in the 6th century and is considered the most important church of the Orthodox sect and Christendom after the church of St. Pietro in Rome, *a monument at the crossroads of cultures*, to the Muslim Turks and converted into a mosque caused a great trauma that continues to this day. However, the Turkish army, which entered Istanbul under the command of Sultan Mehmet the Conqueror exactly 250 years after the sack of Istanbul by the Latins, preserved all the cultural heritage and richness of the city, unlike the burning and looting of Istanbul by the Latins, and maintained their existence, beliefs, and culture for hundreds of years with the understanding of tolerance, justice and freedom shown towards other non-Muslim communities, especially the Orthodox community. Even though the Hagia Sophia Church, the most important sanctuary of the Orthodox community, was converted into a mosque, the icons with human figures and Christian signs inside were preserved until today by covering them with plaster, which can be skillfully removed later.

For the American missionary George Horton, 1453 was a black year. For him, the revival of Byzantium, the last remaining civilization in Anatolia, was a missionary mission:

Since that black year of 1453, the only civilization that has existed in Turkey is that provided by the Christian remnants of the former Byzantine Empire. That is why the work of American and other missionaries was of great importance. They first went to Turkey to convert Muslims. They realized that they could not do this, but that their main task was against Christians who were eager for upliftment and enlightenment. The latter's recent rapid development in advanced agriculture, industry, commerce, and education was revitalizing Christianity in the East and reweaving the dilapidated and shattered fabric of the old Byzantine Empire. The great Christian powers were given a late and final opportunity to right the wrong done to the world by the Turkish capture of Hagia Sophia, the temple of eternal wisdom.⁴

³ M. Bileydi Koç, "Fransız Ortaokul Tarih Ders Kitaplarında Türk İmajı". *Cumhuriyet Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 19(37), 348-377, (Bahar 2023), 359.

⁴ George Horton, *The Blight of Asia, An Account of the Systematic Extermination of Christian Populations by Mohammedans and of the Culpability of Certain Great Power, by with the True Story of the Burning of Smyrna*, (USA: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1926), 60.

Sir Edwin Pears, a British missionary who, like Horton, lived in Constantinople for forty years and later wrote two books about his experiences to demonize the Muslim Turks, wrote in his book *Forty Years in Constantinople*:

“The New Rome of Constantine Augustus came under the rule of a horde of Eastern adventurers, originally Turanians and mongrels through polygamy. This was Asia's greatest victory in its dispute with Europe. For decades to come, at least, it seemed likely that the East would be able to destroy all the fruits of Marathon.⁵”

The Ottoman Empire's inability to maintain its position and power against a Europe that became conscious and powerful with the Renaissance and Reform movements that started with the transformation in Europe, the enrichment of the bourgeois class, which became richer and more educated, and the slaughter and plunder of primitive civilizations by the Western explorers crossing the Atlantic Ocean had disrupted the balance of power between them. The era of European kings asking for help from the Ottoman Empire even in their wars with each other was over, and the era of destroying the Ottoman Empire by uniting with their alliances began. For states like the British Empire and France, the Ottoman Empire was an obstacle on the trade routes to their colonies in the east, and a gateway to the warm waters of the Mediterranean and the Persian Gulf for Russia in the north to develop its trade. In short, by the 19th century, the Turkish presence in Anatolia had become an "oriental problem" for the Western powers. The solution was to organize nationalist fanatics among the non-Muslims who had lived peacefully in the Ottoman Empire for hundreds of years, with all kinds of weapons and material support from outside, to create unrest, and to prevent the interventions of the Turkish public order forces against the unrest and riots caused by these disturbers by spreading the false news of *Turks are massacring Christians! through newspapers to the Western Christian public opinion...*, to demonize the Turks by reviving the image of the *barbaric Turks* of hundreds of years ago, to expel them from Anatolian lands to the east, to ensure the establishment of Greek, Armenian, Kurdish, and Arab states in the places vacated by the Turks through mandate administrations to be established under the control of imperialists, and to turn Hagia Sophia back into a church and make it the center of faith of the Orthodox world. To achieve this goal, they aimed to mobilize the pious Greek and Armenian Christians, Kurdish and Arab ethnic structures in Anatolia and the Middle East with the missionaries they sent to Anatolia since the beginning of the 19th century and the missionary schools they opened by using the opportunities created by the Tanzimat and Islahat Edict.

Western Christian fanatics welcomed the success of foreign-sponsored revolts within the Ottoman Empire with great joy, while those that failed were propagandized to Western public opinion as a *Turkish genocide*. In 1821, the establishment of the Greek state in 1830 was applauded, ignoring the tens of thousands of Muslim Turks who were massacred by Greek gangs in the revolt that started in the Peloponnese and was organized by the Philiki Eteria and the Greek Orthodox Church, however, with the same formula, the massacre, and exile of tens of thousands of Muslim Turks by the Armenian Regiments in the Russian army in the First World War to establish an

⁵ Edwin Pears, *Forty Years in Constantinople*, (London Herbert Jenkins Lti., 1916), 3.

Armenian state in six provinces in the east of Anatolia was ignored, and this unsuccessful attempt was presented to the Western public opinion with the lie of *Armenian Genocide*.

As will be seen in the content of the study, the books of missionary writers who have been trying to create unrealistic history and perceptions against Islam and Turkishness for hundreds of years have been an important factor in shaping today's Western politics. It is also a fact that this approach underlies the Christian world's insensitivity to the unjust attacks and atrocities committed against Muslims and Turks all over the world. The fact that Turkish and Muslim academics do not produce sufficient publications against all these claims and slanders creates a big gap in the literature. This study aims to fill this gap in the literature by analyzing the books of two European missionaries who tried to demonize Muslim Turks and denigrate Islam and its sacred values, and by revealing with documents that the seeds of hatred and hatred sown by missionaries in the hearts of pious Christians are the biggest lie of history.

1. Missionary and Missionary Activities in Turkey

The word mission comes from the Latin *Mittere*, meaning to *send*. It was translated into French as a mission, meaning a special task given to someone to do something. Missionary, which comes from the word mission, means "to establish a religious organization, to propagate religion and to make people followers of that religion"⁶. In general, missionary work is defined as "associations established to convert those of other religions to one's religion" and as "organizations that aim to spread Christianity in non-Christian countries"⁷.

Christian missionary work bases its religious reference on the various sayings of Jesus to his disciples in the New Testament texts. Jesus' words said to his disciples as he sent them out are the main reference for Christian missionary work. However, the most fundamental statement in the New Testament used as a reference for missionary work is the following statement in the Gospel of Matthew: "Go therefore and make disciples of all nations and peoples, baptizing them in the name of the Father. Baptize them in the name of the Father and of the Son and the Holy Spirit. Teach them to observe all that I have commanded you, and lo, I am with you all days, even to the end of the world"⁸.

Priests, priests, or clergymen who take part in spreading Christianity are also called missionaries. In short, we can say that missionary work is an organized work unit for spreading Christianity.⁹ "In religious terms, mission and missionary work has been understood as teaching the Gospel, winning non-Christians to this religion, or converting non-Christians to a particular sect in the period from the time of the Apostles to the present day. Missionary work has been put into practice with the help of means such as printing, medical care, and building schools"¹⁰.

⁶ Uygur Kocabaşoğlu, *Kendi Belgeleriyle Anadolu'daki Amerika, Misyoner Okulları*, (İstanbul Arba Publications, 1989), 1.

⁷ Turkish Dictionary, 1998: II, 1571.

⁸ Matthew, *Kaknüs Yayınları*, İstanbul, 2011, 28:19-20; *Bible (New Testament)*, (İstanbul: Dorlion Yayınları, 2020), 24:14.

⁹ A. Mehmet Kocaoğlu, "Misyonerlik Faaliyetlerinden Pontus Rum Devletine Uzanan Süreç", *Giresun Tarihi Sempozyumu*, 24-25 Mayıs 1996, *Bildiriler*, (İstanbul, 1997), 236.

¹⁰ Kocabaşoğlu, *Kendi Belgeleriyle Anadolu'daki Amerika*, 14; Süleyman Kocabaş, *Ermeni Meselesi Nedir? Ne Değildir?* (İstanbul, 1983), 9.

The greatest missionary of the Christian religion was Paul, who was originally Jewish. Paul (Saul of Tarsus) founded many churches and organized Christianity in the important centers of Anatolia and many parts of Asia, Macedonia, and Greece. The struggle between Christians and Roman emperors continued until the conversion of Emperor Constantine in 325. Constantine made Constantinople the capital of *New Rome*. In the history of Christianity, the Council held in Nicaea in 325 under the leadership of Emperor Constantine is very important.¹¹

In the New Age, from the 16th century onwards, with the discovery of the Americas, the so-called *New World*, the Catholic churches sent missionaries to the newly conquered territories of Spain, Portugal, and France. Thus, Central and South America, the Antilles, and the Philippines were converted to Christianity. Christian missionaries propagated this religion to the Far East, reaching as far as Japan, China, and India. The *Society for the Propagation of the Faith*, founded in Rome in the 17th century, was actively directing missionary activities.¹²

Missionaries gave importance to social service organizations such as hospitals and schools. After the nineteenth century, Christian missions opened schools, colleges, hospitals, and nursing schools in many parts of the world. Later, these social activities extended to agricultural services, support, development and cooperative programs, and literacy campaigns.¹³

Missionary activities in the Ottoman Empire began with the activities of the Jesuit, Franciscan, Capuchin, and Lazarist orders, which started to operate under the auspices of France, to unite the Roman and Byzantine churches, namely the Catholic and Orthodox sects, and to increase the authority of the Pope. They also aimed to convert Muslims to Christianity, convert Greeks, Armenians, and non-Catholic Christians within the borders of the Ottoman Empire to Catholicism, and strengthen the influence of France. The reason why Catholic missionaries started their activities early in the Ottoman Empire was the capitulation privileges granted to France.¹⁴

Missionaries in the Ottoman Empire seized every opportunity. In addition to religious activities, foreigners also gained the right to open schools in the Ottoman Empire, and not content with this, they patronized the schools of non-Muslim communities close to them and maintained their influence on these schools. The policy of the foreign states that controlled the missionaries from the beginning was to control the non-Muslim communities in the Ottoman Empire.¹⁵ Non-Muslims, who cooperated with the imperialist states that wanted to destroy and dismember the Ottoman Empire, supported the missionary schools of foreigners and their political goals.¹⁶

The nineteenth century was a century of many changes for the Ottoman Empire. In 1826 the Janissary Corps was abolished, the Tanzimat Edict was proclaimed in 1839, the Reform Edict was proclaimed in 1856, the Ottoman-Russian War of 1877-1878, and the Constitutional Monarchy I was proclaimed in 1876. Especially after the Edict of Reform, missionary activities had accelerated.

¹¹ Mehmet Çelik, *Fener Patrikhanesi'nin Ekümenlik İddialarının Tarihsel Seyri, (325-1453)*, (İstanbul Akademi Kitabevi, 2000), 5.

¹² Remzi Kılıç, "Misyonerlik ve Türkiye'ye Yönelik Misyoner Faaliyetleri", *TÜBAR-XIX-*/(2006-Bahar), 328-338.

¹³ Kılıç, *Misyonerlik ve Türkiye'ye*, 328-338.

¹⁴ Kocabaş, *Kendi Belgeleriyle Anadolu'daki Amerika*, 77-78.

¹⁵ Kılıç, *Misyonerlik ve Türkiye'ye*, 328-338.

¹⁶ Remzi Kılıç, "Osmanlı Türkiye'sinde Azınlık Okulları (19. Yüzyıl)", *Türk Kültürü, Yıl XXXVII*, S. 431, Ankara, 1999, (151-159), 151.

According to missionary sources, by 1893, 1317 missionaries were working in Turkey. 223 of these were American Protestant missionaries. As of 1893, five colleges were serving 4085 students. There were eighty (80) secondary schools and five hundred and thirty (530) elementary schools. In 1897, there were 624 missionary schools in Turkey with a total of 27,400 students.¹⁷

American Dr. Earle states that "In no other country in the world have missionaries and clergymen served imperialism as much as in Turkey".¹⁸ This shows how strategically important Anatolia was identified and targeted even by American missionaries two centuries ago.¹⁹

In 1897, France had 127 schools, England 60, Germany 22, Italy 22, Austria 11, Russia 7, and America 131 schools in the Ottoman Empire. In the early 20th century, there were 209 foreign missionaries, 1299 local workers, 163 churches, 15348 members, 450 schools, and 25,922 students in Turkey.²⁰

With the efforts of Orthodox and Catholic clergymen and Russia, Greek minority schools became centers of mischief against the Ottoman Empire. Their curriculums were filled with anti-Turkic subjects and how they would destroy the Turkish nation and the Ottoman Empire.

Their curricula included subjects such as propagandizing that the Turks were eternal enemies, making Europe hostile to the Turks, weakening them economically, corrupting the Turkish nation in terms of morality, nationality, religion, and traditions, teaching blasphemy, spreading blasphemy among Turks, encouraging Turks to commit adultery and other immoralities, instilling the spirit of a bully in Turkish youth, breaking the bonds of love and respect between them, and getting the teachers to drink.²¹

2. American Missionary George Horton's Missionary Activities in Turkey (From his book "The Catastrophe of Asia" accusing Turks of massacring Greeks and Armenians)

George Horton was a member of the United States of America (USA) diplomatic corps who served in various consular posts in Greece and the Ottoman Empire. He served as US Consul or Consul General in Turkey for two terms (Izmir, 1911-1917 and 1919-1922). The first one ended with the entry of the United States into the First World War and the end of diplomatic relations with the Ottoman Empire, and the second one covered the Greek administration of the city during the Greek-Turkish War. After leaving Smyrna on September 11, 1922, Horton, who had married a Greek (Catherine Sakopoulos (d. 1973)) during his diplomatic mission in Greece, published his book *The Blight of Asia* in 1926, accusing the Turks of massacring Greeks and Armenians in the wake of the fire in Smyrna on the night of September 12-13.

In his book, Horton describes himself as a Christian missionary and a humanist:

¹⁷ Bilal Şimşir, "Ermeni Propagandasının Amerika Boyutu Üzerine", *Tarih Boyunca Türklerin Ermenilerle İlişkileri Sempozyumu*, (8-12 Ekim 1984), (Ankara 1985), 98.

¹⁸ Kocabaş, *Kendi Belgeleriyle Anadolu'daki Amerika*, 28; Kılıç, *Misyonerlik ve Türkiye'ye*, 157.

¹⁹ Kılıç, *Misyonerlik ve Türkiye'ye*, 328-338.

²⁰ Joseph K Greene, *Leavening The Levant*, (Chicago, Boston, New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1916).

²¹ Kocabaş, *Kendi Belgeleriyle Anadolu'daki Amerika*, 95-97.

I am neither “pro-Greek”, nor “pro-Turkish”, nor American, I am nothing but a follower of Jesus. Having passed the most of my life in regions where race feeling runs high, it has been my one aim to help the oppressed, irrespective of race, as will be shown by documents submitted later, and I have won the expressed gratitude of numerous Turks for the aid and relief I have afforded them on various occasions. I am aware of the many noble qualities of the Turkish peasant, but I do not agree with many precepts of his religion, and I do not admire him when he is cutting throats or violating Christian women. The massacres already enumerated are a sufficient blot upon the Turkish name. They were made possible by the teachings of the Koran, the example of Mohammed, lust, and the desire for plunder. They sink into insignificance when compared with the vast slaughter of more recent years, conducted under the auspices of Abdul Hamid, Talaat and Company, and Mustapha Kemal.²²

Horton mentions that he wrote the book for two purposes. The second purpose is a confession of the incitement of Armenians and Greeks against the Ottoman Empire through missionary schools in Anatolia since the middle of the 19th century.

One object of writing this book is to make the truth known concerning the very significant events and to throw the light on an important period during which colossal crimes have been committed against the human race, with Christianity losing ground in Europe and America as well as in Africa and the Near East.

Another object is to show that the destruction of Smyrna was but the closing act in a consistent program of exterminating Christianity throughout the length and breadth of the old Byzantine Empire; the expatriation of an ancient Christian civilization, which in recent years had begun to take on growth and rejuvenation spiritually, largely as a result of the labors of American missionary teachers. Their admirable institutions, scattered all over Turkey, which have cost the people of the United States between fifty million and eighty million dollars, have been, with some exceptions closed, or irreparably damaged, and their thousands of Christian teachers and pupils butchered or dispersed. This process of extermination was carried on over a considerable period of time, with fixed purpose, with system, and with painstaking minute details; and it was accomplished with unspeakable cruelties, causing the destruction of a greater number of human beings than have suffered in any similar persecution since the coming of Christ.²³

In the first chapter of his book, Horton states, "Since its first appearance, Mohammedism has been propagated by the sword and violence as the great enemy of Christianity, as I will show in a later chapter of this book. In recent years, however, it has been left to the Turks to carry on their savage traditions"²⁴, giving round numbers for the massacres committed by the Turks between 1822 and 1909 and the ethnic groups he claims were killed. When the list is examined, it is seen that there is no indication as to why it started in 1822 (without mentioning the date of the beginning of the Greek Revolt). However, Turkish rule in Anatolia, the Balkans, and the Middle East dates back much earlier than this date. Besides Greeks and Armenians, the list includes Bulgarians, Yezidis, Syrians, Assyrians, Maronites, Mekodons, and even Janissaries.

²² Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 9.

²³ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 4.

²⁴ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 6.

When Horton's narratives are analyzed in the following sections, it is seen that he claims that non-Muslims, who lived in peace and tranquility in the Ottoman Empire until 1822, started to be systematically massacred by the Turks for some unexplained reasons, and that this brutality continued until the Armenian deportation in 1915. It is noteworthy that Horton never mentions the Muslim Turks who were massacred during the Greek revolt that started in 1821. However, the truth was different. The American writer Justin McCarthy, in his book *Death and Exile*, emphasizes that the Greeks in the Peloponnese were engaged in a general policy of extermination against the Muslims, and the nationalist slogan of the uprising was the slogan uttered by Bishop Germanos: "Peace for Christians! Respect for the consuls! Death to the Turks!"²⁵. McCarthy narrates the Tripoli massacre with the following striking sentences:

"For three days the poor Turkish settlers were subjected to the lust and cruelty of a mob of savages. They were spared neither in terms of gender nor age. Even women and children were tortured before being killed. The slaughter was on such a massive scale that even Kolokotronis himself, the gangster's brigand, said that when I entered the town, starting from the gate of the upper fortress, my horse's feet never touched the ground. The victory celebration parade route was paved with a blanket of corpses".²⁶ In his study titled "Peloponnesian Turks Destroyed in the Independence Process of Greece" published by Istanbul University Faculty Member Ali Gönenç, he writes: "The population of Greece decreased from 938,765 to 752,077 between 1821 and 1838. The biggest share in this decrease of nearly 200 thousand belongs to the Peloponnese Turks".²⁷

The Greek revolt against the Ottoman Empire began in March 1821 with the massacre of some officials of the Ottoman state, especially tax collectors. This was followed in April by generalized attacks on Turks living in the Peloponnese in southern Greece. Greek bandits and peasants massacred all the Turks they could find. Ottoman soldiers, both Turkish and Albanian, were ambushed and killed. Some, like the Muslim inhabitants of Kalavryta and Kalamata, surrendered, believing that the Greeks would leave them alive. But they too were killed. Many others, like the Turks of Laconia, were massacred on the roads as they fled.²⁸

Meanwhile, in every corner of the peninsula, the Christian population attacked and murdered the Muslim population. The mansions and vineyards of the Muslims were burned, and their property destroyed to discourage those who had fled desperately to the fortresses from returning. In 1821, between March 26 and Easter on April 22, 1821, more than fifteen thousand [Muslim] lives are thought to have been mercilessly taken and some three thousand Turkish vineyards and settlements destroyed.²⁹

Horton, as a devoted Christian missionary, reveals at the end of the book that his real intention was to discredit Islam and its holy book, the Qur'an, and its Prophet Muhammad:

²⁵ McCarthy, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, 9-10; Ali Gönenç, "Yunanistan'ın Bağımsızlık Sürecinde Yok Edilen Mora Türkleri". *Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih*, 11(12), 5-32, (Ankara, 2011), 11.

²⁶ McCarthy, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, 10; Gönenç, *Yunanistan'ın Bağımsızlık Sürecinde*, 14.

²⁷ Gönenç, *Yunanistan'ın Bağımsızlık Sürecinde*, 25.

²⁸ McCarthy, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, 10-11; Gönenç, *Yunanistan'ın Bağımsızlık Sürecinde*, 25.

²⁹ McCarthy, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, 11.

The strange state of mind that enables the Turk to commit atrocities against humanity that shock and humiliate the entire race is due to three things: His own nature, the teaching of the Koran, and the example of the Prophet. This is what Gladstone³⁰ meant when he spoke of "the union of his nature and his religion".³¹

Horton takes his allegations one step further by claiming that the Qur'an is taken from the *Old Testament* and continues to make derogatory slanderous claims about the Prophet Muhammad:

The Quran is based on the Old Testament and the main historical characters of this book are included in it. It is complemented or supplemented by a belief in supernatural beings, such as the Jinn in many of the Eastern fairy tales and the Thousand and One Nights; to these are added the so-called revelations of the Prophet. Some of these are merely to allow Muhammad to satisfy his own desires, such as when a friend was ordered by an angel to give his beautiful wife to the Prophet.³²

But according to him, the Gospel (New Testament):

"...advocates purity of life and even turns to asceticism. Jesus himself was unmarried and immaculate. The Qur'an is sensual in its teachings about this life and the afterlife. It promises the true believer a share of the females in paradise when he reaches the afterlife. The relationship of earthly wives to this new group is more or less unclear. This doctrine of the Qur'an sheds a clear light on the contemptuous view of women held by Muhammad's followers".³³

Horton went even further in his criticism of the Prophet Muhammad, calling him a *genocidal murderer*.

Muhammad was a polygamist; after leaving Mecca for Medina, where he settled for a while, he raided and plundered caravans to replenish his depleted treasury; he besieged and plundered cities to obtain booty, justifying it with "revelations"; he ordered eight hundred Jewish captives to be separated from their wives and children, slaughtered and their bodies thrown into a ditch. Their wives and families were sold into slavery. This was the first massacre of Muslims; he ordered brutal and inhuman punishments; he eliminated his enemies by murder and assassination.³⁴

In the last lines of his book, Horton summarizes his view of Turkey as follows:

The educated, Europeanized Turk of Constantinople is a shrewd and flamboyant gentleman with a seductive manner, but those who are interested in the future of Turkey, materially or morally, should never forget that this country has been *homogenized* through a series of brutal massacres carefully planned and relentlessly carried out by flamboyant and seductive gentlemen who exploit Muslim fanaticism for their own ends, and their power is based on this fanaticism.³⁵

About Horton, Brian Coleman, in his study *George Horton: The Literary Diplomat*, published in the journal *Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies*, describes Horton as follows;

³⁰ British statesman and Liberal politician. In a career lasting over 60 years, he served for 12 years as Prime Minister of the United Kingdom, spread over four non-consecutive terms (the most of any British prime minister) beginning in 1868 and ending in 1894.

³¹ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 90.

³² Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 91.

³³ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 92.

³⁴ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 93.

³⁵ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 94.

"George Horton was a man of letters and US Consul General in Greece and Turkey during a period of social and political change. He wrote about the retaking of Smyrna by the Turkish army in September 1922. His writings and statements go beyond accusations and events to the demonization of Muslims in general and Turks in particular. In many of his novels, written more than twenty years before the events of September 1922, he described the Turk as the villain of Western civilization. In his account of Smyrna, he should be seen more as a propagandist than a historian.³⁶

Horton, who was an inveterate Turk and Muslim hater, waged a war against Islam and Turkishness, which was welcomed by fanatical Christian circles, especially the Greeks and Armenians of America, and his book became a source for the theses of writers who propagated Turkophobia. Worse still, the prejudice created against Muslim Turks as the *Armenian Genocide* in 1915 influenced Western public opinion.

3. British Missionary Sir Edwin Pear's Missionary Activities in Turkey (Turkey and Its People and Forty Years in Constantinople Books)

Sir Edwin Pears, was born in 1835 in York, England. Robert Pears was a wealthy man and arranged for Edwin to receive a special education. Edwin Pears studied law at the University of London during his studies; he became interested in Roman law and began to work in this field. It was during these studies that a decisive influence on his personality emerged. In addition to law, Pears also became interested in history. This interest, which was also influenced by the religious-centered special education he received in his childhood, led him to produce works in the field of history in which he reflected his religious prejudice.³⁷

One of the main bases of the Armenian claims is Sir Edwin Pears and his books *Turkey and its People* and *Forty Years in Constantinople*. His books, which he wrote as a journalist and jurist, managed to resonate throughout Europe. News that Muslim Turks were massacring Christians and Anatolia was turning into a bloodbath caused great outrage in Europe. Taking advantage of this outrage, British Prime Minister Gladstone managed to launch a major campaign against the Turks based on Pears' writings.³⁸

A British officer named Fred Burnaby (d. 1885), influenced by these reports, traveled to Turkey to investigate the massacres and wrote that what they had been told was a big lie and that "writers who consider themselves Christians should take lessons from the Turks in Anatolia in many matters."³⁹

In 1873, he temporarily accepted a legal position in Istanbul, which he learned was vacant. He stayed in Istanbul for forty years until he was forcibly removed. Pears started his career as a lawyer

³⁶ Brian Coleman, "George Horton: the literary diplomat". *Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies*, 30 (1), 81-93, 2006, 81.

³⁷ Taha Niyazi Karaca, "Ermeni Sorunu ile İlgili Bir İngiliz Kaynağı Üzerine Eleştirel Değerlendirme", *Belleten C. LXVII*, 34, 520.

³⁸ Edwin Pears, *Dictionary of National Biography Twentieth Century 1912-1921*, (Edited by, H.W.C. Davis and J.R.H.Weaver), (London, Oxford University Pres, 1927), 428.

³⁹ Fred Barnaby, *At Sirtında Anadolu* (Çev: Fatma Taşkent), (İstanbul, İletişim Yayınları, 1999), 115.

in the British law office in Istanbul and quickly became the most famous member of the British colony in Turkey. In 1881, he was appointed as the President of the European Consular Bar Association, a position that could be considered the pinnacle of his professional career. In the meantime, he continued to work as a correspondent for the Daily News newspaper, adding journalism to his title as a lawyer and historian. During his time in Turkey, he became an implacable enemy of Abdülhamit (d. 1917), and revealed his thoughts about the Sultan in his book⁴⁰ "The Life of Abdülhamit"⁴¹.

Pears' claim that the idea of "believers treating non-believers as inferior", which is usually attributed to Judaism, is a rule of Islam, can be considered in good faith as "ignorant", but in bad faith as a malicious denigration of Islam:

A great hindrance to the reception by Moslems of European ideas concerning politics, philosophy, or religion is the spiritual pride of the Mahometan, by which term I mean the undoubting conviction that the believer in the religion of Mahomet has a divine right to treat all non-believers as on a lower plane, to reduce them to subjection if they are Jews or Christians, and to exterminate them if they are idolaters. Among the ignorant masses of Moslem Turks, this sense of superiority is deep. This attitude of spiritual conceit can only arise from the conviction of ignorance that divine Power has ordained that Moslems should possess dominance over other men. Once let the Sacred Books be examined and discussed, as they are beginning to be, and the conviction of inherent superiority will diminish or disappear.⁴²

Islam is not only the last religion sent by God Almighty to all mankind through Prophet Muhammad but also the religion of *love and tolerance*. The Holy Quran recognizes all religions and prophets sent before Islam and declares them to be the "true religion":

Then We sent Our messengers one after another in their footsteps. And We sent Jesus, son of Mary, after them, and We gave him the Gospel, and made compassion and mercy in the hearts of those who followed him. And We did not prescribe for them the spiritualism which they had invented (as an innovation). But they invented it to seek Allah's pleasure, but they did not follow it properly. We gave the reward to those of them who believed, but many of them were transgressors.

43

ثُمَّ قَفَّيْنَا عَلَىٰ آثَارِهِم بِرُسُلِنَا وَقَفَّيْنَا بِعِيسَىٰ ابْنِ مَرْيَمَ وَآتَيْنَاهُ الْإِنجِيلَ وَجَعَلْنَا فِي قُلُوبِ الَّذِينَ اتَّبَعُوهُ رَأْفَةً وَرَحْمَةً ۗ وَرَهَابَانِيَّةً ابْتَدَعُوهَا مَا كَتَبْنَا عَلَيْهِمْ إِلَّا اتِّبَاعَ آيَاتِ اللَّهِ فَمَا رَعَوْهَا حَقَّ رِعَايَتِهَا فَآتَيْنَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا مِنْهُمْ أَجْرَهُمْ ۗ وَكَثِيرٌ مِنْهُمْ فَاسِقُونَ

Verily, whoever of the believers (and) the Jews, Christians, and Sabians believes in Allah and the Last Day and does righteous deeds, they shall have their reward with Allah. There is no fear for them and they shall not grieve.⁴⁴

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَالَّذِينَ هَادُوا وَالنَّصَارَىٰ وَالصَّابِئِينَ ۗ مِنْ آمَنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ وَعَمِلَ صَالِحًا فَلَهُمْ أَجْرُهُمْ عِنْدَ رَبِّهِمْ ۗ وَلَا خَوْفٌ عَلَيْهِمْ وَلَا هُمْ يَحْزَنُونَ

⁴⁰ Edwin Pears, *The Life of Abdülhamit*, (London Constable&Company Ltd., 1917).

⁴¹ Karaca, *Ermeni Sorunu ile İlgili Bir İngiliz Kaynağı*, 520-521.

⁴² Edwin Pears, *Turkey and Its People*, (London: Methuen & Co. Ltd., 1911), 318-334.

⁴³ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı Meali*, Hadimü'l Haremeyni Ş-Şerifeyn Kral Fehd Mushaf-ı Şerif Basım Kurumu, Âl-Hadid, 57/27.

⁴⁴ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı*, Âl-Baqarah, 2/62.

Verily, those who believe and those of the Jews, Sabians, and Christians who believe in Allah and the Last Day and do righteous deeds, for them there is no fear, nor shall they grieve.⁴⁵

إِنَّ الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا وَالَّذِينَ هَادُوا وَالصَّابِئِينَ وَالنَّصَارَىٰ مِنَ آمَنَ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ وَعَمِلُوا صَالِحًا فَلَا خَوْفٌ عَلَيْهِمْ وَلَا هُمْ يَحْزَنُونَ

Ignoring tens of thousands of women who were burned to death in the Middle Ages, which they call the Dark Ages, accusing them of "witchcraft", Pears claims that Islam degrades women.

The greatest drawback to the progress of Moslem civilization is the position popularly assigned to women. Thoughtful men among foreigners recognize that this is the most serious blot upon Mahometan practice. Lady Mary Montagu, writing in 1717, said it was a popular delusion among Christian peoples that in accordance with Turkish belief, women have no souls. She then goes on to explain that the belief is that they have souls but of an inferior character to those of men.⁴⁶

However, two verses in the Qur'an are clear that women have souls and can enter Paradise with men:

Allah has promised the believing men and women gardens from whose bank's rivers flow, and dwellings in the Gardens of Aden, in which they will enjoy pure pleasures and pleasures forever. And Allah's pleasure is even greater. This is the greatest salvation and attainment.⁴⁷

وَعَدَ اللَّهُ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ وَالْمُؤْمِنَاتِ جَنَّاتٍ تَجْرِي مِنْ تَحْتِهَا الْأَنْهَارُ خَالِدِينَ فِيهَا وَمَسَاكِنَ طَيِّبَةً فِي جَنَّاتِ عَدْنٍ ۗ وَرِضْوَانٌ مِنَ اللَّهِ أَكْبَرَ ۗ ذَٰلِكَ هُوَ الْفَوْزُ الْعَظِيمُ

Those who believe and do good deeds, whether men or women, will enter Paradise and will not be persecuted even a hair, and their rights will not be lost.⁴⁸

وَمَنْ يَعْمَلْ مِنَ الصَّالِحَاتِ مِنْ ذَكَرٍ أَوْ أُنْثَىٰ وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ فَأُولَٰئِكَ يَدْخُلُونَ الْجَنَّةَ وَلَا يُظْلَمُونَ نَقِيرًا

In his book *Forty Years in Constantinople* Pears recounts an *untrue* memory of the massacre of Christian Bulgarians by Muslims. This anecdote was later cited and used by all anti-Turkish and anti-Muslim missionary writers:

Let me tell of one atrocity which I do not remember to have published. A Bulgarian family of Moslems, living at Bebek on the Bosphorus, was visited by a friend of mine who was a doctor, or hakim. The head of the household was lying ill, stricken with fever. My friend was received by the poor distracted wife, who had already lost two of her children. She thanked the doctor but spoke to him in the following terms: " You can do no good here. Hakim, because this is Allah's business. I will tell you how I know. We were living in a Bulgarian village and our next-door neighbors were Christians. The children of the two houses played together, and when I wanted a lettuce or the loan of a pan, they were always ready to oblige me. One day my husband came to me and said, ' Orders have come for us to kill the Christians, and I have to kill our neighbors; " The woman's instinct revolted. She declared that they had always been kind and had done them no harm, and she did not care who had given the orders, they ought not to be obeyed. Her husband replied that he must carry out the Padishah's command. " Then," said she, " if you do, Allah will punish you... He killed them all. Hakim and I saw the dead bodies of our own children's playmates lying out in the field. Yes, this is Allah's business. He has taken away my two children, and he'll take my husband away. He won't kill me. You can do nothing to save him." Nor could she. Mr. (afterward Sir John) Robinson, of

⁴⁵ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı*, Âl-Ma'idah, 5/69.

⁴⁶ Pears, *Turkey and Its People*, 318-334.

⁴⁷ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı*, Âl-Tawbah, 9/72.

⁴⁸ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı*, Âl-Nisa, 4/124.

the Daily News, sent me a telegram reporting what Mr. Disraeli had said, and adding that he desired full explanations. Thereupon I saw various friends, and especially Dr. Long and Dr. Washburn, who furnished me with translations of a mass of correspondence, from which I wrote a second and longer letter to the Daily News. In my first letter, I gave the names of thirty-seven villages that had been destroyed and whose inhabitants had been tortured or killed. In the second letter, written on June 30th, I brought the number of destroyed villages up to sixty and stated that I had seen an official report that estimated the number of persons killed at 12,000.⁴⁹

The example given by Pears is impressive and written in such a way as to arouse hatred when read. However, the events described are based on completely unknown people. A Muslim woman's conversation with a foreign doctor, which constitutes the basis of the incident, is another issue to be criticized within the cultural structure of the period.

However, the reality was quite the opposite.

Reforms were carried out in many areas to abolish religious discrimination and to ensure that everyone had the same legal status as *equal Ottoman citizens*. However, what non-Muslims wanted was no longer new rights and equality, but the establishment of their national states. The first examples were the 1803 Karayorgi and 1821 Peloponnese revolts and the independence of Greece in 1829. The Bulgarians, who had been under the rule of the Greek Patriarchate of Fener for centuries and were included in the *Greek Nation*, also revolted frequently starting from 1841 as a result of the provocations of Russia. Their aim was first to get rid of Greek domination and then to ensure their political unity by establishing independent national churches.⁵⁰

Greek uprisings contributed greatly to the Bulgarian uprisings and the loss of Rumelia in general. In the Peloponnese, Greek gangs killed 15.000 Turks. These gangs aimed to eliminate the Turks who prevented them from creating a nation. Even though the Ottoman Empire had the power to suppress this rebellion, the Western world supported the Greek gangs. The same scenario would later be seen in the Bulgarian uprisings

The famous historian Justin McCarty in his book "Death and Exile"⁵¹ describes the migration of Muslim refugees in Bulgaria as one of the most horrifying in history. The cause of this horrifying situation was Balkan communism.

The Russian consul in Plovdiv, Nayden Gerov (d. 1900), and the Russian ambassador in Istanbul, the pro-pan Islamism Ignatiew, had a special role in preparing the Bulgarians for the uprising. Turkish and foreign documents confirm that the Bulgarian uprising was organized by the Bulgarian-born Nayden Gerov, who worked in the region continuously between 1857 and 1876.⁵² After all these developments, Bulgarian nationalists began to ignite the fuse of uprising in some villages. They organized the Batak, Pirastim Derbendi, Çömlek village, and Braçkova uprisings. It should be recalled that before these uprisings, there had been uprisings in Tyrnova in 1835, in Nish in 1841, and Vidin in 1850.⁵³ At this point, the year 1876 was a turning point.

⁴⁹ Pears, *Turkey and Its People*, 10-17.

⁵⁰ Gülnihal Bozkurt, "II. Meşrutiyet Osmanlı Meclis Zabıtlarında Bulgar Azınlıklarının Kilise ve Okul Sorunları", 101, <http://dergiler.ankara.edu.tr/dergiler/19/821/10417.pdf>, (Accessed 03 Nov 2023).

⁵¹ McCarty, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, 108.

⁵² British Documents, vol.2, Doc.286, Brophy'den *Elliot'a*, 1876 (Accessed 13 May 2024).

⁵³ Mustafa Burma, "Bulgaristan'ın Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'ndan Ayrılış Sürecinde Bulgar Ayaklanmaları", *Balkan Araştırma Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 1(1), 67-90. <http://www.turkishstudies.net/dergi/cilt1/sayi2/makale/kose2.pdf>, (Accessed 03 Nov 2023).

The first person to go to the region to investigate the uprising was Walter Baring. Baring reported that the number of those killed, including the Batakköy region, was 7,145.⁵⁴ The reports of Blacque and Yonançe Efendi, sent by the Ottoman Government to investigate the uprising, stated that the number of Bulgarians killed was not more than 3000. One of the people who gave the most accurate information about the uprising, but who was ignored by many foreign researchers, was W.L.Stoney (d. 1911), the chief representative of the Central Relief Committee. Stoney worked in the region for 6 months and visited more than 150 villages, including Bulgarian, Turkish, and mixed villages, and in his report, he put the number of people killed at 3,694, including some Turks.⁵⁵ In conclusion, taking all reports into account, it can be said that approximately 3000 Bulgarians and over 500 Turks were killed in the Bulgarian uprising and its suppression. Nevertheless, some sources exaggerated the death toll and increased it from 12,000 to 100,000.⁵⁶

Şevket Sürreyya Aydemir (d. 1976), in his book *The Man Searching for Water*, in which he describes his life in Edirne, where he spent his childhood, describes his experiences at that time as follows:

As was the case in European Turkey, that is, in all of Rumelia, gangs and committeemen were swarming around our border city of Edirne. Half bandit, half politician gangsters, Greek gangsters, Bulgarian gangsters, and mostly Bulgarians... They would raid villages and farms from time to time. According to the stories, a gangster could be seen anywhere and in any outfit. For example, one day in a village masjid, after the morning call to prayer, a dervish with a beautiful voice was reciting the Quran. The congregation stood in rows with their heads in front of them, listening to the Quran. Then, when the music was heard, the prayer was stopped. The dervish with a beautiful voice closed the Qur'an, put it on his prayer rug, and joined the congregation. But a little later, a bomb exploded underneath this prayer rug. The masjid was devastated. The dead were piled on top of each other. However, the dervish was not among them. He had escaped, he was a gangster...⁵⁷

Pears is an admirer of the Armenian nation. According to him, since Armenians were a brave and heroic race, they proved their courage in every region they fought for centuries against Persians, Arabs, Turks, and Kurds and rebelled against centuries of genocide under Muslim rule. With these characteristics, Armenians have also been the representatives of Christianity for centuries. He expresses his deep love for them in his book as follows:

In some respects, the Armenians are the most interesting people in Asia Minor. They are physically a fine race. The men are usually tall, well-built, and powerful. The women have a healthy look about them which suggests good motherhood. They are an ancient people of the same Indo-European race as ourselves, speaking an allied language. During long centuries they held their own against Persians, Arabs, Turks, and Kurds. Wherever they have had a fighting chance they proved their courage. In the economic struggle for life against alien races they and the Jews have managed to hold their own; but, unlike the Jews, a large proportion of them have remained tillers of the soil. In commerce, they are successful not only in Turkey, but in Russia, France, England, and India. Though subject to persecution for centuries under Moslem rule they have always, though sometimes after long and arduous struggle, managed to make their race respected.⁵⁸ "

⁵⁴ British Documents, vol.2, Doc.451, "Report by Mr. MBaring on the insurrection of 1876 (Accessed 13 May 2024).

⁵⁵ Burma, Bulgaristan'ın Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'ndan Ayrılış, 67-90.

⁵⁶ Burma, Bulgaristan'ın Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'ndan Ayrılış, 67-90.

⁵⁷ Şevket Süreyya Aydemir, *Suyu Arayan Adam*, (İstanbul: Remzi Kitapevi, 2020, 10-15).

⁵⁸ Pears, *Turkey and Its People*, 270.

Obviously, the author had been trying to mobilize the religious feelings of his readers with his statements and develop antipathy towards Turks and Muslims. However, he avoids mentioning the situation of Armenians, especially in the Byzantine Empire. All historical facts show that Armenians were completely freed from Byzantine oppression and persecution after they came under Seljuk rule.⁵⁹ During the Ottoman period, Armenians, who received the title of "the most loyal nation", were assigned many positions in the state organization, including ministries and high-level bureaucracy.⁶⁰

The great hatred that Pears felt towards Muslims, especially Muslim Turks was nothing but the deep sadness and anguish that he felt because Istanbul, which was called *Queen City* by those who thought like him and which was the dream of the whole Christian world, where Hagia Sophia, one of the most important temples of the Christian world, was turned into a mosque, was in the hands of Muslim Turks. He expressed this anguish in his book *Forty Years in Constantinople* as follows:

Constantine, the New Rome of Augustus, came under the power of a band of oriental adventurers, originally Muslim Turks, and mongrels through polygamy. This was Asia's greatest victory in its dispute with Europe. Under its new masters, Constantinople was destined to become the most corrupt capital of Europe, incapable of adding any value to the history of the human race. Since 1453, no art, no literature, not even any handicrafts, nothing that the world would gladly preserve has come from Queen City. The occupation has been a misfortune with almost no compensating advantages for the world, as far as the human eye can see. Poverty as a result of mismanagement is the most conspicuous consequence of the conquest affecting the Empire's subjects. Lands were allowed to fall out of cultivation. Industries were lost. Mines were forgotten. Trade and exchange almost disappeared. Population declined. The richest state in Europe became the poorest; the most civilized the most barbaric... The demoralization of the conquered people and their churches was no less catastrophic than the damage to their material interests. Christians lost their heart. Their physical courage waned. The capture of the Queen City was followed by massacres and rapes of women. It continued until the final and complete annihilation of the Christians by the Turks. In the nearly five centuries that have passed, nothing has changed. The Turk has changed neither his character nor his methods.⁶¹

Evaluation

Islam is the greatest enemy of the missionaries. The fact that Judaism was a closed religion specific to the Jewish nation did not bother Christian missionaries much. However, Islam's teachings that spread to humanity with its existence, and most importantly, the unchanged purity of the Quran, which consists of the sacred texts sent to humanity by the Creator, on the other hand, the contradictions between the Old Testament and the New Testament, which constitute the basis of Christianity, the acceptance of four different Gospels among dozens of Gospels by Constantine I in Nicaea in 325 A.D. as sacred texts, and the different approaches between the Gospels caused doubts to arise against Christian teachings. Initially shown as a "hope of salvation" to oppressed

⁵⁹ Louise Nalbandian, *The Armenian Revolutionary Movement, The Development of Armenian Political Parties through the Nineteenth Century*, (California: University of California Press, 1963), 14.

⁶⁰ İlber Ortaylı, *IL Abdülhamit Devrinde Taşra Bürokrasisinde Gayri Müslimler, Sultan II. Abdülhamit ve Devri Semineri*, (İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Tarih Araştırma Merkezi), 1994, 163-171.

⁶¹ Pears. *Turkey and Its People*, 10-17.

nations, Christianity was then used effectively as a rebellion against emperors and the authority of the human system, based on the principle of *Jesus' rule on earth (Establishment of the State of God)*, and with the realization of its commercial and political gains over time, it has ensured its continued existence until today.

Among ancient Turkic societies, faith was seen as a choice rather than an instrument of oppression. In their nomadic life between East and West, the Turkic societies, whose belief in *Gök Tengri* was widespread, were influenced by Buddhism and Confucianism in China in the East and made their choices by meeting Judaism, Islam, and Islam in the West. The acceptance of Islam by the Turks contributed greatly to the transformation of Islam, which was considered to be a religion peculiar to the Arabs who were stuck in the Middle East in the face of the attacks of Christianity, into a world religion as the *Protector and Sword of Islam*. Naturally, the greatest enemy of the missionaries was the Turks rather than the Arabs.

Although Horton was an official of the diplomatic corps of the US government, he defined himself as a missionary, saying "I am neither pro-Greek, nor pro-Turkish, nor pro-American, nor pro-Horton's becoming a missionary was an indication of the US policy of expansion in Europe and especially in the Middle East. Since the beginning of the 20th century, the emergence of oil in the Middle East geography has put an end to the US's nearly century-long policy of isolation (seclusion). In the chaos created by the First World War, US President Wilson, a farsighted academic, planned to take the role of the war-weary Great British Empire in the region and pursue a foreign policy aimed at increasing its interests by dominating the small mandate states to be established under the name of 12 principles, which would be made possible by the activities of missionaries like Horton. In this case, Horton was saying that the US should invade:

Giving us a chance in the struggle for Mosul and oil has been the goal of all negotiations, but today it would be better for the United States to occupy the region than to look after the interests of the oil kings. Publicly it may speak of peace and civilization, but privately it speaks of oil because the territories where future concessionaires will strive to secure their rights are now in danger.⁶²

But Horton was a romantic missionary. Although portraying Turks as genocidal murderers had been a product of British and Russian politics in previous years, unlike them, he added Islam and its Prophet Muhammad to his propaganda with the impulse of his missionary zeal. According to him, not only the Turks were an inferior race that had to be destroyed, but also Islam, which gave them power, had to be destroyed and *Jesus' dominion over the earth* had to be realized. What disturbed him was that "a strong element of the religion of Mohammed is that it is sincere and gives free rein to the passions and impulses of man's lower nature. Whatever the teachings of the Qur'an about spreading its teachings by the sword - because the translations of this holy book are numerous and one could find anything one wished in it".⁶³ For him, how could "a polygamist who plundered camel caravans and ordered the assassination of his enemies be so accepted? This is not meant to denigrate the Prophet but as a statement of known historical facts. The Qur'an, which advocates many virtues, gives more space to human passions and appeals more to the natural man than the asceticism of

⁶² Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 85.

⁶³ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 85.

Christianity, and therefore spreads more rapidly among primitive peoples and those with a lower level of civilization.⁶⁴

Horton expressed his concern about the rapid spread of Islam ahead of Christianity with an example:

"I once met a sweet missionary woman who was returning to America from Africa with her feverish little child for treatment. She told me of the great advance of Islam in Africa and the seemingly hopeless task of Christian missionaries there. She drew up a kind of map of mission stations and explained: "We are trying to put a barrier in Africa to prevent the spread of Islam southward, beyond the equator."⁶⁵

However, Horton, who accused the Turks of genocide, overlooked a very important detail in history. European colonizers started plundering the African continent from the 1500s onwards, and by the 1900s, slave traders had enslaved millions of Africans under the name of free labor in the agricultural fields of the new colonial areas in America. Between these years, 11-13 (according to some sources 28) million Africans were enslaved and 25-30% of this number died within the first two years as a result of the harsh working conditions, torture, and inhuman treatment imposed by the colonizers.⁶⁶

Europeans' colonization and genocide were not limited to Africa. While eight million Arawaks Indians lived on the island of Hispaniola (Haiti and the Dominican Republic), which was discovered by the Spanish explorer Christopher Columbus (d. 1506) in 1492, this number was reduced to only 28 thousand after 22 years of Spanish rule. Again, in the Caribbean in 1493, 8 million Tainos Indians were almost wiped out after 50 years of Spanish rule.⁶⁷ Bartelemo de las Casas (d. 1566), a Dominican Spanish missionary of the time who witnessed the events, described the massacre of Europeans in his memoirs as follows:

In one day, the Spaniards mutilated, beheaded, and raped 3000 thousand people in front of Las Casas. Unprecedented barbarism and inhuman events took place in front of my eyes. The Spaniards cut off the legs of children fleeing from them. They threw people into boiling cauldrons of soap. Our soldiers committed cruel massacres. They raided villages and cities and showed no mercy to men, women, old people, and children. They showed no mercy to pregnant women, ripped open their bellies, and butchered unborn babies...⁶⁸

In the 19th century, the famous British novelist Anthony Trollope (d. 1882), who visited Australia, summarized what the British colonizers did to the Indigenous Australians as follows:

We took away their (the natives') land (homeland), destroyed their food, and imposed our laws which were contrary to their customs and traditions. When they tried to defend themselves or their property in their way, we slaughtered them...We taught them to accept that we were their masters through harsh warfare.⁶⁹

There are dozens of massacres written in the history of Europeans. However, neither in Turkish history nor in Islam is it possible to find any record of mass murder of human beings. Islam, a

⁶⁴ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 85.

⁶⁵ Horton, *The Blight of Asia*, 85.

⁶⁶ Sefa. M. Yürükel, *Batının İnsanlık Suçları I, Soykırımlar Tarihi*, (Ankara Near East Publishing, 2005), 11-18.

⁶⁷ Yürükel, *Batının İnsanlık Suçları I*, 21.

⁶⁸ Yürükel, *Batının İnsanlık Suçları I*, 21.

⁶⁹ Yürükel, *Batının İnsanlık Suçları I*, 30.

human-based religion, and its holy book, the Quran, contain dozens of verses on the value of human life. A few of them are as follows:

"That is why we laid down for the Children of Israel: "Whoever kills a man except as a punishment for killing a life or for causing mischief in the land, it is as if he had killed all mankind. And whoever saves a life, it is as if he had saved the lives of all mankind."⁷⁰

مِنْ أَجْلِ ذَلِكَ كَتَبْنَا عَلَىٰ بَنِي إِسْرَائِيلَ أَنَّهُ مَن قَتَلَ نَفْسًا بِغَيْرِ نَفْسٍ أَوْ فَسَادٍ فِي الْأَرْضِ فَكَأَنَّمَا قَتَلَ النَّاسَ جَمِيعًا وَمَنْ أَحْيَاهَا فَكَأَنَّمَا أَحْيَا النَّاسَ جَمِيعًا وَلَقَدْ جَاءَتْهُمْ رُسُلُنَا بِالْبَيِّنَاتِ ثُمَّ إِنَّ كَثِيرًا مِنْهُمْ بَعْدَ ذَلِكَ فِي الْأَرْضِ لَمُسْرِفُونَ

In another verse;

Do not kill a life which Allah has forbidden to be killed without just cause. Whoever is killed unjustly, we have authorized his guardian to seek his right. But let not that guardian go too far in killing and exceed the limit set by Allah. For with this authority, he has already been given the necessary help.⁷¹

وَلَا تَقْتُلُوا النَّفْسَ الَّتِي حَرَّمَ اللَّهُ إِلَّا بِالْحَقِّ ۗ وَمَن قَتَلَ مَظْلُومًا فَقَدْ جَعَلْنَا لَوْلِيهِ سُلْطَانًا فَلَا يَسْرِفُ فِي الْقَتْلِ ۗ إِنَّهُ كَانَ مَنصُورًا

While thousands of innocent people were burned alive in the name of Christianity during the Inquisition periods in medieval Europe, the Turkish Islamic culture that stretched from Khorasan to Anatolia was laying the foundations for the construction of a new state with the motto *Let the people live so that the state may live*, the advice of Sheikh Edebali (d. 1326) to Osman Bey (d. 1326). Hacı Ahmet Yasevi (d. 1166), one of the Turkish Islamic Sufi wise men, said, "Do not break anyone's heart, even if he is an infidel. Because to break the heart is to break Allah (swt). If you see a poor strange person with a broken heart, put ointment on his wound, be his companion and helper...", he revealed the value given to human beings. Mevlana (d. 1273) said, *Come, come, come, whatever you may be, come again, whether you are an infidel or a Mohammedan, whether you are an idol worshipper, come again, our lodge is not a lodge of despair, come again, even if you have broken your repentance a hundred times* and Yunus Emre (d.1320) who said, *We love the created, because of the Creator have been the representatives of peace, friendship and humanity in Anatolia*. Five hundred years before the concept of human rights started to be spoken only for the white race in America in 1776 and in France in 1789; it was a motto of Mevlana, Yunus Emre, and Hacı Bektaşî Veli (d.1271) in Anatolia.

The book *The New World of Islam* by Lothrop Stoddard, a white supremacist racist missionary, which Horton cites as a reference, "will suffice to show how Islamism has overthrown Christianity wherever it has come face to face".⁷²

Also, Pears was a missionary, commissioned by the British Prime Minister Sir William Ewart Gladstone to create a *hostile* perception of Muslim Turks at the behest of Christianity and in the service of imperialist Britain. Instead of preserving the territorial integrity of the Ottoman Empire, his mission was to help the Ottoman Empire pursue a policy of establishing small national states on the Ottoman territory to prevent Russian expansion. In the context of the new British policy, which became clear during the prime ministership of William Ewart Gladstone, who had a reputation as an enemy of Turks, the Armenian revolutionary movements aiming to establish an Armenian state in Eastern Anatolia were supported by British liberal politicians and writers. In this

⁷⁰ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı*, Âl-Maide, 5/32.

⁷¹ Heyet, *Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı*, Âl-Isra, 17/33.

⁷² Lothrop Stoddard, *The New Word of Islam*, (London: Chapman And Hall, Ltd., 1922), 3.

environment, Sir Edwin Pears also wrote books hostile to the Turks. As a result of this systematic campaign of hostility against the Turks, Gladstone, together with the signatories of the Treaty of Berlin, succeeded in submitting a note to the Ottoman Empire on June 11, 1880, which included the issue of reforms regarding the Armenians".⁷³ Gladstone's zealotry, which started in 1880, soon encouraged the Armenians and enabled them to establish armed organizations for independence. In 1885, the Armenakan Party was founded as a revolutionary political organization. More influential were the Hunchak and Dashnaksutyun parties, the former founded in 1887 and the latter in 1890.

Conclusion

George Horton and Sir Edwin Pears were two of thousands of missionaries who saw Turks and Muslims as a threat to Christians and wanted to wipe them off the face of the earth. Throughout their lives, these missionaries have never stopped attacking Islam, its Prophet Muhammad, and the Turks, whom they see as the "Sword of Islam". This is their reason for existence. They have always existed throughout history and will continue to exist. For them, the genocides committed against other religions and races in the name of Christianity are only a cleansing and purification. Throughout history, millions of innocent men, women, and children have been brutally murdered, enslaved, looted, and destroyed by Christian missionaries and explorers. Many ancient civilizations were wiped off the face of the earth by Westerners. However, Muslim Turks ruled with justice wherever they went and ensured that the people living there lived freely, protected their beliefs, and maintained their existence. Every nation living in the geography where the Ottoman Empire ruled for 600 years has preserved its existence and survived until today.

It is the Western world that has perpetrated the greatest genocide history has ever seen and watched those who perpetrated them. It ignored the massacres of Tatars, Circassians, Crimean Turks, Meskhetian Turks, and Kyrgyz Turks in Ürkün, who were forced to migrate from their homeland by the Russians in the Caucasus and lost their lives in harsh winter conditions, just as it ignored tens of thousands of Turks massacred in the Greek revolt in 1821. The massacres committed by Armenian terrorist organizations such as Dashnaksutsun and Hunchak in Erzurum, Van, Muş, and Bitlis, the massacres and atrocities committed by the Greeks who occupied Anatolia, the Muslim Turks massacred by the Greeks in Cyprus between 1963, and The massacre of more than 8300 Bosniaks in Srebrenica in five days in front of the eyes of Dutch soldiers of the UN, the massacre of Uyghur Turks in the north of China and East Turkistan, the massacre of thousands of Muslim Palestinian men, women and children in Gaza every day by Israeli fire in front of the eyes of the Western world are also ignored by the same group.

In conclusion, the war of the Crescent and Cross and the enmity of the West against the Turks has always existed and will continue to exist. Missionaries like Horton and Pears, as part of their duty, will make every effort to continue this war with the most unrealistic expressions, and slander. The facts of Turkish and Islamic history have been distorted and presented to the world public for

⁷³ Fahir Armaoğlu, 19. Yüzyıl Siyasi Tarihi (1789-1914), (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu, 1997), 565-566.

the sake of Europe's political goals. Those who fulfilled this task were rewarded throughout their lives for being successful in their roles. Today, the seeds of hatred they sowed, their insults that went as far as burning our holy Quran, and the Christians who stood by and watched as thousands of Muslims were killed in Palestine. Today, however, more work is needed by historians *free of conscience and reason* to clean the seeds of hatred they sowed in the hearts of nations.

It aims to draw the attention of the academic community with this study, which takes only two of the publications of dozens of Muslim Turcophobic missionary authors in the historical process as an example. Throughout history, the Turkish scholarly community should not remain silent in the face of the demonization of Muslim Turks against the civilized world with biased, unrealistic, malicious efforts by malicious missionary writers to completely defame the administrations of our heroic ancient ancestors, who would give humanity lessons to the world.

Bibliography

- Armaoğlu, Fahir, *19. Yüzyıl Siyasi Tarihi (1789-1914)*, (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu, 1997).
- Aydemir, Şevket Süreyya, *Suyu Arayan Adam*, (İstanbul: Remzi Kitapevi, 2020, 10-15).
- Barnaby, Fred *At Sirtında Anadolu* (Çev: Fatma Taşkent), (İstanbul, İletişim Yayınları, 1999).
- Bible (New Testament)*, Dorlion Yayınları, İstanbul, 2020.
- Bozkurt, Gülnihal, "II. Meşrutiyet Osmanlı Meclis Zabıtlarında Bulgar Azınlıklarının Kilise ve Okul Sorunları", <http://dergiler.ankara.edu.tr/dergiler/19/821/10417.pdf>, (Accessed 03 Nov 2023).
- British Documents, vol.2, Doc.286, Brophy'den Elliot'a, 1876 (Accessed 13 May 2024).
- British Documents, vol.2, Doc.451, "Report by Mr. MBaring on the insurrection of 1876 (Accessed 13 May 2024).
- Burma, Mustafa, "Bulgaristan'ın Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'ndan Ayrılış Sürecinde Bulgar Ayaklanmaları", *Balkan Araştırma Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 1(1), 67-90. <http://www.turkishstudies.net/dergi/cilt1/sayi2/makale/kose2.pdf>, (Accessed 03 Nov 2023).
- Çelik, Mehmet, *Fener Patrikhanesi'nin Ekümenlik İddialarının Tarihsel Seyri, (325-1453)*, (İstanbul Akademi Kitabevi, 2000).
- Coleman, Brian, "George Horton: the literary diplomat". *Byzantine and Modern Greek Studies*, 30 (1), 81-93, 2006.
- Danişmend, İsmail Hami, *Türk Irkı Niçin Müslüman Oldu?* (Konya Milli Ülkü Yayınevi, 1978).
- Gönenç, Ali, "Yunanistan'ın Bağımsızlık Sürecinde Yok Edilen Mora Türkleri". *Uluslararası Suçlar ve Tarih*, 11(12), 5-32, (Ankara, 2011).
- Greene, Joseph K., *Leavening The Levant*, (Chicago, Boston, New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1916).
- Heyet, Kur'an-ı Kerim ve Türkçe Açıklamalı Meali, Hadimü'l Haremeyni Ş-Şerifeyn Kral Fehd Mushaf-ı Şerif Basım Kurumu, Medine, 2017.*
- Horton, George, *The Blight of Asia, An Account of the Systematic Extermination of Christian Populations by Mohammedans and of the Culpability of Certain Great Power, by with the True Story of the Burning of Smyrna*, (USA: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1926).
- Karaca, Taha Niyazi, "Ermeni Sorunu ile İlgili Bir İngiliz Kaynağı Üzerine Eleştirel Değerlendirme", *Belleten C. LXVII*, 34.
- Kılıç, Remzi, "Misyonerlik ve Türkiye'ye Yönelik Misyoner Faaliyetleri", *TÜBAR-XIX*-(2006-Bahar).
- Kılıç, Remzi, "Osmanlı Türkiye'sinde Azınlık Okulları (19. Yüzyıl)", *Türk Kültürü, Yıl XXXVII*, S. 431, Ankara, 1999, (151-159).

- Koç, M. Bileydi, "Fransız Ortaokul Tarih Ders Kitaplarında Türk İmaji". *Cumhuriyet Tarihi Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 19(37), 348-377, (Bahar 2023).
- Kocabaş, Süleyman, *Ermeni Meselesi Nedir? Ne Değildir?* (İstanbul, 1983).
- Kocabaşoğlu, Uygur, *Kendi Belgeleriyle Anadolu'daki Amerika, Misyoner Okulları*, (İstanbul Arba Publications, 1989).
- Kocaoğlu, A. Mehmet, "Misyonerlik Faaliyetlerinden Pontus Rum Devletine Uzanan Süreç", *Giresun Tarihi Sempozyumu, 24-25 Mayıs 1996, Bildiriler*, (İstanbul, 1997).
- Matthew, Kaknüs Yayınları, İstanbul, 2011, 28.19-20; *Bible (New Testament)*, (İstanbul: Dorlion Yayınları, 2020).
- McCartey, Justin, *Ölüm ve Sürgün*, (İstanbul: İnkılap Kitapevi, 1998).
- Nalbandian, Louise, *The Armenian Revolutionary Movement, The Development of Armenian Political Parties through the Nineteenth Century*, (California: University of California Press, 1963).
- Ortaylı, İlber, *IL Abdülhamit Devrinde Taşra Bürokrasisinde Gayri Müslimler, Sultan II. Abdülhamit ve Devri Semineri*, (İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Tarih Araştırma Merkezi), 1994.
- Pears, Edwin, *Dictionary of National Biography Twentieth Century 1912-1921*, (Edited by, H.W.C. Davis and J.R.H.Weaver), (London, Oxford University Pres, 1927).
- Pears, Edwin, *The Life of Abdülhamit*, (London Constable&Company Ltd., 1917).
- Pears, Edwin, *Forty Years in Constantinople*, (London Herbert Jenkins Lti., 1916).
- Şimşir, Bilal, "Ermeni Propagandasının Amerika Boyutu Üzerine", *Tarih Boyunca Türklerin Ermenilerle İlişkileri Sempozyumu, (8-12 Ekim 1984)*, (Ankara 1985).
- Stoddard, Lothrop, *The New Word of Islam*, (London: Chapman And Hall, Ltd., 1922).
- Turkish Dictionary, 1998: II.
- Uzunçarşılı, İsmail Hakkı, *Büyük Osmanlı Tarihi. I. Cilt*, (Ankara: Türk Tarih Kurumu).
- White, E. George, *Bir Amerikan Misyonerinin Merzifon Amerikan Koleji Hatıraları*, (Terc. Cem Tarık Yüksel), Enderun Kitabevi, İstanbul, 1995.