

Attitudes toward Language and Cultural Pluralism in the Republic of Bashkortostan

Başkurdistan Cumhuriyeti'nde Dil ve Kültürel Çoğulculuğa Dönük Tutumlar

Olga R. GULINA*

Abstract

The multilingualism on the territory of Russian Federation, in particular in the ethnic-dominated republics, is very significant phenomena. This paper firstly reviews linguistic accommodation of ethnic groups living in Bashkortostan and the case of “ethnic/linguistic competition” between Tatars and Bashkirs. Second, the paper explores federal and regional legislations and its practice promoting multilingualism and supporting linguistic diversity on the territory of Russian Federation. Thirdly, the paper reviews the development and role of national minorities’ linguistic rights, in particular cultural rights and rights to education in mother tongue, in the construction of national communities and their identities. The article provides detailed illustrations from range of ethnic communities living in Bashkortostan.

Keywords: Bashkortostan, Russian Federation, multilingualism, linguistic rights

Öz

Rusya Federasyonu'nda, özellikle bir etnik grubun yoğun yaşadığı cumhuriyetlerde, çok dillilik önemli bir olgudur. Bu makale Başkurdistan'da yaşayan etnik grupların dil konusunda uzlaşmalarını Tatarlar ve Başkurdlar üzerinden incelemektedir. İkinci olarak, makale Rusya Federasyonu'nda çok dilliliği teşvik eden ve dil farklılıklarını destekleyen federal ve bölgesel yasaları tartışmaktadır. Üçüncü olarak, makale ulusal azınlıkların dil haklarının gelişimini ve ulusal topluluklar ve bu toplulukların kimliklerinin oluşumundaki rolünü ele almaktadır. Makale Başkurdistan'da yaşayan birçok etnik grup hakkında bilgi sunmaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Başkurdistan, Rusya Federasyonu, çok dillilik, dil hakları

* Director and co-founder of Institute on Migration Policy in Berlin, Germany.
E-mail: olgagulina@gmx.de

INTRODUCTION: HISTORICAL BACKGROUND.

Republic of Bashkortostan (RB) is one of the largest subjects of the Russian Federation located in the territory of the South Urals, historically named under its native people Bashkirts (Bashkorts). Bashkortostan or so called Bashkiria has gone through a long and difficult way of its historical development and has glorious history of achievements. They make up bright pages in the chronicles of the state of Russia.

By the end of the 15th up to the first half of the 16th centuries the Bashkir tribes, inhabiting these lands, were under the rule of three statehoods: the Nogai Horde, the Kazan and Siberian Khanates, which emerged after the break-up of the Golden Horde. When the oppression of these different statehoods became unbearable, the representatives of three Bashkir tribes “went to Kazan, where they bowed their heads before white Tzar”.² In those times, the Bashkir region was governed from Kazan. It was very inconvenient due to a long distance between cities. That was a reason why in 1573 the Bashkirs turned to Ivan IV with a petition about building a fortress on their land. “It is significant evidence that the Bashkirs subjection was voluntary and the town Ufa itself was built at their own request.”³

The history of Bashkortostan is a history of Bashkirs - aboriginals of this land - and also Russians, Tatars, Misharis, Maris, Chuvashs, Udmurts, Mordvinians, Ukrainians and other inhabitants of Russia moved into this region during 17th - 20th centuries.⁴

Nowadays, the basic place of Mari's residing is located on the Mishkinsky, Kaltasinsky, Birsky, Sharansky, Djurtjulinsky, Janaulsky areas of Bashkortostan. Chuvachs are living on the southwest and central areas of Republic. Udmurts are settled mainly in northern and northwest areas, mostly- in Janaulsky, Tatyshlinsky, Kaltasinsky and Buraevsky areas. The tatar population is living in the Sharansky, Chishminsky, Chekmagushevsky, Mijakinsky Kushnarenkovsky, Kiginsky,

² Here means Russian Tzar Ivan IV or so called Ivan the Terrible.

³ Lossiyevskiy Mikhail. 1883, 368-389.

⁴ The national flag of Republic is symbolised friendship and mutual cooperation of folks living in Bashkortostan. The national flag of Bashkortostan Republic is a rectangular three-color width, consisting of horizontal equal stripes: upper - dark blue color, middle - white color, lower - green color. In the center of the white stripe there is a gold emblem - a circle, inside of which a stylized flower of kurai (saltwort), consisting of seven petals is depicted.

In the National Flag of Bashkortostan a green colour means- freedom, eternity of life; white - is peaceful nature, openness, readiness to mutual cooperation of peoples of Bashkortostan republic; dark blue color means clarity, goodwill and cleanness of thoughts. The flower of kurai - is a symbol of friendship, its seven petals, located in the centre of the white strip, symbolise seven ancestries (descent folks), which laid the foundation to uniting of peoples living in the territory of Bashkortostan Republic. (Art. 5 of Law of Republic of Bashkortostan Nr 63-z “*On the National Symbols of Bashkortostan Republic*”).

Buraevsky areas and in city Tuimazy.⁵ According to the statistic, the Russian population is highly urbanised, around 83% of Russians live in the cities - Ufa, Sterlitamak, Salavat, Oktybrskij, Kumertau, Ishimbay, Neftekamsk.⁶

Table 1. The National Groups Living in Republic of Bashkortostan, Dated by All-Russian Census of 2002.⁷

	Urban and rural areas			Urban area			Rural area		
	M/F	Man	Female	M/F	Man	Female	M/F	Man	Female
Russian	1,490,715	688,023	802,692	1,232,289	564,533	667,756	258,426	123,490	134,936
Bashkort	1,221,302	575,862	645,440	517,636	239,035	278,601	703,666	336,827	366,839
Tatars	990,702	465,217	525,485	663,891	306,714	357,177	326,811	158,503	168,308
Chuvash	117,317	55,410	61,907	52,897	24,212	28,685	64,420	31,198	33,222
Mari	105,829	50,414	55,415	37,074	16,846	20,228	68,755	33,568	35,187
Ukrainians	55,249	25,415	29,834	44,277	20,292	23,985	10,972	5,123	5,849
Mordvinians	26,020	11,983	14,037	16,201	7,399	8,802	9,819	4,584	5,235
Udmurts	22,625	10,491	12,134	6,227	2,843	3,384	16,398	7,648	8,750

The census of 1970 defined 3,180,800 people lived in Bashkortostan. There were 1,546,300 Russian, 944,510 Tatars and 892,250 Bashkirs. The next Census was held in 1979. According to this census, there were 1,547,890 Russians, 940,450 Tatars and 935,880 Bashkirs in the republic. The census of 1989 defined 3,943,000 people as the population of Bashkir Autonomous Soviet Republic, included 39,3% of Russians, 28,4% -Tatar, Bashkirs made up 21,8% of population in Bashkortostan.⁸ According to the Russian census of 2002 are 4,104,000 people (+ 161,000) living in RB, included 1,490,715 Russians (36,3 % of the whole population in RB); 1,221,302 of Bashkirs (29,8 %) and 970,702 Tatars (24,1 %). The total number of Bashkirs across the Russian Federation reached 1,673,389 people.

The difference of the represents belonging to Tatars and Bashkirs through the Census 2002 and the Census 1989 is opened political debates and discussions in the society. The situation became irritated due to the fact that Census has passed in 2002 and only in the end of 2004 the Goskomstat (Statistic office of RB) has published the first results of ethnic structure of the population in the Republic.

Some national activists immediately told that the attempts of republic authorities during a lot of years to change ratio between Tatars as leading represents and Bashkirs, were successful.⁹ Mass- media confirmed that during census of 2002 “in the territories with ethnic rivalry where one ethnic group did try to receive

⁵ Sibagatov Radik. 2002.

⁶ The Government Program “Folks of Bashkortostan” for 2003-2012.

⁷ Official Census Results in Russian Federation of 2002.

⁸ BASSR´ Statistic. 1990.

⁹ The Statement of the Tatar Public Centre of Republic Bashkortostan issued on October 23, 2002.

favourable “correct numbers” larger than that of their ethnic rivals” are happened some upward distortion”.¹⁰ Some other researches formulated more cautious their position: “If we do not take into account the phenomenon of identity change, the results may seem strange. It is well known that there are more peasants among Bashkirs and that their fertility rate is greater than that of Tatars. The truth, as always, is somewhere in between”.¹¹

The results of Census became “high topic” and significant political question in the Republic. In June 2003 in Ufa was organised the Tatar congress which has accepted the resolution “About the organisation of repeated census of population in territory of Republic Bashkortostan”. In the same time the initiators of alternative census have begun their interrogation of the population living in the northwest part of Bashkortostan, where was a greatest quantity of infringements according to the view of tatar activists.¹² Certainly, by own strength of tatar activists could not carry out alternative census and later one was proved that this initiative was informational and financially supported by one of applicants for a Presidency in the RB.¹³ Due to this fact and some other reasons the idea of alternative census has not been held up by majority of population.¹⁴

Nowadays, Bashkirs represent one of the ancient folks of Eurasia, generated at Southern Ural Mountains as independent ethnos and one of the dominated national groups living in Republic of Bashkortostan.

1. FEDERAL AND REGIONAL LAW PROTECTING NATIONAL MINORITIES AND ITS PRACTICE

1.1. Federal Legislation

In contrast to European countries a special legislation about minorities as well as terminological and legal definition of this concept is absent both on the level of the Russian Federation (RF) and the Republic of Bashkortostan (RB), although early in the 90’s a number of steps in its creation and approval were taken. This problem is covered in greater detail in other articles,¹⁵ therefore only a brief overview will be given here.

¹⁰ Podlesnykh Oleg. 2001.

¹¹ Tishkov Valery and Stepanov Valery. 2004; Gorenburg, Dmitry. 1999.

¹² Gabdräfikov 2007, 116-124 .

¹³ There were three candidates on the president’s elections of 2003 – Ralif Safin, ethnic Tatar; Sergey Veremeenko, ethnic Russian and present president of RB Murtaza Rakhimov, ethnic Bashkir.

¹⁴ Interesy tatar Bashkirii - ne predmet dlya torga i spekulyatsiy“. *Novosti Ufimskoy gubernii*, November 2, 2009. Accessed November 2, 2009.

¹⁵ The following opinions were stated by Gulina Olga. 2005; Stepanov Valery. 2009; Puchkova Maria. 2004: 105-149.

Definitions in the area of national minorities on the federal level are often vague, controversial or contradictory. The concept “national minority” has not received a wide circulation. It is mentioned in the Constitution of the Russian Federation (Art. 71-72), in the Federal law “About a library science” (Art. 8 § 1), in the Law of the Russian Federation “About employment of the population in the Russian Federation” (Art. 5 § 10-2).

A number of the federal laws mentioning the rights of national minorities extend the action as to citizens of the Russian Federations belonging to the national minority,¹⁶ and on other persons who do not have the Russian citizenship (aliens): foreigners, persons without the citizenship, being in territory of Russia.¹⁷

Nowadays among the terms used for definition of ethnic categories both on the federal and local level such different concepts as “native peoples”, “national minorities”, “nationalities”, “native ethnoses”, “national groups”. Such a variety in terminology, absence of a certain definition of a “minority” and a list of officially recognized minorities is an obstacle in realization measures in protection of minorities as well as ones foreseen in the Framework Convention.¹⁸

The position of the Russian Federation on this question is expressed in the statement at Ratification of the Frame Convention on Protection of National Minorities. “Russian Federation considers that at signing or ratification of the Frame convention on protection of national minorities it is unauthorized to include in the unilateral order in clauses and applications the definition of the term “national minority”, which does not contains in the Frame convention”.¹⁹ Nevertheless, according to international standards Russia tries to carry out politics of preservation and development of ethnic, language and cultural originality of distinctive entities.

¹⁶ Art. 1 of Federal Law Nr 31-FZ “*About a National-Cultural Autonomy*”.

¹⁷ Art. 19 of the Federal Law Nr 3612-I “*The Bases of the Legislation about Culture*”.

¹⁸ Some authors lobbied that the Russian Federation has to use a positive experience of some European countries and issue a special law about national minorities as well. We have some doubts concerning of preparation a closed list of national minorities and ethnic groups living on Russian territory. On the one hand, we suppose that this list could be additional protection from discrimination, guarantee of cultural and linguistic rights, recognition of a cultural pluralism, contributing interethnic integration and positive measures directed to saving and development of cultures and languages could not be secured without certain official concepts and categories corresponding to ethical norms. On another hand, this idea with closed list of national minorities could create some difficulties in the juridical practice and political life. Lawmakers and state holders should take into account the changes in the ethnic map of the country without violation interests of “historically existing” and appeared national minorities, which are not so easy in the modern Russian conditions.

¹⁹ Federal Law of Russian Federation Nr 84-FL “*About Ratification of the Frame Convention on Protection of National Minorities*”.

1.2. Regional Legislation Specified on the Law of Bashkortostan

There is a lack of universally accepted terminology in the area of national minorities' rights on the regional level. Terms and concepts are historical, political and social constructions serving the fulfilment of certain needs of regional parts of Russia and are subject to ongoing conceptual redefinition. Due to this reason, the regional legislation used some definitions which are not containing at federal level: ethnic minority (Tatarstan, Khakassia), ethno-disperse minority (Tomsk region), essential national minorities (Buryatiya), small ethnoses (Yakutia), national groups (Bashkortostan), the titular nation (Kalmykia), the deep-seated people of the given region (Kabardino-Balkariya, Kalmykia, Tatarstan, Khakassia, Sverdlovsk area), titular ethnos (Khakassia), territory of the indigenous population (Dagestan, Khakassia, Irkutsk, Tomsk areas), ethnic groups (Komi, Dagestan, Yakutia), ethnic communities (Adygea), ethno-confessional and ethno-cultural groups (Buryatiya), etc.

Such variety of terms is a result of a distinct regulation of the conceptual device in the federal legislation. According to the Russian Constitution and the Federal Agreement between federal centre and subject of Federation, a problem of rights protection of minority is the joint jurisdiction (Art. 72 § 1b). Such position generated variety of a legal status of minorities in territories of various subjects of Federation and “also destroyed uniformity of approaches to a problem of minority”.²⁰

After proclamation of Declaration on the state sovereignty of Bashkortostan Republic in 1990, a Federal Agreement was signed with Appendix to it from Bashkortostan Republic in 1992.²¹ The Constitution of Bashkortostan Republic was accepted in 1993, its new version was ratified in 2002.

The Constitution of the Republic Bashkortostan (RB) contains the special article regulating the national minorities rights, included their linguistic rights. Art. 31 promotes: “Everyone shall have the right to determine and indicate his nationality. No one may be forced to determine and indicate his or her nationality”. Art. 32 confirmed that everyone shall have the right to use his or her native language, to a free choice of the language of communication, upbringing, education and creative work. Art. 54 of Constitution says: “the Republic Bashkortostan recognises and guarantees the equal rights to preservation and development of languages of all national groups living in its territory, creates possibilities for their free development.”

²⁰ Podlesnykh Oleg. 2001

²¹ The Agreement was signed on differentiating of federal and regional subjects' competence between the Russian Federation authorities and Bashkortostan Republic authorities.

The legal status of languages is defined by the Republic Bashkortostan Law. Art. 3-1 of regional law “About languages in the Republic Bashkortostan”²² is declared that Bashkir and Russian languages²³ are the state languages in all territory of the Republic Bashkortostan. This Law contains one of the important antidiscrimination norm according to which, the state guarantees to the citizens of the Republic “realisation of the civil, political, economic, social and cultural rights independency of their knowledge of any language” (Art.5).

During last five years is generated the serious legislative base oriented on the preservation and development of national cultures and languages of the ethnics. Here are the regional Laws “About culture in the Republic Bashkortostan”, “About Education”, “About languages in the Republic Bashkortostan”, “About national art crafts”, etc. The formation of special body in 2001 – the Ministry of culture and national policy - has given to the republican national policy integrated approach and faced the interests of national groups living in the territory of Bashkortostan.

Additionally, there are a lot of government programs promote preservation and the further development of culture and art of the national groups living in Republic, stabilisation of ethnic relations in Bashkortostan. Here are government programs “Folks of Bashkortostan”; “On preservation, studying and development of languages of population living in RB” for 2000-2005 and the second version of this program for 2006-2010; “Program on studying, revival and development of folklore of the people of Republic Bashkortostan”, etc.

However, in practice there are certain contradictions in the realisation of substantive provisions of federal and regional law, which will be considered below.

2. OVERVIEW OF NATIONAL MINORITIES’ RIGHTS IN THE REPUBLIC OF BASHKORTOSTAN

2.1. Cultural Rights

The existence of different cultures on the languages of national minorities (theatres, newspapers, exhibitions etc.) is the form of keeping of minorities’ languages and one of attitude of saving their cultural heritage. In Bashkortostan various measures are taken in the development of professional arts, cultures of national minorities. The position of Bashkortostan authorities in linguistic and national policy, in access of national minorities to social-cultural sphere is worthy as well as saving the specific of historic and cultural inheritance of minorities.

²²The Law of Republic of Bashkortostan Nr 74-Z “*About Languages in Republic of Bashkortostan*”.

²³ Russian language has the status of state language through the following Law - Art. 3 of the federal Law “*About Languages of the Russian Federation*”; Art. 68 of the Constitution of the Russian Federation; the Federal Law “*About a State language of the Russian Federation*”.

There are 12 professional theatres in RB: 4 Bashkir, 2 Russian, the Theater for the Youth, the Theater for Children (“Sulpan”), Puppet Theater, Theater for Opera and Ballet, the State Theater “Nur”, Tuimazy State Drama Theater.

Today there are 47 folk Tatar collectives (more 22% of the total number) in Bashkortostan, among them 24 are theatrical, 11 dancing, 5 folklore, 5 choral, 2 instrumental Tatar collectives. Beginning since 1991 the Ministry of Culture of the Republic of Tatarstan organizes an Interregional festival of Bashkir and Tatar songs performers “Duslyk mono” in the city of Neftekamsk together with the Union of Tatar Youth “Azatlyk”; there is an annually beauty contest “Nauruz Guzele” to be mentioned. Once two years a republican contest of Tatar songs performers “Tugan gel” is held in RB. Young artists take part in the international music contest named the festival of the Turkic youth “Ural mono”. The national minorities speaking the Turkic languages take an active part in the international festival of Turkic theatres “Tuganlyk”.

In 2010 the Ministry of culture and national policy of RB is planed the following folk’s events: a republican Udmurt festival, republican bashkort festival “Karga butkahi”, republican chuvash festival “Chavash piki”, republican tatar event “Tugan tel”, a celebration of german national “Easter holiday”, etc.²⁴ Annually the Ministry of culture and national policy of RB supported the organization of Mari national holiday “Ujarnja” in Mishkinskij area of RB. On the 28th of January, 2010 has been signed the decree of the President of RB²⁵ about support of annually republican children’s folk dance competition “Baik” among dancers up to 15 years due to preservation of a cultural and spiritual heritage of the Bashkir people, popularization of national creativity, strengthening of interest of creative youth to a national bashkir choreography.

The Republic strong supported a development of language, culture and national traditions of Ukrainian. Since 1990 works the republican national-cultural centre of Ukrainians “Kobzar”, since 1996 operates the Union of the Ukrainian women “Bereginja”, in 1998 opens the Union of the Ukrainian youth “Berkut”. There are 23 Ukrainian folk’s collectives and one Ukrainian historical center in the village Zolotonoshka (Sterlitamak area). On the 26th of February, 2010 took place the sixth congress of Ukrainians in Bashkortostan,²⁶ where participants belonging to Ukrainians and represents of state authorities discussed the realization of cultural rights of Ukrainians in the Republic.

The net of national libraries in the languages of national minorities living on the area of RB are successfully developing. The Book fund in Tatar language counts more than 937,000 issues (4% of the total funds). In 2004, 24,400 issues in Tatar

²⁴ (Ministry of Culture and National Policy of RB, 2010).

²⁵ Decree of President of Republic of Bashkortostan Nr. UP-34.

²⁶ Before congresses of Ukrainians in Bashkortostan were spent four times – on January, 1995, on April, 1997, on January, 2001 and on February, 2005.

were delivered to the library funds. Unfortunately, there is a decrease of literature delivering in the languages of minorities in RB.

Newspapers, journals and magazines are published in 6 languages in RB. 33 of them in Tatar (among them 5 are republican, 5 municipal, 23 regional). The newspaper of “Kyzyl tan” has a circulation of 313,382 issues; the republican youth paper in Tatar “Omet” has 43,923 ones. There are papers for children and teenagers “Ochkyn”, magazines “Tulpar” and “Ayluluki” in Tatar language.

Chuvash, Mari and Udmurt are in RB mass media languages. The paper “Ural-Sassi” and several regional ones are published in Chuvash. Some TV and radio broadcasts are transmitted in Chuvash, Mari, Tatar and Udmurt languages. There is a paper in Mari “Cholman” published in Neftekamsk, a republican one in Udmurt named “Oshmes”. Byelorussian, German, Lettish have less social and communicative functions due to assimilation, dispersion of location of minorities, emigration of most of them to the countries where their nation is the title one.

However, there are some omissions of national policy which needs to take account. In last years has cancelled the republican broadcast “Obrij” in Ukrainian language and release of Ukrainian newspaper “Krinitsa”. The initiative to organise a television announcement in the Ukrainian language at least once a week have not crowned success. There is no professional Ukrainian folk’s collective in Bashkortostan.²⁷

National editions make a considerable segment of media space of Bashkortostan: 61 magazines printed in Russian, 56 - in Bashkir, 33 - in Tatar, 3 in Mari and Chuvash and only one in Udmurt, but the circulation of the Tatar printing editions is less than of the magazines in Bashkir language. The experts convinced that there are certain contradictions in the legislation and practice of its using in Bashkortostan such as the priority in development of national culture, art, language is given to the Bashkirs as to culture of title ethnos.²⁸

2.2. The Rights of National Minorities in the field of education

Examining the problem of the rights of national minorities in this aspect it is necessary to pay attention to following issues: the right of national minorities to *learn their mother tongue or to have instructions in their mother tongue* and realization of this right in Bashkortostan. The authorities of RB have taken decisive steps to protect national minorities in such fields as education and language rights.

²⁷ The statement of VI National Congress of Ukrainians in Republic of Bashkortostan adopted February 26, 2010.

²⁸ Vorob'yev Denis, Grushkin Dmitry. 1999.

Table 2. The Educational Level of the Population in Bashkortostan.²⁹

	Inhabitants older than 15 y.o	Postgraduate Education (PhD)	High Education (Diploma)	Uncompleted high education	Professional Education (college)	Secondary school	Have no initial general education	Included Illiterate persons
Total	3,316,946	6,002	379,850	80,174	937,649	608,203	39,105	25,289
Bashkort	952,481	1,517	93,073	21,248	228,153	201,638	14,066	9,930
Russian	1,226,278	2,420	154,663	31,648	384,519	192,173	12,739	7,433
Tatars	806,778	1,584	103,230	21,872	239,807	146,392	7,237	4,856
Chuvash	96,260	99	6,563	1,447	25,883	22,600	1,241	771
Mari	83,257	44	4,304	974	18,164	21,306	1,441	891
Ukrainians	50,357	131	7,360	1,135	16,160	7,654	486	245
Mordvinians	23,477	18	1,414	250	6,256	4,777	729	435
Udmurts	18,096	11	898	170	3,525	3,562	351	243

In Bashkortostan one can observe educational process in 6 languages of the minorities. The 14 languages of national groups living in Bashkortostan are taught as independent subjects in the schools and other educational institutions. As a result ca. 68,5 % of children belonging to non-Russian nationality join the schools subjects as history and culture in their native language (in 1995 this indicator was near to 50 %).³⁰

In 1,230 schools of RB (117,452 pupils) the educational process is carried out with *Tatar as a mother tongue*. This list can be continued (telling about Tatar language) there are 6 colleges, 4 universities: the Bashkir State University, Sterlitamak, Birsk Pedagogical Institutes, the Eastern External University for the Humanities having their own Tatar Departments and this language is taught as a mother tongue. Besides are 462 kindergartens function in Tatar.

There are 402 Chuvash national schools, where *Chuvash language* is taught as a mother tongue. It is also taught as a mother tongue in a number of Sunday schools in Ufa, Meleuz, Sterlitamak, Belebei. In this aspect one should mention the Chuvash Department of Sterlitamak Pedagogical College, Sterlitamak Pedagogical Institute and Belebei Pedagogical College.

There are 174 Mari national schools, 40 kindergartens in Bashkortostan. *Mari* is taught in Mari Department of Blagoveshchensk Pedagogical School, Birsk Pedagogical Institute, where Mari teachers are prepared.

The *Udmurt language* is taught in 48 schools and 17 kindergartens; in Udmurt Department of Neftekamsk Pedagogical School. *Mordvinian* is a taught language in 8 national schools located in the area of compact living of Mordovians in 9 regions of RB. Mordvinian departments were opened in 1996 in pedagogical colleges of Salavat and Sterlitamak.

²⁹ The Census of Russian Federation of 2002.

³⁰ (Ilishev. 2006, 5-11).

Ukrainian is learned as a mother tongue in five primary schools and in 4 Sunday schools. The Ufa branch of the Moscow state humanitarian university named by M. Sholohov prepared the pedagogical staff speaking in Ukrainian. To compare with other regions of Russia, in Bashkortostan is most developed system of the Ukrainian national education, annually the Ministry of Education and Ministry of culture and national policy announced the Days of Ukrainian Culture in RB and carried out Shevchenkovsky readings and the International competition on knowledge of the Ukrainian language named by Peter Jatsika, where children and youth join in competitions on the best composition in Ukrainian language. *German* is learned as a mother tongue in schools of Blagovar region of RB. Besides it is learned as a mother tongue in 3 Sunday schools.

The tables below presented the basic indicators of educational procedure in languages of national groups living in Republic Bashkortostan.³¹

Table 3. Observation of Preschool Centres and the Languages of Instructions in It on the End of 2008 Academic Year.

	Total		Included:			
			Urban area		Rural area	
	Amount of Institutions	Amount of Scholars	Amount of Institutions	Amount of Scholars	Amount of Institutions	Amount of Scholars
Preschool centres, Total	1800	158,7	589	105,6	1211	53,0
Languages of instructions:						
Russian	851	92,1	412	67,2	439	24,9
Non-Russian	561	17,2	18	2,4	543	14,8
Russian and Non- Russian,	388	49,3	159	36,0	229	13,3
Bashkort	605	21,4	146	9,0	459	12,4
Mari	30	0,6	-	-	30	0,6
Tatar	378	9,1	70	2,2	308	6,9
Udmurt	5	0,2	-	-	5	0,2
Chuvash	37	0,8	10	0,1	27	0,7

Table 4. Training in the Federal and Municipal Educational Institutions in Russian and Other Languages on the Beginning 2008/2009 Academic Years (Without Educational Institutions for Children With Deviations)

	Amount of institutions	Amount of scholars
Amount of the scholars – total	x	437862
Training in following languages:		
Russian	2013	371686
Bashkir	822	51474
Tatar	357	10705
Mari	102	3041
Chuvash	23	699
Udmurt	22	257

³¹ Ministersto obrazovaniya i kulturi. 50-58.

Table 5. Learning The Mother Tongue (Non-Russian) in The Federal and Municipal Educational Institutions on the Beginning 2008/2009 Academic Years (Without Educational Institutions For Children With Deviations).³²

Amount of the scholars, learned the mother tongue (non-Russian) as a school subject:	Amount of institutions	Amount of the scholars
Bashkir	1574	100183
Tatar	813	58593
Mari	147	6151
Chuvash	113	6170
Udmurt	39	1593
Mordovian	12	344
German	3	259
Ukrainian	5	277
Belorussian	3	44
Latvian	1	23
Polish	1	100

In RB after the Resolution of the Cabinet of RB on the 31st December 1999, was issued the program “On preservation, Investigation and Development of the Languages of the Peoples on the Area of RB”³³ for 2000-2005. The most important feature of this program has been a realization of the rights of the citizens to learn their mother tongue; creation of a system of measures to secure functioning and development of Bashkir and other languages on the area of RB; extension of the net of general educational and scientific institutions, development of new educational programs, textbooks and reference books for a profound learning of mother tongues.

The regional authorities reported the following results of the Program: about 70% non-Russian nationality scholars got a chance to study in the mother tongue (+15% in 1994 – 1995). In educational institutions of RB studied a native language up to 91% Bashkir students; 60% scholars of Tatar nationality; 53,4% Chuvash scholars; 61,2% pupils of Mari nationality; 64,6% Udmurt pupils; 21% Mordovian scholar.³⁴

In 2007 the Government of Bashkortostan adopted the second Program called “On preservation, studying and development of languages of population living in RB for 2006-2010”.³⁵As the main goals the Program promotes: 1) achievement of equality of state languages - Bashkir and Russian, maintenance of their functioning as government languages in Republic Bashkortostan, in spheres of the industry, communication, transport, public health services, trade, population consumer services, in mass media; 2) preservation, studying and development of the Bashkir language as a language of titular nation living in RB, as a basis of formation and development of national culture; 3) assistance in preservation,

³² *Ibid.* 58.

³³ Act of Government of RB Nr. 413 of December 31, 1999.

³⁴ (Bashinform, 2009).

³⁵ Act of the Government of RB N 86 of 09.04.2007.

studying and development of national groups' languages using in Republic Bashkortostan, etc. (§ 2 of Program).

To achieve the above-named goals the following actions are planned: a) Bashkir and Russian language courses for the state and municipal service workers (6.1.7.); b) the linguistic research of the Bashkir language and specific of its using (6.2.3-6.2.5.); c) working out of the continuous concept of teaching in national minorities' languages in the pre- and secondary schools, in the institutions of high and professional education (6.3.3.); d) creating the teaching aids, another learning materials, i.e. games, toys, lotto in Bashkir and other languages of inhabitants living in RB (6.3.4.-6.3.5.); e) preparation, edition and publishing of bilingual dictionaries (as an Examples - Russian- Bashkir, Bashkir- English, Udmurt- Bashkir) in native languages of ethnic groups living in Bashkortostan (6.3.2., 6.5.1.); f) design of drivers and typescript in the Bashkir language and creation of typescript in Bashkir alphabet (6.4.3.), etc. Summing up, the program "On preservation, studying and development of languages of population living in RB", written in 30 pages, is mostly directed on the strengthening of the Bashkir language in all spheres of life in RB.

Nevertheless, the national policy of the Republic Bashkortostan in the field of education has successes and failures. One problem is a lack of Bashkir speaking specialists in educational institutions. In March, 2007 the Minister of Education of RB Zinnat Allajarov told: "We, folk of Bashkortostan, are suffering of a lack of the teachers' capable, who can qualitatively train a child in its native language". In the same year the government started with a monetary encouragement program for the best teachers of Bashkir languages, but up today the result is not so good. In Kaltasinsky area of Bashkortostan there are 36 teachers of the Bashkir language and Bashkir literature, but only six of them have the special education.³⁶ Additionally, some authors tells about compulsion and pressure to studying in and of Bashkir language due to the Law of 2005, which has caused a wave of discontent among representatives of non-titular nations in Bashkortostan.³⁷

Another failure is a lack of Ukrainian speaking specialist in the republican schools. Some years ago the Ukrainian department of the Ufa teacher training college № 1 has stopped a preparation of teachers of the Ukrainian language, culture and history for the schools. Up to now it was not possible to achieve opening of kindergartens and classes with studying of the Ukrainian language in places of compact settlement of Ukrainians in cities and areas of RB.³⁸

³⁶ The Statement of the Government's Commission Session about Realization on Law "About Languages in Republic Bashkortostan".

³⁷ (Nekrasova 2009).

³⁸ The statement of VI National Congress of Ukrainians in Republic of Bashkortostan issued February 26, 2010.

Nowadays the RB Government considers the all-round support of education for national minorities in their native languages as one of the reliable investment in the future of Republic Bashkortostan. Moreover, some national groups living in Bashkortostan, especially Udmurts and Mari, have more opportunities to teach in the mother tongue and learn their language than in the territories where their nation is the title one.³⁹

CONCLUSION

Language has political, social and ethical dimensions and is a part of folk's heritage that differ ethnic communities living together. In modern Russia preserving the ethnic diversity - more than 142 ethnics spreading on the territory of Russian Federation, support of linguistic human rights is one of the hardest tasks. This task is covered by federal and regional political agendas and legislations, imposed by economic probabilities and determined by ethnic's elite power. In a multinational, multicultural federal state like Bashkortostan a lot of factors take into account in order to incorporate an effective linguistic policy with respect to national minorities.

Insofar as existing standards of linguistic minority rights are part of human rights law, the starting point for its protection must be a special federal legislation that is unfortunately not appropriate detailed and not sufficient improved. In this connection, the regional governments, in particular in Bashkortostan, consider the special political, legal, economical provisions supporting and developing linguistic rights of national minorities. The national minorities living in Bashkortostan could realize their right to the mother tongue, i.e. pre-school, and less medium and high schools, educational programs. Periodicals and mass-media market in national minorities' languages make a considerable segment of media space of Bashkortostan.

The national minorities living in Bashkortostan have no difficulties in an effective access to social and cultural life, but there are some critical points which need to be adjusted and pointed out in order to realisation of national minorities' rights in the field of education. The preparation of pedagogical specialists speaking in languages of ethnics, state support of the increasing their qualification must be in priority in the years are coming. The realisations of national minority's linguistic rights are a fundamentally communicative topic that presumes the essential social dimension and shows the openness and fluidness of society.

³⁹ For example, the Mari language as a mother tongue learn ca. 62% of Mari children living in Bashkortostan and only 44% of Mari children living in Mari republic. The Mari diaspora in Bashkortostan is one of the biggest and well organised Mari communities in Russian federation. 93 % of Mari living in Bashkortostan are speaking their language, in Russian Federation this ration ca. 83,2%. Official webpage of the Republic Bashkortostan- Bashkortostan.

Although the example of minorities living in Bashkortostan, as well as the protection of their linguistic accommodation refers mostly to the regional policy and regional instruments from which they derive, this could potentially apply to other regions of Russia. Federal and regional lawmakers should amend economic, political and legal regulations in force, start with a financial encouragement program for the teachers of national minorities' languages and move toward protecting the linguistic rights of minorities in a wide way.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Act of Government of RB Nr. 413 issued December 31, 1999.

Act of the Government of RB Nr 86 adopted April 9, 2007.

Constitution of the Republic Bashkortostan adopted December 24, 1993. Accessed November 30, 2009. http://www.gsrb.ru/MainLeftMenu/ZakonoTvorch/Zakoni/vs-22_15.php.

Decree of President of Republic of Bashkortostan Nr. UP- 34 adopted January 28, 2010.

Federal Law Nr 31-FZ “*About a National-Cultural Autonomy*” adopted on March 21, 2002.

Federal Law Nr 3612-I “*The Bases of the Legislation about Culture*” adopted October 9, 1992.

Federal Law Nr. 53-FZ “*About a State Language of the Russian Federation*” adopted June 2, 2005.

Federal Law of Russian Federation Nr 84-FL “*About Ratification of the Frame Convention on Protection of National Minorities*” adopted June 18, 1998

Law of Republic of Bashkortostan Nr 63-z “*On the National Symbols of Bashkortostan Republic*” adopted on May 27, 1999.

Law of the Republic Bashkortostan Nr 74-Z “*About Languages in Republic of Bashkortostan*” adopted April 5, 2004. Accessed December 12, 2009. http://minprom.bashkortostan.ru/Docs/19990215_zakon.htm.

The Statement of the Government’s Commission Session about Realization on Law “*About Languages in Republic Bashkortostan*” adopted May 15, 2009. Accessed on November 23, 2009. http://www.bashpred.ru/new.php?id_n=8049.

The Statement of the Tatar Public Centre of Republic Bashkortostan issued on October 23, 2002. Accessed February 27, 2010. <http://tatar-bashkort.narod.ru/tb-08.htm>

Interesy tatar Bashkirii - ne predmet dlya torga i spekulyatsiy“. *Novosti Ufimskoy gubernii*, November 2, 2009. Accessed November 2, 2009.

BASSR’ Statistic. 1990. *Natsional’nyy sostav naseleniya Bashkirskoy ASSR po rezul’tatam Vsesoyuznoy perepisi naseleniya v 1989 godu*. Ufa.

Gabdrarifov Ildar. 2007. „Fenomen Bashkortostana: ot «tragicheskoy demografii»

k «zakonomernoy rekonfiguratsii chislennosti». *Etnograficheskoye obozreniye* 5: 116-124.

Gorenburg, Dmitry. 1999. "Identity Change in Bashkortostan: Tatars into Bashkirs and Back". *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 22 (3): 554-80.

Gulina Olga. 2005. *Pravo na ravenstvo v kontekste yazykovykh prav natsional'nykh men'shinstv*. Ufa: Bashgu.

Information Agency of Republic Bashkortostan – Bashinform. 2009. Accessed June 26, 2010. <http://www.bashinform.ru>.

Lossiyevskiy Mikhail V. 1883. *Byloye Bashkirii i bashkir po legendam, predaniyam i khronikam. Spravochnaya knizhka Ufimskoy gubernii*. Vol.3(Ufa).

Nekrasova Y. "Delo za roditelyami". *Novosti Ufimskoy gubernii*. October 30, 2009. Accessed December 2, 2009. <http://www.ufagubnews.ru/2009/10/30/4877/>

Official Census Results in Russian Federation of 2002. Accessed November 23, 2009. <http://www.perepis2002.ru/index.html?id=11>.

Official web-page of Ministry of Culture and National Policy of RB. Accessed February 11, 2010. http://www.mknprb.ru/?part_id=291&news_id=726.

Official webpage of the Republic Bashkortostan- Bashkortostan. Accessed on February 12, 2010. <http://www.bashkortostan450.ru/culture/kultura-narodov/mariic/>

Podlesnykh Oleg N. 2001 *Analiticheskiy obzor Plyuralizm rezhimov zashchity prav men'shinstv v sub'yektakh Rossiyskoy Federatsii*. Accessed November 30, 2009. <http://www.humanities.edu.ru/db/msg/43787>.

Puchkova Maria. 2004. *Sootvetstviye konstitutsii i tekushchego zakonodatel'stva RF mezhdunarodnym obyazatel'stvam RF v oblasti zashchity natsional'nykh men'shinstv. Uluchsheniye mezhetnicheskikh otnosheniy i razvitiye tolerantnosti v Rossii*. Moskva: 105-149.

Sibagatov Radik G. 2002. *Bashkortostan Tatarlary . Tel, tarikh , medeniyat mes'elelere*. Kazan': Magarif.

Stepanov Valery. 2009. Preservation and Development of Cultural Plurality: The Russian Approach. Accessed November 30, 2009. http://www.coe.int/t/dghl/monitoring/minorities/6_resources/PDF_RussSem_Pres_VStepanov_en.pdf

The Government Program "Folks of Bashkortostan" for 2003-2012, adopted by Government № 388 on 31st December, 31, 2002. Accessed January 11, 2010. <http://www.minjust.bashkortostan.ru/programm.html>.

The Statement of the Tatar Public Centre of Republic Bashkortostan issued on October 23, 2002. Accessed February 27, 2010. <http://tatar-bashkort.narod.ru/tb-08.htm>.

Tishkov Valery, Stepanov Valery. 2004. Russian Census 2002: The Ethnic Dimension”. Scientific Research Project on Nationality and Language in the All-Russian Census of 2002, Network for Ethnic Monitoring and Early Warning. Accessed January 15, 2009. http://www.eawarn.ru/EN/pub/Projects/EthnoCensus/tishkov-stepanov_win.htm.

Ministerstvo obrazovaniya i kulturi. 2009. Osnovnyye pokazateli obrazovaniya i kul'tury v Respublike Bashkortostan: statisticheskiy sbornik, Ufa: Bashkortostanstat: 50-58.

Ilishev Ildus G. 2006. “Natsional'naya politika v Rossiyskoy Federatsii v svete mezhdunarodnykh nauchnykh i pravovykh standartov”. *Vatandash*. Nr.2: 5-11.

Vorob'yev Denis, Grushkin Dmitry. 1999. *Ideya natsional'noy gosudarstvennosti i problemy etnicheskoy diskriminatsii v Respublike Bashkortostan*, Moskva. Accessed December 2, 2009. <http://www.memo.ru/d/619.html>

The Census of Russian Federation of 2002. Vol. 4: “*National Structure and Possession of Languages and Citizenship*”. Accessed December 12, 2009. <http://www.perepis2002.ru/index.html?id=17>.