

Articles (Theme)

MONEY TALKS: TURKISH-ISLAMIC SYNTHESIS ON BANKNOTES OF TURKEY

Nail Elhan*

Abstract

Banknotes carry traces from both histories and policies of states. This study deals with the banknotes issued in 1980 to today and claims that these banknotes have had political messages. In this respect, Turkish-Islamic Synthesis and its symbolization of banknotes is the main point of this study. Turkish-Islamic Synthesis emerged in the 1960s and evolved to a state policy after the military coup in 1980. It still exists under AKP rule in the 2000s. This maintenance can be traced in design of the banknotes, which issued during military coup period and continued during AKP rule.

Key Terms

Turkish-Islamic synthesis, national identity, religious identity, banknotes, AKP.

*Arş. Gör., Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi, İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi, Uluslararası İlişkiler Bölümü.
nail.elhan@gmail.com

Date of Submission: 08/03/2016. Date of Acceptance: 11/05/2016.

PARA KONUŞUR: BANKNOTLARDA TÜRK İSLAM SENTEZİ

Öz

Banknotlar, tasarımları ve üzerlerinde taşıdıkları semboller ile hem ülkelerin tarihine dair izler taşımaktadırlar hem de bu ülkelerin uyguladıkları politikalara dair ipucu vermektedirler. Bu çalışma, 1980 yılından günümüze kadar Türkiye’de basılmış olan banknotları ele almaktadır ve bu banknotların siyasal bir mesaj taşıdıkları iddiasını savunmaktadır. Bu bağlamda, Türk-İslam Sentezi’nin banknotlar üzerinde sembolleşmesi bu çalışmanın temel argümanıdır. Kökleri 1960’lı yıllara uzanan ve 1980 yılındaki askeri darbe ile bir devlet politikası olarak uygulanmaya başlanan Türk-İslam Sentezi, 2000’li yıllarda da AKP Hükümetleri ile devam etmektedir. Bu devamlılığı, askeri yönetim sırasında kullanılan ve AKP Dönemi’nde basılmaya başlanan banknotlar üzerindeki sembollerde görmek mümkündür.

Anahtar Terimler

Türk-İslam sentezi, milli kimlik, dini kimlik, banknotlar, AKP.

Introduction

In the last decade, it is argued that there is a struggle between those who would like to see Turkey more aligned with the Islamic world and those who want it to remain more secular and ‘Western’ (Friedman, 2010 cited in Orhan, 2013, p. 28). In relation to this argument, a debate on national identity -whether it is based on nationalism or religion- emerges. As Waxman (2000, p. 2) asks:

Do Turks see themselves as members of the West or East? As Europeans or Middle Easterners? As Turks first, or Muslims first? What place does religion and ethnicity have in Turkish national identity?

It may be said that roots and answers of this debate have its origins in the past century. According to this debate, there is a historical contradiction between nationalism and religion. Moreover, Islam and nationalism are not reconcilable issues in terms of political and social levels (Grigoriadis, 2013, p. 71). These two concepts are argued of being incompatible. Especially after secular politics of the early Republican Period, religion has been perceived as the cause of backwardness and as an obstacle for Westernization. Thus, it is claimed that religion is excluded from both political and social spheres of life. However, there is no distinct contradiction between religion and nationalism. Despite the claims that rise of one is decline of the other, relationship between Islam and nationalism is not a zero sum game. On the contrary, there is a dynamic interaction between them. There is a dual process involving the Islamization of

Turkish nationalism, and the nationalization of Islam (Waxman, 2000, p. 5). From the late 1860s until today, religion has become a significant component of nationalism and national identity in Turkey. Gökhan Çetinsaya (1999, p. 351) explains the interaction with a threefold sense:

One is Turkishness and Islam has been closely linked from the very beginning throughout the evolution of Turkish nationalism and modernist Islam. Second is that who rejected Islam among the Turkists and that who rejected nationalism among the Islamists were the exceptions and did not present the majority. Third is that people, who adapt Turkish-Islamic Synthesis among the Islamists and Turkists in present day Turkey, are influenced by same resources published between the 1950s and the 1970s.

When the 1970s and the 1980s came, interaction between religion and nationalism became a *de facto* state policy, which is called as Turkish-Islamic Synthesis (TIS), and it lasts up to today under Justice and Development Party (AKP) rule.

In the conjuncture of Cold War politics, TIS aimed to create a national identity based on ethnicity and religion against the rising left (Yavuz, 2003, 38). According to Orhan (2013, p. 32), this acquired overtones of religious nationalism, a blending of ethnic (Turk) and religious (Sunni Islam).

It is such a significant issue that this synthesis influenced not only the political and social life but also the symbols used in daily life. Banknotes, as one of the most used symbolic instruments in daily life, involves traces of political transitions and state policies.

In this article, continuity of interaction between religion and nationalism will be studied. While doing this, TIS and the banknotes used during the years of military coup in 1980 and the banknotes issued during AKP rule in 2009 will be the focal points. In this respect, this study will be composed of three parts. In the first part, TIS will be explained, the emergence and roots of this project will be tackled. In the second part, continuity of TIS since military coup in 1980 to AKP years in the 2000s will be analyzed. In this part, influence of synthesis in relation to political parties will be discussed. In the last part, roles of banknotes as instruments of political transition and state policies will be discussed. Banknotes used in the early 1980s and banknotes issued in 2009, when the AKP consolidated its power, will be analyzed with reference to TIS.

Turkish Islamic Synthesis

Strengthening of Islam in Turkish politics was partly a consequence of changes in the international system, and, related to this, Turkish right deemed Islam as an asset to tap into after the dawn of the Cold War and the looming of communism (Aslan, 2014, p. 523). Rise of leftist movements was perceived as a threat to sovereignty, national identity and territorial integrity of Turkey, and this resulted in seizing of power by the Turkish Army in 1980. The policies of military government about the national identity was based on the convergence of Turkish nationalism and Islam, which were crystallized in the concept of TIS (Orhan, 2013, p. 40).^{1,2}

¹ There are contributions that claim 'Turkish-Islam Synthesis' formed after the military coup in 1980 represents a radical departure from Kemalist secularism, but it will not be analyzed in this article. For more information, see Banu Eligür, *The Mobilization of Political Islam in Turkey*, Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2010, and Yıldız Atasoy, *Islam's Marriage with Neoliberalism: State Transformation in Turkey*, Palgrave Macmillan: London, 2009.

² It is also claimed that Turkish-Islamic Synthesis aimed to diminish influence of non-Turkish Islamic movements from Iran, Pakistan and Arab World. In addition, it was aimed to counter Islamic revolutionary ideas originating from Iranian Revolution.

It was originally formulated by right-wing intellectuals including İsmail Dayı, Necmettin Erbakan and Agah Oktay Güner, who were members of the Thinkers Club (*Aydınlar Kulübü*) (Atasoy, 2009, p. 94). Then, this club was converted to The Hearth of the Enlightened (*Aydınlar Ocağı*) which was formed in 1970 (Waxman, 2000, p. 18). Concerned of increasing influence of leftist movements, right-wing intellectuals highlighted a religion-inspired nationalism. Religion was defined as the core principle of social and cultural life. It was İbrahim Kafesoğlu, who ideologized interrelation of religion, nationalism and modernity within Turkish context. In this regard, Islam was defined as the most suitable religion for Turks and the TIS as a component of national identity.

Bearing in mind that universities were the center of leftist movements, education was defined as the core of TIS. Governments formed through leading of military regime, referred to religion and religious education as unifying factors to consolidate the nation. In this point, it should be noted that religious education was formed and controlled by the state. It was the 'official Islam', rather than the fundamentalist or reactionary ones (Waxman, 2000, p. 19). In this regard, Çetinsaya (1999, p. 370) points out two factors that helped to evolution of TIS: *İmam-Hatip* schools and *Ülkücü* (nationalist) movement.

Established in 1951, *İmam-Hatip* schools were formed by the state to train and educate *imams* and preachers. The Islamic foundations have played a crucial part in the operation of these schools by providing scholarships, running residence halls and clubs, publishing books and the like (Zubeida, 1996). Number of these schools increased tremendously from the late 1960s to the early 1990s (Zubeida, 1996). A typical *imam-hatip* student read Mehmet Akif, Ziya Gökalp, Yahya Kemal, Necip Fazıl and Peyami Safa, apart from standard religious and other textbooks (Çetinsaya, 1999, p. 370). Playing a crucial role in evolution of TIS, many leading figures in Turkey were graduates of *imam-hatip* schools including National View Movement and AKP (Şen, 2011, p. 64).

Established by Alpaslan Türkeş, an army officer and leader of Nationalist Action Party, in 1968 against increasing impact of leftist-communist political movements, *Ülkücü* Movement aims to reconcile Islam and Turkishness. As it was declared in the slogan of nationalists, 'Turkish as Mount Tanrı and Muslim as Mount Hira',³ *Ülkücü*

³ In pre-Islamic Turkish mythology, Mount Tanrı is defined as the place, where Turks expanded to the world. Mount Hira is believed as the place, where Prophet Mohammad received first revelations from God.

Movement aims to formulate national identity through Turkishness and Islam, both with the pre-Islamic and Islamic memories of the nation (Uzer, 2011, p. 51). Due to the influence of leftist movements, it is clear that campaigns and ideas of nationalist parties have changed. Islam became one of the core elements of nationalism (Bora, 2003, p. 445-6). For instance, Islam was not emphasized in 'Nine Lights'⁴ of Türkeş until 1972 (Çetinsaya, 1999, p. 371). Members of *Ülkücü* Movement were also influenced by ideas of similar intellectuals as *imam-hatip* students were. As a matter of fact, most members of the movement were graduates of *imam-hatips*.

Architects of TIS aimed to create a depoliticized Turkish-Islamic culture, which was expected to consolidate stability in the state. Within TIS, it was stressed that secular nationalism had deficiencies to create correlation between citizens and the state, and this was resulted in rise of leftist ideologies and disorder within country. In this regard, Islam was introduced as the key factor for engagements of citizenship, nationalism and the state. In other words, ideology of the military coup aimed at reinterpreting the relationship between the state and religion in such a way that religion was used as the essence of culture and social control (Altunışık, 2005, p. 48). This is why Şen (2011, p. 60) underlines the dominance of religion: "...in the synthesis the dominant element is Islamism rather than nationalism". In order to create a common ideology in Turkey, TIS aimed at achieving solidarity between conservatives and Turkish nationalists, gathering all ethnic groups in Turkey under the umbrella of Turkish nationalism (Aslan, 2014, p. 524). Islamic-Ottoman heritage was recalled. However, it should be noted that TIS is a form of ideologized Islam that is not based on Quran but formed on the basis of the idea of return to Turkish culture. It was controlled by the state. As Rabasa and Larrabee pointed; although Turkey was defined as a secular state in 1982 Constitution formed by the military regime, the role of religion was strengthened in schools and education as a means of reinforcing Turkish nationalism, which tended to weaken the emphasis on secularism (Rabasa and Larrabee, 2008, p. 38). As a result, Islamists, who were the least affected political group from military coup, found chance to disseminate their ideologies.

Golden Years of TIS: 1980 to 2015

⁴ Nine Lights were formulated by Alpaslan Türkeş. Nine Lights are nine core principles of nationalist discourse including nationalism, idealism, moralism, scientism, communitarianism, supporting villagers, independence and personalism, populism, and supporting industrial and technical developments.

As a result of Islam's gradual infiltration to the state, more Islamically-oriented elite entered to the higher echelons of government, economy, and culture, and they influenced not only state policies, but also the articulation of Turkish national identity (Waxman, 2000, p. 16). In 1983, the State Planning Organization prepared a report stating that the corruption of Turkish moral and cultural values were caused by 'divisive foreign ideologies', and resulted in internal disorder (Atasoy, 2009, p. 93). Moreover, it is alleged that secular nationalism caused the removal of Islam, which constituted cultural links between Kurds and Turks. Therefore, separatist movement among Kurds increased (Atasoy, 2009, p. 96) and leftist movements rose. It was duty of the state to protect national culture against foreign ideologies and empower the national unity. Islam was referred as a consolidative factor. As a result, Ottoman and Islamic legacy rather than the republican one was pointed as the main component of national identity. According to Atasoy (2009, p. 96), in this sense, TIS presents a neo-Ottoman notion of state building in terms of a historical continuity between Islamic-Ottoman heritage, Kemalism and Turkish nationalism. This can be seen both during the 1980s and the 2000s.

Cadres of new right parties and Islamist movements were pioneering groups especially after military coup in 1980. Compared to leftist overtone led by Ali Shariati in Iran, Islamism developed along with free market and neoliberalism in Turkey in the 1980s (Turam, 2007, p. 49). Turgut Özal played an important role in intersection of TIS and neoliberalism.

...Özal united and symbolized the main features of both neoliberalism and Turkish Islamism...the Motherland Party under his leadership was committed to the authoritarian policies of the military regime, enthusiastically pursued strong neoliberal policies, promoted religious-conservative values in politics and culture, and enlarged the religious field (Şen, 2011, p. 67).

Under Motherland Party rule, the network of *imam-hatips* was again expanded, their curriculum changed to include inculcation of the TIS, and the mosque building programme was continued (Hale and Özbudun, 2010, p. xxi). Özal was epitomizing the synthesis of religion and nationalism. As a right-wing politician, he defined Islam as an essential element of Turkish identity:

What holds together, or rather brings together, our unity and our cohesiveness is the fact that we are all citizens of the Turkish Republic. This is the first point. Everybody who lives in this land, everybody who was born here and everybody within the boundaries of the Turkish Republic who is a citizen of this country is a first-class citizen of this country with no distinction being made. Our state is secular. But what holds our nation together, what serves in a most powerful way in our national cohesiveness and what plays the essential role is Islam (Waxman, 2000, p. 17).

Reference to TIS continues in the 2000s during AKP rule. AKP opposes to idea of being an Islamist party (Yavuz, 2004, p. 227). Instead, it defines itself as a conservative democracy. This is because of tensions between secular institutions and Islamist parties. It has never openly presented an anti-Kemalist or anti-*laik* stance. Rather, it transformed the state:

The AKP flourishes in relation to its political renegotiation of the Kemalist political order through an Islamic resignification of cultural issues. It challenges the authoritarian fundamentals of the state, but without being overtly religious and without shattering the *laik* foundation of the modernity project (Atasoy, 2009, p. 9).

Armstrong (2012, p. 134) defines it as uniqueness of AKP, and points out wedding of a popular religious nationalism to real political power. The party refers Islam as the cement of nation without making any references to ethnic roots. Abdullah Gül points the party's reference to religion as a common value:

Turkish people have been practicing religion for centuries. Islam has been the cement of this society, which comes from diversified ethnic backgrounds (Gül, 2001 quoted in Çınar and Duran, 2008, p. 33).

It is a kind of 'Turkish Islam' that incorporates the wisdom of Sufism with the historical experiences of the Republic of Turkey. Turks were practicing Shamanism in pre-Islamic period. When they converted to Islam, religious leaders of them, who were called as shamans, began to be referred in Islamic terms such as sheiks, *babas and velis*. However, Islam was intertwined to pre-Islamic faith and native culture. This symbiosis produced Sufi orders such as *Yeseviyye, Mevleviyye, Bektaşiyye* and *Nakşibendiyye*, and figures such as Mawlana, Ahmet Yesevi, Yunus Emre, Hacı Bektaş-ı Veli and Bahattin Nakşibend (Yavuz, 2004, p. 219). Turkish Islam is based on this Sufi tradition and its conflictual

relation with orthodox interpretations of Islam. Within this context, Sufi figures of Ahmet Yesevi, Mawlana, Yunus Emre and Hacı Bektaş-ı Veli became the mystical characters, which prevented Turkish culture from losing out within the Islamic religion and provided absorbing of Islamic culture into Turkish one (Yavuz, 2004, p. 219).

Under AKP rule, Turkish Islam served to continuation of the TIS. The Ottoman history is mentioned as a key factor. Islamism and Turco-Ottoman identity forms ideological backbone of the party. Erdoğan very often mentions Mehmed the Conqueror, Mehmet Akif and Necip Fazıl, who are prominent figures of Ottoman and Islamist pasts. Conquest of İstanbul is celebrated as a national holiday on every 29th of May in Turkey. AKP has taken such festivities seriously, invoking the nostalgia of pious Muslims for the days of glory of the pre-republican, imperial Ottoman Turkey (Çandar, 2015). Mehmet Akif and Necip Fazıl are defined as poets of the nation, who referred nationalism within Islamic tones and values. For Tayyip Erdoğan, Islam has always been a very important reference (Heper, 2013, p. 151) and Ottoman times are defined as long-awaited period. However, his references throughout 'age of felicity' of Prophet Mohammad and the first four Caliphs are secondary, while primary historical reference point is the Ottoman period, which is perceived as age of peace, tolerance and social harmony (Hale and Özbudun, 2010, p. 152). The concept of 'New Turkey', which is used to refer to AKP rule, aims to strengthen Turkey as it was in Ottoman times. In an organization in 2015, Erdoğan was welcomed as 'the leader' of 'New Turkey', while "New Turkey Anthem" was performed by an Ottoman military band, which praised Erdoğan. Mentioning historical figures from both Turkish and Islamic periods such as Attila the Hun, Oghuz Han, Alpaslan, the Ottoman Empire's founder Osman Ghazi, Mehmed the Conqueror, Selim I, Suleiman the Magnificent, Abdulhamid II and Atatürk, the band pronounced Erdoğan as one of the leaders (Hürriyet, 2015). Inspired also from revival of Ottoman times, TIS under AKP rule exists through education. Educational system is converted for the purpose of creating a pious generation. Making regulations on educational system, role of *imam-hatips* is strengthened. Quran and Prophet Mohammad's life are put as elective courses to secondary schools (Açıkgöz, 2014, p. 51). Courses on Arabic and Ottoman language entered to academic programs of schools. Restoration of nation's roots with their past is aimed:

Erdogan argued the lessons were necessary to restore Turks' severed ties with "our roots", with most unable to read the tombstones of their ancestors...It's not a foreign language. It's a form of Turkish that will never

age. Therefore it will be taught no matter what they say," he added (Telegraph, 2014).

Turkish-Islamic Synthesis and Symbols on Banknotes⁵

Rather than signifying sovereignty or independence of a nation, banknotes also imply historical narratives that are influential both in the construction of national identities, and, related to this, in implementation of state policies. According to Raento, et al. (2004, p. 930), the imaginary of money supports the production and maintenance of a national narrative written by the national elite. This historical-national narrative includes historical figures, monuments and commemorations. In Turkey, banknotes have messages of creation of national identity and providing national unity. For instance, banknotes of early Republican Era were designed in order to serve the policies of nation building. Usages of wolf pictures referring to pre-Islamic history of Turks, and photos from the new capital, Ankara, illustrate this.

The banknotes used during and after military coup in 1980 and the ones designed during AKP rule in 2009 have also messages. Admiration for Ottoman past, overemphasize on Ottoman culture and art, reinvention of Turkish Islam and eligibility of Turkish national identity are explicitly presented in the aforementioned banknotes. Within this context, it is claimed that there is a continuity of TIS.

In Turkey, Central Bank of Republic of Turkey (TCMB) is empowered by the Grand National Assembly of Turkey (TBMM) with prerogative of coining money. This is stated in Article 87 of the Constitution. Themes and symbols on the banknotes are determined by the Council of Bank. These themes and symbols are selected from a repository, which includes alternative themes and symbols such as prominent Turkish figures, scientists and philosophers, Anatolian civilizations, national palaces, and natural beauties.

During the period between 1980 and 2009, three series of banknotes were used in Turkey: the Seventh Issue (E7) Banknotes between 1979 and 2006, the Eight Issue (E8) Banknotes between 2005 and 2010, and the Ninth Issue (E9) Banknotes from 2009 until

⁵ While studying on this article, I had a private correspondence with Central Bank of Republic of Turkey (TCMB) (Date: 28.01.2016, No: 01427). In this part of this article, I will benefit from this correspondence.

today.⁶ Dominant figure in banknotes is Atatürk. All obverse sides consist of his portraits.

E7 is the longest series of banknotes to be used in Turkey. First denomination of this series began to be issued in 1979 and withdrawn in 2006. In this respect, E7 Series witnessed to several events that have important roles in Turkish political history such as the military coup in 1980, rise of separatist movements, increasing demand of democratization, rise of Islamic movements, and the military 'intimidation' on February 28th of 1997. As it is mentioned in the part on the TIS, rise of leftist ideologies, increasing influence of revolutionary Islamist ideas related to Iranian Revolution in 1979 and, related to these, disorder within country highlighted the need for a state-led religion. As a result, synthesis of Turkish-Islam emerged as a key factor to weaken leftist and Islamist movements, and to restore national order. TIS was introduced as an acceptable 'state Islam'. It was also aimed to keep non-conforming Islams as potential threats to the secular regime. In this period, heritage left by Ottomans and Islamic culture was enshrined. Role of Islam in politics increased in such a way that Turkey joined to the Fourth Islamic Summit Conference at presidential level in 1984 for the first time. Even, Kenan Evren, the leader of military coup, was elected as director for economic committee in this conference (Eligür, 2010, p. 134). Passion to the glorious periods of Ottoman history and İstanbul's culture, nostalgia to the era of Mehmet II and conquest of İstanbul, admiration to Turkish-Islamic culture and arts were on the peak of glorification (Çetinsaya, 1999, p. 370).

⁶ Due to differences between dates of issue and dates of withdrawal, when a new series of banknotes issued, the former one maintained to be used for a while. For instance, when E9 series were issued in 2009, E8 series maintained to be used until 2010.

Banknotes were issued in the service of TIS. Islamic designs and themes are located on the reverse sides of the banknotes. A portrait of Mehmet Akif, his house in Ankara, which is currently used as a museum, a view from Ankara Castle, and the script of the first two quatrains of National Anthem are designed themes on 100-Turkish Lira (Figure 1), which were used between 1983 and 1989.



Figure 1

(www.worldbanknotescoins.com)

On 1000-Turkish Lira, a portrait of Mehmet II and a view from İstanbul were designed (Figure 2). This banknote was used between 1986 and 1992. On-5000 Turkish Lira, which were used between 1981 and 1994, a figure of Mawlana and Mawlana Museum in Konya was designed (Figure 3, Figure 4). These banknotes were issued with two different designs. On 10000-Turkish Lira, a figure of Mimar Sinan and one of his architectures, Selimiye Mosque in Edirne, were designed (Figure 5). It was used from 1982 to 1995. These were the first people, whose portraits were designed on the banknotes after the ones of Atatürk and İsmet İnönü. Islamic designs and themes on these banknotes such as a mosque, a tomb, an Islamist philosopher, whirling dervishes and a Sufi figure, an Ottoman sultan and an Ottoman architect, represent the state-controlled Islamization policy, or the TIS. References to the 'magnificent' Turkish-Ottoman past, Turkish Islam, Ottoman art and culture are pointed through banknotes in the 1980s.⁷ In other words, messages and policies of the ruling elite coincide on designs of banknotes.



Figure 2

(www.worldbanknotescoins.com)

⁷ Of course, these four kinds of banknotes were not the only banknotes issued in E7 Series. I decided on these, because of their connection to topic of this article.



Figure 3
(www.turkishbanknotes.info)



E9 Series with renewed designs

Figure 4
(www.worldbanknotescoins.com)

and portraits have been put into circulation on January 1, 2009, in six different values



On 5-Turkish Lira banknote, there is a portrait of Prof. Dr. Aydın Sayılı, who has the first doctoral degree in the field of history of science in the world

Figure 5
(www.worldbanknotescoins.com)

E9 Series of banknotes were issued in 2009⁸ and it brought along debates about who the figures on banknotes were. Even it was discussed in daily newspapers that whether AKP declared sharia rule (Bayer, 2009). In my private correspondence with TCMB, it explained the criteria in determination of figures on banknotes: to be a scientist or an artist, to be 'indigenous' i.e. one of our own, to have a universal recognition, not to be identified with any political ideology, not to be issued on previous banknotes both in Turkey and in the world. In this regard, any changes on designs of banknotes in future are up to these criteria.

consisting of denominations 5, 10, 20, 50, 100 and 200 Turkish Liras (CBRT, 2014, 13). In these banknotes, neo-Ottomanism, contributions of Turks to the science, and Turkish-Islamic culture and art are the dominant themes.

Sayılı, who has the first doctoral degree in the field of history of science in the world

⁸ In 2005, E8 Series of banknotes began to be used until their withdrawal in 2010. Since almost the same figures were used with E7 Series, E8 Series will not be discussed in this article.

(Unat, 2013, p. 2-3), with symbols about the solar system, atomic model and DNA model (Figure 6). His thesis was on scientific developments in the medieval Islamic world. Graduated from Harvard University in 1942, Sayılı is a pioneer of establishment of history of science discipline in Turkey. Similarly, a portrait of another Turkish scientist, Cahit Arf, is designed on 10-Turkish Lira banknote. In addition to Arf's portrait, an equation of his theory, Arf Invariant, is located on the banknotes (Figure 7). Portrayal of both Sayılı and Arf together with scientific symbols on banknotes refers to Turkish-Islamic advancements and contributions of Turks in science.



Figure 6
(www.banknotes.com)

Rather than 5 and 10 Lira banknotes, reference to Ottoman past is emphasized more clearly on 20, 50, 100 and 200-lira banknotes. On 20-Turkish Lira banknote, a portrait of Architect Kemalettin and one of his projects, Rectorate Building of Gazi University in Ankara, are designed (Figure 8).

Kemalettin was an Ottoman architect, but also worked during early republican years. He was one of the pioneers of First National Architectural Movement, which is also called as neo-Ottomanist architecture (Balamir, 2003). This movement had a critical approach against republican period. Republican elite made a clear distinction between the Ottoman period and afterwards. In this regard, public figures such as Mimar Sinan were highlighted in the field of architecture and Ottoman sultans were de-emphasized. With the increasing influence of modernization and Westernization policies, secular buildings such as barracks and schools became the favorite architectures of new republic. Kemalettin opposes to this understanding of republican period and accuses the tracteries during this period as being non-national. His movement aims to replace secularism with Turkishness and Islam in the field of architecture. According to him, Turkish architecture is genuine and composed of Turkish spirit and Muslim civilization (Tekeli and İlkin, 1997, p. 14).

The first woman figure on banknotes in the history of the republic is issued during AKP rule in 2009. A portrait of one of the first novelists in Turkish literature, Fatma Aliye, with several figures of book, pen, inkstand and paper are designed on 50-Turkish Lira banknotes (Figure 9). Fatma Aliye was daughter of Ahmet Cevdet Pasha, a dignitary Ottoman pasha, and wife of Faik Bey, nephew of prominent commander of Battle of Plevne, Gazi Osman Pasha. In her literal works, she was interested in women rights, education of women, marriage and women’s place in society. While emphasizing equality of women and men, she stayed in the frame of traditional values. She opposed to state-led modernization and Westernization policies of Kemalist elite during republican period, and criticized new republic’s sharp distinction with Ottoman past. In her novel, *Uzak Ülke*, discussing Fatma Aliye’s life, Fatma Barbarosoğlu (2010, p. 159) points Aliye’s critics on modernization policies and de-emphasize of Ottoman past:

...what unifies the whole was gone, and thereby the unity was dissolved. Path to be followed is clear: to prepare the future without destroying the



Figure 7



Figure 8

(www.banknotes.com)



Figure 9

(www.istanbulkadınmuzesi.org)

past. Not ignoring, but benefiting from it. I wish they (the Kemalist elite) knew the difference between demolition of the Sultan and demolition of the past. I wish they accept the close relationship between the past and the future.

Designs of 100 and 200-Lira banknotes have also direct references to Turkish-Islamic arts, Ottoman past and Turkish Islam. On 100-Turkish Lira banknotes, there is a portrait

of Ottoman musician Buhurizade Mustafa Efendi, known as Itri (Figure 10). Beside this, figures of musical notes, several instruments and a portrait of a dervish playing reed flute are designed on banknotes. Portrait of dervish playing reed flute refers to Itri's devotion to Mavleviyeh, a religious order based on ideas of Mawlana. Itri was a musician supported by Ottoman sultans.



Figure 10
(www.dreamstime.com)

Today, it is claimed that he is one

of the composers contributed to developments of Turkish classical music. On 200-Turkish Lira, there is a portrait of Yunus Emre, the prominent Sufi and poet, is designed (Figure 11). In addition, there are several figures accompanying his portrait: a figure of his mausoleum, a figure of rose, which is usually included in his poems, a figure of



Figure 11
(www.worldbanknotescoins.com)

pigeon, which symbolizes peace and brotherhood, and one of his verses, which is 'Sevelim Sevilelim' means 'let love and be loved'. Influenced by Mawlana, Yunus Emre points the non-indulgence. Only if one is self-denial, the love of God can be achieved. According to him, all humankind are equal in front of the God without giving attention to their ethnicity, religion

and sect. Issuing of Itri and Yunus Emre directly refers to Ottoman-Islamic past and

Turkish Islam, which are mostly mentioned by AKP cadres. For example, Erdoğan sums up his worldview with a verse of Yunus Emre, which is '*Yaradılanı Severiz, Yaradandan Ötürü*' meaning 'we love the creatures, due to the Creator', within a Turkish Islamic context. In addition, AKP cadres encourage people to learn about Ottoman past, which is defined as a necessity.

Conclusion

To conclude, there is a continuity of state-religion relationship in the history of Turkey. TIS is a product of this relationship emerged in the 1960s and evolved to a *de facto* state policy in 1980 military coup. It maintains to exist during AKP rule in the 2000s. This continuity is concluded within symbols issued on banknotes in these years.

It is clear that the first banknotes issued by the early republic show parallelisms with the ones used today in terms of representing ideologies of ruling political elite and carrying messages about policies of the state. However, it is controversial to claim that there is an established tradition about banknote issuing in Turkey. When the series issued from the 1920s until today are analyzed, it is clear that there is no parallelism in terms of banknotes' usage as political instruments and messages out of several banknotes and series. Only the banknotes issued during Atatürk period, and the ones issued in the early 1980s and under AKP rule clearly have political messages related to political agenda of ruling elites.

Banknotes issued in the early 1980s and 2009, which are subjects of this article, have continuity in terms of TIS. As usage of figures from Ottoman-Turkish and Islamic past demonstrates, symbols and figures issued on these banknotes have direct references to TIS. Although the TCMB defines five criteria on determination of symbols on banknotes in E9 Series, it is debatable. These five criteria are to be a scientist or an artist, to be 'indigenous' i.e. one of our own, to be universally recognized, not to be identified with any political ideology, and not to be issued on previous banknotes both in Turkey and in the world. Adnan Sayılı and Cahit Arf are scientists that were not issued on banknotes before. Thus, their selection makes sense in terms of five criteria of TCMB. As one of the prominent architects in Turkish history, selection of Mimar Kemaleddin can be defined as just that Mimar Sinan has already issued on E7 Banknote Series. However, issuing of Fatma Aliye, İtri and Yunus Emre are controversial in terms of these criteria, one of which was not to be identified with any political ideology. Fatma Aliye is known for her Islamist ideas. İtri and Yunus Emre are prominent figures of Turkish Islam. It is doubtful that they are used in accordance with political rhetoric of

AKP. It is unmoral to refer Fatma Aliye, Itri and Yunus Emre as representatives of a political ideology. But what about their usage as instruments of a political party's rhetoric?

References

- Açıkgöz, S. K. (2014). Kemalism and Post-Kemalism: Turkish State in Search of Palatable Citizen Forever, *Turkish Journal of Politics*, 5:2.
- Altunışık, M. (2005). The Turkish Model and Democratization in the Middle East, *Arab Studies Quarterly*, 27:1-2.
- Armstrong, W. (2012). Turkish Nationalism and Turkish Islam: A New Balance, *Turkish Policy Quarterly*, 10:4.
- Aslan, Ö. (2014). "A Turkish Muslim between Islamism and Turkish Nationalism: Seyyid A. A. (1932-1988)", *Turkish Studies*, 15:3.
- Atasoy, Y. (2009). *Islam's Marriage with Neoliberalism: State Transformation in Turkey*, London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Balamir, A. (2013). Mimarlık ve Kimlik Temrinleri I: Türkiye'de Modern Yapı Kültürünün Bir Profili, *Mimarlık Dergisi*, 313, available on <http://www.mimarlarodasi.org.tr/mimarlikdergisi/index.cfm?sayfa=mimarlik&DergiSayi=6&RecID=66> Date Accessed: 13.02.2016
- Barbarosoğlu, F. (2010). *Uzak Ülke*. İstanbul: Profil.
- Bayer, Y. (10 January 2009) "Paralardaki Aliye Hanım", *Hürriyet*, <http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/paralardaki-aliye-hanim-10753138> Date Accessed: 08.02.2016
- Bora, T (2003). Nationalist Discourses in Turkey, *The South Atlantic Quarterly*, 102:2-3.
- Central Bank of the Republic of Turkey (CBRT), (2014). *The Banknotes of the Republic of Turkey*, General Directorate of Banknote Printing Plant: Ankara.

- Çandar, C. (29 May 2015). "Erdoğan Tries to Rewrite History", <http://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/tr/originals/2015/05/turkey-erdogan-akp-alter-history-for-election-campaign.html># Date Accessed: 08.02.2016
- Çetinsaya, G. (1999). Rethinking Nationalism and Islam: Some Preliminary Notes on the Roots of Turkish-Islamic Synthesis in Modern Turkish Political Thought, *The Muslim World*, 89: 3-4.
- Çınar, M., Duran, B. (2008). "The Specific Evolution of Contemporary Political Islam in Turkey and Its 'Difference'" in Ed. Ümit Cizre, *Secular and Islamic Politics in Turkey: The Making of the Justice and Development Party*. New York: Routledge.
- Eligür, B. (2010). *The Mobilization of Political Islam in Turkey*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Friedman, T. (19 June 2010). Letter From İstanbul, Part 2, *New York Times*.
- Grigoriadis, Ioannis. (2013). *Instilling Religion in Greek and Turkish Nationalism: A Sacred Synthesis*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Gül, A. (2001). "Turkey: Key Policy Challenges", paper presented at the Wilton Park Conference.
- Hale, W., Özbudun, E. (2010). *Islamism, Democracy and Liberalism in Turkey: The Case of the AKP*. New York: Routledge.
- Heper, M. (2013). Islam, Conservatism, and Democracy in Turkey: Comparing Turgut Özal and Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, *Insight Turkey*, 15:2.
- Hürriyet, (11 April 2015). "Ottoman-inspired 'New Turkey' Anthem Praises Erdoğan", <http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/video-ottoman-inspired-new-turkey-anthem-praises-erdogan.aspx?pageID=238&nID=80921&NewsCatID=338> Date Accessed: 04.02.2016
- Orhan, Ö. (2013). The Paradox of Turkish Secularism, *Turkish Journal of Politics*, 4:1.
- Rabasa, A., Larrabee, S. (2008). *The Rise of Political Islam in Turkey*, RAND: Santa Monica.

- Raento, P., Hamalainen, A. Ikonen, H., Mikkonen, N. (2004). Striking Stories: A political Geography of Euro Coinage, *Political Geography*, 23:8.
- Şen, M. (2011). "Transformation of Turkish Islamism and the Rise of the Justice and Development Party" in Ed. Birol Yeşilada and Barry Rubin, *Islamization of Turkey under the AKP Rule*, London and New York: Routledge.
- Tekeli, İ., İlkin, S. (1997). *Mimar Kemalettin'in Yazdıkları*, Ankara: Şevki Vanlı Mimarlık Vakfı.
- Telegraph, (8 December 2014). "Recep Tayyip Erdogan Vows To Impose 'Arabic' Ottoman Lessons In Schools",
[Http://Www.Telegraph.Co.Uk/News/Worldnews/Europe/Turkey/11280577/Recep-Tayyip-Erdogan-Vows-To-İmpose-Arabic-Ottoman-Lessons-İn-Schools.Html](http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/turkey/11280577/recep-tayyip-erdogan-vows-to-impose-arabic-ottoman-lessons-in-schools.html)
Date Accessed: 04.02.2016
- Turam, B. (2007). *Between Islam and the State: The Politics on Engagement*, California: Stanford University Press.
- Unat, Y. (2013). "Ord. Prof. Aydın Sayılı", *Dört Öge*, 1:3.
- Uzer, U. (2011). *Identity and Turkish Foreign Policy: The Kemalist Influence in Cyprus and the Caucasus*, I.B. London: Tauris.
- Waxman, D. (2000). Islam and Turkish National Identity: A Reappraisal, *Turkish Yearbook of International Relations*, 30.
- Yavuz, H. (2004). Is There a Turkish Islam? The Emergence of Convergence and Consensus, *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs*, 24:2.
- Yavuz, H. (2003). *Islamic Political Identity in Turkey*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Zubeida, S. (1996). Turkish Islam and National Identity, *Middle East Report*, 26, available on <http://www.merip.org/mer/mer199/turkish-islam-national-identity> Date Accessed: 01.02.2016