

Is Every Şūfī a Shī‘ī? The Example of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī Based on His Views in Nawādir al-uşūl Regarding the Concepts of Walāyah-Imāmate and Ahl al-bayt-Companions

Her Mutasavvıf Şi‘î midir? Velayet-İmamet ve Ehl-i beyt-Sahabe Mefhumlarına Dair Nevâdiru’l-Usûl’deki Görüşleri Ekseninde Hakîm Tirmizî Örneği

Mahmut Demir

Doç. Dr., Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Hadis Anabilim Dalı
Assoc. Prof. Dr. Hacı Bayram Veli University, Faculty of Divinity, Department of
Hadith

Ankara/Türkiye

57mahmut@gmail.com

ORCID: [0000-0002-6371-4348](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6371-4348)

Makale Bilgisi | Article Information

Geliş Tarihi Received: 13.01.2025
Kabul Tarihi Accepted: 24.05.2025
Yayın Tarihi Published: 15. 06. 2025

This article is a redesigned, revised, and expanded version of the paper titled "Where Does al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī Stand in the Interaction Between Sūfism and Shī‘ism? Reflections on the Possibility of al-Ḥakīm's Influence from Shī‘i Thought," which was presented at the International Symposium "Islamic Scholars from Transoxiana to Anatolia: Imam al-Tirmidhī and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī," held in Termez, Uzbekistan on October 17-18, 2024. / Bu makale, 17-18 Ekim 2024 tarihlerinde Özbekistan'ın Tirmiz kentinde düzenlenen "Uluslararası Maveraünnehir'den Anadolu'ya İslam Âlimleri: İmam Tirmizî ve Hâkim et-Tirmizî" adlı Sempozyum'da sunulan "Tasavvuf ve Şiilik Arasındaki Etkileşimde el-Hakim Nerede Duruyor? el-Hakim'in Şii Düşüncesinden Etkilenme Olasılığı Üzerine Düşünceler" başlıklı bildirinin yeniden tasarlanmış, gözden geçirilmiş ve genişletilmiş bir versiyonudur.

Atrıf | Cite as

Demir, Mahmut. "Is Every Şūfī a Shī‘ī? The Example of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī Based on His Views in Nawādir al-uşūl Regarding the Concepts of Walāyah-Imāmate and Ahl al-bayt-Companions". *Van İlahiyat Dergisi* 13/22 (Haziran 2025), 105-122. <https://doi.org/10.54893/vanid.1618878>

Demir, Mahmut. "Her Mutasavvıf Şi‘î midir? Velayet-İmamet ve Ehl-i beyt-Sahabe Mefhumlarına Dair Nevâdiru’l-Usûl’deki Görüşleri Ekseninde Hakîm Tirmizî Örneği". *Van Journal of Divinity* 13/22 (June 2025), 105-122. <https://doi.org/10.54893/vanid.1618878>

İntihal | Plagiarism

Bu makale, en az iki hakem tarafından incelendi ve intihal içermediği teyit edildi. This article has been reviewed by at least two referees and scanned via plagiarism software.

Web: <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/vanid>

Mail: vanyyuifd@yyu.edu.tr

Is Every Şūfī a Shīʿī? The Example of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī Based on His Views in Nawādir al-uşūl Regarding the Concepts of Walāyah-Imāmate and Ahl al-bayt-Companions*

Abstract

There are significant similarities between Şūfī thought and Shīʿa, if not in all aspects, at least in some. These similarities are more apparent in the theories such as mahdism, imāmate/walāyah, and al-Nūr al-Muḥammadī. As a matter of fact, within Shīʿa, there is a tendency to view Şūfism and Shīʿa thought as almost a unified whole. It has even been argued that every Şūfī must necessarily be an Imāmī Shīʿite and every Shīʿite must be a Şūfī. However, there are also Shīʿa scholars who claim that Shīʿa has no connection with Şūfism and deny Şūfī thought altogether. Kāmil Muşţafā al-Shaybī, who conducted an independent and comprehensive study on the subject, attempted to reveal the similarities between Shīʿa and Şūfism in all aspects. In this context, he particularly references the famous Şūfī and hadith scholar al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, especially in the context of the concept of walāyah. On the other hand, al-Tahrānī, known for his voluminous work on Shīʿa literature, also mentions al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī as a Shīʿa scholar and one of his literary compositions as an example of Shīʿa literature. It can be said that al-Ḥakīm's idea that the Islamic ummah can never be without a *walī*, similar to the Shīʿa theory that the earth cannot be without an *Imam* in the context of *walāyah* and *imāmate*, bears a rhetorical similarity to Shīʿa discourse. However, his explanations about who these walīs will be and their qualities reveal how far he stands from Shīʿa. This study examines al-Ḥakīm's views on concepts and notions such as Ahl al-bayt and the Companions, which are subjects of controversy between Shīʿa and Ahl al-Sunnah, in light of his work *Nawādir al-uşūl*, a hadith commentary, and attempts to verify if the claim that every Şūfī must be a Shīʿa, at least in the context of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, holds true.

Keywords: Hadith, Shīʿa, al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Ahl al-bayt, Companions

Her Mutasavvıf Şiî midir? Velayet-İmamet ve Ehl-i beyt-Sahabe Mefhumlarına Dair Nevâdiru'l-Usûl'deki Görüşleri Ekseninde Hakîm Tirmizî Örneği**

Öz

Tasavvuf düşüncesi ile Şia arasında her konuda olmasa da bazı hususlarda önemli benzerlikler söz konusudur. Bu benzerlikler *mehdilik*, *imamet/velayet*, *Nûr-ı Muhammedî* gibi nazariyelerde daha belirgin bir biçimde karşımıza çıkmaktadır. Nitekim Şia içerisinde de tasavvuf ile Şiî düşüncenin adeta bir bütün olduğu yönünde bir eğilim vardır. Öyle ki onlar her sûfînin mutlaka imâmî Şiî olması, her Şiî'nin de mutlaka mutasavvıf olması gerektiğini ileri sürmüşlerdir. Bununla birlikte Şia'nın tasavvufla hiçbir ilgisinin olmadığını ileri sürüp tasavvuf düşüncesini inkâr eden Şiî alimler de mevcuttur. Konuya dair müstakil ve kapsamlı bir çalışma yapan Mustafa Kamil Seybî, Şia ile tasavvuf arasındaki benzerlikleri tüm yönleriyle ortaya koymaya çalışmıştır. O, bu bağlamda bilhassa velayet düşüncesi bağlamında meşhur sûfî ve hadisçi Hakîm Tirmizî'ye de referanslarda bulunmaktadır. Öte yandan Şiî literatüre dair yazdığı hacimli eseriyle bilinen Tahrânî de Hakîm Tirmizî'ye bir kitabı münasebetiyle bu eserinde ona yer vermektedir. Hakîm'in velayet ve imamet meselesi bağlamında yeryüzünün imamsız kalamayacağı şeklindeki Şiî nazariyeye benzer olarak İslam ümmetinin hiçbir zaman velisiz kalamayacağı şeklindeki düşüncesinin Şia ile söylem benzerliği taşıdığı söylenebilir. Ancak bu velilerin kimler olacağına ve vasıflarına dair yaptığı açıklamalar onun Şia'dan ne kadar uzak bir yerde durduğunu ortaya koymaktadır. Bu çalışmada Hakîm'in, bir hadis şerhi olan *Nevâdiru'l-usûl* adlı eserinde Şia ve Ehl-i sünnet arasında polemik konusu olan Ehl-i beyt ve sahabe gibi bazı kavramlar ve mefhumlara dair görüşleri ışığında onun Şia hakkındaki düşüncelerine yer verilmiş böylece her mutasavvıfın bir Şiî olması gerektiği yönündeki iddianın en azından Hakîm Tirmizî bağlamında doğrulanıp doğrulanamayacağı tespit edilmeye çalışılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Hadis, Şia, Hakîm Tirmizî, Ehl-i beyt, Sahabe.

* This article is a redesigned, revised, and expanded version of the paper titled "Where Does al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī Stand in the Interaction Between Sūfism and Shīʿism? Reflections on the Possibility of al-Ḥakīm's Influence from Shīʿī Thought," which was presented at the International Symposium "Islamic Scholars from Transoxiana to Anatolia: Imam al-Tirmidhī and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī," held in Termez, Uzbekistan on October 17-18, 2024.

** Bu makale, 17-18 Ekim 2024 tarihlerinde Özbekistan'ın Tirmiz kentinde düzenlenen "Uluslararası Maveraünnehir'den Anadolu'ya İslam Âlimleri: İmam Tirmizî ve Hâkim et-Tirmizî" adlı Sempozyum'da sunulan "Tasavvuf ve Şiilik Arasındaki Etkileşimde el-Hakim Nerede Duruyor? el-Hakim'in Şiî Düşüncesinden Etkilenme Olasılığı Üzerine Düşünceler" başlıklı bildirinin yeniden tasarlanmış, gözden geçirilmiş ve genişletilmiş bir versiyonudur.

Introduction

1. The Relationship between Ṣūfism and Shīʿa

The question of whether every Ṣūfī is a Shīʿī has both historical implications and scholarly foundations. Indeed, there are striking parallels between Ṣūfī thought and at least some key Shīʿa doctrines. These parallels are particularly evident in theories like Mahdism, Imāmate/walāyah, and the Muhammadan Light (*al-Ḥaqīqa al-Muḥammadiyya*). Within Shīʿa Islam, some ardently champion these parallels and similarities, while others maintain that Shīʿa has no connection with Ṣūfism, even rejecting Ṣūfī thought altogether. For example, al-Ḥurr al-ʿĀmilī (d. 1104/1693), one of the leading figures of the *Akhbārī* school, attempted to demonstrate in his work *Risālat al-ithnā ʿashariyya fī al-radd ʿalā al-Ṣūfiyya* that Shīʿa has no connection with Ṣūfism and that the views adopted by Ṣūfis have no validity in Shīʿa perspective. According to him, no Shīʿī is a Ṣūfī. In Shīʿa sources, hadith, and biographical works, one can only find disparaging expressions regarding Ṣūfism.¹ This situation has even become one of the reasons for some anti-Shīʿa critics to criticize Shīʿism. Indeed, Muʿīn al-Dīn Ashraf Sharīf Shīrāzī (d. 995/1587),² known as Mīrẓā Makhdūm, who left Imāmiyya Shīʿa and converted to Sunnī Islam, in his work *Nawāqid al-Rawāfiq*, accused Shīʿa of this negative approach towards Ṣūfism. We understand this from the refutation written by al-Shahīd Nūrullāh Shushtarī (d. 1019/1610), a prolific figure of the Ṣafavid era Shīʿī scholar known for his refutations against Sunnīs. By contrast, Tustarī tried to demonstrate with examples that the discourse about Shīʿa denying Ṣūfism was a slander. In fact, in this context, he references the following statement of al-Sayyid Bahāʾ al-dīn Ḥaydar al-Āmulī (d. after 787/1385), one of the first names to reconcile Shīʿism with Ṣūfism:

أن الصوفي الحقيقي لا يكون الا شيعيا اماميا والشييعي الحقيقي لا يكون الا صوفيا

“A true Ṣūfī can only be an Imāmī Shīʿī and a true Shīʿī can only be a Ṣūfī”³

The parallels between Shīʿa and Ṣūfī thought have been the subject of independent study. Kāmil Muṣṭafā al-Shaybī, in his voluminous work *al-Ṣila bayna al-taṣawwuf wa al-tashayyū*,⁴ examined the subject in detail for the first time at an academic level and attempted to demonstrate a close connection between the two schools of thought, both theoretically and practically. In this context, the author also gives a special place in his work to Bahāʾ al-dīn Ḥaydar al-Āmulī, mentioned above, who unites⁵ and integrates Ṣūfism and Shīʿism.⁶ Undoubtedly, the claims and arguments put forward by al-Shaybī deserve to be examined independently by experts in the field. Our concern here is to try to determine whether the claim that there is a necessary connection between Ṣūfism and Shīʿism, or that every Ṣūfī is an Imāmī/Shīʿī, is a verifiable claim, particularly in the case of the famous Ṣūfī and Hadith scholar al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī. Because al-Shaybī frequently refers to al-Ḥakīm's concept of *walāya* when establishing this relationship.

¹ Muḥammad b. al-Ḥasan b. ʿAlī al-Ḥurr al-ʿĀmilī, *Risālat al-ithnā ʿashariyya fī al-radd ʿalā al-Ṣūfiyya*, nṣr. ʿAbbās al-Celālī (Qom: Muʾassasat Anṣāriyān, 1432/2011), 22-23.

² During the Ṣafavid era (while serving as a prominent bureaucrat under Shāh Tahmasb [r. 1524-1576] and his successor Ismāʿīl II [1576-1577]), he converted to Sunnī Islam and consequently sought refuge in the Ottoman Empire. For Mīrẓā Makhdūm's scholarly career during the Ottoman period, see Kioumars Ghereghlou, “A Ṣafavid Bureaucrat in the Ottoman World: Mirza Makhdūm Sharifi Shirazi and the Quest for Upward Mobility in the İlmiye Hierarchy”, *Osmanlı Araştırmaları/The Journal of Ottoman Studies* 53/53 (2018), 153-194.

³ al-Sayyid Ḍiyā al-Dīn Nūrullāh al-Shushtarī, *Maṣāʾib al-nawāṣib fī al-radd ʿalā nawāqid al-rawāfiq*, ed. Qays al-ʿAṭṭar (Qom: Dalil-i Mā, 1426/2005), 2/164; For similar statements by al-Āmulī, see al-Sayyid Bahāʾ al-dīn Ḥaydar al-Āmulī, *Jāmiʿ al-asrār wa manbaʿ al-anwār*, ed. Henry Corbin, Osmān Ismāʿīl Yahyā (Beirut: Muʾassasat al-tarikh al-ʿArabi, 1426/2005), 611.

⁴ The core of this work originates from the author's master's thesis, completed in 1958 at the Department of Philosophy and Social Sciences, Faculty of Arts, Alexandria University. The work has been published three times under this title. As al-Shaybī states in the preface to the third edition from 1982, this book complements his work *al-Fikr al-Shīʿī wa al-nazaʿāt al-Ṣūfiyya*, published in 1966. This second work, in turn, is an outgrowth of his doctoral dissertation, *Studies in the Interaction of Sufism and Shi'ism to the Rise of the Safavids*, completed in 1961 at Cambridge under the supervision of Arthur John Arberry (1905-1969). The author combined the first chapter of *al-Ṣila*, titled “Shīʿī Elements in Ṣūfism,” with his doctoral thesis, restructuring and redesigning it, and republishing it in 1991 under the title “Sufism and Shi'ism.” Kāmil Mustafa al-Shaybī, *al-Ṣila bayn al-taṣawwuf wa al-tashayyū* (Beirut, 1982), 1/7; al-Shaybī, *al-Fikr al-Shīʿī wa al-nazaʿāt al-Ṣūfiyya* (Baghdad, 1966), 5; al-Shaybī, *Sufism and Shi'ism* (England: LAAM, 1991).

⁵ al-Shaybī, *al-Ṣila*, 2/91.

⁶ al-Shaybī, *al-Ṣila*, 1/104.

The most accurate way to determine this is to investigate whether there are ideas in al-Ḥakīm's works that support Shī'a doctrines. In al-Ḥakīm's *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, which also holds the distinction of being the first commentary on Hadith in the history of Hadith studies, there is sufficient data to shed light on the subject. What al-Ḥakīm wrote in this work, especially concerning the concepts of *imāmate*, *walāya*, *ṣaḥāba* (companions), and the People of the House (*Ahl al-bayt*), which are the concepts that largely encapsulate the debates between Shī'a and Sunnī circles, shows us where he stands in the Shī'a-Ṣūfism interaction. However, first, it would be appropriate to provide some brief information about the environment in which al-Ḥakīm grew up and the thoughts he held.

2. Concerning al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī

Al-Ḥakīm grew up in an environment where early theological debates took place, even where they first emerged. Jāhīm ibn Ṣafwān (d. 128/745-46), one of the prominent figures in these debates, was from Tirmidh. This is probably why the author of *Aḥsan al-taqāsīm* states that the majority of the people of Tirmidh were Jāhmīs.⁷ Similarly, Jāhīm's teacher and the person who first initiated the debates on the "Khalq al-Qur'ān" (Createdness of the Quran), Ja'd ibn Dirham (d. 124/742), although settled in Damascus, was originally from Khorasan, the broader eastern Iranian region that encompassed Tirmidh as well as other intellectual settings.⁸ Tirmidh is one of the ancient cities established on the east bank of the Oxus River. The great Khorasanian genealogist Abū Sa'd al-Sam'ānī (d. 562/1166) writes that Tirmidh is an ancient city that has hosted many scholars. The author of *al-Ansāb*, while stating that he himself stayed there for twelve days, also notes that scholars such as Abū 'Abdillāh al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Ishāq ibn Bajūya al-Tirmidhī, and Abū Bakr al-Warrāq were raised there. Al-Sam'ānī adds that Khālid ibn Ziyād ibn Jarw al-Azdī,⁹ known to have transmitted a sheet of writing from Nāfi', was also from Tirmidh.¹⁰

Al-Ḥakīm states in his autobiographical work *Buduvv al-sha'n*,¹¹ that he received his early education from his father, whom he calls "my shaikh," and that his father combined for him the knowledge of transmitted reports (*āthār*) and reason (*ra'y*). The age of twenty-seven was a turning point for al-Ḥakīm, both in terms of his intellectual and spiritual development. On his pilgrimage at this age, he studied Hadith in Iraq and Baṣra, and reached the peak of spiritual pleasure with his visit to Macca.¹² He also writes that he was subjected to slanderous accusations of leading people to corruption with his heretical innovations and claims of prophethood (which he declares that it never even crossed his mind) and was exiled to the city of Balkh by the rulers of the time.¹³ According to what is narrated from the famous Khorasanian Ṣūfī Abū 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Sulamī (d. 412/1021), it is recorded that al-Ḥakīm was accused because of the ideas he put forward in his works *Khatm al-awliyā'* and *Ilal al-sharī'a*, and that these ideas led to his expulsion from Tirmidh.¹⁴ It is also stated that he was accused of considering saints superior to prophets¹⁵

⁷ Abū Abdillāh Shamsuddīn Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-Bashsharī al-Maqdisī, *Aḥsan al-taqāsīm fī ma'rifat al-aqālīm*, ed. M.J. de Goeje (Cairo: Maktabat Madbuli, 1411-1991), 323.

⁸ Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī Ibn 'Asākir, *Tārīkh Dimashq*, ed. 'Amr b. Ghurāma al-'Umarī (Damascus: Dar al-Fikr, 1415/1995), 72/99.

⁹ Ibn Hibbān mentions that he narrated a proper page (*ṣaḥīfa mustaqīma*) from Nāfi', then notes that he served as a judge in Tirmidh, a position later inherited by his son 'Abd al-'Azīz. Muḥammad Ibn Hibbān, *al-Thiqāt*, ed. Muḥammad 'Abd al-Mu'īd (Hyderabad: Dāirat al-Ma'arif al-'Uthmaniyya, n.d.), 6/263-264; Khālid is also among the narrators of al-Tirmidhī and Nasāī, the compilers of the *Sunan*. Jamāluddīn Abū al-Hajjāj Yusuf b. Abd al-Raḥman al-Mizzī, *Tahdhīb al-kamāl fī asmā' al-rijāl*, ed. Bashār 'Awwād Ma'rūf (Beirut: Mu'assasat al-Risāla, 1400/1980), 8/65.

¹⁰ Abū Sa'd Abd al-Karīm b. Muḥammad al-Sam'ānī, *al-Ansāb*, ed. Abdullah 'Umar al-Bārūdī (Beirut: Dar al-Fikr, 1419/1998), 1/459.

¹¹ For al-Ḥakīm's autobiography, see Ferhat Gökçe, "Klasik Arap Literatüründe İlk Otobiyografik Örnekler: Hakīm et-Tirmizī'nin Būdūvvü Şe'n İsimli Eseri", International Symposium from Mā warā' al-Nahr to Anatolia Islamic Scholars: Imam al-Tirmidhī and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Symposium Proceedings, 17-18 October 2024 Tirmiz, 317-325.

¹² Abū 'Abdillāh Muḥammad b. 'Alī al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, ed. 'Uthmān Ismā'īl Yahyā (Beirut: Buḥūth wa-Dirāsāt bi-Idārat Ma'had al-Sharqiyya, n.d.) *Buduvv al-Sha'n*, in the introduction to *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 14.

¹³ al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *Khatm al-Awliyā'*, (*Buduvv*), 17-18.

¹⁴ Tāj al-Dīn 'Abd al-Wahhāb al-Subkī, *Ṭabaqāt al-Shāfi'iyya al-Kubrā*, ed. Maḥmūd Muḥammad al-Ṭanāhī (n.p.: Hijr li al-Ṭibā'a wa-al-Nashr, 1413/1992), 2/245.

¹⁵ According to the claim mentioned by Tāj al-Dīn al-Subkī, al-Ḥakīm allegedly said: If they were not superior, the prophets and martyrs would not envy them. Subkī, *Ṭabaqāt*, 2/245-246; In his commentary on this narration in his *al-Nawādir*, al-Ḥakīm al-

based on a prophetic narration about those whom the prophets envied,¹⁶ speaking of the love of God in a way that no one had ever known or heard before, including fabricated hadiths in his works, and practicing innovation (bidʿa). The Nūr al-Dīn Boyacılar edition of *al-Nawādir*, which we used in our study, occasionally includes editorial notes from which it can easily be inferred that al-Ḥakīm's hadith scholarship has been rightly criticized. Indeed, according to what Ibn Hajar relates, Ibn al-ʿAdīm (d. 660/1262), in his booklet *al-Lamḥa fī al-radd ʿalā Ibn Ṭalḥa*, made the following negative assessments, particularly regarding al-Ḥakīm's identity as a hadith scholar:

"Al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī is not among the scholars of hadith and narration, nor is he knowledgeable about the chains of transmission. However, his words concern Şūfī allusions (esoteric/interpretations), mystical orders, and the matter of unveiling. In this way, he deviated from the principles established by legal scholars and became deserving of criticism.... For this reason, they have said: He introduced into the religion things not accepted by the People of the Sunnah, filled his books with fabricated and unheard-of reports and narrations, and linked all aspects of religion to rationales..."

After mentioning Ibn al-ʿAdīm's exaggeration,¹⁷ Ibn Hajar seems to lament that despite being a great man, he couldn't find a sufficient biography of al-Ḥakīm. In fact, he even refers to the brief information that Abū Nuʿaym wrote about al-Ḥakīm in his *Hilya*, where he presumably hoped to find more details.¹⁸

Al-Ḥakīm, exiled from Tirmidh to Balkh due to the ideas mentioned by Ibn al-ʿAdīm, was met with great courtesy and hospitality by the people of Balkh. Al-Dhahabī states that the local populace embraced him because his views aligned with theirs.¹⁹ The author of *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*, who describes al-Ḥakīm as a "ḥāfiẓ", "zāhid", "muʾadhdhin", and "ṣāhib al-taṣānīf" (author of numerous works), mentions that starting with his father, he received hadiths from figures like Qutayba ibn Saʿīd, al-Ḥasan ibn ʿUmar ibn Shaqīq, Ṣāliḥ ibn ʿAbdullāh al-Tirmidhī, and ʿUtba ibn ʿAbdullāh al-Marwazī. He also states that al-Ḥakīm was interested in hadith narration and traveled for this purpose.²⁰ Elsewhere, al-Dhahabī provides the information that he heard many hadiths in Khorasan and Iraq and states that he was an "imām in hadith".²¹ Some Şūfī historical accounts mention that al-Ḥakīm also wrote an incomplete Qurʾānic exegesis; however, the attribution of the single manuscript copy of this work to al-Ḥakīm and the extent to which this work was authored by him is an ongoing research topic.²²

Tirmidhī states that these individuals are the *awliyāʾ* and *asfiyāʾ* of Allah, but he does not use any expression indicating that they are superior to the prophets. Al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *Nawādir al-uşūl fī maʿrifat akhbār al-Rasūl*, ed. Nūr al-Dīn Boyacılar (Beirut: Dār al-Minhāj, 1436/2015), 6/314; Moreover, he states that no inference can be drawn from this narration that there could be servants superior to the prophets, and that this is stated in the hadith to express their closeness to Allah. al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *Khatm al-awliyāʾ*, 394.

¹⁶ Abū Mālik al-Ashʿarī narrates: We were with the Messenger of Allah when the verse "Do not ask questions whose answers you may dislike" was revealed, and we were asking questions at that time. Thereupon, the Messenger of Allah said: "There are such servants of Allah who are neither martyrs nor prophets, that on the Day of Judgment, prophets and martyrs will envy them due to their closeness to Allah..." Abū ʿAbdullāh Aḥmad b. Ḥanbal, *al-Musnad*, ed. Shuʿayb al-Arnāʾūt, ʿĀdil Murshid (Beirut: Muʾassasat al-Risāla, 1421), 37/530 (N.22894); al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 6/314.

¹⁷ al-Dhahabī, stating that al-Ḥakīm is innocent of the excessive accusations directed at him, reminds us that everyone except the "truthful-innocent" Messenger of Allah may have accepted (*maʾkhūdh*) and rejected opinions, and notes that al-Ḥakīm has also been criticized on a few points. Shams al-Dīn Abū ʿAbdallāh al-Dhahabī, *Tārīkh al-Islām wa-wafayāt al-mashāhīr wa al-aʿlām*, ed. ʿUmar ʿAbd al-Salām Tadmurī (Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-ʿArabī, 1413/1993), 21/278.

¹⁸ Abū al-Faḍl Shihāb al-Dīn Aḥmad Ibn Ḥajar al-ʿAsqalānī, *Lisān al-Mizān*, ed. ʿAbd al-Fattāḥ Abū Ghudda (Beirut: Dār al-Bashāʾir al-Islāmiyya, 1423/2002), 7/388.

¹⁹ According to what Ibn Hajar al-ʿAsqalānī narrates from al-Sulamī, the doctrinal agreement here is that both the people of the region and al-Ḥakīm are inclined towards personal opinion (*raʾy*). ʿAsqalānī, *Lisān al-Mizān*, 7/387.

²⁰ Abū ʿAbdallāh Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. ʿUthmān al-Dhahabī, *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, 1419/1998), 2/161.

²¹ al-Dhahabī, *Tārīkh al-Islām*, 21/276.

²² For a detailed examination on this subject, see Halil Şimşek, "Tefsir Literatürü Mirasında Yeni Bir Keşif: Hakīm et-Tirmizî ve Tefsiri". *Uluslararası Mâverâünnehir'den Anadolu'ya İslam Âlimleri: İmâm Tirmizî ve Hakīm et-Tirmizî Sempozyumu Sempozyum Bildirileri*. Ed. Ferhat Gökçe. 435-443. Ankara: İlahiyat Yayınları, 2024.

While al-Dhahabī gives al-Ḥakīm's age at death as 80, Ibn Hajar states that he lived for 90 years.²³ Al-Ḥakīm, about whose death date different opinions have been put forward,²⁴ left behind many works.²⁵ Stating that al-Ḥakīm authored well-known literary works, Abū Nu'aym al-İsfahānī (d. 430/1039) says that he also wrote hadiths and was a man of rectitude. Abū Nu'aym continues and emphasizes that he opposed the Murji'ites and other dissenting views and that he adhered to the transmitted reports was in line with the People of Hadith (Ahl al-Hadith) in terms of creed.²⁶ Furthermore, in his famous literary compilation of Shī'ite works, Āghā Buzurg al-Ṭahrānī's (1875-1970) association of al-Ḥakīm among Shī'ite authors through the latter's unknown *Nawrūznāma*,²⁷ seems untenable on account of the fact that al-Ḥakīm is widely known to have penned another work entitled *Refutation of Rāfiḍah (al-Radd 'alā al-Rāfiḍa)*.²⁸ However, it seems possible that al-Ḥakīm was influenced by Shī'a, particularly in his esoteric thought system or interpretive approaches. Indeed, after emphasizing al-Ḥakīm's proficiency in hadith, kalam, fiqh, and the Arabic language, Radtke points out that, despite being anti-Shī'a, he borrowed from the Shī'as, even from the extreme factions among them.³⁰

3. Al-Shaybī's Shī'a-Şūfism Relationship Established in the Context of al-Ḥakīm's Concept of Walāyah

Leaving aside the debates regarding al-Ḥakīm's designation as a "Şūfī,"³¹ when the parallels between Shī'ism and Şūfism are evaluated, particularly within the context of the Imāmate-walāyah relationship, one of the first names that undoubtedly comes to mind is al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī. Al-Shaybī, who extensively addresses the matter of walāyah in the Shī'a-Şūfism interaction, states that the Shī'a

²³ Shams al-Dīn Abū 'Abdallāh al-Dhahabī, *Tadhkira*, 2/645; *Siyar a'lām al-nubalā*, ed. Shu'ayb al-Arnā'ūṭ (Beirut: Mu'assasat al-Risāla, 1405-1985), 10/467; 'Asqalānī, *Lisān al-Mizān*, 7/389.

²⁴ al-Ziriklī, addressing the confusion surrounding al-Ḥakīm's death date, provides this assessment: Those suggesting 255 contradict Subkī's account of him narrating hadiths in Nishapur in 285. Those proposing 285 (which al-Shaybī records as both 285 and 289 in different places) clash with the account of Anbārī (actually Ibn Yanal, see al-Dhahabī, *al-Nubalā*, 10/467; 'Asqalānī, *al-Lisān*, 7/389 - note by Abū Ghudda) hearing hadiths from him in 318. Khayruddīn al-Ziriklī, *al-A'lām*, (Beirut: Dār al-İlm li al-melāyīn, 2002), 6/272; Radtke, suggesting that al-Ḥakīm might have died at a ripe old age between 295 and 300, argues that the accounts of his death in 318 seem unlikely. Bernd Radtke and John O'Kane, *The Concept of Sainthood in Early Islamic Mysticism* (Curzon Press., 1996), 2, 12 (footnote 7); See also Fikret Karapınar, "Ḥakīm Tirmizī ve Ona Ait Bir Mecmū'a", *Marife* 2 (2005), 231, for another assertion of his death between 295 and 310.

²⁵ According to Bernd Radtke, the German orientalist known for his research on al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, al-Ḥakīm authored approximately eighty works. Bernd Radtke and John O'Kane, *The Concept of Sainthood in Early Islamic Mysticism*, 2.

²⁶ Ahmed b. Abdullāh b. Ahmed el-İsfahānī Abū Nu'aym, *Ḥilyat al-awliyā' wa ṭabaḳā al-aşfiyā* (Egypt: al-Sa'ada, 1394), 10/233; al-Ḥakīm's *Nawādir al-uşūl* discusses religious divisions and deviant sects in its 165th section. In fact, in light of his writings, it will not be difficult to determine his theological stance. Regarding this matter, he transmits the following narration through 'Ā'isha: When the Messenger of God (peace be upon him) asked his wife, "Who are those who divide their religion and separate into sects?" Aisha replied, "God and His Messenger know best." Thereupon, the Prophet (peace be upon him) responded, "They are the people of misguidance, innovation, and desires within this nation." al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/119; From al-Ḥakīm's explanations regarding who these people of desires, innovation, and misguidance are in the narration, we can readily assert that he maintained the line represented by the Ahl al-Sunnah or Ahl al-Hadith. Indeed, when explaining these groups driven by desires, al-Ḥakīm begins by mentioning those who go to extremes about 'Alī, even ascribing prophethood and divinity to him, and then considers groups like the Khārijites, who waged war against 'Alī, along with schools of thought such as the Mushabbihā, Qadariyya, Jabriyya, and Jahmiyya, within the scope of those misguided, as expressed in the hadith. al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/121-123.

²⁷ al-Ṭahrānī, who attributes a Persian work titled *Nawrūznāma* to al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, also quotes from the introduction of the work. According to this, al-Ḥakīm, upon reaching the age of 125, gained knowledge of astrology and titled the book he wrote on the subject *Nawrūznāma*. Āghā Buzurg Muhammed Muḥsin b. Alī al-Ṭahrānī, *al-Dharī'a ilā ṭaşānīf al-Shī'a* (Beirut: Dār al-aḍvā', tsz), 29/380; Such a work does not appear in Bernd Radtke's list of al-Tirmidhī's works. Furthermore, he states that while al-Ḥakīm knew Persian, he wrote all his works in Arabic, and the attribution of Persian works to him is an error. Bernd Radtke and John O'Kane, *The Concept of Sainthood*, 10. However, it should also be noted that *Nawrūznāma* does not appear in the list of works that Radtke mentions as being wrongly attributed to al-Ḥakīm. See *The Concept of Sainthood*, 5.

²⁸ Abu Abdullah Muhammad ibn Ali al-Tirmidhī al-Ḥakīm, *al-Radd 'alā al-Rāfiḍa*, nşr. Ahmed Subhi Furat (İstanbul: İstanbul Edebiyat Fakültesi Basımevi, 1966), 37-46.

²⁹ While Radtke claims this work is lost, Karapınar states that it was published by Ahmed Subhī Furat in 1966. However, he does not provide any publication information regarding the work. Radtke and O'Kane, *The Concept of Sainthood*, 9; Karapınar, "Ḥakīm Tirmizī ve Ona Ait Bir Mecmū'a", 239. Arabic Language Expert Ahmed Subhī Furat has identified this work as part of a compilation registered under number 770 among Veliyeddin Efendi's books in the Bayezid General Library. According to the information provided by Furat, although this compilation bears the title *Kitab al-Şifā' wa-al 'İlal*, it contains various Şūfī treatises. Furat believes that this 200-folio compilation was written in the ninth century of the Hijri calendar. Ahmed Subhi Furat, "al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī wa al-Radd 'alā al-Rāfiḍa Adlı Risalesi", *Şarkiyat Mecmuası* 6 (1966), 35.

³⁰ Radtke and O'Kane, *The Concept of Sainthood*, 6.

³¹ Radtke and O'Kane, *The Concept of Sainthood*, 5, 6.

Ṣūfism relationship can be deduced from the 157 unanswered questions in al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī's work titled *Khatm al-awliyā'*,³² especially the one concerning the Seal of the Saints. Al-Shaybī's original statement is as follows:

وقد وضع الترمذي 155 سؤالاً يشتم منها وصل التشيع بالتصوف ومنها ما يتعلق بختم الأولياء

"al-Tirmidhī posed 155 questions, some of which suggest a connection between Shī'ism and Ṣūfism and some of which relate to the Seal of the Saints."³³

al-Ḥakīm's particular question concerning the Seal of Saints within the abovementioned questions reads:

من الذي يستحق خاتم الأولياء، كما استحق محمد، صلى الله عليه وسلم، خاتم النبوة؟

"Who deserves to be the Seal of the Saints, just as the Prophet Muhammad (peace be upon him) deserved to be the Seal of Prophethood?"³⁴

Thus, al-Shaybī, drawing attention to the fact that the concept of Mahdism in Shī'ism underlies the idea of *walāyah*, states that the Ṣūfīs adapted this concept inherited from Shī'ism in a way that suits their doctrines, preserving its essence. It seems difficult to reach the conclusion al-Shaybī draws from the question al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī posed. Nevertheless, it can be said that such an interpretation could be derived from the detailed answers Muḥyī al-Dīn Ibn al-ʿArabī (d. 638/1240) provides to this question in his *al-Futūḥāt*.³⁵

Ibn al-ʿArabī states here that Jesus is the Seal of Saints in an absolute sense. According to him, Jesus is a saint with absolute prophethood for this nation and will descend, in the end times, as the heir and final seal. Just as there is no prophethood after Prophet Muhammad, there will be no saint after Jesus. Jesus will descend as a saint possessing absolute prophethood... There will be two resurrections of Jesus on the Day of Judgment; one with us and the other with the prophets.³⁶

Ibn Arabī then addresses the topic of *Muḥammadī Sainthood*, which should be the point al-Shaybī references. For here, Ibn al-ʿArabī refers to the *Mahdī* as the seal of *Muḥammadī Sainthood*. He states that this finality belongs to a man from the Arabs, describing him as being of the noblest Arabs in terms of lineage and power. Not only does Ibn al-ʿArabī say that he appeared in his time, but also claims to have seen him. The author of *al-Futūḥāt* says:

"I met him in the year 595 and saw in him the sign that God concealed from His servants. God allowed me to discover this sign in Fez (Morocco), even to the point of seeing the Seal of Sainthood in him..."³⁷

While connecting the concept of sainthood of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, who is said to be one of the prominent early Ṣūfīs, with the idea of Imāmate in Shī'ism, al-Shaybī approaches with skepticism Ibn Khaldūn's view that early Ṣūfīs were not interested in concepts like the Mahdī, focusing instead on

³² *Khatm al-awliyā'*, the first work to systematically and comprehensively address the issue of prophethood and sainthood, consists of twenty-nine chapters. In the fourth chapter, the author poses 157 questions of a mystical nature, leaving them unanswered to demonstrate that not everyone can speak about these profound and crucial matters, and even if they do, their words may not be accurate. Later, Ibn ʿArabī wrote *al-Jawāb al-mustaḥqīm ʿammā saʿala ʿanhu al-Tirmidhī al-Ḥakīm* to answer these questions, and he also addressed them in more detail in *al-Futūḥāt al-Makkiyya* (Abdūlfettāh Abdullah Bereke, "Ḥakīm et-Tirmizī", *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslām Ansiklopedisi*, [İstanbul: TDV Yayınları, 1997], 15/198.)

³³ al-Shaybī, *al-Ṣila*, 1/125.

³⁴ al-Ḥakīm, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 161.

³⁵ al-Shaybī, *al-Ṣila*, 1/124-125; *Sufism and Shi'ism*, 76.

³⁶ Muḥammad b. ʿAlī Muḥyī al-Dīn al-Ṭāʾī Ibn al-ʿArabī, *al-Futūḥāt al-Makkiyya*, ed. ʿUthmān Yaḥyā (Cairo: al-Maktabatu'l-Arabiyya, 1408/1988), 12/119-120.

³⁷ Ibn al-ʿArabī, *al-Futūḥāt al-Makkiyya*, 12/121; Interestingly, the Sheikh's contemporary and fellow townsman, the great exegete al-Qurṭubī (d. 671/1273), also believed that the Mahdī would appear in the Maghrib al-Aqṣā (Morocco), basing this belief on a tradition. In this tradition, which he narrates in his *al-Tadhkira*, the Prophet is reported to have said: "After me, a peninsula called Andalusia will be conquered. Then the people of unbelief will dominate it, seizing the people's property and land, enslaving their women and children...After the turmoil increases, someone from Fāṭima's lineage will emerge from the Maghrib al-Aqṣā, who is al-Mahdī al-Qā'im, who will appear in the end times; this is the first sign of the Day of Judgment." In a note at the end of the tradition, al-Qurṭubī states, "All of these have happened in our lands, except for the appearance of al-Mahdī, and we have witnessed many of them ourselves." Abū Abdullah Muḥammad b. Ahmad al-Qurṭubī, *al-Tadhkira bi-aḥwāl al-mevtā wa umūr al-ākhirā* (Riyadh: Maktabat Dār al-Minhāj, 1425), 1207-1208.

practices like spiritual struggle,³⁸ He cited declarations made by some early Şūfīs, like Maṣṣūr al-Ḥallāj (d. 309/922), that they were the representatives and deputies of the twelfth Imam (Maḥdī) in occultation to support this.³⁹ Al-Shaybī emphasizes that figures like al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī and al-Ḥallāj lived during the Minor Occultation, a period when Shī'ite expectations of the Maḥdī were at their peak.⁴⁰ On the other hand, Ibn Khaldūn writes that later Şūfīs, along with textual evidence provided by hadith scholars, were influenced by the Twelver and Rāfiḍa sects regarding the definite emergence of the Maḥdī, evaluating him within the framework of the Maḥdī as the Seal of Saints. Therefore, in light of the answers al-Ḥakīm provides to the questions he left unanswered, it would be more accurate to say that Ibn al-‘Arabī, who belongs to the later Şūfīs as Ibn Khaldūn states and not al-Ḥakīm, an early Şūfī as claimed by al-Shaybī, was influenced by the Shī'ite doctrine. As al-Shaybī also states, Ibn al-‘Arabī, among the later Şūfīs, bases his writings about the Maḥdī largely on some of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī's questions related to sainthood and Mahdism.⁴¹

3.1. The Relationship between Imāmate and Walāya and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī

As mentioned above, there are many similarities between the concepts of Imāmate and Walāya (Sainthood). Indeed, one of the most important topics al-Shaybī addresses while discussing the relationship between Shī'ism and Sūfism is the issue of Imāmate and Sainthood. Although establishing such a similarity is possible in some respects, the meaning of "Imām" in Shī'ism and "saint" in Şūfism is not the same. While the Imām represents religious and political authority, in other words spiritual and worldly authority, in Shī'ism, the saint in Şūfism is an identity that expresses purely spiritual leadership. The similarities between al-Ḥakīm's discussions on sainthood during the time of the twelfth Imām's occultation in Twelver Shī'ism and Shī'ite discourse on Imāmate are, in our view, merely a rhetorical resemblance. In this context, it is possible to say that al-Ḥakīm may have adapted the Shī'ite discourse on Imāmate to his own school of thought, or system of sainthood. Because the starting points, or the main arguments upon which both doctrines are based, are largely similar.⁴²

As is known, one of the fundamental arguments of Shī'ite doctrine is the belief that the earth will never be without an *Imām* or a *Qā'im* who will fulfill God's proof. Otherwise, the signs pointing to His existence would be invalid.⁴³ The concept of Mahdism is a complementary element of this understanding. This idea is formulated with phrases like "لا تخلو الدنيا من قائم بالحجة" / The world is never be without one who upholds the proof" and similar expressions, a similar version of which we also see mentioned by al-Ḥakīm, albeit in a different context. Under the heading "People of Closeness" (Ahl al-Qurba) in *Khatm al-awliyā'*, he likens saints to freed slaves. According to him, the saint, too, has attained freedom by escaping enslavement to the carnal self (*nafs*). Al-Ḥakīm states that God will not deprive the earth of such servants, saying:

ولا تخلو الدنيا في هذه الأمة من قائم بالحجة

The world will never be without one who upholds the proof within this ummah.

al-Ḥakīm supports this statement with the following prayer attributed to ‘Alī:

اللهم، لا تزل الأرض من قائم بالحجة، كي لا تبطل حجج الله وبياناته

*O God! Do not leave the earth devoid of those who establish Your proof, lest Your clear evidence and manifest signs be invalidated.*⁴⁴

³⁸ Abū Zayd Walīyyuddīn Ibn Khaldūn, *al-Muqaddima*, ed. A. Muḥammad al-Darwish (Damascus: Dār al-Balkhī, 1425/2004), 1/534.

³⁹ al-Shaybī, *al-Şīla*, 1/125, 250, 496.

⁴⁰ al-Shaybī, *al-Şīla*, 1/250; *Sufism and Shi'ism*, 76.

⁴¹ al-Shaybī, *al-Şīla*, 1/125, 250, 496.

⁴² al-Shaybī, *al-Şīla*, 1/369 ff.; al-Shaybī, *Sufism and Shi'ism*, 73 ff.

⁴³ Abū 'Abdullah Muḥammad b. Ibrahim (Ibn Abi Zaynab an-Nu'mānī), *Kitāb al-Ghayba*, ed. Alī Akbar al-Ghifārī (Tehran: Mektebetu's-Saduq, 1970), 136 ff.

⁴⁴ al-Ḥakīm, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 360-361.

Again in his *Khatm al-awliyā'*, in the chapter titled "Dawlat al-khayr wa-dawlat al-sharr/ State of good and state of evil" and after stating that the *walī* and the *ṣiddīq*⁴⁵ are the proof of God over His creation (إن الولي والصدیق حجة الله على خلقه), al-Ḥakīm transmits a similar prayer from Kumayl ibn Ziyād al-Nakha'ī (d. 82/701), a successor (*tābi'*) known for his closeness to 'Alī:

اللهم لا تخل الأرض من قائم بالحجة. أولئك الأقلون عدداً، الأعظمون عند الله قدراً، قلوبهم معلقة بالمحل الأعلى، أولئك خلفاء الله في عباده وبلاده.

*O God, do not deprive the earth of one who establishes the proof! These establishers are few in number, but their value in God's eyes is great. Their hearts are connected to a sublime place. They are the successors of God amongst His servants and in His lands...*⁴⁶

While the *qā'im* mentioned in al-Ḥakīm's statements and narrations is a *walī*, in Shī'a texts this *qā'im* appears as an *Imām*. Indeed, Muḥammad ibn Ya'qūb al-Kulaynī (d. 329/941), the author of one of Shī'a's most fundamental hadith sources, narrates numerous traditions, mostly from Ja'far al-Ṣādiq, under the chapter heading (أَنَّ الْأَرْضَ لَا تَخْلُو مِنْ حُجَّةٍ) / The world is never be without one who upholds the proof), stating that the earth will never be devoid of a just *Imām* who will invite people to the path of God and teach them what is lawful and unlawful. One of these is the following saying attributed to 'Alī:

اللهم إنك لا تخلي أرضك من حجة لك على خلقك

*O God, You do not deprive Your earth of one who will be a proof to Your servants!*⁴⁷

A similar prayer to the aforementioned prayer of 'Alī recorded by al-Ḥakīm is transmitted by another prominent Shī'a author, al-Shaykh al-Ṣadūq (d. 381/991). In his work, *Ilal al-Sharā'i'*, under the chapter heading concerning 'the reason why the earth is never without an *Imām*', he transmits a narration from his father in which 'Alī is reported to have prayed as follows:

اللهم لا تخل الأرض من حجة لك على خلقك ظاهر أو خاف مغفور لئلا تبطل حججك وبيئاتك

*O God, do not leave the earth without one who will be a proof for Your creation, whether manifest or concealed, so that Your clear signs and proofs may not be invalidated.*⁴⁸

After the death of the Final Prophet (Khātām al-Anbiyā') The Prophet Muhammad (pbuh), the question of who or what kind of individuals would lead the Islamic ummah in religious matters became one of the prominent topics of discussion in the history of Islamic thought. *Imāmate* and/or guardianship are among the fundamental concepts arising from these discussions. Each religious/political thought or sect developed different theories on the subject. Although there are significant differences in the details, there is one common point adopted by all schools of thought, which is the shared idea and belief that there must always be a person or group on earth to uphold and maintain the religion of God. This idea has also found its place in hadith narrations in various forms. The first that comes to mind here is the *tā'ifa* (a distinct group) narration. According to this narration, which is found in reliable hadith sources, the Prophet (pbuh) stated that there will always be a group (*tā'ifa*) within the Islamic ummah who will support the truth, struggle for the sake of truth, and help the religion of God.⁴⁹ The great hadith scholar al-Bukhārī, while using this narration as a chapter heading (*tarjama*), also stated that those who support the truth mentioned in the narration are *scholars*. According to Yazīd ibn Hārūn, these are none other than the People of Hadith (Ahl al-hadith)⁵⁰. In some narrations, which are more favored by Ṣūfīs, those who will inherit the legacy of prophethood appear as the Substitutes (*Abdāl*). Through these individuals, who consist of forty (or thirty in some narrations), God will establish His religion. When one dies, another will

⁴⁵ al-Ḥakīm's use of the terms "sainthood" and "truthfulness," or "saint" and "truthful one," side by side is significant. It appears that he intends to emphasize the superiority of Abū Bakr, titled "the truthful one," in contrast to the Shī'a's emphasis on 'Alī, titled "the saint." al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 430.

⁴⁶ al-Ḥakīm, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 430.

⁴⁷ Abū Ja'far Muḥammad b. Ya'qūb al-Kulaynī, *al-Uṣūl min al-Kāfī*, ed. 'Alī Akbar al-Ghifārī (Tehran: Dār al-Kutub al-'Islāmiyya, 1362/1984), 1/178-179.

⁴⁸ Abū Ja'far Muḥammad b. 'Alī al-Qummī Shaykh Ṣadūq, *Ilal al-Sharā'i'* (Beirut: Dār al-Murtaḍā, 1427), 193.

⁴⁹ Muḥammad b. Ismā'il al-Bukhārī, *al-Jāmi' al-Musnad al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Mukhtaṣar min Umūr Rasūlillāh wa Sunanihi wa Ayyāmihi*, Mawsū'at al-Ḥadīth al-Sharīf -al-Kutub al-Sitta- Combined Edition (Riyadh: Dār al-Salām, 1421), "al-l'tiṣām bi'l-Kitāb wa al-Sunna", 10.

⁵⁰ Abū Muḥammad al-Ḥasan b. 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Rāmahurmuzī, *al-Muḥaddith al-fāṣil bayna al-rāwī wa-al-wā'i*, ed. Muḥammad 'Ajāj al-Khaṭīb (Beirut: n.p., 1404/1983), 153.

take their place.⁵¹ Al-Ḥakīm Tirmidhī states that these individuals, whose numbers will be few in every era, are the truthful guardians, the successors of God on earth after the cessation of prophethood, and their number will not be many.⁵² He uses similar expressions in his work *Khatm al-awliyā'* under the heading "Prophethood and Sainthood", while also stating that the forty saints who will come after the Prophet (pbuh) are from the People of the House (as will be touched upon below when discussing the concept of the People of the House). Due to its importance, we deem it beneficial to record al-Ḥakīm's writings on the subject in their original form:

ثم لما قبض الله، عز وجل، نبيه صلى الله عليه وسلم، صير في أمته أربعين صديقاً. بهم تقوم الأرض؛ وهم آل بيته. فكل ما مات واحد منهم، خلفه من يقوم مقامه. حتى إذا انقضى عددهم، وأتى وقت زوال الدنيا - ابتعث الله ولياً، اصطفاه واجتباها، وقربه وأدناه. وأعطاه ما أعطى الأولياء، وخصه بخاتم الولاية. فيكون حجة الله يوم القيامة، على سائر الأولياء...

After the Almighty and Majestic God took the soul of His Prophet (pbuh), He designates forty individuals from his nation as Ṣiddīqeen. The world stands firm thanks to them. These Ṣiddīqeen are his Ahl al-bayt. When one of them passes away, another takes their place. Even when their number diminishes and the time of the apocalypse arrives, God will send a chosen Walī, drawing them near. He will bestow upon this Walī the same gifts granted to the previous saints, along with the rank of the Seal of Sainthood. On the Day of Resurrection, this Walī will serve as God's proof against all other saints.⁵³

As evident, al-Ḥakīm asserts that God will continue His influence over humanity through specially chosen *walīs-ṣiddīqīn*, similar to the prophets, in the post-prophetic era, or during the time without prophethood. By stating that these *ṣiddīqīn* are members of the *Ahl al-bayt*, al-Ḥakīm imbues this concept with unique significance. But who exactly does al-Ḥakīm envision as being included within the *Ahl al-bayt*? Does this refer to the descendants of Prophet Muhammad (pbuh)? Al-Ḥakīm explicitly presents his perspective on this issue, which is one of the most profound topics of debate in Islamic intellectual history, within his *al-Nawādir*. In this context, al-Ḥakīm's approach and arguments regarding concepts like *Ahl al-bayt* and *Ṣaḥāba* – subjects of contention between Shī'a and *Ahl al-hadith* and/or *Ahl al-sunnah* since early times – are of great significance. Therefore, we believe that al-Ḥakīm's explanations within the context of *thaqalayn* and *nujūm* narrations, which will be detailed below, will contribute meaningfully to the discussions surrounding this topic.

3.2. al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī's Concept of Ahl al-bayt

Al-Ḥakīm dedicates the fiftieth chapter of his work, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, to the widely circulated hadith known as the *thaqalayn* narration. Presenting the narration through the chains of Jābir ibn 'Abdullāh and Ḥudhayfa ibn al-Yamān, al-Ḥakīm provides a concise yet crucial commentary on Ahl al-bayt. Before delving into this commentary, we would like to present the narrations recorded with the author's own chain of transmission. The first narration, transmitted via Jābir, states that the Messenger of God (pbuh), while addressing his companions atop his camel, Qaṣwā', on the Day of 'Arafāt during the Ḥajj season, proclaimed:

أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ قَدْ تَرَكْتُ فِيكُمْ مَا إِنْ أَخَذْتُمْ بِهِ لَمْ تَضِلُّوا كِتَابَ اللَّهِ وَعَتَرَتِي أَهْلَ بَيْتِي

*O people, I leave behind two (matters) among you. As long as you cling firmly to them, you will never stray. These are the Book of God and my descendants, my Ahl al-bayt.*⁵⁴

In another narration, transmitted through Ḥudhayfa ibn al-Yamān, differing from Jābir's version, it appears that the Prophet delivered this address upon returning from the Farewell Pilgrimage. Besides other details, the Prophet (pbuh) states that the "greater weight," referring to the Book of God, and the smaller weight, the *Ahl al-bayt*, will never separate until the ummah reaches the *Ḥawḍ* (Basin) on the Day

⁵¹ Abū'l-Qāsim Sulaymān b. Aḥmad b. Ayyūb al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-awsaṭ*, ed. Ṭāriq b. 'Iwāḍ Allāh, 'Abd al-Muḥsin b. Ibrāhīm al-Ḥusaynī (Cairo: Dār al-Ḥaramayn, n.d.), 4/247; al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 1/263-264; 5/130.

⁵² al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 2/98, 352; 3/314; 5/130.

⁵³ al-Ḥakīm, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 344.

⁵⁴ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 1/258 (N. 294); For the same chain of transmission, see Abū 'Īsā Muḥammad b. 'Īsā al-Tirmidhī, *al-Sunan -Mawsū'at al-Ḥadīth al-Sharīf al-Kutub al-Sitta*-Combined Edition (Riyadh: Dār al-Salām, 1421), "Manāqib", 31, (N. 3786).

of judgement. He advises his followers to heed them carefully.⁵⁵ Certainly, not all chains of transmission of the *Ḥadīth al-thaqalayn* contain the mention of "Ahl al-bayt." A significant portion includes only the Book of God,⁵⁶ while others mention the Book of God alongside the "Sunnah of the Prophet."⁵⁷ The common expression across all transmissions is "*al-thaqalayn*" (the two weighty things).⁵⁸ Discussing all aspects of the *thaqalayn* narration falls beyond the scope of this paper.⁵⁹ Nevertheless, al-Ḥakīm's commentary on this narration, where he concisely remarks on the *Ahl al-bayt*, is noteworthy. Al-Ḥakīm asserts that the *Ahl al-bayt* are God's chosen servants, referencing verse 33 of the Sūrah al-Aḥzāb (O family of the Prophet! God only wishes to remove all impurity from you and purify you completely). He emphasizes that while they possess purity, they are not infallible, as infallibility is exclusively attributed to the prophets.⁶⁰

Al-Ḥakīm, who does not touch upon matters such as the identity of the *Ahl al-bayt* and whom they comprise within the context of the *al-thaqalayn* narrative, provides detailed explanations regarding this topic, which is one of the deepest polemical subjects between Shīʿa and Sunnīs, in the later sections of his work, specifically in the 224th principle. Here, he narrates a tradition that likens the 'Ahl al-bayt' to stars, similar to the expression in the well-known tradition among the Sunnīs which likens the 'Companions' to stars (*nujūm* tradition). According to this *marfūʿ* tradition that al-Ḥakīm narrated from his father through Salama b. al-Akwaʿ, the Prophet (pbuh) said:

النُّجُومُ أَمَانٌ لِأَهْلِ السَّمَاءِ وَأَهْلُ بَيْتِي أَمَانٌ لِأُمَّتِي

*Stars are a security for the people of the sky; and my Ahl al-bayt (likewise) are a security (a guarantee) for my ummah.*⁶¹

We will address al-Ḥakīm's interpretations regarding the stars below while explaining his understanding of the Companions. However, his interpretation of the identity of *Ahl al-bayt* mentioned in the tradition is noteworthy. According to al-Ḥakīm, who also connects the aforementioned hadith with the verse "It is He who created the stars for you to guide yourselves by them in the darkness of the land and sea" (al-Anʿām, 5/97), the *Ahl al-bayt*, who are like the stars, are those who came after the Prophet and followed his path, and they are the truthful ones (*ṣiddīqīn*). These are specially chosen individuals. Indeed, according to another tradition, when prophethood ceased, the earth grieved over this situation and complained to God. Thereupon, God Almighty addressed the earth, saying, "I will create forty truthful ones on your back. When one dies, another will take their place."⁶² Adding that they are also called *Abdāl*, al-Ḥakīm states that they are the pegs of the earth (*awtād*), the earth is established with them, the people of the earth are provided sustenance thanks to them, and rain falls for their sake.⁶³ Al-Ḥakīm, stating that the *Ahl al-bayt* are spiritually, not genealogically, related to the Messenger of God, and their hearts are

⁵⁵ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 1/665 (N. 295)

⁵⁶ Abū al-Ḥusayn Muslim b. Ḥajjāj al-Qushayrī, *al-Musnad al-Ṣaḥīḥ al-Mukhtaṣar min al-Sunan bi-Naql al-ʿAdl ʿan al-ʿAdl, Mawsūʿat al-Ḥadīth al-Sharīf al-Kutub al-Sitta*- Combined Edition (Riyadh: Dār al-Salām, 1421), "Kitāb al-Hajj", 147.

⁵⁷ Mālik b. Anas, *al-Muwattaʿa*, ed. M. Fuʾād ʿAbd al-Bāqī (Cairo: Dār Iḥyāʾ al-Turāth al-ʿArabī, n.d.), "Kitāb al-Qadar", 1.

⁵⁸ In an article evaluating all chains of transmission and texts of the narration, it is stated that the hadith is *mutawātir* in meaning, based on the fact that the phrase "*Thaqalayn*" is the common theme of all narrations. Adem Dölek, "Sakaleyn Hadisi ve Değerlendirilmesi", *Marife* 4/3 (2004), 167

⁵⁹ Bünyamin Erul, who evaluates the *Thaqalayn* narrations in terms of chain of transmission and text, indicates that there is a high possibility that the expressions "Ahl al-Bayt" and/or "the Sunnah of the Prophet" mentioned alongside the Book of Allah are likely to be later interpolations. Erul bases this view both on the statement "I have left you something, as long as you hold onto it, you will not go astray," implying that the thing left behind should be singular, and on the fact that the narrations stating that 'the Messenger of Allah left two things' have flawed chains of transmission. Erul, *Sahabenin Sünnet Anlayışı*, 29. As the author also states, this evaluation undoubtedly does not contradict the fact that (historically) the Prophet, besides the Quran, also left his Sunnah as a guide for his ummah. Bünyamin Erul, "Sahâbenin Sünnet Anlayışı", *İslam Geleneğinde ve Modern Dönemde Hadis ve Sünnet* (Istanbul: KURAMER, 2020), 29, 32.

⁶⁰ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 1/666.

⁶¹ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/535 (N. 1126); Sulaymān b. Aḥmad al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Muʿjam al-kabīr*, ed. Ḥamdī ʿAbd al-Majīd al-Salafī (Cairo: Maktabat Ibn Taymiyya, 1415), 7/22 (N. 6260); Abū ʿAbd Allāh Muḥammad al-Naysābūrī al-Ḥakīm, *al-Mustadrak ʿalā al-Ṣaḥīḥayn* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, 1990), 2/486 (N. 3676). al-Ḥakīm states that the chain of transmission of the narration is sound, while al-Dhahabī, in his note, expresses his suspicion that it is fabricated.

⁶² al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/539; Hakim transmits a similar hadith a bit further on, through Abū al-Dardāʿ. al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/540, (N. 1130).

⁶³ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/539.

connected to God through remembrance. He, in support of his view refers to another tradition: "When my Ahl al-bayt are gone, what has been ordained will befall my ummah." He finds it meaningless that the Prophet's (pbuh) *Ahl al-bayt* should disappear, as the hadith implies, while there are countless descendants and progeny of the Prophet (pbuh) on earth in terms of lineage. Therefore, the Ahl al-bayt referred to here are those forty individuals who are the "people of pure remembrance" (hum ahl al-dhikr al-ṣāfi). When the Day of Judgment approaches, with their disappearance, the light will depart from the people of the earth, and what has been ordained will befall them; just like the disappearance of the people of the sky with the extinguishing of the stars.⁶⁴

Al-Ḥakīm's view that the members of the *Ahl al-bayt* who will be the guarantee and support of the ummah after the prophethood are the forty *Abdāl*, which is based on some baseless or, according to the criteria of hadith methodology, very weak narrations, can certainly be criticized and discussed. While expressing our cautious approach to his supporting evidence, we believe that his approach to the concept of *Ahl al-bayt* and the arguments he uses other than the transmitted evidence⁶⁵ regarding whom it encompasses are noteworthy. According to al-Ḥakīm, the *Ahl al-bayt* in its true sense does not refer to a lineage. That is, when attributed to the Messenger of God and his family, "*bayt*" is essentially the place where God is remembered. God chose the Prophet Muhammad to establish His remembrance on earth. Since the house (bayt) of the Messenger of God is, in this sense, the place of this remembrance, everyone who takes refuge in him and receives their share from this remembrance is considered among the Ahl al-bayt. The heart of the Messenger of God is always with God. This house is more valuable than his "earthly house" where his lineage spreads. This is also the meaning of him becoming the Messenger of God, the Prophet of God, after formerly being Muḥammad ibn 'Abdullāh. Of course, he had a family in terms of lineage. However, with his becoming a prophet, the house of miracles and prophethood prevailed over the house of lineage. Thus, the way of everyone whose heart turns to God became the way of this prophetic house.⁶⁶

At this point, al-Ḥakīm also responded to those who reduce the concept of *Ahl al-bayt* to lineage. Demonstrating an historical and logical approach to the matter, he emphasizes the inconsistency of a concept of *Ahl al-bayt* based on lineage superiority by saying, "When did the Hāshimites, the 'Abdul Muṭṭalib, the Umayyads, the 'Abd Manāf become the guarantee of this ummah, and did the world fall into ruin with their disappearance?!" Similarly, he continues, among the Prophet's descendants, there have been both righteous individuals and those who caused corruption. So, by what means, by what quality, have they become the guarantee of the earth? If the answer to this is "due to the respect for the Prophet," they would be responded to as follows:

Certainly, the prestige of the Messenger of God is high. However, there is something on earth more respected than the Prophet's descendants, and that is the Book of God. Yet, we do not see the Book of God in the aforementioned hadith. In this case, true respect belongs to the people of piety. The high prestige of the Messenger of God is due to the prophethood that God bestowed upon him! (not due to his lineage.)⁶⁷

Al-Ḥakīm refers to an unidentified group of people captivated by the love of the *Ahl al-bayt*, who, having lost their capacity for rational thought, claim the superiority of 'Alī over the first two caliphs and do not hesitate to fabricate hadiths about his virtues. Emphasizing that 'Alī possesses superior qualities that render such fabricated hadiths unnecessary, al-Ḥakīm offers significant insights regarding the 33rd verse of the Sūrah al-Aḥzāb, which is among the strongest arguments for the Shī'a. According to him, as

⁶⁴ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/549.

⁶⁵ Apparently deeming the rational and logical arguments against those who limit the *Ahl al-bayt* by lineage insufficient, al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī transmits narratives of the "*mathālib*" type against the descendants of 'Alī and Tālib, although these are not found in all extant copies of *al-Nawādir*. al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/555-556. The editor Nūr al-Dīn Boyacılar, in his note on these narratives, states that they are baseless and are absent in some copies of *Nawādir*, suggesting they may have been added later. (*Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/556, footnote 1).

⁶⁶ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/547-548.

⁶⁷ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/550.

understood from the context of the verse "O family of the Prophet! Allah only intends to remove impurities from you and purify you completely," the Ahl al-bayt referred to here are the wives of the Prophet. Asserting that the verses from the 28th onwards pertain to the Prophet's wives as a whole, al-Ḥakīm considers it illogical to disrupt this context and suddenly shift the address to 'Alī, Fāṭima, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn, rejecting such interpretations. While accepting the narration of the Cloak (Kisā'),⁶⁸ he states that the event described in this narration is unrelated to the occasion for the revelation of the 33rd verse of Sūrah al-Aḥzāb, and that it occurred after the revelation of the verse. As stated in the mentioned narration, he says that the Messenger of Allah prayed to God for 'Alī, Fāṭima, al-Ḥasan, and al-Ḥusayn to be included among the "purified" mentioned in the verse, refuting the claim that the verse was specifically revealed on them.⁶⁹

As previously mentioned in the context of the relationship between *Imāmate* and *Walāya* (guardianship), while there are similarities in discourse between al-Ḥakīm and his contemporaries like al-Kulaynī and al-Šadūq regarding the inheritance of the prophetic legacy, the concept of *Ahl al-bayt* in al-Ḥakīm's mind bears no relation to the Ši'a doctrine's understanding of *Ahl al-bayt*. Indeed, while he accepts in the context of the Hadith of the Two Weighty Things (*thaqalayn*) in the 50th chapter that the *Ahl al-bayt*, along with the Book of Allah, are the two sources to be followed, he essentially indicates in the following chapter, by including narrations about the *Abdāl*, who is truly meant by *Ahl al-bayt* in the Hadith of the Two Weighty Things.

Holding a significant place in the pyramid constructed by Šūfis in their spiritual world, the *Abdāl* emerge as a rank emphasized by al-Ḥakīm. He devotes the 224th chapter of *al-Nawādir* to narrations about the *Abdāl*, attempting to introduce them in terms of their quantity and qualities. Al-Ḥakīm cites five narrations in this chapter, one of which is *mursal* from al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī. According to the narration attributed to 'Uḇāda ibn al-Šāmit, the number of *Abdāl* is 30; in the following narration from Anas, their number is stated to be 40, with 22 in al-Shām and 12 in Iraq. In the narration from Abū al-Dardā', the *Abdāl* are described as truthful, and their superior qualities are detailed. Some of them will emerge in al-Shām⁷⁰ and some in Iraq. In the narration from Ḥudhayfa ibn al-Yamān, transmitted by al-Ḥakīm through his father, it is stated that the *Abdāl*, numbering 40, will emerge in al-Shām and follow the path of Prophet Abraham.⁷¹

Alongside the *Ahl al-bayt*, the concept of *Šaḥāba* (Companions) is undoubtedly another point of contention between the Ši'a and the Ahl al-Sunnah. Al-Ḥakīm's avoidance of a generalizing approach toward the *Šaḥāba* is noteworthy here. More importantly, the answer to the question of where he stands in the Ši'a-Šūfism interaction can easily be found in his views on the *Šaḥāba*. As touched upon above, his explanations regarding the Ahl al-bayt clearly reveal his approach on this matter. However, the topic of *Šaḥāba* is also important due to its central place in hadith studies and contemporary discussions. Now, al-

⁶⁸ Narrated from Umm Salama (may Allah be pleased with her), the Prophet (peace and blessings be upon him) covered 'Alī, Fāṭima, Ḥasan, and Ḥusayn with a cloth and said: "O Allah, these are my Ahl al-Bayt and my close relatives. Remove impurities from them and purify them completely." Umm Salama asked, "O Messenger of Allah, am I with them?" The Messenger of Allah (peace and blessings be upon him) replied, "You are on the path of goodness." al-Tirmidhī, who notes the hadith as *ḥasan*, adds that Umm Salama's narration is the best hadith transmitted on this topic. al-Tirmidhī, *al-Sunan*, "al-Manāqib", 60, N. 3871.

⁶⁹ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/556-560.

⁷⁰ It is significant that the *Abdāl*, presented as an alternative group to the Imāms who represent sanctity and infallibility for the Ši'a, are said to emerge in al-Shām, a symbol of opposition to 'Alī. Moreover, it is peculiar that this idea is reflected in a narration attributed to 'Alī. According to a narration also transmitted by Ibn Hanbal, when the name of the people of al-Shām was mentioned in the presence of 'Alī in Iraq, those around him asked the Caliph to curse them. 'Alī responded: No, for I heard from the Messenger of Allah: "The *Abdāl* will emerge from al-Shām. They are forty people. When one dies, Allah chooses another in his place. Rain falls through their intercession, victory is achieved against enemies through them. Through them, the people of al-Shām are saved from punishment. Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal, *al-Musnad*, 2/231, N. 896; In the 'Abd al-Raḥmān 'Umayra edition of *al-Nawādir*, the Ibn Hanbal hadith is attributed to the Messenger of Allah through 'Alī in the same source. al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, *Nawādir al-uṣūl fī aḥādīth al-Rasūl*, ed. 'Abd al-Raḥmān 'Umayra (Beirut: Dār al-Jīl, 1412/1992), 3/63; In the N. Boyacilar edition used in this study, it is narrated impersonally (as reported in a narration) that "the earth complained to Allah about being left without a prophet after the cessation of prophethood" (see footnote 48). al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/539. This reminds us once again that the issues of "copying manuscripts/istinsakh" and "copyists/mustansikhs" regarding the publication of our classical sources pose greater problems than we anticipated.

⁷¹ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 1/669-677 (N. 297-301); See also al-Ṭabarānī, *al-Mu'jam al-awsaṭ*, 4/247.

Ḥakīm's approaches and observations on this subject will be presented, followed by a general concluding assessment.

3.3. al-Ḥakīm's Concept of the Ṣaḥāba: Stellar Companions and Others

As is known, the concept of the Ṣaḥāba is a crucial criterion in gauging an individual's sympathy towards Shī'a ideology. In this respect, when we examine the expressions al-Ḥakīm uses on various occasions, particularly regarding Abū Bakr and 'Umar, whose criticism is considered a fundamental principle by the Shī'a, we can observe that he exhibits an approach quite distant from Shī'a doctrine. Towards the end of *Khatm al-awliyā'*, he explicitly states that Abū Bakr al-Ṣiddīq is superior to all other companions.⁷² Elsewhere, after narrating the hadith of the ten promised with paradise with his own chain of transmission (*isnād*), he mentions these companions with their epithets (such as al-Fārūq for 'Umar, al-Ḥawārī for Zubayr), refers to 'Alī as the *waṣī*, and states that each of them is a *walī* (saint) and *ṣiddīq* (truthful) and will enter paradise.⁷³ While al-Ḥakīm's use of the epithet "waṣī" for 'Alī might evoke Shī'a discourse, his complimentary remarks about other companions, especially Abū Bakr, indicate that he does not use this term in the way the Shī'a understand it.⁷⁴ Similarly, in the 164th chapter of *al-Nawādir*, where he discusses the qualities of saints (*awliyā'*), the reality of sainthood (*walāya*), and the dangers of belittling saints, his characterization of the first four caliphs as "Ahlullāh" (People of God), in line with the approach adopted by the Ahl al-sunnah, is another example that illustrates his perspective on this matter.⁷⁵

As mentioned above, in the 224th chapter (al-aṣl), al-Ḥakīm, based on a recorded tradition, established a parallel between the People of the House and the stars, and in another tradition within the same chapter he also drew a similar parallel with the companions. According to this tradition, the Prophet (pbuh) is reported to have said:

مِثْلَ أَصْحَابِي مِثْلَ النُّجُومِ بِأَيِّهِمْ أَتَدْتَبِعُونَ

*My companions are like stars; whomever you follow, you will find the right way.*⁷⁶

Al-Ḥakīm, referencing this narration without an *isnād* and with significant issues according to hadith methodology criteria,⁷⁷ makes significant evaluations regarding the concept of companionship. Although the narration states "whichever one you follow, you will find the right path," al-Ḥakīm does not consider all companions equal. According to him, some companions are like "stars" while others are like ordinary celestial bodies. Al-Ḥakīm likens the companions who are likened to stars (*nujūm*) to the position of Jupiter, Saturn, Venus, Mars, and Mercury among all the planets, and he likens the other companions to the celestial bodies (*kawākib*) outside these major planets. Unlike the guiding nature of stars, these other celestial bodies only illuminate themselves and do not have the characteristic of guiding others. According to al-Ḥakīm, those likened to stars, as stated in the hadith, are the leading and guiding major companions.

⁷² al-Ḥakīm, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 445

⁷³ al-Ḥakīm, *Khatm al-awliyā'*, 376-377.

⁷⁴ As a matter of fact, in his work written as a refutation to the Rāfiḍīs, al-Ḥakīm poses several questions to counter the claim of one of the Rāfiḍī sects that "The Prophet bequeathed the caliphate to 'Alī and made it obligatory for the ummah, just as he made prayer and zakat obligatory." He then asks new questions in response to potential answers and attempts to refute their claims by reinforcing his views with verses from the Quran and hadiths. al-Ḥakīm, *al-Radd 'alā al-Rāfiḍa*, 38.

⁷⁵ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/96 ff.

⁷⁶ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/538.

⁷⁷ As expressed in the note that Boyacılar mentions, this narration does not have an authentic chain of transmission according to hadith scholars. (al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, 3/537, footnote 3) However, there are sound narrations with similar meanings in our sources. A narration similar to the one reported by al-Ḥakīm about Ahl al-Bayt from Salama ibn al-Akwā' (al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uṣūl*, footnote 47) is transmitted by Muslim through Abū Mūsā al-Ash'arī. According to this, the Prophet (peace be upon him) said: "The stars are a source of security for the sky. When the stars disappear, the sky will be afflicted with what it has been promised. I am a source of security for my companions. When I go, my companions will be afflicted with what they have been promised. My companions are a source of security for my umma. When my companions go, my people (umma) will be afflicted with what it has been promised." (Muslim, *al-Ṣaḥīḥ*, "Faḍa'il al-Ṣaḥāba", 207) On the other hand, this form of the narration also appears in the context of the value of scholars. In a weak narration from Anas ibn Ma'lik in Ibn Hanbal's *al-Musnad*, scholars take the place of the companions (and Ahl al-Bayt as mentioned in the above narration). According to this, the scholars on earth are like the stars in the sky. People find their way in darkness on sea and land through the stars. When the stars fade (i.e., when scholars disappear), there will be no one left to guide people. Ebū Abdillāh Ahmed b. Muhammed Ahmed b. Hanbel, *el-Musned*, nṣr. Ṣu'ayb el-Arna'ūt, Muṣṣid 'Adil (Beyrut: Mu'essesetu'r-Risāle, 1421-2001), 20/52, N.12600.

In his view, these "star companions" are great figures of knowledge and jurisprudence, some of whom became caliphs and amirs (governors) after the death of the Prophet (pbuh), such as Abū Bakr, 'Umar, 'Uthmān, 'Alī, Ṭalḥa, Zubayr, 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn 'Awf, Sa'd (ibn Abī Waqqāṣ), Abū 'Ubayda, Mu'adh, Ibn Mas'ūd, and Abū al-Dardā'. According to al-Ḥakīm, who distinguishes between these major companions and those who only saw or met the Messenger once, the number of "star companions" is greater.⁷⁸

Al-Ḥakīm's distinction between a star (*najm*) and an ordinary celestial body (*kawkab*) is a significant metaphor that embodies his concept of Companionship. Based on this distinction, al-Ḥakīm's definition and evaluation of companionship, which differs from the generally accepted definition⁷⁹ among the "People of Hadith," is noteworthy. Due to its importance, it is appropriate to cite here his statements from *Nawādir al-uşūl*, where he presents his understanding of Companionship:

وَلَيْسَ الْمُرَادُ بِهِ مَنْ لَقِيَ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ أَوْ بَایَعَهُ أَوْ رَأَاهُ رُؤْيَا وَاحِدَةً وَإِنَّمَا أَرَادَ مَنْ لَازَمَهُ غَدَاةٌ وَعَشِيَّةٌ وَكَانَ يَتَلَقَّى الْوَحْيَ مِنْهُ طَرِيقًا وَيَأْخُذُ عَنْهُ الشَّرِيعَةَ الَّتِي جَعَلَتْ مِنْهَا لِلْأُمَّةِ وَيَنْظُرُ مِنْهُ إِلَى آدَابِ الْإِسْلَامِ وَشِمَائِلِهِ فَصَارُوا مِنْ بَعْدِهِ أَيْمَةً أَدْلَةً فِيهِمْ الْإِقْتِدَاءُ وَعَلَى سَبِيلِهِمُ الْإِحْتِدَاءُ فَكَانُوا يَمْسُونَ عَنْدهُ وَيَصْبِحُونَ عَنْدهُ وَلَازِمُوهُ فِي السَّفَرِ وَالْحَضَرِ وَتَفَقَّهُوا فِي دِينِ اللَّهِ وَعَرَفُوا النَّاسِيخَ وَالْمَنْسُوخَ وَالسُّنَنَ وَهُمْ الَّذِينَ أَتَى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِمْ وَأَمَرَ نَبِيَّهُ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ بِالصَّبْرِ مَعَهُمْ فَقَالَ {وَاصْبِرْ نَفْسُكَ مَعَ الَّذِينَ يَدْعُونَ رَبَّهُمْ بِالْغَدَاةِ وَالْعَشِيِّ}

What is meant is not someone who merely met the Messenger of Allah (pbuh), pledged allegiance to him, or saw him once. Rather, it refers to those who were with him morning and evening, received the revelation from him directly, learned from him the Sharī'a that became a path for the ummah, observed from him the manners and characteristics of Islam, and thus became guiding leaders after him. It is necessary to follow them and emulate their path. They would spend their evenings and mornings with him, accompany him in travel and residence, delve into the religion of Allah, and learn the abrogating and abrogated verses and the Sunnah. They are those whom Allah praised and commanded His Prophet (pbuh) to be patient with. As Allah (swt) says, 'And keep yourself patient [by being] with those who call upon their Lord in the morning and the evening, seeking His countenance (al-Kahf, 18/28).⁸⁰

We observe that al-Ḥakīm, while adhering to the Ahl al-hadith line regarding the Companions, does not adopt the prevalent generalizing approach but exhibits a more moderate approach unique to himself. We can say that al-Ḥakīm's comments on the companions evoke the distinction made by Ḥanafī methodologists (*uṣūliyyūn*) between jurist and non-jurist companions when evaluating the companions' sayings as evidence.⁸¹ Some Ḥanafī methodologists, when referring to companions, meant the jurist companions who had the competence to express opinions on religious matters and were renowned for their jurisprudence. However, it seems difficult to say that the methodological debate about whether their sayings constitute evidence was on al-Ḥakīm's agenda while making distinctions among the companions. He presents us, in his unique style, with a narrower definition beyond the generally accepted definition of a companion in hadith literature. Although he exhibits no critique of the companions, it is understood that al-Ḥakīm approached the part "بأيهم اقتديتم اهتديتم" (whichever of them you follow, you will be guided) in the aforementioned hadith with caution, arguing that they are not all of equal degree in terms of being followed.

Conclusion

This article discusses the veracity, in the context of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, one of the most prominent figures in Şūfī thought, of certain Shi'a scholars' claims that every Şūfī is a Shīʿī, as well as the assertions of Baghdad-based academic Kāmil Muṣṭafā al-Shaybī, who ardently supported the claims about a close connection between Shīʿism and Şūfism. Al-Shaybī, in substantiating his assertions, specifically refers to al-Ḥakīm in the context of the concept of *walāya*. It is true that there are significant similarities between

⁷⁸ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/537-539.

⁷⁹ According to this definition, narrated by Ibn al-Ṣalāh, the term "Ṣaḥāba" applies to anyone who transmitted even a single hadith or sentence from the Prophet. Those who propose this definition broadened the scope of "Ṣaḥāba" to encompass even those who saw the Messenger of God only once. Ibn al-Ṣalāh, 'Uthman ibn Abdurrahman, *Ma'rifat anwa' ulūm al-hadith*, Ed. by Nūr al-Dīn 'Itr. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1406, 293.

⁸⁰ al-Ḥakīm, *Nawādir al-uşūl*, 3/537.

⁸¹ Recep Çetintaş, "Hanefi Mezhebinde Sahābe Kavlinin Hüccet Değeri", *Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 2017/2, 16/32, s. 609.

certain aspects of Shī'ism and Šūfism in doctrines and practices. However, it is incorrect to generalize that every Šūfī will be Shī'ī or every Shī'ī should be a Šūfī. We have seen the fallacy of this generalization in the example of al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī. However, al-Ḥakīm's articulation, using similar expressions with those of the Shī'a doctrine, of one of their core arguments -that the earth cannot remain without a divinely appointed guide- is purely a stylistic similarity. Similar hadiths indicating that there will always be those who uphold God's religion on earth also exist in *Ahl al-hadith* or *Ahl al-Sunnah* sources. These are similar discourses that manifest in different ways in every era or different factions of the Islamic tradition. The concepts of *walāya* and Mahdism are also like this. It is necessary to distinguish between the Šūfī tradition and Shī'a thought at this point. In our opinion, the connection al-Shaybī establishes between al-Ḥakīm's concept of "the seal of *walāya*" and the Shī'a theory of Mahdism is a forced approach.

In al-Ḥakīm's commentary, *Nawādir al-uşūl fī ma'rifat aḥādīth al-Rasūl*, one of his most important works, his interpretations of some concepts that are subjects of polemics between Shī'a and Ahl al-sunnah, and his explanations regarding certain narrations are points that deserve further consideration in terms of hadith interpretation. His symbolic interpretations, especially when addressing the concepts of *Ahl al-bayt* and *Companions*, supported by linguistic arguments, demonstrate the strength of his argumentation. By observing that scholars from several branches find similarities between their fields and al-Ḥakīm's thoughts, we can conclude that al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī is a multifaceted figure who can attract the attention of hadith scholars, linguists, and exegetes, as well as Šūfis.

Declaration

- 1. Finance/Incentive:** The author declare that no financial/incentive was used in the study.
- 2. Conflict of Interest:** The author declare that there is no conflict of interest in the study.
- 3. Ethical Statement:** The author declare that research and publication ethics were followed in this article. In addition, Ethics Committee Approval is not required for this research.

Bibliography

- Aḥmad ibn Ḥanbal, Abū 'Abdullāh. *al-Musnad*. Ed. by Shu'ayb Arnā'ūt, 'Ādil Murshid. 45 vols. Beirut: Mu'assasat al-Risāla, 1421.
- Ahmed Subhi Furat, "al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī wa al-Radd 'alā al-Rāfiḍa Adlī Risalesi", *Şarkiyat Mecmuası* 6 (1966).
- al-Āmulī, Sayyid Bahā' al-Dīn Ḥaydar b. 'Alī. *Jāmi' al-asrār wa-manba' al-anwār*. Ed. by Henry Corbin, Uthmān Ismā'īl Yaḥyā. Beirut: Mu'assasat al-tārīkh al-'Arabī, 1426/2005.
- al-'Asqalānī, Abū al-Faḍl Shihāb al-Dīn Aḥmad Ibn Ḥajar. *Lisān al-Mizān*. Ed. by 'Abd al-Fattāḥ Abū Ghuddah. 10 vols. Beirut: Dār al-Bashā'ir al-Islāmiyya, 1423/2002.
- Bereke, Abdulfettah Abdullah. "Ḥakīm et-Tirmizī". *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, 15/196-199. Istanbul: TDV Publications, 1997.
- Bernd Radtke and John O'Kane. *The Concept of Sainthood in Early Islamic Mysticism*. Curzon Press., 1996.
- al-Bukhārī, Muḥammad b. Ismā'īl. *al-Jāmi' al-Musnad al-Şaḥīḥ al-Mukhtaşar min Umūr Rasūl Allāh wa-Sunanihi wa-Ayyāmihi*, Mawsū'at al-Ḥadīth al-Sharīf -al-Kutub al-Sittah- Combined Edition. Riyadh: Dār al-Salām, 1421.
- Çetintaş, Recep. "Hanefi Mezhebinde Sahābe Kavlinin Hücet Değeri". *Hitit Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 2017/2, c. 16, sayı: 32, 607-641.
- Dölek, Adem. "Sakaleyn Hadisi ve Değerlendirilmesi". *Marife*, 4/3 (2004), 145-168.
- Erul, Bünyamin. "Sahābenin Sünnet Anlayışı". *İslam Geleneğinde ve Modern Dönemde Hadis ve Sünnet*. 13-46. İstanbul: KURAMER, 2020.
- Ghereghlou, Kioumars. "A Safavid Bureaucrat in the Ottoman World: Mirza Makhdum Sharifi Shirazi and the Quest for Upward Mobility in the İlmiye Hierarchy". *Osmanlı Araştırmaları/The Journal of Ottoman Studies* 53/53 (2018), 153-194.
- Gökçe, Ferhat. "Klasik Arap Literatüründe İlk Otobiyografik Örnekler: Ḥakīm et-Tirmizī'nin Būdūvvü Şe'n isimli Eseri", *International Symposium from Mā warā' al-Nahr to Anatolia Islamic Scholars: Imam al-Tirmidhī and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Symposium Proceedings*, 17-18 October 2024 Tirmiz, 317-325.

- al-Ḥakīm, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad al-Naysābūrī. *al-Mustadrak 'alā al-Şaḥīḥayn*. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, 1990.
- al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn 'Alī. *Nawādir al-uşūl fī ma'rifat akhbār al-Rasūl*. Ed. by Nūruddīn Boyacılar. 5 vols. Beirut: Dār al-Minhāj, 1436/2015.
- al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn 'Alī. *Nawādir al-uşūl fī aḥādīth al-Rasūl*. Ed. by 'Abd al-Raḥmān 'Umayra. Beirut: Dār al-Jīl, 1412/1992.
- al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn 'Alī. *Khatm al-awliyā'*. Ed. by 'Uthmān Ismā'il Yahyā. Beirut: Buḥūth wa-Dirāsāt bi-Idārat Ma'had al-Sharqiyya, n.d.
- al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn 'Alī. *al-Radd 'alā al-Rāfiḍa*, nşr. Ahmed Subhi Furat (İstanbul: İstanbul Edebiyat Fakültesi Basımevi, 1966).
- al-Ḥurr al-'Āmilī, Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan ibn 'Alī. *Risālat al-ithnā 'ashariyya fī al-radd 'alā al-Şūfiyya*. Ed. 'Abbās al-Jalālī. Qom: Mu'assasat Anşāriyān, 1432/2011.
- Ibn 'Asākir, Abū al-Qāsim 'Alī. *Tārīkh Dimashq*. Ed. by 'Amr ibn Ghurāma al-'Umarī. 80 vols. Damascus: Dār al-Fikr, 1415/1995.
- Ibn Ḥibbān, Muḥammad b. Ḥibbān b. Aḥmad. *al-Thiqāt*. Ed. by Muḥammad 'Abd al-Mu'īd Ḥaydarābād: Dā'irat al-Ma'ārif al-'Uthmāniyya, n.d.
- Ibn Khaldūn, Abū Zayd Walī al-Dīn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Muḥammad al-Maghribī. *al-Muqaddima*. Ed. Abdullāh Muḥammad al-Darwīsh. Damascus: Dār al-Balkhī, 1425/2004.
- Ibn al-Şalāḥ, 'Uthmān ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān. *Ma'rifat anwā' ulūm al-ḥadīth*. Ed. by Nūr al-Dīn 'Itr. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1406.
- Ibn al-'Arabī, Muḥyī al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn 'Alī ibn Muḥammad ibn al-'Arabī. *al-Futūḥāt al-Makkiyya*. Ed. 'Uthmān Yahyā. Cairo: al-Maktaba al-'Arabiyya, 1408/1988.
- Karapınar, Fikret. "Hakīm Tirmizî ve Ona Ait Bir Mecnû'a". *Marife 2* (2005), 229-243.
- al-Kulaynī, Abū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn Ya'qūb. *al-Uşūl min al-Kāfī*. Ed. by 'Alī Akbar al-Ghifārī. 8 vols. Tehran: Dār al-Kutub al-Islāmiyya, 1362/1984.
- al-Maqdisī, Abū 'Abd Allāh Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad. *Aḥsan al-taqāsīm fī ma'rifat al-aqālīm*. Ed. M. J. de Goeje. Cairo: Maktabat Madbulī, 3rd Edition, 1411-1991.
- Mālik b. Anas. *al-Muwatta'*. Ed. by M. Fu'ād 'Abd al-Bāqī. Cairo: Dar Ihya' al-Turāth al-'Arabī, n.d.
- al-Mizzī, Jamāl al-Dīn Abū al-Ḥajjāj Yūsuf ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān. *Tahdhīb al-kamāl fī asmā' al-rijāl*. Ed. Bashshār 'Awwād Ma'rūf. 35 Volumes. Beirut: Mu'assasat al-Risāla, Bashshār 'Awwād Ma'rūf, 1400/1980.
- Muslim, Abū al-Ḥusayn Muslim ibn al-Ḥajjāj al-Qushayrī. *al-Musnad al-Şaḥīḥ al-Mukhtaşar min al-Sunan bi-Naql al-'Adl 'an al-'Adl*, Mawsū'at al-Hadīth al-Sharif - al-Kutub al-Sittah - Combined Edition. Riyadh: Dār al-Salām, 1421.
- al-Nu'mānī, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn Ibrāhīm ibn Ja'far (Ibn Abī Zaynab al-Nu'mānī). *Kitāb al-Ghayba*. Ed. 'Alī Akbar al-Ghifārī. Tehran: Maktabat al-Şadūq, 1970.
- al-Qurtubī, Abū 'Abdullāh Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn Abī Bakr. *al-Tadhkira bi-aḥwal al-mawtā wa-umūr al-ākhirā*. Riyadh: Maktabat Dār al-Minhāj, 1425
- al-Rāmahurmuzī, Abū Muḥammad al-Ḥasan ibn 'Abd al-Raḥmān ibn Khallād al-Fārisī. *al-Muḥaddith al-fāşil bayn al-rāwī wa-l-wā'ī*. Ed. by Muḥammad 'Ajāj al-Khaṭīb. Beirut: n.p., 1404/1983.
- al-Sam'ānī, Abū Sa'd 'Abd al-Karīm ibn Muḥammad. *al-Ansāb*. Ed. by 'Abdullāh 'Umar al-Bārūdī. 5 vols. Beirut: Dār al-Fikr, 1419/1998.
- al-Subkī, Taj al-Dīn 'Abd al-Wahhāb. *Ṭabaqāt al-Shāfi'iyya al-Kubrā*. Ed. by Maḥmūd Muḥammad al-Ṭanāḥī. 10 vols. n.p: Hijr lial-ṭibā'ah wa al-Nashr, 2nd Edition, 1413/1992.
- al-Shaybī, Kāmil Muştafā. *al-Fikr al-Shī'ī wa-al-naza'āt al-Şūfiyya*. Baghdād, 1966.
- al-Shaybī, Kāmil Muştafā. *al-Şila bayn al-Taşawwuf wa-al-Tashayyuf*. Beirut, 1982.
- al-Shaybī, Kāmil Muştafā. *Sufism and Shi'ism*. England: LAAM, 1991.
- al-Shaykh al-Şadūq, Abū Ja'far Muḥammad ibn 'Alī ibn al-Ḥusayn ibn Mūsā ibn Bābawayh al-Qummī. *Ilal al-Sharā'ī'*. Beirut: Dār al-Murtaqā, 1427.
- Şimşek, Halil. "Tefsir Literatürü Mirasında Yeni Bir Keşif: Hakīm et-Tirmizî ve Tefsiri". *International Symposium from Mā warā' al-Nahr to Anatolia Islamic Scholars: Imam al-Tirmidhī and al-Ḥakīm al-Tirmidhī, Symposium Proceedings*. Ed. Ferhat Gökçe. Ankara: İlahiyat Yayınları, 2024, 435-443.
- al-Shushtarī, Seyyid Diyā' al-Dīn Nūrullāh. *Maşā'ib al-nawāşib fī al-radd 'alā nawāqīd al-rawāfiḍ*. Ed. Qays al-'Aṭṭār (Qom: Dalīl-i Mā, 1426/2005).

- al-Ṭabarānī, Abū al-Qāsim Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad. *al-Muʿjam al-awsaṭ*. Ed. by Ṭāriq ibn ʿIwaḍullāh ibn Muḥammad, ʿAbd al-Muḥsin ibn Ibrāhīm al-Ḥusaynī. 10 vols. Cairo: Dār al-Ḥaramayn, n.d.
- al-Ṭabarānī, Sulaymān ibn Aḥmad. *al-Muʿjam al-kabīr*. Ed. by Ḥamdī ʿAbd al-Majīd al-Salafī. 25 vols. Cairo: Maktabat Ibn Taymiyya, 1415.
- al-Ṭahrānī, Āghā Buzurg Muḥammad Muḥsin. *al-Dharīʿa ilā taṣānīf al-Shīʿa*. 25 vols. Beirut: Dār al-Aḍwāʾ, n.d.
- al-Tirmidhī, Abū ʿĪsā Muḥammad ibn ʿĪsā. *al-Sunan –Mawsūʿat al-Ḥadīth al-Sharīf - al-Kutub al-Sittah - Combined Edition*. Riyaḍ: Dār al-Salām, 1421.
- al-Dhahabī, Abū ʿAbdillāh Shams al-Dīn Muḥammad ibn Aḥmad ibn ʿUthmān. *Tadhkirat al-Ḥuffāz*. 4 vols. Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, 1419/1998.
- al-Dhahabī, Abū ʿAbdillāh Shams al-Dīn. *Siyar aʿlām al-nubalāʾ*. Ed. by Shuʿayb al-Arnāʾūṭ. 25 vols. Beirut: Muʾassasat al-Risalah, 3rd Edition, 1405–1985.
- al-Dhahabī, Abū ʿAbdillāh Shams al-Dīn. *Tārīkh al-Islām wa-wafayāt al-mashāhīr al-aʿlām*. Ed. by ʿUmar ʿAbd al-Salām Tadmurī. 52 vols. Beirut: Dār al-Kitāb al-ʿArabī, 1413/1993.
- Ziriklī, Khayr al-Dīn. *al-Aʿlām*. 8 vols. Beirut: Dār al-ʿIlm lial-Malāyīn, 2002.