



KİTAP TANITIMI/BOOK REVIEW:

'UYÛN AL-MASĀ'İL FĪ AL-UŞÛL

Hâkim El-Cüşemî, *Uyûnü'l-mesâil fi'l-usûl*, (thk.) Ramazan Yıldırım, Kahire: Daru'l-İhsan, 2018, 463 s.

Berna KAVUK
Arş. Gör., İstanbul Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi, İstanbul
Research Assitant, Istanbul University Faculty of Theology, Istanbul
bernakavuk@istanbul.edu.tr
orcid.org/0000-0003-0966-4543

Abstract

Mu'tazilite scholar al-Hâkim al-Jushamî's (d. 494 AH) exposition of his kalâm thought is presented at best in his primary work, *'Uyûn al-masâ'il fi al-uşûl*, which also presents the former Mu'tazilite scholarship as well as the contemporary discussions in his era. Thus, the publication of this work provides a better understanding in the Mu'tazilite thought in the fifth hijrî century and its developments until this time. In this review, it has been attempted to evaluate the importance of the original work and its contents, as well as challenges regarding the publication and the methodology of the edition.

Keywords: Kalâm, Mu'tazilite, Zaydite, al-Hâkim al-Jushamî, 'Uyûn al-masâ'il fi al-uşûl.

Öz

Mu'tezilî âlim Hâkim el-Cüşemî (ö. 494/1101) *Uyûnü'l-mesâil fi'l-usûl* adlı eserinde kalamî düşüncesini ortaya koymakta aynı zamanda kendisinden önceki ve çağdaşı olan diğer Mu'tezile ulemasına da atıflarda bulunmaktadır. Eserin tahkik edilerek yayımlanmasıyla da Mu'tezilî düşünce sistemini kendi kaynaklarından hareketle tanıyabilme imkânı artmış olmaktadır. Bu çalışmada Hâkim el-Cüşemî ve *Uyûnü'l-mesâil*'in önemi, eserin muhtevası, neşriyle alakalı hususlar ve tahkikinde izlenen yönetime dair değerlendirmeler yer almaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Kelâm, Mu'tezile, Zeydiyye, Hâkim el-Cüşemî, Uyûnü'l-mesâil fi'l-usûl.

Last year has been a prolific year in terms of Mu'tazilite resources as for the publications of the works *'Uyûn al-masâ'il* authored by Abu al-Qâsim al-Balkhî (d. 319 AH) and also by al-Hâkim al-Jushamî (d. 494 AH) with the same title. The latter, which will be introduced here, has a major importance, not only for providing Mu'tazilite thought from the perspective of its own sources but also for bridging the gap between al-Qādî 'Abd al-Jabbār and al-Zamakhshari by referencing the earlier Mu'tazilite traditions as well as its contemporaries.

Moreover, the significance of al-Jushamī's work underlies in projecting the relatively early period of Mu'tazilite-Zaydite interaction with regards to the Zaydite inclination of Mu'tazilite in general.

As to provide a brief biography; Abū Ṣa'd al-Muḥassin b. Muḥammad b. Karrāma al-Ḥākim al-Jushamī was born in 413, in a village called Jusham within the borders of Bayḥaq. He was raised in Mu'tazilite and Zaydite scholarly quarters and lived until about the first half of the fifth century hijrī in Nīshāpūr. Following severe tensions between Sunni and Shiite, however, he had to immigrate to Macca, where the population of Zaydite scholars was rapidly expanding. Nevertheless, he was murdered in Macca in 494, reportedly for the ideas presented in his work *Risālatu Iblīs ilā ikhwānihī min al-Mujbira wa'l-Mushabbihā* by the opponents of this work.

According to the reports, al-Jushamī published over twenty works, some of which have been edited:

- *Risālatu Iblīs ilā ikhwānihī min al-Mujbira wa'l-Mushabbihā fī'l-Shikāyat 'anī'l-Mu'tazila*: This is probably al-Jushamī's last work before his murder to falsify the ideas of Mushabbihā and Jabriyya, and it is also known as *Risālat al-Shaykh Abī Murra ilā ikhwānihī al-Mujbira*. This work has been edited by Husayn al-Mudarrisī and published firstly in 1986 and then in 1995 in Beirut.
- *Taḥkīm al-'uqūl fī taṣḥīḥ al-uṣūl*: It is one of the most significant works of al-Jushamī and it was edited by 'Abd al-Salām al-Wajīh in 2001 in Amman.
- *Tanbīh al-ghāfilīn 'an faḍā'il al-Ṭālibiyyīn*: In this work, al-Jushamī gathers the Quranic verses that he argues that the cause of their revelation are 'Alī or Ahl al-Bayt. This work has been edited and published by Sayyid Taḥsīn Ālu Shabīb al-Mūsawī in 200 in Tehran.
- *Al-Tahdhīb fī tefsīr al-Qur'ān al-Karīm*: This is the tafsir work of the author which the volumes of it has been published in 2012 by 'Abd al-'Azīz Mabruk and 'Ādil Yūsuf in Cairo.
- *Ṭabaqātān al-ḥadiya 'ashara wa'l-thāniya 'ashara min Kitāb Sharḥ al-'Uyūn*: This is a partial edition of the work *Sharḥ 'Uyūn al-masā'il* for the names and short biographies of eleventh and twelfth generations of Mu'tazilite school of kalām. This work was prepared by Fuād Sayyid in the collective edition titled *Faḍl al-'itizāl wa Ṭabaqāt al-Mu'tazila* and published in 1974 in Tunis.
- *'Uyūn al-masā'il fī al-uṣūl*: This is the work introduced in this paper. It has been edited by Ramazan Yıldırım and published in 2018 in Cairo.

Some major works of al-Jushamī are still in manuscript format: *Sharḥ 'Uyūn al-masā'il*, *Kitāb al-'Uyūn fī dhikr ahl al-bid'a*, *al-Ta'sīr wa'l-mu'assir*, *Jilā' al-absār fī mutūn al-akhbār*, *al-Safīnat al-jāmi'a li anwā' al-'ulūm*, *Tanzīh al-anbiyā' wa'l-a'imma*, *al-Risālat al-tamma fī naṣīhat al-āmma*.

This introduced edition of al-Ḥākim al-Jushamī's *'Uyūn al-masā'il fī al-uṣūl* rendered from the single known extant copy in the possession of the special collections library of Badr Centre in Sanaa, Yemen. Registration notes on the first folio attribute the work to al-Ḥākim Abū Ṣa'd Muḥammad b. Karrāma al-Jushamī

and the colophon states that the copy has been completed on 21 Cumādā al-’ulā 557. The manuscript has 191 folios and al-Jushamī’s work ends on 176r. The first folio(s) are missing, so the foreword of the work, as well as any possible dedications to a patron too.

Yıldırım mentions the hardship of editing the work from a single copy, which has ambiguities in words due to lack of letter identifiers and partial damp traces obstructing the orthography of the words. Throughout the edition these missing parts are reconstructed by Yıldırım and indicated in footnotes. Also the many titles and subtitles of the work are absent in the lines with relevant space left for them, apparently with the intention to complete them with red ink. Those headings are generated by Yıldırım according to the content of the section and added to the edition in square brackets. Repetitions in the manuscript are omitted and indicated in the footnotes. As well, the letter (◌), which indicates the word (انتهى), is omitted by the editor in exchange with a full stop. Grammatical mistakes are, however, preserved and corrections are done in footnotes.

In the introductory chapter, Yıldırım introduces reader the intellectual status of the time and places al-Jushamī had lived and releases information concerning his intellectual life, his works, his position amongst Mu’tazilite and his method of kalām. Concerning the vital importance of the work, it has also been highlighted that *’Uyūn al-masā’il* was authored utilising the sources of its time, in an era when the Mu’tazilite thoughts were being forgotten, as well as the excellent style al-Jushamī presented this heritage and his own understanding of kalām.

Al-Jushamī designed the work in ten major chapters (*qism*) and several appropriate subsections (*bāb*, *fasl* and *mas’ala*). The lack of appearance of the renown five principles as major chapter titles, it could cause an early impression that the chapters are not established correctly. Especially, editor’s reluctance of the division of the text into these chapters (e.g. skipping to the seventh chapter after third) hardens to grasp the method of the author. However, the chapters could have been identified simply by following the commentary of the text, *Sharḥ ’Uyūn al-masā’il*, namely: non-Islamic groups, Islamic (*ahl al-Qibla*) groups, Mu’tazilite groups and the issues they agreed upon, unity (*tawhīd*), justice (*ta’dīl*) and consent (*tajwīz*), prophethood (*nubuwwa*), sources of law (*adillat al-shar’iyya*), the promise and the warning (*wa’d* and *wa’id*) and lastly, the cosmology of kalam (*laṭīf al-kalām*, i.e. *daḡīq al-kalām*)

After giving the schema of the work, it can be firstly noticed that there is no chapter dedicated to the very famous principle “the station between two stations” (*al-manzila bayn al-manzilatayn*) and secondly that the principle of “enjoining the right and forbidding the wrong” (*al-amr bi’l-ma’rūf wa al-nahy ’an al-munkar*) is also dealt in the subsection of “leadership” (*imāma*), which is a clear reflection of his approach to the issue itself. The beginning of the work, i.e. the first chapter, starts with the issue regarding Allah not being corporeal (*jism*) and continues with divine attributes. However, the issue is followed by the notion of *bedā’* (alteration in divine will), on Zoroastrians, on unity against Christians and others and the notion

of aḥwāl, thus, shows an indication to the collation of the folios. Then, the chapter continues with the problem of theodicy (*ḥusn* and *qubḥ*) in relation to divine attributes and elaborates the issue with different views upon it.

The second chapter is dedicated for the disputes within the Islamic community, their emergence, key figures and established schools, while stating that Muslims had no controversies during the life span of the Prophet Muhammad in creedal issues and agreed upon these: "The world is temporal and created by an Eternal, Living, Omnipotent, Omniscience, Omnivident and Omniaudient Creator. No incompleteness is associated with Him nor any other thing has any similarity with Him. He is the Lord and Just and He never torments. He always speaks the truth. Religiously accountables (*mukallafūn*) are three parties: *kāfir* (disbeliever), *mu'min* (believer) and *munāfiq* (hypocrite)..." As apparent from the text, the related issues are supposedly being followed, however, due to the damages on the corresponding folio, the section is unable to read, thus it is absent in the edition.

In this chapter al-Jushamī lists the Islamic sects as follows; a) al-Zaydiyya, b) al-Imāmiyya, c) al-Bāṭiniyya, d) al-Khārijīyya, e) al-Mujbīra, f) al-Murjī'a, g) al-Hashwiyya and h) al-'Āmma. He also states additional groups that are not much known as former ones. He also gives details about the main groups, such as their subdivisions and their own major views in contrast to their main group. He does not mention Mu'tazilite as one of these sects and deals with it individually in the following chapter. Significantly, he broadens the group of Jabriyya into Mujbīra counting in it a wide range of groups and schools, namely; Ḍirāriyya, Jahmiyya, Najjāriyya, Kullābiyya, Ash'ariyya, Bakriyya and Karrāmiyya.

In the third chapter, al-Jushamī narrates the emergence of the Mu'tazila and its names, as well as its branches, representatives, views of agreement and disagreement. This doxography is given in ten generations (*ṭabaqāt*), making a contrast with the commentary, which adds to these eleventh and twelfth generations. After the doxography, al-Jushamī continues with the systematic problems of kalām, which clearly indicates the start of the fourth chapter. In these unidentified bulk of subsections, which seems to constitute the fourth, fifth and sixth chapters includes titles of the temporality of the world, divine attributes, *tawlīd*, *ajal*, *rizq*, *as'ār*, *qaḍā*, *qadar*, *taklīf*, *hidāya* and *ḍalāla*, *luṭf*, *khatm* and *nubuwwa*, all somehow related to the principles of *tawḥīd* and *'adāla*.

The seventh chapter starts with the sources of law and then jumps into the issue of *wa'id*. In this section following titles are explored; generality of *wa'id*, punishment in the grave, judgement (*mīzān*), belief and disbelief. As understood from these segments, these should belong to the eighth chapter which is not identified as well.

The ninth chapter is dedicated to the issue of leadership, *imāma*, and the issues of *dār al-Islām* and *dār al-kufr* as well as *al-amr bi'l-ma'rūf wa al-nahy 'an al-munkar* are designated for sub sections of this chapter. Lastly the tenth chapter deals with the issues regarding the field formulated as *daqīq al-kalām* by early scholars with the name *laṭīf al-kalām*. Major issues of the field, substances and accidents (*jawhar* and *'arad*) are discussed in details followed by different views on life, power,

knowledge, will and perception of human beings, as well as issues of time, agency and cause. The work ends with discussions on different definitions like thingness (*shay'iyā*), temporality (*hudūth*), eternity (*qidam*) and persistence (*baqā*).

When we look at the sources of al-Jushamī, it is evident that he quotes several Mu'tazila figures as well as Hanafī scholars without citing a particular work. Among his major sources, we can count Abū al-Qāsim al-Balkhī, Abū 'Alī and Abū Ḥāshim al-Jubbā'ī, Abū 'Abdullah al-Basrī, al-Qāḍī 'Abd al-Jabbār, Abū Rashīd al-Nīshāpūrī, Abū Yūsuf, 'Īsa b. Abān, Ibn al-Thaljī and Abū al-Ḥasan al-Karkhī. Additionally, Baṣriya, Baghdādiya and Ikhshīdiya are the groups that al-Jushamī refers their disagreement exclusively.

With the edition of the text '*Uyūn al-masā'il fī al-uṣūl*', the genuine ideas of both al-Jushamī and other Mu'tazilite scholars have been added to the enriching core texts of Islam, enabling to have a better understanding of the Mu'tazila school, which almost structured extensively from the works of its harsh criticism. Therefore, this edition is a great contribution to the field as being one of the core references of the Mu'tazila.