

## EUROPEAN STUDIES IN TURKEY: PRESENT STATE (2004) AND PROPOSALS A RE-PRESENTATION TWO TEARS LATER ...WITH SOME REGRETS AND AUSPICES

*Angelo SANTAGOSTINO\**

### **ABSTRACT**

*This paper attempts to analyse the findings of the 2004 report on the recent state of European studies in Turkey as an area of increasing academic interest in various Turkish universities and other public and private institutions. It outlines the process in which the profile of EU studies has undergone changes in terms of both scholarly publications and teaching activities from the early 1990s to the present, most notably in the aftermath of the 1999 Helsinki European Council which declared Turkey's candidacy. Its main argument is that even though the existing state of European studies in Turkey at the time of writing up the report could be deemed adequate both in quality and in quantity for a non-negotiating candidate country, the necessity of further diversification and specialisation in this field of undergraduate and postgraduate curricula has undeniably become more apparent since the opening of accession talks with Turkey. In view of this fact it concludes with a deeply critical overview of Turkey's little progress towards implementing the propositions of the report about how to strengthen the European studies.*

**Key Words:** *European Studies, Negotiation, Turkey, Specialisation, Diversification*

---

\* Angelo Santagostino is a Jean Monnet professor of European Economic Integration at the Faculty of Economics at the University of Brescia, Italy.

This article is based on a report prepared in January-March 2004 with Dr. Esra Hatipoglu for the Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs with the support of the European Commission. The views expressed are those of the authors and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Union or of the Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

## ÖZET

*Bu makale Türkiye'de çeşitli üniversiteler ve kamu ve özel kuruluşlar bünyesinde yükselen bir akademik ilgi alanı olarak Avrupa çalışmaları üzerine hazırlanan 2004 tarihli raporun bulgularını ele almaktadır. Makale, rapor çerçevesinde öncelikle 1990'lı yıllardan buyana Avrupa çalışmaları alanında hem akademik yayınlar hem de eğitim faaliyetleri bakımından gözlenen değişim süreci ve özellikle de 1999 Helsinki Avrupa Konseyi Zirvesi sonrasında yaşanan değişim üzerinde durmaktadır. Makalenin ana savı, raporun yazımı sırasında Avrupa çalışmalarının mevcut durumu hem nicelik hem de nitelik bakımından henüz müzakereye başlamamış bir ülke için yeterli görülebilse de Türkiye ile müzakerelerin başlaması ertesinde, hem lisans hem de lisansüstü düzeyde bu alanda daha fazla çeşitlenme ve uzmanlaşma ihtiyacının giderek belirgin hâle gelmekte olduğudur. Bu doğrultuda makale, raporun Avrupa çalışmalarını güçlendirmeye dönük önerilerini uygulamada Türkiye'nin sağladığı cüzi ilerlemeye ilişkin eleştirel bir değerlendirme ile sona erer.*

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** *Avrupa Çalışmaları, Müzakere, Türkiye, Uzmanlaşma, Çeşitlenme*

## Introduction

European studies are a field of increasing interest in Turkish universities nowadays. The profile of EU studies in Turkey began to change in the beginning of 1990s and a major breakthrough in terms of both scholarly publications and teaching activity came in the aftermath of Helsinki Summit (1999) where Turkey's candidacy have been officially declared by the EU. It is apparent that this is highly correlated with the momentum of the relations of the country with the EU. In this context a possible decision in December 2004 that Turkey fulfils the Copenhagen criteria, leading to the opening of accession negotiations "without delay", will surely play a motivation for further diversification and extension of the European studies.

The existing educational offer of European studies in Turkey, that will be described in this Report, can be considered as adequate to the today's needs of a non negotiating candidate country. However the needs will change deeply when negotiation will start. Actually when Turkey will reach the status of negotiating candidate country, this condition will call for a huge diversification and specialisation concerning European studies at all levels (undergraduate, postgraduate, training, etc.).

The necessity of a diversification and specialisation concerning European Studies is thus the basic assumption on which we will work in this Report.

As a consequence of the 1999 Helsinki Council, several universities in Turkey started to build up courses and opened new centres of research concerning the EU studies as a result of intensified demand from both the students and the public. Almost one third of 76 state and private universities in Turkey have already established EU research centres or offer courses on European studies.

Out of the 30 universities having such activities, 14 offer postgraduate degrees; 2 offer undergraduate degrees; 13 have EU research and documentation centres, and 1 has an autonomous institute for EU studies (another one was recently established at Baskent University) offering doctorate degrees as well. Out of these 30, 16 are public and 14 private.

On the other hand, an augmenting number of Jean Monnet Chairs, European modules and Permanent courses supported by Jean Monnet Action of the European Commission, reveal the growing interest of Turkish academics in this field. However we have to notice that Turkey is eligible for the Jean Monnet Action since 2001. This fact is contrasting sharply with the experience of the former Central and Eastern European Countries (CEEC), who have been eligible to the Jean Monnet Action since the beginning of the nineties. Here we can also add, but we will come back to this point in the third part of this Report, another difference between Turkey and the former CEEC: the fact that this Country has not yet had any TEMPUS like programme, with the partial exception of MEDA Programmes which, for instance, is financing, the Jean Monnet Scholarship Programme. Actually TEMPUS I and II have played a fundamental role in the establishment of European studies, from faculties (as in Romania) to training courses, in CEEC. The same thing can be said of Tempus III (2000-2006), for which Turkey is not an eligible country

Thus, in general, we can say that Turkey has done with *her own hands* the huge majority of the work on European studies.

Furthermore the interest in EU affairs is not only growing in the Universities but also among various other institutions.

### **Training on EU matters in Turkey**

European Studies in Turkey are presently structured on three levels: PhD, MA and undergraduate programmes.

In this section we will present the main trends emerged out of the exploration realised January-March 2004) in Ankara, Istanbul, Izmir, Antalya, Konya and Van.

#### ***Doctoral Programmes (PhD)***

The European Community Institute of Marmara University is first and the oldest institution in Turkey providing a PhD programme in European Studies. These programs are PhD in Politics and International Relations of the EU, PhD in Economics of the EU and PhD in Law of the EU. The programs are designed to prepare students for research and teaching about various aspects of the EU. The candidates are assessed individually with a written entrance examination followed by an interview. To graduate from the PhD, a student has to pass all the compulsory courses and if there are, a required number of elective courses (in some years the Institute offers elective courses). Subsequently, he/she is expected to write a PhD. thesis. The PhD. programs run through

four years one allocated to the courses and the other three for the thesis. Language of instruction is English. Each year approximately 5 students are accepted for each Department and so far there are 23 students who were graduated from PhD programs who are mostly working in academia.

In 2001, Dokuz Eylul (9 September) University of Izmir has started a PhD programme in EU Law. In these three years about 5 students have participated in it, no one is still graduated.

### *MA Postgraduate programmes*

Master studies represent the bulk of European studies as they are realised in 12 Universities, 11 of which concentrated in Ankara and Istanbul.

### *Public Universities*

Two main centres of excellence have first of all to be indicated: the University of Ankara and the University of Marmara, both are public universities. The MA programme of Ankara University is realised by the Department of European Union and International Relations, directed by Prof. Dr. Tugrul Arat, and at Marmara University is operating the European Community Institute, directed by Prof. Dr. Muzaffer Dartan.

Both institutions are conducting three different MAs. Ankara University is conducting three Master programmes in “EC Law”, “EU International Relations” and “EC Economics and Finance” and is launching a new postgraduate programme on “International Trade Law and the EC”. Marmara University is conducting MA in “EU Law”, “EU Economics” and “EU Politics and International Relations” each of these leading to a correspondent PhD.

At Ankara University there is not for the moment a Jean Monnet Chair, while at Marmara University there is a Jean Monnet Chair in European Economic Integration, held by Prof. Dr. Muzaffer Dartan. Both have permanent courses and or modules.

The analysis of the curricula of the six MA conducted in these universities indicates that teaching programs cover widely and deeply the concerned matters. Either in Law, International Relations or Economics, different subjects are treated both at theoretical and at policy level. At the same time, also the most topical issues concerning the EU (CFSP, Constitution, Privatisation, just to give a few examples) are treated deeply. These two Universities have also a strong research activity.

Both Universities can rely, for their teaching and research activities, on a wide and very well qualified human capital, composed of full professors, assistant professors, and researchers. If human capital is the most valuable asset of these universities, financial resources represent their weakness. This fact has negative repercussion on their capability to establish and maintain links with the universities of the EU member States.

Marmara University, for instance, had some difficulties in continuing, once exhausted the EU financing, the programme had to rely on a more inward looking attitude.

Ankara and Marmara Universities represent the “tradition” concerning European studies in Turkey, however, the perspectives of membership and the increasing

Consciousness that the future of Turkey is more and more linked to Europe, have put in motion different new initiatives from public and private universities. New MAs have thus been created in these last years.

Galatasaray University, was founded in 1992 on the basis of a bilateral agreement between France and Turkey. Galatasaray’s European vocation stems also from its curriculum including undergraduate and graduate courses on the European Union; its Center for European Research and Documentation; and its extensive student exchange programs. The Department of International Relations, the Law School and the Department of Economics offer undergraduate and/or graduate courses on the European integration, EU policies, EU economics, and EU law. Many students then decide to specialize on the EU, either by entering the master’s program or pursuing their studies abroad. Teaching language is French.

METU and Boğaziçi University have one Jean Monnet each, plus permanent courses and modules. The two MAs of METU and Boğaziçi University are shaped on the classic type of MA in European studies, based on the four pillars namely, law, economics, politics and history. Boğaziçi’s MA is realised in collaboration with METU. The analysis of the curricula leads to the same conclusion that we have indicated previously for Ankara and Marmara Universities. They are well structured and guarantee the students a deep knowledge of the matters taught in the programme. As the MAs of Marmara University, these two are also taught in English. The relative rapidity of the development of European studies in these two Universities is due, besides, the quality of the human capital they dispose, to their prestige, a fact that has undoubtedly helped them to attract Turkish students and also visiting professors from abroad. Actually as for international links, METU has since a few years developed a fruitful cooperation with Madrid Autonomous University and with Sussex University leading to exchange of lecturers for the MA and for the training courses.

Boğaziçi University, through its Centre for European Studies and the Student Forum, is developing a nationwide network, principally aimed to involve Anatolian Universities in some activities concerning European studies. The Translation Department of Boğaziçi University is also starting a special “European Masters in Conference Interpreting” that eventually may well be receiving recognition and support from the European Commission.

Among the new initiatives launched in these last years by public universities it is also worthwhile to mention the case of Gazi University, that conducts two specialised MA one on “EU Law” and the other on “Turkey – EU Relations”. A strong difficulty

that has been pointed out by the teaching staff of Gazi University, but not peculiar to this University and that could represent a serious constraint for the diffusion of European studies among Turkish universities, is the problem of the language, essentially the lack of knowledge of English. The two MAs of Gazi University are actually taught in Turkish language. However the impossibility to read books and documents, explore Internet sites, or having a lecture in a foreign language, represent a severe constraint for the development of European studies.

This fact will have to be taken into consideration for the designing of the training courses for the public officers.

A reality in Turkish academic landscape that is important to consider in the present Report is the Centre for Research and Practice in Human Rights Law, located in the Faculty of Law of the University of Istanbul. The aim of the Centre is to carry out research and activities regarding recognition, protection and fostering of human rights. Concerning EU related matters the Centre has worked recently on the preparation of law proposals for the adoption of “*acquis communautaire*” in the field of labour and social security law, criminal law and constitutional law. The Centre has not any MA programme in the field of Human Rights. However for its human capital, research projects and other activities concerning human rights, the Centre represents the most advanced institution in Turkey who could in the near future take the responsibility of conducting an MA programme in human rights.

### *Private Universities*

As already stated, private universities have, over public universities, the advantage of being much less conditioned in their action by financial resources. For them is thus relatively easier to attract new human resources, to establish and maintain international links and to start new initiatives. European Studies programmes have thus been flourishing in the most prominent of them.

At MA level, three main new initiatives in European Studies have to be mentioned: Yeditepe University, Bilgi University, and Dogus University.

Concerning EU studies, Yeditepe University offers courses at undergraduate level, an MA in “EU Law”, directed by Prof. Dr. Haluk Kaabalioglu, while the Summer School also provides courses on EU matters. The MA, with thesis, is taught in English (the curriculum will be provided) and is presently attended by about 25 students. The Summer School provides a three-week course on EU issues. Lectures are delivered in English. In the 2003 during the Summer School, many visiting scholars from universities like London School of Economics, Oxford, Bremen, Tubingen, and Université Libre de Bruxells have delivered seminars and lectures. Besides members of the European Institutions like the European Parliament, Court of Justice, the European Investment Bank, some former Turkish Ambassadors have also delivered lectures.

A course on “European Union and Euro” is delivered in the fourth year of the curriculum of the Department of Economics. The course includes subjects like integration theory, theory of monetary unions, as well as analysis of the EU monetary union and of other EU policies like Common Agricultural Policy, industrial policy, trade policy and competition policy.

For the prestige of its human capital and for the solid and prestigious network of international relations, Yeditepe University represents an outstanding and growing reality in the landscape of EU Studies both in Turkey and abroad.

On its part Bilgi University is conducting an MA in European Studies in collaboration with Leiden University. It is important to underline this collaboration that allows a fruitful interchange between the two universities, representing a unique case for Turkish European studies. First year courses are taught in Istanbul also with the participation of Leiden visiting professors, while one option for those students who have completed the first year, is that of spending a whole semester in Leiden. Bilgi’s MA is oriented towards business and economics, with an emphasis on trade and other economic relations between Turkey and EU.

Dogus University offers an MA in European Union Studies, with thesis and non-thesis options, within the Social Sciences Institute. The MA in EU studies offers specialisations in Law, Economics and European Culture. This last is a peculiar feature of this MA. The main subjects of this are, according to the curricula, European Identity, Comparative Imagology, European Modernity, European Art and History and History of European Thought. The courses that are taught in English by staff professors and visiting professors. Presently three students are attending the MA programme. Dogus University has one Jean Monnet Chair held by Prof. Dr. Esra LaGro.

As we have seen, Dokuz Eylül (9 September) University in Izmir is offering a PhD in EU Law, at the Department of Labour Economics and Industrial Relations of the Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences. The same Department is also offering a two semesters MA in European Studies. Courses cover three of the four classical pillars of EU studies: Law, Economics, and Political Science. About 25 students presently attend the MA.

Always in Izmir the Department of International Relations and European Union, of Izmir Economic University, offers a two-years MA programme on European Integration and Turkey – EU Relations. The first year of the programme consists of ten courses and the completion of the thesis in the second year on one of the subjects relating to European Integration and Turkey-EU Relations.

MAs in European studies are becoming more and more a natural component of the curricula of both public and private universities in Turkey, without receiving for this purpose strong aids from the EU. Besides, we have to remind a certain rigidity of the Turkish educational system, according to which universities, both public and private,

are subject to bureaucratic complexities to be able to start a new MA or a Doctoral program.

A specific feature of the growth of European Studies in Turkey is that of the double concentration. The first is the already seen territorial concentration, the second, arising from the analysis above conducted, is the sectoral concentration. MA studies are essentially concentrated in social science faculties (where as we have seen they can be divided into classic-type MAs in European studies and MAs specialised in law, economics-business, and international relations), while in technical faculties they are totally absent.

In the near future, according to the basic assumption, this diversification will be necessary. In particular we are thinking to the faculties of engineering, agriculture, environment, all dealing with issues where the “*acquis communautaire*” is widely extended.

### *Undergraduate Programmes*

The Universities of Bahcesehir (Istanbul) and Izmir Economic University offer EU studies at undergraduate level.

The Faculty of Business Administration of Bahcesehir University offers a 4 years 8 semesters undergraduate EU studies course, directed by Prof. Dr. Eser Karakas. The first BA degree will be award in 2004. Presently about 60 students are enrolled in this Programme, with an average of 15 students each year. The teaching language is English and the same is for the textbooks. This BA programme is focuses on economics. The first year is common to the other 4 undergraduates courses run by the four othe Departments operating in this university. Specialisation in EU studies begins with the second year with a 3 credits course on “Institutions of the EU”. In the third and fourth years most of the courses are on EU matters. The curriculum appears to be well conceived and bound to give to the students a strong theoretical basis, at the beginning of the Programme, in order to allow a better understanding of the different policies taught in the last two years. The human capital also, according to the scientific qualifications of the teaching staff, is of outstanding quality.

Izmir University of Economics runs a 4 years 8 semesters undergraduate programme in International Relations and the European Union, directed by Prof. Dr. Haluk Gunugur of the Department of International Relations and the European Union. This undergraduate programme has been established three years ago and is followed by about 60 students. EU related course are: History of the European Integration, History of Turkish- European Union Relations, Central and Eastern European Countries and the EU, European Economic and Monetary Union, European Union Law, European Single Market, Turkish-European Community Customs Union.

Bilkent, Sabanci and Kadir Has Universities do not run any postgraduate or undergraduate programs in EU studies. However in their curricula there are some



courses on EU issues. At Bilkent University of Ankara, which has also a EU Documentation Centre, Dr. Ali Tekin gives a course on the “Future of the European Union”, both analysing at theoretical and historical level the political evolution of the EU and it’s relations with Turkey.

At Sabanci University Prof. Dr. Bahri Yilmaz holds the Jean Monnet Chair of European Economic Integration. The course is offered in the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences. Besides, Sabanci University has two MA programmes, Political Sciences and Conflict resolution in which two courses on EU matters are taught, a Jean Monnet permanent Course on “EU Politics” and a course on “Multilateral Negotiations in the EU”.

Also Kadir Has University does not offer any undergraduate or graduate program on EU Studies. However in the programme of International relations three courses in EU studies are taught: “EU”, “EU- Turkey relation” both taught by Asst. Prof. Dr. Ugur Ozokerk and “EU law taught by Assoc Prof. Dr. Ulku Dermirdogen. ET the posgrade programme on Globalisation and International relations tha course “Working with the EU“ is taught.

In Antalya, Akdeniz University has, at undergraduate level, a permanent course on “European Union: policies Affecting Tourism Sector” in the School of Tourism and

Hotel management, and a module on “EU Economy”, at the Faculty of Economics and Administrative Science. This module is composed of a series of seminars covering various EU policies like European Monetary Union, Competition, Custom Union, Research and Development. In this Faculty is also offered a course on the European Union, mainly concerned with the Union’s international relationships. The

Faculty has the programme to develop an interdisciplinary MA in European studies. Another project of Akdeniz University concerns the House of Europe, who wants to be a forum for discussion on EU issues. The Faculty of Agriculture of this University is working on a project for intensive courses on EU Common Agricultural Policy. The EU General Secretariat supports the course. Specialists will teach it from EU member States.

In the field of life long education Akdeniz University has an interesting programme consisting in an info-bus with which experts will reach rural areas for informing the population about EU matters.

At Konya’s Selcuk University, since its first years, there have been European Union courses with different names among the main and selective courses at the academic curriculum of the Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences and Social Sciences Institute. In the MA program of International Relations “Turkish-EU Relations in the Full Membership Process” and a course on “Enlargement Process of EU” are taught. At the academic curriculum of the master without a thesis program run

by Public Administration and Economy Departments, "EU: History, Institutions and Policies" is presented among the main courses.

In Van, at Yuzuncu Yıl University, there are also some attempts to apply EU matters more on technical fields since the University doesn't have any social sciences department. There are various EU projects run by the University's staff. University is also giving its support for the implementation of the Eastern Anatolia Development Programme that include Van, Bitlis, Hakkari and Mus as cities.

Eskisehir Anadolu University has also a European Documentation Center which was established in 1969 as one of the first Centers. The University has also one Module from Jean Monnet Project which has been implemented for three years to educate the students of both Eskisehir Anadolu University and Osmangazi University at the same time on Basics of the European Union. The Documentation Center is also organizing theseminars like the one that organised during February 2003 in cooperation with METU European Studies Center on EU enlargement and Turkey.

Most universities both public and private that didn't have something concrete on EU matters are seemed very enthusiastic about the future activities. During the discussions with the representatives of Kultur University for example, it was learned that University plan to organise seminars to educate the public, to establish an EU Strategy Unit within the University, to publish a newsletter and a working paper series on EU matters, to revitalize its EU MA programme that doesn't have any student so far within the next academic year. It was learned that Isik University is also planning to realise more or less the same type of activities within the next academic year. Fatih University is also involved in various EU projects from **Web-Based Affective Adaptable and Adaptive Open Distance Learning, Multi-dimensional Language Teaching Classroom to Student Placement** in Germany.

### *Training and Certificate Programs*

ATAUM and METU offer training programs for BA graduates, for officers of the public administration, essentially for the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) and for the business community. ATAUM certificate programs (the next will start in March 2004 and will end in June), are dealing with International Relations, EU Law, EU Social Policy, Common Agricultural Policies and EU Industrial Policies.

METU's courses are taught both by staff professors and visiting professors, from other Turkish universities as for instance Bogazici and Sabanci, and from EU member States universities, like the Autonomous University of Madrid or the Sussex European Institute. These courses while giving an overall view of the EU institutions and policies are mainly concerned with the enlargement process (with its legal, institutional and political, cultural and social dimensions) and with the relations between Turkey and the EU.

Beyond the peculiarities of these programs, here is important to underline the role that these activities could have in the next years for the training of the negotiators (people who will be a part of working group in negotiations) in the public administration. The urgency of this training is clearly felt in the different milieu that we have visited: central administration, public and private universities, foundations and associations. There is a strong consciousness in the Country that the lack of officers trained in negotiation techniques and with a specific knowledge of the issues composing the various chapters of the negotiation process, could represent a serious constraint when this process will start. These types of courses, although with a wider specialisation than the one presently offered, represent a fundamental ingredient of the strategy for reinforcing EU studies that we will be presenting in part three of this Report

### *A Tentative Assessment*

As we have seen previously, EU studies developed in Turkey since 1987 with the establishment of European Community Institute at Marmara University and ATAUM at Ankara University. Since then they have grown substantially (both in terms of formation and research), mainly after the 1999 Helsinki summit. Prospect for Turkey full membership, being the principal factor moving the interest of the academicians, researchers and students. Besides, increasing perspectives for the starting of the negotiations in 2005 have determined a diffusion of the interest in EU matters outside the academic sectors. More and more Foundations and NGOs are thus dedicating an increasing part of their activity to the diffusion of information and knowledge on the European construction.

As we have anticipated in the introduction, and as clearly emerge out of our exploration among Turkish universities, the state of European studies and research can be considered as satisfactory in Turkey, both in quality and in quantity.

However this assessment, at least as quantity is concerned, is strictly limited to the present state of Turkey as a non-negotiating candidate country. When, presumably in 2005, this condition will turn into that of a negotiating candidate country, the necessities will dramatically increase and diversify.

To cope with this new situation new and more effective tools that will be needed. In this light propositions will be presented in the following section.

The satisfactory state of European Studies is even truer if we proceed to a *weighted* assessment of Turkey with the old 15 member States, with the 10 new member States and with third States. Where weighted assessment means that any comparative analysis has to be discounted for the fact that Turkey has not yet received any relevant aid from the EU, with the important exception of the Jean Monnet Scholarship Programme, from 1990 and of the Jean Monnet Action from 2001, as it has been the case of former CEEC, with TEMPUS I and II, even before the starting of the negotiations.

As we have already said, but is worthwhile to repeat it (*repetita juvant*, the Romans were used to say), Turkey has done almost all “with her own hands” as far as EU Studies is concerned, and as our exploration put into evidence has done things of a very high quality. A fact also confirmed to us by the Jean Monnet Action Technical Office who confirmed us that all the ongoing projects in Turkey fulfil the criteria established by the same JMA.

Inevitably the lack of support from the EU, or put it in the other way round, the fact that all has been done through direct and not coordinated initiative of the universities, has determined the double concentration we have indicated in the introduction and that comes out of our exploration. These spontaneous initiatives however have not created any harmful duplication among training and research centres, this means that there is not any need of rationalisation of the existing offer in the field of EU studies.

What actually has to be corrected in the near future is the double concentration. The expected diversification of demand will help this process, but specific tools have to be implemented.

European studies, at undergraduate or postgraduate level, are realised in 29 high education institutions out of a total of 76. One third of Turkish universities are thus concerned, although to different extents, with European studies. However the territorial concentration is huge, in fact out of these 29 universities 18 are located in Istanbul and Ankara.

Two factors can thus be considered at the root of the fact that two third of Turkish universities are not yet concerned with European studies:

- a) small number of academicians with a specific preparation and knowledge in the field;
- b) financial constraints

The removal of the second being a basic condition for the elimination of the first.

Data concerning the enrolment of students in MA and Ph.D. programs indicate that the demand for such a type specialisation is growing. Besides, as the experience of the Bogazici University Centre for European Studies or that of ABEG, tell us, there is a growing interest among the young generation, all over the Country, on the European issues and a growing consciousness of the benefits of the membership to the EU. Another indicator of the interest of young generation in EU affairs is the number of students going to Eu member Countries in order to study at postgraduate level: a yearly flow of about 200 of which 80-100 through the Jean Monnet Scholarship Programme.

This interest of the students in EU affairs indicates also that shouldn't be difficult for universities to find young researchers and scholars in order to form a new generation of academicians dedicated to European studies.

Another characteristic is that the low level of cooperation and interaction among the university centres dedicated to European studies.

The main reasons for this can be indicated as follow:

- a) financial constraints,
- b) lack of a clear perceptions of the potential benefits of the cooperation;
- c) lack of specific programmes for the formation of networks.

As for the offer of courses on EU issues is concerned, the review of the activities carried out indicates both the presence of the classic type of Master in EU studies (interdisciplinary: politics, political history, law, economics) and that of specialised MA courses as in Law, Economics or International Relations.

However we can notice the lack of MA or training courses with specialisation in a particular policy (agriculture, regional, enterprise and so on). As we have seen before the only existing training courses are those of Ankara University and Middle East Technical University, realised to train the public officers.

The main reasons for this can be indicated as follows:

- a) lack of adequate demand and job opportunities;
- b) rigidity of the system to face the changing demand (starting of new MA requiring a long procedure);
- c) insufficient number of academicians and experts in specific fields (agriculture, regional policy, and so on);
- d) financial constraints;

Concerning the quality of EU studies, one of the members of the working group observed:

“Many of the graduate programmes offer a long list of courses, however it should be noted that these course are elective and are not all available simultaneously. With the exception of the two ‘classic’ institutions, one in Ankara and one in Istanbul, I am not sure that current academic resources and experience is at a level to offer serious PhD programs. Furthermore, weakness in the area of law, again with the exception of the two ‘classic’ institutions, needed to be mentioned or at least hinted at...Lastly the research expertise behind many of the programmes remains weak...”

Prospect for membership, in case of starting of the negotiations, will make more evident the need for specialised courses and consequently that of adapting the offer to the changing demand. Also to this end in part three the appropriate tools will be presented.

The need of these specialized courses has been indicated by many of the interviewed persons. In particular to prepare those who will be implied, directly and indirectly, in the negotiation process, those who will work in the European institutions, those who at central or local administrative level will deal with specific policies (e.g. agricultural or regional policies), those who in the public or private sector will have to prepare projects to be submitted for financing from Commission's programmes and so on.

This objective need and demand for specialised training courses on EU matters indicate also the opportunity of wider cooperation between Universities on the one side and NGOs, Foundations and Chambers of Commerce on the other side.

Specific programmes opened to this cooperation could greatly facilitate the implementation of specialised training courses.

Although Turkey only since 2001 is eligible for the Jean Monnet Action, an important and increasing role, as we have seen, is played by this Commission's Programme (Secretariat General for Training and Culture), in the diffusion and reinforcement of European studies in Turkey. JM chairs and other JM programmes are mainly concentrated in the leading institutions. Their role, up to now, has been that of reinforcing the existing activities in the beneficiary universities. In these years the JM Action could play an important role, as it has done in the past for member States and also for candidate States, in the diffusion of EU Studies to those Turkish universities who are not yet concerned with this field of studies.

#### *Proposals for new actions in EU studies.*

In this section we will explore three basic options for energizing European studies in Turkey, namely:

- Launching or supporting of short courses for specific needs in existing institutions;
- Creating networks of Turkish academic institutions and academics in the field of European studies;
- Creating a new specialised university.

### *Short Term Courses For Specific Needs*

The effect of the starting of the negotiations will be the necessity to train those who directly or indirectly will be involved in such a process. As we assessed and described in Part II of this Report, these needs are limited to negotiators, intended as the whole team in charge of this process, but also for the public servants involved in implementation of the EU norms.

There is a strong awareness in the Country of the lack of officers and specialists with the knowledge adequate to this threat. Besides it is obvious, considering the short period of time before the starting of the negotiations, but also the expected length of the negotiation period, that the training activities will have to start at the beginning of the next year and involve a huge number of public officers.

To cope with such a necessity the appropriate tool has to be utilised.

This instrument corresponds to the one indicated as option one: launching or supporting of new short-term courses.

These courses will have to be implemented directly by the MFA, in the form we will explain.

#### *Academic Aspects*

From an academic point of view this instrument should be modulated on two levels:

- Level one, training of a first generation public officers who will act, in a second time, as trainers;
- Level two, training of a second generation.

#### *Level One*

The training of the first generation of negotiators has to cope with two necessities:

- First: endowing the Country with a pool of experts with the capabilities to deal at best with the 31 chapters of the negotiation process and implementation of EU norms;
- Second: training of trainers, to endow the Country with experts having the knowledge and the experience to train the second generation.

This training will have to be based on intensive and specialised courses for officers of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, of the Secretariat General for European Union and of the other Ministries and institutions that will be involved in the negotiations and in the implementation processes. In principle these courses should be realised for each one of the 31 chapters, in practice could be studied the possibility to merge two or more

chapters together. In this respect it can also be argued that because of the Custom Union, Turkey has already implemented an important part of the “*acquis communautaire*” concerning the Single market and the Competition policy. A fact making easier the preparation of negotiators in these particular sectors.

Each course should envisage the participation of one or two core lecturers who will be responsible for most of the lectures of the course concerned and practitioners (diplomats, but also businessman, bankers etc.) in different branches who will deliver specialised seminars. Core lecturers should be chosen among academicians, both national and foreign, with outstanding experience in the relevant field of European studies. Experts should be invited from European Institutions, from public administration institutions of new member States, from Turkish diplomatic corps and also from member States. Courses should be not of about 35-40 hours over two weeks. At the end of each course participants should prepare a short paper to be evaluated by the core lecturers. This would allow the selection of those who will have to act as trainers for the second generation of negotiators. For those who are chosen follow-up course will be organized to train them in teaching methodologies.

With the main task to define the content of the various courses and to choose the lecturers and to monitor the performance of the various training courses a Scientific Committee (SC) should be set up.

The SC will be composed by seven members: 4 representatives of the Turkish academic world related with European studies, 1 representative of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and 1 of the Secretariat General for European Union. Besides a representative of the European Commission should participate as observer to the meetings of the SC. The SC will adopt its own internal regulation.

*The main tasks of the SC can thus be indicated:*

- Defining the contents and duration of the training courses, on the basis of the information provided by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs;
- Prepare a list of preliminary readings to each course, compulsive for the participants.
  - Chose the teachers;
  - Establish the calendar of the different courses;
  - Indicate the site and institution where these courses will take place;
  - Star the necessary arrangements for the practical realisation of these courses;
  - Assure the coordination between these new courses and the already existing ones (see ATAUM and METU certificate courses) in order to avoid duplications.

As for the location, courses could be realised using the facilities of some of the existing public or private universities. Our suggestion is to realise them far from the working place of the participants. This for obvious reasons.



### *Level Two*

The training courses should be organised by the different Ministries both at central and local level. With this purpose an *ad hoc* working group should be set up in each Ministry. For the definition of the content of the various courses the working group should take into consideration the experience of the courses realised at Level one.

The structure of these courses should also be modulated on the experience of Level one.

### *Networking Programme*

As in the case of Option 1, the networking programme has been widely discussed in our meetings. Consequently our proposal is according to the views and needs of the academics concerned with European studies. On this point we obtained also positive comments from the EUSG and from all the scholars participating in the working group.

The Turkish academics strongly believe that it is necessary to create a new programme, notwithstanding the existing ones like Erasmus, Leonardo, JMA, or even Tempus III. Actually also in the case of candidates Countries, we have seen the implementation, almost simultaneously, of different tools: Erasmus, Leonardo, JMA, Tempus I and II. It is true that the present Tempus III is opened to Turkey on a co-financing basis, but there is the serious doubt that this will be sufficient to energize EU studies in Turkey. Adding a specific tool to the existing ones will put Turkey in line with what has been done for the other candidate Countries, but even in this case with a non indifferent temporal lag.

Relying on the existing tool will not cope absolutely with the double concentration emerged out of our analysis.

Our proposal deals with the launching of a programme for the creation of networks of Turkish academic institutions and academics in the field of European studies. These networks have to be intended considered, as in the programmes we quoted, as an agreement among universities finalised to the realisation of a specific project.

According to project cycle analysis and to logical framework approach, we identified for this programme two general objectives:

- Strengthening of what is already existing in Turkish universities, as we have seen in the previous section;
- Creating a new activity in those universities, and as we have seen, they represent the two thirds of Turkish universities, who still do not have yet any course or programme in European studies.

Since the beginning of the nineties the European Commission has launched various networking programmes with third Countries and candidate States, implying the participation of EU member States universities. Med Campus, Alfa, Alban, Asia-Link and of course Tempus I, II, and III, already mentioned, are examples of these activities. The basic principle of these programmes, is that of setting up a network among universities of the beneficiary States and those of EU members states to set up and realise a determined education or training or research or institutional project. Generally these programmes have a duration of three years, in some cases a phasing out period of one or two years foreseen.

As we have already seen EU studies in candidate Countries have been highly supported by Tempus I and II.

Hereafter we indicate the main features of this networking programme, we shall call it TEUNET.

#### *Academic aspects*

Duration: five years. Each project duration will be of tree years plus the possibility to obtain a phasing out period of one or two years.

Eligible country: Turkey

Aims: To promote European studies in Turkish universities, both public and private. More specifically TEUNET is intended to energize in the higher education system of Turkey, the sound development of European studies, training and research by addressing:

1. issues relating to the development of curricula in the area of EU studies;
2. issues relating to the support of research activities of the higher education institutions,
3. the development of training leading to qualifications with a view of making good the shortage of high-level academic qualifications and skills needed by Turkey in order to face the increase and differentiation of EU studies demand and needs;
4. Development of life long education in collaboration with university related NGOs.

TEUNET will associate at least four universities from Turkey and two universities in EU member or candidate Countries (intended as Romania and Bulgaria). This should be the suggested dimension, at least from the Turkish site, as is functional to reach the objectives of the Programme.

The specific activities that shall take place in TUNET will be indicated in the financial proposal and in the applicant's guidelines.

However the main contents of these four points can be indicated in the following way:

Universities participating in the network will be asked to submit for the chosen activity detailed programmes, indicating the objectives, expected results, activities and related costs.

*Point 1:* Strengthening of the existing undergraduate or postgraduate programmes or setting up of new undergraduate or postgraduate programmes. Development of curricula will concern also the strengthening or starting of new courses on EU issues in faculties out of social sciences, like for instance Engineering, Agriculture and Environment where specialised courses on EU policies could be set up.

*Point 2.* Research networks could be set up, specifically to support young researchers.

*Point 3.* Training for academics, especially for young researchers, will consist in intensive courses to be realised within the network. These training courses will be mainly addressed to the teaching staff of the Turkish universities who still have not developed EU studies.

*Point 4.* Universities will collaborate with NGOs to prepare programmes related with life long education for the general public.

Concerning networks we consider that in principle universities will have to be free to choose their partners. However considering the concentration we observed in Part 1, suggestions could be indicated, in the sense that priority will be given to networks including on the Turkish side universities who have already developed EU studies with universities lacking such a specialisation.

### *New Specialised University<sup>2</sup>*

The core studies and research activities of the new institution should of course be EU matters, but we believe that this institution for the peculiarities of the region in which it is located could play a wider role. This means that its teaching and research activities should also cover the broader field

of intercultural relation and dialogue between the EU and the region, in the form that we will propose here.

---

<sup>2</sup> For a previous and wider presentation of this part of the Report see: Angelo Santagostino, *A Magna Europe for Solidarity Between Civilizations. Programme, Project and Symbol*, Marmara Journal of European Studies, Vol.12. 2004.

Among the various comments we received we want to recall the opinion of EUSG, as it represents the common view of the academicians we interviewed.

“Creating a new specialised university is the most important pillar of this project and deserves special attention. Such a university should share the peculiarities and characteristics of the existing ones but should not be a copy of them. In this sense, a University of Europe, designed mainly for EU studies and researches but also covering the broad field of intercultural characteristics of this region, is a good starting point. Moreover, making this university an institution for researchers coming from different neighbours’ of Turkey will make it definitely unique, as it will reflect the “wider Europe” concept in a real sense. However, such a university should have an organic link not only with the universities in the member states and other candidate countries but also with the EU institutions”.

The new institutions will have to play a specific role within the EU and within the region. A role deriving from the fact that Turkey in all its history, has acted as a bridge between East and West and that has been the site of the four different civilisations, Greek, Latin, Christian, Byzantine and finally Ottoman – Muslim, which have shaped most of the world.

For these very reasons we think that this new institution will have to be opened to the students, professors and researchers not only from EU member and candidate States, but also from the neighbours of Turkey: from Balkans, Middle East, Central Asia, Caucasus, most of which, besides, are part of the “Wider Europe” concept (see Communication from the Commission to the Council and the European Parliament. “Wider Europe – Neighbourhood: A new Framework for Relations with our Eastern and Southern Neighbours” [COM (2003) 104 final].

This document stresses (page 12) the basic “importance of dialogue between civilisations and free exchange of ideas between cultures, religions, traditions..”.

The new institution should be also a pole for attracting the Turkish Diaspora.

We will present the characteristic of this new institution in academic, legal and financial terms.

#### *Academic Aspects*

From an academic point of view the new institution will have to be devoted both to teaching and research.

Teaching activities will have to be concentrated at the *postgraduate* and high level. Life long training.

Postgraduate studies will have to lead to MA (optional, as we will explain) and post-doctorate. For this purpose, and for the purpose of the research, four different

departments will have to be created: “History, Cultures and Civilisations”, “EU Enterprise and Entrepreneurship”, “Political Science” and “EU Law”.

Concerning life long education we consider that, especially in the first years of activity, this new institution should concentrate on implementing two-weeks courses focused on the needs of negotiation and implementation.

These activities will have to be strictly coordinated with the ones of option 1.

*Department of History Cultures and Civilisations (DHC)*

The DHC will be offering studies and research activities related with the history of the civilisations and cultures more influential in shaping today’s Europe and more relevant in the political and economic issues that Europe and the region is presently facing, namely European and Islamic.

The DHC will have to act like a forum in which professors and researchers will have the possibility to discuss new approaches and new interpretations of the history of these two civilisations. The study of unity and diversity of cultures and civilisations will have to be a major matter of reflection and discussion.

The purpose of such an approach will have that of creating a deeper understanding among people belonging to these different civilisations and religions. Intercultural dialogue will have to be the path for creating mentalities with a strong propensity to find solutions to political problems through negotiations and mutual understanding.

For this very reason we think that courses on history of civilisations and on their mutual relations will have to be included in the teaching programme of anyone of the doctoral programmes realised in the new institution. Also the history of the European Integration will have to be a part of the teaching programme of anyone of the doctoral programmes realised in the new institution

Postgraduate study and research activities will be structured as a three-year PhD programme, while in the fourth year the students will complete their thesis.

At the end of the first year of the PhD programme, students will have the possibility to apply for an MA. In this case those who have decided to use this possibility will be required to submit a thesis.

Besides doctoral, considering its aims, the DHC will also have to act as a forum where historians, political scientists, including politicians, will have to discuss the issues concerned with the dialogue and cooperation among civilisations.

The DHC will have its own teaching and research staff, visiting professors and people from the political life will be invited for courses, seminars and conferences.

*Department of EU Enterprise and Entrepreneurship (DEE)*

The need of this type of high level formation derives directly from one of the most challenging ongoing processes within the EU policies: the Lisbon process, giving great emphasis to investments in human capital as a key for increasing the competitiveness of European industry.

Europe needs to foster entrepreneurial drive more effectively. It needs more new and thriving firms willing to reap the benefits of market opening and to embark on creative or innovative ventures for commercial exploitation on a larger scale.

For 2010, as recognised by the Lisbon Council, the European Union aims “to become the most competitive and dynamic knowledge-based economy in the world, capable of sustainable economic growth with more and better jobs and greater social cohesion”.

Entrepreneurship has a central role to play in this and enterprise has been identified as a key factor for productivity and growth.

The DEE will aim to provide its students with course-based training in the areas of economics, innovation economics, industrial policies, entrepreneurship, competition policies, and commercial policies. All these issues will have to be taught both at theoretical and applied level.

For what we said above the history of Eurasian civilisations and the History of the European Construction will have to be part of the teaching programme.

The level will be the one needed in to pursue successful both academic career and professional career in the private enterprise sector.

The DEE will also provide guidance in research and will advise students for the preparation of their thesis.

Study and research activities will be structured as a three-year PhD programme, while in the fourth year the students will complete their thesis. At the end of the first year students will have the possibility to apply for an MA, in this case they will be required to submit a thesis.

Concerning life long higher education the DEE will offer seminars, follow-up seminars, workshops and conferences on issues related with its field of teaching and research. These activities will be targeted to businessmen, managers and officials of enterprise associations. Also public officers from ministries of industry and commerce could be a target group.

The DEE will have its own teaching and research staff. Visiting professors and high level managers and entrepreneurs will be invited for specific courses or seminars.

*Department of Political Science (DPS)*

The aims of DPS will have to be that of developing studies and research in comparative politics, centred on the relation between Europe and its eastern neighbour, in particular Middle East, Central Asia, Caucasus and Russia. This will allow a deeper knowledge of the changes occurring in those areas, posing consequently the bases for a better understanding of the political processes that are presently characterising that area.

Focus should be posed on the relations between EU and the area mentioned above.

The enforcement of the concept of “Wider Europe” and its correlated principle of “sharing everything but institutions” will call for a strong deepening of the political dialogue. Work should focus on democratisation processes, political parties, human and minority rights, migration, relations between political powers and religious powers, decentralisation, justice and so on. Institutional building should also receive attention, in particular concerning the issues for the evolution and modernization of the public administration both central and local levels. Issues like Confidence building, crisis management and peacekeeping measures should also be studied.

The DSP should also provide an understanding of the European governance, including the institutional architecture and its evolution. This will imply the discussion of the political theories and doctrines that underline the European integration process.

The level should be the one needed to form public officers with a full capacity in dealing with EU affairs.

The DPS will provide guidance in research and will advise students for the preparation of their thesis.

For what we said above the history of Eurasian civilisations and the History of the European Construction will have to be part of the teaching programme.

Study and research activities will be structured as a three-year PhD programme, while in the fourth year the students will complete their thesis. At the end of the first year students will have the possibility to apply for an MA, in this case they will be required to submit a thesis.

For life long higher-level education, the DPS will run seminars, follow up seminars, workshops and conferences. The target group should be public officers, diplomats and also members of the parliament.

The DPS will have its own teaching and research staff. Visiting professors and high-level public officers and politicians will be invited for specific courses or seminars.

*Department of EU Law (DEL)*

Like the three other department, DEL will offer a programme leading to the doctorate in EU Law.

The curricula should cover the standard issues of an EU Law postgraduate course (including, for instance, Property Rights and Competition Law), but putting emphasis on the legal aspects of the EU international relations. Also a subject like International Law of Economics, focused on the EU case, should be part of the curricula.

For what we said above the history of Eurasian civilisations and the History of the European Construction will have to be part of the teaching programme.

Study and research activities will be structured as a three-year PhD programme, while in the fourth year the students will complete their thesis. At the end of the first year students will have the possibility to apply for an LLM, in this case they will be required to submit a thesis.

As for long life education the DEL will run seminars, follow up seminars, workshops and conferences. The target group should be lawyers, businessman, public officers, diplomats and also member of parliaments.

Some regrets and auspices ...two years later.

In writing this report we worked under the assumption that accession negotiations would start in 2005. Actually Turkey is now a negotiating candidate Country. This implies that the need to strengthen European studies is now much stronger than two years ago.

Unfortunately I have to underline the fact that most of the proposition effort of the Report has been lost, or rather, not yet implemented.

In these last two years, new Jean Monnet chairs and poles of excellence have been created, and this is without doubt a very positive thing and, up to a certain point, can be considered an effect of Turkey's status as negotiating candidate country. I can also say the same for the Erasmus programme. Many Turkish students are now attending EU's universities and the same is true for EU's students in Turkish universities.

However these two important developments are not related to the proposal advanced in the report. In particular I regret that nothing, has yet been done to set-up the new institution. I firmly believe that presently, the increasing need to strengthen and improve relations between Western and Muslim civilisations, calls for the actions of such institutions.

The Turkish academic world has repeatedly demonstrated interest in such an institution. What has been lacking until now is the political will to realize this project.

I can only conclude this paper by expressing the wish that the Turkish political class and those of the 27 member States and the European institutions will set-up the appropriate actions to transform this proposal into reality in the near future.