Türkiye'deki Çağrı Merkezi Hizmetleri Bölümlerinin Müfredat Analizi

Hıdır Polat [a, b], Murat Seyfi [c]

Özet

Küreselleşme ve iletişim teknolojilerindeki gelişmeler ile birlikte Çağrı Hizmetleri sektörünün birçok yeni ihtiyacı ve beklentisi ortaya çıkmaktadır. Bu beklentilere cevap verebilmek için eğitim müfredatlarının incelenmesi ve yenilikçi uygulamaların sektöre transfer edilmesi oldukça önemlidir. Bu kapsamda çalışmanın amacı; Türkiye'de bulunan üniversitelerdeki Çağrı Merkezi Bölümlerinin sektörün bireylerde aradığı nitelikleri sağlamaları hususunda hangi alan derslerine ağırlık vermeleri gerektiğini ortaya çıkararak, çağrı merkezi hizmetleri programı müfredatlarını analiz etmektir. Türkiye'de "Çağrı Merkezi Hizmetleri Programı" bulunan 24 üniversiteden, müfredatlarına ulaşılabilen 19 üniversite, belirlenen alan derslerinin bulunma ve bulunmama durumlarına göre incelenmiştir. Araştırma kapsamında nicel araştırma metotlarından "tarama yöntemi - anlık tarama yöntemi" kullanılarak, elde edilen veriler Sosyal Bilimler İçin İstatistik Programında analiz edilmiştir. Verilerin değerlendirilmesi aşamasında ise, frekans (f) yüzde (%) tanımlayıcı istatistik yöntemi kullanılmıştır. Elde edilen sonuçlar neticesinde çağrı merkezi program müfredatları ile sektörel beklentiler arasındaki ilişkilerde tutarsızlıklar olduğu gözlemlenmiştir. Bu gözlem neticesinde eğitim kademesinin sektörel beklentileri karşılayacak nitelikleri öğrencilere kazandırma noktasında yetersiz kaldıkları söylenebilir.

A Curriculum Analysis of Call Center Services Departments in Turkey

Abstract

With globalization and developments in communication technologies, there are newly-arising needs and expectations from the sector of Call Services. In order to meet these expectations, it is vital to analyze the education curriculums and to transfer innovative practices to the sector. Within this framework, the aim of this study is to analyze the curriculums of Departments of Call Center Services in universities located in Turkey by revealing the courses which the universities need to focus on in order to provide the qualified individuals demanded by the sector. 19 universities whose curriculums are obtained among 24 universities in Turkey which have "The Program of Call Center Services" are analyzed to the extent whether they have the identified field courses in their curriculums. "Survey Research" which is a method for both quantitative and qualitative research is used within the framework of the study and the acquired data is analyzed via Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS). Descriptive statistics methods of frequency (f) and percentage (%) are used in the phase of data evaluation. As a consequence of the acquired results, it is observed that there are inconsistencies in relationships between the curriculums of the programs of call center and sectoral expectations. It can be said, as a result of this observation, that the education level is inadequate in terms of providing qualifications which will meet the sectoral expectations to the students.

[a] İletişim Yazarı: hidir.polat@gop.edu.tr
[b] Oğr. Gör., Tokat Gaziosmanpaşa Üniversitesi Artova MYO, Çağrı Hizmetleri Hizmetleri Programı ORCID: 0000-0002-7839-4666
[c] Doç. Dr., Tokat Gaziosmanpaşa Üniversitesi, NUBYO, Halkla İlişkiler ve Reklamcılık Bölümü, ORCID: 0000-0002-7188-235X

Intdroduction

The factors such as globalization, increasing competitive environment, and influences of new media make businesses adapt to the changing circumstances. Okay and Okay (2012:198) emphasize that it is necessary that the businesses need to be restructured by the end of the 21. century according to their inner and outer audiences. As is understood from this expression, what is valuable in today's competitive environment are the customers, not the businesses. All these developments and changes make customers focal point of businesses. Therefore, the businesses consider ensuring customer loyalty as their first target (Odabaşı, 2015: 35). Call centers are the entities which help businesses to get close to this target in today's competitive environment.

Call centers are the units in which businesses frequently get in contact with their customers. Call centers play a pivotal role in creating a customer loyalty by answering calls from the customers with their qualified staff. Businesses both provide themselves a competitive advantage and improve their products by providing pre-sale and post-sale services via their call centers. For this reason, call centers are acknowledged as the most important channels for businesses to get in contact with their customers (Yavuz and Leloğlu, 2011: 13). According to the "2016 Data of Turkish Call Center Market" of Call Center Association of Turkey, the share of the sector of call center in Turkey is 1.3 billion dollars and the number of employees is 85.000. It is anticipated that these figures will increase in 2017 (Tarakçı, 2017). These statistics demonstrate that call centers are vital for businesses in today's competitive environment. Call centers, which are highly important for businesses, need qualified labor force as do other businesses. In order to fill this gap, there are vocational schools of higher education and colleges as coordinated institutions of higher education in Turkey. There are a total of 24 universities whose vocational schools of higher education have the department of "Call Center Services" in order to satisfy this need in Turkey. Among these universities, 21 of them provide formal education, 2 of them provide open education and 1 of them provides distance education.

This article is built upon the question of "does the higher education institutions have adequate educational content which will satisfy the expectations of the sector of call center in relation to the qualifications of individuals who will work there?" The aim of this article is to help shape the programs of call centers in a way which will make students have the qualifications expected by the sector by revealing the field courses which the programs of call center need to focus on in order to provide the qualified individuals demanded by the sector.

This study is important in that it indicates the disconnection between the education of call center services and the expectations of the sector of call center and that it leads the way to elimination of this disconnection.

Call Center and the Importance of Sectoral Training

Call centers which are sometimes used synonymously with "help desk" or "communication center" are defined as private institutions in which customer representatives, integrated with telephones, provide direct communication service to their customers (Benner, 2006: 1027).

Taylor and Bain (1999:102) define call centers as a process in which the personnel answers inbound and outbound calls via computers and in which these calls are processed and controlled by Automatic Call Distributors (ACDs) or perceivable dialing system. While making this definition, they draw the attention to 3 elements. First one is that the call centers focus on customer services. The second one is that technologies of call centers are integrated with telephones and computers. The third one is that the calls are controlled by the system of Automatic Call Distribution (ACD).

Noraha and D'Cruz (2007: 255) also emphasize that the call centers are for customers, that they have a technological infrastructure consisting of computers and telephones and that they allow simultaneous communication between customer representatives and customers by transferring inbound calls to customer representatives efficiently. If we are to make a more technical definition of call centers, we can say that "Call centers are centers consisting of software (call center service softwares, call center endpoint softwares, call center reporting softwares etc.), hardware (central, computers, servers, gateway, media gateway telephones, operator headsets etc.) and qualified labor force and through which organizations and institutions communicate with other people and/or institutions with which they are in contact via various access methods (telephone, fax, e-mail, SMS, instant message etc.). Based upon the definitions made on this issue, one can define call centers as entities which make one of the inbound or outbound calls or both of them via telephone or computer technologies; which transfers complaints, suggestions and satisfaction of the customers to the organizations while communicating changes or innovations in the products or services of the organizations to the customers and which makes organizations have competitive advantage by acting as a bridge between the organizations and the customers (Seçkin and Ökten, 2009: 193-194). Therefore, call centers which were historically left behind or at back office at first have started to gradually become strategically important (Houlihan, 2001: 209). Call centers which emerged with the aim of transferring requests and complaints in the mid-1960s now appear as an ideal platform to communicate with customers and ensure customer satisfaction and play an important role in terms of institutional businesses. (Call Center Association of Turkey, 2017).

It is stated that factors like increasing competition with globalization, rapid developments in information and communication technologies, increase in the knowledge level of the customers and changing demands of the customers make organizations adapt to the changes. What businesses focus on in such a process is customer satisfaction and loyalty. It is frequently emphasized in the literature that call centers have pivotal roles in terms of businesses. (Keiningham et al. 2006; Aksin et al., 2007; Tuten & Neidermeyer, 2004)

In fact, call centers have started to have an important place in the field of finance, services, and telecommunication in today's world. Businesses answer the questions of their customers, offer solutions to their problems and sell their products via information and communication technologies. In such a process, businesses are arranged according to customer needs and the employees exert effort to flawlessly define customers and to serve them (Frenkel, Tam, Korczynski, and Shire: 1998: 957-958). For this reason, call centers make organizations have a competitive advantage by becoming their affiliation (Lam and Lau, 2004:481). Since businesses see call centers as an opportunity to establish long-term relations with their customers and to create a customer loyalty, call centers have a positive

contribution to the success of the businesses. (Piers and Ellway, 2014: 231). Feinberg et al. (2000:132) describe call centers, which are strategically important for businesses, as "a basic weapon" in terms of management of customer relations.

On the other hand, working with individuals who can adapt to the organization's cultural structure, values, and attitudes is as important as call centers in terms of organizations. In order to ensure this, pre-employment education systems should be arranged in a manner which will provide the skills that are expected from the employees by the employers (Belt and Richardson, 2004:258). The problem of qualified employees is not a problem which will be solely overcome by businesses. A majority of the university graduates today lack fundamental knowledge and skills like expressing their opinions in oral and written form and acting in a teamwork which are necessary for being an active member in an organizational structure (Drucker, 1999: 6). Therefore, the relationship between universities and sector is highly important within the context of vocational training in today's world. In order to provide the labor force that the sector needs, education levels (secondary education and vocation schools of higher education) carry out studies aimed at improving quality and increasing quantity (Öktem and Şahin, 2011: 2). Vocational training for a specific profession is provided by vocational schools of higher education and colleges under higher education in Turkey (Morkoç and Doğan, 2014: 113). Vocational schools of higher education make up an important step for the sector of call center in terms of providing qualified labor force. The Board of Higher Education of Turkey (1981) defines vocational schools of higher education as "an institution of higher education which aims to provide a qualified labor force for certain professions, which offers two years of education-training consisting of two or three semesters in a year and which confers undergraduate's degree." In brief, vocational schools of higher education can be defined as institutions which provide personnel to a certain profession who have the knowledge and skills that will satisfy the expectations of the sector (İçli, 2007: 264).

Similar to many other sectors, in the sector of call center what is important in the success of the business is the presence of qualified personnel. For the maintenance of call centers, employing the right personnel is as important as providing the necessary training for them to improve their work (Kişi, 2016: 147). Particularly with developments in communication technologies and the influence of globalization on the sectors, education programs of public relations and disciplines in relation to public relations have had to be improved constantly (Commission on Public Relations Education Professional Bond Report, 2006). When the planning of education curriculums on call centers around the world are analyzed, it can be seen that there are different practices in every country. The main reason for this is that call centers have a structure based on the service beyond being a mere communication device. Therefore, the focus in the Netherlands is to improve sectoral skills of people who get a bachelor's degree by providing them in-house training and training outside of the institution. Thus, call center education curriculums which constantly renew themselves and meet sectoral needs rather than a uniform curriculum should be created (Sieben and Jaarsveld, 2005, 45-50). In his research on training in call centers in Germany, Rowold carried out studies to determine the expectations of the employees from the training, employees' motivation for learning, their satisfaction from the training and the extent to which the training meet their vocational needs (Rowold, 2007, 30-32). According to the report of Global Call Center, call centers' works are based on the master-apprentice relationship in many

countries like Germany, Austria, the Netherlands, and Denmark. The number of countries developing and implementing training programs is very small. The length of such training, which is usually a certificate training, varies greatly from country to country. For instance, while such certificate training in Israel takes shorter than 3 weeks, it takes almost 25 weeks in Ireland and England. Due to these differences in training programs and sector's constant change and improvement, companies carry out supportive training during the working year by attaching importance to in-service training. Moreover, the fact that the number of part-time employees in the sector is too high is another issue to be addressed while preparing curriculums and in-service training. The percentage of people working part-time in call centers in Israel is 48%, this percentage is 46% in the Netherlands and in Spain, it is 44% (Holman et al. 2007, s.13-14). When the working conditions in call centers are considered, new methods and techniques should be found in the preparation of in-service training programs and their implementation. To do so, methods like positive investigation and well-attended action research which will discover the potential of people and reveal their experiences could be harmonized with education programs (Seyfi and Güven, 2015).

Provision of such education by vocational schools of higher education is critical for both the organizations and employees of the profession. In short, it can be said that the primary purpose of the vocational schools of higher education is to provide a labor force that can satisfy the expectations of the sector (Aksu, Baysal, and Baysal, 2015:2).

Qualifications That the Employees of Call Centers Should Have

There are two titles for the personnel that is or will be working in the sector of call center. The first one is "customer representative" and the second one is "team leader". Qualifications that people who have one of these titles should have were identified with the decision published in the Official Gazette of Turkey No. 28661 dated 5/29/2013 and were published under "National Vocational Standards" in 2013 by Vocational Competency Authority of Turkey (MYK).

"National vocational standards for Call Center Customer Representative and Call Center Team Leader (Level 5) are prepared by Call Center Association of Turkey designated by the MYK and in accordance with the provisions of 'Regulation on Preparation of National Vocational Standards' and of 'Regulation on Organization, Duty, Working Procedures and Principles of Sector Committees of the Vocational Competency Authority' which are published in accordance with the Law which is referred to as the Law for Vocational Competency Authority (MYK) No. 5544."

Qualifications That Call Center Customer Representative and Team Leaders Should Have

"National vocational standards for Call Center Customer Representative (Level 4) and Call Center Team Leader (Level 5) are evaluated by taking the opinions of related institutions and organizations in the sector and approved by the Board of Directors of MYK after they are examined by the MYK Sector Committee of Business and Management." (MYK, a2013:7, MYK b2013:7).

Within this framework, while call center representative is defined as the person who, according to the working instructions, carries out customers' requests in relation to information, operation, complaint and suggestions by taking customer satisfaction into consideration; who answers inbound calls and makes outbound calls for certain issues and who can manage any kind of calls in addition to being an expert in a certain type of services, team leader is defined as the person who manages the group of customer representatives that are in contact with current and potential customers; who carries out customers' requests in relation to information, operation, complaint and suggestions by taking customer satisfaction into consideration and who, within the framework of the identified standards, organizes and controls the group of customer representatives whom are related to the leader (MYK, a2013:8, MYK b2013:8).

The qualifications expected from call center customer representatives and team leaders according to the National Vocational Standards are as follows: Among the below-mentioned qualifications, the items numbered 14, 20, 23, 26 and 30 are only expected from team leaders. The rest are common qualifications expected from both customer representatives and team leaders.

Table 1: Qualifications expected from call center customer

1. Analytical thinking and the skill of making analysis	16. Knowledge of quality-control principles
2. Knowledge of devices, tools, and equipment	17. Knowledge in relation to vocational technological developments
3. Skills of researching and being creative	18. Knowledge of vocational terminology
4. Computer knowledge	19. The skill of learning and transferring the things learned
5. Knowledge of basic call center technologies and operational processes	20. The ability to act proactively
6. The skill of adapting to the changing circumstances	21. The ability to have a positive and patient approach
7. Correct diction and knowledge of phonetics	22. Knowledge of reporting
8. The skill of working in a team	23. The skill of guidance and giving feedback
9. The skill of team management	24. The skill of taking responsibility and initiative
10. Effective communication and the skill of	25. Knowledge of stress management

empathy	
11. Excellence in the ability to express	26. The skill of identifying training needs of the team
12. Excellence in the ability of persuasion	27. Knowledge of publicity and sales development
13. Knowledge of communication devices	28. Knowledge of basic labor legislation
14. The skill of target-oriented leadership*	29. Knowledge of basic occupational health and safety
15. Knowledge of office working principles	30. Knowledge of time management

Methodology

In this study, the curriculums of the programs of call center in higher education institutions in Turkey is compared with the qualifications expected from the individuals during the employment process in the sector. The study is carried out with Survey Research model since this model aims to describe the existing situation as it is. This model is studied with both quantitative and qualitative research methods. The Survey Research allows answering the questions such as "what, where, when, how often, at which level and how". Survey Research is defined as follows: Survey Research is a research approach which aims to describe a past or present phenomenon as it is. The phenomenon, individual or object questioned in the study is defined within the framework of its own existence and as it is. There is no effort to change or influence them in any way (Fraenkel & Wallen, 2006; Gorard, 2006; Wellington, 2006).

Sample

There are 24 universities in Turkey which have the program of call center and 21 of them provide formal education, 2 of them provide open education and 1 of them provides distance education. Among the universities that provide formal education, 19 universities whose curriculums are obtained makes up the sample of the study. Table 1 includes the list of universities included in the sample. In addition, elective courses in the curriculums of the programs of call center in the universities making up the sample of the study are excluded from the framework of the study since they might not be opened because of the majority of the demand from the students during course registration, and thus, the evaluations are carried out on the compulsory courses.

Table 2: Sample of Research

	Name of the University	Vocation School
1	AKDENİZ UNIVERSITY	Social Sciences
2	BİLECİK ŞEYH EDEBALİ UNIVERSITY	Pazaryeri
3	BİNGÖL UNIVERSITY	Bingöl Social Sciences
4	BİTLİS EREN UNIVERSITY	Social Sciences
5	ZONGULDAK BÜLENT ECEVİT UNIVERSITY	Çaycuma
6	DÜZCE UNIVERSITY	Social Sciences
7	ERZİNCAN UNIVERSITY	Kemah
8	GAZIANTEP UNIVERSITY	Nizip
9	GAZİOSMANPAŞA UNIVERSITY	Artova
10	GIRESUN UNIVERSITY	Dereli
11	KARADENIZ TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY	Beşikdüzü
12	KARAMANOĞLU MEHMETBEY UNIVERSITY	Kazım Karabekir
13	KIRKLARELİ UNIVERSITY	Babaeski
14	MEHMET AKİF ERSOY UNIVERSITY	Social Sciences
15	NEVŞEHİR HACI BEKTAŞ VELİ UNIVERSITY	Gülşehir
16	ONDOKUZ MAYIS UNIVERSITY	Çarşamba Ticaret Borsası
17	PAMUKKALE UNIVERSITY	Acıpayam
18	SELÇUK UNIVERSITY	Social Sciences
19	SÜLEYMAN DEMİREL UNIVERSITY	Gönen

Data Collection and Analysis

Data used in the study is acquired from the information packages prepared by the universities within the framework of Bologna Process. SPSS 15.0 is used in the analysis of the acquired data. Descriptive statistics methods of frequency (f) and percentage (%) are used in the phase of data evaluation. The contents of the courses in the curriculums of vocational schools of higher education are taken into consideration during the transfer of data to SPSS and compulsory courses in the curriculums are coded as present (1) or absent (2) according to the compliance with the identified lessons.

Findings

In light of the data acquired within the framework of the study, field courses which are planned to provide qualifications expected by the sector are identified in this part. Similarly, taking the qualifications into account, the presence and the absence of courses, which can

provide the identified qualifications, in the curriculums of the programs of call center in the universities included in the sample are assessed via frequency analysis, and the acquired data is included.

Identification of Courses Which are Thought to Provide Vocational Competencies to the Students of the Programs of Call Center

Within this context, the study tries to identify the courses in the curriculums of the programs of call center in higher education institutions in Turkey which might provide necessary qualifications to call center team leaders and customer representatives according to the national vocational standards. Regarding the identification of courses which will provide the qualifications expected from the students of the programs of call center in Vocational Schools of Higher Education, opinions of 3 experts who are lecturing in the programs of call center are received. Based on the experts' opinions, courses which are planned to provide qualifications in line with sectoral expectations from the students of the programs of call center in the higher education institutions in Turkey and which need to be compulsory within this framework are included in Table 2. The contents of the courses as well as expert opinions are taken into consideration in the process of identification of the courses in the table. In the contents of some of the courses, it is seen that the courses which need to be compulsory are lectured as weekly subjects (e.g. the course of "Team Management" is lectured as a subject in a certain week during the 14-week lecture process of the course of call center management.) Within this context, the expert assessments revealed the fact that lecturing a course, which will provide a qualification, in the content of another course for one or two weeks will be insufficient in terms of providing vocational competence. Within this framework, the common suggestion of the experts is that it is necessary to provide the identified courses as a compulsory field course for one or two semesters and that their contents should be arranged in a manner which will provide qualifications ensuring vocational competence.

Table 3: Classification of Courses Which are Planned to Provide Vocational Qualifications

Courses Which are Thought to Provide the Qualifications	Qualifications That Call Center Customer Representatives and Team Leaders Should Have
Call Center Management	• Knowledge of basic call center technologies and operational processes • Knowledge of vocational terminology
Call Center Technologies	• Knowledge of devices, tools, and equipment • Knowledge in relation to vocational technological developments
Communication and Human Relations	• The skill of adapting to the changing circumstances • Knowledge of communication devices

	• Effective communication and the skill of empathy
Information Technologies	• Computer knowledge
Team Work and Leadership	• The skill of working in a team • The skill of target-oriented leadership • The skill of guidance and giving feedback • The skill of identifying training needs of the team • The skill of managing a team • The ability to act proactively • The skill of taking responsibility and initiative
Vocational Working Principles and Quality Management	• Knowledge of office working principles • Knowledge of quality-control principles • Knowledge of basic labor legislation
Phonetics and Diction	• Excellence in the ability to express • Correct diction and knowledge of phonetics • The skill of learning and transferring the things learned
Stress and Conflict Management	• Knowledge of stress management • The ability to have a positive and patient approach
Techniques of Correspondence and Reporting	• Knowledge of reporting
Time Management	• Knowledge of time management
Persuasion and Methods of Persuasion	• Excellence in the ability of persuasion
Occupational Health and Safety	• Knowledge of basic occupational health and safety
Methods and Techniques of Research	• Analytical thinking and the skill of making analysis • Skills of researching and being creative
Marketing and Sales Management	• Knowledge of publicity and sales development

Since the attributions of students (characteristics, abilities, experiences, knowledge and skills etc.) will be the subject of another field of study, these are excluded from the framework of the study while making this classification. The identification of courses which are thought to provide the vocational competencies to the students is carried out in light of the opinions of the experts. It is thought that vocational knowledge and skills of students will improve as a result of planning and implementation of the related courses by taking the vocational competencies into account.

Distribution of Courses in the Universities

Within this scope, frequency analysis is carried out in relation to the distribution of courses in the curriculums of the Programs of Call Center in universities in Turkey by taking into account the qualifications which are expected from the personnel that will be employed in the sector of call center and which are identified in vocational competency standards. Table 3 includes the results of the frequency analysis.

Table 4: Distribution of Courses of the Programs of Call Center Services According to Universities

Courses	Status	f	%
Call Center Management	Present	17	89.5
	Absent	2	10.5
	Total	19	100
Call Center Technologies	Present	11	57.9
	Absent	8	42.1
	Total	19	100
Communication and Human Relations	Present	19	100
Information Technologies	Present	19	100
Team Work and Leadership	Present	2	10.5
	Absent	17	89.5
	Total	19	100
Vocational Working Principles and Quality Management	Present	7	36.8
	Absent	12	63.2
	Total	19	100
Phonetics and Diction	Present	14	73.7
	Absent	5	26.3
	Total	19	100
Stress and Conflict Management	Present	10	52.6
	Absent	9	47.4
	Total	19	100
Techniques of Correspondence and Reporting	Present	2	10.5
	Absent	17	89.5
	Total	19	100
Time Management	Present	3	15.8
	Absent	16	84.2
	Total	19	100
Persuasion and Methods of	Present	11	57.9

Persuasion	Absent	8	42.1
	Total	19	100
Occupational Health and Safety	Present	1	5.3
	Absent	18	94.7
	Total	19	100
Methods and Techniques of Research	Present	7	36.8
	Absent	12	63.2
	Total	19	100
Marketing and Sales Management	Present	18	94.7
	Absent	1	5.3
	Total	19	100

It is seen from Table 3 that the distribution of the identified field courses in the curriculums of the program of call center services in the universities making up the sample of the study is inconsistent. The courses of Communication and Human Relations, and Information Technologies are present in the curriculums of all of the universities. The courses of Marketing and Sales Management (present in 18 (94,7%) universities), Call Center Management (present in 17 (89,5%) universities) and Phonetics and Diction (present in 14 (73,7%) universities) are present in the curriculums of almost all of the universities. However, it is seen that many of the courses are absent in almost all of the universities. It is seen that the course of Occupational Health and Safety is absent in 18 (94,7%) universities, Time Management is absent in 16 (84,2%), Techniques of Correspondence and Reporting is absent in 17 (89,5%) and Team Work and Leadership is absent in 17 (89,5%) universities. When the presence of other courses is examined, it can be seen that the courses of Methods and Techniques of Research, and Vocational Working Principles and Quality Management are present in 7 (36,8%) universities and absent in 12 (63,2%) universities, the courses of Persuasion and Methods of Persuasion, and Call Center Technologies are, in contrast to the previous courses, present in 11 (57,9%) universities and absent in 8 (42,1%) universities, and the course of Stress and Conflict Management is present in 10 (52,6%) universities and absent in 9 (47,4%) universities.

Discussion

It is seen from the table of "Distribution of Courses of the Programs of Call Center Services According to Universities" that the course of "Communication and Human Relations" which is thought to provide "the skill of adaptation to changing circumstances, the knowledge of communication devices and the skills of effective communication and empathy" and the course of "Information Technologies" which is thought to provide "computer knowledge" are present in 19 (100%) universities.

There are two basic functions for businesses. The first one of them is production and the second one is the sales of these products. Which product is going to be produced and in which markets this product will be sold is the subject of marketing as well as the sale and post-sale processes (Tutar, 2015: 315). Within this scope, "the knowledge of publicity and sales development" is one of the skills expected from the individuals who will be working in the sector of call center. The course of "Marketing and Sales Management" which is thought to provide this skill is present in the curriculums of 19 (100%) universities. From this aspect,

it can be said that the programs of call center are adequate. It is clearly seen from Table 2 that while the knowledge of publicity and sales development is provided in all of the universities, the knowledge of effective persuasion methods, which is an important complementary in this process, is not provided with the same rate. Within this framework, it is seen that the course of "Persuasion and Methods of Persuasion" is present in 11 (57,9%) and absent in 8 (42,1%) universities. What needs to be taken into account is that the purpose of marketing is to bring the customers together with goods and services and sell them by way of various persuasion methods (Parıltı and Öztürk, 2002: 103-104). When considered from this perspective, it is seen that while a course is present in all of the universities, its complementary course is absent in the majority of the universities. In fact, this situation can be interpreted as an adverse effect that will reduce the efficiency of the education.

What is expected from the education process is that it provides necessary knowledge and skills to students required by the occupation (Zaif and Ayanoğlu, 2007: 117). There are contrasts in the distribution of the courses of "Call Center Management", "Call Center Technologies" and "Vocational Working Principles and Quality Management" which are planned to provide vocational knowledge and skills in relation to the occupation. It is planned to provide the knowledge of basic call center technologies and basic operational process and knowledge of vocational terminology to the students who will work in the sector of call center with the course of "Call Center Management". When the presence of this course in the universities is analyzed, it is seen that it is present in 17 (89,5%) universities. It is seen that this course is absent only in 2 (10,5%) universities. Thanks to the course of "Call Center Technologies" which is complementary for the aforementioned course, the students will be qualified in the recent technological developments in the call center sector in addition to having knowledge of devices and tools in call centers. At this point, Table 2 demonstrates the contrast in the distribution of these two courses. Although it is seen that the course is present in the majority of the universities - 11 (57,9%) - it is absent in a considerable number of universities - 8 (42,1%). Another contrast is in the distribution of the course of "Vocational Working Principles and Quality Management" which is planned to teach the working principles and principles of quality control and labor legislation to the students who will work in this sector. Table 2 shows that this course is present only in 7 (36,8%) universities and absent in 12 (63,2%) universities. To sum up, while taking courses that will provide adequate knowledge in relation to call center operation process, the students in the programs of call center in Turkey are receiving an education which lacks issues such as working principles of the sector, legal foundations and technological infrastructure of the sector, and the devices that are used.

Some qualifications which are not required in some occupations are vital for some other occupations. When it comes to call center services, excellent expression skills and diction are the ones that first come to mind. Even when job advertisements for this sector is analyzed, it is seen that there are expectations such as "smooth diction, excellence in speaking skills and fluently speaking". It is a must that the students who will work in the sector of call center have competency in this field (Aydın and Başoğlu, 2014: 35). Students need to receive a good education so that they can meet these criteria. When the distribution of the course of "Phonetics and Diction" which is thought to provide this competency is examined, it is seen that it is present in 14 (73,7%) universities. It is highly important that this course is given as a compulsory field course in the majority of the programs of call center so that the students can find a place for themselves in the work life.

The workers in the sector of call center face intense stress factors and occupational diseases. Workers in call centers are responsible for finding right solutions to the problems of people under time pressure. Busy calls under time pressure appear as a source of stress. In addition, pressure from customers to call center workers and assault to personal rights cause stress (Hernandez, Morris & Picard, 2011; Tuten & Neidermeyer, 2004). Stress cannot be defined as a concept which brings about adverse effects. It sometimes contributes to the working process by enabling a person to reveal his/her skills. A person needs to learn how to balance these positive and negative aspects of stress. An individual who learns to react to stress factors at a minimum level can also control the emergence of these factors. Considering the fact that the workers in call centers are facing intense stress factors, it can be said that stress management is vital. Therefore, the workers should be trained on the issue of stress. In this regard, when the presence of the course of "Stress and Conflict Management" in the programs of call center is analyzed, it is seen that it is present in 10 (52,6%) universities and absent in 9 (47,4%) universities. Considering the fact that the workers in call centers are facing intense stress factors, it is a sad fact that there is not adequate educational content in terms of dealing with stress and sources of stress in almost half of the universities making up the sample of the study. As mentioned above, one of the factors triggering stress is that the workers cannot cope with time pressure. Effective time management is expected from individuals who will work in the sector of call center. As Peter Drucker stated, "Time is the scarcest resource and unless it is managed nothing else can be managed." (Mackenzie, 1985: 14; quoted by Yılmaz and Aslan, 2002: 26). There are countless benefits of time management to both executives and workers. Individuals who manage their time effectively carry out effective works in short periods of time. Organizations of today's competitive environment make efficient time management an obligation. Organizations which want to be successful in the competitive environment have to know the value of time and have to effectively manage it (Stevenson & Hojati 2007; Rich & Hines, 1997). As it is emphasized constantly in the study, this qualification can be provided to students via education. Within this framework, when the programs of call center are examined, it is seen that the course of "Time Management" is absent in 16 (84,2%) universities.

The workers are expected to have knowledge in the issue of Occupation Health and Safety (OHS) so that they can protect themselves from occupational diseases and work accidents. OHS is a concept whose importance has increased with the industrialization. In fact, with industrialization, factors such as "complexity of production processes, changes in working conditions, difficulty faced by workers in adaptation to working conditions, company's increase in production pace to increase profits and productivity in the competitive environment" lead to work accidents and occupational diseases (İşler, 2013:1). Protection of workers from negative factors like work accidents and occupational diseases, and providing them a comfortable and safe working environment can be ensured by training them in the issue of occupational health and safety (www.isgdersi.com, 2017). Providing such an important knowledge to workers can be ensured by training them prior to the work life. Hence, it is a must that the course of "Occupational Health and Safety", which will provide knowledge to students on this issue, is included in the curriculums of the programs of call center. However, when the distribution of the course of OHS is examined, it is seen that this course is absent in 18 (94,7%) universities. It is an obligatory course only in one university. This situation makes the students of the programs of call centers services who will work in

the sector of call center vulnerable to work accidents and occupational diseases during the working process.

Furthermore, the workers are expected to have some qualifications according to their working position (as a team leader or customer representative) such as "the skill of working in a team, the skill of target-oriented leadership, the skill of guidance and giving feedback, the skill of identifying training needs of the team, the skill of team management, the ability of acting proactively and the skill of taking responsibility and initiative". "Teamwork lays the foundation for the idea of working to have a competitive advantage and ensure customer satisfaction for the businesses." (Frankel, Gardner, Maynard & Kelly 2007; Leonard, Graham & Bonacum, 2004). Teamwork allows individuals to develop management skills as well as developing the skills of discussion, reconciliation, persuasion and communication (Genç and Eryaman, 2008:100). The study carried out by Kocabaş and Gökbaş (2003: 100) on teamwork demonstrated that teamwork increases quality in training and in-group motivation and facilitates works. Every worker will take part in a team in the working environment and carry out specific tasks. Students should be trained on how to act in a team and the principles of teamwork prior to their work life. When the programs of call center analyzed, it is seen that the course of "Team Work and Leadership" is absent in 17 (89,5%) universities and it is present only in 2 (10,5%) universities. Each worker who will work in the sector of call center will work in specific groups with a common purpose. Under such circumstances, individuals should be trained prior to their working life so that they are prone to a teamwork. When the whole situation is examined, it is seen that the students of the programs of call center are deprived of such training.

In the call centers they work, the workers of call center report complaints, suggestions, and satisfaction of customers as a result of the call they make as well as answering inbound and making outbound calls. Thus, the individuals who will work in call centers are expected to carry out such tasks. This competency can be provided to students prior to their working life with the course of "Techniques of Correspondence and Reporting". However, when Table 2 is analyzed, the course of "Techniques of Correspondence and Reporting" is present only in 2 (10,5%) universities and absent in 17 (89,5%) universities. The knowledge of reporting is vital in the sector of call center.

One of the main purposes of education is revealing the inquisitive and creative character of students and making them individuals who are coming up with solutions to problems. Within this framework, the researches carried out demonstrate that the individuals who do not have such characteristics have difficulty in overcoming problems. These problems are seen in every level of education from primary school to university. Therefore, the skills of research, production, and use of information should be provided to students (Güneş, 2012: 128-130). These qualifications are also expected from the individuals who will work in the sector of call center. The course which is planned to provide these qualifications to the students of the programs of call center is "Methods and Techniques of Research". When Table 2 is analyzed, it is seen that this course is present only in 7 (36,8%) universities and absent in 12 (63,2%) universities. The expectation of the sector of call center from the individuals is that they have an inquisitive character and are able to come up with analytical solutions to problems. Individuals who do not have these qualifications cannot find a place in the sector for long terms.

Conclusion

Call centers are entities that are vital for businesses in terms of having a competitive advantage in today's world. Call centers act as a bridge between businesses and customers.

Today, call centers are first communication channels for customers.
Businesses that ensure customer loyalty with pre-sale, post-sale and on-the-sale customer support make a big stride in terms of reaching profitable long-term goals by producing goods and services and bringing them together with customers. Call centers appear within this context. Similar to the rest of the world, call centers which appear as a sector of services whose market share is increasing day by day in Turkey provide employment opportunity for thousands. Therefore, call centers have some specific expectations from the individuals who will be employed by these call centers. As in the other sectors, the shortage of qualified labor force is a known problem in the sector of call center.

The individuals who will be working in the sector of call center must have some qualifications. Institutions in Turkey that will provide vocational competencies in education levels are schools of higher education and vocation schools of higher education. In fact, there are a total 24 universities that have "The Program of Call Center Services" in various vocational schools of higher education. A solution should be found to the qualified labor force problem of the sector via these programs. From this point of view, the research carried out demonstrated that the educational content does not seem to be hopeful with regard to the solution to this problem. There is a disconnection between the qualifications that the individuals who will work in the sector of call center should have and education curriculums of the programs of call center in the universities. There are contrasts not only between the sector and the education curriculums of the programs but also among the courses within themselves.

While education on fundamental issues like communication, marketing, and computer knowledge is provided in all of the universities, it is seen that different courses which are complementary to these courses are not included in the curriculums with the same rate. For example, the individuals are expected to know operational processes of call centers and to have command over vocational terminology. While this knowledge is provided in all of the universities, it is seen that there is not education with the same rate on the issues such as devices and tools used in the sector of call center and technological infrastructure, technological development and expectations. This basic contrast leaves unanswered questions in the education process of qualified students that will meet the expectations of the sector.

To sum up, the programs of call center services in the universities of Turkey do not have adequate educational content in terms of providing vocational competencies to the students. A harmonization between the sector and the education should be realized by rearranging the educational contents.

References

Aksin, Z., Armony, M., & Mehrotra, V. (2007). The modern call center: A multi-disciplinary perspective on operations management research. *Production and Operations Management*, 16(6), 665-688.

Aksu, G., Baysal, İ. A., & Baysal, G. (2015). Sektörün Meslek Yüksekokullarından Beklentileri Üzerine Nitel Bir Araştırma. *Elektronik Mesleki Gelişim ve Araştırma Dergisi*, 1-12.

Aydın, E., & Başoğlu, N. (2014). Çağrı Merkezi Hizmetleri Programı Öğrencilerinin Konuşma Becerileri Özyeterlik Algıları: Çaycuma Meslek Yüksekokulu Örneği. *Elektronik Mesleki Gelişim ve Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 33-43.

Belt, V., & Richardson, R. (2004). Social Labour, Employability and Social Exclusion:Pre-employment Training for Call Centre Work. *Urban Studies*, 257-270.

Benner, C. (2006). South Africa On-call: Information Technology and Labour. *Regional Studies*, 1025-1040.

Commission on Public Relations Education. (2006). Public relations education for the 21st century – The professional bond. New York: Public Relations Society of America.
Derneği, Ç. M. (21/07/2017). *Çağrı Merkezi Nedir?* http://www.cagrimerkezleridernegi.org/cagri-merkezi-nedir adresinden alındı

Drucker, P. F. (1996). *Gelecek İçin Yönetim: 1990'lar ve Sonrası.* (F. Üçcan, Çev.) İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Yayınları.

Feinberg, R. A., Kim, I.-S., Hokama, L., Ruyter, K. d., & Keen, C. (2000). Operational Determinants of Caller Satisfaction in the Call Center. *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, 131-141.

Frankel, A., Gardner, R., Maynard, L., & Kelly, A. (2007). Using the communication and teamwork skills (CATS) assessment to measure health care team performance. Joint Commission *Journal on Quality and Patient Safety*, 33(9), 549-558.

Fraenkel, J. R., Wallen, N. E., & Hyun, H. H. (1993). How to design and evaluate research in education (Vol. 7). New York: McGraw-Hill.

Frenkel, S. J., Tam, M., Korczynski, M., & Shire, K. (1998). Beyond Bureaucracy? Work Organization in Call Centres. *The International Journal of Human*, 957-979.

Genç, S. Z., & Eryaman, M. Y. (2008). Değişen Değerler ve Yeni Eğitim Paradigması . *Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* , 89-102.

Gorard, S. (2006). *Quantitative methods in educational research: The role of numbers made easy*. London: Continuum Publishing.

Gökhan AKSU, İ. A., & BAYSAL, G. (tarih yok). Sektörün Meslek Yüksekokullarından Beklentileri Üzerine Nitel Bir Araştırma.

Güneş, F. (2012). Öğrencilerin Düşünme Becerilerini Geliştirme. *Türklük Bilimi Araştırmaları*, 127-146.

Hernandez, J., Morris, R. R., & Picard, R. W. (2011, October). Call center stress recognition with person-specific models. *In International Conference on Affective Computing and Intelligent Interaction* (pp. 125-134). Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg.

Holman, D., Batt, R., & Holtgrewe, U. (2007). *The global call center report: International perspectives on management and employment*. Cornell University ILR School.

Houlihan, M. (2001). Managing to manage? Stories from the call centre floor. *Journal of European Industrial Training*, 208-220.

İçli, G. (2007). İşletmelerin Meslek Yüksekokulu Mezunları İle İlgili Görüşleri Ve Beklentileri (Lüleburgaz İlçe Sınırlarında Faaliyet Gösteren İşletmeler Üzerine Bir Araştırma). *Marmara Üniversitesi İ.İ.B.F Dergisi*, 263-272.

İşler, M. C. (2013). *İş Sağlığı ve Güvenliği Eğitimleri İle Güvenlik Kültürünün İş Kazası ve Meslek Hastalıklarının Önlenmesindeki Etkisi.* Ankara: Çalışma ve Sosyal Güvenlik Bakanlığı.

Keiningham, T. L., Aksoy, L., Wallin Andreassen, T., Cooil, B., & Wahren, B. J. (2006). Call center satisfaction and customer retention in a co-branded service context. *Managing Service Quality: An International Journal*, 16(3), 269-289.

Kişi, N. (2016). Çağrı Merkezi Müşteri Temsilcisi Yetkinliklerinin Analitik Hiyerarşi Süreci Yöntemi İle Önceliklendirilmesi. *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi*, 145-159.

Kocabaş, İ., & Gökbaş, M. (2003). Eğitimde Takım Çalışması. *Education and Science*, 28(30), 8-15.

Kurumu, M. Y. (2013). *Ulusal Meslek Standardı: Çağrı Merkezi Takım Lideri Seviye 5.* Ankara.

Lam, K., & Lau, R. (2004). A Simulation Approach to Restructuring Call Centers. *Business Process Management Journal*, 481-494.

Leonard, M., Graham, S., & Bonacum, D. (2004). *The human factor: the critical importance of effective teamwork and communication in providing safe care*. BMJ Quality & Safety, 13(suppl 1), 85-90.

Morkoç, D. K., & Doğan, M. (2014). Meslek Yüksekokulu Mezunu Çalışanların Mesleki Eğitime Yönelik Görüşleri:. *Electronic Journal of Vocational Colleges*, 112-121.

Noronha, E., & D'Cruz, P. (2007). Reconciling Dichotomous Demands:Telemarketing Agents in Bangalore and Mumbai,India. *The Qualitative Report*, 255-280.

Odabaşı, Y. (2015). *Satışta ve Pazarlamada Müşteri İlişkileri Yönetimi.* İstanbul: Aura Kitapları.

Öktem, Ş., & Şahin, F. İ. (2011). Sektör Ve Meslek Yüksekokulu Beklentilerine Bir Örnek: Başkent Üniversitesi Kazan Meslek Yüksekokulu'nda Açılması Hedeflenen Programlara İlişkin Bir Çalışma. *6. Ulusal Meslek Yüksekokulları Sempozyumu*, (s. 1-8). Aydın.

Parıltı, N., & Öztürk, Y. (2002). Kişisel Satış Sürecinde Yeni Bir İkna Etme Yöntemi: SPIN. *Gazi Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi*, 103-110.

Piers, B., & Ellway, W. (2014). Is The Quantity-Quality Trade-Off In Call Centres A False Dichotomy? *Managing Service Quality*, 230-251.

Rich, N., & Hines, P. (1997). Supply-chain management and time-based competition: the role of the supplier association. *International Journal of Physical Distribution & Logistics Management*, 27(3/4), 210-225.

Rowold, J. (2007). Individual influences on knowledge acquisition in a call center training context in Germany. *International Journal of Training and Development*, 11(1), 21-34.

Seçkin, E., & Ökten, A. N. (2009). Az Gelişmiş Bölgelerin Gelişmesinde Bir Fırsat Olarak Çağrı Merkezleri. *Megaron Journal*, 191-202.

Seyfi, M., & Güven, D. (2015). Appreciative Inquiry as a means of Intra-Institutional communication. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Education Research*, 1(1), 148-158.

Sieben, I. J. P., de Grip, A., & van Jaarsveld, D. (2005). Employment and industrial relations in the Dutch call center sector.

Stevenson, W. J., & Hojati, M. (2007). *Operations Management* (Vol. 8). Boston: McGraw-Hill/Irwin.

Tarakçı, M. (21/07/2017). *Çağrı Merkezi Derneği: Raporlar*. Çağrı Merkezi Derneği: http://www.cagrimerkezleridernegi.org/Public/Upload/Catalog/KQ5WBV5LRPM3Z78.pd f adresinden alındı

Taylor, P., & Bain, P. (1999). An Assembly Line In The Head: Work And Employee Relations In The Call Centre. *Industrial Relations Journal*, 101-117.

Tutar, H. (2015). *İşletme Yönetimi.* Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.

Tuten, T. L., & Neidermeyer, P. E. (2004). Performance, satisfaction and turnover in call centers: The effects of stress and optimism. *Journal of Business Research*, 57(1), 26-34.

www.isgdersi.com. (21/07/2017). *İşçi Sağlığı ve İş Güvenliğinde Eğitimin Önemi.* http://www.isgdersi.com/mod/page/view.php?id=1 adresinden alındı

Yavuz, U., & Leleoğlu, H. (2011). Müşteri ilişkileri Yönetimi'nde Çağrı Merkezlerinin Yeri: Çağrı Merkezi Örneği. *Atatürk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 11-24.

Yeterlilik, K. M. (2013). *Ulusal Meslek Standardı: Çağrı Merkezi Müşteri Temsilcisi Seviye 4.* Ankara.

Yılmaz, A., & Aslan, S. (2002). Örgütsel Zaman Yönetimi. *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi*, 25-45.

Zaif, F., & Ayanoğlu, Y. (2007). *Muhasebe Eğitiminde Kalitenin Arttırılmasında Ders Programlarının Önemi: Türkiye'de Bir İnceleme*. Gazi Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi, 115-136.

Wellington, J. (2015). *Educational research*: Contemporary issues and practical approaches. Bloomsbury Publishing.