

## CITIZENSHIP EDUCATION IN GREEK PRIMARY SCHOOLS: TENSIONS AND CONTRADICTIONS

Maria NIKOLAKAKI (\*)

---

### ABSTRACT

*This paper on citizenship education focuses in Greek primary schools. It assesses citizenship education in Greece historically, from the creation of the Greek nation-state. Two main aspects are examined in this paper: the discourse of teaching citizenship education in Greek primary schools and the teaching of citizenship education, either through other subjects, or through the subject itself.*

*The methodology used in this paper is historical-comparative by discourse analysis, that is, analysis of extracts from the constitution, laws, textbooks and official documents. It concludes that citizenship education in Greek primary schools has little impact on the creation of the citizenship needed in modern Greece.*

**Key Words:** *Citizenship Education, Discourse Analysis, Identity*

### ÖZET

*Yurttaşlık eğitimi üzerine yazılan bu yazı Yunan ilköğretim okullarını incelemekte ve Yunanistan'da Yunan ulus devletinin kuruluşundan bu zamana kadar geçen süre içerisinde yurttaşlık eğitimini tarihsel olarak ele almaktadır. Bu yazıda iki temel yön ele alınmaktadır: Yunan ilköğretim okullarında yurttaşlık eğitimi öğretiminin söylemi ve bu konunun dolaylı olarak ya da doğrudan öğretilmesi. Bu yazıda söylem analizi bağlamında tarihsel-karşılaştırmalı bir yöntem kullanılmakta ve anayasa, kanunlar, ders kitapları ve resmi belgeler incelenmektedir. Çalışmada, Yunan ilköğretim okullarındaki yurttaşlık eğitiminin çağdaş Yunanistan'da gereksinim duyulan yurttaşlığın şekillenmesinde çok az bir etkiye sahip olduğu sonucuna varılmaktadır.*

**Anahtar Sözcükler:** *Yurttaşlık Eğitimi, Söylem Çözümlemesi, Kimlik*

## 1. Introduction

In this paper I explore the intentions for the construction of the citizen in modernity, in the Greek state, via citizenship education of primary schools. The focus on citizenship education, which is taught in primary school, is regarded important, because its evaluation reflects what is regarded as basic knowledge mainly needed by the lower class<sup>i</sup>, in order to exercise the citizen's role in society.

The methodology used in this paper is historical-comparative by discourse analysis, that is, analysis of extracts from the constitution, laws, textbooks and official documents. As regards to citizenship and citizenship education the initial assumptions are:

- Citizenship as a belonging, an 'owing to' identity, is prescribed as a mentality, a way of "seeing" things that is constructed according to certain socio-political-historical circumstances and is specifically and practically translated in duties and rights.
- Citizenship education is the particular subject of the educational system, which aims to transmit the required political and social knowledge for the participation of the constructed citizen in the political and social system.
- Citizenship education and the education of the citizen are highly intertwined. All knowledge, implicit or explicit, transmitted through the educational system reflects the state's concern and intentions for the construction of the citizen.
- The education of the citizen is a site in which the relations between the state, society, community and individuality are worked and reworked. The child is regarded as a means of administration, in order to govern the modern state (Popkewitz, 2002).

Two aspects of the teaching of Citizenship education in Greek primary schools are identified and examined in this paper:

### A. *The Emergence Of The Discourse For Citizenship Education*

- a. 1821-1880, Citizenship education as a part of moral cultivation.
- b. 1880- today, Citizenship education as a part of national cultivation.

### B. *The Teaching of Citizenship Education*

- a. 1895-1959. Teaching citizenship education through other subjects.
- b. 1959-today. The teaching of citizenship education as an autonomous subject in Greek Primary Schools.

---

<sup>i</sup> *The upper class had more opportunities for citizenship education, since it had the ability for higher education.*

## **A: The Emergence Of The Discourse For Citizenship Education**

After the liberation, that followed 400 years of Ottoman occupation, the need to construct a homogenous society out of the Greek population was realized. As has been remarked “a Greek state now existed, but a Greek nation had to be made” (Diamandouros, 1983). From the first years of the Greek revolution the basic vision and concern was how the ‘ragia<sup>ii</sup> would become a citizen’. Primary school was an essential area for the construction of that citizen. The common features of the Greek state were regarded to be language, religion and tradition, under the common territory. Schools were sites, which had been prescribed with the duty of constructing that common population.

### **2.1. Citizenship Education As A Part Of Moral Cultivation**

During this first period, the need of the introduction of citizenship education in the school program and its teaching is combined with the morality of Holy Catechism, or religious catechism, which reflects the traditional approach. Citizenship education is part of moral education; love for the country, along with love for parents and God was regarded to be a Christian virtue, because it was love for the other (Xristias, 1983). The importance of citizenship education can be seen as early as the first years of the construction of the state. The main events of the development of citizenship education are analysed below:

During the liberation war the Peloponnesian Senate came into body in order to put the principles of the new state. The announcement of the Peloponnesian Senate (27-4-1822) mentioned:

If we do not know the political science to a large extent, how would it be possible for us to be properly governed and succeed in it? ... So, send (the children) to schools so as to become pious, honorable and virtuous citizens.

This goal was to be realized by many attempts. An impressive fact is the edition of a book about Citizenship during the Revolution War, titled ‘Political Catechism for the Greeks to use’, which was published in 1826, ‘From the Typography in Hydra’. The Phil-Hellenist K.A.P. wrote it in Italian, and Nicholas G. Pagalakis’ translated it. The editor Joseph N.Kiappe, who is also the editor of the newspaper ‘The Friend Of The Law’, has written the ‘Introduction’ of this book. There he refers to the need of Citizenship Education in Greece, saying: ‘Since we started to live politically too, it is useless to say how essential the political catechism is’.

---

<sup>ii</sup> *A ragia is a Greek subject/slave of the Turks’.*

Enlightened teachers were to contribute to this goal. In his report to the inspectors of (Athens) Friends of Music Association, who supervised the school in which he was the headmaster (3-1-1826), Neophitos Nikitopoulos, one of the first teachers in Greece, describes in detail the way he organized his school, which was similar to the organization of a 'Democratic State'.

Respectable Inspectors, you know that this School concisely depicts a whole nation: that's why it must be organized according to the nation's political system, in which the student must govern and be governed according to the laws. At first, it was shown to the community of the School that every nation has laws, and people must comply with them: for that reason we must make laws in our Schools and lead our lives according to them....These were the things I said and nine Legislators, ten with me, were elected from the School's Public and therefore we recommended freedom of speech at school (by laws) and everyone agreed (Dimaras, 1973).

At the central level there was strong preoccupation for the achievement of this goal. When Kapodistrias, the first Greek Governor (1828-1833), arrived in Greece (11-1-1828), he announced his decision to support 'the restoration of Greece as far as work and elementary education is concerned' (Koukou, 1992). For the organization of such an education he searched for men 'nationally' educated according to "the Holy Faith and the customs of the country". When he announced his manifesto at the National Assembly (with its IA' decree, 2-8-1829), he declared that 'among the government's basic duties is the arrangement of its means and actions in such a way that the social and political restoration of Greece could be achieved'. The basis of this restoration was considered to be 'the citizen's moral formation though the holy religion and national education'.

In order to accomplish this restoration by the government, a (numbered 21/10-10-1829) circular, was sent out by the Secretary of Education N. Chrisogelos 'for the Teachers throughout the State', where it is emphasized that students will be taught not only their subjects but also the 'Holy Catechism', 'through which they will learn the duties of the virtuous citizen' (Koukou, 1992). The concept 'Holy Catechism' reflects the traditionalist's approach where religiosity would contribute to the formation of a good citizen.

The intentions of the central level were to be materialized at the Orphanage of Aegina, where the orphans of the war, who were regarded the state's children, were to be educated. On the 28th of January 1829 Minister Gregoris Constantas sent his official report for the function of Aegina's Orphanage. He presents his thoughts and suggestions for the appropriate

education of the Institution's inmates. He talks about 'pupils' laws', which must be given written to students so they would get accustomed to obeying the laws of the country more easily. He also believed that the social and political environment is an important factor for the children's education. In February 1830 the governor Kapodistrias visits the Aegina's Orphanage where he is satisfied with the teaching method and the successful selection of the extracts of the Greek Literature, which according to him, 'gave the teachers the possibility of inspiring their students' souls with moral and citizenship education' (Koukou, 1992).

After Kapodistrias' assassination, the Bavarian Vice-Regency hastens to re-organize the Education and in 1834 pronounces a law 'For Primary Schools' (11/3-3-34). This law does not define the aim of Primary School and does not mention anything relevant to the students' citizenship education. The fact is that during that period the monitorial system was in use and the teaching method and subjects taught were those that were described in the teaching book, that was translated from the French book written by Sarazine, without any decline (Lefas, 1942). In that monitorial book there is no reference for citizenship education.

In the period described above the main characteristic is the attempt to introduce governmentality to the Greek society. The basis for that would be moral and mental development, for citizenship creation, but there is no systematic discourse about teaching citizenship education as an autonomous subject. What is needed at the time is the construction of a Greek national and political identity; so as to overcome the multiple problems that the country is facing, on a social and political level (Xristias, 1983).

## **2.2. Citizenship Education As A Part Of National-Moral Cultivation (1880-1955)**

From 1880 economic changes in Greece formulate a new condition, which is characterized by an ideological crisis with political projections. The discourse for the need of the teaching of the subject will arise with the middle class awareness and the need to construct its citizens. The middle class becomes conscious of its targets: the creation of a society that tends to industrial development and is governed by a liberal parliamentary system (Fragoudaki, 1988). It is therefore regarded essential to modernize education, in order to correspond to the changing situations. Useful knowledge, for the emerging middle class, in opposition to the ancient Greek orientation is regarded as the bedrock for education.

In 1880, the monitorial school was considered to be inadequate for the preparation of the young Greek citizen, who was needed by the new-formulated

social-economical conditions of the country. The reasons for this change are thought to be the modernization of the society, the “construction” of the modern citizen and the economical development. In this stage the educational system reflects the need for the suitable preparation of the citizen:

The ministry wants the improvement of primary school and its re-construction according to our progress and the findings of the pedagogical science, whose application was successful, making primary school the strongest device of social progress and appropriate towards the growing social and political needs in our country...but nowadays the application of sciences' findings for agriculture, industry and trade and the universal competition over these... make the nations who are incapable to keep up with this wide modern civilization, due to the lack of moral and mental supplies, (which is rather important for the right use of political freedom and the participation in the public matters by voting), miserable. For these reasons, in the modern political societies, which are safely founded in the free competition and the citizens' equal rights without class distinction, the function of school is a basic condition for the purpose of a nation's existence...which help the young citizen to be educated not only as a member of the church and of the society with its national characteristics, but also as a skillful worker capable of all jobs, which demand basic knowledge...

The all age school with the co-instructive method (where pupils are put in classes according to age, as today) is introduced to the Greek schools as a means of responding to these new demands. In the all age school there is an attempt to modernize the educational system by rationalizing teaching. Its justification appears in details in 1880, in the circular with which the monitorial school is abolished, where the reasons for its replacement are mentioned:

In order to be more effective, moral education and the harmonious development of the children's mental powers should be attempted according to the new teaching methods which are based on the inspired experiences, and we should be freed from the monitorial school, which science dooms as mechanical and preventive for the development of the spirit.

From 1880, in the all age school, the herbartian method appears. Along with that there is a new curriculum created. The parliamentary regime, which is consolidated in the remodeled modern-Greek society, requires a free “citizen”, with equal rights, and a moral citizen, who has to obey to rules. And that free and moral citizen would be constructed through the herbartian method. From this time onwards there will be two trends in regard to the validity of the

educational knowledge. On the one hand the traditional, conservative group are expressing classicism, love of antiquity and the revival of the spirit of ancient Greece. On the other hand the modernization group seeks to give knowledge the dimension of functionality and financial efficacy. In Greece, due to the prevalence of the conservative group, moralization was conceived on the basis of a classical humanitarian orientation and a religiosity, values distant from the technocratic rational of the industrial capitalist society of the West (Fragoudaki, 1988).

From 1880 there is an emergence of a “fear of the enemy” through historical circumstances and citizenship education is regarded vital to be taught. The construction of a patriotic feeling is regarded to be the Greek nation’s ‘supplies’. Although during the previous period citizenship education was regarded as part of moral cultivation, and its role was to ‘create virtuous citizens who know how to be ruled’, who posses ‘fear of God and the law’, after 1880 citizenship education is nearer to the moral –national cultivation. Patriotism is disconnected from the Christian emotions and is regarded as the nation’s virtue and a factor of the nation’s progress and unity (Koulouri, 1988).

During the period that follows, there is an attempt to combine citizenship and education, or specifically, to emphasize the contribution of education for a satisfactory citizenship. For example the circular of the Ministry of Education (numbered 8207/9-10-1878) advised:

It is not ignored that, the extension of the elementary knowledge, and children’s mental development and moral education, is the most direct method for the achievement of the state and society’s highest aims.

On the 15th of February 1880 the general inspector G. Petridis organizes and sends a circular to the schools with the title ‘Elementary practical instructions for the teaching of subjects at Primary Schools’. These instructions are confirmed by the Minister of Education N. Papamihalopoulos, where after the students’ activities are described, the aim is declared “...these help students to become honest citizens and good Christians”. Similarly, with the circular of the Ministry of Education, (numbered 7876 of the 4-7-1880), the aim of primary school is defined as follows:

Not just the simple obtaining of experiences or the transmission of a lot of knowledge without inner cohesion and educational meaning, but the common and precisely pre-arranged plan, during the tender age, for the citizens’ character formation and the transmission, through a well-method teaching, that is continually concerned about character building, of the

elementary knowledge from the nature and history, which enables the new citizen to be educated not only as an honest member of the Church but also a citizen who is State inspired with national characters ...(as quoted by Lefas, 1942:14-15)

The education of the citizen dominates the draft of laws in the educational reforms of 1880 (A.D. Avyerinos is the Minister of Ecclesiastical and Public education). The legislation of universal suffrage has proceeded in 1844 and by constitutional provision in 1864. So, according to some, there is 'the danger of seduction and demagoguism of the recently liberated people'. In the Introductory report of the 1-2-1880 it is mentioned:

Because of the fact that the transitive period from slavery to freedom, is thought to be difficult and dangerous, it needs vigilant care and constant attention, just as the childhood and the youth age.

Due to these social and political dangers, in school, in which all social classes are developed and morally educated, the members of these classes must be smoothly moulded during their tender age, by the chisel of education, just like the stones on a wall, well-matched to match the social construction, proved to be the anchor of salvation in modern societies. It is, of course, repeatedly said by the modern wise men, that freedom and universal suffrage without school lead to anarchy and disaster.

On the whole, the above introductory report of draft law seems to be informed about the evolutions in Europe. Belgium and Prussia are generally mentioned and more specifically Jules Ferry's first legislature measures that were taken over by the French Ministry of Education in February 1879. It is worth saying that with Ferry's draft law the subject of Citizenship Education is introduced in the French Primary education (1880).

At the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century there is a debate about the main characteristics that confirm nationality: language, religion, and tradition. Religiosity is one basic characteristic that differentiated Greeks from other nations of the West. Its intense presence on the school program aimed at the creation of compliance to the church. But there is no complete coincidence of religion and Greek hood, since the Muslims of Crete and of Asia Minor are regarded as Greeks, too (Koulouri, 1988). Something more abstract, tradition was invented, to become the national link between the Greeks. On the other hand Greek nationalism, either with its progressive or its conservative expression, raised the issue of Greek language as proof of the national identity and a means of national unity (Fragoudaki, 1988).



At the same time there is a combination of time and space 'dislocation', with the result the definition of 'freed' and 'enslaved' Greece and the emergence of a nationalistic feeling that led to the will to include all the territories where Greeks had lived historically for centuries, territories that were thought to be Greek. This period coincides with the revival of the Great Idea, which is the Greek dream to expand the state, so as to include the nation. After the catastrophe of Asia Minor (1922), the ambitions of the territories of the Greek state were terminated and the goal was to achieve prosperity within the existing territories. That along with the rise of the middle class had the citizen desired to be the envisioned to be an effective citizen, who would contribute to the development of the country. The educational system changed its orientation and targeted towards more practical goals. Citizenship education was a means for that.

Another characteristic of the 19<sup>th</sup> century nationalism is the superiority feeling towards the east. It becomes materialized through the teaching of history and geography, where the description of 'us', as regarded to the 'other', spatially and historically gets formed, either in a positive or a negative manner (Koulouri, 1988). It must be mentioned though that the fanaticism, which was a characteristic of the textbooks of this period was criticized severely by the textbook's judges. The official direction at the administrative level was to cultivate patriotism through indirect ways and not through other countries' humiliation (Lefas, 1942). The formal discourse of the relation of the Greeks with the other nations brings the concept of 'civilization' as a frontispiece because, through this, it is supported that, Greece embraces the whole universe. What is argued is that Ancient Greece is the 'matrix' through which the modern European and universal civilization 'sprang'. Therefore, what is claimed is that the differentiation from the other nations is born from the Greek identity and this identity does not emerge from any need of differentiation. Ancient Greek consignment is the 'vehicle' (Zeilas, 2001).

The point is that during all this period, citizenship education is regarded a vehicle to national-moral cultivation. These intentions will be materialized mainly through books or guides for the teachers, or through the content of other school subjects. The attempt for the writing of a national textbook will be successful in 1955, where the aim is the construction of the effective citizen of the Modern Greek State.

## **B. The Teaching of Citizenship Education In Greek Primary Schools (1895-)**

The first attempts to teach about citizenship will be through language, history and geography. Language was a means to introduce to texts with

particular meanings and if citizenship education at the time was construction of a national identity, history will present its unity in time and geography its unity in space.

The concept of patriotism at the end of the 19<sup>th</sup> century includes not only love for the country, but also knowledge of one's duties towards the country actively in deed, taking the form of sacrificing one's life for the country, if needed (Koulouri, 1988, p: 79). Such a national education aiming at the cultivation of patriotism cannot be based solemnly on history and geography, but needs the support of political and citizenship education and gymnastics.

### **3.1. Teaching Citizenship Education Through Other Lessons (1895-1959)**

The first elements of Citizenship Education appeared during the school year 1895-96, after a competition for the writing of schools-books for primary education was proclaimed. Among the subjects of the 'Reading Textbook', which was approved for the 4<sup>th</sup> year of Primary School, there is a unit, which refers to 'the citizen's duties'. Its striking criticism is very much up to date. In the introduction of this book we read:

If there is something that today's Greek citizen ignores, this is the limits of his duties and rights, which are believed to be wider, even though he thinks that they are very limited. The majority believes that, from their forefathers' blood and from the liberation of their country, they got only rights, licit and illicit, and no duties. And, because they appear to be active members of that society, they ignore the political organization around them, which they haven't been taught and live among unknown and restricting for them conditions..... Therefore (in the book) I thought it important to omit what had to do with turtles, foxes and wolves and instead of these to include other positive knowledge from the real and everyday life that are relevant to today's student and tomorrow's Greek citizen.

And the writer concludes that he devotes one of the three parts in his book to the teaching of the duties and rights, 'which are imposed by the idea of 'an Explanatory Society'. In this ten-year-valid textbook for the Greek Language written by Apostolopoulos high importance is given to Citizenship Education, as its thematic title (The Greek citizen) coincides with the title of the textbook. He justifies his views as follows:

The Ministry with its pre-announcement asks for knowledge useful -to-life to be included in the reading textbook. But, what more useful-to-life knowledge and in accordance to the aim of

modern school, which is to prepare good citizens for the social life, may exist, than knowledge that teaches specifically the citizen's duties and rights. I include, henceforth, some elements of the Constitutional Law'.

With the BTC' Law starts the period during which Citizenship Education is part of other subjects, such as the Language subjects, Geography and History. In the 'Curriculum and timetable of the subjects History and Geography at Primary Schools', it is mentioned that amongst the aims of the History and Geography subjects is:

To know the virtues of the good Greek citizen, who knows how to defend his rights and how to fulfil his obligations, and who is willing to defend all these under any circumstances, whereas at the same time he will be willing to co-operate with the friendly foreign people (Koulouri, 1988).

In 1899, there is a second attempt for the introduction of Citizenship Education as an independent subject in primary education. The Minister of Ecclesiastical and Public Education, Th. Eutaxias, with the draft laws he introduced to be voted in Parliament, presents the subject 'Constitutional citizen's rights and duties with elements of the Political Economy and Mercantile Books'.

This is a whole approach to teach the subject; since the same circle of draft laws suggests also the introduction of the subject at the Teacher's colleges, for the teacher's best preparation. However, objections arose for this particular subject at Primary School, during the discussions in Parliament and to illuminate the misunderstanding for the teaching of the Constitutional Law, Th. Eutaxias responded:

The Constitutional Law, not as is taught at University, nor as it would be taught at High School, because it is going to be taught there too, but in a more elementary way, specially designed according to the Ministry's suggestions, must be introduced. It is a delusion, and I would dare to say a big one, for someone to believe that the citizen's duties and rights ought to be taught only to the academic citizens and especially by the ones that study Law. All Greek citizens have to learn their duties and rights as constitutional Citizens, since each and every one of them will be called to practice his basic rights to elect and to be elected, and since everyone has directly or indirectly to participate in the public matters, and this participation is essential for the prosperity or misfortune of his country. The complete ignorance of our duties and rights as constitutional citizens led us to what we have to face today.

The problematic situation, which the Minister mentions, and the unwillingness to participate in the public matters are the result of the unfortunate Turkish-Greek war of 1897, that was two years before. And, this fact is spoken straight out in the introductory report:

In this way, there would be hope for us to get a real education, which would achieve to strengthen the Greek spirit, would help Greece to have good citizens and would show that our navy and military forces are capable to avert the 1897 stigma from the battle-front.

There was great opposition for the above draft laws, and after many delays, they were voted against, apart from some exceptions (about gymnastics) and the introducer, Th. Eutaxias, resigned. As G. Drosinis, a Greek novelist and intellectual comments, in the magazine *National Education*: 'The draft law for primary education was rejected from the 2<sup>nd</sup> reading and was contracted to 8 clauses...'. What is of importance here though is that for the first time there is a political and not a pedagogical interest to teach the lesson.

In 1904 the 'First Greek Educational Conference' is organized'. According to A. Dimaras (1990:λα) 'It is an expression of all these trends that could be described as 'progressive'. In the Elementary Education section (2<sup>nd</sup> of April Conference) the members of the Council agreed on the following proposal:

To introduce in schools the teaching of subjects about the duties and rights of the Greek citizen and National Catechism (Dimaras,1990: 43-44).

The teachers' proposal would be a subject of discussion in the draft laws of education in the 1913 reform, but at the end they would be rejected. The explanation in the retrospective introductory report is as follows:

Not because we think that the subject is useless, but because we think that the best position for it at primary school is it's teaching along with the History subject. Because this, by itself, would be boring and fruitless, Whereas if it was the conclusion and completion of the Greek History, which at the 6th grade would teach and deal with the situation today, with the ideals and cultural aim of the Greek nation, it would present the duties and rights of the Greek citizen as a result of our history and would include these to the whole national work and progress. On the other hand, in other subjects, too, especially Greek literature, the relevant teaching would be possible.

Ch. Lefhas (1942), an educational historian repulses the above view with the following arguments:

We think that the proposed arguments are not strong. Since we recognize the need of this subject teaching in order to make students aware of their duties and rights as citizens, we have to teach it separately and not along with history and Greek Language. When the teaching hour for this subject is arranged, the teachers will be forced to teach it, otherwise they will neglect it. Moreover, suitable books will be published, and the teacher will know what to teach, whereas, now it is doubtful if they know what they are going to teach. Of course, we cannot support the idea that the teaching of the subject of Citizenship Education will be boring for the students, while the teaching of the other subjects is not. On the contrary, it will be pleasant, since it will excite the students' interest.

Finally, in the curriculum of 1913, Citizenship Education was not included, neither as an independent subject, nor through the History subject. As far as the publishing of books is concerned, we have to mention the edition of 'Citizenship Education' of M. Volanakis, Professor of History in Athens University in 1911 [with re-issues in 1913 and 1933], where in the introduction the writer remarks:

In order to perfect the national education of the Greek youth, we created a special subject through brief, systematic and of many-years studies, to which we gave the name of citizenship education and which we successfully taught at the Supreme Institutes of our friendly Cyprus, when we directed these.

The above mentioned book was a source of inspiration for the later writers.

### **3.2. The Limitation Of Citizenship Education**

As we examined, in 1899 the establishment of Citizenship Education in Elementary Education as an autonomous subject (discipline draft law) was a failure. The 1913 draft laws do not deal with Citizenship Education. In the Educational reformation of 1929 the subject is generally accepted but only for the secondary Education. The Law of 4397/16<sup>th</sup> –24<sup>th</sup> August in 1929, chapter three, clause 1 says:

The aim of primary schools is the elementary preparation of the pupils for life hood and the providing of the essential elements for a respectable citizen's education<sup>iii</sup>.

In spite of the absolute reference concerning 'respectable citizens' the subject is not introduced in Primary Education. There are, however, poor elements of Citizenship Education, which are taught through the Geography and History subjects (Koulouri, 1988).

Metaxa's dictatorship (1934) takes over about the Primary students' "enlightenment" providing schools with a great number of photographic material, prints, signals and the activity of National Youth Organization.

During the German occupation the need of facing the fascist propaganda is indicated, which the school textbooks during the dictatorship used and which are continually taught from the period of the 4th of August in 1934. So, the Pedagogical preparatory schools of Karpenisiou and Tynas (communist party's schools) decided to publish two reading textbooks (one for grades 3rd and 5th of Primary school and one for grades 4th and 6th), which would include texts about national and social life. The further aim of the reading textbooks, which were finally published in 1944, was 'the transmission of the general State spirit'.

The significance for the teaching of the subject was stressed in September of 1949, by the Minister of Education, at that time, K. Tsatsos, who convenes an Inspectors' Education Conference with the main theme Citizenship's Education. The result of the conference was the circular of the National Ministry of Education and Religion, (register number 72586 in 21st –9-1949') for the Inspectors and Officials of Elementary Education. With this circular the Minister suggests the introduction of the subject Citizenship Education in all Primary Schools (Xristias, 1983). The main parts of the circular are:

It is high time to strive against the intolerable individualism; To battle one's tendency of disobedience against the general will; To fight against the refusal of submission to society's aims for the benefit of the individual; To improve and develop the feeling of liability; To reduce the citizen's chronic hostility towards the State; To save tomorrow's citizens from the great ignorance of their basic duties and rights against the total. (Zobanakis, w.d:144)

---

<sup>iii</sup> *In 1899 the aim of the primary education is mainly national education through moral cultivation, in the educational reform of 1913 there is a reference to moral cultivation and an appearance of practical aim of primary education and in the law of 1929 the practical orientation of primary education aim is basically mentioned and is accompanied by the moral aim of primary education.*

It continues:

That is why the 'Citizenship Education' must have the main position among the timetable's subjects, not only in quantity, but also in quality and depth, mainly in order to educate the free spirits, the honest characters and the real democratic citizens of the new era.

The brief presence of K. B Tsatsos in the Ministry of Education did not allow him to materialize his intentions. We must also mention the Greek edition in 1945, of a useful and simple textbook about Citizenship Education, with the title 'The most right thing'. It is another version of Monroe Leaf's FAIR PLAY, which applies to Primary School children in the U.S.A.

During this period, there is a modest interest for teaching Citizenship Education that is arisen every time that there is a national or global crisis. The experiences from 1897 to the 2<sup>nd</sup> World War and the rise of fascism revived little by little the interest of constructing the virtuous citizen through a humanitarian education. Toward the end of this period, the problematic about if to teach citizenship education changed to how to teach citizenship education, and the content is referred as a political and social problem of schooling (Helmis, 1995).

### **3.3.1. Teaching Citizenship Education As An Autonomous Subject In Greek Primary Schools (1955- )**

Finally the subject 'citizenship education' is introduced as an autonomous subject in 1955 in the primary schools of Greece. From that time onwards there were four reforms made and therefore four different curriculum and aims of the lesson declared: those were in 1955, 1969, 1977 and 1984. At this point we will focus on these particular reforms.

In 1955, the Ministry of Education (with the circular numbered 37 of 3-10-1955), 'orders' the Primary Schools' headmasters to teach the subject of 'National Education' in the 6th grade. This fact motivates the school program and becomes the beginning of the teaching of the subject 'Citizenship Education' in Primary Education<sup>iv</sup>. About the aim of Citizenship Education, it is mentioned that:

- The aim of this subject is the student's development, so as to be a good Greek citizen, as an individual and towards others and to the State; Obedience to the rules of good and moral behavior

---

<sup>iv</sup> This subject is officially established (with the Parliamentary decree of the 30th of January, 1957).

and to the State's laws and also compliance with the majority's decisions.

- To increase the appreciation of the Greek ideals

The proposed curriculum accepted positive critiques and was considered to be complete and modern, with well-organized didactic units and with the proper methodological indications and specific comments (Novas, 1957). However, there are two objections for introducing the subject in Greek primary schools. One comes from King Paul's manifesto, where it is mentioned that the Greeks do not have awareness that they need citizenship education (Dimaras, 1990:228-229). The other comes from a more rational argument that 'the relative Greek bibliography was poor and the teachers were neither educated, nor had the required experience for teaching' (Novas, 1957:8). The subject is being taught within the above outlines until 1964.

The new decree (4779/1964) 'About the organization and the administration of the General Education' (Elementary and Secondary), which introduced a new Educational Reform, with a progressive character does not include the Citizenship Education subject in Primary School. This particular law in its introductory report emphasizes the 'Democratic Citizen' and at first sight the abolishment of the subject seems to be striking. A possible explanation would be the fact that Education is compulsory until the C' grade of high school, whereas this subject is taught at the B' and C' grades of High School.

The Greek junta (1967-1974) will stop the teaching and the examination of the subject at Primary Schools (with a circular, numbered 64341 in 13th May in 1967). Its specific reference that citizenship education is not to be taught is probably due to the colonels' excessive zeal since the subject is not taught since 1964. With the above circular, the subject 'Elements of Democracy', which was taught at High School, was cancelled. With the Obligatory Law 129/28-9-67 the aim of education is re-defined.

The General Education, which provides education based on the ideals of the Greek-Christian civilization, aims to make the students able to fulfill their obligations as humans and as citizens and to be able to correspond to the imposing demands of modern life inside the political community of the Greek Nation.

In 1969, the junta publishes a textbook, which reflects the views of the regime. The subject is taught again in the 6th grade for one hour per week. As is referred in the curriculum: (Parliamentary Decree 702/69):



The teaching of this subject aims to introduce students to the modern organized Greek society, to make them aware of their rights and duties inside family, school, profession, the State and the Church, in order to become good Greek citizens and Christians.

The content of the curriculum and textbook is sharply conservative and propagandist with the aim of preserving the 'purity' of the Greek Orthodox tradition from the 'Marxist danger'.

After the restoration of Democracy in the country in 1974, the new law about Education (309/76) emphasizes the Social development and Citizenship Education, 'according to the beliefs of the country's Democratic regime'. It aims mainly at the creation of free and responsible citizens. The subject is taught in 5th and 6th grades from the textbook 'We want to learn everything' (A. Rousopoulou, decree 1034/12-11-77), which mentioned:

Citizenship education intends to help the student to adjust his behavior in the life of the community where he belongs, and to prepare him in a direct and practical way, especially influential, for the conscious practice of his rights and duties, which characterizes the free and democratic citizen.

### **3.3.2. Citizenship Education In Greek Primary Schools Today**

When PASOK<sup>v</sup> came in office in 1981, a wide range of reform measures was introduced at all levels of education. One of the basic acts to be witnessed was the change of the content of education. The democratic air that the movement was thought to be bringing in the country had as result the production of new curricula, so textbooks were written carrying this new atmosphere and ideology. This was obvious at the level of primary education where curriculum reform was way out of due.

PASOK's educational policy followed demands for 'democratization' and 'modernization' as expressed in the post-dictatorial era, which until then had not found the suitable ground to be achieved. The reform was a response to different kind of contingencies: social on the one side and economic on the other.

---

<sup>v</sup> *PASOK is the Socialist Party that was in office of Greece from 1981 to 2004.*

During the second semester of the school year 1983-84, the books of Citizenship Education in the 5th and 6th grades of primary schools are distributed along with the relevant teacher's books. The law 1566/85 for the organization of education that was introduced emphasized the Social and Political dimension of Education. The subject Citizenship Education continued to be taught in the same way but now it is more modernized in content. The subject is ambitious in its conception, since it aims to inform the pupils of many aspects of their lives, to include useful and practical knowledge for living in society. New themes are added to the citizenship education program: health and entertainment, principles of democratic Education, traffic education, Environmental Education, Social Care, Political History, State's Economy. The subject is now called 'Social and Political Education'. The Presidential decree 168/3-5-1984, defines:

The aim of the Social and Citizenship Education subject is to help students:

- ...to know about the organization and the function of the Greek society and the values in which it is based.
- ...to understand the meaning of the social and political institutions for the individual and society.
- ...to develop their critical thinking about the current problems.
- ...to cultivate their social conscience so as to participate responsibly and creatively in the life of the democratic society.
- ...to obtain the essential sensibility towards the community of all humans.

The whole curriculum text is revealing to what kind of citizenship is envisioned and two things are striking:

1. the connection between citizenship, territorial integrity and the Christian orthodox tradition, even though freedom of religious conscience is mentioned and
2. the stress on attitude development instead of inscription (Moutsios, 1997).

This means that, although one can see a shift to a more democratic paradigm, a mono-cultural state is envisioned. It is true though, that at the time that the curriculum and textbooks were made Greece had not yet experienced the major immigration flow that later years affected. On the basis of the above aims, the curriculum reform marked an ideological change towards liberal/progressive values and a strong move towards the competence modality (Bernstein, 1998), which stressed the democratic and cognitive empowerment

of pupils (Moutsios, 1997). But the will for a democratic approach to education did not alter the severe, asphyxiating control of education, with one of the most centralized educational systems to be.

In the Acts that were made for the “Basic principles for the operation of schools” (June, 2002), there is a reflection of the contemporary intentions of the state for respect to the “Other” in schools, and it is mentioned that:

With the contemporary composition of the pupil population, it is probable to have pupils with other religions. They have the right not to attend to the Morning Prayer. At the same time they have the duty to respect the right of the active participation of the others. The School has to give appropriate attention to the above point.

From statements like the above, one can see that the sociological matters of the Greek school are still faced within logic of mental racism, even when they are positioned within a theory of cultural capital. Even when the Ministry of Education supports the idea that it is removing from the traditional ideology for the national identity, it leaves intact its core, since it calls for concepts like ‘uniform community’, to protect the ‘stabilization’ of the nation/state. In result it reproduces a constructed nationalism, upon which the state and its institutions are a result of a generative compliance of the people and it works as a guardian of the uniform ‘commune of principles and interests’. In this way it does not question matters like the relation of meritocracy and social positionality, or the validity of knowledge and respect of the others and the whole ideology is based on a first level of analysis: one can be part of our community as long as he/she does not annoy us.

#### **4. Conclusions**

One outstanding fact that the examination of the historical evolution of the subject Citizenship education in Greek Primary Schools has shown us is that in Greece citizenship education has always been a concern of the education system. It has been combined with the education of the citizen each time and the necessity is stressed according to historical and political circumstances. Politics and citizenship education have been claimed to be a means to construct an effective citizen.

Due to the prevalence of the conservative group in Greece the construction of that citizen was attempted through a theoretical orientation away from the pragmatic situations of real life, to which it refers. As a result the teaching of the subject has always been problematic because it is based on the acquisition of knowledge and not on dispositions through an active citizenship.

The aspirations for the subject were very high since it was believed that the teaching of it was an effective way to combat the nations' defaults. It was regarded that knowledge was enough to overcome the problematic sides of the character of the Greeks', which in a striking comparison, could be regarded as existing even today. But the teaching of citizenship education alone without a holistic combination to face the multiplicity of the concept is proven to be inadequate.

Today, due to bureaucratic reasons, after twenty years of teaching the same books, in Greece, teaching citizenship education has been remarkably stable and unchanged: the curriculum and textbooks that are in use today are the ones made in 1983-5. Despite the fact of taking more part in the European Union and the growth of the impact of globalization, nationhood is presented as belonging to a monocultural state and is ethnocentric. Attempts to remake the curriculum have been stopped by political changes. If there is a possibility of constructing a version of a Modern Greek citizen, who beyond his notion of a Greek Identity holds a European along with a global sense of belonging, these things definitely have to alter.

## REFERENCES

- Diamandouros, N. (1983a). *Ελληνισμός και Ελληνικότητα* (Hellenism and Greekness), edited by D.G.Tsaousis, pp. 51-58. Athens: Kollaros and Co.
- Diamandouros, N. (1983b). *Greek political culture in transition: historical origins, evolution, current trends, in greece in the 1980s*, edited by Richard Clogg, pp.43-69. London: Macmillan.
- Dimaras, A (1973). *Η μεταρρύθμιση που δεν έγινε* (the Reform that never was), Vol. 2, Athens: Ermis.
- Fragoudaki, (1977). *Εκπαιδευτική Μεταρρύθμιση και Φιλελεύθεροι Διανοούμενοι* (Educational Reform and Liberal Intellectuals). Athens: Kedros.
- Gotovos, Ath. (1983). *Ο χρυσός αιώνας της παιδαγωγικής ιδεολογίας και η εμφάνιση της παιδαγωγικής επανάστασης: Ξένες επιδράσεις στην ελληνική παιδαγωγική θεωρία και πράξη-Συμβολή στην κριτική της νεοελληνικής παιδαγωγικής ιδεολογίας* (The golden age of pedagogical ideology and the emergence of pedagogical sciences-Contribution to the criticism of modern pedagogical theory In Ath. Gotovos et al., *Κριτική Παιδαγωγική*

και Εκπαιδευτική Πράξη (Critical Pedagogy and Educational Practice) 24-71. Yiannena: Sincroni Ekpedfsi.

- Jusdanis, G. (1991). European hellenism and greek nationalism: some effects of ethnocentrism on greek linguistic scholarship. *Journal of Modern Greek Studies*, 3, 87-96.
- Kedourie, E. (ed) (1970). *Nationalism in Asia and Africa*. New York: The World Publishing Co.
- Konstantellou, E (1992). Beyond the limits of Humanistic and Technocratic Ideologies in Education: A Critique of the Greek and American Models, Ph.D Thesis, Ohio State University.
- Koukou, E, (1992). Ο Καποδιατριάς και Η Παιδεία, Kapodistrias and Paideia, v. B, Educational Institutions of Aigina, Athens.
- Koulouri, X, (1988). Ιατορία και Γεωγραφία στα Ελληνικά Σχολεία (1834-1914) History and Geography in Greek Schools, General Secretariat for the New Generation, Athens.
- Lefas, X. (1942). Ιατορία της Εκπαιδευάεως, History of Education, OESB, Athens.
- Moutsios, S. (1997). State control in Greece and England: A comparative study, PHD Thesis, Institute of Education, University of London.
- Mouzelis, N. (1978). *Modern Greece: facets of underdevelopment*, London: Macmillan.
- Nikolakaki, M (2001). *The dynamics of postponing: An attempt to approach the linguistic matter of the educational system in Greece from a sociological perspective*, *New Paideia*, Athens, p: 62-76.
- Nikolakaki, M (ed) (2004). *Globalization, technology and paideia in the new Cosmopolis*, Atrapos editions, Athens.
- Nikolakaki, M (2003). Citizenship education as identity formation, in A. Ross: A Europe of Many Cultures, Cice conference, Braga, Portugal, p: 403-11
- Nikolakaki, M. (2003). Citizenship education in Greek primary schools: A Difficult Road to a Distant Place, Learning Conference 2003, RMIT, Institute of Education.
- Novas, G. (1957). Πολιτική Αγωγή, Political Education, Offprint of the Monthly Gazette: Greek Matters, Company for the Greek Studies, Athens.
- Popkewitz, T. (2004). Historicizing the future: Educational reforms, systems of Reason, and the making of children who are future citizens, *Journal of Educational Change*, 5, 229-247.

- Xristias, I. (1983). Θεωρία και Πράξη της Πολιτικής Αγωγής, Theory and Practice of Political Education, Nea Paideia, v. 25.
- Xelmis, S. (1995). Ανάλυση του Προγράμματος και των Διδακτικών Υλικών του Μαθήματος της Κοινωνικής και πολιτικής Αγωγής, Analysis of the curriculum and teaching material of Social and Political Education, Athens.
- Zeilas, P. (2001). Η φιλοσοφία της Πολιτικής Αγωγής στη Νεοελληνική Εκπαίδευση 1929-1989, The philosophy of Citizenship education in Neo-Greek Education 1929-1989, Unpublished PhD Thesis, Panteion University, Greece.
- Zobanakis, G., (no date). *Citizenship education*, Athens.