SPC

Spiritual Psychology and Counseling

Table of Contents

The Bidirectional Spirituality Scale: Construction and Initial Evidence for Validity

W. Paul Williamson[1] 🔘
Henderson State University

Aneeq Ahmad[2] 🔘
Henderson State University

Abstract

This study presents the development and construction of the 16-item Bidirectional Spirituality Scale (BSS), which is based on the theory of vertical and horizontal spirituality. Vertical spirituality focuses on that involving one's relationship with God, whereas horizontal spirituality is concerned with one's relations with people and attunement to meaning and purpose. Using data from 239 USA participants, exploratory factor analysis has produced three factors: vertical spirituality (VS; 8 items); horizontal spirituality-others (HS-O; 4 items); and horizontal spirituality-existential (HS-E; 4 items). A partial confirmatory factor analysis has confirmed the three-factor model. For research purposes, HS-O and HS-E can be combined to produce an 8-item horizontal spirituality scale to complement the 8-item VS scale. Further analyses have found preliminary evidence for both convergent and discriminant validity. Because of its sound psychometric properties, the BSS appears to be a useful, brief instrument for discriminating both religious and non-religious spirituality.

Keywords:

Spirituality scales • Spirituality • Religious spirituality • Non-religious spirituality • Partial confirmatory factor analysis

İki Yönlü Maneviyat Ölçeği: Geliştirme Süreci ve Geçerliliğe İlişkin İlk Kanıtlar

Öz

Bu çalışmada, dikey ve yatay maneviyat teorisine dayanan 16 maddelik İki Yönlü Maneviyat Ölçeğinin geliştirilmesini sunulmaktadır. Dikey maneviyat, kişinin Tanrı ile ilişkisine odaklanırken, yatay maneviyat, birinin insanlarla ilişkileri ve anlam ve amaçlara uyumu ile ilgilidir. 239 ABD'li katılımcılarından gelen veriler kullanarak yapılan açımlayıcı faktör analizinde üç faktör üretmiştir: dikey maneviyat (8 madde); yatay maneviyat-diğerleri (4 madde); ve yatay maneviyat-varoluşsal (4 madde). Kısmi bir doğrulayıcı faktör analizinde, üç faktörlü model doğrulanmıştır. Araştırma amaçları için, yatay maneviyat-diğerleri ve yatay maneviyat-varoluşsal alt ölçekleri, 8 maddelik Dikey Maneviyat Ölçeğini tamamlamak için 8 maddelik bir yatay maneviyat ölçeği oluşturmak için birleştirilebilmektedir. Sağlam psikometrik özelliklerinden dolayı İki Yönlü Maneviyat Ölçeği, hem dini hem de dini olmayan maneviyatı ayırt etmek için kısa ve kullanışlı bir araç olarak görülmektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Maneviyat ölçekleri • Maneviyat • Dini maneviyat • Din dışı maneviyat • Kısmi doğrulayıcı faktör analizi.

1 **Correspondence to:** W. Paul Williamson, Department of Psychology, HSU Box 7854, Henderson State University, Arkadelphia, AR 71999. Contact: williaw@hsu.edu

2 Department of Psychology, Henderson State University, Arkadelphia, AR 71999.

Spirituality has become a phenomenon of increasing interest in the psychology of religion. Had William James (1902/1982) written *The Varieties of Religious Experience* in recent times, one could say he might have entitled it, *The Varieties of Spiritual Experiences*. Although both religion and spirituality have been meaningful concepts over the history of human experience, a tendency in past decades has existed to discriminate their meanings, particularly in Western culture (Zinnbauer & Pargament, 2005). Accordingly, more people now are making the distinction between being religious and being spiritual, although some experience a spirituality that is religiously defined and thus claim to be both religious and spiritual to varying degrees. In the history of psychological research, a consensus of agreement has yet to exist on definitions for these important phenomena, and consequently investigators are becoming more aware of the need to better operationalize these constructs when developing their research instruments. Thus the purpose of this study is to introduce a research tool based on relevant theory that allows for better discrimination of religious and non-religious spirituality.

Measures of Spirituality

Over recent decades, several scales have been developed for measuring spirituality, although many were constructed largely for clinical use (e.g., Daaleman & Frey, 2004; Delaney, 2005; Fang, Li, Lai, Lin, Bridge, & Chen, 2011; Peterman, Fitchett, Brady, Hernandez, & Cella, 2002; Vivat et al., 2013; World Health Organization, 2002). For the purposes here, however, we mainly are concerned with instruments that have been used to advance research on spirituality within the larger context of psychology and religion. We will briefly describe a few of these here.

One of the earliest instruments developed for measuring spirituality is the Spiritual Well-Being Scale (SWBS; Paloutzian & Ellison, 1982). With a backdrop of concern for loneliness and quality of life, the authors constructed 20 items to assess two aspects of spiritual well-being: a vertical dimension that describes religious well-being (RWB), and a horizontal dimension that connotes existential well-being (EWB), or life satisfaction and purpose. Both factors together assess overall spiritual well-being. The SWBS has been widely used in general research but also has been employed in research among psychiatric patients and inmates (Bufford, Paloutzian, & Ellison, 1991), as well as those recovering from substance addiction (Williamson & Hood, 2016). Although well-used, some studies have been unable to confirm the two-factor structure of the SWBS (Ledbetter, Smith, Fischer, Vosler-Hunter, & Chew, 1991; Scott, Agresti, & Fitchett, 1998). Furthermore, the recent move to publish the instrument as a proprietary test has discouraged some investigators from using the SWBS in general research.

Other spirituality scales have since emerged for general research, although some might be found useful in clinical settings. Piedmont (1999, p. 988) defined spiritual transcendence as "the capacity of individuals to stand outside of their immediate sense of time and place to view life from a larger, more objective perspective." With this notion, he consulted various religious texts when developing the 24-item Spiritual Transcendence Scale (STS), which assesses the construct along three dimensions. Prayer fulfillment depicts the transcending effects of prayer and its association with joy, peace, contentment, and spiritual growth. Universality is a factor that describes belief in a higher realm that transcends the present world and brings meaning and interconnectedness with others and life. As the third factor, connectedness is concerned with the degree of personal responsibility felt for one's heritage, including people in the past, present, and future. Together, the three factors provide a composite that reflects a more encompassing dimension of spirituality that Piedmont called global transcendence.

The Sources of Spirituality Scale (SOSS) is an 18-item instrument based on a relational model of spirituality observed among human relationships that has been applied to spiritual experiences with the Sacred (Davis et al., 2015). The instrument itself includes five different factors, each of which depicts a different type of spirituality. The theistic factor assesses the relation with some higher entity, whereas the nature factor measures the connection with natural surroundings. Human spirituality is concerned with one's relation to humanity, and transcendent spirituality focuses on the more ineffable encounters with something beyond the material realm. Finally, self-spirituality measures the degree to which one has connected with a deep and genuine sense of self without involving a sense of divine self. Although these factors assess various aspects of spirituality, their combined scores reflect the general construct of spirituality.

A more recent spiritual well-being instrument is the Spiritual Well-Being Questionnaire (SWBQ; Gomez & Fisher, 2003). Its 20 items are based on the earlier work of Fisher (1998), which Gomez and Fisher used to operationalize the construct; essentially, spiritual well-being is characterized as living harmoniously "within relationships with oneself (personal), others (communal), nature (environment), and God (or transcendental other)" (p. 1976). These four relationship qualities represent the factors that constitute the SWBQ. More specifically, personal well-being is concerned with self-awareness and self-identity, whereas communal well-being involves the nature of personal relationships, including concerns with love, respect, and trust. Interest in developing connections with nature and the environment characterize environmental well-being, while transcendental well-being describes the quality of one's relationship with God. The authors claim the SWBQ to be distinct from other spiritual well-being measures because of being a more broad-based theory, as proposed by Fisher (1998).

At least two spirituality instruments have been developed for use in non-American cultures. Based largely on Piedmont's (1999) theory of spiritual transcendence, the 22-item Scale of Spiritual Transcendence (SST; Piotrowski, Skrzypińksa, & Żemojtel-Piotrowska, 2013) was developed in Poland and includes two subscales. The factor of transcendence proper contains items that describe one's connectedness to a higher reality and humanity, meaning in life, and the positive effects of spiritual practices, whereas items in the factor of spiritual oneness characterize the tendency to accept others and even paradoxical experiences in life. Constructed for use in Turkey, the Spiritual Well-being Scale (SWBS; Ekşi & Kardaş, 2017) contains 29 items based on a survey of various definitions on spiritual well-being. Although not described in great detail, the three factors comprising this instrument include transcendence, harmony with nature, and anomie. Unlike the above SST, the SWBS is available for research only in its cultural language.

All the above instruments have been developed for assessing spirituality based on various theories or definitions of the construct, and their authors have reported acceptable psychometric properties to varying degrees.

A Two-Dimensional Approach to Spirituality

Hood, Hill, and Spilka (2009, p. 282) observed from research that a two-dimensional approach to understanding spiritual transcendence might be useful. A vertical transcendence may apply to those who affirm a God-conscious spirituality, whereas a horizontal transcendence may best characterize others who reject the notion of God yet experience interconnectedness with phenomena encountered along a more horizontal plane, such as with nature, various social movements, and the like. More recently, Streib and Hood (2016, pp. 11–12) offered a distinction between vertical and horizontal transcendence in terms of explicit and implicit religion, as is observed particularly in Western culture. Explicit religion describes a spirituality that relates to an "above world" inhabited with supernatural agents and/or some deity. Implicit religion, however, involves a transcendence experienced by the non-religious, including some agnostics and atheists, all of whom may identify as spiritual but not religious. Accordingly, explicitly religious persons, who recognize the reality of God or some deity, experience a vertical dimension of spirituality, while those who do not encounter a spirituality or connectedness along a horizontal dimension in the present world. Streib and Hood (2016) also acknowledged a "middle ground" between vertical and horizontal transcendence that may include an overlapping of the two (e.g., spiritual experiences among new religious movements, charismatic and esoteric groups, etc.); these may not be necessarily vertical or horizontal. For our purposes here, however, we are concerned only with the vertical and horizontal dimensions of transcendence or spirituality.

Based on this two-dimensional approach (Hood et al., 2009; Streib & Hood, 2016), the intent of this study is to develop a bidirectional spirituality scale that is theoretically distinct from the other spiritual assessments discussed above. With respect to vertical spirituality, our concern is for a scale that assesses the quality of one's relationship with God specifically. The horizontal scale, however, will measure spirituality in terms of two factors that are not necessarily religious: the quality of interpersonal relationships and one's personal attunement to existential meaning and purpose in the world. Because of its vertical and horizontal dimensions, we anticipate that this instrument might be useful for assessing both religious and non-religious spirituality. We expect the religious will relate to both vertical and horizontal dimensions of spirituality while the non-religious will more likely relate to the horizontal than the vertical dimension. Higher scores along both dimensions will reflect a greater degree of spirituality and, implicitly, spiritual wellness.

Method

Participants

Our sample included 239 students from a small state university in the southern USA. They came from general psychology and cross-cultural psychology classes and were given extra credit by their instructors for participating. The participants ranged from 18-47 years of age ($M = 20.96$, $SD = 4.44$), with 71.1% being women (1 participant gave no gender response). About 87% identified as Christian, with the two largest groups being Baptist (49%) and non-denominational (10%), while the remaining 28% identified among several other Christian groups. Among the 13% of non-Christian participants, 7.5% were agnostics, 3.8% were atheists, and 2.4% were a member of a non-Christian religion.

In response to the item, "I consider myself to be a religious person" (1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree), participants scored an average rating of 3.65 ($SD = 1.17$). To the item, "I consider myself to be a spiritual person" (1 = strongly disagree; 5 = strongly agree), participants averaged a score of 3.87 ($SD = 1.03$). Based on a paired-samples t-test, participants perceived themselves as significantly more spiritual than religious ($t_{(238)} = -3.4$, $p < .001$).

Instruments

Religious Orientation. We assessed religious motivation with Gorsuch and McPherson's (1989) indices, one each for intrinsic and extrinsic religious orientation. The intrinsic item was modified to: "My whole approach to life is based on my religion or spirituality" (1 = strongly disagree, 5 = strongly agree). The extrinsic item was revised to: "I go to church/spiritual events mainly because I enjoy seeing people I know there" (1 = strongly disagree, 5 = strongly agree).

Bidirectional Spirituality Scale (BSS). As discussed above, we were interested in developing a brief multi-dimensional spirituality instrument with three factors: (1) vertical spirituality in relation to God; (2) horizontal spirituality in relation to other people; and (3) horizontal spirituality in relation to existential meaning in the world. With this in mind, we constructed 30 items representing these content areas and presented each with a 7-point rating scale (1 = strongly disagree, 7 = strongly agree). The instructions for participants were as follows:

> Please read each statement below very carefully and click your level of agreement on how it relates to your personal life. Do not make your judgment based on how you would like it to relate to you, but how it honestly relates to you.

The BSS included both pro- and contra-items, and contra-items were reverse-scored before their use in the factor analyses. The emergent scales were constructed by summing their respective items, with higher scores indicating higher levels of spirituality (see Table 1 for BSS items).

Beck's Depression Inventory (BDI). Widely used for measuring depression, the BDI (Beck, Ward, Mendelson, Mock, & Erbaugh, 1961) is an instrument with 21-items, each of which presents a series of four statements that progressively indicate higher levels of depression. Each item was scored from 0 to 3, and the sum of all items produced a composite where higher scores reflect depression's characteristic attitudes and symptoms. The reliability of the BDI for this study was .94.

Self-Esteem Scale (SES). We used Rosenberg's (1965) SES to assess participants' subjective views of themselves. Based on a 4-point rating scale (0 = strongly disagree, 3 = strongly agree), the scale is a 10-item unidimensional instrument that measures positive and negative feelings about oneself (e.g., "I feel that I have a number of good qualities."). After reverse scoring contra-items, we summed all item-scores to produce a composite where higher scores indicate higher self-esteem. Its reliability coefficient in this study was .89.

Ego Loss Scale (ELS). To assess weakness of ego strength, we used the Ego Loss subscale of the Exceptional Experiences Questionnaire (Kohls, Hack, & Walach, 2008), which assesses the frequency and evaluation of exceptional and spiritual experiences. The ELS includes 12 items, each of which is presented with a 5-point rating scale (1 = Never, 2 = Seldom, 3 = Sometimes, 4 = Often, 5 = Very often). An example from the ELS is: "A feeling of ignorance or not knowing is overwhelming to me." For this study, we assessed only the frequency of such experiences. We calculated a composite score by summing all item ratings, with higher scores reflecting weaker ego strength. Its reliability in this study was .92.

God Mysticism Scale (GMS). We measured reports of mysticism using a brief version of the God Mysticism Scale (Hood & Williamson, 2000). The original

instrument is a 32-item scale with three subscales that measure introvertive mystical experiences, extrovertive mystical experiences, and the interpretation of these mystical experiences. The introvertive subscale assesses an inner mysticism involving a withdrawal from the world and sensory experience, whereas the extrovertive subscale measures an outer mysticism concerning unity with all things in the world. The interpretation subscale assesses the meaning of the mysticism types in terms of sacred and affective qualities.

To use a briefer version of the scale, we performed an exploratory factor analysis of the original data and selected 4 of the highest loading items (2 pro-traits and 2 con-traits) from each of the three factors. This resulted in a 12-item GMS that assesses introvertive mystical experiences, extrovertive mystical experiences, and their interpretation of those experiences. An example of an extrovertive item is: "I have had an experience in which I realized the oneness of myself and all things in God." A 9-point rating scale is presented with each item (1 = strongly disagree, 9 = strongly agree). After recoding the con-trait items, we summed the scores of all 12 items to produce a composite, with higher scores reporting more mystical experiences. The reliability of the GMS in this study was .88.

Penn State Worry Questionnaire (PSWQ). The widely-used PSWQ (Meyer, Miller, Metzger, & Borkovec, 1990) includes 16 statements that describe variations of the tendency to worry (e.g., "My worries overwhelm me."), and each statement is presented with a 5-point rating scale (1 = not at all typical of me, 5 = very typical of me). We computed a composite score by reverse-scoring con-trait items and then summing all item scores. A higher score indicates a greater tendency to worry. The reliability of the PSWQ for this study was .92.

Happiness Scale (HS). The HS (Lyubomirsky & Lepper, 1999) measures subjective happiness through the use of four items presented with a 7-point rating scale (e.g., "In general, I consider myself" (1 = not a very happy person, 7 = a very happy person). After reverse-scoring one con-trait item, we computed a composite score by summing all four items; higher scores reflect higher levels of subjective happiness. The reliability of the HS in this study was .87.

Life Orientation Test (LOT). The LOT (Scheier, Carver, & Bridges, 1994) includes six items along with four filler items that are scored. Three items measure optimism and three assess pessimism, with higher scores indicating higher levels of optimism/pessimism. All items are presented with a 5-point rating scale (1 = strongly disagree, 5 = strongly agree), with some following examples: "In uncertain times, I usually expect the best" (optimism); and "If something can go wrong for me, it will" (pessimism). The reliabilities for optimism and pessimism on the LOT in this study were .72 and .76, respectively.

Satisfaction with Life Scale (SLS). The SLS (Diener, Emmons, Larsen, & Griffin, 1985) is a 5-item survey that measures cognitive judgments about life satisfaction (e.g., "In most ways my life is close to my ideal."). A 7-point rating scale (1 = strongly disagree, 7 = strongly agree) is presented with each item. Ratings for all items were summed to compute a single score with higher scores indicating more satisfaction with life. The reliability of the SLS in this study was .84.

Procedure

Upon approval of this study from our Institutional Review Board, we assembled the protocol for the above instruments in SurveyMonkey for collecting research data. We contacted Instructors in our department about the study and asked if they would offer extra credit to their students for participation. We then emailed instructors the link to the survey website for distribution to their students.

Once the link was accessed, the first page presented participants with informed consent concerning a description of the study, promised anonymity, risks, and benefits; furthermore, it stated that they could withdraw from participation at any time without penalty (i.e., without loss of course extra credit). At the bottom of this page, participants were required to click a box indicating they agreed to participate before gaining access to the subsequent pages on demographic items and survey instruments. According to SurveyMonkey, the average time for participation was 16 minutes.

Results

Data Preparation

Our initial sample included 255 participants; however, we deleted 16 participants from the sample who had omitted responses to more than eight survey items or who had omitted an entire scale. For the remaining participants, we computed the variable mean to substitute for any missing values. This process left us a sample of 239 participants with complete data for our analyses. We performed all data analyses with IBM SPSS software, version 22.

Exploratory Factor Analysis (EFA)

Our major concern was to develop a brief Bidirectional Spirituality Scale (BSS) with 3 factors that assess (1) vertical spirituality (VS) in relation to God; (2) horizontal spirituality-others (HS-O) in relation to other people; and (3) horizontal spirituality-existential (HS-E) in relation to one's place of being the world. Our thinking is also that both the HS-O and HS-E factors can be combined as a Horizontal Spirituality (HS) factor in corollary with VS.

We included all 30 BSS items in an EFA to determine the initial structure, using principal axis factoring as the method of extraction and varimax rotation. As revealed by the scree plot (eigenvalues > 1), the initial solution identified four factors that accounted for 58.81% (Factor 1 = 30.56%, Factor 2 = 12.3%, Factor 3 = 11.7%, Factor 4 = 4.25%) of the variance in scores (see Table 1). All items from Factor 1 appeared to describe a spiritual relationship with God. Concerning Factor 2, all items except for Item 25 appeared to describe spiritual relations with other people. With the exception of Items 10 and 3, Factor 3's items were concerned with existential issues that can be described as spiritual in nature. Factor 4 included only three items, one of which was about personal relations while two others described existential concerns.

Table 1.
Initial Factorial Structure of the Bidirectional Spirituality Scale based on the Exploratory Factor Analysis of 30 Items (N = 239)

Item		Factors			
#	Items	I	II	III	IV
26.	When I engage in spiritual or religious practices, I feel drawn to God.	.903			
22.	I often have the sense that God is with me.	.900			
16.	I often feel close to God.	.886			
14.	I am fully confident that God is directing my life.	.874			
20.	I know beyond all doubt that God loves me.	.870			
28.	I feel a peacefulness when I think about God.	.867			
12.	I know that God hears me when I pray.	.864			
8.	Many times, I feel very connected with God.	.835			
18.	I am living out God's will for my life in this world.	.805			
6.	When I encounter God, I usually feel a oneness with God.	.773			
24.	I feel that my life is in tune with God.	.754			
4.	I find it easy to relate to the Higher Power.	.651			
2.	I feel that my life is in harmony with something that is greater than myself.	.484			
27.	I am able to see the good side of other people.		.676		
29.	When I am with other people, it's pretty easy to feel a connection with them.		.637		
9.	When I am around other people, I feel a harmony with them.		.629		
25.	When dealing with problems, I tend to believe that things will eventually work out for the best.		.611		
23.	I find it easy to forgive others who have wronged me.		.596		
17.	I tend to get along well with most everyone.		.585		
13.	I feel a closeness with people in my life.		.512		
21.	My life doesn't seem to have much purpose.*			.736	
30.	I often feel lost from a sense of direction in this world.*			.666	
5.	I don't know why I am in this world.*			.619	
11.	I find meaning and purpose in living my life in this world.			.611	
10.	I often feel lost from God.*			.525	
3.	I feel at peace with my family, friends, and most other people.			.471	
7.	I usually feel in synch with what is going on around me.			.423	
1.	I know my place in this world.				.470
15.	I don't usually feel annoyed by other people.*				.390
19.	I am living in this world the way that I believe I should.				.335

* = Con-trait item

Since our goal was to develop a brief scale suitable for research, we decided to select 16 items from the first 3 factors based on two criteria: (1) items should represent a good sampling of content with respect to the meaning of the factor and (2) the strength of factor loadings should be considered as much as possible with concern for the first criterion. We selected the first 8 items (26, 22, 16, 14, 20, 28, 12, and 8) from Factor 1 as they seemed a good representation of content associated with deistic spirituality; they also were the items with the highest loadings on the factor. From Factor 2, we selected the four items (27, 29, 23, and 17) that seemed to best characterize spiritual maturity in relating with others. From Factor 3, we gave priority to selecting the four items that represented the concern for existential attunement in the most diverse way; as stated above, the strength of factor loadings was of secondary concern, particularly so in this case. Even though both Items 21 and 11 characterized concern for finding purpose in life, Item 11, which loaded with less magnitude, includes the word "meaning," which broadened the content; thus we selected Item 11 instead of Item 21. From Factor 3, we selected Items 30, 5, 11, and 7.

Table 2.
*Final Factorial Structure, Descriptive Coefficients, and Reliabilities of the 16-Item Bidirectional Spirituality Scale Based on Exploratory Factor Analysis (*N = 239*)*

Item		Factors			
#	Items	I	II	III	α
	Bidirectional Spirituality Scale (BSS, 16 items; *M* = 84.27, *SD* = 18.65)				.92
	Vertical Spirituality (VS, 8 items; *M* = 43.2, *SD* =13.68)				.97
20.	I know beyond all doubt that God loves me.	.902			
26.	When I engage in spiritual or religious practices, I feel drawn to God.	.898			
22.	I often have the sense that God is with me.	.888			
14.	I am fully confident that God is directing my life.	.880			
28.	I feel a peacefulness when I think about God.	.875			
12.	I know that God hears me when I pray.	.870			
16.	I often feel close to God.	.868			
8.	Many times, I feel very connected with God.	.810			
	Horizontal Spirituality (HS = HS-O + HS-E, 8 items; *M* = 41.07, *SD* = 7.97)				.78
	Horizontal Spirituality – Others (HS-O, 4 items; *M* = 21.47, *SD* = 4.41)				.74
27.	I am able to see the good side of other people.		.725		
23.	I find it easy to forgive others who have wronged me.		.606		
17.	I tend to get along well with most everyone.		.599		
29.	When I am with other people, it's pretty easy to feel a connection with them.		.586		
	Horizontal Spirituality – Existential (HS-E, 4 items; *M* = 19.6, *SD* = 5.12)				.75
30.	I often feel lost from a sense of direction in this world.*			.651	
5.	I don't know why I am in this world.*			.649	
11.	I find meaning and purpose in living my life in this world.			.648	
7.	I usually feel in synch with what is going on around me.			.489	

* = Con-trait item
Note: BSS = Bidirectional Spirituality Scale; VS = Vertical Spirituality; HS = Horizontal Spirituality; HS-O = Horizontal Spirituality–Others; HS-E = Horizontal Spirituality–Existential

Once item selection was completed, we subjected the 16 items to a second EFA using again the principal axis factoring method of extraction with varimax rotation. The scree plot (eigenvalues > 1) revealed a solution of 3 factors that accounted for 64.06% (Factor 1 = 39.79%, Factor 2 = 12.60%, Factor 3 = 11.67%) of the variance. As expected, Table 2 shows all items loaded on the appropriate factors with sufficient magnitudes of strength (> .40). We conducted reliability analyses to examine the internal consistency of the entire BSS (16 items), VS (8 items), HS-O (4 items), HS-E (4 items), and Horizontal Spirituality (HS, 8 items, which is the combination of HS-O and HS-E). As presented in Table 2, all reliabilities indicate adequate internal consistency for all scales/factors. Table 2 also reports the means and standard deviations for all scales/factors.

Partial Confirmatory Factor Analysis (PCFA)

To further test the fit of the model to the data, we conducted a PCFA of the 16 BSS-items using SPSS software as outlined by Gignac (2009). Accordingly, the value of such a procedure is that the results can provide justification for recommending future research with another sample to validate an EFA-derived model using full confirmatory factor analysis. To perform the procedure, we entered the 16 items and selected maximum likelihood as the method of extraction and varimax rotation. The three-factor structure of the BSS derived by the EFA was confirmed by the PCFA. Using Bartlett's Sphericity Test (Null model χ^2) and Goodness of Fit (Implied model χ^2) statistics, we calculated the close-fit index values for the normed-fit index (*NFI*), comparative-fit index (*CFI*), Tucker-Lewis index (*TLI*), and root mean square error of approximation (*RMSEA*) as outlined by Gignac (2009). Gignac (p. 41) recommended that the *NFI*, *CFI*, and *TLI* values that are approximately .95 or larger and *RMSEA* values that are approximately .08 or less indicate an acceptable fit of the model to the data; however, others (e.g., Kelloway, 1998, p. 27) have argued that close-fit indices of .90 or greater and *RMSEA* values less than .10 indicate good fit for the model. Based on these latter criteria, the fit indices presented in Table 3 indicate good fit of the Bidirectional Spirituality model to the data.

Table 3.
Partial Confirmatory Factor Analysis Fit Indices for the Bidirectional Spirituality model (N = 239)

Bartlett's Test of Sphericity (Null model) χ^2 / *df*	Goodness of Fit (Implied model) χ^2 / *df*	*NFI*	*CFI*	*TLI*	*RMSEA*
3166.227/120*	242.368/75*	.923	.945	.912	.097

* *p* < .001

BSS and Scale/Factor Correlations

In preparing the initial items for the BSS, we assumed that factors would likely be orthogonal for a general sample that includes both religious and non-religious

participants. In view of this, our focus here is largely on the relationships between the three spirituality scales/factors (VS, HS-O, HS-E). As presented in Table 4a, the correlations for VS X HS-O (r = .32; p < .01) and VS X HS-E (r = .42; p < .01), and for HS-O X HS-E (r = .40, p < .01) are not large in magnitude, which suggests some degree of independence. In addition to these empirically-derived subscales, we constructed an 8-item Horizontal Spirituality (HS) scale, which might be useful in research, by combining the HS-O and HS-E factors. The size of the correlation for VS X HS-E (r = .45, p < .01) also suggests some degree of independence.

Table 4a.
*Correlations Between the Bidirectional Spirituality Scale and Scales/Factors (*N = 239)

Factors	VS	HS	HS-O	HS-E
BSS	.92*	.75*	.58*	.67*
VS	-	.45*	.32*	.42*
HS	-	-	.81*	.86*
HS-O	-	-	-	.40*

* p < .001
BSS = Bidirectional Spirituality Scale; VS = Vertical Spirituality; HS = Horizontal Spirituality;
HS-O = Horizontal Spirituality–Others; HS-E = Horizontal Spirituality–Existential

For religious people in general, however, we would expect VS to be more strongly related to the dimensions of HS-O and HS-E—much more so than for non-religious people. To investigate this hypothesis, we divided our sample into subgroups of religious (n = 207) and non-religious (n = 32) participants. For each of the groups, we computed descriptive coefficients for the scales/factors and also correlations between these scales/factors (see Table 4b). Not surprisingly, the religious (M = 47.09, SD = 9.20) scored significantly higher than the non-religious (M = 18.01, SD = 10.87) on the VS factor, which is reflected in their overall BSS scores and its factors, although both groups are much more similar in scores on the HS-O, HS-E, and HS factors.

When comparing correlations between VS and the dimensions of the HS-O and HS-E from the entire sample (Table 4a) with those for the religious and non-religious subgroups (Table 4b), we found changes in magnitude that might be expected. For the religious, the correlation for VS X HS-E (r = .52, p < .01) is considerably larger in size, while that for VS X HS-E (r = .44, p < .01) is somewhat larger. For the non-religious, however, these correlations are much smaller in size and not significant (VS X HS-O, r = .08, p = .669; VS X HS-E, r = .28, p = .123). Concerning the correlations for VS X HS (the composite of HS-O + HS-E), they are also larger in magnitude for the religious (r =.57, p < .01), but again decreased in size to being insignificant for the non-religious (r = .24, p = .186). Over all, the comparison between the entire sample and the religious and non-religious subsamples shows the correlations between VS and the dimensions of horizontal spirituality (HS-O, HS-E, HS) to have remained significant and even increased in magnitude for religious participants, but to have decreased in size and become insignificant for non-religious participants.

Table 4b.

*Correlations Between the Bidirectional Spirituality Scale and Scales/Factors; Descriptive Coefficients for Religious (*n = 207*) and Non-Religious Participants (*n = 32*)*

Factors	BSS	VS	HS	HS-O	HS-E	*M / SD*
BSS	-	.91*	.87*	.75*	.71*	88.57/15.10
VS	.84*	-	.57*	.52*	.44*	47.09/9.20
HS	.73*	.24	-	.83*	.86*	41.47/7.83
HS-O	.46*	.08	.73*	-	.42*	21.49/4.45
HS-E	.69*	.28	.88*	.33	-	19.98/4.85
M / SD	56.48/15.32	18.01/10.87	38.47/8.50	21.34/4.20	17.13/6.13	-

* *p* < .01

Note: Religious participant correlations are reported above the hash marks; non-religious participant correlations are reported below the hash marks.

BSS = Bidirectional Spirituality Scale; VS = Vertical Spirituality; HS = Horizontal Spirituality;
HS-O = Horizontal Spirituality–Others; HS-E = Horizontal Spirituality–Existential

What these findings suggest on the one hand is that the spirituality that religious participants experience in relation to their God is reflected strongly in their relationships with people—in other words, the former may flow into the latter. On the other hand, although the non-religious may enjoy a spiritual connection with others and may be spiritually attuned to their sense of place in the world, this is not derived from a vertical relationship with God.

Evidence for Validity

The preliminary construct validity for the BSS, which has been established above, is assisted with evidence for both convergent and discriminant validity (Kaplan & Saccuzzo, 2009, pp. 147–153). We developed BSS items such that higher scores would reflect increased spiritual attunement to God, other people, and existential concerns. Those with higher BSS scores, therefore, should score higher in mysticism, self-esteem, happiness, life satisfaction, and optimism and score lower in depression, weak ego strength, worry, and pessimism. We also anticipated that higher scores on the BSS would relate to higher reports of intrinsic and, to a lesser degree, extrinsic religiosity.

Correlations between BSS/factors and the above variables are reported in Table 5. Because of the large sample size and its statistical power to detect even weak relationships, we set the alpha level of significance for relationships at $p < .01$. Concerning the full measure of the BSS, all validity coefficients are significant in the expected direction except for worry ($r = -.17, p > .01$), although they were of various magnitudes (from $r = .23$ to .69 [absolute values], $p < .01$).

Table 5.
Validity Correlations for the Bi-directional Spirituality Scale and Sub-factors (N = 239)

Study Variables	BDSS and Sub-factors				
Convergent Validity Measures	**BDSS**	**VS**	**HS**	**HS-O**	**HS-E**
God Mysticism (Hood & Williamson, 2000)	.69*	.72*	.37*	.27*	.34*
Self-esteem (Rosenberg, 1965)	.41*	.22*	.59*	.33*	.62*
Happiness (Lyubomirsky & Lepper, 1999)	.51*	.40*	.51*	.41*	.44*
Optimism (Scheier et al., 1994)	.40*	.24*	.53*	.42*	.46*
Life satisfaction (Diener et al., 1985)	.33*	.24*	.38*	.21*	.41*
Discriminant Validity Measures					
Depression (Beck et al., 1961)	-.44*	-.28*	-.55*	-.32*	-.58*
Ego Loss (Kohls et al., 2008)	-.29*	-.16	-.40*	-.18*	-.46*
Worry (Meyer et al., 1990)	-.17	-.06	-.29*	-.20*	-.28*
Pessimism (Scheier et al., 1994)	-.23*	-.17*	-.24*	-.15	-.25*
Religious Motivation					
Intrinsic (Gorsuch & McPherson, 1989)	.57*	.63*	.24*	.17*	.22*
Extrinsic (Gorsuch & McPherson, 1989)	.25*	.30*	.06	-.01	.10

*$p < .001$ (Note that for the coefficient of .17, two relationships are significant, while one is not. This is due to rounding.)
BSS = Bidirectional Spirituality Scale; VS = Vertical Spirituality; HS = Horizontal Spirituality;
HS-O = Horizontal Spirituality–Others; HS-E = Horizontal Spirituality–Existential

Because the BSS assesses two distinct dimensions of spirituality, perhaps a more useful procedure for examining scale validity is to attend the coefficients reported in the columns for VS and HS. For both dimensions, convergent-validity coefficients are all positive and significant and range from approaching moderate ($r = .22$) to large ($r = .72$) magnitudes. Concerning discriminant validity, more evidence exists for HS than for VS. All discriminant validity coefficients are significant and negatively related to HS, ranging in magnitude from -.25 to -.58. However, only two of these coefficients are significant and negatively related to VS: Pessimism ($r = -.17$) is weakly related, and depression ($r = -.28$) is near-moderately related. In observing the columns for the HS-O and HS-E—which constitute the HS—even more discriminating and interesting information exists. For example, all validity variables are more strongly related to spiritual attunement to one's existential place in the world (HS-E) than to spiritual relations with others (HS-O). As expected, intrinsic religious motivation is most strongly associated with the BSS and is significant across all factors, whereas extrinsic orientation is less related to the BSS and VS, and unrelated to the other factors. Thus these analyses indicate the initial evidence for both convergent and discriminant validity of the BSS to be a measure of bidirectional spirituality.

Discussion

This study has been concerned with developing a brief instrument that is theoretically grounded for assessing the vertical and horizontal dimensions of spirituality (Streib & Hood, 2016). Analyses of the data derived a 16-item scale with three factors of vertical spirituality (VS), horizontal spirituality-others (HS-O), and horizontal spirituality-

existential (HS-E) with good internal consistency and initial evidence for validity. Furthermore, the bidirectional construction of this instrument allows for spiritual assessment with both religious and non-religious groups. It is useful with religious groups in that it relates to both their vertical and horizontal dimensions of spirituality; for them, a spiritual relationship with God likely flows into their spiritual relations with other people and affords them a sense of meaning and purpose in life. The BSS also seems useful with non-religious groups who might not relate to a God-based spirituality but otherwise experience a spiritual connection with other people and find themselves spiritually in attunement with a sense of purpose and meaning in life.

The findings of the present study have indicated the BSS to have sound psychometric properties. Furthermore, our findings from the partial confirmatory factor analysis (Gignac, 2009) warrant the need for further investigation with a different sample using a full confirmatory factor analysis. Such a study would further establish the construct validity of the BSS as a measure of bidirectional spirituality. Nevertheless, this study indicates that the BSS holds promise as a brief, multidimensional scale for research on religious and non-religious spirituality (see Appendix).

References

Beck, A.T., Ward, C.M., Mendelson, M., Mock, J., & Erbaugh, J. (1961). An inventory for measuring depression. *Archives of General Psychiatry, 4,* 561-571.

Bufford, R. K., Paloutzian, R. F., & Ellison, C. W. (1991). Norms for the Spiritual Well-Being Scale. *Journal of Psychology and Theology, 19*, 56-70.

Daaleman, T. P., & Frey, B. B. (2004). The spirituality index of well-being: A new instrument for health-related quality of life research. *Annals of Family Medicine, 2*, 499–503.

Davis, D. E., Rice, K., Hook, J. N., Van Tongeren, D. R., DeBlaere, C., Choe, E., & Worthington, Jr., E. L. (2015). Development of the Sources of Spirituality Scale. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *62*, 503–513.

Delaney, C. (2005). The Spirituality Scale development and psychometric testing of a holistic instrument to assess the human spiritual dimension. *Journal of Holistic Nursing, 23,* 145-167.

Diener, E., Emmons, R. A., Larsen, R. J., & Griffin, S. (1985). The Satisfaction with Life Scale. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, *49*, 71-75.

Ekşi, H., & Kardaş, S. (2017). Spiritual well-being: Scale development and validation. *Spiritual Psychology and Counseling, 2*, 73–88.

Fang, C. K, Li, P. Y., Lai, M. L., Lin, M. H., Bridge, D. T., & Chen, H. W. (2011). Establishing a "physician's spiritual well-being scale" and testing its reliability and validity. *Journal of Medical Ethics, 37,* 6-12.

Fisher, J. W. (1998). *Spiritual health: Its nature, and place in the school curriculum* (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Victoria, Australia.

Gignac, G. E. (2009). Partial confirmatory factor analysis: Described and illustrated on the NEO-PI-R. *Journal of Personality Assessment, 91,* 40-47.

Gomez, R., & Fisher, J. W. (2003). Domains of spiritual well-being and development and validation of the Spiritual Well-Being Questionnaire. *Personality and Individual Differences, 35*, 1975–1991.

Gorsuch, R.L., & McPherson, S.E. (1989). Intrinsic/extrinsic measurement: I/I-revised and single-item scales. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, 28,* 348-354.

Hood, R. W., Jr., Hill, P. C., & Spilka, B. (2009). *The psychology of religion: An empirical approach* (4ᵗʰ ed.). New York: Guilford Press.

Hood, R.W., Jr., & Williamson, W.P. (2000). An empirical test of the unity thesis: The structure of mystical descriptors in various faith samples. *Journal of Psychology and Christianity, 19*(3), 232-244.

James, W. (1982). *The varieties of religious experience.* New York: Penguin. (Original work published in 1902)

Kaplan, R. M., & Saccuzzo, D. P. (2009). *Psychological testing: Principles, applications, and issues* (7ᵗʰ ed.). Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, Cengage Learning.

Kelloway, E. K. (1998). *Using LISREL for structural equation modeling.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Kohls, N., Hack, A., & Walach, H. (2008). Measuring the unmeasureable to tickin boxes and actually opening Pandora's box? Mixed methods research as a useful tool for investigating exceptional human experiences. *Archive for the Psychology of Religion, 30*, 155-187.

Ledbetter, M. F., Smith, L. A., Fischer, J. D., Vosler-Hunter, W. L., & Chew, G. P. (1991). An evaluation of the construct validity of the Spiritual Well-Being Scale: A confirmatory factor analytic approach. *Journal of Psychology and Theology, 19*(1), 94-102.

Lyubomirsky, S., & Lepper, H. S. (1999). A measure of subjective happiness: Preliminary reliability and construct validation. *Social Indicators Research, 46,* 137-155.

Meyer, T. J., Miller, M. L., Metzger, R. L., & Borkovec, T. D. (1990). Development and validation of the Penn State Worry Questionnaire. *Behaviour Research and Therapy, 28*, 487-495.

Paloutzian, R. F., & Ellison, C. W. (1982). *Loneliness, spiritual well-being and the quality of life.* In L. A. Peplau & D. Perlman (Eds.), *Loneliness: A sourcebook of current theory, research and therapy* (pp. 224–237). New York: Wiley.

Peterman, A. H., Fitchett, G., Brady, M. J., Hernandez, L., & Cella, D. (2002). Measuring spiritual well-being in people with cancer: The Functional Assessment of Chronic Illness Therapy-Spiritual Well-Being scale (FACIT-Sp). *Annals of Behavioral Medicine, 24,* 49–58.

Piedmont, R. L. (1999). Does spirituality represent the sixth factor of personality? Spiritual transcendence and the Five-Factor Model. *Journal of Personality, 67,* 985-1014.

Piotrowski, J., Skrzypińksa, K., & Żemojtel-Piotrowska, M. (2013). The Scale of Spiritual Transcendence: Construction and validation. *Annals of Psychology, 16,* 469-485.

Rosenberg, M. (1965). *Society and the adolescent self-image.* Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Scheier, M. F., Carver, C. S., & Bridges, M. W. (1994). Distinguishing optimism from neuroticism (and trait anxiety, self-mastery, and self-esteem): A re-evaluation of the Life Orientation Test. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 67, 1063-1078.

Scott, E. L., Agresti, A. A., & Fitchett, G. (1998). Factor analysis of the Spiritual Well-Being Scale and its clinical utility with psychiatric inpatients. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, 37*, 314-321.

Streib, H., & Hood, R. W., Jr. (2016). Understanding spirituality: Conceptual considerations. In H. Streib & R. W. Hood, Jr. (Eds.), *Semantics and psychology of spirituality: A cross-cultural analysis* (pp. 3-17). New York: Springer.

Vivat, B., Young, T., Efficace, F., Sigurdadóttir, V., Arraras, J. I., Åsgeirsdóttir, G. H., … the EORTC Quality of Life Group. (2013). Cross-cultural development of the EORTC QLB-SWB36: A stand-alone measure of spiritual well-being for palliative care patients with cancer. *Palliative Medicine, 27*, 457–469.

Williamson, W. P., & Hood, R. W., Jr. (2016). *Psychology and spiritual transformation in a substance abuse program: The Lazarus Project.* Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.

World Health Organization. (2002). WHOQOL Spirituality, Religiousness and Personal Beliefs (SRPB) Field-Test instrument. Geneva: Department of Mental Health and Substance Dependence, World Health Organization. Online available at www.who.int/mental_health/media/en/622.pdf

Zinnbauer, B. J., & Pargament, K. I. (2005). Religiousness and spirituality. In C. L. Park & R. F. Paloutzian (Eds.), *Handbook of the psychology of religion and spirituality* (pp. 21-42).

Appendix

Below are the instructions and recommended presentation order of the Bi-directional Spirituality Scale for future research.

Instructions: Please read each statement below very carefully and rate your level of agreement on how it relates to your personal life. Do not make your judgement based on how you would like it to relate to you, but how it honestly relates to you.

1 = Strongly disagree
2 = Moderately disagree
3 = Slightly disagree
4 = Uncertain
5 = Slightly agree
6 = Moderately agree
7 = Strongly agree

1. I know beyond all doubt that God loves me.
2. I am able to see the good side of other people.
3. When I engage in spiritual or religious practices, I feel drawn to God.
4. I often feel lost from a sense of direction in this world.*
5. I often have the sense that God is with me.
6. I find it easy to forgive others who have wronged me.
7. I am fully confident that God is directing my life.
8. I don't know why I am in this world.*
9. Many times, I feel very connected with God.
10. I tend to get along well with most everyone.
11. I know that God hears me when I pray.
12. I find meaning and purpose in living my life in this world.
13. I often feel close to God.
14. When I am with other people, it's pretty easy to feel a connection with them.
15. I feel a peacefulness when I think about God.
16. I usually feel in synch with what is going on around me.

* Con-trait items are to be reverse-scored.

Original Article

Parallelisms between Jungian Archetypes with Ibn 'Arabi's Concept of Ayani-Sabita

Turgay Şirin[1]
Istanbul Sabahattin Zaim University

Abstract

This study attempts to put forth the relationship between Carl Gustav Jung's concept of the archetype and Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi's concept of Ayani-sabita. In this context, the nature of the concepts of Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi's Ayani-sabita and Jung's concept of the archetype are examined, as well as the similarities and differences between each of the two concepts, by researching the issues of the relationship of these concepts with existence and humans. Attention is attempted to be drawn in the study's results to the topics that the concept of Ayani-sabita, which is often unrecognized in the literature on psychology, can contribute to contemporary psychology, arriving at the conclusion that this concept may be one that can contribute to the science of psychology just as Jung's archetype concept.

Keywords

Archetype, Ayani-sabita, Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi, Carl Gustav Jung

Jung'un Arketip Kavramı ile İbnü'l-Arabi'nin Âyân-ı Sâbite Kavramı arasındaki Paralellikler

Öz

Bu çalışmada Carl Gustave Jung'un "arketip" kavramı ile Muhyiddin İbnü'l-Arabî'nin "âyân-ı sâbite" kavramı arasındaki ilişki ortaya konulmaya çalışılmıştır. Bu kapsamda Jung'un Arketip kavramı ile Muhyiddin İbnü'l-Arabî'nin âyân-ı sâbite kavramlarının niteliği, bu kavramların varlıkla ve insan ile ilişkisi konuları araştırılarak, her iki kavramın benzerlik ve farklılıkları incelenmiştir. Çalışmanın sonucunda psikoloji literatüründe çok fazla tanınmayan âyân-ı sâbite kavramının günümüz psikolojisine katkıda bulunabileceği hususlara dikkat çekilmeye çalışılmış ve bu kavramın tıpkı C. G. Jung'un arketip kavramı gibi psikoloji bilimine katkı sağlayabilecek bir kavram olabileceği sonucuna ulaşılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Arketip, Âyân-ı Sâbite, Muhyiddin İbnü'l-Arabî, Carl Gustave Jung

The history of humanity is a magnificent treasure that undoubtedly has been constructed over accumulations. The common accumulation of humanity that has come to the present day poses a significant treasure for many areas of science, which includes psychology at the top, being particularly interested in knowing and understanding humans. A significant part of the accumulations in this context have formed the areas of philosophy, literature, and Islamic mysticism, as well as other mystical areas. Within this accumulation, the mystic schools that are based on humans' spiritual development have drawn the attention of many important pioneers in the history of modern psychology, like C. Gustav Jung and Sigmund Freud. These names are known to have been interested in primitive tribes and religious and mystical movements and to have researched and analyzed Eastern texts (for additional information please see Freud, 2001 [1939] & Jung, 2012). In fact, one of the many psychologists who are found to have constructed their own personality theories with motion from these analyses is Jung. Indeed, the concept of archetype, which he developed by taking inspiration from the Eastern texts he had researched, constitutes an important element of his own personality theory; he conducted psychological counseling studies, which he made with his clients in pioneering this concept (Jung, 2003; Stevens, 1999; Jung, 1997).

As much as Jung's archetype concept resembles Plato's ideals, it also stands before us as a concept that differs through his own original rendition. Jung's archetype concept is the pre-existing forms of comprehension; namely, it is an *a priori* factor that compels human intuition and its conceptions into formats specific to humans (Jung, 2003, pp. 17–21; Fordham, 2001, p. 27; Stevens, 1999, pp. 50–59). As can be understood here, abstract and even certain metaphysical concepts like Jung's archetype are found in the psychology literature. Thus the fact is undeniable that these types of metaphysical and philosophical concepts have an effect for contemporary psychological sciences that research humanity. At this point here, the teachings of Islamic mysticism may also be an important resource for psychology, just as the Eastern teachings and other mystic schools that formed an important place in Jung's research were able to be a source of inspiration for psychology. Namely, psychology's research into the areas of mysticism, mystical experiences, human models, and human approaches can provide access to findings that will be able to create a benefit for modern people on the journey of discovering human nature. From this point of view, investigating the lives, works, practices, and views of the important Sufi thinkers who have given direction to mystical life for centuries from a psychological perspective can be assessed as a method that will be able to serve this purpose. On this point here, Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi (1165-1239), whose actual name is Abu Bakir Muhyiddin Muhammad bin Ali and who has research institutes established today in his name, can be evaluated as an important Sufi thinker (Cebecioğlu, 2008, pp. 9–10). In fact, Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi used the concept of Ayani-sabita, a concept that resembles the archetype, in also understanding humans, just like C. G. Jung (Ibn Arabi, translated 2013, p. 46; Kâşânî, 1992, p. 55; Kılıç, 1999, pp. 501–502).

Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi said the ayni-sabita of the essences of objects, or in other words that which has been created, has been fixed in the wisdom of Allah since time immemorial. This concept, mostly occurring in the literature as Ayani-sabita, means the availability of objects, which exist in the outer universe as an important concept of mysticism, as knowledge in the mind of Allah before becoming visible and the essences and hidden truths of the revealed existence that are in the mind of Allah (Cebecioğlu, 2005, p. 69; Kılıç, 1999, pp. 501–502). In short, Ayani-sabita is the possible existences of the truths that are constant in the knowledge of Allah Ta'ala (Kâşânî, 1992, p. 55). At the same time, Ayani-sabita is the appearance of divine manifestations, or the scene of emergence. When the entity, attributes, and names of Allah Ta'ala emerge in the eyes of the created, the scene of the occurrence appears in different representations in terms of predisposition. The multiplicity, or multitude, emerges from the capacities of Ayani-sabita. In short, filling up the entire universe in the guise of existence is in line with the demands that the Ayani-sabitas make from Allah and the predispositions that are in ayni-sabita (Ibn 'Arabi, 2013, p. 46). This also emerges directly in humans and determines all human characteristics. A similar situation stands out here while defining Jung's archetype concept in defining "the pre-existing forms, namely an *a priori* factor that innately exists prior to the emergence of consciousness and compels its comprehension in humans in specific formats" (Jung, 2003, pp. 17–21; Fordham, 2001, p. 27; Stevens, 1999, pp. 50–59).

In short, a number of similarities and differences are considered between Jung's concept of archetype and Ibn 'Arabi's concept of Ayani-sabita. When examining the literature, particularly in Turkey, although some studies (Öztekin, 2011) on this issue have been encountered, the need for various comprehensive studies is understood. Therefore, researching the relationship between Jung's archetype concept and Ibn 'Arabi's Ayani-sabita concept forms the main purpose of this study.

Jung's Concept of Archetype

According to Jung, archetypes are forms of expressions of the legacy left to their innate self by way of universal motifs common for all of humanity that each individual possesses and carries within themselves (Jung, 2014). Jung referred to Plato's concept of idea while describing his archetype concept, stating the archetype concept to have been used more in ancient times and being a concept synonymous with Plato's idea (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 17). In support of this argument, Jung illustrated the concept of *Corpus Hermeticum* (the archetypal light), marking the existence of the idea of the phenomenon of the Light of God in ancient times, which is the "first image" of all the lights preceding and above this phenomenon. Afterwards he also stated, "If I had been a philosopher, this Platonic claim would continue and I would say this; there is a maternal primary image that precedes and is above all phenomena

related to the elemental state somewhere in a celestial place. However, defending my private temperament or my personal opinion as a general passing thing in the face of intellectual problems is not possible because I am an empiricist, not a philosopher" (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 17–18).

According to Jung, the archetype concept is an extension and part of the social (collective) unconscious. Jung noted the collective unconscious on this issue, taking it one step further then the views of previous thinkers by saying, "If I have a share in these discoveries, it is in also showing that archetypes are spread not only through traditions, language, and the eyes but that anytime and anywhere they can spontaneously reappear independent of any external factors" (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 20).

Jung also referred to common symbols that exist in humans by associating the concept of archetypes with the collective unconscious. The image of God that exists in humans and the common symbols (i.e., mandalas, basic cults) that exist in various cultures are evidences of the existence of the collective unconscious (Jung, [trans.] 2014, p. 23).

According to Jung, critiquing the essence, source, and methods of psychology is necessary with the stipulation of not falling into the trap of psychologism. The center of this critique forms the essence of human actions. According to this, an *a priori* factor is found in human actions. This is also what comes innately from the psyche, and therefore is the preconscious and unconscious individual structure. The issue that needs to be watched out for here is that a baby is not a blank sheet that can be filled when providing suitable conditions after being born. On the contrary, humans are a highly complex entity with very clearly defined individual phenomenon even at time of birth. The reasons this comes to us in darkness are that we cannot see it directly. However, when the first observable psychic responses start to be given, humans need to be blind according to Jung in order to not see the individual characteristics in these responses, namely to not see the original personality. Moreover, these details also clearly do not form the moment that they are observed. At most here, psychological factors are found to pass from generation to generation similar to genetic transference (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 19).

According to Jung, if there is a psyche that allows for exhibiting behaviors specific to species just like other creatures, humans have a preformatted psyche specific to their species. Here one must accept the existence of unconscious psychic structures that allow humans to behave like humans. Jung called this "image" (Jung, 1952/1977, p. 216; Jung, 1976/2003, p. 20). Because these images are species specific, they are primary images and emerge simultaneously with the emergence of the species. In fact, Jung likened archetypes to the fossils of animals' old ancestors in a speech in 1952 (Jung, 1952/1977, p. 209). According to Jung, these particular features exist in the core of humans. Jung, in his own words, interprets this as: "Humans have this specific style in their core, and the assumption that it is not hereditary, that it forms

anew in every person, is as ridiculous as the primitive belief that the morning sun is a different sun than the one that set the previous evening" (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 20).

The concept Jung described as the "primary image" is equivalent to the archetype concept. According to Jung, this primary image becomes certain only through the conscious, namely through the materials of conscious experience. Jung explained this with the crystal metaphor, saying:

> However, the form of the archetypes can be compared with a crystalline axis system, as I have also explained elsewhere before. The crystalline axis system has in a sense preformed the crystal formation in the primordial fluid yet itself does not have a material existence. Material existence emerges through the clustering of only ions in a special form, then later molecules. The archetype itself is void; it is purely a formational element; because self-depiction is an *a priori* possibility, it is nothing more than *facultas praeformandi* (designed power). What is transferred by way of heredity here is not depictions but forms. In this respect, they correspond to instincts that are also still formational. If the existence of archetypes cannot somehow be proven, neither can instincts unless they are seen concretely. (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 21)

Jung attempted to make it easier for us to understand the concept through the crystal analogy while explaining the archetype concept. According to him, although the crystals' structures change, the one thing that does not change in principle is the axis system, which always has the same geometries. The same is true of the archetype according to him. As such, the emerging form of the archetype, which can be characterized in principle, is never concrete; it just has an invariant meaning in its core (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 21). For example, the empirical appearance of the various archetypes defined by Jung, such as the emergence of the mother archetype or the anima/animus archetypes, do not derive solely from these archetypes but can also be caused by the people who appear or different cultures, religions, and traditions symbolically. They appear as images in different cultures, mythologies, legends, and fairy tales. They appear as creatures, animals, and plants that are real or a product of fantasy, as in countless examples in mythologies such as half-human beings, dwarves, and giants (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 21).

Archetypes also show themselves through symbolisms and images in dreams (Jung, 1952/1977, p. 216). They can additionally show themselves in the form of emotions as in images or imagined constructs. These effects become evident at peoples' births, deaths, achievements earned in the face of natural obstacles, the period of transitioning to puberty, or times when facing great danger (Fordham, 2001, p. 28).

Jung's archetype concept basically has a dualism, because aside from being psychic, it also has a neurological structure. It is both spirit and material. Jung saw this as a compulsory precondition of psychophysical events (Stevens, 1999, p. 57). According to Jung, archetypes are hidden essences of the conscious mind, or using his analogy, "roots that are not just put out into the soil in the narrow sense of the spirit, but generally

to the whole world" (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 20–21; Stevens, 1999, p. 57). By moving the archetype concept a little further here, Jung advocates that archetypal structures are not just the basic condition for the existence of all living organisms; at the same time they are a structure that also supervises the behaviors of inorganic substances. In this respect, the archetype concept is evaluated "generally as a bridge transitioning to matter (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 17–21, Stevens, 1999, p. 57). According to Stevens, this thought deeply impacted physicist Wolfgang Pauli and the archetype concept according to him transferred what he believed to have important contributions to our ability to comprehend the principles of the universe (Stevens, 1999, p. 57).

Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi's Concept of Ayani-Sabita

The composition of Ayani-sabita means the things and essences that do not change. According to the Islamic Sufi Ibn 'Arabi, it is "science of the circumstances about the eternal fixed truths in the knowledge of Allah before coming into the realm of existence" (Cebecioğlu, 2005, p. 69; Kâşânî, 1992, p. 55). Ibn 'Arabi used the term *Ayn*, which occurs in this concept of Ayani-sabita, in the sense of truth, the original essence and nature, and used *sabita* in the sense of the wisdom of form, the body mental (Kılıç, 1999, p. 505). Sabita, which is mentioned here, namely the concept of certainty, has the meaning of the occurrence in the visible universe of a thing that is fixed in the knowledge of Allah. Human nature is also from the things that are fixed in this knowledge. In this case, Ibn 'Arabi through the expression of Ayani-sabita means what is found among the universe where objects appear through the universe, where the truth of objects or things is found, and an essence of all things apart from Allah that provides contact with Allah. However, this essence (ayn) is one that has not received the aura of existence (Konuk, 2005, Vol. 1, pp. 15, 17, 39, 40).

In the thoughts of Ibn 'Arabi, Ayani-sabita is the initial determination of all beings and the point of being created on earth. Here, Ayani-sabita means both the divine names and at the same time the truths of things possible (Izutsu, 2015, pp. 215–225; Afifi, 1994, pp. 56–60; Kılıç, 1999, p. 505). Ibn 'Arabi examined this concept in detail in his works *The Meccan Revelations* and *The Ringstones of Wisdom*.

The concept of Ayani-sabita is one that basically establishes the relationship of existence with the creator. This concept is understood to have been produced in order to express the ability of what is possible to establish the connection of its need for a sole essence with binding existence (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2014, Vol. 6, p. 254). Because of this here, fixed truths (Ayani-sabita) must be found in the face of the existence of the Truth. These are characterized through nonexistence in infinity. What is being mentioned forms that which no other thing has aside from Allah (the first, the eternal). The existence of Allah has spread in the way that their claims require regarding this Ayani-sabita. Thus, not havıng a mental or illusory emptiness in the

interval, Ayan formed outwardly not for itself but for others (Ibn 'Arabi, 1980, p. 60; [trans.] 2013, p. 47).

Ayani-sabita, which in a nutshell means the essences of things, is the origins of the entire universe, namely that which has been created. In fact, Ayani-sabita is the exemplifications fixed in the knowledge of Allah. The concept of Ayani-sabita is located in the basis of Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi's as well as human understanding. According to him, everything that is apparent in existence can realize existence through Ayani-sabita. Ibn 'Arabi said in this respect in his work *The Meccan Revelations*:

> He is Lord all the time, therefore Ayani-sabita, by saying the name of existence given to its selves, must look to Him all the time. Allah looks to them through the eyes of mercy because they constantly pray. Thus Allah is also always Lord in our state of existence as in our state of absence. Just as the characteristic of possibility belongs to us, the obligation belongs to Him. (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2014, C11, p. 170)

As can be understood here, Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi expresses that, by constantly looking to Allah, one aspect of Ayani-sabita is virtually a place of manifestation, the dispenser of all attributes, designations, and existence. Like other creatures, therefore, humans also emerge through the pretext of Ayani-sabita.

According to Ibn 'Arabi, humans at this point are the Ayna-Haqq (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2014, Vol. 11, p. 513). Namely, they are the mirror (ayna) of the Truth (Haqq) because our bodies are as much as what is in His wisdom. To say His knowing is to say His intending; that which He does not intend is a thing He does not render into being. In the Qur'an (2:117) also on this topic is said "(He) is the unique creator of the heavens and the earth. When He wills a thing to be [when He intends] He only says 'Be' to the thing and so it immediately happens." Accordingly, Allah has intended our existing being and our own identic, namely while not existing, and rendered us into being over our fixed appearances (our Ayani-sabitas; Ibn 'Arabi, 1985, Vol. 1, p. 167; [trans.] 2016, Vol. 1, p. 91). Through this characteristic, humans have converged on a quality where they can be the ordained vicegerent on earth (Qur'an, 2:30, 6:165, 27:62). Thus, in terms of Islam, humans are an existence where the concepts of *jamiyat* (as the collection and reflection of all the names and attributes of Allah), *berzahiyat*, (which expresses the contradictions in the structure of human existence), and *khilafat* (which signifies being efficient in accordance with the moral principles on earth in line with what humans and the state of this existence and knowledge require) can be gathered within the self (Erginli, 2008). In the Qur'an, Adam is taught the names of everything. He then offered these to the angels, saying "Inform me of the names of these if you are truthful" (Qur'an, 2:31); this ayah expresses that the names of Allah were taught to humans through the personage of Prophet Adam. This also indicates that in being created, humans have the characteristic of being able to understand the names of Allah and even be the locus in the manifestations of names

(Ibn 'Arabi, 1980, p. 49; [trans.] 2015, pp. 98–99). So, how is this possible? Ibn 'Arabi answered this question with "By means of Ayani-sabita it is possible" (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 46).

According to Ibn 'Arabi, Ayani-sabita, which exists in humans, fulfills its function through the Entity's (Allah's) manifestation. In this aspect, humans have a passive location across from the Entity. Each entity has their own special abilities and talents; no one is the same as another. The Truth, having an absolute body, reveals the representation of that ayn (being) as appropriate to each of the ayn's abilities from the Ayani-sabita. (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 46). The affectation of these abilities and talents is also just the corporality of the entity of Allah. In this respect, the Ayani-sabita demands the Truth to manifest being within the framework of the abilities and talents that are their requirements. This demand is not through words but through states. The relationship of Ayani-sabita with human psychology comes into play here. Namely, Ayani-sabita has effects on humans' physical and psychological states. In fact, Ibn 'Arabi established the relationship of humans' Ayani-sabita with the attributes and states they carry, saying:

You know our provisions are found in the ranks of the Truth. These are provisions whose matters are attributed to the self in countless numbers, like mastery, worship, and desire. Humans see these when they research the states of their nafs (carnal desires). For this reason, Allah has characterized Himself as the possessor of names and morals. (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2014, Vol. 17, pp. 198–199)

As will be understood from these statements, Ibn 'Arabi emphasized that moral and psychological characteristics like mastery are associated with the states of the human soul. Ibn 'Arabi, motioning from this, stated the appearance of the truth in humans undergoes a change even more clearly due to Ayani-sabita. As a result, all of humans' bio-psycho-spiritual dimensions, or in the most basic sense, their disposition and personality, can be understood to be related to Ayani-sabita.

Results and Assessments

As a result of this study, which we have done for the purpose of understanding the relationship between Carl Gustav Jung's archetype concept and M. Ibn 'Arabi's Ayani-sabita concept, the conclusion has been reached that similarities and differences exist between these two concepts.

When we look at the similarities between these two concepts, we see both concepts have been addressed as an *a priori*, or innately basic and deterministic, concept in human actions. In fact, according to Jung, archetypes are forms of expression that each individual possesses within the self and carries inside and has a legacy left to the

innate self by way of universal motifs that are common for all of humanity (Taylor, 2009, p. 108). Jung, finding that these related interests have an *a priori* factor in human actions, showed the concepts of *Corpus Hermeticum* (Archetype light) as evidence of this and connected the perception of God to this as "light" (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 19–21). Here is understood that Jung's archetypes are also an abstract scientific essence just like Ayani-sabita. In addition, Allah is also understood as "light" in the Islamic Sufi tradition, and this issue is explained in Surah An-Nur, the 24th surah of the Quran (24:35) in that the connection of the Truth with things is attempted to be understood through the degrees of His Light's manifestations. Ibn 'Arabi's concept of Ayani-sabita is also one associated with the appearance of the Entity's Light (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 46; [trans.] 2014, Vol. 11, pp. 170, 513).

Another similarity between the two concepts is that they are also used in the sense of "unchanging (fixed) reality." According to Jung, archetypes, which can in fact be characterized in principle, are never tangible in their revealed form; they only possess an "unchanging (fixed)" sense that can be perceived in principle in their core (Jung, 1976/2003, p. 21). Ibn 'Arabi also preferred to say "unchanging (fixed) truth, just like Jung, for the concept he used for this (Ayani-sabita; Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 46).

Another issue where the concepts were also used similarly is Jung's evaluation of archetypes and Ibn 'Arabi's evaluation of Ayani-sabita "as a transitional bridge to matter in general" (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 17–21; Stevens, 1999, p. 57). Archetypes again possess a number of capacities and abilities like Ayani-sabita. What emerged is from the following viewpoint. Namely, the archetype itself is empty, a purely formational element; its self-depiction is nothing other than its *a priori* possibility, or its *facultas praeformandi* (designed power; Jung, 1976/2003, p. 21). Ibn 'Arabi's concept of Ayani-sabita has also been similarly described, stating it to possess a number of abilities and talents and that the manifestations of the Truth are in accordance with these talents (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 46). In other words, Muhyiddin Ibn 'Arabi established a connection between his Ayani-sabita and its physical appearance among all aspects, including its creation and personality (İbnü'l-Arabî, [trans.] 2013, pp. 46–47; Fusus, 1980, p. 49; Futuhat, [trans.] 2014, Vol. 1, pp. 98–99). Jung also established a connection through archetypes between the personality structure and daily behaviors of humans (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 17–21). In other words, archetypes also have a hidden structure in humans that is abstract and unseen and that determines who a person is, just like Ayani-sabita. As can be understood here, the abilities that archetypes and Ayani-sabita have and that appear have both been defined as elements that shape humans.

Another common point of the two concepts that we have characterized is that each of the two concepts has been described as a center of spiritual transference. Ibn 'Arabi stated "The son is the father's secret" in "The Ringstone of Seth" from his

work *The Ringstones of Wisdom*, mentioning the talents and grants that humans are given by means of the ayns (fixed truths; Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 52). This issue recalls the spiritual transference that Ayani-sabita uses, just as Carl Gustav Jung used while describing the archetype concept. After stating that Seth has this knowledge on this issue, Ibn 'Arabi says:

> Due to this knowledge, he was named Seth. The name means the gift of Allah (Hibetullah). The keys to different types of gifts are in His Hands. Allah firstly gave Seth to Adam. Allah gave Seth to Adam, only from Adam himself because the child is the father's secret. Therefore, he stems from him and returns to him. (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 52)

Clearly Ibn 'Arabi describes that the person's innate characteristics can be transferred spiritually. Thus, because this is a spiritual classification and it refers to the manifest knowledge in the related section, the transference is understood to be a spiritual transference. We say this situation resembles the spiritual transference of Jung's collective unconscious and archetypes.

In summary, certain similarities are understood to exist between Jung's archetype concept and Ibn 'Arabi's Ayani-sabita concept. In particular, Jung's assessment of archetypes as "a transitional bridge to matter in general" (Jung, 1976/2003, pp. 17–21; Stevens, 1999, p. 57) brings the two concepts closer together in terms of the existence of Ayani-sabita being an essence that enables itself and its emergence. Again, the idea that it covers all that has been created and has collective (shared, social, universal) common essences is from the parts of these two concepts that are able to be shared.

Just as similarities are found between C. G. Jung's archetype concept and Ibn 'Arabi's Ayani-sabita, so too do differences exist. The issue that needs to first be emphasized on this matter is that the archetype concept and the concepts of Ayna-sabita are not the same one-to-one concepts. Thus when investigating the nature of the archetype concept in general, this concept is not understood to have the fixed truths that are in the entity of the Truth, as Ibn 'Arabi qualifies his Ayani-sabita concept, but to contain certain information that exists at a lower order and in the realm of ideas. Here we can make the comment that archetypes correspond to the Ayani-sabita of the universal model in Ibn 'Arabi's thoughts. In fact, Ibn 'Arabi stated on this matter, by referencing the ayah informing that Allah is at a new task every moment (Qur'an, 55:29), that the absolute existence of the Truth is manifested in every moment, namely by constantly being revealed, from the Ayani-sabita of all that exists (Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2013, p. 51). This case continues this way in every world and in every stage of creation in a state of succession (Konuk, 2005, p. 55; Ibn 'Arabi, [trans.] 2014, Vol. 8, p. 189). Therefore, we can understand with motion from here that Ayani-sabitas exist in all universes.

Another issue that again supports this interpretation of ours is Jung's description of the collective unconscious as the place humans can reach in dreams and acquire

common archetypes (Jung, [trans.] 2014, p. 23). This place is also equivalent to the realm of exemplification (*Misal alemi*) in Ibn 'Arabi's ranks of existence. Thus the realm of exemplification that corresponds to the fifth stage in the stages of existence is an intermediate realm between substance and souls. The reason it's called the realm of exemplification at this stage is that a representation resembling the one that each person who emerges in the universe of souls acquires in the realm of matter is also formed in this realm. In other words, the stage of exemplification is the surface of the stage of souls and the offshoot of the stage of matter. Therefore, some call this realm the realm of imagination because these representations which we can only realize through the power that belongs to imagination also occur in the most beautiful dreams (Konuk, 2005, pp. 67, 111). In other words, one of the places souls arrive at in dreams and receive steadfast information is this realm according to Ibn 'Arabi (1980, pp. 99–106). For this reason, dreams pose an important place for both C. G. Jung and M. Ibn 'Arabi. Thus according to Ibn 'Arabi, people can learn the terms that occur from the Truth by reaching universal exemplification in dreams; they can learn what will be, what has been, and the things the Truth has told itself (Abn Arabi, 1980, pp. 99–106; Konuk, 2005, Vol. 1, pp. 38, 108, 458, 577; Qur'an, 37:102; 12:4). In short, Ibn 'Arabi's definition of universal exemplification has a group of common symbols, just like what exists in Jung's collective unconscious. Thus we can say Jung's collective unconscious corresponds to the universal exemplification in the literature on Ibn 'Arabi and the archetypes that are included here correspond to the Ayani-sabita in the universal exemplification.

The aim of the dervish who progresses in Sufism is to complete their ascension to the edgeless expanse of space beyond the limits of the human mind by reaching divine favor and becoming nothing in within the presence of Allah, and afterwards to exist in and continually remember Allah. All efforts are for this. This situation, which forms a sense of meaningfulness that is decisive only in one's own self and appears opposite the mind on this journey, reveals itself through the symbols special manifestations that exist within. Here we can say that Sufi views and Jung's approach each other on issues such as cosmic potentials, archetype symbols, and the revelation of divine programming that humans innately bring through unexpected events whose understanding is difficult with the everyday mind. However, the most basic difference between the two concepts here we can say to be Ibn 'Arabi's concept of Ayani-sabita being used as a basic term that forms a wider and more bio-psycho-spiritual understanding of the human than Jung's. In other words, if it is necessary to identify from another point of view, we can say perhaps the most important difference of Jung from Ibn 'Arabi is that archetypes are unable to establish a connection with divine being. This is because the concept of Ayani-sabita has no such reference to archetypes while being used as a basic concept that provides a connection between humans and the Truth. While expressions beyond the consciousness of the concepts of archetypes and Ayani-sabita such as being unique to humanity, being

able to possess a collective reality beyond time and space, and archetypes' formation in the wait between worlds bring these two concepts closer together, its position across from being is the most significant issue separating these two concepts, as the concept of Ayani-sabita reaches a higher metaphysical dimension and is the source of all things created that also surround humans. Indeed, the concept of Ayani-sabita is the essence that forms the face of not just humans but of all existence that looks at the creator; it receives no whiff of existence (it has not been created; Konuk, 2005, Vol. 1, pp. 15, 17, 39, 40). Namely, Ayani-sabita is a much wider and stronger concept that also covers humans. In fact, separating Ibn 'Arabi's understanding of humans from his understanding of existence is not possible. On this point, the concept of Ayani-sabita is an essence that, through the dimension that looks at humans, connects them to Allah and reveals all human characteristics in the visible realm. Ayani-sabita here is a divine essence that while through one sense in fact determines the fate of all of humans' actions, attributes, and characteristics in daily life, in another sense brings humans to the state of Allah's visible (*nazar-gah*) and manifested (*tajalli-gah*) place. In short, Ibn 'Arabi identified humans as a divine existence through the concept of Ayani-sabita and indicated that, by reason of this precious essence that they carry, are cognizant of the secret of the khalifa (vicegerents of morality; Ibn 'Arabi, 1985, Vol. 1, p. 167; [trans.] 2016, Vol. 1, p. 91).

As a result, the possibility is seen to exist in the case of interpreting the concept of Ayani-sabita, which is associated with the deep spiritual structure of humans, like the understanding of psychotherapy, personality theory, and the Myers-Briggs Type Indicator personality test that have been produced over the concept of Jung's archetypes, through contemporary psychology in evaluating what may be inspired in producing different personality approaches, human typologies, and psychotherapeutic methods. Varied and more detailed studies are recommended for this purpose on Ibn 'Arabi's concept of Ayani-sabita, such as his understanding of and views on humans regarding this concept, the psychological effects of Ayani-sabita on humans, the relationship of personality to Ayani-sabita, and the relationships Ayani-sabita has with the views of various psychologists.

References

Abdurrezzak Kâşânî (1992). *Mu'cemu ıstılahatı's-sufiyye*. (Abdülâl Şahin, tahkik) Kahire: Daru'l-Inad.

Cebecioğlu, E. (2005). *Tasavvuf terimleri ve deyimleri sözlüğü*. İstanbul: Anka Yayınları

Cebecioğlu, E. (2008). Muhyiddin İbnü'l-Arabî'nin (560/1165-638/1240) hayatı ve eserleri. *Tasavvuf, İlmî ve Akademik Araştırma Dergisi (İbnü'l-Arabî Özel Sayısı-1), yıl 9, sayı21*, ss. 9-25.

Erginli, Z. (2008). İbnü'l-Arabî'ye göre hz. Âdem'de temel insan nitelikleri.*Tasavvuf İlmî ve Akademik Araştırma Dergisi (İbnü"l-Arabî Özel Sayısı-1), yıl 9, sayı21*, ss.161-197

Taylor, E. (2009).*The mystery of personality a history of psychodynamic theories*, New York.

Fordham, Frieda (2001). *Jung psikolojisinin ana hatları*, (Aslan Yalçıner, Çev.), 5. baskı, İstanbul.

Freud, Sigmund (1939). *Moses and monotheism*. (Translated From The German ByKatherine Jones). Published By The Hogarth Press And The Institute of Psycho-Analysis. Printed in Great Britain By The Garden City Press Limited At Letghworth, Hertfordshire.

Freud, Sigmund (2001). *Totem and taboo. Some points of agreement between the mental lives of savages and neurotics*. (Translation by James Strachey). First published in Routledge Classics, London. ISBN 0-203-25893-2.

Izutsu, Toshihiko (2015). *İbnü'l-Arabî'nin fusûs›undaki anahtar kavramlar*. (Ahmed Yüksel Özemre, Çev.). İstanbul: Kaknüs Yayınları

İbn Manzûr, Ebü›l-Fazl Muhammed b. Mükerrem b. Ali el-Ensâr (tsz.).*Lisânü'l-Arab*, Beyrût.

İbnü'l-Arabî, M.(1985). El-*fütuhat-ı mekkiyye*. (Arapça). (Osman Yahya, Hazırlayan). Elheyetü'l Mısriyyetü'l Â'mmetü Lil-Kitabi, El-Mektebetül Arabiyye.

İbnü'l-Arabî, M.(2013).*Fususu'l-Hikem*. (Ekrem Demirli, Çeviri ve Şerh). İstanbul: Kabalcı Yayıncılık

İbnü'l-Arabî, M. (2015). *Fütuhat-ı mekkiyye peygamberler ve veliler*. (Ekrem Demirli, Çev.). İstanbul: Litera Yayıncılık. ISBN, s. 978-605-9925-27-3.

İbnü'l-Arabî, M.(2014). *Fütuhat-ı mekkiyye*. (Ekrem Demirli, Çev.). 18 Cilt, İstanbul: Litera Yayıncılık.

İbnü'l-Arabî, M.(1980). *Fususü'l-hikem ve't-ta'likatu aleyh*. (Arapça). (Ebü'l-A'lâ Afîfî, haz.) [Fusus al Hikam (Pearls of Wisdom), arabic, edited by Abu 'Ala Afifi] Beyrut-Lübnan:Dârü'l-Kütübi'l-Arabiyye

Jung, C. G. (1977). *CG Jung speaking interviews and encounters*. In William McGuire & RFC Hull(Ed. & Trans.), Bollingen Series XCVII, Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.

Jung, C. G. (2012). *Doğu metinlerine psikolojik yaklaşım*. (Ahmet Demirhan, Çev.). İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları.ISBN, s. 9789755746494

Jung, C. G. (2014). *The collected works, the archetypes and the collective unconscious*. Second Edition. In Sir Herbert Read, Michael Fordham and Gerhard Adler(Ed.), translated from the german to english by R. F. C. Hull, Routledge, London

Jung, C. G. (2003). *Dört arketip*. (Zehra Aksu Yılmazer, Çev.), Metis Yayınları. (Original work 1976, Patmos Verlag, Walter Verlag, Düsseldorf, Zürih)

Kılıç, M. E. (2009). *Şeyh-i ekber ibn arabi düşüncesine giriş*. İstanbul: Sufi Kitap

Kılıç, M. E. (1995). *Muhyiddîn ibnü'l-arabî'de varlık ve mertebeleri (vücûd ve merâtibu'l- vücûd)*. (Basılmamış Doktora Tezi, Marmara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul).

Kılıç, M. E. (1999). İbnü'l-Arabî maddesi.*Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Ansiklopedisi (DİA)*. Cilt20, s. 493- 516, İstanbul.

Konuk, Ahmed A. (2005).*Fusûsu'l-hikem tercüme ve şerhi, ahmed avni konuk*. (Mustafa Tahralı ve Selçuk Eraydın, Hazırlayan). İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Vakfı Yayınları, Cilt 1- 4, ISBN 975-548-036-6 (Takım).

Merter, M. (2006). *Dokuzyüzkatlı insan*, İstanbul: Kaknüs Yayınları

Öztekin, A. (2011). İbnü'l-Arabî'nin "âyân-ı sâbite"si ile jung'un "arketipler"i üzerine bir değerlendirme. Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi, 52:1(2011), ss. 293-303

Stevens, A. (1999). *Jung*. (Ayda Çayır, Çev.). 1. Baskı. İstanbul: Kaknüs Yayınları

Psychodrama and Spirituality: A Practice-Friendly Review

Gökhan Özcan[1]

Marmara University

Abstract

Psychodrama is a set of widely-used philosophy, theories, and techniques on which J. L. Moreno laid the foundations. Moreno built his philosophy and practice on spiritual grounds from existential thought, theology, and texts about the relationship between God and man. This article aims to summarize the definition, basic process, and techniques of psychodrama, a group of psychotherapy methods, to reveal the relationship between Moreno philosophy and spirituality in different aspects and to examine Jungian Psychodrama, Souldrama, and the Therapeutic Spiral Model in this context as contemporary spiritually-oriented psychodrama approaches.

Keywords

Spirituality • Psychodrama • Moreno philosophy • Spiritually-oriented psychodrama approaches

Psikodrama ve Maneviyat: Uygulamacılara Yönelik bir Derleme

Öz

Psikodrama, J. L. Moreno'nun temellerini attığı, yaygın olarak kullanılan felsefe, kuram ve teknikler bütünüdür. Moreno, felsefesi ve pratiğini varoluşçu düşünceden, teolojiden ve Tanrı-insan ilişkisine dair metinlerden beslenerek, manevi bir zeminde inşa etmiştir. Bu makale, bir grup psikoterapi yöntemi olan psikodramanın tanımını, temel süreç ve tekniklerini özetlemeyi, Moreno felsefesi ile maneviyat arasındaki ilişkiyi farklı düzlemlerde açığa çıkartmayı ve bu bağlamda manevi yönelimli çağdaş psikodrama yaklaşımları olarak 'Jungiyen Psikodrama', 'Ruhsal Drama' ve 'Terapötik Spiral Model'i incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Maneviyat • Psikodrama • Moreno felsefesi • Manevi yönelimli psikodrama yaklaşımları

Psychodrama is based on the spontaneous experiential theater studies and clinical practice of its founder, psychiatrist Jacob Levy Moreno (1888-1974) in the early 1920s (Marineau, 1989; Tahar and Kellerman, 1996), and is a complex, powerful technique of group psychotherapy that encourages and develops clients' actions in life based on role play and self-presentation dramatization both verbally and non-verbally (Corsini & Wedding, 1995; Kellerman, 1992; Nicholas, 2017; Rosenbaum & Berger, 1963; Yalom, 1995).

Although psychodrama was first developed as a type of group psychotherapy, it is applied in different approaches and creative forms nowadays. As a sociodrama not focusing on the individual, psychodrama is used to evaluate and treat a wider social network (Blatner, 1996; Figusch, 2012) in couple and family therapies and in individual therapies performed by one or two co-therapists (Holmes, 2015). Meanwhile, psychodrama can be considered not only as a method of psychotherapy but also as a laboratory where psychosocial problems are explored through drama tools and participants' own behaviors. Hence, Moreno based the psychodrama principles and techniques on dramaturgical terminologies and practices (Blatner, 2000a; Jones, 1996; Scheiffele, 1997). As in theater, psychodrama has a scene where the play is acted out. A protagonist is the main actor of the work and one therapist as director guides the play; the auxiliary egos play the roles the protagonist wants to work on and the audience watches the play (Moreno, 1934).

Regardless of orientation, the psychodrama process consists of three stages: *warm-up*, *action*, and *sharing* (Blatner, 2007). Moreno described the warm-up period as the protagonist's preparation process in putting one of his/her problems into words and treated the warm-up process as a therapeutic process of Spontaneity Theater and then contributed to transferring it into psychotherapy. The creative, aesthetic, and dramatic warm-up of theater transforms into therapeutic warm-up, which allows new behavior patterns to be experienced in life-like situations (Howie & Bagnall, 2015). The warm-up phase, which can be designed as forms of focusing on the here and now, breathing, walking, running, movement and mirroring exercises, Tai Chi, dancing, and physical games, strengthens unity, spontaneity, and creativity and also prepares the protagonist for the main play (Casson, 2004; Williams, 1991; Zoran, 2006).

The play (action) phase comes after the warm-up. In this phase, the protagonist may stage one or more events that have occurred in the past, are occurring currently, or will occur in the future. The main purpose of the protagonist study is to develop spontaneity and creativity in order to best meet new situations in life (Blatner & Cukier, 2007; Gershoni, 2003; Tauvon, 2005).

Sharing, the last stage of psychodrama work, is when the auxiliary egos and the audience watching the play share their feelings after the protagonist's play. The

purpose of the sharing phase is to normalize the protagonist's story by allowing for the possibilities of emotional discharge in the group, of making a mental picture of the situation being studied, of providing insight, and of showing that other group participants live experiences similar to the protagonist's (Karp, 2005; Leventon, 2001).

Briefly examining the therapeutic techniques of psychodrama after transferring the basic process is important. *Role reversal* is the most important technique of psychodrama. The protagonist has the opportunity to discover the *other's* position, experiences, thoughts, feelings, and behaviors through role reversal. An auxiliary ego chosen from the group replaces the protagonist's. *Doubling*, which is another technique from psychodrama, is when the group leader or audience expresses the protagonist's suppressed and unexpressed feelings and behaviors instead of the protagonist. The doubling technique encourages the process of empathy and gives the protagonist a lead for action. Using the *mirror* technique, the protagonist can choose an auxiliary ego for his/her role and can exit the scene and observe his/her life from the outside. Thus the protagonist can look at life from a distance and get the opportunity to make objective evaluations (Holmes, 1991; Wilkins, 1999).

Moreno and Divinity

Unlike the many philosophers of his time, Moreno did not divide the information fields he worked on into sections, instead claiming a consensus to exist between psychology, psychiatry, theology, philosophy, sociology, and their disciplines. For this reason, Moreno not only benefitted from psychiatry but also from existential philosophy (Howie, 2012), especially spirituality and theology (Lindqvist, 2005; Steere, 1997).

One can see traces of the existentialist-humanistic view in Moreno's perceptions of the human in his definition on being human as a free being who can self-define, develop, and enter into deep interactions. According to Moreno, a person's experiences are fundamental to potential. The essence of the experience is action, spontaneity, and being in the here and now. Human beings can embrace the universe, but at the same time they must accept their limited power (Dökmen, 2003).

The true and deep relationship which the existential philosopher Martin Buber (*1878-1965*; 1950) described as I-Thou (I-You), is a fundamental topic of Moreno's philosophy and practice. Moreno was influenced by Buber; Moreno evaluated relationships without conflict as fixed, predictable, and superficial and tried to construct opportunities for mutual authentic dialogue through psychodrama and sociometry (Apter, 2003; Waldl, 2005).

Moreno's interest in spirituality and theology can be attributed to a childhood memory. At the age of four, he proposed to his friends to play a game called 'God and

His Angels' in the cellar of his home; he moved to the role of God, and his friends asked him why he was unable to fly and encouraged him to do so. In response, he flew himself down from his chair and broke his shoulder (Moreno, 1946). He considered this moment to be the spiritual moment in which he discovered psychodrama and its basic tools (Scategni, 2002).

Moreno emphasized the creativity and spontaneity of the cosmos in his texts; he regarded the term *cosmos* not only as the physical universe but also as the much larger dimensions of the soul (i.e., wisdom, experience, and imagination). Thus he considered the soul as an expression of God's action and fundamental nature. For him, God is theologically a creative and spontaneous being (Blatner, 2000a).

In his book, *Words of the Father* (1971), Moreno said that God was not a being who created and then departed, as described in some religious texts; he said that God creates every moment and that every person has the power to participate in God's creation through their actions and spontaneity. Moreno, who considered creativity as a divine power spreading over the cosmos, presented a philosophy that can be extended over religion, even to all religions. Here one encounters a view of an aesthetic, active, and immanent God instead of the God of history or religion that punishes and rewards. Moreno is based on the *I-God* consciousness, unlike a transcendent God-consciousness, which has been revealed as the *He-God* and *Thou-God* throughout history. I-God emphasizes the creative aspect that is active in action and potentially present in every human being (Borgatta, Boguslaw, & Haskel, 1975; Blatner, 2000b; Johnson, 1948; Kraus, 1984).

Moreno stated psychodrama to have an eventual and spiritually-healing level called *cosmic catharsis*, claiming that the individual goes beyond the given reality through cosmic catharsis. For example, in psychodrama, a man can be a woman or a person can animate an animal or dead person. In this way, when individuals get out of themselves and discover the visible and invisible aspects of the cosmos, they can experience coexistence and thus healing in the universe (Garcia & Buchanan, 2009).

Current Efforts in the Relation of Psychodrama and Spirituality

The spiritual aspects on which Moreno based psychodrama have important parts as they are fed from theology and are still being researched by modern authors. Blatner (2000b, 2005b) examined the cabbalistic, mystical, and archetypical elements in Moreno's philosophy and claimed psychodrama to be a mythical journey. Thus, psychodramatists should also take on the role of *director of rites* in addition to the roles of leader, director, and therapist that they already have. According to Blatner, by playing a spiritual role, the psychodramatist becomes the one who tries to relate the group's existence to its greater integrity and also the one who can say things like,

"We have gathered here for spiritual purposes to help each other, to love, and to make our group members stronger, freer, and wiser."

While explaining the theory of the role that the foundations of psychodrama are based on, Moreno (1961) described roles in triplet: our physiological activities in life as *psychosomatic roles*, our social relationships as *social roles*, and psychological self-aspects as *psychodramatic roles*. Natalie Winters (2000), a psychodrama practitioner and theoretician, stated in her article, *Fourth Role Category*, that the psychospiritual role in Moreno's role theory is incomplete. According to her, the psychospiritual role includes functions such as dreaming, being receivers, remembering, being givers, believing, and praying. Psychodrama leaders who adopt a psychospiritual role can invite the group to experience universal intelligence, wisdom, divinity and the present.

Emphasis on the spiritual aspects of psychodrama has not only been made by psychodramatists. For example, Thomas Moore (1994, 1996), an American Jungian philosopher, researched the nature of the soul; he described the soul as a personal and professional development opportunity and stated psychodrama and playback theater to enable one to open the heart and live the soul because of its philosophical background and techniques.

As Moreno (1947) tele is a negative or positive social relation configuration in bilateral relations and is thought to have a spiritual aspect. The key element of tele is its reciprocity that reflects the human capacity to perceive or imagine how other people feel about a relationship (Moreno, 1956). When a group is created, all members have a potential tele structure that includes their personal history prior to the group coming together. This constitutes the basis for the active tele structure that will later develop (Zuretti, 2005). During the action in psychodrama, a protagonist chooses an auxiliary ego to portray anything from his/her life, and the common aspects the chosen person has with the chosen role are recognized during or after the play. Here, the tele process occurs with rapid identification (Yaniv, 2014). Studies examining the tele phenomenon in relation to quantum psychology have enriched the literature on the relationship of psychodrama and spirituality with new scientific developments (Hammer, 2000; Wolinsky, 1991; Zohar & Marshall, 1990).

As an effective example of an attempt to reconcile psychodrama with different schools of psychology, Goldberg (2009) focused on the relationship between psychodrama theory/ practice and positive psychology, examining the overlooked parts of Moreno's original work and emphasizing the strengths, virtues, and geniuses in each individual using a positive psychodrama approach.

In the literature, the presence of religiously-oriented psychodrama studies is remarkable in addition to those on spirituality. In this way, Pitzele (1991) tried to

integrate psychodrama into tales from the Torah and called psychodrama a window/mirror of soul and a spiritual instrument of truth for the human being; Meyer (2012) aimed to evaluate and organize religious and spiritual perceptions through drama by applying religious-oriented drama therapy on students from different religions. Frick (2013) examined the use of psychodrama in Christian biblical-drama sessions, which parallel Moreno's and Christian author Ignatius's (*35-108 A.D.*) thoughts; Frick used the psychodramatic role-reversal technique in the biblical-drama.

Quantitative and qualitative studies are found investigating the relationship between psychodrama and spirituality, as well as theoretical and practical approaches. In one reported case study, Perrotta (2012) conducted psychotherapy sessions using a predominantly Jungian psychodrama-oriented dream work for a female client with a history of violence and emotional conflicts in her family history; Perrotta stated that, at the end of the process, significant developments had occurred in the roles in the client's life and in her individualization orientations. Tavakoly, Namdari, and Esmaili (2014) reported that the psychodrama group in their quasi-experimental study conducted with 32 women differed significantly from the control group in terms of spiritual well-being. Salehi and Shokri (2016) found the group participating in the psychodrama-oriented group consultation to differ in terms of intrepidity and mental intelligence compared to the control group in a full experimental study with 60 female high school students.

Contemporary Spiritually-Oriented Psychodrama Approaches

Classical (Morenian) psychodrama has been developed and enriched with the technical and practical interventions of the following psychodrama practitioners. The most important approaches to spiritual orientation are: Jungian psychodrama, soul drama, and the therapeutic spiral model.

1. Jungian psychodrama. This approach was created by integrating Jung's analytic theory into psychodrama. It was developed by the Italian psychology professor and Jungian psycho dramatist, Maurizio Gasseau (Gasseau & Gasca, 1991). The theoretical framework in Jungian psychodrama is structured on the concepts of Jung's (2014) depth psychology, dreams, archetypes, collective unconscious, and individualization process.

Different from that of classical psychodrama, the stage in Jungian psychodrama sessions forms a full circle. Plays are acted within this circle because, in Jungian thought, the circle is the archetype of fullness and thus attempts to provide the group with integrity (Jung, 2017). In the case of Jungian Psychodrama, the value of role reversal as a therapeutic psychodrama technique is that one faces one's antagonist–or in Jungian terminology, one's shadow–while playing a different role. The shadow

is the unconscious part that the individual rejects and does not desire (Jung, 1969). The protagonist has the chance to meet his/her shadow while experiencing another role in the role reversal technique, and one takes the opportunity to step toward individualization and realize one's inner thoughts while paired by the group leader in the doubling technique (Gasseau & Scategni, 2007).

At the beginning of a Jungian psychodrama session, the group leader tries to gather participants' dreams and images of the past or future (Gasseau & Perrotta, 2013). Dreams are the most extensively studied subject in Jungian psychodrama and correspond exactly to the drama's structure (Jung, 1934). All types of dreams are handled in Jungian psychodrama: prediction dreams, nightmares, recurrent dreams, symbolic dreams, social dreams, and dreams of the future (Scategni, 1994, 2001, 2002). Before starting the dream work, participants are encouraged to try to remember imagery from dreams using Gasseau's semi-hypnotic experience inspired by the ancient practices of Asclepeion, the *dream incubation* technique that accompanied by a Tibetan bell. In this direction, dreams are worked on together through the connotations of the protagonist's past experiences. After working on a dream or any other experience, the group leader takes the role of observer and makes narrative observations. In this part, the leader brings the distinctive aspects of the dream to archetypal and hermetic descriptions without departing from the dream phenomenon, and, if necessary, comments on the collective unconscious of the group in the context of this dream (Gasseau & Gasca, 1991).

In Jungian psychodrama, dreams are not only studied individually but also as a group. The dream that a person talks about evokes another person's dream, and by arousing different dream associations in another person, a chain of associations is formed and a phenomenon termed the *social dream matrix* occurs. In this stage of the Jungian psychodrama, these associations are acted out in order; a matrix is formed from these associations, ultimately attempting to reveal and interpret the collective unconsciousness of the group (Lawrence, 2003; Tatham & Morgan, 2018). With its ceremonial and shamanic experiences, Jungian psychodrama is an orientation where *surplus reality* is worked intensively. Surplus reality is the realization of fantasies and future thoughts in the here and now of the psychodrama stage (Moreno, Blomkvist, & Rutzel, 2013). For example, a protagonist in the mourning process can be allowed to switch to the role of the deceased and send one's self messages, then return to the original role and receive these messages (Gasseau & Scategni, 2007).

1.1. Case Study. A section from the dream work of Ms. T (age 24):[*]

A storm is coming. A Tweety-bird blanket hangs on the balcony from my home, I loved this blanket very much in my childhood. There is also a flower-figured sheet with a pair of red wet socks hanging from it. My mom tells me to take them in because of the storm, and I tell her that I'll take them in later. After a while I look at the sheets and socks on the balcony from inside the house. The Tweety-bird blanket has fallen to the ground and the other one has flown away. My mother brought only the red socks in. I think I couldn't get out because of the storm, and I feel angry at my mother for not taking my blanket in.

After telling her dream, Ms. T was invited to the middle of the group by the group director. The group director stood next to her in a supportive manner and asked her if there had been any storms in her life in recent years. Ms. T mentioned that maybe it is the break up with her boyfriend whom she had been together with for three years. Her boyfriend had gone abroad for academic reasons and their relation was forced to finish because of that.

The director asked Ms. T to choose someone from the group for her boyfriend's role. Ms. T created a scene in which she and her boyfriend talked about their relationship in the park. The manager gave Ms. T the opportunity to tell her boyfriend the things she had wanted but been unable to say in real life, and she said this: "*This country's system is bad, but not as bad as you think. You don't have to go. I am angry with you because there is no place for me in the future you have established for yourself.*" The scene closed, and the director offered to return to the dream, asking her to choose people from the group for the roles of the red socks, the Tweety blanket, the other sheet, the mother, and the storm. The dream began to be relived from the beginning. The scene was ended after the following sentence from Ms. T: "*My favorite sheet has gone. I can't take it in, it's very cold outside.*" Here, Ms. T was asked to make associations. Ms. T remembered that her mother used to read her *Little Red Riding Hood* as a child. The outside was dangerous because of the storm, and this evoked the memory of the forest being dangerous for Little Red Riding Hood. Ms. T chose the role of mother for someone in the group and listened to this tale from her mother. She changed the role and became her mother, and the scene was relived. While the tale was being told, the scene was stopped at the moment when the hunter came in to save the little girl, and Ms. T was doubled (doubling technique) by the director with the following sentences:

There's no one in my life to read a tale for me. My boyfriend's leaving. I feel like my love story is stolen. My boyfriend is not a good hunter. My Tweety blanket has also gone. This situation is not easy at all for me.

---

[*] This case study was conducted by the Institute for Psychodrama, Sociodrama and Community Mental Health, on 28-30 September 2018 by Prof. Dr. Maurizio Gasseau & Prof. Dr. Ali Babaoğlu from the session of FEPTO (European Psychodrama Federation) accredited Analytical Psychology and Jungian Psychodrama and has been reported by changing some information in order to protect the personal rights of the participant.

This doubling was very meaningful to Ms. T, and she started to cry. The director offered to return to the dream again and asked her to end the dream as she wanted. Ms. T went to the balcony, took the Tweety blanket and embraced it, then ended the work. After the dream work, people who had taken roles in the dream work shared. Then in the narrative observation the director said:

> It was interesting for you to remember the Little Red Riding Hood tale since this tale is about erotic emotions. She's about to be seduced, beaten, fooled, etc. The wolf perhaps represents the men in your life and your boyfriend. It may represent not only your boyfriend but also your complicated feelings about your boyfriend's leaving. Meanwhile, the blankets may represent a love affair because there were two sheets: one of them flew because of the storm and the other one fell to the ground. Just like you and your boyfriend. The fall of the Tweety blanket to the ground was like your childhood walking away from you.

Ms. T worked on her dream and some memories from her past and present on a Jungian psychodrama stage using this dream. The facts that the dream phenomenon has a metaphysical value different from the structure of the physical world and that the dream is associated with active images from the point of creativity have brought this work to a spiritual axis.

1. Souldrama. Developed by American psychodramatist Connie Miller (2000, 2004), souldrama is an approach based on the concepts of spirituality and spiritual intelligence, which help one realize higher aims by regulating the ego and spirit. It is a type of intelligence on problems related to spiritual intelligence, meaning, and values that question how one can live life in a larger, richer, more meaningful way. It is used in defining and regulating the skills and abilities necessary for the adaptive use of spirituality (Emmons, 2000; Zohar & Marshall, 2000).

Souldrama is concerned with Moreno's emphasis on the concept of divinity and claims that psychodrama actually focuses on promoting mental intelligence and spirituality. With the inclusion of spirituality in therapy, clients can obtain the necessary spiritual energy to make life changes (Miller, 2007). Souldrama proposes a seven-phase spiritual discovery process, each stage is overcome by the *cover* metaphor, by passing each cover forward, a new phase of spiritual consciousness is introduced (Miller, 2000, 2004).

The first session is called faith, and the second session is called truth. These deal with rational intelligence. In the faith session, basic trust is provided through prayer, and in the truth session, participants try to find out what skills their parents bestowed on them in order to discover their higher goals. The third session is mercy, and the fourth session is called love. These are based on emotional intelligence. Participants can switch to the role of God and explore ways to be empathetic with the people they know; in the love session, they discover the personal meanings of love, unconditional

love, and acceptance through the active image technique. The last two sessions attempt to develop mental intelligence. While the fifth session, called modesty, aims to balance one's sense of trust with self-confidence and modesty in order to appreciate people's diversity to learn the value of being faithful to one's beliefs, the sixth session, thankfulness, invites participants to think deeply about their self-worth and gratitude. In integration, the seventh and final session, participants experience the moment, listen to the spirit, and begin to be creative with God. This stage is where this transformation and the three different intelligences combine (Miller, 2008, 2010). Souldrama also is used in twelve steps in the treatment of alcohol addiction in the clinical environment (Miller, 2013).

3. Case Study. This section is about Mr. J. He is 45 years old, newly divorced, and has worked for 20 years at the same job with his wife. Setting up his own business recently and struggling to cope with the financial crisis, Mr. J is having problems with his current relationships with women. For Mr. J, two phases were designed represented by covers. The first cover is the discovery of the soul's task. In this phase, Mr. J was introduced to his mother's soul on the psychodrama stage in order to deal with the problems he had had with his mother. **

Firstly, a statue was made of the way his mother showed her love to Mr. J when she was alive. His mother wants him to light a candle. Mr. J is looking back at her over his shoulder.

Protagonist: (to the mother's soul) *You were bitter.*

Mother's Soul: *I didn't know how to love.*

Protagonist: *I had to listen and take your sorrowful sentences. Even though I hated to listen to them, I wanted to listen to understand what was going on in the family. That was my way of controlling things. We had to move because we had gone bankrupt. I had to leave home but I never wanted to do it. I had wanted to stop your sorrow.*

Mother's Soul: *I apologize.*

Mr. J's Guardian Angel brought a book, *The Task of My Spirit.* Mr. J reads from the book:

My job is to design houses in which people can live happily and peacefully. The guardian angel repeats this.

Guardian Angel: *Explain to your mother how you tried to stop her sorrow.*

Protagonist: *I tried to stop your sorrow by desiring to make a house where you and I could stay together. That's what I'm doing as a profession now, building safe areas. Thank you*

** This case study is quoted from Case A in Conny Miller's (2000, p. 181) article *The Technique of Souldrama® and Its Applications.* Some expressive changes have been made to protect the integrity of the style in the article. The session was directed by Conny Miller.

for helping me with this. I'm trying to make a connection with your love, by sculpting your sorrow. I couldn't build anything without feeling sorrow. Thank you for giving me this gift I use every day in my job.

In order to solve his problems with women, Mr. J had to first face his mother in Souldrama. His attempt to accept the feelings of sorrow that his mother had caused him, the spiritual message from the Guardian Angel (auxiliary ego), and calling this whole process the *Discovery of Soul's Task* suggest that this case study has a spiritual texture.

3. Therapeutic spiral model (TSM). This approach was adapted to the psychodrama clinic by M. Katherine Hudgins (2002) in order to ensure safe and qualified work on clients with traumatic experiences. The scientific theoretical orientation of this model is based on trauma neurobiology; cognitive behavioral therapy's understanding of the mind, attachment, and object relations theory; Morenian spontaneity; creativity concepts; and role theory (Hudgins, 2007).

The *spiral* metaphor in the name of the approach was created by Hudgins as a spiritual image inspired by the healing symbols of American, New Zealand, and Australian natives and African, South Americas, and Korean shamans.

Accordingly, spiral energy is a way for spiritual chaos to begin to decrease, and clients should take the spiral one step at a time to consciously control the mental hurricane. It is an effective metaphor that helps create realistic goals and cognitive meanings through the act of re-understanding perceptions and belief systems impaired by trauma. The TSM aims to create positive role voices that can be personalized according to clients' spiritual resources and symbolizes this effort as psychotherapeutic heart surgery (Hudgins & Toscani, 2013).

The TSM proposes some prescription roles for strengthening the self-organization of a client who has had a traumatic experience: the observer ego, inner-soul strength, client role, interpersonal strength, over strength, body match, inclusive match, and director of defense. These roles can be undertaken by the psychodrama manager to support the client (Hudgins, 2002). In particular, the roles of inner-soul strength and over strength are thought to have spiritual sides.

2.1. Case Study. This is a portion of the beginning of the trauma work executed by the protagonist, Mei Feng, a middle-aged TSM group member in Nantou, Taiwan who wishes to gather strength to abandon her abusive husband. ***

Mei Feng bursts into tears as she begins walking and is then able to speak to form the session contract. She says: "*I'm even afraid to work on this problem. I am afraid*

*** This case study is from an article published in Kate Hudgins' book *Psychodrama: Advances in Theory and Practice*' (pp. 176–177). Some of the quoted statements have been changed to preserve its style integrity.

he will understand what I am doing." The client's limbic system has captured her cognitive functions, and she loses the ability to remain in the here and now in the moment. Rather than directing her to the past, clinical attempts are made to enable TSM to exercise prescribed roles effectively in order to consolidate self-organization and to increase her spontaneity. The clinician, as a director, attempts to stop the trauma spiral that lowers the unprocessed right-brain scans, taking over the power and connections they need, the sensations, body memories, and intensive affect and coping skills needed to survive. The psychodrama director steps in as her body match in order to increase her active bodily awareness and to focus her attention on the now.

The director made the following supportive statement to the protagonist:

We should stop right here and get some strength and support for you so that you can face some fear of being hurt by your husband. Take a few deep breaths to prepare yourself. I'm going to stand next to you, and help you stay at now as your body match. I'm talking to the first person you have, to your auxiliary side. The one that helps you stay safe now. All right?

The protagonist makes a silent okay sign.

The director stands beside the protagonist as her body match and starts to speak:

I'm taking a few deep breaths... and... As I'm doing this... my mind is getting slower... I'm looking at this room. I'm in the social services TSM group. I'm safe. Silence... breathes... Maybe I can imagine a strong, solid tree in my dream. I feel my roots beneath the ground. Yes... here... better... I'm a big, strong tree, I've been through a lot of storms and I'm still up.

Protagonist: *I can slow down. Yeah, I see the room and I see the other people in the group. I feel... myself... as a tree... a Chinese tree... I've been here for 3000 years... I've given solace to many people (lightened their sorrow) and connected to the earth with strong roots.*

Director: *Good, choose someone to be a tree and we shall embody it as an over strength. If you meet your fears today, it's something you need. Also, I will ask you to choose someone to be your body match who can walk with you during the drama.*

The phase continued using prescription roles until her self-organization strengthened and her spontaneity increased. Mei Feng's primary intention was to gain her spiritual power through TSM in order to face her abusive husband on the psychodrama stage. Mei Feng was supported by the director's spiritual sensitivity. Discussing the neurological structure and somatic signs of trauma experienced by Mei Feng with spiral metaphors and reviving the image of an ancient, curative tree in order for her to gain her inner soul strength have been evaluated as interventions with spiritual aspects.

Conclusion

Psychodrama has a wide and rich perspective that cannot be limited only as a therapeutic tool in treating psychological symptoms. Moreno was ingeniously able to perceive and convey the influence of spirituality and religion on human beings and life, despite the contrary ideas and criticisms of his time. The most important points that make Moreno's ideas valuable are how he associates the notions of spontaneity and creativity with God directly and his ability to indicate the infinite power and boundaries of human potential without departing from the scientific developments of his age as he places the perception of God at an aesthetic level with the idea of I-God. Contemporary researchers have also notably dealt with Moreno's legacy of thought along different axes in spiritual and religious contexts.

Placing dreams, which are space-less and timeless, and the individual and collective unconscious onto its main axis and using Jungian archetypes, myths, and alchemy as an interpretation tool in the narrative-observation stage allow Jungian psychodrama to be considered as having a spiritually sound framework. The spiritual core of the Jungian psychodrama that stands out with its focused practice deepens and enriches its dream work, which is also considered in classical psychodrama. Eastern mysticism is integrated into psychodrama through the dream incubation technique.

Souldrama has a terminology and practice directly oriented at spirituality. The intense usage of spiritual metaphors is an important contribution of Souldrama to classical psychodrama. However, its application based on a protocol consisting of phases increases the risk of the protagonist reducing creativity and spontaneity; thus Souldrama must be considered to have some limitations.

The Therapeutic Spiral Model, however, can be considered a strong approach with its indications in treating trauma by reason of its shamanic origin: caring for the client's spiritual resources and aiming to transform meaning.

Rather than considering the decisiveness of theoretical framework and forms of intervention on the functionality of these three spiritually-oriented approaches, clients' expectations and needs, personality traits, and whether or not they find the approach meaningful are considered to be more decisive factors.

Although psychodrama is a therapeutic tool with widespread use in Turkey, academic studies focusing on the spiritual aspects of Moreno's philosophy and psychodrama are found to be quite limited. In light of this article, a need exists for studies where psychodrama can be considered together with the Sufism discipline, which is the aesthetic dimension of Islamic thought. This article is hoped to encourage new articles on the relevance between psychodrama and spirituality.

References

Apter, N. (2003). The human being: JL Moreno's vision in psychodrama. *International Journal of Psychotherapy*, *8*(1), 31-36.

Blatner, A. (1996). *Acting in: Practical applications of psychodramatic methods*. New York: Springer.

Blatner, A. (2000a). A new role for psychodramatists: Master of ceremonies. *Journal of Group Psychotherapy, Psychodrama and Sociometry*, *53*(2), 86.

Blatner, A. (2000b). *Foundation of psychodrama history theory and practice*. New York: Springer.

Blatner, A. (2005a). Perspectives on Moreno, psychodrama, and creativity. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, *1*(2), 111-121.

Blatner, A. (2005b). Role theory, archetypes, and Moreno's philosophy illuminated by the kabbalistic Tree of Life. *Journal of Group Psychotherapy, Psychodrama and Sociometry*, *58*(1), 3-14.

Blatner, A. (2007). Morenian approaches: Recognizing psychodrama's many facets. *Journal of Group Psychotherapy, Psychodrama and Sociometry*, *59*(4), 159-170.

Blatner, A. & Cukier, R. (2007). Moreno's basic concepts. C. Baim, J. Burmeister, & M. Maciel (Ed.), *Psychodrama: Advances in theory and practice* (pp. 293-307). London: Routledge.

Borgatta, E. F., Boguslaw, R., & Haskell, M. R. (1975). On the work of Jacob L. Moreno.

Sociometry, *38*(1), 148-161.

Buber, M. (1950). *I and thou* (R. G. Smith, Trans.). London: T. & T. Clark. Casson, J. (2004). *Drama, psychotherapy and psychosis*. East Sussex: Routledge.

Corsini, R., & Wedding, D. (1995). *Current psychotherapie*s. Itasca: F. E. Peacock.

Dökmen, Ü. (2003). *Sosyometri ve Psikodrama* [Sociometry and psychodrama]. Istanbul: Sistem.

Emmons, R. A. (2000). Is spirituality an intelligence? Motivation, cognition, and the psychology of ultimate concern. *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, *10*(1), 3-26.

Figusch, Z. (Ed.) (2012). *From one-to-one psychodrama to large group socio-psychodrama*. Maidstone: Lulu.

Frick, E. (2003). Psychodrama and the spiritual exercises. *The Way*, *42*(3), 151-160.

Garcia, A., & Buchanan, D. R. (2009). Psychodrama. E. R. Johnson, D. Read (Ed.), *Current approaches in drama therapy* (pp. 393-423). Springfield: Charles C Thomas.

Gasseau, M., & Gasca, G. (1991) *Lo Psicodramma Junghiano*. Torino: Boringhieri.

Gasseau, M., & Scategni, W. (2007). Jungian psychodrama: from theoretical to creative roots.

C. Baim, J. Burmeister, & M. Maciel (Ed.), *Psychodrama: Advances in theory and practice*

(pp. 261-271). London: Routledge.

Gershoni, J. (2003). *Psychodrama in the 21st century: Clinical and educational applications*. New York: Springer

Goldberg, M. C. (2009). Positive Psychodrama and the early works of JL Moreno. *Group*, *33*(4), 359-372.

Hammer, R. D. (2000). New approaches to psychodrama. *Journal of Group Psychotherapy, Psychodrama and Sociometry*, *52*(4), 155-161.

Holmes, P. (1991). Classical psychodrama: An overview. P. Holmes, & M. Karp (Ed.), *Psychodrama: Inspiration and technique* (pp. 7-13). London: Routledge.

Holmes, P. (2015). *The inner world outside: Object relations theory and psychodrama*. New York: Routledge.

Howie, P. C. (2012). Philosophy of life: JL Moreno's revolutionary philosophical underpinnings of psychodrama and group psychotherapy. *Philosophy and Group Psychotherapy*, *36*(2), 135-146.

Howie, P. C., & Bagnall, R. (2015). The transmogrification of warm-up: From drama to psychodrama. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, *44*, 35-44.

Hudgins, M. K. (2002). *Experiential treatment for PTSD The Therapeutic Spiral Model*. New York: Springer.

Hudgins, M. K. (2007). Clinical foundations of the Therapeutic Spiral Model: Theoretical orientations and principles of change. C. Baim, J. Burmeister, & M. Maciel (Ed.), *Psychodrama: Advances in theory and practice* (pp. 175-189). London: Routledge.

Hudgins, M. K., & Toscani, F. (2013). *Healing world trauma with the Therapeutic Spiral Model: Psychodramatic stories from the frontlines*. Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley.

Johnson, P. E. (1948). The psychodrama of God by J. L. Moreno. *Journal of Bible and Religion*, *16*(4), 244-246.

Jones, P. (1996). *Drama as therapy: Theory, practice and research*. New York: Routledge. Jung, C. G. (1934). *The collected works of C. G. Jung*. London, New York: Routledge.

Jung, C. G. (1964). *Man and his symbols*. New York: Doubleday.

Jung, C. G. (2014). *The archetypes and the collective unconscious*. London: Routledge.

Jung, C. G. (2017). *Mandala symbolism*. (R. F. C. Hull, Trans.) Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Karp, M. (2005). An introduction to psychodrama. M. Karp, P. Holmes, & K. B. Tauvon (Ed.), *The handbook of psychodrama* (pp. 3-15). East Sussex: Routledge.

Tahar, E., & Kellermann, F. P. (1996). Psychodrama and drama therapy: A comparison. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, *23*(1), 27-36.

Kellerman, F. P. (1992). *Focus on psychodrama: Therapeutic aspects of pychodrama*. Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley.

Gasseau, M. & L. Perrotta (2013). The Jungian approach: in situ supervision of psychodrama. Krall, H., Fürst, J., & Fontaine, P. (Ed.). (2013). *Supervision in psychodrama* (pp. 37-57). Wiesbaden: Springer.

Kraus, C. (1984). Psychodrama for fallen gods: a review of Morenian theology. *Journal of group psychotherapy, psychodrama and sociometry*, *37*(2), 47-66.

Lawrence, W. G. (Ed.). (2003). *Experiences in social dreaming*. New York: Karnac. Leventon, E. (2001). *A clinician's guide to psychodrama*. New York: Springer.

Lindqvist, M. (2005). Religion and the spirit. P. Holmes, M. Karp, & M. Watson (Ed.),

Psychodrama since Moreno (pp.137-153). New York: Routledge.

Marineau, R. F. (1989). *Jacob Levy Moreno 1889-1974: Father of psychodrama, sociometry, and group psychotherapy*. New York: Routledge.

Meyer, D. D. (2012). Techniques for spiritual, ethical, and religious counseling. *Counseling and Value*, *57*(10), 241-252.

Miller, C. (2000). The technique of Souldrama and its applications. *Journal of Group Psychotherapy, Psychodrama and Sociometry*, *52*(4), 173-186.

Miller, C. (2004). *Souldrama: A journey into the heart of God*. NJ: Self-published.

Miller, C. (2007). Psychodrama, spirituality and Souldrama. C. Baim, J. Burmeister, & M. Maciel (Ed.), *Psychodrama: Advances in theory and practice* (pp. 189-201). London: Routledge.

Miller, C. (2008). Souldrama®: Spirituality in action. *Journal of Creativity in Mental Health*, *3*(2), 139-156.

Miller, C. (2010). *Starve the ego: Feed the soul! Souldrama*. Roseburg: Lulu.

Miller, C. (2013). Integrating two models for the treatment of addictions: Souldrama and 12- step recovery in action. *Journal Of Groups In Addiction & Recovery*, *8*(2), 81-111.

Moore, T. (1994). *Soulmates honoring the mysteries of love and relationship*. New York: HarperCollins.

Moore, T. (1996). *The re-enchantment of everyday life*. New York: HarperCollins.

Moreno, J. L. (1934). *Who shall survive? A new approach to the problem of human interrelations*. Washington: Mental Disease Publishing.

Moreno, J. L. (1946). *Psychodrama*. New York: Beacon House.

Moreno, J. L. (1947). Contributions of sociometry to research methodology in sociology. *American Sociological Review*, *12*(3), 287-292.

Moreno, J. L. (1956). The sociometric school and the science of man. *Sociometry*, *18*(4), 271– 291.

Moreno, J. L. (1961). The role concept, a bridge between psychiatry and sociology. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, *118*(6), 518-523.

Moreno, J. L. (1971). *Words of the Father*. New York: Beacon House.

Moreno, Z. T., Blomkvist, L. D., & Rutzel, T. (2013). *Psychodrama, surplus reality and the art of healing*. New York: Routledge.

Nicholas, M. W. (2017). The use of psychodrama and sociometry techniques in psychodynamic and other process groups. *International Journal of Group Psychotherapy*, *67*, 131-140. doi: 10.1080/00207284.2016.1238751.

Perrotta, L. (2012). Transgenerational violence against women: Jungian psychodrama on the path to individuation. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Family Studies*, *17*(2), 335-338.

Pitzele, P. A. (1991). The psychodrama of the bible: Mirror and window of soul. *Religious Education*, *86*(4), 562-570.

Rosenbaum, M., & Berger, M. (Ed.). (1963). *Group psychotherapy and group function*. New York: Basic Books.

Salehi, M., & Shokri, M. (2016). The group psychodrama consultation effect on resiliency and spiritual intelligence of Eight grade female students. *European Online Journal of Natural and Social Sciences: Proceedings*, *5*(3), 164-170.

Scategni, W. (1994). *Das Psychodrama zwischett alltaglicher and arehetypischer Er/ahrungswelt*. Solothurn and Dusseldorf: Walter Verlag.

Scategni, W. (2001). *The social dream in psychodrama*. Turin: Ananke.

Scategni, W. (2002*). Psychodrama, group processes, and dreams: Archetypal images of individuation*. (V. Marsicano, Trans.) New York: Taylor&Francis.

Scheiffele, E. (1997). The theatre of truth: Psychodrama, spontaneity and improvisation; the theatrical theories and influences of Jacob Levy Moreno. *Research in Drama Education*, *2*(2), 227.

Steere, D. A. (1997). *Spiritual presence in psychotherapy: A guide for caregivers*. New York: Routledge.

Tauvon, K. B. (2005). The protagonist. M. Karp, P. Holmes, & K. B. Tauvon (Ed.), *The handbook of psychodrama* (pp. 97-117). East Sussex: Routledge.

Tavakoly, F. M., Namdari, K., & Esmaili, M. (2014). Effect of psychodrama-based group training for healthy lifestyle on psychological balance, spiritual well-being and optimism. *Journal of Life Science and Biomedicine*, *4*, 346-351.

Tatham, P., & Morgan, H. (2018). *Social dreaming.* New York: Routledge.

Waldl, R. (2005) J. L. Moreno's einfluss auf Martin Buber's Ich und Du [J. L. Moreno's influence on Martin Buber's I and Thou], *Zeitschrift für Psychodrama und Soziometrie, 4*(1), 175–191.

Wilkins, P. (1999). *Psychodrama*. London: SAGE.

Williams, A. (1991). *Forbidden agendas: Strategic action in groups*. East Sussex: Routledge.

Winters, N. (2000). The psychospiritual in psychodrama: A fourth role category. *The International Journal of Action Methods*, *52*(4), 163-171.

Wolinsky, S. (1991). *Trances people live*. Connecticut: Bramble Company.

Yalom, I. D. (1995). *The theory and practice of group psychotherapy*. New York: Basic.

Yaniv, D. (2014). Tele and the social atom. *Zeitschrift für Psychodrama und Soziometrie*, *13*(1), 107-120.

Zohar, D., & Marshall, I. N. (1990). *The quantum self: Human nature and consciousness defined by the new physics*. New York: William Morrow & Company.

Zohar, D., Marshall, I., & Marshall, I. N. (2000). SQ*: Connecting with our spiritual intelligence*. New York: Bloomsbury Publishing.

Zoran D., Veljković J., & Tovic, M. (2006*). Psychodrama: A beginner's guide*. Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley.

Zuretti, M. (2005). The co-unconscious. P. Holmes, M. Karp & M. Watson (Ed.),

Psychodrama since Moreno (pp. 153-168). New York: Routledge.

Original Article

Partner Violence in Muslim Marriages: Tips for Therapists in the US

Esra Nihan Bridge[1] 🆔
Kadıköy Counseling and Research Center

Nesrin Duman[2] 🆔
Bartın University

Abstract

Partner violence in Muslim marriages is one of the most challenging subjects in the therapy setting for both therapists and Muslim clients. Due to the lack of studies and the negative reputation of Muslim families' in Western culture, many therapists may carry stereotypes about partner violence in Muslim societies. Moreover, as a result of these same reasons, many Muslim clients might be hesitant to seek help or share their negative experiences. In family therapy, therapists would benefit from knowing what Muslim marriages are like and from learning to respect their clients' cultural values. Understanding Muslim families better can be valuable in the therapy setting for many Muslim clients by helping therapists recognize abuse and enabling clients to seek help for partner violence. The current study aims to guide therapists in understanding marriages, cultural values, and partner violence in terms of Muslim marriages; to prepare them for challenges in therapy; and also to encourage future studies focused on preventing and combatting intimate partner violence.

Keywords:
Muslim marriages • Intimate partner violence • Couples • Violence • Therapist

Müslüman Evliliklerde Partner Şiddeti: ABD'deki Terapistler İçin Öneriler

Özet

Müslüman evliliklerde partner şiddeti, hem terapistler hem de Müslüman danışanlar için terapi ortamındaki en zorlu konulardan biridir. Çalışmaların yetersizliği ve Müslüman aileleri Batı kültüründeki olumsuz itibarı nedeniyle, pek çok terapist Müslüman toplumlarda partner şiddeti ile ilgili önyargılar taşıyabilmektedir. Ayrıca, bu benzer nedenlerin bir sonucu olarak, birçok Müslüman danışan yardım istemede veya olumsuz deneyimlerini paylaşmada tereddüt yaşayabilir. Aile terapisinde, Müslüman evliliklerin nasıl olduğunu bilmek ve danışanların kültürel değerlerini öğrenmek terapistlere fayda sağlayacaktır. Müslüman aileleri terapi ortamında daha iyi anlamak, birçok Müslüman danışana yönelik terapilerde terapistlerin şiddeti tanımalarına yardımcı olmada ve danışanların partner şiddeti için yardım aramalarını sağlamada değerli olabilir. Bu çalışma, terapistlere Müslüman evliliklerini, kültürel değerlerini ve partner şiddetini anlamada rehberlik etmeyi; onları terapideki zorluklara hazırlamayı ve ayrıca eşe/partnere yönelik şiddeti önleme ve bunlarla mücadeleye odaklanmış gelecekteki çalışmaları teşvik etmeyi amaçlamaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler:
Müslüman evlilikler • Yakın partner şiddeti • Çiftler, Şiddet • Terapist

1 Istanbul Kadıköy Counseling and Research Center, Istanbul-Turkey. E-mail: esranihanbridge@gmail.com

2 **Correspondence to:** Nesrin Duman. Bartin University Psychology Department Kutlubey Campus, Bartın-Turkey. E-mail: nesrinduman@bartin.edu.tr

Understanding cultural diversity and assessing religion's impact on families have increasingly received attention from many therapists and researchers in the field of family therapy (Daneshpour, 1998, 2016). Even though a large Muslim population exists in the US, the majority consists of African-Americans, Asians, and Arabs (Abugideiri, 2010) with the religion of Islam still being one of the most unfamiliar and misjudged religions in the world (Mohamad, 1996). Daneshpour (1998) stated Western thinking to have many negative opinions related to Islam, such as the religion being oppressive to women and many Muslim men being aggressive or terrorists (Daneshpour, 1998, 2016). One can predict that many therapists also might lack information or even carry negative assumptions about the religion.

Daneshpour (1998) believes that this negative reputation causes Muslim people in the USA some reluctance in seeking therapy. The fears of being judged and of being viewed as irrational may cause many Muslims to resist seeking therapy, even in serious situations (Daneshpour, 1998, 2016). In the field of family therapy, having therapists know what Muslim marriages are like and learning to respect clients' cultural/religious values is very important for clients being able to feel understood and respected in a therapy setting. For Muslim clients as well as the therapists, partner violence in Muslim marriages appears as one of the most difficult topics. Partner violence includes physical-sexual-emotional violence, stalking, and psychological aggression (including coercive acts) by a current or former intimate partner ("Intimate partner", 2018). When Muslim families in the USA encounter partner violence, many of them may be reluctant to seek help or talk about their negative experiences in a therapy setting. Moreover, in some situations, therapists might overreact about the power dynamics in couple relations or be confused about the indicators of partner violence in Muslim marriages. For this reason, understanding the values of Muslim families can be invaluable for therapists and many Muslim clients for recognizing and assisting with partner violence. The purpose of this paper is to address partner violence for Muslims in family therapy. It aims to guide therapists in understanding marriage, cultural values and partner violence in Muslim marriages, in preparing them for challenges in therapy, and also in encouraging future studies focused on preventing and combatting intimate partner violence.

Muslim Marriages and Cultural Values

To begin with, providing some information about Muslim marriages and family cultural values is crucial for comprehending this culture. Even though the term Muslim marriage is used to describe the general characteristics of the community, this term seems to minimize the differences between customs and tradition (Robinson, 2010). While marriage in Muslim culture may have some similarities with marriages in other cultures, is also has obvious differences. Primarily, many Muslim people also

desire to have a religious ceremony apart from the official marriage to be counted as married in their religion (Daneshpour, 1998, 2016). A Muslim marriage ceremony takes place with a religious guide (Ayyub, 2000) and involves certain prayers. Many times this religious ceremony will be held after a short period of time after the couple has started dating, as opposed to the long engagements in USA culture. One of the motives for Muslim couples to get married early is their desire to receive Allah's blessing before they become involved in a sexual relationship.

The most significant differences in Muslim marriages appear in gender roles. For example, according to Abugideiri (2010), many Muslim women might presume that one of the ways to worship God is by being the best wife to their husbands. On the other hand, many traditional Muslim men might desire to have control over their family instead of sharing power (Ayyub, 2000). Also, many traditional Muslim women can surmise that their husbands' responsibility is to lead the family according to Muslim guidelines (Abugideiri, 2010). They may be more willing to follow their husbands' rules. Many Muslim families usually adopt a patriarchal system; therefore, traditional Muslim men might maintain authority over making decisions (Ayyub, 2000). This authority can cause the Muslim women to think that asking their husbands' permission is mandatory when she wants to do something, such as going out or meeting up with friends. Consequently, many married Muslim women find obeying their husbands to be appropriate when their husbands do not approve of something, thus giving up something they desire.

Even if they live within USA culture, many Muslim women still might hold some traditional beliefs about problems in marriage (Abugideiri, 2010). Some Muslim women believe extremely that they are responsible for failures in the marriage; therefore, they experience shame during marital conflicts (Abugideiri, 2010). Daneshpour (1998) stated that many Muslim families also see themselves as the root of any problems. For instance, parents may consider a child's behavioral problems to be due to their lack of responsiveness to the child's needs (Daneshpour, 1998).

In addition to seeing personal and marital problems as a failure, discussing them with family or outsiders is another challenging topic for Muslim couples. Sharing problems in their marriage and seeking support from others for marital problems can bring shame to Muslim couples (Daneshpour, 1998). These women may also believe that, if they talk about their private problems, the community might ostracize them for sharing details of their marriage and for not respecting their husband (Abugideiri, 2010). One may predict that with this belief, intimate partner violence is able to remain undiscovered for long periods of time. Aside from seeking support through resources, Muslim women asking for help from their parents for their marital problems may also be dishonorable (Abugideiri, 2010). Al-Krenawi and Graham (2005) mentioned the

extended family's power and influence over the family. In some situations, extended families can exacerbate existing problem by blaming the mother for her parenting skills or criticizing her for not managing the marriage well. Especially in serious marital problems, many women may be hesitant to go back to their parents' house, or her parents may not even accept her back home.

In terms of divorce, even though Islam views divorce as a very unpleasant and bitter event, Muslim law allows a couple to divorce (Daneshpour, 1998). Unlike legal divorce, the Muslim way of divorcing can only be done verbally (Isgandarova, 2018). In talaq (repudiation, divorce), the husband has a right to dissolve the marriage by simply announcing to his wife that he repudiates her. However, the main point is usually how the Muslim families react to divorce. As previously stated, many Muslim women might consider divorce as a failure, and they find it shameful to go back to their parents' house. Also, the extended family may oppose their daughter's divorce and force her to remain married and be patient. Being divorced can be considered especially reprehensible for women. Moreover, a custody battle may arise; child custody can cause serious problems for the couple, especially when they attempt to remarry. In addition, Muslim children with divorced parents who grow up with only one parent and are removed from the other it can be challenging and considered reprehensible. This might also cause the child/children to be ostracized in the community (Abugideiri, 2010). As a consequence, many Muslim couples may desire to begrudgingly stay married to keep the family together.

Partner Violence in Muslim Marriages

When the issue is of violence in the domestic setting, anyone in the Muslim family can undeniably become the victim. Researchers have emphasized violence in Muslim marriages to be unrelated to any race, ethnicity, or socio-economic level (Faizi, 2011); the perpetrators and victims of violence can also come from any Islamic sect (Khan, 2006). The current literature has demonstrated partner violence in Muslim marriages to appear as physical, sexual, or emotional violence (Faizi, 2011) and may also include spiritual, verbal, and financial abuse (Isgandarova, 2018). Khan (2006) reported the research on Muslim families to have illustrated 47% of the Muslim community to have suffered from some type of domestic violence, and 12% of the Muslim community in the US to have experienced physical violence in the families. The literature has a lack of studies, particularly on partner violence in Muslim marriages.

According to Ayyub's (2000) study with South Asian Muslim families, those who had experienced partner violence indicated the majority of cases to be about power sharing and control. While fewer percentages of cases involved alcohol or substance abuse, nearly 20% of clients said it involved another woman (Ayyub, 2000). Surveys

have indicated women and children in Muslim communities to have experienced tremendous risks of violence (Abugideiri, 2010). Isgandarova (2017) conducted a study to explore domestic violence against pregnant women and interviewed seven Azerbaijani Muslim women. That study revealed the baby's gender to also play a crucial role in violence against pregnant women. While many families prefer boys over girls, discovering that a baby is female may lead to emotional and physical violence. That study's participants stated that putting emotional pressure on women to have a boy and/or threatening them with divorce are common ways to emotionally abuse pregnant women. Furthermore, some husbands might force women to have an abortion if the baby's gender is learned to be female, even though sex-selective abortion in Islam is prohibited. The study demonstrated that, if a family is going through financial struggles, women are usually blamed for getting pregnant, which will cause more financial problems (Isgandarova, 2017).

Firstly, mention how the religion of Islam views violence in marriage is imperative. Khan (2006) stated that Islam, like many other religions, aims to promote harmony and peace everywhere, including in marriage. Islam emphasizes being patient and practicing perseverance in overcoming challenges; however, this cannot be interpreted as the religion silently enduring violence (Abugideiri, 2010). Lack of knowledge about Islam usually leads to the idea that Islam tolerates violence towards the wife (Ibrahim & Abdalla, 2011); however, Islam certainly does not promote domestic violence (Khan, 2006), as violence in the marriage being unacceptable in Islam is very well-known by most Muslims (Abugideiri, 2010). Furthermore, many Muslim women are quite certain that God abhors oppression and injustice (Abugideiri, 2010). Ibrahim and Abdalla (2011) stated the reason why partner violence is associated with Muslim marriages to be an attribution to verse 4:34 in the Qur'an. While this verse simply explains a husband's responsibilities toward the wife, reading that specific verse out of context has misled many to think that Islam allows partner violence. Even though many Muslim women know the Qur'an does not legitimize violence towards spouses (Ibrahim & Abdalla, 2011) and oppression and violence to be unacceptable, they can experience moments of confusion and doubt in violent situations (Abugideiri, 2010).

Because being a good wife and being patient during challenges are promoted in the religion, this belief can affect Muslim women's behaviors toward violence. Isgandarova (2017) stated that not seeking support and not reporting violence to the police is fairly common among Muslim women. Due to their desire to keep the family together, many Muslim women sacrifice themselves and tolerate domestic violence. Noting that Muslim people are not more resilient to domestic violence than other populations is imperative (Abugideiri, 2010). However, many Muslim women remain in an abusive relationship for a long time, and acknowledging the reasons is crucial. Recognizing women's role in keeping the family together in Muslim culture is imperative. Faizi (2011) reported

the most common reasons for Muslim women staying in abusive relationships to be financial dependency, unwillingness to break the family apart, hope that the violence will end, and/or social pressure, which is not at all different from the reasons for non-Muslim women who stay in abusive relationships.

The literature has demonstrated that marital conflicts can appear during acculturation processes due to adjusting to the differences in new societies and the major changes in daily, family, and social life (Al-Krenawi &Graham, 2005). Ammar, Couture-Carron, Alvi, and San Antonio (2014) researched domestic violence with female Muslim immigrants and compared their results to female non-Muslim immigrants, finding out that 23% of female Muslim immigrants and 27% of female non-Muslim immigrants stated still experiencing violence from an intimate partner and the main reasons for them remaining in the relationship to be financial reasons, lack of social support, fear of the perpetrator, cultural and religious beliefs, and/or immigration-related issues (Ammar et al. 2014). This study also indicated in its comparison of both Muslim and non-Muslim immigrant women, nearly 35% of the Muslim women reported cultural and religious beliefs and fear of the community's negative reactions toward divorce to be critical factors for their staying in the relationship (Ammar et al. 2014).

Not only are cultural and religious values crucial for understanding intimate partner violence, but also the view of Muslim community toward partner violence. Firstly, some Muslims can find being violent or being faced with violence acceptable under certain circumstances. Abugideiri (2010) stated that some Muslims might approve or accept wife beating when it comes to disobedience, infidelity, or insulting behavior towards the husband because Islam sees the husband as the protector and maintainer of his wife and gives him the responsibility of heading the family. This approach encourages the wife to obey her husband. As stated before, if a Muslim woman does not receive her husband's approval before acting or does things which her husband opposes, she can be considered disobedient and the Muslim community can view the violence as acceptable. According to Abugideiri (2010), many Muslim women can justify experiencing and accepting violence for having had an affair. Furthermore, some Muslim men may increase the level of violence, even killing their wives as a result of an affair (Abugideiri, 2010).

Furthermore, other risk factors are powerful in understanding intimate partner violence in Muslim marriages. Isgandarova (2017) emphasized that one of the reasons women become vulnerable to partner violence is early-age marriage. Similar to the literature, poverty, alcohol, and substance abuse are also considered risk factors that contribute to domestic violence (Isgandarova, 2017). Abugideiri (2010) stated that many Muslim women who have been in abusive relationships realized during the therapy sessions that their parents had been in a similar type of relationship and

that their father had been abusive to their mother. This information demonstrates that witnessing violence in one's parents' relationships can be considered a risk factor for Muslim women in their tolerance of abuse and refusal to leave an abusive relationship with their husband. Moreover, one can assume that witnessing familial violence can be a risk factor for Muslim men's violence in their marital relationship. For this reason, intimate partner violence in Muslim families should be recognized as being able to also resemble partner violence in other cultures and as being unexplainable through strictly religious or cultural values.

Discussion and Conclusion

The prevalence of partner violence in Muslim marriages is not fully known due to the limited studies. Moreover and as stated before, domestic violence in Muslim families is usually concealed for several reasons (Khan, 2006). The most critical cause intriguing the mental health field is Muslim families' hesitance in seeking help. While some clients might find talking about their private life acceptable, others might consider this as a betrayal to the family. Sharing problems in their marriage and seeking support from others for marital problems can also bring shame to Muslim couples (Daneshpour, 1998, 2016). In addition, Muslim women might be reluctant to go to therapy due to her belief that a non-Muslim therapist will not understand her or that she will be underestimated or judged. In therapy settings, a non- Muslim therapist can find connecting with Muslim clients, staying unbiased, fully understanding their experiences, and properly recognizing violence in their relationships to be challenging. While two of the main reasons are the lack of studies and therapists' lack of knowledge about what Muslim marriages are like, another reason might relate to the biases against Muslim people and a negative reputation. For this reason, becoming a culturally competent therapist and understanding the values of Muslim families can be beneficial for many Muslim clients in several areas, particularly in seeking help for partner violence.

In two case studies of Arab Muslim Palestinian couples, Al-Krenawi and Graham (2005) emphasized the challenges of working with Muslim couples in therapy. They reported that the couple usually prefers talking about difficult issues in their individual sessions; the women may not mention violence until having an individual session. Therefore, having individual sessions with both partners could be beneficial for therapists. Also in couple's therapy, Muslim men may try to control the therapy session and compete with the therapist to gain authority (Al-Krenawi & Graham, 2005). In this situation, until a therapeutic alliance occurs, understanding and respecting Muslim men's desire to be powerful may assist the therapist. Al-Krenawi and Graham (2005) stated that, in some situations, the therapist's gender might create a conflict for the Muslim couple. For instance, some Muslim women might believe a male therapist will take her husband's side and, for this reason, might prefer a female

therapist. Additionally, Muslim women in couple's therapy might stay more passive and rely on the therapist to explain to their husbands their negative feelings, rather than talk about them (Al-Krenawi & Graham, 2005).

Therapists need to stay present and neutral and hear the client's story and perceptions of their marriage in the therapy setting without judging. Religion is indispensable for most Muslims in their daily life, and not respecting their values might cause them to limit their interactions with others (Robinson, 2010). Because unfamiliar approaches and suggestions are usually not internalized by clients, therapists should take into consideration the importance of religion in the roles of marriage, divorce, and gender for Muslim clients and should adopt an approach compatible with Muslim values (Daneshpour, 1998, 2016) Al-Krenawi and Graham (2005) recommended having therapists adopt a strengths-based approach and being more active in sessions. They also stated therapists should explore support systems and the circumstances for having immigrated; they should have a holistic view of the problems, including the psychological, social, spiritual, and family dynamics (Al-Krenawi & Graham, 2005).

Therapists also should remember that violence in Muslim marriages can range from emotional violence to physical violence (Ibrahim & Abdalla, 2011). In addition to this, therapists should receive intensive training on evaluating intimate partner violence in order to recognize the signs; they should provide support and referral resources to victims (McPhail, Busch, Kulkarni, & Rice, 2007). The feminist approach emphasizes the importance of empowerment and self-determination work for female victims of partner violence (McPhail, Busch, Kulkarni, & Rice, 2007). Fulu and Miedima (2016) stated that, in the USA, women with high status have lower rates of violence. This knowledge illustrates that women with high status in the community can be a protective factor for Muslim women. In addition to high status, having less pressure towards divorce and having more balanced marriage roles can also be considered protective factors in Muslim marriages (Fulu & Miedima, 2016). For this reason, contributing to the positive image of women and their education is fundamental in preventing and combatting partner violence. As previously cited, Muslim women might be confused about their duties and responsibilities and may be under the pressure of their roles. Isgandarova (2017) recommended that the Islamic community can be used for advising women not to view tolerating violence as a religious duty. Collaborating with Muslim community would also be compelling for encouraging Muslim women to seek help and support in violent situations.

While almost all societies oppose partner violence, facing this might manifest in different ways. According to Hajjar (2004), countries should be responsible for protecting citizens from family violence, for providing resources to combat violence in domestic settings, and for regulating laws. Khan (2006) stated that educating

families about the effects of domestic violence and supporting training for religious leaders to increase awareness of violence in Muslim families should be the most important steps taken. Religious leaders can play an active role in preventing partner violence by giving speeches against partner violence and training the Muslim community (Cunradi, Caetano, & Schafer, 2002). Finally, preventing and combatting partner violence requires interdisciplinary work.

References

Abugideiri, S. (2010). The peaceful families project: Addressing domestic violence in Muslim communities. *Partner Abuse*, 1(3), 363-76.

Al-Krenawi, A., Graham,J. (2005). Marital therapy for Arab Muslim Palestinian couples in the context of reacculturation. *The Family Journal: Counselıng and Therapy for Couples and Families*, 13(3), 300-310. DOI: 10.1177/1066480704273640

Ammar, N., Couture-Carron, A., Alvi, S., San Antonio, J. (2014). Experiences of Muslim and non-Muslim battered immigrant women with the police in the United States: A Closer understanding of commonalities and differences. *Violence Against Women,* 19(12), 1449–71.

Ayyub, R. (2000). Domestic violence in the South Asian Muslim immigrant population in the United States. *Journal of Social Distress and the Homeless*, 9(3), 237-48.

Cunradi, CB., Caetano, R., Schafer, J. (2002). Religious affiliation, denominational homogamy, and intimate partner violence among US couples. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*. 41(1), 139-151.

Daneshpour, M. (1998). Muslim families and family therapy. *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy*, 24(3), 355-67.

Daneshpour, M. (2016). *Family therapy with Muslims*. New York: Routledge.

Faizi, N. (2001). Domestic violence in the Muslim community. *Texas Journal of Women and the Law*, 10(2), 209-30.

Fulu, E., Miedema, S. (2016). Globalization and changing family relations: Family violence and women's resistance in Asian Muslim societies. *Sex Roles*, 74, 480-94.

Hajjar, L. (2004). Religion, state power, and domestic violence in Muslim societies: A framework for comparative analysis. *Law & Social Inquiry,* 29(1), 1-38.

Ibrahim, N. & Abdalla, M. (2010). A critical examination of Qur'an 4:34 and its relevance to intimate partner violence in Muslim families. *Journal of Muslim Mental Health,* 5, 327–49.

Intimate partner violence: definitions. (2018, 23 October). Retrieved from https://www.cdc.gov/violenceprevention/intimatepartnerviolence/definitions.html

Isgandarova, N. (2017). The role of Islam in preventing domestic violence towards Muslim women in Azerbaijan. *Spiritual Psychology and Counseling*, 2, 183–202. http://dx.doi.org/10.12738/spc.2017.2.0019

Isgandarova, N. (2018). *Muslim women, domestic violence, and psychotherapy theological and clinical issues*. New York: Routledge.

Khan, F. (2006). A Muslim response to domestic violence. *Journal of Religion & Abuse*, 8(1), 79-82.

McPhail, B. A., Busch, N. B., Kulkarni, S., & Rice, G. (2007). An integrative feminist model: The evolving feminist perspective on intimate partner violence. Violence Against Women, 13(8), 817-841.

Mohamad, M. (1996). Islam: the misunderstood religion. *Jati, Bilangan* 2, Disember 1996.

Robinson, R. (2010). Boundary battles: Muslim women and community identity in the aftermath of violence. *Women's Studies International Forum*, 33, 365–73.

Research Article

College Students' Attitudes Toward Counseling for Mental Health Issues in Two Developing Asian Countries

Angus C.H. Kuok[1] ⓘ
University of Saint Joseph

Jafar Rashidnia[2] ⓘ
University of Saint Joseph

Abstract

This study examines 300 college students in Iran and China. It clarifies that students from China have more positive attitudes toward counseling than those from Iran using a quantitative survey with well-established existing scales in the literature. The regression tests show different indictors for college students' attitudes toward mental health counseling in these two developing countries. Anticipated risk has been found as the most negative and powerful predictor of attitudes toward counseling in Iran. Stigma has been found as the most negative and powerful predictor of attitudes toward counseling in China. Implications have been discussed for educational departments and governments to advocate positive evaluations on mental health counseling services.

Keywords:

Attitudes toward counseling, Anticipated risk, Stigma, Iranian, Chinese

Gelişmekte Olan İki Asya Ülkesinde Üniversite Öğrencilerinin Ruh Sağlığı Sorunlarına Yönelik Psikolojik Danışma Tutumları

Öz

Bu çalışma İran ve Çin'deki 300 üniversite öğrencisi üzerinde yapılmıştır. Literatürde desteklenen ölçeklerden oluşan nicel bir anket kullanılan çalışmada Çinli öğrencilerin, psikolojik danışma konusunda İranlılardan daha olumlu tutumlara sahip oldukları bulunmuştur. Regresyon testleri, üniversite öğrencilerinin bu iki gelişmekte olan ülkede ruh sağlığı danışmanlığına yönelik tutumları için farklı göstergelerini incelemiştir. Beklenen risk, İran'da psikolojik danışmaya yönelik tutumların en olumsuz ve güçlü göstergesi olarak bulunmuştur. Çin'de ise, damgalanma psikolojik danışmaya yönelik tutumların en olumsuz ve güçlü göstergesi olarak bulunmuştur. Ruh sağlığı danışmanlığı hizmetleri ile ilgili olumlu değerlendirmeleri savunmaya yönelik olarak eğitim bölümleri ve hükümetler için sonuç ve öneriler sunulmuştur.

Anahtar Kelimeler:

Psikolojik danışmaya yönelik tutum, Beklenen risk, damgalanma, İranlı, Çinli

1 **Correspondence to:** Angus C. H. Kuok (PhD) Department of Psychology Faculty of Social Sciences University of Saint Joseph, Macao, China. Email: anguskuok@gmail.com

2 University of Saint Joseph, Macao, China.

Humans experience difficulties in coping with life's numerous demands and stressors in the different stages of development throughout life (Erikson, 1995). Among these stages is the period between adolescence and emerging adulthood, when humans encounter more various stressors than other stages such as physical changes, sexual identification, peer pressures, study pressure, seeking intimacy in a relationship, conflicts in being independent, and the transition from school to work (Santrock, 2015). Studies have indicated that humans in this transition period experience various psychologically-related challenges such as a stressful university environment with regards to socioeconomic factors, having to adjust to university culture, and experiencing the pressure of academic performance (Bowman & Payne, 2011; Flisher, De Beer, & Bokhorst, 2002; Sennet, Finchilescu, Gibson, & Strauss, 2003). Therefore, students might experience distress that can lead to poor mental health due to these challenges. However, students in higher education are found to be hesitant and to delay seeking counseling when they encounter stressors and issues related to mental health (Young, 2009).

Cooper, Corrigan, and Watson's (2003) study suggested that the kinds of assistance people ask for vary significantly. People tended to seek assistance from medical professionals, including primary care physicians, nurses, and mental health specialists (i.e., psychiatrists, psychologists, or mental health counselors) or to seek assistance from a generic group of community mentors (i.e., clergy, older friends, and teachers). Moreover, the Asian population is hesitant to consult counselors (Eisenberg, Golberstein, & Gollust, 2007; Masuda et al., 2009). The hesitancy the Asian population displays may be attributed to myths associated with consulting a counselor or professional in relevant disciplines; they believe that others will think they are crazy (Yang, Phelan, & Link, 2008). In Asian cultures, families are tight knit, so another family member's advice is often sought and valued for this type of decision making. As Asians live in a collectivistic culture in which people tend to categorize others as in-group or out-group in their community (McCarthy, 2005); in other words, families, close friends, and people from their religion are in the in-group while the rest are in the out-group. Thus, professionals in counseling and mental health services are more likely to fall into the out-group.

In addition, Asian cultures value shame avoidance, hierarchical relationships, and collectivistic orientations, as well as emotional self-control, conformity to norms, family recognition through achievement, filial piety, and humility (Kim, 2007). Asia is a very large continent that encompasses many countries, each sharing common and different values or cultures; for example, just as Iran is Persian and China is Asian, both are developing countries with the largest populations in West and East Asia, respectively. Studies have suggested both Iranian and Chinese culture to be collectivist (Li, Wang, & Fischer, 2004; Tavakoli, 2013); in other words, their

attitudes, behaviors, family structure, and well-being are guided by loyalty to one's family. However, they were completely different in terms of religion; nearly 98% of Iranians are Muslim (Hassan, 2008). Surprisingly, more than 50% of the Buddhists in the world live in China (Pew Research Center, 2016), but around half of the Chinese are atheists (Washington Post, 2013).

Although seeking and receiving help from counseling could assist in reducing distressing symptoms (Bergin & Garfield, 1994), only a few people who experience significant distress seek counseling (Boldero & Fallon, 1995; Carlton & Deane, 2000; Meehan, Lamb, Saltzman, & O'Carroll, 1992). Andrews, Hall, Telsson, and Henderson's (1999) study found that more than one in five adults in Australia meet the criteria for a mental health disorder, while 62% of persons with a mental disorder do not seek any professional help (e.g., counseling) for mental health issues. This striking statistic highlights the fact that many people from an individualistic society hesitate to seek counseling services when encountering mental health-related issues; it would be understandable for people in a collectivistic society (like Iran and China) to have much higher reluctance to seek counseling services due to their daily hassles and burdens. Thus, the present study aims to (1) discover students' attitudes toward counseling in Iran and China and (2) understand the factors related to students' attitudes toward counseling in Iran and China.

Attitudes toward Counseling: Differences between China and Iran

Attitudes are referred to as either favorable or unfavorable evaluations of objects, people, and events (Robbins & Judge, 2014). Robbins and Judge also suggested that humans' attitudes help predict behaviors when the attitudes correspond to previous experiences or when one is under social pressure. Kushner and Sher (1989, p. 256) mentioned that seeking counseling for mental health issues has been described as a "potentially difficult, embarrassing, and overall risky e*nterprise… [that can induce] fear and avoidance in some individuals.*" Particularly critical to those in collectivistic cultures who seek counseling for mental health issues is that this may not only possibly generate harms for themselves and their family, but also create conflict with religious rituals. That is, if an individual encounters a problem, one tends to go to family members, religious leaders, or elders for advice and support, so a person is often discouraged from using counseling services for religious reasons (McCarthy, 2005). However, due to the religious differences between Chinese and Iranian, the impact of religion on seeking counseling for the Chinese (i.e. they tend to seek help from family) is impossible to be much smaller than that for Iranians (i.e. they seek help from both family and religious friends/leaders). Thus, the first hypothesis, H1, is as follows: Chinese attitudes on counseling for mental health issues are more positive than those among Iranians.

Possible Factors Related to Attitudes toward Counseling

Moreover, Kushner and Sher (1989) first conceptualized the act of seeking counseling for mental health issues as a classic approach/avoidance conflict. Approach factors like one's level of distress and desire to reduce that distress maximize the likelihood of seeking counseling services for mental health issues; namely, they have positive attitudes toward counseling. In contrast, avoidance factors like perceived risks minimize the chances of seeking counseling. Thus, these people have conceived avoidance factors about counseling services for mental health issues; namely, they possess negative attitudes toward counseling. In Lee's (2004) study of the intentions for seeking counseling for mental health problems, around 25% of the respondents mentioned that they would seek counseling while 12% refused to seek any counseling service. Unfortunately, the percentage of those in emerging adulthood who seek counseling is worse than that for the general population. In Hinderaker's (2003) study on college students' use of counseling services, less than 20% were willing to seek counseling while more than 50% were unlikely to seek counseling.

Vogel, Wester, and Larson's (2007) review of people avoiding counseling stated the importance of understanding more about the factors that contribute to avoidance when people need to decide on seeking counseling services for mental health issues. They also pointed out that, although several studies exist on the impact of different avoidance factors, most had looked at only one or two factors at a time. Thus, clarifying the relationships among the different avoidance factors involved in whether or not people seek counseling service is necessary and could provide a clearer picture if the factors influencing one's assessment of counseling services were understood. In an effort to contribute to exploring these issues, Vogel, Wester, and Larson (2007) included a large number of the avoidance factors suggested in previous research; namely, stigma, anticipated risk, self-disclosure, treatment, fears, and fear of emotions.

Stigma. Stigma is defined as the fear of being labeled negatively if one seeks counseling assistance for mental health problems (Deane & Chamberlin, 1994). In other words, a person who seeks counselors considers him/herself less socially acceptable (Corrigan, 2004). Stigma associated with receiving treatment is identified as a major barrier to seeking counseling services (Stefl & Prosperi, 1985). In addition, some studies have found that people who had sought counseling assistance were negatively labeled as awkward, cold, defensive, dependent, insecure, sad, unsociable, disturbed, crazy, and weak, for example (Sibicky & Dovidio, 1986). Therefore, imagining that people hesitate to seek counseling services is easy because they consider themselves to be less socially acceptable. Thus, the second hypothesis, H2, is as follows: The more stigma people perceive, the more negative attitudes toward counseling (a) students in Iran and (b) students in China have.

Anticipated risk. Anticipated risk refers to an individual's perception of the potential dangers of participating in counseling (Vogel & Wester, 2003). Fisher, Goff, Nadler, and Chinsky (1988) stated the potential danger of *opening up* to others could be worse than their actual problem. For example, some traditional people tend to avoid counseling because of a culture where seeking help is considered inappropriate (Brooks, 1998). Keith-Lucas (1994) suggested that anticipated risk is likely to be particularly salient for those considering counseling related to divulging distressing or emotional information; people feel vulnerable in front of an expert and consider the potential risk of being hurt further if they feel "*misunderstood, …, judged, or even ignored when they self-disclose*" (Harris, Dersch, & Mital, 1999, p. 407). Counseling is a type of interpersonal relationship (Teyber, 2005) that can influence one's evaluation of the prospect of seeking help (Vogel & Wei, 2005). Lin's (2002, p.207) study suggested people often avoid counseling because of the "*shame and embarrassment of sharing problems with relative strangers.*" Therefore, this leads them to view counseling as a risky endeavor and thus to think less about how counseling benefits them. Thus, the third hypothesis, H3, is as follows: The more people *anticipate risk*, the more negative attitudes toward counseling (a) students in Iran and (b) students in China have.

Self-disclosure. Self-disclosure *occurs "when A knowingly communicates to B information about A which is not generally known and is not otherwise available to B*" (Worthy, Gary, & Kahn, 1969, p. 59). Jourard (1964) first described how the ability to self-disclose to others was central to people's decision to seek help because, during the process of being helped, people had to choose to reveal to others their private feelings, thoughts and attitudes. Self-disclosure is believed to lead to health benefits because of the reduction in distress engendered by confronting a previously concealed stressor (Pennebaker, 1997). Although further studies have reported that personal comfort in self-disclosing to counselors is associated with the intention to seek assistance (Vogel & Wester, 2003; Vogel et al., 2007), Morton (1978) found that people disclose more to friends than strangers.

Moreover, Komiya, Good, and Sherrod (2000) concluded that Asian peoples' apprehensions about experiencing and disclosing negative emotions are the greatest barriers to seeking counseling. Diala et al. (2000) also reported that people who are uncomfortable talking about personal issues with professionals in mental health care are five times less likely to seek assistance. Quite critically, people in collectivistic societies disclose to their family and friends, whom they perceive as trustworthy, but choose to not disclose to counselors (McCarthy, 2005). Therefore, people who are comfortable in disclosing their distress to family and friends are less likely to seek counseling. Thus, the fourth hypothesis, H4, is: The more people are willing to disclose their problems to family and friends, the more negative attitudes toward counseling (a) students in Iran and (b) students in China have.

Treatment fear. Treatment fear is defined as "*a subjective state of apprehension arising from aversive expectations surrounding the seeking and consuming of mental health services*" (Kushner & Sher, 1989, p. 251). These fears are categorized into three aspects: (1) how the professionals in mental health care would treat the people who seek help, (2) what the professionals in mental health care would think of the people who seek help, and (3) whether the people who seek help would be coerced by the professionals in mental health care. Kushner and Sher (1989) also claimed that fearful responses to actual or even imagined aspects of seeking counseling services might increase one's reluctance to seek assistance. Pipes, Schwarz, and Crouch (1985) found that individuals who did not use counseling facilities have more fears of seeking counseling services. Furthermore, Deane and Todd (1996) also found that treatment fears negatively predict college students' intentions to seek professional assistance. In Chang's (2008) study on Chinese respondents, the unfamiliarity with the counseling process is a major barrier to seeking counseling services. Moreover, Kushner and Sher (1989) found that people who need but have not sought counseling assistance have the highest level of treatment fears, suggesting that these might inhibit their intention to seek counseling services even if they admit that benefits exist. This seems to reflect an idea that people might perceive the act of seeking counseling services detrimentally. Therefore, the thought of seeking counseling services with this negative perception might be perceived as worse than the problem. Thus, the fifth hypothesis, H5, is as follows: The more people perceive *treatment fears*, the more negative attitudes toward counseling (a) students in Iran and (b) students in China have.

Fear of Emotions. Komiya, Good, and Sherrod (2000) defined this as a fear generated by strong emotions when discussing one's experiences, which might lead the individual to avoid seeking counseling services. Greenson (1987) asserted that a resistance to seeking assistance forms from one's fear of experiencing further hurtful consequences. Moreover, Kelly (1988) found a number of psychotherapy clients to keep secrets from their therapists because telling one's secrets to others induces strong emotions that, being afraid to express them, the individual therefore avoids expressing in session. This is especially true in Asian cultures, where emotional control is highly valued and expression of emotions is perceived as an unfavorable personality trait (Narikiyo & Kameoka, 1992). Moreover, Vogel and Wester (2003) found that the expectation of having to express emotions to counselors reduces one's positive attitudes toward counseling. Thus, the sixth hypothesis, H6, is: The more one perceives the *fear of having to expose emotions*, the more negative attitudes toward counseling (a) students in Iran and (b) students in China have.

Aside from the avoidance factors suggested by Vogel, Wester, and Larson (2007), this study also has applied the personality theory, a personality guide on how individuals understand, interpret, and react to the world around them (McCrae &

John, 1992). The Big Five is one of the favorite personality models and includes openness, conscientiousness, extraversion, agreeableness, and neuroticism (McCrae & Costa, 2008; McCrae & John, 1992). This study targets mainly college students, as they have more opportunities than the general population to learn the real concepts of counseling and mental health services. Therefore, the personality variable of openness has been suggested for determining the relationship of attitudes toward counseling; in other words, people who are willing to experience new things are more likely to have a positive assessment of counseling and similar services. Another reason for choosing openness is that it is a variable related to positive psychology, which focuses on personal strengths and functioning (Seligman & Csikszentmihalyi, 2000).

Openness. This includes traits like being insightful, imaginative, and possessing a wide variety of interests (Goldberg, 1993; McCrae & John, 1992). People who like to learn new things and enjoy new experiences usually score high in openness. Seeking counseling is relatively new to people in collectivistic cultures; Chinese and Iranian people who seek help from professionals lead their family and themselves to lose face and perhaps be in conflict with religious rituals. Therefore, those with high openness levels are more likely to seek counseling. Thus, the seventh hypothesis, H7, is: The more one has openness to experiences, the more positive attitudes toward counseling (a) students in Iran and (b) students in China have.

Method

Respondents

Three hundred college students (150 Iranian and 150 Chinese) participated in this study as the respondents. Of the 150 Iranian respondents (69 females and 81 males), the average age is 24.54 ranging from 20-25 years old ($SD = 3.90$). All are Muslims. Of the 150 Chinese respondents (74 females and 76 males), the average age is 25.19, ranging from 20-26 years old ($SD = 4.42$). For religion, 140 (90%) are atheist and the rest are Buddhist.

Measures

Data have been obtained using a questionnaire combining measures from existing scales with established validities and reliabilities; content validity suggests that they were developed according to the corresponding theories (Sekaran & Bougie, 1992). As all scales were originally developed in English and the study takes place in Iran and China where Persian and Chinese are the respective mother tongues, the scales were first translated by a group of bilingual experts proficient in either both English and Chinese or both English and Persian. Then another group of bilingual experts translated the respective Chinese and Persian versions back to English for comparing

the similarity. For the main variables, unless otherwise noted, respondents have been asked about the extent to which they agree that the statements describe them. All items use a five-point Likert-type scale ranging from 1 (strongly disagree) to 5 (strongly agree). All the reliabilities of the study's variables are shown in Table 1.

Attitudes toward seeking counseling. This construct was measured by a 10-item scale on attitudes toward seeking professional help for psychological problems (Fischer & Farina, 1995). For the items, the word *professional help* was replaced with *counseling for mental health issues*. The original alpha of this scale is .85 (Fischer & Farina, 1995). Respondents' having higher scores in this measure suggests that they have more positive attitudes toward seeking counseling.

Stigma. This variable is measured by the Self-Stigma of Seeking Help Scale, a 10-item scale whose original alpha value is .72 (Vogel, Wade, & Haake, 2006). Respondents' having higher scores in this measure suggests that they have higher stigma levels for seeking help.

Anticipated risk. This construct is assessed through Vogel and Wester's (2003) Disclosure Expectation Scale (DES), which consists of two subscales: anticipated risk and anticipated utility. Each subscale is comprised of four items; the four from anticipated utility are the reserved items. The original alpha of this scale was reported to range from .74 to .83. Respondents' having higher scores in this measure suggests that they perceive higher levels of anticipated risk for disclosure.

Self-disclosure. This variable is assessed using the 12-item Distress Disclosure Inventory (DDI) developed by Kahn and Hessling (2001). The original alpha of this scale is .80. Respondents' having higher scores in this measure suggests that they are more willing to disclose.

Treatment fear. This variable is measured using a 9-item scale, the Thoughts About Psychotherapy Survey (TAPS) by Kushner and Sher (1989) and adapted from Pipes, Schwarz, and Crouch's (1985) Thoughts About Counseling Scale. Items from TAPS's two subscales, therapist responsiveness and coercion concern, have been combined in the present study. The original alpha of this scale was reported to range from .87 to .92 (Kushner & Sher, 1989). Respondents' having high scores in this measure suggests that they perceive higher levels of treatment fear.

Fear of emotions. This variable is measured using the 5-item anxiety subscale from the Affective Control Scale (Williams, Chambless, & Ahrens, 1997), whose original alpha is .94. Respondents' having higher scores on this measure suggests that they perceive higher levels of fear of emotions.

Openness. This variable is measured using the 5-item Openness to Experience Scale (Golberg, 1999), the original alpha for this scale is .86. Respondents' having higher scores in this measure suggests that they are more willing to try new things.

Procedure

As the target group of this study is university students in Iran and China, the data have been obtained in districts near universities in Tehran, Iran, and Macau, China. In addition, this study has not been conducted inside university campuses where the respondents study to avoid any pressure from peers or teachers. The systematic sampling method has been used where every fifth person passing by was approached to be a respondent when they were on lunch break or after school, as this helps ensure the respondents have more spare time to fill in the questionnaire and, by not taking place within the universities, to eliminate the sense of being monitored by their peers. In Iran, those who agreed to participate were handed the questionnaire; of the 221 people asked, 150 completed questionnaires have been collected with a response rate of 67.9%. In China, 196 agreed to participate with 150 completed questionnaires being collected with a response rate of 76.5%.

Compliance with Ethical Standards

In accord with international guidelines for the ethical treatment of research participants, the guidelines from the American Psychological Association have been followed. The respondents were approached individually and asked if they were university students, then they were asked for their informed consent and willingness to fill in a questionnaire by telling them the purpose of the study. No conflict of interest has been found for this study.

Results

Test for Multicollinearity

This was assessed using a tolerance test $(1 \quad R^2)$ for each independent variable. According to Hair et al. (1998, pp. 191–193), a tolerance value of less than 0.10 is problematic. This test uses all the independent variables (for the planned regressions), and each one is regressed over all the other independent variables (excluding demographics because they are naturally correlated). The tolerance values for the independent variables range from .28 to .70, all above the .10 cut-off indicating multicollinearity is not a concern.

Test for Common Method Bias

Common method bias is a statistical phenomenon in which statistical relationships may be based on the measurement method but not on the measure of the construct. This has been assessed by factor analyzing all the variables in this study together and using the maximum-likelihood approach with a forced, one-factor solution (see Harman, 1960). A ratio of the resultant χ^2 value over the degrees of freedom less than 2.00:1 indicates common-method bias (i.e., a single factor). For this study, the ratio was 32.62:1, suggesting that common-method bias is not a concern.

Attitudes toward Counseling between Iranian and Chinese Students

Both students in Iran and China have positive attitudes toward counseling ($M = 4.51$, $SD = .26$ for the Chinese; $M = 4.26$, $SD = .39$ for the Iranian). As mentioned in the method section, all scales measure between one and five with 3 being the midpoint for scoring. Thus, a score greater than three suggests that the respondent has positive attitudes toward counseling. In addition, an independent samples t-test was run on the overall difference between the two means for attitudes toward counseling for mental health issues. Chinese students hold more positive attitudes toward counseling than Iranian students ($t_{(298)} = 6.677$ $p < .05$), which supports H1.

Correlations Analyses

Means, standard deviations, and correlations have been computed for the variables to assess their hypothesized relationships with attitudes toward counseling. For Iranians, attitudes toward counseling is found to have significant positive and negative correlations to stigma, anticipated risk, treatment fear, and openness; this support H2a, H3a, H4a**,** H5a, and H7a**.** However, no significant relationship has been found for fear of emotions, which does not support H6a. For the Chinese, their attitudes toward counseling have been found to have significant positive and negative correlations to all independent variables; this supports H2b,

Table 1
Inter-correlations between Muslim and Atheist Attitudes toward Counseling and Other Independent Variables in Iran and China.

	Muslim in Iran			**Atheist in China**			**Alpha**
	Mean	*SD*	*Pearson Correlation*	*Mean*	*SD*	*Pearson Correlation*	
1.Attitudes toward counseling	4.26	0.39		4.51	0.26		.77
2.Stigma	1.69	0.39	-.76****	1.56	0.44	-.65 ****	.84
3.Anticipated risk	1.70	0.57	-.74****	1.51	0.57	-.57 ****	.90
4.Self disclosure	3.25	1.35	-.21 *	3.54	1.34	-.43 ****	.98
5.Treatment fear	1.59	0.28	-.60****	1.49	0.51	-.57 ****	.82
6. Fear of Emotions	3.50	1.10	-.12	3.62	1.04	-.24 ***	.90
7.Openness	3.79	0.72	.19 *	3.93	0.84	.43 ****	.90

Note. All variables are scored from 1 to 5. * = p < .05, ** = p < .01, *** = p < .005, **** = p < .001.

H3b, H4b, H5b, H6b and H7b. The details on these results with their relationship strengths are shown in Table 1.

Regression Analysis

To test the strengths of the relationships among the variables, two multiple stepwise regressions were conducted for Iranian and Chinese attitudes toward counseling.

For Iranian attitudes toward counseling, two variables have been proven to be good predictors. Each predictor has the power to estimate attitudes toward counseling; the impact and effect size (f^2; see Cohen, 1992) of each predictor variable has been measured, and the strongest significant negative predictor is anticipated risk ($\Delta R^2 = .55$ with a large $f^2 = 1.22$, $p < .001$). The second strongest significant negative predictor is stigma ($\Delta R^2 = .08$, a small $f^2 = 0.09$, $p < .001$). These variables were combined to form a powerful predictor ($R^2 = .63$, $F = 125.12$, $p < .001$). These results are shown in Table 2.

For Chinese attitudes toward counseling, five variables have been found to be predictors. The strongest significant predictor (negative) is stigma ($\Delta R^2 = .42$, a large $f^2 = 0.72$, $p < .001$). The second strongest significant predictor (positive) is openness ($\Delta R^2 = .05$, a small $f^2 = 0.05$, $p < .001$). The third strongest significant predictor (negative) is treatment fear ($\Delta R^2 = .02$, a small $f^2 = 0.02$, $p < .05$). The fourth strongest significant predictor (negative) is self-disclosure ($\Delta R^2 = .02$, a small $f^2 = 0.02$, $p < .05$). The fifth strongest significant predictor (negative) is fear of emotions ($\Delta R^2 = .02$, a small $f^2 = 0.02$, $p < .05$).These variables form a powerful overall predictor ($R^2 = .53$ $F = 32.36$, $p < .001$). These results are shown in Table 2.

Table 2

Stepwise Regressions Using the Antecedent Variables as Predictors for Iranian and Chinese Attitudes toward Counseling.

Criteria/Variables	Iranian Attitudes toward Counseling			Chinese Attitudes toward Counseling		
	Beta	t-value	ΔR^2	Beta	t-value	ΔR^2
Stigma	-.291	-5.65****	.09	.092	-3.34****	.42
Anticipated risk	-.422	-5.60****	.55	-.095	-0.79	
Self disclosure	-.001	-0.01		-.067	-3.33*	.02
Treatment fear	-.067	-1.30		-.122	-2.74*	.02
Fear of Emotions	-.130	-1.94		-.064	-2.52*	.02
Openness	.039	0.76		.070	3.23****	.05
Total R^2			.63			.53
Final F			125.12****			32.36****
(*df*)			(2,147)			(5,144)

Note. * = p < .05, ** = p < .01, *** = p < .005, **** = p < .001

Discussion

Iranian and Chinese Students' Attitudes toward Counseling

A statistically significant difference has been found regarding students' attitudes toward counseling between people in Iran and in China. The participants from China score significantly higher in attitudes toward counseling compared to those from Iran. Religion could be one of the possible explanations for this variation; in this study, all participants from Iran have religious beliefs while 90% of the participants from China are atheist. Religious individuals prefer talking to their friends and family before making the step to seek counseling (Wamser, Vandenberg & Hibberd, 2011), even if they want to undertake counseling services, they prefer counselors with the same belief system because they feel there would be greater improvement when working with a therapist who understands and supports their values (Morrow, Worthington, & McCullough, 1993).

Factors Affecting Iranian and Chinese Students' Attitudes toward Counseling

This study provides some insights into the attitudes toward counseling of two Asian societies (Iran and China). Namely, different patterns of predictors have been found between the Iranian and Chinese students' attitudes toward counseling. For Iranians, how they interpret the risk they may receive for seeking counseling is the key issue influencing unfavorable evaluations on counseling among Iranian students. When individuals weigh the risks from disclosing one's problem to a counselor and the possible further problems associated with it, they would rather keep their problems to themself. Unlike talking to family members, Muslim clerics, or even Muslims' God, individuals did not feel they would face any negative consequences due to the rules and rituals of religion. Moreover, in collective culture, the uncertain consequences of decision-making (e.g., seeking counseling for mental health issues) not only affects the individual but also generates an impact on family members and close friends (Pearson, 1993); this further increases negative evaluations on counseling.

For the Chinese, stigma is the strongest predictor of attitudes toward counseling, suggesting that individuals' worrying about being labeled negatively for seeking counseling may be a reflection of their weakness and uselessness; this is a major concern among Chinese living with traditional Chinese values. One of these critical values is *face*, referred to as social reputation, respectability, or the way one is regarded in society (see Ho, 1976). Also in Chinese practice, people would prefer to enhance and save face rather than lose face (see Bond & Hwang, 1986). Therefore, seeking help from a counselor may be considered an act of losing face (i.e., a public embarrassment, a portrayal of weakness). Moreover, Bond and Hwang (1986) suggested that the Chinese not only want to enhance, save, and not lose one's own face but also want to enhance, save, and not lose others' faces. The Chinese proverb "family scandal should

not be made public," means family problems and weaknesses should be dealt with in the family, remaining private to avoid losing family face (Pearson, 1993).

Interestingly, the personality variable of openness has been found to predict positive attitudes toward counseling among the Chinese, suggesting that people who are open to experience new things and ideas are more likely to seek counseling service, even if they live in a collectivist society where social harmony is a cultural value of utmost importance (Yang, 1995). In other words, they tend to seek counseling without being encouraged by their culture. Also, for the point of view on religion, atheists do not have the boundary of religious rituals, which lead to conflicts in their thinking and behaviors.

Implications

The various predictors for Iranian and Chinese attitudes toward counseling have revealed the need for different approaches in these two Asian societies. For Iranians, educating people on the benefits of seeking counseling services is needed. Subjects related to mental health and care can be added to secondary-school education programs. Namely, some education relevant to the main symptoms of different mental health issues would be necessary, but not explaining all the different illnesses along with the criteria of the DSM-IV. The purpose of this would be to increase awareness of different mental health issues based on accurate information rather than on information from misleading sources (e.g., information from peers or the Internet). This would reduce misunderstandings between mental illnesses and common illnesses. For some severe illnesses, teaching them some of the symptoms of the illnesses (i.e., pathology) would be necessary, but not teaching them how the illnesses formed (i.e. etiology). This would minimize the justification of abnormality due to misunderstandings about unusual symptoms or to generalizing the idea of having mental health problems as being the same as some common illnesses (i.e., if someone catches a cold, they have fever and sore throat, or that someone with depression has moods that might swing from extremely subdued to manic). In addition, because religion is crucial to Iranians (McCarthy, 2005), they prefer to ask for help from religious people rather than psychological professionals (counselors). Thus the best way is to equip religious people with a vanguard of knowledge on mental health and advocate them to share the concept of mental health within their social network, preferably with those having the same religious background. Even if people within the religious network do not look first for psychological professionals, at least they can seek help and be more likely to receive accurate information from the representative group of religious people.

For the Chinese, reducing the stigmatization associated with seeking counseling is a very critical issue; people need to understand more about the processes of

seeking counseling for mental health issues. This could be achieved using seminars and activities (e.g., counseling or mental health day), which could be held in the community in order to let them have a full picture about such matters of mental health (both the negative and positive sides). This would help eliminate distorted beliefs about mental health. Furthermore, mental health departments and those organizations that provide counseling services could cooperate together by informing citizens about the nature of counseling service for mental health issues. For example, a television program could be made talking about the procedures involved in offering assistance and the ability of recovered patients (from mild to severe disturbance) to rejoin the community. Narrowing down the distance between the world of normality (general population) and the world of divergence (minor population-patients) might also help.

Moreover, Lee (2004) has suggested offering counseling training or courses (validated by the government) to general medical doctors. Family doctors have been found to be the first source for people with mental health concerns for seeking assistance. Thus, strengthening family doctors' counseling techniques would allow them to evaluate patients' situations and provide them with assistance. For more serious issues, family doctors could act as a bridge between patients and specialized professionals to ensure that patients receive adequate assistance effectively in addition to preventative care (i.e., recognizing that patients have the potential to develop mental health problems and become victims due to the labeling effect).

References

Andrews, G., Hall, W., Teesson, M., & Henderson, S. (1999). *National Survey of Mental Health and Wellbeing Report 2: the Mental Health of Australians*. Common wealth of Australia.

Bergin, A.E., & Garfield, S.L. (1994). *Handbook of Psychotherapy and Behavior Change* (4th ed.). Canada: Wiley.

Boldero, J., & Fallon, B. (1995). Adolescent help-seeking: what do they get help for and from whom? *Journal of Adolescence*, *18*(2), 193- 209. http://dx.doi.org/10.1006/jado.1995.1013

Bond, M.H., & Hwang, K.K. (1986). The social psychology of Chinese people. In: Bond, M.H. (Ed.), *The Psychology of the Chinese People*, pp. 213–266. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Bowman, B., & Payne, J. (2011). A profile of students receiving counseling services at a university in post-apartheid South Africa. *Journal of Child and Adolescent Mental Health, 23*(2), 143-153. doi: 10.2989/17280583.2011.634544

Brooks, G. R. (1998). *A new psychotherapy for traditional men*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Carlton, P.A., & Deane, F.P. (2000). Impact of attitudes and suicidal ideation on adolescents' intentions to seek professional psychological help. *Journal of Adolescence*, *23*(1), 35-45. doi: 10.1006/jado.1999.0299

Chang, H. (2008). Help-seeking for stressful events among Chinese college students in Taiwan: Roles of gender, prior history of counseling, and help-seeking attitudes. *Journal of College Student Development*, *49*(1), 41-51. doi: 10.1353/csd.2008.0003

Cohen, J. (1992). A power primer. *Psychological bulletin*, *112*(1), 155-159.

Cooper, A. E., Corrigan, P. W., & Watson, A. C. (2003). Mental illness stigma and care seeking. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disease, 191*(5)*,*339–341. Retrieved from http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/12819554

Corrigan, P. (2004). How stigma interferes with mental health care. *American psychologist*, *59*(7), 614. doi: 10.1037/0003-066X.59.7.614

Deane, F. P., & Chamberlain, K. (1994). Treatment fearfulness and distress as predictors of professional psychological help-seeking. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling*, *22*(2), 207-217. doi:10.1080/03069889400760211

Deane, F. P., & Todd, D. M. (1996). Attitudes and perceived likelihood of seeking professional help for personal problems or suicidal thinking. *Journal of College Student Psychotherapy, 10*(3)*,* 45-59. http://dx.doi.org/10.1300/J035v10n04_06.

Diala, C., Muntaner, C., Walrath, C., Nickerson, K.J., LaVeist, T.A., & Leaf, P.J. (2000). Racial differences in attitudes toward professional mental health care and in the use of services. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, *70*(4), 455-464. doi: 0.1037/h0087736

Eisenberg, D., Golberstein, E., & Gollust, S. E. (2007). Help-seeking and access to mental health care in a university student population. Medical care, *45*(7), 594-601. doi:10.1097/MLR.0B013e31803bb4c1

Erikson, E.H. (1995). *A Way of Looking at Things: Selected Papers, 1930-1980.* W.W. Norton & Company.

Fischer, E. H., & Farina, A. (1995). Attitudes toward seeking professional psychological help: A shortened form and considerations for research. *Journal of College Student Development, 36*(4), 368-373.

Fisher, J. S., Goff, B. A., Nadler, A., & Chinsky, J. M. (1988). *Social psychological influences on help seeking and support from peers. In B. H. Gottlieb (Ed.), Marshaling social support: Formats, processes, and effects (pp. 267–304).* Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Flisher, A. J., De Beer, J. P., & Bokhorst, F. (2002). Characteristics of students receiving counselling service at the University of Cape Town, South Africa. *British Journal of Guidance and Counselling, 30*(3), 299-310. doi: 10.1080/030698802100002000

Goldberg, L. R. (1993). The structure of phenotypic personality traits. *American Psychologist*, *48*(1), 26-34. doi:10.1037/0003-066X.48.1.26

Goldberg, L. R. (1999). A broad-bandwidth, public domain, personality inventory measuring the lower-level facets of several Wve-factor models. In I Mervielde, I. Deary, F. De Fruyt, & F. Ostendorf (Eds.), *Personality psychology in Europe* (Vol. 7, pp. 7–28). Tilburg, The Netherlands: Tilburg University Press

Greenson, R. R. (1987). *The technique and practice of psychoanalysis.* Madison, Wl: International University Press.

Hair, J.F., Anderson, R.E., Tatham, R.L. and Black, W.C. (1998), *Multivariate Data Analysis*, fifth ed. Prentice Hall, Upper Saddle River, NJ.

Hassan, H. D. (2008). *Iran: Ethnic and religious minorities*. Retrieved from https://fas.org/sgp/crs/mideast/RL34021.pdf

Harman, H. H. (1960), *Modern Factor Analysis.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press

Harris, S. M., Dersch, C. A., & Mital, M. (1999). Look who's talking: Measuring self-disclosure in MFT. *Contemporary Family Therapy: An International Journal*, *21* (3), 405–415. doi: 10.1023/A:1021968517320

Hinderaker, D.J. (2003). *College Student Mental Health and Use of Counseling Center Services*. Master of Social Work Clinical Research Papers. Paper 190. http://sophia.stkate.edu/msw_papers/190

Ho, D.Y.H. (1976). On the concept of face. *American Journal of Sociology*, *81*(4), 867–884. doi: 10.1086/226145

Jourard, S.M. (1964). *The transpersonal self*. New York: Van Nostrand.

Lee, W.K. (2004). *The Hong Kong citizens' attitudes and behaviors about seeking help for the emotional problems*. Research fund by Hong Kong Primary Care Foundation (HKPCF) and presented in Hong Kong

Li, J., Wang, L., & Fischer, K. (2004). The organization of Chinese shame concepts. *Cognition & Emotion*, *18*(6), 767-797. doi:10.1080/02699930341000202

Lin, Y. (2002). Taiwanese university students' conceptions of counseling. *Journal of Contemporary Psychotherapy, 31*(3)*,* 199–211. doi: 10.1023/A:1013968105377

Kahn, J.H., & Hessling, R.M. (2001). Measuring the tendency to conceal versus disclose psychological distress. *Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology*, *20*(1), 41-65. doi: 10.1521/jscp.20.1.41.22254

Keith-Lucas, A. (1994). *Giving and taking help* (2nd ed.). St. Davids, PA: North American Association of Christian Social Workers

Kelly, A.E. (1998). Clients' secret keeping in outpatient therapy. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 45*(1)*,* 50-57. doi: 10.1037/0022-0167.45.1.50

Kim, B. S. K. (2007). Adherence to Asian and European American Cultural Values and Attitudes Toward Seeking Professional Psychological Help Among Asian American College Students. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 54*(4)*,* 474-480. doi: http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0022-0167.54.4.474

Komiya, N., Good, G. E., & Sherrod, N.B. (2000). Emotional openness as a predictor of college Students' attitudes toward seeking psychological help. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *47*(1), 138-143. doi: 10.1037/0022-0167.47.1.138

Kushner, M.G., & Sher, K.J. (1989). Fear of psychological treatment and its relation to mental health service avoidance. *Professional Psychology: Research and Practice*, *20*(4), 251-257. doi: 10.1037/0735-7028.20.4.251

Masuda, A., Anderson, P. L., Twohig, M. P., Feinstein, A. B., Chou, Y.-Y., Wendell, J. W., & Stormo, A. R. (2009). Help-seeking experiences and attitudes among African American, Asian American, and European American college students. *International Journal for the Advancement of Counseling, 31(3),* 168–180. doi:10.1007/s10447-009-9076-2

Meehan, P.J., Lamb, J.A., Saltzman, L.E., & O'Carroll, P.W. (1992). Attempted suicide among young adults: progress toward a meaningful estimate of prevalence. *American Journal of Psychiatry*, *149*(1), 41-44. doi: 10.1176/ajp.149.1.41

McCarthy, J. (2005). Individualism and Collectivism: What do they have to do with counseling? *Journal of Multicultural Counseling and Development*, *33*(2), 108-117. doi: 10.1002/j.2161-1912.2005.tb00009.x

McCrae, R. R., & Costa, P. R. (2008). The five-factor theory of personality. In O. P. John, R. W. Robins, L. A. Pervin, O. P. John, R. W. Robins, L. A. Pervin (Eds.), *Handbook of personality psychology: Theory and research (3rd ed.)* (pp. 159-181).

McCrae, R. R., & John, O. P. (1992). An introduction to the five-factor model and its applications. *Journal of Personality*, *60*(2), 175-215. doi:10.1111/j.1467- 6494.1992.tb00970.x

Morrow, D., Worthington, E.L., & McCullough, W.E. (1993). Observers' perceptions of a counselor's treatment of a religious issue. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, *71*(4), 452-456. doi: 0.1002/j.1556-6676.1993.tb02664.x

Morton, T. L. (1978). Intimacy and reciprocity of exchange: A comparison of spouses and strangers. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *36*(1), 72-81. doi: 10.1037/0022-3514.36.1.72

Narikiyo, T. A., & Kameoka, V. A. (1992). Attributions of mental illness and judgments about help seeking among Japanese-American students. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 39*(3)*,* 363-369. doi: 10.1037/0022-0167.39.3.363

Pearson,V. (1993). Families in China: An undervalued resource for mental health. *Journal of Family Therapy, 15*(2)*,* 163-185. doi: 10.1111/j.1467 – 6427.1993.00752.x

Pennebaker, J.W. (1997). *Opening up: The healing power of expressing emotions*. New York: Guilford.

Pew Research Center, (2016). *Buddhists*, Retrieved from http://www.pewforum.org/2012/12/18/global-religious-landscape-buddhist/

Pipes, R.B., Schwarz, R., & Crouch, P. (1985). Measuring clients fears. *Journal of Counseling and Clinical Psychology*, *53*(6), 933-934. doi: 10.1037//0022-006X.53.6.933

Robbins, S., & Judge, T.A. (2014). *Organizational Behavior* (16ed.), Pearson

Santrock, J. (2015). *Life-Span Development (15ed.)*, McGraw Hill.

Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (1992). Research Methods for Business: A Skill Building Approach, John Willey and sons Inc. *New York*.

Seligman, M. E. P., & Csikszentmihalyi, M. (2000). Positive psychology: An introduction. *American Psychologist, 55(1),* 5-14. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0003-066X.55.1.5

Sennet, J., Finchilescu, G., Gibson, K., & Strauss, R. (2003). Adjustment of black students at a historically white South African university. *Educational Psychology, 23*(1), 107-116. doi: 10.1080/0144341022000022988

Sibicky, M., & Dovidio, J. F. (1986). Stigma of psychological therapy: Stereotypes, interpersonal reactions, and the self-fulfilling prophecy. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *33*(2), 148. doi: 10.1037/0022-0167.33.2.148

Stefl, M. E., & Prosperi, D. C. (1985). Barriers to mental health service utilization. *Community Mental Health Journal, 21*(3)*,* 167-177. doi: 10.1007/BF00754732

Tavakoli, M. (2013). Content and Style of Advice in Iran and Canada/Le Contenu et la style de conseil en Iran et Canada. *Canadian Journal of Counselling and Psychotherapy*, *47*(2), 299-311. Retrieved from http://cjcrcc.ucalgary.ca/cjc/index.php/rcc/article/viewFile/2513/2482

Teyber, E. M. (2005). *Interpersonal process in psychotherapy: An integrative model (5th ed.)*. Belmont, CA: Brooks/Cole.

Wamser, R., Vandenberg, B., & Hibberd, R. (2011). Religious fundamentalism, religious coping, and preference for psychological and religious treatment. *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, *21*(3), 228-236. doi: 10.1080/10508619.2011.581582

Washington Post (2013). *A surprising map of where the world's atheists live*. Retrieved from https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2013/05/23/a-surprising-map-of-where-the-worlds-atheists-live/?utm_term=.ec2ecb4ec44f

Worthy, M., Gary, A.L., & Kahn, G.M. (1969). Self-disclosure as an exchange process. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *13*(1), 59-63. doi: 10.1037/h0027990

Vogel, D. L., Wade, N. G., & Haake, S. (2006). Measuring the self-stigma associated with seeking psychological help. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, *53*(3), 325-337. doi:10.1037/0022-0167.53.3.325

Vogel, D. L., & Wei, M. (2005). Adult attachment and help-seeking intent: The mediating roles of perceived social support and psychological distress. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 52*(3), 347–357. doi: : 10.1037/0022-0167.52.3.347

Vogel, D. L., & Wester, S. R. (2003). To seek help or not to seek help: The risk of self-disclosure. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 50*(3), 351-361. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0022-0167.50.3.351

Vogel, D. L., Wester, S. R., & Larson, L. M. (2007). Avoidance of counseling: Psychological factors that inhibit seeking help. *Journal of Counseling & Development, 85*(4), 410-422. doi: 10.1002/j.1556-6678.2007.tb00609.x

Williams, K. E., Chambless, D. L., & Ahrens, A. H. (1997). Are emotions frightening? An extension of the fear of fear concept. *Behaviour Research and Therapy*, *35*(3), 239–248. doi:10.1016/S0005-7967(96)00098-8

Yang, K.S. (1995). Chinese social orientation: an integrative analysis. In: Lin, T.Y., Tseng, W.S., Yeh, E.K. (Eds.), *Chinese Societies and Mental Health*, pp. 19–39. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.

Yang, L. H., Phelan, J. C., & Link, B. G. (2008). Stigma and beliefs of efficacy towards traditional Chinese medicine and Western psychiatric treatment among Chinese-Americans. *Cultural Diversity & Ethnic Minority Psychology, 14*(1)*, 10–18. doi: 10.1037/1099-9809.14.1.10.

Young, C. (2009). The CORE-OM intake norms of students attending a South African university counselling service: A comparison with UK counseling service data. *British Journal of Guidance & Counselling, 37*(4), 473-483. doi: 10.1080/03069880903161377

Erratum: Correcting the Name of the Spiritual Well-Being Scale as the Three-Factor Spiritual Well-Being Scale

Selami Kardaş[1]
Muş Alparslan University

Because Paloutzian and Ellison (1982) had already developed a scale named the *Spiritual Well-Being Scale*, it is necessary to change the name of the scale independently developed by Ekşi and Kardaş (2017) to the *Three-Factor Spiritual Well-Being Scale*. This change helps scholars avoid any conceptual vagueness or confusion between these two measures, and helps researchers to better identify, understand, and use the specific scale most appropriate for assessing the exact concept they wish to study.

Erratum: Spiritüel İyi Oluş Ölçeği'nin Adının Üç-Faktörlü Spiritüel İyi Oluş Ölçeği Olarak Düzeltilmesi Hakkında

Paloutzian ve Ellison (1982) tarafından hâlihazırda Spiritüel İyi Oluş Ölçeği adı verilen bir ölçek geliştirildiğinden, Ekşi ve Kardaş (2017) tarafından bağımsız olarak geliştirilen ölçeğin adının *"Üç-Faktörlü Spiritüel İyi Oluş Ölçeği"* olarak değiştirme gerekliliği ortaya çıkmıştır. Bu değişikliğin, araştırmacıların bu iki ölçek arasındaki herhangi bir kavramsal belirsizlik veya karışıklık yaşamalarını önlemeye; ve çalışmak istedikleri kavramı değerlendirmek için en uygun spesifik ölçeği daha iyi tanımlamalarına, anlamalarına ve kullanmalarına yardımcı olacağı düşünülmektedir.

References/Kaynakça

Ekşi, H., & Kardaş, S. (2017). Spiritual well-being: Scale development and validation. *Spiritual Psychology and Counseling, 2,* 73-88. http://dx.doi.org/10.12738/spc.2017.1.0022

Paloutzian, R. F., & Ellison, C. W. (1982). Loneliness, spiritual well-being and the quality of life. In Peplau, L. A. & Perlman, D. (Eds), *Loneliness: a sourcebook of current theory, research and therapy,* (pp. 224-237). New York: Wiley-Interscience.

1 **Corresponding author of the concerned Article./İlgili makalenin sorumlu yazarı.** Department of Educational Sciences, Guidance and Psycholological Counseling, Muş Alparslan University, Muş Turkey. Email: selamikardas@gmail.com