MASCULINITIES

a journal of culture and society

Issue 14

Autumn 2020

EDITORIAL BOARD

Advisory Board

Adam Walton	*(UCL Institute of Education)*
Aksu Bora	*(Hacettepe University)*
Alev Özkazanç	*(Professor Emerita)*
Alp Biricik	*(Independent Researcher)*
Arda Arıkan	*(Akdeniz University)*
Aslıhan Doğan Topcu	*(Mersin University)*
Arsev Ayşen Arslanoğlu	*(Artvin Çoruh University)*
Ayse Erbora	*(Okan University)*
Ayse L. Kirtunc	*(Professor Emerita)*
Banu Açıkgöz	*(Bülent Ecevit University)*
Berrin Koyuncu Lorasdağı	*(Hacettepe University)*
Burcu Alkan	*(Bahçeşehir University)*
Chris Haywood	*(Newcastle University)*
Cirus Rinaldi	*(University of Palermo)*
Cüneyt Çakırlar	*(Nottingham Trent University- Bilgi University)*
Çağla Ünlütürk Ulutaş	*(Pamukkale Üniversitesi)*
Daphna Hacker	*(Tel Aviv University)*
Dilek Cindoğlu	*(Abdullah Gül University)*
Ebru Kılıç Bebek	*(Özyegin University)*
Eda Acara	*(Queens University)*
Emel BastürkAkca	*(Kocaeli University)*
Esma Durugönül	*(Akdeniz University)*
Fatma Umut Beşpınar	*(METU*)
Feryal Cubukcu	*(Dokuz Eylul University)*
Figen Uzar Özdemir	*(Bülent Ecevit University)*
Funda Şenol Cantek	*(Independent Researcher)*
Gamze Toksoy	*(Mimar Sinan Univerty)*

Güncel Önkal   *(Maltepe Univerty)*

Hande Eslen-Ziya   *(Glasgow Caledonian University)*

Hilal Onur-Ince   *(Hacettepe Univerty*)

Jonathan Allan   *(Brandon University)*

Jeff Hearn   *(University of Hanken)*

Joseph Vandello   *(University of South Florida)*

Maria Rashid   *(SOAS)*

Melek Goregenli   *(Independent Researcher)*

Mine Özyurt Kılıç   *(Ankara Sosyal Bilimler University)*

Murat Göç   *(Celal Bayar University)*

Murat İri   *(Istanbul University)*

Nejat Ulusay   *(Ankara University)*

Nevzat Kaya   *(Dokuz Eylül University)*

Nil Mutluer   *(Humboldt University zu Berlin)*

Nilgün Toker   *(Independent Researcher)*

Orkun Kocabıyık   *(Akdeniz University)*

Papatya Genca-Alkan   *(Celal Bayar University)*

Raewyn Connell   *(University of Sydney)*

Sandra Slater   *(College of Charleston)*

Selcuk Candansayar   *(Gazi University)*

Selim Sırı Kuru   *(University of Washington)*

Serpil Sancar   *(Ankara University)*

Simten Coşar   *(Hacettepe University)*

Şahinde Yavuz   *(Karadeniz Technical University)*

Seref Uluocak   *(Onsekiz Mart University)*

Tingting Tan   *(Kyushu University)*

Ulaş Işıklar   *(Beykent University)*

Züleyha Çetiner Öktem   *(Ege University)*

Content

Book Reviews/Kitap İncelemeleri

Introduction

The 14ᵗʰ issue of *Masculinities: A Journal of Culture and Society* is published at the same time as a new wave of MeToo movement in Turkey. Women in literary and publishing circles have been sharing their experiences of sexual harassment and exposing names of men in the same circles who harassed them. As members of the Initiative for Critical Studies of Masculinities (ICSM) and the Editorial Board of *Masculinities* Journal, we would like to start this introduction by stating that we stand by these women who have courageously opened up a space for discussion of gender norms conducing to harassment and gender-based violence.

This discussion has once again highlighted the significance of questioning and struggling against masculinities with their multiple facets (re)producing unequal gender relations. What is particularly striking in this recent wave of MeToo in Turkey is to see a stark lack of reflection on their own masculinities of the exposed men, most of whom advocate a liberal and progressive political stance. Yet, their critical stance does not extend to their own advantageous gender position consolidated with their highly regarded status as authors that they unacceptably abuse.

As ICSM, we stand by all survivors of sexual harassment and violence whether they have openly talked about it or not. We are against all forms of gender-based violence and we will continue to question and help transform masculinities conducing to gender-based violence with a vision for a gender equal society.

*

The 14ᵗʰ issue includes four articles, one research-in-progress paper and two book reviews. This issue opens with two articles in which performance of masculinities intersect with popular culture from

different regions. In their article entitled "The Cowboy Scientist Saves the Planet: Hegemonic Masculinity in Cli-Fi Films", Sam Kendrick and Joane Nagel focus on an emerging genre – climate fiction – to explore the kind of constellation of masculinity in these films. The argue that these films feature a particular kind of heroic masculinity, which they identify as the "Cowboy Scientist", combining both traditional and modern characteristics. In the second article entitled "Men without Shirts: Bollywood, Bodybuilding and Masculinities in Pakistan", Amna Nasir shows the connection between gym culture and Bollywood movies, which are very popular in the city of Gujranwala, by focusing on the male body. Nasir finds out that the particular hegemonic body types and certain behavioral patterns in Bollywood movies are idealized by the bodybuilders in the city and this creates increased interest for men to join the gyms.

The following article of this issue shifts focus to the femininities amongst women in a skateboarding community. Yuliya Kulynych brings this example of alternative femininities in conversation with masculinities and traces the disruption of hegemonic gender relations in her paper entitled "Resistant Formations of Alternative Femininities within Skateboarding — an Exploration of Gender at a Time of Feminist Transformation". Kulynych shows exclusion of women and restriction of their bodies in skateboarding and emphasizes the role of female skateboarders' resistance to the male hegemony in this sport culture.

In this issue, we also have an article in Turkish. Ahmet Duran Arslan's article entitled "Murathan Mungan's Stories Entitled '*Suret Masalı*' and '*Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı*' as an Intersection of Hegemony, Homophobia, and Masculinity" focuses on two works by a most significant author in contemporary Turkish literature. Arslan deals with these stories to explore the narrative strategies Mungan uses to criticize masculinity and analyzes the representations of masculinities narrated by Mungan with two main focuses: hegemony and homophobia.

In the research-in-progress section, Ecem Nazlı Üçok's piece entitled "The Impact of Migration on (Re)negotiating One's Gender

Identity: A Qualitative Study on First Generation of Turkish Migrant Men Living in Sweden" takes the issue of gender as an analytic concept for migration process and discusses the ways in which Turkish migrant men in Sweden create their gender identities in between of Turkishness, Swedishness, and the self.

The last section of the 14th issue includes two book reviews – both in Turkish. Firstly, Burcu Dabak Özdemir critically evaluates Ezgi Sarıtaş's "*Cinsel Normalliğin Kuruluşu: Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Heteronormatiflik ve İstikrarsızlıkları*", which is based on Sarıtaş's PhD thesis entitled "Heteronormativity and Its Instabilities: Sexual Modernity during Late Ottoman and Republican Periods" submitted to the Department of Women's and Gender Studies at Ankara University in 2018. Secondly, Çiçek Nilsu Varlıklar Demirkazık reviews "Radikal Baba" (Rad Dad: Dispatches from the Frontiers of Fatherhood) edited by Tomas Moniz and Jeremy Adam Smith.

Finally, as members of the Editorial Board of *Masculinities* Journal, we would like to thank the authors and the reviewers of this issue for their valuable contributions. We hope you will enjoy this issue and share it widely. We also invite researchers to submit their work for the 15th and 16th issues of Masculinities Journal to be published in 2021. You can visit the journal's website or send us an e-mail for more information.

3

Atilla Barutçu, PhD
Editor of Masculinities Journal

ARTICLES

The Cowboy Scientist Saves the Planet:
Hegemonic Masculinity in Cli-Fi Films

Sam Kendrick[*] and Joane Nagel[**]
University of Kansas

Abstract: This paper argues that climate fiction (cli-fi) films constitute a contemporary stage for the enactment of heroic masculinity. In cli-fi films, the changing climate can be understood as a new frontier in which survival depends on traditional masculine traits of strength and bravery combined with more modern knowledge of science and nature. We identify the "Cowboy Scientist" as a heroic archetype in cli-fi films that embodies both traditional and technical attributes in an updated version of hegemonic masculinity. We examine depictions of heroic masculinity in two high-grossing cli-fi films with wide target audiences in the global film market: the US-made *The Day After Tomorrow* (2004) and the Australian-made *Mad Max: Fury Road* (2015). Through a critical analysis of gender and the environment in these films, we track the Cowboy Scientist as he battles human and environmental enemies, cleverly combines primal intuitions with scientific expertise, and saves the helpless and vulnerable through a series of heroic feats. Scholars have long recognized popular culture as an important area of study because it both reflects and shapes social norms and values. Our goal in this discussion of heroic masculinity in pop culture cli-fi representations is to contribute to ongoing conversations about the relationship between gender and climate change (seen most clearly in *The Day After Tomorrow*) and the resilience of hegemonic masculinity to triumph even in the presence of defiant femininity (as shown in *Mad Max: Fury Road*).
Keywords: Hegemonic masculinity, cli-fi, gender, climate change

---

[*] PhD student in Sociology, e-mail: skendrick@ku.edu ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5682-4426
[**] PhD, Professor of Sociology, e-mail: nagel@ku.edu, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-6452-0297

For [President Theodore] Roosevelt, the major role model for American men in the first twenty years of the [20th] century and beyond, the cowboys and hunters of the West … were the finest exemplars of American manhood. Having constantly to face the dangers of nature and its rigors, these men escaped from the confinements and effeteness that afflicted the Easterner (White, 1993, p. 11).

Introduction: Cowboys, Men, and Nature

Enactments of hegemonic masculinity around the world typically take place against a backdrop of epochal challenge involving a quest to save one's reputation, protect women, children, and weaker men, and/or advance a noble way of life (Bly, 1990; Joseph & Black, 2012, p. 488). Contemporary imaginings of American masculinity share these nearly universal features, but often are framed in narratives of exceptionalism, wilderness, and the frontier. Theodore Roosevelt offered the clearest articulation of men's dependence on nature as a proving ground for the American character as "democratic, masculine, honorable, hardy, innovative, individualistic, risk taking, competitive" (Sturgeon, 2009, p. 56). In Roosevelt's guide to the "strenuous life," modeled after cowboys, hunters, Indian fighters, and trappers in U.S. history, he urged men to strive "for renewed meaning by glorifying the hard work and discipline of the vanished frontier" (White, 1993, p. 11). A man's mettle could only be tested against a wild world. Manliness was best asserted by confronting and conquering human and natural savagery. He viewed American pioneer settlers as "adventurous frontiersmen," and lauded the ranchers, railroaders, and cowboys who spread West as "men who greatly dared and greatly did…[with] a record of endless feats of arms, of victory after victory in the ceaseless strife waged against wild man and wild nature" (Roosevelt, 1903, p. 241).

Roosevelt's celebration of U.S. male vigor was motivated, in part, by his efforts to overcome his own childhood illnesses, and by what he saw as the threats to all American men from increasing urbanization and

wage labor in the early 20th century. He sought to protect the places that allowed for a cowboy existence and thus rescue U.S. national masculinity: "Wilderness areas [were] arenas where men could free themselves of the feminizing and corrupting influences of cities" (Sturgeon, 2009, p. 56). Because the vanishing frontier posed an existential threat not only to the U.S. Western wildlands, but to American manhood, Roosevelt became a pioneer of the first U.S. conservation movements to save both nature and masculine virility. Contemporary American masculinity continues to be rooted in narratives of man against nature. In the 21st century, when environmental concerns exist on a global scale, the cowboy— "a symbol of rugged masculinity"— emerges from American iconography and establishes himself as a central figure in what it means to be a man in the face of a global environmental crisis (Glotfelty, 2004, p. 128; Kimmel, 1996).

Masculinity and Popular Culture

In many narrative traditions, the natural world, sometimes enhanced by the supernatural, is an arena for enacting masculinity (Hultman, 2013; Jackson & Balaji, 2011; Sturgeon, 2009). Dystopian natural landscapes offer especially fertile opportunities for manly displays of valor, bravery, and ingenuity because they are unique settings not tethered to contemporary constraints. Although the threat to nature described in climate change science fiction ("cli-fi") rests on a different logic from the vanishing frontier of Roosevelt's era, cli-fi dystopian landscapes transformed by environmental disaster are equally rich venues on which to stage the trials of manhood (Brady, 2017). The depiction of men as uniquely in possession of essential knowledge is part of the construction of hegemonic masculinity.

Hegemonic masculinity refers to culturally embedded and naturalized actions, attitudes, and behaviors that assert male dominance and legitimize gender inequality (Connell, 2019). In contemporary discussions of masculinity, scholars recognize hegemonic masculinities as multifaceted, omnipresent, and legitimating gender inequality

(Messerschmidt & Messner, 2018). Messerschmidt (2019) summarizes their power and invisibility:

> Hegemonic masculinities…are ubiquitous throughout society [but] often are simultaneously *hidden in plain sight*…hegemonic masculinities are so obvious that people do not actually "see" them—because they are everywhere, they are nowhere—and this social condition signals *bona fide* hegemony. (p. 17, emphasis in original)

In the context of popular culture, Sparks (1996) notes that action heroes embody hegemonic masculinity in ways that are so widely held and taken for granted that they are difficult to recognize and typically go uncontested: "the heroism, the villainy, the action, and the violence are in a certain sense invisible for as long as the masculinities on which they rely remain unmarked and unremarkable" (p. 349). For decades, scholars have noted that "the heroic agents of popular film and television…have, predominantly, been men," and they have long proclaimed that hegemonic masculinity is inevitably and inextricably linked to action heroes (Sparks, 1996, p. 348). In her analysis of masculinity in science fiction films, Kac-Vergne (2018) argues that despite any "redefinition of hegemonic masculinity" that has taken place since the hypermasculine heroes of the 1980s, "white [Western] males remain the central figures" in these films, which have failed to "[challenge] male hegemony" (p. 192). Leikam's (2017) discussion of the *extreme weather hero* in the U.S. made-for-TV *Sharknado* (2013) film series speaks to this. She advocates for close readings of cli-fi heroes in order to expose "the ways in which masculinity is decisively entangled with our imaginations about environmental crises" (p. 29). Her focus on an action parody TV movie limits her analysis, however, because such spoof representations of masculinity are purposefully exaggerated.

Whether exaggerated intentionally or not, global consumers of cli-fi films and fiction are quite likely to see the masculine hero, what we are calling here, the "Cowboy Scientist," grappling with a complex unknown challenge and saving the day by virtue of his technical prowess and

bravery. The Cowboy Scientist is a heroic figure who possesses the extraordinary courage, inventiveness, and scientific knowledge needed to face any threat and find the solution to save humanity. As the one who is most equipped to facilitate humanity's survival in extreme environmental conditions, his presence legitimizes men's dominance in discussions of climate change science and policy.

In this paper, we identify representations heroic manhood in two commercially successful, mainstream cli-fi films: *The Day After Tomorrow* (2004; hereafter *Day After*) and *Mad Max: Fury Road* (2015; hereafter *Fury Road*). We find that the male heroes of these two films are not simply caricatures of the *extreme weather hero* in Leikam's critique. They are more mainstream, representing a legacy of Western (in this case, American and Australian) hegemonic masculinity that has made its home in scientific and policy-related discussions of climate change that extend beyond the borders of fiction into actual research and political realms. In both films, they are Cowboy Scientists—Western white men who are depicted as global male hegemons without whose essential help the world would end. In the following section, before we begin our analysis of the films and discussion of the Cowboy Scientist, we provide brief plot summaries and outline our reasons for choosing these specific films.

The Films: Plot Summaries and Social Context

In *Day After*, a global "major climate shift" is taking place and paleoclimatologist Jack Hall (played by American actor Dennis Quaid) calls for a change in public policy. His warnings are not taken seriously by the U.S. Vice President, who considers the economic risks to be too great. As the weather conditions worsen and the Vice President still denies the need for action, Jack fights the odds to face the weather and trek to New York City to rescue his son, Sam (Jake Gyllenhaal), who is braving the weather successfully because of his dad's advice and his own competence. In the end, the climate has shifted into a new ice age, Americans have sought refuge in the Global South, Jack makes it to New

York, Sam and his friends have survived, and they all get transported to a safer environment thanks to newfound military support.

Fury Road is set in a post-apocalyptic, post-climate changed world. After a series of nuclear wars over scarce natural resources, Earth has become a barren wasteland where violence defines interactions and the religious dictator Immortan Joe rules the water supply, the Citadel, and its inhabitants. Imperator Furiosa (Charlize Theron), an androgynous woman with a cyborg arm, is one of Immortan Joe's trusted rig drivers, and she uses her position to help his five wives ("breeders") escape his tyranny and abuse. She plans to take them to the Green Place, a female Eden from which she was taken as a child. She meets Max Rockatansky (played by British-born actor Tom Hardy) along the way, and they end up working together to survive.

Day After and *Fury Road* are both considered firsts of their kind— *Day After* in addressing human culpability in climate change and *Fury Road* in presenting developed female characters as action heroes in the established hypermasculine *Mad Max* franchise. Critics and commentators rarely put these films in conversation with one another, because, in many ways, the films seem to occupy opposite ends of the cli-fi genre. They have strikingly different narrative styles, and their social commentaries seem unrelated, one deals with the environment and the other with gender. We argue, however, that both films are vehicles for the Cowboy Scientist to rescue humanity and the future. In both films, the changing climate and the social distortions it generates are backdrops for heroic masculinity to perform and prevail. Both films position the Cowboy Scientist against a male antagonist who represents a competing masculinity. In both films, the changing climate represents a new wilderness, an unknown frontier that only men with particular kind of masculine bravery (cowboy) and technical knowledge (scientific) can conquer. The survival of women (and other men) in the films depends on the macho intuition and scientific acumen of the leading male character who embodies the gendered key to everyone's survival.

We compare these films because they were commercially

successful, critically acclaimed blockbuster hits. They stand in contrast to documentaries and art films, such as *An Inconvenient Truth* (2006) (often discussed alongside *Day After*), which have more self-selecting audiences, reflecting different priorities and the conscious use of social conventions to deliver a critique. Both films were marketed first and foremost as action films, and the principal motive for their production was financial profit. As Leiserowitz (2004) notes "their primary goal was to create a 'popcorn movie'"—which means the films needed to be accessible in order to "draw a mass audience" (p. 26). Any environmental or social commentaries were "secondary goals." This makes them particularly amenable to a critical examination of popular imaginings of gender and the environment.

Popular culture is an important area of study because it both reflects and shapes social norms and values. As Tanenbaum et al. (2017) write, "For every person who reads NASA's most recent reports on carbon levels in the atmosphere, there are thousands of people who watch films like *Fury Road*. These stories matter" (p. 67). Yes, but they matter only if we are looking at the right things, which discussions of cli-fi are not, we argue, because they have failed to integrate considerations of gender with concerns for the environment. Critics have yet to address the ways in which the hero fighting climate change perpetuates a hegemonic masculinity that is deeply embedded in cli-fi morality tales. Until there are critical discussions of how men, women, and the environment interact in cli-fi films, the films remain co-creators—not critical representations of—a narrative that reinforces hegemonic masculinity.

In this paper, we identify the Cowboy Scientist as a heroic archetype specific to cli-fi films, where extreme weather conditions and eco-disasters create a set of conditions that require his specific skillset to survive. In the sections that follow, we first describe how the Cowboy Scientist is characterized in *Day After*, which is often considered the gold standard for cli-fi films. Next, we analyze Max as *Fury Road*'s Cowboy Scientist, paying specific attention to how his characterization compares to that of Immortan Joe (a competing masculinity) and Furiosa (a

competing femininity). Finally, we address the implications of our analyses for larger discussions of gender and climate change.

The Day After Tomorrow: The Gold Standard

In our discussion of *Day After*, we have three goals: to elaborate the film's contributions to the cli-fi genre before characterizing Jack and Sam as standard Cowboy Scientists; to analyze the film's explicit environmental message and its commentary against climate change denialism; and to address the matter of gender representations, specifically focusing on the absence of women in the film.

The Day After Tomorrow is considered a turning point in the genre of cli-fi films. It was a box office hit that delivered a targeted political commentary, and it was "undoubtedly the first film of its kind to cite humanity, namely western humanity, as the central and sole problem for the cause of apocalyptic events" (Livesey, 2014, p. 71). Fifteen years after its theatrical release, *Day After* has continued to inform the cli-fi films that followed it and remains "a ready point of reference for discussions—and visualizations—of climate change" for filmmakers, cli-fi fans, and scholars alike (Svoboda, 2014, p. 12). Current scholarship about *Day After* and subsequent cli-fi films describes the films as "cautionary tales," analyzes how they shape audience attitudes toward climate change, and debates the social and political "usefulness" of the genre (Leiserowitz, 2004; Manzo, 2017; Schröder, 2010; Von Burg, 2012). For better or for worse, *Day After* has established which messages are important to communicate, what types of solutions can fix the problem, and who has the authority and expertise to face the changing climate; therefore, its representations are especially important for analysis.

Jack & Sam: Cowboy Scientists in *The Day After Tomorrow*

As is the case in all action films, the hero plays a defining role in cli-fi films. According to Murray and Heumann (2009), the eco-disaster film (i.e., cli-fi) "looks like most disaster [action] films in every way other than the way the image of the hero is constructed" (p. 10). Murray and Heumann (2009) see *Day After*'s Jack and his son, Sam, as *eco-heroes*—"a new breed" of hero that has only "the best qualities" of the other action hero archetypes (p. 6). These heroes "serve the community [with science] while maintaining solitary quests," as cowboys would (p. 6). They see the "new" type of hero in films like *Day After* as indicative of a positive turn in heroic representation, but they do not question how masculinity is constructed or what the gendered implications might be. Salvador and Norton (2011) are less taken with Jack's and Sam's heroic ventures, arguing that they convey the message that "there is nothing we can do about global climate change" (p. 60). They see Jack and Sam as undermining the film's environmental message, because their "heroic victories are obtained through rugged individualism and the wherewithal to know what 'really' matters for survival" (p. 55). They read this as a message that "the only course left is to hope that nature will ultimately set things right" (p. 60), while we argue that the more subtle takeaway is that only the Cowboy Scientist can help us survive.

13

Because the Cowboy Scientist is genre-specific to cli-fi, it is useful to analyze in more detail how he is characterized in *Day After*. Early in the film, we meet Jack Hall, a climate scientist who spends his time in Antarctica studying ice shelves and is a classic example of the Cowboy Scientist. His relationship with his family is strained, because like the cowboy out on the range, he has a dangerous job that requires him to leave his wife and son behind for extended periods of time (Glotfelty, 2004). When disaster strikes, however, his family relies on him to save them. His work as a climate scientist may have made him an absentee father, but it is also the thing that gives him the "right stuff" to make the trip to New York City and be there for his son when it really counts.

In the Antarctic wilderness, Jack's strength and endurance are

tested constantly. In the film's opening scenes, he risks his life to save his research when an ice shelf breaks off and destroys his campsite (Emmerich, 2004, 00:03:43-00:06:03). So, when Jack reports his findings to policy makers at an international meeting, he is not making "sensationalist claims" based on abstract data or speculation (Emmerich, 2004, 00:07:56). His climate models and scientific training may inform his presentation, but he collects his own data and has directly experienced the shifting climate. Jack's physical endurance speaks to his "more traditionally heroic features," but he is also "intellectually driven" and has a value system that reflects those of an American "everyman" (Murray & Heumann, 2009, pp. 6-7). Wearing denim shirts and flannels throughout most of the movie, Jack opposes suit-wearing government officials and takes matters into his own hands when it comes to saving his family. At the end of the day, Jack is just a dad who will stop at nothing to reunite with his son. Both action hero and American patriarch, Jack not only saves the world, but also his son, who, by the end of the film, has "evol[ved] into a new eco-hero [Cowboy Scientist] like his father" (Murray & Heumann, 2009, p. 8).

Jack's son, Sam is a second-generation Cowboy Scientist whose intelligence and resourcefulness make him the expert on survival for him and his friends. When a devastating blizzard hits New York City and panicked survivors crowd the public library, Sam steps up and keeps everyone alive who will listen to him (Emmerich, 2004, 01:09:58-01:10:48). He burns books for heat, raids the vending machines, and tells everyone to stay inside. When Laura, his classmate and crush, gets sick (01:28:38-01:29:50), he fashions snowshoes out of wicker chairs and braves the blizzard to fetch antibiotics (01:32:25-01:33:01). On his journey to get medicine, he fights a pack of hungry wolves, demonstrating that he is every bit the cowboy that his dad is (Emmerich, 2004, 01:36:01-01:36:05).

As the first disaster film to feature the destruction of New York City post-9/11, *Day After*'s environmental message is a "call to political action" and national "unity in the face of crisis" (Kakoudaki, 2011, p. 352; Livesey, 2014, p. 73). According to Livesey (2014), the film's environmental stance is an overt critique of the Bush administration, evidenced by the fictional Vice President's likeness to Dick Cheney and by "scenes undermining the efficacy of corporate lifestyles and contemporary capitalism" (p. 72). In fact, Kirby (2011) argues that the film's critical value lies in its depiction of politics. The science behind the film may be dismissed easily, but critics "could not, and did not, challenge the film's portrayal of [the conservative] political stance on global warming" (p. 180).

Day After's much-discussed environmental message is that we must accept the reality of climate change: "the dangers of global warming are real and continued denial can only result in disaster" (Von Burg, 2012, p. 11). This message is directed at the growing number of American skeptics who doubt the severity of climate change or perceive its science to be uncertain, despite the scientific consensus that climate change is real and serious. Studies indicate that the majority of climate change skeptics are white, conservative men, which is a crucial point of consideration in larger discussions of skepticism and climate change (McCright & Dunlap, 2011). This demographic also holds the most power in society; therefore, "Men not only are the primary articulators of climate change skepticism, they set the agenda, provide the funding, and are the main supporters of organized climate change denialism" (Nagel, 2016, p. 173).

The film's critique of climate change denialism is articulated by the white, male Vice President, who is the film's primary antagonist—he is a climate change skeptic who repeatedly ignores Jack's warnings and denies climate change is a threat until the very end of the film. Mimicking the rhetoric of real climate change skeptics and deniers, the Vice President accuses Jack of "making sensationalist claims," and

recommends he "stick to science and leave the policy to us [politicians]" (Emmerich, 2004, 00:07:56; 01:03:49-01:03:52). The Vice President finally revises his beliefs after the President dies in the storm. In his first presidential address, he calls for collaboration and unity in the face of disaster, expressing hope for the future (Emmerich, 2004, 01:51:43-01:53:30). Ultimately, the film delivers a critique against those who would deny the severity of climate change.

Day After takes a bold stance against climate change denialism, but it does not challenge the overrepresentation of white men as scientists and policy makers. The film and its critics effectively communicate that the problem is not that there are too many men; the problem is that those men must accept and address climate change as a legitimate threat. There is a notable absence of women in *Day After*, which communicates that they do not belong in discussions about climate change. Film scholars apparently agree, since hardly any—in academia or popular media—have commented on the absence of women in the film. In the scholarship about *Day After*, we have not found anything that meaningfully addresses gender. McGreavy and Lindenfeld (2014) come close when they identify the overrepresentation of white men "as decision makers and leaders" and men of color as "less empowered" in *Day After*, but their analysis stops with men (pp. 132, 124). The small number of women occupying minor roles reflects and reproduces hegemonic masculinity's pervasiveness and invisibility.

There are only two women in *Day After* with significant roles—Lucy and Laura—and their primary purpose is to serve the men's storylines. These women take care of others as women are expected to do, but their capacities are limited, and there is little they can do without men. Lucy is Jack's ex-wife, Sam's mom, and a pediatrician. When she is not being consoled by Jack or worrying about Sam, she is taking care of Peter, a young boy and cancer patient. Even though Lucy is a doctor, her care for Peter is limited to reading him children's books and watching over him as a mother would do. Her supposed act of heroism is staying with Peter, who is left behind when the hospital is being evacuated. She "bravely" waits with him—until a *male* firefighter shows up to rescue

them (Emmerich, 2004, 01:25:04-01:25:47). Ultimately, her heroic act consists of taking care of a child while waiting for a man to save them.

Laura is Sam's classmate, love interest, and ultimately the reason he joined the scholastic decathlon team and is in New York City in the first place. When New York is flooding, Laura separates from her cohort to help a Haitian mother and daughter who are trapped in a taxi, and she cuts her leg in the process (Emmerich, 2004, 00:47:59-00:48:52). Inexplicably, Laura does not see the giant wave quickly approaching her, but Sam does, and he risks his life to pull her to safety just in time (Emmerich, 2004, 00:50:18-00:50:58). Sam risks his life for her a second time when her cut gets infected, and he faces inclement weather and a pack of wolves to get her antibiotics (Emmerich, 2004, 01:33:05-01:36:25). Her single attempt to be heroic to assist an unnamed, black, foreign mother and daughter ends up endangering Sam again, further demonstrating that women are not equipped to handle serious threats. Throughout the course of the movie, Sam evolves from a science student into a Cowboy Scientist, because the people he cares about need him, and he's the only one who can help them survive.

17

Other representations of women in *Day After* reflect reductive stereotypes, including an Asian scientist running reports and sending updates to Jack and his boys from the comfort of the lab, an unnamed blonde woman sexually distracting a meteorologist from monitoring the weather in L.A., a group of nurses in the children's hospital where Lucy works, and the female spinster librarian who hosts survivors taking shelter in the library. These representations cast women in supporting roles, reinforcing their subordination to men. Critical discussions of the film overlook the place of women in the film, which communicates the message that the only relevant roles for women are in relation to men.

Mad Max: Fury Road: Gender Challenge or Confirmation?

Our second film, *Fury Road*, has been widely hailed in popular and scholarly commentary as a feminist upending of traditional male action heroes because of its central female character, Imperator Furiosa—an independent and rebellious woman who not only survives but excels in a dystopian world of toxic masculinity. In the sections that follow, we challenge this reading, and argue that in this film, the Cowboy Scientist still manages to rule the road. We begin by analyzing *Fury Road*'s representations of women, with a particular focus on critical debates about the film's feminist politics, followed by a brief discussion of the how the film links gender and environmental destruction. Next, we offer an extended characterization of Max as the film's Cowboy Scientist, and we conclude by we conclude by questioning the tendency of critical discussions to position Max as the standard against which Immortan Joe's toxic masculinity and Furiosa's feminist heroism can best be understood.

The Women of *Fury Road*

In contrast to simplistic and supporting roles of women in *Day After,* representations of women in *Fury Road* are more complex and central to the plot. On the surface, *Fury Road* seems to challenge the masculine-dominated realm of cli-fi depicted in *Day After*. The film is often read as a feminist hijacking of an otherwise male-centric film series, a fact that has incited outrage from men's rights activists and praise from practically everyone else (Garcia, 2015; Stewart, 2015; Sandars, 2019). Reviews published in the popular press have lauded *Fury Road*'s feminist twist, portraying it as evidence that the franchise is "keeping up with the times" (Robinson, 2015, para. 5). Klassen (2015) explains that "audiences need to be saved from yet another male-dominated action flick," and "2015 doesn't need an insane wanderer, we need a strong and capable warrior named Furiosa" (para. 8). Despite fears that feminism will ruin the film, commentators assure moviegoers that "the movie is

fantastic, calibrated perfectly to appeal to fans of the action genre in general and the Mad Max franchise in particular" (Perry, 2015, para. 11). Feminism is seen to be palatable in this film, allowing entertainment, action, and empowered women to coexist. Furiosa may be in the spotlight, but "it's not like Max (and the other guys) don't get to participate in some truly spectacular orgies of violence" (Smith, 2015, para. 13).

Discussions of gender in *Fury Road* pinpoint Furiosa as a feminist action hero and Immortan Joe as a narcissistic religious dictator who personifies toxic masculinity, and in some readings, the white capitalist patriarchy (Boulware 2016; Yates 2017). Scholars have debated the extent of the film's feminist politics, especially the masculinization of Furiosa which stands in opposition to the sexualization of Immortan Joe's "wives" (Bampatzimopoulos, 2015). The wives' repeated assertion that they are not "things" creates the basis of the film's much-discussed critique of violence against women. The wives are vocal about how they have been mistreated; they have been sexualized, weakened, and rendered helpless against their will at the hands of Immortan Joe. In contrast, Furiosa has agency precisely because she "has renounced stereotypically feminine attributes" (Martínez-Jiménez et al., 2018, p. 413). She forfeits motherhood, long hair, and makeup in favor of driving a truck with a buzzcut and a forehead blackened by grease "war paint." The wives, on the other hand, wear clinging scant clothing and look scared, frail, hyper-feminine, and "sexy in an undernourished, 'lingerie catalogue model' way" (Di Paolo, 2018, p. 201). In the scene where the wives remove their chastity belts to reclaim their sexual liberation from male control (Miller, 2015, 00:33:06-00:33:37), they are seen "moistening their white sheer clothing" with a hose "in the middle of the desert" in an overtly sexual scene reflecting a familiar male fantasy (Martínez-Jiménez et al., 2018, p. 413).

The fact that *Fury Road* was written and directed by men makes some commentators hesitant to consider the film a true "feminist masterpiece" (King, 2015, para. 3). Still, director George Miller allegedly "recognized the limitations" facing men who attempt to tell "a story

about female exploitation and survival," which led him to bring in consultants like Eve Ensler, who wrote the *Vagina Monologues* and works with women who have survived abuse (Robinson, 2015, para. 3). Ensler spent a week with the female cast to "give their back stories depth" by offering them "a perspective on violence against women around the world" (Del Barco, 2015, para. 7; qtd. in Dockterman, 2015, para. 5). Feminist readings of the film suggest that *Fury Road* may have overcome what Kac-Vergne (2016) identifies as "feminist tokenism," wherein the introduction of "active female characters" simply creates "the illusion that women have gained power in postfeminist America" (p.2).

Gender and the Environment in *Fury Road*

It is not difficult to draw parallels between Max's world and our own. In the film's opening scenes, voices of men, women, and children explain that the apocalypse followed humanity's absolute consumption of Earth: "oil wars," "killing for guzzoline [gas]," and "water wars" created "this wasteland" (Miller, 2015, 00:00:25-00:00:53). Even after human-induced climate change created a wasteland, this post-apocalyptic world still relies on the consumption of fossil fuels. The wasteland remains a wasteland because the environment continues to be abused. This abuse is certainly linked to certain masculine regimes. Tanenbaum et al. (2017) identify "water, gasoline, and ammunition" as "the backbone of warlord Immortan Joe's power" and a "synecdoche for the power structures underlying today's so-called developed world" (p. 64).

Critical discussions of the environment in *Fury Road* often liken the destruction of nature to the subjugation of women in society. Throughout the film, the wives repeatedly ask about the devastation of the environment, posing the question, "Who killed the world?" Although the question goes unanswered in the film, this question has been central to gender analyses of *Fury Road*, which identify men as oppressors of women, symbolized by the male destruction of the world. Gallagher (2015) argues, "there is no doubt that [the answer to this question] is

'men'" (p. 52). He identifies "unchecked masculinity" and "the glorification of war" as the culprits of environmental destruction, lauding the film's social critique of "several key tenets of traditional masculinity" (Gallagher, 2015, p. 52). Magnett (2017) argues that it is "perfectly clear" who killed the world: "It's the same people who keep making the world worse: men" (para. 4). Yates (2017) suggests that the capitalist patriarchy is a more accurate, nuanced answer to the question, arguing that the film "assign[s] blame for the 'killing of the world' (the creation of the Wasteland) to capitalist patriarchy itself, the system that Immortan Joe embodies" (p. 365). Boulware (2016) agrees, arguing that the question is not rhetorical, "and the answer is abundantly obvious: Immortan Joe, and everything he represents" (p. 5). But Max does not enter the conversation, because he is not seen as part of the masculine tradition that has killed the world.

Industrial modern society and its violence against nature have been fueled by a masculine logic that perceives "men/culture as rulers over women/nature" (Hultman, 2013, p. 84). Hultman and Pulé (2020) point to "masculine configurations" that "represent 'unmarked' (i.e., normalised) categories whose social and environmental impact on the world is hidden by the systems that created and continue to maintain them" (p. 478). Critical discussions are so preoccupied with the question of who killed the world that that they neglect to acknowledge that it is also a man who is positioned to revive it. Max, not Immortan Joe, is an "unmarked," but nevertheless central, masculine figure in the film.

Max Rockatansky: Cowboy Scientist in *Fury Road*

Throughout *Fury Road*, Max maintains masculine structures through his physical strength and mastery of the environment. Max's self-confident characterization, expertise in fighting, and knowledge of the land make him a definitive Cowboy Scientist, though his strengths are more primal than those of Jack and Sam in *Day After*. Max roams the world alone. Like an animal, he is "hunted by scavengers, ... a man reduced to a single instinct: survive" (Miller, 2015, 00:02:43-00:03:17). Early in the film,

Max is captured and muzzled by the War boys, who call him a "raging feral" (Miller, 2015, 00:16:07-00:16:09). His primitivity links him to the land, proven by his ability to subsist on his own, unlike the disfigured people of the Citadel, trapped because they are "addicted to water" (Miller, 2015, 00:09:49-00:09:54). Max is "an archetype that celebrates the masculine belief that isolation and independence are sources of strength" (Gallagher, 2015, p. 54). He is a survival expert — "the master of his environment, …who tames the land" for those who cannot, "before fading back into isolation so that his memory can become legend," like all great cowboys (Gallagher, 2015, p. 54).

Max's cowboy characterization remains unproblematized in critical discussions of the film. Critics have acknowledged him as a masculine heroic figure, but only to the extent that he provides a foil against Immortan Joe and Furiosa. Immortan Joe and the War Boys are flagrant representations of toxic masculinity in a patriarchal society, where violence defines a man, and women are sexual objects. Max's strengths are magnified in his confrontations with Immortan Joe and his caravan of Half-Life War Boys for whom fighting is central to their way of life—a marker of masculinity. It is a grand performance accompanied by a soundtrack played by a musician strapped to the front of a giant war rig playing a fire-spouting, electric guitar (Miller, 2015, 00:17:00-00:17:17). Immortan Joe orchestrates the fight scenes, and though he is too weak to fight anyone, he wears a costume that embellishes his decrepit body with military medals (Miller, 2015, 00:06:51-00:07:22).

A clear distinction can be drawn between Max and the other men in the film. Max does not share "the masculine beliefs of the villains, nor of the men who 'killed the world'" (Gallagher, 2015, p. 54). This is most evident in the scene where Max kills the Bullet Farmer, a weapons dealer who rides with his crew in a tank, shooting indiscriminately at anything and everything that crosses his path. The scene takes place off-screen in "the only action sequence in the film not shown head-on," which Gallagher (2015) sees as a demonstration that "Max possesses a capacity for brutality that even the film wants to keep hidden" in order to maintain the distance between Max and Immortan Joe (p. 55). In the

scene, the Bullet Farmer is in hot pursuit of Max and the women, whose escape is temporarily stalled by an overheated engine. Demonstrating his authority and expertise, Max arms himself with a few weapons, tells Furiosa, "You need to take the War Rig half a klick down the track," and disappears into the fog (Miller, 2015, 01:12:31-01:12:34). We see an explosion in the distance, and Max emerges carrying supplies and covered in blood—"not his blood," Furiosa notes, it is the Bullet Farmer's blood (Miller, 2015, 01:14:24). Max is thus capable of extreme violence, including single-handedly taking down a tank full of men who are armed with machine guns. Like the cowboys of "the imaginary West," Max's violence is for survival, and in protecting the women, he "serves a greater good," which makes his actions not only "justifiable," but heroic and distinct from Immortan Joe and the War Boys (Martins, 2019, pp. 50-51). Max does not have to publicly perform his masculinity; he just *is* masculine.

Max's masculinity goes unchecked, and in many scholarly readings of the film, he is upstaged and outdone by Furiosa, a woman. Researchers often point to Furiosa as Max's equal and the film's true hero. The scene leading up to Max's off-screen act of violence has been considered evidence of their partnership (Bampatzimopoulos, 2015; Gallagher, 2015). In this scene, Max wastes two bullets in an attempt to eliminate the fast-approaching Bullet Farmer. With one bullet remaining, Furiosa takes the rifle and stabilizes it on Max's shoulder with the instruction, "Don't breathe" (Miller, 2015, 01:09:41). Furiosa's shot manages to blind the Bullet Farmer, and this scene has been read as a demonstration of Furiosa's superiority — she hits the target when Max cannot. For instance, Bampatzimopoulos (2015) describes the scene "as a moment that disrupts the binary logic of gender and indicates the momentary possibility of a relationship between two equals, where gender is of little importance" (p. 215). In our analysis, however, Furiosa may outperform Max with a gun when she has his shoulder to stabilize her shot, but Max is the one who finishes the job with his superior hand-to-hand combat skills. Max is a better fighter, a fact that is established early on in the film when he first meets Furiosa and they fight. Furiosa attacks first and

proves to be a strong opponent, but Max still wins.

Acknowledging Max's superior strength, Bampatzimopoulos (2015) questions whether Furiosa's feminist characterization challenges or reinforces the existing gender order. He sees Furiosa as "the most challenging version of a female action hero so far," and argues that she is not part of a "breakthrough narrative that deconstructs the patriarchal world" (p. 217). Although the "patriarchal order is indeed questioned" in the film, it is not "disrupted," because Furiosa ultimately returns to "the private sphere" and Max remains an "eternal explorer" (p. 213). Although Bampatzimopoulos identifies Max as part of the patriarchal order, he does not problematize his character or make mention of hegemonic masculinity. The Cowboy Scientist's heroic masculinity is the reason why the film may only question, but does not disrupt, the existing gender order.

Martínez-Jiménez et al. (2018) critique hegemonic masculinity in the film, but they focus on Furiosa and treat Max as strictly supplemental. They argue that Furiosa "does not question hegemonic masculinity," and the film legitimizes a neoliberal social order "without questioning the social construction of masculinity or challenging the hierarchical gender complementarity" (pp. 413, 415). Furiosa not only neglects to challenge hegemonic masculinity, she conforms to it. Her strength comes from the fact that she "renounced stereotypically feminine attributes" (Martínez-Jiménez et al., 2018, p. 413). Although they recognize Max as "the real protagonist of the film," given "the story is actually told from [his] subjective point of view," they do not engage his characterization beyond that (p. 412). They argue that "hegemonic masculinity goes unquestioned" in the film because Furiosa "[has] assumed its terms," not because Max embodies it (p. 413). Furiosa—not Max—is at the center of their discussion of hegemonic masculinity. Even if Furiosa has "embrac[ed] the dominant male codes" of the gender hegemony (Martínez-Jiménez et al., 2018, p. 413), we conclude that she cannot be a Cowboy Scientist, because she lacks the necessary environmental intuition and masculine skillset afforded to men like Max. If Furiosa's successes can be attributed to the masculine characteristics

she has adopted, then her failures are the result of what remains of her femininity. In cli-fi films, only men can be Cowboy Scientists.

In *Fury Road*, women are not equipped to survive the changing climate on their own, even with Furiosa's help. The Vuvalini feminist enclave from which Furiosa originated, were unable to adapt to the conditions of the shifting climate, and most of their clan died after failing to keep the Green Place alive. Those who remain rely on their attractive leader, who uses her naked body as "bait" to distract enemies; their war tactics are based on her body and sexuality (Miller, 2015, 01:17:45). Furiosa's journey back to the Green Place provides the basis of the film's plot, but when it comes to environmental destruction and climate change, there is no going back. The Green Place "has since withered and died because of climate change" (Di Paolo, 2018, p. 202). When she finds out that she has been pursuing something that no longer exists, she decides to continue moving east. This decision offers no practical solutions to their material situation—just hope for something better. She invites Max to come along, because, while she has apparently assumed control of the Vuvalini and makes decisions for the women, she cannot speak for him. He declines, explaining, "I'll make my own way," as cowboys do, warning her, "You know, hope is a mistake—If you can't fix what's broken, you'll go insane" (Miller, 2015, 01:25:05-01:25:30).

Sensing the women's chances of survival are slim, Max feels a pang of guilt and uses his environmental expertise to invent a better solution to the problem than the women's blind hope; he convinces Furiosa to turn back and seize the Citadel, where there is known water and resources. She has a better chance at survival "fix[ing] what's broken" in the Citadel, which succeeded where the Green Place failed. There is nothing wrong with the existing structure, just the man in charge. The film may have communicated the message that men like Immortan Joe have "killed the world," but it is only men like Max who know how to ensure everyone's survival.

Critical discussions of the film seldom explore these implications of Max's intervention. Di Paolo (2018) recognizes that Max "offers key

advice" to Furiosa, but he argues that while they "benefit from Max's help," Furiosa and the other women "do not *need* him to ride in like a white knight to save them" (pp. 202-203). Max may not be "a white knight," but he is not inconsequential. Di Paolo (2018) promotes Max from mere sidekick to feminist ally—a "champion of freedom" who should be "instructive to males in the audience" (p. 202). Valenti (2015) proposes an alternative title, "Mad Max: Feminist Ally" (para. 5), which aligns with Magnett's (2017) perception of Max as "a true ally and someone worthy of admiration," and by the end of the film, argues that Max has realized "feminism is necessary not only for women, but for the creation of a better world" (paras. 16, 23).

Max, however, is the one who convinces the women to "claim the Citadel" (Di Paolo, 2018, p. 202), facilitates its successful overthrow, remains unscathed, and then uses his own blood to save the mortally-wounded Furiosa so that she can rise to power. In the film's final scenes, after the women assume control over the Citadel, Max tips his proverbial cowboy hat and exchanges a respectful nod with Furiosa before disappearing from view (Miller, 2015, 01:52:49-01:52:55). His decision to return to wilderness bespeaks the masculine tropes of self-reliance, independence, wanderlust, and adventurousness. For cowboys, "there is an implicit rejection of a feminized civility in favour of a reunion with wild nature" (Sparks, 1996, p. 352). Max's departure reflects a critical element of the hegemonic masculinity well-integrated into the film: sangfroid modesty, which Verevis (2019) notes, is fully on display at the film's end: "Furiosa kills Joe, and upon arriving at the Citadel she is heralded as a liberator. Meanwhile, with only a parting nod to Furiosa, the still reluctant hero, Max, slips quietly away into the crowd" (p. 142).

Max may have played an instrumental role in Furiosa's survival and success, but in the end, he leaves, because he is a Cowboy Scientist, not a feminist ally. When Max is construed as an ally, his knowledge of the land is understood as advice, his ability to save Furiosa is read as an equal partnership, and his leaving at the end is seen as knowing his place to step aside and let the women take over. When Max is not recognized as the Cowboy Scientist, hegemonic masculinity not only hides in plain

sight, but also appears as a counter-hegemonic, safe feminist ally deserving praise.

Conclusion

We have argued here that the Cowboy Scientist is a heroic archetype of cli-fi films that valorizes a hegemonic masculinity, a valorization that remains unrecognized in most film scholarship. In cli-fi films, Cowboy Scientists overcome the dangers of the wilderness (cowboys' skillset), and find solutions to the environmental calamity (scientists' strengths). Fighting, which is central to most demonstrations of masculinity, is embedded in both of these enterprises and is a core component of Cowboy Scientist masculinity. The Cowboy Scientists we have analyzed here may seem as different as their respective films, but in each they demonstrate masculine insights and essential expertise that enable them to survive in the wilderness and engage in plenty of fighting along the way. In many scholarly discussions of heroism in *Day After* and *Fury Road*, Jack and Sam Hall are praised, while Max is seen to be eclipsed by Furiosa who is asserted to be the true hero of the film. We argue that the hegemonic nature of the Cowboy Scientist allows him to go unnoticed, yet remain highly visible as a masculine presence. The Cowboy Scientist is the personification of modest hegemonic masculinity. He is a minimalist everyman that the public can get behind. He is not excessive, and he is quietly courageous. The portrayals of climate change in these films may be hyperbolic, but the Cowboy Scientist's actions and concerns certainly are not.

Day After is the most discussed cli-fi film of all time, but in the years since its premiere, there has yet to be a substantial discussion of the stereotypical depiction and limited presence of women in the film. The spotlight is on the men in *Day After*, who are portrayed as representing the interests of the common good. In contrast, women dominate the analytical focus in *Fury Road*, and their importance tends to be overstated, camouflaging Max's centrality; he is considered by scholars as inconsequential because the presumed real hero is a woman.

On the surface, *Fury Road*'s strong female characters may seem to challenge *Day After*'s masculine-dominated realm of cli-fi and heroes, but both films create space for the timeless Cowboy Scientist. Both films communicate the message that the existing gender structures need not change and the overrepresentation of men is not a problem. Men like the Vice President in *Day After* and Immortan Joe in *Fury Road* are powerful, but not hegemonic; they must change their ways or be deposed. Despite their differences, one takeaway message from both films is that the Cowboy Scientist reigns eternal: Jack is *not* a negligent politician, and Max is *not* Immortan Joe. A second, less obvious message imbedded in both films is that while men and their machines may have destroyed the planet, masculinity is the only way to save it.

Work Cited

Bampatzimopoulos, S. (2015). Female Action Hero vs Male Dominance: The Female Representation in Mad Max: Fury Road. *Ankara Üniversitesi Dil ve Tarih-Coğrafya Fakültesi Dergisi*, *55*(2), 205–218.

Bly, R. Iron John: *A Book about Men*. New York: Addison-Wesley, 1990.

Boulware, T. (2016). 'Who Killed the World': Building a Feminist Utopia from the Ashes of Toxic Masculinity in Mad Max: Fury Road. *Journal of Film and Visual Narration*, *1*(1), 1–17.

Brady, A. (2017). The Man Who Coined 'Cli-Fi' Has Some Reading Suggestions for You: A Conversation with Dan Bloom. Retrieved from Chicago Review of Books website: https://chireviewofbooks.com/2017/02/08/the-man-who-coined-cli-fi-has-some-reading-suggestions-for-you/.

Connell, R. (2019). Masculinities in Troubling Times: View from The South. *Masculinities Journal,* 12(Autumn), 5-13.

Del Barco, M. (2015). The Women Pull No Punches In Fiery, Feminist "Mad Max." Retrieved from npr website: https://www.npr.org/2015/05/15/406731120/the-women-pull-no-punches-in-fiery-feminist-mad-max

Di Paolo, M. (2018). *Fire and Snow: Climate Fiction from The Inklings to Game of Thrones*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Dockterman, E. (2015). Vagina Monologues Writer Eve Ensler: How Mad Max: Fury Road Became a "Feminist Action Film." Retrieved from Time website: https://time.com/3850323/mad-max-fury-road-eve-ensler-feminist/

Emmerich, R. (2004). *The Day After Tomorrow*. USA: 20th Century Fox.

Gallagher, C. (2015). Old Hands, New Breed: Mad Max: Fury Road and Evolving Gender Roles. *Metro: Media & Education Magazine*, 186, 48–55.

Garcia, M. (2015). 5 Reasons "Mad Max: Fury Road" Is Definitely the Most Feminist Blockbuster of the Year. Retrieved from Mic website: https://www.mic.com/articles/118508/5-reasons-mad-max-fury-road-is-definitely-the-most-feminist-blockbuster-of-the-year

Glotfelty, C. (2004). 'Once a Cowboy': Will James, Wade Mitchell, and the Predicament of Riders Who Turn Writers. In M. Alliser (Ed.), *Eco-Man: New Perspectives on Masculinity and Nature* (pp. 127–140). Charlottesville, VA: University of Virginia Press.

Hultman, M. (2013). The Making of an Environmental Hero: A History of Ecomodern Masculinity, Fuel Cells and Arnold Schwarzenegger. *Environmental Humanities*, 2, 79–99.

Hultman, M., & Pulé, P. (2020). Ecological masculinities: A response to the Manthropocene question. In L. Gottzén, U. Mellström, & T. Shefer (Eds.), *Routledge Handbook of Masculinities* (pp. 477–487). New York: Routledge.

Jackson, R., & M. Balaji (2011). *Global Masculinities and Manhood*. Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.

Joseph, L., & Black, P. (2012). Who's the man? Fragile masculinities, consumer masculinities, and the profiles of sex work clients. *Men and Masculinities, 15*(5), 486–506.

Kac-Vergne, M. (2018). *Masculinity in Contemporary Science Fiction Cinema: Cyborgs, Troopers and Other Men of the Future*. New York: I.B. Tauris.

---. (2016). Sidelining Women in Contemporary Science-Fiction Film. *Miranda*, 12, 1–16.

Kakoudaki, D. (2011). Representing Politics in Disaster Films. *International Journal of Media & Cultural Politics*, *7*(3), 349–356.

Kimmel, J. (1996). *Manhood in America: A Cultural History*. New York: The Free Press.

King, T. (2015). No, Mad Max: Fury Road is not a feminist masterpiece (but that's OK). Retrieved from New Statesman America website: https://www.newstatesman.com/culture/2015/05/no-mad-max-fury-road-not-feminist-masterpiece-s-ok

Kirby, D. A. (2011). *Lab Coats in Hollywood: Science, Scientists, and Cinema*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Klassen, A. (2015). "Mad Max" Is A Feminist Masterpiece, Because "Fury Road" Is All About Furiosa... & Her Sidekick Max. Retrieved from Bustle website: https://www.bustle.com/articles/82751-mad-max-is-a-feminist-masterpiece-because-fury-road-is-all-about-furiosa-her-sidekick

Leikam, S. (2017). Of Storms, Floods, and Flying Sharks: The Extreme Weather Hero in Contemporary American Culture. In *Men and Nature: Hegemonic Masculinities and Environmental Change* (pp. 29–36).

Leiserowitz, A. A. (2004). Before and After The Day After Tomorrow: A U.S. Study of Climate Change Risk Perception. *Environment*, *46*(9), 22–37.

Livesey, S. (2014). Climate Change, Capitalism, 9/11, and The Day After Tomorrow. *Film Matters*, (Spring 2014), 71–75.

Magnett, C. (2017). Why "Mad Max: Fury Road" Really Belongs to Imperator Furiosa". Retrieved from Comicbook website: https://comicbook.com/2020/01/10/my-hero-academia-manga-256-covert-nomu-mission-eraserhead/

Manzo, K. (2017). The usefulness of climate change films. *Geoforum*, 84 (May), 88–94.

Martínez-Jiménez, L., Gálvez-Muñoz, L., & Solano-Caballero, Á. (2018). Neoliberalism Goes Pop and Purple: Postfeminist Empowerment from Beyoncé to Mad Max. *Journal of Popular Culture*, *51*(2), 399–420.

Martins, D. K. (2019). Annie Proulx's Wyoming Stories: Deconstructing Hegemonic Masculinity in the American West. *Masculinities Journal*, 11, 46–71.

McCright, A. M., & Dunlap, R. E. (2011). Cool dudes: The denial of climate change among conservative white males in the United States. *Global Environmental Change*, *21*(4), 1163–1172.

McGreavy, B., & Lindenfeld, L. (2014). Entertaining Our Way to Engagement? Climate Change Films and Sustainable Development Values. *International Journal of Sustainable Development*, *17*(2), 123–136.

Messerschmidt, J. (2019). Hidden in Plain Sight: On the Omnipresence of Hegemonic Masculinities. *Masculinities Journal*, 12(Autumn), 14-29.

Messerschmidt, J. W., & Messner, M. A. (2018). Hegemonic, Nonhegemonic, and "New" Masculinities. In J. W. Messerschmidt, P. Y. Martin, M. A. Messner, & R. Connell (Eds.), *Gender Reckonings: New Social Theory and Research* (pp. 35–56). New York: New York University Press.

Miller, G. (2015). *Mad Max: Fury Road*. USA: Warner Bros.

Murray, R. L., & Heumann, J. K. (2009). *Ecology and Popular Film: Cinema on the Edge*. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.

Nagel, J. (2016). *Gender and Climate Change: Impacts, Science, Policy*. New York: Routledge.

Perry, D. (2015). "Mad Max: Fury Road" Is the Feminist Action Flick You've Been Waiting For. Retrieved from The Verge website: https://www.vice.com/en_us/article/vdxdm3/the-new-mad-max-movie-is-both-badass-and-totally-feminist-944

Robinson, J. (2015). How Mad Max: Fury Road Could Become the Most Surprising Feminist Triumph of the Year. Retrieved from Vanity Fair website: https://www.vanityfair.com/hollywood/2015/05/mad-max-fury-road-eve-ensler-feminist-triumph

Roosevelt, T. (1903). *The Strenuous Life: Essays and Addresses*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons.

Salvador, M., & Norton, T. (2011). The flood myth in the age of global climate change. *Environmental Communication*, *5*(1), 45–61.

Sandars, D. (2019). Disruptive Daughters: The Heroine's Journey in Four Films. In F. Collins, J. Landman, S. Bye (Eds.), *A Companion to Australian Cinema* (pp. 313-335). New York: Wiley-Blackwell.

Schröder, N. (2010). Framing Disaster: Images of Nature, Media, and Representational Strategies in Hollywood Disaster Movies. In L. Volkmann, N. Grimm, I. Detmers, & K. Thomson (Eds.), *Local Nature, Global Responsibilities: Ecocritical Perspectives on the New English Literatures* (pp. 281–306). New York: Rodopi.

Smith, K. (2015). Why "Mad Max: Fury Road" is the feminist picture of the year. Retrieved from New York Post website: https://nypost.com/2015/05/14/why-mad-max-fury-road-is-the-feminist-picture-of-the-year/

Sparks, R. (1996). Masculinity and Heroism in the Hollywood 'Blockbuster''.' *The British Journal of Criminology*, *36*(3), 348–360.

Stewart, S. (2015). Oops! I Made a Feminist Manifesto: George Miller and 'Mad Max.' Retrieved from Women and Hollywood website: https://womenandhollywood.com/oops-i-made-a-feminist-manifesto-george-miller-and-mad-max-238f64bfa9bc/

Sturgeon, N. (2009). *Environmentalism in Popular Culture: Gender, Race, Sexuality, and the Politics of the Natural*. Tucson, AZ: University of Arizona Press.

Svoboda, M. (2014). A Review of Climate Fiction (Cli-Fi) Cinema…Past and Present. *Yale Climate Connections*, 1–20.

Tanenbaum, J., Pufal, M., & Tanenbaum, K. (2017). Furious Futures and Apocalyptic Design Fictions: Popular Narratives of Sustainability. *Interactions*, *24*(1), 64–67.

Valenti, J. (2015). Sexists are scared of Mad Max because it is a call to dismantle patriarchies. Retrieved from The Guardian website: https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/may/27/sexi

sts-are-scared-of-mad-max-because-it-is-a-call-to-dismantle-patriarchies

Verevis, C. (2019). Another Green World: The *Mad Max* Series. In F. Collins, J. Landman, S. Bye (Eds.), *A Companion to Australian Cinema* (pp. 133-148). New York: Wiley-Blackwell.

Von Burg, R. (2012). Decades Away or The Day After Tomorrow?: Rhetoric, Film, and the Global Warming Debate. *Critical Studies in Media Communication*, *29*(1), 7–26.

White, K. (1993). *The First Sexual Revolution: The Emergence of Male Heterosexuality in Modern America*. New York: New York University Press.

Yates, M. (2017). Re-Casting Nature as Feminist Space in Mad Max: Fury Road. *Science Fiction Film & Television*, *10*(3), 353-370.

Gezegeni Kurtaran Kovboy Biliminsanı:

İklimkurgu Filmlerinde Hegemonik Erkeklik

34

Öz: Bu makale iklimkurgu (*cli-fi*) filmlerinin kahraman erkekliğin canlandırıldığı çağdaş bir sahne işlevi gördüğünü savunmaktadır. Bu filmlerde, değişmekte olan iklim yeni bir hudut bölgesi olarak yorumlanabilir. Bu yeni hudut bölgesinde hayatta kalmak için geleneksel erkeklik özellikleri olan güç ve cesaret ile birlikte modern bilim ve doğa bilgisi de gerekmektedir. Bu makalede "Kovboy Biliminsanı"nı, bünyesinde güncel hegemonik erkekliğin hem geleneksel hem de teknik özelliklerini barındıran iklimkurgu filmi kahramanı arketipi olarak tanımlamaktayız. Küresel film pazarında geniş bir izleyici kitlesini hedef alan iki yüksek hasılatlı iklimkurgu filmindeki – Amerikan yapımı *The Day After Tomorrow* (2004) ve Avustralya yapımı *Mad Max: Fury Road* (2015) – kahraman erkeklik betimlemelerini incelemekteyiz. Bu filmlerde yer alan toplumsal cinsiyet ve doğa temsillerini eleştirel bir analize tabi tutarak, Kovboy Biliminsanının insan ve doğa formundaki düşmanlarla savaşmasının, bilimsel uzmanlıkla ilkel sezgileri zekice birleştirmesinin ve bir dizi kahramanlık marifeti ile yardıma muhtaç ve kırılgan olanları kurtarmasının izini sürüyoruz. Popüler kültür, toplumsal normları ve değerleri yansıttığı ve şekillendirdiği için araştırmacılar tarafından uzun zamandır önemli bir çalışma alanı olarak kabul edilmektedir. Pop kültürün iklimkurgu temsillerindeki kahraman erkeklik üzerine yürüttüğümüz bu tartışma ile amacımız, (*The Day After Tomorrow*'da en net şekilde görülen) toplumsal cinsiyet ve iklim değişikliği arasındaki ilişki ile meydan okuyan kadınlığın mevcut olduğu durumda dahi (*Mad Max: Fury Road*'da görüldüğü üzere) hegemonik erkekliğin dirençliliği üzerine yürütülen tartışmalara katkı sağlamak.

Keywords: Hegemonik erkeklik, iklimkurgu, toplumsal cinsiyet, iklim değişikliği

Men Without Shirts:
Bollywood, Bodybuilding and Masculinities in Pakistan

Amna Nasir[*]

University of Sydney, Australia

Abstract: Gujranwala is a city known for its wrestlers. Over the past few years, the traditional wrestling is transforming into an urban phenomenon of bodybuilding; though, the focus on male body has remained the same. Wrestling and bodybuilding are not mere sports in this city but rather an expression of one's masculinity and dominance. A certain type of Bollywood movie culture, in which the hero is shown as a hyper-masculine, muscular and assertive man, have become very popular among the male audience in Gujranwala. This study aims at investigating the connection between the fast-growing gym culture in Gujranwala and such Bollywood movies, and how the hegemonic masculinity shown in these movies is being interpreted by the male Bollywood audiences in Gujranwala. Through Quota Sampling, and with the sample of a hundred bodybuilders, a questionnaire-based survey was conducted. The corresponding results showed that Bollywood movies were extremely popular in Gujranwala; gym-goers idealised heroes with particular hegemonic body types and behavioural patterns and believed that they inspired them to join gyms.

Keywords: Bollywood movies, bodybuilding, masculinity, men, Pakistan.

---

[*] Journalist and researcher, e-mail: amnanasir100@hotmail.com

ORCID ID: 0000-0001-7981-7192

Introduction

The purpose of this study is to investigate the role Bollywood movies play in formulating and transforming the existing bodybuilding culture in Pakistan. Furthermore, it analyses the effect of such movies on the idea of masculinity among Pakistani male gym-going population.

By taking the male, gym-going population of Gujranwala as a sample, this study explores the effect Bollywood movies had on their idea of masculinity, which can be defined as one where men are supposed to have beefed up bodies and are dominant and assertive. The current study explores the link between three phenomena; bodybuilding, Bollywood and masculinity.

This study looks at the impacts of body imagery shown in Bollywood movies on the younger generation of men in Pakistan and the relationship between the body types and masculinity traits portrayed in these movies and the bodybuilding culture in Pakistan. There have been no significant studies that link masculine body image portrayals in Bollywood with gym-going trends and attitudes in South Asia, and I believe that my paper will make significant advances in this area for further researches.

The methodology used for this research is quantitative, as it explores the relationship between Bollywood movies and gym-going behaviour in Gujranwala. A hundred male gym-goers from Gujranwala selected through Quota Sampling were asked to fill the questionnaire and the results collected were then manually accumulated in the SPSS software. The questionnaire consisted of the questions related to their gym-going behaviour, their taste of Bollywood movies, and their idea of what constitutes to be a real man.

The upcoming chapters will present the readers with an overview of Bollywood and its relationship with masculinity, body imagery and bodybuilding, the impact of Bollywood movies in Pakistan, a brief overview of the past scholarship on toxic masculinity, unhealthy body image portrayals and cinema, followed by a section on the findings of my

study and how it corresponds with the existing literature and lastly, the conclusion.

The Idea of Masculinity

In order to understand how it may impact one's life and the society at large, it is firstly important to understand the different ways in which masculinity can be defined. Masculinity is understood as a personality type which consists of traits include courage, independence and assertiveness. Machismo is often termed as a deep structure of masculinity and is often equated with bravery, sexual domination, and protective about honour, being able and willing to face the dangers. By teaching all these traits to men, they are taught to be assertive, while women are forced to be passive. Machismo might lead to a man being the total opposite of hypersensitive, often resorting to violence as a form of expressing his feelings (Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005).

Masculinity has different interpretations depending on cultures and history. However, the basic frame of the term is quite similar, generally and contributes to strengthening gender roles by attributing a particular gender with a set of traits and responsibilities (Dornan, 2004; Kaufman, 2015). This definition of masculinity certainly fits well within the South Asian concept of what a man should be and is echoed in the Bollywood movie portrayals of the "perfect man" – which will be discussed later in the paper. In South Asian cultures, the concept of masculinity is taken very seriously and if a man fails to display the right masculine characteristics, he is instantly considered an outcast and is made a subject of public ridicule. (Dornan, 2004; Kaufman, 2015). As we will later discuss in the discussions section, a man who cannot identify with these set masculine traits is mocked and deemed less of a man – something also echoed time and again in the Bollywood movies discussed in this paper.

The cinematic portrayal of these strict categorisation of masculine traits into a mould of hegemonic masculinity can lead to men feeling the need to perform a certain kind of masculinity. Much like the case of discontent over female bodies, males also face the same malaise over their physiques and bodies. While in the case of females, such discontent leads to issues like anorexia nervosa, in order to achieve a thin frame; in the case of males to achieve masculine bodily features, phenomena like muscle dysmorphia are witnessed. According to various researches, the reason why most males are unsatisfied with their bodies is the socially constructed concept of masculinity and its connection with body image (Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005; Kapoor, 2017).

Bollywood and Masculinity

For decades, Bollywood movies are infamously portraying a hegemonic and toxic form of masculinity. The male protagonist is a tall, muscular fellow with a carefully crafted body, sporting a set of abs and bulging muscles. Someone who can conveniently beat up a hundred bad guys with one hand and refuse to die even after bullets pierce his body. This toughness is not limited just to the sculpted bodies of the heroes; it expands to all other parts of their personality too. A quintessential Bollywood hero will be rowdy, full of revenge for the wrongs done to him and his loved one, assertive and angry (Shandilya, 2014). Not only this, the cute looks of this hero will also allow him to get away with harassing and stalking the women as a gesture of love. In his show Satyamev Jayate, Aamir Khan, one of the leading Bollywood stars admitted that Bollywood movies, teach the audiences that if they harass and stalk women, they would fall in love with them. He later apologised for having worked in such movies himself (Lakshami, 2014).

A United Nations [UN] report in 2014 revealed, "Deep-seated discrimination, pervasive stereotyping, sexualisation of women and their underrepresentation in powerful roles by the international film industry" (Singh, 2014). The study by UN especially notes the overall high depiction of women as a sexual object, rather than on empowering

roles. The male-centric movies produced by Bollywood can itself be traced back to the Hindi culture, where patriarchy reigns supreme and the alpha male is thought to be a brave person who fights for whatever is his and is often a hero (Vetticad, 2016). Keeping this in mind, men often take the leading position in the Hindi cinema, where the hero, as described by Vetticad (2016), is "north Indian, Hindu, upper-caste, heterosexual men marked out by their ability and desire to be the sole breadwinner, protector and head of a household, to fight wars if they are aristocrats, to single-handedly bash up dozens of goons and/or to woo women to the point of hounding them." This can be evident from Akshay Kumar's Holiday, where he stalks the heroine and kisses her forcefully in the public, or Salman Khan lifting Jacqueline Fernandez's skirt in Kick - all they are in for is to be won over by the hero (Vetticad, 2016).

Among other traits depicted in Bollywood movies that are taught to be "masculine", one is their body image. The idea of a "masculine physique" is dominated by hefty sizes, through movies and action figures, is shown to be a bulky body with beefed up muscles. While men are expected to look in a certain way, they are forced to repress their emotions, act cold and should not get swayed by their feelings. This objectification of a male's body then result in men striving to achieve the ideal and upon failing to do so, they end up under severe societal pressure, resulting in depression, self-imposed isolation, low on self-esteem and often going for unhealthy means to achieve that body image (Deus, 2012: Miller, 1998).

Bodybuilding Culture in Pakistan

Bodybuilding can be defined as the use of "progressive resistance exercise" to develop the muscles (Emery, 2003). This exercise is done using dumbbells, barbells, machine stations, gradually increasing the weight. If it is done effectively using proper diet and control, the body can transform, enhancing a man's overall look. Although bodybuilding is mostly exercised for health and fitness purposes, there are certain sports related to it – competitions and powerlifting (Emery, 2003).

History of bodybuilding in the Subcontinent can be traced back to the 11th century when men used dumbbells made up of wood to enhance their physiques. However, bodybuilding as a sport was developed in the 19th century. After the partition, a Health Culture Movement was started in 1948 at Bagh-e- Jinnah, Lahore. Soon afterwards, when the youth in Lahore responded with great fervour, more clubs were opened all over the city. First competition can be traced to have occurred in 1952, titled Mr Lahore. Following its success, the competition was expanded to the provincial level, as Mr Punjab was organized soon after. The same year, in December, the first ever Mr. Pakistan contest was organized in Lahore by Pakistan Amateur Bodybuilders Association. In 1995, when the fourth annual Mr. Pakistan was organized, it became the well-attended contest, with 55 bodybuilders taking part from all over the country. Bodybuilding has been especially popular in the Punjab region of Pakistan and it can be said that the country has a long history attached with bodybuilding (Verkaaik, 2013).

Research Questions

1. What is the impact of Bollywood movies on the existent bodybuilding culture in Pakistan?

2. What role does Bollywood culture play in strengthening the gender-related stereotypes in Pakistani male population?

Literature Review

Since the focus of this research is on the stereotypical ideas of masculinity, it is important to explore the role played by media in promoting certain gender-related stereotypes. Some of the most popular gender-related stereotypes include "boys will be boys" or "girls should not get dirty", lying bare the socially constructed ideas about gender. This section reviews the existing literature on this topic in order to

understand the phenomenon of masculinity and body imagery, and their relationship with Bollywood cinema.

Prevalent depiction of genders in media portray a woman as caring, polite, cooperative, conscious about the way she looks and is overly sensitive. On the contrary, a man is often portrayed as someone very rational, competent, assertive, and good in everything (Foss, 2008; Mishkind, Rodin, Silberstein, & Striegel-Moore, 1986) Women are often portrayed as sex objects in media, where most of the times, their bodies are shown unnecessarily. However, over the past few years, male bodies have also been presented as "erotic spectacle and commodity", changing the overall idea and experience of masculinity (Kapoor, 2017; Verkaaik, 2013).

Bollywood in Pakistan

The Bollywood industry and its course of action have deeply integrated themselves into the Pakistani society. There is a large audience of Bollywood cinema in Pakistan and a huge amount of fan following for the Bollywood actors and actresses. The cinemas in Pakistan are also reliant on Bollywood films in order to survive (Juni, 2014). This is because the film industry in Pakistan is not producing enough content to keep the cinema business running. According to Juni (2014), Bollywood films and music have heavily influenced the Pakistani society over the past few years. From Indian music being played in local festivities to Pakistani channels airing Indian entertainment shows to Bollywood films heavily appreciated by masses in Pakistan, different segments of the society in Pakistan are definitely contingent on Indian industry mediums for their daily dose of entertainment (Hussain, 2017).

The popularity of Bollywood films can be judged from their box office collections in Pakistan. PK collected around 19 crore INR in Pakistan, followed closely by Dhoom 3, which collected 12 crore INR. Shah Rukh Khan's Don 2 managed to collect more than 4 crore INR (Nagpal, 2015).

41

The Bollywood Connection

To understand the phenomenon of movie-going, it is important to understand the idea of identification. Over the past decade, the definition of an ideal hero in Bollywood has transformed from the lover-boy like Aman in Kal Ho Na Ho to Chulbul Pandey in Dabangg. While the trend of Bollywood heroes going shirtless is very old, Shah Rukh Khan was the first one to develop the modern-day 8 pack-abs for his Om Shanti Om song, Dard-e-Disco. Om Shanti Om grossed 1.5 Billion INR worldwide, becoming the highest grossing movie at the time of its release (PlanetBollywood, 2007).

Ghajini was released only few months after Om Shanti Om, again with Aamir Khan with a hefty body and often shirtless. It broke all existing box office records by crossing the 100-crore mark in India. Ghajini was also released in Pakistan, amid heightened political tensions between India and Pakistan. India Express, an India daily reported that it opened to good response from the audience and continued running in the cinemas for more than three weeks. The report said: Ghajini' opened to a good response three weeks ago and most Pakistanis are raving about the film (The Indian Express, 2009).

Salman Khan's bodyguard, which was released in 2011 opened to rave reviews in Pakistan, with movie grossing 50 million rupees on its first day. (Dawn, 2011). In Bodyguard, Salman Khan is again a muscular bodyguard who is supposed to protect a woman. In its title song, he wiggles his heavily built biceps to the tunes of music. Salman Khan Starrers Dabangg and Dabangg 2 broke all the existing box office records at the time in Pakistan, with the second part grossing PKR 1 crore on the opening day. Both the films end with a fight where Salman Khan, showing his heavily built, muscular body fights the villain and ends up winning (Indicine, 2013). Salman Khan's Sultan, which is about a wrestler's life, has become the biggest grossing movie in Pakistan, earning more than 300 million (Aijaz, 2016).

Such movies finding success in Pakistan points towards the acceptance they found among the audiences, resulting in the increase in gym-going population. Herald's Umer Ali visited Gujranwala – a city famous of its pehalwani and bodybuilding – and discovered serious Bollywood influence on the gym culture there (Miller, 1998; Ali, 2016).

Ali (2016) argues that a significant increase in the gym-going population after Dabangg and Dabangg 2. Several gym owners confirmed to (Ali, 2016) that "many of the trainees come here with the sole purpose of looking like Salman Khan. Their haircuts and facial hair are all in the fashion of Chulbul Pandey."

Bollywood movies are popular all over the South Asian Diaspora and their popularity, especially in India has prompted many researches on their impact on the society. The continuous negative portrayal of women has led to the validation of women as inferior beings and it has reinforced the idea that this is natural (Kapoor, 2017). Apart from being depicted as inferior beings, women are also sexually objectified. They are strategically placed in the movie to cater to the "male gaze" (Khan & Taylor, 2018).

In her essay titled "Visual Pleasures and Narrative Cinema", Mulvey (1975), proposed that women are mostly portrayed as an object of the male sexual desire and her own desires or feelings are not as important as the pleasure of the heterosexual, male audience. In Bollywood movies, the heroine is, with few exceptions, always secondary and lower than the hero. Her role in most Bollywood movies is given in the context of a male protagonist, whose role is central to the script. Females are rarely given roles where they hold their own, independent existence (Khan & Taylor, 2018). However, in the recent years, male body has also been eroticised. Like Shah Rukh Khan showing his six pack abs in "Dard- e-disco" from Om Shanti Om is placed for the pleasure of female audiences (Roy, 2010).

Movies like Kuch Kuch Hota Hai "reinforce conventional gender constructions". Hero, named Rahul is an urban, straight male, who is friends with a tomboyish girl Anjali (who is in love with Rahul), falls in

love with Tina after she proves to him that she's a good Indian woman. Meanwhile, Anjali tries to conform to Rahul's beauty standards but fails. Heartbroken, Anjali goes away from his life. Years later, she has now become "womanly" and is about to get married to another man but in a "giving-a-bride-over" scene, her fiancé takes her to Rahul, with whom she gets married (Ciecko, 2001). Similarly, when someone watches a Hindu film, they respond to it and interpret it, first as a man or a woman and other aspects of your identity might be irrelevant in your interpretation of a film. Contrary to these urban college-going type heroes, is the brand of heroes like Chulbul Pandey in Dabangg, who are hyper-masculine, have beefed-up bodies, are the agency for goodness and fight the evil. Girls often swoon over them and they decide which girl they want to be with, not the other way around. Movies like these in India all over the world have led to a crisis of body image among the male movie-going population (Ciecko, 2001).

It is generally thought that body dissatisfaction is a problem associated only with the females. However, several researches have shown that men are also a victim of body dissatisfaction and this rate is fast increasing (Primus, 2014). According to a Psychology Today survey conducted in 1997, around 47% of men were dissatisfied with their bodies. However, Primus (2014) argues that the numbers could be much higher because many men would be too embarrassed to talk about these issues, in an attempt to avoid being mocked as "gay" or "girlie".

Male becoming overly body conscious has been explained by Threatened Masculinity Theory (Mills & D'alfonso, 2007), which explains that with the growing popularity of the feminist movement, women are now standing shoulder-to-shoulder with men and are no more dependent on them. The roles like being the breadwinner and a "man", which were a way for men to assert their muscularity, have now diminished, forcing them to look for other avenues to do so. According to Mills & D'alfonso (2007), failure to distinguish themselves from women leads men to focus on their bodies, as a way of regaining their masculinity and express it more assertively.

Psychoanalysis by Badinter reveals that the male body consciousness is also an attempt of men to differentiate themselves from women. Since men come from female bodies, they struggle to disenchant themselves from female body, to assert their masculinity (Rodgers, 1995). Validating this argument, Primus (2014) believes that as men look at muscularity as an avenue to express their masculinity, the ideal male body image in media has also changed to a muscular one, as few studies indicate that male models are now becoming increasingly muscular and losing body fat. This heavily muscular body depicted in media is unnatural, as it is unattainable by most of the men. A barrage of these body images makes men to believe that should also achieve such bodies, and upon failing to do so, lead to male body dissatisfaction (Mishkind, Rodin, Silberstein, & Striegel-Moore, 1986).

Similarly, Bollywood movies, having a large audience in Pakistan, have influenced the cultural transformation of the country (Matusitz & Payano, 2012). From Bollywood male heroes like Shahrukh Khan and Salman Khan becoming household names in Pakistan to Bollywood dialogues being a part of the daily life, Bollywood movies have a sweeping influence in the cinemagoers. According to Juni (2014), 72% of Pakistanis use CDs to watch Bollywood movies. 67% of them watch Bollywood movies with the sole purpose of entertainment, while 13% watch for the sake of education and 20% for information.

Pakistani cinemas mostly show Bollywood movies, as the quantity of Pakistani movies produced per year is very low and Hollywood movies don't attract mass audiences. Pakistani cinemas depend on Bollywood movies for survival (Juni, 2014). Apart from the cinemas, Pakistani TV channels also have agreements with Bollywood production houses and regularly showcase Bollywood movies.

A study about the impact of Bollywood movies on the cultural transformation in Pakistan by Juni (2014) revealed that an average male spends 6-7 hours a week watching Bollywood movies. It also indicated that the day-to-day interaction of Pakistani youth is influenced by the

45

Indian movies. The study further revealed that the dressing choices of the Pakistani youth were heavily affected by the India movies.

With this sort of cultural impact of Bollywood movies on the Pakistani audiences, one of the research questions for this thesis are highlighted once again; do Bollywood movies affect the bodybuilding culture in Pakistan? Several studies suggest that the image of a hero has changed over time in Bollywood movies. According to Kavi (2000), the difference between male Bollywood heroes can be judged by two movies which are a few decades apart. In Achyut Kanya released in 1940, Ashok Kumar's body is always covered, while in Salman Khan's Judwa produced in 1990, he's shown shirtless at every chance. This phenomenon is often referred to as the "eroticisation of male body" (Kavi, 2000).

Salman Khan's movies from 2014 to 2017 are prime examples of this phenomenon. According to Shandilya (2014), Khan is an action hero who cracks jokes with the villain while showing off his impeccable abs and saving the damsel in distress. This larger than life persona that he creates on screen with his movies Ready, Bodyguard, Ek Tha Tiger, Dabangg 2, have launced Khan into super-stardom. In these movies, the plot revolves around the muscular heroes who express their masculinity through fighting off with the villains; the fight sequence itself is focused on two male bodies, both "inviolable and impenetrable". However, the hero succeeds in violating the body of the villain and succeeds (Shandilya, 2014).

Like the hyperbolising of women body creates a distance between a woman and her body, allowing the audience to her femininity as being constructed, same is the case with the male body in action films. These films limit the masculinity to the depiction of bodily strength and physical power. These visuals, when seen on screen, move the male audiences to aspire for such body, leading them to practice hardcore bodybuilding, which often comes at a cost. Depending how an individual approaches bodybuilding, it can either just be a pastime or a sport. However, the "talent" in bodybuilding is based mostly on the appearance of a bodybuilder. In bodybuilding competitions, the focus is on

individuals, rather than teams, so bodybuilders tend to go to extreme positions to show their muscles in the best possible way (Denham, 2008).

Historically, bodybuilding has prevailed due to the fear of male bodily degeneration, in the context that male body has always been an avenue for men to express their sexuality. In the West, First World War gave a chance for men to reclaim their masculinity through bodybuilding. This, however, was different from the traditional definition of masculinity, as this time, equipped with muscular body, it was modernised and sexualised (Carden-Coyen, 2009).

According to Verkaaik (2013), bodybuilding is cultural product, in which the practitioners, either males or females, feel insecure about themselves, so they compensate this insecurity through showcasing their bodies in the public. It can also be the result of feeling powerless, hence muscular bodies become symbolic to power. While the male bodybuilders may want to look like Salman Khan in Dabangg, bodybuilding physique can be transformed through training, diet and at times taking drugs, the final shape, however, depends on the genetics. Hence, the result of a male bodybuilder can never be exact version of his idealized image, in this case Salman Khan (Verkaaik, 2013).

When this audience fails to achieve the desired results, they shift towards the use of unhealthy drugs and practices, for example steroids, to achieve the type of bodies they see in the movies. Several studies have shown the relation of eating disorders and plastic surgery with the body image disorders and how it might result in the use of steroids and practices by bodybuilders (Keane, 2005).

According to Keane (2005), steroid use is linked to a prevalent syndrome known as muscle dysmorphia. The dangers linked to the use of steroids are more than one. Male bodybuilders abusing anabolic may develop the female breast tissue, as their use starts interfering with the regular production of testosterone. Steroids are a shortcut for the younger bodybuilders who might aspire to look like the heroes they see on TV. Instead of training for years, doing different sorts of exercises to

develop a natural body, many would seek one pill that is going to speed up their way to the glory (Denham, 2008). The overuse of steroids also causes aggression, narcissism, hostility and irritability. Like drugs, the absence of steroids also causes anxiety, as the users crave for it. Muscle dysmorphia is based on the false ideas of body image as perceived in media texts. When suffering from this syndrome, one cannot see their body as it is in reality and rather see it as defected, due to their perception of a good body (Keane, 2005).

Another side effect of steroids is roid-rage, which is a psychological effect, where the users of steroids react in extremely angry manners. The term was first used in 1980s, when several bodybuilders were found to be committing violent crimes. The users cannot control their impulse and overreact in most situations. However, many researchers believe that such side-effects exist only in those who excessively use the steroids (Dhar, 2013)

The literature reviewed suggest a significant link between the male body image and the idea of masculinity, how it is promoted in Bollywood movies and how the audiences keenly perceive these media texts as reality, attempting to achieve the same body and may end up using anabolic steroids, indulging into unhealthy practices, which results in affecting their health.

Findings and Discussion

This chapter consists of the critical discussion and analysis of the findings of the research. According to the findings, 40% of the men have joined the gyms in less than a year, and 21% have been going to gyms for 1-2 years. Comparatively, only 3% of the respondents have been going to gyms for more than 5 years, which indicates that the gym culture is only growing popular now and might not have been popular enough 5 years ago. Both Sultan and Dangal were released in less than a year, indicating an apparent effect on the gym-going trends. 18% of the men spend more than 2 hours in the gym on a daily basis, which indicates the importance

of gym in their lives. While a majority, 41% of the respondents spend less than one hour in the gyms, indicating that they come for fitness, 4% of them spend more than 3 hours in the gym. Majority of the respondents were not too highly educated, which could be one reason why films had an impact on their lives, as they failed to watch them critically. Findings of the survey reveal that the Social Learning and Imitation Theory is at work here, as the body builders follow what they see on the screen.

One of the research questions for this study was to analyse the impact of Bollywood movies on the bodybuilding culture in Pakistan. 68% of the respondents of the survey, who were bodybuilders from Gujranwala, agreed and strongly agreed that Bollywood movies are a great source of entertainment. These findings match the findings of Juni (2014), who also stated that Bollywood movies had a large audience in Pakistan. Only 18% of the respondents disagreed with the statement that Bollywood movies are a great source of entertainment, and 10% remained neutral. One of the main focuses of this study has been the impact of Salman Khan's movies on the bodybuilding culture, as it has been identified in the literature review that his movies have depicted a very hyper- masculine hero, and very stereotypical gender roles. As per the responses of the bodybuilders, 49% of them believe Salman Khan has the best body among the other Bollywood actors. John Abraham is the second most popular actor among the bodybuilders in Gujranwala, 29% of them believe he has the best body among his rivals. 17% of the respondents believed Hrithik Roshan had the best body, while only 4% voted for Vidyut Jammwal, who has very pumped body, but is not too popular as yet. Salman Khan is mostly known as "Salman Bhai" among his fans, which exist in large numbers in Pakistan as well, as indicated by the findings of this study. The line between the screen and reality gets blurred, enabling the audiences to see Salman Khan as one of their own, thus they try to imitate him. This corresponds to the imitation theory, which states that humans tend to learn and imitate what they see around them. This can turn toxic, as the real-life persona of Salman Khan would be completely different, and it will be like chasing the wrong ideals.

Salman Khan has become a very popular phenomenon among Pakistani male, gym-going population, as 70% of the respondents believe that Salman Khan is the most masculine hero of all times. 73% of the respondents also believe that when the audiences see Salman Khan on the screen, performing different stunts, depicting a hyper-masculine persona, they are inspired to follow him. Salman Khan's last film Sultan, which broke all box office records in Pakistan and was about the life of a wrestler, is a huge hit in Gujranwala, and was 87% of the respondents have watched it. Only 12% of the respondents disagree that Sultan can inspire men to join gyms, while 83% of them agree that Sultan inspires men to join gyms. It is important to note here that while Bollywood movies did inspire many men to join the gyms, the obsession with body was always there in the society.

77% of the respondents agree that the physique built by Salman Khan must be followed by everyone. These results clearly show that Salman Khan has a massive following in the city of Gujranwala and most bodybuilders either join gyms after looking him in screen or get inspiration from him and workout harder to become like him. Salman Khan also appeared shirtless during as early as 1990, but his success started with Wanted. According to Shandilya (2014), his success could be due to the introduction of a masti genre, in which violence has been shown as a fun part of the film. According to Roy (2010), these movies are a continuation of the trend where the male bodies have been eroticised.

This study attempted to explore if the male gym-going population in Gujranwala liked Bollywood heroes due to their well-built bodies. 38% of the respondents strongly agree and 42% of them agree that Bollywood heroes look attractive and masculine due to their well-built bodies. This indicates the prevalent mind-set among the youth in Gujranwala in which they see masculinity through the lens of body imagery. The impact of this type of Bollywood heroes is demonstrated when 38% of the respondents strongly agree and 49% of them agree that these muscular heroes inspire the movie-goers to join gyms. Only 5% of the respondents disagreed that such body imagery depicted in the

films doesn't inspire anyone to join the gyms. Most gyms in Gujranwala are mostly abuzz with Bollywood songs, ranging from rap to item songs and these songs were instilling passion and fervour among the audiences.

52% of the respondents strongly agree with the statement that muscular Bollywood heroes are a role model for people, and 32% of the agree with it. This is a clear indicator of the extent to which certain Bollywood movies have influenced the male gym-going population in Gujranwala.

One of the research questions asked in this study is, if Bollywood movies are complicit in promoting certain gender-related stereotypes in Pakistan. 35% of the respondents strongly agree and 35% of them agree that shirtless heroes shown in the Bollywood movies are true depictions of a real man. 10% of the respondents remained neutral, while only 20% of them disagreed with the statement. It shows a clear trend that along with the depiction of beefed-up bodies and inspiring men to join the gyms, Bollywood movies have also promoted a stereotypical idea of masculinity, where the real is supposed to have a well-built, muscular body. The heroes going shirtless are particularly shown as an important moment in the film.

As a continuation of the same trend, 44% of the respondents strongly agree and 40% agree that having a good body is synonymous to being manly. These ideas can become very dangerous for men, in what is known as toxic masculinity (Miller, 1998).

The gender-related stereotypes are strengthened further by Bollywood movies showing women finding heroes with well-built bodies to be attractive. These stereotypes resonate among the gym-goers of Gujranwala, where 80% of the respondents agree that women do find men with good bodies to be attractive. Female characters are mostly shown inferior to their male protagonists and are present in movies just to support and further the agendas of the men (Khan & Taylor, 2018). For example, in Wanted, Salman Khan is the protagonist, and the heroine falls for him because of his looks. In a song in Ramleela, when the

51

protagonist, Ranveer Singh takes his shirt off, women faint after looking at him. Apart from that, this also reveals that Bollywood movies set certain unachievable standards for men. Mulvey (1975) introduced to the concept of male gaze, stating that women are shown in media as an object of male sexual desire (Khan & Taylor, 2018).

In movies like Dabangg, where the hero is asserting his wishes upon the heroine, threatening her to take the money or get slapped, has left a mark on the male Bollywood movie audiences in Gujranwala, as 78% of the respondents agree that a real man is assertive. This is quite revealing of the sort of stereotypes that the Bollywood movies are strengthening and enforcing in Pakistan. 84% of the respondents assert that a real man should have a strong body. When this is seen keeping the popularity of Bollywood movies in view, it can be said that Bollywood movies depict a masculinity that revolves around strong bodies, hence there is a popular belief among the bodybuilders that they should have a strong body to be a real man, strengthening the stereotypes related to gender roles.

As Bollywood movies mostly depict men to be dominant in their lives, the influence is evident on the viewers in Gujranwala, 47% of whom strongly agree and 41% agree that a real man is dominant in all walks of life – a concept known as Alpha male. Alpha male is known to be all powerful, all conquering, who single-handedly take on 10 men – aggressive and dominant.

As identified in the literature review, bodybuilders may resort to extreme dieting regimes, using supplements and steroids in order to achieve a certain look. 93% of the respondents agree that it is important to follow a strict dieting regime to achieve a certain look. On the question of supplements, 50% of the respondents agree that it is important to take them, while 38% disagree with the statement that it is important to take supplements.

The side-effects and harmfulness of steroids have been discussed in detail in the literature review. As many bodybuilders take them, they are not really aware of their side-effects. 33% of the respondents were

fully aware, and 33% of partially aware, a quarter of the respondents were not aware at all about the side-effects of the steroids. Despite a majority of the respondents being aware of their side-effects, 68% of them agreed that it was important for the bodybuilders to take steroids to take part in bodybuilding competitions. Only 20% of the respondents conflicted the statement that bodybuilders have to take steroids while taking part in the competitions.

Some bodybuilders quite often take sex tablets like testosterone, while working out. As shown in the (32% of the respondents agree that it is important to take sex tablets, while 52% were neutral. Only 16% of the bodybuilders disagreed with this statement, which shows the ideas that have taken roots in the younger generations.

25% of the bodybuilders were not aware of the effects at all, while 42% were only partially aware. Helen Keane (2005), who studied the steroids users and found them to be extremely violent and antisocial. She also notes that the steroid users went to extremes of personality disorders, as some of them were hyper-masculine, while the others were hyper-feminine.

The social learning theory introduced by Albert Bandura in 1971 was applied in this research. Every human being, like learning from other external factors, also learns and imitates what they see in their surroundings. According to Bandura (1971), man's behavioural patterns can change through experiencing something directly, or by learning something new by observing others around him.

A person, unless he is attentive, cannot learn from his surroundings. He can only learn if he attends to or is able to recognize the features of his model's behaviour. After he has given enough attention to the model, then comes the retention stage, where he remembers the behaviour of his model. A motivation is needed to imitate the act of his act, which if present, can lead to reproduction (Bandura, 1971).

This theory was applied in this research and it was theorised that the male gym-going population in Gujranwala was inspired by Bollywood movies to join the gyms. Watching a Salman Khan movie in the cinema, seeing his hyper-masculine, muscular persona on screen, it is theorised that men in Gujranwala learnt from him and decided to imitate him, thus joined the gyms in an attempt to look like him.

Several experiments have shown that if children are exposed to violent behaviour in films, they tend to be aggressive immediately after watching it (Huesmann, 2005). This can also be viewed through the theory of social construction of gender. Many researchers believe that gender roles are socially constructed, and the society decides how a man, or a woman should behave. Social constructionism is the idea that people take things as "real", which they see as being practiced in the society.

The ways through which gender roles are constructed can be divided into two parts. First is the materialist theory, which discusses the structures upon which the social environments function to perpetuate gender roles, and second is the discursive theories, discuss the meanings taken from language and culture to associate them to a certain gender (Alsop, Fitzsimons, & Lennon, 2002). The gender is defined only in the two binaries of male and female, which are defined by the way one behaves, talks, eats and dresses. The stereotypical definition of gender sees women as submissive and quiet, while men are expected to be strong and bold. These traits are constructed socially, and the individuals are not given the chance to decide their own identity (Connell& Messerschmidt, 2005).

If a person believes that he's capable of doing what he observed by the model, there is a more chance that he is going to imitate. Bandura (1971) named this phenomenon as "self-efficacy" and defined is as "people's beliefs about their capabilities to produce designated levels of performance that exercise influence over events that affect their lives." This can be applied on the population of this research, as the motive of men joining the gyms was to look like Salman Khan and other muscular

Bollywood heroes, and in order to do so, they opt for unnatural ways like taking supplements and steroids.

Due to the influence of mass media, social learning theory is also applied on their effects on human behaviour. Media has become a very important tool to influence the choices made by everyone. In this age, people are bombarded by messages from print, electronic and social media, which subconsciously affects their choices (O'Rorke, 2006). Several big industries, like fashion or food are heavily reliant on the same phenomenon. This way, through advertising a certain brand for example, some ideas like masculinity can be associated with that brand (Bandura, 2002).

Several research studies conducted in the past have shown that movies affect audiences in general and young audiences in particular. After watching movies, young audience members are more likely to imitate what they see on screen and even indulge into unhealthy practices. These studies used various models of "media effects" to establish the influence of visuals on the behaviour of younger audiences, especially in terms of sex, action, aggression and violence (Juni, 2014). However, talking specifically about young Hindi film viewers, Kapoor (2017) argues that younger audiences make out different meanings from the movie narratives and their interpretation of romantic and violent scenes can be poles apart from each other, depending on the intersecting factors of their identities; their ages, socio-economic background and other life experiences. With this sort of effect on the behaviour of the audiences, mass media also promotes various stereotypes, which may include a typical depiction of an object, idea, belief or a community.

Conclusion

As the reviewed literature found out, Bollywood movies are extremely popular in Pakistan and have created a niche of their own. While the society is already patriarchal and has internalised the stereotypical ideas of masculinity, it is further strengthened by the depiction of manhood in

most of the Bollywood movies, where the hero is muscular, aggressive, assertive, and dominant over the heroine and over people around him. In particular, Salman Khan is the most popular actor among the male gym-going population of Gujranwala.

The stereotypical idea of masculinity has found fertile ground in Gujranwala, and it is further strengthened by the Bollywood movies. It is evident from the responses that Bollywood heroes are found attractive due to their well-built bodies, and having a good body is synonymous to being manly and dominant. The survey also revealed that 78% believe a real man is assertive. As the theory applied in this research was social learning theory, it has thus been proven that it works on this context of the study and the men in Gujranwala learnt these ideas from the society; movies being a big part of it. The survey also revealed the tendency of men in Gujranwala to use steroids and how they impact the health.

To conclude, the survey results have answered the research questions regarding the impact of Bollywood movies on the bodybuilding culture in Pakistan, the role they play in strengthening the gender-related stereotypes and in addressing the possible connection between bodybuilding and masculinity. It has been proven through data that Bollywood movies play a major role in inspiring men to join the gyms and look like the heroes they see on the screen. Apart from inspiring men to join the gyms, movies also formulate their worldviews regarding what the real man is, how he behaves and looks. Bollywood movies also set the standard for an ideal body image, which the men in Gujranwala attempt to imitate, and during the process, face adverse effects, especially on their health.

Work Cited

Aijaz, R. (2016, July 19). *'Sultan' Makes Rs 300m on Pakistani Box Office*. Retrieved from The Express Tribune: https://tribune.com.pk/story/1144999/winning-streak-sultan-makes-rs-300m-%20pakistani-box-office

Ali, U. (2016, July 14). *A Body Blow: The Deadly Practices Among Bodybuilders in Punjab*. Retrieved from Herald: http://herald.dawn.com/news/1153619

Alsop, R., Fitzsimons, A., & Lennon, K. (2002). *Theorizing Gender.* Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bandura, A. (1971). *Social Learning Theory.* New York: General Learning Press.

Bandura, A. (2002). Social Cognitive Theory of Mass Communication. In J. Bryant, & D. Zillmann, *Media Effects: Advances in Theory and Research* (pp. 121-153). New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers.

Carden-Coyne, A. A. (2009). Classical Heroism and Modern Life: Bodybuilding and Masculinity in the Early Twentieth Century. *Journal of Australian Studies*, *23*(63), 138-149.

Ciecko, A. (2001). Superhit Hunk Heroes for Sale: Globalization and Bollywood's Gender Politics. *Asian Journal of Communication* , *11*(2), 121-143.

Connell, R. W., & Messerschmidt, J. W. (2005). Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept. *Gender and Society*, *19*(6), 829–859.

Dawn. (2011, September 04). *Eid Films: Revival or Survival of Cinema?* Retrieved from Dawn.com: https://www.dawn.com/news/656488/eid-films-revival-or-survival-of-cinema

Denham, B. E. (2008). Masculinities in Hardcore Bodybuilding. *Men and Masculinities*, *11*(2), 234–242.

Deus, P. (2012, March 18). *Whose Body Is This? Society's Ideal Male Body.* Retrieved from Bodybuilding.com: https://www.bodybuilding.com/fun/par34.html

Dhar, M. (2013, July 25). *Does 'Roid Rage' Really Exist?* Retrieved from Live Science: https://www.livescience.com/38354-what-is-roid-rage.html

Dornan, J. (2004). Blood from the Moon: Gender Ideology and the Rise of Ancient Maya Social Complexity. *Gender and History*. *16* (2), 459-475.

Emery, M. (2003). *Men's Bodybuilding: A Short History*. Retrieved from Men's Bodybuilding: A Short History: http://www.bodybuildingreviews.net/Bodybuilding.html

Foss, S. K. (2008). *Rhetorical Criticism: Exploration and Practice.* Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press Inc. .

Howse, C. (2012, November 01). *25 Characteristics of an Alpha Male*. Retrieved from Chad Howse Fitness: http://chadhowsefitness.com/2012/11/25-characteristics-of-an-alpha-male/

Huesmann, L. R. (2005). Imitation and the Effects of Observing Media Violence on Behavior. *Perspectives on Imitation: From Neuroscience to Social Science: Imitation, Human Development, and Culture*.

Hussain, T. (2017, February 26). *Pakistan's Forbidden Romance with Bollywood*. Retrieved from South China Morning Post: https://www.scmp.com/week-asia/society/article/2072968/pakistans-forbidden-romance-bollywood

Indicine. (2013). *Dabangg 2 Pakistan Box Office: Record Breaking Opening Day*. Retrieved from Indicine: https://www.indicine.com/movies/bollywood/dabangg-2-pakistan-box-office-record-breaking-opening-day/

Juni, M. S. (2014). Impact of Bollywood Movies on Cultural Transformation among Pakistani Youth in University of Sargodha's Students, Sargodha. *International Journal of Research*, *1*(9), 107-200.

Kapoor, H. (2017). The Bechdel in India: Gendered Depictions in Contemporary Hindi Cinema. *Journal of Gender Studies*, *26*(2), 212-226.

Kaufman, S. B. (2015, December 10). *The Myth of the Alpha Male*. Retrieved from Greater Good Magazine: https://greatergood.berkeley.edu/article/item/the_myth_of_the_alpha_male

Kavi, A. R. (2000). The Changing Image of the Hero in Hindi Films. *Journal of Homosexuality*, *39*(3-4), 307-312.

Keane, H. (2005). Diagnosing the Male Steroid User: Drug Use, Body Image and Disordered Masculinity. *Health*, *9*(2),189–208.

Khan , S., & Taylor, L. D. (2018). Gender Policing in Mainstream Hindi Cinema: A Decade of Central Female Characters in Top-Grossing

Bollywood Movies. *International Journal of Communication*, 12, 3641–3662.

Lakshami, R. (2014). *A lesson from a Bollywood star on what makes 'a real man'*. Retrieved from Washington Post:

https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2014/11/10/a-lesson- from-a-bollywood-star-on-what-makes-a-real-man/

Matusitz, J., & Payano, P. (2012). Globalisation Of Popular Culture: From Hollywood To Bollywood. *South Asia Research*, *32*(2), 123–138.

Miller, T. (1998). Commodifying the Male Body, Problematizing "Hegemonic Masculinity?". *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 22 (4), 431–446.

Mills, J. S., & D'alfonso, S. R. (2007). Competition and Male Body Image: Increased Drive for Muscularity Following Failure to a Female. *Journal of Social and Clinical Psychology*, *26*(4), 505-518.

Mishkind, M. E., Rodin, J., Silberstein, L. R., & Striegel-Moore, R. H. (1986). The Embodiment of Masculinity: Cultural, Psychological, and Behavioral Dimensions. *American Behavioral Scientist*, *29*(5), 545–562.

Mulvey, L. (1975). Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema. *Screen*, *16*(3), 6-18.

O'Rorke, K. (2006). Social Learning Theory & Mass Communication. *ABEA Journal*, 25, 72-74.

Primus, M. (2014). Body Dissatisfaction and Males: A Conceptual Model. *Scholarly Horizons*, 1, 1-24.

Nagpal, P. (2015). *8 Bollywood Movies That Rocked The Box Office Charts In Pakistan*.
Retrieved from SchoopWhoop:
https://www.scoopwhoop.com/entertainment/bollywood-movies-that-rocked-the- box-office-charts-in-pakistan/#.qmhzh7bus
PlanetBollywood. (2007). Retrieved from
http://planetbollywood.com/displayArticle.php?id=112707023731

Rodgers, C. (1995). Elisabeth Badinter and "The Second Sex": An Interview. *Signs*, *21*(1), 147-162.

Roy, A. G. (2010). *Bhangra Moves: From Ludhiana to London and Beyond.* New York: Ashgate Publishing .

Shandilya, K. (2014). Of Enraged Shirts, Gyrating Gangsters, and Farting Bullets: Salman Khan and the New Bollywood Action Film. *South Asian Popular Culture* , *12*(2), 111-121.

The Indian Express. (2009, January 21). *Forget Indo-Pak Tensions, Pakistanis Can't Resist Bollywood!* Retrieved from The Indian Express: http://archive.indianexpress.com/news/forget-indopak-tensions-pakistanis-cant-%20resist-bollywood-/413535/

Verkaaik, O. (2013). Notes on the Sublime: Aspects of Political Violence in Urban Pakistan. *South Asian Popular Culture*, *11*(2), 109-119.

Vetticad, A. M. (2016, May 31). *The Changing Face of 'Mardaangi' in Bollywood: Men May Now be Gentle, Gorgeous and/or Gay*. Retrieved from Firstpost: https://www.firstpost.com/entertainment/the-changing-face-of-mardaangi-in-bollywood-men-may-now-be-gentle-gorgeous-andor-gay-2808174.html

Üstsüz Erkekler: Pakistan'da Bollywood, Vücut Geliştirme ve Erkeklikler

Öz: Gujranwala, Pakistan'da güreşçileriyle bilinen bir şehirdir. Son birkaç senedir, geleneksel güreş, vücut geliştirmenin kentlileştirilmiş bir versiyonuna dönüşmeye başlasa da, erkek bedeni üzerindeki odakta bir değişme söz konusu değildir. Güreş ve vücut geliştirme faaliyetleri Gujranwala'da sadece birer spor faaliyeti olmaktan ziyade erkekliğin ve baskınlığın ifade edilmesi için birer araç olarak kullanılmaktadır. Kahramanın hiper maskülen, kaslı ve kendine güvenen erkekler olduğu Bollywood sinema kültüründeki erkeklik tipi Gujranwala'daki erkek izleyici kitlesinde oldukça popülerleşmiş durumdadır. Bu çalışma, Gujranwala'da hızlı gelişen spor salonu kültürü ve bahsi geçen Bollywood filmleri arasındaki bağlantıyı ve bu tarz filmlerde sunulan hegemonik erkekliğin Gujranwala'daki erkek izleyiciler tarafından nasıl yorumlandığını araştırmaktadır. Yüz vücut geliştiren erkeği kota örnekleme yoluyla dahil ederek bir anket araştırması uygulanmıştır. Araştırmanın sonuçları Bollywood sinemasının Gujranwala'da oldukça popüler olduğunu, vücut geliştiren erkeklerin bu filmlerde sunulan hegemonik bedenler ve davranışlar örüntülerini idealleştirdiğini ve bu erkeklik temsillerinin spor salonlarına kaydolma konusunda erkeklere ilham verdiğini göstermektedir.

Anahtar kelimeler: Bollywood filmleri, vücut geliştirme, erkeklik, erkek, Pakistan.

Resistant formations of alternative femininities within skateboarding — an exploration of gender at a time of feminist transformation

Yuliya Kulynych[*]

University of Manchester

Abstract: Based on semi-structured interviews with 8 female skateboarders, this paper offers an in-depth analysis into the physical and aesthetic practices of alternative femininities amongst women in a skateboarding community. Skateboarding sites are prominent carriers of alternative femininity because they allow women to reclaim traditionally masculine traits such as physical strength, resilience and assertiveness (Pavlidis and Fullagar, 2013) and in turn experiment with their gender performance by integrating these elements of masculinity within their gender identities. As a result, female skateboarders actively challenge sexist 'assumptions as to what their bodies can do' (Pavlidis and Fullagar, 2015: 10) and confront misleading stereotypes of physical fragility and mental weakness.This research will therefore provide an informative account into the ways in which skateboarding practices facilitate collective gender performance and with it resistance against male hegemony amongst women.

Keywords: Female masculinities, gender performance, resistance, feminism, skateboarding

---

[*] PhD student, Department of Geography. e-mail: yuliya.kulynych@hotmail.com

ORCID ID: 0000-0002-4044-7582

Introduction

This paper will examine the nuanced construction of alternative femininities within the gender normative structure of skateboarding. In particular it will explore formations of resistant femininities, which oppose the dominant hyper-feminine discourse and inevitably disrupt hegemonic gender relations (which symbolically confine women within the position of inferiority). This inquiry is particularly based on Connell's (1987) theory of gender hegemony, which suggests that emphasised femininity is organised "as an adaptation to men's power" (Schippers, 2007, p. 3), as it is rendered through expressive characteristics; such as being 'nurturing, sensitive, demure or sweet' (Windsor, 2015, p. 8). Connell (1987) argues that these characteristics simply do not hold the capacity to adequately compete with traditional masculine expressions of power; such as self-assertion, physical strength and emotional stoicism (Burn et al, 1996, p. 2). Such inability to compete ultimately situates the hyper-feminine gender expression/identity within a position of subordination. Therefore, in this work I have put Connell's (1987) theory into practice through a comprehensive exploration of the nuanced ways in which skater girls opposed certain elements of hyper-femininity and in turn creatively integrated elements of masculinity within their gender identities. Through this gender performance they resisted the exclusive male ownership of masculinity — by suggesting that masculinity is a mere collection of cultural practices, that can be taken up and enacted collectively by various gender groups (Schippers, 2007). The participants therefore viewed their femininity as a discourse that could be actively redefined, in relation to conventional masculine and feminine cultural expressions. Thus, while this project re-affirms and evidences theories on gender by Connell (1987), Schippers (2007) and Halberstam (1998) that I use to support this project — it also brings a new element which focuses on new forms of feminist resistance as utilised by the participants. Consequently, this work supports and evidences the argument made by some feminist scholars who argue for feminist resistance to have taken more of a decentralised and localised

form amongst young women today, in comparison to the former collectivist, second wave movement (Kelly et al, 2004; Harris, 2003). This work therefore contributes to sociological understandings of the changing mode of feminist resistance within everyday, local practices against the popular claim that young women have betrayed the legacy of political action and "have no politics to speak of at all" (Kelly et al, 2004, p. 3). Consequently, the originality of this paper lies in its examination of the ways in which oppositional skater femininities are reshaping contemporary feminist ideologies with their complex forms of gender performance and views on gender inequality. Therefore, by putting Connell's (1987) theory into practice this work has the potential to refine sociological interpretations of hegemonic gender relations and the ways in which those could be challenged through resistant, feminist action.

Sport as a site of male hegemony

Most academic literature on sport studies has widely conveyed that women have historically been excluded from participation in mainstream sports (Beal, 1992), as a way of restricting their bodies from strong and powerful feminine expressions. Beal and Wheaton (2003) write that in the 19th Century women were advised by medical doctors to avoid physical exercise, because it was believed to "damage their reproductive system and contribute to 'mannishness" (Beal and Wheaton, 2003, p. 50). Such institutional suppression of masculine behaviour served to confine women within weak and docile modes of hyper-femininity, as a way of denying them access to masculine expressions — such as physical strength, competitiveness and bravery. Hyper-femininity is therefore enacted through the embodiment of 'expressive' characteristics and has historically been idealised in terms of "delicacy, dreaminess and sexual passivity" (Conboy et al, 1997, p. 94). Such feminine discourse has been particularly reinforced by the post-feminist promise of sexual attractiveness as a determinant of a successful experience of womanhood; which can only be attained

through the purchase of goods that guarantee sexual appeal — as an ideal norm of femininity (Velding, 2014).[1] Thus, such such form of femininity positions itself as polar opposite to maleness and therefore preserves masculinity's hegemony and exclusivity within the male body. Therefore, the institutionalisation of these practices presents femininity as an ideological construction, which is structurally and symbolically confined to a narrow version of hetero-normative expressions — that are essentially constructed to compliment masculinity.

As a result, Beaver (2016) in his comprehensive work on femininities within sport has suggested that sportswomen are often required to display normative, hyper-feminine appearance; such as wearing make-up or pink uniforms, as a way of proving that they are 'still essentially feminine', despite a contradictory performance of masculine behaviour (Beaver, 2016, p. 3). Jan Felshin (Beaver, 2016, p. 3) deems this strategy as 'apologetic', where sportswomen apologise for their controversial embodiments of masculinity, which deviate from their social roles as women. Sportswomen are therefore more readily recognised as athletes, when they exhibit traditionally feminine characteristics, such as "grace, beauty, charm and balance" (Beal, 1992: 172), often through the participation in feminised sports like gymnastics or figure skating.

Furthermore, Vikki Krane (2001) argues that such display of heteronormative, hyper-feminine appearance often results in sportswomen being "sexualised, trivialised and devalued" (Krane, 2001, p. 9) by their male counterparts. Indeed, sportswomen are often perceived in sexual terms, which inevitably discredit their athletic ability and reduce them to objects of male desire (Beaver, 2016). According, to Connell (1987) this is because hyper-femininity is "organised as an

64

[1] Post-feminist, feminine ideal is defined by a slim, beautiful and sexually available female who seeks empowerment from her hyper-feminine appearance (Gill, 2007). The post-feminist movement/theory argues that women can now freely reclaim their hyper-feminine identities as powerful in opposition to the second wave feminist thinking which deemed hyper-femininity as oppressive and in line with heterosexist standards.

adaptation to men's power", and is "oriented to accommodate the interests and desires of men'' (Connell, 1987, p. 183). Connell's (1987) theory therefore poses an important critique on the post-feminist theory, which presents hyper-femininity as an empowering and liberatory identity (Gill, 2007). Connell asserts that such hyper-feminine gender identity/expression is "not in much of a state to establish hegemony'' (Connell, 1987, p. 188) over masculinities, because it is ideologically constructed to complement male hegemony.

Consequently, such feminine requirement in mainstream sport, enables men to position themselves as polar opposite to femininity, and therefore assert expressions of masculinity as natural preserves of the male body. Thus, by rendering physical prowess and competitiveness as natural and fixed possessions of masculinity, sport has traditionally acted as a site in which men exercised their presumably biological superiority over women. Halberstam (1998) argues that this strategy has enabled men to symbolically distance their natural maleness from dominant notions of femininity and therefore "stand unchallenged as the ultimate bearer of power" (Halberstam, 1998, p. 5). Consequently, Atencio et al (2009) argue that such relentless exclusion of women from aggressive sports, has enabled sportsmen to conjure their own masculine habitus within the field. Particularly, by constructing 'idealised practices and taste distinctions' as exclusive markers of symbolic capital, in opposition to women's habitus, which was deemed as "lacking in skill'' (Atencio et al, 2009, p. 2) and cultural power. This brief discussion of the existing academic literature within the field suggests that the positioning of women as outsiders has enabled men to exert control over women's bodies, and inevitably dictate legitimate ways in which they could experience themselves within sport.

Sport subcultures as cultural sites of resistance

Within existing sociological literature sport subcultures are often described as cultural sites of resistance in which "normative relations are contested and struggled over" (Beal, 1992, p. 48). They can be

contended as progressive spaces, which accommodate "alternative ways of thinking and being that challenge the dominant culture'' (Beaver, 2012, p. 6). Wearing (1998) suggests that such leisure sites provide women with spaces for "rewriting the script" (Wearing, 1998, p. 147) of normative femininity, beyond the dominant, hyper-feminine discourse. Therefore, alternative forms of sport may act as symbolic platforms, which enable women to enact non-normative, feminine practices and actively expand the concept of femininity "beyond the homogenised images found in popular culture" (Beaver, 2016, p. 19).

Skateboarding could therefore be considered as an alternative sport, due to its fluid structure and absence of rules. It is normally practiced on an underground, informal scale at public skateparks or street corners and is not considered as an official, organised sport (Borden, 2001). Alana Young (2006) writes that skateboarding has traditionally been regarded as a male practice, due to its aggressive nature and risk of severe injuries, which are aligned with mainstream masculinities (Young, 2006, p, 12). Also, public skateparks and street corners have often been regarded as unsafe territories for young women (Atencio, 2009, p. 164) and have traditionally been considered as male domains of power. Therefore, women have often been excluded from street spaces, which have normally symbolised danger and sexual harassment (Atencio, 2009). However, Natalie Porter (2003) argues that in the last few years women have "taken it upon themselves to create their own visibility'' (Porter, 2005, p. 3) within skateboarding, by producing 'all girl skater competitions', blog posts, zines and social media accounts. Such recent emergence of female skaters has validated women's position within the sport and inevitably posed a threat on male monopoly and domination (Porter, 2005, p. 76). Consequently, according to Currie et al (2009) by occupying street skateparks from the subject position of a skater, girls are beginning to actively challenge male dominance of social space and reconfigure street skateparks as legitimate sites of femininity.

Currie et al (2009, p. 8) further argue that skateboarding allows women to define themselves as alternative to the dominant form of hyper-femininity, through their unapologetic enactment of traditionally masculine traits of physical strength, risk taking and bravery. According to Schippers (2007) it can be viewed as an empowering leisure space within which women actively reclaim conventionally masculine traits, and directly attempt to ''challenge the idea that women and men's bodies are significantly different enough to legitimate gender inequality'' (Krane, 2001, p. 10). Thus, through their physical performance of traditionally masculine characteristics within a male dominated space, skater girls not only pose a critique on the naturalisation of masculinity but also attempt to conjure their own habitus by accessing power that was normally withheld from them in street spaces (Atencio, 2009, p. 14). Furthermore, by asserting their presence in public spaces, skater girls challenge the idea that "the street remains in some ways a taboo for women" (Porter, 2005, p. 32) and inevitably reconstruct traditional gender roles by occupying the urban landscape via a "boisterous display of physical activity'' (Antecio, 2009, p. 103)

Becky Beal (1992) argues that skateboarding does not promote conventional hyper feminine practices of the "immaculately groomed, petite china doll" (Beal, 1992, p. 177). Thus, skateboarding practices allow girls to re-code conventionally masculine expressions as feminine and therefore re-construct essentialist forms of femininity and masculinity beyond the gender binary. Consequently, the existing literature within this field suggests that skateboarding often accommodates oppositional behaviour which disrupts the hegemonic relationship of subordination and dominance (between skater girls and their male counterparts), and ultimately undermines oppressive gender relations not only within the sport, but also the wider patriarchal gender order (Beal, 1992, p. 177).

Methodology

Through a number of internet searches, I came across a website to a female only skate night in a city in the southeast of England, which was the only running female exclusive night within the city. I contacted them via their Facebook page and arranged to interview them at an indoor skate park in which the night took place every Thursday. Out of the 10 girls present, I interviewed 8, that agreed to speak to me. They were between 16 and 18 years of age.

I used semi-structured interviews as a research technique, which I also audio taped. This method was particularly appealing to me, as I was committed to allow my participants to enhance this project with their own perceptions and views. And, although I had some pre-planned questions and topics that I wanted to discuss, the course of the interviews took more of a fluid form, where girls had the agency to formulate their own "conceptions of their lived world" (Kvale, 1996, p. 11) and therefore the freedom to construct authentic narratives. Thus, the conversations which emerged were around themes such as gender, in particular what it is like to be a female skateboarder and to occupy public skateparks from such a position. As well as, embodiment, sexuality and femininity in relation to their skateboarding practices. My willingness to allow girls to lead our conversations reflected my genuine interest in what they had to say — which enabled them to feel comfortable in my presence, as the researcher. Consequently, semi structured interviews provided meaningful, individual responses that could not have been obtained through technical, quantitative techniques (Silverman, 1943).

I began my data analysis by closely transcribing the recorded responses from my participants. This was an interpretative process in itself, where I systematically traced primary connections and emerging themes from the data (Ryan and Bernard, 2003). I had a lot of complex and overlapping narratives, which at first was highly overwhelming. But I then began to unpack those by detecting emerging categories and codes within each interview, and later proceeded to establish overarching

themes across the whole data set (Barbour, 2007). Also, because I adopted an exploratory objective of gender, I allowed "knowledge to evolve through dialogue" (Kvale, 1996, p. 55) — which I then compiled into narratives or stories, that my participants collectively told. I then proceeded on to analysing the way such narratives communicated with broader sociological concepts, by creatively engaging with existing literature and theoretical frameworks. My final step of data analysis consisted of locating my findings within broader social and political contexts, as a way of interpreting the way in which my emerging theory further illuminated those debates (Rubin and Rubin, 2005, p. 227).

In regards to ethical issues, I made sure that my participants were 16 years old or above, and so were able to consent independently without a legal guardian. Before conducting each interview I provided my participants with an Information Sheet and gave them adequate time to read it before asking them to sign the consent form. I also elaborated on the aims of my research and explained why they seemed like suitable candidates; as well as answered any of their questions before proceeding with the interview process. I emphasised that at any given point they had the right to withdraw, stop the interview or change the topic in discussion. I also assured them that the recordings of the interviews would be destroyed after they were transcribed and that their identities would remain completely confidential throughout the final write up. I remained mindful of the questions I asked my participants, and made sure that they were not too personal or emotionally difficult to answer. Thus, this study was low risk and did not induce any psychological stress or anxiety, beyond the risks encountered in the everyday life of the participants (Miller et al, 2012).

Fetishism of the feminine

Most girls reported that their gender and sexual expressions were subjected to relentless policing and governance by the male skaters. Their appearance was routinely critiqued and insulted, particularly when it deviated from the hyper-feminine, heteronormative discourse.

Girls that displayed masculine behaviour or aesthetic attributes, such as wearing baggy clothes or having short hair said that they were "penalised for looking too boyish and accused of being gay''. One of the girls argued that this was because "male skaters like to fetishise feminine girls, because that's what they like in a sexual and romantic way". Therefore, performances of masculine expressions were de-valued and stigmatised as 'excessive' or 'butch' (Windsor, 2015) because they appeared as threatening to the compulsory model of heterosexuality, which serves to facilitate men's sexual preferences. Connell (1987) argues that the hyper-feminine identity is organised "as an adaptation to men's power", and is "oriented to accommodate the interests and desires of men" (Connell, 1987, p. 183). Such required mode of femininity within skateboarding is "not in much of a state to establish hegemony" (Connell, 1987, p. 188) over masculinities or other femininities, because it does not possess enough cultural power to assert patriarchal dominance or hierarchy over other gender identities. This is arguably because hyper-femininity is rendered through 'expressive' characteristics such as being caring and accommodating, which are also communicated through culturally devalued expressions of compliance, weakness and passivity. Indeed, one of the girls supported this by stating:

> whenever I go to street skateparks there's this thing where if you are in a guy's way they like expect you to move, because of this whole thing that girls are supposed to be polite and caring and so they'll like clear the way for you because they're meant to be nice.

According to Connell (1987) such performance of 'expressive' characteristics by women does not hold the capacity to adequately challenge and compete with masculine expressions of power; such as 'self-assertion, physical strength and emotional stoicism' (Burn et al, 1996: 2). Consequently, the suppression of masculine embodiment by female bodies within skateboarding, acts as a symbolic attempt to confine female skaters to a narrow version of compliant, hetero-normative femininity; as a way of positioning skater masculinity as "the ultimate bearer of power" (Halberstam, 1998, p. 5). This inevitably

creates a "hierarchical and complementary relationship" (Schippers, 2007, p. 6) between the dominant, hegemonic masculinity and the subordinate feminine identity.

Such hyper-feminine requirement within skateboarding is also reflective of a post-feminist subjectivity, which presents sexual attractiveness as a source of empowerment and determinant of a successful experience of womanhood (Velding, 2014). For example, one of the participants stated:

> male skaters like girls that are typically feminine, like even in skater competitions I've seen some guys give higher marks to the girls that are like traditionally feminine, so they'll like be dressed in something a bit more provocative or something that shows off their body a bit more.

Consequently, the regulations and demands directed at skater femininities, mirror gender policing practices in affinity with forms of post-feminist rationalities. Gill (2007) argues that young femininities are often surveilled in relation to these incentives, which require girls to present themselves as hetero-feminine, sexual subjects. However, another participant highlighted a significant contradiction, by stating:

> even when girls do wear something feminine, something that reveals their bodies, like a skirt and a vest top, boys would then look at them in a sexual way, and accuse them of trying to get attention.

This quote reveals a sexist double standard, fostered by post-feminist rationalities, that require girls to "look and constantly be up for it" (Phipps and Young, 2010, p. 10) yet have to conceal their own sexual desires. Therefore, the requirement to perform sexual prowess through a hyper-feminine appearance positions "sexual agency into a form of regulation itself" (Phipps and Young, 2010, p. 10), rather than a source of empowerment. Skater girls' inability to independently exploit a hyper-feminine image in order to serve their own agendas, such as to 'seek male attention', presents a certain difficulty to develop a positive sense

of themselves as autonomous, sexual beings. And to further echo Connell (1987), this is because emphasised femininity is only supposed to be "oriented to accommodate the interests and desires of men" (Schippers, 2007, p. 3). And so by positioning themselves as sexual subjects, rather than objects of male desire, skater girls would establish an unwanted hegemony as sexual choosers and disrupt misogynistic gender relations within the sport.

This discussion reflects a paradoxical nature of post-feminist sensibilities, which do not really mean that girls could construct themselves as autonomous beings in charge of their own sexuality, but rather have to appear as powerful only in ways that accommodate the male gaze. MacRobbie (2012) points out that this post-feminist masquerade underlies ''female vulnerability'' and serves to ''re-assure male structures of power'' (Scharff, 2012, p. 34). This is particularly performed through hyper-femininity locating itself as polar opposite to maleness and therefore contributing to the preserve of masculinity's hegemony and exclusivity within the male body. This is exemplified by the sexualisation of hyper-feminine gender expressions by male skaters; which enables them to trivialise girls' athletic abilities and position their sporting skills as exclusive attributes of the masculine identity (Beaver, 2016, p. 4).

McRobbie (2012) further suggests that ''femininity always appears more uncertain and less secure than masculinity'' (Scharff, 2012, p. 7), due to constant beauty advertisements presenting femininity as a fragile identity in constant need of fixing and strengthening. These marketing strategies contribute to the further entrenchment of gender binaries into popular belief, which serve to position masculinity as a superior entity. Such vulnerability and instability of the feminine identity is also highlighted by one of the participant's responses — "if you are overly feminine then they'll literally treat you like meat, like an attractive thing, but then if you're not girly enough then they'll accuse you of being a lesbian and like not really see you as attractive — so you can't really win''. This points towards the precariousness of skater femininity, where any expression that is exhibited is inevitably met with scrutiny and social

devaluation by the male audience. This quote illustrates the equation of feminine expressions with sexual capital in the context of heterosexuality — degrees of which are then turned into sexist forms of regulation and stigmatisation. Consequently, although hyper-femininity seemingly acts as the most respectable and desirable identity within skateboarding, when performed in excess it is then disempowered through sexual trivialisation by the male skaters. Skater femininity is therefore an inherently controversial identity, which simultaneously acts as a point of praise and stigmatisation. Therefore, there is an apparent lack of neutral ground that the feminine body is able to occupy, due to it being charged with contested and ideological dispositions. According to Connell (1987), to be in a hegemonic gender position is to be in a position of power, where one's monopoly is unchallenged and fixed as part of the gender order. A neutral gender identity could arguably act a hegemonic gender position, protected from conflicting connotations by the safety of its neutrality. Consequently, skater girls' subjection to various sexist double standards and paradoxical feminine expressions, could be understood by the inexistence of a hegemonic feminine identity, which would guarantee them a neutral social status within the gender hierarchy of skateboarding. This is also arguably because hyper-femininity is ideologically constructed to complement male hegemony, and does not exercise enough independent power to establish its own hegemony, due to being structurally and symbolically confined to the inferior position within the gender order (Connell, 1987).

Additionally, male skaters' hegemonic position was highlighted by their ability to freely transgress gender binaries, in a way that skater girls couldn't. One of the participants stated:

> 'Boys are never called gay or get taken the mick out of for looking gay or too feminine. Like recently boys have been wearing a lot of pink stuff, and like eyeshadow as part of the whole emo trend, and like no one is really saying anything, but when a girl looks boyish, she is then called gay or like too masculine — because that's not what girls are supposed to look like'.

This quote is reflective of the way male skaters were able to utilise their hegemonic gender position to re-inscribe powerless feminine characteristics into legitimate identity resources. Through their masculine embodiment of femininity, they were able to credit those traits with validity and respectability, by turning them into fashionable dispositions of power. Whilst doing this, male skaters were protected by the symbolically neutral and value free territory that they occupy within the gender order, which maintains their social power and reputation. Conversely, female skaters weren't permitted as much gender fluidity or reflexivity, and so were fixed within static gender parameters. Inevitably, their expressions of masculinity were stigmatised and devalued due to the female body not holding enough hegemonic power to match the degree of hegemony that masculine expressions convey. Therefore, feminine embodiments of masculinity within skateboarding were viewed as an invasion of hegemonic territory and essentially a politically charged statement.

Rejection of hyper-femininity

Through their skateboarding practices, girls actively resisted the forms of hyper-femininity that were imposed on them by the male skaters (as discussed in the previous chapter). They did this by symbolically distancing their feminine expressions from the 'girly' gender discourse. For example, one of them stated:

> girls that are girly care about their make-up and like the way they look, but like here it's not about that whole make-up thing, you're never not gonna be bruised — so I suppose girly girls especially wouldn't want to do it, because they wouldn't want to get bruises on their face, cos it doesn't look good — but here girls don't really care about that'.

This description of the 'girly' girl who maintains her attractiveness with the use of cosmetic products echoes a dominant, post-feminist female aesthetic which promotes a blemish free, flawless image of femininity,

achieved through constant self-regulation and improvement with the use of consumer goods (Velding, 2014, p. 17). Consequently, skater girls used the term 'girly' in a derogatory sense, as a way of symbolically distancing themselves from those connotations, particularly by stating ''but here it's not about that whole make-up thing''. Therefore, by being unafraid to risk their beauty with bruises and scars they dismissed dominant post-feminist and neoliberal self-reflexivities, which require women to rigorously improve their appearance, as a way of obtaining the ''immaculately groomed'' (Beal, 1992, p. 12), and 'perfect' image.

It is also important to understand how interviewees perceived traditional femininity and as a result ''placed themselves in opposition to it'' (Holland, 2004, p. 9). One of the respondents stated:

> stereotypically when I think of femininity, I think of like a woman who does her make-up, who is very classy, who's like really dainty, polite and delicate and who maybe wears a lot of pink. And obviously here we still wear pink and stuff, but it's different, you won't see us giggling and looking all pretty, like here the most respected way of being a girl would be to be a really good skater and have a lot of like mental drive and physical power and that's what I kind of associate with femininity the more girl skaters I meet.

75

This response suggests that powerful femininity for skater girls was not one that displayed post-feminist, heteronormative qualities. Girls' performance of "mental drive and physical power", symbolically re-coded conventionally masculine expressions as feminine and therefore rejected the vulnerability of the female identity, which has been used to "re-assure male structures of power'' (Scharff, 2012, p. 34). Therefore, by actively constructing oppositional forms of femininity, skater girls established new patterns for the gendered interaction within the sport, that did not replicate hegemonic gender relations (Schippers, 2007, p. 9). Thus, by discrediting traditional elements of hyper-femininity, girls refused to compliment hegemonic masculinity "in a relation of subordination" (Schippers, 2007, p. 11), through the embodiment of

culturally devalued, 'expressive' characteristics. Carrie Paechter (2006) argues that such distancing from hyper-femininity could be interpreted as a rejection of the "disempowerment that comes with it" (Paechter, 2006, p. 9). Indeed, as previously discussed, hyper-femininity is ideologically constructed to complement male hegemony (Connell, 1987) and is therefore symbolically confined to the inferior position within the gender order. Therefore, a rejection of hyper-femininity amongst skater girls, could be viewed as a power claiming strategy (Paechter, 2006, p. 9), through which they refuse to participate in a "relation of subordination" (Schippers, 2007, p. 11) and as a result attempt to conjure a hegemonic gender identity within the given sport.

Furthermore, skater girls resisted restricting norms of hyper-femininity with their 'strong and active bodies' (Porter, 2005, p. 80). For example, one of the participants stated: "I think it's made me think about my appearance much less and actually think about what my body could do to achieve something rather than just look a certain way''. This quote points towards skater girls' refusal to protect their feminine image from injuries, and therefore 'contain their bodies in acceptable post-feminist ways' (Aapola et al, 2004, p. 132). Instead, girls actively exhibited control over their physical activities and participated in the ''act of self-governance and regulation'' (Young, 2006, p. 130) over their own bodies. They freely navigated their bodies at public skateparks and therefore "made room for themselves in spatial terms" (Backstrom, 2013, p. 5) in opposition to the idea that "the street remains in some ways a taboo for women'' (Porter, 2005, p. 32). Thus, by asserting their presence in public spaces, skater girls re-negotiated traditional gender roles by occupying "the urban landscape" via a boisterous display of physical activity (Antecio, 2009: 103).

Therefore, through their bodily performances, skater girls persistently challenged ''sexist assumptions about girls being unable to skate'' (Currie et al, 2005, p. 11) or what their bodies could do, beyond cultural imaginings. For example, one of the participants stated:

> It still kind of shocks guys, when girls are really good, like if
> a girl falls they think we are gonna break our nail and start
> crying over it and I think its cos the world seems to believe
> that girls are fragile compared to guys. But like the amount
> of times you see girls falling over in skateboarding — we
> can take a hit, and guys don't seem to get that'.

This quote illustrates skater girls' active rejection of stereotypical characteristics of femininity, such as fear of injury or physical fragility. They spoke about their injuries with a sense of pride and achievement, with one participant stating: "I'm never not bruised, but it's kind of nice though, cos they're like markers of hard work, like for example when I learn a really hard trick, I know that I'm gonna be covered in massive bruises, cos that's what it takes — it takes a lot of falling and getting back up''. Through their embodiment of pain and injury, skater girls resisted the hyper-feminine characteristics of emotional vulnerability and physical weakness and inevitably challenged the ''gender binary that equates athleticism and toughness with masculinity'' (Beaver, 2014, p. 7). Consequently, skater girls' enactment of bodily and psychological endurance of pain, bravery and physical strength, enabled them to challenge cultural assumptions that ''women's and men's bodies are significantly different enough to legitimate gender inequality'' (Krane, 2001, p. 7). Therefore, through their physical performance of traditionally masculine characteristics, skater girls posed a critique on the naturalisation of masculinity, against the common assumption that men are biologically defined by those traits (Connell, 1987, p. 167). Consequently, skateboarding practices allowed girls to enact masculine expressions and therefore resist the exclusive male ownership of masculinity — by suggesting that masculinity is a mere collection of cultural practices, that can be taken up and enacted collectively by various gender groups (Schippers, 2007).

However, although participants rejected the 'girly', post-feminist discourse of femininity, they did not necessarily dismiss their own feminine identities. Skater girls perceived femininity not as a fixed identity category, but as a collection of diverse behavioural and aesthetic

dimensions. For example, one of them stated "I feel like I'm feminine in character, but my appearance varies, like sometimes I can wear the girliest outfit like a prom dress out skating and other times I'll wear the baggiest jeans, it just kind of depends what I feel like and where I'm going''. This suggests that femininity is in a constant state of formation and renegotiation and is therefore not a unified, or cohesive identity practice (Kelly, 2004). Another participant preferred to blend traditionally masculine aesthetics with conventional feminine attributes, such as wearing ''man's boots with fishnet tights and pink, puffy skirts but with a lot of black smudged eye make-up and messy hair''. These gender performances are reminiscent of the Riot grrrl movement, which ''constructed subcultural femininities'' by mixing elements of aggressive punk masculinity with sartorial images of femininity (Leblanc, 1999, p. 163). Such blending of various gendered attributes can be seen as a symbolic performance of 'undoing' gender, by consciously manipulating gendered expressions, in an attempt to "create subject positions that are not constrained by the rigidity of the masculine/feminine binary'' (Beaver, 2016, p. 16; Finley, 2010). Skater girls therefore viewed their femininity as a discourse that could be actively redefined, in relation to conventional masculine and feminine cultural expressions. This practice fits in with Mimi Schippers' (2002) 'gender manoeuvring' framework, which is defined by "an effort to transform the gender relations in a localised setting, but also part of the larger gender order of male dominance" (Finley, 2010, p. 4; Schippers 2002). Therefore, by producing new modes of femininity, skater girls collectively undermined gender binary categories by signalling that there is 'no one femininity or masculinity with which to identify' (Butler, 2004, p. 51). This is particularly true because their gender performance encompassed conventionally masculine and feminine expressions, which inevitably constructed "new patterns for gendered interaction in this setting'' (Finley, 2010, p. 7).

Re-construction of feminism

Whilst skater girls refused to comply to the post-feminist aesthetic and behavioural subjectivities, they still utilised post-feminist slogans, such as 'just do what you want' as a form of empowerment. For example, one of the participants stated: "I think there are challenges, but I think it is important to just do what you want and not care much about people's criticisms''. This quote was a response to the policing and control that skater girls were subjected to by the male skaters, as discussed in the first section. The statement is specifically post-feminist due to the theory's assertion that 'all battles have been won' and girls are now free to do precisely 'whatever they want'. Gill and Donaghue (2013) suggest that post-feminism regards women as liberated, independent subjects who are able to make "free and autonomous choices" (Madhok and Phillips, 2013, p. 241), an attitude that is clearly reflected in the participant's response. This work has therefore pointed towards a further need to examine the interplay between feminism and girlhood and the way emerging, oppositional femininities are reconfiguring contemporary feminist ideologies with complex forms of gender performance. This is not dissimilar to the argument Kelly et al (2004) make in their work as they highlight the importance of illuminating the contradictory ways in which young women engage and interact with feminism, whilst simultaneously re-negotiating their own feminine identities.

According to Angela McRobbie (2006), there has a been a significant 'unfixing' of young women in British society. She argues that girls have been "unhinged from their traditional gender position" (McRobbie, 2006, p. 4), whilst their male counterparts remained fixed within the old forms of masculinity. Such contention is also present in this work, where skater girls actively produced new modes of femininity, in resistance to the old forms of gender binaries reinforced by the male skaters. McRobbie (2006) further argues that the current re-negotiation of femininity amongst young women signals new formations of feminist

79

identities that embody feminist activism in significantly different ways to the second wave, feminist movement. Anita Harris (2003) has written about the concept of a 'new girl', who reflexively and actively engages in identity practices and critically reinstates new embodiments of girlhood (Harris, 2003). Harris (2003) suggests that the conjunction of neoliberal and post-feminist subjectivities since the early 1990s, has resulted in the growth of educational and employment opportunities, leading to the birth of the 'can do' girl, who is autonomous and able to 'just do what' she wants, to further echo the participant's response. Similarly, Ulrick Beck has argued that the convergence of neoliberalism with individualism and personal autonomy has allowed girls to independently redefine femininity and "reject aspects of the available model of femininity that did not suit their own visions of themselves" (Aapola et al, 2004, p. 37). This suggests that skater girls re-constructed old modes of femininity and masculinity by actively producing new forms of gender expressions that suited their individual, skater identities. Such process suggests that femininity is not a stable or fixed identity point, which cannot be represented by a homogenous feminist theory. Therefore, the old second wave theoretical binary, which positioned femininity 'at one end of the political spectrum and feminism at the other' (McRobbie, 2006, p. 8) is no longer a useful conceptualisation of the two entities. This is particularly because second wave feminism practiced a tendency to 'cling onto foundationalism' (Kelly et al, 2004, p. 10) and fix femininity within its essentialist feminist theory; which produced an imaginary dichotomy between the saviour feminist ideology and a homogenous group of oppressed women. Therefore, the unintentional pick and mixing of post-feminism, in which skater girls simultaneously rejected dominant post-feminist aesthetics, yet manifested its slogans points towards the way in which "girls and feminism mutually transform each other in the wake of their shared instability" (Kelly et al, 2004, p. 9). Consequently, the debates about which forms of feminist ideologies are more relatable to young women, fail to recognise the nuanced ways in which young women negotiate their feminine identities and therefore transform feminism through their actions.

As a result of such changes, theorists like Harris (2003) have argued that feminine resistance has in some cases taken more of a decentralised and localised form amongst young women, in comparison to the former collectivist, large scale, second wave movement. Therefore, the popular claim that young women have betrayed the legacy of collective political action (Kelly et al, 2004) is somewhat misleading and sensationalist, because what is missing from such rhetoric is the willingness to recognise the changing mode of resistance within everyday, local practices. Anita Harris (2003) further supports this statement by suggesting that young women's resistance has entered into a more underground and micro level activism, against the prevailing view that young women "have no politics to speak of at all" (Kelly et al, 2004, p. 3; Harris 2003). Therefore, instead of regarding young women as apolitic, post-feminist subjects, there is a need to recognise their enactment of feminist politics within the patterns of their daily lives (Kelly et al, 2004; Harris, 2003). Consequently, within the current political and economic landscape, feminist action is arguably better understood through "small group practices of women", rather than the "large scale social action" (Currie et al, 2009, p. 22) and explicit agendas that characterised the second wave movement.

Conclusion

In this work I have extensively explored the ways in which gender binaries act as policing frameworks, which in this case have been used by male skaters to exclude women from masculine expressions, and locate skater femininity within inferior, expressive characteristics. Female skaters resisted the dominant, hyper-feminine gender binary via a construction of alternative feminine expressions, which posed a critique on the hegemonic gender order that was imposed on them by their male counterparts. Skater girls opposed certain elements of hyper-femininity and in turn creatively integrated elements of masculinity within their gender identities. Through this gender performance they

resisted the exclusive male ownership of masculinity — by suggesting that masculinity is a mere collection of cultural practices, that can be taken up and enacted collectively by various gender groups (Schippers, 2007). The participants therefore viewed their femininity as a discourse that could be actively redefined, in relation to conventional masculine and feminine cultural expressions.

I would therefore like to point further research towards a wider use of a constellatory approach to the study of gender, by exploring the mutually contingent relationships between masculinity and femininity and the implications those complex gender expressions/identities hold for feminist theory and practice. A close investigation of the characteristics and practices which (re)produce relational categories such as 'man/woman' in the first place, would offer a possibility to de-construct normative gendered performativities and create room for resistant transgressions and a radical re-making of oppressive gendered identities (Browne and Nash, 2010). Similarly to the ways in which female skaters produced new modes of femininities in opposition to hegemonic masculinity and in turn established new patterns for the gendered interaction within the sport, that did not replicate oppressive gender relations (Schippers, 2007, p. 9). Thus, there is much need for further study on the interplay between girlhood and feminism and the ways in which emerging, oppositional femininities are reshaping and innovating contemporary feminist ideologies through their unique forms of gendered resistance.

Work Cited

Atencio, M. Beal, B. Wilson, C. (2009). The distinction of risk: urban skateboarding, street habitus and the construction of hierarchical gender relations. *Qualitative Research in Sport and Exercise*, *1*(1), 3-20.

Aapola, S. Gonick, M. Harris, A. (2004). *Young Femininity: Girlhood, Power and Social Change*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Beal, B. Wheaton, B. (2003). Keeping It Real. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport, 38*(2), 155-176.

Beaver, T. (2012). By the Skaters, for the Skaters - The DIY Ethos of the Roller Derby Revival. *Journal of Sport and Social,* 36, 25-49.

Beaver, T. (2016). Roller derby uniforms: The pleasures and dilemmas of sexualized attire. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, *51*(6), 639-657.

Beal, B. (1992). *The subculture of skateboarding: Beyond social resistance*, ProQuest Dissertations Publishing – thesis.

Burn, S. O'Neil, A. Nederend, S. (1996). Childhood tomboyism and adult androgyny, *Sex Roles*, *34*(5), 419-428.

Browne, K. (2006). Challenging Queer Geographies, *Antipode*, *38*(5), 885-893.

Browne, K. Nash, C. (2010). *Queer methods and methodologies: intersecting queer theories and social science research*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Butler, J. (2004). *Undoing Gender*. US: Rutledge.

Bourbour, R. (2007). *Introducing Qualitative Research: A Student's Guide to the Craft of Doing Qualitative Research*. London: SAGE Publication.

Backstrom, A. (2013). Gender Manoeuvring in Swedish Skateboarding: Negotiations of Femininities and the Hierarchical Gender Structure, *Young*, *21*(1), 29-53.

Connell, R.W. (1987). *Gender and Power*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Conboy, K. Medina, N. Stanbury, S. (1997). *Writing on the body: female embodiment and feminist theory*. New York: Columbia University Press.

Currie, D. Pomerantz, S. Kelly, D. (2009). *Girl Power: Girls Reinventing Girlhood*. US: Peter Lang Publishing.

Finley, N.J. (2010). Skating Femininity: Gender Maneuvering in Women's Roller Derby. *Journal of Contemporary Ethnography*, *39*(4), 359-387.

Gill, R. (2007). Postfeminist media culture: elements of a sensibility. *European journal of cultural studies*, 10(2), 147-166.

Harris, A. (2003). *Future Girl: Young Women in the Twenty-First Century*. New York; London: Routledge.

Holland, S. (2004). *Alternative Femininities: Body, Age and Identity*. UK: Berg Publishers.

Krane, V. (2001). We Can Be Athletic and Feminine, but Do We Want To? Challenging Hegemonic Femininity in Women's Sport. *Quest*, *53*(1), 115-33.

Kvale, S. (1996). *Inter Views: An Introduction to Qualitative Research Interviewing*. London: SAGE Publications.

Leblanc, L. (1999). *Pretty in punk: girls' gender resistance in a boys' subculture*. London: Rutgers University Press.

Madhok, S. Phillips, A. (2013). *Gender, Agency, and Coercion*. UK: Palgrave Macmillan.

McRobbie, A. (2006). Shut up and dance: Youth culture and changing modes of femininity. *Cultural studies*, *7*(3), 406-426.

Miller, T. Birch, M. Mauthner, M. Jessop, J. (2012). *Ethics in Qualitative Research*. London: Sage Publications.

Paechter, C. (2006). Masculine femininities/feminine masculinities: power, identities and gender. *Gender and Education*, *18*(3), 253-263.

Pavlidis, A. Fullagar, S. (2013). Becoming roller derby grrrls: Exploring the gendered play of affect in mediated sport cultures. *International Review for the Sociology of Sport*, *48*(6), 673-688.

Pavlidis, A. Fullagar, S. (2013). The pain and pleasure of roller derby: Thinking through affect and subjectification. *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, *18*(5), 483-499.

Pomerantz, S. D. Currie, Kelly, D. (2005). Skater girlhood and emphasized femininity: 'you can't land an ollie properly in heels. *Gender and Education*, *17*(3), 229-248.

Pomerantz, S. D. Currie, Kelly, D. (2004). Sk8er girls: Skateboarders, girlhood and feminism in motion. *Women's Studies International Forum*, *27*(5), 547-557.

Porter, N. (2005). *Female skateboarders and their negotiation of space and identity.* ProQuest Dissertations Publishing.

Rubin, H. Rubin, I. (2005) *Qualitative Interviewing: The Art of Hearing Data.* London: SAGE.

Ryan, G. Bernard, R. (2003). Techniques to Identify Themes. *Field methods*, *15*(1), 85-109.

Schippers, M. (2007). Recovering the feminine other: masculinity, femininity, and gender hegemony. *Theory and Society*, *36*(1), 85-102.

Scharff, C. (2012). *Repudiating Feminism -Young Women in a Neoliberal World*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Silverman, D. (1943). *Doing qualitative research: a practical handbook*. London: SAGE Publications.

Velding, V. (2014). Depicting Femininity: Conflicting Messages in a "Tween" magazine. *Youth and Society*, *30*(3), 505-527.

Widsor, W. (2015). Femininities. *International Encyclopedia of the Social & Behavioral Sciences*, pp.893-897.

Wearing, B. (1998). *Leisure and feminist theory*. London: SAGE.

Young, A. (2006). 'The flipside: Young womens' understanding of the risks in skateboarding', (Online) Available at: http://www.ruor.uottawa.ca/handle/10393/27430

85

Feminist Dönüşüm Zamanlarında bir Toplumsal Cinsiyet İncelemesi:
Alternatif Dişilliklerin Kaykay Etrafında Dirençli Oluşumu

Öz: 8 kadın kaykaycı ile yürütülen yarı-yapılandırılmış görüşmelere dayanan bu araştırma, kaykay camiasındaki kadınlar arasındaki eril dişilliklerin fiziksel ve estetik pratiklerinin derinlemesine bir analizini sunmaktadır. Kaykay mekanları dişil erilliğin önde gelen taşıyıcılarındandır; zira, kadınların fiziksel güç, dayanıklılık, rekabetçi dürtüler ve girişkenlik gibi (Pavlidis and Fullagar, 2013) geleneksel eril özelliklere sahip çıkmalarına olanak tanırlar. Bu tip sporlardaki kadınlar, aktif olarak 'vücutlarının neyi yapabileceği konusundaki varsayımlara' meydan okurlar (Pavlidis and Fullagar, 2015: 10) ve fiziksel kırılganlık ile mental zayıflık gibi yanlış stereotipleştirmelerin karşısına çıkarlar. Dolayısıyla bu araştırma, kaykay pratiklerinin kolektif toplumsal cinsiyet performansını ve böylece eril hegemoni karşısında kadınların direncini kolaylaştırmasının bilgilendirici bir izahatini verecektir.

Anahtar kelimeler*: Dişil erkeklikler, toplumsal cinsiyet performansı, direnç, feminizm, kaykay

Hegemonya, Homofobi ve Erkeklik Üçgeninde Murathan Mungan'ın "Suret Masalı" ve "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı" Öyküleri*

Ahmet Duran Arslan**
Muğla Sıtkı Koçman Üniversitesi

Öz: Hegemonya, homofobi ve erkeklik kavramları arasındaki ilişkiler, son yıllarda sosyoloji başta olmak üzere psikoloji, hukuk, siyaset bilimi gibi birçok alanda araştırma konusu olmuştur. Bu alanlara ek olarak edebiyat da bahsi geçen meselelerin kurgusal düzeyde icra edildiği önemli sahalardan biridir. Özellikle hegemonik erkekliği sorgulayan yazarlardan biri olan Murathan Mungan'ın eserlerinde, homofobik tutumlar ve bu tutuma maruz kalanların yaşadıkları "ötekilik deneyimi" geniş yer tutar. Bu çalışmada, Mungan'ın erkeklik meselesine dair bütün bu sorunları nasıl öyküleştirdiği, kurmaca dünyanın sunduğu imkânlar dâhilinde nasıl tartıştığı ve bu tartışma sürecinde hangi anlatısal stratejilerden yararlandığı örneklem olarak seçilen öyküler üzerinden analiz edilecektir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Hegemonya, homofobi, erkeklik, Murathan Mungan, öykü

---

* Arş. Gör., Edebiyat Fakültesi, Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü,
e-mail: ahmetduranarslan@gmail.com, ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5131-2499

> *"Babalarından başka doğru bilmeden*
> *yaşlanıyordu erkekler."*
> Şükrü Erbaş

Başlarken

Murathan Mungan'ın öyküleri söz konusu olduğunda iki nokta hemen öne çıkar: estetik hassasiyet ve edebî derinlik. Uzun zihinsel mesailer sonrasında işleyen titiz bir kalemdir Mungan. Bu yüzden hep velut metinlere gebedir. Eserlerinde sürükleyici olay örgülerinin yanı sıra düşünce de ihmal edilmez. Yaşadığı coğrafyanın kültürel iklimine, ikilemine kayıtsız kalmaz yazar. Özellikle öyküleri tarihî, siyasi ve sosyo-kültürel birçok çelişki ve çatışma üzerine kuruludur. Bu nedenle onları çözümlerken yüzey yapılarındaki serüven kadar derin yapılarındaki düşünceyi de hesaba katmak gerekir. Böylelikle "metnin hakkı" bir bakıma ödenmiş olur. Elbette hiçbir metinde anlamı tümüyle tüketmek ya da ele geçirmek mümkün değildir; ancak unutmamak gerekir ki, yazar kadar okur ya da eleştirmenin de metne karşı bir sorumluluğu vardır. Bu yazıda incelenecek "Suret Masalı" ve "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı" öykülerine bu itibarla yaklaşılacaktır. İki öyküyü birbirine belirli bir açıdan "akraba" kılan temel noktanın ise, öykülerin merkezindeki hegemonya-homofobi-erkeklik üçgeni olduğu söylenebilir.

Cinsiyetlen(diril)miş İktidar ve Homofobi

Öykülerin analizine geçmeden önce, ele alınacak metinlerdeki derin anlamların daha iyi kavranabilmesi adına hegemonya, homofobi ve erkeklik kavramları arasındaki girift ilişkiyi ortaya koyacak bir kuramsal temellendirme yapılacaktır. Buna göre, hegemonya kavramının doğasında bulunan "ben" ve "öteki" ayrımı ve kendini öteki üzerinden tanımlama ihtiyacı, bir başka üstünlük biçimi olan hegemonik erkeklik için de geçerlidir. "R. W. Connell, hegemonik erkekliğin, hegemonik olmayan üç özgül erkekliğin karşısında inşa edildiğini iddia eder." (Günay Erkol, 2019, s. 2) Buna göre, "suç ortağı (işbirlikçi) erkeklikler",

88

eşitsiz toplumsal cinsiyet ilişkilerini menfaatlerine kullanırlar ve hegemonik erkekliğin sürmesine neden olurlar; "tâbi kılınan (madun) erkeklikler", hegemonik erkekliğin uzağında ve ondan bir sapma olarak inşa edilirler; "marjinalleştirilmiş erkeklikler", sınıf, ırk, etnik köken ve yaş gibi eşitsiz ilişkiler nedeniyle ayrımcılığa uğrarlar. Elbette günümüzde bu ayrımların tartışmaya açık olduğu ve erkekliklerin bu denli net sınırlarla çizilemeyeceği aşikârdır. Bu anlamda "erkekliklerin bir ilişkisellik içinde kurulduğunu ve farklı erkeklik inşalarına olanak sunan toplumsal süreçlerle kesişim halinde oluştuğunu" (Günay Erkol, 2019, s. 6) gözden kaçırmamak gerekir. Kadınlar ise söz konusu hegemonik yapının tamamen dışında, "temel öteki" konumundadırlar. Böylelikle hem kadınlar hem de öteki erkeklik biçimleri iktidar alanından uzaklaştırılır. Michael Kimmel seksizm, ırkçılık ve homofobinin hegemonik erkekliği oluşturan ve onun pekişmesini sağlayan temel unsurlar olduğunu ve bu unsurların da hegemonik erkekliğin normatif bir durumdan normal bir duruma dönüşmesini sağlayan söylemsel mekanizmalar görevini üstlendiğini belirtir. (akt. Onur ve Koyuncu, 2004, s. 35) Kimmel'a göre "Homofobi, erkekliğin kültürel tanımını örgütleyen ataerkilliğin merkezinde yer alan ilkelerden biridir." (2013, s. 92) Öte yandan "hem cinsiyetçilik hem de ırkçılıkla derinlemesine bir biçimde iç içe geçmiştir." (2013, s. 100) Bu yüzden homofobiyi sadece eşcinsellere yönelik bir baskı politikası olarak düşünmek, kavramın cinsiyetçilik ve ırkçılıkla olan yakın ilişkisini ve erkek(lik)ler arasındaki iktidar mekanizmalarını düzenleyici yapısını göz ardı etmek anlamına gelir. Bu bağlamda Şenol Topcu, homofobinin kişisel bir korku ve irrasyonel bir inanç olmanın çok ötesinde kültür ve anlam sistemleriyle, kurumlar ve sosyal geleneklerle ilişkili olarak ele alınması gerektiğini ve politik bir alanda oluşan gruplar arası bir sürece işaret ettiğini belirtir. (2019, s. 37) Serpil Sancar da benzer şekilde heteroseksüelliğin, hegemonik erkekliğin kurucu unsuru olarak betimlenebileceğini ve homofobinin basitçe eşcinsellere karşı bir ön yargıcı tavır olmaktan öte, erkekleri hegemonik erkekliğe zorlayıcı işlevlere sahip olduğunu ifade eder. (2013, s. 204)

Ayrıca ergen erkek arkadaş gruplarıyla yapılan bir araştırmanın gösterdiği üzere, erkek çocuklar daha ilkokulda homofobik terimlerle disipline edilmektedir ve ilk öğrenilen cinsel terimler genellikle homofobiyle ilişkilidir. (Sancar, 2013, s. 204) Cinsiyetçi toplumsal ve kültürel mekanizmalar, erkek çocukları küçük yaşlarda "ibne", "top", "oğlancı", "luti" ve "kulampara" gibi muhtelif homofobik kelimelerle disipline ederek egemen erkeklik biçiminin değerlerini benimsemeye yöneltir. Buna göre, erkek çocukların heteroseksüel ilişkiyi tek cinsel yönelim biçimi ve erkekliğin temel kalelerinden biri olarak içselleştirmesi beklenir. Bu süreçte çocuklara homofobik, cinsiyetçi ve ırkçı terimlerin şekillendirdiği kimi "ötekileştirici söylemler"in de empoze edildiği iddia edilebilir.

Cenk Özbay'ın ifade ettiği gibi heteroseksüellik, hegemonik erkekliğin zamanlar ve kültürler üstü tek ortak bileşenidir. Hegemonik erkekliğin tek meşru cinsel yönelim biçimi olan heteroseksüellik, hem gündelik yaşamda evlilikle kutsanırken hem de kültürel örüntülerle teşvik edilir; ya da bir başka deyişle hegemonik erkeklik, heteroseksüellik temeliyle inşa edilir. (2011, s. 184) Peki heteroseksüellik, hegemonik erkeklik için neden bu denli önemlidir? Çünkü heteroseksüellik, erkeklik-kadınlık karşıtlığının üzerine giydirilen ve erkeğin kadına göre üstünlüğünü salık veren hiyerarşik iktidar ilişkilerinin teminatı ve bekası için elzem araçlardan biridir. Heteroseksüel ilişki dışına çıkılması demek, hegemonik erkekliğin temel dayanaklarından birinin sarsılması, bir nevi hegemonyanın zarar görmesi demektir. Bu nedenle eşcinsel ilişki, standartlaş(tırıl)mış toplumsal cinsiyet akışının tersine çevrilmesi olarak görülür ve bir tehdit olarak algılanır. Çünkü hegemonik erkekliğin güvencesi olarak görülen heteroseksüel aile kurumu ile babalık konumunu çıkmaza soktuğu, erkekliğin kaybına ve "dolayısıyla" kadınsılaşmaya neden olduğu düşünülür.

Bu bağlamda Özbay, -R. W. Connell'ın yazılarında sıkça vurguladığı- hegemonik erkekliğin değişmez bir öze işaret etmediği, sabitlenebilecek bir karakter yapısı sunmadığı ve kültürler arasında seyahat edebilecek bir ilişkisellik modeli oluşturmadığı gibi konulara

değinir ve Connell'ın çizdiği çerçeveye göre tanımlanabilecek her tür erkeklik biçiminin, gerekli şartlar sağlandığında hegemonikleşebileceğini belirtir: Eşcinsel erkeklik hariç. Çünkü Özbay'a göre "eşcinsellik; bir 'yönetici toplumsal mantık' olarak heteroseksüelliğin ve kurumların itinayla çizilmiş sınırlarını yıpratır. Heteroseksüelliği 'asıl', 'normal' ve 'sağlıklı' sayan, diğer tüm cinsel yönelim ve kimlikleri cezalandırılacak, tedavi edilecek, en iyi ihtimalle de gizlenecek bir 'sapkınlık' olarak niteleyen sınırlardır bunlar. (2013, s. 200) Topcu ise eşcinselliğin, toplumsal cinsiyet rollerini yerine getiren kişilere rollerin yapaylığını, yaşadıklarının bir role hapsolmuşluk olduğunu gösterdiğini ve bu nedenle de toplumsal cinsiyet düzeni içinde bir tehdit unsuru olarak görüldüğünü ifade eder. (2019, s. 44) Bu yüzden hegemonik erkeklik, eşcinselliği bireysel eğilim olarak adlandırmaz; onu mücadele edilmesi gereken toplumsal ve ahlaki bir sorun olarak algılar. Barutçu da, hegemonik erkekliği tehdit ettiği düşünülen eşcinsel erkeklerin toplum tarafından sünnetsiz, işsiz, askere gitmemiş, bedensel olarak engeli olan veya ilerleyen yaşına rağmen evlenmemiş bir erkeğe nazaran çok daha büyük bir problem olarak algılandığını ifade eder. (2013, s. 57)

Görüldüğü üzere hegemonya, homofobi ve erkeklik arasında girift bir ilişki bulunmaktadır. Toplumsal iktidar ilişkilerini etraflıca çözümleyebilmek adına zaten birbirine içkin vaziyetteki bu kavramları birlikte düşünmek, birlikte ele almak gerekir. Bahsi geçen kavramlar arasındaki yakın temasın izlerinin sürülebileceği en temel alanlardan biri de edebiyattır. Özellikle Murathan Mungan'ın öyküleri bu bağlamda öne çıkar. Yazının bundan sonraki kısmında, Mungan'ın örneklem olarak seçilen "Suret Masalı" ve "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı" öyküleri üzerinden söz konusu izlere odaklanılacaktır.

"Suret Masalı" ile "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı"nda Örgütsel ve Kurumsal Hegemonya

Murathan Mungan'ın öykülerinde eleştiri oklarının yöneltildiği noktalardan biri sol devrimci gruplar ise, bir diğeri darbe dönemlerinde bu gruplara çeşitli işkenceler uygulayan polislerdir. Buna göre, birbirine

karşıt olarak bilinen bu gruplar, hegemonik/homofobik tutumları itibarıyla ortaklaşırlar. Özellikle "Suret Masalı" ve "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı"[1] öykülerinde cinsiyetlen(diril)miş toplumsal öğretilerin örgütsel ve kurumsal boyuttaki izleri vurgulanır. Bu anlatılarda hem sol devrimci grupların kendi içlerindeki hiyerarşik-ötekileştirici tutumlarından bîhaber konumları hem de polisler aracılığıyla şiddetin kurumsal yüzü ironik bir şekilde eleştirilir.

"Suret Masalı"

"Suret Masalı", Mungan'ın *Kaf Dağının Önü* (1994) adlı kitabındaki üç uzun öyküden biridir. Öykü, temel olarak Ceylâ karakteri üzerinden bir kadının erkek egemen devrimci grubun cinsiyetçi tavrıyla savaşımını konu edinir. Aynı zamanda kitabın açılış metni olan bu öykü, muhtelif eleştirilere ev sahipliği yapmasıyla dikkat çekicidir. Gün geçtikçe içerisindeki renkleri ve çoğulluğu iğdiş ederek "karakalabalık"a dönüşen toplum, darbe ve işkenceler dönemi, azınlıklara yönelik kalıplaşmış dışlayıcı söylemler, Mardin'in doğasını ve tarihî dokusunu harap eden betonlaşma süreci, sözde devrimcilik gibi konular, öyküde tartışılan meseleler arasındadır. Ancak metindeki temel eleştiri, erkek egemen sol devrimci grupların hegemonik ve homofobik tutumuna yöneliktir. Buradaki erkeklik eleştirisi, Ceylâ karakterinin örgütle ilişkiselliği üzerinden dile getirilir. Bilgili, güçlü ve asil bir kadın olarak çizilen Ceylâ devrimci mücadeleye, inandığı değerlere katkı sağlamak için örgüt içinde daha önemli konumlara gelmek ister. Ancak örgütteki erkekler arasında, kadınların işkence sırasında fiziksel acıya dayanamayacak kadar hassas ve kırılgan bir bedensel yapıya sahip oldukları, bu yüzden de işkence anında çok kolay "çözülecekleri" gibi bir algı hâkimdir. Bundan dolayı

---

[1] Bu iki öykü hegemonya, homofobi ve erkeklik arasındaki ilişkileri merkeze aldığı için çalışmaya dâhil edilmiştir. Bunun dışında yazarın *Kadından Kentler* (2008) kitabındaki "Burası Ankara İl Radyosu, Şimdi…" ile *Eldivenler Hikâyeler* (2009) kitabındaki "Kaset" öyküleri de bahsi geçen konuya dair çeşitli göndermeler içerir. Ancak bu öykülerde söz konusu mesele odağa alınmayıp yalnızca değinme düzeyinde bırakıldığı için onlar çalışma kapsamına alınmamıştır (Ayrıntı için bk. Arslan, 2016).

örgütle ilgili üst düzey bilgilerin kadınlarla paylaşılmamasına özen gösterilmekte ve onların önemli rütbelere gelmeleri engellenmektedir. Örgütün erkek egemen mekanizmasıyla tanışan Ceylâ hayal kırıklığına uğrar. Ortak değerleri paylaştığına inandığı arkadaşları tarafından dışlanmıştır. Dışlanma gerekçesini bir türlü aklı almaz, nitekim zaman Ceylâ'yı haklı çıkarır:

> Mertlik, yiğitlik, dürüstlük, erkeklik gerekiyordu işkencede direnebilmek için. Fallus sahibi olmak işkenceye karşı direnmeyi, dayanmayı garanti eden tabiatın erkek nesline en büyük armağanı olan tabii bir özel mülkiyetti. Taksimatı söz konusu olamıyordu. Oysa işkencede en çok erkekler çözüldü. Tavizsiz bir dünya kurmuşlardı kendilerine. Kendi erkeklikleri ve erkeklik imgeleri üzerine kurdukları koskoca bir dünya içeride hemen yıkılıveriyordu. En ufak bir gıcıklaşmada birbirine horozlanabilen, yumruk yumruğa girebilen, havalarda sandalye, masa uçurabilenlerin bütün erkeklik hakları ellerinden alınmıştı içeride. Kendilerini ve imgelerini savunmak için gerekli olan bütün silahları ellerinden alınmıştı. Başka çözüm yollarını öğretmemişti hayat onlara. Bu yüzden daha kolay çaresizleşiyor, daha kolay çöküyorlardı. Kendilerini hep erkeklikleriyle savunduklarından kendilerini savunmanın, korumanın başka bir yolunu öğrenememişlerdi. (Mungan 2011, s. 61-62)

Görüldüğü üzere öyküde, cinsiyetlen(diril)miş bedenlere yüklenen erkeklik-kadınlık rolleri, erkek egemen devrimci hareket üzerinden ironik şekilde eleştirilir. Fiziksel dayanıklılık ve cengâverlikle eşlenen "erkek-lik" ile, bedensel acizlik ve teslimiyetle eşlenen "kadın-lık" rolleri, darbe döneminde hapiste yatarak çeşitli işkencelere maruz kalmış bir kadının tanıklığı üzerinden ters yüz edilir. Ayrıca yine bu satırlarda, erkeklik imajının devingen ve kırılgan yapısı da vurgulanır. Dışarıda ve özgürken bakışının değdiği her tarafa tehditler savuran ve saldıran kimi erkeklerin, içeride ve tutsakken uysallaşıp sessizleşmeleri örneği üzerinden erkekliğin çelişkili hâllerine işaret edilir.

Örgütsel düzeydeki darbenin ardından Ceylâ'ya bir darbe de sorgucu/işkenceci polislerden gelir. Öyküde polisler, hegemonik erkekliğin bir başka biçiminin üyeleri ve aynı zamanda "yasal şiddet uygulayıcıları" olarak çizilmiştir. Onlar üzerinden işkence aracılığıyla meşrulaştırılan kurumsal şiddete dikkat çekilir. Gerekli bilgileri zaten örgütün üst düzey erkek üyelerinden almış olan polisler, Ceylâ'ya işkenceye devam ederler; onun direnci karşısında şaşkındırlar. Çünkü küçük bir burjuva kızının kırılgan ve pasif olması, erkeğin hâkimiyeti karşısında aciz kalması gerektiğini düşünürler. Bu bağlamda Connell'ın "ön plana çıkarılmış kadınlık" (2016, s. 273) kavramı yol gösterici olabilir. Buna göre, boyun eğme seçeneği, kültürel ve ideolojik olarak en çok desteklenen bu kadınlık örüntüsüne merkez oluşturur. "Aynen hegemonik erkeklik gibi ön plana çıkarılmış kadınlık da, içeriği her ne kadar özellikle ev ve yatak odasının mahrem alanıyla bağlı olsa da, kültürel bir inşa biçimi olarak fazlasıyla kamusaldır." (2016, s. 274) "Erkeklerin iktidarına uyum sağlama olarak örgütlenen ve boyun eğme, çocuk terbiyesi ve empatiyi kadınca erdemler olarak öne çıkaran bir kadınlık" (2016, s. 274) biçimidir söz konusu olan. İşte bu yüzden Ceyla'nın direnci, erkekliği bir tehdit olarak algılanır. Tehdit altında hissettikleri erkekliklerini/iktidarlarını korumak ve korkularını bastırmak için ona uyguladıkları şiddetin dozunu artırarak işkenceye devam ederler.

Öyküde Nesle Teyze, Edibe Hanım, Meriç Nevzat, Veysi, Çetin, Naim, Beşir ve Umman gibi birçok kişi bulunmasına karşın öne çıkan isimler Ceylâ ve Ressam Faris'dir. Ceylâ ve Fâris, Mardin'den çocukluk arkadaşlarıdır. Metinde Ceylâ'nın, dostu Faris'le söyleştiği ve yazıştığı pasajlar geniş yer kaplar. Bu pasajlar genellikle erkek egemen mekanizmalara yöneltilecek eleştirilere bir alan açmak için işlevsel olarak kurgulanmıştır:

> Bu memlekette her şey erkeklerin tekelinde. Her şey erkekliğin. Ve ne kadar olağan bir şeymiş gibi yaşıyoruz bu gerçeği. Tıpkı bütün öteki gerçekleri yaşadığımız gibi. Hadi gel seninle slogan atalım: Kadın meselesini çözememiş bir sosyalizm yenilmeye mahkûmdur! Sonunda mutlaka

uzlaşacaktır çünkü: Kahrolsun uzlaşma! Kahrolsun
erkeklerin demokrasisi! Kahrolsun Fallokrasi!" (2011, s.
29) "Daha iki kişilik ilişkilerimizi bile üretemezken, koca bir
devrimi gerçekleştirmekten söz ediyorduk. (2011, s. 60)

Erkek egemen dünya düzenine bir isyan niteliğindeki bu ifadeler,
erkeklik meselesinin toplumsal iktidar ilişkileri açısından ne denli
merkezî bir konumda olduğunu gözler önüne serer. Tüm yurttaşların eşit
sayıldığı bir yönetim biçimi şeklinde lanse edilen demokrasinin başına,
erkekliği temsil eden fallusun getirilmesiyle türetilen "Fallokrasi"
kavramıyla toplumsal cinsiyet eşitsizliğine dikkat çekilir. Alıntının son
cümlesi de sol örgüt üyelerinin kendi hegemonik ve hiyerarşik
tavırlarından bihaber konumlarına içerden bir eleştiri niteliğindedir.
Ceylâ, yine Faris'e hitaben yazdığı şu satırlarda ise Türkiye'deki erkeklik
ve kadınlık meseleleriyle ilgili ilginç bir sav ortaya atar:

"Demin sana kadın meselesi falan dedim ya, yalan!
Türkiye'de kadın meselesi yok. Yok öyle bir şey. Türkiye'de
erkek meselesi var. Bundan böyle bu düşüncenin
savunuculuğunu hatta gerekirse teorisyenliğini yapacağım.
[...] Erkek olmak uğruna neler yitirdiklerinin farkında bile
olmadan ölüp gidiyorlar." (2011, s. 31)

Burada bir "ters okuma" yahut "yapısöküm"den bahsetmek mümkündür;
çünkü Türkiye'deki "kadın meselesi"nin kadınlarla ilgili değil aslında
yine erkeklerle ilgili olduğu ileri sürülüp, meselenin çözümü için odağı
değiştirmek ve erkek(lik)lere yönelmek gerektiği vurgulanır. O hâlde
öyküde, erkeklik eleştirisinin yapıldığı pasajlarda sözün/sesin tamamıyla
Ceylâ'ya bırakıldığını ve onun aracılığıyla toplumsal cinsiyete dair birçok
fikrin tartışmaya açıldığını söylemek mümkündür. Üstelik bu pasajlar,
muhtelif sosyolojik tartışmaları körükleyebilecek velut bir niteliktedir.

"Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı"

Kaf Dağının Önü kitabının kapanış öyküsüdür "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar
Masalı". Öykü, on altı bölümden oluşan yüz altmış sekiz sayfalık hacmiyle

95

geleneksel tür tanımının sınırlarını ihlal eder. Edebî türlerin tasnifi konusunda muhtelif görüşler bulunmasına karşın Mungan'ın tavrı nettir. Kendisine öykü anlayışına dair bir soru yöneltildiğinde yazar, eğer kasıt "kısa olmalı, bir olay ya da bir durum anlatmalı, gerçekçi ya da fantastik olmalı" gibi bir formülasyonsa bir öykü anlayışı olmadığını ifade eder ve ekler: "Malzemesi hikâye türüne uygun düşen, kendi dünyamda karşılığı olan, yazarlığımın temel dertleriyle örtüşen şeyleri hikâye olarak yazıyorum." (1987, s. 31) Bu bağlamda Leyla Burcu Dündar, yazarın öykülerini "çağdaş masal" (2001, s. 7) olarak nitelendirir. Dündar, "masal" kelimesiyle Mungan'ın mit, efsane, destan gibi geleneksel anlatı türleriyle olan yakın ilişkisini, "çağdaş" kelimesiyle de yazarın metinlerarasılık (*intertextuality*), yeniden yazma (*rewriting*) ve üstkurmaca (*metafiction*) gibi modern anlatım teknikleriyle olan münasebetini vurgulama niyetindedir. Bu anlamda "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı"nın hemen başındaki üstkurmaca dikkat çekicidir. Başkahraman eşcinsel bir yazar olup anlatı, bu yazarın ölüm haberiyle başlar. Haberi veren, yazarın ölümünü kabullenmekte zorlanan bir başka yazar arkadaşıdır:

> Bir hafta sonraydı. Editörünün yolladığı dosya, kapağı bile açılmadan öylece duruyordu masamın üzerinde. El sürememiştim. [...] Dosyanın üzerinde iri harfler ve özenli yazın: Kaf Dağının Önü. Masallar. [...] Ertesi gün dosyanı okumaya başladım. Çoğu yarım kalmış, bitirmediğin, bitiremediğin, birbirinin içinde sürüp giden masallardan oluşuyordu. Kendince masallarından. Seni yakından tanıyan, dünyanı bilen bir yazar olarak dosyana çeki düzen verecek, kopuklarını giderecek, bağlantılarını sağlamlaştıracak, son hâlini vererek yayıma hazır hâle getirecektim. (Mungan 2011, s. 128-129)

Kendi inşa sürecini okurundan gizlemeyen öyküde, bahsi geçen iki yazarın seslerinin yer yer birbirine karışması sonucu kimlikler belirsizleşir ve metne ustaca müphemiyet ve gizem katılır.

"Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı", çok çeşitli eleştirilere ev sahipliği yapan velut bir öyküdür. Metinde 6-7 Eylül olaylarına, 27 Mayıs/12 Mart/12 Eylül darbelerine, bu dönemlerdeki işkencelere, Türkiye Solu'na, erkek egemen edebiyat kanonuna, sosyo-kültürel yozlaşmaya ve eşcinselliklerini gizleyerek yaşayanlara yönelik muhtelif göndermeler mevcuttur. Ayrıca anlatıda Reşat Nuri, Nâzım Hikmet, Melih Cevdet, Dostoyevski, Flaubert, Marquez, Borges, Calvino, Nabokov, Woolf, Joyce, Althusser ve Foucault gibi birçok yazar, şair ve düşünürle metinlerarası bir diyalog da kurulmuştur. Tek başına detaylı bir incelemeyi hak eden bu öyküde, çalışmanın gereğince hegemonya, erkeklik ve homofobi üçgeni üzerinde durulacaktır. Metnin temel eleştirinin hegemonik/homofobik devrimci örgüt ve erkek egemen edebiyat kanonu üzerine olduğu söylenebilir.

Öykünün başkahramanı olan eşcinsel yazar, devrimci hareketin bir üyesidir; daha doğrusu bir üyesi olmak ister ama cinsel yönelimi onu örgütün bir parçası olmaktan alıkoyar. Çünkü heteroseksüellik, hegemonik erkekliğin en temel koşuludur. Dolayısıyla kadınlar gibi, "kadınsı" bulundukları için eşcinsellere de erkek egemen örgüt içinde -aktif olarak- yer yoktur. Böylelikle eşcinsel yazar da "ibne" damgası yer ve hiçbir zaman grup tarafından benimsenmez. Söylem ve hareketleri bir devrimci için fazla "yumuşak" bulunur. Örgütün anlayışına göre bir devrimci; fiziksel olarak güçlü, dayanıklı ve sert bir mizaçta olmalı, süsten/gösterişten de uzak durmalıdır. Bu durum öyküde şu şekilde işlenir:

> Çok sonra öğrendim, bazı geceler, bazı arkadaşlarla aynı odalarda mahsus yatırılarak imtihan edildiğimi, bazı arkadaşlarımın, eşcinsel bir ilişkim olup olmadığını anlamak için beni ciddi ve sürekli bir biçimde gözaltında tuttuklarını. [...] Gene de ikna edemiyordum onları, boyalı kuştum, teleklerim, tüylerim, rengim onlardan ayırıyordu beni. [...] Ne gariptir ki, polisler de boyalı kuşu teleklerinden, tüylerinden renginden tanımışlardı. Ayrı kafese koydular hemen. Bu yüzden de beni iki kat aşağılamaya başladılar. [...] Bir gece sabaha kadar hiçbir

97

> siyasi soru sormadan yalnızca, ibne misin, değil misin,
> sorusu üzerine falakaya çektiler. (2011, s. 269-271)

Bu satırlar, iki farklı düzeydeki hegemonik/homofobik erkeklik biçimine dair çeşitli veriler sunar: Biri gayriresmî, illegal ve örgütsel düzeydir; diğeri resmî, yasal ve kurumsal... O hâlde öyküdeki devrimci hareket için şu tespiti yapmak mümkündür: Bir hegemonik erkeklik biçimine başkaldıran, onu devirip yerine geçmek isteyen bir başka hegemonik erkeklik biçimi adayı. Çünkü her ikisinde de heteroseksüellik ve fiziksel güç olmazsa olmaz niteliklerdir. Bu iki testten geçemeyen bireyler, "eksik/çürük/ikincil" olarak damgalanarak "hükmedilen" konumuna itilirler. Alıntılanan pasajın özellikle son cümlesi, kurumlara sinmiş homofobik tavrı göstermesi açısından önemlidir. Bütün bu yaşanılanlardan sonra eşcinsel yazarın çıkardığı sonuç şu olur: "Erkeklik imparatorluğu yıkılmadan demokrasinin hiçbir biçimine geçilemeyeceğini düşünüyorum. Yeni bir dünyanın hiçbir biçimine." (2011, s. 272)

98

Öyküde eleştiriye uğrayan bir diğer nokta ise erkek egemen edebiyat kanonudur. Metnin "*barda bir akşamüstü*" adlı bölümünde, Türk edebiyatının son elli yılı panoramik şekilde değerlendirilir. Bu kısımlar kurgusallıktan uzak olup âdeta bir edebiyat eleştirisi metnini çağrıştırır. Memleketin ücra köşe öğretmenleri, zalim ağalar, yoksul ırgatlar, Çukurova sıtması, hümanist balıkçılarla Rum meyhaneciler, parkalı öğrenci liderleri, kan davaları, Almanya'ya işçi olarak göç edenlerin sergüzeştleri, darbe dönemleri ve işkenceler, gecekondu-kent karşıtlığı, küreselleşmeyle yaygınlaşan popülizm ve tüketim kültürü gibi Türk edebiyatının belirli dönemlerinin ana meselesi olmuş muhtelif konulara değinilir. Erkek egemen edebiyat kanonunun öyküye dâhil edilmesinin ana nedeni ise hegemonyanın sadece fiziksel olmayacağını, başka şekillerde de kurulabileceğini göstermektir. Buna göre "beden", hegemonik erkekliğin tek tezahür alanı değildir; "yazı" da bir iktidar alanı/mekânı olarak işlevselleş(tiril)ebilir. O hâlde burada, fiziksel üstünlüğe dayalı bir hegemonya biçiminden ziyade söylemsel/yazınsal üstünlüğe dayalı bir hegemonyadan bahsedilebilir. Sancar'ın deyişiyle "kolektif, fiziksel güce dayalı, bedensel kapasite odaklı bir erkeklikten

[...] bireysel, akla dayalı, bedenin üretken gücünün estetik temsiline dayalı bir erkeklik" (2013, s. 46) biçimine geçiştir burada söz konusu olan.

Bu bağlamda öyküde, eşcinsel yazar üzerinden Türk edebiyatı kanonunun uzun yıllar erkek egemen ve heteroseksist yapıda olduğu dile getirilir. Daha önce örgüt içerisinde "erkeklik sınavı"nı geçemediği için ötelenen yazar, daha sonraki yıllarda aynı sebepten ötürü edebî çevrelerden de dışlanır. Bu durum anlatıda şu şekilde karşılık bulur:

> Ne yaparsam yapayım örgüt içinde yükselemiyordum, sürekli görünmeyen eller tarafından engelleniyordum. Daha sonra edebiyat dünyasında da benzer itilmeleri yaşayacaktım. Kurallar her yerde aynıydı. Varlığım, herkesi kaçtığı bir köşede sıkıştırıyordu. Erkek dünyayı tehdit ediyordum. (Mungan 2011, s. 269)

Bu satırlar aracılığıyla patriyarkal otoriteye ve homofobik uygulamalara yönelik isyan dile getirilir. Benzer şekilde "*barda bir akşamüstü*" bölümünün açılış paragrafı da, erkek egemen edebiyat kanonuna getirdiği eleştiriler açısından dikkat çekicidir. Bir barda akşam saatlerinde iki yazar arkadaş oturmakta ve edebiyat üzerine konuşmaktadır. Konuşmanın daha hemen başında sözü alan eşcinsel yazar, heyecanlı bir edayla -sanki uzun süredir bu anı bekliyormuş gibi hiç zaman kaybetmeden- tiradını atar:

> Kadın yazarlar ardı ardına patlıyordu. Bir furya, geçici bir moda sanılırken âdeta bir egemenlik biçimine dönüşmeye başlamıştı. *Erkek Egemen Edebiyat dünyası kastre olmuş gibiydi*. Erkek yazarlar, elleri apış aralarına kilitlenmiş, şimdi ne yazacaklar, diye korkulu gözlerle kadınların kalem uçlarına bakıyorlar; dışına sürüldüklerini hissettikleri bir dünyanın bu cadı ruhlu yazıcılarına saldırmak istediklerindeyse, onların yazdıklarına bulaşmış aybaşı bezlerinden ya da evde kalmış kız duyarlığından, daha olmadı histeri krizlerinden söz ederek, biyolojik tanım ayrımlarını, mutlak üstünlük aygıtlarına dönüştürmeye

çalışıyorlardı. Başlangıçta, Cumhuriyet çocuğu kadın-
larımızın, yazar da olabildiklerinin sevinciyle karşılanan
aferin dönemi bittikten sonra, tehlike ve tehdit dönemi
başladı; demeye kalmadı feminizm dalgası yükseldi. Sadece
erkeklere değil, kendi bizatihi erkek olan sosyalizme de bir
saldırıydı bu. Saldırı dört kol çengi, erkekler ringin
köşesinde sayı dinliyorlar:

…yedi…sekiz…dokuz…Yetmiyormuş gibi bir de ibne
yazarlar, şairler çıktı ortaya. Aslında onlar hep vardı ama
kimlik kartı kullanmıyorlardı. […] *Edebiyatın erkekliği*
tehlikedeydi. Deplasmanda yeniliyordu bütün hayatı kendi
sahası olarak gören erkekler! İktidar, her zaman paradoksun
ironisine kilitlenmemiş midir? (2011, s. 182-182) [vurgular
bana ait, A.D.A.].

Öykü bu kısımlarda kurmaca dünyadan uzaklaşıp bir fikir yazısı ya da
tarihsel analiz kimliğine bürünür. Bir dönemin edebî ve sosyal çevresinin
tahlilini içeren bu pasajda, hegemonik erkekliğin "iki ötekisi" olan
kadınlar ve eşcinsellerin söylemsel/yazınsal hegemonyayla mücadelesi
vurgulanır. Ayrıca edebiyat ve sosyalizmdeki erkeklik hegemonyasının
kadın ve eşcinsel yazarlarca kademe kademe kırılması da iktidarın
kaygan, kırılgan yapısını gözler önüne serer.

Bitirirken

En temel meselelerinden biri insan ve insan ilişkileri olan edebî
metinlerin psikoloji ve sosyolojiyle ilişkisi kaçınılmazdır. Öyle ki
metinlerdeki derin yapıların çözümlenebilmesi, örtük anlamların
kavranabilmesi adına disiplinlerarası çalışmalar elzem konumdadır.
Mungan öykülerinin etraflıca analiz edilebilmesi için de bakış açılarını,
görme biçimlerini çoğaltmak gerektiği bir gerçektir. Çünkü yazar, kaleme
aldığı metinlerde gelenek ve moderni sentezler; sosyo-kültürel, siyasal
vb. birçok meseleye dair muhtelif göndermeler/eleştiriler yapar.
Hegemonya, homofobi ve erkeklik arasındaki girift ilişki de onun
öykülerinde sıkça işlenen temalar arasındadır. "Suret Masalı" ile

"Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı" öyküleri bu açıdan büyük benzerlik taşır. Metinlerde sol devrimci gruplar aracılığıyla örgütsel, polisler aracılığıyla da kurumsal düzeydeki hegemonik/homofobik söylem ve edimlere kurmaca dünyanın sunduğu imkânlar üzerinden dikkat çekilir. Bu öykülerde cinsel kimliği/yönelimi nedeniyle dışlanan, "ikincil" konuma itilen, fiziksel ya da söylemsel şiddete maruz bırakılan grupların yaşadıkları "ötekilik deneyimi"ni okumak mümkündür. Burada asıl vurgu, şiddetin göz önündeki bireysel ya da toplumsal çehresine değil, daha çok göz ardı edilen örgütsel ya da kurumsal çehresine yöneliktir. Aslında böylelikle onun iktidarla, hegemonik erkeklikle, heteronormativiteyle olan yakın ilişkisine işaret edilir. Ayrıca "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı", yazının da bir iktidar alanına/mekânına dönüşebileceğini göstermesi ve edebiyat tarihi/kanonu meselesine özgün eleştiriler getirmesi açısından çarpıcıdır. Sonuç olarak her iki öykünün de, gerek odaklandıkları konular gerek içerdikleri çok yönlü eleştiri ve göndermelerle özgünlük mülküne eriştiğini söylemek mümkündür.

Kaynakça

Arslan, A. D. (2016). *Murathan Mungan'ın Öykülerinde Hegemonik Erkeklik: İfşa ve Darbe*. Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi. İstanbul: Boğaziçi Üniversitesi.

Barutçu, A. (2013). *Türkiye'de Erkeklik İnşasının Bedensel ve Toplumsal Aşamaları*. Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi.

Connell, R. W. (2016). *Toplumsal Cinsiyet ve İktidar: Toplum, Kişi ve Cinsel Politika* (Çev. Cem Soydemir). İstanbul: Ayrıntı.

Dündar, L. B. (2001). *Murathan Mungan'ın Çağdaş Masallarında Cinsiyetçi Geleneğin Eleştirisi.* Yayımlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi. Ankara: Bilkent Üniversitesi.

Günay Erkol, Ç. (2019). Erkekliğin Onda Dokuzu… *BirGün* (7 Aralık 2019), (Erişim Tarihi: 21.10.2020) https://www.birgun.net/haber/erkekligin-onda-dokuzu-279131

Kimmel, M. S. (2013). Homofobi Olarak Erkeklik: Toplumsal Cinsiyet Kimliğinin İnşasında Korku, Utanç ve Sessizlik (Çev. M. Bozok). *Fe Dergi,* 5(2), 92-107.

Koyuncu, B. ve Onur, H. (2004). Hegemonik Erkekliğin Görünmeyen Yüzü: Sosyalizasyon Sürecinde Erkeklik Oluşumları ve Krizleri Üzerine Düşünceler. *Toplum ve Bilim*, 101, 31-49.

Mungan, M. (1987). Hikâyeciliğimiz Bir Tıkanıklığı Yaşıyor. *Gösteri*, 77, 31-32.

Mungan, M. (2011). Suret Masalı. *Kaf Dağının Önü*. İstanbul: Metis, 9-72.

Mungan, M. (2011). Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı. *Kaf Dağının Önü*. İstanbul: Metis, 125-293.

Özbay, C. (2011). Neoliberal Erkekliğin Sosyolojisine Doğru: *Rentboy*'lar Örneği. C. Özbay, A. Terzioğlu ve Y. Yasin (Haz.). *Neoliberalizm ve Mahremiyet: Türkiye'de Beden, Sağlık ve Cinsellik* içinde, (s. 179-208). İstanbul: Metis.

Özbay, C. (2013). Türkiye'de Hegemonik Erkekliği Aramak. *Doğu Batı*, 63, 185-204.

Sancar, S. (2013). *Erkeklik: İmkânsız İktidar: Ailede, Piyasada ve Sokakta Erkekler.* İstanbul: Metis.

Topcu, Ş. (2019). Murat Uyurkulak'ın 'Pembe', Murathan Mungan'ın 'Kaset' Öykülerinde Erkekliğin ve Erkeklik Algısının Kurucu Unsuru Olarak Homofobi. *KaosQ+*, 8, 36-45.

Murathan Mungan's Stories Entitled "Suret Masalı" and "Kâğıttan Kaplanlar Masalı" as an Intersection of Hegemony, Homophobia, and Masculinity

Abstract: How the concepts of hegemony, homophobia, and masculinity are related to one another, have been the subject of research in many fields, particularly sociology, psychology, law, and political science. In addition to these fields, literature is an important field in which mentioned matters are studies on a fictional level. Murathan Mungan is one of the authors who question hegemonic masculinity, homophobic attitudes, and the "otherness experience" of those exposed to these attitudes are frequently discussed in his texts. In this study, how Mungan narrated all these problems regarding masculinity, discussed them within the possibilities offered by the fictional world, and which narrative strategies he used in this discussion process will be analyzed through the stories chosen as a sample.

Keywords: hegemony, homophobia, masculinity, Murathan Mungan, story

The impact of migration on (re)negotiating one's gender identity: A qualitative study on first generation of Turkish migrant men living in Sweden

Ecem Nazlı Üçok*
Lund University, Sweden

Abstract: This article addresses the ways how Turkish migrant men acknowledge positioning about their gender identity with placing themselves in between of triadic categories, which can be indicated in their narratives as Turkishness, Swedishness, and the Self. While finding themselves at the intersection between three different groups and performing the role of 'generalized other,' migrant men negotiate, react, and respond to the gender identities that they encounter throughout the migration process. By collecting men's narratives of their experiences, the research provided opportunities to reflect on the symbolic meaning of gender identities and manhood. The features that influence gender identities are shaped by broader factors such as culture, class, ethnicity and social hierarchies and also by the elements that arise, individual's social interactions like their personal life stories, experiences, marriage, etc. By exploring first-generation Turkish migrant men's positioning and understanding, this study contributes to the growing research field of treating gender as a central analytic concept for the outcomes of the migration process.
Keywords: Migration, masculinities, the self, gender identity, symbolicinteractionism

* Graduate Student, e-mail: ecemucok@gmail.com
ORCID ID: 0000-0002-7582-1562

> *'The marginal man, as Park conceived him was a, cultural hybrid, a man living and sharing intimately in the cultural life and traditions of two distinct peoples; never quite willing to break, even if he were permitted to do so, with his past and his traditions, and not quite accepted, because of racial prejudice, in the new society in which he now sought to find a place. He was a man on the margin of two cultures and two societies, which never completely interpenetrated and fused.' (Goldberg, 2012:201)*

Robert Park created the idea of the 'the marginal man' to describe migrants who came from Europe to the United States by the mid 1890's (Goldberg, 2012). Park's 'the marginal man', 'was himself a microcosm of cultural conflict, which reappeared in his mind as 'the conflict of 'the divided self,' the old self and the new' (Goldberg, 2012, p. 201). According to Park, the cultural conflict that the immigrants experience could provide an opportunity to be positioned and creating a new understanding of themselves in relation to their place and role in the host society. Park's marginal men, who had a potential to reconstruct their identity, turn into creative agents who, as immigrant, experienced cultural conflict as a crisis (Goldberg, 2012).

As Park also points out, when immigrant men move to a new context, conflicting relations with new and old cultural models come along as well. What I mean here with culture is in the sense of everyday life in households, families, streets, work; in everyday situations where is essential in building people's practices, assumptions, expectations, and identities. Turkish Migrants are one of the largest groups in Sweden who started to migrate by mid 1960's. Even though there have been several studies about Turkish Migrants in Sweden and about their integration processes and historical past, there is a lack of research about Turkish Migrant Men, which considers a gendered understanding of the migration process. There is a tendency to see migrant groups as homogenous, and thus we tend to ignore intersections of class, age, length of residency, and marital status in our research. Studying men and

masculinities in the context of migration offers us the possibility to redefine our prospects, such as that men can change their subjectivities and practices, and could serve as an opportunity to understand gender domination and the changing social relations of gender in daily practices of people.

A man's social identity can take different shapes, and some identities could be prioritized over others in different societal and cultural models (Hearn, 2012). If we say that one's own cultural model affects how gender roles and masculinity are shaped, we can ask the question in the case of migrant men: what happens to immigrant men who suddenly find themselves in another cultural context? As Hearn stated, maybe we can argue that for migrant men who find themselves in new cultural and gender expression of roles, old roles can no longer be enabled for them so we cannot take for granted the old gender identities that they have (Hearn, 2012, p. 23).

Throughout the article, this study tries to include a gendered understanding of the migration and settlement process, which suggests an analysis of how normative and social practices surrounding masculinity enter men's personal narratives and how they relationally construct their identities and practices. This article represents an attempt to make a place where the voices of first-generation immigrant men, who found themselves in a new cultural and gendered context, can be heard. My main aim was to avoid a homogenous understanding of Turkish immigration in Sweden. In doing so, I focused my research on the post migration status of educated heterosexual Turkish men who immigrated to Sweden after the 1960s for several different reasons.

By exploring Turkish immigrant men's ideas and understanding of gender perceptions, norms, and cultural practices in Turkey and Sweden, the study will contribute to the growing field of research on exploring and practicing masculinity in different locations. Another contribution of this article is the opening of places to see men and masculinity as shifting phenomena in the process of change and to deconstruct the relationship of men's formation within a gender order.

In light of the above, the main objective of the article is shaped as with following questions: 1.) How do Turkish migrant men position their gender identities in Sweden and Turkey? How do Turkish men perceive changes in their gender identities when moving from Turkey to Sweden? How do they define the shift in their gender expression affect relations in their private sphere?

2.) How do Turkish men perform their post-migration gender identity? To what extent are migration and settlement processes playing a role?

Historical Background

Many Turkish Migrants are spread all around the world, but most live in Germany, the Netherlands, and Sweden. Sweden has been an immigration country for Turks since the mid-1960s. Most Turkish migrants started to immigrate to Europe to seek employment and a better life. Sweden had signed a labor force agreement with Turkey in 1967, but most of the migration happened through unofficial networks (Baser, 2017). The agreement aimed to provide the Swedish economy with temporary unskilled labor, 'guest workers', while thinning the ranks of Turkey's unemployed. The Turkish men who had arrived on their own in the 1960s brought their wives and children to Sweden in the 1970s. People from Ankara, Istanbul and other provinces also migrated to Sweden, mostly through social contacts. The people who came from urban areas had higher socioeconomic position that migrants from rural areas. Turkish migrants came to work in big industrial cities like Stockholm and Gothenburg, where they found jobs mainly in the manufacturing sector as blue- collar workers (ibid).

Later on, people who found jobs as blue collar had a chance to change their careers or build their own job in Sweden. These people had found places in the job market as teachers, nurses, restaurant owner. The participants of this study consist of those people who built themselves another type of career path, different from the first one in respect to

when they arrived to Sweden. After the first phase of immigration ended around 1972, most of the people who immigrated to Sweden did so for political reasons and governmental pressure on political groups in Turkey. Most of the people escaped from the oppressive government. Another wave of migration began after the military coup in 1980, represented by as asylum-seekers, and mostly with a Kurdish origin (Baser, 2017). Since the mid-1980s, asylum seekers have been heading for Western Europe. They have been seeking protection from the consequences of the Turkish military's intervention in civilian politics in 1980, and from the increase in the violence surrounding efforts to suppress a separatist movement by Turkey's large Kurdish minority, which by most accounts makes up roughly 20 percent of the total population. The two sides have fought over a range of issues, including the right to use the Kurdish language and demands for a separate Kurdish state. According to governmental statistics, the violence surrounding the Kurdish problem in Turkey, especially during the first half of the 1990s, led to the displacement of approximately 330,000 people from their regular places of residence (Baser, 2017).

People immigrated to Sweden to find a way to escape from the pressure coming from the different leftist and rightist groups. According to official statistics, there were 47,06 Swedish residents in 2016 who were born in Turkey (Statistics Sweden, 2016)) and more than half living in the city of Stockholm. When we look at the gender ratio while 25,858 immigrants were men, women immigrants were 23,156. Baser mentions that if we include the children and grandchildren of the first generation immigrations from Turkey, the number of Swedes with their origins in Turkey far exceeds 100,000 (Baser, 2017).

Moving towards to intersectional and gendered understanding of migration

Starting from the 1980s, men's studies started to grow with the theoretical works of Connell about the construct of masculinity and the variations of masculinity in different contexts. Connell (1995) examined the

differences and similarities of masculinity at various times, places, and experiences. He argued that the way masculinity is constructed would be understandable through the study of local and cultural masculinity. The construction of an intersectional perspective on how class, race, ethnicity, age, and national context affect masculinity became an essential topic to investigate to different kind of stories of men that how this several factors affect their identity and masculinity (Connell and Messerschmidt, 2005).

Collin's articulation of the concept of **intersectionality** can be contextualized in my research to understand how the organization of power in given societies is not only shaped by a single axis of social distribution but through many axes that influence each other like culture, ethnicity, class, gender, and nationality. As Collins states, 'For one is never simply just a woman or a man; one is defined by and operates within these other social constructs that have very real consequences that shape experiences, life chances, perspectives, and values' (Cole, 2017).

The intersectional approach does not recognize individuals from the perspective of not as fixed entities, but rather as they produce their own life narratives and identities in different events. The self is multiple, shifting, changing according to one's own social interactions. According to Connell (2001), if we want to understand the concept of gender and inequalities between men and women, it is important to examine the different systems and institutions of societies like family, marriage, media, state, military, and, in the case of my research, 'migration'. Pease and Hibbins, inspired by Connell's work, suggested that if we want a more fully engendered understanding of the migration process, including the gendered dimensions of men's experience is a necessary component for development of migration and gender studies (Pease 2013, p. 78).

For many researchers who are interested in migration processes in Critical Studies on Men and Masculinities, gender served as a main analytical concept for studying the outcomes of the migration process (Pease 2013, p. 81). Traditional immigration research had a tendency to

generally focus on men 'by examining men as non-gendered humans and it too has ignored the gendered dimensions of men's experiences' (Hibbins and Pease et al., 2009, p. 5). Moreover, according to this understanding, instead of treating the gender as a variable 'within the causes and experiences of migration', rather there is a need to treat it as a 'central analytical concept for studying the causes and outcomes of the migration process' (Ibid). By adopting this approach, I have tried to develop a fully engendered understanding of the migration process through the use of intersectionality to connect the categories of gender, ethnicity, class, race, nationality, etc., together.

Theoretical Framework Framing social actors

In contrast to positivist theoretical approaches, which emphasize the statistical and objective understandings of data analysis, I tried to follow the tradition of **interpretive approach** as a theoretical path. The interpretive approach can be defined as human action, and human experience is rooted in people's meanings, activities, interactions, and interpretations (Prus, 1996). The positivistic method while emphasizes a statistical, scientific, and objective understanding of analysis, while the interpretive tradition for many positivist sociologists was criticized for being unscientific and subjective. Weber and the symbolic interactionist conceptualization were the ones that follow the qualitative path of the interpretive framework.

How social actors build their social reality through different cultural models plays a vital role in my analysis of Turkish immigrant men. Many theorists have discussed how to view social actors and their way of constructing social reality. Weber explained that action is something social that is the subjective meaning connected to it by the actions of the individual considering of the behavior of others (Ibid). According to this understanding, social action might be influenced by the past, present and future relationships (Ibid). Weber suggests a method of understanding the meaning of action from the actor's point of view. The actor is seen as a subject rather than an object of the research, in which

individuals organize their understanding and give it a meaning, rather than being unaware objects oriented by other forces (Ibid)

In the same line of Weber's discussion on social actors, symbolic interactionists like Goffman and Mead wrote how social actors are shaped through interactions with others. Turkish migrant men who changed their location to other positioned their individual experience through reflection on people's awareness of Mead's *'generalized other'*. Mead, in his work entitled Mind, Self and Society, focuses on the idea that one's mind is not given but rather that it emerges and is shaped when people interact with the others through the processes of communication (Mead, 2015). The mind develops itself through interaction with other people and becomes able to make meaningful implications of itself and others. As Mead points out people's image of the self are asserted through interaction with other and develop taking the 'role or adopting the viewpoint of other' (Cronk) The self is not an unsociable concept or object but instead is something that takes form when we encounter those around us. Humans' ability to think, interpret, define, and select is a 'reflective' process only with the accompany of others and anticipating the self as an object from the viewpoint of other (Prus, 1996. p. 55). Mead explained that 'the reflective essence of self that rooted in a society of others' as generalized other (Mead, 2015). Through the generalized other, individuals embody the expectations of many people and sets of cultural norms, behaviors, attitudes, values, and particular languages (Aboulafia, 2016).

Furthermore, also Goffman (1959) focuses on the human capacity for self-reflexivity in his work called 'The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life'. Goffman's social actors are alive and interactionist. Goffman writes 'they make mistakes, they watch, define, and try to anticipate the other, they plan, they perform, they adjust as objects of their awareness, people have images of themselves and others' (Goffman, 1959 cited in Prus, 1996, p. 80). In my research, my participants started to be reflective about their life experiences and conditions by comparing their past and present relations in different social settings. They were not merely 'dummy' objects that we can

analyze through statistical processes. In the case of my research participants, it was vital for me to acknowledge them as social actors who are reflexive and expressive about their own life choices, experiences, and encounter in different social settings.

Moving from here, Mead explained that 'the self' is not a passive reflection of the generalized other but rather the individual's active reaction to the social world. Individuals can decide what they will do 'in the light of the attitudes of others' (Cronk). According to Mead, there are two phases of the self; the first one is 'me' which is refers 'the self' while representing the behaviors, expectations, and attitudes learned through interactions with others and acts in habitual ways; second one is 'the I' can reflect on these and make self-consciousness choices as we can conceptualize that 'it allows us to be different, both from other people and our former selves through reflection on our actions' (Appelrouth and Edles, 2011, p. 62). In this sense we can define the 'the self'(me) as not static or fixed but rather as something that can be developed over time from social experiences and activities.

The self can go through a transformation in relation to different interactions with others. In the light of the discussion of Mead, and partly Goffman, I started to ask this question to the Turkish migrant men migrated to Sweden; what would for one can mean being generalized other when they found themselves with the interaction of people who have different sets of symbols, norms, behaviors, cultural systems different from their previous self? If individuals create themselves through the social interactions with others and create a sense of self, when they move to one culture to another, new reactions can occur with interacting the social actors in the new context. Considering Mead's conceptualization, we can say that when the cultural system in which one resides changes, new selves can produce themselves.

The social interaction between me and my participants and myself positioned them in a triadic situation of 'Swedishness, Turkishness, and the Self'. In describing the generalized other by itself, they position themselves as actors (I) whose audience is their own actions (me). They

unfold the situation of finding themselves from Turkey to Sweden and how this affected their sense of self with the creation of new categories in their interactions. With their encounter of Swedish culture and interaction with Swedish people, Turkish migrant men describe, ascribe, think, position, question, and interpret the social context, norms, and ideas that they found themselves in host community.

<div align="right">Defining *in-betweenness*</div>

The world is becoming more transnational; what we call men and gender relations is not hard to understood only locally or transnationally. What we call gender relations, men, and masculinity are both constructed through local and transnational borders. These local, national, societal, and cultural patterns and what is defined along specific cultures are not fixed entities. They are also shaped by global and transnational processes like migration (Hearn, 1990, p.23).

Immigrant men and their masculinity are not stable entities; men move between different national and cultural contexts where they are confronted **'multiplicity of potential trajectories'** (Howson et al., 2009, p. 5). In saying 'multiplicity of potential trajectories', I interpreted Howson as meaning that transnational migrant men have several kinds of directions they can follow in the new social contexts that they moved to. These migrant men do not consist of homogenous groups, but instead they differ depending on intersectional components. We must acknowledge that the migrant man does not directly assimilate or integrate himself into the new discursive practices of society. There are certain amounts of processes and different reasoning's in which they need to deal with 'multiple potential trajectories' and also a state of in-between-ness, even if they define themselves as having integrated or not integrated into the society they moved to (Howson et al., 2009). In the Turkish context, local masculinity can produce certain kinds of discursive practices to construct identities and organize practices. And in the Swedish context, migrant men can produce 'cultural blending or

corresponding relationships with other Swedish men' (Pease, 2013, p. 85).

As Grillo conceptualizes, I dealt with the states of **'in-between-ness'** of my participants in my analysis (Grillo, 2001). The experiences of migration for my participants were trans-migratory, which is marked by 'in-between-ness' where their identities cannot be restricted to the local society from which they came or the one in which they settled. As Nowicki describes, Turkish migrant men became 'little by little', instead of being someone from 'here' or 'there', they have become someone simultaneously 'here and there' (Ibid 2001, 103). This state of 'in-between-ness' can be explained with the formation of a hybrid identity. We can say that there is a three-way of possibilities of social integration. The first is *marginalization*, which refers to the distancing of oneself from both cultures at the same time. Second is *assimilation*, which can be defined as the full adoption of the host culture and segmentation and the complete identification and socialization inside the ethnic surrounding (Schumann, 2011). And last, *multiple integrations* allow for the development of a hybrid identity, which I prefer to call in my participants' feeling of being home neither represented in Turkey and Sweden for most of them, or 'in-between-ness' (ibid).

Transformations in what men do, with whom men engage, and what men understand emphasize the importance of going back to the social meanings about what is to be a man. And it is possible in this context to see why 'identity has emerged as one of the key dynamic concepts in... rethinking social and cultural change' (Hearn, 2013, p. 134). The process of transmigration is something linked to social, economic, and cultural relations, and the activities of daily life could take a different path or not in the new transnational social field that they settled. The identities of people cannot be constructed by itself, but rather must be through social relations. When transnational men move to a new context, they enter new social relations in which gender regimes and the gender order constitute specific discourse.

The main point that caused my participants to be in a state of 'in-betweenness' was the construction of the different cultural model in Sweden and Turkey. Turkey was drawing a picture of a collectivistic system of culture in contrast to Sweden's individualistic values. My participants were aware that these two formulated ways of constructing cultural norms and values affected how they act, define, speak, think, and how they perceived gender and gender identities.

Hofstede explains that there are four dimensions of social systems: power distance, collectivism vs. individualism, femininity vs. masculinity and uncertainty avoidance (Hofstede, 2011, p. 2). Power distance emphasizes how members of certain kind of institutions, like 'family', accept that power is something distributed unequally. While Sweden characterizes an attitude of culture that lowers inequality, meaning being independent, equal rights and power are decentralized, Turkey portrays the opposite picture. In individualism and collectivism, individualism measures the degree of interdependence a society maintains among its members. It can illustrate that the ties between individuals are weak and everyone is expected to look after himself or herself (Ibid. p. 13).

In collectivism, people belong to groups, families, and organization, and throughout people's lives, it's essential to protect and keep ties strong with each other. In individualistic cultures, gender roles are not very distinct and the margin of being masculine and feminine is not sharp, while in collectivistic traits, the social roles of being women and men are highly differentiated. In social and family relations, gender equality is prominently essential regarding how societies differ. While the traditional gender roles of men are higher (men are the breadwinners, women are the caretakers) in countries with low gender equality, the roles of women and men have more freedom to destroy this traditional construction in countries with high gender equality like Sweden (Hofstede, 2011, p. 16).

My participants reflected on how they found themselves, and how migration from a collectivist society to individualistic society affected

their relations with gender, family, and connection in Sweden. What I call Swedish values or Turkish values are not static elements but are interchangeable and self-reflexive, like the migrant men themselves. It is important to point out that there is no homogenized picture of how Turkish society or Swedish society is framed, but the only thing that we pay attention to here is how these characteristic values affect the descriptions of Turkish migrant men exposed to Swedish culture.

Methodological considerations

Schrock and Schwalbe (2009, 279) suggest that 'qualitative methods provide the best insight into how men present themselves as gendered beings.' Following the footsteps of Schrock and Schwalbe, I decided to avoid survey-based and questionnaire-based approaches since I wanted to dig into how Turkish men position themselves with their own perceptions. I wanted to stay away from materializing men and masculinity by treating them as fixed identities. As I adopted a qualitative method, methodological concerns emerged from the ethnographic tradition of research. Malinowski, an important figure of ethnographic research, insisted in his work that ethnography should not begin with a rigid hypothesis (O'Reilly, 2008, p. 54).

I had some concerns about how I was going to prevent myself from having assumptions and a hypothesis in my mind about what I kind of answer I might receive from my participants. From that moment on, I accepted that it is impossible start out with no preconceived ideas, thoughts, or theories. Since I am from Turkey and share the same cultural package with my participants, I was afraid to adopt the fully inductive approach that ethnographic research tradition requires. The inductive approach could be explained along the lines of the 'researcher starts with as open a mind an as few preconceptions as possible allowing theory to emerge from the data'. The deductive approach can be defined as the data that emerged from the theory (O'Reilly, 2008, p. 104).

As I was having these concerns throughout my research and rejecting the idea of deductive approach, I felt like I had to find a middle way to analyze my data with another kind of methodological approach. Instead of totally adopting an inductive approach, Karen O'Reilly suggests to use an iterative inductive method, which can be described as the acceptance that we have some preconceptions, theories, and goals as researchers and that it is impossible to think that an 'ethnographer can be entirely inductive' (O'Reilly, 2005, p. 2). According to O'Reilly, iterative- inductive approach includes 'drawing on a family of methods, involving direct and sustained contact with human agents, within context of their lives and cultures, watching what happens, listening to what is said, asking questions, and producing a richly written account that respects the irreducibility of human experience, that acknowledges the role of theory, as well as the researcher's own role, and that views humans as part object/part subject' (O'Reilly, 2005, p. 2).

Instead of adopting a deductive approach, which is a theory-before-research method, I tried to start my research with as open and clear a mind as possible about what I was going to gather through data collection. I let my data lead my analysis and theoretical framework. During my research process, I tried not to close my mind to things that would surprise me, and during the data collection process, I focused on theories and concepts that could be useful for my research. 'This involved a constant iteration of participating, writing, reading, thinking, listening, and participating, in a circular rather than linear way' (O'Reilly, 2008). By acknowledging that the ethnographic research is not a 'clean experience' (O'Reilly, 2005, p. 5), I looked through the lenses of a Turkish person and with a baggage of an academic knowledge, and my role as a researcher was hard to ignore. The things I recorded as data were directly related to my own theoretical orientation and subjectivity. My preconceptions shaped my goals and theories, but I tried to minimize the effect of these and turn them into advantages was my main goal by trying to acknowledge and be reflexive in accepting this.

Moreover, my methodological considerations also came from the encounter between asa woman researcher and my male participants is an

illustration of a gendered power which is gender as also performed and have implications on my own finding and analysis in my research. As one of the prominent standpoint theorist Donna Haraway discussed that the situated knowledges that produced in my research is in a relationship with certain power structures such as gender, class, ethnicity etc. (Haraway, 1988). Being in a neutral position towards as a woman researcher in my research was not completely possible. While interpreting their experiences, I acknowledged my privileged position as a woman from Turkey in an academic world which has the power to interpret my participants' social realities. The situated knowledge that I analyze with my own interpretation is produced in a specific social context and certain experiences.

As a female researcher, I tried to follow the footsteps of feminist methodology. As Pease and Pini and Dywer and Buckle underlines during the 1980's feminist postmodernist-standpoint researchers drew a three methodological highlight (Pease and Pini, 2013; Dywer and Buckle, 2009):

1.) 'a recognition of the open presence of the researcher as intrinsic to the process' (Pease and Pini, 2013, p. 40);

2.) 'non-hierarchical, non-manipulative research relationships which have the potential to over- come the separation between the researcher and the researched' (Dywer and Buckle, 2009, p. 62)

3.) 'transforming the research process into one of conscientization, a process of learning and critical self-reflection for the participants' (Pease and Pini, 2013, 40-41).

Interviews and experiences

The interviews were conducted by myself on eight Turkish migrant men. I needed to limit my sample to eight semi-structured interviews due to the time limitation in my research process. The length of my interviews was between 1.5-2 hour. The participants of my research were chosen through a snowball method, and selected through existing networks from my

119

own involvement with the Turkish community in Sweden and familiarities through people. I used a thematic analysis to analyze my interviews. A thematic analysis can be defined as a method identifying, analyzing and reporting patterns within data (Braun and Clarke, 2006, p. 79). As I discussed before I adopted an iterative-inductive approach which develops a process of coding the data without trying to fit them pre-existed frames in my mind.

As following to footsteps of thematic analysis, I listened the audio-records of my interviews more than one time and after I transcribed them, I re-read them during my analysis process. I coded every data item that could be have a potential for the themes. Among the several themes of analysis, there were work life, comparison between Swedish and Turkish culture, gender relation, family and social life for Turkish migrant men. The aim of both these chapters was to show how the movement of men to different geographical places could make them question and analyze their way of constructing identities and gendered identities in relation to home and host community.

The research sample contained men who had left Turkey after 1970's and restricted the length of the stay in Sweden between 20- 50 years.

Name	Marital Status	Length of Stay	Education/ Occupation	Age
Erdem	Married to a Turkish woman	47 years	high school- owns his cleaning company	63 years old
Ali	Married to a Turkish woman	49 years	high school- trade sector	67 years old
Mehmet	Married to a Swedish woman	47 years	university- architect in Turkey and teacher in Sweden	70 years old
Ahmet	Married to a Swedish woman	20 years	university- doctor	45 years old
Cem	Married to a Swedish woman	34 years	university- teacher	65 years old
Osman	Married to a Turkish woman	47 years	university- engineer	68 years old
Selim	Divorced from a Swedish woman- now single	28 years	high school- tourist agency owner	53 years old
Halil	Married to a Turkish womn	45 years	high school- owns a restaurant	64 years old

The group is heterogeneous in terms of marital status, length of stay, education, motivation for leaving Turkey, but I tried to choose to class of my participants from middle-class men who at least highest completed education is high school. Here it is important here to acknowledge that all my interviewees were heterosexual, and if I were to extend my study to homosexual men, the results would have been different. All of my participants religiously were Sunni and had a Turkish origin.

I strove to get the interviewees to talk as openly and variedly possible about their lives in the old country and about the migration process and existence in the host country. I told my informants that I wanted to conduct their interviews in the manner of a casual meeting in a social environment. I wanted my interviewees to choose a place to meet because it was important for me that they felt comfortable enough to talk. Three of my interviews were conducted in a household environment, and the rest were conducted at coffee shops where my participants choose to meet in the Swedish cities of Lund and Malmö.

Although all of my participants had visited Turkey various time after they immigrated to Sweden, and one can assume that they can have an enough knowledge of current situation in Turkey, I must admit that there were no fixed facts in the sense when they talk about how the reality is in Turkey for all men nowadays. Their past relations of the social world have formed the men's self- concept and view of life. The experiences they had back then make it possible to identify certain patterns and processes about the discourse of Turkish culture, men, and masculinity.

The main question I tried to centered my interview questions was how the migration from one culture to another had influenced the men in my study in relation to their perception of themselves as men in general. Six general areas were covered in the semi-structured interviews: Their relations with Turkey, migrant experiences, ethnicity, work and family conditions, relation with Swedish women and men. The order of coverage varied, depending on the flow of conversation with each Turkish migrant man.

I had some concerns about conducting my interviews in Turkish because I was going to translate everything into English to analyze my findings. I was afraid that during the translation process specific meanings and phrases in Turkish were going to lose their meaning for my reader. I found it hard to translate some of the words to English.

Since I was sharing the same store of knowledge with my participants in my research, I had the chance to attribute more meanings to the things they said. I was aware of how a Swede, or someone from another culture, would interpret differently from my interpretation if they were to conduct this research. I am aware that my transcription and translation are not completely neutral and unbiased. Moreover, it is necessary to acknowledge that transcription and translation process was important to take into account for my analysis because the way I transcribe and translate contains my references and biases (Dong and Blommaert, 2010, p. 68).

During all the data collection and analysis processes, I tried to sustain my role as a researcher which I know that there is no neutral production of knowledge, as all knowledge is situated in relation to the researcher's positions and experiences (Harraway, 1988). My perspectives and my position were a part of my fieldwork. As Blommaert and Dong discuss, I think that 'an analysis of the interview is never just an analysis of what the interviewee said, it is an analysis of a dialogue between men and the interviewee' (Dong and Blommaert, 2010, p. 49) When I was putting together results, as a researcher, I was part of it in many ways; by selecting the research questions I found interesting, my interactions with interviewees, and the inspiration I got from my previous experiences, and theories.

Ethical considerations

The ethical decisions in this research were directed by the ASA/ Ethical guidelines for good research practice (2011). This study is not based upon to review by an ethical board. When the thesis began, I tried to make sure

that that I would have not posed any major ethical challenges. However, throughout my research, I tried to follow established ethical principles. Verbal consent received from all interviewees. When I was contacting with them and before we started the interview, I informed them that they would have been kept anonymous in the research, and asked their permission to record the interviews. I told them whenever they felt uncomfortable about talking for a topic to get recorded, we could have stopped (except one of my interviewees, no one wanted to stop recording during the interviews).

I also made clear that the data would have only been used for this research. I had to be sure that the interviewees were informed about the research objectives, that they agreed to participate, that their anonymity would have been preserved and that the recorded interviews would have only been used for research purposes. My participants wanted me to do keep their real name under cover so I changed their name because of ethical concerns. I was afraid to exploit my participants' good intention to help me out during my research. When we finished to interviews, some of the men's expressed that how they feel relaxed and happy to talk about these things because it made them to rethink to their life choices and experiences. Moreover, I believe that this kind of studies has a good effect on society level because it makes people to realize that starting a new life as an immigrant in a new society can be challenging for social actors, more than we think.

On emotions and Reflexivity

Ethnographers are in 'precarious situations' because of as researchers and 'participants in the life-worlds of others' (Prus, 1996, p. 187). My role in my research is a source of intrusive self who as a researcher forces to generalize and simply other people's lives (O'Reilly, 2008, p. 191). I found myself trying to maintain dramaturgical discipline (Goffman, 1959); I noticed that during the research process. I was on a stage while in the existence of interviewees in my field. I was trying to manage my

emotional experience through the challenges and ambiguities in field research (Prus, 1996).

I tried to locate myself in my research as openly and honestly as much as I can which my analysis filtered through my own subjectivity. Furthermore, I strongly believe that there is a need of acknowledging the emotional labor and subjective reflexivity involved in doing qualitative research. During the research process, I often found myself emotionally involved more than I needed to.

As a researcher, I was aware that my subjectivity could affect my research in different ways. The predominant part of my subjectivity which had an impact on my research was my gender, age and nationality. I was a female second-year master's student, coming from Turkey and living in Sweden for almost 2 years, which is less than my Turkish participants immigrated to here.

I experienced what Lyman and Scott defines as "stage fright" that I was worried about my ability to feel comfortable with my interviewees during the interviewee process (Prus, 1996: 188). After I conducted my interviews, I found myself emotionally drained and exhausted. One day after I finished one of my interviews, I went to grab a coffee with my friends and when they saw me, they told me that I was looking very saddened and exhausted. I tried to explain them how I felt connected when my participant talked about his migration process in a new context.

In the process of conducting interviews, I performed an emotional labor (Hochshild, 2003 cited in Seear and McLean, 2008) as a researcher while I was listening to the life stories of my participants. I suppressed my own emotions in exchange for making the interviewee feel comfortable. However, at the end of the interviews I was left on my own to process how they made me feel afterwards. When they started to talk about the loneliness that they felt, and the feelings of missing home, I started to memorize my own adaptation process to Sweden, and made me think about those days. When some of my participant expressed how throughout all these years they were never fully integrated in Sweden, it

led me to think about my own fears and feelings to live in another society and culture different than mine. I was in their same situation, coming to a new country and changing my whole life for my education at a younger age. I had hard times.

As a woman searching for men, I was aware that my research was including gendered power (Pease and Pini, 2013). I had some concerns whether my male participants would have been less willing to participate to my research, or would have been less talkative when answering to questions that I asked. Since I was a young female researcher, and way younger than my participants, I think that I was not assigned to a position of having an 'authoritarian researcher' female identity towards my male participants (Arendell, 1997). That gave a certain kind of strength to my research, as well as some disadvantages.

I felt like most of my participants would not full see myself in the researcher role, but rather as someone that had the same as their kids; I could have been their daughter, or one of their relatives. Suddenly, I found myself, instead of a researcher, as someone that they could share their concerns about life, inner thought, and the political and social situation and future of Turkey, with. Although after we finished the interview, they wanted to continue talk with me about their life, retirement plans, and the fear of getting old. I could see from my participants that they found in me as someone close to their nationality. some of them they invited to have dinner with their families since they were seeing me a young girl who came to study to another country. I felt like I was getting closer to them as I should have not to.

I tried to keep my position as 'working in the hypen' while I was trying to position myself as insider and outsider status. As Fine and Sirin, Kanuha developed a strategy as strategies for researching at the hyphen of insider and outsider status, I tried to position myself in the betweenness of them (Fine and Sirin, 2007). Since my research focuses on the qualitative analysis of cultural narratives of the Turkish migrant men who moved to Sweden, I consider myself as an insider in this group because I am a native Turkish, born and raised in Turkey. Engaging in

125

the research from a feminist perspective also means not intentionally drawing boundaries between those doing the research and those being researched, although each person has a different relationship to the work being done (Lloyd, Ennis& Alkinson, 1994).

As Dwyer and Buckle defines, insider research refers to share as a researcher to same identity, language and experiential base with the participants of study (Dwyer and Buckle, 2009). To be an insider researcher made my participant to more open to me and allowed me to collect more in-depth data. Some of my participants, at the end of interviews, told me that they would have not felt comfortable if they had spoken to a Swedish person or from another nationality, about this topic. Sharing a certain kind of national background made them to accept to do participate to my research.

As an insider, the linguistic easiness which I shared with my participants helped me to gain more data and insights about my research. I was familiar to the narratives and stories that they were telling to me about Turkey. It was easy to build a trustful relationship because I was coming from the same background and speaking same native language with my participants. They were seeing me as an acquaintance they could share their lives and thoughts about Turkey and Sweden with. I was afraid that my role as an insider would hinder my research process with the possibility of 'the participant will make assumptions of similarity and therefore fail to explain their individual experience fully' (Dywer and Buckle, 2009, p. 58). The disadvantage of being an insider for me was that I could not ask simple questions that someone who is an outsider status would easily ask. I think as an insider, I unintentionally avoided asking the questions whose answers I already assume to know.

At the same time, I was on outsider in the Swedish society who moved here two years ago. I did not have any previous experience about Swedish culture and practices. As an outsider, I was able to keep my distance and objectivity towards Swedish culture but it was not the same for Turkish context. As an insider, I had difficult times to keep a distance

emotionally and objectively to my own culture. Even though I found some positive sides positioning myself not insider or outsider, I felt the pressure of losing my objectivity, being overly subjective with internalizing my participant's point of views. I was worried that as an insider perspective my research was going to be seen as biased or not scientific enough. I noticed that I was both the subject and object of my research.

I had my own challenges in identifying whether I was an insider or outsider, or somewhere in between in my research (Acker, 2000). I think that the terms of being an insider and outsider are something slippery. As Acker suggests, instead of focusing to restrict myself with the question of being insider or outsider, I prefer to position myself 'the space in it between' as researcher (Dwyer and Buckle, 2009, p. 57). I believe that since the process of research includes intensive process of reading and writing, my perspective shaped my position as researcher. Therefore, it was hard to drive a drive clear-cut position in respect to the one that I occupied as researcher.

Men in betweenness

Turkish migrant men as active social actors, positioned themselves in a triangular structure of categorization as in relation to 'Swedishness, Turkishness and 'the Self'. Through their narratives, my participants positioned themselves with different verbal categories by viewing their own actions in previous self and new self. They structured certain kind of structural descriptions of themselves as in relation to Turkish women/ Swedish women, Turkish culture/ Swedish culture, Turkish men/ Swedish men. Using the method of contrast in their own narratives, they constantly compared and contrasted Sweden and Turkey through their own experiences.

Thus, a 63 years' old man, Erdem who had been living in Sweden for 47 years explained that the protection of Turkish identity was playing a vital role for him to sustain his life in Sweden:

> I have never seen myself as Swedish after almost 50 years. I have always wanted to appear in my Turkish identity. I wanted them to accept me for who I am, how I am. I can say that maybe I integrated myself but I have never been assimilated and that's the most important thing. If you are living in another society and accept living in there, you need to accept being integrated but not assimilated. I'm seeing my friends who get assimilated, they are adapting custom and tradition of Swedishness especially the ones that marry a Swedish woman, and you can see the effect on their kids.

Erdem specifically emphasized that having a Swedish identity and Turkish identity are two different categories to describe 'sense of self' that he has. And then he continued through acknowledging that there is a difference between being assimilated and integrated to a new society. While he was describing that he feels himself integrated, he didn't accept to get assimilated by custom and tradition of Swedishness. For him being a Swede or Turk have a certain different appearing in his mind and he choose to positioned himself through his Turkishidentity.

> Also, my other participant Ali, who is 67 years old, commented this:

> My Turkishness cannot be erased. I'm the son of Ottoman women; this can't be changed, either by culture or other things. The thing that I'm sad about the changes that are happening in Turkey. Turkey is changing and not in a positive way, unfortunately. When you say Swedishness, I always supported my Turkishness in Sweden; I would never stamp down that. Us 'Turks' since we are Muslims there is always negative and disadvantage thoughts and behaviors against us. In my work life, I had hard times because of my name so many times. I'm here almost 50 years, and I'm sometimes regretting that I build my life in here. Of course, there are some other sides that it's beautiful, but I have

> never felt belong to this country, and I'm not going to feel
> myself like that in the future either.

The positioning of one's self between Swedishness and Turkishness became clearer as a distinctive category when Ali expressed that he always wanted to expressed himself through his Turkishness. According to my participant, the reason behind the fact that that he never felt to belong to this country was the ethnic discrimination: he was going through because of his name and religious identity. In Sweden, his Turkish identity had a bad connotation in people's mind for him and this made him establish certain kind of close relationship with Turkishness rather than Swedishness. As Mead defines societies made up of human beings communicating mutually through making the meaning of 'shared symbolic representation of the generalized other' (Prus, 1996). In the case of my participant, through reflecting to his representation of self in the host society, Ali became aware of how he was seen in the eyes of others and in relation to that he develops a sense of self.

The 70 years old, Mehmet who is married to a Swedish woman was emphasizing on how he constructed his identity between Turkey and Sweden:

> Well, I did this in this way... I always had a relationship with Turkey. My family was there, and we were visiting my family and friends in Turkey very often. I'm not Turkish or Swedish, but at the same time, I'm Swedish and Turkish. I can say that I'm in the middle of the two. I believe that I adapted myself to Swedish culture very well. I believe that I know Swedish culture and relations maybe more than a Swede. Even though my Swedish is not perfect, I can read every book. I'm a Turk who protected my Turkish self through adjusting the Swedish culture.

Mehmet was voluntarily trying to protect his relationship with Turkey through visiting Turkey time to time. When my other participants pointed out in their expression of understanding of their 'self' was emphasizing their Turkishness and Turkish identity more than others, Mehmet on the

contrary preferred to view his identity both from a category of Swedishness and Turkishness. As Khosravi states, migration itself does not need to be a traumatic experience of marginalization or being incomplete, but instead, one can have double identities and be able to maneuver among them (Khosravi, 2009). My participant asserted his position that having a distinct identity as Turkish and Swedish made him develop a different tactic towards building 'hybrid identities' (Schumann, 2011). He is aware that he is in this state of in-between-ness in Sweden with his ethnic Turkish background, but this turned out for him a way to position himself with old self and the new self that he has now.

Men's relationship with new gender relations

While my participants were having a state of 'in between-ness' towards their 'The self' in Sweden with comparison to Turkey, they were also having conflicting experiences reflection of in their family relation, women and expected gender roles. Coming from a culture in which the concept of a man and woman has been mapped in a distinctive way, moving from a collectivist and family-oriented society into a more individualistic and independent society in which gender roles are less distinctive was one of the biggest conflicted themes among my participants. Turkish men's ideas about male identities were knitted with women's identities, gender roles, and their relationships. Migration to Sweden made them to compare and contrast the discourse of being a woman in Turkey and Sweden in relation to family and gender relations. Migration allowed them to take different roles and performances through describing between what it means to practice family and gender roles in Sweden and Turkey. The men in this part emphasize how different the social context of gender relations was different from Turkey.

When I asked one of my participants, Ali, about what are the views about Swedish women, family and the reason of why he married a Turkish woman, he answered by saying;

> I have never considered getting married to a Swede because of cultural differences. What was going to happen after kids born? I felt like if I married a Swedish woman, I'm going to feel myself in prison. I was afraid to get married to Swedish women because there is going to be a huge family difference. I had some Swedish girlfriends, but I always knew that I would get married to a black-haired Turkish girl. I was seeing the people around me that married a Swedish women getting divorced after 5-10 years and I was getting more afraid if I get married to a Swede, we will get divorced.

And then he continues,

> I believe that Swedish women cannot be affectionate to her family, kids like Turkish women. I knew that Swedish women couldn't be with me; I wouldn't have the courage and enough time to change her ideas. Swedish women are more headstrong, independent and Turkish women are dependent. Women in Sweden have more freedom of thought, and they are living in a freer way for many years. I was afraid if I get married to a Swedish woman, to ruin the family will be easier. I wanted my wife to be attached to my mom, family and our culture.

Ali states that there are cultural differences that lie down in the characteristic values of Swedish and Turkish women in relation to family-life and gender- role expectations. By comparing Swedish women to Turkish women, Ali described Swedish women described as more attached to their freedom and interdependency, and this made to lose their ties to have affectionate family relations. In the contrary, he describes Turkish women as more dependent and attached to her family and kids. The emotion of 'being afraid' of getting married to a Swedish woman is related for Ali to the protection of Turkish cultural values and family relations with getting married a black-haired Turkish girl as he did.

My other participant is named Erdem, he is married to a Turkish woman, and preferred to marry a Swedish woman. He gave answers to my questions similar to Ali:

> I had some Swedish girlfriends, but my family was extremely conservative so I couldn't do that. I didn't think that they were going to accept this. My mom told me that 'don't even tried to introduce to your father, he will never accept this.' And then he emphasized that 'I thought that Swedish women customs and tradition were not going to fit my family life, I was seeing around me that many couples were getting divorced and families are getting destroyed. There are some differences between Turkish women and Swedish women; they are freer and have a broad vision. They have more self-confidence in family life comparing to Turkish women. If I had married a Swedish woman, I would have more responsibilities because Swedish women are growing up with more self- confidence when the equal rights matter of fact...

Erdem illustrates himself as a migrant man who moved to Sweden with his whole family, continuing to carry on their conservative, traditional values that comes from previous cultural setting. Erdem's mother's behavior towards him to introduce his Swedish girlfriend to his parents was something that later on reflected on the idea. If he marries a Swedish woman, she was not going to be able to fit her into his family as he thought about this. Both Ali and Erdem had a common fear that if they married a Swedish woman, their marriage was going to end up with a divorce because of cultural differences. As Ali distinguished Swedish women from Turkish women, Erdem continued to do that using same kind of rhetorical categories like 'being free, having a self-confidence, giving importance to equal rights'; the later were representing, and the Swedish women, opposites of this were Turkish women.

And, he, continues to make some insightful comments about how domestic responsibilities are conducted inside of family life in Sweden;

> Inside of home, with the care of the kid and raising them, everything needs to be at the same level, and that could be a problem between Swedish women and me. To give an example from my relationship, the reason why I ended up my last Swedish girlfriend was this. I came back home after work, and I asked her to bring me water and then she replied to that 'well I just got back from work too! You can go and get your water to yourself! I don't remember if my wife told me that kind of thing one day, these are maybe can sound too simple to you. But after she said like this, I didn't see her again. I just thought that if she is not able to get a glass of water to me how she will take care of a family or protect it.

One of the essential central parts of the societal interaction in Turkey is 'the family' (Boratav, 2017). In traditional family relations, husband-wife relationships reflect patriarchal values and generally based on hierarchical order in Turkey. According to this, men's authority and hierarchical superiority can be seen as the main gender norm in this order, and women can be seen as an object of men's authority. This means that it needs to be weak in relations, less valuable and needs to obey (Boratav, 2017). For Ali, to have an equal relation inside of the family relations was an obstacle for him to build a relationship with Swedish women. He is supporting this idea that he expresses giving of how he broke up his last Swedish girlfriend that he had. As Mansson states, *'the immigrant men's traditional propensity for controlling and dominating a love relation sometimes collides with the Swedish women's striving for independence'* (Mansson, 1993; Khosravi, 2009). His girlfriend's behavior of not bringing glass of water to Ali made him characterize Swedish women in the opposite of traditional role of women as 'caretaker' inside of the family relations.

Conclusion

This article explored how first-generation Turkish migrant position their perceptions of gender identity concerning intersecting factors like ethnicity, class, social systems, and personal relations between Sweden and Turkey marked by migration, settlement process. This study gives importance to insights about first generation Turkish immigrant men's understanding of the post- factum status of their descriptions.

The profound findings showed that Turkish immigrant men generated a sense of 'generalized other' about their encounters with different gender relations, and norms in the host society. They have become aware of the dissimilarities between Sweden and Turkey due to their post factum status of the migration process. They have compared and contrast two sets of generalized others and become being able to position themselves in between two societies. That caused them to catch a moment of creativity to constitute a new way of understanding of themselves. As Mead's explains, immigrant men's 'the self' through interacting with new gender relations and the social system took a different form from the previous sets of symbols that they constructed themselves. In this moment of creativity through reflecting the 'I' they defined and positioned themselves in the triadic situation of 'Swedishness, Turkishness, and the self.' Turkish migrant men as social actors were alive subjects that they construct, contrast, contest their sense of their identity, belonging and gender through a critical re-appropriation of their 'past' and a creative redefinition of what was available to them in the host society (Goffman, 1959 cited in Prus, 1996).

Moreover, Turkish immigrant men's social interactions in their private spheres also created cultural tensions for them. Some of my participants reflected upon their fear of getting married to Swedish women because of cultural differences. When they were describing the Swedish women, almost all of men's emphasized to individualistic characteristics of society through attributing features like being independent, not being attentive and attached to her family, self-confidence, selfish in comparison to Turkish women. My participants

described Turkish women from a collectivistic societal setting with the features of being affectionate and connected to her family, husband, kid, dependent, and less self-confidence.

Work Cited

Aboulafia, M. (2016).George Herbert Mead, *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, Edward N. Zalta (ed.).

Appelrouth, S. and Edles. L.D. (2011). *Sociological Theory in the Contemporary Era*. (2nd edn). London: Pine Forge Press.

Arendell, T. (1997). Reflections on the Researcher-Researched Relationship: A Woman Interviewing Men. *Qualitative Sociology*, *20*(3), 341-368.

Boratav, H., Fişek, G. & Ziya, H. (2017). *Turkish Masculinities*. Istanbul: Bilgi University Publications.

Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *3*(2), 77-101.

Cole, L. N. (2017). What is Feminism is Really About? https://www.thoughtco.com/what- is-feminism-p2-3026083

Collins, P. H. & Sırma, B. (2016). Intersectionality. Malden, MA: Polity Press.

Connell, R & Messerschmidt, J. (2005). Hegemonic Masculinity: Rethinking the Concept. *Gender and Society*, *19*(6), 829-859.

Connell, R. (1995). *Masculinities*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Connell, R. (2013). *The Men and the Boys*. Hoboken: Wiley.

Cronk, G. 'George Herbert Mead'. Bergen Community College https://www.iep.utm.edu/mead/

Donaldson, M. Raymond, H., Richard, H. & Bob, P. (2009). *Migrant Men: Critical Studies of Masculinities and the Migration Experience*. Hoboken: Taylor & Francis.

Dywer, S. C. & Jennifer L. B. (2009). The Space Between: On Being an Insider- Outsider in Qualitative Research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 8*(1), 54-63.

Goffman, E. (1959). *The Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*, Anchor; 1 edition.

135

Goldberg, C. A. (2012). Robert Park's Marginal Man: The Career of A concept in American Sociology. *Laboratorium, 4*(2), 199-217. Princeton Institute for Advanced Study.

Grillo, R. (2007). Betwixt and Between: Trajectories and Projects of Transmigration. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 33*(2), 199-217.

Haraway, D. (1988). Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective. *Feminist Studies*, *14*(3), 575-599.

Hearn, J. (1990). *Men of the World: Genders, Globalizations, Transnational Times*. London: Sage.

Hearn, J., Blagojević, M. & Harrison, K. (2013). *Rethinking transnational men: beyond, between and within nations*. New York: Routledge, 2013, p.251.

Hearn, J., Nordberg, M., Andersson, K., Balkmar, D., Gottzén, L., Klinth, R., Pringle, K., & Sandberg, L.. (2012). Hegemonic Masculinity and Beyond: 40 Years of Research in Sweden. *Men and Masculinities*, *15*(1), 31-55.

Hofstede, G. (2011). Dimensionalizing Cultures: The Hofstede Model in Context. *Online Readings in Psychology and Culture*, *2*(1). https://doi.org/10.9707/2307- 0919.1014

Khosravi, S. (2009). Displaced Masculinity: Gender and Ethnicity among Iranian men in Sweden. *Iranian Studies*, *42*(4), 591-609.

Mansson, Sven-Axel (1993). *Cultural conflict and the Swedish sexual myth: the male immigrant's encounter with Swedish sexual and cohabitation culture.* Westport, Conn: Greenwood Press.

Mead, G. H. (2015) *Mind, Self and Society: The Definitive Edition*. Chicago University Press.

O'Reilly, K. 2008. *Key Concepts in Ethnography*. London: Sage.

Pease, B. & Pini, B. (2013). *Men, Masculinities and Methodologies.* Palgrave Macmillan.

Prus, R. C. (1996). *Symbolic interaction and ethnographic research: intersubjectivity and the study of human lived experience.* Albany: State university of New York.

Schumann, S. (2011). *Hybrid identity formation of migrants: A case study of ethnic Turks in Germany*. European University Viadriana Frankurt.

Seear, K. L., & McLean, K. E. (2008). Breaking the silence: The role of emotional labour in qualitative research. In T. Majoribanks et al. (Eds.), The annual conference of The Australian Sociological Association 2008. Re-imagining Sociology: Conference Publication Proceedings (pp. 1 - 16).

Appendix:

Interview Guide: General questions:

- How old are you? What is your marital status?
- Do you have any kids? How many if you have?
- What is your profession?
- When did you move to Sweden? What were the reasons that caused you to move to Sweden?
- How do you feel as a Turk in Sweden?
- What does it mean to be Turkish in Sweden for you?
- How can you identify yourself as in terms of ethnically and culturally? -Swedish or Turkish?
  -If identify himself as Turkish ask How are you feeling as a Turk who are living in Sweden?
- What are the relations that you have as Turk within Swedish society?
- Do you try to keep the contact with Turkey and relatives?
- Do you travel to Turkey very often?
- How do you feel when you go back to Turkey as Turkish men living in Sweden?

Family/ Fatherhood:

- Do you feel that filling the breadwinner role is essential for you and your family in Sweden?
- Do you think to create equally shared housework chores is possible?
- If you compare Sweden with Turkey, do you think that to create an equal environment in housework chores is more important in Sweden?
- How is in your family? Who do you think is more responsible in housework?
- Do you help housework chores?
- What is your expectation from your wife or women in the housework chores?
- How is it to be a Turkish father in Sweden?
- How is it feels like to raise your kid in Sweden?
  - Do you think you have involved their life enough?

- Think about your relationship with your father in a Turkish context and your relation with your kids in Sweden? Is there any differences or similarities among them?
- What is being a 'good' father means in Sweden for you?
- What is being a 'good' father means in Turkey for you?

- Do you think your kid is more integrated into Swedish context or Turkish?

- Do you think fatherhood you are experiencing or observing is different from Turkish context?

- What do you think about Swedish men and their relations with their families and kids? Is it differing from Turkish men?

- What do you think for parental leave for fathers? Do you think parental leave for fathers is a good thing or not?

- How is your work life? Are you satisfied and happy what you are doing?

- Do you have good connections with your colleagues?

- What are your thoughts about your Swedish male colleagues?

- Do you think you have different personality traits from your Swedish male colleagues?
  -Are you feeling comfortable around them?
  - Are you sharing your problems?
  -Are you socializing with them outside of workplace?

- Do you face any social pressures in your workplace as a Turkish man?

- What do you think about pay discrimination in workplaces? Do you think women and men need to get paid equally?

- Do you believe that women and men have different places in different work fields?

- What do you think about how gender perceptions in workplaces differ in Sweden from Turkey?
  Do you think women and men need to have different responsibilities?

Cultural setting and social relations:
- Tell me about your experiences as Turkish male migrant in Sweden? It was hard for you to adopt a new culture or not? How did

you feel? Did you feel excluded or included?

- Do you think it is easy to connect with Swedish people? Do you think to know the language helped you to integrate more into the Swedish society?

- Are you socializing with more Turkish male migrants in your daily life activities? If it is yes what kind of things are you doing with them? What are the topics you are generally talking?

- Do you think that have you ever face or experience with racial attitudes and discrimination as a Turkish man living in Sweden?

- What was the first cultural differences that you notice when you move to Sweden that makes different from Turkish culture?

- Did you have any ideas about gender relations in Sweden before you move here?

- What are your perceptions about men and women relationships in Sweden? Do you think there is a big difference than Turkey?

- How can you define traditional male-female roles in Turkey? How? Why?
  - Can you observe the same kind of traditional roles in Sweden?
  - How was the being raise as a Turkish man?
  - What are your perceptions about Swedish men?
  - What are your perceptions about Swedish women?
  - Do you think Swedish men and Turkish men differs?

Cinsiyet Kimliklerinin (Yeniden) İnşa Edilmesine Göçün Etkisi: İsveç'te Yaşayan Birinci Nesil Türk Erkek Göçmenleri Üzerine Niteliksel Bir Araştırma

Öz: Bu çalışma, Türk erkek göçmenlerin cinsiyet kimliklerini kendi deneyimleri ve söylemleriyle Türklük, İsveçlilik ve Benlik triadik kategorileri üzerinden nasıl konumlandırdıklarını ele almaktadır. Bu üç kategorinin arasında kendilerini konumlandırmaya çalışan İsveç'te yaşayan birinci nesil Türk erkek göçmenler 'genelleştirilmiş öteki' rolünü üstlenirken, göç süreci ve sonrasında cinsiyet kimliklerinin nasıl şekillendiğine dair cevaplar vermektedirler. Araştırma, erkeklerin kendi göçmenlik anlatılarını ele alarak cinsiyet kimliklerinin nasıl sembolik anlamlar yansıttığını incelemeye çalışmaktadır. Bir erkeğin cinsiyet ve sosyal kimliği farklı biçimler alabilir ve bazı kimlikler diğerlerine göre farklı sosyal ve kültürel sistemlerde öncelik görebilir. Farklı kültürel modeller erkeklerin cinsiyet rollerinin ve erkekliklik kavramının nasıl şekillenebileceğini etkileyebilir. Buna bağlı olarak şu soruyu sorabiliriz; kendilerini farklı bir kültür ve sosyal model içerisinde bulan Türk erkek göçmenler, yeni cinsiyet kimlikleri ve söylemleri arasında kendilerini nasıl konumlandırmaktadırlar? Hearn'ün de tartıştığı gibi, yeni kültürel ve cinsiyet söylemleriyle karşılaşan Türk göçme erkekler, önceki geldikleri toplumsal sistemdeki eski rolleri eleştirebilir, mesafe alabilir ve yeni benlik ve kimlik anlayışları geliştirebilirler. Bunun tam tersi olarak kendi önceki kimliklerini ve benliklerini korumayı da tercih edebilirler. Cinsiyet kimliklerini etkileyen faktörleri iki gruba ayırabiliriz. Daha kapsayıcı faktörler olarak kültür, sınıf, etnik köken ve sosyal hiyerarşileri ele alırsak eğer bunlara bağlı olarak çıkan unsurları ise bireylerin kendi kişisel yaşam öyküler, anlatıları, deneyimleri ve sosyal etkileşimleri olarak tanımlayabiliriz. Niteliksel araştırma yöntemi kullanılarak, İsveç'te ikamet eden birinci nesil göçmenlerle mülakatlar sonucu şekillenen bu çalışma, cinsiyeti analitik bir kavram olarak merkez noktasına almaktadır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Göçmenlik, erkeklikler, benlik, cinsiyet kimliği, sembolik etkileşim

141

BOOK REVIEWS

Ezgi Sarıtaş

Cinsel Normalliğin Kuruluşu: Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Heteronormatiflik ve İstikrarsızlıkları

Metis Yayınları, 2020, 367 sayfa, ISBN-13:978-605-316-204-9

Reviewed by: Burcu Dabak Özdemir, *Yaşar Üniversitesi*
DOI: 0000-0003-2124-252X

Ezgi Sarıtaş'ın *Cinsel Normalliğin Kuruluşu: Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Heteronormatiflik ve İstikrarsızlıkları* adlı çalışması Ankara Üniversitesi Kadın Çalışmaları Anabilim dalında Mart 2018 yılında tamamladığı doktora tezinin kitaplaştırılmış halidir. Bu çalışmayı alanyazın adına önemli kılan özelliğinin, dayandığı queer perspektifle uyum içinde çalışan metodolojik bir yaklaşımla birlikte takip ettiği tarihi, istikrarsız ve gerilimli alanlarla anlamaya çalışması ve bunu yaparken zaten kendi tanımlarında kendileriyle birlikte birçok soru işaretini okuyucuya armağan olarak sunan heteronormativite, normallik, cinsellik, homoerotik gibi kavramların hazırladığı tuzaklara düşmemesi olduğu iddia edilebilir. Bu anlamıyla Sarıtaş'ın çalışmasının incelediği konuya getirdiği yeni bir perspektifin yanında, bu perspektifi getirirken karşılaşabilecek tehlikelerden başarıyla kaçınmış bir çalışma olduğu söylenebilir.

Cinsel Normalliğin Kuruluşu, geç Osmanlı ve erken Cumhuriyet dönemlerine eşlik eden anlatıları, tarihsiz ve coğrafyasız gibi görünen, kendini evrensel bir kavram olarak dayatan heteronormallik ekseninde queer bir yaklaşımla incelemeyi kendine amaç edinmiş, temasını cinsel modernlik üzerine kurmuş bir çalışmadır. Sarıtaş anlatıları, dönemler içinde üretilmiş söylemlerin içindeki istikrarsız, çelişkili ve kırılgan alanları takip ederek okumaya çalışmaktadır. Yazarın bu istikrarsızlığın cinsiyet, cinsellik ve erotizmle ilgili idrak edilebilirlik çerçevesini çizen eski söylemlerle, modernleşme süreçlerine eşik eden yeni ve rakip söylemlerin biraradalığından kaynakladığı iddiası, heteronormatifliğin

kendi ihlallerini üreten, nihai ve mutlak bir süreç olmadığı konusundaki queer perspektifle birleşmektedir. Bu sebeple de 'cinsel modernlik dönemi' olarak adlandırdığı çalışmanın alanını oluşturan 19.-20. yüzyıl dönemini, kendinden önce gelen dönemin erotik ve toplumsal dönüşümleri hesaba katarak inceleyen kitap, modern cinsel kimlikler ile modern öncesi erotik eylemler arasında keskin nihai bir dönüşüm ve karşıtlık işaretlemeden analiz etmeye çalışmaktadır. Böylelikle Batı/Doğu, modern/modern olmayan, geçmiş/şimdi, eski/yeni gibi ikili eşitsizlikler arasında tek taraflı bir etkilenme modelini reddederek, modernlik serüvenini tek bir kırılma anı üzerinden inceleme tehlikesinden kurtulur.

Kitabın birinci bölümünde Sarıtaş, 19. yüzyılda yaşanan dramatik dönüşümleri bir önceki yüzyılla ilişkisini kurarak, yüzyılın başında erkek homoerotizmini idrak edilebilir kılan çerçevelerin yüzyıl sonuna doğru marjinalleşmelerini 3 temel başlık altında keskin bir kronoloji benimsemeden incelemektedir: tasavvufi aşk kavrayışındaki, homososyal alanlardaki, başta edebiyat olmak üzere kültürel temsil alanındaki dönüşümler. Keskin bir kronolojiden beslenememesinin sebebi ise tasavvufi aşk kavrayışındaki dönüşümlerin 17. yüzyıla, homososyal alanlardaki dönüşümün 18. yüzyıla, kültürel temsil alanındaki dönüşümlerin ise bunları takiben 19. yüzyıla denk düşmesinden kaynaklanıyor. Ama Sarıtaş'ın çalışması bu farklı dönemlere tekabül eden dönüşümleri tek yönlü ve ilerlemeci tarih anlayışından kurtararak birbirleriyle karşılıklı okuması, çalışmayı geleneksel disiplin sınırlarına meydan okuyan bir metodoloji için uygun bir sahaya dönüştürüyor. Sarıtaş bu bölüme kendinden önce yapılmış çalışmaların altını çizdiği ve erkek homoerotizmini marjinalleştirmede önemli bir payı olduğuna inandığı utanma hissini tartışarak başlıyor. Yazar, utanma hissinin uygarlaştırıcı bir görev üstlendiği konusunda Norbert Elias'la aynı fikri paylaşmasının yanı sıra, bu utanma hissinin hangi tarihsel ve toplumsal dönüşümlerle birlikte incelenmesi gerektiği ve hissin hangi tarihsel işlevi taşıdığı sorularını soruyor. Sarıtaş Osmanlı cinsiyet çalışmalarında iddia edildiği gibi utanmanın bir sessizlik, sansür ve örtme ile sınırlandırılmayacağını ve aksine bu hissin kimlik kurucu bir

işlevle üretici bir his olabileceğini savunuyor. Utanmanın homososyalliği homoerotizminden ayrılmasına katkı sağlayan ve aşkı dünyevileştiren bir duygu olarak tanımlayan yazar, bu bölüme bununla ilişkili olarak tasavvufi aşktaki dönüşümlerle devam ediyor. Tasavvufi aşkın homoerotik yanına değinen yazar, dindeki Ortodoks yaklaşımların artmasıyla birlikte tasavvufun işaret ettiği uhrevi aşkın dünyevileşmeye başladığını ve bu dünyevileşmenin aşkı heteronormal düzenlemeler konusunda daha açık bir alan haline getirdiğini anlatıyor.

Ardından homoerotizmle süreklilik içindeki erkek homososyalliğinin incelendiği alt bölümde dönüşüm, erkeler arası hiyerarşinin erotizyonu ve homososyalleşme mekânlarının- meyhane, kahvehane, hamam, homososyal mekânlar- dönüşümü olarak iki kısımda inceleniyor. Marjinalleşmenin izlerini süren yazar, erkek homoerotizminin üretildiği ve düzenlendiği mekânlar olarak işaretlediği mekân ve pratikleri inceleme yoluna gidiyor. Bu bölümde temel olarak, erkekler arası usta-çırak ilişkisi temelindeki hiyerarşik konumlandırmadan Sultan ve tebaasına kadar geniş bir yelpazede, tabiiyet ilişkisinin içerdiği -aşık-sevgili, efendi-kul, tebaa-hükümdar, usta-çıra, hoca-öğrenci ilişkilerinin de içinde barınan- homoerotik arzuların düzenlenmesi anlatılıyor. Buna göre, tabiiyet ilişkisi içindeki erkekler arası ilişkileri düzenleyen erotik normlara göre egemen konumdaki erkeğin tabii konumdaki erkekle cinsel ilişkisi egemen olan aktif olduğu sürece cinsiyet rolünde bir sapmaya işaret etmemektedir. Cinselliğin yöneldiği arzu nesnesinin cinsel kimliğinden çok, aktif ve pasif arasında kurulan düzenlemelerle şekil bulan dönemin normlarını yazar, tek cinsiyetli yaklaşımım toplumdaki hâkim söylem olmasıyla açıklıyor. Homososyal mekanların farklı sınıflardan erkeklerin de homoerotik pratikler sergileyebileceği mekanlar olarak anlatan Sarıtaş, Yeniçeri Ocağı'nın kaldırılması, köleliğin yasaklanması, bu mekânların politik amaçlı sürekli izlenip denetlenmesi yoluyla dönüşüme uğradıklarını ve bunun da homoerotizmi homososyallikle ayrıştıran unsur olduğunun altını çiziyor.

İkinci bölümde 19. yüzyıl ve 20. yüzyıla ait üç öz anlatı üzerinden heteronormatiflik tarihinin dönüşüm ve tutarsızlıkları, kırılganlık ve

biraradalıkları inceleniyor. 19 yüzyıl mutasavvıfı olan Aşçı İbrahim Dede'nin Hatıratı, Cumhuriyet tarihinin tartışmalı karakterlerinden Dr. Rıza Nur'un Anıları ve Reşat Ekrem Koçu'nun İstanbul Ansiklopedisi bu bölümde incelenen anlatılardır. Sadece içlerine sızan erotik imalar ve söylemlerin incelendiği eserler yoluyla hangi erkeklerin hangi çerçeveler aracılığı ile hangi erkeklere arzularını dile getirebildikleri ve bunu yaparken hangi stratejileri geliştirdikleri ve stratejilerin heteronormatifliğin işleyişi konusunda taşıdığı ipuçları analiz edilmiştir. Yazar incelemesinin sonucunda, Aşçı Dede'nin anlatılarında tek cinsiyetli sistemin söylemlerine bağlı olarak homoerotizmle sınırı bulanıklaşmış homososyal ilişkilerin erkekler arası bir sözleşme olarak kabul edildiği, ulus ve aile kavramlarından daha üst bir mertebeye yerleştiği sonucuna varmıştır. Bu nedenle onun anlatılarında evlilik ve homoerotik arzu birbiriyle çelişen değerler değildir. Aşçı İbrahim Dede'nin anlatılarında homoerotizm ve aşk deneyimleri tasavvufi kariyeri ve bürokratik kariyeri arasında biçimlenmiştir. Anlatılarında sıklıkla gayri şehvaniliğe ilişkin vurgular tasavvufi yanıyla ulvi aşkı destekler niteliktedir. Dr. Rıza Nur'un anıları homoerotik arzuyu birinci tekil şahıs ile dile getiren nadir bir metin olma özelliği taşımaktadır. Onu anlatılarında cinselliğin Aşçı Dede'nin anlatılarından farklı olarak daha mahrem alana sıkışmış merkezileşmiş ve kurumlaşmış olduğuna dikkat çeken Sarıtaş'a göre, Rıza Nur aynı zamanda homoerotizmi erkekliği tehdit eden bir unsur olarak tanımlayarak dönemin normallik söylemlerinin ürettiği birçok çelişkiyi görünür kılmıştır. Sarıtaş aynı zamanda, Rıza Nur'un metinlerinde homoerotik arzunun sadece erkekliğe değil Türklüğe de helal getiren bir unsur olarak tarif edildiğinin anlatarak dönemin ulus devletçilik anlayışını ve Türklüğe yapılan vurgunun cinsiyet normları arasına nasıl sızdığını da okuyucuya göstermiş olur. Rıza Nur için padişaha duyulan aşkın yerini vatan ve millete duyulan sevgi almıştır. Yani ulus devletin oluşumuyla birlikte eroto-politik hiyerarşinin kırılmasına onun anlatılarını takip ederek şahitlik yapabiliriz.

Reşad Ekrem Koçu'nun Ansiklopedisi Sarıtaş'a göre, Cumhuriyet'in resmi tarih anlatılarıyla silinen bir dünyaya, ansiklopedi türünün sunduğu sistematik bilginin güvenilirlik iması içinde yeniden

hayat verme çabası olarak okunabilir. Koçu, kişisellikten uzak olması beklenen bir türü sadece kişiselleştirmekle kalmaz aynı zamanda erotikleştirir. Çünkü o kentin tarihini kendi benliğinin tarihine çevirir. Homoerotik arzunun gitgide kişisel bir patoloji olarak anılmaya başladığı bu dönemde bir sapık olarak anılmak Koçu için ayrıcalıklı konumunu kaybetmesi demek olacağından hazırladığı ansiklopedide hem eşcinsellik patolojik olarak tarif edilirken hem de homoerotik alt kültürün mahrem biçimlerinin katılımcısı olmayı arzulayan bir ikirciklik söz konudur. Bu parodik çelişki Sarıtaş'a göre, heteronormatifliğin çelişkilerini ifşa etmektedir.

Kitabın üçüncü bölümünde yazar, homoerotizm ve arzu nesnesi kadının uyandırdığı kaygılara değinmiştir. Bu bölümde yazar, heteroerotik aşk ve cinsellik söylemlerini, bu söylemleri destekleyen dönemin önemli argümanları arasında yer alan 'arkadaşlığa dayalı evlilik' düşüncesi içerisinde tartışmıştır. Kadının arzu nesnesi olarak temsil stratejilerinin içinde yer almaya başlamasını ikili cinsiyet rejimi söyleminin merkezileşmesine bağlı olarak yorumlayan Sarıtaş, arkadaşlık söylemlerinin evlilik rejiminin içine girmesinin, karı ve kocanın birbirlerinin biricik dostları ve yoldaşları olduğu fikrinin, evliliği arzulanabilir kılmak için olduğunu söyler. Heteronormatiflik ekseninde kadını arzu nesnesi olmasının yarattığı kaygıları dönemin edebi metinlerinde takip eden Sarıtaş, erkek kadınsılığı ve kadın erkeksiliğinin temsillerini inceler. Bu incelemenin aynı zamanda ideal kadın ve erkeklikleri tanımlama işlevi gördüğünü iddia eden yazar, dönemin edebiyat eserlerinde cinsellikten arınmış erkeksileşmiş kadın figürlerin kutlanırken, kadınlara düşkün erkeklerin efemineleştiği temsillere dikkat çeker.

147

Kitap değindiği konular ve yaklaşımı açısından önemli, bir yerde durmaktadır. Fakat kitabın içeriğinin organizasyonunun kafa karıştıran bir yapıda olduğu söylenebilir. Kitabın kurgusunun bulanıklaştığı bölümler mevcuttur. Örneğin kitabın başında uzun uzun anlatılan ve önemli argümanlar içeren utanma ile ilgili bölüm kitabın geri kalanına sirayet etmemekte ve havada kalmaktadır. Buna benzer kısmaların mevcudiyeti kitabın takibini zorlaştıran unsurlar olarak düşünülebilir.

Seçtiği örneklemi tam derinlemesine incelemeye başlarken araya giren uzun alıntılardan oluşan kuramsal kısımlar, okuyucuyu çalışmanın ana ekseninden kopardığı, yazının dinamiğini bozduğu yönünde eleştirilebilir. Bu bölümler okuyucuya kitabın akışı içinde yazarın izini kaybettirmektedir. Ayrıca kadın homososyalliğine ve homoerotizmine kitapta yer verilmemesi, kadınların sadece erkek heteroerotik arzusunun yönlendiği nesne olarak çalışmada yer almasının eksikliğe neden olduğu söylenebilir. Bunun yanı sıra daha önce de üzerine birçok kereler çalışılmış metinlere tekrar bakma cesareti göstermesi ve bu metinleri normalliğin kuruluşunu anlamak üzere çelişkiler üzerinden takip etme başarısı çalışmayı değerli kılmaktadır.

Ed: Tomas Moniz ve Jeremy Adam Smith

Radikal Baba, Habitus Yayıncılık, 2014, 294 sayfa, ISBN: 978-605-4630-19-6

Reviewed by: Çiçek Nilsu Varlıklar Demirkazık, *Ankara Yıldırım Beyazıt Üniversitesi,*
DOI: 0000-0003-4576-9991

Türkçe yazında 2000'lerden sonra gelişmeye başlayan eleştirel erkeklik çalışmaları sayesinde "erkeklik" konulu kitapların çoğaldığını söylemek mümkün. Özellikle militarizm, çalışma hayatı, sinema ve edebiyat temsilleri gibi alanlarda erkekliklerin kurgulanışı yayınlarda yer edinirken erkeklikle ilgili bir başka uğrak olan "baba olmak"la ilgili kaynaklar ise hala oldukça kısıtlı. Halbuki Pınar Selek'in de belirttiği gibi toplum, bir erkekten sünnet olma, askere gitme, işe girme ve evlenme görevlerinden sonra son olarak baba olma görevini de yerine getirmesini bekler ve bu nedenle "babalık" kavramı erkekliğin kurucu unsurlarından biri olarak karşımıza çıkar. Alandaki yazın çoğunlukla "Babalık Sanatı" ya da "Babalık Kılavuzu" tarzı başlıklardan oluşan eğitim kitaplarından, "ebeveynlik ölçekleri" ile sınırlı bir babalık rolünü ölçen araştırmalardan ve bütün patolojilerin nedenini annelerin hatalarına yükleyen, babaların ise sadece "terk etmemiş" olmakla bile çocuklar için üst benlik gelişimini sağlayıcı bir rolde bulunduğu psikanalist analizler içeren kitaplardan oluşuyor. Bu tarzın dışında başka bir kitap okumak isterken *Radikal Baba* ile karşılaşırsanız, babalık deneyimiyle ilgili oldukça farklı noktalardan pek çok hikâyeyi dinleme fırsatına kavuşmuş olursunuz.

    Radikal Baba temelde Rad Dad adlı zinde ve Daddy Dialectic adlı forumda yer alan yazılardan derlenen bir kitap. Editörlerden Tomas Moniz Rad Dad'in, Jeremy Adam Smith ise Daddy Dialectic'in kurucularıdır ve kitaba gerek kendi anlatılarıyla gerekse yaptıkları söyleşilerle katkı sunmuşlardır. Diğer yazarlara bakıldığında ise geniş çeşitlilikte bir yelpaze görmek mümkün: fotoğrafçı, transseksüel

* PhD student in Sociology, e-mail: skendrick@ku.edu ORCID ID: 0000-0002-5682-4426

(çevirmenin tabiriyle transcinsel) bir hukukçu ve bir müzik grubu üyesinin yanında ev babaları [*stay home dads*], bir punk rock aktivisti, pek çok farklı alanda faaliyet göstererek kendilerini sosyal adalet aktivistleri olarak tanımlayanlar vb. Babalık deneyimlerini yazan erkeklerin kimlikleri önem teşkil ediyor çünkü kitap ebeveynlik alanını apolitik bir noktadan değil, politik seçimlerin bu alan üzerindeki karşılıklı etkisi üzerinden kurgulamayı hedeflediğini belirtiyor. Babalık deneyimleriyle ilgili bir kitap yazmayı riskli bulduğunu söyleyen Moniz, bunun nedenlerinden birinin hala çocuk bakımı ve ev işlerinin büyük çoğunluğunun kadınların sorumluluğunda olduğu bir dünyada "alt değiştirdiğini" ya da "çocuğunu uyuttuğunu" söyleyen babaların bu alanda ahkam kesmesinin kendini beğenmişlik olarak algılanabileceğinden çekinmesi olduğunu belirtiyor. Bir diğer neden ise erkeklerin ebeveyn olma konusunda söyleyecek fazla şeylerinin olmadığı yönündeki genel inanış olarak sunuluyor. Ebeveynliğin de içinde bulunduğu yeniden üretim alanı sadece kadına ait bir alan olarak algılandığı sürece bu inanışın devam etmesi olası görünüyor. Yine de bu riskleri göze alan editörler kimi zaman çocukların ergenlik sorunları ya da bakım vermenin sıkıntılarını içeren eğlenceli babalık anlatılarını, kimi zaman da erkekliğe dair derinlemesine sorgulamalar içeren yazıları bir araya getirerek bizlerle buluşturmuşlar. Cinsiyetlere özgü rolleri meşrulaştırmak için kullanılan babalığa dair sosyal klişeleri sorguladığını söyleyen kitap aynı zamanda "erkeklerin başarının anlamı ve başarıya ilişkin kapitalist kavramların erkek kimliğinin oluşumuyla bağlantısını derinlemesine tekrar ele almalarını" (s. 8) da amaçlıyor.

Kitapta yazılar sıralanırken 5 ayrı sınıflandırmaya gidilmiş. İlk 3 bölüm çocukların gelişim dönemlerine göre bir ayrım yaparken son iki bölüm "anne-babalık politikaları" ve "radikal babalarla röportajlar" başlıklarını taşıyor. İlk kategori olan "Doğum, Bebekler ve Yürüme Çağındakiler" farklı pek çok öyküyü anlatıyor okuyuculara. Yakın arkadaşları olan lezbiyen bir çifte sperm donörlüğü yapan gey bir erkeğin "baba" kavramını tanımlayışını ve doğumda eşiyle beraber olan bir erkeğin bu deneyimi paylaşımını okuyoruz. Evlat edinen bir punk rock aktivistinin kendi babasıyla ve erkeklikle ilgili olan sorgulamaları

ışığında geliştirdiği babalığa dair düşüncelerini ve toplumsal dönüşüm/ "devrim" için yapmak istedikleriyle sevgi ile büyütmek istediği çocuğuna karşı sorumluluklarının çatıştığı noktaları öğreniyoruz. Siyahi bir baba olan Shawn'ın bir gün parkta kızıyla oynarken yaşadığı olayda beyazlar tarafından suçlanmasını anlatması ve kızının ten renginin hiçbir öneminin olmadığı bir dünyada yaşayabileceğine dair umudunu kaybettiğini söylemesi elbette ki okuyanları etkiliyor. Bir yazıda engelli bir çocuğa sahip bir erkeğin hayatını incelerken bir diğer yazıda kendisini transcinsel olarak tanımlayan Jack'in ebeveynlik sürecinde cinsiyetin anlamını yeniden düşündüğüne ve cinsel kimlik/cinsiyet kimliği ile ilgili sahip olunan politikalarla uyumlu bir aile kurmanın zorluklarından bahsedişine tanık oluyoruz.

İkinci bölüm olan "Çocuklar"da babaların hikâyeleri biraz daha değişiyor ve artık büyüyen çocuklarıyla birlikte yoğunlukla toplumsal cinsiyet rol kalıplarıyla, etnik ayrımcılıklarla, piyasa zihniyetiyle, sporun rekabetçiliğiyle, teknolojinin gelişimiyle mücadele ettiklerini görüyoruz. Çocukların "Baba, sen Meksikalıya benziyorsun, ama ben beyazım" şeklindeki tespitlerinin ya da "Bu kişi kız mı erkek mi anlayamadım", "Neden okulda erkekler, özellikle siyah erkekler başlarını kızlardan daha çok belaya sokuyor" tarzı sorularının artık babaları klasik rol ve kimliklerle ilgili açıklamalarda bulunmaya yönelttiğini görüyoruz. Kızının odasını Yuri Kochiyama ve Frida Kahlo'nun posterleriyle süslemeyi, onu cinsiyet ayrımı olmayan oyuncaklarla büyütmeyi planlarken en sevdiği renk pembe olan bir kız çocuğu olan ya da çok sevdiği *Star Wars* filmlerini iki oğluna izlettikten sonra onlara umut, sevgi ve uyumun da savaş, şiddet ve ölüm kadar kuvvetli güçler olduğunu açıklamak zorunda kalan babalarla karşılaşıyoruz. Kitlesel pazarlama ve cinsiyet arasında derin bir bağın olduğunu ve satın aldığımız şeylerin kimliklerimizi inşa eden sistemleri güçlendirdiğini söyleyen bir baba çocuğu için şöyle diyor: "Ona kendisini yetersiz hissettirip sonra geçici bir neşe veya bütünlük hissi yaşaması için bir şeyler satın almasını sağlama üzerine kurulu bir sistemin getirdiği yükler olmadan kendi kimliğini ifade edebilmesini ve onu keşfetmesini istiyorum. [...] Kendi kültür ve değerlerimi çocuğuma yansıtıyor

olduğumu itiraf ediyorum, ama sanırım bu da anne-baba olmanın bir parçası" (s. 106).

"Çocukluk ve Ergenlik" başlıklı 3. bölümde -tahmin edilebileceği gibi- babaların ergen çocuklarıyla yaşadıkları sıkıntılara odaklanılıyor. Fark ediyoruz ki artık cinsellikle ilgili çok daha detaylı konuşmanın ve bilgi vermenin zamanı gelmiş! Peki, çocuğunu ot içerken ya da yalan söylerken yakalayan bir baba ne yapar? Kızınızla dinlediği müzik türü nedeniyle kavga edebileceğiniz hiç aklınıza gelir mi? Materyalizme karşı birisiniz ve çocuğunuzu materyalizmden koruyucu değerlerle büyüttüğünüzü düşünüyorsunuz ve bir gün ergen kızınızın maddiyatçı ve sınıf ayrımı yapan söylemlerine tanık oluyorsunuz, nasıl davranırsınız? Bütün bu sorunların hepsi hayatın içinden ve ne yapılacaklara dair bir reçete var ortada, ne de "doğru"lar; sadece deneyimler önem kazanıyor bu noktada. Bir başka babanın deneyimine göre erkekler için son derece homososyal bir alan olduğunu anladığımız kaykaycılık ortamı, kız çocuk yetiştirme konusunda geleneksel kurallara karşı koyan bir alan olarak karşımıza çıkabiliyor mesela. Bu ortam ergenlere farklı insanlarla ve yaşam tarzlarıyla tanışmaları, dünyayı öğrenmeleri için bir olanak sağlayabiliyor.

"Anne-Babalık Politikaları: Cinsiyet, Irk, İşbirlikleri, Vizyonlar" bölümünde babalıkla ilgili değerlerle politikaların birleştiği noktaları görüyoruz. Çocuklarını yetiştirirken onlara iyi rol modeller olmaya çalışan fakat mükemmel ebeveyn olmayı başaramayan babaların kaygılarını okuyoruz. "Böyle feminist bir baba nasıl olur da bu kadar tipik bir erkek çocuk yetiştirir?" tarzı bir eleştiri karşısında "çocuğuma sadece örnek olmaya çalışıyorum ve bunu da ancak doğru olduğunu düşündüğüm hayat tarzını sürerek başarabilirim" açıklamasında bulunuyor bir baba. Başka biri ise iyi rol modellerin yanında destekleyici bir toplumun da olması gerektiğini, işlerin sağlık hizmeti ve çocuk doğduktan sonra izin talebiyle bitmeyip çocuğun bakımının sürekliliği ve çalışma hayatına dair alternatiflere ihtiyaç olduğunu belirtiyor. Yaşadığı yerdeki devlet desteği sisteminden dolayı yarı zamanlı bir işte çalışarak devlet yardımı alan, bu sayede çocuklarını kreşe göndermemeyi tercih eden bir baba diğer erkeklere şöyle sesleniyor: "Sizin evde olmanızı

152

desteklemeyen bu ülkedeki cezalandırıcı, püriten kültür. Bana veya vergilerinizin desteklediği diğer babalara kızmayın. Sizi bizlere katılmaktan alıkoyan bu utanç, onur ve korku sistemini yaratan varlıklara kızın. Sizi çocuğunuzun ilk adımlarını attığını görmekten alıkoyan sisteme kızın" (s. 229-230).

Kitabın son bölümünü ise radikal babalarla yapılan röportajlar oluşturuyor. Günümüz yetişkin dünyasına hâkim olan "kıran kırana rekabet" duygusunu çocuklarını başkalarıyla yarıştırarak yaşatan, aşırı hevesli orta sınıf anne-babaları eleştiren bir aktivist olan Chang, çocukluğun bile yeni liberalizmin işgali altında olduğunu düşündüğünü söylüyor. Bir başka aktarımda feminist ekonominin eleştirelliği sayesinde fark ettiklerini söyledikleri çocuklara yönelik kapitalist gıda reklamlarını durdurma kampanyası başlatan bir grupla karşılaşıyoruz. Çocuklarına sahip olduğu değerleri aktarmaya çalışırken onları "siyaseten doğru" hale getirme çabası içinde olmadığını söyleyen bir diğer baba çocukların önlerine sunulan verili bir dünyada yaşamalarını istemediğini söylüyor. Bu yüzden çocuklardan ırk, sınıf, cinsiyet ve cinselliği bilmeleri, tarih ve kültürü öğrenerek mücadele etmeyi kendilerinin tercih etmeleri bekleniyor. Bir başka insanın sorumluluğunu alma kararını da içeren çocuk büyütme eylemini son derece politik bir eylem olarak gördüğünü söyleyen başka bir baba, yazar olarak araştırdığı Zapatista hareketinden esinlendiğini söylüyor. Zapatistalar için "onur" kavramı kişinin tüm potansiyelini yaşama hakkı anlamına geliyor ve yazar da kızını devrimci bir onurla yetiştirmek istiyor.

Radikal Baba elbette ki ABD merkezli anlatılardan oluşuyor fakat -neyse ki- ABD'nin kozmopolit yapısı çeşitliliği oldukça arttırıyor. Kitabı okurken şu soru geliyor aklınıza: Eğer bu kitap Avrupa, Asya ya da Orta Doğu anlatılarından oluşsaydı ne gibi farklılıklar olurdu? İnsanlıkla ilgili evrensel ortaklıklarımızın yanında kültürel, ekonomik ve politik farklılıklar kuşkusuz ki çok daha farklı hikâyeler ortaya çıkarır, mümkün olduğu oranda da karşılaştırma yapabilmemizi sağlardı. Fakat kitabın şöyle bir ortak görüşe sahip olduğunu söylemek mümkün: ebeveyn olarak baskın kültürün değerlerinden rahatsızsanız bu kültürü sahip

153

olduğunuz tüm mütevazi yöntemlerle değiştirmeye çalışmalı ve çocuklarınızı da buna yönlendirmelisiniz (s. 256). Yani baskın kültür ve mücadele yöntemleri her toplumda farklı özellikler gösterebilir, önemli olan değişim isteğidir. Kitabın *radikalliği*, tam da bu değişim isteğinden kaynaklanıyor. Çocuğunu "askerleştirmeden" onu direnişe hazır biri haline nasıl dönüştüreceğinin kaygısını yaşayan bir ABD'li babayı okumak Türkiyeli bir okurun özdeşim kurabileceği noktaları ortaya çıkarabiliyor. Farklı olasılıkların varlığını bilmek okuyucu için motive edici olabiliyor. Bu kitaptan anarşist konferanslarda çocuk bakım hizmetinin verilmiş, anne baba olma üzerine panellerin yapılmış olduğunu öğreniyoruz ve "çocuk dostu devrim" diye bir fikrin varlığına tanık oluyoruz.

Radikal Baba bir araştırma/inceleme kitabı olmadığı için ondan belli tutarlılıkta bir bütün oluşturmasını beklemek mümkün değil. Farklı düşünceye ve deneyime sahip yazarlar bazen eğlenceli, bazen dramatizasyona kaçan hikâyeler anlatırken bazen de "klişe" söylemlerde bulunabiliyorlar. Kitabın tutarlı bulabileceğimiz yanı ise çoğu yazarın söyleminin feminizmden beslenmesi, bu sayede de hedeflediği radikal duruşu yansıtabilmesi. Yazının başında değinilen erkekliğin kurucu unsurlarından biri olan babalık, feminist bir bilinçle tanımlanmadığında kadınlar üzerinde hakimiyet kurmak amacıyla ve erkeklerin egolarını büyüten yeni bir alan olarak kurgulanma riskini içinde barındırıyor. Bu sebeple günümüzde erkeklik krizi tartışmaları çerçevesinde şekillenmeye başlayan yeni erkeklik, içerimli (inclusive) erkeklik tanımlamalarının altında sınıflandırabileceğimiz *yeni/ eşitlikçi/ demokratik/ ilgili/ pro-feminist babalık*, otomatik olarak radikal bir özellik kazanıp kendisini hegemonik ya da geleneksel erkekliğin karşısında konumlandırmış olmuyor. Tartışmalar daha çok yeni, bebeğin bakımına katılıyor olmak pro-feminist babalık için önemli bir koşul fakat yeterli değil. Yürürlüğe giren kamu politikalarıyla beslenmediğinde ve feminizmin yol göstericiliğiyle desteklenmediğinde eksiklerinin kalması kaçınılmaz. Ayrıca Günay-Erkol'un (2019) da bahsettiği gibi, eşitsizliğin farkına varmaları için erkeklerin baba olmasını bekleyeceksek işimiz zor çünkü babalık geç yaşlarda edinilen bir kimlik ve her erkek de baba

olmak zorunda değil. Yine de geç olsun, güç olmasın diyelim. Baba olduktan sonra feminizme desteğinin arttığını söyleyen editörlerden Smith, yirmilerinde yanıtladığını zannettiği feminist sorulara kişisel ve politik düzeyde yeni yanıtlar bulmaya başlamış. Bu başlangıçlar bizler için ümit verici.

Bir hikâye anlatıcılığı olarak blog yazılarını okumak eğlenceliydi. Fakat yazarlar bizi şu konuda uyarıyor; kapitalizmin, dinin ve ataerkinin de kendi anlattığı hikâyeler var ve bunlar gündelik hayatın her yerindeler. O yüzden *radikal* olanlarını dinlemek her zaman için daha ilgi çekici olacaktır.

Kaynakça:

Günay Erkol, Ç. (2019). *Erkeklerin babalık rollerine girmeden inisiyatif almalarını sağlamalıyız* adlı söyleşisi. http://www.sivilsayfalar.org/2019/03/27/erkeklerin-babalik-rollerine-girmeden-inisiyatif-almalarini-saglamaliyiz/?fbclid=IwAR0LF9mpo1eJxpoiUWPjhLjLjQmJ5w8t-GvqIt5mdkTNZb1C9is4Ln5zzBE adresinden erişildi.

Düzeltme

Masculinities Journal'ın 13. sayısında Mehmet Beşikçi'nin "*Cihan Harbi'ni Yaşamak ve Hatırlamak: Osmanlı Askerlerinin Cephe Hatıraları ve Türkiye'de Birinci Dünya Savaşı Hafızası*" başlıklı kitabının Çimen Günay-Erkol tarafından hazırlanan tanıtım yazısı ilk yayınlandığında, Beşikçi'nin doktora tezine dayanan kitabı olan "*Birinci Dünya Savaşı'nda Osmanlı Seferberliği*" yerine sehven tanıtılan kitabın başlığı kullanılmıştır.

Instructions for Authors

Journal Description

Masculinities: A Journal of Culture and Society is a peer-reviewed, interdisciplinary and international academic journal with a Critical Masculinity Studies perspective. It has been published bilingually (English and Turkish) twice a year (Spring and Fall) since 2014 by the ICSM, Initiative for Critical Studies of Masculinities.

Aims

It aims to provide researchers with a platform to present cutting-edge and inspirational scholarly discussions on representations, formation, and experiences of men and masculinities, focusing on their cultural, social, political and aesthetic reflections and constructions in culture and society.

Scope

Masculinities accepts articles, book reviews and ongoing research reports that evaluate men and masculinities critically in all fields of social sciences and humanities.

It aims to publish interdisciplinary and pioneering research in the intersections of masculinities with various fields, including art, literature, history, sociology, politics, psychology, law, philosophy, communication and linguistics.

Editors invite original and critical discussions in the form of articles, book reviews, and research reports regarding ongoing (graduate) research, and conference reports. Interviews with researchers from the field are also welcome.

Frequency

Masculinities is published twice a year in Spring and Fall.

Language

Masculinities accepts submissions in English or Turkish. Before submission, manuscripts need to be checked grammatically and also for fluency, clarity, and proper use of relevant terminology. Submissions that fail to comply with the standards of the journal may not be accepted for preliminary evaluation.

Originality and Plagiarism

The author is responsible for ensuring that the submitted manuscript is original and has not been published elsewhere or has been submitted to another academic journal.

All submissions go through a 'Turnitin' check and they are subject to further plagiarism control. If the result of Turnitin check shows 20% or more similarity, except for direct quotations, the submission may be rejected by the editors. If the result is over 10% similarity, the submission is returned to the author for revision.

Copyright

The authors retain the copyright in their work but grant *Masculinities* the sole and exclusive right to publish for the full legal term of copyright.

The authors maintain the right to use their manuscripts in different media, on the condition that they reference *Masculinities* as the original publisher.

Translations of original manuscripts submitted to the journal should include written permission obtained by the translator from the original author and the publisher.

Authors are required to gain permission for reproduction of any images not of their own creation.

Submission Notes

* Authors must submit their manuscript title, author name(s) and last name(s), ORCID number of author(s), institution and contact information, e-mail address, and a short biographical note in a separate file. (Click to download the Author Information Form.)

* The submitted manuscript **should not include** any information regarding the author, including their first and last name. Articles should include a title, abstract, 3-6 keywords, body text, and a bibliography.

* Articles and research-in-progress pieces **should not exceed 8000** (eight thousand) words, including abstract, notes, and references.

* The word limit for book reviews is 1500 words.

* Manuscripts not complying with citation and/or grammar rules will be returned to the author for revision before being accepted to preliminary evaluation.

* Communication in co-authored texts will be maintained with the person who forwards the manuscript to the Journal.

* The authors of the manuscripts published in the journal are not paid any royalties.

* *Masculinities* does not charge the authors for any fee for publication of their manuscripts.

Evaluation Process

- All kinds of manuscripts should be sent to masculinitiesjournal@gmail.com in **both** .doc **and** .pdf formats.

- The authors are notified of reception of submission once the editors receive the manuscript.

- Submissions first go through a preliminary review by the editors to ensure the manuscript complies with academic standards, publication ethics, the scope and aims of the journal as well as the writing and citation rules. Only submissions complying with these criteria are directed to reviewers. Review process may vary in terms of duration.

- The authors are informed of the decisions of the reviewers as soon as the both review reports have been received.

- *Masculinities* uses double blind peer review, in which the identities of the authors and reviewers are anonymised to ensure submissions are judged for their merit.

- Articles that receive acceptance from two reviewers are published with the final approval of the editorial board. If one of the reviewers rejects the article while the other accepts, it is sent to a third reviewer. In all cases, the editorial board makes the final decision about publication of manuscripts.
- Research-in-progress pieces and book reviews are generally not sent to reviewers, but they are reviewed by the editorial board.
- The authors should prepare a report that responds to the review reports. The authors are expected to list the changes they have made in this report, and to give reasons for the changes requested by the reviewer but they have not considered appropriate and not done.
- Articles that have a positive result in the review process are put in order for publication according to the date of reception of their final versions following the review reports. Editorial board reserves the right to make minor changes in language and wording of the manuscripts, approves the final versions, and decides on the order of publication.

Article Withdrawal

In accordance with the *Masculinities* publishing policies, the authors who want to withdraw their manuscripts during the evaluation process should send their withdrawal requests to the editor via e-mail. The editor examines the withdrawal request and returns to the author.

Unless the withdrawal request is approved, the authors cannot submit their manuscripts to another journal for evaluation.

For the book reviews, following points should also be considered.

- A book review aims to shed light on the most important points dealt with in the book and to discuss them critically.
- Book reviews should follow a general structure consisting of introduction, book summary, critical discussion and conclusion.
- Title, author, city and publishing house, publication year and ISBN number of the book should be included in the title section.

- The name of the author who reviews the book should be written in 11 font size, italic and bold on the right corner under the article's title; and author's title, affiliation and e-mail address should be written in 9 font size in the footnote with a (*) sign.

Open Access Policy

Masculinities adopts the principle that offering scientific research free of charge will increase the global sharing of information, and thus provides open access to all of its issues and articles. In this context, our journal permits its readers to "read, download, copy, distribute, print, search or link to their full text" in accordance with the definition of "open access" by BOAI (Budapest Open Access Initiative).

Manuscrpt Submission Rules

Manuscripts to be submitted to the *Masculinities*;

- On A4 size white page, page margins should be left of the top 2.5 cm, bottom 2.0 cm, left 2.5 cm, right 2.5 cm and pages should not be numbered.
- Double spaced with Times New Roman style and (Excluding the title page) should be written as plain text in 12 font size (These dimensions will ensure that the submitted tables and graphics do not exceed the journal page size and are easier to use).
- In the writing, one space should be used following punctuation marks, such as commas and periods.
- The parts that need to be emphasized in the text and the titles of works such as books and journal titles should be written in italic.
- Notes and explanations (if any) should be given as footnotes.
- Tab key should not be used at the beginning of the paragraphs and enter key should not be used between the paragraphs.
- 0 pt before the paragraph and 6 pt after the space should be left. No additional blank lines should be left between paragraphs.

The submitted manuscripts must follow the citation rules of the 2020 (seventh) edition of the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association (APA) (see **https://apastyle.apa.org/)**

- Title page
- Abstract page (Turkish **and** English for submissions in Turkish) and Keywords (3-6)
- Main text
- References
- Appendix (if any)
- Figure Captions and figures (if any)
- Author Notes

Title Page

The title page should be a separate page to the running head, the title of the study, the authors, the institutions of the authors and the author's note.

For detailed information and examples, see https://apastyle.apa.org/style-grammar-guidelines/paper-format/title-page

Running Head: Write the short title of your work in capital letters, consisting of several words, by leaning to the upper left corner of the page to the left.

Title: Should be compatible with the content of the article and should consist of maximum 10-12 words; Cambria style should be used in 12 font size and bold letters, centred on the page.

Author name and information: Author's name and surname should be written below the manuscript title by centring the page. Job title, institution address and e-mail should be appear at the bottom of the first page marked by a star (*) right after the surname. Author information should only be included in the title page and **should not** be used in the main body of the article.

Abstract

Abstract section

- Should start in a separate page after the title page
- Should be written in Turkish <u>and</u> English (for submissions in Turkish)
- Should be under the title of "Abstract"
- Should not exceed 200 words
- Should contain 3 to 6 keywords; and these keywords should be given under the body of the abstract and follow the title of "Keywords".
- Should be prepared to present the key aspects and the main argument of the manuscript
- Should not include any abbreviations, references, quotations, tables or figures.

Main Text

Main text should start in a separate page following the abstract page.

The title of the manuscript needs to be written in the upper right corner of each page

Introduction should lay out the main problematic of the article by contextualizing it in a broader scholarly context. Introduction should also include the argument as well as a brief outline of the main points in article. The Method section (applying to empirical research articles) should briefly explain the method(s) used in the research and the rationale behind that choice as well as the data collection and analysis processes and participants.

In-Text Quotations:

Quotations exceeding 40 words need to be written in a separate block. This block should be intended 1 cm from left and right sides with 10 font size (Cambria) and 15 pt. line spacing without any quotation marks.

In-text short quotations: Quotations below 40 words can be used in text by using quotation marks

References

- This part should start on a new page. All works cited in the text should be included in the end-text reference list and all works cited in the reference list should be referred in the text.
- Works cited in the text should be written in an alphabetical order based on the surnames of the authors.
- The author name and the date in the cited work must match the author name and date information in the end-text reference list.
- The works of the same author are sorted by the publication year, the earliest work being in the first order.
- When citing the authors' single and multiple co-authored works, first cite the work with single author regardless of the publication year.
- In the case of multiple works with the same publication year with multiple authors, use an alphabetical order in terms of the second author if the first author is the same across the works; use an alphabetical order in terms of the third author if the first and the second author are the same across the works.

For more information please visit:

https://apastyle.apa.org/style-grammar-guidelines/references/

The works cited in the reference list should follow the examples below:

Periodicals

Include the digital object identifier (DOI) in the reference if one is assigned (see the example below)

Journal Article with One Author

Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). Article title. *Journal Title, Volume*(issue), Page range. DOI.

Demetriou, D.Z. (2001). Connell's concept of hegemonic masculinity: A critique. *Theory and Society. 30*(3), 337-361. https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1017596718715

Türkoğlu, B. (2014). Fay hattında erkeklikler: Çalışma ve işsizlik ekseninde erkekliğe bakış. *Mülkiye Dergisi*, *37*(4), 33-61.

Journal Article with Two Authors

Author Surname, First Initial & Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). Article title. *Journal Title, Volume*(issue), Page range. DOI.

Connell, R.W. & Messerschmidt, J.W. (2005). Hegemonic masculinity: Rethinking the concept. *Gender and Society*, *19*(6), 829-859.

Barutçu, A. & Hıdır, N. (2016). Türkiye'de babalığın değişen rolleri: (Pro)feminist babalar, *Fe Dergi*, *8*(2), 27-45.

Journal Article with Three or More Authors

Author Surname, First Initial., Author Surname, First Initial., and Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). Article title. *Journal Title, Volume*(issue), Page range. DOI.

Boratav, H.B, Fişek, G.O. & Eslen-Ziya, H. (2014). Unpacking masculinities in the context of social change: Internal complexities of the identities of married men in Turkey. *Men & Masculinities*, *17*, 299-324.

Books

Book with Single Author

Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). *Book title* (Edition). Place of Publication: Publisher.

Connell, R. W. (2005). *Toplumsal cinsiyet ve iktidar* (3. baskı). İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları.

Connell, R. W. (2005). *Masculinities* (2th ed). Cambridge: Polity Press.

Book with Two Authors

Author Surname, First Initial & Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). *Book title* (Edition). Place of Publication: Publisher.

> Hearn, J. & Pringe, K. (2006). *European perspectives on men and masculinities*. N.Y: Palgrave Macmillan.

Book Chapter

Author Surname, First Initial & Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). in Title of Chapter. *Book title* (Edition) (Page Range). Place of Publication: Publisher.

> Yıldırım, A. & Şimşek, H. (2000). Nitel araştırmanın planlanması: sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. A. Yıldırım & H. Şimşek (Eds.), *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri* içinde (2. Baskı, s. 49-91). Ankara: Seçkin Yayınları.

> Dillard, J. P. (2020). Currents in the study of persuasion. In M. B. Oliver, A. A. Raney, & J. Bryant (Eds.), *Media effects: Advances in theory and research* (4th ed., pp. 115–129). New York & London: Routledge.

Edited Book

Author Surname, First Initial & Author Surname, First Initial. (Ed.) (Year). *Book title* (Volume). Place of Publication: Publisher.

> Cornwall, J. A. & Lindisfarne, N. (Eds.) (2014). *Dislocating masculinity: Comparative ethnographies*. New York & London: Routledge.

Chapter in an Edited Book

Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). Title of chapter. In Editor's First Initial, Editor's Surname (Ed.) *Book title* (Edition, Page Range). Place of Publication: Publisher.

> Loizos, P. (1994). A broken Mmrror: Masculine sexuality in Greek Eehnography. A. Cornwall & N. Lindisfarne (Eds.), *Dislocating Masculinity: Comparative ethnographies* (1st ed., pp. 66–81). London & New York: Routledge.

Unpublished Dissertations/Thesis

Author Surname, First Initial. (Year). *Title of thesis/dissertation* (Description). Institution and place where thesis/dissertation is held.

> Akyüz, S. (2012). *Political manhood in 2000's Turkey: Representations of different masculinities in politics*. (Unpublished Dissertation). Bilkent University / Institute of Economy and Social Sciences, Ankara.

Scientific Meetings and Conferences
Oral Presentation

Author's surname, initial of the author's given name. (Year, Month) *The title of the oral presentation*. The title of the scientific meeting,

> Arpacı, M. (2019, Eylül). *Türkiye'de tıbbi söylem, erkeklik ve cinsellik.* [Sözlü Sunum]. 2. Uluslararası Erkekler ve Erkeklikler Sempozyumu, İstanbul, Türkiye.

> Güler, E. (2019, September). *Masculinity crises in 1960s' Turkish novels*. [Conference presentation]. The 2nd International Symposium on Men and Masculinities, İstanbul, Turkey.

Conference Proceedings

The conference/panel papers should be cited like edited book chapters.
First presenter's surname, initial of the first presenter's given name, Second presenter's surname, initial of the second presenter's given name, the third presenter's surname, initial of the third author's given name. (Year, Month and days) The title of the presentation. Initial of the session chair(s)'s name. Surname of the session chair. *The title of the Symposium/Panel*. The name of the organizing institution of the Symposium/Panel.   The Place of the Symposium/Panel.

> Korkmaz, L. (2017, Haziran 10-12). Cinsiyetçilik. İçinde Z. Yeniçeri (Oturum başkanı), *Cinsiyet ve dezavantajlı gruplar* [Panel]. Sinop Barosu, Sinop, Türkiye.

> De Boer, D., & LaFavor, T. (2018, April 26–29). The art and significance of successfully identifying resilient individuals: A

person-focused approach. In A. M. Schmidt & A. Kryvanos (Chairs), *Perspectives on resilience: Conceptualization, measurement, and enhancement* [Symposium]. Western Psychological Association 98th Annual Convention, Portland, United States.

Media Sources

Anonymous Newspaper Article or News Report

The title of the Article. (Year. Day, Month). *The name of the newspaper*, page range (or url link).

Karar seçimi etkilemez. (2003, 24 Ocak). *Radikal*, 6.

Mrs. Obama says 'lovely frame' in box during awkward handoff. (2018, February 1). *AP News*. https://www.apnews.com/31f3520500c94a6ebfdbd2a0db5f4b 60

Nonanonymous Newspaper Article or News Report

Author's surname, the initial of the author's given name. (Year, Day, Month) The name of the article. *The name of the newspaper*. Page range.

Belge, M. (2008, 4 Ocak). Tarih niçin sevilir? *Radikal*, 7.

Harlan, C. (2013, April 2). North Korea vows to restart shuttered nuclear reactor that can make bomb-grade plutonium. *The Washington Post,* A1, A4.

Films or Videos

Director's surname, Initial of the Director's name. (Year). *Title of film.* Production Location: Production company.

Akpınar, N. (Yapımcı) ve Erdoğan, Y. (Yönetmen). (2004). *Vizontele Tuba* [Film]. Türkiye: BKM Film
Fleming, V. (Director). (1939). *Gone with the wind* [Film]. Selznick International Pictures; Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer.

An episode of a Television Programme

Screenwriter's surname, Initial of the Screenwriter's name. (Screenwriter) & Director' surname, Initial of the Director's name. (Year). Title of the episode. (Television programme episode) *Television Programme Title.* Broadcasting Place: Broadcasting Institution.

> Favreau, J. (Screenwriter), & Filoni, D. (Director). (2019, November 12). Chapter 1 (Season 1, Episode 1) [TV series episode]. In J. Favreau, D. Filoni, K. Kennedy, & C. Wilson (Executive Producers), *The Mandalorian*. Lucasfilm; Golem Creations.

Internet Sources

A DOI (Digital Object Identifier) number should be provided in the bibliography, if available, for online periodicals. If the DOI number is not available, the full URL should be provided.

> Woodyatt, A. (2019, September 10). *Daytime naps once or twice a week may be linked to a healthy heart, researchers say.* CNN. https://www.cnn.com/2019/09/10/health/nap-heart-health-wellness-intl-scli/index.html

Periodicals
Journal Article

Author's surname, Initial of the author's name. (Publication date). The title of the article. *Journal title, Volume* (Issue), Page range, URL

> Munsch, C. L., & Gruys, K. (2018). What threatens, defines: tracing the symbolic boundaries of contemporary masculinity. *Sex Roles, 79,* 375-392. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-017-0878-0

Newspaper Article

Author's surname, Initial of the author's name. (Date of Publication) The title of the article. *The name of the newspaper*. Web address. (URL)

> Carey, B. (2019, March 22). Can we get better at forgetting? *The New York Times.* https://www.nytimes.com/2019/03/22/health/memory-forgetting-psychology.html

Webpage on a Website with a Retrieval Date

The title of the document. (n.d.). *The title of the source.* The source which the document has been retrieved. Retrieval date, web address.

> U.S. Census Bureau. (n.d.). *U.S. and world population clock*. U.S. Department of Commerce. Retrieved January 9, 2020, from https://www.census.gov/popclock/

In-Text Citation and Reference Guideline

Sources with One Author:

Citations of a reference with one credited author must include the author's surname, the publication year (and the page number if direct quotation is used).

> Example: (Edwards, 2006)

Sources with Two Authors

Citations of a reference with two credited authors must include the surnames of both authors, the publication year (and the page number if direct quotation is used).

The surnames must be separated by "&".

> Example: (Clayton & Craig, 1999,)

Sources with Three or More Authors

Citations of a reference with three or more credited authors must include the surname of the first author, followed by "et al.", the publication year (and the page number if direct quotation is used).

> Example: (Carrigan et al., 2005)

To recognise the sources with the same-first author, the second and the third authors must also be included.

Citations of a reference with no credited author display a short title in title case (headline capitalization) and the publication year.

> Example: As mentioned in another source (*College Cost Book*, 1983)

Sources with the Same Author

Sources with the same author must be listed chronologically. And be separated by comma.

> Example: (Connell, 1987, 1995)

In-text articles must be written in parenthesis, not in italics.

> Example: In Michael S. Kimmel's essay titled (1994) "Masculinity as homophobia" ….

Secondary Resource Citations

The citation of a secondary resource—a work cited within a primary resource but not itself consulted—features the surname and year (when available) of the work cited within the primary resource and, following the phrase "as cited in," a citation of the primary resource. Only the primary resource is included as an entry in the reference list.

> Example: John Mogey, for example, back in 1957, appears to have mistaken cultural for behavioral changes when, in talking about the emerging role of men in the family, he asserts that the "newer" father's "behavior is best de- scribed as participation, the re-integration of fathers into the conspicuous consumption as well as the child rearing styles of family life" (Mogey, 1957 as cited in Lewis, 1986).

References without direct quotation

If another source is referred without direct quotation, reference must be written as (Author's Surname, year)

> Example: The problem has also received some feminist as well as media attention, further highlighting its connections with a crisis of masculinity (Campbell, 1993).

If another source is referred without direct quotation, and the author of the cited work is given in the sentence, the page number must be added at the end of the sentence.

Example: Similarly, Adams and Coltrane (2004) highlight the tendency to collapse into anxieties concerning the implosion of gendered differences or the biological stereotypes concerning both children and parenting (p. 231).

First authors with the same surnames:

Citations of references by different first authors who share the same surname are distinguished by inserting the first authors' given-name to the citations.

Example: Ian Taylor (1999), Yolande Taylor (2003).

Multiple References with Different Authors

When citations of references to two or more sources are necessary, authors' surnames and year of the publications are written in the same parenthesis.

Example: (Beynon 2002; Taylor 2003).