

*Religion and Culture*  
*(Special Issue)*

June 2023

Issue 31

ISSN: 2146 - 4901

e-ISSN: 2667 - 6575

# ŞIRNAK ÜNİVERSİTESİ İLAHİYAT FAKÜLTESİ DERGİSİ

*Şırnak University Journal of Divinity Faculty*





ISSN: 2146-4901  
e-ISSN: 2667-6575

<b>Yayıncı</b>	<b>Publisher</b>
Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi	Şırnak University Divinity Faculty
<b>Yayımlandığı Ülke</b>	<b>Broadcast Country</b>
Türkiye	Türkiye
<b>Yayın Modeli</b>	<b>Release Model</b>
Açık Erişim	Open Access
<b>Yayın Periyodu</b>	<b>Published Period</b>
Haziran - Aralık	June - December
<b>Hedef Kitle</b>	<b>Target Audience</b>
Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisinin hedef kitle, ilahiyat alanında araştırmalarını sürdüren profesyoneller ile bu alana ilgi duyan öğrenciler, okurlar ve kurumlardır.	The target audience of Şırnak University Journal of Divinity Faculty is professionals who continue their research in the field of theology and students, readers and institutions who are interested in this field.
<b>Yayın Dili</b>	<b>Publication Language</b>
Türkçe / İngilizce / Arapça	Turkish / English / Arabic
<b>Ücret Politikası</b>	<b>Price Policy</b>
Hiçbir ad altında yazar veya kurumundan ücret alınmaz.	No fee is charged from the author or institution under any name.
<b>Hakemlik Türü</b>	<b>Type of Arbitration</b>
En az iki uzman hakem tarafından çift taraflı kör hakemlik sistemine uygun olarak değerlendirilir.	It is evaluated by at least two expert referees in accordance with the double-blind refereeing system.
<b>Telif Hakkı</b>	<b>Copyright</b>
Yazarlar, Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisinde yayımlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler. Fakat yazıların hukuki sorumluluğu yazarlarına aittir.	The authors hold the copyright of their works published in Şırnak University Journal of Divinity Faculty. They have the right. But the legal responsibility of the articles belongs to their authors.
<b>İntihal Kontrolü</b>	<b>Plagiarism Check</b>
Ön kontrolden geçirilen makaleler, Turnitin ya da Ithenticate yazılımı kullanılarak intihal için taranır.	Pre-checked articles are scanned for plagiarism using Turnitin or Ithenticate software.
<b>Yönetim Yeri</b>	<b>Administration Place</b>
Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi, Mehmet Emin Acar Yerleşkesi, 73000 Tel: +90 486 216 40 08, Şırnak / TÜRKİYE	Şırnak University Faculty of Divinity, Mehmet Emin Acar Campus, 73000 - +90 486 216 40 08 Şırnak / TÜRKİYE

**Yayın Tarihi** **Publishing Date**  
15 Haziran 2023 15 June 2023

e-mail: [suifdergi@gmail.com](mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com)

Dizinleme Bilgileri | Indexing Services



<https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/sirnakifd/indexes>

**Owner**

(On behalf of Şırnak University Faculty of Divinity)  
Prof. Hüseyin GÜNEŞ

**Managing Director / Yazı İşleri Müdürü**

Prof. İbrahim BAZ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

**Editor in Chief / Baş Editör**

Assoc. Prof. Hamdullah ARVAS | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

**Field Editors / Alan Editörleri**

Assist. Prof. Nazan YEŞİLKAYA | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. Nesim ASLANTATAR | İnönü University, Malatya, TÜRKİYE  
R.A. Muhammed ŞAHİN | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
R.A. Gülizar ARTUÇ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
R.A. Delila ELÇE | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

**Yayın Kurulu / Editorial Board**

Doç. Dr. Nurullah AGİTOĞLU | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Ahmet GÜL | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Mehmet Şükrü ÖZKAN | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Ruhullah ÖZ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Emin CENGİZ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Ahmet ÖZDEMİR | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Abdalbaki DENİZ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. İrfan YILDIRIM | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. Harun TAKÇI | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. İsmet TUNÇ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. Yunus İBRAHİMOĞLU | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. Ahmet ÖZALP | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. Yusuf EMRE | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

**Yazım ve Dil Editörü / Writing Editor**

Arş. Gör. Delila ELÇE | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

**Yabancı Dil Editörü / Foreign Language Editor**

İbrahim Halil ERCİK | Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, Bitlis, TÜRKİYE  
Dr. M. Rashid ALDARSHAWI | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

**Danışma Kurulu / Advisory Board**

Prof. Dr. Abdurrahim ALKIŞ | Dicle Üniversitesi, Diyarbakır, TÜRKİYE  
Prof. Dr. Müfit Selim SARUHAN | Ankara University, Ankara, TÜRKİYE  
Prof. Dr. Hamdi GÜNDOĞAR | Adıyaman University, Adıyaman, TÜRKİYE  
Prof. Dr. Fadıl AYĞAN | Siirt University, Siirt, TÜRKİYE  
Prof. Dr. Mehmet BİLEN | Dicle Üniversitesi, Diyarbakır, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Yaşar ACAT | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Davut EŞİT | Van Yüzüncüyıl University, Van, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Fevzi RENÇBER | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Mehmet Ata AZ | Yıldırım Bayezit University, Ankara, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Kasım ERTAŞ | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Muhammed Nasih ECE | Van Yüzüncüyıl University, Van, TÜRKİYE  
Doç. Dr. Yunus KAPLAN | Van Yüzüncüyıl University, Van, TÜRKİYE

**Mizanpaj Editörü / Layout Editor**

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Yakup AKYÜREK | Şırnak University, Şırnak, TÜRKİYE

## İÇİNDEKİLER / CONTENTS

### Research Articles / Araştırma Makaleleri

- 6-21 **Some Ethical Concerns About End of Life:  
A Paradigm Shift From Ars Moriendi to Medicalized Death**  
*Yaşam Sonuna Dair Bazı Etik Kaygılar: Ars Moriendi'den Tıbbileştirilmiş  
Ölüme Bir Paradigma Değişimi*  
Ercan AVCİ
- 22-46 **Change of Identities and Religiosities of Muslim Young People across Time and Space:  
Resilient Youth**  
*Gençlerin Kimlik ve Dindarlıklarının Zaman ve Mekâna göre Değişimi: Direnen Gençlik*  
Mustafa Cabir ALTINTAŞ
- 47-75 **An Evaluation of Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Sufi Influences in the Indian Subcontinent: The  
Case of Chishti Tariqa**  
*Muînüddin Çiştî'nin Hint Yarımadası'ndaki Tasavvufi Etkilerine Dair Bir Değerlendirme: Çiştîyye  
Tarikatı Örneği*  
Vahit GÖKTAŞ - Saeed Rashed Hasan CHOWDURY
- 76-98 **Attitudes to Violence and Spiritual Well-Being among Married Individuals**  
*Evlü Bireylerde Şiddete Yönelik Tutum ve Manevî İyi Olma*  
Sema ERYÜCEL – Tuğçe KARADEMİR
- 99-121 **The Relationship between Attachment to God, Perception of God and Emotional State, and  
Psychological Well-being: The Sample of Chronic Diseases**  
*Tanrı'ya Bağlanma, Tanrı Algısı ve Duygu Durumu ile Psikolojik İyi Olma Arasındaki İlişki: Kronik  
Hastalıklar Örneği*  
Fatma SAĞLAM DEMİRKAN
- 122-151 **A Comparison of the Linguistic Categories of Muştarak and Muşkil of the Hanafî Islamic  
Jurisprudence**  
*Hanefî Usûl-ı Fıkhı'nın Müşterek ve Müşkil Dil Kategorilerinin Bir Mukayesesi*  
Ahmet TOPAL





ISSN: 2146-4901  
e-ISSN: 2667-6575

## Some Ethical Concerns About End of Life: A Paradigm Shift From Ars Moriendi to Medicalized Death

*Yaşam Sonuna Dair Bazı Etik Kaygılar: Ars Moriendi'den Tıbbileştirilmiş Ölüme Bir Paradigma Değişimi*

**Ercan AVCİ**

ORCID: 0000-0003-4857-8429 | E-Posta: [avcie@duq.edu](mailto:avcie@duq.edu)

Post-Doctoral Fellow, Duquesne University, Grefenstette Center for Ethics

*Dr., Duquesne Üniversitesi, Grefenstette Etik Merkezi*

Pittsburgh, ABD

ROR ID: [02336z538](https://orcid.org/02336z538)

### Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

**Citation / Atıf:** Avcı, Ercan. "Some Ethical Concerns About End of Life: A Paradigm Shift From Ars Moriendi to Medicalized Death". *Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31 (Haziran 2023), 6-21. <https://doi.org/10.35415/sirnakifd.1230066>

Date of Submission ( <i>Geliş Tarihi</i> )	05. 01. 2023
Date of Acceptance ( <i>Kabul Tarihi</i> )	09. 04. 2023
Date of Publication ( <i>Yayın Tarihi</i> )	15. 06. 2023
Article Type ( <i>Makale Türü</i> )	Research Article (Araştırma Makalesi)
Peer-Review (Değerlendirme)	Double anonymized - Three External (Üç Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körleme).
Ethical Statement ( <i>Etik Beyan</i> )	It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited. ( <i>Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.</i> )
Plagiarism Checks ( <i>Benzerlik Taraması</i> )	Yes (Evet) – Turnitin / Ithenticate
Conflicts of Interest ( <i>Çıkar Çatışması</i> )	The author(s) has no conflict of interest to declare ( <i>Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.</i> )
Complaints (Etik Beyan Adresi)	<a href="mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com">suifdergi@gmail.com</a>
Grant Support ( <i>Finansman</i> )	The author(s) acknowledge that they received no external funding in support of this research. ( <i>Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır.</i> )
Copyright & License (Telif Hakkı ve Lisans)	Authors publishing with the journal retain the copyright to their work licensed under the CC BY-NC 4.0. ( <i>Yazarlar dergide yayımlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmalarını CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.</i> )

## **Abstract**

Medicine has several goals, including preventing and curing diseases, relieving pain and suffering, and promoting and maintaining the mental and physical health of the person from birth to death. Thanks to medical and technological developments in the last century, medicine has started to provide the opportunity to live longer. However, whether a longer life leads to a better life is debatable. Before these developments, death was regarded as a natural and inevitable end and mostly handled with religious approaches, such as *Ars moriendi*. However, these medical and technological advances have caused a misleading perception that medicine has the power to achieve every desired outcome. Under the influence and pressure of this misleading situation, people began to demand aggressive treatments, like resuscitation, mechanical ventilation, artificial nutrition and hydration, and chemotherapy. Of course, these medical interventions can be lifesaving for some patients. However, in the case of incurable conditions, such as metastatic cancers, Alzheimer's disease, or advanced organ failure, aggressive treatment methods often fail to produce promising results; on the contrary, they place a variety of burdens on patients, families, and society, as significantly reducing patients' quality of life, causing unrealistic hopes, and exhausting limited health resources. In this context, the article aims to briefly examine the change in people's perception of death and the dying process and to evaluate its de facto and ethical impacts. This study shows that medical and technological breakthroughs have significantly changed people's comprehension, acceptance, and perception of death, which made death no longer a natural end, but a medical failure. In other words, a medical interventions-based death, called medicalized death, has replaced a religion-based death. As a result of this change, the social, spiritual, and emotional aspects of death and the dying process are ignored for the sake of excessive and ineffective medical interventions. This situation brings about a critical shift in where, how, and when to die, and produces various ethical problems regarding the principles of respect for autonomy, non-maleficence, and justice. The present article demonstrates that most people want to die at home and spend their last days with their families. However, due to medical interventions, many die in healthcare facilities while on medical treatments and machines. In this context, this study recommends home-based palliative care services encompassing social, emotional, and spiritual support instead of aggressive medical interventions at end-of-life. Home-based palliative care will enable individuals to spend the last days of their lives at home with their loved ones, receive emotional and spiritual support, and prevent themselves, their families, and society from unnecessary and futile medical expenses. In conclusion, in light of the principles of respect for autonomy, non-maleficence, and justice, in end-of-life issues, medicine should focus on improving patients' quality of life, providing patients with social, emotional, and spiritual support, and ensuring that patients have the opportunity to spend their last days of life with their family members, which can most suitably be achieved through home-based palliative care.

**Keywords:** *Ars Moriendi*, Medicalized Death, End of Life, Ethical Challenges, Palliative care.

## Özet

Tıbbın, hastalıkları önlemek ve iyileştirmek, ağrı ve ıstırapı dindirmek ve erken ölümleri engellemek dâhil olmak üzere, doğumdan ölüme kadar kişinin ruh ve beden sağlığını geliştirmek ve sürdürmek şeklinde çeşitli amaçları bulunmaktadır. Son yüzyıldaki, tıbbi ve teknolojik gelişmeler sayesinde, tıp, daha uzun yaşama imkânı sağlamaya başlamıştır. Ancak, daha uzun yaşamın, daha iyi bir yaşam sağlayıp sağlamadığı konusu tartışmalıdır. Bahsi geçen gelişmelerden önce, ölüm, doğal ve kaçınılmaz bir son olarak kabul edilmekteydi ve çoğunlukla *Ars moriendi* gibi dini yaklaşımlarla ele alınmaktaydı. Fakat, söz konusu tıbbi ve teknolojik gelişmeler, tıbbın, her istenilen sonucu elde etme gücü varmış gibi yanıltıcı bir algıya yol açmıştır. Bu yanıltıcı durumun etkisi ve baskısı altında, insanlar, resüsitasyon, mekanik ventilasyon, yapay beslenme ve hidrasyon ve kemoterapi gibi agresif tedaviler talep etme yoluna gitmeye başladılar. Elbette bu tıbbi müdahaleler, bazı hastalar için hayat kurtarıcı nitelikte olabilmektedir. Ancak, metastatik kanserler, Alzheimer hastalığı veya ilerlemiş organ yetmezlikleri gibi tedavi imkânı olmayan hastalıklar durumunda, agresif tedavi yöntemleri çoğunlukla umut verici sonuçlar üretememektedir; tersine, bunlar, hastalara, ailelere ve topluma, hastaların yaşam kalitesini önemli ölçüde düşürmek, gerçek dışı umutlara neden olmak ve sınırlı sağlık kaynaklarını tüketmek şeklindeki yükler getirmektedir. Bu bağlamda, makale, insanların ölüm ve ölüm süreci algısındaki değişimi kısaca incelemeyi ve bunun fiili ve etik etkilerini değerlendirmeyi amaçlamaktadır. Bu çalışma, tıbbi ve teknolojik alanlardaki ilerlemelerin, insanların ölümü anlama, kabul etme ve algılama biçimlerinde önemli değişikliklere yol açtığını ve bu değişikliklerin etkisiyle, ölümün artık doğal bir son değil, tıbbi bir başarısızlık olarak görülmeye başladığını göstermektedir. Başka bir ifadeyle, tıbbileştirilmiş ölüm olarak adlandırılan, tıbbi müdahalelere dayalı bir ölüm anlayışı, din temelli bir ölüm anlayışının yerini almıştır. Bu değişimin bir sonucu olarak, ölüm ve ölüm sürecinin sosyal, manevi ve duygusal yönleri, aşırı ve sonuç doğurmayan tıbbi müdahaleler uğruna göz ardı edilmektedir. Bu durum, nerede, nasıl ve ne zaman ölüneceği konularında ciddi bir değişim meydana getirmekte ve özerkliğe saygı gösterme, zarar vermeme ve adalet ilkeleri temelinde çeşitli etik sorunlar üretmektedir. Mevcut makale, insanların çoğunluğunun evde ölmek ve hayatlarının son günlerini aile üyeleriyle birlikte geçirmek istediğini göstermektedir. Ancak agresif tıbbi müdahaleler nedeniyle, bu insanların birçoğu sağlık kuruluşlarında, tıbbi müdahalelere ve cihazlara bağlı biçimde ölmektedirler. Bu çerçevede, söz konusu bu çalışma, hayatın son döneminde, agresif tıbbi tedaviler yerine, sosyal, duygusal ve manevi desteği de kapsayan evde palyatif bakım hizmetlerini önermektedir. Evde palyatif bakım hizmetleri, bireylere, ömürlerinin son günlerini kendi evlerinde sevdikleriyle birlikte geçirmelerine, duygusal ve dinsel destek almalarına ve kendilerini, ailelerini ve toplumu gereksiz ve faydasız tıbbi masraflardan kurtarma imkânı sağlayacaktır. Sonuç olarak, yaşamın sonuna dair konularda, özerkliğe saygı, zarar vermeme ve adalet ilkeleri ışığında tıp, hastaların yaşam kalitesini iyileştirmeye, hastalara sosyal, duygusal ve manevi destek sağlamaya, hastaların hayatlarının son günlerini aile bireyleriyle birlikte geçirmelerine olanak sağlamalıdır, ki bahse konu bu amaçları sağlamanın en uygun yolu evde palyatif bakım hizmetleridir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** *Ars Moriendi*, Tıbbileştirilmiş Ölüm, Yaşamın Sonu, Etik Sorunlar, Palyatif bakım.



## **Introduction**

Public health improvements, medical advances, and technological developments have increased average life expectancy worldwide. According to the U.S. National Institute on Aging and the World Health Organization, the percentage of people aged 65 or older, which was 8% in 2010, will be 16% of the world population in 2050, and the aging population will increase by 250% in developing countries and 71% in developed countries between 2010 and 2050.<sup>1</sup> Additionally, the number and percentage of deaths resulting from chronic diseases, including cancer, dementia, cardiovascular diseases, and diabetes, have been growing, which means that many deaths have been occurring through a predictable period.<sup>2</sup> These changes in the aging population and the pattern of dying indicate administrative, financial, and ethical challenges.

Preventing premature death and ensuring a peaceful death is a fundamental goal of medicine.<sup>3</sup> Even though referring to a subjective matter, the concept of premature death is generally understood based on available medical opportunities and the possibility of restoring and maintaining certain human functions in light of social and cultural comprehension.<sup>4</sup> However, contemporary medical ethics considers the person the major – or the only – agent who can decide on what premature death is. As Jonsen et al. emphasize, the principle of respect for persons or respect for autonomy requires “acknowledging the moral right of every individual with decision-making capacity to choose and follow his or her own plan of life and actions.”<sup>5</sup> In this view, an individual with the decision-making capacity has the right to make all end-of-life decisions about her/his life. This right, which originates from the right to self-rule or self-governance, also allows the person to interpret the meaning of her/his quality of life.<sup>6</sup> Medical conditions or state of illness should not deprive the

---

<sup>1</sup> U.S. National Institute on Aging National Institutes of Health and World Health Organization, *Global Health and Aging* (National Institute on Aging National Institutes of Health and World Health Organization, Publication no. 11-7737, 2011), 2-6.

<sup>2</sup> World Health Organization, “The Top 10 Causes of Death” (Accessed 5 January 2023).

<sup>3</sup> The Hastings Center Report, “The Goals of Medicine: Setting New Priorities”, *The Hastings Center Report* 26/6 (1996), 13-14.

<sup>4</sup> The Hastings Center Report, “The Goals of Medicine: Setting New Priorities”, 13.

<sup>5</sup> Albert R. Jonsen et al., *Clinical Ethics: A Practical Approach to Ethical Decisions in Clinical Medicine* (New York: McGraw Hill Education, 2015), 49.

<sup>6</sup> Tom L. Beauchamp - James F. Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 101.

patient/person of enjoying the right to self-governance, the insight into her/his quality of life, and decisions about medical interventions.<sup>7</sup> However, in the event of a lack of decision-making capacity, surrogates become decision-makers with the risk of making decisions inconsistent with patients' preferences, wishes, and values.<sup>8</sup>

The *Ars moriendi*, also known as the art of dying, is a concept going back to the Bubonic Plague (Black Death) outbreak that killed millions of people in Europe.<sup>9</sup> According to James M. Murphy and John Silke, the *Ars moriendi* consists of "two texts written in Latin around the 15th century that offered advice on how to die well according to the Christian ideals of the time."<sup>10</sup> As Carlo Leget underscores, in the Roman Catholic tradition, the *Ars moriendi* "has been a guide to a good death for many generations" by accepting and describing death through a religious perspective.<sup>11</sup> The *Ars moriendi* does not only refer to the death of the elderly but death at any age.<sup>12</sup> Therefore, regardless of the time and form of death, the *Ars moriendi* points out the absolute power of God on life, death, and after death and suggests having faith in His control and decision.

However, especially in parallel with medical and technological advances, the impact of the religion-based standpoint on the death and dying process has weakened. Antibiotics, artificial nutrition and hydration, mechanical ventilation, resuscitation, chemotherapy, etc., have allowed medicine to play a significant role in sustaining life. Even though these medical tools and opportunities have lifesaving functions, excessive utilization of them at the end of life, which is called medicalized death, causes patients to stay on medical devices and interventions until death.<sup>13</sup> For this reason, it is also possible to deem medicalized death as the opposite side of palliative care.<sup>14</sup> Medicalized death represents life-sustaining interventions until death, whereas palliative care intends to improve and maintain the patient's quality of life by providing pain management and social, emotional, and spiritual

<sup>7</sup> ML Slevin et al., "Who Should Measure Quality of Life, the Doctor or the Patient?", *British Journal of Cancer* 57 (1988), 109–112.

<sup>8</sup> Bernard Lo, *Resolving Ethical Dilemmas: A Guide for Clinicians* (Philadelphia: Wolters Kluwer, 2020), 83.

<sup>9</sup> Dugdale, "Dying, a Lost Art", *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*, ed. Lydia S. Dugdale (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015), 3-7.

<sup>10</sup> James M. Murphy - John Silke, "Ars Moriendi; The Art of Dying well – New Insights into the Molecular Pathways of Necroptotic Cell Death", *EMBO Reports* 15 (2014), 155.

<sup>11</sup> Carlo Leget, "Retrieving the *Ars Moriendi* Tradition", *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy* 10 (2007), 313.

<sup>12</sup> Arthur E. Imhof, "Ars Moriendi: How to Live and How to Die", *Historical Social Research* 22/1 (1997), 195.

<sup>13</sup> Benyamin Schwarz - Benson Jacquelyn, "The "medicalized death": Dying in the Hospital", *Journal of Housing for the Elderly* 32/3-4 (2018), 379-430.

<sup>14</sup> David Field, "Palliative Medicine and the Medicalization of death", *European Journal of Cancer Care* 3/2 (1994), 58-62.

support according to the patient and her/his family's preferences.<sup>15</sup> In other words, medicalized death only focuses on prolonging life through medical interventions, while palliative care concentrates on quality life through medical, social, emotional, and spiritual support.

In this context, the present paper aims to briefly expound on the paradigm shift from the Ars moriendi to medicalized death and assess the pertinent ethical concerns in light of the issues of where, how, and when to die and in accordance with social responsibility, respect for autonomy, beneficence, non-maleficence, and justice. This article not only appraises medicalized death from a critical stance but also points out the relevant ethical problems and proposes home-based palliative care to promote patients' quality of life in their last days and alleviate the connected ethical concerns.

## **1. Primary Challenges**

Death is a natural and inevitable phenomenon. The Quran's verse "every soul will taste death" is a religious expression of that natural reality.<sup>16</sup> However, increasing medical interventions have remarkably changed the perception of the death and dying process. Lydia S. Dugdale regards the medical engagements in the death and dying process as the deterioration of the Ars moriendi (the art of dying) and the emergence of medicalized death.<sup>17</sup> Janna C. Merrick evaluates the matter of death and dying as the issue of how and where to die.<sup>18</sup> Merrick's approach can be expanded on where, how, and when to die to more comprehensively evaluate how the Ars moriendi has transformed into medicalized death.

### **1.1. Where to Die**

The central issue surrounding death and dying is mainly about how to make a good death possible. The perception of a good death is subjective because some can consider it a painless or sudden death, while others may accept it as death occurring at home.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>15</sup> Timothy W. Kirk - Margaret M. Mahon, "National Hospice and Palliative Care Organization (NHPCO) Position Statement and Commentary on the Use of Palliative Sedation in Imminently Dying Terminally Ill Patients", *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management* 39/5 (2010), 914.

<sup>16</sup> *Quran.com* (Accessed 14 January 2023), el-Ankabut 29/57.

<sup>17</sup> Lydia S. Dugdale, "Dying, a Lost Art", *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*, ed. Lydia S. Dugdale (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015), 3.

<sup>18</sup> Janna C. Merrick, "Death and Dying: The American Experience", *End-of-Life Decision Making: A Cross-National Study*, ed. Robert H. Blank and Janna C. Merrick (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2005), 219.

<sup>19</sup> Stephen R. Latham, "Pluralism and the "Good" Death", *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*, ed. Lydia S. Dugdale (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015), 33.

Nevertheless, regardless of various perceptions regarding the term good death, the primary medical and ethical goal is to allow each person to fulfill her/his good death. Therefore, the matter of where to die is an essential point in the end-of-life process that generates personal, social, medical, and economic consequences. Studies demonstrate that dying at home is not only most people's wish but also a primary indicator of a good death for most people.<sup>20</sup> Nevertheless, the number of deaths at home has remarkably decreased in many countries, including the United States and Europe.<sup>21</sup> This shift is an ongoing change in Western attitudes toward death and dying parallel medical and technological developments.<sup>22</sup>

People's wish regarding where to die composes the personal aspect of the issue. The reasons behind this wish may vary, and granting or ignoring it creates happiness or frustration. Dying at home also indicates and requires a strong social and family commitment. However, changes in social and family bonds and lifestyle as well as difficulties in taking care of patients with severe chronic diseases, such as cancer and Alzheimers, make healthcare institutions inevitable places for most people where to die.<sup>23</sup> Atul Gawande highlights this challenge and states, "[y]our chances of avoiding the nursing home are directly related to the number of children you have, and ... having at least one daughter seems to be crucial to the amount of help you will receive."<sup>24</sup> Therefore, dying at home or somewhere else is not only associated with personal wishes but also a social structure.

Medical and financial dimensions are two other important matters of where to die because being at home or in a healthcare facility and the type of facility directly reflect the kind of medical care and the number of costs. Whether utilizing aggressive treatment or palliative care, being in a hospital or a nursing home, or receiving hospice care at home or in a skilled nursing home determines the forms of medical care and their costs. End-of-life care denotes one of the most expensive healthcare services in some countries like the United

---

<sup>20</sup> Joachim Cohen et al., "Which Patients With Cancer Die at Home? A Study of Six European Countries Using Death Certificate Data", *Journal of Clinical Oncology* 28/13 (2010), 2267.

<sup>21</sup> M. Therese Lysaught, "Ritual and Practice", *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*, ed. Lydia S. Dugdale (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015), 73.

<sup>22</sup> Philippe Aries, *Western Attitudes Toward Death from the Middle Ages to the Present*, trans. Patricia M. Ranum (Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974), 87-88.

<sup>23</sup> Daniel Callahan, "The Elderly and Dementia", *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*, ed. Lydia S. Dugdale (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015), 149-152.

<sup>24</sup> Atul Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End* (New York: Metropolitan Books, 2014), 79.

States.<sup>25</sup> However, as Gawande underlines, it is questionable whether certain forms of end-of-life care, especially aggressive treatments provided in hospitals, which are the most costly services, produce meaningful benefits.<sup>26</sup> According to the study by Jennifer S. Temel and her colleagues, receiving early palliative care generates a higher quality of life and a longer life span for patients with metastatic non-small-cell lung cancer instead of aggressive treatment.<sup>27</sup> From this perspective, in general, palliative care has a significant function to provide patients with socially, spiritually, and financially better outcomes. However, the content and scope of care and the place where palliative care is received play a prominent role in the potential benefits and costs for patients, their families, and societies.<sup>28</sup>

## **1.2. How to Die**

The issue of how to die is associated with medical interventions during the process of dying. Lydia S. Dugdale expounds on this matter by addressing the transformation of the Ars moriendi into medicalized death.<sup>29</sup> As Dugdale accentuates, the Ars moriendi articulates that “the dying faithful should not fear death, since God is in control of every moment, including death,” and a good death can be achieved “by leading a repentant and righteous life.”<sup>30</sup> Even though the Ars moriendi represented a religious approach to explaining how a good death is possible and why death should not be feared, this perspective, which deems death a natural phenomenon, had also influenced secular approaches for many centuries until medical and technological advances gained sufficient ability to impact the time and manner of death.<sup>31</sup>

Pharmaceutical, medical, and technological improvements in the 20th century, including the discovery of penicillin, X-ray technology, and resuscitation and ventilation devices, have produced life-prolonging opportunities and consolidated medical power.<sup>32</sup> These changes generated a paradigm shift by transferring the role of religion in the

---

<sup>25</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 153.

<sup>26</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 153, 177-178.

<sup>27</sup> Jennifer S. Temel et al., “Early Palliative Care for Patients with Metastatic Non–Small-Cell Lung Cancer”, *The New England Journal of Medicine* 363/8 (2010), 733-742.

<sup>28</sup> Li Yiting et al., “End-of-Life Care in China: A View from Beijing”, *End-of-Life Decision Making: A Cross-National Study*, ed. Robert H. Blank and Janna C. Merrick (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2005), 35.

<sup>29</sup> Dugdale, “Dying, a Lost Art”, 3.

<sup>30</sup> Dugdale, “Dying, a Lost Art”, 7.

<sup>31</sup> Dugdale, “Dying, a Lost Art”, 3.

<sup>32</sup> David Cutler - Ellen Meara Cutler, “Changes in the Age Distribution of Mortality over the 20th Century” (Accessed 8 April 2023), 1-4.

perception of death to medicine. Atul Gawande emphasizes this alteration by stating, “scientific advances have turned the process of aging and dying into medical experience, matters to be managed by health care professionals.”<sup>33</sup> Before the mentioned breakthroughs, under of a lack of medical therapies, the *Ars moriendi* referred to the acceptance of death and submission to death-causing factors. However, medical advances have created alternatives and expanded the number of options when encountering a life-threatening disease or incident. As a result of this situation, most of the deaths have recently occurred after long periods of medical interventions.<sup>34</sup> In other words, medical improvements have engendered enormous potential for prolonging and shaping the manner of the dying process. For instance, requesting resuscitation or comfort measures only, receiving aggressive treatment or palliative care, or accepting or refusing palliative sedation determines how to die. For this reason, death and dying are no longer merely issues of accepting fate but are also subject to the type and amount of medical treatments and interventions.

### 1.3. When to Die

Medical and technological advances also notably affect the time of death. Especially the use of antibiotics, resuscitation and ventilation facilities, and artificial nutrition and hydration remarkably influence the timing of death. Providing or withholding/withdrawing life-sustaining support carries a crucial role in when to die. According to Farr A. Curlin, more than two in three Americans die at a healthcare institution, which means that people continue receiving healthcare services until death.<sup>35</sup> However, as Curlin underlines, the overuse of healthcare facilities, particularly hospitals, and life-sustaining opportunities is a primary concern due to its ethical, religious, and financial ramifications.<sup>36</sup> Philippe Aries describes the excessive use of medicine at the end of life by saying, “[d]eath is a technical phenomenon obtained by a cessation of care, a cessation determined in a more or less

---

<sup>33</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 6.

<sup>34</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 156-157.

<sup>35</sup> Latham, “Pluralism and the “Good” Death”, 43.

<sup>36</sup> Farr A. Curlin, “Hospice and Palliative Medicine’s Attempt at an Art of Dying”, *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*, ed. Lydia S. Dugdale (Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015), 49.

avowed way by a decision of the doctor and the hospital team.”<sup>37</sup> Therefore, medical and technological advances have made death less unpredictable, personal, and religious.

The emergence and growth of bioethics gave patients and their families to actively engage in end-of-life decisions through the principle of respect for autonomy.<sup>38</sup> However, as highlighted by the report of The Hastings Center, “stimulating false and unrealistic public hopes, and creating expectations about the transformative powers of medical progress that cannot be achieved” is a new problem of medicine resulting from the process of medicalization.<sup>39</sup> In this context, this unrealistic perception of medical power leads to people seeking all medical interventions until death, which does not prevent death but impacts the time of death. For instance, particular interventions, such as cardiopulmonary resuscitation and mechanical ventilation, directly affect the time of death. Therefore, under today’s medical opportunities, letting a patient die or prolonging her/his life for a certain period is possible.

## **2. Ethical Concerns**

Even though the history of medical ethics goes back to the time of Hippocrates, the patient’s autonomy-oriented ethical approach largely emerged through the growth of bioethics. Traditional medicine was physician-driven and requested physicians’ benevolence without considering patients’ participation in decision-making. However, contemporary medicine focuses on the patient’s autonomy and regards the patient as a primary stakeholder in all patient-related issues, including end-of-life care.<sup>40</sup> Nevertheless, regarding end-of-life issues, some believe that healthcare professionals should prolong patients’ lives as long as possible at all costs by utilizing life-sustaining technologies. In contrast, others focus on scarce resources and question life-prolonging treatments in the scope of justice.<sup>41</sup> In this context, the matters of where to die, how to die, and when to die can cause different ethical dilemmas that can be seen on personal, social, and national levels.

---

<sup>37</sup> Aries, *Western Attitudes Toward Death from the Middle Ages to the Present*, 88.

<sup>38</sup> Lo, *Resolving Ethical Dilemmas: A Guide for Clinicians*, 13.

<sup>39</sup> Daniel Callahan, “The Goals of Medicine-Setting New Priorities”, *Hastings Center Report* 26/6 (1996), 6.

<sup>40</sup> Beauchamp - Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 1, 214.

<sup>41</sup> Daniel P. Sulmasy et al., “Eleanor Roosevelt’s Last Days: A Bioethical Case Study”, *The American Journal of Medicine* 128/4 (2015), 438.

## 2.1. Social Responsibility, Autonomy, and Justice

Studies show that people vastly prefer dying at home. For instance, the study conducted by Deniz Ulker in Turkey demonstrates that 71.8% of the participants expressed their wishes to die at home.<sup>42</sup> Similarly, most of the severely ill patients in Canada favor dying at home.<sup>43</sup> Furthermore, an overwhelming majority of Americans with terminal diseases hope to die at home, but more than 70% of them die in a healthcare facility, either at a hospital, nursing home, or hospice facility.<sup>44</sup> According to Joan M. Teno et al., in 2009, 24.6% of Medicare beneficiaries in the United States died in acute care hospitals, 29.2% of the beneficiaries used an intensive care unit (ICU) in the last month of their lives, and 42.2% of them were using hospice care in the time of their death.<sup>45</sup> These numbers demonstrate that a principal wish of people, dying at home, is not met at the end of their lives. As Li Yiting et al. emphasize, this situation can be interpreted as “[a]dvances in medicine have the capacity to extend a life that is often burdened with poor emotional and social quality.”<sup>46</sup> In this context, the imbalance between dying people’s wishes and the place where they die represents a crucial familial, social, and ethical challenge. In other words, the issue of where to die does not merely encompass a medical aspect but also social and ethical components. The social dimension is related to the relationship and responsibility between parents and their children or among family members, whereas the ethical aspect is associated with the connection between the principle of respect for autonomy and the possibility of honoring the patient’s last wishes to die at home.

The financial facet of where to die is another essential matter impacting the principle of justice. In Canada, the 2014 Ontario Auditor General’s report illustrated that palliative care at home is the most cost-effective method, costing less than \$100 per day compared with \$460 in a hospice facility and \$1,100 per day in an acute-care hospital in the last month of patients.<sup>47</sup> The figures in the United States indicate that Medicare has to devote approximately 25% of its expenditures to only about 5% of the beneficiaries receiving end-of-

<sup>42</sup> Deniz Ulker, *Personal Preferences of Older People’s Family Caregivers Regarding End of Life Decisions*, (Muğla: Muğla Sitki Kocman University, Master’s Thesis, 2016), viii-ix.

<sup>43</sup> The Canadian Cancer Society, *Right to Care: Palliative care for all Canadians*, (Canadian Cancer Society, 2016), 11.

<sup>44</sup> Merrick, “Death and Dying: The American Experience”, 219.

<sup>45</sup> Joan M. Teno et al., “Change in End-of-Life Care for Medicare Beneficiaries: Site of Death, Place of Care, and Health Care Transitions in 2000, 2005, and 2009”, *JAMA* 309/5 (2013), 470.

<sup>46</sup> Yiting et al., “End-of-Life Care in China: A View from Beijing”, 34.

<sup>47</sup> The Canadian Cancer Society, *Right to Care: Palliative care for all Canadians*, 16.



life care in the last year of their lives.<sup>48</sup> Therefore, the utilization of hospitals and intensive care units as a part of end-of-life care might be assessed with Curling's words as "[t]he overuse of life-sustaining technology [that] absorbs time, energy, attention, and resources."<sup>49</sup> In this view, in light of the principle of justice, end-of-life care, particularly hospital based-care, raises a fundamental ethical debate on whether to provide terminally ill patients with solely palliative care or honor their demand for aggressive therapies.

As mentioned above, choosing 'comfort measures only' or asking for life-sustaining interventions also affects the matter of when to die. Before the discovery of life-sustaining technologies, reversing the cessation of cardiopulmonary functions was impossible. However, nowadays, life-sustaining technologies, such as cardiovascular resuscitation and mechanical ventilation, give healthcare professionals the ability to reverse life-threatening situations and restore and maintain patients' medical conditions. At that point, currently available life-sustaining treatments are decisive medical interventions that directly influence the issue of when to die and transform death from a natural end to "a technical phenomenon."<sup>50</sup> However, aggressive life-sustaining treatments sometimes refer to forcing the patient to remain alive without basic human functions.<sup>51</sup> Furthermore, showing extraordinary effort to keep the dying person alive contains ethical concerns regarding the principle of justice because futile medical interventions not only induce harm to the patient but also uselessly and unduly exhaust limited healthcare resources. The principle of justice demands utilizing healthcare resources fairly among all individuals and populations and not wasting them through ineffective treatments.

## **2.2. Autonomy, Beneficence, and Non-maleficence**

Beneficence and non-maleficence are two traditional principles of medical ethics. Beneficence is a moral statement that requires producing good for patients, while non-maleficence refers to not harming patients. Beneficence carries a positive characteristic that requests healthcare professionals actively behave in accordance with the patient's best interest under available medical opportunities, whereas non-maleficence necessitates

---

<sup>48</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 153.

<sup>49</sup> Curlin, "Hospice and Palliative Medicine's Attempt at an Art of Dying", 50.

<sup>50</sup> Aries, *Western Attitudes Toward Death from the Middle Ages to the Present*, 88.

<sup>51</sup> Callahan, "The Elderly and Dementia", 156.

healthcare professionals not inducing unduly and useless harm to the patient.<sup>52</sup> On the other hand, autonomy focuses on the patient's autonomous preferences and prioritizes the patient's decision over the caregivers' decisions. In this view, the issue of how to die creates several arguments regarding autonomy, beneficence, and non-maleficence. Euthanasia, palliative sedation, and assisted suicide are some of these subjects bringing about many ethical, religious, and philosophical questions concerning the conflict between patients' demands for dying painlessly and the duty of healthcare professionals.<sup>53</sup>

Additionally, the use or omission of life-sustaining technologies, the determination of decision-makers, and the conflicts between patients' best interests and surrogates' decisions cause many ethical and legal problems.<sup>54</sup> Despite all the medical and technological advances, Atul Gawande underlines physicians' limited power in dealing with human biology and states, "I have seen the damage we in medicine do when we fail to acknowledge that such power is finite and always will be."<sup>55</sup> However, the overuse of aggressive treatment is not only a problem resulting from patients' perception of the limitations of medical interventions but also a predicted matter intentionally overlooked by some healthcare professionals. According to Gawande, almost half of the oncologists confess that they provide patients with certain treatments from which they know the patient most likely will not benefit.<sup>56</sup> This statement exhibits that some life-sustaining or aggressive treatments produce no benefit to patients, but false hopes, waste of resources, and harm to patients. To some extent, this violates the principles of autonomy due to not accurately informing patients about the expected consequences; the principle of beneficence because of not providing patients with useful options, such as hospice care; and the principle of non-maleficence due to applying ineffective treatments, which may harm patients physically and psychologically.

## Conclusion

Death was previously considered a natural, personal, and religious phenomenon by accepting its reality and inevitability. However, advances in medicine and life-sustaining technologies have allowed healthcare professionals to get involved in the dying process and

---

<sup>52</sup> Beauchamp - Childress, *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*, 150-153, 202-206.

<sup>53</sup> Sulmasy et al., "Eleanor Roosevelt's Last Days: A Bioethical Case Study", 437-439.

<sup>54</sup> Merrick, "Death and Dying: The American Experience", 224-233.

<sup>55</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 259.

<sup>56</sup> Gawande, *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matter in the End*, 167-168.

play certain roles through life-sustaining support, which has caused people to attribute excessive power to medical interventions and put healthcare professionals in the role of playing God. The *Ars moriendi* represents the approach that interprets death from a religious perspective, whereas medicalized death refers to the standpoint that contemporary medicine can avert death. The shift from the *Ars moriendi* to medicalized death has not only significantly changed people's perception of death, the dying process, and the potential of medicine, but also has led to certain ethical and social challenges surrounding the issues of where to die, how to die, and when to die: whether to die at home or in a healthcare facility; whether to receive pain management care or aggressive treatment; and whether to be on comfort measures only or life-sustaining care. The implementation or omission of these with each option's possible medical benefits and risks and financial burdens to patients, families, and/or societies engenders particular consequences that may not be congruent with ethical principles. For example, dying in a healthcare facility, instead of at home, addresses the respect for autonomy-related concerns; aggressive treatments, instead of the quality of life at the end of life, point out the beneficence- and non-maleficence-related worries; and hospital-driven treatments, instead of palliative care, and the relevant costs indicate the justice-related issues. For this reason, even though it is reasonable to continue benefiting from medical and technological developments, we should avoid the overuse of these technologies, accept the certainty of death, and acknowledge the scarcity of resources.

However, establishing a balance between the utilization of medical technologies and quality of life at the end of life necessitates a change in the mindset of pertinent stakeholders. At that point, educating healthcare professionals, patients, and families about the limitations of medicine, the advantages of palliative care, and the importance of utilizing healthcare resources effectively can produce desirable outcomes. In particular, patients and their families should be properly and adequately informed that instead of aggressive treatments in healthcare institutions, providing patients with severe illnesses with home-based hospice care would increase their quality of life through medical care (pain management), allow them to spend their last days with their family members, give them the opportunity of receiving spiritual and emotional care, and prevent them from unduly consuming scarce healthcare resources. Besides these practical benefits, home-based hospice care has great potential to satisfy relevant ethical requirements by honoring patients' wishes to die at home, benefitting them through medical, spiritual, and emotional support, preventing them from the harm of aggressive treatments, and eschewing the waste of scarce healthcare resources.

## References / Kaynakça

- Aries, Philippe. *Western Attitudes Toward Death from the Middle Ages to the Present*, trans. Patricia M. Ranum. Baltimore: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1974.
- Beauchamp, Tom L. – Childress, James F. *Principles of Biomedical Ethics*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Callahan, Daniel. "The Elderly and Dementia". *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*. Ed. Lydia S. Dugdale. 149-160. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015.
- Callahan, Daniel. "The Goals of Medicine-Setting New Priorities". *Hastings Center Report* 26/6 (1996).
- Cohen, Joachim et al. "Which Patients With Cancer Die at Home? A Study of Six European Countries Using Death Certificate Data". *Journal of Clinical Oncology* 28/13 (2010), 2267-2273.
- Curlin, Farr A. "Hospice and Palliative Medicine's Attempt at an Art of Dying". *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*. Ed. Lydia S. Dugdale. 47-63. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015.
- Cutler, David – Cutler, Ellen Meara. "Changes in the Age Distribution of Mortality over the 20th Century". Accessed 8 April 2023. <https://www.nber.org/papers/w8556>.
- Dugdale, Lydia S. "Dying, a Lost Art". *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*. Ed. Lydia S. Dugdale. 3-17. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015.
- Field, David. "Palliative Medicine and the Medicalization of Death". *European Journal of Cancer Care* 3/2 (1994), 58-62.
- Gawande, Atul. *Being Mortal: Medicine and What Matters in the End*. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2014.
- Imhof, Arthur E. "Ars Moriendi: How to Live and How to Die". *Historical Social Research* 22/1 (1997), 191-197.
- Jonsen, Albert R at el. *Clinical Ethics: A Practical Approach to Ethical Decisions in Clinical Medicine*. New York: McGraw Hill Education, 2015.
- Kirk, Timothy W. - Mahon, Margaret M. "National Hospice and Palliative Care Organization (NHPCO) Position Statement and Commentary on the Use of Palliative Sedation in Imminently Dying Terminally Ill Patients". *Journal of Pain and Symptom Management* 39/5 (2010), 914-923.
- Latham, Stephen R. "Pluralism and the "Good" Death". *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*. Ed. Lydia S. Dugdale. 33-46. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015.
- Leget, Carlo. "Retrieving the Ars Moriendi Tradition". *Medicine, Health Care and Philosophy* 10 (2007), 313–319.
- Lo, Bernard. *Resolving Ethical Dilemmas: A Guide for Clinicians*. Philadelphia: Wolters Kluwer, 2020.
- Lysaught, M. Therese. "Ritual and Practice". *Dying in the Twenty-First Century*. Ed. Lydia S. Dugdale, 67-85. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2015.
- Merrick, Janna C. "Death and Dying: The American Experience". *End-of-Life Decision Making: A Cross-National Study*. Eds. Robert H. Blank and Janna C. Merrick. 219-241. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2005.
- Murphy, James M. - Silke, John. "Ars Moriendi; The Art of Dying Well – New Insights into the Molecular Pathways of Necroptotic Cell Death". *EMBO Reports* 15 (2014), 155-164 *Quran.com*. Accessed 14 January 2023. <https://quran.com>.

- Sulmasy, Daniel P et al. "Eleanor Roosevelt's Last Days: A Bioethical Case Study". *The American Journal of Medicine* 128/4 (2015), 437-440.
- Schwarz, Benyamin - Jacquelyn, Benson. "The "medicalized death": Dying in the Hospital". *Journal of Housing for the Elderly* 32/3-4 (2018), 379-430.
- Slevin, ML et al. "Who Should Measure Quality of Life, the Doctor or the Patient?". *British Journal of Cancer* 57 (1988), 109-112.
- Temel, Jennifer S et al. "Early Palliative Care for Patients with Metastatic Non-Small-Cell Lung Cancer". *The New England Journal of Medicine* 363/8 (2010), 733-742.
- Teno, Joan M. et al. "Change in End-of-Life Care for Medicare Beneficiaries: Site of Death, Place of Care, and Health Care Transitions in 2000, 2005, and 2009". *AMA* 309/5 (2013), 470-477.
- U.S. National Institute on Aging National Institutes of Health and World Health Organization. *Global Health and Aging*. National Institute on Aging National Institutes of Health and World Health Organization. Publication no. 11-7737, 2011.
- Ulker, Deniz. *Personal Preferences of Older People's Family Caregivers Regarding End-of-Life Decisions*. Mugla: Mugla Sitki Kocman University, Master's Thesis, 2016.
- The Canadian Cancer Society. *Right to Care: Palliative Care for all Canadians*. Canadian Cancer Society, 2016
- The Hastings Center Report. "The Goals of Medicine: Setting New Priorities". *The Hastings Center Report* 26/6 (1996), 1-27.
- World Health Organization. "The Top 10 Causes of Death". Accessed 5 January 2023. <http://www.who.int/mediacentre/factsheets/fs310/en/index2.html>.
- Yiting, Li et al. "End-of-Life Care in China: A View from Beijing". *End-of-Life Decision Making: A Cross-National Study*. Eds. Robert H. Blank and Janna C. Merrick. 33-59. Cambridge; London: The MIT Press, 2005.



ISSN: 2146-4901  
e-ISSN: 2667-6575

## Change of Identities and Religiosities of Muslim Young People across Time and Space: Resilient Youth

*Gençlerin Kimlik ve Dindarlıklarının Zaman ve Mekâna göre Değişimi: Direnen Gençlik*

**Mustafa Cabir ALTINTAŞ**

ORCID: 0000-0002-8991-7047 | E-Posta: [mcabiraltintas@sirnak.edu.tr](mailto:mcabiraltintas@sirnak.edu.tr)

Assistant Professor, Şırnak University, Faculty of Divinity, Department of Religious Studies

*Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Şırnak Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Din Eğitimi Ana Bilim Dalı*

Şırnak, Türkiye

ROR ID: [01fcvk23](https://orcid.org/01fcvk23)

### Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

**Citation / Atıf:** Altıntaş, Mustafa Cabir. "Change of Identities and Religiosities of Muslim Young People across Time and Space: Resilient Youth". *Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31 (Haziran 2023), 22-46. <https://doi.org/10.35415/sirnakifd.1257267>

Date of Submission ( <i>Geliş Tarihi</i> )	28. 02. 2023
Date of Acceptance ( <i>Kabul Tarihi</i> )	11. 04. 2023
Date of Publication ( <i>Yayın Tarihi</i> )	15. 06. 2023
Article Type ( <i>Makale Türü</i> )	Research Article ( <i>Araştırma Makalesi</i> )
Peer-Review ( <i>Değerlendirme</i> )	Double anonymized - Two External ( <i>İki Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körleme</i> ).
Ethical Statement ( <i>Etik Beyan</i> )	It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited. ( <i>Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.</i> )
Plagiarism Checks ( <i>Benzerlik Taraması</i> )	Yes ( <i>Evet</i> ) – Turnitin.
Conflicts of Interest ( <i>Çıkar Çatışması</i> )	The author(s) has no conflict of interest to declare ( <i>Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.</i> )
Complaints ( <i>Etik Beyan Adresi</i> )	<a href="mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com">suifdergi@gmail.com</a>
Grant Support ( <i>Finansman</i> )	The author(s) acknowledge that they received no external funding in support of this research. ( <i>Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır.</i> )
Copyright & License ( <i>Telif Hakkı ve Lisans</i> )	Authors publishing with the journal retain the copyright to their work licensed under the CC BY-NC 4.0. ( <i>Yazarlar dergide yayımlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmaları CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.</i> )

## **Abstract**

Modern people have cut themselves off from the sacred and imaginative realities and live in secular and measurable time. They live in a world described by Max Weber in terms of disenchantment. In Muslim society, many Muslims are not detached from reality; rather, they live in an enchanted world, a world of spirits and forces. This creates tensions between secular liberal and traditional views of life. In this sense, the young people strives to take a certain place and role in that society; they try to know themselves in society, to determine their personalities' limits, to find out 'who they are, what they believe, what they value and connect, what their aim should be, in short, what their place in society is'. In this research, the identity, religious life and behavior of Muslim young people, religious resilience, and accordingly religious changes and transformations have been examined along with religious potential. To be resilient, a person must be able to change, and to adapt to new circumstances. Thus, the paper explores that the Turkish youth may have new religious perceptions and different identity structures depending on the color of the time. The effect of different cultures and social changes and the new social manifestations that develop depending on this situation can be effective on the way to the transformation of religious identities. In the first step, this paper is exploring the questions: 'how does religion affect young people's recognition and evaluation of themselves and life? The next step is to research how Muslim youth can help people experiencing resilience to be strengthened, and how they can be strengthened as they exercise a religiosity and their identity. The paper could help to find out how religious faith can have in enabling people to overcome difficulty by giving them faith to hold on to life and find meaning and purpose, as well as by providing a supportive network of people. The data were obtained from semi-structured interviews which were conducted with 30 students of Şırnak University in Turkey. It includes participants' accounts of their process of making meaning of the world, their evolving understanding, perceptions, experiences and identity situations. Nevertheless, literature survey method has chosen to support and enhance the quality of the research. The qualitative research method was adopted as an interpretative paradigm. The data shows that; the relationship between the individual and religious belief and identity motivation is related to inhomogeneous results and factors. Young people create their own identity, which is mixed, and bricolage. Each individual has different conceptions and different motivations regarding religious identity. In this sense, religiosity and identity is fed by different social and psychological dynamics; in general, it seems to be related to time, space and socialization processes.

**Keywords:** Religion and Resilience, Identity Changes and Resilience, Hybrid Identity, Resilient Muslim Youth, New forms of Religiosity.

## Özet

Modernite ile birlikte insanlar Max Weber tarafından hayal kırıklığı olarak tanımlanan, kendilerini kutsal ve manevi gerçeklerden arındırılmış, dünyevi ve ölçülebilir bir zamanda ve dünyada yaşamaya başladılar. Müslüman toplumlarda ise pek çok Müslüman gerçeklikten kopuk değildir; daha ziyade manevi bir dünyada, ruhların ve kutsalların dünyasında yaşarlar. Bu, seküler liberal ve geleneksel yaşam görüşleri arasında gerilim oluşturmaktadır. Bu anlamda gençler o toplumda belli bir yer ve rol almak için çaba harcarlar; toplum içinde kendilerini tanımaya, kişiliklerinin sınırlarını belirlemeye, 'kim olduklarını, neye inandıklarını, neye değer verdiklerini ve bağ kurduklarını, amaçlarının ne olması gerektiğini, kısacası toplumdaki yerlerinin ne olduğunu' bulmaya çalışırlar. Bu araştırmada, müslüman gençlerin kimliği, dini yaşam ve davranışları, dini dayanıklılıkları ve buna bağlı olarak dini değişim ve dönüşümleri, dini potansiyelleri ile birlikte incelenmiştir. Dirençli olmak için, bir kişinin değişebilmesi ve yeni koşullara uyum sağlayabilmesi gerekir. Bu nedenle makale, Türkiye'de gençliğin zamanın rengine bağlı olarak yeni dini algılara ve farklı kimlik yapılarına karşı değişimini araştırmaktadır. Farklı kültürlerin ve toplumsal değişmelerin etkisi ve bu duruma bağlı olarak gelişen yeni toplumsal tezahürler, dini kimliklerin dönüşmesinde etkili olabilmektedir. Buna bağlı olarak makale öncelikle şu soruları araştırıyor: 'Din, gençlerin kendilerini ve yaşamı tanıma ve değerlendirmelerini nasıl etkiler ve bu etki nasıl olur? Bir sonraki adımda ise, Müslüman gençliğin değişime dayanıklılığı kimliklerinin güçlenmesine nasıl yardımcı olabileceğini ve dindarlıklarını uygularken nasıl güçlenebileceklerini araştırmaktır. Makale, dini inancın insanlara hayata tutunmaları, anlam ve amaç bulmaları için inanç vererek ve aynı zamanda destekleyici bir insan ağı sağlayarak insanlara zorlukların üstesinden gelmelerini sağlamada nasıl yardımcı olabileceğini ortaya koymada yardımcı olabilir. Veriler Türkiye'de Şırnak Üniversitesi'nde öğrenim gören 30 öğrenci ile yapılan yarı yapılandırılmış görüşmelerden elde edilmiştir. Veriler, katılımcıların dünyayı anlamlandırma süreçlerine, gelişen anlayışlarına, algılarına, deneyimlerine ve kimlik durumlarına ilişkin açıklamalarını içerir. Bununla birlikte, literatür tarama yöntemi de araştırmanın kalitesini desteklemek ve artırmak için seçilmiştir. Elde edilen veriler gösteriyor ki; bireysel ve dini inanç ve kimlik motivasyonu arasındaki ilişki homojen olmayan sonuçlar ve faktörlerle ilgilidir. Her bireyin dini kimliğe ilişkin farklı kavramları ve farklı motivasyonları vardır. Müslüman gençler de karma ve melez bir kimlik oluşturmaktadırlar. Bu anlamda dindarlık ve kimlik, farklı sosyal ve psikolojik dinamiklerden beslenir; genel olarak zaman, mekan ve sosyalleşme süreçleri ile ilgili görünmektedir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Din ve Dirençlilik, Değişen Kimlikler ve Dayanıklılık, Hibrit Kimlikler, Direnen Müslüman Gençlik, Yeni Dindarlık Biçimleri.



## **Introduction**

Young individuals nowadays confront an assortment of special challenges from quickened social change, fast globalization, and postmodern culture. They are looking for how their personal lives can end up entire and complete.<sup>1</sup> Included in this journey is the method of finding their put in a complex world, looking for fulfilling ways of picking up a sense of meaning and having a place, while managing with the numerous instabilities of the world.

In the face of the rapidly globalizing world, young people can feel helpless and powerless. In this sense, it is known that religious beliefs give clues about the meaning and value of life and provide motivation in the face of life difficulties.<sup>2</sup> Each individual's inclination to religion or having a religious belief motivation may differ. However, religious beliefs can be seen as a source of positive motivation. Argyle argues that religion has seven psychological resources: meeting needs, eliminating anxiety/fear, eliminating guilt, protecting, gaining identity, and relaxing in the face of the unknown.<sup>3</sup> The meaning of having religious belief; at the same time the benefit and harm to the individual; it may be related to the motivation it creates at the psychological level and its contribution to well-being.<sup>4</sup> Accordingly, Turkish Muslim youth have been influenced by the social and social values of Western culture and the worldwide and postmodern world. With the effect of the quickly globalizing world, young people's likes and choices, convictions and feelings, interface and concerns are beneath the control of the postmodern world. As a result, numerous Turkish Muslim youth confront a struggle of personality occasioned by Turkey's "Islamic, Eastern, cosmopolitan, traditional Ottoman past and socially engineered Western, secular, positivist, and modern future".<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Friedrich Schweitzer, *The postmodern life cycle*. (St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2004), 5-12.

<sup>2</sup> Steven Stack, "A Comparative Analysis of Suicide and Religiosity", *Journal of Social Psychology* 119/2 (1983), 285-286.

<sup>3</sup> Marry Argyle, "Dinin Yedi Psikolojik Temeli." Çev: Mehmet Dağ, *Eğitim Hareketleri Dergisi* 23 (1978), 272-273.

<sup>4</sup> Kenneth I. Pargament, "The Bitter and the Sweet: An Evaluation of the Costs and Benefits of Religiousness." *Psychological inquiry* 13/3 (2002), 170-172.

<sup>5</sup> Margaret Fitzpatrick vd., *Globalization and Education Policy in Turkey: Education of Women, Religious Education and Higher Education* (University of Illinois: Urbana-Champaign, 2009), 63.

## 1. Aims and Significance of the Study

Turkish youths want to either adopt a strict Islamic faith structure or entirely secularize themselves. Tensions between the secular liberal and traditional perspectives of life are what give rise to this conundrum. Through an inevitable contact with both the wider secular/liberal and Western society and traditional Islamic culture, they develop their sense of identity and worldviews.<sup>6</sup> As a member of the society, the young people strives to take a certain place and role in that society; they try to know themselves in society, to determine their personalities' limits, to find out 'who they are, what they believe, what they value and connect, what their aim should be, in short, what their place in society is'.<sup>7</sup> The first step, this paper is exploring the questions: 'how does religion affect young people's recognition and evaluation of themselves and life, and how does this happen? At this stage, is there a relationship between religion and the search for identity, which is described as the youth's effort to know himself?'

On the other hand, religious youth may need to know how they can help, how to enable people experiencing resilient to come through it well, and be able to guide community who want to offer religious care to one another and want to know how to help rather than hinder. Resilience research makes room for a consideration of the role of religion and faith and gives attention to the spiritual and the theological. There is a need to research how Muslim youth can help people experiencing resilience to be strengthened, and how they can be strengthened as they exercise a religiosity and their identity. The paper could help to find out how religious faith can have in enabling people to overcome difficulty by giving them faith to hold on to life and find meaning and purpose, as well as by providing a supportive network of people.

A long-suppressed crisis in Muslim culture has now come to the surface in response to some of the difficulties of contemporary secular life.<sup>8</sup> Islam has nonetheless presented a significant challenge to the secularism that Western liberal society takes for granted by insisting on religiously regulating the social lives of its members.<sup>9</sup> Young people's worldview

---

<sup>6</sup> Mustafa Cabir Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: Worldviews and Identity Discernment of Muslim Youth* (Ankara: Nobel Yayıncılık, 2021), 3.

<sup>7</sup> Orhan Öztürk, *Ruhsağlığı ve Bozuklukları* (Ankara: Nobel Akademi, 16. Basım, 2020),13.

<sup>8</sup> Bassam Tibi, *Islam between culture and politics* (New York: Palgrave, 2001).

<sup>9</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 8.

may be challenged by a necessary contrast between these value systems and religious tradition, which could hinder their spiritual or religious growth by making them aware of the inconsistency between these ideals. In these conditions, the study is concerned to be one of the few attempts to discuss a need for professional care in dealing with development of youth's religiosity and identity. The importance of this study is enhanced by the fact that in Turkish society most of the challenges in the life of religious individuals have usually been confronted with formal religious considerations such as whether they conform to Islamic proclamations or not. As a result, the study's findings may help create new methods of instruction and curricula for religious education of young people as well as fresh insights into the sociology of religion, particularly in the context of Islam.

## **2. Research Methods**

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with 30 students of Şırnak University in Turkey. Simple Random sampling method is used for obtaining information from participants regarding the university population. With 15% of the population between the ages of 18 and 24, these young students represent one of Turkey's most active and social communities.<sup>10</sup> Future religious worldviews dominating in the nation will influence and inform their attitudes, values, and sense of self. Participants' accounts of their attempts to make sense of the world, as well as their changing understanding, perceptions, experiences, and identification circumstances, are included in the data. Nevertheless, literature survey method has been chosen to support and enhance the quality of the research. In short, qualitative research method was adopted as an interpretative paradigm. By using literature analysis, semi-structured interview form was prepared and interviews were conducted.

## **3. Resilience, Religion and to be Resilient Youth and Community**

Resilience literature is wide in scope, identifying many factors as contributing to the resilience of individuals, families and communities. Factors which can be influenced by the work of religion and emerge from the literature focus on struggle, the self and relationship.<sup>11</sup> These three factors are essential to building resilience and present challenges to religion and education.

---

<sup>10</sup> *Turkey's Statistical Year Book* (Ankara: MEB yayımları, 2020).

<sup>11</sup> Justine Allain Chapman, *Resilient Pastors: The Role of Adversity in Healing and Growth* (SPCK publishing: UK, 2012), 11.

In psychology, resilience is the positive capacity developed by people who are open and motivated to change in the face of adversity. The research into resilience represents a shift from overemphasizing pathology in the past, to recognizing the strengths in human character. The resilient take up the struggle of dealing with the circumstances of their lives in such a way as to be strengthened personally by their experience. Resilient people are those who have coped with adversity, been constant in resisting destruction, and been able to construct a new sense of themselves and their lives.<sup>12</sup>

The list of characteristics that define the resilient, compiled via study on a variety of topics and contexts, has remained relatively steady through time and includes traits related to children, families, relationships, and the environment. It includes "characteristics having to do with physical and mental well-being, cognitive ability, safe relationships, self-regulation and self-direction, motivation and a positive outlook on life, spiritual and religious systems of beliefs and meaning, as well as family, peer, school, and cultural systems. The resilient children grew up to be adults who possessed greater social maturity, nurturance, empathy, sense of responsibility and independence.<sup>13</sup>

Research on resilience allows for the discussion of the function of faith and religion and emphasizes the spiritual and theological. This is made feasible by the understanding that resilience involves more than just paying attention to the actions and conditions of others.<sup>14</sup> It involves motivation and self-perception, for example, which are shaped by religion and spirituality for good or ill. The ability to use religious resources to cope when faced with misfortune is referred to as spiritual resilience. This entails fending against attempts to destroy one's spiritual traits and creating something constructive in keeping with more overarching theological objectives. Studies exploring spiritual resilience have not been confined to the kind of spirituality that is expressed and experiences in traditional religious practices; the spirituality studied encompasses interpersonal and societal intersections, relationships to self, and the ability to go beyond the limits of self-interest, one's own experience, and horizon of meaning. It also includes openness to spirit, understood variously as God, the divine, energy, source of life, mystery and what is beyond understanding.<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>12</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 15.

<sup>13</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 16.

<sup>14</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 19.

<sup>15</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 19.

Literature on resilience demonstrates the significance of religious faith in helping people overcome adversity by giving them the hope they need to cling on to life and find meaning and purpose as well as by offering a network of people who can assist them.<sup>16</sup> Therefore, religion provides the young person with the opportunity to present certain values, to be in a community that integrates around the same values and practices, and to participate in them, making them feel confident that they have a place in the society they live in and that it will help them determine their status in the society. In addition, the sense of trust and resilience gained by the positive contributions of religion will help the young person to see himself as an independent individual. Young people will gain the ability to make conscious decisions and behave on their own, to take responsibility and to perceive themselves as a separate individual with the sense of confidence they have gained. For this reason, we can say that the sense of independence, which is formed and developed with a sense of trust and resilience, religion, and therefore Islam, will also contribute positively to the young person's ability to act on his own and gain his responsibility by presenting an understanding of life and stating that he has a responsibility since puberty.<sup>17</sup>

Studies in resilience emphasize the importance of knowing oneself to be of value, of having a future and being self-disciplines in order to deal with adversity and come through strengthened. The studies also recognize that the need for self-reliance in many of the resilient when they were in difficult circumstances can be hard to shed and makes it difficult for them to trust and form intimate relationships.<sup>18</sup> Today, religion has largely lost its authority of forming the basis of social life and human relations. For this reason, young people may have difficulty in comprehending the religious understanding of life, the values related to the arrangement of daily life and determining their place in social life. However, presence of religious beliefs; it can also be perceived as important and necessary in terms of gaining psychological resilience in the face of socioeconomic problems, individual losses and traumas and negative life events experienced on an individual and social basis.<sup>19</sup> Healthy, mutually beneficial relationships are the foundation for resilience. Teaching, preaching, and one-on-one counselling need to be carefully considered so that people can decide when to

---

<sup>16</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 28.

<sup>17</sup> Naci Kula, *Gençlik Döneminde Kimlik ve Din. Gençlik, Din ve Değerler Psikolojisi*. Hayati Hökelekli (İstanbul: DEM Yayınları, 3. Basım, 2015), 65.

<sup>18</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 89.

<sup>19</sup> Mustafa Cabir Altıntaş, "Worldview Theory and its relation to Islam and Muslim Identity." *ULLUM* 4/1 (2021)

accept in problematic or violent situations and move toward a higher quality of life. Teaching humility, self-denial, and self-sacrifice requires tact since these qualities must be displayed from a place of understanding oneself to be significant and valued by God, and capable of making room for another.<sup>20</sup>

Religion has lost its power and influence in modern society. It has become a personal, private and subjective living space, and a matter of preference and attitude, which is mostly kept alive in individual consciences or in closed religious communities and groups.<sup>21</sup> However, communion or group event is an integral part of social life. Religious life naturally leads to communion, because some of the religious activities also take place as community activities. However, in modern society, traditional communion either tended to break down or gained some new functions while losing some of its functions. Today, religious communities are not only religious; it has many psychological, social, cultural and economic functions. In addition to the religious confusion and uncertainty in our society, the inadequacy of religious education and training is an important factor that increases the interest in religious communities. The social meaning of religious communities depends on the construction of an identity on their members. The concept of identity, on the other hand, is a symbol that is visualized in the mind with all its features and expresses belonging in the definition and interpretation of a phenomenon under investigation. Identity is not a concrete entity that can be defined or constructed on its own. Social communities come to the fore in the identity gaining a meaning. These social communities, on the other hand, build their identities on their members, base their wealthy and reproduce their social identities. Social identity, on the other hand, can be defined as collective identities formed by individuals adopting the rules, rituals and symbols of the social communities of which they are members.<sup>22</sup>

Religion is one of the most important components of Turkish society. In the society, religious communities have an important position and function in terms of better living and

---

<sup>20</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 126.

<sup>21</sup> Hayati Hökelekli, *Gençlik, Din ve Değerler Psikolojisi* (İstanbul: DEM Yayınları, 3. Basım, 2015).

<sup>22</sup> Bhikhu Parekh, *Kimliğin Mantiği*. çev. Suat Aksoy. Haz. Fırat Mollaer (Ankara: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 2014), 53

understanding the application area of religion. What religious communities mean are communities that are solidarity, as defined by Durkheim in sociological terms.<sup>23</sup>

Every religious, cultural, and social event has an impact on the individual, as we can tell from the participant. Events where religious teachings or points of view are discussed in ways that go beyond ceremonial devotion serve to strengthen a religious worldview. Social gatherings frequently help people connect Islam as a way of life and a vision of life, bringing to light important challenges and inspiring individuals and groups of people to reconsider their beliefs. Community events add another building stone to the process of forming and influencing a religious worldview.<sup>24</sup> In this sense, resilient religious communities are become important, because they are able to feel and convey people's sadness about a situation and show compassion. They are able to share in the joy and sorrow of others, and have the wisdom and maturity to lay down burdens for times of rest and renewal. Good religious people are resilient. They continue to grow in wisdom and compassion through the struggles of their own lives in the difficulties they encounter in their ministry.<sup>25</sup> Therefore, the religious community represents a direct aid for young people who are faltering in search of identity, overwhelmed by uncertainty and confusion, find it difficult to determine their place and duty in society, and seek a way to realize their spirituality and morality.

#### **4. Findings and Discussion**

##### **4.1. Identity Issues: Changes, Crises and Resilience**

The concept of identity can be defined as a phenomenon that gives a sense of self-expression, identification, finding meaning in the existing objective world, meaning and belonging. It is the individual's separating what belongs to him/her from what is not and giving himself/herself a different value from the others.<sup>26</sup> Identity appears everywhere, with many definitions; but although it is a difficult term to define, it is a new term that seems to be an old concept and is constantly innovating.<sup>27</sup>

When an individual is asked the question 'who are you?', it leads that person

---

<sup>23</sup> Emile Durkheim, *Dini Hayatın İlk Biçimleri*. Haz. Esen Aksu. çev. Yasin Aktay ve Kenan Çapık (İstanbul: Ataç Yayınları, 2019), 557.

<sup>24</sup> John Valk vd. *An Islamic Worldview from Turkey* (CA: USA, Palgrave, 2017), 62.

<sup>25</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 1.

<sup>26</sup> Seden P. Meral, *Kurumsal Kimlik ve Marka* (Ankara: Detay Yayıncılık, 2011), 3.

<sup>27</sup> Philip Gleason, *Kimliği Tanımlamak: Semantik Bir Tarih*, çev. Fırat Mollaer, Haz. Fırat Mollaer (Ankara: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 2014), 22.

to believe that s/he can be someone else for a moment.<sup>28</sup> Identity does not have a static fact. In other words, as the individual interacts in his/her daily life, the process of identity formation begins and the coming of identity continues. Individuals are both affected and continue to be affected in the interaction process. Therefore, individuals develop by being influenced by other individuals in interactions and therefore they build their own identity.

My participants answer the question of human nature; and their sense of world, identity or selfhood, by asking: 'Who are we?' General questions that we want to answer are: 'what does it mean to be human? Who are we as human beings? Or, what is the nature, task and purpose of human being?'<sup>29</sup> All humans embrace some notion of what it is to be human, whether consciously or unconsciously. Although we may not be able to express what we think we are, we operate with an implicit understanding of an identity, a picture of who we are as human beings.<sup>30</sup> Hence their answers might incorporate a secular western worldview such 'a highly complex machine, a naked ape, evolved biologically'<sup>31</sup> or an Islamic worldview such 'a pinnacle of God's creation and not biologically evolved'. For instance, a 18 years old female student gives meaning of what humans really are by referencing some verses, and consisting her identity:

Human is vicegerent (Khalifah) of God on earth. In other words, a creature that represents Allah and carries out God's light and revelation. I would say, they are superior to other creatures. Humans are the most honourable of the created, whose soul has been taken from God, whose body had been taken from earth, who has his/her own mind and will (Iradah), and who is the caliph of God in the world. (Student 8).

Walsh & Middleton gives an example answer for a person who lives in North America:

I am me, an individual, the free and independent master of my own destiny. I stand in a world full of natural potential, and my task is to utilize that potential to economic good. While I am hindered in this task by ignorance of nature and lack of tools for controlling it, nevertheless my hope rests in the good life of progress wherein nature

---

<sup>28</sup> Zygmunt Bauman, *Kimlik*. çev. Mesut Hazır (Ankara: Heretik Yayınları, 2017), 29.

<sup>29</sup> Walsh, Brian J. - Middleton, J. Richard, *The Transforming Vision. Shaping a Christian World View* (Downers Grove, Ill: InterVarsity, 1984), 51.

<sup>30</sup> Walsh, *The Transforming Vision*, 52.

<sup>31</sup> James William Sire, *The Universe Next Door* (Downers Grove: IVP. 2009), 22.



yields its bounty for human benefit. Only then will all find happiness in a life of material affluence, with no needs and no dependence.<sup>32</sup>

Accordingly, a Muslim young person may assert:

I am the pinnacle of God's creation, who believes Him and obeys what He orders and dependent on His wise and loving rule. I am God's representative on earth, higher than any other living creatures. My entire life is in submission to Him. This is intrinsic to our creature hood. I am not autonomous. God has placed me in a position of authority over the earth to cultivate and develop it. Servant hood is central to my humanness.<sup>33</sup>

The relationship between religion and identity covers a very large literature. A person's unique religious characteristics are called religious personality. A person's religious beliefs, feelings, thoughts and doubts, his religious attitudes and behaviours, his approach to religion and his way of evaluating religious principles form his religious identity.<sup>34</sup> Nevertheless, parents play a very important role in the establishment of religious identity, values, practices and norms of behavior in their children.<sup>35</sup> Some of my participants claim that *"nature of humanity is unique for everyone, however according to Islamic culture all children are born with a good nature and in a state of innocence; and their parents' guide them to follow a way which is religious or without spirituality during their life"*. One of them (20 years old male) said:

All babies come into the world as religious, but their families decide for their religion, so it could change during the life. We born in this world, and we live in Islam with other people. We might be varied, there are leftist, rightist, covered people or uncovered, Christians and Jews, or atheists... all kinds of people are...(Student 13)  
In general, there is a reciprocal relationship between faith and identity.

Maturity and full attitude faith is a factor that can encompass everything that makes up identity. Adopted religious beliefs have the power to create integration in the personality structure. For example, religion leads to a sense of responsibility and personal integrity. In a sense, religion contributes to personal development by offering a coherent pattern of identity and way of life. The most important function of religion is to create a fully integrated, stable and solid human personality and identity.<sup>36</sup>

---

<sup>32</sup> Walsh, *The Transforming Vision*, 36.

<sup>33</sup> Altıntaş, *Worldview Theory*, 146.

<sup>34</sup> L.B. Brown, "Toward the Psychology of Religion". *Journal of Psychology and Christianity* 5/2 (1986), 13-18.

<sup>35</sup> Judith Kearins, *Child-rearing practices in Australia: Variation with life-style* (Perth: Education Dept. of Western Australia, 1984).

<sup>36</sup> Hayati Hökekleli, *Din Psikolojisi* (Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 16. Basım, 2021).

There have been radical social and cultural changes in Turkey in the last century. These changes brought discord and conflicts. Young people, who were forced to change in parallel with different role expectations and change in the changing social order, had to continue their search for identity in an environment of mental tension. Young people either become a type of person who does not believe in any value, lacks ideals and goals, is distracted by daily pursuits and material pleasures, becomes alienated from himself and his environment, or joins some religious and ideological groups and enters into an attachment that reaches the point of loss of identity.<sup>37</sup> It is difficult to prevent our young people, who are faced with contradictory religious understandings, interpretations and practices, from drifting to extremes or developing an attitude of religious indifference and distrust. As can be seen, religious beliefs and values constitute the main axis of the identity development process in society. A female participant explains her thoughts by saying:

If religion lived in full of meaning, I am sure that all people were in peace. I think, there would be no pressure, because Turkey is a multicultural and multi-national country, I mean there are many different religions, sects, ethnicities, and cultures. Everyone has places to worship; there are temples in everywhere. If everyone else practice comfortably what they believe, if they are free to what they want to believe, that time if we invite them to search Islam and its culture rather than to insult them or to fight them, then Turkey would become a real Islamic state (Student 19).

For the young person who is looking for a meaning and purpose in life, religion is great importance as it creates a self-identity and provides mental clarity by satisfying the need to understand the world. Even if they do not fulfill their traditional religious duties, the number of young people who benefit from their religious references in terms of their worldview and outlook on life is not small. Although there is no significant difference in fulfilling the requirements of the secular social order and lifestyle, it is common to encounter young people who are religious at the discursive level.

In the face of the multifaceted conditions and difficulties of internalizing and experiencing religious values as a whole, the fact that young people maintain their interest in religion, at least at an intellectual level, reveals the existential importance of religion for them. Therefore, it is a common situation in our society that people, who define themselves with identities such as secular, modern, etc., sometimes resort to religious references. The

---

<sup>37</sup> Hökelekli, *Gençlik, Din*, 13.

number of people who benefit from religion at the level of meaning is always higher than those who regularly practice religion.<sup>38</sup> Even though the number of those who give primary importance to religious beliefs and values in their lives and do what is necessary, religious institutions continued to be active in the social and political field. On the other hand, it is clear that modernization has given birth to many powerful anti-secularization movements. A visible religious activity and revival is strongly felt in both the Christian and Islamic worlds. The most important reason for this is; modernism damages what people firmly believe, all old beliefs, and makes them doubt their beliefs and values.<sup>39</sup>

Religion provides a mental clarity for young people who are in search of understanding the world and finding a purpose in life, and as a holistic worldview, it encompasses all knowledge and understanding and creates a structure related to the reality they face. Therefore, religious youth are able to become more 'optimistic' and feel that they have taken control of their situation with the help of God.<sup>40</sup> Young people who falter in identity confusion find an opportunity to gain an identity in religion. Thus, they can get away from the tensions between change and the need for balance or integration, in conflicts between contradictory identities, and attain a consistent and balanced self. This leads to a positive outlook on life and people.

Depending on the changing time and space relations of religious identities, the construction process continues. This process is gradually increasing its impact according to the course of political and social events. The fact that the phenomenon of religion makes its presence felt as a political ideology or approach in addition to the theological approach also affects the perceptions of religiosity. Therefore, as religiosity increases its visibility in different geographies and on different ideological grounds, it can be expected that different perceptions of religiosity of individuals belonging to the same religion will emerge.

When we think in the context of Turkey; it can be said that different styles of religious identity are based on differences in interpretation in Islamic references and religious values.

---

<sup>38</sup> Günter Seufert, *Türk Gençleri Arasında Din ve Milliyetçilik: Türkiye ve Avrupa'da Gençlik* (Ankara: Konrad Adenauer Vakfı, 2000), 78.

<sup>39</sup> Hökelekli, *Gençlik, Din*, 11.

<sup>40</sup> Edwin Hyde, *Religion in Childhood and Adolescence: A Comprehensive Review of the Research* (Birmingham: Religious Education Press, 1990), 220.

The discourses of different religious authorities, especially at the point of interpreting the holy book and fulfilling the worship, offer a perspective that religious identity can be experienced differently. According to our data, my participants are experienced the religion in different way, for examples: there are young people who fast but do not perform prayers in Ramadan; read the Quran but do not worship; do not consume alcoholic beverages only in Ramadan; believe in God but do not perform their prayers; remembering some religious nights as special; regardless of their level of piety, Islamic belief variable interpretations are seen in religious living practices according to time and conditions, as well as those who are not or relatively low emphasize the importance of sharing in the feast of sacrifice. This may be related to individuals' giving place to a ranking or priority in their religious values and orientations. Moreover, the impact of post-modernity and the rapid change in consumption habits; religious values of individuals have also enabled them to live on a slippery ground or on a more personal level. In this sense, the religious values that build religious identity can also be shaped according to the wishes and desires of individuals.

#### **4.2. Conservatism as a Resilience Orientation in Youth Religiosity**

Conservatism is one of the issues that should be discussed on the basis of the necessities of social life or the values that the individual-society needs. For this reason, the discussion of what established social values mean in terms of conservatism and where conservatism is positioned on the basis of traditional values can also pave the way for a resilient religious perspective.

The concept of conservatism; it means preserving the traditional values and norms that give life to the existing structure or opposing the break with the traditions with rapid change.<sup>41</sup>Conservatism is generally associated with religiosity or a lifestyle in which religious attitudes predominate. As in the world, "conservatism" in Turkey is not a concept with clear boundaries theoretically and can be confused with different definitions. Conservative person is often used for traditional religious people or people who prioritize their religious life. It points out that conservatism is above all religious, and conservatism is mostly defined through religiosity. In Turkey, the concept of conservatism is generally read and perceived as religiosity. For instance:

---

<sup>41</sup> Ömer Demir -Mustafa Acar, *Sosyal Bilimler Sözlüğü* (İstanbul: Adres Yayınları, 6. Basım, 2005), 129.

"If someone says, "I am Muslim", she must follow what Islam requires. She must act its system. Especially a woman who has hijab, must be careful than others, she will properly cover her body, not make up or wear shiny clothes. She could not engage with men, and hanging out with them. Today's generation like this kind of relations, however, this is not a kind of Muslim what Islam wants. (Student, 18)"

From this point of view, conservatism indicates the progress of people in the life cycle without the need for any other relationship of belonging, leaning on themselves and their own values - preserving the traditional structure on which they are based. Most Turkish youth believe that Islam is the only religion that matters in the eyes of God, which gives the impression to them that Western religions and ideologies are not Islamic. For instance, being a Jew or a Christian is not considered acceptable by the majority of people when it comes to religion. One participant (student 17) explains what she thinks about West by claiming:

West is Non-Muslim part of the world, Islam is out of its context.

According to Genç and Coşkun, conservatism is a concept that can be reconstructed, even if it is perceived as being closed in the religious sense or not being willing to change.<sup>42</sup> We can see conservatism as a determining factor in creating/maintaining a thought or lifestyle within both the religious segment and the value system. Being conservative requires having a stance and attitude and is based on the continuation of traditionalism or the weight of religious beliefs. In this regard some of participants advocate for a Turkish Islam. However, it is pertinent to ask, "Is there a distinct Turkish Islam? What has been the impact of globalization and modernity on the Turkish youth?". A female (student 6) asserts that:

Turkey is a secular state, which means to accept the separation between Islam and secular. I cannot think a separation of Islam and state. In fact, Islam is at every stage of our life, and we must believe and live in Islam in every field of our life such as eating, sleeping, law, and government.

Islam still has an impact on all facets of life in Turkey, despite its secularism and modernity. Islam is not the only religion involved. According to Yavuz, "religion is an essential component of human society and is an expression of humankind's almost visceral

---

<sup>42</sup> Ernur Genç - Tuba Coşkun, "Muhafazakârlık ve Türkiye Muhafazakârlıklarının Bazı Halleri." *Niğde Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi* 8/1 (2015), 29.

drive to search for meaning; furthermore, religion can provide people a sense of identity."<sup>43</sup> Every area of Muslim life is being shaped by globalization processes. In light of this, Muslims may have a variety of understandings.<sup>44</sup> Therefore, the perception of conservatism, which is tried to be interpreted in the context of temporal, spatial and consumption relations, seems worth examining.

Conservatives move forward by needing the approval of tradition and the traditional religiosity in the modernization process and act as a social communication mechanism within the normatively accepted innovations.<sup>45</sup> Although the perception of conservatism changes with modernity and the continuous industrialization process; with the effect of postmodernity, it has become easy to rebuild. In other words, "conservatism is based on the reaction against the capitalist modernization process, in the name of the continuity of the political, social and cultural structures, perhaps more precisely the meanings and values attributed to those structures".<sup>46</sup>

This study deals with the discourse that Turkey is becoming increasingly religious or conservative. It includes rapid secularization, the new generation's moderate bond with religion, the sharia-secularization debate, the increasing number of women wearing headscarves, the constant consumption of alcohol, and the general perception of conservatism; based on the discourse that Turkey is rapidly becoming conservative, it actually includes observations on why it has not become conservative, contrary to this discourse. Along with technological progress, in the 2000s, it is seen that Turkish religiosity was under the influence of a time period that emerged as a result of the Turkish modernization experience and modern-secular tendencies also transformed religiosity typologies.<sup>47</sup>

On the other hand, in today's generation, the idea of individualism and the adage "Religion is individual" are becoming increasingly popular. Accepting individuality and our own choices plays an effective role in shaping our way of life. A male (student, 16) gives a

---

<sup>43</sup> M. Hakan Yavuz, "Is there a distinct Turkish Islam?". *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 24/2, (October 2004), 214.

<sup>44</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 141.

<sup>45</sup> Gabriel A. Almond vd. *Strong Religion: The Rise of Fundamentalisms Around the World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003).

<sup>46</sup> Tanıl Bora, *Türk Sağının Üç Hali* (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003), 6.

<sup>47</sup> Necdet Subaşı, "Türkiye Dindarlığı: Yeni Tipolojiler". *İslamiyat* 5/4 (2012), 17-40.

voice who thinks like him by saying:

I am what I am. They do not understand me because they look through a single aspect. 'It is not like that, you should do like...' people just give advice to us. I am still on my own way; I can say 'this is me, as an individual.'

But, we must free the young people, they should make their own decision, they live a modern life, they find their own way. For example, they do not overwhelm themselves, like wearing burqa, frocks... I do not accept them. A Muslim can live an individual way.

This understanding has resulted with 'religion becomes a matter of personal choice' which clearly explained by Grace Davie. Davie states that religion becomes instead a matter of personal choice could understood:

I go to church (or to another religious organization) because I want to, maybe for a short period or maybe for longer, to fulfill a particular rather than a general need in my life and where I will continue my attachment so long as it provides what I want, but I have no obligation either to attend in the first place or to continue if I don't want to.<sup>48</sup>

As we see, there are three main groups according to our data: tough modernists/secularists, religious conservatives and liberals. We can state that conservatism and religiosity are interpreted differently by different segments of society depending on changing times and political developments, different definitions of religiosity have emerged, and intergroup relations are open to change depending on psychological or political foundations. Therefore, considering being religious and being secular in one-sided and opposite positions in Turkey may lead to a shallow approach.<sup>49</sup> According to the data, the majority of participants are aware of secular modern culture and its key elements, including individuality, modernism, liberal and democratic values, civilization, and technology. They all agree that Islam and the West's culture get along well. The notion that "Turkish Muslim youth should protect their religious side while westernization process is going on" is held by some individuals with more conventional worldviews. The westernization process is considered as a threat to Islam and its impact since it is seen as a denial of authentic Islamic principles, traditions, and institutions. The opinion is also that more contemporary and individualized forms of belief have taken the place of traditional dogmatic beliefs. It is a resilience of religion toward secularism.

In this situation, despite the fact that some young people have very rigid

---

<sup>48</sup> Grace Davie, *The Sociology or Religion* (Atlanta, GA: Sage, 2007), 281.

<sup>49</sup> Kamile Paker – Sevim Cesur, "Laiklik Konusunda Ayrışan Gruplar ve Belirli Psiko-Sosyal Değişkenlerin Dış-Grup Değerlendirmelerinde Rolü." *Akademik Araştırma Dergisi* 57 (2013), 63.

understanding and reject compromise with secular modern culture, they can accept and respect any type of hybrid identities and worldviews by building positive relationships with people, upholding their rights, not deceiving others, etc. Those conservative young Muslims value ethical standards above everything else in order to keep religious values apart from all other aspects of life, even while they are surrounded by western secular principles. We learned from the participants that Islamic ethical norms are still in force and have a significant influence on many facets of society, even in societies where a secular culture predominates.<sup>50</sup> Islam actually seeks to maintain a healthy balance between this world and the afterlife; it serves as a constant reminder that the afterlife is the primary motivation behind conservative Muslims' acts in the here and now. In order to avoid dualities that are likely to arise in a Muslim's life, such as World-Afterlife, Material-Immaterial, and Religious-Secular, this is fundamental to Islam.

#### **4.3. Changing Religious Identities and New Forms of Religiosity in the Context of Resilience**

The Turkish case is one of the particular in that it combines a majority-Muslim population and history with a secularist vision of the state and modernity.<sup>51</sup> The religious and secular individuals' experiences in these settings reveal both Islamic and Western cultures. The story of the Turkish Muslim youth serves as an example of how religious traditions may take in and reframe the secular and modern discourse that permeates the world. The mutable nature of religious traditions prompts a reevaluation of religion's place in society and in day-to-day affairs. Young Turkish Muslims occasionally appropriate concepts, behaviors, and institutions from Western and other cultures, whether consciously or unconsciously. Nevertheless, this appropriation occurs in a setting that challenges identity by applying a lens made up of their Islamic cultural tradition.<sup>52</sup>

The study puts forward that the young religious segment may also have different-new religious perceptions or different identity structures as religious people, depending on the color of the time. The effect of different cultures and social changes and the new social manifestations that develop depending on this situation can be effective on the way to the

---

<sup>50</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 177.

<sup>51</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 2.

<sup>52</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 178.



transformation of religious identities. To be resilient, a person must be able to change, and to adapt to new circumstances. Motivation for change is necessary, as is the capacity to maintain the demands the change places on one's self-esteem and self-image. Self-awareness, of the challenge being confronted and the emotional suffering of its impact, is the first step toward change. A sufficient level of self-worth is essential for motivation to take charge and get through, and empowerment makes it possible to develop resilience. A person can make decisions and choose a new course of action with the aid of self-control or discipline as well as a rich inner life.<sup>53</sup>

Increased visibility of the Islamic style; as a religious identity, it points to both the traditional life based on belief and worship, and to determine the boundaries of traditionalism with "new" forms. In this context, secularization and Islamization can coexist. For example, by modernizing Islamic lifestyles, Islamic belongings and identities are transforming; at the same time, religious people continue to insist on preserving Islamic forms.<sup>54</sup> My data refutes the claim that Islam and the West are intrinsically incompatible; rather, it demonstrates how they interact and influence one another's cultures. Young Turkish Muslims are empowered and transformed by new forms of identity that are compatible with Western culture, and they also assist in the process of balancing modernity and Islam, secular and religious behaviors. As a result of the formation of hybridization, young people create their own identity, which is mixed, and bricolage. Islam may change and take on new forms, as well as new channels through which to spread; secularization and Islamization coexist. Young people look for solutions to the question: 'Is it possible to build a bridge between secular and religious discourse and worldviews?' Islamic identities are changing as a result of the modernization of Islamic lives.

Today's Turkish youth may tend to exhibit new religious codes and behavioral patterns in order to dissolve the dilemmas faced by Islamic values in the process of commodification and not to be caught between two different conceptions of thought. They appear to be a kind of identity in which they are articulated rather than choosing between some extremes; which can be summarized as "there is not only black or white, there are grey areas". This implies that individuals have personally undergone a transformation from a

---

<sup>53</sup> Chapman, *Resilient Pastors*, 25.

<sup>54</sup> Altıntaş, *Worldview Theory*, 150-152.

"grey world from a black and white world" in that clear distinctions between the two cultures have vanished in their thinking and daily lives, and conflicting conceptions and mental structures can coexist.<sup>55</sup>

Postmodernity, including modernity, produces new forms specific to each phenomenon, and these new forms also include the reconstruction of belief styles. Accordingly, with the increasing emphasis on individuality from the past to the present, it can be said that religions are lived in individual-specific styles rather than in an organized or institutional way. Therefore, it can be said that with the integration of religious practices into modernity and technological progress, different visibility models have emerged. As can be seen in this style of religiosity, which is experienced as "compatible" with modernity, we can say that religious people perform religious worship or activities on a more performative level rather than collectively. This situation may show that the religious people are in the process of subjectivities by giving a subjective appearance of religiosity-religiousness with their unique religious clothing, speaking and shopping styles. It can be thought that this process has created "legitimate" grounds that allow the religious segment to integrate itself into modernity and this integration creates new appearances of religiosity and new religious discourses. It appears that several of the commandments of Islam that were previously regarded as untouchable were opened to discussion and became "touchable" during postmodern times, when it was acceptable to question everything.<sup>56</sup> The experiences that are fueled by discourses like "I can pray and drink wine" and "the place of prayers is different from the place of entertainment" have secular ramifications. Similarly, as a result of a related view, religion has been privatized and subjectified in postmodern times. Thus, religion is a phenomenon belonging to the private sphere.

### **Conclusion**

In this research, which we have done to understand the identity, religious life and behavior of young people, religious resilience, religious culture and accordingly religious changes and transformations have been examined along with religious potential. The data shows that; the relationship between the individual and religious belief and identity

---

<sup>55</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 198.

<sup>56</sup> Altıntaş, *The Role of Religious Education*, 193.

motivation is related to inhomogeneous results and factors. Each individual has different conceptions and different motivations regarding religious identity. In this sense, religiosity is fed by different social and psychological dynamics; in general, it seems to be related to time, space and socialization processes.

When we think in terms of religious/Islamic identity, stereotypes about the religion of Islam and a homogeneous religious group come to mind. However, with the effect of the changing world and popular culture, it can be difficult to talk about a homogeneous religiosity or religious identity. With which other social identities the individual lives his/her religious identity in the socialization process and the relations of his/her multiple identities with each other may also indicate that there will not be a homogeneous perception of religiosity. Therefore, religiosity and identity; it ceases to be a concept that will be limited to categorizing certain stereotypes and a way of life based on certain religious beliefs.<sup>57</sup> This feature makes it easy to rebuild. Therefore, changes in the concept of religiosity due to the relational nature of the discourse prevent religious people from being evaluated with a specific and limited perspective.

The attitudes, values and beliefs acquired by young people can change over time depending on different variables and in different time periods. Therefore, this change includes tendencies such as religious attitudes leaving the institutional area and open to individual inquiries, and the individualization process of religion.<sup>58</sup> While some participants live their religiosity or practices of religious living more closed, to the extent determined by their inner spirituality; some may prefer to live in a way that makes their worship more visible (religious practices in public, collective prayers, Friday prayers, direct participation in the activities of religious groups-congregations). People who believe that religion has unchangeable and rigid sides can be expected to lead a "secluded" or communal lifestyle, depending on the values they acquire in life. With the effect of changing conditions and postmodern discourses, ideologies and trans-boundary perceptions come into play; new religious practices-discourses, which we thought did not match their religious attitudes and behaviours, came to light. Anti-capitalist Muslims, secular religious people, especially in the

---

<sup>57</sup> Hüseyin Certel, "Dini Yaşantıda Kalite Sorunu." *SDÜ İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 24 (2010), 33-59.

<sup>58</sup> Kamile Parker – Selda Akçalı "Dinin Bireyselleşmesi: Üniversite Gençliği ile bir Ölçek Çalışması." *Gaziantep University Journal of Social Sciences* 11/4 (2012), 1440-1459.

last ten years, the daily life practices of religious women have become more visible and thus the emergence of changes that determine the phenomenon of identity has strengthened the bond with the public sphere and the segments that bring the different together have become evident.

This change of manifestations of religiosity over time constitutes one of the main points of the study. Religious roles attributed to men and women in daily life practices, changes in the understanding of haram-halal, the theme of popular culture from an Islamic point of view (Islamic fashion industry), luxury mawlid organizations, and the discourses of "Islam is misinterpreted, this is not the real Islam" that are frequently heard in daily conversations are different. It may also indicate a changing understanding of religious identity. This observed change may be related to the fact that the Islamic identity, which is a strong social identity, moves away from the rigid/traditional stereotypes that categorize it or is reproduced through new discourses.

In the modern society we live in, ensuring the harmony between religion and the world constitutes a serious problem area. Secular contemporary ideologies tried to overcome this problem by completely isolating religion from social life, but they were unsuccessful in their plans. However, the practice of modern life continues to affect and determine individual lives with all its institutions and rules. In a secular world, maintaining traditional religiosity has many difficulties. Being both modern and being Muslim seems possible only by transforming and transforming at a hybridized level within borders.<sup>59</sup> In this process, it is possible for religious young people to make choices according to some alternatives in order to continue their lives without entering into a long-term conflict with the social order. Some young people try to adapt to the environment they live in by developing multiple identities that are intertwined. As a matter of fact, while some young people are trying to find a place in social life within 'Muslim-nationalist, Muslim-modern, Muslim-secular' identities at the same time, some young people who define themselves mainly with a non-religious identity need to apply to religious references from time to time. In all these cases, there is a defensive and resilient identity processed with a mental and cultural effort.

---

<sup>59</sup> Nilüfer Göle, *İslam'ın Yeni Kamusal Yüzleri* (İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2000), 19-40.

## References / Kaynakça

- Almond, Gabriel A. vd. *Strong Religion: The Rise of Fundamentalisms Around the World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003.
- Altıntaş, Mustafa Cabir. *The Role of Religious Education in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century: Worldviews and Identity Discernment of Muslim Youth*. Ankara: Nobel Yayıncılık, 2021.
- Altıntaş, Mustafa Cabir. "Worldview Theory and its relation to Islam and Muslim Identity." *ULUM* 4/1 (2021),133-158.
- Argyle, Marry. "Dinin Yedi Psikolojik Temeli." çev: Mehmet Dağ, *Eğitim Hareketleri Dergisi* 23 (1978), 272-273.
- Bauman, Zygmunt. *Kimlik*. çev. Mesut Hazır. Ankara: Heretik Yayınları, 2017.
- Bora, Tanıl. *Türk Sağının Üç Hali*. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2003.
- Brown, L.B. "Toward the Psychology of Religion". *Journal of Psychology and Christianity* 5/2 (1986), 13-18.
- Certel, Hüseyin. "Dini Yaşantıda Kalite Sorunu." *SDÜ İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 24 (2010), 33-59.
- Chapman, Justine Allain. *Resilient Pastors: The Role of Adversity in Healing and Growth*. SPCK publishing: UK, 2012.
- Davie, Grace. *The Sociology of Religion*. Atlanta, GA: Sage, 2007.
- Demir, Ömer - Acar, Mustafa. *Sosyal Bilimler Sözlüğü*. İstanbul: Adres Yayınları, 6. Basım, 2005.
- Durkheim, Emile. *Dini Hayatın İlk Biçimleri*. haz. Esen Aksu. çev. Yasin Aktay ve Kenan Çapık. İstanbul: Ataç Yayınları, 2019.
- Fitzpatrick, Margaret vd. *Globalization and Education Policy in Turkey: Education of Women, Religious Education and Higher Education*. University of Illinois: Urbana-Champaign, 2009.
- Genç, Ernur - Tuba Coşkun. "Muhafazakârlık ve Türkiye Muhafazakârlıklarının Bazı Halleri." *Niğde Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi Dergisi* 8/1 (2015), 27-40.
- Gleason, Philip. *Kimliği Tanımlamak: Semantik Bir Tarih*, çev. Fırat Mollaer, Haz. Fırat Mollaer, Ankara: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 2014.
- Göle, Nilüfer. *İslam'ın Yeni Kamusal Yüzleri*. İstanbul: Metis Yayınları, 2000.
- Hökelekli, Hayati. *Gençlik, Din ve Değerler Psikolojisi*. İstanbul: DEM Yayınları, 3. Basım, 2015.
- Hökelekli, Hayati. *Din Psikolojisi*. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 16. Basım, 2021.
- Hyde, Edwin. *Religion in Childhood and Adolescence: A Comprehensive Review of the Research*. Birmingham: Religious Education Press, 1990.
- Kearins, Judith. *Child-rearing practices in Australia: Variation with life-style*, Perth: Education Dept. of Western Australia, 1984.
- Kula, Naci. Gençlik Döneminde Kimlik ve Din. *Gençlik, Din ve Değerler Psikolojisi*. Hayati Hökelekli. 33-81. İstanbul: DEM Yayınları, 3. Basım, 2015.
- Meral, Seden P. *Kurumsal Kimlik ve Marka*. Ankara: Detay Yayıncılık, 2011.
- Öztürk, Orhan. *Ruhsağlığı ve Bozuklukları*. Ankara: Nobel Akademi, 16. Basım, 2020.
- Paker, Kamile – Cesur, Sevim. "Laiklik Konusunda Ayrışan Gruplar ve Belirli Psiko-Sosyal Değişkenlerin Dış-Grup Değerlendirmelerinde Rolü." *Akademik Araştırma Dergisi* 57 (2013), 51-76.
- Paker, Kamile Oya – Akçalı, Selda. "Dinin Bireyselleşmesi: Üniversite Gençliği ile bir Ölçek Çalışması." *Gaziantep University Journal of Social Sciences* 11/4 (2012), 1440-1459.

- Parekh, Bhikhu. *Kimliğin Mantığı*. çev. Suat Aksoy. Haz. Fırat Mollaer. Ankara: Doğu Batı Yayınları, 2014.
- Pargament, Kenneth I. "The Bitter and the Sweet: An Evaluation of the Costs and Benefits of Religiousness." *Psychological inquiry* 13/3 (2002), 168-181.
- Schweitzer, Friedrich. *The postmodern life cycle*. St. Louis: Chalice Press, 2004.
- Seufert, Günter. *Türk Gençleri Arasında Din ve Milliyetçilik: Türkiye ve Avrupa'da Gençlik*. Ankara: Konrad Adenauer Vakfı, 2000.
- Sire, James William. *The Universe Next Door*, Downers Grove: IVP., 2009.
- Stack, Steven. "A Comparative Analysis of Suicide and Religiosity". *Journal of Social Psychology* 119/2 (1983), 285-286.
- Subaşı, Necdet. "Türkiye Dindarlığı: Yeni Tipolojiler". *İslamiyat* 5/4 (2012), 17-40.
- Tibi, Bassam. *Islam between culture and politics*. New York: Palgrave, 2001.
- Turkey's Statistical Year Book*. Ankara: MEB yayınları, 2020.
- Valk, John vd. *An Islamic Worldview from Turkey*. CA: USA, Palgrave, 2017.
- Walsh, Brian J. - Middleton, J. Richard. *The Transforming Vision. Shaping a Christian World View*, Downers Grove, Ill: InterVarsity, 1984.
- Yavuz, M. Hakan. "Is there a distinct Turkish Islam?". *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 24/2, (October 2004), 213-233.

## An Evaluation of Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Sufi Influences in the Indian Subcontinent: The Case of Chishti Tariqa

*Mu'niiddin Çiştî'nin Hint Yarımadası'ndaki Tasavvufî Etkilerine Dair Bir Değerlendirme: Çiştîyye Tarikatı Örneği*

**Vahit GÖKTAŞ**

ORCID: 0000-0002-1171-5795

E-Posta [vgoktas@ankara.edu.tr](mailto:vgoktas@ankara.edu.tr)

Prof. Dr. Ankara University, Faculty of Theology,  
Department of Basic Islamic Sciences,  
Prof. Dr. Ankara Üniversitesi,  
İlahiyat Fakültesi, Temel İslam Bilimleri Bölümü,  
Ankara-Türkiye  
ROR ID: [01wntqw50](https://orcid.org/01wntqw50)

**Saeyd Rashed Hasan CHOWDURY**

ORCID: 0000-0002-3864-1378

E-Posta [saeydrashed.du1991@gmail.com](mailto:saeydrashed.du1991@gmail.com)

Ph.D. Candidate, Ankara University, Graduate School of  
Social Sciences, Department of Basic Islamic Sciences,  
Doktora Öğrencisi, Ankara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler  
Enstitüsü, Temel İslam Bilimleri Bölümü,  
Ankara-Türkiye  
ROR ID: [01wntqw50](https://orcid.org/01wntqw50)

### Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

Citation / Atıf: Göktaş, Vahit – Chowdury, Saeyd Rashed Hasan. "An Evaluation of Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Sufi Influences in the Indian Subcontinent: The Case of Chishti Tariqa". *Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31 (Haziran 2023), 47-76. <https://doi.org/10.35415/sirnakifd.1244284>

Date of Submission (Geliş Tarihi)	29. 01. 2023
Date of Acceptance (Kabul Tarihi)	19. 05. 2023
Date of Publication (Yayın Tarihi)	15. 06. 2023
Article Type (Makale Türü)	Research Article (Araştırma Makalesi)
Peer-Review (Değerlendirme)	Double anonymized - Three External (Üç Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körleme).
Ethical Statement (Etik Beyan)	It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited. (Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur).
Plagiarism Checks (Benzerlik Taraması)	Yes (Evet) – Turnitin / Ithenticate.
Conflicts of Interest (Çıkar Çatışması)	The author(s) has no conflict of interest to declare (Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir).
Complaints (Etik Beyan Adresi)	<a href="mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com">suifdergi@gmail.com</a>
Grant Support (Finansman)	The author(s) acknowledge that they received no external funding in support of this research. (Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır).
Copyright & License (Telif Hakkı ve Lisans)	Authors publishing with the journal retain the copyright to their work licensed under the CC BY-NC 4.0. (Yazarlar dergide yayınlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmaları CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır).

## **Abstract**

This article aimed to analyse the life and works of Mu'in al-Din Hasan Ibn Sayyid Giyaseddin as-Sijzi al-Chishti (d. 633/1236) as well as the effects of the Chishti Tariqa of which he was the founder, in the Indian Subcontinent. The importance and effects of Chishti Tariqa, the first and largest sect of India, in the spread of Islam and the construction of the basic structure of Islamic civilisation and culture are mentioned. The Chishti Tariqa emerged around 930 CE in Chishti, a small town near Herat, Afghanistan, and this tariqa got its name from its founder Mu'in al-Din Chishti. The essential condition of the Chishti Tariqa is a life in accordance with the Qur'an and Sunnah, that is, following the Sharia. According to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, Sufism without Sharia is superstitious. People who follow the path of Sufism without following the Shari'a cannot enjoy spiritual life in any way. Mu'in al-Din Chishti settled the Chishti order in Lahore and Ajmer in India in the middle of the 12th century. Mu'in al-Din Chishti is among the most well-known scholars, thinkers and sufis in the Indian subcontinent. In addition, Mu'in al-Din Chishti has a distinguished personality in social life. He saw the religious life as a service to the creatures and inculcated his followers to be in the social life and to serve the creatures. For this reason, he considered meeting the needs of the needy and feeding the hungry as a requirement of obedience to Allah and never neglected this. Due to his influence in India, Mu'in al-Din Chishti was given titles such as "Merciful to the Poor, Sun of India and Spiritual Sultan of India". He first stayed in Bukhara and Samarkand for a while for his education and then went to Baghdad. Mu'in al-Din Chishti also visited many important Islamic science centres of the period, such as Damascus, Mecca, Medina, Hamadan, Tabriz, Herat, Nishapur, Isfahan, Gorgan, Sabzevar, Balkh, and came to Lahore in India via Ghazni. Mu'in al-Din Chishti was also an influential Islamic scholar who devoted himself to the spread of Islam. Due to his invitation, many people accepted Islam in groups. The rulers of the period were disturbed due to the increasing number of Mu'in al-Din Chishti's influence circle and the people around him. The Hindu Raja, the king of the period, who thought his authority would be in danger, started to persecute Mu'in al-Din Chishti and his followers in various ways. However, Mu'in al-Din's influence on the people increased continuously despite all these problems. According to historical records, approximately nine million non-Muslims became Muslims in India under the influence of Mu'in al-Din Chishti. The study aimed to delineate Mu'in al-Din Chishti's life, scientific personality, works, influences and sect, lineage, mystical views, his travels for science, the Islamic scholars he met during his travels and learned knowledge, and his societal influences. Chishti's sufi doctrines were discussed through essential concepts in his works and the sect's method. In addition, the article also described the relations of Chishti with the rulers of his own time, the difficulties he encountered during his guidance of the people, and the reasons for these difficulties.

**Keywords:** Sufism, Mu'in al-Din Chishti, Chishti Tariqa, Indian Subcontinent, Ajmer, Delhi, Spread of Islam.



## Özet

Bu makalede, Muînüddîn Hasen b. Seyyid Gıyâsiddin es-Siczî el-Çiştî'nin (ö. 633/1236) hayatı, eserleri ve kurucusu olduğu Çiştîyye tarikatının Hint Yarımadası'ndaki etkileri ele alınmıştır. Hindistan'ın ilk ve en büyük tarikatı olan Çiştîyye'nin İslam'ın yayılmasında, İslam medeniyetinin ve kültürünün temel yapısının inşasında öneminden ve etkilerinden bahsedilmiştir. Çiştîyye tarikatı, Afganistan'ın Herat yakınlarındaki küçük bir kasaba olan Çiştî'de miladî 930 yılı civarında ortaya çıkmıştır. Çiştîyye tarikatı ismini kurucusu olan Muînüddin Çiştî'den almıştır. Çiştîyye tarikatının en temel şartı, Kur'an ve sünnete uygun bir yaşam yani şeriata ittibâdır. Muînüddin Çiştî'ye göre şeriatsız tasavvuf batıldır. Şeriata uymadan tasavvuf yolunda olan kişiler manevi hayattan hiçbir şekilde tat alamazlar. Muînüddin Çiştî, tarikatını 12. yüzyılın ortalarında Hindistan'ın Lahor ve Ajmer şehirlerinde yerleşik hale getirmiştir. Muînüddin Çiştî Hint Yarımadası'ndaki en tanınmış âlim, mütefekkir ve sufilerden biridir. Ayrıca Muînüddin Çiştî sosyal hayatın içinde bir şahsiyettir. O, dini hayatı mahlûkata hizmet olarak görmüş ve müritlerine içtimaî hayatın içinde olmayı, mahlûkata hizmet etmeyi telkin etmiştir. Bunu için ihtiyaç sahiplerinin ihtiyaçları gidermeyi, açları doyurmayı Allah'a itaatin bir gereği olarak görmüş ve hiçbir zaman bunu ihmal etmemiştir. Hindistan'daki tesirlerinden dolayı Muînüddin Çiştî'ye "Yoksullara Merhametli, Hindistan'ın Güneşi ve Hindistan'ın Manevi Sultanı" gibi unvanlar verilmiştir. İlim tahsili için önce Buhara ve Semerkant'ta bir müddet bulunmuş, daha sonra Bağdat'a gitmiştir. Muînüddin Çiştî ayrıca Şam, Mekke, Medine, Hemedan, Tebriz, Herat, Nişâbur, İsfahan, Esterâbâd, Sabzavar ve Belh gibi dönemin birçok önemli ilim merkezini ziyaret etmiş ve Gazne üzerinden Hindistan'ın Lahor kentine gelmiştir. Muînüddin Çiştî aynı zamanda kendisini İslam'ın yayılmasına adanmış önemli bir mübelliğdir. Onun daveti sayesinde pek çok insan gruplar halinde İslam'ı kabul etmiştir. Muînüddin Çiştî'nin tesir halkasının ve çevresindeki insanların sayısının gittikçe artmasından dolayı dönemin idarecileri rahatsız olmuştur. Kendi otoritesinin tehlikeye gireceğini düşünen dönemin kralı Hindu Raja, Muînüddin Çiştî ve takipçilerine çeşitli şekillerde zulmetmeye başlamıştır. Ancak tüm bunlara rağmen Çiştî'nin halk üzerindeki etkisi her geçen gün daha da artmıştır. Tarihî kayıtlara göre, Hindistan'da Muînüddin Çiştî'nin etkisiyle yaklaşık dokuz milyon gayrimüslim Müslüman olmuştur. Bu makalede Muînüddin Çiştî'nin hayatı, ilmî şahsiyeti, eserleri, tesirleri ve tarikatı, silsilesi, tasavvufî görüşleri, ilim için yaptığı seyahatler, karşılaştığı ve ilim tahsil ettiği kişiler ve tesirleri ele alınmıştır. Çiştî'nin tasavvufî görüşleri eserlerindeki ve tarikat usulünde öne çıkan bazı kavramlar üzerinden ele alınmıştır. Bunların yanında makalede Çiştî'nin kendi devrindeki yöneticilerle münasebetlerine, halkı irşadı esnasında karşılaştığı zorluklara ve bu zorlukların nedenlerine de temas edilmiştir.

**Anahtar Kelimeleri:** Tasavvuf, Muînüddin Çiştî, Çiştîyye Tarikatı, Hint Yarımadası, Ajmer, Delhi, İslam'ın Yayılması.

## **Introduction**

The Chishti tariqa originated around 930 in Chishti, a small town near Herat, Afghanistan, emphasising love, tolerance, and generosity. Mu'in al-Din Chishti brought this order to Lahore and Ajmer in India in the middle of the 12th century. He is the eighth person of this tariqa after Abu Ishaq Shamir, the founder of the Chishti tariqa. Mu'in al-Din Chishti made this Chishti order an established order in his own time. Mu'in al-Din Chishti was a muballig, mufakkir, generous, compassionate, universally minded and deeply humanitarian. As a result of his piety, piety and self-sacrifice, the kingdom of Kufr and Shirk became the home of Islamic knowledge. Only through the efforts and influence of Mu'in al-Din Chishti did mosques and pulpits become visible where the darkness of shirk prevailed. Allahu Akbar began to resound where the poisonous fumes of idolatry and shirk abounded.

Helpless, sheltered, and poor people used to stay in his dargah. Millions of non-Muslims accepted Islam at his hands, not as a result of any war but impressed by the sweetness of his character. He introduced the spiritual silsila in the Indian subcontinent through the Chishti sect; later, his followers like Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki, Fariduddin Masud Ganjeshkar, and Nizamuddin Auliya took the Sufi sect to a unique height in the history of the Indian subcontinent. This cult practice has spread beyond Asia and Europe in the last century.<sup>1</sup>

Currently, there are four sub-branches of the Chishti Tariqa. It is worth noting that the Chishti Tariqa, in principle, does not allow tariqa members to encounter the state. The Chishti Tariqa attaches great importance to one thing to its followers the purpose of man on earth is to live only for Allah and to worship Him. The Chishti sect is one of India's oldest and most established sects. It is best known for contributing to the spread of Islam in the region. The Chishtiyah sect, refounded by Mu'inuddin Hasan al-Chishti, is the first Islamic movement to emerge in the Indian subcontinent. This growing and expanding sect, under the leadership of Hasan al-Chishti, established itself at the centre of the Islamic orbit of the

---

<sup>1</sup> Vahit Göktaş vd., "Spirituality in the Context of Tablighi Jamaat and its Implication on Muslim Society: The Sufi Perspective." *International Journal of Social, Political and Economic Research* 9/2 (2022), 49-66.

whole of India within a short time. This tariqa succeeded in Islamizing India, Pakistan, and Bangladesh.<sup>2</sup>

*Wahdatul Wujud's theory* (the concept of the unity of existence) is seen in the intellectual infrastructure of the Chishti community. The tariqa places great importance on matters such as murakaba and samā'. Chishtīyah disciples were influential in the spread of Islam in various parts of the provincial areas of India. The Chishtīyah sect opposes private property, fearing it may alienate people from Allah. Members of the Tariqa do not value material things that give people pleasure. They stay away from violence and conflict. The Chishtīyah movement emphasises the importance of friendship and brotherhood. They strive to eradicate the feeling of revenge from people. They work to establish an orderly society free from corruption, strife and lies. It is worth noting that the Chishtīyah community, in principle, does not allow community members to meet the state. Akbar Shah, one of the greatest rulers in Indian history, was closely interested in the Chishtīyah sect. He showed respect to the Chishtīyah Pirs and Sheikhs of his time.

Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti was consistently vigilant in observing Shariat's rules. He did not tolerate any violation of Shariat, directly or indirectly. He strictly instructed his devotees to abide by the shariah. Even Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki wrote a book to be followed by Ahle Chishti and mentioned that the followers of Chishtīyah Tariqa could never violate the Shari'ah. Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki's self-authored *'Dalilul Arefin's* book, the eighth chapter, deals with this issue.<sup>3</sup>

His chief caliph was Khwaja Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki (d. 633 AH), who lived in Delhi. Iltutmish, the Muslim king of India, respected Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki very much. He was buried near the Qutub Minar in Delhi, and it became a tourist site. The following famous Chishti Sufi of Delhi is Khwaja Nizam Uddin Auliya (d. 725 AH), whose shrine is in Delhi. Sheikh Ankhi Siraj was the leading disciple who popularised Chishtīyah Tariqa in

---

<sup>2</sup> Saeyd Rashed Hasan Chowdury, *Bangladeş'te Tasavvufun ve Tarikatların Değerlendirilmesi, Sosyal Gelişimleri ve Oynadıkları rol: Yirmi Birinci Yüzyılda bir vak'a İncelemesi* (Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2019), 27.

<sup>3</sup> Saeyd Rashed Hasan Chowdury, "Bangladeş'te Tasavvuf Kültürü ve Temsilcileri", *Tematik Tasavvuf Toplantıları Fikriyat Kişiler Kurumlar*, haz. Ahmet Cahid Haksever (Ankara: Sonçağ, 2019), 33-52.

Bangladesh.<sup>4</sup> Another world-renowned scholar of the Chishtiyah sect is Fariduddin Masud Ganjeshkar (d. 668 AH), whose shrine is at Pakpattan in Punjab.<sup>5</sup> Some other world-renowned saints of the Chishtiyah Tariqa are Hazrat Shah Nasiruddin Cherahe Delhi (d.781 AH), Khwaja Alauddin Sabir Kaliari (d. 690 AH), Shaikh Shamsuddin Turk Panipati (d.718 AH), Khwaja Jalaluddin Qulbir Awliya (d. 765 AH) ), Khwaja Abdul Haq Radlabi (d. 837 AH), Khwaja Arif (d. 882 AH), Shah Abdul Quddus Ganguhi (d. 944 AH), Shaikh Jalaluddin Thanewari (d. 989 AH), Shaikh Nizamuddin Thanewari (d. 1024 AH), Khwaja Muhibullah Ilahabadi (d. 1058), Shah Abdul Bari Siddiqui (d.1226 AH), Miazi Noor Muhammad Jhanjhanabi (d.1259 AH), Haji Imdadullah Muhajir Makki (d.1346 AH); Hakimul Ummat Maulana Ashraf Ali Thanabi (d. 1342 AH), Qutbul Alam Maulana Rashid Ahmad Ganguhi (d.1323 AH), Shaikhul Hind Maulana Mahmud Hasan Deobandi (d. 1920) and Shaikhul Islam Maulana Hussain Ahmad Madani (d.1957 AD).

We have given great importance to the literature review while preparing the article. Since English, Hindi, Urdu, and Bengali<sup>6</sup> languages are ubiquitous and used in the countries of the Indian subcontinent, and our article is written in the English language, we have tried to review the information and references available in these languages about Munuddin Chishti.

As Mu'in al-Din Chishti was a famous Sufi scholar, there has been some recent research on him in Turkish. Ömer Tay did his PhD on Mu'in al-Din Chishti and Chishti Order<sup>7</sup> in the Turkish language, and we have taken various references from his thesis in this article. We have used Turkish references in some cases. Apart from this, we have reviewed articles by Ömer Tay like The Approach of the Chishtiyya Order to the Sama and Music and The Socio-Cultural Service of the Sufis to Islam in the Indian Subcontinent (Example of

---

<sup>4</sup> Vahit Göktaş- Saeyd Rashed Hasan Chowdury, "Freedom Of Religion, Faith and Religious Tolerance in Bangladesh: A Case Study on The Islamic Mysticism/Banglades'te Din Özürlüğü, İnanç ve Dinî Hoşgörü: İslâm Tasavvufu Üzerine Örnek Bir Araştırma." *Disiplinlerarası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 5 (2019), 41-67.

<sup>5</sup> Ömer Tay, "Hindistan'ın İslâmlaşmasında Sûfî Bir Mürşid: Ferîdüddîn Genc-İ Şeker Ve Tasavvuf Anlayışı". *Bingöl Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 18 (Aralık 2021), 175-188.

<sup>6</sup> Azmi Özcan, *Bengal* (Istanbul: DIA, 1992), 12-28.

<sup>7</sup> Ömer Tay, *Mu'üddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarikatı* (Erzurum: Atatürk Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2021), 1-5.

Chishtiyya Sect)<sup>8</sup> and another article by Ethem Cebecioğlu like "The Role of the Sufis in the Spread of Islam in South Asia."<sup>9</sup>

We have reviewed in depth various books and articles related to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, and his Tasawuf thought in different languages like Bengali, Hindi, and English languages, for example, the book of Anisul Arwa by Mu'in al-Din Chishti, Khwaja Garibe Nawaz by Arifur Rahman<sup>10</sup>, Chishti Kayam Darood and Salam by Syed Safiqul Islam Al Ansari. Besides, we have tried to take various references from Abuz Joha Noor Ahmed's book, Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti, Cherage Chishti<sup>11</sup>, written by Mohammad Mamunur Rashid and Abdur Rashid's biography of Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti. We have also reviewed an article in English by Nadeem, Habib, and Malik on the Sufi saint 'Khaja Gharib Nawaz' and his impact on the Indo-Pak subcontinent.

But we indeed get minimal academic narrative from these texts. Despite Mu'in al-Din Chishti being a famous Sufi of the Indian subcontinent, we have not found sufficient academic references. These works extensively cover his biography, but his Tasawwuf thought it is not much covered. In this article, we have tried to fill the gaps in the Tasawwuf thought of Chishti in these books. However, this article attempts to show how Mu'in al-Din Chishti established the Chishti Tariqa in the Indian subcontinent and how this tariqa has influenced Muslims Today.

### 1. Brief Review of Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Life and Philosophy

Islam and Muslims arrived in the Indian subcontinent long before Mu'in al-Din Chishti arrived in the Indian subcontinent. Many Sufi saints devoted themselves to spreading Islam in the Indian subcontinent. But with the arrival of Mu'in al-Din, there was a revolution in the propagation of Islam, which was transformed into a social revolution. In the 11th and 12th centuries AD, discrimination between people in the Indian subcontinent reached its peak. The upper-caste Hindu society looked down upon the lower castes of their

---

<sup>8</sup> Ömer Tay, "Hind Alt Kıtasında Sûfîlerin Sosyo-Kültürel Açından İslâm'a Olan Hizmetleri (Çiştîyye Tarikatı Örneği)", *İslara Uluslararası İslam Araştırmaları Kongresi Bildiriler Kitabı*, haz. Erdem Can Öztürk-Mahmud Esad Erkaya (Ankara: Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi, 2022), 183-194.

<sup>9</sup> Ethem Cebecioğlu, "Güney Asya'da İslâm'ın Yayılmasında Sufîlerin Rolü", *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 33/1 (1994), 158-178.

<sup>10</sup> Muhammad Arifur Rahman Nishan, *Khwaja Garibe Nawaz* (Chittagong: Muhammadi Qutubkhana Press, 2008), 76.

<sup>11</sup> Mohammad Mamunur Rashid, *Cherage Chishti* (Narayanganj: Hakimabad Khankaye Mozaddediya, 1989), 17.

religion with great disdain. Abu Rayhan al-Biruni's *Kitabul Hind* describes how the upper castes oppressed ordinary people. At that time, Mu'in al-Din Chishti broke the barriers of caste and untouchability and propagated the philosophy of Tawhid. Responding to his call, people started accepting Islam in groups and taking shelter under the cool shade of Islam.

### **1.1. Birth and Ancestry**

Mu'in al-Din Chishti is the most famous Sufi saint of the Indian subcontinent of the Chishti school. He was born in 1138 in the village of Sanjar in the Sistan state of Khorasan in Central Asia. His father's name is Syed Khwaja Ghiyas Uddin, mother's name is Syeda Ummul Wara Mahenur. On his father's side, he was the fourteenth descendant of Hazrat Ali; on his mother's side, he was the twelfth descendant of Hazrat Fatima.<sup>12</sup> Besides, he was a descendant of Abdul Kader Jilani. Later, his family migrated to the city of Khorasan in present-day Afghanistan. The word Chishti is added to the end of Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti's name due to his initiation into and representation of the Chishti Tariqa. Chishti is the name of a village. His seventh senior, Pir Khwaja Ishaq Chishti, lived in this village. He spread Islam with the name of Chishti Tariqa. Chishti's father died when he was fifteen, and his mother died a few days later.<sup>13</sup> He inherited an orchard; he continues to make a living through income.

### **1.2. Early Life and Educational Achievement**

Hazrat Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti first received his religious education from his father. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti's father was a devotee of Allah and a wealthy man. He always tried to lead his life according to the rules of the Quran and Hadith. Mu'in al-Din Chishti was brought up with great care and affection during childhood. The highly developed character qualities of a perfect human being are revealed in him. When Mu'in al-Din Chishti was seven, he prayed five times regularly.<sup>14</sup> He did not stop offering prayers; at this young age, he used to fast regularly and attend the dhikr program. When he reached the age of nine, he memorised the Quran. After that, under the overall supervision of his father for 13 years, he gained knowledge about the Quran, Hadith, Fiqh, Usul fiqh, Tafsir, Arabic Literature, Ethics, Philosophy of Wisdom etc. In addition, he learned from the famous

---

<sup>12</sup> Fariduddin Attar, *Tazkeratul Awliya* (Dhaka: Emdadia Library, 2001), 271.

<sup>13</sup> Attar, *Tazkeratul Awliya*, 271.

<sup>14</sup> Tay, *Mu'müddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*, 29-30.

Hadith scholar Abul Ma'ali on various matters of Shari'ah. Later, he studied for five years under the famous scholar Hazrat Sharfuddin of Samārkanđ and the famous muhaddith Hazrat Husamuddin of Bokhara.

### 1.3. Acquiring The Knowledge of Ilm Ma'refat and Taking Bai'at

He inherited an orchard from his father. One day he was watering his orchard when the famous Sufi Sheikh Ibrahim Kunduji came to his orchard. Mu'in al-Din was surprised to see him and entertained Kunduji with some fruits. Kunduji gave Mu'in al-Din a piece of bread and asked him to eat it. Ibrahim Kunduji influenced him. Later he distributed his property and other belongings among people experiencing poverty.

A deep attraction toward Islam was born in his mind. He gave away all his wealth to people experiencing poverty, left the world's illusion, and migrated to Samārkanđ in Bukhara for enlightenment and higher education. Then he accepted the discipleship of Maulana Sharfuddin and Maulana Hasan Uddin there. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti started travelling from Bokhara to Iraq for spiritual enlightenment and murshids. On the way to Harun in Nishapur, he met the famous Pir of the Chishtia Tariqa Usman Haruni. He was the great spiritual scholar of that time. Hazrat Osman Haruni lived in a small town called Harun near Nishapur. He was the murid and chief caliph of Sharif Jilani. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din became a murid to him on Wednesday, 11 Shawwal 560 AH, after Zohr prayer. After two and half years of becoming a murid, Hazrat Osman Haruni gave him the Caliphate of the Chishti Tariqa.<sup>15</sup>

Mu'in al-Din Chishti served Usman Haruni for twenty years. Taking leave of Usman Haruni, he reached Makkah through Damascus and Hejaz to perform Hajj, then went to Madinah and visited the grave of the Prophet (Pbuh). He then travelled towards Baghdad and met many Ulama-Mashaikhs on the way; Nazimuddin Cobra is notable among them. Al-Mustansir Billah was the caliph of Baghdad at that time. Mu'in al-Din Chishti met Shaikh Abdul Qadir Jilani and spent fifty-seven days in his presence. Abdul Qadir Jilani taught him Shari'at, Maarifat, Tariqat and Batini Ilm of Haqiqat. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti resumed his journey from Baghdad.<sup>16</sup> He reached Lahore in Pakistan via Syria, Kirman, Hamadan,

---

<sup>15</sup> Muhammad Tayyeb Nadeem vd., "Şufi Saint 'Khāwaja Gharīb Nawāz' and His Impact on Indo-Pak Subcontinent: An Analysis in the light of His Intuitive Role", *Al-Qamar* 4/1 (2021), 193-206.

<sup>16</sup> Tay, *Mu'innüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarikatı*, 44-47.

Tabriz, Herat, Isfahan, Astarabad, Sab jawar, Mihna, Balkh and Ghazni. He visited the shrine of Shaikh Ali Huzbiri in Lahore and proceeded to Delhi.

#### **1.4. Arriving in India**

He eventually came to India under the guidance of the famous scholar Hazrat Usman Haruni. At that time, all of India was full of kufr and shirk. There was the rule of tyrannical rulers. So, he first went to Delhi to spread Islam. Mu'in al-Din Chishti reached Ajmer from Delhi with forty followers on 10 Muharram 561 AH. There he established mosques, madrasas and khanqahs. There he devoted himself extensively to the propagation of Islam. At his call, non-Muslims accepted Islam in droves. Fearing the loss of the kingdom, the Hindu king started to persecute Mu'in al-Din Chishti and his followers in various ways. But none of the stateside strategies was successful for Mu'in al-Din Chishti's policy and Karamat. Instead, the number of his followers is increasing day by day. After that, he started spreading Islam independently, and millions of people were initiated into Islam.

Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti's selection of Ajmer for Dawat, Tabligh and Tajkiya was a spiritual victory. Due to his unwavering determination, high morale and boldness of faith, the light of Tawhid spread in the land devoid of true religion. As a result of his Taqwa, piety and self-sacrifice, the kingdom of kufr and shirk became the abode of Islamic knowledge and ulema.<sup>17</sup> Only through the efforts and influence of Khwaja Mu'inuddin that mosques and pulpits become visible where the darkness of shirk prevailed. Allahu Akbar resounded everywhere, filled with the poisonous vapour of idolatry and shirk. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti spent the rest of his life in Ajmer, spreading Islam, training, and teaching.<sup>18</sup> He appointed Khwaja Qutbuddin Bakhtiar as his successor in Delhi. On the other hand, Sultan Shamsuddin Altamash, his murid, expanded the empire, strengthened the foundation, and established justice.

#### **1.5. His Books**

Mu'in al-Din Chishti, at the age of 15, wrote a valuable book on Ilme Tasawwuf. He aspired to acquire deep knowledge in Tasawwuf and learned various subjects from world-famous Sufis and scholars. Later he wrote various books. Notable books written by him

---

<sup>17</sup> Syed Abul Hasan Ali Nadwi, *Tareekh e Dawat o Azeemat* (Lucknow: Nadwatul Ulama, 1997), 11-108.

<sup>18</sup> Islamic Foundation Bangladesh, *Islamic Encyclopaedia* (Dhaka: Islamic Foundation Bangladesh Publication, 1996), 727.



include (1) Anis-ul-Arwah, (2) Kanj-ul-Israr, (3) Hadis-ul-Ma'arif, (4) Risala Maujudia, (5) Diwane Khawaja, (6) Risalaye Dar Qasbe Lafus (7) Khairul Majalis (8) Fawaeduch Salekin (9) Rahatil Muhebbin (10) Fawaedul Fuad (11) Kashf-ul-Israr (12) Afaq-o-Anfas etc.<sup>19</sup>

### 1.6. Death

Hazrat Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti passed away on the night of the 5th Rajab 633 Hijri. He was then 97 years old. His eldest son Khwaja Fakhruddin Chishti led his funeral prayers. Mu'in al-Din is buried in Ajmer, India. Mughal Emperor Akbar built a beautiful mausoleum around his grave. In 978 Hijri, King Akbar built a mosque adjacent to the shrine of Mu'in al-Din. Ors, an Islamic program, is held annually from the 1st Rajab to the 6th Rajab at his tomb in Ajmer Sharif. The mosque is built of white and red marble. People of different religions, races and tribes gather from different countries. Ajmer Sharif has become a beautiful visiting place for people from all walks of life, irrespective of caste and religion. Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs, Buddhists, and Christians come here as visitors. The famous scholar of the subcontinent, Abdul Haque Muhaddith Dehlavi, in his well-known book Akhbarul Akhiyar, mentions that Hazrat Mu'in al-Din Chishti was one of the greatest Sufis of the Indian subcontinents. After his death, Muhaddith said, "Habibullah Mata fi Hubbillah", which means Allah's Habib (beloved) died in love with Allah.<sup>20</sup>

## 2. Re-founder of the Chishti Tariqa

Chishti Tariqa is a prevalent and influential Sufi order in various parts of the Muslim world, including the Indian subcontinent. There is disagreement about the founder of the Chishti sect. Abu Ishaq, the ninth male subordinate of Hazrat Ali, was the founder of the Chishti sect.<sup>21</sup> According to Abdulkhak Muhaddis Dihlavi, Khwaja Abdal Chishti is the founder of the Chishti sect.<sup>22</sup> Love, tolerance, and generosity are emphasised in Chishti Tariqa. This tradition originated around 930 in Chishti, a small town near Herat, Afghanistan. After Abu Ishaq Shami, the founder of the Chishti Tariqa, Mu'in al-Din Chishti

---

<sup>19</sup> Tay, *Mu'innüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*, 54.

<sup>20</sup> Sayyid Muhammad b. Mubarak Kirmani, *Siyar-ul-Auliya*, Urdu Trans. Ghulam Ahmed Biryani (Lahore: Mushtaq Book Corner, 2012), 47.

<sup>21</sup> Abush Joha Noor Ahmad, *Khaja Muinuddin Chishti* (Dhaka: Ahmad Publishing House, 1979), 11-36.

<sup>22</sup> Abdulkhak Muhaddis Dihlavi, *Ahbârü'l-Ahyâr fi Esrârü'l-Ebrâr* (Tehran: Encümen-i Âsâr-ı Mefâhir-i Ferhengî, 1963), 23.

is the eighth person in this sect.<sup>23</sup> Therefore, Mu'in al-Din Chishti brought this tariqa to Lahore and Ajmer in India in the middle of the 12th century. He became famous as one of the greatest Sufis on the Indian Subcontinent.<sup>24</sup> Mu'in al-Din Chishti transformed this Chishti Tariqa into an established Tariqa in his time. Due to this, Mu'in al-Din Chishti is considered the re-founder of the Chishti sect in the Indian subcontinent. Currently, there are several branches of this sect.

Later his followers like Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki, Farid Uddin Ganjshakar, Nizamuddin Auliya and many others took the Sufi movement to a unique height in the history of the Indian subcontinent.<sup>25</sup> However, among them, he assigned the responsibility of the caliphate to Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki and continued the continuity of this tariqa.<sup>26</sup> The two sub-sects of this sect are 'Nizamiya', named after the main caliph Sultanul Mashayekh Hazrat Nizam Uddin, and 'Saberiya', named after one of the caliphs Hazrat Makhdoom Ali Kaliari, still exist in the world. In the last century, the sect spread beyond Afghanistan and South Asia. Chishti Pirs and Murids have established their centres in the UK, USA, Australia, and South Africa.<sup>27</sup>

### **3. Mu'in Al-Din Chishti's Contribution to The Spread of Islam**

The rich and the poor were equally welcome in the Hazrat Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti's dargah. He loved impoverished people very much. That is why his widespread title is Garibe Nawaz. Such many people accepted Islam under the guidance of Mu'in Aldin Chishti. No other sage in history has recorded that so many people accepted Islam.<sup>28</sup> The famous historian and religious leader Khwaja Hasan Nizami reviewed various historical books and mentioned in his famous book Nizami Bansari that about one crore people accepted Islam at the hands of Mu'in Al-Din Chishti, and this is how Islam spread widely

---

<sup>23</sup> Tay, *Mu'innüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*, 149-153.

<sup>24</sup> Abdulkadir Aksöz, "Hindistan'ın En Yaygın Tarikatı, Çiştîyye", GZT.com (Retrieved 12 December 2022).

<sup>25</sup> Tay, "Hindistan'ın İslâmlaşmasında Sûfî Bir Mürşid: Ferîdüddîn Genc-i Şeker ve Tasavvuf Anlayışı", 175-188.

<sup>26</sup> Ibn Battuta, *Ibn Battuta Travel Book*, trans. A. Sait Aykut (Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications, 2000), 33-52.

<sup>27</sup> T.W. Arnold, *History of İntişar-ı İslam*, trans. Hasan Gündüzler (Ankara: Akçağ Publications, 1971), 47-83.

<sup>28</sup> Annemarie Schimmel, *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*, trans. Ergün Kocabıyık (Istanbul: Kabalcı Publications, 2016), 23.

throughout the Indian subcontinent.<sup>29</sup> Today more than five hundred million Muslims live in this subcontinent.<sup>30</sup> Mu'in Al-Din Chishti has been established as its primary foundation.

Hazrat Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti visited many countries. Before the visit, strict worship was performed by Murāqabah and Mushahada. During his travels, Hazrat Mu'in al-Din Chishti had the meet many Pirs. Even he met with Abdul Kader Jilani, who stayed with him for 57 days.<sup>31</sup> Abdul Kader Jilani told him the Belayat of Iraq had been given to Shihab al-Din 'Umar al Suhrawardi, and you have been given the belayat of Hindu places. Hazrat Mu'in al-Din Chishti came to India in 586 with only 40 travelling companions. After that, he invited Islam to the followers of different religions without interruption. He came from Arabia through Iraq, Iran, and Afghanistan, first to Lahore and then to Ajmer via Delhi.<sup>32</sup>

At that time, Ajmer in India was the main centre of Hindu religion and spirituality and imperial and Rajput power. On 10 Muharram 561 Hijri, Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti arrived in Ajmer from Delhi with forty dervishes. As a result of Mu'in al-Din's arrival in Ajmer, people started coming to his dargah in droves. At that time, the ruler of Ajmer was Prithviraj or Roy Pathura. At this, Prithviraj became angry with Mu'in al-Din Chishti and misbehaved with his murids and devotees. Prithviraj sent the famous sorcerer Ramedeo to overthrow Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti.<sup>33</sup> However, the sorcerer Ramedeo also succumbed to the overwhelming power of the Khwaja and took the name of Muhammad Satafi as a Muslim. King Prithviraj used to torture and humiliate a member of his court who was a follower of Mu'in al-Din Chishti. Mu'in al-Din Chishti wrote to Prithviraj seeking a remedy for Chishti. Prithviraj responded to the letter insultingly, saying that this man speaks big things that no one has ever said or heard after coming here. Khwaja Sahib was deeply offended by this behaviour of Prithviraj. The following quote came from his speech "Pithra zindah gereftam, wa Musalmanan dadem (I captured Prithviraj alive and gave it to the Muslims)". It is a historical fact that this statement of Mu'in al-Din became true.

---

<sup>29</sup> Khwaja Hasan Nizami, *Nizami Bansari* (Islamabad: Mushtaq Book Corner, 2015), 88-98.

<sup>30</sup> Azmi Özcan, *Muhammed Bahtiyar Halacî* (İstanbul: DIA, 2005), 7.

<sup>31</sup> Dilaver Güner, *Abdülkâdir Geylânî Hayatı, Eserleri, Görüşleri* (İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları, 2013), 3-7.

<sup>32</sup> Cebecioğlu, "Güney Asya'da İslâm'ın Yayılmasında Sufilerin Rolü", 158-178.

<sup>33</sup> Tay, "Hind Alt Kıtasında Sûfîlerin Sosyo-Kültürel Açından İslâm'a Olan Hizmetleri (Çiştîyye Tarikatı Örneği)", 183-194.

The ruler of Afghanistan's Ghor province was Moinuddin Muhammad bin Sam, also known as Shahabuddin Muhammad Ghori. According to historical accounts, Sultan Shihabuddin Muhammad Ghuri initially limited his campaign to North-West India. Muhammad Ghuri attacked India on the orders of Mu'in al-Din Chishti. In a fierce battle between the two near Delhi, 150 Indian nobles took Prithviraj's side. However, Ghori crushed all their resistance, and Prithviraj was captured alive and killed on Sultan's orders. In this way, the ordinary people, irrespective of caste and religion, were spared from the hands of this tyrant through the prayers of this great saint.

Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti's selection of Ajmer for Dawat, Tabligh and Tazqiya was a spiritual victory. Due to his unwavering determination, high morale and boldness of faith, the light of Tawheed spread in the land devoid of true religion. The more the number of Muslims in India increases till doomsday, and the more the spread of Islam continues, the more its reward will reach the soul of Shaikhul Islam Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Hasan Chishti.<sup>34</sup> Undoubtedly, the great sages of the Chishtia Silsila have an eternal claim and right over the Indian subcontinent.

During Mu'in al-Din Chishti's lifetime, India's political centre shifted from Ajmer to Delhi, and Ajmer lost its importance. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti appointed Khwaja Qutbuddin Bakhtiar as his successor in Delhi. On the other hand, Khadem Sultan Shamsuddin Altamash, his private devotee, expanded the empire, strengthened the foundation, and established justice.

#### **4. Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Doctrines and Perspective on Sufism**

Mu'in al-Din Chishti focused on the propagation and tabligh of Sufism rather than the philosophical dimension of Sufism. So, he did Dawah's work in Sufism rather than theory. However, he used terminology related to Sufism during the dawah work in his books. According to Islam, faith and morality are two essential elements of religion. From the beginning of the world to the end, Allah sent the Prophet to save humankind from deviation from the faith of Tawheed and moral degradation. The Sufis have always exalted moral virtues after Muhammad (pbuh) and his companions. This is because the Sufis gave spiritual initiation to people according to their moral level. In Sufism, more emphasis is

---

<sup>34</sup> Sayyid Muhammad b. Mubarak Kirmani, *Siyar-ul-Auliya*, 47.

placed on the practical side of character and morality than on other scientific approaches. For this reason, life practices of exemplary personalities were considered rather than theories of morality.<sup>35</sup>

The Sufis say that moral activities and virtues are as crucial as worship and dhikr in the Sufi life. Many Sufis began defining the term Sufism by pointing out its relationship to morality. For example, according to Abul-Husayn an-Nuri (d. 908), Sufism is not a ceremony or a body of knowledge; In contrast, Sufism is limited to ethics only. If Sufism were only a science, it would be acquired through learning. Hence, he developed a distinct definition of Sufism. Mu'in al-Din Chishti mentions Sufism as a similar subject. According to him, Sufism is neither a form nor a science; On the contrary, Sufism is an excellent and good morality.<sup>36</sup> Also, Abu Muhammad Serri (d. 923), Abu Bakr Kettani (d. 933) and Abu Muhammad Murtaish (d. 939) defined Sufism as good morals and ethics. Mu'in al-Din Chishti says that the hal (status) revealed by famous Sufis cannot be explained by apparent knowledge or rituals. Instead, through spirituality, people can gradually gain knowledge about these aspects.

According to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, a person does not become a Sufi merely by studying mysticism. The inner way of life gradually identifies one as a Sufi. A Sufi must have a proper understanding of the divine. The Sufi must surrender his will to the will of Allah. He should be kind, hospitable and courteous. He must have no arrogance and must be without any trace of superiority. He should be content, humble, and gentle. A Sufi should have the utmost trust in Allah.<sup>37</sup>

Mu'in al-Din Chishti says Tasawwuf is not a piece of general knowledge or rasam (conduct). Tasawwuf imbues man with a character comparable only to that of Redwan, the Guardian Angel of Heaven. It is a teaching by the Murshid in the way of Allah, leading to the annihilation of the self and reaching the Manzil (desired place). Tasawwuf is concerned with Allah's pleasure, which is not achieved through common sense or custom. Knowledge

---

<sup>35</sup> Ali b. Osman Hücvârî, *Keşfü'l-Mahcûb*, trans. Süleyman Uludağ (Istanbul: Dergâh Publications, 2018), 234.

<sup>36</sup> Mu'in al-Din Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, trans. Kafiluddin Ahmad Chishti (Dhaka: Chishtia Publications-Rashid Book House, 1993), 111.

<sup>37</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 111.

or manners do not help to form a disposition or character beloved of God and belonging to an entirely different world.<sup>38</sup>

#### 4.1. Al 'Arif (The knower of Allah)

The word "Arif" is an Arabic word. This word means "one who knows". It is a term used in Sufism. Arif is used for Sufis who have reached knowledge and truth with their spiritual experience. Arif is a person who learns and understands with the power of insight and profound experience for moral and spiritual refinement. The opposite of Alim is ignorant, and the opposite of Arif is a denier. Arif is a perfect man. 'Arif is gifted with divine knowledge (ma'rifa). 'Marifa is a light which Allah casts into the heart of whomsoever he wills.

Arifs are enemies of the world. They hate the mortal world and want a good relationship with Allah. They are free from the love of the world and repelled by the attraction of the world. The Arifs fell into many sorrows and shed many tears. Mu'in al-Din Chishti said the nearest God erases all their sorrows. Among the lovers of God, there is a group that rejoices significantly in the friendship of God. They do not care about any wealth in the world. They waste their lives only in the love of Allah. Then Mu'in al-Din Chishti said, Dawood Tayi came out of the mosque with his eyes closed and stood in the congregation. A dervish asked Shaikh if anything could be learned in this situation. He replied, *"Today, it has been 45 years since I closed these two eyes because I will not see anyone other than Allah. Because loving God and seeing others is contrary to love."*<sup>39</sup>

Khawaja Abu Saeed Abul Khair said Allah establishes His love in the heart of His servant whom He has allowed seeing or getting close to so that its perfection will last until the Day of Resurrection and will not be destroyed. Arif dissolves in Allah; he has no consciousness. Suppose he is asked where he has been or what he wants and will reply that he does not understand anything except the Great Creator alone.

In this context, Allah says,

أَقَمَّنْ شَرَحَ اللهُ صَدْرَهُ لِلْإِسْلَامِ فَهَوَى عَلَى نُورٍ مِنْ رَبِّهِ فَوَيْلٌ لِلْقَاسِيَةِ قُلُوبُهُمْ مِنْ ذِكْرِ اللَّهِ أَوْلَيْكَ فِي ضَلَالٍ مُبِينٍ.

---

<sup>38</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 111.

<sup>39</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 112-113.

"Those whose hearts Allah has widened for Islam rest on the light of Allah."<sup>40</sup>

If someone asks the meaning of this verse, the answer will be that Allah has developed the dignity of Arif through this verse. When Arif reached the level of wahdaniyat (belief in the oneness of God) and Jalal Rabubiyat, he became blind and did not pay attention to anything.

Mu'in al-Din Chishti said a lover should be conscientious about four things in love. First: Always be immersed in Allah's remembrance and be contented. Secondly, the level of perfection of dhikr should be reached. Third: Meditate so that the love of the world is removed. Fourthly, to always cry, i.e. to maintain the state where the mind dissolves in tears. Then there are four manjils for lovers, namely Mohabbat (love), Ilmiat (acquisition of knowledge), Haya (shame), and Tadhim (respect). A true lover (Mohabbat Sadiq) puts the Creator above all else and abides in His love.<sup>41</sup>

Hasan Basri was asked who Arif was. He replied that Arif is a person who has detached himself from the world and has spent all his wealth in the way of Allah. The purity of love is the nature of Arif. To sit with a pir or dervish and discuss the holy mind is the best thing in the world. Arif is perfect only when he has no desire to act according to his own will or does not wake up. Only the remembrance of Allah sustains him. A genuine Arif has no possessions or wealth.<sup>42</sup>

#### 4.2. Murāqabah (Sufi meditation)

In the Chishtīyah Tariqa, self-knowledge or training in body theory is emphasised. It is not possible for one to attain the perfection of this tariqa or to reach the stage of Sufi-Dervish until he has advanced to the final stage of this training. Similarly, in the Chishtīyah Tariqa, there is a provision for the special training of these twelve letters without nuqta (dot), Kalema Tayyyaba 'La-Ilaha Illallah', namely: Lam, Alif, Alif, Lam, Ha, Alif, Lam, Alif, Alif, Lam, Lam, and Ha. The Chishtīyah Tariqa are instructed to perform dhikr and Murāqabah with extreme caution. And on the path of tariqa, it is essential to follow every

---

<sup>40</sup> *Kur'ân-ı Kerim Meâli*, çev. Halil Altuntaş – Muzaffer Şahin (Ankara: Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı Yayınları, 2009), Zümer, 39/ 22.

<sup>41</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 113.

<sup>42</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 113-115.

instruction of one's Shaykh or Murshid. If someone wants to become a murid, he must first pray two rakat prayers and follow the instructions on various matters. Then the murid must recite the 99 names of Allah by the Pir. Otherwise, no Sālik (a follower of Sufism) can reach the ultimate path of Sufism.

The murid is ordered to go to any dargah and fast for 40 days. Eventually, he was considered a murid of the tariqa. There are specific rules to be followed in Chishtīyah Tariqa to do Murakaba. First, he has to recite Fateha and Sawab Resani. Then one Zarbi, two Zarbi, Isme Jaat, and thirteen Tasbeeh should be recited. Then the Murāqabah (meditation) will begin. Usually, Latifah must do Murāqabah.

*According to the Chishtīyah Tariqa, the human body has ten Latifa. These are 1. Kalb: two fingers below the left breast, slightly towards the chest; 2. Ruh: two fingers below the right breast, slightly towards the chest; 3. Sir: two fingers above the left breast, slightly towards the chest; 4. Khafi: in the place of prostration between the forehead; 5. Akhfā: middle of the scalp; 6. Nafs: Located in the navel; 7. water; 8. fire; 9. soil; and 10. the wind. The latter four are present everywhere in the body.<sup>43</sup>*

These ten lata'if have different uses while performing Murāqabah in the Chishtīyah Tariqa.

### **4.3. Suluk, Kashf and Karamat**

The literal meaning of the word Suluk is way, manners, exchange, customs etc. In Tasawwuf terms, it refers to the path or level of spiritual education. The path or road on which the ascetic devotee or spiritual person can attain nearness to God is divided into many levels. Salik must pass one level after another to reach the destination or the desired place. The aggregate of these layers is called suluk.<sup>44</sup>

Many shaykhs (pirs) and auliya of tariqa have prescribed 180 levels or steps of Suluk. The pirs of the Jonaidiya and Qadiriyya sects fixed the number of suluks to a hundred. The guardians of Dhul-Nun tariqa say that the number of this level is seven. The Mashaikh of Tabqatiya, Ibrahim and Bashrehani tariqas fixed the number of these levels at fifty. Bayazid Bastami, Abdullah Ibn Mubarak and Sufyan al-Thawri state that the total number of suluk is

---

<sup>43</sup> Saeyd Rashed Hasan Chowdury– Vahit Göktaş, "A Critical Analysis of Imam Rabbani Ahmad Sirhindi's Doctrines on Sufism", *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf dan Pemikiran Islam* 11/1 (2021), 93-121.

<sup>44</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 100.



45. There are 20 levels of suluk in the order of Shahsoja Kirmani, Samnun Muhebbā and Khwaja Miratish. According to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, the total number of levels of Suluk is 15. Then he said that between these levels, there is a level of Kashf and Karamat. Everyone should keep their secret at this level. A person who exposes himself to the level of Kashf and Karamat will be deprived of the front level. In those tariqas with a total of 180 levels, the level of Kashf and Karamat is the 80th. This level is 70 in Jonaidiya Tariqa. The status of Kashf and Karamat in Basharia Tariqa is at number 30. This level is number twenty-five in Dhul-Nun Misri Tariqa.<sup>45</sup>

This level is number ten near Shah Soza Kirmani. Kashf and Karamat are in the fifth position in Chishtīyah Tariqa. So, he will be successful and attains all the levels without exposing himself to the level of Kashf and Karamat. Revealing Kashf and Karamat at this level will result in disqualification from the remaining levels. Ahle Suluks have kept these layers so that it is easier for the Suluks to follow different paths.<sup>46</sup>

Moreover, the Suluks should also understand their level due to their situation and try to circumnavigate the levels accordingly. After passing through these prescribed levels, a person attains further higher levels and passes into the transcendental unconscious, absorbed in God's meditation. His separation is transformed into a union. Mu'in al-Din Chishti also said that among the Ummah of Muhammad (pbuh), extraordinary and incomparable personalities appeared, many of whom have died. After passing through those prescribed levels of Suluk, many are still present who have passed through thousands of higher levels. But they never revealed its secret. They never even noticed who and what they were.

#### 4.4. Dhikr (Remembrance of Allah)

There are thirteen types of Dhikrs in the Chishtīyah Tariqa. Through this high-level dhikr, first 'La-Ilaha Illallah', then 'Illallah', then 'Allahu Allah' and finally 'Allah' is recited. It is called dhikr of thirteen tasbeeh because it must be recited thirteen hundred times.<sup>47</sup> They used to wear colourful clothes during dhikr. A characteristic of the Chishtīyah Tariqa is the

---

<sup>45</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 101.

<sup>46</sup> Chishti, *Anis-ul-Arwah*, 143.

<sup>47</sup> Tay, *Mu'müddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarikatı*, 174.

predominance of love of Allah. Therefore, high status is observed among the pirs of this sect. They do not allow the words of Allah to be read from their tongues.

#### 4.5. Samā' (Spiritual concert)

As a word, samā' means hearing. On the other hand, in Sufi literature, it means to run and bend under the influence of music or any rhythmic sound. Also, samā' means reciting the Qur'an or hymns in a beautiful voice. Those who strictly adhere to the Shariah perspective that samā' is not haram in the total sense. They state that Samā' music can be used as vigilance and spiritual therapy under certain conditions. Chishti Sufis usually begin and end their samā' program by reciting the Qur'an. They have laid down some etiquette and manners for the Samā' programme.<sup>48</sup>

Abu Ishaq-i Shami is considered the founder of the Chishtīyah sect. He participated in the Samā' program when he came to Chishat City. Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Pir Osman Haruni continued to practice Samā'. This tradition continued and became more widespread after the migration of the Chishtia community to the Indian subcontinent by Mu'inuddin-i Chishti. Mu'inuddin-e Chishti enjoyed performing Samā', and sometimes he was influenced by Samā' music.<sup>49</sup> His samā' program was also attended by his caliph Qutbuddin Bakhtiar Kaki, Shahabuddin as-Suhrawardi, Khawaja Imaduddin Ali Faqeeh Kirmani and prominent Sufis of Baghdad. Mu'in al-Din Chishti's Khalifa Qutbuddin Bakhtiar passed away in Samā''s programme.

Mu'in al-Din Chishti quotes this Qur'anic verse regarding the legitimacy of Samā':

الَّذِينَ يَسْتَمِعُونَ الْقَوْلَ فَيَتَّبِعُونَ أَحْسَنَهُ أُولَئِكَ الَّذِينَ هَدَاهُمُ اللَّهُ وَأُولَئِكَ هُمْ أُولُو الْأَلْبَابِ.

*There are those who listen to the word and follow the best of it; these are the people whom Allah has guided. These are the people of intelligence themselves.*<sup>50</sup>

He argues that the word al-qawl (the word) is used in a general sense in this verse, so the Samā' is valid from the perspective of the Shari'ah. He says that the animal characteristics in man prevent the emergence of love and mystery, so there is no enthusiasm

<sup>48</sup> İsa Çelik- Ömer Tay, "Çiştīyye Tarikatının Semâ ve Mûsikîye Yaklaşımı", *Çukurova Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi (ÇÜİFD)* 21 / 1 (Haziran 2021), 210-230.

<sup>49</sup> Tay, *Mu'inüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştīyye Tarikatı*, 189.

<sup>50</sup> Zümer 39/ 18.

or joy in a man's heart. Therefore, through Samā', the human mind can be engrossed in the love of Allah.

The Samā' tradition of the Chishtīyah sect has continued in sequence since the beginning. Nizamuddin Awliya showed great passion for Samā' music. The love of Allah is increased by Samā' music. Hence the Mashaikhs of the Chishtīyah sect call Samā' the food of the soul. The 'Samā'' or 'Ma'rifati' song is prevalent among the Masaikhs of the Chishtīyah Tariqa. The samā' programs of the Chishtia community are held not only in dargahs and khankas but also at homes. After the samā' program, gifts and food are distributed. The Chishti community open their samā' program with Quran and ends with Quran. This tradition is inherited from Chishtia Pir Mimshad Ilvi Dinhini. According to the Chishtīyah, samā' is not just music; through it, one can realise spiritual secrets and truths. The Chishti community in the Indian subcontinent still emphasises Samā'. Samā' has not disappeared in the Chishti community as they consider it one of their traditions that has remained only from their ancestors.<sup>51</sup>

Nizamuddin Auliya shed light on the rules and procedures of the samā' program. He follows Imam Ghazali in saying about Sama that eight rules should be followed in the samā' program by which the samā' program will be observed perfectly.

- i. When Sufis want to perform samā', they must sincerely intend to perform the ceremony.
- ii. The area where the samā' program will be executed must be clear.
- iii. Only those who like samā' will be in the program.
- iv. All must wear perfume and nice clothes to attend the samā' program.
- v. Everyone should listen to the words of samā'.
- vi. Participants should not look too far to the right and left. They should think while listening to the samā' and be interested in the movements of the samā'.
- vii. The person in the samā' assembly must follow the Sama community.

---

<sup>51</sup> Çelik-Tay, "Çiştīyye Tarikatının Semâ Ve Mûsikîye Yaklaşımı", 210-230.

viii. Screaming should not be done while doing samā'. However, wailing may be done, and involuntarily dancing or spinning is permissible in a way that does not enter the Riya. Because crying alleviates sorrow and dancing evoke joy.<sup>52</sup>

A review of the procedure for conducting the samā' program reveals that the Chishti observe samā' in the same manner as the Mevlevis. The reason is that Fariduddin Masud Ganjeshkar of the Chishtīyah tariqa put his hand on his shoulder while standing for samā'.<sup>53</sup>

#### 4.6. Tawba (Repentance)

Sufis say that three conditions are necessary for repentance. The first condition is to be sincerely repentant after sinning. The second condition is to renounce sin, and the last is to resolve not to do all the sins committed in the past. Mu'in al-Din Chishti also mentions a few other conditions. The first is to stay away from the ignorant, the second is to abandon sin, and the third is to act according to Allah's orders and do more good deeds.<sup>54</sup>

Mu'in al-Din Chishti gave three pieces of advice to people to avoid sin. These are eating less, sleeping less, and talking less. He says that eating less, which is the first of these, corresponds to khawf (Fear) maqām in Sufism. Because with some food, one can eliminate many sins and avoid hellfire.<sup>55</sup> He said the second symptom is lack of sleep which corresponds to riḍā (رضا) maqām in Sufism. Less sleep led to greater diligence, increased devotion, and, consequently, closer to Paradise. He said that speaking less, the third and last sign corresponds to muhabbat maqām.<sup>56</sup> The depth of ijtiḥad and contemplation is achieved by speaking less. One becomes closer to Allah by continuing this state. Mu'in al-Din Chishti gave great importance to repentance for true struggle with self. According to him, the Saalikeen should stay away from the haram with his nafs and engage in the struggle to fulfil the obligation of shariah. According to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, the Saalikeen and disciple

<sup>52</sup> Ebû Hamîd Muhammed Gazâlî, *İhyâu Ulûmi'd-Dîn*, çev. Ahmed Serdaroğlu (İstanbul: Bedir Yayınları, 1975), 744-750.

<sup>53</sup> Muhammed b. Mübârek b. Muhammed Alevî Kirmânî Mîrhord, *Siyerü'l-Evliyâ* (Lahor: Müştâk Ahmed Yayınları, 1885), 504.

<sup>54</sup> Kutbeddin Bahtiyar Kaki b. Kemaleddin Ahmed b. Mûsâ al-Ûşî, *Delîlü'l-Ârifîn: Melfûzât-ı Mu'înüddîn Çiştî* (Lahor: Diyâü'l-Kuran, 1999), 111.

<sup>55</sup> Kutbeddin Bahtiyar Kaki, *Esrâr-i Hakîkî: Mektûbât-ı Mu'înüddîn-i Çiştî*, trans. Muhammed Ekber Kâdirî (Lahore: Ekber Beg Silrez Publications, 2004), 67.

<sup>56</sup> Mu'înüddîn-i Çiştî, *Divan-ı Hâce Mu'înüddîn-i Çiştî*, trans. Âreş Gûderzî (Pakistan: Çâphane Huaşe, 1944), 58-74.

should never commit sins but be sensitive. One should turn to Allah in repentance if one sins.<sup>57</sup>

#### 4.7. Zuhd (Asceticism)

Each of the Sufis interpreted zuhd in different ways based on their spiritual experience. Some have said that zuhd means avoiding what is forbidden. Others said to abandon the part of halal and mubah that is more than necessary. Mu'in al-Din Chishti accepted the world's love as the beginning of heresy. He felt one should flee from the world's love as the Sufis fled from hell. According to him, although people collect worldly goods with love and enthusiasm in the early years of their youth, they should give up this love of accumulation as they grow older. He said that Saalikeen should spend his accumulated worldly goods in the way of Allah. It is not for a Saalikeen to overthink worldly wealth. Because according to him, the more the Sufi values the world, the more he alienates himself from Almighty Allah.<sup>58</sup>

Dhul-Nun al-Misri was once asked about the characteristics of a true Sufi, and he gave a beautiful answer. He said a true Sufi is a person who has lost his heart for the pursuit of humanity and the love of the world. Mu'in al-Din Chishti believed a Sufi must shed his human garb and turn away from the world to reach heaven's realm.<sup>59</sup> As a result, Mu'in al-Din Chishti preferred to live a poor life. He did not care about worldly accumulation and preferred the spiritual life outwardly and inwardly. He advised his followers to work more, earn through their efforts, continue their lives, and try not to burden others. He wanted them to be ascetics, not in body but in their hearts.<sup>60</sup>

#### 4.8. Sabr (Patience)

Patience is a maqām that facilitates Sufi's path and helps him reach his goal. Patience means not being hasty to react and tolerating trouble or danger in people's way. The word patience is used more than a hundred times in the Quran.<sup>61</sup> It is considered one of the signs of piety in Sufism. Abdullah Ibn Abbas (ra) said there are three types of patience based on the Quranic verses. The first type is to be patient in fulfilling Allah's obligatory things. The

---

<sup>57</sup> Tay, *Mu'nuddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*, 61.

<sup>58</sup> Mu'nuddîn-i Çiştî, *En'sü'l-Ervâh*, trans. Hakîm Mutîü'r-rahmân (Lahor: Diyau'l-Kur'an, 1999), 15-34.

<sup>59</sup> Tay, *Mu'nuddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*, 62.

<sup>60</sup> Çiştî, *Divân-ı Hâce Mu'nuddîn-i Çiştî*, 58-66.

<sup>61</sup> Ebû Nasr Serrâc et-Tûsî, *el-Lüma'fi Tarihi't-Tasawwufi'l-Islami* (Beirut: Daru'l-Kütübü'l İlmîyye, 2001), 49.

second is to be patient to avoid engaging in what Allah has prohibited. The third is to be patient when faced with adversity.<sup>62</sup>

Mu'in al-Din Chishti describes patience as an essential maqām (position). He identified the servant's shouting and displeasure in distress as a rebellion against Allah. According to him, the servant who does this will be cursed by Allah, his worship will be destroyed, and Allah will not look upon him with mercy. Mu'in al-Din Chishti did not only ask for abundance from Allah as ordinary people demand abundance. He did not see any difference between blessings and hardships from Allah. But he used to ask Allah for strength to persevere in trouble.<sup>63</sup>

#### 4.9. Ma'rifat (The Divine Gnosis)

Mu'in al-Din Chishti quotes a verse from the Quran. Allah says:

وَمَا خَلَقْتُ الْجِنَّ وَالْإِنْسَ إِلَّا لِيَعْبُدُونِ.

*I have created the Jinn and humankind so they may worship Me.*<sup>64</sup>

The famous commentator Mujahidin (d. 722) and one of the early Sufis, Abu'l-Nuri (d. 908), interpreted the word لِيَعْبُدُونِ as لِيَعْرِفُونِ, meaning to recognise and know Allah. Mu'in al-Din Chishti uses this verse to refer to the terms Arif and Ma'rifat in Sufism.<sup>65</sup> According to him, an Arif is a person in constant contact with Allah and sees all things with contemplation.<sup>66</sup>

Arif must be calm and dignified so that Allah fulfils his will. He must be knowledgeable and properly understand the various maqāms of Sufism. He must always be prepared for death. In Sufism, the position of Ma'rifat is so high that when a Saalikeen reaches this position, he becomes closer to Allah.<sup>67</sup> According to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, a Saalikeen must acquire certain qualities to attain Ma'rifat. The first is that Arif must possess

<sup>62</sup> Çiştî, *Divân-ı Hâce Muînüddîn-i Çiştî*, 67-74.

<sup>63</sup> Tay, *Muînüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarikatı*, 66.

<sup>64</sup> Zâriyât 51/ 56.

<sup>65</sup> Hâdim Hasan Shah Zübeyrî. *Muînü'l-Ervâh*. (Ecmîr: Mühÿ'l-Evkâf, 1983), 19.

<sup>66</sup> Kâkî, *Delîlü'l-Ârifîn*, 39; Zübeyrî, *Muînü'l-Ervâh*, 133; Serrâc, *el-Lüma'*, 37.

<sup>67</sup> Tay, *Muînüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarikatı*, 74.

certain qualities so that divine revelation and light will flow upon him. His heart is always directed towards Allah, and Allah fulfils his will.<sup>68</sup>

#### 4.10. Tawakkul (Reliance)

One of the good qualities and status that a Sufi should acquire in himself is Tawakkul. Sufis will make every effort necessary to achieve the desired goal in any work. After that, leaving the responsibility of the work to Almighty Allah is understood as Tawakkul. Tawakkul means trusting in what is in the sight of Almighty Allah and not placing hope in what is in the hands of man.<sup>69</sup> The Tawakkul of the Sufis is gratitude for what Allah has given and obedience to what is destined. The people of Tawakkul attain peace of heart without any hope.<sup>70</sup> His heart is attached to Almighty Allah. The people of Tawakkul do not want to get any results with their general knowledge. They always trust Almighty Allah to get results.<sup>71</sup>

According to Mu'in al-Din Chishti, a true Sufi does not tell anyone about the persecution and suffering he has suffered from the public. He is patient when Allah tests him. He does not doubt or object with his heart or tongue. Surrender to Allah Almighty in all his affairs.<sup>72</sup> Mu'in al-Din Chishti defines the Tawakkul of the Sufis as not praising anything other than Almighty Allah. The higher the knowledge and status of the person, the higher the level of tawakkul.<sup>73</sup> Mu'in al-Din Chishti shares the same thoughts as Junaid Baghdadi about tawakkul. He felt that a Sufi must be purified from envy and pride in his heart to attain the status of Tawakkul. Otherwise, it will not be possible to reach the maqâm of Tawakkul.<sup>74</sup>

#### Conclusion

After the time of Prophet Muhammad (Pbuh) and his companions, the Sufi saints were responsible for spreading his preached Islam to the world. They travelled far, risking

---

<sup>68</sup> Çiştî, *Enîsü'l-Ervâh*, 10-28.

<sup>69</sup> *Selçuk Eraydın, Sufism and Sects* (Istanbul: Marmara University Faculty of Theology Publications, 2000), 166; Sarraj, *al-Luma*, 49.

<sup>70</sup> Abdu'l-Kerim b. Hevâzin Kuşeyrî, *er-Risâletü'l-Kuseyriyye fî İlmi't-Tasawwuf* (Beirut: Dâru'l- Cîl, 1990), 162.

<sup>71</sup> Ebû Bekr Muhammed b. İshâk Buhârî Kelâbâzî, *et-Ta'arruf li-Mezhebi Ehli't-Tasavvuf* (Beyrut: Dâru'l-kütübî'l-'ilmiyye, 2001), 66.

<sup>72</sup> Tay, *Muînüddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*, 68.

<sup>73</sup> Kâkî, *Delîlü'l-Ârifîn*, 39-52; Zübeyrî, *Muînü'l-Ervâh*, 133-140.

<sup>74</sup> Ebû Tâlib Mekkî, *Kûtu'l-Kulûb fî Mu'âmeleti'l-Mahbûb* (Mısır: 1306), 25-26.

their lives, and established Islam properly. One such great saint is Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti. He was a historical Sufi figure legendary in the spread of Islam in the Indian subcontinent and a global spiritual inspiration living in the 12th century. He lived his life following the teachings of the Quran and Sunnah. He significantly contributed to the expansion of Islam in South Asia by introducing and founding the Chisti order there. He invited people to Islam, and through him, many people accepted Islam.<sup>75</sup> He was kind-hearted, and his character and character were great strengths. He had the utmost respect and admiration for his spiritual teacher and leader, and he constantly gave off the impression of being melancholy and contemplative. He was blessed with various Karamat from Allah since his childhood. In addition, he achieved spiritual perfection through rigorous worship, Riyazat, Moraqaba and Moshahada. That is why all, irrespective of caste and religion, were drawn to his company and had sincere devotion and respect for him.

He introduced the spiritual movement or Silsilah through the Chishti movement in India; Later, his followers like Qutubuddin Bakhtiyar Kaki, Fariduddin Masud Ganjeshkar, Nizamuddin Auliya and many others took the Sufi movement to unique heights in Indian history. The contribution of this Chishti Tariqa to the spread of Islam in the Indian subcontinent, in the field of Dawat-Tajdid and in building the foundation and structure of Islamic civilisation and culture is undeniable. He would initiate his followers into the esoteric mysteries of Sufi philosophy. In the Chishtiya Tarika, self-knowledge or the practice of body theory is particularly important. One cannot achieve perfection in this method or reach the stage of Insan Kamel until he has advanced to the final stage of this training.

Most of the followers of Sufism in the Indian subcontinent are claimants of the Chishti Tariqa. Some believe Allah's commands and prohibitions are forgiven if they become disciples. But they do not know that the law rules are the means of sustaining their existence. So, excluding these is a far cry from being Tasawwuf; Getting the right to enter the world of Sufism is impossible. Khwaja Mu'in al-Din Chishti was consistently vigilant in observing Sharia's rules. He did not tolerate any violation of Sharia, directly or indirectly. He used to instruct his devotees to abide by the Sharia. He composed a book and gave it to his murid Hazrat Khwaja Qutb Uddin Bakhtiyar so that the followers of the Chishtiyya

---

<sup>75</sup> Tay, "Hind Alt Kıtasında Sûfîlerin Sosyo-Kültürel Açısından İslâm'a Olan Hizmetleri (Çiştîyye Tarikatı Örneği)", 183-194.



Tariqa could never violate the Sharia. Qutub Uddin Bakhtiyar has recorded this in the eighth chapter of his book *Dalilul Arefin*.

This cult practice has spread beyond Afghanistan and South Asia in the last century. There are several branches of the Chisti sect. The Chishti Pirs and disciples have established their centres and circles in the United Kingdom, United States, Australia and South Africa.

In this study, an attempt has been made to shed light on the biography of Mu'in al-Din Chishti and his thinking. Mu'in al-Din Chishti is not only an ordinary person but also an influential scholar in the Muslim world. So, it demands more research about him. It is expected that future researchers can make essential contributions to academia by using our research as a reference.

## References/ Kaynakça

- Attar, Fariduddin. *Tazkeratul Awliya*. Dhaka: Emdadia Library, 2001.
- Ahmad, Abush Joha Noor. *Khaja Muinuddin Chishti*. Dhaka: Ahmad Publishing House, 1979.
- Aksöz Abdulkadir. "Hindistan'ın En Yaygın Tarikatı, Çiştîyye". GZT.com. Retrieved 12 December 2022.
- Arnold, T.W. *History of İntişar-ı İslam*, trans. Hasan Gündüzler. Ankara: Akçağ Publications, 1971.
- Battuta, Ibn, Abu Abdullah Muhammed b. Abdullah b. Muhammed b. İbrahim el-Levâtî et-Tancî. *Ibn Battuta Travel Book*, trans. A. Sait Aykut. Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications, 2000.
- Bangladesh, Islamic Foundation. *Islamic Encyclopaedia*. Dhaka: Islamic Foundation Bangladesh Publication, 1996.
- Cebecioğlu, Ethem. "Güney Asya'da İslâm'ın Yayılmasında Sufîlerin Rolü", *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 33/1 (1994), 158-178.
- Chowdury, Saeyd Rashed Hasan– Göktaş, Vahit. "A Critical Analysis of Imam Rabbani Ahmad Sirhindi's Doctrines on Sufism", *Teosofi: Jurnal Tasawuf dan Pemikiran Islam* 11/1 (2021), 93-121.
- Chowdury, Saeyd Rashed Hasan. *Bangladeş'te Tasavvufun ve Tarikatların Değerlendirilmesi, Sosyal Gelişimleri ve Oynadıkları rol: Yirmi Birinci Yüzyılda bir vak'a İncelemesi*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2019.
- Chowdury, Saeyd Raashed Hasan. "Bangladeş'te Tasavvuf Kültürü ve Temsilcileri", *Tematik Tasavvuf Toplantıları Fikriyat Kişiler Kurumlar*, haz. Ahmet Cahid Haksever. 33-52. Ankara: Sonçağ, 2019.
- Chishti, Mu'in al-Din. *Anis-ul-Arwah*, trans. Kafiluddin Ahmad Chishti. Dhaka: Chishtia Publications- Rashid Book House, 1993.
- Çelik, İsa-Tay, Ömer. "Çiştîyye Tarikatının Semâ ve Mûsikîye Yaklaşımı". *Çukurova Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi (ÇÜİFD)* 21 / 1 (Haziran 2021), 210-230. <https://doi.org/10.30627/cuilah.796364>
- Çiştî, Muînüddîn-i. *Enîsü'l-Ervâh*, trans. Hakîm Mutîü'r-rahmân. Lahor: Diyau'l-Kur'an, 1999.
- Çiştî, Muînüddîn-i Çiştî. *Divân-ı Hâce Muînüddîn-i Çiştî*, trans. Âreş Gûderzî. Pakistan: Çâphane Huaşe, 1944.
- Dihlavi, Abdulhak Muhaddis. *Ahbârü'l-Ahyâr fi Esrâri'l-Ebrâr*. Tehran: Encümen-i Âsâr-ı Mefâhir-i Ferhengî, 1963.
- Et-Tûsî, Ebû Nasr Serrâc. *el-Lüma'fî Tarihi't-Tasawwuf'l-Islami*. Beirut: Daru'l-Kütübü'l İlmîyye, 2001.
- Gazâlî, Ebû Hamîd Muhammed. *İhyâu Ulûmi'd-Dîn*. trans. Ahmed Serdaroğlu. İstanbul: Bedir Yayınları, 1975.

- Göktaş, Vahit vd., "Spirituality in the Context of Tablighi Jamaat and its Implication on Muslim Society: The Sufi Perspective." *International Journal of Social, Political and Economic Research* 9/2 (2022), 49-66.
- Göktaş, Vahit – Chowdury, Saeyd Rashed Hasan."Freedom Of Religion, Faith and Religious Tolerance in Bangladesh: A Case Study on The Islamic Mysticism/Bangladeş'te Din Özürlüğü, İnanç ve Dinî Hoşgörü: İslâm Tasavvufu Üzerine Örnek Bir Araştırma". *Disiplinlerarası Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 5 (2019), 41-67.
- Gürer, Dilaver. *Abdülkâdir Geylânî Hayatı, Eserleri, Görüşleri*. İstanbul: İnsan Yayınları, 2013.
- Hücvîrî, Ali b. Osman. *Keşfü'l-Mahcûb*, trans. Süleyman Uludağ. İstanbul: Dergâh Publications, 2018.
- Kaki, Kutbeddin Bahtiyar b. Kemaleddin Ahmed b. Mûsâ al-Ûşî. *Delîlü'l-Ârifîn: Melfûzât-ı Mu'înüddîn Çiştî*. Lahor: Diyâü'l-Kuran, 1999.
- Kakî, Kutbeddin Bahtiyar. *Esrâr-i Hakîkî: Mektûbât-ı Mu'înüddîn-i Çiştî*. Trans.: Muhammed Ekber Kâdirî. Lahore: Ekber Beg Sîlrez Publications, 2004.
- Kelâbâzî, Ebû Bekr Muhammed b. İshâk Buhârî. *et-Ta'arruf li-Mezhebi Ehli't-Tasavvuf*. Beyrut: Dâru'l-kütübi'l-İlmiyye, 2001.
- Kirmani, Sayyid Muhammad b. Mubarak. *Siyar-ul-Auliya*. Urdu Trans. Ghulam Ahmed Biryani. Lahore: Mushtaq Book Corner, 2012.
- Kur'ân-ı Kerîm Meâli*, çev. Halil Altuntaş – Muzaffer Şahin. Ankara: Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı Yayınları, 3. Basım, 2009.
- Kuşeyrî, Abdu'l-Kerim b. Hevâzin. *er-Risâletü'l-Kuseyriyye fî İlmi't-Tasawwuf*. Beirut: Dâru'l-Cîl, 1990.
- Mekkî, Ebû Tâlib. *Kâtu'l-Kulûb fî Mu'âmeleti'l-Mahbûb*. Mısır: 1306.
- Mîrhord, Muhammed b. Mübârek b. Muhammed Alevî Kirmânî. *Siyerü'l-Evliyâ'*. Lahor: Müştâk Ahmed Yayınları, 1885.
- Nadbi, Syed Abul Hasan Ali Nadbi. *Tareekh e Dawat o Azeemat*. Lucknow: Nadwatul Ulama, 1997.
- Nadeem, Muhammad Tayyeb vd., "Şufî Saint' Khâwaja Gharîb Nawâz'and His Impact on Indo-Pak Subcontinent: An Analysis in the light of His Intuitive Role", *Al-Qamar* 4/1 (2021), 193-206.
- Nizami, Khwaja, Hasan. *Nizami Bansari*. Islamabad: Mushtaq Book Corner, 2015.
- Nishan, Muhammad Arifur Rahman. *Khwaja Garibe Nawaz*. Chittagong: Muhammadi Qutubkhana Press, 2008.
- Özcan, Azmi. *Bengal*. İstanbul: DIA, 1992.
- Özcan, Azmi. *"Muhammed Bahtiyar Halacî"*. İstanbul: DIA, 2005.
- Rashid, Mohammad Mamunur. *Cherage Chishti*. Narayanganj: Hakimabad Khankaye Mozaddediya, 1989.
- Schimmel, Annemarie. *Mystical Dimensions of Islam*, trans. Ergün Kocabıyık. İstanbul: Kabalcı Publications, 2016.

- Tay, Ömer. *Mu'înuddîn-i Çiştî ve Çiştîyye Tarîkatı*. Erzurum: Atatürk Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2021.
- Tay, Ömer. "Hindistan'ın İslâmlaşmasında Sûfî Bir Mürşid: Ferîdüddîn Genc-İ Şeker Ve Tasavvuf Anlayışı". *Bingöl Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 18 (Aralık 2021), 175-188.
- Tay, Ömer. Hind Alt Kıtasında Sûfîlerin Sosyo-Kültürel Açından İslâm'a Olan Hizmetleri (Çiştîyye Tarikatı Örneği), *İslara Uluslararası İslam Araştırmaları Kongresi Bildiriler Kitabı*. haz. Erdem Can Öztürk-Mahmud Esad Erkaya. 183-194. Ankara: Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli Üniversitesi, 2022.
- Zübeyrî, Hâdim Hasan Shah. *Mu'înü'l-Ervâh*. Ecmîr: Mühyi'l-Evkâf, 1983.



## Attitudes to Violence and Spiritual Well-Being among Married Individuals

*Evlü Bireylerde Şiddete Yönelik Tutum ve Manevi İyi Olma*

**Tuğçe KARADEMİR**

ORCID: 0000-0002-0985-215X

E-Posta [tugcekarademir@gmail.com](mailto:tugcekarademir@gmail.com)

PhD. Student, Akdeniz University Institute of Social  
Sciences, Philosophy and Religious Sciences,

*Doktora Öğrencisi, Akdeniz Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü*  
*Felsefe ve Din Bilimleri,*

Antalya -Türkiye

ROR ID: 01m59r132

**Sema ERYÜCEL**

ORCID: 0000-0001-5583-8204

E-Posta [semaeryucel@akdeniz.edu.tr](mailto:semaeryucel@akdeniz.edu.tr)

Assoc. Prof. Akdeniz University, Faculty of Theology,  
Department of Psychology of Religion,

*Doç. Dr., Akdeniz Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Din Psikolojisi*

*Anabilim Dalı,*

Antalya-Türkiye

ROR ID: 01m59r132

### Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

**Citation / Atıf:** Karademir, Tuğçe - Eryücel, Sema. "Attitudes to Violence and Spiritual Well-Being among Married Individuals". *Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31 (Haziran 2023), 77-99. <https://doi.org/10.35415/sirnakifd.1257691>

Date of Submission ( <i>Geliş Tarihi</i> )	28. 02. 2023
Date of Acceptance ( <i>Kabul Tarihi</i> )	11. 04. 2023
Date of Publication ( <i>Yayın Tarihi</i> )	15. 06. 2023
Article Type ( <i>Makale Türü</i> )	Research Article ( <i>Araştırma Makalesi</i> )
Peer-Review ( <i>Değerlendirme</i> )	Double anonymized - Two External ( <i>İki Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körlme</i> ).
Ethical Statement ( <i>Etik Beyan</i> )	This article reproduced from dissertation named "Attitudes to Violence and Spiritual Well-Being Among Married Individuals" and supervised by Associate Prof. Sema Eryücel (Master Dissertation, Akdeniz University, Antalya, 2021) ( <i>Bu makale Doç Dr. Sema Eryücel tarafından yönetilen "Evlü Bireylerde Şiddete Yönelik Tutumlar ve Manevi İyi Oluş" isimli doktora tezinden üretilmiştir (Yüksek Lisans Tezi, Akdeniz Üniversitesi, Antalya, 2021).</i> It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited. ( <i>Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.</i> )
Plagiarism Checks ( <i>Benzerlik Taraması</i> )	Yes ( <i>Evet</i> ) – Turnitin / Ithenticate.
Conflicts of Interest ( <i>Çıkar Çatışması</i> )	The author(s) has no conflict of interest to declare. ( <i>Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.</i> )
Complaints ( <i>Etik Beyan Adresi</i> )	<a href="mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com">suifdergi@gmail.com</a>
Grant Support ( <i>Finansman</i> )	The author(s) acknowledge that they received no external funding in support of this research. ( <i>Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır.</i> )
Copyright & License ( <i>Telif Hakkı ve Lisans</i> )	Authors publishing with the journal retain the copyright to their work licensed under the CC BY-NC 4.0. ( <i>Yazarlar dergide yayımlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmaları CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.</i> )

## **Abstract**

The most common domestic violence is spousal violence against women in Turkey. Although spousal violence may seem to be concerning two people in an intimate relationship, it is actually considered as one of the problems that goes beyond the family and affects the peace of the society. Spiritual well-being discusses the relationship between the meaning of life, the pleasure or satisfaction one receives from this life, and the values that can be called spiritual. In this respect, it is a type of well-being and includes both spirituality and well-being. Studies show that religious commitment prevents spousal violence; spirituality and religious commitment reduce violence against married women and increase marital satisfaction. This study aims to examine the relationship between married individuals' attitudes towards violence and their spiritual well-being scores. The research was carried out with married participants living in Muratpaşa, Antalya. Married participants did not participate in the study as couples, but as individuals. 269 (56.8%) participants were female and 205 (43.2%) were male, and thus, the data of 474 participants were studied in the research. Intimate Violence Responsibility Scale (IVRS) and Spiritual Well-Being Scale forms and socio-demographic information form were applied to the participants. SPSS 22.0 was used for the statistical analysis of the data obtained from the scales while descriptive statistics T-Test and Anova-Tukey were performed during the evaluation phase. It was determined that the data set showed a normal distribution and parametric tests were used. The relationship between dependent and independent variables was tested with Pearson correlation. When the sub-dimensions of attitude towards violence and spiritual well-being are examined in terms of gender variable, the sub-dimension of violence was significantly higher in women while control and abuse sub-dimensions were significantly higher in men. It is observed that gender does not differ between the sub-scores of spiritual well-being. This situation can be evaluated as the factors that create spiritual feelings do not create differences between genders in society as a supra-gender phenomenon. When the sub-dimensions of attitudes towards violence of the participants and their spouses are compared in terms of the age variable, it is seen that the control attitude towards violence of the older age (66 years and over) participants is lower than the younger participants. According to the findings related to education, it was found that those who graduated from high school had significantly less control and abuse mean scores than other education levels. In addition, no significant relationship was found between the education level of high school students and the violence sub-dimension. According to the study, those with a low level of education exhibit more verbal violence than those with a higher education level. It is expected that violence will decrease with the increase in the level of education, but the reason for the contradictory data in the literature may be related to the quality of education. Carrying out new studies on this issue may be useful. According to the research findings, while there was a significant negative relationship between the sub-dimensions of transcendence and violence and the sub-dimensions of control and abuse, a positive relationship was found between harmony with nature, violence, control and abuse. It has been found that spiritual well-being (transcendence) increased, and the scores of attitude towards violence decreased. In this sense, it is suggested that spiritual education programs will be influential in changing the attitudes towards violence. It is suggested that it would be beneficial to include spiritual education in education programs.

**Keywords:** Psychology of Religion, Violence in Intimate Relationships, Spiritual Well-being, Married Individuals.

## Özet

Ülkemizde, aile içi şiddetin en yaygın türü, kadına yönelik eş şiddetidir. Eş şiddeti her ne kadar yakın ilişki içindeki iki kişiyi ilgilendiren bir durum olarak görünse de aslında ailenin sınırını aşan ve toplumun huzurunu etkileyen sorunlardan biri olarak değerlendirilmektedir. Manevi iyi oluş, hayatın anlamının, insanın bu hayattan aldığı hazzın veya memnuniyetin, manevi denilebilecek değerlerle ilişkisini tartışmaktadır. Bu açıdan iyilik halinin bir türüdür ve bünyesinde hem maneviliği hem de iyilik halini barındırmaktadır. Araştırmalar dini bağlılığın eş şiddetinin oluşmasını engellediğini, maneviyatın ve dini bağlılığın evli kadınlara karşı şiddeti azalttığı ve evlilik doyumunu arttırdığını göstermektedir. Bu araştırmanın amacı, evli bireylerin şiddete yönelik tutumları ve manevi iyi oluş puanları arasındaki ilişkiyi incelemektir. Araştırma, Antalya/ Muratpaşa'da ikamet eden, evli katılımcılar ile gerçekleştirilmiştir. Evli bireyler, çift olarak ele alınmamış, bireysel katılım sağlanmıştır. Araştırmaya %56,8 'sı (269 kişi) kadınlardan %43,2'si (205 kişi) erkeklerden olmak üzere toplam 474 katılımcının verileri dâhil edilmiştir. Katılımcılara, Yakın İlişkilerde Şiddete Yönelik Tutum ve Spiritüel İyi Oluş Ölçeklerinin formları ile sosyo- demografik bilgi formu uygulanmıştır. Ölçeklerden elde edilen verilerin istatistiksel analizi için SPSS 22.0 bilgisayar programı kullanılmıştır. Veri setinin normal dağılım gösterdiği belirlenmiş ve parametrik testler kullanılmıştır. Değerlendirme aşamasında tanımlayıcı istatistik, T-Testi ve Anova-Tukey yapılmıştır. Bağımlı ve bağımsız değişkenler arasındaki ilişki Pearson korelasyon ile test edilmiştir. Cinsiyet değişkeni bakımından şiddete yönelik tutum ve manevi iyi olma alt boyutları incelendiğinde, şiddet alt boyutunun kadınlarda anlamlı düzeyde yüksek; kontrol ve istismar alt boyutlarının ise erkeklerde anlamlı düzeyde yüksek olduğu sonucu elde edilmiştir. Cinsiyetin, manevi iyi oluşun alt puanları arasında farklılaşmadığı görülmektedir. Bu durum manevi duyguları oluşturan faktörlerin cinsiyet üstü birer olgu olarak toplumda cinsiyetler arası farklılığı oluşturmadığı şeklinde değerlendirilebilir. Yaş değişkeni bakımından katılımcıların ve eşlerinin şiddete yönelik tutum alt boyutları karşılaştırıldığında ileri yaş (66 yaş ve üzeri) katılımcıların şiddete ilişkin kontrol tutumunun kendilerinden genç katılımcılara kıyasla daha düşük düzeyde olduğu görülmektedir. Eğitim ile ilgili elde edilen bulgulara göre ise lise mezunu olanların diğer eğitim düzeylerinden anlamlı olarak daha az kontrol ve istismar ortalama puanına sahip oldukları tespit edilmiştir. Ayrıca eğitim düzeyi lise olan katılımcılar ile şiddet alt boyutu arasında da anlamlı ilişki bulunmamıştır. Buna göre eğitim düzeyi düşük olanlar yüksek olanlara oranla daha fazla sözel şiddet sergilemektedir. Eğitim düzeyinin artması ile şiddetin düşmesi beklenilmektedir ancak alan yazında bulunan verilerin çelişkili çıkma nedeni eğitimin niteliği ile ilgili olabilir. Bu konu ile ilgili yapılacak yeni çalışmalar faydalı olabilir. Araştırma bulgularına göre aşkınlık ve şiddet alt boyutları ile kontrol ve istismar alt boyutları arasında anlamlı negatif ilişki bulunurken doğayla uyum; şiddet, kontrol, istismar arasında pozitif yönlü bir ilişkiye rastlanılmıştır. Manevi iyi oluşun (aşkınlık) artmasıyla şiddete yönelik tutum puanlarının düştüğü tespit edilmiştir. Ayrıca aşkınlık alt boyutuna ilişkin olarak dini ve manevi değerlerin şiddeti azaltmada önemli rol oynadığını belirten çalışmalar mevcuttur. Bu anlamda manevi eğitim programlarının şiddet tutumlarının değiştirilmesinde faydalı olacağı değerlendirilmektedir. Eğitim programları içinde manevi eğitimlere yer verilmesinin faydalı olacağı değerlendirilmektedir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Din Psikolojisi, Yakın İlişkilerde Şiddet, Manevi İyi Oluş, Evli Bireyler.

## Introduction

Violence, an open sore of society, is getting more and more common in Turkey and the world.<sup>1</sup> Violence between spouses within the family makes marriage life unbearable and deeply affects family members, especially children. Domestic violence, which occurs in different forms, is rapidly increasing despite the efforts to reduce and prevent its negative consequences. The most common domestic violence is spousal violence against women in Turkey<sup>2</sup> There are factors such as cultural, social, economic and personal ones that play a role in the formation of violence. There are many factors. It is extremely important to identify these and take steps to solve them. With each passing day, the acceptance and internalization of violence feeds the source of violence and increase the size of the danger. Although spousal violence may seem to be concerning two people in an intimate relationship, it is considered as one of the problems that goes beyond the family and affects the peace of society.<sup>3</sup> Individuals who make up the society shape their selves within the family and sow the seeds of their values and worldviews largely according to family attitudes and views. Preventing violence in the family, which can be defined as the cornerstone of society, will make a great contribution to preventing other types of violence.

The concept of spirituality is very important in shaping human life and behavior. According to Maslow's hierarchy of needs theory, spirituality is an integral part of human life. Self-actualization is at the top of the hierarchy of needs pyramid. Self-actualized individuals are the transcendent people unlike themselves and look at the world more holistically. They care about the natural life around them and are more motivated for experiences, righteousness and goodness.<sup>4</sup> Marriage is an institution that meets the basic needs of individuals, supports the development of each other's personalities and prepares the ground for them to reach the stage of self-realization. Along with spiritual feelings, it

---

<sup>1</sup> Kadın Statüsü Genel Müdürlüğü (KSGM), *Türkiye'de Kadına Yönelik Aile İçi Şiddet* (Ankara: Elma Teknik Basım Matbaacılık, 2009),185; World Health Organization (WHO), *WHO Multi-Country Study on Women's Health and*

<sup>2</sup> *Domestic Violence Against Women*. (Geneva: Publications of the World Health Organization 2005), 83. [http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/43310/9241593512\\_eng.pdf?sequence](http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/43310/9241593512_eng.pdf?sequence)

<sup>3</sup> Peggy Goodman, "The Relationship Between Intimate Partner Violence and Other Forms of Family and Societal Violence", *Emergency Medicine Clinics of North America* 24 (2006), 889-903.

<sup>4</sup> Cynthia Chandler et.al, "Counseling for spiritual wellness: Theory and practice", *Journal of Counseling & Development* 71/2 (1992), 168-175.



reveals the feelings of love and compassion of spouses towards each other.<sup>5</sup> In this context, the concept of spirituality is expected to have important and positive results in marital satisfaction and the prevention of violence. Concepts such as peace, happiness, communication, harmony, and satisfaction are influential in the prevention of conflict and violence in marriage. It is seen that religion and spirituality positively affect both the well-being of individuals and their marital life. It is necessary to increase the diversity of preventive measures against the violence that starts in the family and causes chain destruction. Religion and spiritual values, which advise bringing out the moral values existing in the creation of human beings, knowing the limits, not violating the rights of others, and ensuring individual and social peace, can be effective measures. In this direction, this study was carried out considering that spirituality plays an important role in influencing people's attitudes towards violence and in preventing domestic violence. As a matter of fact, spiritual well-being includes the ability to discover the inherent potential of the individual, to find, express and act on his main purpose in life.

Spirituality embodies the power of turning the hostility inside people into peace and love.<sup>6</sup> Based on these facts, the subject of the research is the relationship between the attitudes of married individuals towards violence and their spiritual well-being.

## 1. Marriage and Violence

Marriage is defined as "an institutionalized way, a system of relations, a legal relationship that binds a woman and a man as husband and wife, and provides a certain status to the children to be born, in which the state has the right and authority to control socially".<sup>7</sup> In studies on marriage, words and phrases such as marital harmony, marital satisfaction, and the quality of marriage are frequently used.<sup>8</sup> In the study of Rosen-Grandon et.al,<sup>9</sup> 10 features that affect marital satisfaction are listed: Continuity of marriage, commitment to the spouse, strong moral and spiritual values, respect for the spouse as a

---

<sup>5</sup> Fatma Zeynep Belen, *Aile İçi İletişime Manevi Psiko-Sosyal Yaklaşım* (Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2010), 50-54.

<sup>6</sup> Öznur Özdoğan, *İsimsiz Hayatlar Manevi ve Psikolojik Yaklaşımın Arınma ve Öze Dönüş* (Ankara: Özdenöze Yayınları, 2009), 189.

<sup>7</sup> İbrahim Ethem Özgüven, *Ailede İletişim ve Yaşam* (Ankara: Pdrem Yayınları, 2001), 60.

<sup>8</sup> Şennur Tutarel Kışlak - Işıl Göztepe, "Duygu Dışavurumu, Empati, Depresyon ve Evlilik Uyumu Arasındaki İlişkiler", *Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 3/2 (2012), 27-46.

<sup>9</sup> Jane Rosen-Grandon et.al, "The relationship between marital characteristics, marital interaction processes, and marital satisfaction", *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 82/1(2004), 58-68.

friend, commitment to sexual life, willingness to be good parents, belief in God and spiritual religious devotion, willingness to please and support the spouse, being a good companion for the spouse and willingness to forgive and be forgiven. In addition, Geçioğlu and Kayıklık<sup>10</sup> concluded that if religiosity increases, marital harmony also increases. According to Yiğit's study<sup>11</sup>, it was found that individuals with high marital satisfaction have low rates of exposure to domestic violence. In addition, it is stated that religion and spirituality are effective in such areas as preventing domestic conflicts, ensuring peace and tranquility in marriage and preventing miscommunication between spouses.<sup>12</sup>

The concept of violence has been handled in two ways, and different definitions have been made in the narrow and broad sense. Violence in its narrow sense is only painful acts against one's body, which can also be called apparent violence. In a broad sense, they are events that affect the person physically or emotionally but cannot be seen from the outside. This type of violence is also called implicit violence.<sup>13</sup> Violence has been classified in many ways. For example, WHO<sup>14</sup> divides violence into three broad categories based on the characteristics of the perpetrators:

- 1) Self-directed Violence: Self-directed violence is divided into two as suicide and self-abuse. There are three stages which are suicidal thoughts, attempted suicide and suicide.
- 2) Interpersonal Violence: This type of violence is also divided into two among themselves.
  - a) Domestic violence or violence in intimate relationships: It is the type of violence that generally occurs between family members and between spouses. It takes place at home.
  - b) Environmental violence: It usually occurs between people who are not related to each other, know or do not know each other, and takes place outside the home.

---

<sup>10</sup> Ahmet Rifat Geçioğlu - Hasan Kayıklık, "Dindarlık ve Evlilik Uyumu İlişkisi Evli Bireyler Üzerine Bir İnceleme", *Çukurova Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 19/1 (2019), 202-224.

<sup>11</sup> Elifsu Yiğit, *Evlü Kadınlarda Aile İçi Şiddet ile Evlilik Doymu ve Psikolojik İyi Oluş Arasındaki İlişkinin İncelenmesi* (İstanbul: Beykent Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2018), 81.

<sup>12</sup> Asım Yapıcı, "Eşlerin Dinsel Algı ve Yaşayışına Göre Evlilikte Dindarlık ve Maneviyat Huzur mu Kusur mu?", *Turkish Studies* 12/2 (2018), 79-106.

<sup>13</sup> Muhammet Kızılgeçit, *Din Psikolojisinin 100'ü* (Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2017), 204.

<sup>14</sup> World Health Organization (WHO), *World Report on Violence and Health*. Geneva: Publications of the World Health Organization, 2002), 6. [https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/42495/9241545615\\_eng.pdf](https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/42495/9241545615_eng.pdf)

- 3) Collective Violence: It is the type of violence that many people are involved in, and it is divided into three as social, political and economic.

Violence is also commonly categorized as physical, psychological (emotional), economic and sexual violence in the literature.<sup>15</sup> However, there is no clear distinction between the types of violence stated. It is possible to see another type of violence simultaneously besides any type of violence. For example, at the time of physical violence, the person may be subjected to verbal or psychological violence.<sup>16</sup>

Violence is a phenomenon with many different aspects and is fed by many factors. Each of the psychological, social, and economic situations gives rise to violence.<sup>17</sup> In addition, the behaviors caused by violence can first be associated with the personality of the individual.<sup>18</sup> Tuzcuoğlu<sup>19</sup> listed the situations that can cause violence in his study. Among these, violence from one's own family first, observing violence and adopting it as one's behavior, seeing other people as enemies, television programs and computer games with violent content, news about violence, traffic stress, competition and negative behaviors in the working environment, perceiving various sports branches out of purpose, unemployment and inability to adapt to the place of migration are counted. According to Moses,<sup>20</sup> poverty is among the factors that create violence. In addition, hostilities between individuals and communities, pro-terrorist events, and war environments are triggers for violence. In addition to these, if fear rather than love is active in human relations, violence can be seen as an integral part of this relationship. Fear is an emotion that begins to be felt in the early childhood years and is encountered in many parts of life throughout life. Personality, on the other hand, is shaped by developing with different types of violence.<sup>21</sup> There can be no healthy psychological development for individuals who have been deprived of the feeling of love since childhood. Love is the basic emotion that makes people human. Fear separates and removes, while love integrates. If people have been exposed to fear a lot, they first

<sup>15</sup> Mustafa Ulu, "Şiddet ve Kişilik İlişkisi Üzerine Psikolojik Bir Araştırma", *Bilimname Dergisi* 12/3 (2016), 57-82.

<sup>16</sup> Aynur Bader Eryiğit, *Kutsal Kitaplar Açısından Kadına Yönelik Şiddet ve Ayrımcılık* (İstanbul: Düşün Yayıncılık, 2018) 38.

<sup>17</sup> Mahmut Tezcan, "Bir Şiddet Ortamı Olarak Okul", *Cogito* 6/7 (1996), 105-108.

<sup>18</sup> Rafael Moses. "Şiddet Nerede Başlıyor", çev. Ayşe Kul, *Cogito* 23/27 (1996), 6-7.

<sup>19</sup> Necla Tuzcuoğlu, "Şiddet ve Şiddete Neden Olan Etkenler ve Çözüm Yolları". *Aile ve Şiddet*, ed. Adem, Solak (Ankara: Hegem Yayıncılık, 2010), 193-220.

<sup>20</sup> Moses, "Şiddet Nerede Başlıyor" 6-7.

<sup>21</sup> Adem Solak, *Şiddet Kültürü Türkiye'nin Suç ve Sosyal Risk Haritası*, (Ankara: Hegem Yayınları, 2016), 27.

experience problems within themselves and then start to reflect on their surroundings. They feel on a knife edge in human relations, feel the need to protect themselves, which make them aggressive and prone to violence.<sup>22</sup>

## 2. Spiritual Well-Being

Spirituality is derived from Latin. Spirit, which is the root of the word Spiritus, means spirit, courage and breath.<sup>23</sup> In Turkey, the word spirituality, which overlaps with spirituality in terms of meaning, is used extensively both in social life and in the academic field.<sup>24</sup> Spirituality is a concept that can contain many values within itself. Self-awareness, compassion, mercy, patience, tolerance can be counted among them.<sup>25</sup> It is possible for a person to learn about their pain, to turn their hostility into cooperation and to reveal the peace and love within them.<sup>26</sup> Throughout history, religion/religiousness and spirituality have been a part of human life. In fact, spirituality and religiosity manifest themselves both as subjects and objects in most of the human actions.<sup>27</sup> Although some researchers differ on the relationship between the concepts of spirituality and religion, this is actually a result of the West's negative attitude towards religiosity through secularism and the belief that the only source of knowledge of the society is science.<sup>28</sup> Functionalities normally covered by religion have begun to be specified only as the field of spirituality.<sup>29</sup> However, many studies perceive spirituality and religion as intertwined. For example, according to the results of the research conducted by Zinnbauer et al.<sup>30</sup>; 74% of the respondents describe themselves as "both spiritual and religious", 19% as "spiritual but not religious" and 4% as "religious but not spiritual". According to this study, the number of people who consider the concepts of

---

<sup>22</sup> Hamdi Kalyoncu, *Aile İçi Şiddet ve Şiddet Ortamında Çocuklar*, (İstanbul: Yediveren Yayınları, 2014), 27-28.

<sup>23</sup> Berra Keçeci, *Evlü Kadınların Psikolojik İstismar Profillerinin Toplumsal Cinsiyet Algıları ve Spiritüel İyi Oluşları Açısından İncelenmesi* (İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2018),

<sup>24</sup> Sevde Düzgüner, "Nereden Çıktı Bu Maneviyat: Manevi Bakımın Temellerine İlişkin Kültürlerarası Bir Analiz", *Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik* ed. Ali Ayten, et.all (İstanbul: Dem Yayınları, 2016), 1/17-43.

<sup>25</sup> Sema Eryücel, "Self-Handicapping and Spiritual Well-Being", *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 11/59 (2018a), 661-670.

<sup>26</sup> Özdoğan, *İsimsiz Hayatlar*, 189.

<sup>27</sup> Brain Zinnbauer – Kenneth Pargament, "Dindarlık ve Maneviyat", çev. Sevde Düzgüner, *Din ve Maneviyat Psikolojisi Temel Yaklaşımlar ve İlgi Alanları*, çev. ed. İhsan Çapçioğlu- Ali Ayten (Ankara: Phoenix Yayınevi, 2013), 61-102.

<sup>28</sup> Halil Ekşi - Selami Kardeş, "Spiritual Well- Being: Scale Development and Validation", *Spiritual Psychology and Counseling* 2 (2017), 73-88.

<sup>29</sup> Zinnbauer - Pargament, "Dindarlık ve Maneviyat", 68.

<sup>30</sup> Brain Zinnbauer et.all, "Religion and spirituality: Unfuzzifying the fuzzy", *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 36 (1997), 549-564.

"Spirituality" and "Religion" together and see themselves as religious and spiritual at the same time is quite high.

Spiritual well-being is an individuals' desire to make sense of human existence, to find purpose, to be questioning, to understand complicated intangible concepts and entities.<sup>31</sup> Spiritual well-being represents an opening to the spiritual dimension that allows one's spirituality to integrate with other dimensions of life, thereby maximizing the potential for growth and self-realization.<sup>32</sup> When individuals cannot adapt to the developments and changes in life, they can fall into a spiritual void. After observing this situation, the concept of spiritual well-being attracted attention and gained importance.<sup>33</sup>

Spiritual well-being discusses the relationship between the meaning of life, the pleasure or satisfaction one receives from this life, and the values that can be called spiritual. In this respect, it is a type of well-being and includes both spirituality and well-being. On the other hand, the quality of individuals' relations with themselves, their environment and the divine being help to have an idea about their spiritual development and their satisfaction with the relations they have established. In other words, it mostly expresses the individuals' religious and existential well-being. In this respect, it corresponds to the aspect of love, which is the invisible part of life.<sup>34</sup>

Spirituality, which affects people's life positively, has an important role in preventing the problems such as stress and anxiety lead us to a dead end.<sup>35</sup> In addition, this concept was found to be associated with hope and psychological resilience. In the study conducted by Eryücel<sup>36</sup> it was observed that the hope and psychological resilience scores of children under

<sup>31</sup> Keçeci, *Evli Kadınların Psikolojik İstismar Profillerinin Toplumsal Cinsiyet Algıları ve Spiritüel İyi Oluşları Açısından İncelenmesi*, 19. Keçeci, Berra. *Evli Kadınların Psikolojik İstismar Profillerinin Toplumsal Cinsiyet Algıları ve Spiritüel İyi Oluşları Açısından İncelenmesi*. İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2018.

<sup>32</sup> Charlene Westgate, "Spiritual Wellness and Depression", *Journal of Counseling & Development* 75 (1996), 26-35.

<sup>33</sup> Rebecca Powell Stanard et.all, "Assessment of spirituality incounseling", *Journal of Counseling & Development* 78/2 (2000), 204-210.

<sup>34</sup> Hatice Acar, "Manevi İyi Oluş ile Dindarlık Arasındaki İlişki Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme", *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 18/2 (2014), 391-412; Peter Hill et.all, "Conceptualizing Religion and Spirituality: Points of Commonality, Points of Departure". *Journal for The Theory of Social Behaviour* 30 (2000), 51-77.

<sup>35</sup> Mehmet Akif Klavuz – Esra Klavuz, "Yaşlanma Döneminde Kayıplarla Başa Çıkma Manevi Danışmanlık Hizmetlerinin Önemi", *Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik*. ed. Ali Ayten et.all (İstanbul: Dem Yayınları, 2016), 17-38.

<sup>36</sup> Sema Eryücel, "Koruma Altındaki Çocuklara Yönelik Dini Manevi Rehberlik Uygulamaları ile Umut ve Psikolojik Sağlıklı İlişkisi", *Akademik Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 6/80 (2018b) 367-385.

protection increased as a result of religious-spiritual guidance studies. Besides, belief in God and destiny, which is frequently emphasized in religious texts, increases well-being and reduces hopelessness. On the other hand, spirituality plays an active role in psychological support processes. For example, it has been determined that religious-spiritual based interventions in counseling practices provide a permanent decrease in the psychopathological status of clients.<sup>37</sup> Life events faced by the individual can have a short-term and rapid effect on well-being.<sup>38</sup> At this point, spirituality emerges as an important concept that helps people cope with the troublesome events they encounter. The concept of religious coping on this subject has been included in scientific studies by Pargament. It has been seen that positive religious coping helps the individual to adapt to life as soon as possible

### 3. Method

#### 3.1. Problems of the Research

The main problem of the research is to determine the relationship between the demographic variables of married individuals and their attitudes towards violence in intimate relationships and their level of spiritual well-being. In this context, the problem sentence of the research is "What is the relationship between the level of spiritual well-being of married individuals and their attitudes towards violence?".

1: Is there a significant relationship between the attitudes of married individuals towards violence and the sub-dimensions of spiritual well-being?

2: Is there a significant relationship between sociodemographic variables, violence attitudes of married individuals in intimate relationships and sub-dimensions of spiritual well-being?

#### 3.2. Data Collection Tools

In the study, the *Intimate Violence Responsibility Scale (IVRS)* and *Spiritual Well-Being Scales* as well as personal information form and were used to find out the demographic information of the participants such as gender, age, education and income.

---

<sup>37</sup> Faruk Karaca - Muhammed Cevad Acar, "Psikolojik Danışma Sürecinde Kullanılan Dinî/Manevi Temelli Müdahalelerin Vaka Analizi Yöntemi ile İncelenmesi Üzerine Bir Araştırma", *Sağlık Hizmetlerinde Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik*, ed. Ali Ayten et.all( İstanbul: Değerler Eğitimi Merkezi Yayınları, 2019), 279.

<sup>38</sup> Alan Carr, *Pozitif Psikoloji*. çev. Ümit Şendilek (İstanbul: Kaknüs Yayınevi, 2016), 36.

### 3.2.1. Intimate Violence Responsibility Scale (IVRS)

*Intimate Violence Responsibility Scale (IVRS)* revised form was used to evaluate individuals' attitudes towards violence. It was designed by Fincham et al.<sup>39</sup> Demirtaş et al.<sup>40</sup> completed the adaptation study as the *Intimate Violence Responsibility Scale Revised Form (IVRS-RF)*. *IVRS-RF*, which is a 5-point Likert scale, consists of three sub-dimensions and 17 items. Internal consistency coefficient was 72, 62 and 65 for the dimensions of violence, control and abuse, respectively.

### 3.2.2 Spiritual Well-Being Scale

It was developed by Ekşi and Kardaş<sup>41</sup> for adults. The scale, which was created as a 5-point Likert scale, consists of three sub-dimensions and a total of 29 items. When the Cronbach Alpha values of the scale were examined, it was found out that transcendence, harmony with nature, anomie and total value were found to be .953, .864, .853 and .886, respectively.

## 4. Findings

Table1: T-Test Results of Participants' Attitudes Towards Violence (Violence, Control and Abuse) and Spiritual Well-Being (Transcendence, Harmony with Nature and Anomie) Levels according to Gender Variable

	Gender	N	Mean	s.s	T	P
Violence	Female	269	1,6385	,91684	2,504	0,013
	Male	205	1,4415	,74975		
Control	Female	269	2,7299	,65279	-3,201	0,001
	Male	205	2,9358	,72372		
Abuse	Female	269	1,9172	,69283	-4,123	0,000
	Male	205	2,1742	,65657		
Transcendence	Female	269	4,4062	,79140	0,989	0,323
	Male	205	4,3327	,80929		
Harmony with Nature	Female	269	4,3696	,74206		0,522

<sup>39</sup> Frank Fincham et.al, "Attitudes Toward Intimate Partner Violence in Dating Relationships", *Psychological Assessment* 20 (2008), 260–269.

<sup>40</sup> Ezgi Toplu Demirtaş et.al, "Intimate Partner Violence in Turkey: The Turkish Intimate Partner Violence Attitude Scale-Revised", *Journal of Family Violence* 32 (2017), 349–356

<sup>41</sup> Ekşi - Kardaş, "Spiritual Well- Being: Scale Development and Validation", 73-88.

	Male	205	4,4118	,68550	-0,641	
Anomie	Female	269	3,8789	,78084	-0,375	0,708
	Male	205	3,9059	,77347		

In Table 1, according to the gender variable, it is seen that female participants (mean: 1.638) have a statistically significantly higher mean score for the violence sub-dimension, one of the sub-dimensions of attitude towards violence, than male participants (mean: 1.441) ( $p < 0.05$ ). In the sub-dimensions of control and abuse, it is seen that male participants (mean: 2.936 and 2.174) have higher mean scores than female participants (mean: 2.730 and 1.917) ( $p < 0.05$ ). According to the gender variable, it is clear that the mean scores of the sub-dimensions of the spiritual well-being of the female participants which are transcendence, harmony with nature and anomie do not differ statistically from the male participants ( $p > 0.05$ ).

Table 2: Anova Test Results on Attitudes Towards Violence (Violence, Control and Abuse) and Spiritual Well-Being (Transcendence, Harmony with Nature and Anomie) Levels of Participants according to Age Variable

		Sum of Squares (SS)	Degree of Freedom (df)	Mean Square (MS)	F	P
Violence	Between groups	3,218	5	,644	,883	,492
	Within the group	341,249	468	,729		
	Total	344,467	473			
Control	Between groups	5,587	5	1,117	2,373	,038
	Within the group	220,398	468	,471		
	Total	225,985	473			
Abuse	Between groups	2,608	5	,522	1,101	,359
	Within the group	221,665	468	,474		
	Total	224,273	473			
Transcendence	Between groups	3,212	5	,642	1,006	,414
	Within the group	298,878	468	,639		
	Total	302,089	473			
Harmony with Nature	Between Groups	3,744	5	,749	1,461	,201
	Within the group	239,900	468	,513		
	Total	243,644	473			
Anomie	Between groups	4,751	5	,950	1,584	,163
	Within the group	280,780	468	,600		
	Total	285,531	473			



In the control sub-dimension, which is one of the sub-dimensions of the level of attitude towards violence, the control sub-dimension mean scores of the participants who are 66 years old and over (mean: 2,567) in terms of the age variable were found to be significantly lower than the participants aged between 36 and 45 (mean: 2.744), 56 and 65 (mean: 2.806), 46 and 55 (mean: 2.852), 26 and 35 (mean: 2.870), and 25 and under (mean: 3.124) ( $f= 2.373$ ;  $p<0.05$ ). No statistically significant difference was found in other sub-dimensions in terms of age variable ( $p>0.05$ ).

Table 3: Anova Test Results on Attitudes Towards Violence (Violence, Control and Abuse) and Spiritual Well-Being (Transcendence, Harmony with Nature and Anomie) Levels of Participants by Educational Status Variable

		Sum of Squares (SS)	Degree of Freedom (df)	Mean Square (MS)	F	P
Violence	Between groups	5,498	3	1,833	2,541	,056
	Within the group	338,969	470	,721		
	Total	344,467	473			
Control	Between groups	4,941	3	1,647	3,502	,015
	Within groups	221,044	470	,470		
	Total	225,985	473			
Abuse	Between groups	4,693	3	1,564	3,348	,019
	Within groups	219,580	470	,467		
	Total	224,273	473			
Transcendence	Between groups	4,124	3	1,375	2,168	,091
	Within groups	297,965	470	,634		
	Total	302,089	473			
Harmony with nature	Between groups	,645	3	,215	,416	,742
	Within groups	242,998	470	,517		
	Total	243,644	473			
Anomie	Between groups	19,155	3	6,385	11,266	,000
	Within groups	266,375	470	,567		
	Total	285,531	473			

In the sub-dimensions of control and abuse, which are among the sub-dimensions of the level of attitude towards violence, the mean scores of the participants who were high school graduates (mean: 2,729 and 1,938) were found to be significantly lower than college or university graduates (mean: 2,815 and 2,052), secondary school or equivalent vocational school graduates (mean: 2,902 and 2,103) and primary school graduates (mean: 3,060 and 2,262). ( $f= 3.348$ ;  $p<0.05$ )

In the anomie sub-dimension, which is one of the spiritual well-being sub-dimensions, the average score of the participants who were primary school graduates (mean: 3,567) was found to be significantly lower than college or university graduates (average: 3,574), secondary school or equivalent vocational school graduates (mean: 3,811) and high school graduates (mean: 3,567). 4,079). ( $f= 11,266$ ;  $p= 0.00$ ) No statistically significant difference was found in other sub-dimensions in terms of educational status variable ( $p>0.05$ ).

Table 4: Sub-Dimensional Relationships Between Variables of Attitude Towards Violence and Spiritual Well-Being

		Violence Control	Abuse	Transcendence	Harmony with nature	Anomie
Violence	r 1 P n 474					
Control	R ,811** P ,000 N 474	1				
Abuse	R ,662** P ,000 N 474	,684** ,000 474	1  474			
Transcendence	R -,269** P ,000 N 474	-,313** ,000 474	-,289** ,000 474	1  474		
Harmony with nature	r ,137** p ,003 N 474	,117* ,011 474	,105* ,023 474	,086 ,061 474	1  474	
Anomie	R ,588** P ,000 N 474	,638** ,000 474	,570** ,000 474	-,141** ,002 474	,246** ,000 474	1  474

When the table is examined, it is seen that the violence sub-dimension, a sub-dimension of attitude towards violence, has a negative relationship with transcendence (-.269\*\*), a sub-dimensions of spiritual well-being while it has a positive relationship with harmony with nature (r: .137\*\*), and anomie (r: .588\*\*).

The control sub-dimension, a sub-dimension of attitude towards violence, has a negative relationship with the transcendence sub-dimension (r: -.313\*\*), a sub-dimension of spiritual well-being, and a positive relationship between harmony with nature (r: .117\*) and anomie sub-dimension (.638). \*\*). Abuse, which is one of the sub-dimensions of attitude towards violence, has a negative relationship with transcendence (-.289\*\*), a sub-dimension of spiritual well-being, and a significant positive relationship with harmony with nature (r: .105\*) and a significant positive relationship with anomie (r: .570).

## Discussion

The aim of this study is to examine the relationship between married individuals' attitudes towards violence and their spiritual well-being scores. The data of 474 participants were included in the scope of the research. In terms of the socio-demographic characteristics of the participants, their attitudes towards violence and the differences in the dimensions of spiritual well-being were evaluated. In order to reach more participants in the research, married individuals did not participate in the study as a couple, but individually.

When the sub-dimensions of attitude towards violence and spiritual well-being are examined in terms of gender variable, the sub-dimension of violence was significantly higher in women while control and abuse sub-dimensions were significantly higher in men.

It is observed that gender does not differ between the sub-scores of spiritual well-being. Parallel with the findings, in the study conducted by Şirin<sup>42</sup> no relationship was found between the spiritual well-being of married individuals and gender. Moreover, in Kızıllırmak's<sup>43</sup> study, it was concluded that spirituality, which he defined as the search for

---

<sup>42</sup> Turgay Şirin, "Evli Çiftlerin Spiritüel İyi Oluşları ile Evlilik Doyumları Arasındaki İlişki", *Ekev Akademi Dergisi* 23/77 (2019), 389-410.

<sup>43</sup> Özlem Kızıllırmak, *Genç Yetişkinlerde Yaşamda Anlamın Maneviyat ve Kişilik Özellikleri Açısından İncelenmesi* (Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2015) 63-75.

meaning, did not differ in terms of gender. This situation can be evaluated as the factors that create spiritual feelings do not create differences between genders in society as a supra-gender phenomenon.

When the sub-dimensions of attitudes towards violence of the participants and their spouses are compared in terms of the age variable, it is seen that the control attitude towards violence of the older age (66 years and over) participants is lower than the younger participants. In the literature, it is seen that the effectiveness of the elderly individual in life and social interaction are weakened.<sup>44</sup> From this point of view, it can be interpreted that the tendency of older individuals to control the behavior of their spouses in social life may decrease compared to the past. It has been argued that cultural and environmental factors play an important role in domestic violence and spousal violence.<sup>45</sup> For example, it has been stated that domestic violence may be an inevitable situation for people living in disadvantaged environments caused by low socioeconomic and sociocultural levels and that men with socioeconomically disadvantaged conditions are more likely to resort to emotional violence.<sup>46</sup>

According to the findings related to education, it was found that those who graduated from high school had significantly less control and abuse mean scores than other education levels. In addition, no significant relationship was found between the education level of high school students and the violence sub-dimension. According to the study, those with a low level of education exhibit more verbal violence than those with a higher education level. There are also related findings in various other studies in the literature. In addition to the findings that violence increases as the education rate decreases,<sup>47</sup> it is seen that the number of types of violence are parallel with the increase in education level.<sup>48</sup> It is expected that violence will decrease with the increase in the level of education, but the

---

<sup>44</sup> Fatma Öz, "Yaşamın Son Evresi: Yaşlılık Psikososyal Açından Gözden Geçirme", *Kriz Dergisi* 10/2 (2002), 17-28.

<sup>45</sup> Emine Öztürk, *Türkiye'de Aile İçi Şiddet* (Ankara: Gece Kitaplığı, 2017), 72-88.

<sup>46</sup> Rachel Jewkes, "Intimate partner violence: causes and prevention", *The Lancet*, 359/9315 (2002), 1423, 1429.

<sup>47</sup> Öner Altıntop - Filiz Adana, "Yeni Evli Çiftlerin Aile İçi Şiddete Yönelik Tutumları ve İlişkili Faktörler", *Gümüşhane Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Dergisi* 8/3 (2019), 268-276 ; Berra Keçeci ve Halil Ekşi, "Evli Kadınlarda Toplumsal Cinsiyet Algısı ve Spiritüel İyilik Halinin Psikolojik İstismar Üzerine Etkisi", *Marmara Üniversitesi Kadın ve Toplumsal Cinsiyet Araştırmaları Dergisi* 4-1(2020), 30- 48 ; Ali Bayer, *Değişen Toplumsal Yapıda Aile: Eşler Arası Şiddet ve Din İlişkisi Üzerine Bir Araştırma Konya İli Örneği* (Konya: Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2013) 227-228.

<sup>48</sup> Faruk Kocacık – Mustafa Çağlayandereli, "Ailede Kadına Yönelik Şiddet: Denizli İli Örneği", *Uluslararası İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi* 6/2 (2009), 24-43.

reason for the contradictory data in the literature may be related to the quality of education. Carrying out new studies on this issue may be useful.

When the sub-dimensions of spiritual well-being were examined, it was concluded that the sub-dimension of anomie was significantly lower in primary school graduates and low-income participants. It can be considered as an interesting finding that as the level of education and income decreases, the level of meaninglessness also decreases. In cases where the sense of meaning is not given in the education programs, the life satisfaction of individuals with high education and income level may be high. It can be assumed that this situation causes an increase in anomie. It is suggested that it would be beneficial to include spiritual education in education programs.

According to Armstrong,<sup>49</sup> spiritual actions also include beliefs about how to treat others. Individuals who have belief in God and transcendence behave more respectfully towards others. Therefore, individuals are expected to avoid violent attitudes thanks to their values and spiritual feelings<sup>50</sup>. Intelligence is an important concept in the problem-solving process, and it has been emphasized recently that spirituality is a type of intelligence. Spirituality changes thoughts, feelings and behaviors with its many values. As a result of the analysis of the study, it is an expected finding that a significant negative relationship between the sub-dimensions of spiritual well-being, transcendence and IVRS (violence, control, abuse) will be obtained. In addition, regarding the transcendence sub-dimension, there are studies stating that religious and spiritual values play an important role in reducing violence. For example, in a study conducted by Brinkerhoff et al.<sup>51</sup> in Canada, it was stated that strong religious affiliation prevented spousal violence. Similarly, the study by Ghodrati et al.<sup>52</sup> which included Muslim and Christian male participants, concluded that spirituality and religious commitment reduce violence against married women and increase marital satisfaction. Ekşi and Okan,<sup>53</sup> in their recent study, revealed the existence of a significant

---

<sup>49</sup> Laverne Berkel et.al, "Gender Role Attitudes, Religion, And Spirituality as Predictors Of Domestic Violence Attitudes in White College Students", *Journal of College Student Development* 45/2 (2004), 119-133.

<sup>50</sup> Halil İbrahim Özasma, *Eşler Arası İletişim ve Maneviyat* (Ankara: Sonçağ Akademi, 2021), 190

<sup>51</sup> Merlin Brinkerhoff et.al, "Religious involvement and spousal violence: The Canadian case", *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 31 (1992), 15-31.

<sup>52</sup> Fatemeh Ghodrati et.al, "The Relationship Between Religious Attitude and Domestic Violence Against Women of Reproductive Age", *Journal of Midwifery and Reproductive Health* 7/1 (2019), 1522-1526.

<sup>53</sup> Halil Ekşi - Nesrullah Okan, "Gençlerde Maneviyat ve Şiddet Eğilimi Arasındaki İlişki Erken Dönem Uyum Bozucu Şemaların Moderatör Etkisi", *Bilimname* 44 (2021), 521-546 .

negative relationship between spirituality and violence and stated that spirituality is an effective factor in reducing violence. Based on all these studies, it is thought that individuals with spiritual feelings, high feelings of transcendence, and belief in God can contribute to peace and tranquility in marriage.

A positive relationship was found between all sub-dimensions of IVRS and harmony with nature, which is the sub-dimension of spiritual well-being. This can be considered as an interesting finding. As a matter of fact, faithful individuals who adapt to the world and nature they live in have respect and values.<sup>54</sup> This respect and value is expected to affect their thoughts and attitudes towards violence. It is thought that this situation is due to reasons such as the limited spiritual education given about nature, especially with the effect of city life, and due to its promotion only through rules. This can be clarified with new studies.

It was concluded that there is a positive and significant relationship between IVRS sub-dimensions (violence, control, abuse) and anomie sub-dimension. According to this finding, the violence and abuse attitudes of individuals with high anomie are also high. Kuruçay and Gürses<sup>55</sup> associated meaninglessness with concepts such as alienation, insecurity, suicide, unhappiness and a crisis of values. The fact that individuals' values, which contribute to the ability to distinguish what is right and wrong, are corrupted, explains their tendency to violence in their behavior.

### **3.1 Conclusion and Recommendation**

According to the findings obtained from the research, a significant negative relationship was found between the sub-dimension of spiritual well-being, transcendence, and the sub-dimensions of violence in intimate relationships (violence, control and abuse) while, however, a significant positive relationship was found between harmony with nature and IVRS sub-dimensions. A positive relationship was found between anomie, which is a sub-dimension of spiritual well-being, and the sub-dimensions of IVRS. According to these sub-dimension relations, as people's feelings of transcendence increase, their attitudes

---

<sup>54</sup> Eda Feyzioğlu, *Ekoloji, İnsan ve Din* (Konya: Selçuk Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi,2011), 67.

<sup>55</sup> Yasin Kuruçay ve İbrahim Gürses "Ergenlerde Anlamsızlık ile İlgili Problemlere Dinin Etkisi Üzerine Değerlendirmeler", *İnönü Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 9/1 (2018), 87-111.

towards violence decrease. Moreover, as their anomie (meaninglessness) increases, their attitudes towards violence increase. When we look at the relationships with demographic information, violence, which is a sub-dimension of IVRS, is higher in female participants. Control and abuse sub-dimensions are higher in male participants. Control and abuse sub-dimensions were found to be significantly lower in high school graduates and high-income participants. Anomie sub-dimension was found to be lower in primary school graduates and those with low income. There was a negative significant relationship between the age of 65 and over and the control sub-score.

- It is thought that spirituality will be effective in preventing the occurrence of violence, which has devastating consequences in marriage. Therefore, it is recommended to carry out family education programs that include spiritual programs before and during marriage.

- Spirituality is a process. It is recommended that spirituality be given by educators who have training in spirituality within the current education programs.

- Carrying out studies to increase spirituality in the lower income group.

- Opening spiritual centers, supporting religious and spiritual institutions with socio-cultural content.

- In addition to quantitative research in new studies, it is recommended to focus on qualitative studies such as interviews and observations.

## References / Kaynakça

- Acar, Hatice. "Manevi İyi Oluş ile Dindarlık Arasındaki İlişki Üzerine Bir Değerlendirme". *Cumhuriyet Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 18/2 (2014), 391-412.
- Altıntop, Öner - Adana, Filiz. "Yeni Evli Çiftlerin Aile İçi Şiddete Yönelik Tutumları ve İlişkili Faktörler" *Gümüşhane Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Dergisi* 8/3 (2019), 268-276.
- Bayer, Ali. *Değişen Toplumsal Yapıda Aile: Eşler Arası Şiddet ve Din İlişkisi Üzerine Bir Araştırma Konya İli Örneği*. Konya: Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Sosya Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2013.
- Belen, Fatma Zehra. *Aile İçi İletişime Manevi Psiko-Sosyal Yaklaşım*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2010.
- Berkel, Laverne et.all "Gender Role Attitudes, Religion, And Spirituality As Predictors Of Domestic Violence Attitudes in White College Students". *Journal of College Student Development* 45/2 (2004), 119-133.
- Brinkerhoff, Merlin B et.all "Religious involvement and spousal violence: The Canadian case". *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 31 (1992), 15-31.
- Carr, Alan. *Pozitif Psikoloji*. çev. Ümit Şendilek. İstanbul: Kaknüs Yayınevi, 2016.
- Chandler, Cynthia K. et.all "Counseling for spiritual wellness: Theory and practice". *Journal of Counseling & Development* 71/2 (1992), 168-175.
- Demirtaş Ezgi Toplu et.all "Intimate Partner Violence in Turkey: The Turkish Intimate Partner Violence Attitude Scale-Revised". *Journal of Family Violence* 32 (2017), 349-356
- Düzgüner, Sevde. "Nereden Çıktı Bu Maneviyat: Manevi Bakımın Temellerine İlişkin Kültürlerarası Bir Analiz". *Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik* ed. Ali Ayten, et.all 1/17-43. İstanbul: Dem Yayınları, 2016.
- Ediz, Ayşe - Altan, Şenol. "Türkiye'de Kadına Yönelik Şiddet Üzerine Bir Alan Araştırması". *TBB Dergisi (Özel Sayı)* 2017, 397-410.
- Ekşi, Halil - Kardeş, Selami. "Spiritual Well- Being: Scale Development and Validation". *Spiritual Psychology and Counseling* 2 (2017), 73-88.
- Ekşi, Halil - Okan, Nesrullah. "Gençlerde Maneviyat ve Şiddet Eğilimi Arasındaki İlişkide Erken Dönem Uyum Bozucu Şemaların Moderatör Etkisi". *Bilimname* 44 (2021), 521-546 .
- Eryiğit, Bader Aynur. *Kutsal Kitaplar Açısından Kadına Yönelik Şiddet ve Ayrımcılık*. İstanbul: Düşün Yayıncılık, 2018.
- Eryücel, Sema. *Yaşam Olayları ve Dini Başa Çıkma*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 2013.
- Eryücel, Sema. "Self-Handicapping and Spiritual Well-Being". *Uluslararası Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 11/59 (2018a), 661-670.
- Eryücel, Sema. "Koruma Altındaki Çocuklara Yönelik Dini Manevi Rehberlik Uygulamaları ile Umut ve Psikolojik Sağlık İlişkisi". *Akademik Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi* 6/80 (2018b) 367-385.



- Feyzioğlu, Eda. *Ekoloji, İnsan ve Din*. Konya: Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2011.
- Fincham, Frank et.all "Attitudes Toward Intimate Partner Violence in Dating Relationships". *Psychological Assessment* 20 (2008) 260–269.
- Geçioğlu, Ahmet Rifat - Kayıklık, Hasan. "Dindarlık ve Evlilik Uyumu İlişkisi Evli Bireyler Üzerine Bir İnceleme". *Çukurova Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 19/1 (2019), 202-224.
- Ghodratı, Fatemeh et. all "The Relationship Between Religious Attitude And Domestic Violence Against Women of Reproductive Age". *Journal of Midwifery And Reproductive Health* 7/1 (2019), 1522-1526.
- Gordon, Kristina Coop. ve Baucom, Donald (2003). "Forgiveness and Marriage: Preliminary Support for a Measure Based on A Model of Recovery from A Marital Betrayal". *The American Journal of Family Therapy*, 31: 179-199.
- Goodman, Peggy. "The Relationship Between İntimate Partner Violence and Other Forms of Family and Societal Violence". *Emergency Medicine Clinics of North America* 24 (2006), 889-903.
- Hill, Peter et.all "Conceptualizing Religion and Spirituality: Points of Commonality, Points of Departure". *Journal for The Theory of Social Behavior* 30 (2000), 51– 77.
- Jewkes, Rachel. "Intimate partner violence: causes and prevention". *The Lancet*, 359/9315 (2002),1423–1429.
- Kalyoncu, Hamdi. *Aile İçi Şiddet ve Şiddet Ortamında Çocuklar*. İstanbul: Yediveren Yayınları, 2014.
- Karaca, Faruk - Acar, Muhammed Cevad. "Psikolojik Danışma Sürecinde Kullanılan Dinî/Manevi Temelli Müdahalelerin Vaka Analizi Yöntemi ile İncelenmesi Üzerine Bir Araştırma". *Sağlık Hizmetlerinde Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik* ed. Ali Ayten et.all 267-28. İstanbul: Değerler Eğitimi Merkezi Yayınları, 2019.
- Kaya Sakarya, Alime. *Üniversitede Öğrenim Gören Gençlerde Flörtte Şiddet*. Konya: Necmettin Erbakan Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2013.
- Keçeci, Berra. *Evlü Kadınların Psikolojik İstismar Profillerinin Toplumsal Cinsiyet Algıları ve Spiritüel İyi Oluşları Açısından İncelenmesi*. İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2018.
- Keçeci, Berra ve Ekşi, Halil. "Evlü Kadınlarda Toplumsal Cinsiyet Algısı ve Spiritüel İyi Halinin Psikolojik İstismar Üzerine Etkisi" *Marmara Üniversitesi Kadın ve Toplumsal Cinsiyet Araştırmaları Dergisi* 4-1(2020), 30- 48.
- Kızılgeçit, Muhammet. *Din Psikolojisinin 100'ü*. Ankara: Otto Yayınları, 2017.
- Kızılırmak, Özlem. *Genç Yetişkinlerde Yaşamda Anlamın Maneviyat ve Kişilik Özellikleri Açısından İncelenmesi*. Ankara: Gazi Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2015.
- Klavuz. Mehmet Akif - Klavuz, Esra. "Yaşlanma Döneminde Kayıplarla Başa Çıkma Manevi Danışmanlık Hizmetlerinin Önemi". *Manevi Danışmanlık ve Rehberlik*. ed. Ali Ayten et.all 17-38. İstanbul: Dem Yayınları, 2016.

- Kocacık, Faruk - Çağlayandereli, Mustafa. "Ailede Kadına Yönelik Şiddet: Denizli İli Örneği" *Uluslararası İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi* 6/2 (2009), 24-43.
- KSGM, Kadın Statüsü Genel Müdürlüğü. *Türkiye'de Kadına Yönelik Aile İçi Şiddet*. Ankara: Elma Teknik Basım Matbaacılık, 2009.
- Kuruçay, Yasin ve Gürses, İbrahim. "Ergenlerde Anlamsızlık ile İlgili Problemlere Dinin Etkisi Üzerine Değerlendirmeler". *İnönü Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 9/1 (2018), 87-111.
- Moses, Rafael. "Şiddet Nerede Başlıyor". çev. Ayşe Kul. *Cogito* 23/27 (1996), 6-7.
- Öz, Fatma. "Yaşamın Son Evresi: Yaşlılık Psikososyal Açıdan Gözden Geçirme" *Kriz Dergisi* 10/2 (2002), 17-28.
- Özasma, Halil İbrahim. *Eşler Arası İletişim ve Maneviyat*. Ankara. Sonçağ Akademi, 2021
- Özdoğan, Öznur. *İsimsiz Hayatlar Manevi ve Psikolojik Yaklaşımla Arınma ve Öze Dönüş*. Ankara: Özdenöze Yayınları, 2009.
- Özgüven, İbrahim Ethem. *Ailede İletişim ve Yaşam*. Ankara: Pdrem Yayınları, 2001.
- Öztürk, Emine. *Türkiye'de Aile İçi Şiddet*. Ankara: Gece Kitaplığı, 2017.
- Rosen-Grandon, Jane et.all "The relationship between marital characteristics, marital interaction processes, and marital satisfaction". *Journal of Counseling & Development* 82/1 (2004), 58-68.
- Solak, Adem. *Şiddet Kültürü Türkiye'nin Suç ve Sosyal Risk Haritası*. Ankara: Hegem Yayınları, 2016.
- Stanard, Rebecca, Powell et.all 2000. "Assessment of spirituality incounseling". *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 78/2 (2000), 204-210.
- Şirin, Turgay. "Evli Çiftlerin Spiritüel İyi Oluşları ile Evlilik Doyumları Arasındaki İlişki". *Ekev Akademi Dergisi* 23/77 (2019), 389-410.
- Tezcan, Mahmut. "Bir şiddet ortamı olarak okul". *Cogito* 6/7 (1996), 105-108.
- Tutarel Kışlak, Şennur -Göztepe, Işıl. "Duygu Dışavurumu, Empati, Depresyon ve Evlilik Uyumu Arasındaki İlişkiler" *Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 3/2 (2012), 27-46.
- Tuzcuoğlu, Necla. "Şiddet ve Şiddete Neden Olan Etkenler ve Çözüm Yolları". *Aile ve Şiddet*. Ed. Adem, Solak. 193-220. Ankara: Hegem Yayıncılık, 2010.
- Ulu, Mustafa. "Şiddet ve Kişilik İlişkisi Üzerine Psikolojik Bir Araştırma". *Bilimname Dergisi* 12/3 (2016), 57-82.
- Westgate, Charlene. E. "Spiritual Wellness and Depression". *Journal of Counseling & Development* 75 (1996), 26-35.
- WHO, World Health Organization. *World Report on Violence and Health*. Geneva: Publications of the World Health Organization, 2002. [https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/42495/9241545615\\_eng.pdf](https://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/42495/9241545615_eng.pdf)
- WHO, World Health Organization. *WHO Multi-Country Study on Women's Health and Domestic Violence Against Women*. Geneva: Publications of the World Health Organization 2005 Erişim Tarihi:

28/05/2021.[http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/43310/9241593512\\_eng.pdf?sequence](http://apps.who.int/iris/bitstream/handle/10665/43310/9241593512_eng.pdf?sequence)

Yapıcı, Asım. “Eşlerin Dinsel Algı ve Yaşayışına Göre Evlilikte Dindarlık ve Maneviyat Huzur mu Kusur mu?”. *Turkish Studies* 12/2 (2018), 79-106.

Yiğit, Elifsu. *Evlü Kadınlarında Aile İçi Şiddet ile Evlilik Doyumu ve Psikolojik İyi Oluş Arasındaki İlişkinin İncelenmesi*. İstanbul: Beykent Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2018.

Zinnbauer, Brian. J et.all “Religion and spirituality: Unfuzzifying the fuzzy”. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion* 36 (1997), 549-564.

Zinnbauer, Brian - Pargament, Kenneth. “Dindarlık ve Maneviyat”. çev. Sevde Düzgüner. *Din ve Maneviyat Psikolojisi Temel Yaklaşımlar ve İlgili Alanları*. çev. ed. İhsan Çapçioğlu-Ali. Ayten. 61-102. Ankara: Phoenix Yayınevi, 2013.

Şırnak Üniversitesi  
İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi



Şırnak University  
Journal of Divinity Faculty

ISSN: 2146-4901  
e-ISSN: 2667-6575

## YAZAR KATKI ORANI BEYANI (AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION STATEMENT)

**Makale Bilgisi (Article Information):** Attitudes to Violence and Spiritual Well-Being among Married Individuals - *Evlü Bireylerde Şiddete Yönelik Tutum ve Manevî İyi Olma*

Makaledeki Yazar Katkılarının Yüzde ile Gösterilmesi (Showing Author Contributions in the Article as Percent)		1. Sorumlu Yazar (Responsible Author)	2. Katkı Sunan Yazar (Contributer Author)
Çalışmanın Tasarlanması	Conceiving the Study	%20	%80
Veri Toplanması:	Data Collection	%100	%0
Veri Analizi	Data Analysis	%80	%20
Makalenin Yazımı	Writingup	%70	%30
Makale Gönderimi ve Revizyonu	Submission and Revision	%50	%50

Not(e): Belgenin imzalı asıl nüshası dergi süreç dosyalarında mevcuttur (*The signed original copy of the document is available in the journal process files archive*).



ISSN: 2146-4901  
e-ISSN: 2667-6575

## The Relationship between Attachment to God, Perception of God and Emotional States, and Psychological Well-being: The Sample of Chronic Diseases

*Tanrı'ya Bağlanma, Tanrı Algısı ve Duygu Durumları ile Psikolojik İyi Olma Arasındaki İlişki: Kronik Hastalıklar Örneği*

**Fatma SAĞLAM DEMİRKAN**

ORCID: 0000-0001-7085-9919 - E-Posta [saglam.fatma@gmail.com](mailto:saglam.fatma@gmail.com)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Kafkas University Faculty of Theology, Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies, Department of Psychology of Religion

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Kafkas Üniversitesi, Felsefe ve Din Bilimleri Bölümü, Din Psikolojisi Anabilim Dalı  
Kars, Türkiye  
ROR: 04v302n28

### Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

**Citation / Atıf:** Demirkan, Fatma Sağlam. "The Relationship between Attachment to God, Perception of God and Emotional State, and Psychological Well-being: The Sample of Chronic Diseases". *Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31 (Haziran 2023), 100-121.  
<https://doi.org/10.35415/sirnakifd.1255773>

Date of Submission ( <i>Geliş Tarihi</i> )	24. 02. 2023
Date of Acceptance ( <i>Kabul Tarihi</i> )	29. 05. 2023
Date of Publication ( <i>Yayın Tarihi</i> )	15. 06. 2023
Article Type ( <i>Makale Türü</i> )	Research Article ( <i>Araştırma Makalesi</i> )
Peer-Review ( <i>Değerlendirme</i> )	Double anonymized - Two External ( <i>İki Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körleme</i> ).
Ethical Statement ( <i>Etik Beyan</i> )	It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited. ( <i>Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.</i> )
Plagiarism Checks ( <i>Benzerlik Taraması</i> )	Yes ( <i>Evet</i> ) – Turnitin / Ithenticate.
Conflicts of Interest ( <i>Çıkar Çatışması</i> )	The author(s) has no conflict of interest to declare ( <i>Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.</i> )
Complaints ( <i>Etik Beyan Adresi</i> )	<a href="mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com">suifdergi@gmail.com</a>
Grant Support ( <i>Finansman</i> )	The author(s) acknowledge that they received no external funding in support of this research. ( <i>Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır.</i> )
Copyright & License ( <i>Telif Hakkı ve Lisans</i> )	Authors publishing with the journal retain the copyright to their work licensed under the CC BY-NC 4.0. ( <i>Yazarlar dergide yayınlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmalarını CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.</i> )

## **Abstract**

Worldwide population growth, inadequate and unhealthy living conditions are among the main reasons that increase the number of people with chronic diseases. Chronic diseases generally consist of cardiovascular diseases, cancers, diabetes, stroke, and chronic respiratory diseases. Although chronic diseases usually develop due to advancing age, they may sometimes be seen at young ages. These diseases progress slowly and require regular and continuous treatment and care. In addition, the number of individuals with chronic diseases is increasing day by day due to the increase in population, and since it is not possible to cure the disease, patients are given supportive treatment. In addition to drug treatment, psycho-educational programs are applied to patients by specialists. In other words, patients are informed about the conditions that may cause the disease, what to pay attention to and how the disease can affect their lives. Because high mortality rates due to chronic diseases can negatively affect the psychological health of patients. In this process, patients are informed about the ways of coping with the problems brought about by the disease and psychological support is provided to them as necessary. If a psychopathological condition has developed due to the disease, psychological treatment can be started for the patient. To the extent that the patient gives consent, moral support practices can also be used during the treatment process. Here, a holistic approach to the patient's problems is important for patient health. According to the World Health Organization's definition, health is a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being of the individual. Well-being is divided into two as subjective well-being and psychological well-being. According to Ryff, psychological well-being is the state of being aware that a person with a complex structure is a whole and that they have their own responsibility to protect, maintain and improve their well-being in this whole. This research was conducted to determine whether attachment to God, perception of God and emotional state predict psychological well-being. For this purpose, adult individuals with chronic diseases were included in this study. The research sample consisted of 304 individuals residing in different provinces of Turkey and having chronic diseases. The age range of the sample is between 25 and 72 and the mean age is 47.98. This research, in which scanning method and survey technique were used is fieldwork. In this research, God Attachment Inventory, God Perception Scale and Psychological Well-Being Scale were used as data collection tools. The data were analyzed with the SPSS package program. The findings show that attachment to God, perception of God and emotional states are among the variables that predict psychological well-being. The other variables predicting psychological well-being; loving God, anxious attachment to God, anxious mood, high school and secondary school graduate, conditional God, restless emotional state, and the place where their spent most of their life (village-town). This study showed that there was a relationship between the biological, psychological and spiritual dimensions of human beings. This study will provide data for spiritual counseling and guidance services in health field.

**Keywords:** Psychological Well-being, Perception of God, Attachment to God, Positive Emotions and Negative Emotions.

## Özet

Dünya genelinde yaşanan nüfus artışı, yetersiz ve sağlıksız yaşam koşulları ve diğerleri kronik hasta sayısında artışa neden olmaktadır. Kronik hastalıklar genellikle kalp damar hastalıkları, kanserler, diyabet, inme ve kronik solunum yolu hastalıklardan oluşmaktadır. Kronik hastalıklar genellikle ilerleyen yaşa bağlı olarak gelişse de bazen küçük yaşlarda görülebilir. Ayrıca nüfus artışına bağlı olarak kronik hastalığı olan bireylerin sayısı her geçen gün artmakta ve hastalığın tedavisi mümkün olmadığı için hastalara destek tedavisi verilmektedir. İlaç tedavisinin yanında uzmanlar tarafından hastalara psiko-eğitim programları uygulanmaktadır. Yani hastalığa neden olabilecek durumlar, nelere dikkat edilmesi gerektiği ve hastalığın hayatını nasıl etkileyebileceği hakkında hastalar bilgilendirilmektedir. Çünkü kronik hastalıklara bağlı ölüm oranlarının yüksek olması hastaların psikolojik sağlığını olumsuz etkileyebilmektedir. Bu süreçte hastalar; hastalığın getirdiği sorunlarla başa çıkma yolları hakkında bilgilendirilmekte ve onlara gerektiği ölçüde psikolojik destek sağlanmaktadır. Hastalığa bağlı psikopatolojik bir durum gelişmiş ise hastaya psikolojik bir tedavi başlanabilir. Hasta onay verdiği ölçüde tedavi sürecinde manevi destek uygulamaları da kullanılabilir. Burada hastanın sorunlarına bütüncül yaklaşım sergilenmesi hasta sağlığı açısından önemlidir. Dünya Sağlık Örgütü'nün (DSÖ) sağlık tanımına göre sağlık bireyin fiziksel, ruhsal ve sosyal yönden tam anlamıyla bir iyilik halidir. İyi oluş hali, öznel iyi oluş ve psikolojik iyi oluş olarak ikiye ayrılmaktadır. Ryff'e göre psikolojik iyi oluş, karmaşık bir yapıya sahip olan insanın bir bütün olduğunun ve bu bütün içinde iyiliğini korumak, sürdürmek ve geliştirmek için kendi sorumluluğunu taşıdığı farkında olma halidir. Bu araştırma, Tanrı'ya bağlanma, Tanrı algısı ve duygusal durumun psikolojik iyi oluşu yordayıp yordamadığını belirlemek amacıyla yapılmıştır. Bu amaç doğrultusunda kronik hastalığı olan yetişkin bireyler araştırmaya dahil edilmiştir. Araştırma örnekleme, Türkiye'nin farklı illerinde ikamet eden ve kronik hastalığı olan 304 bireyden oluşmaktadır. Örneklemin yaş aralığı 25 ile 72 olup yaş ortalaması 47,98'dir. Tarama yöntemi ve anket tekniğinin kullanıldığı bu araştırma; saha araştırması niteliğine sahiptir. Araştırmada veri toplama aracı olarak, Tanrı'ya Bağlanma Envanteri, Tanrı Algısı Ölçeği ve Psikolojik İyi Oluş Ölçeği kullanılmıştır. Veriler SPSS paket programıyla analiz edilmiştir. Elde edilen bulgulara göre; Tanrı'ya bağlanma, Tanrı algısı ve duygu durumlarının, psikolojik iyi oluşu yordayan değişkenler arasında olduğu söylenebilir. Psikolojik iyi olma halini yordayan diğer değişkenler; Allah sevgisi, Allah'a kaygılı bağlanma, duygu durumu kaygılı, lise ve ortaokul mezunu, koşullu Allah algısı, duygu durumu huzursuz, hayatının çoğunu geçirdiği yer (köy-kasaba), olarak belirlenmiştir. Bu çalışma insanın biyolojik, psikolojik ve manevi yönleri arasında bir ilişki olduğunu göstermektedir. Bu çalışmanın, sağlık alanında yapılan manevi danışmanlık ve rehberlik hizmetlerine veri sağlayacağı düşünülmektedir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Psikolojik İyi Oluş, Allah Algısı, Allah'a Bağlanma, Olumlu Duygular ve Olumsuz Duygular

## Introduction

Attachment is which develops in different ways depending on that basic needs, such as their child's hunger-thirst, sleep, protection, and love, are met by the parents sufficiently and when needed.<sup>1</sup> Meeting the needs at a sufficient level and at the desired time enables the child to develop a positive attitude toward the caregiver. However, not meeting the needs adequately and on time causes the child to develop negative attitudes towards the caregiver. Attitudes are which developed towards parents emerge with the effect of internal working models. As a product of synthesizing emotional, mental, and behavioral processes, internal working models determine how attachment styles will develop. According to the developing attachment styles, the attitudes and behaviors that the child will develop in the face of events and situations are shaped.<sup>2</sup>

The development of the religion-individual relationship is determined not only by internal working models, but also by parental religiosity.<sup>3</sup> According to the correspondence hypothesis, parental attachment styles and parental religiosity determine the child's religiosity. Kirkpatrick's study on the relationship between parental religiosity and attachment styles of individuals concluded that individuals who have insecure attachments to religious parents and those with secure attachments to non-religious parents are less likely to be religious. At the same time, individuals who have secure attachments to religious parents and those with insecure attachments to non-religious parents are more likely to be religious.<sup>4</sup> As can be seen, the parent's lifestyle and their parent's relationship with the child also shape the child's relationship. Individuals who are securely attached to the attachment figure are expected to have a high level of well-being because they have a positive self-perception.<sup>5</sup> It has been determined in some studies that there is a relationship between attachment style and well-being.<sup>6</sup> So what does well-being mean?

<sup>1</sup> Burcu Çalık Bağrıyanık, et al. "Sağlıklı Ebeveyn- Bebek Bağlanması". *Eurasian Journal of Health Science*, 3/2 (2020), 42.

<sup>2</sup> John Bowlby. *Bağlanma*, çev. Tuğrul Veli Soylu (İstanbul: Pinhan Yay. 2012), 327-33.

<sup>3</sup> Angie McDonald, Richard Beck, Larry Norsworthy, "Attachment to God and Parents: Testing the Correspondence vs. Compensation Hypotheses", *Journal of Psychology and Christianity*, 24/1 (2005), 22.

<sup>4</sup> Lee A. Kirkpatrick, *Attachment, Evolution, and the Psychology of Religion* (New York&London: Guilford Press, 2005), 113.

<sup>5</sup> Çiğdem Berber Çelik, "Bağlanma Stilleri, Psikolojik İyi Oluş ve Sosyal Güvende Hissetme: Aralarındaki İlişki Ne?", *Bayburt Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 13/25 (2018), 34.

<sup>6</sup> Kemal Baytemir, "Ergenlikte Ebeveyn ve Akranına Bağlanma ile Öznel İyi Oluş Arasındaki İlişkide Kişilerarası Yeterliğin Aracılığı", *Eğitim ve Bilim Dergisi*, 41/186 (2016), 82; Rosario J. Marrero-Quevedo, Pedro J. Blanco-Hernández, Juan A. Hernández-Cabrera, "Adult Attachment and Psychological Well-Being: The Mediating



In the historical process, the state of well-being has been used with different names and definitions. Ancient philosophers used the concept of happiness instead of well-being. By considering the concept of happiness within the scope of moral philosophy, they associated the concept of happiness with concepts such as taking pleasure, benefiting, and being virtuous.<sup>7</sup> Aristippus aimed to achieve happiness based on the principle of "pleasure is the highest and pain the lowest (it should be avoided)."<sup>8</sup> Pleasures are generally divided into two groups: sensory pleasures and intellectual pleasures.<sup>9</sup> It can be said that sensory pleasures are more related to subjective well-being, while intellectual pleasures are related to psychological well-being.

Three philosophical views of happiness: life satisfaction, hedonic well-being (e.g., emotional well-being, happiness, subjective well-being), and eudaimonia (psychological well-being, self-realization, individual development, and mental health development).<sup>10</sup> The characteristics of psychological well-being are self-awareness, awareness of positive personal characteristics, being satisfied with life, being consistent, keeping positive and negative emotions in balance, being in a state of general optimism, and progressing towards self-development.<sup>11</sup> Psychological well-being refers to the holistic development of the individual, including cognitive, emotional, physical, spiritual, self and social processes.<sup>12</sup> The person who covers and defines psychological well-being in the most comprehensive way is Carol Ryff. Ryff used different theories and phenomena while defining psychological well-being. Psychological well-being concept of Ryff includes *Maslow's conception of self-actualization, Roger's view of the fully functioning person, Jung's formulation of individuation, and Allport's*

---

Role of Personality", *Journal of Adult Development*, 26 (2019), 41; Vincenzo Calvo, et al., "Attachment and well-being: Mediatory roles of mindfulness, psychological inflexibility, and resilience", *Current Psychology*, Vol 41, 2022, 2966–2979.

<sup>7</sup> Ahmet Cevizci, *Felsefe Sözlüğü* (İstanbul, Paradigma yay., 1999), 612-613.

<sup>8</sup> Encyclopaedia Britannica, "Aristippus: Greek philosopher", Accessing 20 November 2022: <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Aristippus>; Cevizci, *Felsefe Sözlüğü*, 73; Gunnar Skirbekk, Nils Gilje, *Felsefe Tarihi*, çev: Emrullah Akbaş, Şule Mutlu, (İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversitesi Kitabevi), 127.

<sup>9</sup> Cevizci, *Felsefe Sözlüğü*, 402.

<sup>10</sup> M. Joseph Sirgy, *The Psychology of Quality of Life: Hedonic Well-Being, Life Satisfaction, and Eudaimonia*, 2. ed., (New York & London: Springer, 2012), 7-18.

<sup>11</sup> Carol D. Ryff, Burton H. Singer, "Know Thyself and Become What You Are: A Eudaimonic Approach to Psychological Well-being", *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 9/1, (2008), 20.

<sup>12</sup> Brett Roothman, Doret K. Kirsten, Marie P. Wissing, "Gender Differences In Aspects of Psychological Wellbeing", *South African Journal Of Psychology*, 33/4, (2003), 212.

*conception of maturity*.<sup>13</sup> In addition, according to Ryff, there are six dimensions that characterize the individual's psychological well-being.<sup>14</sup>

(1) Self-acceptance: It can be defined as a person's acceptance of themselves with their positive and negative aspects. If the person's self-acceptance level is high, a positive self-perception occurs, and if it is low, a negative self-perception occurs.

(2) Positive Relations with others: Individuals who act for self-actualization establish positive relationships with other people. A positive relationship is built on love, empathy, compassion, deep friendship and identification.

(3) Autonomy: It is the ability of a person to make their decisions, to be independent and to regulate their behavior with intrinsic motivation. By activating the internal evaluation focus, the persons create their own characteristics.

(4) Environmental Mastery: It is defined as an individual's preference for environments suitable for their psychological health. It is about the extent to which an individual takes advantage of environmental opportunities. Being active in the relationship with the environment and dominating the environment contributes to the person's development.

(5) Purpose in Life: It represents thoughts and beliefs that give an individual the feeling that life has purpose and meaning. An individual who behaves in line with these thoughts and beliefs is hopeful. Because the purpose of life adds meaning to their life by enabling the individual to progress in line with certain goals.

(6) Personal Growth: An individual needs to gain experience to develop themselves and reveal their potential. As in Maslow's hierarchy of needs, self-actualization is the ultimate goal of human life. In line with this purpose, the individual wants to develop and have unique characteristics.

This study aims to determine how the psychological and spiritual aspects of the individuals who receive continuous treatment and care due to their illness are related to each other. For this purpose, individuals with at least one chronic disease were included in the study. This research investigated whether demographic characteristics (gender, age, marital

---

<sup>13</sup> Carol D. Ryff, Burton Singer, "Psychological Well-Being: Meaning, Measurement, and Implications for Psychotherapy Research". *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics*, 65/1, (1996), 14.

<sup>14</sup> Carol D. Ryff, Burton Singer, "Psychological Well-Being: Meaning, Measurement, and Implications for Psychotherapy Research". 15

status, financial situation, education level, place of residence), emotional state, attachment styles, and perception of God have a predictive effect on psychological well-being. The following hypotheses were formed within the framework of this question:

Hypotheses:

(H<sub>1</sub>) There is a relationship between God's perception and psychological well-being.

(H<sub>2</sub>) There is a negative relationship between insecure attachment to God and psychological well-being and a positive relationship with secure attachment.

(H<sub>3</sub>) There is a positive relationship between positive mood states and psychological well-being and a negative relationship with negative mood states.

(H<sub>4</sub>) Individuals with chronic disease feel more anxious.

## **2. Method**

This research is a relational research type of quantitative research design. In this study, a scanning model was used as a method. The research data were obtained using the questionnaire technique.

### **2.1. Data Collection Tools**

#### **2.1.1. Personal information form**

In the personal information form, questions about gender, age, marital status, educational status, and economic status were included to introduce the participants. At the same time, the question 'How do you evaluate your mood in general?' was posed. Emotions felt hopeful, cheerful, peaceful, pessimistic, anxious and restless were included in the choices.

#### **2.1.2. The Attachment to God Inventory**

The Attachment to God Inventory was developed by Richard Beck and Angie McDonald in 2004 (Attachment to God Inventory AGI).<sup>15</sup> The adaptation of the form to Turkish was made by Subaşı. AGI, which consists of 26 questions, was determined as three dimensions as a result of factor analysis (KMO = .827; Cronbach alpha = .787;  $\chi^2 = 1.221$ ;  $p = 0.000$ ). These dimensions are; avoidance, anxiety and trust dimensions. The Attachment to God Inventory consists of three sub-dimensions: secure attachment, avoidant attachment,

---

<sup>15</sup> R. Beck, ve A. McDonald, "Attachment to God: The Attachment to God Inventory, Test of Working Model Correspondence, and and Exploration of Faith Group Differences", *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 32/2, (2004), 92-103.

and anxious attachment. The questions of the confidence dimension are 2, 4, 8, 9, 10, 13, 16, 18, 19, 20, 22, 23, 24 and 26. The questions of the anxiety dimension are 3, 5, 14, 18 and 25. The questions of the avoidance dimension are 1, 6, 7 and 11. The Cronbach's alpha values obtained were .849 for the confidence dimension, .770 for the anxiety dimension and .570 for the avoidance dimension. In general, Cronbach's alpha value of AGI is .787. The questions in the inventory were measured with a 7-point Likert type rating.<sup>16</sup>

### 2.1.3. God Perception Scale

The God Perception Scale of Halstead & Hautus was adapted into Turkish by Akın et al. The analysis results of the form adapted to Turkish are as follows: In the confirmatory factor analysis, the model consisting of 16 items and two dimensions (loving God and conditional God) was found to fit well ( $\chi^2 = 264.43$ ,  $sd = 97$ , RMSEA = .069, CFI = .91, IFI = .91, NFI = .85, RFI = .82, GFI = .92, SRMR = .069). The internal consistency reliability coefficients of the scale were .83 for the loving God sub-dimension, .56 for the conditional God sub-dimension, and .67 for the whole scale. The factor loadings of the scale range from .27 to .77, and the corrected item-total correlation coefficients range from .10 to .68. The perceptions of God scale consists of two dimensions, which are loving God and conditional God. The items of loving God are 4,5,7,8,12,13,14 and 16. The items of the conditional God are 1,2,3,6,9,10,11 and 15. Reverse coded items in the scale are 1,2,3,6,9,10,11 and 15. The scale consists of 16 items and has a 5-point Likert-type rating.<sup>17</sup>

### 2.1.4. Psychological Well-being Scales

The Psychological Well-being Scale developed by Ryff (1989) is a total of 84 items consisting of six sub-dimensions and 14 items in each dimension.<sup>18</sup> The Turkish adaptation of this scale form was carried out by Akın (2008). It was observed that the internal consistency coefficients of the psychological well-being scales ranged from .87 to .96. The test-retest reliability ranged from .78 to .97. Within the scope of this study, the internal consistency

<sup>16</sup> Hacer Subaşı. *Üniversite Öğrencilerinin Tanrı İle İlişkilerinin Bağlanma Kuramı Açısından Değerlendirilmesi*, (İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisans Tezi, 2012), 89.

<sup>17</sup> Ahmet Akın, et.al. "The Validity and Reliability of the Turkish Version of the Religious Activities Scale". Paper presented at the 2nd International Conference on Ethics Education, (Ankara, May 21-23, 2014).

<sup>18</sup> C. D. Ryff. "Happiness is Everything, or Is It? Explorations On The Meaning Of Psychological Wellbeing". *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 57, (1989). 1072.

coefficient of the scale was calculated as .89.<sup>19</sup> The scale consists of 18 items and has a 5-point Likert-type rating. The scale consists of six sub-dimensions: autonomy, environmental mastery, personal growth, positive relationships with others, purpose in life and self-acceptance. Reverse-coded items in each subscale are as follows: Autonomy: 2, 20, 32, 44, 56, 62, 74; Environmental Dominance: 9, 15, 27, 45, 63, 75; Personal Growth: 4, 22, 34, 58, 76, 82; Positive Relationships with Others: 7, 13, 31, 43, 55, 61, 73; Purposes in Life : 11, 17, 29, 35, 41, 65, 83 and Self-acceptance: 18, 24, 42, 54, 60, 66, 84.<sup>20</sup>

## **2.2. Data Collection and Analysis**

Before starting the present study, ethics committee approval was obtained from Kafkas University Social and Human Sciences Scientific Research and Publication Ethics Committee to conduct this research in a healthy and legal manner. The average time to fill out the questionnaire was between 15-20 minutes. The application was made between June 2021 and April 2022. For data analysis, the data were evaluated using the SPSS 21.0 statistical program.

Within the scope of this research, descriptive statistics were used to determine the characteristics of the participants. For the research questions, multiple regression and correlational analysis were performed. Before proceeding to the multiple regression analysis, it was checked whether the assumptions were met. Only one of the variables of the God Perception Scale total score and the Love for God dimension score, in which the bilateral correlation values of the independent variables were above 0.80, were included in the multiple regression. The binary correlation values of the other independent variables were below 0.80, the VIF values were less than 10, the tolerance values were higher than 0.20, and it was concluded that there was no multicollinearity problem. Since Durbin-Watson values were between 0-2.5, it was accepted that there was no autocorrelation. In addition, dummy coding was used while demographic variables were included in the analysis. The stepwise regression method was used in the multiple regression analysis.

---

<sup>19</sup> Ahmet Akın. "Psikolojik İyi Olma Ölçekleri (PİÖÖ): Geçerlilik ve Güvenirlilik Çalışması, Kuram ve Uygulamada", *Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, 8/3, (2008), 721.

<sup>20</sup> Ahmet Akın. "Psikolojik İyi Olma Ölçekleri (PİÖÖ): Geçerlilik ve Güvenirlilik Çalışması, Kuram ve Uygulamada", *Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, 8/3, (2008), 739.

## Results

Frequency and percentage statistics were computed to analyze the emotional states of individuals with chronic illnesses, and the findings are presented in Table 1.

**Table 1.** Emotional State of the Participants in Daily Life

Predictor	Min.	Max.	$\bar{X}$	SD
Age	25	72	47,98	6,47
Variable	Levels	n	%	
General Evaluation Of Mood In Daily Life	Hopeful	24	7,89	
	Cheerful	24	7,89	
	Peaceful	86	28,29	
	Pessimistic	28	9,21	
	Anxious	117	38,49	
	Uneasy	25	8,22	

*Min.:minimal value, Max.: Maximum value,  $\bar{X}$ :Mean, sd: Standard deviation, n: Number of subjects, %: Percent*

When Table 1 was examined, the general mood states of the participants in daily life were 7.89% (n = 24) hopeful, 7.89% (n = 24) cheerful, 28.29% (n = 86) peaceful, 9.21 (n = 28) rated it as pessimistic, 34.49% (n = 117) as anxious and 8.22% (n = 25) as uneasy.

Descriptive statistic regarding the psychological well-being scale score used in the study were presented in Table 2.

**Table 2.** Descriptive statistics of scale scores

	$\bar{X}$	$\bar{X}$ / Number of items	ss	Skewness	Kurtosis	
Psychological Well-being Scale	Self-acceptance	10,83	3,61	2,60	-,642	-,152
	Personal growth	11,11	3,70	2,55	-,525	-,640
	Purpose in life	10,72	3,57	1,73	-,309	1,310
	Positive relations with other	10,49	3,50	2,43	,010	-1,058
	Environmental mastery	8,56	2,85	3,19	-,392	-1,164
	Autonomy	11,13	3,71	1,75	-,515	1,311
	Total	62,84	3,49	9,71	-,456	-,418

*Min.:minimal value, Mak.: Maximum value,  $\bar{X}$ :Mean, ss: Standard deviation*

When Table 2 was examined, Psychological Well-being Scale self-acceptance mean score was 10.83; personal growth average score of 11.11; the purpose in life mean score was 10.72; the mean score of establishing positive relationships with other was 10.49; the environmental mastery mean score was 8.56; The average autonomy score was 11.13 and the scale total score average was 62.84. When the values obtained by dividing the mean by the

number of items in the scale were examined, the personal growth and autonomy with chronic diseases were the highest, and the environmental mastery levels were the lowest. When the skewness and kurtosis values were examined, it was seen that the scale scores generally approached the normal distribution. However, it was seen that only God Perception Scale conditional God scores were markedly sharpened and skewed to the left.

To examine the predictive effects of the demographic characteristics (gender, age, marital status, financial situation, graduation status, place where they spend most of their life), the emotional states they described, their God attachment styles and their perception of God, on the psychological well-being of individuals with chronic disease. Multiple regression analysis was performed. The results were presented in Table 3.

**Table 3.** Examination of the variables that predict the psychological well-being levels of individuals with chronic diseases

Model	B	Standard Error	$\beta$	t	p	R	R <sup>2</sup>
<i>Regression 1 (Dependent variable: Self-acceptance)</i>							
Invariant	5,339	1,745		3,060	,002		
Loving God	,131	,023	,370	5,579	,000		
Mood (anxious)	-2,140	,288	-,402	-7,442	,000		
Anxious attachment to God	-,119	,023	-,247	-5,226	,000		
Age	,059	,017	,146	3,498	,001		
Mood (uneasy)	-2,115	,455	-,224	-4,644	,000	0,76	0,58
Mood (pessimistic)	-1,081	,377	-,121	-2,864	,004		
Conditional God	,090	,033	,146	2,717	,007		
Monthly income (We generally meet my needs)	-,612	,276	-,094	-2,219	,027		
Educational status (high school)	,475	,223	,090	2,129	,034		
					F(9, 293)=45,444; p = 0,000		
<i>Regression 2 (Dependent variable: Personal Growth)</i>							
Invariant	2,005	1,571		1,276	,203		
Loving God	,203	,022	,587	9,237	,000		
Anxious attachment to God	-,138	,023	-,291	-6,082	,000		
Educational status (high school)	,709	,211	,138	3,364	,001		
Conditional God	,161	,033	,266	4,941	,000	0,77	0,59
Avoidant attachment to God	,132	,032	,167	4,055	,000		
Mood (anxious)	-1,024	,249	-,196	-4,112	,000		
Mood (uneasy)	-1,130	,416	-,122	-2,715	,007		
					F(7, 295)=60,179; p = 0,000		
<i>Regression 3 (Dependent variable: Purpose in Life)</i>							
Invariant	10,153	,859		11,823	,000		
Anxious attachment to God	-,046	,019	-,141	-2,408	,017	0,21	0,04
Secure attachment to God	,021	,010	,121	2,065	,040		
					F(2, 300)=6,853; p = 0,001		
<i>Regression 4 (Dependent variable: Positive Relations with Other)</i>							
Invariant	11,459	,941		12,182	,000	0,45	0,20

Anxious attachment to God	-,166	,028	-,366	-6,012	,000		
Loving God	,071	,019	,215	3,839	,000		
Educational status (undergraduate)	-,866	,350	-,142	-2,476	,014		
F(3, 299)=25,571; p = 0,000							
<i>Regression 5 (Dependent variable: Environmental Mastery)</i>							
Invariant	7,651	1,022		7,488	,000		
Loving God	,135	,021	,311	6,345	,000		
Mood (anxious)	-2,833	,318	-,433	-8,898	,000		
Mood (uneasy)	-2,934	,527	-,253	-5,563	,000		
Eğitim durumu (ortaokul)	-,761	,259	-,114	-2,933	,004	0,79	0,63
Anxious attachment to God	-,086	,023	-,144	-3,696	,000		
Mood (pessimistic)	-1,393	,432	-,126	-3,224	,001		
Place spent most of their life (village-town)	-,743	,320	-,088	-2,325	,021		
F(7, 295)=72,512; p = 0,000							
<i>Regression 6 (Dependent variable: Autonomy)</i>							
Invariant	12,997	,408		31,842	,000		
Anxious attachment to God	-,101	,020	-,311	-5,107	,000		
Educational status (undergraduate)	-,847	,269	-,193	-3,147	,002	0,32	0,10
Place spent most of their life (district)	,623	,210	,167	2,962	,003		
F(3, 299)=11,734; p = 0,000							
<i>Regression 7 (Dependent variable: Total Score)</i>							
Invariant	45,456	5,360		8,481	,000		
Loving God	,668	,080	,506	8,359	,000		
Anxious attachment to God	-,604	,084	-,334	-7,213	,000		
Mood (anxious)	-4,783	,921	-,240	-5,195	,000		
Educational status (high school)	3,745	1,028	,190	3,642	,000		
Conditional God	,392	,118	,169	3,332	,001	0,79	0,63
Mood (uneasy)	-4,553	1,545	-,129	-2,947	,003		
Place spent most of their life (village-town)	-2,540	,986	-,099	-2,576	,010		
Educational status (secondary school)	2,159	1,043	,106	2,069	,039		
F(8, 294)=62,412; p = 0,000							

When the results of the first regression model given in Table 3 were examined, the multiple regression model was completed in nine stages. In other words, nine predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The 0.01 level of the F value for the regression equations was statistically significant ( $F(9, 293)=45,444; p<0.01$ ). The variables that were significant predictors of psychological well-being self-acceptance dimension scores were loving God, mood (anxious), anxious attachment to God, age, mood (uneasy), mood (pessimistic), conditional God, monthly income (generally we meet my needs) and educational status (high school). The independent variables included in the model as predictors explained 58% of the change in psychological well-being self-acceptance



dimension scores. When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the variable with the most important share in the explained variance was the anxious mood. It was seen that the regression coefficient from the loving God to the dimension of self-acceptance was 0.131. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the loving God dimension scores caused an increase of 0.131 units in the self-acceptance dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the mood (anxious) variable to the self-acceptance dimension was -2,140. Accordingly, it can be said that the self-acceptance scores of the participants with mood (anxious) were 2,140 units less than the other participants. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the anxious attachment to God to the self-acceptance was -0.119. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the anxious attachment to God dimension scores caused a 0.119-unit decrease in the self-acceptance dimension scores. The regression coefficient from the age variable to the self-acceptance dimension was 0.059. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the age of the participants caused an increase of 0.059 units in the self-acceptance dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the mood (uneasy) variable to the self-acceptance dimension was -2,115. Accordingly, it can be said that the self-acceptance dimension scores of the participants whose mood (uneasy) were 2,115 units less than the other participants. The regression coefficient from the mood (pessimistic) variable to the self-acceptance dimension was -1.081. Accordingly, the self-acceptance dimension scores of the participants with mood (pessimistic) were 1,081 units less than the other participants. It was determined that the regression coefficient from conditional God to self-acceptance dimension was 0.090. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the participants' conditional God scores caused an increase of 0.090 units in their self-acceptance dimension scores.

When the results of the second regression model given in Table 3 were examined, the multiple regression model was completed in seven stages. In other words, seven predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The 0.01 level of the F value for the regression equations was statistically significant ( $F(7, 295)=60,179; p<0.01$ ). The variables that were significant predictors personal growth dimension scores of psychological well-being were loving God, anxious attachment to God, educational status (high school), conditional God, avoidance attachment to God, mood (anxious), and mood (uneasy). The independent variables included in the model as predictors explained 59% of the change in personal

growth scores on the psychological well-being . When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the most important variable in the explained variance was the loving God. It was seen that the regression coefficient from the loving God to the dimension of personal growth was 0.203. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the loving God dimension scores caused an increase of 0.203 units in the personal growth dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the anxious attachment to God to the dimension of personal growth was -0.138. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the anxious attachment to God caused a 0.138-unit decrease in the personal growth dimension scores. It was seen that the regression coefficient from the conditional God dimension to the personal growth dimension was 0.161. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the conditional God dimension scores caused an increase of 0.161 units in the personal growth dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the avoidant attachment to God dimension to the personal growth dimension was 0.132. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in avoidant attachment to God dimension scores caused an increase of 0.132 units in personal growth dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the mood (anxious) variable to the personal growth dimension was -1,024. Accordingly, the personal growth dimension scores of the participants with mood (anxious) were 1.024 units less than the other participants. It was determined that the regression coefficient from mood (uneasy) variable to the individual development dimension was -1,130. According to this, the personal growth dimension scores of the participants whose mood (uneasy) were 1,130 units less than the other participants.

When the results of the third regression model given in Table 3 are examined, the multiple regression model was completed in two stages. In other words, two predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The F value of the regression equations was statistically significant at the 0.01 level ( $F(2, 300)=6.853; p<0.01$ ). The variables that were significant predictors of purpose in life dimension scores of psychological well-being were determined as the anxious and secure attachment to God. The independent variables included in the model as predictors explain 4% of the change in the purpose in life dimension scores of psychological well-being, . When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the predictor variables included in the regression equation have approximately the same share in the explained variance. It was

determined that the regression coefficient from the anxious attachment to God to the dimension of the purpose in life was -0.046. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the anxious attachment to God scores caused a decrease of 0.046 units in the purpose in life dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the secure attachment to God dimension to the dimension of the purpose in life was 0.021. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the scores of the secure attachment to God dimension caused a decrease of 0.021 units in the scores of the purpose of life dimension.

When the results of the fourth regression model given in Table 3 are examined, the multiple regression model was completed in three stages. In other words, three predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The 0.01 level of the F value for the regression equations was statistically significant ( $F(3, 299)=25.571; p<0.01$ ). The variables that were significant predictors of positive relations with other dimensions scores of psychological well-being were determined as the anxious attachment to God, loving God and educational status (undergraduate). The independent variables included in the model as predictors explain 63% of the change in the scores of positive relations with others. When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the most important variable in the explained variance was the anxious attachment style to God. The regression coefficient from the anxious attachment to God dimension to the dimension of positive relationships with others was -0.166. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the anxious attachment to God dimension scores caused a 0.166-unit decrease in the scores of positive relationships with other. The regression coefficient from the loving God dimension to the dimension of positive relationships with other was 0.071. Also, a one-unit increase in the scores of the loving God dimension caused an increase of 0.071 units in the scores of positive relationships with other.

When the results of the fifth regression model given in Table 3 were examined, the multiple regression model was completed in seven stages. In other words, seven predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The F value of the regression equations was statistically significant at the 0.01 level ( $F(7, 295)=72.512; p<0.01$ ). The variables that were significant predictors of environmental mastery dimensions of psychological well-being were determined as the loving God, mood (anxious), mood (uneasy), educational status (secondary school), anxious attachment to God dimension, mood (pessimistic), and place

spent most of their life (village- town). The independent variables included in the model as predictors explained 63% of the change in environmental mastery scores of psychological well-being. When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the variable with the most important share in the explained variance was mood (anxious). It was seen that the regression coefficient from the loving God to the dimension of environmental mastery was 0.135. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the loving God dimension scores caused an increase of 0.135 units in the environmental mastery dimension scores. The regression coefficient from the mood (anxious) variable to the environmental mastery dimension was 2.833. Accordingly, the environmental mastery dimension scores of the participants with mood (anxious) were 2,833 units less than the other participants. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the mood (uneasy) variable to the environmental mastery dimension was -2,934. Accordingly, the environmental mastery dimension scores of the participants whose mood (uneasy) were 2,934 units less than the other participants. The regression coefficient from the anxious attachment to God dimension to the environmental mastery dimension was -0.086. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the anxious attachment to God dimension scores caused a 0.086-unit decrease in the environmental mastery dimension scores. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the mood (pessimistic) variable to the environmental mastery dimension was -1.393. Accordingly, the environmental mastery dimension scores of the participants with mood (pessimistic) were 1,393 units less than the other participants.

When the results of the sixth regression model given in Table 3 were examined, the multiple regression model was completed in three stages. In other words, three predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The F value of the regression equations was statistically significant at the 0.01 level ( $F(3, 299)=11.734; p<0.01$ ). The variables that were significant predictors of the scores of the autonomy dimension of psychological well-being were determined as the anxious attachment to God, educational status (undergraduate), and the place spent most of their life (district). The independent variables included in the model as predictors explained 10% of the change in the scores of the autonomy dimension of psychological well-being. When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the most important variable in the explained variance was the anxious attachment style to God. The regression coefficient from the anxiety dimension of

attachment to God to the dimension of autonomy was -0.101. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the scores of anxiety attachment to God caused a 0.101-unit decrease in the autonomy dimension scores.

When the results of the seventh regression model given in Table 3 are examined, the multiple regression model was completed in eight stages, in other words, eight predictor variables were included in the regression equation. The 0.01 level of the F value for the regression equations was statistically significant ( $F(8, 294)=62.412; p<0.01$ ). Variables that were significant predictors of psychological well-being scale scores were loving God, anxious attachment to God dimension, emotional state (anxious), education status (secondary school), graduation status (high school), place spent most of their life (village town), conditional God and mood (uneasy). The independent variables included in the model as predictors explained 63% of the change in psychological well-being scale scores. When the standardized regression coefficients ( $\beta$ ) were examined, it was understood that the most important variable in the explained variance was the loving God. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the loving God dimension to psychological well-being was 0.668. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the scores of the loving God dimension caused an increase of 0.668 units in the scores of the psychological well-being scale. The regression coefficient from the anxious attachment to God to psychological well-being was -0.604. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the scores of the anxious of attachment to God caused a 0.604-unit decrease in the scores on the psychological well-being scale. The regression coefficient from the mood (anxious) variable to psychological well-being was -4,783. Accordingly, the psychological well-being scale scores of the participants with mood (anxious) were 4,783 units lower than the other participants. The regression coefficient from educational status (high school) to psychological well-being was 3,745. Accordingly, the psychological well-being scale scores of the high school graduates were 3,745 units higher than the other participants. The regression coefficient from the conditional God dimension to psychological well-being was 0.392. Accordingly, it can be said that a one-unit increase in the conditional God dimension scores caused an increase of 0.392 units in the psychological well-being scale scores. The regression coefficient from the mood (uneasy) variable to psychological well-being was -4,553. The psychological well-being scale scores of the participants whose mood (uneasy) are 4,553 units less than the other participants. It was determined that the regression coefficient from the place spent most of their life (village-

town) to psychological well-being was -2,540. Accordingly, the psychological well-being scale scores of the participants who spent most of their lives in the village-town were 2,540 units less than the other participants. The regression coefficient from educational status (secondary school) to psychological well-being was 2.159. Accordingly, the psychological well-being scale scores of the secondary school graduates were 2,159 units higher than the other participants.

### Discussion and Conclusion

Human is a complex creature with more than one physical, psychological, social and spiritual structure.<sup>21</sup> Changes and transformations in these structures may affect other structures and cause a holistic change and transformation. Consistent with a previous study in the literature, this study also shows a relationship between psychological well-being and spirituality and health.<sup>22</sup> It has been found that the state of psychological well-being changes depending on the imagination created for God.<sup>23</sup> The loving God or the perception of God as a being that can be loved is the variable that best predicts psychological well-being. The findings in the literature suggest that when the loving God score increases, the psychological health score also increases. There is a positive relationship between mental health and a positive God image and a negative relationship with a negative God-image.<sup>24</sup> Individuals who love God envision God as compassionate and helpful. Because they trust in God, they believe that they will get help from God in every situation.<sup>25</sup> Individuals who develop positive mental representations of themselves and others also develop positive mental representations of God. They believe God is a loving and helpful being and envision God as a higher self than their own.<sup>26</sup> Self-perception is related to self-acceptance, autonomy and individual development. Individuals with a positive self-perception attach importance to their personal development, the decisions of others are also important to them, but they

<sup>21</sup> Mustafa Koç. "Ruh Sağlığı İle Dini Başa Çıkma Metodu Olarak Dua Ve İbadet Fenomeni Arasındaki İlişki Üzerine Psikolojik Bir Yaklaşım", *EKEV Akademi Dergisi*, 9/24, (2005), 12.

<sup>22</sup> Agnieszka Bożek, Pawel F. Nowak, Mateusz Blukacz. "The Relationship Between Spirituality, Health-Related Behavior, and Psychological Well-Being", *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11, (2020), 8-9.

<sup>23</sup> Nuran E. Korkmaz, "Tanrı'ya Bağlanma Ve Psikolojik İyi Olma". *Toplum Bilimleri Dergisi*, 6 (12), (2012), 102; Matt Bradshaw, Blake Victor Kent. "Prayer, Attachment to God, and Changes in Psychological Well-Being in Later Life", *Journal of Aging and Health*, (2017), 1

<sup>24</sup> Ali Akbar Haddadi Koohsar, Bagher Ghobary Bonab, "Relation Between Quality of Image of God and Mental Health in College Students", *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 29, (2011), 249.

<sup>25</sup> Ines Testoni, et al. "The Implicit Image of God: God as Reality and Psychological Well-Being", *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 55/1, (2016), 174.

<sup>26</sup> Lee A. Kirkpatrick, *Attachment, Evolution, and the Psychology of Religion*, 109.

make the final decisions themselves<sup>27</sup> and these people accept themselves as they are. These people trust others just as they trust themselves. Therefore, secure attachment develops in these individuals. In anxious attachment, this situation is reversed. Anxiously-attached individuals have a low positive self-perception and a high negative self-perception.<sup>28</sup> For this reason, the psychological state of the anxiously attached individual is expected to be low. The data obtained in this study also support this situation. It is seen that when the anxious attachment score increases, psychological well-being decreases.

Another variable that affects psychological well-being is mood. Psychological well-being varies depending on whether the individual is stressed or not.<sup>29</sup> It is expected that individuals who are in a positive mood have high psychological well-being. Individuals who are in a negative mood are expected to have low psychological well-being. It can be said that the research data partially meet this expectation. It is seen that there is a negative relationship between being anxious<sup>30</sup> and restless and general psychological well-being, and there is also a negative relationship between pessimism and self-acceptance, and environmental dominance.

This study is consistent with some studies in terms of its findings on the relationship between perception of God, attachment to God, emotional state and psychological well-being.<sup>31</sup> The anxiety levels of individuals with chronic diseases are higher than other emotional states. This condition can be associated with the disease. Because of their chronic diseases, patients may need to use drugs for life or be hospitalized because their vital values deteriorate in the acute period which may worry them. Anxiety experienced during the

---

<sup>27</sup> Nebi Sümer, Derya Güngör: "Yetişkin Bağlanma Stilleri Ölçeklerinin Türk Örneklemini Üzerinde Psikometrik Değerlendirmesi ve Kültürlerarası Bir Karşılaştırma", *Türk Psikoloji Dergisi*, 14/43, (1999), 75.

<sup>28</sup> K. Bartholmew, & L.M. Horowitz, "Attachment Styles among Young Adults: A Test of a Four-Category Model", *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 62/2, (1991), 227.

<sup>29</sup> Aydan Ermiş, Egemen Ermiş, Osman İmamaoğlu. "Psychological Well-Being And Its Effect On Perceived Stress In University Students During The Coronavirus Process", *The Online Journal of Recreation and Sports*, 11/4, (2022), 14.

<sup>30</sup> M. Nagaraj, "Anxiety and Psychological Well-Being Among Adult and Old Age", *The International Journal of Indian Psychology*, 4/3, (2017), 194.

<sup>31</sup> Zaimah Lutfia Ningrum, Fitri Ayu Kusumaningrum, "The Relationship between Attachment to God and Students' Psychological Well-Being", *Proceedings of the 3rd Borobudur International Symposium on Humanities and Social Science* (2021); Nuran E. Korkmaz, "Tanrı'ya Bağlanma Ve Psikolojik İyi Olma"; Fatma Sağlam Demirkan, "Yetişkin Kronik Hastalarda Allah'a Bağlanma, Duygu Durumu Ve Yaşam Memnuniyeti İlişkisi". *Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 7/1, (2020); Ali Akbar Haddadi Koohsar, Bagher Ghobary Bonab, "Relation between quality of image of God and mental health in college students", *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 29, (2011).

illness affects their psychological health negatively.<sup>32</sup> However, the positive relationship between having a God image and a secure attachment to God and psychological well-being,<sup>33</sup> and the positive relationship between religiosity and psychological well-being<sup>34</sup> strengthen the view that religion has an enhancing role in psychological health. Emotional state has a more decisive role in determining psychological well-being than the perception of God and the way of attachment to God. However, considering the strong relationship between emotional states and the perception of God and the ways of attachment to God, the effect of God perception and attachment styles on psychological well-being brings to mind the idea that it occurs through emotions. Since the sample group of this study consisted of Muslim individuals in general, it can be said that the results obtained in the study represent the relationship between the Islamic belief in God perception and attachment styles to God and psychological well-being. Therefore, it is believed that this study, by demonstrating the relationship between patients' perception of God, their emotional states, their attachment to God, and their psychological health, may contribute to spiritual counseling and guidance services in the field of healthcare in our country.

#### **Proposal:**

This study measured the relationship between psychological well-being and perception of God, attachment to God and emotions. A further experimental study can be conducted to measure the effects of God perception and God attachment styles on psychological well-being, or a phenomenological study can be conducted to examine the God-conceptions of individuals with chronic diseases and their relationships with God.

In this study, variables predicting psychological well-being were examined, further study, it can also be researched whether the same variables predict different aspects of mental health, such as happiness, depression, and anxiety disorders.

<sup>32</sup> Ülku Özdemir, Sultan Taşçı, “Kronik Hastalıklarda Psikososyal Sorunlar Ve Bakım”, *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi*, 1/ 1 (2013), 60-64.

<sup>33</sup> Nuran E. Korkmaz, “Tanrı’ya Bağlanma Ve Psikolojik İyi Olma”, 102; Fatma Sağlam Demirkan, “Yetişkin Kronik Hastalarda Allah’a Bağlanma, Duygu Durumu Ve Yaşam Memnuniyeti İlişkisi”, 472.

<sup>34</sup> Necmi Karşlı, İlahiyat Fakültesi Öğrencilerinde Psikolojik İyi Oluş ve Dindarlık, *Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 53, (2021); David M. Njus & Alexandra Scharmer, “Evidence that God Attachment Makes a Unique Contribution to Psychological Well-Being”, *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, 30/3, (2020), 1.



## References / Kaynakça

- Akın, Ahmet. "Psikolojik İyi Olma Ölçekleri (PİÖÖ): Geçerlilik ve Güvenirlilik Çalışması, Kuram ve Uygulamada". *Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, 8/3, (2008), 721-750.
- Akın, Ahmet et.al. "The Validity and Reliability of the Turkish Version of the Religious Activities Scale". Paper presented at the 2nd International Conference on Ethics Education, Ankara, May 21-23, (2014).
- Aydan Ermiş, Egemen Ermiş. Osman İmamaoğlu. "Psychological Well-Being And Its Effect On Perceived Stress in University Students During The Coronavirus Process". *The Online Journal of Recreation and Sports*, 11/4, (2022), 10-21.
- Bartholmew, K.- Horowitz, L.M. "Attachment Styles Among Young Adults: A Test of a Four-Category Model". *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 62/2, (1991), 226-44.
- Baytemir Kemal. "Ergenlikte Ebeveyn ve Akranla Bağlanma ile Öznel İyi Oluş Arasındaki İlişkide Kişilerarası Yeterliğin Aracılığı". *Eğitim ve Bilim Dergisi*, 41/186, (2016), 69-91.
- Beck, Richard - McDonald Angie. "Attachment to God: The Attachment to God Inventory, Test of Working Model Correspondence, and Exploration of Faith Group Differences". *Journal of Psychology and Theology*, 32/2, (2004), 92-103.
- Berber Çelik, Çiğdem. "Bağlanma Stilleri, Psikolojik İyi Oluş ve Sosyal Güvende Hissetme: Aralarındaki İlişki Ne?". *Bayburt Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 13/25, (2018), 27-40
- Bożek, Agnieszka- Nowak Pawel F. - Blukacz Mateusz. "The Relationship Between Spirituality, Health-Related Behavior, and Psychological Well-Being". *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11, (2020), 1-13.
- Bowlby, John. *Bağlanma*, çev. Tuğrul Veli Soylu. İstanbul: Pinhan Yay. 2012.
- Bradshaw, Matt- Kent, Blake Victor. "Prayer, Attachment to God, and Changes in Psychological Well-Being in Later Life". *Journal of Aging and Health*, (2017), 1–25.
- Calvo, Vincenzo, et al., "Attachment and well-being: Mediatory roles of mindfulness, psychological inflexibility, and resilience". *Current Psychology*, 41, (2022), 2966–2979.
- Cevizci, Ahmet. *Felsefe Sözlüğü*, 3. Basım. İstanbul: Paradigma Yayınları, 1999.
- Çalık, Bağrıyanık, Burcu, et al. "Sağlıklı Ebeveyn- Bebek Bağlanması", *Eurasian Journal of Health Science*, 3/2, 2020, 40-47.
- Encyclopaedia Britannica, "Aristippus: Greek philosopher", Accessing 20 November 2022: <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Aristippus>.
- Ermiş, Aydan, Egemen Ermiş, Osman İmamaoğlu. "Psychological Well-Being And Its Effect On Perceived Stress In University Students During The Coronavirus Process". *The Online Journal of Recreation and Sports*, 11/4, (2022), 10-21.
- Karşlı, Necmi, "İlahiyat Fakültesi Öğrencilerinde Psikolojik İyi Oluş ve Dindarlık". *Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 53, (2021), 165-194.
- Kirkpatrick, Lee A. *Attachment, Evolution, and the Psychology of Religion*. New York&London: Guilford Press, 2005.
- Koç, Mustafa. "Ruh Sağlığı İle Dini Başa Çıkma Metodu Olarak Dua Ve İbadet Fenomeni Arasındaki İlişki Üzerine Psikolojik Bir Yaklaşım". *EKEV Akademi Dergisi*, 9/24, (2005), 11-32.
- Korkmaz, Nuran E. "Tanrı'ya Bağlanma Ve Psikolojik İyi Olma". *Toplum Bilimleri Dergisi*, 6/12, (2012), 95-112.
- Koohsar, Ali Akbar Haddadi- Bonab, Bagher Ghobary. "Relation Between Quality of Image of God and Mental Health in College Students". *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 29, (2011), 247-251.

- McDonald Angie- Beck Richard- Norsworthy Larry, "Attachment to God and Parents: Testing the Correspondence vs. Compensation Hypotheses". *Journal of Psychology and Christianity*, 24/1, 2005, 21-28.
- Marrero-Quevedo, Rosario J., Pedro J. Blanco-Hernández, Juan A. Hernández-Cabrera, "Adult Attachment and Psychological Well-Being: The Mediating Role of Personality". *Journal of Adult Development*, 26, 2019, 41-56.
- Nagaraj, M. "Anxiety and Psychological Well-Being Among Adult and Old Age". *The International Journal of Indian Psychology*, 4/3, (2017), 190-195.
- Njus, David M.- Scharmer, Alexandra. "Evidence that God Attachment Makes a Unique Contribution to Psychological Well-Being". *The International Journal for the Psychology of Religion*, 30/3, (2020), 1-24.
- Ningrum, Zaimah Lutfia, Fitri Ayu Kusumaningrum, "The Relationship between Attachment to God and Students' Psychological Well-Being", *Proceedings of the 3rd Borobudur International Symposium on Humanities and Social Science* (2021), 403-408.
- Özdemir, Ülkü, Sultan Taşçı, Kronik Hastalıklarda Psikososyal Sorunlar Ve Bakım, *Erciyes Üniversitesi Sağlık Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi*, 1/ 1 (2013), 57-72.
- Roothman Brett- Kirsten Doret K.- Wissing Marie P. "Gender Differences In Aspects Of Psychological Wellbeing, *South African Journal Of Psychology*, 33/4, (2003), 212-218.
- Ryff, Carol D., Singer, Burton. "Psychological Well-Being: Meaning, Measurement, and Implications for Psychotherapy Research". *Psychotherapy and Psychosomatics*, 65/1, (1996), 14-23.
- Ryff, Carol D. "Happiness is Everything, or Is It? Explorations On The Meaning Of Psychological Wellbeing". *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 57, (1989), 1069-1081.
- Ryff, Carol D., Burton H. Singer, "Know Thyself and Become What You Are: A Eudaimonic Approach to Psychological Well-being", *Journal of Happiness Studies*, 9, (2008), 13-39.
- Sağlam Demirkan, Fatma. "Yetişkin Kronik Hastalarda Allah'a Bağlanma, Duygu Durumu Ve Yaşam Memnuniyeti İlişkisi". *Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 7/1, (2020), 449-482.
- Sirgy, M. Joseph. *The Psychology of Quality of Life: Hedonic Well-Being, Life Satisfaction, and Eudaimonia*, 2. Edition. New York & London: Springer, 2012.
- Skirbekk Gunnar- Gilje Nils. *Felsefe Tarihi*, çev. Emrullah Akbaş, Şule Mutlu, İstanbul: İstanbul Üniversite Kitabevi.
- Sümer, Nebi- Güngör, Derya: "Yetişkin Bağlanma Stilleri Ölçeklerinin Türk Örnekleme Üzerinde Psikometrik Değerlendirmesi ve Kültürlerarası Bir Karşılaştırma" *Türk Psikoloji Dergisi*, 14/43, (1999), 71-106.
- Subaşı, Hacer. *Üniversite Öğrencilerinin Tanrı İle İlişkilerinin Bağlanma Kuramı Açısından Değerlendirilmesi*. İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Yüksek Lisan Tezi, 2012.
- Testoni, Ines, et al. "The Implicit Image of God: God as Reality and Psychological Well-Being". *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 55/1, (2016), 174. 174-184.



## A Comparison of the Linguistic Categories of Muştarak and Muşkil of the Hanafî Islamic Jurisprudence

*Hanefî Usûl-ı Fıkhî'nın Müşterek ve Müşkil Dil Kategorilerinin Bir Mukayesesi*

**Ahmet TOPAL**

ORCID: 0000-0003-3127-1674 - E-Posta [ahmet.topal@aya.yale.edu](mailto:ahmet.topal@aya.yale.edu)

Assist. Prof. Dr. Hitit University Faculty of Theology, Department of Basic Islamic Sciences,  
Arabic Language And Rhetoric

*Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Hitit Üniversitesi, İlahiyat Fakültesi, Temel İslam Bilimleri,*

Çorum, Türkiye

ROR: [01x8m3269](https://orcid.org/01x8m3269)

### Article Information / Makale Bilgisi

**Citation / Atıf:** Topal, Ahmet. "A Comparison of the Linguistic Categories of Muştarak and Muşkil of the Hanafî Islamic Jurisprudence". *Şırnak Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 31 (Haziran 2023), 122-151. <https://doi.org/10.35415/sirnakifd.1258792>

Date of Submission ( <i>Geliş Tarihi</i> )	01. 03. 2023
Date of Acceptance ( <i>Kabul Tarihi</i> )	08. 06. 2023
Date of Publication ( <i>Yayın Tarihi</i> )	15. 06. 2023
Article Type ( <i>Makale Türü</i> )	Research Article ( <i>Araştırma Makalesi</i> )
Peer-Review ( <i>Değerlendirme</i> )	Double anonymized - Two External ( <i>İki Dış Hakem / Çift Taraflı Körleme</i> ).
Ethical Statement ( <i>Etik Beyan</i> )	It is declared that scientific and ethical principles have been followed while carrying out and writing this study and that all the sources used have been properly cited. ( <i>Bu çalışmanın hazırlanma sürecinde bilimsel ve etik ilkelere uyulduğu ve yararlanılan tüm çalışmaların kaynakçada belirtildiği beyan olunur.</i> )
Plagiarism Checks ( <i>Benzerlik Taraması</i> )	Yes ( <i>Evet</i> ) – Turnitin / Ithenticate.
Conflicts of Interest ( <i>Çıkar Çatışması</i> )	The author(s) has no conflict of interest to declare ( <i>Çıkar çatışması beyan edilmemiştir.</i> )
Complaints ( <i>Etik Beyan Adresi</i> )	<a href="mailto:suifdergi@gmail.com">suifdergi@gmail.com</a>
Grant Support ( <i>Finansman</i> )	The author(s) acknowledge that they received no external funding in support of this research. ( <i>Bu araştırmayı desteklemek için dış fon kullanılmamıştır.</i> )
Copyright & License ( <i>Telif Hakkı ve Lisans</i> )	Authors publishing with the journal retain the copyright to their work licensed under the CC BY-NC 4.0. ( <i>Yazarlar dergide yayımlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmalarını CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı altında yayımlanmaktadır.</i> )

## **Abstract**

The linguistic categories (*aqsām al-lafz*) of Islamic Jurisprudence (*Uṣūl al-Fiqh*) have recently become a source of interest to both Arabic linguists as well as scholars of Islamic Law. There seems to be a widespread tendency, however, among contemporary scholars to approach to them without any concern to highlight aspects where they are similar to, or different from, each other, unless such a comparison was already made in classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence, even where the occasion demands the otherwise. One such occasion concerns *muštarak* and *muškil*, the two linguistic categories that fall under the first and the second linguistic categorizations respectively. While *uṣūlīs* compare *muštarak* with its co-subcategories (e.g. *khāṣṣ*) and *muškil* with its co-subcategories (e.g. *khafī*), they do not compare *muštarak* and *muškil* with each other despite the striking similarities between them. These similarities might compromise the integrity of the linguistic categorization due to the seeming existence of two separate categories for what appears to be the same concept. Therefore, there is a need to analyze the two categories in a comparative way to establish the nature of the relationship between the two, which is an issue, to the best of my knowledge, that has never been addressed in the previous literature, thus constituting an important gap that needs to be filled. The need to fill this gap becomes more urgent as the contemporary works that discuss *muštarak* and *muškil* define these two categories almost identical, sometimes even providing the same examples for each one of them, without noting the nature of the difference between them, which epitomizes the degree of misunderstanding which this gap in the classical literature can lead to today. In an attempt to fill this gap, this paper provides, for the first time, a comparative analysis of *muštarak* and *muškil*. Falling back upon classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudences within the Ḥanaḫī school, the present work argues that the difference between *muštarak* and *muškil* is that in the case of *muškil*, the assigned meanings of a given ambiguous expression has not yet thought through and requires two types of inquiries, namely *ṭalab*, which is to list the assigned meanings in use, and *ta`ammul*, which is to determine which one of the assigned meanings of the ambiguous expression is meant on a given speech/writing occasion. However, in the case of *muštarak*, the assigned meanings of a given ambiguous expression have already been worked out and therefore are already known by the addressee(s) on a given speech/writing occasion, thus requiring only the inquiry of *ta`ammul*. Therefore, this paper further argues that after its meanings in use are determined through *ta`ammul*, *muškil* turns into *muštarak*. In this regard, *muškil* expression can be said to be an earlier version of *muštarak*, just as *muštarak* can be referred to be an earlier version of *mu`awwal* after one of its assigned meanings are preponderated upon through *ta`wil*.

**Kew Words:** Islamic Law (*Fiqh*), Arabic Linguistics, Linguistic categories of Islamic Jurisprudence (*uṣūl al-fiqh*), *Muškil*, *Muštarak*.

## Özet

İslam hukuk metodolojisi (*usûl-ı fıkhın*) dil kategorilerinin (*elfâz* bahislerinin), son zamanlarda hem Arap dilcileri hem de İslam hukuku üzerine çalışma yapan ilim adamları için bir ilgi kaynağı haline geldiği görülmektedir. Ancak, konuyu çalışan modern dönemdeki ilim adamları arasında, klasik eserlerde zaten mukayesesi yapılmış olanların dışında dil kategorilerinin benzerliklerine ya da farklılıklarına, durumun bir mukayeseyi gerektirdiği zamanlarda bile, değinme endişesi taşımayan yaygın bir yaklaşım söz konusudur. Böyle bir durum, sırasıyla birinci ve ikinci lafız tasnifi içerisinde yer alan *müşterek* ve *müşkil* lafızları için de görülmektedir. Klasik usûl âlimleri bu her iki dil kategorisini, kendi dil tasnifleri içerisinde yer alan diğer dil alt-kategorileri ile mukayeseye tabi tutmaktadır. Sözelimi, klasik usûl âlimleri, *müşterek* lafız onunla aynı dil tasnifi içerisinde (yani birinci dil tasnifinde) yer alan *hâss* ile; *müşkil* lafız ise onunla aynı dil tasnifinde (yani ikinci dil tasnifinde) yer alan *hafî* ile mukayese etmektedirler. Bununla beraber, bu alimlerin *müşterek* ve *müşkil* lafızları, aralarındaki çarpıcı benzerliklere rağmen mukayese etmediği görünmektedir. Bu benzerlikler, dil tasnifinin sağlamlığını sarsabilir çünkü aynı kavram için iki terimin var olduğu zannedilebilir. Daha önceki literatürde işaret edilmemiş olan bir problemi teşkil eden ve bu sebeple de alanda önemli bir boşluğu temsil eden *müşterek* ve *müşkil* lafızların arasındaki ilişkinin nasıl olduğu sorusuna yanıt bulabilmek amacıyla, bu iki kategorinin, mukayeseli bir analizine ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır. *Müşterek* ve *müşkil* lafızları inceleyen modern eserler, bu iki dil kategorisini neredeyse aynı şekilde tanımlamakta ve onları açıklamak için aynı örnekleri kullanmaktadırlar. Bu durum ise, bu konuda bahsi geçen boşluğun sebep olabileceği yanlış anlaşılmanın boyutunu gözler önüne sermektedir. İlk kez burada tespit ettiğimiz bu boşluğu doldurmak için, bu makale, literatürde tespit edebildiğimiz kadarıyla ilk defa *müşterek* ve *müşkil* lafızların mukayeseli bir analizini gerçekleştirmektedir. Hanefi mezhebi klasik eserlerine dayanarak, *müşterek* ve *müşkil* arasındaki farkı şu şekilde izah etmektedir: *Müşkil* lafızda, manasında kapalılık bulunan lafızın dilde kullanılan manaları üzerinde alimler henüz kafa yormamış ve dolayısıyla onlar için bunları listeleme ihtiyacı doğmamıştır. Bu durum, *müşkil* lafızda iki tür bilgiye ulaşma yöntemi gerektirmektedir: *taleb* (kullanımdaki konulmuş manaların tespiti) ve *teemmül* (belirli kullanım sırasında bu konulmuş manalarından hangisinin kastedildiğinin tespiti). *Müşterek* lafızda ise, manasında kapalılık bulunan lafızın konulmuş (*vad'î*) manaları üzerinde âlimler zaten düşünmüş ve bunları tespit etmiştir. Bundan dolayı bu lafız türü sadece *teemmül* gerektirir. Bu sebeple, bu makale, dilde kullanılan manaları henüz âlimler tarafından tespit edilmemiş *müşkil* lafızın, *müşterek* lafızın bir önceki versiyonunu temsil ettiğini iddia etmektedir. Ayrıca, bu manalarının neler olduğu tespit edildikten ve listelendikten sonra (ki bu durum, bu manaların sözlüklerde yer almasına da sebebiyet verebilir), daha önceden *müşkil* kategorisi altına düşen lafızın, artık doğal olarak *müşterek* lafza tebdîl olacağı yine bu makalede savunulmaktadır. Bu durumun bir benzeri, herhangi bir konuşma sırasında manalarından birinin, muhatap tarafından maksûd (kastedilen anlam) olarak tercih olunması sebebiyle *müşterek* lafızın, *müevvel* lafza dönüşmesinde de görülmektedir.

**Anahtar kelimeler:** İslam Hukuku, Arap Dil Bilimi, *Usûl-ı Fıkh'ın* Dil kategorileri (*Elfâz* Bahisleri), *Müşterek*, *Müşkil*.

## Introduction

The growing interest in *aqşam al-lafz* (the linguistic categories) of *Uşûl al-Fiqh* (Islamic Jurisprudence) and the nature of the existing approaches to these categories adopted in contemporary scholarship as well as the issues associated with these approaches have been explored in detail elsewhere.<sup>1</sup>

The contemporary scholars often repeated, with various degrees of success, what is already mentioned in classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence with regard to the linguistic categories, without any interest into exploring the overarching theory that led to the production of these categories.<sup>2</sup> This brings up a morass of issues concerning our understanding of the nature of the linguistic categories in particular and of *Uşûl al-Fiqh* in general.<sup>3</sup>

This paper deals with one of the characteristics of the prevailing approaches to categories that results from their lack of interest in the framework behind the linguistic categories that steered the scholars of Islamic Jurisprudence (hereafter, *uşûlīs*) when producing the categories. In fact, its main argument is that the prevailing approaches to the categories are characterized by their tendency to compare and contrast the categories which had already been compared and contrasted with each other in classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence while avoiding from

---

<sup>1</sup> See Ahmet Topal, "The Role of the Arabic Language in *istinbât al-ḥukm* within the Context of Criminal law: A General Framework for Inquiry into the Linguistic Categories of *uşûl al-fiqh* of the Ḥanafī school of law" (PhD diss., Leeds University, 2020).

<sup>2</sup> See, in this regard, Fahrettin Atar, *Fıkh Usûlü* (Istanbul: IFAV, 2018), Zekiyüddin Şâban, *İslâm Hukuk İlminin Esasları (Usûlü'l-Fıkh)* [in Arabic] (Ankara: TDV Yayınları, 2018), Bernard G. Weiss, *The Search for God's Law: Islamic Jurisprudence in the Writings of Sayf al-Dīn al-Āmidī* (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2010), Mohammad Hashim Kamali, *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence* (Cambridge: The Islamic Texts Society, 1991), Wael B. Hallaq, *A History of Islamic Legal Theories: An Introduction to Sunnī uşûl al-fiqh* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), Aron Zysow, *The Economy of Certainty: An Introduction to the Typology of Islamic Legal Theory*, Resources (Atlanta, Georgia : Lockwood Press, 2013), Muhammed M. Yunis Ali, *Medieval Islamic Pragmatics: Sunni Legal Theorists' Models of Textual Communication* (London and New York: Routledge, 2009), David R. Vishanoff, "Early Islamic Hermeneutics: Language, Speech, and Meaning in Preclassical Legal Theory" (PhD diss., Emory University, 2004), and Behnam Sadeghi, *The Logic of Law Making in Islam* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013).

<sup>3</sup> Topal, "The Role of the Arabic Language in *istinbât al-ḥukm*," 51.

making any comparisons between categories which have not so far been subject to any comparison in classical manuals, even where the occasion demands the otherwise. One such occasion concerns *muštarak* and *muškil*, and this paper will compare these two categories with each other as a case study to support its main argument.

## 1. A Literature Review on the Difference between *Muštarak* and *Muškil*

Despite the striking similarities between the two, which might well underpin the existence of two separate categories for what appears to be the same concept, *muštarak* and *muškil* have been compared and contrasted with each other in neither the contemporary nor the classical manuals, which I will next review below.

### 1.1. Contemporary Literature

The majority of contemporary works on Islamic legal studies tend to avoid from discussing the linguistic aspects of *Uşūl al-Fiqh*, and so it does not come as a surprise that we do not find any separate modern work that is dedicated to a comparison of *muštarak* and *muškil*.

Nevertheless, there are several contemporary works that deal with the linguistic categories in general, and while doing so, they discuss or touch upon, with various lengths, the two linguistic categories as well. We also find others whose subject matter is more specific, such as covering only the ambiguous categories, and while doing so they also discuss or touch upon *muštarak* and/or *muškil*.

Yalınkılıç and Abay, for instance, specifically attempt to compare with *muškil* the linguistic categories that have ambiguity in them such as *khafī*. Yet, they are silent when it comes to comparing it with *muštarak* in any way whatsoever in spite of the fact that *muštarak* is also a linguistic category with ambiguity and therefore falls under the subject matter that their paper aims to cover.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> Mehmet Yalınkılıç and Ahmet Abay, "Meryem suresi 71. Ayet Bağlamında İşkâli Giderme Yöntemleri", in *Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 5 / 9 (December 2018): 463-482, p. 467-9.

Another example in this regard is Karaahmetoğlu, who discusses the type of *işkâl* and the ways of resolving them within the scope of Ibn Āšūr,<sup>5</sup> while providing no conceptual basis for *qur'* that would justify the fact that *tuhr* (the state of pureness from menstrual discharge) is the intended meaning of the expression *qur'*.<sup>6</sup> Instead, she contends herself to say that despite the fact that the expression *qur'* could potentially come to mean both *tuhr* and *hayđ* (menstruation), the exegetes require that the most suitable and the most correct of them to be chosen in terms of its meaning and use. As a result, she notes, it is necessary to choose the former as the intended meaning of the word *qur'*, albeit without really exposing the logic behind choosing the former and not the latter meaning of the word *qur'*.<sup>7</sup>

Being more of a general treatment of the categories, Kamali's *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence* is widely used work that discusses, among other categories, *muşkil* and *muştarak*. He notes, "*Mushkil* denotes a word which is inherently ambiguous, and whose ambiguity can only be removed by means of research and *ijtihad*." He next goes on to compare it with *muşkil*'s co-subcategory under the second categorization. He then notes something worth discussing here: "There are, for example, words which have more than one meaning, and when they occur in a text, the text is unclear with regard to one or the other of those meanings." This is in fact quite similar to how he defines *muştarak*, where he notes, "A homonym [*muştarak*] is a word which has more than one meaning."<sup>8</sup>

What is even more interesting to show the degree of misunderstanding among contemporary scholars when it comes to the nature of the difference between the categories of *muştarak* and *muşkil* is the fact that Kamali gives the same example for *muştarak* and *muşkil*,

---

<sup>5</sup> See, for instance, Reyhan Karaahmetoğlu, "İbn Āşūr'a Göre İşkâl Sebepleri ve Çözüm Yolları," in *Mutalaa* 1 / 2 (December 2021): 222-239, p. 228.

<sup>6</sup> For more information on the term *qur'* being a *muştarak* expression, see Şams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Ḥamza b. Muḥammad al-Fanārī al-Rūmī, ed. Muḥammad Ḥasan Muḥammad Ḥasan Ismā'īl, *Fuṣūl al-Badā'i' fi Uşūl al-Sharā'i'* (Beirut: Dār Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, 1971), I, 105-106.

<sup>7</sup> See Karaahmetoğlu, "İbn Āşūr'a Göre İşkâl Sebepleri ve Çözüm Yolları," 228.

<sup>8</sup> Kamali, *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence*, 116.



namely the word *qur'*.<sup>9</sup> And yet, he makes no effort to investigate the nature of the difference between the two categories.

For the convenience of my readers, I will provide with Kamali's remarks here on the expression *qur'*. When giving *qur'* as an example for *muštarak*, he notes: "Similarly the word '*qur'*' has two meanings, namely menstruation, and the clean period between two menstruations. The Hanafis, the Hanbalis and the Zaydis have upheld the first, while the Shafi'is, Malikis and Ja'faris have upheld the second meaning of *qur'*."<sup>10</sup> Interestingly enough, he provides the same example, namely *qur'*, for *muškil* and makes almost the same remarks: "There are, for example, words which have more than one meaning, and when they occur in a text, the text is unclear with regard to one or the other of those meanings. Thus, the word '*qur'*' which occurs in sura al-Baqarah (2:228) is *Mushkil* as it has two distinct meanings: menstruation (*hayd*) and the clean period between two menstruations (*tuhr*). Whichever of these is taken, the ruling of the text will differ accordingly. Imam Shafi'i and a number of other jurists have adopted the latter, whereas the Hanafis and others have adopted the former as the correct meaning of *qur'*."<sup>11</sup>

These are representative examples from the contemporary scholarship, and more examples could have been cited.<sup>12</sup> Similar examples are also explored elsewhere from works of Weiss, Kamali, Ali, Vishanoff, and Sadeghi within the scope of linguistic categories other than *muštarak* and *muškil*. They also demonstrate the lack of interest among contemporary scholars to approach to the linguistic categories in a comparative way even when this causes misunderstandings with regard to one's understanding of each relevant linguistic category and

---

<sup>9</sup> See Kamali, *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence*, 98 and 116.

<sup>10</sup> Kamali, *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence*, 116.

<sup>11</sup> Kamali, *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence*, 98.

<sup>12</sup> Another example is Kavalcıođlu, A. "Debûsî ve Semerkandî'nin Fıkıh Usulünde "Kapalı Lafızlar" in *Konusuna Yaklaşımları ve Görüşlerinin Mukayesesi*". *Karadeniz Teknik Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi (KTUİFD)* 5 (2018): 61-85.

of the whole science of *Uşûl al-Fiqh* (Islamic Jurisprudence) as well as the role of these linguistic categories on the formation of Islamic Law (*Fiqh*) as we know it today.<sup>13</sup>

## 1.2. Classical Literature

The classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence within the Ḥanafī school of law, as far as I am aware of, do not make any comparison between the categories of *muştarak* and *muşkil* on a theoretical basis.<sup>14</sup> There could be a number of reasons behind the lack of classical manuals of any comparison between *muştarak* and *muşkil*. To mention but one possibility, this might be due to the fact that the difference between the two categories might well be too obvious to their authors.<sup>15</sup>

Thus, I do not claim that the classical scholars did not know the difference between the two categories. Rather, the classical scholars, at least the earlier ones, appear to be well aware of the difference between *muştarak* and *muşkil*, as they are the ones who produced the categories in

---

<sup>13</sup> Vishanoff, Sadeghi and several others consider the role of *Uşûl al-Fiqh* with its linguistic categories in the formation of the Ḥanafī school of law to be negligible. For details on the nature of their approaches to the linguistic categories and issues associated with their approaches, see Topal, "The Role of the Arabic Language in *istinbāt al-ḥukm*," 45-86. There are other works that repeat similar mistakes due to their approaches to the categories. See for instance, Tariq, Jaffer, "Mu'tazilite Aspects of Faḥr Al-Dīn al-Rāzī's Thought," *Arabica* 59, no. 5 (2012): 510-35, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41727686>.

<sup>14</sup> See, for instance, Molla Jiwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār 'alā al-Manār* (Istanbul: al-Maktaba al-Ḥanāfiyya, n.d.), I, 150. See also, al-Pazdawī, Fakhr al-Islām 'Alī b. Muḥammad, *Kanz al-Wuṣūl ilā Ma'rifat al-Uşūl* (N.p., Mīr Muḥammad Kutub-khānah Markaz 'Ilm wa Adab, n.d.), 9. Noting on whether or not the expression *annā* falls under *muşkil* or *muştarak*, Ibn Ḥalabī notes, in his glossary on Ibn Malak's *Şarḥ al-Manār*, that the relevant verse can be regarded both as *muştarak* and *muşkil* simultaneously, though without really exposing the logic behind this or exploring the theoretical difference between *muşkil* and *muştarak* (see Ibn Ḥalabī, Raḍī al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Ibrāhīm, *Anwār al-Ḥalāk 'alā Şarḥ al-Manār li-Ibn Malak* (Istanbul: Āsitāna, n.d.), I, 365.

<sup>15</sup> It could also be the case that *uşūlīs* may have not felt the need to cover the difference between the two categories simply because there might be no disagreement (*khilāf*) among scholars or schools of law on it that would make it worth to be included in classical works. For a discussion of the influence of disagreements, though not on manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence, but on Islamic legal manuals, (see Abdurrahim Bilik, "Hilâf Mesailinin Hanefî Muhtasarların Metin Kurgusuna Etkisi ve Temel Şerhlerde Ele Alınışı (Kitabu's-Salât Örneği)" in *Universal Journal of Theology* 5 / 2 (Aralık 2020): 109-134.) For other reasons behind the absence of such comparisons in classical manuals, albeit discussed within the scope of another matter, see Topal, "The Role of Arabic in *istinbāt al-ḥukm*," 86-89.

the first place and their works on Islamic Jurisprudence do provide valuable insights into the matter in hand, which will be illustrated below.

A close reading of the classical works on Islamic Jurisprudence can actually help one gain insights into the nature of the similarities and the differences between the two categories. In this regard, when commenting on al-Nasafī's influential work on *Uṣūl al-Fiqh*, namely, *al-Manār*, Molla Jīwan points out, perhaps unwittingly, to the similarities between *muštarak* and *muškil*. He classifies them both under the class of *izdiḥām al-ma'ānī* along with other two categories, namely *khafī* and *mujmal*.<sup>16</sup>

He holds that what all these four linguistic categories have in common is the fact that they all have multiple potential intended meanings. That is why he classifies them under the class of *izdiḥām al-ma'ānī*,<sup>17</sup> which I might translate as 'merging of meanings in a single expression.' As to the difference between the two linguistic categories, i.e. *muštarak* and *muškil*, however, the same passage does not provide any insights. In fact, he notes the following:<sup>18</sup>

"فإن الخفي يدرك بمجرد الطلب والمشارك والمشكل بالتأمل بعد الطلب بخلاف المجمل فإنه قد يحتاج إلى ثلاثة طلبات الأولى الاستفسار عن المجمل ثم الطب للوصاف بعده ثم التأمل للتعيين."

As seen in the excerpt, Molla Jīwan discusses the question of how *mujmal* differs from the rest of the sub-classes of *izdiḥām al-ma'ānī*, namely, *khafī*, *muškil*, and *muštarak*, which he explains by appealing to the fact that *mujmal* is the only one among them that requires three inquiries, namely, *istifsār* (asking for clarification), *ṭalab* (pondering), and *ta'ammul* (deliberation).<sup>19</sup> Similarly, he notes that *khafī* differs from the rest of the co-subclasses of *izdiḥām al-ma'ānī* in that it is the only linguistic category the ambiguity of which is resolved through *ṭalab* alone.<sup>20</sup> Instead

<sup>16</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150. See also, Ibn Malak, *Šarḥ al-Manār*, I, 366.

<sup>17</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150. See also, Ibn Malak, *Šarḥ al-Manār*, I, 365.

<sup>18</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150. See also, al-Pazdawī, *Kanz al-Wuṣūl*, 9.

<sup>19</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150.

<sup>20</sup> The term *ṭalab* refers to an inquiry into the meanings in which a given expression can be used, which is expressed by Molla Jīwan as an inquiry into whichever meaning it is used in (لأي معنى يستعمل هذا اللفظ) (Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 149). *Ṭalab* is to be followed by another process of inquiry in the case of *muškil*,

of noting the difference between the two, he mentions how both *muştarak* and *muşkil* require *ṭalab* and *ta'ammul* while *khafī* only requires the former.<sup>21</sup>

Moreover, he is not the only *uşulī* who does so. In fact, discussing how *izdiḥām al-ma'ānī* is a genius/class for *mujmal*, *muştarak*, *muşkil*, and *khafī*, Ibn Malak makes similar remarks when he says:

"لأن المراد يدرك في الخفي بمجرد الطلب وفي المشترك والمشكل بالتأمل بعد الطلب."<sup>22</sup>

This translates as the following:

This is because the intended meaning in *khafī* is known merely through *ṭalab*, and in *muştarak* as well as *muşkil* via *ta'ammul* following *ṭalab*.

Likewise, Şadr al-Şarī'a compares the ambiguous expressions to each other from a different perspective. He notes the following:

"وإذا خفي أي المراد من اللفظ فخفاؤه إما لنفس اللفظ أو لعارض. والثاني يسمى خفياً. والأول إما أن يدرك المراد بالعقل أو لا. الأول يسمى مشكلاً. والثاني إما أن يدرك المراد بالنقل أو لا يدرك أصلاً. الأول يسمى مجملاً والثاني متشابهاً. وهذه الأقسام متباينة بلا خلاف."<sup>23</sup>

This translates as follows:

When an expression becomes ambiguous, that is to say, its intended meaning of it, its ambiguity is either [1] due to the expression itself or [2] to an accident. The latter [2] is named "*khafī*". The former's [1] intended meaning can either [1.1.] be understood through intellect or [1.2.] it cannot. The former [1.1.] is called *muşkil*. The latter's [1.2.] intended meaning can either [1.2.1.] be understood through *naql* [report, containing, *tafsīr*, an explanation, provided by the addresser] or [1.2.2.] it can never be. The former [1.2.1.] is called *mujmal* and the latter [1.2.2.] is *mutaşābih*. And these categories are obvious without any argument [over them].

---

namely *ta'ammul*, which refers to an inquiry to determine which sense among the potential senses of the expression is meant on a particular speech/writing occasion (see, Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 149).

<sup>21</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150.

<sup>22</sup> Ibn Malak, *Şarḥ al-Manār*, I, 366.

<sup>23</sup> Şadr al-Şarī'a, *al-Tawḍīḥ*, 197.

However, Şadr al-Şarī'a, too, does not compare *muşkil* with *muştarak* and thus does not provide insights into the nature of the difference between the two either.

Thus, *uşūlīs* seem to be either irrelevant to the difference between *muştarak* and *muşkil*, as is the case with, for instance, Şadr al-Şarī'a or even worse, put them into the same basket in that both require *ṭalab* and *ta'ammul* for their ambiguity to be resolved, and instead of noting the difference between the two, they rather go on to explain how these two differ from *khafī*, as is the case, for example, with Ibn Malak and Molla Jīwan.

This brings to the mind the question of how and in what ways *muştarak* and *muşkil* might be different from each other. Or do *uşūlīs* consider *muştarak* and *muşkil* the same?

As will be illustrated using classical sources, the *ṭalab* that is required in *muştarak* by some scholars for its ambiguity to be resolved seems to be different from the *ṭalab* that is required in *muşkil*'s ambiguity's resolution. Therefore, the similarity between *muşkil* and *muştarak* as far as both seemingly requiring *ṭalab* is more apparent than real.

## 2. *Muştarak* and *Muşkil* as Described in Classical Works

There is not much that the Ḥanafī primary sources of Islamic Jurisprudence directly or explicitly offer when it comes to the nature of the difference between *muştarak* and *muşkil* on a theoretical level.<sup>24</sup> Nevertheless, one could find pieces of information that can help lay a foundation for a comparative analysis of the linguistic categories between *muştarak* and *muşkil* and subsequently reveal the nature of the difference between the two. In this section (section 2) therefore, I will describe, starting with *muşkil*, both of these categories as they are presented in classical works.

---

<sup>24</sup> See, for instance, 'Alā al-Dīn Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. Aḥmad al-Samarqandī, *Mizān al-Uşūl fī Natā'ij al-Uqūl*, ed. Muḥammad Zakī 'Abd al-Barr (N.p.: Maṭba'a Dūḥa al-Ḥadītha, 1984), 340 and 354, Şadr al-Şarī'a, *al-Tawḍīḥ*, 197, and al-Shāshī, Niẓām al-Dīn Abū 'Alī Aḥmad b. Muḥammad b. Ishāq, *Uşūl al-Shāshī*, ed. 'Abd Allāh b. Muḥammad al-Khalīlī (Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, 2003), 24-25.

## 2.1. Muşkil

The category of *muşkil* falls under the second categorization within the Hanafi Jurisprudence and *uşûlīs* define it as the following:

"وهو عند الاصوليين عبارة عن كلام يحتمل المعاني المختلفة ويكون المراد واحدا منها لكنه قد دخل في اشكاله وهي تلك المعاني المختلفة فاختلفت بسبب هذا الدخول".

This translates as the following:

According to *uşûlīs*, it [*muşkil*] is an expression that has multiple potential meanings. Yet, the intended meaning [of *muşkil* expression] is [only] one of them. However, it mixed with its likes, which are these various [i.e. multiple] meanings. As a result of this mix, it [i.e. the *muşkil* expression] became ambiguous.<sup>25</sup>

The two examples often given for *muşkil* expression are (i) *qawārīr min fiḍḍa* (decanter made of silver), mentioned in Qur'ān 76:16,<sup>26</sup> which translates as "Decanter made of silver: they will determine the measure thereof (according to their wishes)<sup>27</sup> and (ii) *annā*, as in *annā la-ki hādā* (O Mary! Whence (comes) this to you?),<sup>28</sup> mentioned in the Qur'ān 3:37,<sup>29</sup> which translates as

<sup>25</sup> Other *uşûlīs* defined *muşkil* similarly. Al-Shāshī, for instance, notes: "وأما المُشكَل... دخل في أشكاله وأمثاله حتى لا يقال المراد إلا بالطلب ثم بالتأمل حتى يمتيز عن أمثاله ونظيره في الأحكام", which can be translated as "As to *muşkil*,... [it is that which] enters upon its likes and its equals so much so that its intended meaning cannot be known only through pondering and then deliberating with the purpose of differentiating it from its likes and compeers in legal ruling (al-Shāshī, Niẓām al-Dīn Abū 'Alī Aḥmad b. Muḥammad b. Ishāq, *Uşūl al-Shāshī* (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-'Arabī, 1982), 81.) For similar remarks, see also a-Laknawī, *Qamar al-Aqmār*, I, 148; al-Nasafī, *al-Manār*, I, 148; and Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 148. For the lexical meaning of the term *muşkil*, which is "things or affairs, that are confused or dubious [by reason of their resembling one another or from any other cause]," see Edward William, Lane, *An Arabic-English Lexicon Derived from the Best and Most Copious Eastern Sources* (Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1968), 1500.

<sup>26</sup> قَوَارِيرٍ مِنْ فِضَّةٍ قَدَرُوا مِنْهَا تَقْدِيرًا

<sup>27</sup> See, Ḥusām al-Dīn Ḥusayn b. 'Alī b. Ḥajjāj al-Signāqī, *al-Kāfi Šarḥ al-Pazdawī*, ed. Fakhr al-Dīn Sayyid Muḥammad Qānat (al-Riyāḍ: Maktabat al-Rushd, 2001), 234, where al-Signāqī notes: "فالقارورة من الزجاج تكون لا من الفضة، فتأملنا فقلنا: إن تلك الأواني لا تكون من الزجاج، ولا بد من الفضة، بل لتلك الأواني حظ منهما، فإن للزجاج صفاء ليس هو للفضة وهو أن يجلي عما في باطنه، والفضة لها بياض ليس هو للزجاج، فكان لتلك الأواني صفاء الزجاج وبياض الفضة، وهما الصفتان الحميدتان لهما، فانتهت عنها الصفات الذميمة التي لهما."

<sup>28</sup> See, for instance, Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 149.

<sup>29</sup> فَتَقَبَّلَهَا رَبُّهَا بِقَبُولٍ حَسَنٍ وَأَنْبَتَهَا نَبَاتًا حَسَنًا وَكَفَّلَهَا زَكَرِيَّا كُلَّمَا دَخَلَ عَلَيْهَا زَكَرِيَّا كَلِمًا دَخَلَ عَلَيْهَا زَكَرِيَّا الْمِحْرَابَ وَجَدَ عِنْدَهَا رِزْقًا قَالَ لِمَزِيْمٍ أَنَّى لَكَ هَذَا إِذْ ظَنَّاكَ أُمَّةً هُوَ مِنْ عِنْدِ اللَّهِ إِنَّ اللَّهَ يَرْزُقُ مَنْ يَشَاءُ بِغَيْرِ حِسَابٍ

“And her Lord accepted her with full acceptance and vouchsafed to her a goodly growth; and made Zachariah her guardian. Whenever Zachariah went into the sanctuary (*miḥrāb*) where she was, he found that she had food. He said: O Mary! Whence (comes) this to you? She answered: It is from Allah. Allah gives without limit to whom He wills.”

I will next deal with these two examples of *muškil* with an eye to providing insights into nature of the linguistic category of *muškil* with its both types and how exactly both differ from the category of *muštarak*. I will start with *qawārīr min fiḍḍa* and proceed to *annā*, which represent multiple-worded *muškil* and one-worded *muškil* respectively.

### 2.1.1. Multiple-worded *muškil*

The issue with *qawārīr min fiḍḍa* that made it fall under the ambiguous category of *muškil* is that when the word *qārūra* (pl. *qawārīr*), which means a cup made of glass, is described with the adjectival of being made of silver, this particular type of cup then happens to be described with two opposing features, namely, the feature of being made of silver and the feature of being made of glass. In fact, as far as our understanding of the world in which we live in is concerned, there exists no item that is being described by the expression *qārūra min fiḍḍa*.

It is true that we do know of cups made of glass and those made of silver. But we have not experienced any cup which combines the feature of being made of silver and that of being made of glass. In other words, this expression mixes with each other what we know of in this world in terms of two ordinary features of ordinary cups in order for this mix/combination (*mudkhal* or *madkhūl*)<sup>30</sup> to denote, perhaps on the strength of this combination, a meaning of an extraordinary type of cup used in paradise to serve drink to those who go to paradise, as it is understood from the context of the expression where it is mentioned in the Qur’ān 76:16.<sup>31</sup>

<sup>30</sup> *Mudkhal* is the passive participle noun of *adkhala-hū* (Lane, 861). I am using it here to allude to how *uṣūlīs* define *muškil*, which, as they note, mixes with, or enters upon, its likes, when they say “وهو الداخل في أشكاله” (It is that which mixes with, or enters upon, its likes (see al-Nasafī, *al-Manār*, I, 148.)

<sup>31</sup> قَوَارِيرَ مِنْ فِضَّةٍ قَدَّرُوهَا تَقْدِيرًا

Thus, the meaning which the addresser, in this case, God the Almighty, seems to convey to his creation is expressed not with the name of the particular cup used in paradise, but through this combination, namely *qārūra min fiḍḍa*. The addressee(s) could then come up with their best understandings of the expression following pondering (*ṭalab*) and deliberation (*ta'ammul*).

This is in line with the definition of *muşkil*, which states that “it [*muşkil*] is that which enters upon, or mixes with, its likes (*amṭālihi*).”<sup>32</sup> In fact, *qārūra min fiḍḍa* mixes the two features of cups that we know of, namely, the feature of being made of glass and the feature of being made of silver. Once we move to the process of *ṭalab* to find out what this combination/mix of features might denote in terms of the intended meaning of this mysterious cup that is noted in the Quran, we go further down to the sub-features of the feature of being made of glass and those of the feature of being made of silver.

This then leads us to arrive at the conclusion that *glass* has two sub-features that stand out among the materials that one would know of during the time when Qur'ān 76:16 was revealed: transparency and opaqueness. While the former sub-feature is desired, the latter is not so when it comes to glass material. The other conclusion which one arrives at here is that *silver* has two sub-features: brightness and the lack of purity. While the former is something appreciated when it comes to silver, the latter is not desired, as noted by *uşūlî* scholars.<sup>33</sup>

As a result, when the feature of being made of glass and that of being made of silver were combined with each other in the *muşkil* expression *qārūra min fiḍḍa*, the outcome of this combination is a type of cup that might possess the features of transparency and/or opaqueness in addition to the features of brightness and/or the lack of purity. Some of the potential intended meanings of the expression *qārūra min fiḍḍa* that one could then derive from this are as the following:

1. Cup that is opaque and impure.

---

<sup>32</sup> Al-Nasafî, *al-Manār*, I, 148. See also, al-Samarqandî, *Mizān al-Uşûl*, 354 and al-Pazdawî, *Kanz al-Wuşûl*, 9.

<sup>33</sup> Molla Jîwan, *Nûr al-Anwâr*, I, 150. See also Şadr al-Şarî'a, *al-Tawḍîḥ*, 196.



2. Cup that is opaque and bright.
3. Cup that is transparent and bright.
4. Cup that is transparent and impure.

The intended meaning of any given *muškil*, though could potentially be more than one, must be one of these potential senses in a given speech or writing occasion and it cannot denote multiple meanings at the same time.<sup>34</sup> Then, in our case which one of the combination of features mentioned above could express the intended meaning of the *muškil* expression of *qārūra min fiḍḍa*?

It seems that the only plausible answer to this question is the third option because it is the one that contains only the positive sub-features. In fact, these two features, namely, transparency and brightness, would be the expected features among the potentials for a type of cup to be used in the paradise.<sup>35</sup> This process of choosing the most likely option among the potential intended meanings of a *muškil* phrase is what *uṣūlīs* refer to as the process of *ta'ammul* (deliberation).<sup>36</sup>

### 2.1.2. One-worded *muškil*

The issue which *uṣūlīs* found with one-worded *muškil* expressions such as the expression of *annā* mentioned in Qur'ān 2:223<sup>37</sup> is similar to the issue with multiple-worded *muškil* expressions as in *qārūra min fiḍḍa*, which I have explored in the previous section. The issue with the one-worded *muškil* expressions involves a somewhat easier thought process in its resolution in comparison to the previous type of *muškil* expression, which consists of multiple words.

<sup>34</sup> Al-Nasafī, *al-Manār*, I, 148

<sup>35</sup> Şadr al-Şarī'a, *al-Tawḍīḥ*, 196.

<sup>36</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150, al-Pazdawī, *Kanz al-Wuṣūl*, 9, al-Samarqandī, *Mizān al-Uṣūl*, 354, and Şadr al-Şarī'a, *al-Tawḍīḥ*, 196.

<sup>37</sup> نِسَاؤُكُمْ حَرْثٌ لَّكُمْ فَاتُوا حَرْثَكُمْ أَنَّى شِئْتُمْ وَقَدِّمُوا لِنَفْسِكُمْ ۚ وَاتَّقُوا اللَّهَ وَأَعْلَمُوا أَنَّكُمْ مُلَاقُوهُ ۗ وَبَشِّرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ (Your wives are a place of sowing of seed for you, so approach them how you please. And send forth something good for yourselves. Be mindful of Allah, and know that you will meet Him. And give good news to the believers.)

The relative easiness in the resolution of this type of *muşkil* expression, which I refer to as 'one-worded *muşkil*,' seems to come from the fact that each one of the *muşkil* expression's potential meanings is already known to the linguistic community.

The problem here originates from the fact that scholars had not found themselves in a situation where they would consider all its potential meanings that were in circulation at that time and then make a list of all these potential meanings, a list to be used for feature reference.<sup>38</sup>

Thus, as is the case with the multiple-worded *muşkil*, here one needs to first ponder upon (go through the process of *ṭalab*) to determine the potential meanings of one-worded *muşkil* expression. Given that the process of *ṭalab* (pondering) is performed by someone who knows the Arabic language well, it would help them reach to the meanings of the *muşkil* expression that were in circulation in the Arabic language then.<sup>39</sup>

This is the process which *uşûlīs* have followed with the word *annā*, too. In fact, undertaking the inquiry of *ṭalab*, *uşûlīs* noted that the potential meanings of *annā* are as the following:

1. *ayy kayfiyya* (how) as in "*annā yakūnu lī ġulamun*," (How shall I have a son!), which is mentioned in Qur'ān 19:08.<sup>40</sup>
2. *min ayy makān* (whence) as in "*annā laki hādā*," (O Mary! Whence (comes) this to you?), which is mentioned in Qur'ān 3:37.<sup>41</sup>

<sup>38</sup> Note, however, that listing here does not necessarily entail a written one. A given scholar's lack of knowledge of a given expressions' potential meanings that were in use at the time of his/her consideration of it constitutes for this particular scholar the type of ambiguity that *uşûlīs* refer to as the *işkāl* and would thus render such word as *muşkil*. Him/her considering this particular expressions' potential meanings that were in use then, i.e. the process of *ta'ammul*, might lead him/her arrive at realizing all the senses of the expression. Once this happens, the *işkāl* of the expression is removed, apparently without requiring these meanings to be written.

<sup>39</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150.

<sup>40</sup> قَالَ رَبِّ اَنْى يَكُونُ لى غُلَامٍ وَكَانَتْ اَمْرًا نى عَاقِرًا وَقَدْ بَلَغَتْ مِنَ الْكِبَرِ عِتِيًّا  
<sup>41</sup> فَتَقَبَّلَهَا رَبُّهَا بِقَبُولٍ حَسَنٍ وَاَنْبَتَهَا نَبَاتًا حَسْبًا وَكَفَّلَهَا زَكَرِيَّا كُلَّمَا دَخَلَ عَلَيْهَا زَكَرِيَّا الْمِحْرَابَ وَجَدَ عِنْدَهَا رِزْقًا قَالَ يَمْرِؤُْمِ اَنْى لَكَ هَذَا اِنْ كُنْتَ هُوَ مِنْ عِنْدِ  
اللَّهِ اِنَّ اللّهَ يَرْزُقُ مَنْ يَشَاءُ بِغَيْرِ حِسَابٍ

As such, following the inquiry of *ṭalab*, comes the process of choosing the most likely option of the *muškil* expression through the process of *ta'ammul* (deliberation). Upon completion of this process also, scholars seem to have realized that what is meant by the *muškil* expression in Qur'ān 2:223 is the first option here. This is primarily because of the context in which the expression is mentioned. In fact, the verse notes that “*Nisā'ukum ḥartun la-kum*” (Your wives are a place of sowing of seed for you.) Scholars understood that the only plausible potential intended meaning of *annā* here would therefore be the first one, i.e. *ayy kayfiyya* (how) rather than *min ayy makān* (whence). In effect, *annā* in Qur'ān 2:223 is interpreted (made *ta'wīl*) in its first sense. Thus, a husband could have intercourse with his wife in various positions but not through ways other than the birth canal, as explained by scholars.<sup>42</sup>

The resolution of the issues with the two types of *muškil* expressions, such as *qārūra min fiḍḍa* and *annā*, therefore involves first deciding the potential intended meanings of a *muškil* expression through *ṭalab* and then choosing one of them as the intended meaning thereof on a given occasion of speech or writing through *ta'ammul*.

## 2.2. *Muštarak*

Having thus explained what *muškil* is on the basis of an analysis of classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence, I would like to discuss next *muštarak* as it is described by *uṣūlīs* in an effort to compare and contrast *muškil* with *muštarak*. In fact, al-Nasafī defines *muštarak* as the following:

"ما يتناول افرادا مختلفة الحدود على سبيل البديل"<sup>43</sup>

This translates as:

<sup>42</sup> See, for instance, Molla Jīwan, I, 149; al-Nasafī, *Kašf al-Asrār*, (Istanbul: al-Maktaba al-Ḥanīfiyya, n.d.), I, 149.

<sup>43</sup> Al-Nasafī, *al-Manār*, I, 137. See also al-Dabūsī, Imām Abū Zayd. *Taqwīm al-Adilla*, ed. Khalīl Muḥy al-Dīn Ḥusayn (Beirut: Dār al-Kutub al-‘ilmiyya, 2001), 104, al-Pazdawī, *Kanz al-Wuṣūl*, 7, and Ṣadr al-Šarī‘a, *al-Tawḍīḥ*, 45, 100-101.

That which includes by way of interchange individuals the definitions of which are different.

This means that *muštarak* could refer to more than one kind of entity at a time. This is due to the fact that *muštarak*, as noted by Molla Khusraw, is an expression which was assigned to multiple meanings through multiple occasions of assignment (*waḍ'*).<sup>44</sup>

The example *uṣūlīs* often provide for *muštarak* is the word *qur'*, which is assigned both to *ḥayḍ* (menstruation<sup>45</sup>) and *ṭuhr* (the state of pureness from menstrual discharge<sup>46</sup>).<sup>47</sup> Though opposite, each one of these meanings could be the intended meaning of *qur'*. In this regard, Ibn Malak notes the following:

تأمل علماءنا في لفظ القرء فوجدوه دالا على الجمع كما يقال قرأت الشيء أي جمعته وعلى الإنتقال أيضا كما يقال قرأ النجم إذا إنتقل. وكلاهما موجودان في الحيض لأنه هو الدم المجتمع في الرحم ومنتقل من الطهر إلى الحيض لأنه هو الأصل والحيض عارض كذا قاله الشراح.<sup>48</sup>

This translates as the following:

Our scholars have deliberated upon the word *qur'*, and they found that it signifies [i] 'gathering' as in "*qara' tu šay'an*," that is, "I have gathered something" and also [ii] 'moving' as in "*qara' al-najmu*," [the star moved] when it moves.<sup>49</sup> Both [meanings] are present in menstruation because it is the blood that is gathered in the womb and transforms from pureness to menstruation. This is because it is the original [state of a woman] while menstruation is accidental/ephemeral, as stated by commentators.

---

<sup>44</sup> Molla Khusraw, *al-Mir'āt*, 185.

<sup>45</sup> Wehr and Cowan, *A Dictionary of Modern Written Arabic*, 517 and Lane, *An Arabic-English Lexicon*, 259.

<sup>46</sup> Lane, Lane, *An Arabic-English Lexicon*, 1887.

<sup>47</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 138.

<sup>48</sup> Ibn Malak, 'Izz al-Dīn 'Abd al-Laṭīf, *Šarḥ al-Manār* (Istanbul: Āsitāna, n.d.), 342.

<sup>49</sup> He is referring to "shooting star."

The ambiguity of *muštarak* may be resolved through *ta'wīl*, which involves *ta'ammul* among other ways of inquiry.<sup>50</sup> In that case, it turns into *mu'awwal*. If it cannot be resolved through *ta'ammul*, then it turns into *mujmal* and requires *tafsīr* for its intended meaning to be understood by the addressee(s).<sup>51</sup>

Having thus provided detailed information on both *muškil* and *muštarak*, I will next analyze the two categories in a comparative way.

### 3. The Nature of the Difference between the Categories of *Muškil* and *Muštarak*

I have thus covered *muškil* and *muštarak* in detail on the basis of some of the major classical manuals of Islamic Jurisprudence in the Ḥanafī school of law in the previous section, and now I would like to discuss the nature of the difference between the two in this section through a comparative analysis between the two.

From the ongoing discussion on *muškil* and *muštarak* in the previous two sections, it is clear that a *muštarak* expression, like *qur'*, and a *muškil* one, like *annā*, are quite similar to each other in some respects.

First, both types of expressions could potentially come to refer to more than one meaning on any given speech/writing occasion. In this regard, the *muštarak* expression *qur'* could come to mean *ṭuhr* or *ḥayd* on one hand, and the *muškil* expression *annā* could come to mean *ayy kayfiyya* or *ayy makān* on the other, as explained above.

Second, the same examples, such as *qur'* and *annā*, are given for both *muškil* and *muštarak*. For someone reading about these two categories, one may well find that neither their definitions nor the examples given in classical manuals help explain the difference between the two.

---

<sup>50</sup> On this, Ibn Malak notes that preponderance of one of a given *muštarak*'s meanings could be done through *ta'ammul* as in the word *qur'*, or it could be done through a consideration of its, in our example, the word *qur'*s, *sibāq*, which is *thalātha* (three), or it could also be done by taking its *siyāq* into consideration (for more information, see Ibn Malak, *Šarḥ al-Manār*, 347.)

<sup>51</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150.

Last, but not least, both *muştarak* and *muşkil* are said to require *ṭalab* in addition to *ta'ammul* for their ambiguities to be resolved.

All of these similarities lead to confusion as to the nature of the difference between *muşkil* and *muştarak*. Among these three aspects where *muştarak* and *muşkil* seem to have in common, I think the most significant is the last one in that it plays a key role in differentiating *muştarak* and *muşkil* from each other.

In fact, as mentioned above, while discussing *izdiḥām al-ma'ānī* being a genius/class for *mujmal*, *muştarak*, *muşkil*, and *khafī*, Ibn Malak and Molla Jīwan note that intended meaning of a *muştarak* as well as of *muşkil* is known through *ta'ammul* in addition to *ṭalab*.<sup>52</sup>

I believe that the type of *ṭalab* that these two scholars seem to require for the ambiguity of *muştarak* to be resolved is not the same *ṭalab* that all the *uşūlīs* require for *muşkil* to go through for its ambiguity to be resolved. I further argue that the use of *ṭalab* in this specific sense is not common among, at least, the earlier *uşūlīs*. In fact, the idea of *muştarak* requiring *ṭalab* in addition to *ta'ammul* contradicts to the view of al-Pazdawī, earlier eminent scholar on *Uşūl al-Fiqh*. He makes the following remarks when comparing *muştarak* with *mujmal*:

“ لأن المشترك يحتمل الإدراك بالتأمل في معنى الكلام لغة برجحان بعض الوجوه على البعض فقبل ظهور الرجحان سمي مشتركا. ”

This translates as follows:

This is because certainly [the intended meaning of a given] *muştarak* could potentially be understood through *ta'ammul* (deliberation) on the [intended] meaning of the utterance by prepondering one of its [potential] meanings over the others. Prior to the completion of the preponderance, it is referred to as *muştarak*.

Furthermore, Pazdawī is not the only scholar who does not mention *ṭalab* as a type of inquiry that needs to be present during the resolution of a given *muştarak*'s ambiguity. In fact,

---

<sup>52</sup> Ibn Malak, *Šarḥ al-Manār*, I, 366 and Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150.

Molla Jīwan himself speaks of *muštarak* requiring *ta'ammul*, where he makes no reference to its requirement of *ṭalab* when he notes:

"ألترجح من المشترك قد يكون بالتأمل في الصيغة وقد يكون بالتأمل في السباق كما قلنا في القرء بالنظر إلى نفسه وبالنظر إلى

ثلاثة...<sup>53</sup>

This translates as the following:

Preponderance from [among the potential senses of] the *muštarak* may be carried out through *ta'ammul* upon the expression, and it may be done through *ta'ammul* on the co-textual context (*sibāq*), as we mentioned on the matter of *qur'*, by taking into consideration [the expression] itself as well as [the expression] *thalātha*.<sup>54</sup>

Here, Molla Jīwan himself makes no reference to *muštarak* requiring *ta'ammul* for its ambiguity to be resolved, which implies that *ṭalab* in the case of *muštarak* is not seen as a prerequisite for its ambiguity to be resolved.

Likewise, al-Nasafī himself does not refer to *ṭalab* as a type of inquiry that needs to be undertaken for *muštarak*'s intended meaning to be resolved. When discussing *muštarak*, al-Nasafī makes the following remarks in his *al-Manār*:

"حكمه التوقف فيه بشرط التأمل ليترجح بعض وجوهه للعمل به."<sup>55</sup>

This translates as:

Its [referring to *muštarak*] legal ruling is that one needs to suspend judgement on it with the condition of making deliberation (*ta'ammul*) so that one of its meanings is preponderated upon for it to become acted upon.

Furthermore, in his own commentary on *al-Manār*, he discusses in some length the way in which the ambiguity of *muštarak* can be resolved, appealing to *ta'ammul* on the expression,

---

<sup>53</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 141.

<sup>54</sup> For more information, see below.

<sup>55</sup> Al-Nasafī, *Manār al-Anwār*, I, 138.

looking at the *sibāq*, and finally by looking at another report.<sup>56</sup> He does not make any reference to *muştarak*'s needing *ṭalab* for its ambiguity to be resolved. Similar remarks are also made by Molla Jīwan, as noted above.<sup>57</sup>

Then, the reason behind some scholars' mentioning of *ṭalab* in addition to *ta'ammul* in the resolution of a given *muştarak* expression may not be to indicate that *ṭalab* is required and that they may have referred not to a given scholar's lack of knowledge of a particular ambiguous expression's assigned senses that are in use. As a matter of fact, even if one studied a given *muştarak*'s assigned senses previously, as soon as they encounter with the expression in given speech occasion, they will still need to recall the assigned senses of the *muştarak* expression. Therefore, they will need to recall the assigned senses, though not from what they know of the general raw linguistic corpus, but from what they know of in terms of processed information with regard to the language.

This type of inquiry also involves one's intellectual effort to determine the potential assigned senses of a given ambiguous expression in that they recall these senses on the speech occasion. As a result, this type of inquiry may also be referred to as *ṭalab* in that sense. And this could be what scholars like Molla Jīwan refers to when they speak of *muştarak* needing *ṭalab*.

This kind of *ṭalab* differs from the one seen in *muşkil*, though. In the case of *muşkil*, a person comes across an ambiguous expression which he/she has not previously considered with an eye to listing its potential meanings that are in use in the language.<sup>58</sup> Therefore, here the person's intellectual effort of gathering the assigned senses of the ambiguous expression involves a search from the raw linguistic corpus whereas in the case of *muştarak* it is quite the opposite, as I noted above.

---

<sup>56</sup> Al-Nasafī, *Kaşf al-Asrār*, I, 138.

<sup>57</sup> Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 141.

<sup>58</sup> Remember that through *ṭalab*, its potential meanings are sought after, something expressed by Molla Jīwan as "لأي معنى يستعمل هذا اللفظ", that is, an inquiry into whichever meaning it is used in (see *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 149).



I think the ongoing discussion on whether or not *muštarak* requires *ṭalab* for its resolution to be resolved has no bearing on *muštarak*'s relation to *muškil*. In other words, the similarity between *muškil* and *muštarak* with regard to both requiring *ṭalab* in their ambiguities to be resolved is more apparent than real, as each category requires a different type of *ṭalab*.

Thus, I argue that the difference between the two lies in the fact that unlike the case in *muštarak*, the potential meanings of *muškil* expression are not thought through by linguists or jurists.<sup>59</sup> This is probably because in the case of *muškil* scholars have not previously had any occasion where they would feel the need look into the matter so closely so far as to list the potential meanings of *muškil* expression such as *annā*. This also explains why *ṭalab*, which is to list the potential meanings of a given expression, is a requirement of *muškil*, while it is not for *muštarak*, according to such scholars as al-Nasafī and al-Pazdawī, as noted above.

To illustrate, when considering the Qur'ān 2:223<sup>60</sup> with an eye to trying to understand for the first-time the intended meaning of the word *annā* that is mentioned in it, scholars must have felt the need to investigate the potential meanings that *annā* denoted in the Arabic language of the time.<sup>61</sup> Scholars' lack of knowledge during their first encounter with the word *annā* of the potential meanings which the word denoted when it was revealed made it difficult for them reach to the intended meaning of the word. Therefore, they needed to first go through the process of *ṭalab*.

In the case of *muštarak*, on the other hand, scholars had already studied and listed the *wad'ī* (assigned) senses of *muštarak* and thus by the time they encountered a *muštarak* expression such as *qur'*, granted that its assigned meanings were discovered already before the relevant revelation

<sup>59</sup> Note that this lack of complete knowledge of a given expression's potential meanings used in language can well be in relation to a given scholar and not something common among the linguists or jurists or even the members of the same linguistic category. For someone who does not know Arabic at all, all the expressions mentioned in the sources of Islamic Law (e.g. *annā*) would be *muḥmal* and not *muškil*, as indicated by *uṣūlīs* (see, *Laknawī, Qamar al-Aqmār*, I, 149-150.)

<sup>60</sup> نَسَاؤُكُمْ حَزْتُ لَكُمْ فَأْتُوا حَزْنَكُمْ أَلَىٰ نَيْبِنْتُمْ وَقَدِّمُوا لِأَنْفُسِكُمْ وَأَتَّقُوا اللَّهَ وَاعْلَمُوا أَنَّكُمْ مُلَاقُوهُ وَبَشِّرِ الْمُؤْمِنِينَ

<sup>61</sup> This is the process which *uṣūlīs* refer to as *ṭalab* (see Molla Jīwan, *Kitāb Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 150).

that included the word *qur*', they were already aware of the potential senses the *muştarak* word could denote in a given speech or writing occasion. That is why *uşûlîs* highlight the fact that the potential senses of *muştarak* are assigned (*wad'î*) senses,<sup>62</sup> i.e. senses that became part of the linguistic corpus as assigned (*wad'î*) senses, as opposed to *muşkil*'s potential senses which have not yet become part of the language as assigned (*wad'î*) senses.

As such, unlike the case with *muşkil*, where its potential meanings are to be discovered through *ṭalab* (pondering), the list of potential senses that a *muştarak* expression can denote have already made their way into the recorded lexical body of the language,<sup>63</sup> and therefore require no *ṭalab*. To illustrate, when one looks at lexicons, one realizes that there are multiple meanings for the entry of *annā*.<sup>64</sup> This makes it a *muştarak* expression today, as its potential meanings later on probably made their way into the lexical body of language. Therefore, the ambiguity seen in a *muşkil* expression is an ambiguity with regard to its potential intended meanings which have not yet listed in the lexical body of the language at the time of that inquiry.

I thus further argue that once the potential meanings of a given *muşkil* expression such as *annā* become part of the knowledge of a given scholar who is looking at the matter for the first time, the *muşkil* expression turns into a *muştarak* expression for that scholar. Later on, the knowledge of the potential meanings of *annā* might become part of the linguistic corpus of other

---

<sup>62</sup> Even if we accepted that the word *qur*' was not already explored in terms of its assigned meanings by the time of the relevant revelation, this would only made the example of *qur*' a bad example for *muştarak*, and it would have still held as a good hypothetical example.

<sup>63</sup> I should note here that these meanings do not actually have to be written down or made their way into lexicons. Rather, at minimum, they have to become part of the linguistic corpus of the particular scholar looking into the matter or a group of them. This information might well make its way into lexicons, as that is how it commonly occurs with languages whose body of language come to be written down.

<sup>64</sup> Ibn Manẓūr, Muḥammad b. Mukarram, *Lisān al-'Arab*, (Būlaq: n.p., AH 1300-8; another edn, Beirut: n.p. 1955-6), 160. See also Lane, *An Arabic-English Lexicon*, 119. This has been pointed out by *uşûlîs* as well. In discussing *muştarak*, for instance, al-Shāshī notes the following: "أجمع العلماء رَجَمَهُمُ اللهُ تَعَالَى عَلَى أَنْ لَفْظَ الْقُرْءِ " (al-Shāshī, *Uşûl al-Shāshī* (1982), 36-39), which indicates that scholars consider it to have turned into *muştarak* expression.

scholars as well and also be part of the written language once it is recorded in any piece of literature such as lexicons.

This whole process can be seen not only in one-worded *muškil* expressions such as *annā* but also in multiple-worded *muškil* expressions. They, too, can potentially make their way into lexicons in the form of phrases. The potential meanings of the expression *qārūra min fiḍḍa* also made their way into the lexicons, rendering them *muštarak* as well.<sup>65</sup>

As such, the difference between *muštarak* and *muškil* is that in the case of *muškil* the potential meanings of a given *muškil* expression have not yet been thought through. Whereas, in the case of *muštarak*, the potential meanings of a given *muštarak* expression have already been worked out, which might have made their way into lexicons later on. Therefore, a *muškil* with its potential meanings that have not yet been worked out by scholars represents an expression that would later on evolve into *muštarak*<sup>66</sup> if the inquiry of *ṭalab* is successfully completed, resulting in the identification of all the potential meanings of the *muškil* expression that are in use in the language of the time.

I believe that nuances such as these that we see between *muškil* and *muštarak* represents such a remarkable sensitivity on the part of *uṣūlīs* when it comes to the nature of language. This is because their analysis of language for the purpose of deriving laws from the sources of Islamic law takes into consideration, in a consistent theoretical manner, differences even between one's lack of readily available knowledge of potential meanings of a given expression that are in use in

---

<sup>65</sup> See, for instance, Lane, *An Arabic-English Lexicon*, 2464.

<sup>66</sup> It would be wrong to say that *muškil* is a type of *muštarak*, as it would be wrong to say that *mu'awwal* is a type of *muštarak*, simply because *muškil*'s definition does not match with *muštarak*'s nor does *muštarak*'s with *mu'awwal*. Rather, they represent concepts which are, though evolve from one another, are different at the end. This is also similar to the case with *khafī* and *zāhir* in that once a *khafī* expression's *khafā'* (ambiguity) is removed through *ṭalab*, it turns into *zāhir*, and this does not mean that one is the sub-category of the other, but rather, the expression ceases to qualify to be categorized under the former and falls under the latter upon the resolution of the ambiguity in it (for the notion of *khafī* turning to *zāhir*, see Molla Jīwan, *Nūr al-Anwār*, I, 141 and al-Nasafī, *al-Manār*, I, 147.)

the language, as is the case with *muşkil*, and one's readily available knowledge of this information as is the case with *muştarak*.

Nuances such as these that we see between *muşkil* and *muştarak* seem to perfectly serve to refine the process of law-making in Islamic Law. It also illustrates the high degree of scrutiny that *uşûlîs* studied the language of the sources of Islamic Law, the primary one's of which are the Qur'ân and the Sunna.

#### 4. Conclusion

This paper pinpoints the fact that the difference between the linguistic categories of *muşkil* and *muştarak* of the Hanafî school of law is not well-established in either classical or contemporary sources. It argues that the difference between the two has much to do with whether or not the potential meanings of these expressions have been previously worked out by scholars and thus became readily available to them for future reference.

The potential intended meanings of a *muşkil* expression need to be listed through *ţalab* before they can be used. In the case of a *muştarak* expression, on the other hand, its potential intended meanings have already been worked out by scholars, thus requiring no process of *ţalab*. These meanings might then make their way into the lexical body of the language of other members of the linguistic community, which would likely be resulted in being listed as assigned (*wađ'î*) senses of the expression in lexicons.

This explains why the same example such as *qur'* sometimes could be given for both *muştarak* and *muşkil* expressions in the literature. In fact, in the case of *muşkil*, the potential meanings of the word *qur'* were not thought through and thus were not listed prior to scholars' consideration of it. On the other hand, once the meanings of the word *qur'* that were used in the language were thought through and listed by scholars, which resulted in them discovering that it was used either to signify *jam'* (gathering) and *intiqaîl* (move). This discovery then turned this *muşkil* expression into a *muştarak* for these scholars.

In short, *qur*' whose potential meanings were to be worked out by scholars had fallen under the category of *muškil*, while *qur*' whose potential meanings were already been worked out by scholars fell under *muštarak*.

The present work thus argued that a *muškil* expression, and especially one that consists of one word, constitutes an earlier version of *muštarak* expression in that the latter evolves from the former and not that one is the sub-category of the other. For instance, despite the fact that *annā* is given as an example of *muškil* phrase in classical as well as modern *uṣūl* works, it seems to have made its way into lexicons with two of its potential meanings,<sup>67</sup> and thus have turned into *muštarak* after it was considered a *muškil* expression.

All these come down to illustrating the fact that reading the linguistic categories, and in particular those which have similar features as is the case with *muškil* and *muštarak*, without any consideration as to how they are different from each other, one might end up with incorrect understandings of, at least, some of these linguistic categories. This then seems to have led them to avoid going beyond the classical manuals even if the occasion demands otherwise, as I explored within the context of *muškil* and *muštarak*. Contemporary treatments of the subject matter thus seem to be eclectic in nature and are characterized by their unease with exploring beyond the picture of what *uṣūlīs* sufficed to reveal of this unparalleled linguistic theory that was behind the process of law-making in Islamic Law.

This uneasiness with going beyond what *uṣūlīs* revealed of their linguistic theory is also represented with their avoidance to explain any given linguistic category using examples other than those mentioned in classical texts, even if this would mean using the same examples to explain two different categories, as was the case with their treatment of *muškil* and *muštarak*. They

---

<sup>67</sup> Obviously, it is worth mentioning here that *muškil* expressions that consist of more than one word, such as *qārūra min fiḍḍa*, would hardly make their way into lexicons as separate entries, albeit could well be found in entries for each word that such expressions contain, as is the case with *qārūra min fiḍḍa*, as noted above.

define the two almost identical and yet provided the same example, namely *qur'*, simply because this is the example often given in the classical manuals.

As the ongoing discussion suggests, I believe that no one embarking on a study of Islamic Law and Islamic Jurisprudence can feel at ease with their subject without scrutinizing the linguistic categories and the linguistic theory that steered the classical scholars when producing these categories.<sup>68</sup>

Finally, as illustrated in the case of *muşkil* and *muştarak* in the present work, each linguistic category gains its proper meaning not independently but in consideration of its relations to other categories. As such, approaching to the linguistic categories in a holistic way that allows one to appreciate the fine details between the categories and their implications for the process of law-making in Islamic Law, which includes drawing new comparisons, is the way forward in the contemporary study of *Uşûl al-Fiqh* (Islamic Jurisprudence) and *Fiqh* (Islamic Law).

---

<sup>68</sup> *Uşûl al-Fiqh*'s linguistic categories are still used for the process of law-making in Islamic Law even in Türkiye, Malaysia, Pakistan, USA, UK, and elsewhere, so these categories are still relevant for the study and practice of Islamic Law (see Hüseyin İçen, "Çağdaş Dönemde Fetva Faaliyeti: İslam Hukuku ve Toplum Bağlamında Dinî Kurumlardan Örnekler" in *İslam Tetkikleri Dergisi* 13 (2023): 479-486.)

## References / Kaynakça

- Ali, A. Yusuf., trans. *The Meaning of the Holy Qur'ān*. Brentwood, Maryland: Amana Corporation, 1991.
- Atar, Fahrettin. *Fıkıh Usûlü*. Istanbul: IFAV, 2018.
- Bilik, Abdurrahim. "Hilâf Mesailinin Hanefî Muhtasarların Metin Kurgusuna Etkisi ve Temel Şerhlerde Ele Alınışı (Kitabu's-Salât Örneği)". In *Universal Journal of Theology* 5 / 2 (Aralık 2020): 109-134.
- Crystal, David. *A Dictionary of Linguistics and Phonetics*. 6th ed. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2008.
- Al-Dabûsî, İmâm Abû Zayd. *Taqwîm al-Adilla*. Edited by Khalîl Muhyî al-Dîn Hûsayn. Beirut: Dâr al-Kutub al-'Ilmiyya, 2001.
- Hallaq, Wael B. *A History of Islamic Legal Theories: An Introduction to Sunnî Uşûl Al-Fiqh*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997.
- Ibn Hâlabî, Rađî al-Dîn Muḥammad b. İbrâhîm. *Anwâr al-Ḥalak 'alâ Şarḥ al-Manâr li-Ibn Malak*. Istanbul: Āsitāna, n.d.
- İçen, Hüseyin. "Çağdaş Dönemde Fetva Faaliyeti: İslam Hukuku ve Toplum Bağlamında Dinî Kurumlardan Örnekler". In *İslam Tetkikleri Dergisi* 13 (2023): 479-486.
- Kamali, Mohammad Hashim. *Principles of Islamic Jurisprudence*. Rev. ed. Cambridge: Islamic Texts Society, 1991.
- Karahmetoğlu, Reyhan. "İbn Âşûr'a Göre İşkâl Sebepleri ve Çözüm Yolları" In *Mutalaa* 1 / 2 (December 2021): 222-239.
- Kavalcıoğlu, A. "Debûsî ve Semerkandî'nin Fıkıh Usulünde "Kapalı Lafızlar" Konusuna Yaklaşımları ve Görüşlerinin Mukayesesi". In *Karadeniz Teknik Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* (KTUİFD) 5 (2018): 61-85.
- Ibn Malak, 'Izz al-Dîn 'Abd al-Laṭîf. *Şarḥ al-Manâr*. Istanbul: Āsitāna, n.d.
- Lane, E. W. *An Arabic-English Lexicon Derived from the Best and Most Copious Eastern Sources*. Beirut: Librairie du Liban, 1968.
- Jiwan, Molla. *Nūr al-Anwār*. Istanbul: al-Maktaba al-Ḥanîfiyya, n.d.
- Ibn Manzûr, Muḥammad b. Mukarram. *Lisān al-'Arab*. Būlaq: AH 1300-8; another edn, Beirut: 1955-6.
- Jaffer, Tariq. "Mu'tazilite Aspects of Faḥr Al-Dîn al-Rāzî's Thought." *Arabica* 59, no. 5 (2012): 510–35. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/41727686>.
- Molla Khusraw, Muḥammad b. Faramûz. *al-Mir'ât fî Sharḥ Mirqât al-Uşûl*. Istanbul: Fazilet, 2016.
- Şadr al-Şarî'a, 'Ubayd Allāh b. Mas'ūd Taj al-Şarî'a. *al-Tawḍîḥ fî Ḥalli Ġawāmiz al-Tanqîḥ*. N.p., N.d.

- Šams al-Dīn Muḥammad b. Ḥamza b. Muḥammad al-Fanārī al-Rūmī. Edited by Muḥammad Ḥasan Muḥammad Ḥasan Ismā'īl. *Fuṣūl al-Badā'i' fī Uṣūl al-Sharā'i'*. Beirut: Dār Kutub al-ʿIlmiyya, 1971.
- Al-Nasafī, Abū al-Barakāt. *Kaṣf al-Asrār*. Istanbul: al-Maktaba al-Ḥanīfiyya, n.d.
- Al-Nasafī, Abū al-Barakāt. *Al-Manār*. Istanbul: al-Maktaba al-Ḥanīfiyya, n.d.
- Nasūhîzâde, Büyük Haydar Efendi. *Usul-i Fıkh Dersleri*. 2nd ed. Istanbul: Üçdal, 1966.
- Pickthall, Marmaduke William, *The Meaning of the Glorious Qur'an Revised New modern English edition* (Birmingham: Islamic Dawah Centre International, 2011).
- Al-Samarqandī, ʿAlā al-Dīn Abū Bakr Muḥammad b. Aḥmad. *Mizān al-Uṣūl fī Natā'ij al-Uqūl*. Edited by Muḥammad Zakī ʿAbd al-Barr. N.p.: Maṭbaʿa Dūḥa al-Ḥadītha, 1984.
- Samar, Mahmut. "İslam Hukuk Usulünde Müşterek Lafzın Manaya Delaletine Dair Tartışmalar." In *Eskiyeşi / 42* (September 2020): 961-984, <https://doi.org/10.37697/eskiyeşi.764230>.
- Sezgin, Fuat. *Geschichte des arabischen Schrifttums*. Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1967.
- Al-Siġnāqī, Ḥusām al-Dīn Ḥusayn b. ʿAlī b. Ḥajjāj. *al-Kāfi Šarḥ al-Pazdawī*. Edited by Fakhr al-Dīn Sayyid Muḥammad Qānat. al-Riyāḍ: Maktabat al-Rushd, 2001.
- Al-Pazdawī, Fakhr al-Islām ʿAlī b. Muḥammad. *Kanz al-Wuṣūl ilā Maʿrifat al-Uṣūl*. N.p.: Mīr Muḥammad Kutub-khānah Markaz ʿIlm wa Adab, n.d.
- Al-Shāshī, Niẓām al-Dīn Abū ʿAlī Aḥmad b. Muḥammad b. Ishāq. *Uṣūl al-Shāshī*. Edited by ʿAbd Allāh b. Muḥammad al-Khalīlī. Beirut: Dar al-Kotob al-Ilmiyah, 2003.
- Topal, Ahmet. "The Role of the Arabic Language in *istinbāt al-ḥukm* within the Context of Criminal law: A General Framework for Inquiry into the Linguistic Categories of *uṣūl al-fiqh* of the Ḥanafī school of law." PhD dissertation, Leeds University, 2020.
- Vishanoff, David R. "Early Islamic Hermeneutics: Language, Speech, and Meaning in Preclassical Legal Theory." PhD diss., Emory University, 2004. <http://david.vishanoff.com/wp-content/uploads/Dissertation.pdf>
- Yalınkılıç, Mehmet and Abay, Ahmet. "Meryem suresi 71. Ayet Bağlamında İşkâli Giderme Yöntemleri." In *Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* 5 / 9 (December 2018): 463-482.
- Yazır, Elmalı'lı Muhammed Hamdi, *Hak Dîni Kur'ân Dili*. N.p.: Eser, 1979.
- Zysow, Aron. *The Economy of Certainty: An Introduction to the Typology of Islamic Legal Theory*. Atlanta, Georgia: Lockwood Press, 2013.