

E-ISSN: 2147-1185

# İNSAN VE TOPLUM BİLİMLERİ ARAŞTIRMALARI DERGİSİ

JOURNAL OF THE HUMAN AND  
SOCIAL SCIENCE RESEARCHES



**itobiad**



YIL- YEAR: 2023

**Cilt-Volume : 12**

**Sayı- Issue : 4**

**Special Issue on Sustainability and Digital  
Transformation**

**Sürdürülebilirlik ve Dijital Dönüşüm Özel Sayısı**

İSTANBUL / TÜRKİYE

Since 2012 -12 th Years

# İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi

Journal of the Human and Social Science Researches

itobiad

Cilt/Volume:12 Sayı/ Issue: 4

Special Issue on Sustainability and Digital Transformation / Sürdürülebilirlik ve Dijital Dönüşüm

Özel Sayısı 2023


e-ISSN: 2147-1185

[www.itobiad.com](http://www.itobiad.com) & <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/itobiad>

## Yayıncı / Publisher

**Mustafa Süleyman ÖZCAN**- [publisher@itobiad.com](mailto:publisher@itobiad.com)

[itobiadmuhasabe@gmail.com](mailto:itobiadmuhasabe@gmail.com)

 0000-0003-1091-6314


Eyüp-İstanbul

[www.itobiad.com](http://www.itobiad.com)

## Yazı İşleri Müdürü/Managing Editor

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mustafa YİĞİTOĞLU** [itobiad@itobiad.com](mailto:itobiad@itobiad.com)


[mustafayigitoglu@ibu.edu.tr](mailto:mustafayigitoglu@ibu.edu.tr)-[www.mustafayigitoglu.com](http://www.mustafayigitoglu.com)

 0000-0001-6308-1475

Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, Faculty of Theology,  
Bolu-TURKIYE

## Baş Editör/ Editor in Chief

**Prof. Dr. Serkan DİLEK**- [serkand1975@yandex.com](mailto:serkand1975@yandex.com),


 0000-0002-0393-4509

Kastamonu University, Economics and Administrative  
Sciences Faculty, Bolu-TURKIYE

## Editör Yardımcısı/Editorial Assistant

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mustafa YİĞİTOĞLU** -


[itobiad@itobiad.com](mailto:itobiad@itobiad.com) , [mustafayigitoglu@ibu.edu.tr](mailto:mustafayigitoglu@ibu.edu.tr)

 0000-0001-6308-1475

**Address:** Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, Faculty of  
Theology, Bolu-TURKIYE

## Editör Yardımcısı/Editorial Assistant

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Erhan TECİM** - [erhantecim@gmail.com](mailto:erhantecim@gmail.com)

 0000-0001-6578-5150

Selcuk University, Sociology, Konya- TURKIYE

## Veri Girişi/Data Entry

Mehmet ÖZGÜN- [mehmet\\_1296\\_@hotmail.com](mailto:mehmet_1296_@hotmail.com)

Yazım Desteği Akademik Yayın ve Danışmanlık-TURKIYE

## E-Yayın/Electronic Publication

30.09.2023

<https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/itobiad>

## Yönetim Yer /Executive Office

Yesil Pınar Mah. Ruzgarlı Sokak. No:8/10 Eyup  
Sultan -İSTANBUL

[publisher@itobiad.com](mailto:publisher@itobiad.com) ; [itobiad@itobiad.com](mailto:itobiad@itobiad.com)

[www.itobiad.com](http://www.itobiad.com)

## Dizinlenme Bilgileri / Abstracting And Indexing Services

[itobiad] Tubitak-Ulakbim **TR Dizin**, **EBSCO**, , Index Islamicus, **Modern Language Association (MLA)**, Education Full Text (H. W. Wilson) Database Coverage List, **DOAJ: Directory of Open Access Journals**, IPSA, **CNKI**: China National Knowledge Infrastructure, Erih Plus, **The Belt and Road Initiative Reference Source (Ebsco)**, RILM Abstracts of Music Literature (EBSCO) For detailed information, please click here: <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/itobiad>


## Digital Platforms

ULRICH'S (Proquest), JGate, Academic Journal Database, Asos, SJournals, Academic Journals Database, Türk Eğitim İndeksi (TEİ), EuroPub, İlahiyat Atıf Dizi (Davet), Sobiad **For detailed information, please click here:** <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/itobiad>

## Alan Editörleri/Section Editors


### İktisadi İdari Bilimler Editörleri / Economic Administrative Sciences Editors

**Prof. Dr. Serkan DİLEK**- serkand1975@yandex.com,

 0000-0002-0393-4509


Kastamonu University, Economics and Administrative Sciences Faculty, Bolu-TURKIYE

**Prof. Dr. Saim KAYADİBİ**- saimkayabidi@karabuk.edu.tr

 0000-0002-4753-4216

Karabuk University Faculty of Business Administration, Karabuk- TURKIYE


**Dr. Samet YÜCE**- syuce@kastamonu.edu.tr

 0000-0002-9975-4739

Kastamonu University School of Foreign Languages, Kastamonu-TURKIYE

**Prof. Dr. Norma Md SAAD** -norma@iiium.edu.my

International Islamic University Malaysia, Kulliyah of Economics and Management Sciences

 0000-0002-2455-904X


Islamic Economy

Kuala Lumpur / Malasia

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Dzuljastri Abdul RAZAK**-

dzuljastri@iiium.edu.my

International Islamic University Malaysia, Kulliyah of Economics and Management Sciences


 0000-0002-2455-904X

Islamic Economy

Kuala Lumpur / Malasia

**Dr. Khoirul UMAM**- khoirulumam@unida.gontor.ac.id


University Darussalam Gontor (unida),

 0000-0002-5530-8884

Indonesia

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Siti Zubaidah ISMAIL**- szubaida@um.edu.my


University of Malaya- Malaysia

 0000-0003-3381-4943

### Siyaset Bilimi Editörü/ Editor of Political Science

**Dr. Oğuz ÖZCAN**- oguzozcan@ticaret.edu.tr


İstanbul Ticaret University

 0000-0003-4031-615X

### Eğitim Editörleri / Educaciton Editors


**Asist Prof. Dr. Cennet GÖLOĞLU DEMİR** –

gologlu.cennet@gmail.com, Bahkesir- TURKIYE

 0000-0002-8770-6107

Bandırma Onyediy Eylül University

**Dr. Macario G. GAYETA**-doc.aiyo@gmail.com


 0000-0001-8183-5234

University of the East, University of the East Caloocan Campus, PHILIPPINES

### Felsefe ve Dini Araştırmalar Editörleri / Philosophy and Religious Studies Editors


**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ömer Faruk HABERGETİREN**-

ofhabergetiren@hotmail.com

 0000-0001-9304-6726


Karabuk University, Faculty of Islamic Sciences, Karabuk-TURKIYE

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Erhan TECİM** – erhantecim@gmail.com

 0000-0001-6578-5150

Selcuk University, Sociology, Konya- TURKIYE


**Asist Prof. Dr. Ali YILDIRIM** – oklubali@hotmail.com

 0000-0003-1687-993X

Tokat Gaziosmanpasa University, Faculty of Theology, Tokat-TURKEY

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Şükrü MADEN** –


sukrumaden@karabuk.edu.tr

 0000-0002-7165-6299

Karabuk University, Faculty of Theology, Karabuk- TURKIYE


**Asist Prof. Dr. Mehmet HABERLİ** –

mehmethaberli@gmail.com

 0000-0001-9942-6527


Bilecik Şeyh Edebali University, Faculty of Islamic Science, Bilecik- TURKIYE

**Nelofar ARA**- nelofarara2017@gmail.com

 0000-0003-1366-1505

Lovely Professional University, Pencap-INDIA


**Asist Prof. Dr. Ahmad ALI**- ahmadali.pak@yandex.com

 0000-0001-6739-9384

Abdul Wali Khan University-Pakistan

### Tarih Kültür Sanat Editörleri / History, Culture and Arts Editors


**Prof.Dr. Gülçin YAHYA KAÇAR**-gulcin.yahya@hbv.edu.tr>

 0000-0001-6056-2564

Ankara Hacı Bayram Veli University State Conservatory of Turkish Music Instrument Education Department


Ankara-TURKIYE

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Aşkın ÇELİK**- a\_celik36@hotmail.com

 0000-0003-4056-0371

Manisa Celal Bayar University, Faculty of Education, Manisa-TURKIYE


**Assist Prof. Dr. Can DOĞAN**- can.dogan@ibu.edu.tr,

 0000-0001-9165-4381

Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, Faculty of Fine Arts, Bolu-TURKIYE


### **İngilizce Dil Editörü / English Language Editor**

**Prof. Dr. Saim KAYADİBİ**- saimkayabidi@karabuk.edu.tr

 0000-0002-4753-4216


Karabuk University Faculty of Business Administration, Karabuk- TURKIYE

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fatma DEMİRAY AKBULUT**- demiray\_f@ibu.edu.tr

 0000-0003-0689-8483

Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, School of Foreign Languages, Bolu- TURKIYE

**Dr. Samet YÜCE**- syuce@kastamonu.edu.tr


 0000-0002-9975-4739

Kastamonu University School of Foreign Languages, Kastamonu-TURKIYE

### **Fransızca Dil Editörü / French Language Editor**

**Instructor Zeynep BÜYÜKSARAC**-

zeynepbuyuksarac@ibu.edu.tr


 0000-0001-7683-0965

Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, School of Foreign Languages, Bolu- TURKIYE

### **Rusça Dil Editörü / Russian Language Editor**

**Asst. Prof. Dr. Gulzira ZHAXYGULOVA**-


gulzirazhaxygulovala@ibu.edu.tr

 0000-0002-3797-6803

BOLU ABANT İZZET BAYSAL UNIVERSİTİ- Bolu-TURKIYE

### **Almanca Dil Editörü / German Language Editor**


**Dr. Muhammet Ali CAN** muhammetalican@gmail.com

 0000-0001-8781-0812

Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, Theology Faculty, Çanakkale- TURKIYE


## **Yayın Kurulu / Editorial Board**

**Prof. Dr. Serkan DİLEK**- serkand1975@yandex.com,

 0000-0002-0393-4509


Kastamonu University, Economics and Administrative Sciences Faculty, Bolu-TURKIYE

**Prof. Dr. Saim KAYADİBİ**- saimkayabidi@karabuk.edu.tr

 0000-0002-4753-4216


Karabuk University Faculty of Business Administration, Karabuk- TURKIYE

**Doç. Dr. Hanudin AMİN**- hanudin@ums.edu.my

 0000-0003-3645-287X


Universiti Malaysia Sabah- Malasia

**Dr. Maciej MILCZANOWSKI** – macm@poczta.onet.pl

 0000-0002-2322-2074

Rzeszow University-POLAND

**Dr. Muhammad Uhaib AS'AD**-uhaibm@yahoo.com

 0000-0003-3645-2706

Islamic University of Kalimantan-INDONESIA


**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Tetiana KUSHNAREVA** –

kushnareva\_t@mail.ru

Vernadsky Federal University-RUSSIA

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Şükrü MADEN** –


sukrumaden@karabuk.edu.tr

 0000-0002-7165-6299

Karabuk University, Faculty of Theology, Karabuk- TURKIYE

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ömer Faruk HABERGETİREN**-


ofhabergetiren@hotmail.com

 0000-0001-9304-6726

Karabuk University, Faculty of Theology, Karabuk- TURKIYE


**Prof. Dr. Esmail ABOUNOORİ**-

esmaiel.abounoori@semnan.ac.ir

 0000-0003-4168-7163

Semran University-IRAN


**Assist Prof. Dr. Ali YILDIRIM** – oklubali@hotmail.com

 0000-0003-1687-993X

Tokat Gaziosmanpasa University, Faculty of Theology, Tokat-TURKEY

**Assist Prof. Dr. Mehmet HABERLİ** –


mehmethaberli@gmail.com

 0000-0001-9942-6527

Bilecik Şeyh Edebalı University, Faculty of Islamic Science


Bilecik- TURKIYE

**Dr. Maksym DOICHYK**- maksvdoc@ukr.net

 0000-0001-5081-1336

Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, UKRAINE

**Assist Prof. Dr. Ahmad ALI**- ahmadali.pak@yandex.com


 0000-0001-6739-9384

Abdul Wali Khan University-Pakistan

Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, Faculty of Fine Arts,


Bolu-TURKIYE

**Dr. Macario G. GAYETA**-doc.aiyo@gmail.com

 0000-0001-8183-5234

University of the East Caloocan, PHILIPPINES


**Dr. Nagmi AİMER**-najmimuftah@gmail.com

 0000-0003-1739-2509

Higher Institute of Marine Sciences Techniques,  
SabrathaLIBYA


**Prof. Dr. Ihor HURAK**-ihorhurak@gmail.com

Vasyl Stefanyk Precarpathian National University, Ivano-  
Frankivsk- UKRAINE

 0000-0003-1739-2509

**Dr. Amina OMRANE** -amina.omrane@yahoo.fr


UNİVERSİTY OF SFAX

 :0000-0001-9057-5307

Tunus


**Asist Prof. Dr. Cennet GÖLOĞLU DEMİR** –

gologlu.cennet@gmail.com, Balıkesir- TURKIYE

 0000-0002-8770-6107

Bandırma Onyedi Eylül University


**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Erhan TECİM** – erhantecim@gmail.com

 0000-0001-6578-5150

Selcuk University, Sociology Konya-TURKEY

**Prof. Dr. Norma Md SAAD** -norma@iium.edu.my

International Islamic University Malaysia, Kulliyah of  
Economics and Management Sciences


 0000-0002-2455-904X

Islamic Economy

Kuala Lumpur / Malasia

**İndeks Editörü & Index Editor**

**Havva ÖZGÜN**- info@yazimdestegi.com

 0000-0002-2905-5326

Yazım Desteği Akademik Yayın ve Danışmanlık-TURKIYE

<https://yazimdestegi.com/>

### **Hakem Kurulu / Referee Board**

**İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi [itobiad]**, en az iki hakemin görev aldığı çift taraflı kör hakemlik sistemi kullanmaktadır. Hakem isimleri gizli tutulmakta ve yayımlanmamaktadır. / **Bu konuda genel bilgi için** [www.itobiad.com](http://www.itobiad.com) **Journal of the Human and Social Science Researches [itobiad]** uses double-blind review fulfilled by at least two reviewers. Referee names are kept strictly confidential. **For detailed information, please click here:** <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/itobiad>

### **Telif Hakları/Copyrights**

Dergide yayınlanan çalışmalarının telif hakları yazarlara aittir ve çalışmaları [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) (CC BY-NC 4.0) kapsamında lisanslanmıştır.

Authors own the copyright to their work published in the journal and their work is licensed under [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/) (CC BY-NC 4.0)

## İçindekiler/Contents

i/vi | Jenerik/Generic

### Araştırma Makaleleri/ Research Articles

---

- 2296/2322 | Didem KOCA  
**Evaluation of Digital Skills Development Policies with the Examples of Netherlands, Sweden, and Germany**  
Dijital Becerileri Geliştirme Politikalarının Hollanda, İsveç ve Almanya Örnekleriyle Değerlendirilmesi
- 2323/2343 | Cumali KILIÇ  
**Organizational Stress and Performance From the Perspective of Technological Developments**  
Teknolojik Gelişmeler Perspektifinden Örgütsel Stres ve Performans
- 2344/2362 | Neşe SALİK ATA  
**Bibliometric Analysis of Covid 19 and Industry 4.0 Studies Published in Web of Science Database**  
Web of Science Veri Tabanında Yayınlanan Covid 19 ve Endüstri 4.0 Konulu Çalışmaların Bibliyometrik Analizi
- 2363/2387 | Şayan BERBER & Meri TAKSİ DEVECİYAN & Hazal Koray ALAY  
**Digital Literacy Level and Career Satisfaction of Academics**  
Akademisyenlerin Dijital Okuryazarlık Düzeyi ve Kariyer Tatmini
- 2388/2410 | Rabia ÖZAT & Mualla AKÇADAĞ  
**Systematic Literature Review of Publications on Digital Twin Topics in Certain Research Areas**  
Belirli Araştırma Alanlarında Dijital İkiz Konulu Yayınların Sistematik Literatür İncelemesi