

# *Journal of Balkan and Black Sea Studies*

Year 6, Issue 11

December 2023

e-ISSN: 2667-470X

## **editors**



### **Editor in Chief and Owner**

Mehmet HACISALİHOĞLU, Prof. Dr.,  
Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität Munich  
Chair of Turkish Studies  
Yıldız Technical University,  
Department of Political Science and International Relations

### **Managing/Section Editors**

*Bulgaria, Romania:*

*Responsible Director:* Cengiz YOLCU, PhD cand., Istanbul 29 Mayıs University

*Former Yugoslavia:*

Jahja MUHASILOVIĆ, PhD. International University of Sarajevo

*Greece, Cyprus:*

Deniz ERTUĞ, PhD., Istanbul

*Albania, Kosovo:*

Fatih Fuat TUNCER, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Istanbul Gelişim University

*Caucasus, Russia:*

Keisuke WAKIZAKA, Assist. Prof. Dr., Istanbul Gelişim University

### **Secretary**

Zeyneb GÖKÇE

## Editorial Board

- Chair:** Mehmet HACISALİHOĞLU, Prof. Dr.,  
Fuat AKSU, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University  
Isa BLUMI, Prof. Dr., American University of Sharjah  
Cengiz ÇAĞLA, Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University  
Ali ÇAKSU, Prof. Dr., Balıkesir University  
Bilgin ÇELİK, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Dokuz Eylül University  
Krisztián CSAPLÁR-DEGOVICS, Dr., Research Centre for the Humanities, Budapest  
Neriman ERSOY-HACISALİHOĞLU, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Istanbul University  
Ayşe KAYAPINAR, Prof. Dr., National Defence University  
Levent KAYAPINAR, Prof. Dr., Ankara University  
Elçin MACAR, Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University  
Çiğdem NAS, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University  
Ali Fuat ÖRENÇ, Prof. Dr., Istanbul University  
Nurcan ÖZGÜR-BAKLACIOĞLU, Prof. Dr., Istanbul University  
Esra ÖZSÜER, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Istanbul University  
Laçın İdil ÖZTİĞ, Assoc. Prof. Yıldız Technical University  
Milena PETKOVA, Assoc. Prof. Dr., Kliment Ohridski University, Sofia  
Cevdet ŞANLI, Assist. Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University  
A. Gül TOKAY, PhD., Istanbul/London

## International Advisory Board

- Vermund AARBAKKE (Assist. Prof. Dr., Aristotelian University of Thessaloniki)  
Fikret ADANIR (Prof. Dr., Bochum)  
Yıldırım AĞANOĞLU (Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi)  
Bülent AKYAY (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Trakya University)  
Giorgi ANCHABADZE (Prof. Dr., Ilia State University, Tbilisi)  
Andrey ANDREEV (Prof. Dr., Veliko Tarnovo University)  
Ali ASKER (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Karabük University)  
Mustafa AYDIN (Prof. Dr., Kadir Has University)  
Mustafa AYDIN (Prof. Dr., İstanbul University)  
Ayşegül AYDINGÜN (Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University)  
Aydn BABUNA (Prof. Dr., Boğaziçi University)  
Evgeniy BAHREVSKIY (Dr., Russian Cultural and Natural Institute, Moskva)  
Bojan BALKOVEC, (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Ljubljana University)  
Evren BALTA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Özyeğin University)  
Tsira BARAMIDZE (Prof. Dr., I. J. Tbilisi State University)  
Nikica BARIĆ, (Dr. Croatian Institute of History)  
Boban BATRIČEVIĆ, (Dr., University of Montenegro)  
Milivoj BEŠLIN, (Dr., Belgrade University)  
Kemal BEYDİLLİ (Prof. Dr., Istanbul)

Ourania BESSİ (Dr. Birmingham University)  
Yuliya BİLETSKA (Dr. Erciyes University)  
Faruk BİLİCİ (Prof. Dr., INALCO, Paris)  
Bülent BİLMEZ (Prof. Dr., İstanbul Bilgi University)  
Nuray BOZBORA (Prof. Dr. Marmara University)  
Nazım CAFEROV (Assist. Prof. Dr., Azerbaijan State Economy University)  
Zdenko ČEPIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Institute of Contemporary History -Slovenia)  
Tihomir CIPEK, (Prof. Dr., Zagreb University)  
Merab CHUKHUA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., I. J. Tbilisi State University)  
Konrad CLEWING (Dr., Südost-Institut, Regensburg)  
Ahmet CONKER (PhD., Yıldız Technical University)  
Mitat ÇELİKPALA (Prof. Dr., Kadir Has University)  
Birgül ÇOLAKOĞLU (Prof. Dr., Istanbul Technical University)  
Krisztián CSAPLÁR-DEGOVICS (Dr., Research Centre for the Humanities, Budapest)  
Hakan DEMİR (Dr., Sakarya University)  
Birgül DEMİRTAŞ (Prof. Dr., TOBB Economics and Technology University)  
Ayşe DIETRICH (Prof. Dr., International Journal of Russian Studies)  
Ljubodrag DIMIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Belgrad University)  
Margarita DOBREVA (PhD., Institute for Balkan Studies, Sofia)  
Feridun M. EMECEN (Prof. Dr., 29 Mayıs University)  
Halit EREN (Prof. Dr., Rumeli University)  
M. Ozan ERÖZDEN (Prof. Dr., MEF University)  
Rossitsa GRADEVA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., American University in  
Bulgaria/Blagoevgrad)  
Nevena GRAMATIKOVA (PhD., Bulgarian National Library)  
Darina GRIGOROVA (Prof. Dr., Sofia University)  
Abdurrahman GÜMÜŞ (Dr., Yıldız Technical University)  
Abdullah GÜNDOĞDU (Prof. Dr., Ankara University)  
Sadriye GÜNEŞ (Assoc. Prof. Dr., İstanbul University)  
Fuat HACISALİHOĞLU (Assist. Prof. Dr., Ordu University)  
Ali HÜSEYİNOĞLU (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Trakya University)  
Nedim İPEK (Prof. Dr., Ondokuz Mayıs University)  
Toğrul İSMAYIL (Prof. Dr., Sütçü İmam University)  
Mümin İSOV (Assist. Prof. Dr., Trakya University)  
Husnija KAMBEROVIĆ, (Prof. Dr., Sarajevo University)  
Tomasz KAMUSELLA (Assoc. Prof. Dr., The University of St Andrews)  
Ertuğrul KARAKUŞ (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Kırklareli University)  
Ayşe KAYAPINAR (Prof. Dr., National Defense University)  
Levent KAYAPINAR (Prof. Dr., Ankara University)  
Özkan Özer KESKİN (PhD., Ordu)  
Machiel KIEL (Prof. Dr., Bonn)  
Hakan KIRIMLI (Prof. Dr., Bilkent University, Ankara)  
Markus KOLLER (Prof. Dr., Bochum University)  
Işık KUŞÇU (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University)  
Şule KUT (Prof. Dr., Okan University Istanbul)  
Elçin MACAR (Prof. Dr., Yıldız Teknik University)  
Hans Georg MAJER (Prof. Dr., Munich)

Mirjana MARINKOVIĆ (Prof. Dr., Belgrade University)  
Admir MULAOSMANOVIĆ (PhD., International University of Sarajevo)  
Mirela MURGESCU (Prof. Dr., Bucharest University)  
Ghia NODIA (Prof. Dr., Ilia State University, Tbilisi)  
Hasan OKTAY (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Uluslararası Vizyon University, Gostivar)  
Mehmet Akif OKUR (Prof. Dr., Yıldız Technical University)  
Mehmet ÖLMEZ (Prof. Dr., Istanbul University)  
Gencer ÖZCAN (Prof. Dr., Istanbul Bilgi University)  
Kader ÖZLEM (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Uludağ University)  
Enriketa Papa PANDELEJMONI (PhD., Tirana University)  
Ivan PARVEV (Prof. Dr., Sofia Kliment Ohridski University)  
Antoni PEHAR (PhD., Sarajevo)  
Spyridon PLOUMIDIS (PhD., National Kapodistrian University of Athens)  
Lyubomir POZHARLIEV (Dr. phil., Leibniz-Institut für Länderkunde, Leipzig)  
Radmila RADIĆ, (PhD., Institute for Recent History of Serbia)  
Mihai Sorin RADULESCU (Prof. Dr., Bucharest University)  
Florian RIEDLER (Dr. phil., University of Leipzig)  
Biljana RISTOVSKA-JOSIFOVSKA (Prof. Dr., Institute of National History,  
Skopje)  
Stefan ROHDEWALD (Prof. Dr., University of Leipzig)  
Orlin SABEV (Prof. Dr., Institute for Balkan Studies, Sofia)  
Georgios SALAKIDES (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Thrace Demokretus University,  
Komotini)  
Abdullah SAYDAM (Prof. Dr., Erciyes University)  
Oliver Jens SCHMITT (Prof. Dr., University of Vienna)  
Oleksandır SEREDA (Assist. Prof. Dr., Odessa)  
S. Akşin SOMEL (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Sabancı University)  
Ali Emre SUCU (Assist. Prof. Dr., Ankara University)  
Ilira SULO (Prof. Dr., University of Tirana)  
Oktay F. TANRISEVER (Prof. Dr., ODTÜ)  
Abdullah TEMİZKAN (Prof. Dr., Ege University)  
Ljubinka TRGOVČEVIĆ (Prof. Dr., Belgrade University)  
Zaza TSURTSUMIA (Prof. Dr., Queen Tamar University, Tbilisi)  
Tsvetelina TSVETKOVA (PhD., Sofia)  
Ömer TURAN (Prof. Dr., Middle East Technical University)  
Fatma Sel TURHAN (Assoc. Prof. Dr., Istanbul Technical University)  
Novica VELJANOVSKI, (Prof. Dr., Macedonia)  
Anđelko VLAŠIĆ, (PhD., Croatian Institute of History)  
Zeynep ZAFER (Prof. Dr., Ankara University)

## General Information

---

*Journal of Balkan and Black Sea Studies* is an interdisciplinary refereed journal focusing on the humanities and social sciences of the Balkan countries and the former Soviet republics. The journal welcomes contributions in the fields of history, economics, politics, international relations, culture, art, geography, literature, theology, ethnography and environmental sciences. The idea behind this initiative is to extend a cross-cultural and cross-disciplinary approach over issues of regional importance. Under this light, the journal aspires to act as an academic forum for scholars in historical as well as contemporary context on a wide range of cross-regional issues and to provide the epistemological framework for a comparative investigation, which would enhance our understanding of the Balkan, and Black Sea societies, politics and communities. Furthermore, manuscripts connecting the region with wider scopes, such as technological applications, will be also considered.

The journal is published online with two issues per year (June and December) commencing in 2018 and themed issues are anticipated. Submitted manuscripts should be original and not published or under consideration for publication elsewhere. Their length should not exceed 8.000 words. The manuscript will be subject to anonymous peer-review by at least two members of the scientific committee. The use of graphics and images in colour is encouraged and not subject to limitations (within reason). However, it is the responsibility of the individual authors to acquire copyright permission if needed. The language for manuscripts is English and Turkish. Articles, other than in English or Turkish, will be occasionally accepted. Articles must have an abstract of up to 150 words in English.

*Indexes and Platforms:* ISI, DRJI, ASOS, Cite Factor, H-Soz-Kult, H-Net, WorldCat, ResearchGate, WZB, academia.edu.

Copyright@2023 by BALKAR

**Design and Page Setting**

Cengiz Yolcu

## Conditions of Publication



*Guidelines for Submission:* Each issue will include articles, review essays, and shorter book reviews. All articles are to be submitted in electronic form to the journal editorial board at <http://dergipark.org.tr/balkar>. Submissions are to be up to 8,000 words in length and may be accompanied by footnotes and a bibliography. Transliterations will be kept to a minimum, and when used will follow the standard adopted by the appropriate scholarly bodies in the respective language areas. Articles are expected to be written in English though submissions in other languages can also be considered. Review essays are to be up to 4,000 words in length. They may review one or more books and may also focus on multiple works of a single author, works in a series, or publications around particular historical sources. Book reviews are to be 1,000 words in length.

*Review of Submissions:* All submissions are evaluated through a double-blind review process and include review both by editorial board members and external reviewers. *Publishable Copy:* Articles are to be submitted via electronic means in Word format and accompanied by a copy in pdf format. The pictures and figures should be sent separately in 200 dpi resolution in tif format.

*General Style Rules:* 1. The text must be formatted with 1.5-inch margins and be double-spaced. 2. A separate cover sheet must be included with the manuscript title, author's name, ORCID iD Number, professional affiliation, complete mailing address and telephone number. 3. A short abstract of 70-100 words in English (including also five key words) should accompany the article. 4. Capitalization: authors should be consistent in their use of capitalization. 5. Italics: the titles of works and periodicals should normally be italicized. Foreign words should also be italicized. 6. In general, foreign words and phrases, both in main text and footnotes should be provided in translation. All non-Roman alphabets should be transliterated according to the rules of international transliteration. 7. All articles should include footnotes. 8. All articles should have a bibliography at the end of the article. 9. Illustrations, tables, maps and figures must be numbered consecutively in the text and captions identifying the source of any image or data should be used. Figure title: below the picture; Table title: above the table. 10. For further reference, The Chicago Manual of Style Online (<http://www.chicagomanualofstyle.org>) is recommended.

## Editorial Office Contacts

Journal Website: <http://dergipark.org.tr/balkar>

Postal address:

Prof. Dr. Mehmet Hacısalihoglu

Yıldız Technical University,

Davutpaşa Campus, İİBF,

34220 Esenler, Istanbul-Turkey

e-mail: [mhaci@yildiz.edu.tr](mailto:mhaci@yildiz.edu.tr)

Tel: +90212383 68 33

## Contents

---

### Research Articles

1-24

The Ottoman Dracula. Kazıklı voyvoda and the Construction of the Rebel  
and Evil in the Ottoman Empire

Adrian Gheorghe, Dr. phil,

Ludwig-Maximilians-Universitaet München

25-56

İsrail-Filistin Sorunu Gölgesinde Unutulan Bir Halk: İsrail  
Çerkeslerinin Sosyal Entegrasyonları ve Sorunları

Emir Fatih Akbulat, Dr.,

Istanbul

57-74

Negotiating Values: Diyanet and the Syrian Refugee Crisis

Iulia-Alexandra Oprea, PhD., Assist. Prof.

GE Palade University of Medicine, Pharmacy, Science and Technology, Targu  
Mures

75-102

The European Union's Soft Power Dynamics in Kazakhstan

Madina Zhunissova, PhD. candidate,

Marmara University, Istanbul

103-116

Transformation of Memorial Culture: The Case of Husein Bey  
Gradašević in Contemporary Bosniak Perspective

Amir Duranović, PhD. Assoc. Prof.,

University of Sarajevo

### Review Articles

117-126

William H. Holt, *The Balkan Reconquista and Turkey's Forgotten Refugee  
Crisis* Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 2019, 328 p.

Emir Fatih Akbulat, Dr.,

Istanbul

**Book Reviews**

127-130

*Das osmanische Europa. Methoden und Perspektiven der  
Frühneuzeitforschung zu Südosteuropa*- Eds. Andreas Helmedach,  
Markus Koller, Konrad Petrovsky and Stefan Rohdewald. Leipzig:  
Eudora-Verlag 2014, 506 p.  
Klaus Kreiser, Prof. Dr.,  
Berlin



## Editorial

---

The *Journal of Balkan and Black Sea Studies* is an Istanbul-based journal that aims to enhance academic exchange among social scientists from Turkey, the Balkans, the Caucasus, and Eastern European countries. We initiated the journal in 2018 and have since published ten issues. The current, eleventh issue comprises five research articles and two book reviews.

The inaugural research article in this issue, titled "The Ottoman Dracula: Kazıklı Voyvoda and the Construction of the Rebel and Evil in the Ottoman Empire" by *Adrian Gheorghe*, delves into the portrayal of the rebellious Romanian prince from the 15th century in Ottoman historical narratives spanning the 15th to 18th centuries. Gheorghe seeks to uncover potential links between the depiction of Dracula in German-speaking Europe and Ottoman historical accounts.

The second research article in this issue, titled "İsrail-Filistin Sorunu Gölgesinde Unutulan Bir Halk: İsrail Çerkeslerinin Sosyal Entegrasyonları ve Sorunları" by *Emir Fatih Akbulat*, addresses the overlooked Circassian community residing in Israel. The Circassians were historically settled in the region during the Ottoman era, and after the establishment of Israel, they encountered a new government and language. The author highlights that despite facing discrimination due to their Muslim faith, similar to other Muslims, the Circassians have managed to establish positive relations with Israeli authorities and have been employed in roles such as soldiers or policemen.

The third research article in this issue, titled "Negotiating Values: Diyanet and the Syrian Refugee Crisis" by *Iulia-Alexandra Oprea*, explores the role of the Turkish Presidency of Religious Affairs (Diyanet) and its Friday sermons advocating for acceptance and tolerance of Syrian refugees in Turkey, employing the Islamic concepts of *muhacir* (migrant) and *ensar* (helper). The article also delves into the tension between Islamic humanism and Turkish nationalism within contemporary Turkish discourse, as reflected in the narratives presented by Diyanet.

The fourth research article in this issue, titled "The European Union's Soft Power Dynamics in Kazakhstan" by *Madina Zhunissova*, examines the soft power tools employed by the EU in Kazakhstan since the early 1990s. Utilizing Joseph Nye's concept of soft power, the author seeks to elucidate EU policies in the realms of culture, political values, and foreign policy. Zhunissova's concluding assessment of the EU's engagement in Kazakhstan is that both parties, namely the EU and Kazakh authorities, share an interest in fostering a closer relationship.

The fifth research article (based on a conference paper) in this issue, titled "Transformation of Memorial Culture: The Case of Husein Bey Gradašćević in Contemporary Bosniak Perspective" by *Amir Duranović*, analyzes Bosniak historiography concerning the Bosniak notable Husein Bey Gradašćević, who initiated a revolt against Ottoman central rule in the early 1830s. According to the author, Bosniak historians, especially since the Bosnian War between 1992 and 1995, tend to interpret Husein Bey's movement as reflecting the desire of Bosniak notables for national autonomy in the 19th century. Another group of historians, including Turkish historians, assess it merely as a resistance movement against the modernization process in the Ottoman Empire.

The sixth article in this issue is a comprehensive book review by *Emir Fatih Akbulat*, focusing on William H. Holt's book titled "The Balkan Reconquista and Turkey's Forgotten Refugee Crisis." Akbulat also references earlier studies by scholars such as Justin McCarthy and Nedim İpek on the expulsion of Balkan and Caucasian Muslims during the long 19th century. He assesses Holt's new book as a highly significant contribution to the field, particularly in shedding light on the (lack of a strong) memorial culture of migrants from the Balkans and Caucasus in Turkey.

The final paper is a concise book review by *Klaus Kreiser* on the book titled "Das Osmanische Europa. Methoden und Perspektiven der Frühneuzeitforschung zu Südosteuropa" (edited by Andreas Helmedach, Markus Koller, Konrad Petrovsky, and Stefan Rohdewald).

In conclusion, I would like to express my gratitude to the authors

of these excellent articles. I also extend my thanks to the editorial board members, first of all Cengiz Yolcu, and the referees of this issue for their hard work and valuable efforts during the evaluation process of the articles.

Mehmet Hacısalihođlu, Prof. Dr.

Editor in Chief