

EISSN 2602-4039





Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University



VOLUME 69 • ISSUE 1 • JANUARY 2019

forestist.istanbul.edu.tr



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

#### Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

#### EDITOR IN CHIEF

#### Murat Demir 厄

İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

#### **ASSOCIATE EDITORS**

Ender Makineci 厄

İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

#### **Run-Cang Sun**

College of Materials Science and Technology, Director, Beijing Key Laboratory of Lignocellulosic Chemistry, Beijing Forestry University, Beijing South China University of Technology, Guangzhou, China

#### Martin A. Hubbe

North Carolina State University, Department of Forest Biomaterials, United States

#### **EDITORIAL BOARD**

Abdullah Emin Akay (D) Bursa Technical University, Faculty of Forestry, Bursa, Turkey

Ünal Akkemik (D) İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forest Botany Department, İstanbul, Turkey Turkey

M. Hakkı Alma Rector, Iğdır University, Iğdır, Turkey

Kazuhiro Aruga Utsunomiya University, Faculty of Agriculture, Department of Forest Science, Japan

#### Nadir Ayrılmış D

Department of Wood Mechanics and Technology, İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

**Kevin Boston** 

Department of Forest Engineering, Resource Management, Oregon State University, College of Forestry, United States of America

Zeki Candan Department of Forest Products Engineering, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, İstanbul, Turkey

Ignacio J. Diaz-Maroto Hidalgo iD University of Santiago de Compotela, Spain

#### Jürgen Huss

Albert- Ludwigs- Üniversität, Waldbau Institut, Standort und Vegetationkunde, Freiburg, Deutschland, Germany

#### Raphael Thomas Klumpp

University of Natural Resources and Life Sciences (BOKU), Department of Forest- and Soil Sciences, Institute of Silviculture, Vienna, Austria

Ignacio J. Diaz-Maroto Hidalgo University of Santiago de Compotela, Spain

S. Nami Kartal İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Lee Woo-Kyun Division of Environmental Science and Ecological Engineering, College of Life and Environmental Sciences, Korea University in Seoul, Republic of Korea

Ender Makineci İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Marc Palahi European Forest Institute, Spain

Neil Pederson (D) Harvard Forest, Harvard University, United States of America

**Tibor Pentek** University of Zagreb, Faculty of Forestry, Croatia

Yowhan Son Division of Environmental Science and Ecological Engineering, Korea University, Republic of Korea

#### Yafang Yin

Chinese Academy of Forestry, Research Institute of Wood Industry, Deputy of IUFRO Unit 5.06.00 Properties and utilization of plantation wood, Beijing, China

Tetsuhiko Yoshimura

Shimane University Faculty of Life and Environmental Science, Japan



İbrahim KARA

Publication Director Ali ŞAHİN

Editorial Development Gizem KAYAN

Finance and Administration Zeynep YAKIŞIRER ÜREN

Deputy Publication Director Gökhan ÇİMEN

Publication Coordinators Betül ÇİMEN Özlem ÇAKMAK Okan AYDOĞAN İrem DELİÇAY Arzu YILDIRIM Project Coordinators Sinem KOZ Doğan ORUÇ

Graphics Department Ünal ÖZER Deniz DURAN Beyzanur KARABULUT Contact Address: Büyükdere Cad. No: 105/9 34394 Mecidiyeköy, Şişli, İstanbul Phone: +90 212 217 17 00 Fax: +90 212 217 22 92 E-mail: info@avesyayincilik.com



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

#### EDITORIAL STAFF

Mustafa Akgül 🕞 İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Selim Bayraktar b İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Süleyman Çoban (b) İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

#### LANGUAGE EDITORS (ENGLISH)

Hamit Ayberk İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Dorian Gordon Bates Istanbul University, İstanbul, Turkey

Seda Erdinler İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

#### STATISTICAL EDITORS

**Emrah Özdemir** İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey Hüseyin Tuncay Güner D İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Fatma Diğdem Tuncer ib İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Hüseyin Yurtseven D İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Alan James Newson İstanbul University, İstanbul, Turkey

Alper Gün Özturna İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey

Ersel Yılmaz

İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, Turkey



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

### AIMS AND SCOPE

Forestist is an international, scientific, open access periodical published in accordance with independent, unbiased, and double-blinded peer-review principles. The journal is the official publication of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry and continues publication since 1951. Forestist is published biannually on January and July and the publication language of the journal is English.

Forestist aims to contribute to the literature by publishing manuscripts at the highest scientific level on all fields of forestry. The journal publishes original articles, reviews, and brief notes that are prepared in accordance with the ethical guidelines.

The scope of the journal includes but not limited to; forest, forestry, forestry based industries, landscape and environment.

The target audience of the journal includes specialists and professionals working and interested in all disciplines of forestry.

The editorial and publication processes of the journal are shaped in accordance with the guidelines of the International Committee of Medical Journal Editors (ICMJE), World Association of Medical Editors (WAME), Council of Science Editors (CSE), Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), European Association of Science Editors (EASE), and National Information Standards Organization (NISO). The journal is in conformity with the Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing (doaj.org/bestpractice).

Forestist is currently indexed in Web of Science-Emerging Sources Citation Index, DOAJ, TUBITAK ULAKBIM TR Index, Gale, EBSCO Abstracts, CAB Direct, CABI Forestry Abstracts, CABI Forest Products Abstracts, CABI Environmental Science Database, CABI Horticultural Science Database, CABI Soil Science Database, CABI Soils and Fertilizers Abstracts, CABI Plant Genetics and Breeding Database, CABI Plant Genetic and Resources Abstracts, CABI Plant Protection Database, CABI Review of Agricultural Entomology.

All expenses of the journal are covered by the İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry. Processing and publication are free of charge with the journal. No fees are requested from the authors at any point throughout the evaluation and publication process. All manuscripts must be submitted via the online submission system, which is available at http://forestist.istanbul.edu.tr. The journal guidelines, technical information, and the required forms are available on the journal's web page.

Statements or opinions expressed in the manuscripts published in the journal reflect the views of the author(s) and not the opinions of the İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry, editors, editorial board, and/or publisher; the editors, editorial board, and publisher disclaim any responsibility or liability for such materials.

Forestist is an open access publication and the journal's publication model is based on Budapest Open Access Initiative (BOAI) declaration. Journal's archive is available online, free of charge at http://forestist.istanbul.edu.tr. Forestist's content is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License.



Editor in Chief: Murat DEMİR Address: İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry, Valide Sultan Cad. No:1, 34473 Bahçeköy, Sarıyer, İstanbul, Turkey Phone: +90 (212) 338 24 00 / 25289 E-mail: forestist@istanbul.edu.tr

Publisher: AVES Address: Büyükdere Cad., 105/9 34394 Mecidiyeköy, Şişli, İstanbul, Turkey Phone: +90 212 217 17 00 Fax: +90 212 217 22 92 E-mail: info@avesyayincilik.com Web page: www.avesyayincilik.com



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

### **INSTRUCTIONS TO AUTHORS**

Forestist is an international, scientific, open access periodical published in accordance with independent, unbiased, and double-blinded peer-review principles. The journal is the official publication of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry and continues publication since 1951. Forestist is published biannually on January and July and the publication language of the journal is English.

Forestist aims to contribute to the literature by publishing manuscripts at the highest scientific level on all fields of forestry. The journal publishes original articles, reviews, and brief notes that are prepared in accordance with the ethical guidelines.

The scope of the journal includes but not limited to; forest, forestry, forestry based industries, landscape and environment.

The target audience of the journal includes specialists and professionals working and interested in all disciplines of forestry.

The editorial and publication processes of the journal are shaped in accordance with the guidelines of) the Council of Science Editors (CSE), the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), the European Association of Science Editors (EASE), and National Information Standards Organization (NISO). The journal conforms to the Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing (https://doaj.org/bestpractice).

Originality, high scientific quality, and citation potential are the most important criteria for a manuscript to be accepted for publication. Manuscripts submitted for evaluation should not have been previously presented or already published in an electronic or printed medium. The journal should be informed of manuscripts that have been submitted to another journal for evaluation and rejected for publication. The submission of previous reviewer reports will expedite the evaluation process. Manuscripts that have been presented in a meeting should be submitted with detailed information on the organization, including the name, date, and location of the organization.

Manuscripts submitted to Forestist will go through a double-blind peer-review process. Each submission will be reviewed by at least two external, independent peer reviewers who are experts in their fields in order to ensure an unbiased evaluation process. The editorial board will invite an external and independent editor to manage the evaluation processes of manuscripts submitted by editors or by the editorial board members of the journal. The Editor in Chief is the final authority in the decision-making process for all submissions.

The authors are expected to submit researches that comply with the general ethical principles which include; scientific integrity, objectivity, collegiality, data integrity, institutional integrity and social responsibility.

#### Authorship

Being an author of a scientific article mainly indicates a person who has a significant contribution to the article and shares the responsibility and accountability of that article. To be defined as an author of a scientific article, researchers should fulfill below criteria:

- Making a significant contribution to the work in all or some of the following phases: Research conception or design, acquisition of data, analysis and interpretation.
- Drafting, writing or revising the manuscript
- Agreeing on the final version of the manuscript and the journal which it will be submitted
- Taking responsibility and accountability of the content of the article

Outside the above mentioned authorship criteria, any other form of specific contribution should be stated in the Acknowledgement section. In addition to being accountable for the parts of the work he/she has done, an author should be able to identify which co-authors are responsible for specific other parts of the work. In addition, authors should have confidence in the integrity of the contributions of their co-authors.

If an article is written by more than one person, one of the co-authors should be chosen as the corresponding author for handling all the correspondences regarding the article. Before submission, all authors should agree on the order of the authors and provide their current affiliations and contact details. Corresponding author is responsible for ensuring the correctness of these information.

Forestist requires corresponding authors to submit a signed and scanned version of the authorship contribution form (available for download through http://forestist.istanbul. edu.tr) during the initial submission process in order to act appropriately on authorship rights and to prevent ghost or honorary authorship. If the editorial board suspects a case of "gift authorship," the submission will be rejected without further review. As part of the submission of the manuscript, the corresponding author should also send a short statement declaring that he/she accepts to undertake all the responsibility for authorship during the submission and review stages of the manuscript.

Forestist requires and encourages the authors and the individuals involved in the evaluation process of submitted manuscripts to disclose any existing or potential conflicts of interests, including financial, consultant, and institutional, that might lead to potential bias or a conflict of interest. Any financial grants or other support received for a submitted study from individuals or institutions should be disclosed to the Editorial Board. Cases of a potential conflict of interest of the editors, authors, or reviewers are resolved by the journal's Editorial Board within the scope of guidelines.



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

#### Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

The Editorial Board of the journal handles all appeal and complaint cases within the scope of COPE guidelines. In such cases, authors should get in direct contact with the editorial office regarding their appeals and complaints. When needed, an ombudsperson may be assigned to resolve cases that cannot be resolved internally. The Editor in Chief is the final authority in the decision-making process for all appeals and complaints.

Forestist requires each submission to be accompanied by a Copyright License Agreement (available for download at http://forestist.istanbul.edu.tr). When using previously published content, including figures, tables, or any other material in both print and electronic formats, authors must obtain permission from the copyright holder. Legal, financial and criminal liabilities in this regard belong to the author(s). By signing the Copyright License Agreement, authors agree that the article, if accepted for publication by the Forestist, will be licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Non Commercial-NoDerivatives 4.0 International License (CC BY-NC-ND).

Statements or opinions expressed in the manuscripts published in Forestist reflect the views of the author(s) and not the opinions of the editors, the editorial board, or the publisher; the editors, the editorial board, and the publisher disclaim any responsibility or liability for such materials. The final responsibility in regard to the published content rests with the authors.

#### MANUSCRIPT PREPARATION

Manuscripts can only be submitted through the journal's online manuscript submission and evaluation system, available at http://forestist.istanbul. edu.tr. Manuscripts submitted via any other medium will not be evaluated.

Manuscripts submitted to the journal will first go through a technical evaluation process where the editorial office staff will ensure that the manuscript has been prepared and submitted in accordance with the journal's guidelines. Submissions that do not conform to the journal's guidelines will be returned to the submitting author with technical correction requests.

Authors are required to submit the following:

- Copyright Transfer Form,
- Author Contributions Form, and

during the initial submission.

These forms are available for download at http://forestist.istanbul.edu.tr

#### Preparation of the Manuscript

**Title page:** A separate title page should be submitted with all submissions and this page should include:

- The full title of the manuscript as well as a short title (running head) of no more than 50 characters,
- Name(s), affiliations, highest academic degree(s), and ORCID ID(s) of the author(s),
- Grant information and detailed information on the other sources of support,
- Name, address, telephone (including the mobile phone number) and fax numbers, and email address of the corresponding author,
- Acknowledgment of the individuals who contributed to the preparation of the manuscript but who do not fulfil the authorship criteria.

**Abstract:** An English abstract should be submitted with all submissions. Submitting a Turkish abstract is not compulsory for international authors. Abstract section of all types of articles should be unstructured. Please check Table 1 below for word count specifications.

The style of abstract must be concise and must not contain references. The abstract should be prepared to summarize the following parts in an unstructured way:

 Aim of study: Set the goal or directly the specific objectives and, describe the relevance of the study;

- Study area: Specify the geographic area in which the study has been made;
- Material and methods: Describe briefly materials and methods, crops or organisms involved must be identified, as well as soil type, chemicals, or other details which can be important for the interpretation of the results;
- Main results: List and discuss relevant results (including numeric values of experimental results);
- Research highlights: One or two closing sentences with most relevant findings and implications.

**Keywords:** Each submission must be accompanied by a minimum of four to a maximum of six keywords for subject indexing. The keywords should be listed in full without abbreviations. Keywords should be written both in English at the end of the related abstract. The authors should not use the same words as the manuscript title.

#### Manuscript Types

**Research Articles:** This is the most important type of article since it provides new information based on original research. The main text of original articles should be structured with Introduction, Materials and Methods, Results and Discussion, and Conclusion subheadings. Please check Table 1 for the limitations for Research Articles.

Statistical analysis to support conclusions is usually necessary. Statistical analyses must be conducted in accordance with international statistical reporting standards. Information on statistical analyses should be provided with a separate subheading under the Materials and Methods section and the statistical software that was used during the process must be specified.

Units should be prepared in accordance with the International System of Units (SI).

**Review Articles:** Reviews prepared by authors who have extensive knowledge on a particular field and whose scientific background has been translated into a high volume of publi-



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

#### Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

cations with a high citation potential are welcomed. These authors may even be invited by the journal. Reviews should describe, discuss, and evaluate the current level of knowledge of a topic in the field and should guide future studies. The main text of review articles should be begun with an Introduction section and finalized with a Conclusion section. The remaining parts can be named relevantly to the essence of the research. Please check Table 1 for the limitations for Review Articles.

Short Note: This type of manuscript present significant findings from tangential investigations that are offshoots from larger studies or from early results that will have to be confirmed through further study. The main text should be structured with Introduction, Materials and Methods, Results and Discussion, and Conclusion subheadings. Please check Table 1 for the limitations for Short Note.

Tables: Tables should be included in the main document, presented after the reference list, and they should be numbered consecutively in the order they are referred to within the main text. A descriptive title must be placed above the tables. Abbreviations used in the tables should be defined below the tables by footnotes (even if they are defined within the main text). Tables should be created using the "insert table" command of the word processing software and they should be arranged clearly to provide easy reading. Data presented in the tables should not be a repetition of the data presented within the main text but should be supporting the main text.

Figures and Figure Legends: Figures, graphics, and photographs should be submitted as separate files (in TIFF or JPEG format) through the submission system. The files should not be embedded in a Word document or the main document. When there are figure subunits, the subunits should not be merged to form a single image. Each subunit should be submitted separately through the submission system. Images should not be labeled (a, b, c, etc.) to indicate figure subunits. Thick and thin arrows, arrowheads, stars, asterisks, and similar marks can be used on the images to support figure legends. Like the rest of the submission, the figures too should be blind. Any information within the images that may indicate an individual or institution should be blinded. The minimum resolution of each submitted figure should be 300 DPI. To prevent delays in the evaluation process, all submitted figures should be clear in resolution and large in size (minimum dimensions:  $100 \times 100$  mm). Figure legends should be listed at the end of the main document.

All acronyms and abbreviations used in the manuscript should be defined at first use, both in the abstract and in the main text. The abbreviation should be provided in parentheses following the definition.

Scientific plant and animal names should be written in italics in the main text.

When a product, hardware, or software program is mentioned within the main text, product information, including the name of the product, the producer of the product, and city and the country of the company (including the state if in USA), should be provided in parentheses in the following format: "EC meter (Orion Star A212, Thermo Scientific, MA, USA)

All references, tables, and figures should be referred to within the main text, and they should be numbered consecutively in the order they are referred to within the main text. Limitations, drawbacks, and the shortcomings of original articles should be mentioned in the Discussion section before the conclusion paragraph.

**References:** While citing publications, preference should be given to the latest, most up-to-date publications. If an ahead-of-print publication is cited, the DOI number should be provided. Authors are responsible for the accuracy of references. In the main text of the manuscript, references should be cited by author's name and the publication year in parenthesis. When there are more than two authors, the first author should be listed followed by "et al." Please see below for examples:

For single authored reference: (Clausen, 1992)

For double authored reference: (Kelso and Smith, 1998)

**Reference with multiple authors:** (Medvec et al., 1999)

For multiple references, in order of year: (Lebow, 2000; Imamura, 2001; Cooper and Taylor, 2005)

For references with the same author and year: (Hill, 2000a; Hill, 2000b)

**Reference List:** The list of references should only include works that are cited in the text and that have been published or accepted for publication. Personal communications and unpublished works should only be mentioned in the text. Do not use footnotes or endnotes as a substitute for a reference list. The references must be listed alphabetically according to the last name of the author. The names of the journals should be written in italics and volume numbers should be provided. Journal titles should not be abbreviated.

Table 1. Limitations for each manuscript type

Type of manuscript	Word limit	Abstract word limit	Reference limit	Table limit	Figure limit
Research Article	8000	250	40	8	7 or total of 15 images
Review Article	8000	250	60	8	10 or total of 20 images
Short Note	4000	200	20	8	10 or total of 20 images



Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

#### Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

The reference styles for different types of publications are presented in the following examples:

Journal Article: Heede, B.H., 1991. Response of a stream in disequilibrium to timber harvest. *Environmental Management* 15 (2): 251-255.

**Books with a Single Author:** Birkeland, P. W., 1984. Soils and Geomorphology. Oxford University Pres, New York.

Editor(s) as Author: Brilon, W. (Ed.), 1988. Intersections Without Traffic Signals, Proceedings of an International Workshop. Springer-Verlag, Berlin.

**Book Section:** Fischer, G.W., Nagin, D., 1981. Random versus coefficient quantal choice models. In: Manski, C.F., McFadden, D. (Eds.), Structural Analysis of Discrete Data with Econometric Applications, MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, pp. 273-304.

Symposium, Conference and Workshop Papers: Dahlgren, R. A., 1988. Effects of forest harvest on stream-water quality and nitrogen cycling in the Casper creek watershed. In: Proceedings of The Conference on Coastal Watersheds: The Casper Creek Story. May 6, Ukiah, California.

Daganzo, C., 1996. Two paradoxes of traffic flow on networks with physical queues. II.Sym-

posium Ingenieria de los Transportes, Madrid, 22-24 May 1996, pp. 55-62.

Online Document (Web) Reference: FAO. 2006. Rural radio transmissions and rural youth in Mali. http://www.fao.org/sd/dim\_kn1/kn1\_060202\_en.htm (Accessed: 27 February 2006).

Article by DOI: Asakawa, S., Yoshida, K., Yabe, K., 2004. Perceptions of urban stream corridors within the greenway system of Sapporo, Japan. *Landscape and Urban Planning*, in press doi:10.1016/S0169-2046(03)00158-0.

**Thesis:** Güner, H.T., 2016. The Miocene flores and vegetation of the Yatağan Basin, Western Anatolia. Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, İstanbul University, Institute of Sciences, p. 185., İstanbul, Turkey.

#### REVISIONS

When submitting a revised version of a paper, the author must submit a detailed "Response to the reviewers" that states point by point how each issue raised by the reviewers has been covered and where it can be found (each reviewer's comment, followed by the author's reply and line numbers where the changes have been made) as well as an annotated copy of the main document. Revised manuscripts must be submitted within 30 days from the date of the decision letter. If the revised version of the manuscript is not submitted within the allocated time, the revision option may be cancelled. If the submitting author(s) believe that additional time is required, they should request this extension before the initial 30-day period is over.

Accepted manuscripts are copy-edited for grammar, punctuation, and format. Once the publication process of a manuscript is completed, it is published online on the journal's webpage as first online publication before it is included in its scheduled issue. A PDF proof of the accepted manuscript is sent to the corresponding author and their publication approval is requested within 2 days of their receipt of the proof.

#### Editor in Chief: Murat DEMİR

Address: İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry, Valide Sultan Cad. No:1, 34473 Bahçeköy, Sarıyer, İstanbul, Turkey Phone: +90 (212) 338 24 00 / 25289 E-mail: forestist@istanbul.edu.tr

#### Publisher: AVES

Address: Büyükdere Cad. 105/9 34394 Mecidiyeköy, Şişli, İstanbul, Turkey Phone: +90 212 217 17 00 Fax: +90 212 217 22 92 E-mail: info@avesyayincilik.com www.avesyayincilik.com





Official Journal of İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Forestry

Formerly Journal of the Faculty of Forestry İstanbul University

### CONTENTS

#### **ORIGINAL ARTICLES**

1	Distribution, biology, morphology and damage of <i>Cinara cedri</i> mimeur, 1936 (Hemiptera: Aphididae) in the Isparta Regional Forest Directorate Şükran Oğuzoğlu, Mustafa Avcı
11	Development planning approach for children with orthopaedic disabilities; example of Eymir Lake (Ankara) Sima Pouya, Öner Demirel
22	Geology and woods of a new fossil forest from the early Miocene of Gökçeada (Turkey) Yıldırım Güngör, Ünal Akkemik, Cem Kasapçı, Ece Başaran
35	Physical and social barriers for disabled urban park users: case study from Kastamonu, Turkey Nur Belkayalı, Yavuz Güloğlu
44	<b>Visual assessment of rural landscape with different characters</b> Esra Özhancı, Hasan Yılmaz
61	Estimating diameter at breast height (DBH) from diameter at stump height (DST) in triple mixed stands in the region of Artvin in Turkey Abdurrahman Şahin, Aydın Kahriman, Aşkın Göktürk
68	Physical and mechanical properties of wood impregnated with quebracho and boron compounds Muhammed Said Fidan, Hakan Adanur

### Distribution, biology, morphology and damage of *Cinara cedri* Mimeur, 1936 (Hemiptera: Aphididae) in the Isparta Regional Forest Directorate

## Isparta Orman Bölge Müdürlüğü sedir ormanlarında *Cinara cedri* Mimeur, 1936 (Hemiptera: Aphididae)'nin yayılışı, morfolojisi, biyolojisi ve zararı

Şükran Oğuzoğlu 🕩, Mustafa Avcı 🕩

Department of Forest Engineering, Süleyman Demirel University, Faculty of Forestry, Isparta, Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

In 2015-2016, a study was performed examining the distribution, colony dispersion in tree canopies, occurrence rate in shoots at different ages, morphology, and the damage of the cedar aphid (Cinara cedri Mimeur 1936) (Hemiptera: Aphididae) This study was completed alongside biological observations in the Isparta Regional Forest Directorate. This study was conducted across 46 sites at an elevation of 820-1738 meter (m) and the distribution of this species was determined by a survey. Compared to other sites, the Cinara cedri (C. cedri) population was found to be higher in 10 sites with young stands with an average height of 1000-1200 m. These sites were established through plantation. Colonies were typically observed on the shoots from the previous year and on branch axils. They were found to feed on shoot tips and trunks of young trees and preferred shoots with a diameter of 1.0-1.5 centimeter (cm) on the southern and eastern aspects of the trees. It was observed that C. cedri mostly fed on shoots of the previous year, which caused the needles to dry and turn red. Damage was observed especially on young trees from which the dried needles fell and defoliation was concentrated particularly on the shoot tips and tops of the trees. It was found that honeydew was secreted by those insects fed with sap, and this secretion then covered the needles, shoots and branches, resulting in fumagine. The populations overwintered as eggs and then nymphs hatched during the first week of April. The adult stage was reached after completing four nymph periods over a time span of between one week and 10 days. These adults then reproduced parthenogenetically, with winged viviparous individuals appearing between May and June, and oviparous emerging in October. The final stage of the cycle was a period of mating and then egg-laying.

Keywords: Cedar aphid, Cinara cedri, damage, Isparta, life cycle

#### Cite this paper as:

Oğuzoğlu, Ş., Avcı, M., 2019. Distribution, biology, morphology and damage of *Cinara cedri* Mimeur, 1936 (Hemiptera: Aphididae) in the Isparta Regional Forest Directorate. *Forestist* 69(1): 1-10.

Corresponding author: Şükran Oğuzoğlu e-mail: sukranoguzoglu@sdu.edu.tr

*Received Date:* 24.10.2017 *Accepted Date:* 23.10.2018



Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attributi NonCommercial 4.0 International

#### ÖΖ

Çalışma, 2015-2016 yıllarında Isparta Orman Bölge Müdürlüğü'nde, sedir yaprak biti (*Cinara cedri* Mimeur 1936) (Hemiptera: Aphididae)'nin yayılışı, türün ağaç tepe tacındaki koloni dağılımı ve farklı yaşlardaki sürgünlerde bulunma oranı, morfolojisi, biyolojisi ile zararı tespit edilmiştir. Çalışma, 820-1738 m arasında yükseltiye sahip 46 alanda gerçekleştirilmiştir. Plantasyon sahaları, genç meşcere ve ortalama 1000 m yükseltide bulunan 10 alanda diğer alanlara göre *C. cedri*'nin popülasyonunun daha fazla olduğu belirlenmiştir. Kolonilerin genellikle bir önceki yıla ait sürgünlerde ve dal koltuğunda bulunduğu, ayrıca sürgün ucu ile genç ağaçların gövdesinde de beslendikleri, ağacın güney ve doğu bakıdaki 1,0-1,5 cm çapındaki sürgünleri tercih ettiği görülmüştür. *C. cedri*'nin çoğunlukla bir önceki yıla ait sürgünlerde beslendiği ve ibrelerin kuruyup kızarmasına yol açtığı gözlenmiştir. Zararın özellikle genç ağaçlarda olduğu, kuruyan ibrelerin döküldüğü ve yapraksızlaşmanın ağacın sürgün uçları ile tepe kısmında olduğu görülmüştür. Zararlının öz suyu ile beslenmesi nedeniyle ballı madde salgıladığı ve ballı maddenin dalların üzerini kapladığı ve fumajin oluşumuna neden olduğu belirlenmiştir. Popülasyonlar kışı yumurta döneminde geçirmiş, Nisan ayının ilk haftasında yumurtadan çıkan kanatsız viviparların yaklaşık bir hafta ile 10 günlük sürede dört nimf dönemini tamamlayarak erginliğe ulaşmışlardır. Mayıs-Haziran aylarında kanatlı viviparların görüldüğü, ekim ayının son haftasında oviparların ortaya çıktığı ve çiftleşerek yumurta bıraktıkları gözlenmiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Cinara cedri, Isparta, sedir yaprak biti, yaşam döngüsü, zarar

#### INTRODUCTION

Taurus cedar (*Cedrus libani* A. Rich.) is one of four cedar species distributed across the world. The Taurus cedar, which is naturally found in Turkey, Lebanon and Syria, is distributed across approximately 482.391 hectares (ha) in Turkey, 2.300 ha in Lebanon and 400 ha in Syria (Aksoy and Özalp, 1990; Aytar et al., 2011; Khuri et al., 2000; OGM, 2015). The Taurus cedar is one of the most commonly used tree species in the plantations of Turkey after the Crimean pine (*Pinus nigra* J. F. Arnold subsp. *pallasiana* (Lamb.) Holmboe) (Boydak, 2014; Yaltırık, 1988).

Cinara cedri was identified in 1936 by J. M. Mimeur in Morocco Cedrus atlantica (Mimeur, 1935). C. cedri is an aphid belonging to the Hemiptera order and Aphididae family and especially chooses cedar species as a host (Binazzi et al., 2015; Lieutier and Ghaioule, 2005; Mimeur, 1935). Due to the quality of cedar wood and its wide use as an ornamental plant, C. cedri is distributed across different areas of the world along with its host. This species was first recorded in Turkey in 1959 in Gaziantep on C. libani (Tuatay and Remaudiere, 1964). This species was found in Ankara, Konya (Center, Akşehir), Burdur (Center, Bucak-Sobya-Kızılgöl, Çeltikçibeli), İstanbul (Dolmabahçe-Bahçeköy-Yıldız), Hatay (Karaağaçlı), Eskişehir, Afyon, Isparta (Şarkikaraağaç-Kızıldağ), Antalya (Center, Elmalı-Çığlıkara, Kaş-Sütleğen-Çereli), Samsun (Bafra), Bartın, Tekirdağ, Adana, Karaman, Niğde, Osmaniye, Mersin, Kahramanmaraş and Kastamonu (Aslan, 2014; Aytar, 2006; Çanakçıoğlu, 1975; Düzgüneş et al., 1980; Görür et al., 2009; Uygun et al., 2000; Ülgentürk et al., 2012, 2013; Ünal and Özcan, 2005).

C. cedri causes damage by sucking the sap from the shoots and leaves of cedar trees which consequently leads to the needles turning red and drying out (Tuatay, 1999). The secreted honeydew sticks to leaves and shoots causing occlusion of the stoma and lenticels. Additionally, the fungus growing on this secretion leads to fumagine, thereby blocking photosynthesis of the tree. Several fly and bee species are also attracted to the honeydew and the trees which are also damaged from disease-related factors associated with these species. Loss of increment is observed on the damaged trees and their seed production yield decreases (Binazzi et al., 2015; Çanakçıoğlu, 1975; Núňez-Perez and Tizado, 1996). Despite its damaging effects, this species provides nutrition for ants, bees and fly species due to its honeydew secretion and is important for the continuation of the ecological balance. It is known that ants that visit aphids on plants increase honeydew secretion, which facilitates the predation of some harmful insects by ants and keeps away the natural enemies of aphids (Ülgentürk et al., 2012).

A semi-arid climate is the influencing environment across 35% of Turkey and most of this area is potential plantation fields. In recent years, the majority of plantation studies have been performed in semi-arid areas. Cedar is a species which is commonly used in semi-arid areas. Therefore, it is very important to protect the existing cedar forests and to identify the species that cause damage to cedar forests whilst undertaking efforts to control these species with a view to establishing healthy forests.

The purpose of this study was to contribute to the control of the species by determining the morphological features of *C. cedri* that damages cedar forests, as well as its distribution, damage and biology.

#### MATERIAL AND METHODS

The study was conducted in the natural and plantation cedar forests of Isparta Regional Forest Directorate in 2015-2016. While collecting samples from shoots where C. cedri was found, the shoot diameter of the colony, distance to shoot tip, and colony width were measured and recorded in the field report along with information regarding coordinates, elevation, aspect, and stand in the areas where C. cedri was found. Furthermore, the egg, nymph and adult stages of C. cedri, in addition to features such as the part of the tree they feed on, whether it causes colour change damage, formation of fumagine, distribution of the colony on the tree canopy, and colony density were investigated and photographed. Both nymphs and adults were cultivated and monitored in laboratory conditions, and information on their biology and morphology was recorded. Adults were placed in Eppendorf tubes with 70% alcohol, prepared as per Martin (1983) and were categorized as per Blackman and Eastop (2012).

The identification key for global aphid species belonging to the genera *Cedrus* is presented below (Blackman and Eastop, 2012).

Key to aphids on Cedrus (Blackman ve Eastop, 2012):

1 Antenna processus terminalis/ basal part of last antennal segment more than 1. siphunculi long and tubular, swollen distally .....Illinoia morrisoni

- Antenna processus terminalis/ basal part of last antennal segment less than 1. siphunculi are broad hairy cones .....2

2 Rostral segment V short, flask-shaped, pointed only at tip, hardly longer than its basal width. siphunculi cones with few hairs, in 1-2 rings around pore .....*Schizolachnus pineti* 

- Rostral segment V acutely pointed, dagger-shaped, usually twice or more as long as its basal width. siphunculi cones large and dark with numerous hairs .....3

3 Antenna 5-segmented. Dorsal hairs of aptera club-shaped, ornamented with numerous barbules .....*Cinara laportei* 

- Antenna 6-segmented. Dorsal hairs normal, pointed .....4

4 Hairs on body and appendages short; those on antenna III maximally about as long as basal diameter of segment .....*Cinara curvipes* - Hairs mostly long; longest hairs on antenna III maximally more than 2 × basal diameter of segment .....5

5 Body lenght 3.0 mm or less. Dorsal length of hind tarsus I distinctly longer basal width .....6

- Body lenght more than 3.0 mm. Dorsal length of hind tarsus I shorter than basal width .....7

6 Aptera with 0-1 secondary rhinaria on antenna III. antenna IV longer than antenna VI. abdominal tergit 1-6 without any extensive dark sclerotisation *....Cinara cedri* 

- Aptera with c. 5 secondary rhinaria on antenna III, antenna IV shorter than antenna VI, and abdominal tergit 1-6 with an extensive pattern of dark sclerotisation .....*Cinara deodarae* 

7 Aptera with hind tarsus II less than  $4 \times$  hind tarsus I. antenna III with more than 40 long hairs, very few of these less than  $2 \times$  basal diameter of segment. Body length 3.8-7.8 milimeter (mm) .....*Cinara confinis* 

- Aptera with hind tarsus II 4 or more × hind tarsus I. antenna III with less than 30 hairs of very variable length, often less than 2 × basal diameter of segment. Body length c.3.3 mm .....*Cinara indica* 

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### Hosts of Cinara cedri

*C. cedri* was observed on *C. libani* in the study field. However, according to the literature, it was also observed on *C. atlantica*, *C. deodora*, *C. brevifolia*, *Thuja* sp., *Pinus* sp., *P. brutia* (Binazzi et al., 2015; Görür et al., 2009; Lieutier and Ghaioule, 2005; Ülgentürk et al., 2013; Ünal and Özcan, 2005).

#### Distribution of *Cinara cedri* in the forests in the study field and effects of different field and stand characteristics on the distribution of *Cinara cedri*

As a result of the survey conducted to determine the distribution of *C. cedri* in Isparta Regional Forest Directorate's natural and plantation forests, the presence of the species was noted in 46 fields where the studies were conducted (Figure 1).

When the stand structure of the study sites was investigated, it was observed that 26 sites contained a cedar-Crimean pine mixed stand, 18 sites had a pure cedar stand, one site had a fir-cedar stand, and one site contained a cedar-Kasnak oak stand. Nine sites were found to be natural and 37 sites were identified as plantation forests. When the sites were assessed in terms of stand age, it was observed that 33 sites had young stands, 11 sites had mixed stands and two sites had old stands. The four areas (Isparta-center, SDU campus, Gökçay Park and



Figure 1. Locations of *Cinara cedri* detected in Isparta Forest Regional Directorate

Ayazmana Park) are close to the settlement area, therefore stand properties of these areas were not given (Table 1). In review of literature, no information was found regarding stand characteristics or aspects of the sites where *C. cedri* was found. Çanakçıoğlu and Mol (1998) and Usta and Keskin (1992) stated that when the population of *C. cedri* became dense, they preferred young seedlings in particular. It was found that *C. cedri* was intensely distributed (particularly across young stands established in plantations) in the study sites Bucak, Atabey, Gönen, Keçiborlu, Yukarıgökdere-Beşkuyu, Uluborlu, Isparta-center, SDU campus, Eğirdir-center, Gökçay Park and Yalvaç City Forest. The species distribution was found between elevations of 820 m (Bucak) and 1738 meter (m). Regarding dense populations, observations were recorded at elevations between 1000-1200 m.

Serttaş et al. (2012) stated that *C. cedri* was found in the Antalya-Çığlıkara Nature Protection Area at an average elevation of 1830 m. Çanakçıoğlu (1975) had reported *C. Cedri* in the same place at an elevation of 1000-1750 m, in Ankara Atatürk Forest Farm at 900 m, in İstanbul Bahçeköy at 110 m, in Antalya-Kaş-Çerçeli at 1710 m, in Burdur at 925 m, in Eskişehir at 790 m and in Afyon at 1020 m. Tosun (1975) reported the occurrence of *C. cedri* in the garden of Antalya Regional Forest Directorate at 40 m, in the Isparta-Şarkikaraağaç-Kızıldağ cedar forest at 1300 m, Burdur-Bucak-Sobya Kızılgöl forest at 1600 m, in Burdur-Çeltikçibeli region at 950 m. The elevations at which *C. cedri* presence was identified in this study were similar to those reported in the literature.

#### Morphology

#### Egg

In the study, it was observed that when the *C. cedri* eggs were first laid at the end of October and November, they were light brown in colour and subsequently turned a dark glossy brown. It was found that eggs were laid generally on the needles at the tip of shoots, with a few of them on the needles of the shoots from the previous year, forming either a single line or two lines (Figure 2). It was noted that similar conclusions which were given in the study of Çanakçıoğlu (1975). Çanakçıoğlu and Mol (1998) and Usta and Keskin (1992) stated that eggs were dark brown and glossy, 0.7-1.0 mm in length and 0.2-0.3 mm in width. According to the measurements recorded in this study, eggs were 0.43 mm in width and 1.17 mm in length - greater than those values reported in the literature.

#### Nymph

It was observed that the dark coloured stripes on the thorax and abdomen area appearing towards the 4<sup>th</sup> nymph stage became clearer and the head area of those individuals that were a light bronze grey brown during the 1<sup>st</sup> nymph stage turned from dark brown to light brown. Moreover, it was found that during the 1<sup>st</sup> nymph stage, the thorax and abdomen were thin and long, yet towards the 4<sup>th</sup> nymph stage they were enlarged. It was observed that the density of the waxy layer varied amongst

#### Table 1. Characteristics of the land and stand of 46 Cinara cedri detected localities in study area

Isparta-Genter      1043      Plain      3/46/43/N-30/32/47      Plantaton      -        Isparta-SDD Campun      1019      East      27/44/PN-30/32/07F      Plantaton      -        Isparta-SDQ Campun      1019      East      27/44/PN-30/32/07F      Plantaton      Sa        Isparta-Sdq AkITomb      B38      West      37/2146/N-30/32/07F      Plantaton      Sc2        Isparta-Sdq AkITomb      B38      West      37/2146/N-30/32/07F      Plantaton      Sc2        Isparta-Sdq AkITomb      B38      West      37/2146/N-30/32/07F      Plantaton      Sc2        Isparta-Sdq AkITomb      B31      West      37/2147/N-30/32/07F      Plantaton      Sa        Isparta-Gobaix Village      D104      D104      Plantaton      Sa      Sa      Sa        Isparta-Gobaix Village      D167      North      37/247/N-10/03/247F      Plantaton      Sa        Isparta-Gobaix Village      D166      Northwest      37/4479/N-30/4704F      Nature      Scd2        Isparta-Gobaix Village      D176      West      37/4479/N-30/3704F      Plantaton      C Scd2	No	Locality	Altitude (m)	Aspect	Coordinate	Nature/Plantation	Stand property*
3Bucak-Karapinar Village820Southwest872146/N-3072207EPlantationSa4Isparta-Saj Aşk/Tomb838West372146/N-3073926EPlantationSc25Edindr-Barla1182East37550/N-3074/149EPlantationSc46Dinar-Tekin Village874Plain37550/N-30709724EPlantationSa7Bagmaky-Sanköy1024Plain375440/N-30709724EPlantationSa9Koçborlu1067North375457/N-3071728EPlantationSa10Celendost951Plain807717/N-307054EPlantationSa11Eginir-Center976Northwest375247/N-3074728EPlantationSa12Isparta-Goneyce880West374497N-3074704ENatureScd113Vukangskdere-Beşkuyu1738South374497N-3074257ENatureScd214Isparta-Goneyce880West374497N-3073257ENatureScla15Isparta-Hisartepe1485Northwest374437N-30731562FPlantationScla16kaku-Sakaafyar113South374437N-30731562FPlantationScla17Vinagradefili1415Southwest374437N-30731572FPlantationScla18Aksu1336Northwest37437N-3073724FPlantationScla19Vinagradefili1415Southwest37437N-3073724FPlantationScla10 </td <td>1</td> <td>Isparta-Center</td> <td>1043</td> <td>Plain</td> <td>37°46'43''N-30°32'49"E</td> <td>Plantation</td> <td>-</td>	1	Isparta-Center	1043	Plain	37°46'43''N-30°32'49"E	Plantation	-
i      bit bit bit bit bit bit bit bit bit bit	2	Isparta-SDÜ Campus	1019	East	37°49'49''N-30°32'05''E	Plantation	-
SEgidir.Barla1182Fast375SQFN.30'4494'SPlantationSQA6Dinar-Takin Village874Plain38'03QFN'30'0907'EPlantationSa07Bagmake/Sanköy1024Plain37'54'07'N'30'052'4'EPlantationSc18Dinar-Dikki93'1West37'64'07'N'30'052'4'EPlantationSa09Kegborlu1067North37'54'57'N'30'1728'EPlantationSa010Gelendost95'1Plin37'52'7'N'30'973'EPlantationSa011Egirdir-Center976Northwest37'42'47'N'30'474'FNatureScd112Ispatra-Gobanis Village17'16West37'43'47'N'30'474'FNatureScd213Ispatra-Gokay Park1738South37'43'47'N'30'474'FNatureScd214Ispatra-Gokay Park1733Northwest37'43'57'N'30'31'56'EPlantation-15Ispatra-Gokay Park1133South37'43'57'N'30'31'16'EPlantationScd316Isbatra-Gikay Park123South37'43'57'N'30'31'16'EPlantationScd317Yenigarbademli141'SSouth37'43'57'N'30'31'16'EPlantationScd318Aksu123Northwest37'43'57'N'30'31'14'EPlantationScd419Aksu'Akadafar126South37'55'S'N'30'31'14'EPlantationScd310Aksu'Akadafar125Sat37'55'S'N'30'31'14'E	3	Bucak-Karapınar Village	820	Southwest	37°21'46''N-30°22'00''E	Plantation	Sa
Dirar-Tekin Village      B74      Plain      BF03 OFN-300907E      Plantation      Sol        7      Bagmakgi-Sanköy      1024      Plain      3754407N-3009524E      Plantation      Sci        8      Dinar-Dikki      931      West      3800407N-307122FE      Plantation      Sa        9      Keyiborlu      1067      North      3755747N-307122FE      Plantation      Sa        10      Gelendost      951      Plain      3870247N-30493FE      Plantation      Sa        11      Egidin-Center      96      Northwest      375242N-30493FE      Nature      Sod        12      kaparta-Gobania Willage      1716      West      374495N-304925FE      Nature      Scd        13      Vukangökdere-Beskuyu      1738      South      374495N-303245FE      Plantation      C/Sa        14      Isparta-Gobania Willage      1153      Plain      374435N-303215FE      Plantation      Scd        15      kaparta-Hisartepe      1485      Northwest      374435N-303714FE      Plantation      Sci        16      kayarbakafgar	4	lsparta-Sağ Âşık Tomb	838	West	37°21'46''N-30°39'26"E	Plantation	Sc2
n      n      n      n      n      n      n      n      n      n        8      Dinar-Dikki      931      West      38'00'40'N-30'11'32'E      Plantation      Sa        9      Keyborlu      1067      North      37'54'57'N-30'17'28'E      Plantation      Sa        10      Gelendost      951      Plain      88'0'17'N-31'00'54'E      Plantation      Sa        11      Égirdir-Center      976      Northwest      37'52'2'N-30'49'30'E      Plantation      Sa        12      Sparta-Gioneyce      880      South      37'44'49'N-30'47'2'E      Nature      Scd2        13      Vakangokder-Begkuyu      1738      South      37'44'9'N-30'3'2'E'      Plantation      CkSab2        15      kparta-Gineyce      880      West      37'44'3'N-30'3'2'E'      Plantation      Scd30        16      kparta-Kaideypa Park      1153      Plain      37'44'3'N-30'3'2'E''      Plantation      Scd30        17      Venijarbademli      1415      Southwest      37'44'3'N-30'3'1'2'E''      Plantation      Scd30 <tr< td=""><td>5</td><td>Eğirdir-Barla</td><td>1182</td><td>East</td><td>37°55'04''N-30°44'49''E</td><td>Plantation</td><td>SÇka</td></tr<>	5	Eğirdir-Barla	1182	East	37°55'04''N-30°44'49''E	Plantation	SÇka
Dirar-Dikci      931      West      88'00'40''N-30'11'32''E      Plantation      Sa        9      Keçiborlu      1067      North      37'54'5''N-30'17'28''E      Plantation      Sa        10      Gelendost      951      Plain      38'07'17''N-31'00'34''E      Plantation      Sa0-2        11      Égidir-Center      976      Northwest      37'52'24''N-30'49'30''E      Plantation      Sa0        12      Isparta-Cobanisa Village      1716      West      37'44'4''N-30'49'25''E      Nature      Scd1        13      Vikangökdere-Begkuyu      1733      South      37'44'4''N-30'49'25''E      Plantation      CkSab2        14      Isparta-Gineyce      830      West      37'44'3''N-30'3'150''E      Plantation      CkSab2        15      Isparta-Gineyce      1485      Northwest      37'44'3''N-30'3'150''E      Plantation      CkSab2        16      Isparta-Hisartepe      1485      Northwest      37'44'3''N-30'3'1'20''E      Plantation      CkSa        17      Venijarbademli      1415      South      37'44'3''N-30'3'1'20''E'      Plantation      CkSa	6	Dinar-Tekin Village	874	Plain	38°03'04''N-30°09'07''E	Plantation	Sa0
9Keçiborlu1067North3754'57'N-30'1728''PlantationSa10Gelendost951Plain38'0'11'N-31'00'54'EPlantationSa0-211Ejirdir-Center976Northwest37'52'24'N-30'49'36'EPlantationSa012Isparta-Çobanisa'lılage1716West37'47'49'N-30'47'A'ENatureScd113Vukangökdere-Beşkuyu1786South37'44'9'N-30'42'ENatureScd214Isparta-Gökçay Pak1830West37'44'9'N-30'31'SCPlantationCkSa215Isparta-Hisartepe1465Southwest37'44'3'N-30'31'SCPlantationCkSa216Isparta-Hisartepe1465Southwest37'43'S'N-30'13'SCPlantationCkSa317Yenişarbademli1415Southwest37'43'S'N-31'12'D'EPlantationCkSa318Aku-Yakafşar125Northeast37'43'S'N-30'13'D'EPlantationCkSa319Aku-Yakafşar125Northeast37'55'S'N-30'31'A'EPlantationScda421Atabey1041South37'55'S'N-30'31'A'EPlantationScda223Keçiborh-Ceather1042West37'55'S'N-30'31'A'EPlantationScda224Keçiborh-Ceather1042West37'55'S'N-30'31'A'EPlantationScda225Keçiborh-Ceather Village1337Northeast37'53'S'N-30'13'EPlantationScda226Keçiborh-Ceather Village156	7	Başmakçı-Sarıköy	1024	Plain	37°54'40''N-30°05'24"E	Plantation	Sc1
10Gendost951Plain80°11'1'N-31'00'54"PlantationSa0-2111Egirdir-Center976Northwest27'52'24''N-30'49'36"PlantationSa012Isparta-Çobanisa Village1716West37'4'4''N-30'49'25"NatureScd113Yukangökdere-Beşkuyu1738South37'4'4''N-30'4'82'5"NatureScd214Isparta-Göneyce880West37'4'4''N-30'4'82'5"PlantationÇkSab215Isparta-Göneyce880West37'4'4''N-30'3'45''PlantationÇkSab216Isparta-Hisartepe145Northwest37'4'4''N-30'3'45''PlantationÇkSab17Venişarbademli1415Southwest37'4'3''N-31'120'ETPlantationÇkSa18Aku-Yakafşar125Northwest37'4'3''N-31'120'ETPlantationÇkSa19Aku-Yakafşar125North37'4'3''N-31'14'B''PlantationÇkSa20Aku-Yakafşar126North37'5'5''N-30'3'14''EPlantationÇkSa21Atabey1041South37'5'5''N-30'3'14''EPlantationSal22Gönen1066East37'5'5''N-30'18''EPlantationSal23Keçiborlu-Cosher Village1337Northwest37'0'5''N-30'18''EPlantationSal24Keçiborlu-Cosher Village1507North36'0'5''N-30'18''EPlantationSal25Atmyaja-Kumluafi164South36	8	Dinar-Dikici	931	West	38°00'40''N-30°11'32''E	Plantation	Sa
11Eğirdir-Center976Northwest37'522'N-30'49'36"EPlantationSa012İsparta-Çobanisa Village1716West37'44'N-30'43'25"ENatureScd113Yukangökder-Beşkuyu1738South37'44'N-30'43'25"ENatureScd214İsparta-Gönçoce880West37'44'N-30'43'25"EPlantationÇkSab215İsparta-Hisartepe185Northwest37'44'35'N-30'35'26"PlantationSCka016İsparta-Hisartepe185Northwest37'44'35'N-30'31'56"EPlantationÇkSa17Yenjarbademli1415Southwest37'44'36'N-30'31'121"EPlantationÇkSa18AkuAku1213South37'44'36'N-31'10'21"EPlantationÇkSa19Aksu-Yakaafşar1275Northwest37'64'3'N-31'10'21"EPlantationÇkSa20Aksu-Yaka136North37'55'5'N-30'31'47"EPlantationÇkSa21Atabey104South37'57'5'N-30'13'03"EPlantationSa'14'3'23Keçiborlu-Center104Northwest37'03'1'A'20'17'24"EPlantationSa'14'3'24Keçiborlu-SenirTown102North36'05'0'N-30'46'0'ENatureSclc22'25Keçiborlu-SenirTown102Southeast37'50'1'N-29'24'3'EPlantationSck22'26Ainnya/A-Kumluági104Southeast37'05'1'N-29'42'1'EPlantationSck22'27Isparta-Sen	9	Keçiborlu	1067	North	37°54'57''N-30°17'28''E	Plantation	Sa
11isparta-Çobanisa Village1716West37'47'47'N-30'47'24"NatureScd113Yukangökdere-Beşkuyu1738South37'44'N-30'45'N-30'45'22"NatureScd214Isparta-Gönçoce880West37'44'N-30'45'22"PlantationÇiSab215Isparta-Gönçoce1153Plain37'44'A'N-30'32'24"PlantationÇiSab216Isparta-Hisartepe1485Northwest37'44'35'N-30'31'56"PlantationSçiAo17Yenişarbademli1415Southwest37'44'36'N-31'10'22"PlantationÇiSa'18Aksu1213South37'44'36'N-31'10'22"PlantationÇiSa'19Aksu-Yakaafşar1275Northeast37'44'36'N-31'10'19"PlantationÇiSa'20Aksu-Yaka1326North37'56'5'N-31'14'08"PlantationÇiSa'21Atabey1041South37'64'5'N-30'31'14"PlantationÇiSa'22Gonen1066East37'57'5'N-30'18'03"PlantationSa'23Keçiborlu-Center102Vest37'50'1'N-30'17'4"PlantationSa'24Keçiborlu-SenirTown1026Southeast37'90'1'N-30'17'4"PlantationSa'25Keçiborlu-SenirTown1026Southeast37'90'1'N-30'17'4"PlantationSa'26Senirkent-Kapidağ105'1North36'0'0'N-30'4'N-21'15'1NatureSck22'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'1'	10	Gelendost	951	Plain	38°07'17''N-31°00'54''E	Plantation	Sa0-2
11Vikangokdere-Beskuv1738South37'43'4''N-30'48'25''NatureScd214Isparta-Göneyce880West37'40'45''N-30'45'22''Plantation(Ksb2)15Isparta-Gökçay Park1153Plain37'44'9'N-30'32'5''Plantation-16Isparta-Gökçay Park1153Northwest37'43'35''N-31'150''EPlantationSçka017Yenişarbademli1415Southwest37'43'35''N-31'120'E'ENatureÇkSG18Alsu1213South37'43'35''N-31'120'E'EPlantationÇkSa19Alsu-Yakaafşar1275Northeast37'43'S''N-31'14'0E'EPlantationÇkSa20Aksu-Yaka1326North37'43'S''N-30'14'EPlantationÇkSa21Atbey1041South37'55''N-30'31'4'EPlantationÇkSa22Gönen1086East37'57'S'N-30'14'EPlantationSa23Keçiborlu-Senirowin1026Southeast37'57'N-30'17'E'PlantationSa24Keçiborlu-Senirowin1026Southeast37'91'N'N-30'17'E'PlantationSa25keçiborlu-Senirowillage1507North36'50'19'N-29'41'E'NatureSc26Senirkent-Kapidâ1504Southeast37'09'1'N-39'17'E'PlantationSa27Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37'09'1'N-39'42'E'NatureSc28Altinyaya-Kumluâji1604Southeast3	11	Eğirdir-Center	976	Northwest	37°52'24''N-30°49'36''E	Plantation	Sa0
Instra-Güneyce      880      West      37'40'45''N-30'45'22'E      Plantation      ÇkSab2        15      İsparta-Gökçay Park      1153      Plain      37'44'49'N-30'32'45'E      Plantation      -        16      İsparta-Gökçay Park      1153      Northwest      37'44'49'N-30'31'56'E      Plantation      Çks3        17      Yenişarbademli      1415      Southwest      37'43'35''N-31'12'21'E      Plantation      Çks3        18      Aksu      1213      South      37'43'35''N-31'12'21'E      Plantation      Çks3        19      Aksu Yakaafşar      1275      Northeast      37'43'65''N-30'31'14'E      Plantation      Çks3        20      Aksu Yaka      1326      North      37'56'45''N-30'37'14''E      Plantation      Çks4        21      Atabey      1041      South      37'57'5''N-30'31'24''E      Plantation      Sa        22      Gönen      1086      East      37'57'S''N-30'18'03''E      Plantation      Sa        23      Keçiborlu-Center      1042      West      37'95'1'N-30'17'24''E      Plantation      Sa        24 </td <td>12</td> <td>Isparta-Çobanisa Village</td> <td>1716</td> <td>West</td> <td>37°47'49''N-30°47'04''E</td> <td>Nature</td> <td>Scd1</td>	12	Isparta-Çobanisa Village	1716	West	37°47'49''N-30°47'04''E	Nature	Scd1
In Instra-Gökçay Park1153Plain37'44'9'N-30'32'45''EPlantation-16İsparta-Gökçay Park145Northwest37'43'45'N-30'31'56''EPlantationSÇka017Yenişarbademli1415Southwest37'43'3'N-31'20'S2''ENatureÇİsca18Aksu1213South37'43'3'N-31'121''EPlantationÇİsca19Aksu-Yakaafşar1275Northeast37'43'6'N-31'10'19'EPlantationÇIs'a20Aksu-Yaka1326North37'45'5'N-30'31'4'EPlantationÇIs'a21Atabey1041South37'55'S'N-30'31'24'EPlantationÇIs'a22Gönen1086East37'57'S'N-30'31'24'EPlantationÇIs'a23Keçiborlu-Center1042West37'57'S'N-30'31'24'EPlantationŞa'a24Keçiborlu-Center1042West37'04'17'N-30'17'24'EPlantationSa'a25Keçiborlu-Center1026Southeast37'49'17'N-30'17'24'EPlantationSa'a26Senirkent-Kapidāğ1507North36'00'0'N-30'46'10''ENatureSckcd227Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37'93'51'N-29'42'B''EPlantationSickcd228Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36'50'19'N-29'42'B''EPlantationSickcd229Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36'50'19'N-29'42'B''EPlantationSickcd220Çavdır1150<	13	Yukarıgökdere-Beşkuyu	1738	South	37°43'44''N-30°48'25"E	Nature	Scd2
ArrowNorthwest37'43'5'''''''''''''''''''''''''''''''''	14	lsparta-Güneyce	880	West	37°40'45''N-30°45'22"E	Plantation	ÇkSab2
1.11.11.4Southwest37*4233*N-31*20'52"ENatureCkSa18Aksu1213South37*43'35*N-31*12'21"EPlantationCkSa19Aksu-Yakaafşar1275Northeast37*43'35*N-31*10'19"EPlantationCkSa20Aksu-Yaka1326North37*43'35*N-31*10'19"EPlantationCkSa21Atabey1041South37*64'5*N-30*31'14"EPlantationCkSa22Gönen1086East37*57'5*N-30*31'24"EPlantationCkSa23Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*57'5*N-30*31'24"EPlantationSa 124Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*64'5*N-30*917"EPlantationCkSb 325Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*64'5*N-30*917"EPlantationSa 126Senirkent-Kapidag1507North38*06'0*N-30*410"ENatureSa 127Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37*57'3*N-30*30*06"EPlantationSa 228Altınyala-Kumluağil1604South36*50'19*N-29*24'19"ENatureSc 229Altınyala-Tamtr1564Southeast37*09'17*N-29*24'19"ENatureSc 230Çavdır1138Southeast37*09'17*N-29*42'2"EPlantationSa 331Tefenni1138Southeast37*09'17*N-29*22'2"EPlantationSc333Kızıldağ NP**1116North88*07'3*N-31*25'2"EPlantation </td <td>15</td> <td>Isparta-Gökçay Park</td> <td>1153</td> <td>Plain</td> <td>37°44'49''N-30°32'45''E</td> <td>Plantation</td> <td>-</td>	15	Isparta-Gökçay Park	1153	Plain	37°44'49''N-30°32'45''E	Plantation	-
18Aksu1213South37*43'35'N-31°12'21''EPlantationÇkSa19Aksu-Yakaafşar1275Northeast37*43'35'N-31°110'19''EPlantationÇdSa20Aksu-Yaka1326North37*54'35'N-31°14'08''EPlantationÇdSa21Atabey1041South37*56'45''N-30'37'14''EPlantationÇdSa22Gönen1086East37*57'55''N-30'31'24''EPlantationÇdSa23Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*045''N-30'31'24''EPlantationÇdSa24Keçiborlu-ÖzbahçeVillage1337Northwest38'00'45''N-30'19'07''EPlantationÇdSa25Keçiborlu-ÖzbahçeVillage1367North38'06'00''N-30'46'10''ENatureSa26Senirkent-Kapidağ1507North38'06'00''N-30'46'10''ENatureSqCc227Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37'53'33''N-30'3006''EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36'50'19''N-29'24'3''ENatureSqCcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564Southeast37'047''N-29'482'TEPlantationSab2-131Tefeni1138Southeast37'047''N-29'482'TEPlantationSab2-132Karamanlı1121Northwest37'047''N-29'482'TEPlantationÇdSab233Kızldağ NP**121Northwest38'02'21'N-31'12'52''EPlantationÇdSab234Çarksaraylar	16	Isparta-Hisartepe	1485	Northwest	37°43'45''N-30°31'56"E	Plantation	SÇka0
19Aksu-Yakaafsar1275Northeast374'436'N-31'10'19'EPlantationSad20Aksu-Yaka1326North37'43'55'N-31'14'08'EPlantationÇkSa21Atabey1041South37'56'45'N-30'31'14'EPlantationÇkSa22Gönen1086East37'57'5'N-30'31'24'EPlantationÇkSab223Keçiborlu-Center1042West37'57'29'N-30'18'24'EPlantationSa124Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village1337Northwest38'00'45''N-30'17'24''EPlantationÇkSb325Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village1026Southeast37'917''N-30'17'24''EPlantationSa26Senirkent-Kapidağ1507North38'06'00''N-30'30'6''EPlantationSa27Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37'51'3''N-30'30'6''EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Famtur164Southeast37'09'1''N-29'42'1''ENatureSckcd229Altınyayla-Tamtur1564Southeast37'20'4'''N-29'42'3''ENatureSab2-131Tefeni1138Southeast37'20'4'''N-29'42'3''EPlantationSab2-132Karamahl121Northwest37'20'4'''N-29'42'3''EPlantationSab2-133Kızldağ NP*1421North38'02'2'N-31'2'5''ENatureSa'34Karasaylar1421Northwest38'13''N-31'25''EPlantationÇkSab235Yakaçaçiy Forest <t< td=""><td>17</td><td>Yenişarbademli</td><td>1415</td><td>Southwest</td><td>37°42'33''N-31°20'52''E</td><td>Nature</td><td>ÇkSc3</td></t<>	17	Yenişarbademli	1415	Southwest	37°42'33''N-31°20'52''E	Nature	ÇkSc3
Aksu-Yaka1326North37*34'35''N-31'14'08"EPlantationÇkSa21Atabey1041South37*56'45''N-30'37'14"EPlantationSçka22Gönen1086East37*57'55''N-30'31'14"EPlantationÇkSab223Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*57'29''N-30'18'03"EPlantationSa124Keçiborlu-Cabahçe Village1337Northwest38'00'45''N-30'19'07"EPlantationÇkSb325Keçiborlu-SenirTown1026Southeast37*917''N-30'17'24"EPlantationSa26Senirkent-Kapidă1507North38'06'00''N-30'46'10"ENatureSa27İsparta-Senirce Village1025East37*53'03''N-30'30'06"EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36'60'01''N-29'24'19"ENatureSqkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtr1564South36'50'48''N-29'24'23"ENatureSqkcd230Çavdır1150Southeast37'20'47''N-29'42'3TEPlantationSa31Tefenni1138Southeast37'224'S''N-29'52'3"EPlantationSq33Kızıldağ NP**1301South38'01'23''N-31'25'25''PlantationSq34Çanksaraylar1316Northwest38'18'S8''N-31'15'57''EPlantationSq35Yakaç-City Forest116Northwest38'123'''N-31'15'57''EPlantationSq36Yakaç-Sağkonak116North	18	Aksu	1213	South	37°43'35"N-31°12'21"E	Plantation	ÇkSa
Atabey1041South37*56'45''N-30'37'14"EPlanationSçka22Gönen1086East37*57'55''N-30'31'24"EPlantationÇkSab223Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*57'29''N-30'18'03"EPlanationSa124Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village1337Northwest38'00'45''N-30'19'07"EPlanationÇkSb325Keçiborlu-Senir Town1026Southeast37*69'17''N-30'17'24"EPlanationSa26Senirkent-Kapidağ1507North38'06'00''N-30'46'10"ENatureSc127Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37*53'03''N-30'30'06"EPlanationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36*50'19''N-29'24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564Southeast37*09'51''N-29'42'51''EPlanationSab2-130Çavdır1150Southeast37*09'51''N-29'42'51''EPlanationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37*09'51''N-29'42'51''EPlanationSab2-132Karamanlı1121Northwest38'02'22''N-13''15''ENatureSc333Kızıldağ NP**1361South38'02'13''N-31'12'S'Z''PlanationÇkSb234Çarıksaraylar136South38'02'13''N-31'12'S'Z''PlanationÇkbc235Yalvaç-City Forest116'Northwest38'12'31''N-31'15'S'''PlanationÇkbc236Yalvaç-City Forest	19	Aksu-Yakaafşar	1275	Northeast	37°44'36''N-31°10'19''E	Plantation	Sa0
22Gönen1086East37*57*55*N-30*31*24*EPlantationÇkSab223Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*57*29*N-30*18'03*EPlantationSa124Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village1337Northwest38*00'45*N-30*19'07*EPlantationÇkSb325Keçiborlu-Senir Town1026Southeast37*49'17"N-30*17'24*EPlantationSa26Senirkent-Kapıdağ1507North38*06'00'N-30*46'10*ENatureSc127Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37*55'03*N-30*30'06*EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36*50'19"N-29*24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564Southast37*047"N-29*423"ENatureSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37*047"N-29*423"EPlantationSab2-132Karamanlı1121Northwest37*2245"N-29*52'23"EPlantationŞkab233Kızıldağ NP**1421North38*02'22'N-31*21'52'ENatureSc334Çanksaraylar1301South38*07'43"N-31*25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38*18'58'N-31*10'36'EPlantationŞcka036Yalvaç-Gity Gökçebağ Village1169North37*21'51'N-30*15'57'EPlantationSçka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37*21'51'N-30*15'57'EPlantationSçka037 </td <td>20</td> <td>Aksu-Yaka</td> <td>1326</td> <td>North</td> <td>37°43'55''N-31°14'08''E</td> <td>Plantation</td> <td>ÇkSa</td>	20	Aksu-Yaka	1326	North	37°43'55''N-31°14'08''E	Plantation	ÇkSa
23Keçiborlu-Center1042West37*57'29"N-30°18'03"EPlantationSa124Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village1337Northwest38'00'45"N-30°19'07"EPlantationÇkSb325Keçiborlu-Senir Town1026Southeast37*49'17"N-30°17'24"EPlantationSa26Senirkent-Kapidăg1507North38'06'00"N-30°46'10"ENatureSc127İsparta-Senirce Village1025East37*53'03"N-30°30'06"EPlantationSq28Altınyayla-Kumluağil1604South36'50'19"N-29°24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564South37*09'51"N-29°42'3"EPlantationSa2-130Çavdır1150Southeast37*09'51"N-29°42'3"EPlantationSa2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37*09'71"N-29°42'3"EPlantationSa2-332Kazındağı NP**1121Northwest37*02'47"N-29°42'3"EPlantationÇkSa233Kızıldağı NP**121Northwest38'02'22"N-31*21'52"ENatureSc334Kızıldağı NP**1361South38'02'21"N-31*15'57"EPlantationÇkSa235Yalvaç-City Forest116Northwest38'15'8"N-31*10'36"EPlantationŞcko236Yalvaç-Báğkonak1169North38'12'31"N-31*15'57"EPlantationSc437Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37*15'46"N-30*2'31"EPlantationSc437 <td>21</td> <td>Atabey</td> <td>1041</td> <td>South</td> <td>37°56'45''N-30°37'14''E</td> <td>Plantation</td> <td>SÇka</td>	21	Atabey	1041	South	37°56'45''N-30°37'14''E	Plantation	SÇka
24Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village1337Northwest38°00'45"N-30°1907"EPlantationÇkSb325Keçiborlu-Senir Town1026Southeast37°49'17"N-30°17'24"EPlantationSa26Senirkent-Kapidağ1507North38°06'00"N-30°46'10"ENatureSc127Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37°53'03"N-30°30'06"EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36°50'19"N-29°24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564South36°50'48"N-29°24'23"ENatureSab2-130Çavdır1150Southeast37°20'47"N-29°42'51"EPlantationSd22-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°42'25"EPlantationSa-332Kızıldağ NP**1121Northwest37°20'47"N-29°42'25"EPlantationSc333Kızıldağ NP**1301South38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc434Yalvaç-City Forest116Northwest38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-Gity Forest116North38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSqu36Yalvaç-Gakçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSqu37Burdur-Gókçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSqu38Kalvaç-Bağkonak1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSqu	22	Gönen	1086	East	37°57'55''N-30°31'24''E	Plantation	ÇkSab2
25Keçiborlu-Senir Town1026Southeast37°49'17"N-30°17'24"EPlantationSa26Senirkent-Kapıdağ1507North38°06'00"N-30°46'10"ENatureSc127Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37°53'03"N-30°30'06"EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36°50'19"N-29°24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tantır1564South36°50'48"N-29°24'23"ENatureSab2-130Çavdır1150Southeast37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationSa-332Karamanlı1121Northwest37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationSa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°18'58'N-31°10'36"EPlantationÇkbc235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSq436Yalvaç-Bağkonak1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSq637Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSq038Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°21'54"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSq038Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°21'54"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSq039 <td< td=""><td>23</td><td>Keçiborlu-Center</td><td>1042</td><td>West</td><td>37°57'29''N-30°18'03''E</td><td>Plantation</td><td>Sa1</td></td<>	23	Keçiborlu-Center	1042	West	37°57'29''N-30°18'03''E	Plantation	Sa1
26Senirkent-Kapidåğ1507North38°06'00"N-30°46'10"ENatureSc127Isparta-Senirce Village1025East3753'03"N-30°30'06"EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36°50'19"N-29°24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564South36°50'48"N-29°24'32"ENatureSçkcd230çavdır1150Southeast37°04'7"N-29°48'27"EPlantationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°24'7"N-29°48'27"EPlantationÇkSab232Karamanlı1121Northwest37°24'5"N-29°52'3"EPlantationSo34Kaildå NP**1421NorthSa°0'14"'N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest116Northwest38°14'3"N-31°15'5"EPlantationŞcka036Yalvaç-Bağkonak116NorthSa°11'N-31°15'5"EPlantationSçka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North3°21'4'N-30°24'31"EPlantationSçka038Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North3°21'5'N-30°24'31"EPlantationScka038Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North3°21'5'N-30°24'31"EPlantationScka039Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North3°21'5'N-30°24'31"EPlantationScka039Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North3°21'5'N-30°24'31"ENatureScd1	24	Keçiborlu-Özbahçe Village	1337	Northwest	38°00'45''N-30°19'07''E	Plantation	ÇkSb3
27Isparta-Senirce Village1025East37°53'03"N-30°30'06"EPlantationSa28Altınyayla-Kumluağıl1604South36°50'19"N-29°24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564South36°50'48"N-29°24'23"ENatureSçkcd230Çavdır1150Southeast37°09'51"N-29°42'51"EPlantationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°42'23"EPlantationÇkSab232Karamanlı1121Northwest37°22'45"N-29°52'23"EPlantationÇa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°13'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSçka036Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSçka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa0	25	Keçiborlu-Senir Town	1026	Southeast	37°49'17''N-30°17'24''E	Plantation	Sa
28Altınyayla-Kumluağil1604South36°50'19"N-29°24'19"ENatureSçkcd229Altınyayla-Tamtır1564South36°50'48"N-29°24'23"ENatureSçkcd230Çavdır1150Southeast37°09'51"N-29°42'51"EPlantationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationÇkSab232Karamanlı1121Northwest37°22'45"N-29°52'23"EPlantationSa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSçka036Yalvaç-Bağkonak1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGscd1	26	Senirkent-Kapıdağ	1507	North	38°06'00''N-30°46'10''E	Nature	Sc1
29Altınyayla-Tamtır1564South36°50'48"N-29°24'23"ENatureSçkcd230Çavdır1150Southeast37°09'51"N-29°42'51"EPlantationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationÇkSab232Karamanlı1121Northwest37°22'45"N-29°52'23"EPlantationSa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationÇkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSqka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGscd1	27	Isparta-Senirce Village	1025	East	37°53'03''N-30°30'06''E	Plantation	Sa
30Çavdır1150Southeast37°09'51"N-29°42'51"EPlantationSab2-131Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationÇkSab232Karamanlı1121Northwest37°22'45"N-29°52'23"EPlantationSa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationSçkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSqua37Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	28	Altınyayla-Kumluağıl	1604	South	36°50'19''N-29°24'19''E	Nature	SÇkcd2
31Tefenni1138Southeast37°20'47"N-29°48'27"EPlantationÇkSab232Karamanlı1121Northwest37°22'45"N-29°52'23"EPlantationSa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationSçkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSquad37Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureSouth	29	Altınyayla-Tamtır	1564	South	36°50'48''N-29°24'23''E	Nature	SÇkcd2
32Karamanlı1121Northwest37°22'45"N-29°52'23"EPlantationSa-333Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationSçkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSçka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	30	Çavdır	1150	Southeast	37°09'51''N-29°42'51''E	Plantation	Sab2-1
33Kızıldağ NP**1421North38°02'22"N-31°21'52"ENatureSc334Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationSçkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSçka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureScd1	31	Tefenni	1138	Southeast	37°20'47''N-29°48'27''E	Plantation	ÇkSab2
34Çarıksaraylar1301South38°07'43"N-31°25'28"EPlantationÇkSab235Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationSÇkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSÇka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	32	Karamanlı	1121	Northwest	37°22'45''N-29°52'23''E	Plantation	Sa-3
35Yalvaç-City Forest1116Northwest38°18'58"N-31°10'36"EPlantationSÇkbc236Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSÇka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	33	Kızıldağ NP**	1421	North	38°02'22''N-31°21'52''E	Nature	Sc3
36Yalvaç-Bağkonak1136West38°12'31"N-31°15'57"EPlantationSÇka037Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	34	Çarıksaraylar	1301	South	38°07'43"N-31°25'28"E	Plantation	ÇkSab2
37Burdur-Gökçebağ Village1169North37°45'46"N-30°24'31"EPlantationSa038Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	35	Yalvaç-City Forest	1116	Northwest	38°18'58"N-31°10'36"E	Plantation	SÇkbc2
38Bucak-Katran Mountain1136North37°21'54"N-30°05'38"ENatureGScd1	36	Yalvaç-Bağkonak	1136	West	38°12'31''N-31°15'57''E	Plantation	SÇka0
	37	Burdur-Gökçebağ Village	1169	North	37°45'46''N-30°24'31''E	Plantation	Sa0
39 Isparta-Kuleönü 1025 West 37°50'58"N-30°37'02"E Plantation SÇka0	38	Bucak-Katran Mountain	1136	North	37°21'54''N-30°05'38''E	Nature	GScd1
	39	lsparta-Kuleönü	1025	West	37°50'58''N-30°37'02''E	Plantation	SÇka0

Tabl	Table 1. Characteristics of the land and stand of 46 Cinara cedri detected localities in study area (continue)					
No	Locality	Altitude (m)	Aspect	Coordinate	Nature/Plantation	Stand property*
40	Büyükgökçeli	1047	North	37°53'13"N-30°44'04"E	Plantation	ÇkSa
41	Eğirdir-Center	1016	Northeast	37°51'27"N-30°50'45"E	Plantation	Sa0
42	Uluborlu	1150	Northwest	38°03'58''N-30°25'09''E	Plantation	Sa3
43	Isparta-Ayazmana Park	1045	North	37°44'48"N-30°34'54"E	Plantation	-
44	Bucak-Seydiköy	892	East	37°30'27"N-30°33'07"E	Plantation	Sb3
45	Kasnak Oak NPA**	1192	Southeast	37°42'46"N-30°50'11"E	Nature	SMkcd2
46	Gölcük NP***	1400	Southeast	37°43'45"N-30°29'05"E	Plantation	ÇkSab2

\*Stand property: Main tree species; S: Cedrus libani; Çk: Pinus nigra; Mk: Quercus vulcanica; G: Abies cilicica

Age classes of stands according to diameter of 1.30 m; a: 0-7.9 cm, b: 9-19.9 cm, c: 20-35.9 cm, d: 36-51.9 cm, e: >52 cm

Canopy closure; 0: 1-10%, 1: 11-40%, 2: 41-70%, 3: 71-100%.

\*\*NPA: Nature Protection Area; \*\*\*NP: Nature Park



Figure 2. Egg, nymph and adult form of the Cinara cedri populations respectively

individual specimens. In winged specimens, morphologically similar features were found in transition to the nymph phase. However, wing colours were different in head, thorax and siphunculi. Wings that were bright white during the 1<sup>st</sup> nymph phase turned darker at the 4<sup>th</sup> nymph phase. In the winged specimens, the siphunculi area and legs were darker in colour and there were black and grey coloured stripes on the head and thorax area. It was observed in the study that the head, thorax and abdomen area along with the intersection area of the femur and tibia was dark in colour whereas the legs and antennae were yellowish brown (Figure 2). Antenna, leg, abdomen and thorax characteristics were similar to the findings reported by Çanakçıoğlu (1975), Çanakçıoğlu and Mol (1998) and Cebeci (2003). Mendel et al. (2016) and Cebeci (2003) stated that winged specimens did not have dark coloured stripes and the wings were a greyish-yellow colour. In this study, however, it was observed that some individuals had grey-white wings while some had dark stripes on their wings (Figure 2). This was interpreted to signify that *C. cedri* might have morphological variations under the influence of ecological features.

#### Adult

In the study, it was observed that adults were generally a dark/ black colour in the head region with dark coloured stripes on the thorax and abdomen. It was found that the legs and antennae



Figure 3. Nymph stages and adult of the *Cinara cedri* on a shoot (29 April 2016)

were dark compared to the nymph stage. However, specimens whose bodies were red in colour were also observed (Figure 2). Usta and Keskin (1992) stated that the head region in adults was dark; Görür (2014) stated that adults' head regions were black in colour - similar to the findings of this study. Çanakçıoğlu (1975) stated that both the winged and wingless viviparous insects had a length of 3.0-4.4 mm while Usta and Keskin (1992) reported lengths ranging from 3.0-3.8 mm. In this study, the average length of adults was found to be length 3.09 mm and width was 1.71 mm - these values were similar to those reported in the literature.

#### Biology

In this study, unhatched eggs were also observed in addition to the wingless viviparous specimens that hatched on 03.04.2016. Çanakçıoğlu (1975) stated that the eggs in the İstanbul Bahçeköy Park of the Faculty of Forestry did not hatch on 05.03.1965 some hatched on 08.04.1965 while most of them hatched on 19.04.1965, which was similar to the findings of this study. In this study, it was observed that a maximum of nine eggs were laid on a needle and Usta and Keskin (1992) and Çanakçıoğlu and Mol (1998) reported similar findings. It was found that wingless viviparous individuals completing four nymph phases in 10 days became adults after parthenogenetically reproducing and these specimens hatched between May and June. In contrast, oviparous individuals were observed to copulate and lay eggs in October-November (Görür et al., 2009).

It was observed that while there was a significant rise in the population twice a year during June and September, the species completed its lifecycle on a single host (Figure 3). These



Figure 4. Damage on needles of Cinara cedri



findings are similar to those reported by Usta and Keskin (1992), Çanakçıoğlu and Mol (1998) and Toper Kaygın and Çanakçıoğlu (2003).

Figure 5. Honeydew on needles and fumagine formation

#### Damage

It was observed that *C. cedri* mostly fed on the shoots of the previous year and caused the needles to dry out and turn red.





Figure 6. Cinara cedri colonies at the end of shoot and cone petiole

Damage was found on young trees in particular, from which the dried needles fell, and that defoliation occurred on shoot tips and canopies. The signs observed in this study were similar to those reported in literature (Binazzi et al., 2015; Çanakçıoğlu, 1975; Düzgüneş et al., 1980; Núñez-Pérez and Tizado, 1996; Tuatay, 1999; Usta and Keskin, 1992; Ünal and Özcan, 2005). Although it was stated in the literature that the seed production capacity of dried needles decreased and led to increment loss, this was not observed in this study. In our study, it was found that the damage was high particularly in Uluborlu and Bucak-Karapınar sites (Figure 4). Binazzi et al. (2015) stated that C. cedri might form dense colonies under suitable micro-climate conditions while Mendel et al. (2016) stated that there might be significant loss of needles due to the damage of the species and that would cause the tree to lose its vitality. As it was stated by Çanakçıoğlu and Mol (1998) and Usta and Keskin (1992), the population during high density periods preferred young seedlings in particular, while damage from the species was also found on young trees in this study in Uluborlu and Bucak-Karapinar.

It was found that since *C. cedri* fed on sap, there was a honeydew secretion and honeydew covered the needles, shoots and branches. It was observed that bees were attracted to this honeydew and that fungi growing on honeydew led to fumagine on trees. Intense fumagine formation was found especially in Uluborlu and Bucak-Karapınar (Figure 5). It was also found that colony presence was very high in city centres, parks and gardens and that honeydew secretion dripped on roads, sidewalks and on cars in carparks. Fumagine formation was also reported by many other authors (Binazzi et al., 2015; Çanakçıoğlu, 1975; Düzgüneş et al., 1980; Núñez-Pérez and Tizado, 1996; Tuatay, 1999; Usta and Keskin, 1992; Ünal and Özcan, 2005) and the first damage to this species in our country was observed in the plantation fields in the Mediterranean region (Aytar, 2006).

## Dispersal across the tree canopies and occurrence rate on the shoots at different ages of colonies of *Cinara cedri*

In this study, colonies of *C. cedri* were mostly seen on shoots in south and east sections, while fewer were observed on shoots in north and west sections. Çanakçıoğlu (1975) stated that *C. cedri* colonies were only observed on those sections of the cedar that were exposed to light. Colonies were observed particularly on lower branches of both old and young trees, and on the trunks, shoots, shoot tips, branches, branch axils, and cone stems of young trees (Figure 6). Similar findings were also noted in the literature (Aytar, 2006; Çanakçıoğlu and Mol, 1998; Düzgüneş et al., 1980; Tuatay, 1999; Usta and Keskin, 1992; Ünal and Özcan, 2005). However, no information was found in the literature regarding the observation on cone stems. Görür (2014) stated that *C. cedri* was not found in trunk cracks but it was observed on the trunks themselves of young trees.

In the study, the colonies were found on shoots with a diameter of 1.0-1.5 cm. Núñez-Pérez and Tizado (1996), stated that *C. cedri* individuals existed densely on 1.5 cm-diameter branches,

which was consistent with the measurements recorded in this study. The thickest shoot diameter was found in shoots located in Bucak-Karapınar with 4.7 cm. Mendel et al. (2016) stated that sometimes colonies covered trunks at a diameter of 5-6 cm. The distance of the colony to the shoot tip was found to be 22.14 cm on average and the width of the colony was 4.11 cm. In the literature no information was found regarding the distance of the colony to the shoot tip and the width of the colony.

#### CONCLUSION

According to the findings in the areas studied, in general, intensive damage of C. cedri was not found. A small number of colonies were observed - mostly on shoots - and (apart from a few sites) yellowing and abscission of leaves along with formation of fumagine were not found intensely. It was found that the C. cedri population was higher in those 10 sites established by plantation with young stands and located at an average elevation of 1000-1200 m compared to the others. However, on the trees in the Uluborlu cedar plantation forest, a high amount of fumagine formation from previous years, along with yellowing in some trees and contraction and decrease in needles were observed. In the Bucak-Karapınar village cedar-Crimean pine plantation forest, needle contraction and decrease along with yellowing of trees were identified, yet fumagine formation was observed to be less dense. Furthermore, in city centres, parks and gardens, colonies were much denser and honeydew secretion dripped on roads, sidewalks and cars in carparks.

Many aphid species can easily increase their population size on a variety of hosts and this highlights the importance of the control of these species. As aphids are the prey of many species including Hymenoptera, Coleoptera, Diptera and Neuroptera orders, they have a lot of natural enemies. Therefore, in ecosystems where aphids are intensely observed, biological control is considered more beneficial as opposed to chemical control with its many known side effects. However, in order to switch to biological control, natural enemies should initially be identified. This study is part of a master's thesis and in this study natural enemies of the pest were identified. In this study, it can be stated that natural enemies were effective and kept the balance of the pest population throughout the study field in general.

It is suggested that during forestry activities, as well as identifying natural enemies, the inclusion of other species where possible, preservation of in-forest bushlands and increasing efficiency via a variety of natural enemies, would help maintain the balance of *C. cedri* populations in cedar plantations. Thus, chemical intervention would no longer be required. In populated areas, however, the use of bio-insecticides may be recommended in order to avoid exposure to intense honeydew secretion and fumagine formation. Moreover, the collection and extermination of shoots on which eggs and colonies are found or enabling parasitoid emergence could help contribute to the control of the species. **Ethics Committee Approval:** This study does not contain an approach involving humans or animals as a subject. Based on this, ethics committee approval was not necessary for this study.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

**Author Contributions:** Concept – Ş.O., M.A.; Design - Ş.O., M.A.; Supervision - M.A.; Resources - Ş.O., M.A.; Materials - Ş.O., M.A.; Data Collection and/or Processing - Ş.O., M.A.; Analysis and/or Interpretation - Ş.O., M.A.;Literature Search - Ş.O.; Writing Manuscript - Ş.O.; Critical Review – M.A.; Other – Ş.O., M.A.;

**Acknowledgements:** As this study is part of a master's thesis, we would like to thank the Süleyman Demirel University Fellowship Training Program Coordination for their support with project numbered ÖYP-06475-YL15.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Financial Disclosure:** The authors declared that this study has received financial support from Süleyman Demirel University Fellowship Training Program Coordination with project numbered ÖYP-06475-YL15.

#### REFERENCES

- Aksoy, H., Özalp, G., 1990. Türkiye'de Sedirin (*Cedrus libani* A. Rich.) Orman Toplumları (Forest Communities of Cedar in Turkey). International Cedar Symposium 22–27 October, pp. 93-102. Antalya/ Turkey.
- Aslan, M.M., 2014. Kahramanmaraş ili ağaçlarında Aphidoidea (Hemiptera) türleri ve doğal düşmanları. Türkiye II. Orman Entomolojisi ve Patolojisi Sempozyumu, 7-9 Nisan, Antalya, s. 456-466.
- Aytar, F., 2006. Geographical Distribution of *Cinara cedri, Cinara* (*Cedrobium*) laportei (Homo.; Aphididae) and Newly Discovered A Parasitoid of *Cinara cedri, Pauesia (Pauesia)* anatolica (Hym.; Braconidae) in Turkey. VIII. the European Congress of Entomology, Supplementary Abstract Book-2, 17-22 September, İzmir, Turkey. p. 27.
- Aytar, F., Dağdaş, S., Duran, C. 2011. Biology and Control of *Calomicrus apicalis* Demaison, 1891 (Col.: Chrysomelidae), a New Pest of *Cedrus libani* A. Rich. in Turkey. Silva Lusitana, 19.
- Binazzi, F., Sabbatini Peverieri, G., Roversi, P.F., 2015. First Record in Cyprus of *Cinara (Cinara)* cedri Mimeur (Aphididae: Lachninae) on *Cedrus brevifolia* (Hooker Fil.) Henry. *Redia* XCVIII: 151-154.
- Blackman, R.L., Eastop, V.F. 2012. Aphid's on the World's Trees. An Identification and Information Guide CAB International, Wallingford, 1004 p.
- Boydak, M., 2014. Toros Sedirinin Ekolojisi, Doğal Gençleştirilmesi ve Bu Türle Karstik Alan Ağaçlandırmaları. II. Ulusal Akdeniz Orman ve Çevre Sempozyumu, 22-24 Ekim, İsparta.
- Cebeci, H.H., 2003. İstanbul Orman Bölge Müdürlüğü İstanbul İli Ağaçlandırma Alanlarındaki Entomolojik Sorunlar. İstanbul Üniversitesi, Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Doktora Tezi, 184s., İstanbul.
- Çanakçıoğlu, H., 1975. The Aphidoidea of Turkey. İstanbul Üniversitesi Orman Fakültesi Yayınları, İstanbul Üniversitesi Yayın No: 1751, Orman Fakültesi Yayın No: 189, 309s., İstanbul.

- Çanakçıoğlu, H., Mol, T., 1998. Orman Entomolojisi Zararlı ve Yararlı Böcekler. İstanbul Üniversitesi Orman Fakültesi Yayınları, Rektörlük No: 4063 Fakülte No: 451, 541s., İstanbul.
- Düzgüneş, Z., Toros, S., Kılınçer, N., Kovancı, B., 1980. Ankara İlinde Saptanan Afit Predatörleri ve Bunların Biyolojik Mücadelede Kullanılma Olanakları. TÜBİTAK-TOAG Proje Raporu, Proje No: 295, 198s.
- Görür, G., Zeybekoğlu, Ü., Akyürek, B., Işık, M., Akyıldırım, H., 2009. Trabzon, Rize ve Artvin İllerinin Afit (Homoptera: Aphididae) Faunasının Belirlenmesi. TÜBİTAK-TBAG, 107T450 No.lu Proje Sonuç Raporu, 223s.
- Görür, G., 2014. İç Batı Anadolu Bölümü Afit (Hemiptera: Aphidoidea) Faunasının Belirlenmesi. TÜBİTAK-TBAG 111T866 No.lu Proje Sonuç Raporu, 235s.
- Khuri, S., Shmoury, M. R., Baalbaki, R., Maunder, M., Talhouk, S. N., 2000. Conservation of the *Cedrus libani* populations in Lebanon: history, current status and experimental application of somatic embryogenesis. *Biodiversity & Conservation*, 9(9): 1261-1273. [CrossRef]
- Lieutier, F., Ghaioule, D., 2005. Entomological research in Mediterranean forest ecosystems. Editions Quae., Paris.
- Martin, J. H., 1983. The identification of common aphid pests of tropical agriculture. *Tropical Pest Management*, 29(4): 395-411.
   [CrossRef]
- Mendel, Z., Branco, M., Battisti, A., 2016. Invasive Sap-Sucker Insects in the Mediterranean Basin. T.D. Paine, F. Lieutier (eds.), Insects and Diseases of Mediterranean Forest Systems (261-291), Springer International Publishing, 892 p., Switzerland.
- Mimeur, J.M., 1935. Aphididae Du Maroc (Septiéme Note). Bulletin de la Société des Sciences Naturelles du Maroc Xv(3): 251-258.
- Núňez-Perez, E., Tizado, E.J., 1996. Conifer aphids (Homoptera: Aphididae) and some natural enemies in the León province (Spain). *Boletín de la Asociación espa-ola de Entomología* 20(1-2): 85-93.
- Orman Genel Müdürlüğü (OGM), 2015. Türkiye Orman Varlığı. Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Orman ve Su İşleri Bakanlığı Orman Genel Müdürlüğü Yayını, 36s., Ankara.
- Serttaş A., Sarıbaşak H., Güngöroğlu C., Yolcu H.İ., Erler F., Avcı M., Sungur N., 2012. Elmalı Çığlıkara Sedir Ormanlarına Nakledilen Kırmızı Orman Karıncalarının (*Formica rufa* L.) Envanteri ve Beslenme Alışkanlıklarının Tespiti. Batı Akdeniz Ormancılık Araştırma Enstitüsü Araştırma Teknik Bülteni. Teknik Bülten No: 47, Enstitü Yayın No: 63, 39s., Antalya.
- Toper Kaygın, A., Çanakçıoğlu, H., 2003. Contributions to the knowledge of conifer aphid fauna in Turkey and their zoogeographical distribution. *Anzeiger für Schädlingskunde* 76(2): 50-56.
   [CrossRef]
- Tosun, İ., 1975. Akdeniz Bölgesi İğne Yapraklı Ormanlarında Zarar Yapan Böcekler ve Önemli Türlerin Parazit ve Yırtıcıları Üzerine Araştırmalar. Orman Bakanlığı Orman Genel Müdürlüğü Yayınları Sıra No: 612 Seri No: 24, 201s., Vural Matbaası.
- Tuatay, N., 1999. Türkiye Yaprakbitleri (Homoptera: Aphididae): V. Chaitophinae, Lachninae ve Thelaxinae. *Bitki Koruma Bülteni* 39(1-2): 1-21.
- Tuatay, N., Remaudiere, G., 1964. Premiere Contribution au Catalogue des Aphididae (Hom.) de la Turquie. *Revue de Pathologie Vegetale et d'Entomologie Agricole de Paris* 43(4): 243-278.
- Usta, H.Z., Keskin, S., 1992. Sedir Ormanlarının Zararlıları ve Mücadelesi. Sedir El Kitabı Dizisi: 6. (Editör Ünal ELER) Ormancılık Araştırma Enstitüsü Yayınları. Muhtelif Yayınlar Serisi: 66, s. 265-286, Ankara.

- Uygun, N., Toros, S., Ulusoy, M.R., Satar, S., Özdemir, I., 2000. Doğu Akdeniz Bölgesi Aphidoidea (Homoptera) türleri ve bunların parazitoit ve predatörlerinin saptanması. Türkiye Bilimsel ve Teknik Araştırma Kurumu, Tarım ve Orman Araştırma Grubu, Proje No: Tübitak-Togtak 1720, 214 s.
- Ülgentürk, S., Kıran, K., Ayhan, B., Civelek, H.S., Eskin, A., 2012. Ants species (Hymenoptera: Formicidae) associated with *Marchalina hellenica* Gennadius (Hemiptera: Marchalinidae) in Turkey. *Turkish Bulletin of Entomology* 2(4): 263-270.
- Ülgentürk, S., Özdemir, I., Kozar, F., Kaydan, M.B., Dostbil, Ö., Sarıbaşak, H., Civelek, H.S., 2013. Türkiye'nin Batı Kısmındaki Ormanlarda Ballı Madde Salgılayan Türler. *Türkiye Entomoloji Bülteni* 3(4): 125-133.
- Ünal, S., Özcan, E., 2005. Kastamonu Yöresi Aphididae (Homoptera) Türleri. Süleyman Demirel Üniversitesi Orman Fakültesi Dergisi Seri A, 1: 76-83.
- Yaltırık, F. 1988. Dendroloji ders kitabı I. Gymnospermae (Açık tohumlular). İstanbul Üniversitesi Orman Fakültesi Yayınları 3443/386, İstanbul.

### Development planning approach for children with orthopaedic disabilities; example of Eymir Lake (Ankara)

Ortopedik engelli çocukların iyileştirilmelerine yönelik planlama yaklaşımı: ODTÜ Eymir Gölü örneği (Ankara)

Sima Pouya 🗅, Öner Demirel 🕩

Department of Landscape Architecture, Karadeniz Technical University, 61080, Trabzon, Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

The aim of this study is to provide the re-planning of Lake Eymir, located in the city of Ankara with the participation of shareholders and children with orthopedic disabilities as the main user group. Post-occupancy evaluation was implemented in the research and techniques, and surveys, observations, and interviews with experts were used. Behavioral maps showing the activities of the subjects were created using geographical information systems. People's rude manners, limited means of transport, and economic problems prevent children with disabilities from visiting open green areas. It is suggested that Lake Eymir and its surroundings should be convenient for developing activities for children with disabilities. A convenient and accessible passage should be planned to achieve this.

Keywords: Behavioral mapping, children with orthopedic disabilities, Eymir Lake planning, landscape, post-occupancy evaluation

#### ÖΖ

Çalışmanın amacı, Ankara kenti yakın çevresinde bulunan Eymir Gölü'nün doğal çevre değerlerinin paydaşların katılımı ve ortopedik engelli çocukların kullanıcı kesimler olarak gözlemlenmesi doğrultusunda yeniden planlanmasını sağlamaktır. Araştırmada kullanım Sürecinde Değerlendirme Metodu (POE) uygulanmıştır. Bu kapsamda anket oluşturma, gözlem yapma ve ilgili uzmanlarla görüşme teknikleri kullanılmıştır. Gözlem sonucunda coğrafi bilgi sistemi kullanılarak deneklerin yapmış oldukları etkinliklerin gösterildiği davranış haritaları oluşturulmuştur. Başta çevredeki insanların rahatsız edici tavırları, ulaşım olanağı kısıtlılığı ve mevcut ekonomik sorunlar, bu engelli çocukların açık yeşil alanlara gitmesini engellemektedir. Eymir gölü ve çevresinin, ortopedik engelli çocuklaran yönelik geliştirilen etkinliklere uygun olması ve bu kapsamda erişilebilirliğin sağlandığı uygun geçiş yollarının yeniden düzenlenmesi önerilmektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Davranış haritalaması, Eymir Gölü planlaması, kullanım sonrası değerlendirme, ortopedik engelli çocuklar, peyzaj

#### INTRODUCTION

Today, many scientists have been conducting studies the effects of natural and organized environment on human health and healing (Erickson, 2012; Harris, 1996; Marcus & Barnes, 1999; Söderback et al., 2004; Stigsdotter & Grahn, 2003; Ulrich, 1999; Whitehouse et al., 2001). One point that the present study takes into consideration is the planning of green networks of inner and outer urban to create healing environments, as accessible and suitable places, for disabled persons.

To achieve this, it is necessary to have a participative management approach in which the related experts, state and non-state organizations, and also managers of governmental institutions play a role. When the magnitude of the orthopedic disabilities of population is compared to the general population in Turkey, (Barış & Uslu, 2009; Maralcan et al., 2003; Sakız & Woods, 2015; Yalçın, 2012; Yorulmaz, 2010), it is not possible to mention an area planning that contains wide fields, has rich

#### Cite this paper as:

Pouya, S., Demirel, Ö., 2019. Development planning approach for children with orthopaedic disabilities; example of Eymir lake (Ankara). *Forestist* 69(1): 11-21.

Corresponding author: Sima Pouya e-mail: sima.pouya@inonu.edu.tr

*Received Date:* 05.12.2017 *Accepted Date:* 23.10.2018

Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International recreational diversity and brings the healing features of the natural environment values to the forefront, except for the limited-sized and numbered replannings made for the treatment of the disability (Akın, 2006). The fact that there have been partial improvements for the disability in some areas of the existing parks is not sufficient to say that these kinds of park areas have the healing quality for the disability. In this case, a process that constitutes all the green web components within the city needs to be initiated with a participatory approach (Şafak & Pouya, 2016). Participatory approach can be defined as joint actions of people, landscape architects and, city planners with the objective of formulating development plans and selecting the best available alternatives for their implementation (URL 1).

Within the immediate environment and hinterland of the city, city forests, wetlands, wide city parks providing wide mobility can be given as examples of these green web components when considering the natural environment values (vegetation, water resources, birds and other living creatures) as well as the healing and treating features for the disability. It has been reported that 12/29 percent of the population in Turkey has mental or physical disabilities and out of this percentag, 9 million people are at the age of 1-12 who have special needs. According to the Ministry of Education.there are 1 million and 100 thousand disabled children agred between 4 and 18 and among them 45 thousand ones have vision impairment, 130 thousand ones have hearing impairment, 500 thousand of them have mental and emotional disabilities, and 300 thousand of them suffer from physical disabilites. Enrollment rate in Disabled Children School is around 2% (Pouya et al., 2018; Şafak & Pouya, 2016).

In this study, the Lake Eymir located in the immediate environment of Ankara city is replanned in accordance with the participation of shareholders and observation of the children with orthopedic disabilities as user groups. In the study, students with orthopedic disabilities aged 8-12 in the Dogan Chaglar Special Education School (DCSES) in Ankara were chosen as subjects.

The reason for choosing this age group is that it is the age group in which awareness about environment and nature starts to shape for the first time if we look at the literature on the pertinent subject. In addition, it constitutes the periods of time when



Figure 1. The location of Eymir Lake and its surroundings in Ankara

the interest towards environment intensifies and physical and mental mobility reaches its highest level. Also, it is highly important for the children to be in relation to natural areas in terms of their development (Ünver, 2014).

The aims of this study are:

- To systematically evaluate the usage process of the Lake Eymir-Mogan which is planned for visitors' recreational (one-day) usage, located in the immediate environment of Ankara city and whose implementation is conducted in terms of the children with orthopedic disabilities.
- To determine the level of meeting the need and requirement of the user with orthopedic disabilities in this field, to identify the place performance value.
- To determine what kind of activities this area is designed and for what kind of activities the children with orthopedic disabilities use this area.
- To determine whether the area meets the needs and demands of the children users with orthopedic disabilities or not.

#### MATERIAL AND METHODS

#### Study Area

As to the study area, the Lake Eymir recreation area and its surroundings is located in the Ankara city macro form and is one of the limited open green areas (Figure 1) (Beklioğlu, 2000; Eyyubi, 2004). The Lake Eymir recreational area, which is located in Ankara city macro form and one of the limited open green areas, is among the privileged areas for increasing urban life quality and creating an image for the city as well as its ecological contributions with its immediate environment to the city ecosystem (Figure 2) (Bilgin, 2009) and for this reason this area has been chosen as the research area. Middle East Technical University is responsible for the management of the area (Gürer, 2014; İnce, 2002; Köç, 2006; Sarıemir, 2009). The reason for choosing this area as a research area is

Also, the area of the Dogan Chaglar Special Education School was used as a material together with students with orthopedic disabilities used as subjects. The reasons for preferring this school are:

- It is a unique Special Education school that has the most ancient history located in Ankara (Elementary, Secondary and High School) (TR. Altındağ District Governor, 2013).
- In every step of the study; the construction of this school (administrative, educational, social, and physical) has enabled to conduct observation studies with children aged 8-12, surveys with the families and teachers, and interviews.

The method used in the study is Post Occupancy Evaluation Method (POE). This method, which constitutes many techniques, is the main method of the study (Groat & Wang, 2002; Preiser, 2002; Presier et al. 1988; Sherman et al. 2005; Whitehouse et al. 2001). Systematical observation, survey, interview technique methods have been used among the techniques, according to the aims of the study. The stages of POE in the Study

Method: Stage I: POE Planning Stage, Stage II: POE Management Stage, Stage III: POE Application Stage (Figure 3).

#### Stage I: POE Planning Phase

#### **Making Presentation in DCSES**

Before starting the study, a presentation consisting of detailed information about the main goal of the study, its scope, and implementation studies was made to the school administrators, teachers, families and, students. The presentation consisted of information about the positive effects of the natural areas on the orthopedically disabled children and the activities that children can do in the Eymir area.

#### Identification of the subject group

The student group aged 8-12 from Ankara DCSES was selected as the subject in the study. There were also children who had mental and speech disorders among them. It was deemed suit-



Figure 2. Eymir Lake Area

able to choose ones with orthopedic disabilities having different characteristics among them and to use them as subjects in order to observe the children's behaviors and reactions on a large scale. The number of the sample observed in this study was four. In this type of observation, given the study purposes, it was not possible to have the natural observation and therefore, the samples were taken to the environment. This, in turn, had a set of limitations and difficulties (such as hard transportation, parent accompany etc.). So this issues made us focus on only four cases.

#### Getting permissions needed for the study

After deciding to conduct surveys, interviews and observation practices about the study, the researchers received permission in order to work in Turkey Governorship of Ankara, Directorate of National Education, DCSES and to enter into the Middle East Technical University Presidency, General Secretariat, area of Lake Eymir and its surroundings on 20-25 May.





Figure 3. The basic design of the research

#### **POE Management Phase**

This stage consisted of three main steps; systematical observation study, survey study with the parents of the children with orthopedic disabilities and interviews.

#### First Step: Systematical Observation

Observation study was organized as a 6-day fieldwork on 20-25 May. This study was conducted with a 15-person team consisting of 4 children with orthopedic disabilities chosen from DCSES, at least one parent that accompany children (mother-father), the counselor from the school, 4 professional observers (academician group), a driver and Antalya Representative of Orienteering Federation (as a one day participant).



Figure 4. Selection of sub-spaces for the observation technique in Lake Eymir

Before starting the observation study, all the places in the area and the activities conducted were explained in order to examine this area and its surroundings. The activities that could be conducted by the children with orthopedic disabilities aged 8-12 were determined. Six sub-places were chosen in the area (Table 1).

Observers took part in the activity as well, because of the fact that the observation tour was an unstructured one. 1 observer for each child was picked and charged from the observer group consisting of the academicians. "A Notation Chart" was used and developed in order to make it easy to observe and record (digitize) the data when it was necessary on the observations. The data obtained through the observations were recorded instantly in whipstitches. These records were kept with the notes taken on the notation chart, observation forms filled right after the observations, and physical recorders (photograph and video recorders).

On the first day of the observation study, children were brought to area 3 which had been planned beforehand in the field of Lake Eymir. Each child was helped to get on a bike. The bikes were 3-wheeled. Children safely sat on the back and their seat belts were fastened. On the second day of the observation study, children were brought to the horse riding area, in other words to the area 4. Each child was brought to the horse riding area, was helped to get on a horse safely and was toured around the children horse riding area 4-5 times with the help of the employees. On the third day of the observation, children were brought to area 1. Area 1 was a premise located on the south side of the lake in an access point to water as explained in the previous chapter. Children viewed the most beautiful

Table 1.6 sub-places were chosen in the research area in order to do planned activities					
1-day	2-day	3-day	4-day	5-day	6-day
To get on a bike	The horse riding	Sightseeing & took photographs	Trip to the forest	Orienteering activities	Playing with the ball
When the second	Total C				

#### Table 2. The description of three orienteering activities

- Game 1 Labyrinth orienteering was conducted as sorting numbers from 1 to 9. The aim of the game was to find the numbers that had been splattered randomly in the activity area and provide them to sort the numbers from 1 to 9 in an order. While doing this sorting, snapping the checkpoints on the floor into the slots through a thread with the electronic ring given to the participants, in the meantime focusing their attention and making believe them that they could do this was among the main goals.
  Game 2 Puzzle orienteering. The aim of this game was to complete the whole puzzle by matching A4-sized 25 orienteering symbols on the paper with the dispersed and tiny symbols. While completing the puzzle, the aim of the game was for the participants to see the piece in the fastest way through ensuring eye, hand, symbol coordination and put it in its place as a puzzle piece. All the children completed this stage successfully.
- Game 3 Snake orienteering. In this game, children followed the snake figure on the picture drawn on the map and passed through the funnels. Participants reached their targets by showing the designated route on the map to the group leaders (Orienteering trainer or observation group) and by going forward in order to pass through the funnels.

landscape of the lake and took photographs in this area. In this area, the observers taught children how to take photographs with a camera. On the fourth day of the observation, children were brought to area 5 in order to observe their stimulation senses. This area was on the north of the lake and right on the roadside. Because of the fact that this area was inclined, bringing them to the area with wheelchairs and their mobility was performed with the support of their parents, observers and the counsellor (Figure 4). On the fifth day of the observation, children were brought to area 2. This area was designed as a basketball field. This area was preferred because of its flat floor and impervious surface in order to conduct orienteering activities to the children. Orienteering trainer in the activity designed three different games. Preparations were made before starting the game. The description of the games explained in Table 2.

On the last day of the observation study (sixth day), they went to the other area which was area 6. It was chosen as the most convenient place for playing with the ball because there was a huge lawn in the area. Children were brought to the lawn after eating something and in this area, they played with the ball with the observers.

#### **Preparing Behavioral Maps**

The data obtained from the notation charts were evaluated via using ArcGIS10.0 program in order to digitalize them. Data points were obtained via GPS and activity routes were determined through following the subjects during the activities. The information of which activities, in which places and for how long they were conducted was digitalized with the Behavioural Maps in Geographical Information System (GIS).

## Second Step: Survey Study with the Parents of the Children with Orthopedic Disabilities

Reasons for making the survey with the parents; to get informed about the performance level of the natural areas around them and about the sufficiency and suitability level of the existing natural areas in Ankara for the disabled children, and to determine what the issues and problems are in terms of them. To know the thoughts of the parents on the subjects of the design of the natural areas (for example area of Eymir) and to suggest them for designers.

The Survey study conducted in this stage consisted of 2 parts as A and B. Questions were usually asked as test form. In addition to that, choices were given in order to give hint in some questions but they were open-ended questions in order that children can write other answers.

#### **Third Step: Interviews**

The last stage of the study was to make interviews. Interviews were made to 4 different groups face to face in accordance with various disciplines with special goals. These were teachers in DCSES (How can the presence of orthopedically disabled children aged 8-12 in the natural areas contribute to them from the viewpoint of the teachers? and so on.), principal or vice princi-

pal of the school (Does he believe in the importance of taking children to these areas and giving education there? and so on.), director or administrator of the area of Lake Eymir which is affiliated to METU (Is there any healing or educative effect of the area of Lake Eymir on the disabled children? and so on.), Doctor/ Psychologist Related to the Education and Rehabilitation of the orthopaedic disabilities (What kind of benefits do the natural areas have in terms of the health of the disabled children? How should be the design of the natural areas towards the disabled children? and so on).

#### **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

#### **Results of Behavioral Maps**

According to the behavioral maps of all the participants, they faced walking problems in all areas (mostly in area 5). Pavements, ramps, and passageways in the areas were not convenient for the proceeding and access to wheelchairs. When the behavioral maps of the participants were compared, it was seen that the participants had shown different behaviours from each other. But some small details were obtained. For example, it was detected that Participant 1 had shown more interest in the animals and birds in the area, wanted to watch and pet the animals s/he came across to, talked and had more conversation with the people around while riding a bike, paid more attention to red flowers (Dutchman's breeches), and succeeded in standing up and shooting the ball with the help of his/ her mother while playing with the ball.

It was observed that the participants had to ask for help from their parents and the observers while riding a horse, playing orienteering games, riding a bike, playing with the ball, and wandering in the areas. The participants conducted the activities with different speed and quality because of the fact that their physical properties and disability levels were different.

#### **Results of the Observation Forms by the Observers**

According to the comments of the observers, it was noticed that almost all the participants had the walking problem with wheelchairs in the chosen sub-places in the area of Lake Eymir. Ramps, pavements, and roads in the areas weren't convenient for them. It was observed that children wanted to touch the water in area 2 but couldn't touch due to the fact that they were in wheelchairs and the water level was low. It was observed that children wanted to touch the water in area 2 but couldn't touch due to the fact that they were in wheelchairs and the water level was low. According to the comments of the observers, the presence of the disabled children in the natural areas showed that it was beneficial for their education. It was seen that the children fancied taking landscape pictures in area 2 and being in the natural areas and playing together made the disabled children socialize more and increased their self-esteem. Orienteering games in area 2 and ball-playing activities in area 6 gave them the opportunity to interact with each other and participants got information about geographical skills, map-read, field survey, and geographical subjects. The area of Lake Eymir and other natural areas like that affect disabled children positively in terms of spirit, the sound of nature; the sound of water, the sound of birds, the sound of leaves, all of them are the factors that bring peace and happiness to the children. It was observed that the facilities in the area of Lake Eymir, for example especially the entrances of WCs, restaurants, and cafes were not designed convenient for the disabled children (Figure 5).

#### **Results of the Survey Conducted by the Parents**

Results of the survey conducted by the parents are shown in Table 3.

#### Results of the Interviews Made with the Teachers of DCOHES

When the teachers were asked whether they used open-green areas of the school or not, all the teachers said that outdoors were important for disabled children but that the schoolyard wasn't convenient for that because some of the children had the mental disability as well as physical disabilities. Thus, they suggested that education settings could be created in the schoolyard. According to the teachers, disabled children do not use schoolyard much and they spend their out of school time at their homes. They also said that plants and animals outside the school drew their attention and they were like a therapy and thought to be positive for them to socialize.

#### Table 3. Results of the survey conducted by the parents

- 79, 3% of the children use wheelchairs and 51% of these children have mental problems. In addition to their orthopedic disabilities, 51, 72% of the children have mental problems and 31, 01% of the children have speech disorders.
- When analyzing the question "How do the parents took part in the research spend their spare time with their children?", it is stated that 25, 9% watch TV, 20, 9% rest in the home, 19, 2% visit relatives-friends, and 11, 7% go to parks. It could be deduced that parents spend their time mostly at home environment instead of taking their children outdoors.
- 23% of the parents couldn't go to open-green areas with their disabled children, 51, 7% couldn't go because they are annoyed from the looks of the people around, 21, 9% have transportation problems and economic shortages.
- In the study, families stated that they preferred these areas mostly on weekends (58, 9% of the families) and they spent maximum 1-3 hours in these areas (59% of the families).
- In the surveys, families stated that animals, birds (18, 1%), nature sounds of the environment, and water elements (12, 3%) drew the attention of 22, 1% of the children in outdoors.
- It was stated that 43% of the children showed interest in flowers and fruit trees and they wanted to touch them.



Figure 5. Pictures taken in the area during the observations

## Results of the Interview Made with the Director/ Manager of the Lake Eymir

The area of the Lake Eymir is open to all kinds of pedestrian use but automobile entrance only belongs to the METU personnel. Any kind of construction is prohibited because of the fact that the area of the Lake Eymir is under protection but road alteration is possible. Activities of the METU rowing team and walking, running, bike-riding activities that everybody could do are provided in the area. Wild animals, fresh air, water activities, natural plants and all elements associated with nature show healing and rehabilitation effects on the disabled children. It is seen that the facilities and activities in the area aren't convenient for the disabled children but road alterations and increase in sports facilities in the future will be beneficial for these children.

## Results of the Interview Conducted with the Principal of DCSES

The principal of the school believes that natural environments are beneficial for the disabled children especially in terms of education. Courses can be given and technical visits can be conducted in schoolyard and schoolyard will be altered for the disabled children in the future. The principal of the school said that the disabled children didn't have important differences from normal children but the disabled children needed more care and their problems stemmed from health problems aside from their orthopedically disabled. He stated that trip programs, picnic activities, and similar organizations for them to socialize were organized for the disabled children but it is important in these trips and picnic activities that the physical place should be accessed easily by the students.

#### Results of the Interview Made with the Related Groups Intended for the Education and Rehabilitation of the Orthopedically Disabled

The number of factors affecting the development of a child increases and changes if there is orthopedically or health deficiency in the child. Aside from the issues that deficiency caused, factors like education level of the family, socio-economic situation, number of siblings, and their environment play a big role in the development of the child. Usually, the problems of the children with orthopedic disabilities are; no physical, language, speech, mental, social, and emotional features unique to them, balance disorder, limitation of movements like walking, running, and climbing, lack of self-esteem, poor motor coordination, adjustment problems, writing difficulties.

Natural and green areas in Ankara city are not useful enough for the disabled children, because of the fact that children with orthopedic disabilities cannot benefit from gardens and parks and there are a lot of reasons for that. Access problem (Families have access problems due to the fact that these parks and natural areas are usually distant, they can only go by their own cars because they cannot go on foot or by public transport vehicles), design drawbacks of the natural areas (especially, roads are not convenient for wheelchair and walking stick users), annoying looks and reactions of the people around are counted among the reasons. Natural areas are the places used for game therapy. Tactile activities; sand and water paintings, trees planted in the garden that provide smells, touchable surfaces or surfaces that direct the child can be conducted in these areas.

Eymir lake and its surroundings, the forested area (area 5)



Recommended ways in the forest area



Figure 6. Suggested arrangements for Eymir Lake and its surroundings

#### Suggestions for the Re-Planning of Lake Eymir and its Surroundings

Altering the Lake Eymir in order to easily access and use the area is more important than making special designs. Decreasing the limitations to the minimum in the natural areas like Lake Eymir and its surroundings in terms of the disabled people and considering them in the design, practice and rearrangement studies should be among the most important goals. In area 5, children had trouble accessing and wandering the area and their families took them to the area. Special walking trails should be constructed in the area, in this way, these areas can transform into an accessible and usable one (Figure 6).

In all the sub-places chosen in the area of the Lake Eymir, it was observed that the usual cause of walking problems was that the flagstones weren't convenient. Width, slope and flooring of pedways and, pavements shouldn't limit the movements of the disability. Curbstones of the pavements are some of the most faced obstacles and poor stones should be especially used in the junction points (Figure 7).

In order for the wheelchair user to make contact with, touch or reach to the plant, elevated flower boxes should be 90 cm from the floor on a minimum 120 cm-wide pedway. Around the Lake Eymir, for example, the heights of the flower pots in area 2 are short, thus disabled children devoid of smelling and discovering them, flower boxes with different heights should be present in the area (Figure 8). Observing terraces can be built in some places of the lake, in this way, children can easily watch the landscape and take pictures (Figure 9). It was observed that some activity areas weren't convenient in the area of Lake Eymir. One of them was the horse-riding area. It was seen that the children with orthopedic disabilities had trouble while getting

on the horse and its reason was that some tools were lacking in the area (Figure 10).

#### CONCLUSION

The study information is analyzed from the post-occupancy evaluation method which includes the questionnaire, interview and, observation. Specifically referring to the questionnaire the analysis in this research is done through the same method as Soltani, et al. (2012) in Malaysia. The result shows that there is a considerable demand for improving the current design and status to boost the needs of children with disabilities in Turkey, especially in Ankara city. Additionally, nature and greenery spaces have healing effect that allows disabled children to socialize themselves with normal children thus, can enhance their confidence level.

The article used behavioral maps to evaluate the designed area in terms of disabled children with the difference that researchers was carried out in the school garden. Similarly, this evaluation method is used by Hussien, 2012 and Hussein & Daud, 2014, research. Overall, the results are roughly the same that children with disabilities are able to play games and participant on similar activities in green space along with other normal kids. In this research, the most important problem of the Eymir lake after its assessment was the routes and the connectivity of the paths, that prevented the accessibility of disabled children especially orthopedic disabled children. This result is the same as Hussein & Daud, 2014 article finding. Moreover the remarkable result of this article was that children with disabilities going to the semiopen spaces around the city are affected by the financial status of the family, the acceptance of disability in the society around and simplicity to access vehicles and transportation services.



orthopedic disabilities

Some ways that have been made in the Eymir lake and its surroundings

Figure 7. Arrangements to be made in Eymir Lake and its surroundings

This study needs to be discussed in a more integrated approach in order for the Lake Eymir and its surroundings to fulfill their healing function especially in terms of the children with orthopedic disabilities. There should be complementary elements of the integrative planning that will be conducted

specifically to this area. Functional analysis and filthiness analysis of natural values of all data layers' levels of interaction and bearing capacity studies (ecologic, physical, visual, economic, and social) resulted from recreational use should be conducted. For this, there is a need for a management plan. The



Figure 8. The size of the flowerpots in the area should be arranged according to the children with disabilities



Figure 9. Viewing terraces must be built to watch the scenery around Eymir Lake and take pictures (Perspectives by Sima Pouya)



Figure 10. Arrangements to be made in the horse riding area

management plan should put forward the organization model in the first step responsible for the area management. An interdisciplinary plan involving the opinions of all parts should be materialized with a participatory approach for the area. The planning should involve levels that provide the protection, improvement, social benefit, and economic development of the area. The importance of the area in terms of people should be again put forward with a vision paper with an approach that represents different layers of society and all walks of life. The disability that represents an important part of the society is included as well. Important functions of the area like protection, creating economic value, social utilization, and economic rehabilitation should describe the parts of the area and zoning should be conducted in this way. The features put forward by different function sections will give hints about which needs are put forward by which activities in which places. This planning approach is resource-based and environmentally sensitive and it will help to define the recreation areas.

**Informed Consent:** Verbal informed consent was obtained from children who participated in this study.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

**Author Contributions:** Concept – S.P., Ö.D.; Design - S.P., Ö.D.; Supervision – Ö.D., S.P.; Resources - S.P., Ö.D.; Materials – S.P.; Data Collection and/or Processing – S.P.; Analysis and/or Interpretation - S.P., Ö.D.; Literature Search – S.P.; Writing Manuscript – S.P.; Critical Review - S.P., Ö.D.

Acknowledgements: We thank Sahar Pouya and Elif Demirel for their assistance in observational activities, Veysel Güler for his assistance in orienteering activities that planned, administrators and students of Doğan Chalar Special Education School for their assistance in observations, interviews and survey studies and Sara Demir for her assistance in the preparation of behaviour maps.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Financial Disclosure:** The authors declared that this study has received financial support of science research projects in Karadeniz Technical University.

#### REFERENCES

- Akın, Z. Ş., 2006. Healing garden for children. Master thesis. Landscape Architecture, University of Ankara, Ankara.
- Barış, E.M., & Uslu, A., 2009. Accessibility for the Disabled People to the Built Environment in Ankara. African Journal of Agricultural Research 4: 801-814.
- Beklioğlu, M., 2000. Göller, Food Chain Destruction and Biomanipulation: Eymir and Mogan Lake, Science and Technical Journal/Bilim ve Teknik. 72-76.

- Bilgin, C., 2009. ODTÜ's Birds 1995-2008, Observation Group.
- Erickson, M.S., 2012. Restorative garden design: Enhancing wellness through healing spaces. *Journal of Art and Design Discourse* 2: 89-101.
- Eyyubi, S., 2004. Using ecosystem management in Turkey as a process for sustainable development, Doctoral thesis, Landscape Architecture, University of Ankara, Ankara.
- Groat, L., & Wang, D., 2002. Architectural research methods. New York.
- Gürer, N., 2014. The Basic Principles Of Recreational Area Design, Case Study: Ankara Eymir Lake. Journal of Recreation and Tourism Research (JRTR) 1(2).
- Harris, M., 1996. The healing garden. Harper Collins Publishers.
- Hussein, H., Daud, M.N., 2014. Examining the methods for investigating behavioral clues of special-schooled children. *Field Methods* 27(1): 97-112. [CrossRef]
- Hussein, H., 2012. The influence of sensory gardens on the behavior of children with special educational needs. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 38: 343-354. [CrossRef]
- İnce, Ö. 2002. Assessing the outcomes of biomanipulation in lake Eymir using physical, chemical and biological parameters, Master thesis, University of Kırıkkale, Biology, Kırıkkale.
- Maralcan, G., Kuru, I., Aydin, U.Y., Altinel, L., Bozan, M.E., Ellidokuz, H., 2003. The prevalence of orthopedic disabilities in the district of Çay, Afyon, Turkey. *Acta Orthopaedica Traumatologica Turcica* 38(5): 343-347.
- Marcus, C.C., Barnes, M., 1999. Healing gardens: Therapeutic benefits and design recommendations. John Wiley & Sons.
- Pouya, S., Demirel Ö, Pouya, S., 2018. Evaluating Children Garden; Utilization and Consumer Satisfaction in Ankara. A|Z ITU Journal of the Faculty of Architecture 15 (1): 47-56.
- Preiser, W.F.E., 2002. The Evolution of Post-Occupancy Evaluation: Toward Building Performance and Universal Design Evaluation, Learning From Our Buildings: A State of the Practice Summary of Post-Occupancy Evaluation. USA: National Academy of Sciences.
- Preiser, W.F.E., Rabinowitz, H.Z., White, W., 1988. Post-Occupancy Evaluation. NY: Van Nostrand Reinhold.
- Sakız, H., Woods, C., 2015. Achieving inclusion of students with disabilities in Turkey: Current challenges and future prospects. *International Journal of Inclusive Education* 19(1): 21-35. [CrossRef]

- Sarıemir, İ., 2009. Impacts on the Gölbaşi Special Environmental Protection Region of Ankara Gölbaşı Mogan Park, Master's thesis, Landscape Architecture, Bartın University, Bartın. Turkey.
- Soltani, S.H.K., Abbas, M.Y., Awang, M.B., 2012. Disabled children in public playgrounds: A pilot study. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences* 36: 670-676. [CrossRef]
- Söderback, I., Söderström, M., Schälander, E. 2004. Horticultural therapy: the 'healing garden and gardening in rehabilitation measures at Danderyd Hospital Rehabilitation Clinic, Sweden. *Pediatric Rehabilitation* 7(4): 245-260. [CrossRef]
- Stigsdotter, U., Grahn, P., 2003. Experiencing a garden: A healing garden for people suffering from burnout diseases. *Journal of Therapeutic Horticulture* 14: 38-49.
- Şafak, P., Pouya S., 2016. Evaluation of Disabled Children in Turkey with the Aim of their Needs to Green Space. *Journal of Environmental Protection and Ecology* 17(4): 1575-1581.
- Sherman, S.A., Varni, J.W., Ulrich, R.S., Malcarne, V.L., 2005. Post-occupancy evaluation of healing gardens in a pediatric cancer center. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 73(2): 167-183. [CrossRef]
- TR. Altındağ District Governor, 2013. Doğan Çağlar Engelliler Secondary School.
- Ulrich, R.S., (1999). Effects of gardens on health outcomes: Theory and research. Healing gardens. Therapeutic Benefits and Design Recommendations 27: 86.
- Ünver E, 2014. Relationship between physical activity level and 6-minute walk test in pre-pubertal boys, Master Thesis, Sports Sciences and Technology, Hacettepe University, Ankara.
- Whitehouse, S., Varni, J.W., Seid, M., Cooper-Marcus, C., Ensberg, M.J., Jacobs, J.R., Mehlenbeck, R.S., 2001. Evaluating a children's hospital garden environment: Utilization and consumer satisfaction. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 21(3): 301-314. [CrossRef]
- Yalçın, N., 2011. Yalçın, N. 2011. Child abuse in Turkey and solution proposal, Unpublished master Project, İstanbul.
- Yorulmaz, Ç., 2010. Examining The Problems Encountered While Helping The Orthopedically Individuals In Skill Training Processed In Institutions That Provide Training To Orthopedically Handicapped People, Master Thesis, Gazi University, Decorative Products Training Ankara.

### Geology and woods of a new fossil forest from the Early Miocene of Gökçeada (Turkey)

### Gökçeada'nın Erken Miyosen döneminden yeni bir fosil ormanın jeolojisi ve ağaçları

Yıldırım Güngör<sup>1</sup> 💿, Ünal Akkemik<sup>2</sup> 💿, Cem Kasapçı<sup>1</sup> 💿, Ece Başaran<sup>1</sup> 💿

<sup>1</sup>Deparment of Geology Engineering, İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Engineering, 34320, İstanbul, Turkey <sup>2</sup>Department of Forest Botany, İstanbul University-Cerrahpaşa, Faculty of Forestry, 34473, İstanbul, Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

In Gökçeada, metamorphic, sedimentary and volcanic rocks from the period covering the Paleozoic to the Upper Miocene periods have formed outcrops over time. A newly identified fossil forest site in Gökçeada covers an area of approximately 1.5 square kilometers of land situated near the coastline. Silicified trees in the area from the early Miocene period were observed to present three phases of pyroclastic deposition, namely: the complete silicification phase, the half silicification phase and the coal phase. The purpose of this study is to present the paleobiology and paleoecology of the wood flora and the geological formation of the fossil forest site, and to evaluate this information in terms of paleoclimatology. Sixteen (16) petrified pieces of wood thought to have originated from the upper slopes and found on the sea shore were collected, with three planes of thin sections taken from each one. A total of 12 types of woods were identified, as follows: three conifers (*Cupressinoxylon, Sequoioxylon* and *Pinoxylon*) and nine angiosperms (*Alnoxylon, Carpinoxylon, Ostry-oxylon, Palmoxylon* type 1 and 2, *Fagoxylon, Quercoxylon* sect. *Ilex, Laurinoxylon* and *Platanoxylon*). The wood composition in Gökçeada is similar to that of the wood flora of the Miocene in Lesvos, showing the presence of riparian, well-drained lowland and coastal trees.

Keywords: Çanakkale, Early Miocene, Gökçeada, petrified wood, pyroclastics

#### ÖΖ

Gökçeada'da metamorfik, tortul ve volkanik kayaçlar Paleozoyik'ten Üst Miyosen'e kadar uzanmaktadır. Silisleşmiş ağaçlar erken Miyosen döneminden olup üç farklı evreye sahip piroklastiklerde gözlenmiştir. Bu fazlar tam silisleşme fazı, yarım silisleşme fazı ve kömür fazıdır. Yeni fosil orman alanı yaklaşık 1.5 kilometrekarelik bir alanı kapsamakta ve deniz kıyısına yakın yerlerde bulunmaktadır. Çalışmanın amacı, bu fosil ormandaki ağaçları tespit etmek, fosil orman alanı oluşumu belirlemek ve paleoklimatolojik açıdan değerlendirmektir. Üst yamaçlardan deniz kıyısına taşınan 16 adet taşlaşmış ağaç parçası toplanmış ve her birinin üç yönünden ince kesitler alınmıştır. Toplam 12 farklı odun tipi tespit edilmiştir. Bunlar üç kozalaklı (*Cupressinoxylon, Sequoioxylon ve Pinoxylon*) ve dokuz angiosperm cinsidir (*Alnoxylon, Carpinoxylon, Ostryoxylon, Palmoxylon*, tip 1 ve 2, *Fagoxylon, Quercoxylon sect. Ilex, Laurinoxylon* ve *Platanoxylon*). Gökçeada'daki ağaç bileşimi, Midilli Adası'nın Miyosen yaşlı ağaç florasına oldukça benzemektedir. Bu ağaç bileşimi nehir kıyısı, iyi drenajlı alçak kesim ve kıyıya yakın bir orman varlığını göstermektedir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Çanakkale, Erken Miyosen, Gökçeada, piroklastik, silisleşmiş ağaç

#### INTRODUCTION

Palaeobotany studies concerning petrified wood have revealed valuable information about forests dating back to the late Oligocene and the late Miocene forests as well as the climate of Turkey (e.g. Özgüven, 1971; Sayadi, 1973; Selmeier, 1990; Dernbach et al., 1996; Akkemik et al. 2009; Aytuğ and Şanlı, 1974; Eroskay and Aytug, 1982; Şanlı, 1982; Aras et al. 2003; Akkemik and Sakınç, 2013; Akkemik et al., 2016; Akkemik et al., 2017; Bayam et al., 2018). These studies showed that forests were composed of both conifers and broad-leaved trees. In riparian forests there were trees such as palmae,

#### Cite this paper as:

Güngör, Y., Akkemik, Ü., Kasapçı, C., Başaran, E., 2019. Geology and woods of a new fossil forest from the Early Miocene of Gökçeada (Turkey). *Forestist* 69(1): 22-34.

Corresponding author: Ünal Akkemik e-mail: uakkemik@istanbul.edu.tr

*Received Date:* 05.04.2018 *Accepted Date:* 23.10.2018

Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International Licence. Salix, Populus and Liquidambar, in swampy areas there were Sequoia, Taxodium and Glyptostrobus, and in well-drained lands, the forests were composed of Pinus, Juniperus, Picea, Cedrus, Podocarpus, Quercus (ilex type), Acer, Ulmus, Zelkova, Prunus, Salix, and Fraxinus etc. The resulting climate produced from this vegetation structure was a warm climate from the late Oligocene to the middle Miocene periods. The genera of Taxodioxylon, Pinoxylon, Quercus and Alnus were identified in the well-known fossil forests site, Lesvos Petrified Forest by Süss and Velitzelos (1994 a, b) and Velitzelos (1996, 1997).

A new petrified forest (fossil forest) site was found located on the island of Gökceada, which is one of the larger islands in the Aegean Sea. Petrified wood can be found on both the soil surface and within the soil. Small and large wood pieces can be found in the material that has moved downwards from the upper slopes. The geology of the island was well-studied. Akartuna (1950) and Okut (1975) performed the first significant geological studies in Gökçeada, and these studies were used widely during the construction of geological maps. Following this, the characteristics of Tertiary volcanism in Gökçeada was investigated in detail by Ercan et al. (1995), Temel and Çiftçi (2002), Kesgin and Varol (2003), Varol and Baykal (2008), Koral et al. (2008), and at this point the island's 1/100000 scale geology map was published by Ilgar et al. (2008). More recently, Basaran et al. (2015 and 2016) studied Gökçeada's geopark potential, and Sarı et al. (2015) examined in detail the magmatic and volcanic rocks of Gökçeada.

The purpose of this study was to present the wood flora and formation of the fossil forest site, and to evaluate this data in terms of paleoclimatology.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

Gökçeada is an Aegean island, located at the entrance of Saros Bay to the north of the Aegean Sea, west of Gelibolu, and to the north of Lesvos (Figure 1). The fossil forest site is located on the south of the island. Silicified trees were found in an area up to 200 m above sea level. They were found in materials propelled along during the volcanic eruption and surfaced with the wear of the material above (Figure 2). A total of 16 samples were collected from the area. Preservation states were variable - while many of the samples were well-preserved, some were quite poorly preserved. However, most of the samples were of sufficient condition for identification.

For wood identification purposes, we took thin sections from three planes (the transverse section (TS) radial longitudinal section (RLS) and tangential longitudinal section (TLS)) from all specimens. Identification of the silicified woods was performed at the Tree-ring Research and Wood Anatomy Laboratory in the Forest Botany Department of the Faculty of Forestry, Istanbul University.

For identification, the wood anatomy reference book collection housed in the Forest Botany Department of the Faculty of Forestry, University of Istanbul were used (e.g. Jacquiot 1955; Greguss 1955; Greguss 1967; Barefoot and Hankins 1982; Fahn et al. 1986; Schweingruber 1990; Tidwell 1998; Eliçin 1977; Akkemik and Yaman, 2012). Additionally, an online database called InsideWood (http://insidewood.lib.nsc.edu), was another informative reference for wood identification. When using specific terminology, together with the aforementioned references, we followed the descriptions given in the IAWA Committee (1989) for hardwood identification and IAWA Committee (2004) for softwood identification wherever possible.



#### General Geology of Gökçeada

The general geology of Gökçeada was summarized based on the related reference (Akartuna, 1950; Okut, 1975; Akartuna and



Figure 2. Some fossil wood in the field. 1-4) Petrified woods, 5) A wood sample, which has turned to coal, 6) A long petrified wood stem

Atan, 1978; Ercan et al., 1995; Temel and Ciftci, 2002; Kesgin and Varol, 2003; Varol and Baykal, 2008; Koral et al., 2008; Ilgar et al, 2008; Başaran et al., 2015, 2016; Sarı et al., 2015) as follows (Figure 3). The oldest unit in the study area is the Late Ediakaran/Early Paleozoic age Çamlıca Metamorphics, containing a sericite schist, a chlorite schist, slate and marble. This unit is located on Dağiçi Tepe on the north-west of Gökçeada and have fault outcrops. Camlica Metamorphites have been unconformably overlaid by the Early Eocene age Karaağaç formation. The Karaağaç Formation includes submarine fan deposits, rhyolitic lavas, sandstone, claystone marl alternations and formed outcrops between Gizli Liman and Mutludere in Gökceada. These rhyolitic volcanic rocks, cutting across the Çamlıca metamorphites and intruding into the Karaağac Formation, are the oldest volcanic units in the study area. These units were seen to be of columnar shape and composed of rhyolitic lava and tuffs (Temel and Çiftçi, 2002).

The Middle Eocene age Koyunbaba Formation is composed of platform carbonates and overlies the Karaağaç Formation unconformably. This unit starts with conglomerate at its base and continues with conglomerate-sandstone-siltstone and marl alternations towards the top.

The Soğucak Formation conformably covers the Koyunbaba Formation and is characterized by an abundance of Nummulites sp. fossils (Varol and Baykal, 2008). This formation is composed of shallow marine carbonates. The Middle-Upper Eocene aged Ceylan Formation is composed of claystone-sandstone-shale intercalations and lies conformably on the Soğucak Formation. This formation has been conformably overlaid by the Early Oligocene age Mezardere Formation which is composed of conglomerate-sandstone-siltstone and marl alternations. Both the



Figure 3. Geological map of the study area (Modified after Koral et al., 2008 and Sarı et al., 2015)

Ceylan and Mezardere sedimentary units are turbiditic deposits of a deep marine sedimentary environment. These units are cut by subvolcanics at different levels. The lower parts of these subvolcanics are identified as the Mutludere Intrusion, which consists of diorite-monzodorites (Sarı et al., 2015).

The Late Oligocene age Gökçeada Ignimbrite in the east and south part of the Island, is composed of pumice flows and lies uncomformably on the Mezardere Formation. The Early Miocene age Kesmekaya volcanics are covered by these pumice flows and composed of basaltic andesite, andesitic Iava and pyroclastic rocks. The entire section is covered by the Upper Miocene age Çanakkale Formation in the study area (Figure 3).

#### **RESULT AND DISCUSSION**

#### Formation Pattern of the Fossil Forest

The fossil forest was analysed in the pyroclastics in the study area (Figure 2). This fossil forest was observed in three different levels within this unit. These phases are (1) the complete silicification phase, (2) the semi-silicification phase and (3) the coalification phases. These phases, observed within the same unit, indicated that the trees were the same age but were formed in different sedimentary environments in a short interval. The main volcanic activities of the Early Miocene period completely buried these forest after which, complete silisification occurred. These samples were clearly observed in the study area. Pyroclastic flow swept the majority of the forest towards the sea and some of this banked on the shore zone. The Semi-silicification and coalification phases also occurred in these banked forest units. Due to the tectonic uplift of the Island, burned out segments of forest were observed as coal fragments in cliffs and were rapidly eroded. This fossil forest, located in the east part of the study area, occurred within the Early Miocene age pyroclastic debris flow and Quaternary colluvial fan deposits.

#### Wood Flora of the Fossil Forest

Twelve different wood types of conifers and broad-leaved trees were identified (Table 1). All woods were catalogued by add-

ing "xylon" at the end of the name such as Alnoxylon, Pinoxylon, Fagaceoxylon and Seqoioxylon. Quercus woods can be identified as section levels (sec. Cerris, sec. Ilex, sec. Quercus). In Gökçeada, Quercus woods were identified as Quercoxylon section Ilex (evergreen oaks) (Table 1). The name Sequoioxylon includes the genera Sequoia, Sequoiadendron and Metasequoia, due to having very similar wood features. The identification details and wood features were given for each wood type below.

#### Systematic palaeobotany

#### Cupressinoxylon (Cypress)

Family CUPRESSACEAE Rich. ex Bartling 1830 Genus CUPRESSINOXYLON Göppert 1850

Material: Material no. 4.

**Locality:** East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and near to the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Tree-ring border distinct. Gradual transition from earlywood to latewood. No resin canal in cross section; axial parenchyma very common, and horizontal walls slightly nodular. Cross-field pitting cupressoid. 2-3 (1-4) pits per cross-field. Rays homogenous. Ray height 1-15 cells (mostly 6-7 cells), uniseriate or sometimes partly biseriate. Pitting on radial walls of tracheids uniseriate. Tracheidal pitting also common on the tangential walls (Plate I).

**Discussion:** The name of this type of wood was proposed as *Cupressinoxylon* by Bamford et al (2002). Due to having cupressoid type cross-field pits, gradual transition from earlywood to latewood, wood growth ring boundary distinct, 1-15 cells of ray height, abundant axial parenchyma cells, tracheidal pitting on tangential walls, and slightly nodular walls of axial parenchyma cells (Figueiral et al., 1999; Klusek, 2014; Pujana et al., 2014), wood identification leads us to *Cupressinoxylon*. Similar woods

Sample No	Groups	Family	Identification
4	Gymnosperms	Cupressaceae	Cupressinoxylon
211p			Sequoioxylon
260		Pinaceae	Pinoxylon
3	Monocotyledonous	Araceae	Palmoxylon type 1
259			Palmoxylon type 2
231	Dicotyledonous	Betulaceae	Alnoxylon
1			Carpinoxylon
2			Ostryoxylon
257		Fagaceae	Fagoxylon
5e, 5ece2, 202			Quercoxylon section llex
1ok, 5, 261		Lauraceae	Laurinoxylon

Table 1. Woods identified and their sample numbers. The gymnosperms listed first and then angiosperms in the table

were described from the early Miocene of central Anatolia as *Juniperus* by Akkemik et al. (2016). *Juniperus* woods have very low ray cells and a space between tracheids in cross-field (Akkemik et al., 2016). Today, the genus of *Cupressus* L. is represented by one species (*Cupressus sempervirens* L.) across the Mediterranean region, and is common in coastal areas.

#### Sequoioxylon (Redwood)

Family CUPRESSACEAE Rich. ex Bartling 1830 Genus SEQUOIOXYLON Torrey 1923

Material: Material no. 211p.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Distinct tree-ring border with 2-13 rows of latewood tracheids. No resin canal in cross-section; axial parenchyma common, and horizontal walls generally smooth or slightly nodular. Rays homogenous in general, and there are rarely ray tracheids present. Cross-field pitting is taxodioid and rarely cupressoid. Ray height is 3-15 cells, uniseriate or rarely partly biseriate (Plate II).



Plate I. *Cupressinoxylon* sections. 1) A transversal section with dense axial parenchyma, 2) Tangential section, 3) Slightly nodular end wall of axial parenchyma, 4) Cupressoid type cross-field pits, 5) Tracheidal pitting on tangential walls of tracheids

**Discussion:** This type of wood is very common in the European part of Turkey (Özgüven, 1971; Akkemik et al., 2005; Sakınç et al., 2007; Akkemik and Sakınç, 2013), in Çamlıdere (Akkemik et al., 2009), and in Kızılcahamam (Bayam et al, 2018). Today, this genus is extinct throughout Europe and Asia.

#### Pinoxylon (Pine)

Family PINACEAE Sprengel ex F. Rudolphi, 1830 Genus PINOXYLON Knowlton 1900

Material: Material no. 260.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundaries distinct, and a gradual transition from earlywood to latewood. Longitudinal resin canals visible with thin-walled epithelial cells. Tracheid pitting in radial walls in earlywood uniseriate. Latewood tracheids thick-walled, and no helical thickening. No axial parenchyma observed. Rays are heterogeneous and those without horizontal resin canals, exclusively uniseriate, rays with resin canals partly multiseriate. Ray tracheid present, but walls not



Plate II. *Sequoioxylon* sections. 1) Transversal section without resin canal, 2) Tangential section with high rays, 3) Taxodioid type cross-field pits on radial section, 4) Smooth end wall of axial parenchyma

visible clearly on the section. Pinoid type of cross-field pits distinct, and two pits per cross-field observed in general. Ray height 1-12 cells (Plate III).

**Discussion:** This type of wood was identified from Early Miocene of Central Anatolia (Akkemik et al., 2016; Bayam et al., 2018) and in Lesvos (Velitzelos and Zouros, 1997). Vertical resin canals, heterogenous rays with ray tracheids and horizontal resin canals, and pinoid type of cross-field pits are the clear features of pine woods. All these features were observed in the petrified wood, and then it was identified as *Pinoxylon*. Today, it is represented by 5 different 2-needle species in Turkey. Pinoid type cross-field pits may be used in identification of the modern species by using the key given in Akkemik and Yaman (2012). The fossil wood is rather similar to the modern *Pinus pinea* L. with their cross-field pits, therefore this wood may be named *Pinus* cf. *pinea*.

#### Palmoxylon (Palms)

Family ARECACEAE Schultz Sch. 1832 Genus PALMOXYLON Schenk 1882

Material: Material no.s. 3 and 259.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.



Plate III. *Pinoxylon* sections. 1-2) Transversal sections with resin canal, 3) Tangential section with horizontal resin canal, 4) Heterocelluler rays with pinoid (slightly windows-like)

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description of type 1 (Sample No: 3):** The wood is made up of small vascular bundles, measuring around 200-300  $\mu$ m in diameter, scattered in loosely packed parenchymatous ground tissue. They comprise 4-8 wider and around 100  $\mu$ m in length, closely spaced metaxylem vessels together with more small ones. The shapes of the metaxylem vessels are clearly ellipsoid (Plate IV).

**Wood description of type 2 (Sample No: 259):** The wood has small vascular bundles, measuring less than 200-250  $\mu$ m in diameter. They are distributed throughout the parenchymatous ground tissue through the wood. They comprise numerous, small (less than 50  $\mu$ m in diameter) closely spaced metaxylem vessels together with smaller ones. The shapes of the metaxylem vessels are clearly circular (Plate V).

**Discussion:** This type of monocotyledon wood was identified from Seben Fossil Forest in Bolu for the first time (Akkemik et al., 2016). It is also found in Lesvos island (Zouros et al., 2004). These two types of wood are different from the wood found in Seben Fossil Forest, which had 2-4 vessels in each vascular bundle found (Akkemik et al., 2016). The modern palm wood in Turkey is *Phoenix theophrasti*, and mostly restricted to the southwest Anatolia (Boydak, 1983, 1985). This identification may be



Plate IV. *Palmoxylon* type 1. 1) Transversal section of the wood, 2) Vascular bundle with elipsoid vessels elements
considered as an indicator genus for paleoclimatic evolution of the early Miocene of Gökçeada.

#### Alnoxylon (Alder)

Family BETULACEAE Gray 1822 Genus ALNOXYLON Felix 1884

Material: Material no. 231.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

#### Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundary generally distinct. Wood diffuse porous, and vessels arranged in no specific pattern, solitary or commonly in radial multiples of 2-4 or more. Solitary vessel outline angular. Perforation plate scalariform with 10-30 bars. Intervessel pits opposite and small. No helical thickening observed. Mean tangential diameter of vessel lumina 50-100  $\mu$ m in earlywood and less than 50  $\mu$ m in latewood. 40-100 vessels per square mm. Rays were exclusively uniseriate and all rays procumbent. Aggregate rays visible. Ray number per square mm more than 12. Maximum ray height could not be observed (Plate VI).



Plate V. *Palmoxylon* type 2. 1) Transversal section of the wood, 2) Vascular bundle with rounded vessels elements

**Discussion:** Features such as vessel diffuse porous, aggregate rays, vessels in radial rows of up to 4 or more, scalariform perforation plates (with 20-30 bars) are the characteristics for *Alnus* wood (Akkemik and Yaman,2012). We determined all these features on the wood. *Alnoxylon* was also determined by Selmeier (2001) from the middle to the late Miocene of North West Anatolia. Selmeier and Velitzelos (2000) described *Alnoxylon* from the early Miocene of Lesvos Island and from Oligocene volcanic series of Thrace, NE Greece. This genus was one of the most common trees in riparian vegetation during Miocene (Denk et al, 2017a; Güner et al., 2017). Today, the genus *Alnus* is represented by two species in Turkey, *Alnus glutinosa* (L.) Gaertn. and *Alnus orientalis* Decne. They are the main elements of riparian vegetation.

#### Carpinoxylon (Hornbeam)

Family BETULACEAE Gray 1822 Genus CARPINOXYLON Vater 1884

Material: Material no. 1.

**Locality:** East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene



Plate VI. *Alnoxylon* sections. 1-2) Transveral section with aggregate rays, 3) Scalarifom perforation plates, 3) *Tangential section of the wood* 

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundaries indistinct. Wood diffuse porous and vessels arranged in radial multiples, and generally in a dendritic pattern. Radial clusters of vessels very common and solitary vessels rather rare. Perforation plate simple. Fibers thick-walled. Axial parenchyma commonly apotracheal diffuse and diffuse-in-aggregate, and in narrow and short tangential bands. Ray width 1-3 seriate, and in some rays, one to four rows of square marginal cells present. Rays per millimeter more than 12, and ray height 1-30 cells (Plate VII).

**Discussion:** *Carpinus* wood has growth rings having distinct or indistinct boundary, diffuse porous and vessels in radial multiples, simple or scalarifom perforation (with 2-3 bars), and aggregate rays (Akkemik and Yaman, 2012). In the fossil wood, similar features were observed. However, clearly indistinct growth ring boundary, dendritic arrangement of vessels and lower rate of aggregate rays are small changes from the modern represantatives. This genus is represented by two species in Turkey - *Carpinus orientalis* Mill. and *Capinus betulus* L. in the humid and well-drained lowlands and upland forests.

#### Ostryoxylon (Hophornbeam)

Family BETULACEAE Gray 1822 Genus OSTRYOXYLON Ü. Akkemik 2018

Material: Material no. 2.



Plate VII. *Carpinoxylon* sections. 1-2) Transversal sections of the wood, 3) Rays in tangential section, 4) Simple perforation plate

**Locality:** East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline. **Age:** Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundaries distinct with 1-2 rows of marginal fiber cells. Wood diffuse-porous, and vessels arranged in radial multiples 2-4 or more (up to 13 vessels). Perforation plates simple and intervessel pits mostly alternate. Mean tangential diameter of vessel lumina less than 50 µm. Vessel frequency 50-100 per square mm. Helical thickening on vessels very common. Axial parenchyma present and diffuse. Rays width 1-4 seriate, and aggregate rays present. Rays heterocellular; body ray cells procumbent with mostly 1-4 rows of upright and / or square marginal cells. Rays per mm were more than 12. Maximum ray height up to 71 cells (Plate VIII).

**Discussion:** In spite of the fossil wood of *Ostrya* being very similar to that of *Carpinus*, the presence of helical thickening in *Ostrya* wood is the main difference between these two genera. This type of wood may have procumbent or heterocellular rays, simple or scalariform perforation plates, 1-3 seriate or 4-to 10 seriate of rays together with helical thickening in vessels (Suzuki and Watari, 1994; Jeong et al., 2009). Because our wood has very similar features to those of the fossil wood *Ostrya*, we have identified this wood as *Ostryoxylon*. This is the first description of this fossil-genus in Turkey. The modern representative of this genus is *Ostrya carpinifolia* Scop. in Turkey, and grows in well-drained



Plate VIII. *Ostroyoxylon* sections. 1) Transversal section, 2) Simple perforation plates and helical thickening on the walls of vessels, 3) Heterocellular rays, 4) Rays in tangential section

upland forests in the Mediterranean region and lowland and upland forest of Black Sea region of Turkey.

#### Fagoxylon (Beech)

Family FAGACEAE Dumort. 1829 Genus FAGOXYLON Stopes and Fujli 1910

Material: Material no. 257.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

#### Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundary distinct. In the border of growth ring, vessel number decreases and thick-walled fibers increase. Wood diffuse to semi-ring porous. Pores frequent and more than 100 per square mm. Vessels solitary and clustered. Intervessel pits opposite and alternate. Perforation plate mostly simple, rarely scalariform. Mean tangential diameter of vessel lumina around 50 µm. No helical thickening observed. Axial parenchyma commonly apotracheal diffuse and diffuse-in-aggregate. Rays uniseriate to multiseriate. Width of multiseriate rays more than 10 cells. All ray cells procumbent. Rays per millimeter 4-12, and height of multiseriate rays more than 1 mm (Plate IX).



Plate IX. *Fagoxylon* sections. 1-2) Transversal section with narrow and very wide rays. Wood semi-ring porous, 3) Tangential section of the wood

**Discussion:** *Fagoxylon* was described in Turkey for the first time. The presence of distinct annual ring boundary, diffuse porous, distribution of 1-3 seriate and more than 10 seriate of rays through wood, and long rays (>1 mm) showed the features of the wood of *Fagus*. Leaves and other macrofossils of the genus *Fagus* were identified by Denk et al. (2017a) and Güner et al. (2017) from a different region of Turkey. This was a common genus in the early Miocene forests (Denk et al., 2017a; Güner et al., 2017). Today, this genus is represented by two species (*Fagus orientalis* Lipsky and *F. sylvatica* L.) in the lowland and upland humid forest sites of Turkey.

#### Quercoxylon section Ilex (Evergreen oak)

Family FAGACEAE Dumort. 1829 Genus QUERCOXYLON Hofmann 1929 Section ILEX

Material: Material nos. 5e, 5ece2, and 202.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundaries mostly distinct or indistinct, and wood diffuse porous. Transition from earlywood vessels to latewood indistinct, and from one ring to the next. Vessels exclusively solitary, these solitary vessels are rounded, and walls of vessels are thick. Perforation plate simple. Mean tangential diameter of vessel lumina 100-200  $\mu$ m in earlywood, and 50-100  $\mu$ m in the latewood, and 5-20 vessels per square mm. Axial parenchyma commonly diffuse, in narrow and short tangential bands and scanty paratracheal. Rays in two distinct sizes, uniseriate and multiseriate (more than 10-seriate and extremely broad). In multiseriate rays, height more than 1 mm. All ray cells procumbent, and 4-12 rays per millimeter. Tyloses common in vessels of earlywood (Plate X).

**Discussion:** The former studies showed that evergreen sclerophyllous oaks (*Quercus* section *llex*) of Turkey belong to a wider Eurasian group of evergreen oaks (Denk & Grimm, 2009; Denk & Grimm, 2010; Hubert et al., 2014; Hipp et al., 2015). This type of wood is rather common in the early Miocene through Turkey (Akkemik et al., 2016; Bayam et al., 2018). Today, Turkey is represented by three evergreen oak species. They are *Quercus coccifera*, which is a common macchie element, *Q. ilex* which is a rare macchie element growing throughout the coastal areas of Black, Aegean and the Mediterranean Seas, and *Q. aucheri*, which is an endemic species growing locally in southwestern Turkey and the Greek island of Kos.

#### Laurinoxylon (Laurel)

Family LAURACEAE Juss. 1789 Genus LAURINOXYLON Felix 1890

Material: Material nos. 10k, 5, and 261.

Locality: East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth ring boundaries distinct, marked by thick-walled latewood fibres. Vessel diffuse-porous, and arranged in no specific pattern, solitary, and radial multiples of 2-3 vessels. Perforation plates simple. Intervessel pits alternate and small-sized (4-7  $\mu$ m). Shape of the alternate pits polygonal. Mean tangential diameter of vessel lumina 50-100  $\mu$ m and the number of vessels per square mm 20-40. Axial parenchyma was scanty paratracheal, and strand length 1 to 4 cells. Ray width 1 to 3 cells, and body ray cells procumbent with one row of upright and/or square marginal cells. 4-12 rays per mm. Oil cells commonly present, and associated with ray parenchyma (Plate XI).

**Discussion:** *Laurinoxylon* including the the genera, *Laurus* and *Ocotea* is one of the most common wood types in the Miocene time. Many different woods of this morphogenus have been identified (Prakash et al., 1971; van der Burgh et al., 1973; lamandei and lamandei, 1997; Cevallos-Ferriz et al., 2016; Jud and Dunham, 2017). The presence of oil and/or mucilage cells in rays, diffuse porous, distinct boundary of growth ring, 1-3 seriate of ray cells, vasicentric type of axial parenchyma are the typical features of *Laurinoxylon*. We observed all of these features. Güner et al. (2017) and Denk et al. (2017a) identified Laucaceae type leaves from western and central Turkey as well. Today, only one genus and species of Lauraceae, *Laurus nobilis* L., represents the family in Turkey. This species grows in the warm, humid and semi-humid lowland areas throughout coastal Turkey.



Plate X. *Quercoxylon* sect. Ilex sections. 1-2) Transversal sections, 3) Tangential section with narrow and very wide rays, 4) Vessel with simple perforation plate

#### Platanoxylon (Plane)

Family PLATANACEAE T. Lestib. 1826 Genus PLATANOXYLON E. Hofmann 1952

Material: Material no. 258.

**Locality:** East of Eşelek Village - Gökçeada, and on the coastline.

Age: Early Miocene

**Wood description:** Growth rings boundary distinct, marked by distended rays and by thick-walled and radially flattened latewood fibers. Wood diffuse-porous, and vessels arranged in no specific pattern, and generally solitary and rarely in radial multiples. Shape of the solitary vessel outline angular. Perforation plates both simple and scalariform. Scalariform perforation plates mostly with 10-20 bars. Intervessel pits opposite. Vessel diameter 50-100 µm. Vessel frequency 40-100 per square mm. Axial parenchyma diffuse-in-aggregates and scanty paratracheal. All ray cells procumbent (homocellular). Rays distended at growth ring boundaries, and mostly multiseriate, larger rays commonly both 4- to 10-seriate and > 10-seriate. Ray height generally more than 1 mm. Prismatic crystals common in procumbent ray cells (Plate XII).



Plate XI. *Laurinoxylon* sections. 1) Transversal section with diffuse porous, 2) Tangential section with 1-3 rows of rays, 3-4) Heterocellular rays with oil cells on the borders, and simple perforation plates

**Discussion:** Wood of *Platanus* is rather similar to that of *Fagus* (Akkemik and Yaman, 2012). Woods of both of these two genera were described in this study. In *Platanoxylon*, the features are (1) rays distended at growth ring boundaries, (2) rays densely multiseriate (>10 seriate), (3) vessels exclusively solitary (90% or more), (4) perforation plates predominantly scalarifom, and (5) prismatic crystals common in rays. In contrast, *Fagoxylon* has (1) different sizes of rays, (2) no prismatic crystals in rays, (3) both simple and scalariform perforation plates. This type of wood, *Platanoxylon*, was described for the first time in Turkey. Today, *Platanus orientalis* L. is the unique plane species in the Mediterranean Basin. The fossil plane described here may be the ancestor of the present species.

#### Paleoclimatology of the Fossil Forest

The petrified wood materials collected from the coastline were materials which had moved from the upper areas to the shoreline. It was possible to evaluate a total of 12 wood types, belonging to different vegetation units defined by Denk et al. (2017a,b,c), as evidence of this movement (Table 2).

Among the 12 different wood types, *Pinoxylon* and *Cupressinox-ylon* may be considered as members of well-drained (lowland and) upland conifer forests. *Sequoioxylon* may be a member of a swamp, riparian or well drained lowland forest type. *Palmoxylon* woods may be seen as plants indicating subtropical, humid



Plate XII. *Platanoxylon* setions. 1) Transversal section with wide rays and diffuse porous, 2) Wide rays with prismatic crystals, 3) Scalariform perforation plate

forest and, swamp or riparian vegetation. Two types of palm woods are members of these types of forests together with *Alnoxylon* and *Platanoxylon* (Table 2).

Finally, we can conclude that the following wood genera might be members of a forest from the lowlands to the uplands in the early Miocene of Gökçeada: *Palmoxylon, Sequoioxylon, Alnoxylon, Platanoxylon, Laurinoxylon, Cupressinoxylon, Quercoxylon* section *Ilex, Pinoxylon, Carpinoxylon, Ostryoxylon,* and *Fagoxylon*. Very similar results to the petrified woods of the Island Lesvos (Velitzelos et al., 2014) were obtained. *Sequoioxylon* (known as *Taxodioxylon gypsacum* in Lesvos), *Palmoxylon, Fagoxylon, Alnoxylon, Laurinoxylon* and *Quercuxylon* section *Ilex* were also identified from the island of Lesvos.

Within this wood vegetation the presence of palm trees may indicate that the climate in Gökçeada was both subtropical (warm and humid) and mountainous. The early Miocene palaeobotany studies on macrofossils (Denk et al., 2017a,b,c; Güner et al., 2017), microfossils (Akgün et al., 2007; Akkiraz et al., 2011), and petrified woods (Akkemik et al., 2005; Akkemik et al., 2009; Akkemik and Sakınç, 2013; Akkemik et al., 2016 and 2017; Bayam et al., 2018) revealed that the climate during the early Miocene period was subtropical warm and humid. The results from this study also supported the presence of a similar climate type in Gökçeada.

#### CONCLUSION

Petrified wood materials revealed a very rich wood flora in Gökçeada with 12 types of different woods (*Palmoxylon type 1 and type 2, Sequoioxylon, Alnoxylon, Platanoxylon, Laurinoxylon,* 

Table 2. The genera identified a	nd their vegetation units
Identification	Vegetation Unit*
Pinoxylon	VU0, VU3-VU7
Cupressinoxylon	VU5, VU7
Sequoioxylon	VU3, VU4, VU5
Palmoxylon type 1	VU0, VU4
Palmoxylon type 2	VU0, VU4
Alnoxylon	VU3, VU4
Carpinoxylon	VU5
Ostryoxylon	VU5
Fagoxylon	VU5, VU6
Quercoxylon section llex	VU5, VU6, VU7
Laurinoxylon	VU4, VU5
Platanoxylon	VU4

\*From Denk (2017) and Güner et al (2017): Vegetation Unit (VU) 0: Subtropical, moist or dry light forest. VU 1: Aquatic. VU 2: Bogs, wet meadows. VU 3: Swamp forest. VU 4: Riparian forest. VU 5: Well-drained lowland forest (VU5a - *Quercus drymeja*, Fagaceae gen. et spec. indet. various, VU5b - edaphically and aspect wise dry forest). VU 6: Well-drained upland forest (*Fagus-Cathaya*). VU 7: Welldrained (lowland and) upland conifer forest including hammocks Quercoxylon section *llex*, *Pinoxylon*, *Cupressinoxylon*, *Carpinoxylon*, *Ostryoxylon* and *Fagoxylon*). Knowledge on the early Miocene flora and climate of Aegean Basin was increased with these findings, and we can conclude that the climate and the wood flora of Gökçeada are rather similar to those of Lesvos - which had a subtropical warm and humid climate. Due to having a rich fossil wood flora, the fossil forest in Gökçeada should be protected, and considered as a geosite. Furthermore, the area should then become a designated tourism route after protecting the petrified woods.

**Peer-review:** Externally peer-reviewed.

Author Contributions: Concept – Y.G.; Design – Ü.A., Y.G.; Supervision – Ü.A. Y.G.; Materials –E.B., Y.G.; Data Collection and/or Processing – E.B., Y.G., Ü.A.; Analysis and/or Interpretation – E.B.; Y.G.; – Ünal Akkemik.; Literature Search – E.B., Y.G., Ü.A., C.K.; Writing Manuscript – Ü.A., Y.G., C.K.; Critical Review – Ü.A., Y.G.

**Acknowledgements:** This study was supported by the Research Fund of İstanbul University. Project No: 47336.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Financial Disclosure:** This study was supported by the Research Fund of Istanbul University. Project No: 47336.

#### REFERENCES

- Akartuna, M., 1950. İmroz Adasında bazı jeolojik müşahadeler. Türkiye Jeoloji Kurumu Bülteni 2/2:8
- Akgün, F., Kayseri, M.S., Akkiraz, M.S., 2007. Paleoclimatic evolution and vegetational changes during the Late Oligocene–Miocene period in western and central Anatolia (Turkey). Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, *Palaeoecology* 253: 56–90. [CrossRef]
- Akkemik, Ü., Köse, N., Poole, I., 2005. Sequoioiodae (Cupressaceae) woods from the upper Oligocene of European Turkey (Thrace). *Phytologia Balcanica* 11 (2): 119-131.
- Akkemik, Ü., Türkoğlu, N., Poole, I., Çiçek, I., Köse, N., Gürgen, G., 2009. Woods of a Miocene Petrified Forest near Ankara, Turkey. *Turkish Journal of Agriculture and Forestry* 33: 89-97.
- Akkemik, Ü., Yaman, B., 2012. Wood Anatomy of Eastern Mediterranean Species. Kessel Publishing House, Germany.
- Akkemik Ü., Sakınç M., 2013. Sequoioxylon petrified woods from the Mid to Late Oligocene of Thrace (Turkey). *IAWA Journal* 34 (2): 177-182. [CrossRef]
- Akkemik, Ü., Arslan M., Poole I., Tosun S., Köse N., Karlıoğlu Kılıç, N., Aydın A., 2016. Silicified woods from two previously undescribed early Miocene forest sites near Seben, northwest Turkey. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 235: 31–50. [CrossRef]
- Akkemik, Ü., Acarca, N.N., Hatipoğlu, M., 2017. The first Glyptostroboxylon from the Miocene of Turkey. *IAWA Journal* 38(4): 561-570. [CrossRef]
- Akkiraz, M.S., Akgün, F., Utescher, T., Bruch, A.A. and Mosbrugger, V., 2011. Precipitation gradients during the Miocene in Western and Central Turkey as quantified from pollen data. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 304: 276–290. [CrossRef]

- Aras, A., Aksoy N., Batı Z., Sakınç M., Erdoğan M., 2003. Yaşayan fosil Sequoiadendron giganteum (Ağaçlı Linyitleri): Ksiloloji, Palinoloji ve Yaşı Türkiye Kuvaterner Çalıştayı. TURQUA IV, pp: 187-195.
- Aytug, B., Şanlı, İ., 1974. Forêt de la fin du Tertiaire aux environs du Bosphore. I. Ü. Orman Fakültesi Dergisi 24: 64-78.
- Bamford, M., Zijlstra, G., Philippe, M., 2002. Proposal to conserve the name Cupressinoxylon against Retinodendron (fossil Gymnospermae, Coniferales), with a conserved type. *Taxon* 51: 205-206. [CrossRef]
- Barefoot, A.C., Hankins, F.W., 1982. Identification of Modern and Tertiary Woods. Clarendon Press, Oxford.
- Basaran, E., Gungor, Y., Kasapçı, C., 2015. Gökçeada'nınm (Çanakkale) Silisleşmiş Ağaçlarının Jeoturizm Potansiyeli. 68. Türkiye Jeoloji Kurultayı, Bildiri Özetleri , pp., 290-291. Ankara
- Basaran, E., Gungor, Y., Akkemik, Ü., 2016. Yeni bir Fosil Ormanın Ağaçları: Gökçeada Türkiye. 69. Türkiye Jeoloji Kurultayı, Bildiri Özetleri, pp., 212-213. Ankara
- Bayam, N.N.A., Akkemik, Ü., Poole, I., Akarsu, F., 2018. Further Contributions to the early Miocene forest vegetation of the Galatian Volcanic Province, Turkey. Palaeobotanica Electronica, 21.3.40A: 1-42.
- Boydak, M., 1983. Ülkemizin nadide bir türü Datça Hurması (Phoenix theophrastii Greuler). Çevre Koruma 18: 20-21 İstanbul.
- Boydak, M., 1985. The distribution of Phoenix theophrasti in the Datça Peninsula, Turkey. *Biological Conservation* 32: 129-135.
   [CrossRef]
- Cevallos-Ferriz, S.R.S, López, G.C., Flores Rocha, L.A., 2016. Laurinoxylon chalatenangensis sp. nov. from the Miocene Chalatenango Formation, El Salvador. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 233: 186-192. [CrossRef]
- Denk, T., Grimm, G.W., 2009. Significance of pollen characteristics for infrageneric classification and phylogeny in Quercus (Fagaceae). *International Journal of Plant Science* 170: 926–940. [CrossRef]
- Denk, T., Grimm, G.W., 2010. The oaks of western Eurasia: traditional classifications and evidence from two nuclear markers. *Taxon* 59: 351–366.
- Denk, T., Güner, T.H., Kvaček, Z., Bouchal, M.J., 2017a. The early Miocene flora of Güvem (Central Anatolia, Turkey): a window into early Neogene vegetation and environments in the Eastern Mediterranean. Acta Palaeobotanica (monograph) 57: 237-338. [CrossRef]
- Denk, T., Velitzelos, D., Güner, T., Bouchal, J.M., Grimsson, F., Grimm, G.W., 2017b. Taxonomy and palaeoecology of two widespread western Eurasian Neogene sclerophyllous oak species: Quercus drymeja Unger and Q. mediterranea Unger. *Review of Palaeobotany* and Palynology 241: 98-128. [CrossRef]
- Denk, T., Grimm, G.W., Manos, P.S., Deng, M., Hipp, A., 2017c. An updated infrageneric classification of the oaks: review of previous taxonomic schemes and synthesis of evolutionary patterns. In: Gil-Peregrin, E., Peguero-Pina, J.J., Sancho-Knapik, D. (eds) Oaks Physiological Ecology. Exploring the Functional Diversity of Genus Quercus. *Tree Physiology* 7: 13-38. [CrossRef]
- Dernbach, U., Herbst, R., Jung, W., Schaarschmidt, F., Selmeier, A., Velitzelos, E., 1996. Versteinerte Wälder. –188 S.; Heppenheim (D'Oro).
- Elicin, G., 1977. Turkiye Doğal Ardıc (Juniperus L.) Taksonlarının Yayılışları ile Onemli Morfolojik ve Anatomik Ozellikleri Uzerinde Araştırmalar, İ.U. Yayın No: 2327, O.F. Yayın No:232, İstanbul.
- Ercan, T., Satır, M., Dora, A., Sarıkoğlu, E., Yıldırım, T., Adis, C., Walter, H.J., Özbayrak, İ.H., 1995. Biga Yarımadası, Gökçeada, Bozcaada ve Tavşan Adaları'ndaki Tersiyer yaşlı volkanitlerin petrolojisi ve bölgesel yayılımı. *Maden Tetkik ve Arama Dergisi* 117: 55-86.
- Eroskay, O., Aytug, B., 1982. Bois petrifiés du Bassin d'Ergene oriental. I. Ü. Orman Fakültesi Dergisi 32(A): 7-21.

- Fahn, A., E. Werker, E., Baas, P., 1986. Wood Anatomy and Identification of Trees and Schrubs from Israel and Adjacent Regions. The Israel Academy of Science and Humanities Publication, pp. 221.
- Figueiral, I., Mosbrugger, V., Rowe, N.P., Ashraf, A.R., Utesher, T., Jones, T.P., 1999. The Miocene peat-forming vegetation of northwestern Germany: An analysis of wood remains and comparision with previous palynological interpretations. *Review of Paleobotany and Palynology* 104: 239-266. [CrossRef]
- Greguss, P., 1955. Xylotomische Bestimmung der Heute Lebenden Gymnospermen, Academia Kiado, Budapest.
- Greguss, P., 1967. Fossil Gymnosperm Woods in Hungary, From Permian to Pliocene. Academia Kiado, Budapest.
- Güner, H.T., Bouchal, J.M., Köse, N., Göktaş, F., Mayda, S., Denk, T., 2017. Landscape heterogeneity in the Yatağan Basin (southwestern Turkey) during the middle Miocene inferred from plant macrofossils. Palaeontolographica, Abt. B: Palaeobotany-Palaeophytology 296(1-6): 113-171.
- Hipp, A. L., Manos, P., McVay, J. D., Cavender-Bares, J., González-Rodríguez, A., Romero-Severson, J., Hahn, M., Brown, B. H., Budaitis, B., Deng, M., Grimm, G., Fitzek, E., Cronn, R., Jennings, T., Avishai, M., Simeone, M.C., 2015. A phylogeny of the world's oaks. http://2015. botanyconference.org/engine/search/index.php?func=detail&aid=1305.
- Hubert, F., Grimm, G. W., Jousselin, E., Berry, V., Franc, A., Kremer, A., 2014. Multiple nuclear genes stabilize the phylogenetic backbone of the genus Quercus. *Systematics and Biodiversity* 12: 405-423. [CrossRef]
- lamandei, E., lamandei, S., 1997. Xylotomical study of some fossil dicot trunks of Techereu in the Metalliferous Carpathians. Acta Palaeontologica Romaniae. 1. The First Romanian National Symposium on Palaeontology, 17-18 October, 1997, Bucharest, pp 107-112.
- IAWA Committee, 1989. IAWA List of microscopic features for hardwood identification by an IAWA Committee. E. A. Wheeler, P. Baas & P. E. Gasson (Eds.) IAWA Bulletin.n.s. 10: 219-332.
- IAWA Committee, 2004. IAWA list of microscopic features for softwood identification. IAWA Journal 25: 1-70.
- Ilgar A., Demirci, E.S., Duru, M., Pehlivan, Ş., Dönmez, M., Akçay, A. E., 2008. 1/100.000 ölçekli Türkiye Jeoloji Haritaları Çanakkale H15 ve H16 Paftaları. No: 100. Maden Tetkik ve Arama Genel Müdürlüğü, Ankara.
- Jacquiot, C., 1955. Atlas d'anatomie des bois des conifères, Press of Centre Technique du bois et du Fonds Forestier National, Paris, France.
- Jeong, E.K., Kim, K., Suzuki, M., Kim, J.W., 2009. Fossil woods from the Lower Coal-bearing Formation of the Janggi Group (Early Miocene) in the Pohang Basin, Korea. *Review of Paleobotany and Palynology* 153: 124–138. [CrossRef]
- Jud, N.A., Dunham, J.I., 2017. Fossil woods from the Cenozoic of Panama (Azuero Peninsula) reveal an ancient neotropical rainforest. *IAWA Journal* 38(3): 366-411. [CrossRef]
- Kesgin, Y., Varol, B., 2003. Gökçeada ve Bozcaada'nın Tersiyer jeolojisi (Çanakkale). Türkiye. Maden Tetkik ve Arama Dergisi 126: 49-67.
- Klusek, M., 2014. Miocene coniferous woods of the Polish Carpathian Foredeep. Acta Palaeontologica Polonica 59(3): 697-708.
- Koral, H., Öztürk, H., Hanilçi, N., 2008. Tectonically induced coastal uplift mechanism of Gökçeada Island, Northern Aegean Sea, Turkey. *Quaternary International* 197: 43–54. [CrossRef]
- Özgüven, K., 1971. Sur un bois fossile de Taxodiaceae dans la flore Neogene d'Istanbul (Turquie d'Europe): Sequoioxylon egemeni n.sp. Revue de la Faculté des sciences de l'Université d'Istanbul Series B 36: 89-114.

- Prakash, U., D. Brezinova & C. Buzek., 1971. Fossil woods from the Doupovske Hory and Ceske Stredohori Mountains in northern Bohemia. *Palaeontographica B* 133: 103-128.
- Pujana, R. R., Santillana, S. N., & Marensi, S. A., 2014. Conifer fossil woods from the La Meseta Formation (Eocene of Western Antarctica): evidence of Podocarpaceae-dominated forests. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 200: 122-137. [CrossRef]
- Sarı, R., Türkecan, A., Dönmez, M., Küçükefe, Ş., Aydın, Ü., Özmen, Ö., 2015. The geology of Gökçeada (Çanakkale). *Bulletin of the Mineral Research and Exploration* 150: 1-18. [CrossRef]
- Sayadi, S., 1973. Contribution a l'etude de la flore miocène de la Turquie. –Thèse 3e cycle Paléontologie (Paléobotanique), Paris IV, pp. 81.
- Schweingruber, F. H., 1990. Anatomy of European Woods. Verlag Paul Haupt, Bern and Stuttgart.
- Selmeier, A., 1990. Dichrostachyoxlon zirkelii (Felix), Mimosoideae, a silicified wood from Miocene sediments of Küçük Çekmece Lake (Turkey). Mitteilungen der Bayerischen Staatssammlung für Paläontologie und Histor. Geologie 30: 121-135.
- Selmeier, A., 2001. Silicified Miocene woods from the North Bohemian Basin (Czech Republic) and from Kuzuluk, district Adapazari (Turkey). Mitteilungen der Bayerischen Staatssammlung für Paläontologie und Histor. Geologie 41: 111-144.
- Selmeier A., Velitzelos, E., 2000. Neue Aufsammlungen von verkieselten Holzresten aus tertiären Schichten Griechenlands (Lesbos, Kastoria, Thrakien), Mitteilungen der Bayerischen Staatssammlung für Paläontologie und Histor. Geologie 40: 213-227.
- Suss, H., Velitzelos, E., 1994a. Ein neues fossiles Koniferenholz, Taxoceoxylon biseriatum sp. nov., aus tertiaren Schichten der Insel Lesvos, Griechenland. *Feddes Repertorium* 105 (5-6): 257-269. [CrossRef]
- Suss, H., Velitzelos, E., 1994b. Zwei neue tertia re Holzer der Gattung Pinoxylon KNOWLTON emend. READ aus dem Versteinerten Wald von Lesvos, Griechenland. Feddes Repertorium 105(7–8): 403-423.
- Suzuki M., Watari S., 1994. Fossil wood flora of the early Miocene Nawamata formation of Monzen, Noto Peninsula, central Japan. Journal of Plant Research 107: 63–76. [CrossRef]
- Şanlı, İ., 1982. Récherches xylologiques sur la flore du Tertiaire de la Thrace Turque. I. Ü. Orman Fakültesi Dergisi 32(A): 84-138.
- Temel, R. Ö. ve Çiftçi, N. B., 2002. Gelibolu Yarımadası, Gökçeada ve Bozcaada Tersiyer çökellerinin stratigrafisi ve ortamsal özellikleri. Türkiye Petrol Jeologları Derneği Bülteni 14: 17-40.
- Tidwell, W.D., 1998. Common fossil plants of Western North America. Smithsonian Institution Press. pp. 299. Washington and London.
- Van der Burgh, J., 1973. Hölzer der niederrheinischen Braunkohlenformation, 2. Holzer der Braukohlengruben "Maria Theresia" zu Herzogenrath, "Zukunft West" zu eschweiler und "Victor" (Aulpich Mitte) zu Zulpich, nebst einer systematisch-anatomischen bearbeitung der gattung Pinus L. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynolology* 15: 73-275. [CrossRef]
- Velitzelos, E., 1996. The petrified forest of Lesvos, a rare natural and geological monument (in Greek). Proc.1st Symposium on the Petrified Forest of Lesvos: pp.35-42, Mytilene
- Velitzelos, E., 1997. The petrified forest of Lesvos Protected Natural Monument. Proc. Internat. Sympos. On Engineering Geology and the Environment, Athens, p.3037-3043, Athens.
- Velitzelos, D., Bouchal, J.M., Denk, T., 2014. Review of the Cenozoic floras and vegetation of Greece. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 204: 56-117. [CrossRef]
- Velitzelos, E., Zouros, N. 1997. The Petrified Forest of Lesvos Protected Natural Monument. Proc. Internat. Sympos. On Engineering Geology and the Environment, Athens, pp. 3037–3043.
- Zouros, N., Velitzelos, E., Valiakos, E., Ververis, K. 2004. Submarine petrified forest in Lesvos, Greece. 5th International Symposium on Eastern Mediterranean Geology. Thessaloniki, Greece, 14-20 April 2004.

### Physical and social barriers for disabled urban park users: case study from Kastamonu, Turkey

### Engelli kent parkı kullanıcılarının fiziksel ve sosyal sorunları: Kastamonu kenti örneği

Nur Belkayalı<sup>1</sup> (D), Yavuz Güloğlu<sup>2</sup> (D)

<sup>1</sup>Department of Landscape Architecture, Kastamonu University, Faculty of Engineering and Architectre, Kastamonu, Turkey <sup>2</sup>Department of Political Science and Public Administration, Kastamonu University, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Kastamonu Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

More than a billion people in the world suffer from some kind of disability, which can affect quality of life. Some people experience physical or social disadvantages depending on the nature of their disabilities. The social disadvantages stem from civic policies that do not take into consideration the needs of disabled people, standards that are not fulfilled and people's prejudices. In this study, barriers that disabled people experience in physical and social environments are examined in terms of open areas and greenspaces. To this end, popular parks in Kastamonu from Turkey were chosen as the study area. In the scope of the study, a questionnaire was given to 124 disabled persons and the relatives of disabled persons and 382 individuals who currently do not have any disabilities. Multivariate linear regression was used in order to evaluate the questionnaire data. The study results indicate that disabled individuals encounter physical and social barriers, and they also confirm that non-disabled people often complain about the same problems as disabled people with regard to the management and running of public parks. Moreover, the study reveals that the actions of public law corporations toward disabled people are not sufficient and public information and awareness-raising activities also fall short.

Keywords: Barrier, disabled, physical environment, social environment, urban park

#### ÖΖ

Dünyada bir milyardan fazla insan herhangi bir tür engellilik yaşamakta, bu durum ise yaşam kalitesini olumsuz yönde etkilemektedir. Engel durumuna bağlı olarak kişiler fiziksel ya da sosyal dezavantajlar yaşamaktadır. Bu durum çoğunlukla uygulanan politikaların engelli insanların ihtiyaçlarını göz önünde bulundurmamasından, standartların yerine getirilmemesinden ve insanların önyargılarından kaynaklanmaktadır. Bu çalışmada engelli kişilerin fiziksel ve sosyal çevrede yaşadıkları dezavantajlar açık ve yeşil alanlar özelinde irdelenmeye çalışılmıştır. Bunun için Türkiye'de Kastamonu ilinde bulunan ve en fazla kullanılan parklar çalışma alanı olarak seçilmiştir. Çalışma kapsamında 124 engelli ve engelli yakınına, 382 adet şu anda engeli bulunmayan bireye anket uygulaması yapılmıştır. Anket verilerinin değerlendirilmesi için multivariate linear regression gerçekleştirilmiştir. Çalışma sonuçları engelli bireylerin parkları kullanımında fiziksel ve sosyal engellerle karşılaştığını gösterirken, şu an engelsiz olan bireylerinde kent parklarını kullanımında engelli bireylerle aynı sorunlardan şikayetçi olduğu u gösterirken, bilgilendirme ve bilinçlendirme konusunda da eksiklikler olduğunu göstermiştir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Engelli, fiziksel çevre, kent parkı, kullanım olanakları, sosyal çevre

#### INTRODUCTION

Everybody is temporarily or permanently disabled at a certain period of his/her life time as he/ she cannot or would not healthfully carry out his/her physical or mental activities. It is stated that more than a billion people, or, in other words, 15% of world population suffer from some kinds of disability (WB, 2017). Around 200 million of them have remarkable difficulties in continuing their lives. Yet, everyone is equal and must have equal rights. Therefore, the aim of the Convention on

#### Cite this paper as:

Belkayali, N., Güloğlu, Y., 2019. Physical and social barriers for disabled urban park users: case study from Kastamonu, Turkey. *Forestist* 69(1): 35-43.

Corresponding author: Nur Belkayalı e-mail: nbelkayali@kastamonu.edu.tr

*Received Date:* 11.04.2018 *Accepted Date:* 13.07.2018

Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD), which was adopted in 2006, is stated as "to encourage, ensure and preserve all disabled people to benefit from fundamental freedoms and all human rights completely and equally and to increase the respect towards their personal dignity of being a human being (UN, 2006).

While World Health Survey states the number of disabled people at the age of 15 and over as 785 million (15.6%), Global Burden of Disease survey estimates the number around 975 million (19.2%). While World Health Survey estimates that 110 millions of these people (2.2%) have respectable difficulties in performing their functions, Global Burden of Disease estimates the number of severe disablements in the categories of disabilities such as quadriplegia, severe depression or blindness, as 190 million (3.8%). According to the measurements of Global Burden of Disease survey, 13 million out of 95 million (0.7%) disabled children (between the ages of 0-14) are stated "severe disabled" (WHO, 2011). According to the results of Turkey Disabled Survey conducted by Turkish Statistical Institute in 2002, nearly 12.29% of total population in Turkey and nearly 12.98% of Black Sea Region are disabled (TSI, 2017a). When the families of disabled individuals are added to these numbers, it is obvious that an unignorable number of the total population is either disabled or live with disabled people and, thus, are affected by negative living conditions.

It is possible to encounter people in different age groups, levels of education, occupations, physical and mental structures and socio-economic status in living spaces. Each individual within society has the right of benefiting from equal opportunities. A modern and ergonomic living space means an area which can be accessible by everyone (Altınçekiç and Erdönmez, 2001). State administration is responsible for providing citizens with the opportunity of benefiting from government services equally (Akyılmaz et al., 2017; Gülan, 1988). In the 10<sup>th</sup>, 42<sup>nd</sup>, 51<sup>st</sup> and 60<sup>th</sup> Acts of the Turkish Constitution on labour matter, it is arranged that everyone is equal before the law and the State is responsible for ensuring the equality of people. It is also arranged that the state has to take necessary measures to rehabilitate people with special needs, it has to preserve children, women and those with physical and mental disabilities privately in terms of working conditions, it has to protect disabled people and take precautions to help them adapt to community life. "United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) was put into force on 18/12/2008 in Turkey, and the Code about Handicapped no 5378 was enacted". Apart from these legal regulations, a great many legal regulations have been enacted in order to enable people with disabilities to live independently by being respected, given dignity and to take part in every aspect of life.

Disability is a term that comprises a person's non-adaptation to the environment. What is meant by adaption of disabled individuals to the environment is rendering the physical environment for their use. In other words, it is the reducing of physical handicaps. The main objective here is to give disabled people the right of inclusion to daily life. Physical environment should be made suitable for disabled individuals to achieve this purpose. Hence, Tufan (2006) uses the statement that "People who are called disabled are those who are prevented by some barriers in physical environment".

Both providing special education and enabling the right of benefiting from the physical environment are significant in integrating disabled people with society. However, it is known that disabled individuals encounter social barriers as well, and it is sometimes more difficult to overcome them. The first step to take in overcoming these barriers is the acknowledgement of the disabled by society and sharing the same environment with them. Learning to live with the concept of disability and disabled individuals from childhood would start the process of tolerance and cohesion. Yet, there are great deficiencies in both the perception of "disabled" in society and adaptation of the physical environment for the disabled. These restrictions cause disabled people not to benefit from the environment sufficiently as society routinely does. In the survey held by the Turkish Statistical Institution in 2012 in the areas of registered disabled people about the suitability of physical environment planning to their use, it is determined that 66.9% of them state that pavements, pedestrian ways and crosswalks are not proper. Again in the same survey, it is indicated that 43.3% disabled individuals' state that parks and green areas are not suitable for the use of disabled people. That 34.4% of disabled people do not have any idea about whether the parks and green areas are suitable for their use or not is an attention-grabbing result (TSI, 2017b).

The survey indicates that one of the areas that disabled people encounter problems is parks. Parks are the areas which the city-dwellers use in order to relax, where they find serenity and rest both physically and mentally. Parks are among the public goods presented to the common use of everyone in Turkish Law (Gülan, 1999; Ayanoğlu, 1992; Aydın, 1999). Although benefiting from these areas is the right of disabled people as well as other individuals, social and physical restrictions prevent disabled people from using them sufficiently. For disabled people to benefit from parks sufficiently by removing limitations is primarily possible by identifying the limits, that is determining the problems.

In this study, the aim is to identify factors limiting disabled people from benefiting from parks in the city centre. For this reason, a questionnaire has been conducted to both disabled and non-disabled individuals by interviewing them in and out of parks. By evaluating the questionnaires, it is aimed to determine to what extent disabled individuals benefit from parks, and the physical and social reasons that impede their use of parks. It is also aimed to identify the viewpoint of society to disabled individuals and the level of their interest and knowledge about the problems that disabled individuals encounter.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Study area

Kastamonu province is located in the north of Turkey, in the West Black Sea Region (Figure 1). Sinop is in the east, Bartin and Karabük are in the west, Çankırı is in the south and Çorum is in the south-east of the city. The north of the city is surrounded by the Black Sea. Founded on Karaçomak valley, the centre of the city is a remarkably old settlement. Researches on the area indicate that the first settlement in Kastamonu dates back to paleolithic age. The city was domineered by Candaroğulları for a long time as 168 years after the settlement of Turks to Anatolia, then it was dominated by the Ottoman Empire in the 14th century and became a city in the 19th century (Bakırcı, 2005).

The population of Kastamonu was determined as 372,373 people (KCP, 2017). Registered disabled people living in Kastamonu were stated as 10,714 people according to National Disabled People Database (NDD, 2013). In the neighbouring cities, the following numbers of disabled people were stated: Bartin 6,571, Karabük 5,674, Sinop 5,650, Çankırı 3,773 (NDD, 2013; Açıkgöz, 2017).

As Kastamonu has the largest disabled population in the region, it has been chosen as the research area. Since the study is carried out in city parks, Kışla Park, Sinanbey Park, Cevizli Park, Cumhuriyet Meydanı Park, İsfendiyarbey Park and Terminal Park have been preferred as they are the most preferred and the most easily accessible ones.

#### Material

In the scope of the study, in order to determine the problems that the disabled encounter, a survey on 124 disabled and the relatives of disabled, and 382 non-disabled individuals was conducted. Disabled individuals and their families were reached through a special training centre for the disabled in Kastamonu



Figure 1. Location map for study areas

province. Since the parks in the city centre were chosen for the study, the population of Kastamonu city centre (city centre: 146,103 persons (KCP, 2017) was used as a base with 95% confidence level and 0.05 margin of error while determining the number of questionnaires (Yazıcıoğlu and Erdoğan, 2004). The main materials of the study are comprised of parks chosen as the study area and questionnaires.

In the scope of the survey study conducted to disabled people, participants were asked questions about their demographic features, their disability states, their utilization of parks, encountered problems, to what extent parks meet the needs of disabled individuals, barriers preventing disabled people from integrating with society, the level of knowledge about the rights of disabled people and the expectations of disabled people from formal institutions. In the survey conducted to non-disabled people, their demographic features, whether they use the parks or not, their feelings and thoughts when they are in the same environment with disabled people and their level of knowledge about the studies concerning disabled people were tried to be identified.

#### Method

Likert Scale was used in the survey study in order to identify the attitudes of participants to the use of urban parks and physical and social problems of disabled people. In the responses received according to the Likert Scale, the average value was used as a base and the evaluations were carried out accordingly. Physical and social problems and expectations of disabled people were tried to be identified through the analyses. There is no ethics committee approval certificate. The study is not about collecting personal or private information.

SPSS package (Statistical Package for Social Sciences Program, Version 19.0, IBM, New York, United States) was used in analysing the data obtained from the research. Multivariate linear regression was carried out in order to find out whether there existed a relationship between the use or non-use states of city parks by participants and disability status. While the use of city parks was chosen as the dependent variable, physical and social factors such as disability status, age, education, income status, transportation and free time were assessed as independent variables (Equation 1);

#### Y=A+b1x1+ b2x2+ b3x3

"Y" expresses dependent variable (the status of individuals' usage of city parks), "A" shows the invariance coefficient, "bn" indicates independent variable coefficient and "xn" symbolizes independent variable (gender, age, income status, disability status, transportation etc.).

In order to test the presence of an autocorrelation problem among the variables in the regression model, the Durbin-Watson coefficient is calculated. Durbin-Watson coefficient ranges between zero and four. If the value is close to two, it shows the absence of an autocorrelation problem (Fox, 1997). All analyses were conducted at the 0.01 level of significance.

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

In the scope of the study, first, the factors affecting the status of all individuals' usage of city parks were identified and then, the result was explained under the following subtitles since two different questionnaires were applied to disabled and non-disabled individuals.

#### Factors Affecting the Use of Urban Parks

According to the regression analysis results in order to determine factors affecting the use of urban parks in Kastamonu, it was identified that income status, disability status, free time status, reactions of other people using the parks, the suitability of the parks for usage and accommodation variables were significant according to the 0.01 significance level and the maintenance of parks variable was significant according to the 0.05 significance level. The effect of determined factors on the individuals' use of city parks were identified as 61% (R<sup>2</sup>: 0.611) (Table 1). No auto correlation was found between those variables (Durbin-Watson coefficient: 1.814). As a result of the F test carried out for the total relevance of the model, the model was found to be statistically significant in total (sig:0.000<0.001) (Table 1).

Multi regression model for the factors affecting the use of urban parks was found out as below (Table 1) (Equation 1):

#### **Equation 1**

Use of urban parks=1.270 + (-0.036) x income status x (-0.082) x disability status + 0.093 x transportation status + 0.070 x the suitability of parks for use + 0.185 x free time status + 0.063 x the reactions of other people using the park + 0.030 x maintenance of parks It was identified that there was an inverse relationship between the individuals' use of parks and their income and disability states. As the income status ( $\beta$ : -0.036) and the disability status ( $\beta$ : -0.082) increased, the use of urban parks decreased (Table 1).

#### Survey Results Applied to Disabled People

According to the survey results applied to disabled people in order to identify physical and social barriers encountered in urban parks in Kastamonu, it was found that 44.4% of participants were between 31-40 age group, 33.1% were high school graduates and 32.3% had a monthly income between 1,000-1,500 TL. It was also identified that 38.7% of participants were physically disabled while 23.4% were mentally disabled (Table 2).

When the disabled people were asked about whether they were satisfied with using the same parks with non-disabled people, 62.9% stated that they liked it. When they were asked about their acceptance by non-disabled persons, 34.7% stated that they were sometimes accepted while 19.4% stated that they did not gain acceptance (Table 3).

When they were asked about whether parks in Kastamonu met the needs of disabled people, 58.1% of disabled participants stated that it did not meet their needs while 36.3% stated that it partially met their needs. It was observed that 51.6% of disabled people were not informed about the works of municipality and non-governmental organizations concerning disabled people, 44.4% of them were not aware of the applications concerning legislation on disability. Moreover, 72.2% of participants stated that the applications of formal institutions were insufficient in meeting the needs of disabled people (Table 4).

When they were asked about the kinds of arrangements to be made in parks in order to meet the physical needs of disabled people, they stated that problems that made the access to the parks difficult should be resolved (avg:4.19), proper decking materials should be used (avg: 4.08) and furniture should be arranged according to the disabled (avg: 3.96). When problems that disabled people encounter were examined within a social perspective, the reasons preventing

Table 1. Coefficients of factors that affect the use of Kastamonu urban parks
---

		Unstandardized Coefficients			
Model	В	Std. Error	Beta	t	Sig.
(Constant)	1,270	,052		24,639	,000
Income	-,036	,013	-,078	-2,756	,006
Disability status	-,082	,021	-,129	-3,875	,000
Transportation status	,093	,015	,249	6,143	,000
Suitability of parks for use	,070	,017	,189	4,180	,000
Free Time Status	,185	,015	,415	12,219	,000
Reactions of other people using the parks	,063	,024	,112	2,684	,008
Maintenance of parks	,030	,016	,084	1,962	,050
R,782 <sup>a</sup> R Square,611 Adj. R Square 0,60	6 Std. Error 0.448	Durbin-Watso	on 1,814 F 111,915	Sig000ª	

disabled people from integrating with society were stated by the participants as the negative view of society to disabled people (avg: 3.83), that local governments did not constitute sufficient social environment for the disabled (avg: 3.83) and that state institutions and organizations did not carry out necessary work (avg: 3.81). Moreover, the status of the disabled (avg:3.64) was also stated as one of the significant barriers in integrating with society. When the one who had the most significant role in integrating the disabled with society was asked, it was stated that this role mostly belonged to the non-disabled (avg: 4.13). Moreover, the families of the disabled (avg: 3.82) possessed an important role in integrating with society (Table 5).

#### Survey Results Conducted to Non-Disabled People

According to the survey results conducted to non-disabled people so as to identify physical and social barriers encountered while using the urban parks in Kastamonu, it was stated that 30.9% of participants were between the ages of 21-30, 63.9% were university graduates, 29.1% earned between 0-500 TL monthly income and 28.0% earned 2,500 TL and over (Table 2).

It was determined that 95.5% participants did not feel uncomfortable about using the same parks with the disabled. When whether the disabled gain acceptance by the non-disabled in parks was asked, 39.8% stated that they sometimes gained acceptance while 30.6% stated that they gained acceptance (Table 3).

#### Table 2. Demographic Features of Kastamonu Urban Park Users

		Disabled		Non-di	sabled	Total	
Demographic features	Groups	n	%	n	%	n	%
Age	15-20	3	2,4	112	29,3	115	22,7
	21-30	22	17,7	118	30,9	140	27,7
	31-40	55	44,4	81	21,2	136	26,9
	41-50	35	28,2	51	13,4	86	17,0
	>50	9	7,3	20	5,2	29	5,7
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Education	primary education	4	3,2	21	5,5	25	4,9
	high school	37	29,8	92	24,1	129	25,5
	university	41	33,1	244	63,9	285	56,3
	postgraduate	42	33,9	25	6,5	67	13,2
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Income	0-500	13	10,5	111	29,1	124	24,5
	501-1000	24	19,4	46	12,0	70	13,8
	1001-1500	40	32,3	57	14,9	97	19,2
	1501-2500	20	16,1	61	16,0	81	16,0
	>2501	27	21,8	107	28,0	134	26,5
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Disability status	Non-disabled	0	0	382	100	382	75,5
	Mentally disabled	29	23,4	0	0	29	5,7
	Physically disabled	48	38,7	0	0	48	9,5
	Visually disabled	4	3,2	0	0	4	0,8
	Speech handicapped	8	6,5	0	0	8	1,6
	Hearing impaired	7	5,6	0	0	7	1,4
	Other	23	18,5	0	0	23	4,5
	Physical, speech, other impaired	1	0,8	0	0	1	0,2
	Speech, hearing impaired	1	0,8	0	0	1	0,2
	Physical, visual, hearing impaired	1	0,8	0	0	1	0,2
	Mentally, physical, visual, speech impaired	1	0,8	0	0	1	0,2
	Mentally, physical, speech impaired	1	0,8	0	0	1	0,2
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100

It was identified that 54.7% of non-disabled participants stated that urban parks in Kastamonu did not fulfill the needs of the disabled and 40.8% stated that they partially fulfilled their needs. When they were asked whether they were aware of the works of the municipality and non-governmental organizations concerning the disabled in the city of Kastamonu, 53.9% of non-disabled participants had the answer"no". Also 52.6% of participants stated

that they did not know anything about the laws and regulations conducted for the disabled. Moreover, 65.2% of participants stated that the applications of public legal entities were insufficient in meeting the needs of disabled people (Table 4).

According to spatial context, when the physical arrangements like urban furniture, pavement, signs etc. to be made in parks in order

#### Table 3. The attitudes of Kastamonu urban park users

		Disabled		Non-di	sabled	То	tal
Demographic features	Groups	n	%	n	%	n	%
Are you pleased with using the park together with other individuals?	Yes	78	62,9	365	95,5	443	87,5
	No	22	17,7	12	3,1	34	6,7
	Sometimes	24	19,4	5	1,3	29	5,7
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Do the disabled people gain acceptance by the non-disabled people in the park?	Yes	41	33,1	117	30,6	158	31,2
	No	24	19,4	68	17,8	92	18,2
	Sometimes	43	34,7	152	39,8	195	38,5
	l have no idea	16	12,9	45	11,8	61	12,1
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100

#### Table 4. Identification on the usage status of Kastamonu urban parks by disabled people

		Disabled		Non-di	sabled	То	tal
Demographic features	Groups	n	%	n	%	n	%
Do the parks in Kastamonu meet the							
needs of disabled people?	Yes	7	5,6	17	4,5	24	4,7
	No	72	58,1	209	54,7	281	55,5
	Partially	45	36,3	156	40,8	201	39,7
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Do you know the studies of municipality and							
non-governmental organizations	Yes	30	24,2	74	19,4	104	20,6
	No	64	51,6	206	53,9	270	53,4
for the disabled people?	l have no idea	30	24,2	102	26,7	132	26,1
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Do you know the laws, regulations etc.							
enforced for disabled people?	Yes	36	29,0	87	22,8	123	24,3
	No	55	44,4	201	52,6	256	50,6
	l have no idea	33	26,6	94	24,6	127	25,1
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100
Are the applications sufficient in meeting							
the needs of disabled people?	Yes	12	9,7	20	5,2	32	6,3
	No	92	74,2	249	65,2	341	67,4
	l have no idea	20	16,1	113	29,6	133	26,3
	Total	124	100	382	100	506	100

to meet the needs of disabled people were asked, it was stated that furniture should be arranged properly (avg: 3.48). Arrangements such as removing the transportation difficulties (avg:2.97), removing the deficiencies of traffic signs (avg:2.67), enabling sufficient lightning (avg:2.71) were stated unimportant (Table 5).

From a social perspective, when the reasons preventing disabled people from integrating with society were observed it was determined as the following: negative view of society towards the disabled (avg:3.48), that the municipality did not constitute sufficient social environments for the disabled (avg:3.77) and that public institutions and organizations such as governorship, ministry, etc. did not fulfill adequate studies (avg:3.60). Moreover, the status of the disabled was stated as not being a significant factor in integrating with society (avg:2.97) (Table 5).

It was determined that non-disabled individuals had the most significant role in integrating the disabled with society (avg:4.19). Besides, public institutions and organizations such as governorship and ministry (avg:3.62), municipalities (avg:3.42), non-governmental organizations (avg:3.54) and the families of the disabled (avg:3.29) were stated as having a significant role in the integration of the disabled with society (Table 5).

#### CONCLUSION

Although it is emphasized in all kinds of international platforms that each individual should have equal rights and freedom, disabled people, forming a significant part of society, still encounter many physical and social problems during their lives. Though societies seem to make efforts to solve these problems, researches indicate that disabled people still encounter physical and social barriers. The results of the study conducted in Kastamonu city centre supports these identifications.

Factors affecting the usage status of urban parks physically and socially have tried to be determined by regression analysis carried out in the scope of the study. According to the survey results, conducted with both disabled and non-disabled people, the most significant factor affecting the usage of parks in Kastamonu is identified as the free time status of individuals ( $\beta$ :0.185). However, when the factors in terms of physical and social barriers that the users face at parks are evaluated, the most important physical barriers are identified as transportation status ( $\beta$ :0.093). The accessibility of parks is the most significant issue for all individuals. The disability status of individuals ( $\beta$ :-0.082) comes up as one of the factors affecting the use of

Table 5. Identifications about the physical and social barriers encountered by the disabled people in the usage of Kastamonu urban parks

		Significance Level Average		
Demographic features	Suggestion	Disabled	Non-disabled	
What kind of arrangements should be carried				
out in order for the parks to be used by everyone?	Problems making transportation difficult should be removed	4,19	2,97	
	Signs should be used	3,36	2,67	
	Adequate lightning should be enabled	3,38	2,71	
	Proper decking should be used	4,08	3,16	
	Furniture usable by everyone should be used	3,96	3,48	
	Hygiene and maintenance should be attached importance	3,83	3,30	
	It should be safer	4,28	3,31	
Reasons of preventing the disabled				
rom integrating with the society	Status of the disabled	3,64	2,97	
	Negative viewpoint of society to the disabled	3,83	3,48	
	Municipality do not constitute adequate physical and social environment for the disabled	3,65	3,77	
	Institutions such as governorship and ministry do not carry out adequate studies	3,81	3,60	
To whom does the role of integrating				
the disabled with the society belong most?	To the disabled himself/herself	2,85	2,65	
	To the family of the disabled	3,82	3,29	
	To the municipality	3,55	3,42	
	To the institutions such as governorship and municipality	3,77	3,62	
	To the non-governmental organizations	3,49	3,54	
	To the non-disabled people	4,13	4,19	

parks. The results of the study indicate that the increase in the disability status of individuals impedes the usage of parks. Another factor affecting the use of parks is the suitability of parks (B:0.07) for the use of individuals. One of the social barriers determined in the study is that the use of parks depends on the reactions of other people using the park. Though both disabled and non-disabled people state that they do not feel uncomfortable using the parks together, it is identified by the regression analysis conducted to them that the reactions of other individuals affect themselves, indeed. It is thought that this result comes up as disabled and non-disabled people's opportunities in using the parks together are limited. Similar results are seen in the studies of Prellwitz and Tamm (1999), Talay et al. (2010), Moore and Lynch (2015). Income status of the individuals and maintenance of parks are observed as the other factors affecting the use of parks. It is observed that the use of parks have decreased depending especially on the improvement of income. It may depend on the decrease in the free times of people whose income have increased and show that they do not get service in the quality and diversity as they have expected, depending on the increase in their income.

It is stated both by the disabled and non-disabled individuals that parks in Kastamonu are insufficient in meeting the needs of disabled people physically. Insufficient arrangements in meeting the needs of the disabled at parks are stated as furniture (dustbin, sitting unit, signs, etc). Moreover, the necessity to remove transportation difficulties is emphasized by the participants. In sum, it is observed that deficiencies determined by disabled and non-disabled people are common.

When problems encountered by disabled people are examined socially, it is determined that disabled and non-disabled people refer to the same points. Reasons preventing the disabled from integrating with society are stated primarily coming up as local governments, state and public legal entities do not fulfill necessary work. The negative view of society towards the disabled and their status are determined as forming further barriers in integrating with society. It is because when disabled and non-disabled people are asked whether they feel uncomfortable using the same park together, the majority of them state that they do not feel uncomfortable (the disabled 62.9% and non-disabled 95.5%).

While both groups state that the most significant role in the integration of disabled people with society belongs to the disabled themselves, it is stated that the local government and other public legal entities play a significant role, as well. Therefore, if disabled people are provided with necessary opportunities by the local government and public legal entities and necessary arrangements are made in parks, it is thought that there would be nothing to prevent the use of parks by disabled and non-disabled people together.

One of the remarkable results of the study is that the disabled and non-disabled participants have stated that they are not aware of the studies of the local government and/or non-gov-

ernmental organizations concerning the disabled. It comes to existence that the local government and other public legal entities should inform the interest groups as well as make the necessary arrangements at parks (Akyılmaz, 2000). In Turkey, in order to provide full participation of the disabled to social life, it is ensured in the 2<sup>nd</sup> provisional article of the law no 5378 that current formal institutions that belong to state institutions and organizations, current roads, pavements, crosswalks, open and green areas, sports areas and similar social and cultural areas and any structures built by natural and legal persons and open to public service should be accessible to the disabled. The 8-year period allotted to fulfill these applications started on 7/7/2005 (OG, 2005). Yet, both this study and the study conducted by Sirel et.al. (2012) at Adana Çukurova University Campus, Alp's study (2014) regarding İstanbul University Beyazıt Campus, the study of Olgun and Yılmaz (2014) regarding Niğde Kızılelma Park, True and Türel's study (2013) regarding Izmir, Bayraktaroğlu and Büke's study (2015) concerning Istanbul Fenerbahce-Pendik coastline indicate that studies in Turkey are not at a sufficient level and that the interest groups are not adequately informed about the studies.

However, in the 3<sup>rd</sup> subclause of the 5<sup>th</sup> article of United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, which Turkey became part of in 2008, the following statement "Contracting countries take all necessary steps to make reasonable arrangements concerning the disabled in order to ensure equality and remove discrimination" appears and it is stated in the scope of the convention that active campaigns should be designed, started and continued in order to increase the awareness concerning the disabled in all parts of society, including the families, and in order to raise awareness in society for ensuring respect for the rights and human dignity of the disabled (OG, 2009). It is determined with this study that society in fact is not aware of the legal and physical arrangements and there still exists prejudice towards the disabled within society in a social sense.

Consequently, the study results indicate that disabled people still do not have the same rights as other individuals and the rate of using communal areas is far from being equal. Although local governments and other public legal entities conduct the necessary studies in terms of legal and physical aspects, the studies are not at a sufficient level and individuals are not informed of these studies. Factors affecting the use of urban parks should be assessed according to their importance as soon as possible and the deficiencies should be eliminated without wasting time. The disabled should be enabled to live independently and to participate in all areas of life. It should not be forgotten that each individual is disabled at some point of his or her life.

**Ethics Committee Approval:** There is no ethics committee approval certificate. The study is not about collecting personal or private information.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

**Author Contributions:** Concept – N.B., Y.G.; Design – N.B.; Supervision – Y.G.; Resources – Y.G.; Materials – Y.G.; Data Collection and/or Processing – Y.G.; Analysis and/or Interpretation – N.B.; Literature Search – N.B., Y.G.; Writing Manuscript – N.B.; Critical Review – N.B., Y.G.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Financial Disclosure:** There is no grant information and other sources.

#### REFERENCES

- Açıkgöz. 2017. There are 10 thousand disabled people in Kastamonu. Açıkgöz Newspaper Life News. http://www.aciksoz. com.tr/m/?id=1062 (Accessed: 17 September 2017).
- Akyılmaz, B, Sezginer, M., Kaya, C., 2017. Turkish administrative law. Seçkin Publishing House, Ankara, Turkey; p: 111.
- Akyılmaz, B. 2000. Procedure of administrative procedure in the light of administrative procedure relations. Yetkin Publications, Ankara, Turkey; p: 88-89.
- Alp, M.A. 2014. The research of the possibilities of outdoor space usage for disabled people: the example of Istanbul University Beyazit Campus. İstanbul University Graduate School of Science and Engineering Department of Landscape Architecture Master Thesis, İstanbul.
- Altınçekiç, T.H., Erdönmez, İ.M. 2001. Landscape assessment in Ulus Park from the user point of view. *İstanbul University Journal of Forest Faculty* 51(2): 1-15.
- Aydın, A. 1999. Legal basis of ınjury from forests in Turkey, İstanbul University Journal of Forest Faculty 49(1): 83-109.
- Ayanoğlu, S. 1992. Place of forests between the public sites, forestry description and scope. İstanbul University Journal of Forest Faculty 42(1-2):73-94.
- Bakırcı, S. 2005. A research on the evaluation of Kastamonu historical town center in terms of landscape architecture. Ankara University Institute of Science and Technology Landscape Architecture Department Master Degree Thesis, Ankara, Turkey.
- Bayraktaroğlu, B., Büke, A. 2015. Examination of children's playgrounds in terms of universality measure: Fenerbahçe-Pendik coastline example. *Süleyman Demirel University Journal of Engineering Science and Design* 3(3): 575-582.
- Fox, J. 1997. Applied regression analysis, linear models, and related methods. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Gülan, A. 1988. Public service concept. Journal of Administrative Law and Science 9(1-3): 47-159.
- Gülan, A. 1999. Legal Regime Subject to Procedures for Utilizing Public Goods. Alfa Publishing, İstanbul, Turkey; p: 36.
- KCP, Kastamonu Central Population. 2017. "Kastamonu Central Population" http://www.nufusu.com/ilce/merkez\_kastamonu-nufusu (Accessed: 17 September 2017).

- Moore, A., Lynch, H. 2015. "Accessibility and usability of playground environments for children under 12: A scoping review". Scandinavian Journal of Occupational Therapy 22(5): 331–344. [CrossRef]
- NDD, 2013. National Diabled People Database. https://sbu.saglik. gov.tr/sbozurlu. (Accessed: 12 September 2016).
- OG, Official Gazette. 2005. "Law on disabled people". Law No:5378, Official Gazette, 7/7/2005, Issue: 25868, Scheme:5, Vol:44.
- OG, Official Gazette. 2009. "United Nations Convention on the rights of persons with disabilities". Official Gazette. 14/7/2009, Issue: 27288.
- Olgun, R., Yılmaz, T. 2014. A research on the accessibility of parks: Niğde Kızılelma Park sample. Artvin Coruh University Journal of Forestry Faculty 4(15-1): 48-63.
- Prellwitz, M., Tamm, M. 1999. "Attitudes of key persons to accessibility problems in playgrounds for children with restricted mobility: A study of a medium-sized municipality in northern Sweden". Scandinavian Journal of Occupational Therapy 6: 166–73.
  [CrossRef]
- Sirel, B., Boyacıgil, O., Duymuş, H., Konaklı, N., Altunkasa, F., Uslu, C. 2012. Assessment of accessibility of Cukurova University Campus open areas in terms of physically disabled people. Çukurova University Journal of Engineering and Architecture Faculty, Adana, Turkey 27(1): 53-72.
- Talay, İ., Akpinar, N., Belkayali, N. 2010. "Barriers to playground use for children with disabilities: A case study from Ankara, Turkey". Africa J Agricult Res 5: 848–855.
- True, E.M., Türel, H.S. 2013. Usefulness of structured environments by physically disabled people: İzmir sample. Artium 1(1): 1–16.
- Tufan, İ. 2006. Disabled or Handicapped?. Radikal. http://www.radikal.com.tr/radikal2/engelli-mi-ozurlu-mu-874136 (Accessed: 12 September 2016).
- TSI, Turkish Statistical Institute. 2017a. "Turkish Statistical Institute disabled statistics, results of the disabled statistics, disability rate". http://www.tuik.gov.tr/PreTablo.do?alt\_id= 1017 (Accessed: 07 August 2017).
- TSI, Turkish Statistical Institute. 2017b. "Turkish Statistical Institute disabled people statistics, research on problems and expectations of disabled people, distribution of thoughts of disabled people according to the disability type about the usability of physical environment arrangements on the places where they live". http:// www.tuik.gov.tr/PreTablo.do?alt\_id=1017 (Accessed: 09 September 2017).
- UN, United Nations. 2006. "Final report of the Ad Hoc Committee on a comprehensive and integral international convention on the protection and promotion of the rights and dignity of persons with disabilities". 6 December 2006, A/61/611; 2006. p:7.
- WB, World Bank. 2017. "Disability". http://www.worldbank.org/en/ topic/disability (Accessed: 07 August 2017).
- WHO, World Health Organization. 2011. "World disability report, Executive summary". World Health Organization Publications, Geneva, Switzerland; p: 1.
- Yazıcıoğlu, Y., Erdoğan, S. 2004. Spss Applied Scientific Research Methods. Detay Publication, Ankara, Turkey (in Turkish).

### Visual assessment of rural landscape with different characters

Farklı karakterdeki kırsal peyzajların görsel değerlendirmesi

Esra Özhancı<sup>1</sup> 🕩, Hasan Yılmaz<sup>2</sup> 🕩

<sup>1</sup>Department of Landscape Architecture, Nevşehir Hacı Bektas Veli University, Faculty of Engineering and Architecture, 50300, Nevşehir, Turkey

<sup>2</sup>Department of Landscape Architecture, Atatürk University, Faculty of Architecture and Design, 25240, Erzurum, Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

Rapid urbanization and urban structuring made in resonse to intense and stressful living conditions has been putting undue pressure on city residents. In addition, the harmful effects of urban and industrial pollutants increases with every passing day. For these reasons, the existence and nature of rural areas become even more important as the aesthetic and functional roles of rural sites grow. The visual value of the landscape is the initial data that reflects the identity of the area and the beginning of landscape planning. Visual quality has a particularly decisive value for the goals of minimizing intervention and making the right planning decisions for rural areas. This study aimed to conduct visual evaluation on rural areas that feature different characters. Visual Landscape Quality Analysis was performed on designated rural settlements (10 villages situated in Bayburt). Results showed that the highest rated landscape unit was Vegetation Landscape (M = 0.78), with Path Landscape ranking second (M = 0.71), and followed by Agricultural Landscape in third rank (M = 0.70). The Cultural Landscape ranked the least (M = -0.43).

Keywords: Bayburt, visual landscape, visual quality

#### ÖΖ

Hızlı kentleşme ve kentsel yapının ortaya çıkardığı yoğun ve stresli yaşam koşulları, kent halkı üzerinde baskı oluşturmaktadır. Ayrıca kentsel ve endüstriyel kirleticilerin yarattığı zararlı etkiler her geçen gün artmaktadır. Bu noktada kırsal alanların varlığı ve niteliği daha da önem kazanmakta, estetik ve fonksiyonel rolü büyümektedir. Bir peyzajın görsel değeri, alanın kimliğini yansıtan ilk veri ve planlamanın başlangıcıdır. Görsel kalite, özellikle kırsal alanlarda müdahalenin minimuma indirilmesi, doğru plan kararları alınması açısından belirleyici bir değer olmaktadır. Bu çalışmada, çalışma alanında yer alan farklı karakterdeki kırsal alanlar için görsel değerlendirme elde edilmek istenmiş, belirlenen örnek kırsal yerleşimler (Bayburt ilinde yer alan 10 köy) üzerinde Görsel Peyzaj Kalite Analizi uygulanmıştır. Peyzaj üniteleri bütününde; en yüksek puan alan peyzaj ünitesi Bitki Örtüsü (M=0,78), ikincisi ise Yol Peyzajı (M=0,71), üçüncüsü ise Tarımsal Peyzaj (M=0,70) olmuştur. Kültürel peyzaj ise son sırada yer almıştır(M=-0,43).

Anahtar Kelimeler: Bayburt, Görsel kalite, görsel peyzaj

#### INTRODUCTION

Turkey, which is on the route for EU(European Union) membership process, has been the side of many of the international agreements on the environment, and has been trying to reflect these agreements to its internal legal system (Erdem and Coskun, 2009). Ecological values were discussed in the political agenda in Europe for many years (Rio declaration) and the visual quality received less attention. However, changes were observed with the European Landscape Agreement (2000), and a new landscape concept was developed that was integrated with visual, cultural, and social landscape quality together with ecological functions. The importance and difficulty of integration has been emphasized in many studies (Tress et al., 2005, 2007; Fry et al., 2009). Fry et al. (2009), which schematized the common ground between visual and ecological landscape characters as the *set of intersections*.

#### Cite this paper as:

Özhancı, E., Yılmaz, H., 2019. Visual assessment of rural landscape with different characters. *Forestist* 69(1): 44-60.

Corresponding author: Esra Özhancı e-mail: eozhanci@nevsehir.edu.tr

*Received Date:* 23.05.2016 *Accepted Date:* 12.12.2018

Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International Licence. Today, the interest on interesting landscape (symbolic, historical, etc.) is decreasing, and the concept of planning and management of ordinary landscape is becoming the subject matter in the agenda. There is no consensus on the qualities, values and needs of these common cultural landscapes. According to Vouligny et al. (2009), the intense agricultural usage area landscapes are a good example in this context.

According to Özgüc (1999), the attractiveness and pleasing effects of a place give us the visual quality of that place. The physical factors of the source, which affects the user's perceptions, need to be defined in this context. Landscape quality assessment is an active study field in environmental perception studies, and it is also an important component in environmental planning and management, and for this reason, it is one of the important chains that must not be ignored (Meitner, 2004). In a reasonable and healthy landscape planning work, the planner has to reveal and consider the aesthetic interpretation of the society about the present source before the interpretation of his/her own aesthetic values (Özgüc, 2008).

Not only do the visual components of landscape provide us with an aesthetical value, but they also show us the relation between cultural, economic and biological phenomena. In fact, it is possible to establish a relation between the beauty of the landscape and the wealth of it in terms of bio-ecological factors. Although it is not always possible to apply landscape Visual Landscape Quality Assessment (VLQA) techniques, this quality must be considered as a source that must be preserved to protect rural landscape variety (Angileri and Toccolini, 1993).

The required methodological frame and steps that are necessary for the sensitivity of the visual properties must be applied and emphasized (Krause, 2001);

- The landscape units must be limited with characteristic shaping of the area, structural elements (topography, water, vegetation, colonization) and their landscape mosaic orders,
- Separation of the macro, meso and micro structures within a single landscape part (image, local elements and the structure of the view may be isolated according to the obstacles present in the area),
- Determining the preservation demands, certain interactions and disruption type sensitivities,
- Investigating the disruption levels that will be caused by the ways that will be proposed for equalization, avoiding or minimizing considerable and continuous disruptions.

The assessment of the visual aesthetic quality of a landscape has developed at a significant level in recent years. Objective, reliable and accurate digital measurements and models are the bases in this respect (Palmer and Hoffman, 2001; Roth, 2006). There are two main landscape aesthetics theories paradigms that are based on landscape assessment methods; "objective" paradigm (visual quality according to landscape features), "subjective" paradigm (the landscape quality "in the eye of the audience"). The analysis of the relations between the visual quality and structural features of the landscape is an active study field in which environmental perception research is what counts. The relations between landscape structure and perception are less known; however, it will be extremely advantageous to know them (Fuante de Val et al., 2006). Psycho-physiological model, on the other hand, assumes that the physical features of landscape define the psychological reaction of the observer (Winchcombe and Revell, 2004).

In this study, VLQA was performed in different village types sampling area located within the borders of the city of Bayburt. The aim of the study is to make a VLQA, to analyze the natural and cultural values in rural characteristics in detail, and to make some recommendations. It is also the aim of the present study to form a basis for future studies that will be conducted in the area and in similar areas.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Material

Bayburt has an elevation of 1400-3350 m, and is located on 40°10' Northern and 40°15' Eastern longitude. Bayburt is in Coruh Basin and surrounded by Soğanlı Mountain in the North, Otlukbeli Mountain in the South, Mescit Mountain in the East and Giresun Mountain in the west. VLQA was performed in the 10 villages that were included as the sampling in the study. The villages were ranging through many different areas that showed ecological and morphological differences in a line stretching from north-south part of the city, and for this reason, the area has many different climate types, specific values and character areas (Figure 1). The study was established different landscape types like Plain Village, Mountain Village, Water Shore Village, and Forest Village. The villages that were determined as the study area were Calidere, Helva, Masat, Aslandede, Camlikoz, Bayraktar (Bayburt/Central village), Sırataslar, Kılıckaya, İncili (Bayburt/ Aydıntepe district) and Devetası (Demirozu district) Villages.

#### Method

The basic idea of the VLQA is to determine the rural identity in the samples of rural residential areas that have different characteristics in Bayburt. In this context, it was also aimed in the present study that the landscapes that have high visual quality value are determined, the advantages and disadvantages brought by different ecological and cultural features in this residential area are revealed, and the differences in the assessments of the experts and other society members are defined. As a result of these assessments, the Rural Landscape Visual Value was defined in the present study.

Many methods have been applied for Visual Landscape Analysis and Assessment until our present day (Paquette and Dammon, 2003; Arriaza et al., 2004; Turk, 2006; Rogge et al., 2007; Gruehn and Roth, 2008; Lokocz et al., 2011; Cloquell-Ballester et al., 2012; Özhancı et al., 2013). In this study, a Visual Quality Evaluation Method that is specific and suitable for the present study area was formed by making use of the Scenic Beauty Estimation Method-Daniel and Boster, 1976 and various other studies to determine the rural landscape features of the study area. The residential tissues (housing areas) in the general silhouette and villages have been dealt with in architectural terms. In this respect, VLQA was made by considering the bases of the Gestalt Hypothesis and architectural principles. The landscape charac-



Figure 1. The location of Bayburt and rural settlement (1. Calıdere, 2. Helva, 3. Masat, 4. Aslandede, 5. Camlıkoz, 6. Bayraktar, 7. Sırataslar, 8. Kılıckaya, 9. İncili, 10. Devetası)

teristics of the rural residential areas, which were determined as the study area, were divided into 5 Units to perform visual evaluation, and the photographs of these areas were evaluated according to various parameters by experts and public. Then, the data obtained in the study were evaluated in statistical terms.

#### Photographing Process and Classification

The photographing process in the study area was performed in 2011-2012 August-September period. Nikon D40 Pro camera was used in the field work performed in 10 villages that were selected as the study area; between 10:00-15:00 (to reduce the solar effect to the lowest level). Nearly 5000 photographs were sifted through by experts according to the purpose of the study, and 55 photographs were chosen to be used in the evaluation process. The photographs were taken at the eye level, and the distance was kept at the same level in every village for the desired photograph type. For the purpose of making a better evaluation, the images that would be evaluated by the expert team and public were classified under 5 Landscape Character Units, which are;

**1. General Silhouette (G)**, which refers to the images in which rural residential areas and landscape areas are included in the frame (Figure 2).

**2. Natural Landscape / Vegetation (VG)**, which refers to the Vegetation and landscape areas located in and around rural residential areas (Figure 3).

**3. Road Landscape (RL)**, which refers to the main road destination and landscape that are included in the rural residential area and that enable users to reach the rural residential areas (Figure 4).





Figure 2. Examples of the general silhouette images used in visual quality analysis



VG1

VG2

VG3



VG5

VG6

VG7

Figure 3. Examples of the vegetation images used in visual quality analysis



RL1

*RL2* 

*RL3* 



Figure 4. Examples of the road landsape images used in visual quality analysis

**4. Agricultural Landscape (AL)**, which refers to the images that include the agricultural areas, landscapes and surrounding areas, which are one of the main components of rural residences (Figure 5).

**5. Cultural Landscape (Housing texture) (CL)**, which refers to the images in which there are residential areas, mosques, alleys and squares, which are in the focal point of the rural residence (Figure 6).



AL9

*AL10* 

AL11

Figure 5. Examples of the agricultural landscape images used in visual quality analysis



CL 5

CL6

RL7



CL 13

CL14

CL15

Figure 6. Examples of the cultural landscape images used in visual quality analysis

#### Assessment Process

#### **Assessment of Public**

In this study, a public assessment was also performed in the scope of the VLQA, which was conducted to obtain the opinions on Visual Quality of the landscape of the city of Bayburt. Many previous studies were reviewed, and the questionnaires, analyses and data analyses were made by using the most ideal evaluation parameters.

The participants of the study were Architecture and Design Faculty, Landscape Architecture Department 2<sup>nd</sup> Grade students (46), Fine Arts Faculty, Music Department (23) and Traditional Handcraft Department students (21), Science Faculty Geography Department students (42), Literature Faculty Turkish Language and Literature Department students (30) and the residents of Erzurum (46), which makes a total of 6 different groups, and 208 people.

The evaluation process started with a briefing on the purpose of the study which was also intended to avoid problems that might occur due to misinterpretations. Then, all the images were presented to the participants as a slideshow, and the participants were asked to evaluate each image between -2 and +2 scores within 15 seconds (-2: completely repulsive,-1: repulsive, 0: neutral, +1: attractive, +2: very attractive). This evaluation was performed only to familiarize the participants to the images, and this process was not used in further analyses.

In the last stage, the participants were asked to rate the images between -2 and +2 range in terms of naturalness, openness, variety, order, trust, cohesion and the fineness of the sceneries (Table 1).

#### **Expert Evaluation**

In this stage, the images of different character areas were evaluated by an expert group consisting of Landscape Architecture Department academicians by using a series of landscape and architectural parameters. The evaluation form was presented to the expert group, and they were asked to make evaluations on the photographs according to the given range of points. The aim of this evaluation was to define the relation between expert evaluation and the evaluation of the people. Then, in order to determine the real value of the landscape, the participants were asked to choose the most proper statements that fit their viewpoints.

#### **Evaluation of the Classified Photographs over Parameters**

In general silhouette and vegetation assessment, the evaluation of the landscape features and assessment of the images (9 general silhouette and 12 vegetation) taken from the residential areas were made by the expert group. Eleven main titles were used in the evaluation, which were visual area, visual area depth, closure, continuance, water, dominant vegetation, topography, cultural elements, and sky.

The real value of the landscape, based on the statement "For humans, the landscape that is independent from its functions is the real landscape", in the last stage, the experts were asked to choose one of the statements; "Landscape must be developed", "Landscape may stay as is", "Landscape may be completely eliminated, or converted into another landscape". In addition, the vegetation images were questioned in terms of the most ideal landscape function (Rogge et al., 2007). The evaluation list is given in Table 2.

In road landscape, eight images that were taken from the residential areas were evaluated in terms of degree of naturalness, the rhythm of the road, the contribution of the topography, the sense of area, traditionalism level, surprises, dominant vegetation, the quality of the scenery road, the effectiveness of the skyboard line, the type of the landscape through which the landscape road passes. In addition, the images were also questioned in terms of the real value of the landscape. The evaluation list is given in Table 3.

Agricultural landscape is another basic component of the visual evaluation. Eleven agricultural area images taken from

PARAMETER / Definitions	
Naturalness	Give Low points if you perceive a clear inconsistency between the "current natural scenery features" and "the scenery features that seems to be given place by humans in the scenery" in the image.
Openness	If you think that it is difficult or confusing to interpret the image, give a low point.
Variety	If you think that the image has various elements that are different from each other, give a high point; and if not, give a low point.
Order	If you perceive that the image has ranked elements or it has a clear order of things, give a high point.
Reassurance	If you perceive that the components of the image recalls risks or dangers, give low point; if the image presents a hospitable, danger-free and safe perception, give a high point.
Cohesion	If there are foreign elements that are not integrated with the rest of the landscape elements, give a low point.
The beauty of the scenery	Give a point to the image according to the beauty of the scenery.

#### Table 1. The parameters used in public evaluation

the study area by the expert group were evaluated in terms of the landscape features and elements. There were 14 main titles in the evaluations, which were visual area, visual area depth, and vegetation around it, agricultural products, topography, cultural elements, color, composition, perceptibility, variety, openness, and order. In addition, the images were also questioned in terms of the real value of the landscape and the most ideal landscape function. The evaluation list is given in Table 4. Cultural landscape (housing texture) is another component of visual evaluation. 15 residential area images that were taken by the expert group were evaluated in terms of agricultural features and elements. There were 8 main titles in the evaluation; similarity, closeness, topography contribution, sense of area, traditionalism level, definable form, image clarity, and the sustainability of the streets. In addition, the images were also questioned in terms of the real value of the Landscape and the most ideal Landscape function. The evaluation list is given in Table 5.

			SCOF	RING		
Parameters	1	2	3	4	5	6
VISUAL AREA	Closed	Filtered	Open			
VISUAL AREA DEPTH	<100m	100 m-2 km	>2 km			
CLOSURE	No	There is				
CONTINUANCE	No	There is				
WATER						
*Water flow	No Flow	Flow				
*Water source type	No water	River	Lake	Dam		
* Water ratio	0-25%	25-50%	50-75%	75-100%		
DOMINANT VEGETATION						
* Covered with vegetation area ratio	0-25%	25-50%	50-75%	75-100%		
* Vegetation type	No egetation	Herbaceous plants and shrubs	Culture plants	Mixed shrubs and trees	Trees	Forest
TOPOGRAPHY	Plain/ near flat	Partially wavy	Partly mountainous	Mountainous	Valley	
CULTURAL ELEMENTS						
* Presence of man-made positive elements / places and typical houses	Not at all	One item	Two items	Three or more		
* The existence of man-made negative elements / roads, industry, energy lines etc.	Three or more	Two items	One item	Not at all		
* Proportion of man-made elements	75-100%	50-75%	25-50%	0-25%		
SKY						
*Sky ratio	0-25%	25-50%	50-75%	75-100%		
*Presence of significant skyline	No	There is				
THE REAL VALUE OF THE LANDSCAPE	Landscape may be, completely eliminated or converted into another landscape	Landscape must be developed	Landscape may stay as is			
IDEAL LANDSCAPE FUNCTION (for vegetation images)	Existing use	Agricultural use	Recreation / Tourism	Protection		

#### **Statistical Analysis**

The 'SPSS 10.0' Statistical Package Program was used in the analysis of the questionnaires that were used in visual quality analysis. The One-Way Variance Analysis (ANOVA), Regression Analysis and Correlation Analysis (Spearman's RHO) were used in the analyses of the data.

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

# Scoring the General Attractiveness and Comprehensive Questioning

The beauty of the scenery scores (-2,-1, 0,+1,+2 range) that were given by 207 participants for 56 different images to which VLQA was applied were evaluated and ranked according to Visual Preference Score (VPS) (Table 6.). 55.7% of

the participants were female, and 61,35% were living in the city center with their families, 55.56% lived in a cold-climate area.

The images VG5, VG6, VG8, VG9, VG11 from the Vegetation Images; AL1, AL2, AL7 from Agricultural Landscape Images; CL14 from Cultural Landscape Images; RL7 from Road Landscape Images were determined to have the highest "beauty of the scenery scores". The first three images were VG6 (M=1.40), VG11 (M=1.37) and VG5 (M=1.28), respectively (Figure 7).

As a result of the evaluations, the images with the lowest "beauty of the scenery score" were CL2, CL8, CL7, CL4, CL3, CL1, CL9 and G4, respectively (Figure 8.).

#### Table 3. Features used in the evaluation of road landscape images by the expert group

		SCORING					
Parameters	1	2	3	4	5	6	
DEGREE OF NATURALNESS	Incompatible with natural tissue floor type+vegetation+ sign boards +energy transmission lines	Partially compatible with natural tissue floor type+vegetation+ sign boards + energy transmission lines	Compatible with natural tissue floor type+ vegetation+ sign boards +energy transmission lines				
THE RHYTHM OF THE ROAD (compliance with natural forms)	Stable	Partially mobile	Active				
THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE TOPOGRAPHY	Low	Medium	Clear				
THE SENSE OF PLACE (the power to represent the geography in which it is located)	Low	Medium	Clear				
TRADITIONALISM LEVEL (Originality)	No traditional structure	Some traditional structures	Completely traditional structures				
SURPRISES	No	There is					
DOMINANT VEGETATION							
* Covered with vegetation area ratio	0-25%	25-50%	50-75%	75-100%			
* Vegetation type	No vegetation	Herbaceous plants and shrubs	Culture plants	Mixed shrubs and trees	Trees	Forest	
THE QUALITY OF THE SCENERY ROAD	Low	Medium	Clear				
THE EFFECTIVENESS OF THE SKYBOARD LI	NE Low	Medium	Clear				
THE TYPE OF THE LANDSCAPE THROUGH WHICH THE LANDSCAPE ROAD PASSES	Cultural Landscape	Agricultural Landscape	Meadow- grassland	Mountain Ecosystem			
THE REAL VALUE OF THE LANDSCAPE	Landscape may be completely eliminated, or converted into another landscape	Landscape must be developed	Landscape may stay as is				

In the whole of the landscape character unit groups, the highest score belonged to Vegetation Unit (M=0,78); and the second highest score belonged to Road Landscape Unit (M=0,71). The Cultural Landscape was the last item in the list (Table 7). As a matter of fact, the differences between the different types of images were found to be statistically significant in One-Way Variance Analysis (ANOVA) results (f value =419.732, p=0.000<.01) (Table 8.).

#### The Visual Quality Parameter Scores of the Images

The Regression Analysis was applied to determine at which level the visual quality parameters were effective on the beauty of the scenery factor. The results of the analysis are given below (Table 9).

In this respect, the independent variables can explain the 47.4% of the variance in the dependent variables. In addition. accord-



Figure 7. The images with highest score of landscape beauty



CL 2

CL7

CL4



Figure 8. The images with lowest score of landscape beauty

ing to the significance value in Anova, the value was p < 0.01; for this reason, the model was found to be significant (Table 10).

The relation between all the parameter and the beauty of the scenery was significant at p<0,01 level. However, there was no statistically significant relation between the beauty of the scenery and 'openness' parameter. It was understood that the factor that had the highest effect on the beauty of the scenery was 'Naturalness', and 'trust' and 'cohesion' followed this (Table 11). This situation may be characterized with the following formula;

 $y=0.213+0.245x_1+0.045x_2+0.079x_2+0.166x_4+0.081x_5+0.290x_6$ In the image with the highest beauty of the scenery score in visual landscape quality parameters, the distribution of the scores was as; naturalness (M=1.56); openness (M=1.19); variety (M=0.74); order (M=0.90); reassurance (M=0.72) and cohesion (M=-0.92).

#### **Expert Evaluation**

The scores given to the images as a result of expert evaluation in general silhouette images and their VPS scores are given in Table 12.

The scores given to the images as a result of expert evaluation in vegetation images and their VPS scores are given in Table 13.

The scores given to the images as a result of expert evaluation in agricultural landscape images and their VPS scores are given in Table 14.

			SCORING		
Parameters	1	2	3	4	5
VISUAL AREA	Closed	Filtered	Open		
VISUAL AREA DEPTH	<100m	100 m-2 km	>2 km		
VEGETATION AROUND IT					
*Covered with vegetation area ratio	0-25%	25-50%	50-75%	75-100%	
* Vegetation type	No vegetation	Herbaceous plants and shrubs	Culture plants	Mixed shrubs and trees	Trees
AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTS	Inactive in view	Active in view			
TOPOGRAPHY	Plain / near flat	Partially wavy	Partly mountainous	Mountainous	
CULTURAL ELEMENTS					
* Presence of man-made positive elements / places and typical houses	Not at all	One item	Two items	Three or more	
* The existence of man-made negative elements / roads, industry, energy lines etc.	Three or more	Two items	One item	Not at all	
* Proportion of man-made elements	75-100%	50-75%	25-50%	0-25%	
COLOR					
*Number of color	One color	Two color	Three or more		
*Color harmony	Clear color harmony	Poor color harmony			
COMPOSITION					
*Focus	No focus image	Focus image			
PERCEPTIBILITY					
*Kitle-Bosluk Oranı	Low	Medium	Clear		
VARIETY	Low	Medium	Clear		
OPENNESS	Low	Medium	Clear		
ORDER	Low	Medium	Clear		
THE REAL VALUE OF THE LANDSCAPE	Landscape may be completely eliminated, or converted into another landscape	Landscape must be developed	Landscape may stay as is		
IDEAL LANDSCAPE FUNCTION	Existing use	Meadow- grassland	Recreation / Tourism	Protection	

The scores given to the images as a result of expert evaluation in road landscape images and their VPS scores are given in Table 15.

The scores given to the images as a result of expert evaluation in cultural landscape images and their VPS scores are given in Table 16.

The images that had the highest average scores in expert evaluation in expert evaluation are CL5 (M=2.90) from CL images; VG6 (M=2.65) from VG images; AL3 (M=2.65) from AL images; RL1 (M=2.58) from RL images; G1 (M=2.31) from G images (Figure 9).

According to the results of the correlation analysis (Spearman's RHO). which was conducted to question the relation between the landscape features and VPS scores. it was observed that the relation with the vegetation rate was significant in GS images. the relation with water flow and water source type was very significant in VG images. and the relation with the existence of man-made positive elements; and the relation with topography contribution was significant in CL images. The results for all landscape units are given in Table 17.

The common features of the high point area vegetation images were that they had dominant naturalness in them. integrity and



CL5

VG6



Figure 9. The highest rated images in Experts Review

#### Table 5. Features used in the evaluation of cultural landscape images by the expert group

		SCORING	
Parameters	1	2	3
SIMILARITY	Low	Medium	Clear
CLOSENESS	Low	Medium	Clear
TOPOGRAPHY CONTRIBUTION	Low	Medium	Clear
SENSE OF AREA	Low	Medium	Clear
TRADITIONALISM LEVEL	No traditional structure	Some traditional structures	Completely traditional structures
DEFINABLE FORM	Yok	Var	
MAGE CLARITY	Low	Medium	Clear
THE SUSTAINABILITY OF THE STREETS	Low	Medium	Clear
THE REAL VALUE OF THE LANDSCAPE	Landscape may be completely eliminated, or converted into another landscape	Landscape must be developed	Landscape may stay as is
IDEAL LANDSCAPE FUNCTION	Existing use	Recreation / Tourism	Potection

Landaaana			s made GPKD	Dhata	
Landscape Types	Photo cod	VPS and Std. Deviation	Landscape Types	Photo cod	VPS and Std Deviation
GENERAL SILHOUETTE (GS)	G1	0.02±1.31	ROAD LANDSCAPE (RL)	RL1	0.73±1.24
	G2	0.13±1.28		RL2	0.93±1.13
	G3	0.43±1.27		RL3	0.39±1.22
	G4	-0.44±1.28		RL4	0.67±1.20
	G5	0.72±1.23		RL5	0.73±1.22
	G6	0.63±1.28		RL6	0.66±1.25
	G7	0.30±1.19		RL7	0.99±1.14
	G8	0.21±1.22		RL8	0.70±1.31
	G9	0.75±1.20			
VEGETATION (VG)	VG1	0.34±1.09	AGRICULTURAL LANDSCAPE (AL)	AL2	1.10±1.14
	AL1	1.14±1.15		AL3	0.94±1.13
	VG2	0.97±1.25		AL4	0.37±1.75
	VG3	0.13±1.30		AL5	0.58±1.20
	VG4	0.24±1.40		AL6	0.61±1.23
	VG5	1.28±1.01		AL7	1.24±1.03
	VG6	1.40±0.97		AL8	0.47±1.23
	VG7	0.24±1.35		AL9	0.44±1.26
	VG8	1.27±1.04		AL10	0.50±1.26
	VG9	0.99±1.13		AL11	0.31±1.33
	VG10	0.83±1.20			
	VG11	1.37±1.02			
	VG12	0.29±1.26			
CULTURAL LANDSCAPE (CL)	CL1	-0.74±1.30			
	CL2	-1.00±1.23			
	CL3	-0.86±1.17			
	CL4	-0.88±1.18			
	CL5	-0.14±1.34			
	CL6	-0.28±1.35			
	CL7	-0.91±1.13			
	CL 8	-0.92±1.14			
	CL 9	-0.69±1.29			
	CL10	-0.75±1.22			
	CL11	-0.29±1.30			
	CL2	-0.20±1.39			
	CL13	-0.43±1.30			
	CL14	1.03±1.14			
	CL15	0,64±1,30			

Table 7. The scores obtained b units	y the landscape character
Landscape Character Unit	VPS and Standart Deviation
GENERAL SILHOUETTE	0.31±1.30
VEGETATION	0.78±1.30
ROAD LANDSCAPE	0.71±1.22
AGRICULTURAL LANDSCAPE	0.70±1.24
CULTURAL LANDSCAPE	-0.43±1.38

that they did not have any negative and inconsistent elements. In addition. in all images. almost an image pool appeared with the contribution of the topography. In the "Scenery/Traffic Island" Theory of Appleton (1975). topography plays a significant role in the evaluation of the spatial structure of the landscape. This is closely related with the feeling that landscape has a typical or panoramic view (Hagerhall. 2001; Fuente de Val et al. 2006).

The AL7 image. which was taken from Masat Village agricultural landscape. shows a neatly-planned agricultural parceling.

#### Table 8. ANOVA test showing the results of inter-group and intra- group analysis of different units of images

	Sum of squares	Sd	Mean squares	f	р
Between groups	2832.518	4	708.130	419.732	.000*
Within groups	19199.199	11380	1.687		
Total	22031.717	11384			
*p<0,01, statistically very signi	ficant				

Table 9. The Regression model between landscape beauty and parameters							
R	R <sup>2</sup>	Adjusted R <sup>2</sup>	Std. error of the estimate				
0,689ª	0.474	0.473	0.79				

Table 10. Anova Test between landscape beauty and parameters										
Model	Sum of squares	Sd	Mean squares	F	р					
Regression	1165.216	6	194.203	310.029	0.000ª					
Residual	1292.266	2063	0.626							
Total	2457.483	2069								

#### Table 11. The Regression Analysis results of the interpretation of landscape beauty

		Unstandardized coefficient B Std. Hata			
	В			t	Significance
CONSTANT	0.213	0.037		5.768	0.000
NaturalIness(x <sub>1</sub> )	0.245	0.024	0.039	1.872	0.000
Openness (x <sub>2</sub> )	0.045	0.019	0.084	4.250	0.061
Variety (x <sub>3</sub> )	0.079	0.025	0.188	9.830	0.000
Order (X <sub>4</sub> )	0.166	0.024	0.170	6.920	0.000
Safety (x <sub>5</sub> )	0.081	0.019	0.093	4.225	0.000
Cohesion ( $x_6$ )	0.290	0.023	0.301	12.616	0.000

Table 12. The average scores VPS and	landscape features o	f general silhouette images
--------------------------------------	----------------------	-----------------------------

	G1	G2	G3	G4	G5	G6	G7	G8	G9
MEAN SCORE	2.31	1.69	1.75	2.19	2.5	2.19	1.60	1.94	2.19
VPS	0.02	0.13	0.43	-0.44	0.72	0.63	0.30	0.21	0.75

the cultural plants among them. and the residential area in the background. The Populus sp. and Prunus sp., which are placed in a certain order, agree with the linear structure of the agricultural landscape.

Cultural Landscape images received low scores in general evaluation and the CL14 image (Helva Village) ranked 7<sup>th</sup> among the first group. When the details are considered. it is observed that this image reflects the natural structure better when compared with other images. Image is a network of parts with humans animals green elements and trees. In the background the mountain silhouette strengthens the effect. In expert evaluation it was included in images that had low scores. It was observed that this image was weak in terms of the architectural features that were questioned.

#### Table 13. The average scores VPS and landscape features of vegetation images

	VG1	VG2	VG3	VG4	VG5	VG6	VG7	VG8	VG9	VG10	VG11	VG12
MEAN SCORE	2.47	2.35	2.23	2.06	2.47	2.65	2.35	2.12	2.00	1.88	2.59	2.00
VPS	0.34	0.97	0.13	0.24	1.28	1.40	0.24	1.27	0.99	0.83	1.37	0.29

Table 14. The average scores VPS and landscape features of agricultural landscape images											
	AL1	AL2	AL3	AL4	AL5	AL6	AL7	AL8	AL9	AL10	AL11
MEAN SCORE	2.05	1.75	2.65	2.45	2.25	2.15	2.2	2.2	1.6	2.35	1.8
VPS	1.14	1.10	0.94	0.37	0.58	0.61	1.24	0.47	0.44	0.50	0.31

#### Table 15. The average scores VPS and landscape features of road landscape images

	RL1	RL2	RL3	RL4	RL5	RL6	RL7	RL8
MEAN SCORE	2.58	1.92	2.50	1.75	2.50	1.83	2.25	2.00
VPS	0.73	0.93	0.39	0.67	0.73	0.66	0.99	0.70

#### Table 16. The average scores VPS and landscape features of cultural landscape images

	CL1	CL2	CL3	CL4	CL5	CL6	CL7	CL8
MEAN SCORE	2	2.6	2.4	2.2	2.9	1.7	2.1	1.3
VPS	74	-1.0	86	88	14	28	91	92
	CL9	CL10	CL11	CL12	CL13	CL14	CL15	
MEAN SCORE	2.3	2.4	2.7	2.1	2.6	1.5	2.3	
VPS	69	75	29	20	43	1.03	.64	

#### Table 17. The correlation analysis between landscape characteristics and VPS scores

Landscape Unit	Landscape features	VPS	Significance
General silhouette	DOMINANT VEGETATION		
	Covered with vegetation area ratio	0.725*	0.027
Vegetation	WATER		
	Water flow	0.753**	0.005
	Water source type	0.753**	0.005
	CULTURAL ELEMENTS		
	Presence of man-made positive elements / places and typical houses	0.585*	0.046
Cultural Landscape	THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE TOPOGRAPHY	0.549*	0.042
*p<0.05. statistically significant			
**p<0.01. statistically very significant			

The weakest feature of the rural residential areas was that it is not possible to see an efficient architectural character. Together with the new and uncontrolled construction. The culture of wooden adobe and stone structures that dominated in the past have been lost and architecturally unidentified structures appeared in the area. This attracts the attention both in construction technique and in the colors used. In this context, plans must be made in further studies to regain the architectural character; and the village townhouse culture. Which has been brought until our present day through a tradition that exists almost in every village, must be placed in the very center of this structure. The governmental buildings that are built by the state (school. healthcare center. etc.) must also reflect this culture. Tempesta (2010) conducted a study on rural areas and reported that traditional structures contributed to the visual value of the landscape; however. other manmade elements weakened this effect and left a deep and negative trace. However which is more important is that these traditional structures must represent a certain architectural identity. The basic source of the visual activity is the existence of this identity. RL7 image is the image of a road landscape near Devetası Village. The natural vegetation which surrounds the road as a belt. Increases the quality of the image with its colors. While the trees bring the vertical effect in the skyboard line of the road. The active topography is another component in the background. In this image. The clarity and naturalness come to the forefront together with the topography contribution. which is also the case in vegetation images.

The G9 image is the only image with high score in its group (General Silhouette). The thing that makes it unique is the efficiency of the water element in the landscape. In the image of Aslandede Village. It attracts attention that there appear bends and curves when the Coruh River passes through the village and runs towards the plain. It brings the wealth of morphology of the valley to the forefront in its group.

In the whole of the unit groups the highest score belongs to the area landscape unit vegetation. The second highest score belongs to the road landscape unit and the third highest score belongs to agricultural landscape unit. The cultural landscape ranked the last in this context. As a matter of fact Lokocz et al. (2011) conducted a preference study and reported that natural landscape photograph category (including the road images) ranked the first and agricultural landscapes followed it.

When industrial elements are included in rural landscape. there appear changes in negative ways in concepts like fineness and naturalness. Meanwhile asphalt roads also cause negative changes in these concepts (Cloquell-Ballester et al. 2012). In this study, the road images that were used in the evaluations did not cause a negative effect because it did not create a direct contrast with the natural texture. The natural vegetation of the area must be preserved, and must be evaluated together with the colorful road landscape. Stations and facilities must be established to enable people find the opportunity of stopping by or spending the night and watch the vista points where the vegetation can be watched in the best manner in the roads with scenery.

In the analysis that was made to determine to which extent the visual quality parameters were effective on the beauty of the scenery factor. It was determined that there was no statistically significant relation between the beauty of the scenery and 'openness' parameter. The 'naturalness' was the factor that had the highest effect on the beauty of the scenery (Purcell and Lamb. 1984; Hartig. 1993; Hagerhall et al.. 2004; Cloquell-Ballester et al.. 2012). and 'trust' and 'cohesion' followed this.

The images that had the highest average scores in the expert evaluation were CL5. VG6. AL3. RL1. and G1. The CL5 image. which is the image of a cultural landscape of the Masat Village residential area. has several architectural elements like the clarity and continuity. In other images it was observed that aside from the agricultural landscape image. The water and especially the topography elements increase the visual efficiency aside from the agricultural landscape image.

In the literature the two determiners that are effective on the preference have been reported as "attracting people to visit and see" and "worth preserving" concepts (Sevenant and Antrop, 2009). The "attracting people to visit and see" concept has been considered as the need of humans to discover and as the discovery behavior in the literature (Hagerhall, 2000). "Attractive vegetation", "being not under the influence of humans" and "being not disrupted" refer to the naturalness level that is perceived (Sevenant and Antrop, 2009).

It was observed that the results of the evaluation done by the experts do not overlap with the evaluation of the people. As a matter of fact the indicators that have visual and ecological importance may not be interpreted in the same manner in both viewpoints. The differences expressed by this indicator may be positive in terms of ecological aspect and negative in terms of visual aspect. The visual and ecological function scale of humans shows differences. For example if we are talking about an open area in a landscape. a major-scale open area may be perceived as positive in terms of visual aspect and a minor-scale open area will have many ecological functions (Fry et al., 2009).

When the relation between the landscape features and visual preference scores was considered. It was determined that the relation with *the rate of area covered with vegetation* is important in general silhouette images and the existence of the *water flow. water source type and manmade positive elements* is significant in vegetation images and the relation between the topography contribution is significant in cultural landscape images. As a matter of fact studies conducted so far revealed that the elements that were perceived as natural developed landscape; and anthropogenic elements deteriorated the visual quality (Schroeder. 1988; Franco et al. 2003; Arriaza et al. 2004; Rogge et al. 2007; Palmer. 2008; Tempesta. 2010). In addition another important point that must be kept in mind is the level of the effect created by the perspective of the image. The photographer must add a perspective comment before the viewer.

#### CONCLUSION

In Visual Quality Analysis. it was determined that the VG6. VG11. VG5. VG8 and VG9 images had the highest scores in Vegetation Images; the AL7. AL1. AL2 images had the highest scores in Agricultural Landscape Image; CL14 had the highest score in Cultural Landscape Images; RL7 had the highest scores in Road Landscape Images in terms of "the beauty of the scenery score"; and the first three images were VG6. VG11 and VG5. respectively. The images that had the highest scores in each Landscape Character Unit were G9 in the GS Unit; B6 in the VG Unit; Y7 in the RL Unit: T7 in the AL Unit: K14 in the CL Unit. As a whole of the unit groups. The Area Landscape Unit Vegetation had the highest score; the Road Landscape Unit had the second highest score; the Agricultural Landscape Unit had the third highest score; and the Cultural Landscape ranked the latest. It was determined that there was no statistically significant relation between the beauty of the scenery and 'openness' parameter; and the factor that had the highest effect on 'the beauty of the scenery' was 'naturalness'; and 'trust' and 'cohesion' followed it.

The images that had the highest Landscape Feature Scores in expert evaluations were K5. B6. T3. Y1. and G1. The K5 image. which is one of the Cultural Landscape Images from Masat Village residential area has several architectural elements like image clarity and continuity. In other images it attracts attention that aside from the agricultural landscape image. Visual efficiency is also increased by especially water and topographical elements.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

**Author Contributions:** Concept – E.Ö., H.Y.; Design – E.Ö., H.Y.; Supervision – E.Ö., H.Y.; Resources – E.Ö.; Materials – E.Ö.; Data Collection and/or Processing – E.Ö.; Analysis and/or Interpretation – E.Ö., H.Y.; Literature Search – E.Ö.; Writing Manuscript –E.Ö., H.Y.; Critical Review – E.Ö., H.Y.; Other – E.Ö.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Financial Disclosure:** This article includes a part of the PhD thesis supported by the Scientific Research Project of Atatürk University.

#### REFERENCES

- Angileri. V., Toccolini. A., 1993. The assessment of visual quality as atol for the conservation of rural landscape diversity. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 24(1-4): 105-112. [CrossRef]
- Arriaza. M., Canas-Ortega. J.F., Canas-Madueno. J.A., Ruiz-Aviles. P., 2004. Assessing the visual quality of rural landscapes. *Lanscape and Urban Planning* 69: 115-125. [CrossRef]
- Bergen. S. D. Ulbricht C. A. Fridley J. L., Ganter M. A., 1995. The validity of computer-generated graphic images of forest landscape. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 15(2):135-146. [CrossRef]
- Cloquell-Ballester. V.A., Torres-Sibille. A.C., Cloquell-Ballester., V.A. Santamarina-Siurana. M.C. 2012. Human alteration of the rural landscape: Variations in visual perception. *Environmental Impact Assessment Review* 32: 50–60. [CrossRef]

- Erdem. N., Coskun. A.A., 2009. Concurrency Analysis of European Lanscape Convention Articles with Turkish Planning Legislation. Journal of the Faculty of Forestry Istanbul University. Series B. Vol 59. No 2.
- Franco. D. Franco. D. Mannino. I. Zanetto. G. 2003. The impact of agroforestry networks on scenic beauty estimation. The role of a landscape ecological network on socio-cultural process. *Land-scape Urban Plan* 62: 119-138. [CrossRef]
- Fry. G., Tveit. M.S., Ode. A., Velarde., M.D., 2009. The ecology of visual landscapes: Exploring the conceptual common ground of visual and ecological landscape indicators. *Ecological Indicators* 9: 933-947. [CrossRef]
- Fuante de Val. G. Atauri A.J. Lucio J.V. 2006. Relationship between landscape visual attributes and spatial patte§rn indices: A test study in Mediterranean- climate landscapes. *Landscape and Planning* 77(4): 393-407. [CrossRef]
- Gruehn. D. Roth. M. 2008. New Approaches in Visual Landscape Assessment and Modelling. International Landscape Architecture Conference Proceedings. Jelgava. Latvia.
- Hagerhall. C.M. 2000. Clustering predictors of landscape preference in the traditional Swedish cultural landscape: prospect-refuge. mystery. age and management. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 20: 83–90. [CrossRef]
- Hagerhall. C. M.2001. Consensus In Landscape Preference Judgements. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 21: 83-92. [CrossRef]
- Hagerhall. C.M. Purcell. T. Taylor. R. 2004. Fractal dimension of landscape silhouette outlines as a predictor of landscape preference. *Journal of Environmental Psychology* 24: 247-255. [CrossRef]
- Hartig. T. 1993. Nature experience in transactional perspective. Landscape and Urban Planning 25. 17–36. Journal of Environmental Psychology 17: 11-32.
- Krause. C.L. 2001. Our visual landscape managing the landscape under special consideration of visual aspects. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 54: 239-254. [CrossRef]
- Lokocz. E. Ryan. R.L. Sadler. A.J. 2011. Motivations for land protection and stewardship: Exploring place attachment and rural landscape character in Massachusetts. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 99: 65–76. [CrossRef]
- Meitner, M.J., 2004. Scenic beauty of river views in the Grand Canyon: relating perceptual judgments to locations. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 68: 3-13. [CrossRef]
- Özhancı, E., Yılmaz. H., Yılmaz. S., 2013. Safety perception of different plant designs in pedestrian and car streets. Urban Design International 19: 303–310. [CrossRef]
- Özgüç, İ.M., 1999. Visual researchs on landscape planning of TEM Hadımköy-Kınalı. Journal of the Faculty of Forestry Istanbul University. Seri A 49(2): 115-132.
- Özgüç, İ.M., 2008. Landscape Aesthetic and Visual Quality Assessment. Journal of the Faculty of Forestry Istanbul University. Series B. Vol 58. No 1.
- Palmer, J.F., Hoffman R.E., 2001. Rating reliability and representation validty in scenic landscape assessments. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 54: 149-161. [CrossRef]
- Palmer. J.F., 2008. The perceived effects of clearcutting in the White Mountains of New Hampshire. USA. *Journal of Environmental Management* 89: 167–183. [CrossRef]
- Paquette. S., Damon. G., 2003. Changing ruralities. changing landscapes: exploring social recomposition using a multi-scale approach. *Journal of Rural Studies* 19: 425-444. [CrossRef]
- Purcell, A.T., Lamb, R.J., 1984. Landscape perception: an examination and empirical investigation of two central issues in the area. *Journal of Environmental Management* 19: 31–63.

- Rogge, E., Nevens, F., Gulinck, H., 2007. Perception of rural landscapes in Flanders: Looking beyond aesthetics. Landscape and Urban Planning 82: 159–174. [CrossRef]
- Roth, M., 2006.Validating the use of Internet survey techniques in visual landscape assessment—An empirical study from Germany. Landscape and Urban Planning 78(3): 179-192. [CrossRef]
- Schroeder, H.W., 1988. Visual impact of hillside development: Comparison of measurements derived from aerial and ground-level photographs. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 15 (1-2): 119-126. [CrossRef]
- Sevenant. M., Antrop M., 2009. Cognitive attributes and aesthetic preferences in assessment and differentiation of landscapes. *Journal of Environmental Management* 90: 2889–2899. [CrossRef]
- Tempesta, T., 2010. The perception of agrarian historical landscapes: A study of the Veneto plain in Italy. *Landscape and Urban Planning* 97: 258–272. [CrossRef]
- Türk. Y.A., 2006. A method for integrated urban planning and design. KTU Science Institute. PhD Thesis.
- Vouligny, É., Domon, G., Ruiz, J., 2009. An assessment of ordinary landscapes by an expert and by its residents: Landscape values in areas of intensive agricultural use. *Land Use Policy* 26: 890–900. [CrossRef]
- Winchcombe, J., Revell, G., 2004. Farm Forestry and Landscape Architecture: A feasibility study. Joint Venture Agroforestry Program; RIRDC Publication 04/187. Canberra.

## Estimating diameter at breast height (DBH) from diameter at stump height (DST) in triple mixed stands in the region of Artvin in Turkey

### Artvin yöresindeki üçlü karışık meşcerelerde kütük çapı ile göğüs çapı ilişkisi

Abdurrahman Şahin 🗅, Aydın Kahriman 🗅, Aşkın Göktürk 🕩

Department of Forest Engineering, Artvin Çoruh University, Faculty of Forestry, Artvin, Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

Diameter at breast height is used as an independent variable in the calculation of most tree or stand parameters because it can be measured easily and has high correlation with tree variables. But, it is necessary to estimate the size of the DBH of the tree concerned to have knowledge of the tree which has been separated from the area. In this study, DST-DBH relationships were investigated on stands where Oriental Spruce (So), Scots Pine (Ps) and Eastern Black sea Fir (Fb) were mixed. For this purpose, 206 trees (69 So, 69 Ps and 68 Fb) were used which were cut from 23 different sample areas taken in fully closed SoPsFb and PsSoFb stands in Artvin. According to the statistics analysis; models that best explain the variability of the DBH are power for spruce, quadratic for pine and linear models for fir. These models can explain the variance of DBH in triple mixed stands by 95.2% for spruce, 96.5% for pine and 96.4% for fir, and standard errors of models are 1.850, 1.598 and 1.643 respectively. As a result, these models, which at a certain height of success in predicting DBH, can be used by practitioners at fully closed triple mixed stands in Artvin.

Keywords: Diameter at breast height, diameter at stump height, regression analysis, triple mixed stands

#### ÖΖ

Göğüs çapı, kolay ölçülebilir olması ve diğer ağaç değişkenleriyle yüksek korelasyona sahip olmasından dolayı, tek ağaç veya meşcere parametrelerinin birçoğunun hesaplanmasında bağımsız bir değişken olarak kullanılmaktadır. Ancak ormanlık alandan ayrılmış olan ağaç hakkında bilgi sahibi olabilmek için göğüs çapı büyüklüğünü tahmin etmek gerekmektedir. Bu çalışmada, Doğu Ladini (L), Sarıçam (Çs) ve Doğu Karadeniz Göknarı (G) karışık meşcerelerinde göğüs çapı-kütük çapı ilişkisi araştırılmıştır. Bu amaçla Artvin'de tam kapalı olan LÇsG ve ÇsLG meşcerelerinden alınan 23 farklı örnek alandan kesilmiş olan 206 ağaç (69 adet L, 69 adet Çs ve 68 adet G) verisi kullanılmıştır. Yapılan istatistiksel analizlere göre, göğüs çapındaki değişkenliği açıklayan en iyi modeller Ladin'de power, Sarıçamda kuadratik ve Göknarda ise doğrusal modeller olmuştur. Bu modellerin üçlü karışık meşcerelere göğüs çapı değişkenliğini açıklama oranları Ladin için %95,2, Sarıçam için %96,5 ve Göknar için de %96,4 ve bu modellerin hataları da sırasıyla 1.850, 1.598 ve 1.643 şeklinde bulunmuştur. Sonuç olarak, göğüs çapını tahmin etmede belli başarı seviyesinde olan bu modeller, Artvin'deki tam kapalı üçlü karışık meşcerelerde uygulayıcılar tarafından kullanılabilir olarak bulunmuştur.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Göğüs çapı, kütük çapı, regresyon analizi, üçlü karışık meşcereler

#### INTRODUCTION

The most basic variable, used for measurements made in sample areas, is the diameter at the breast height (DBH) in forestry applications (Kangas and Maltamo, 2006; Bettinger et al, 2018). The most common measure used to calculate the dimensions of living and dead trees is DBH. The height of the breast is accepted as 4.5 feet (1.37 meters) from the ground level (Bettinger et al., 2009; 2018).

The diameter at breast height (DBH) corresponding to a height of 1.3 meters is measured in all of the repeated forest inventory (Pretzsch, 2009). Because the DBH is the main variable, which is easy to

#### Cite this paper as:

Şahin, A., Kahriman, A., Göktürk, A., 2019. Estimating diameter at breast height (DBH) from diameter at stump height (DST) in triple mixed stands in the region of Artvin in Turkey. *Forestist* 69(1): 61-67.

Corresponding author: Abdurrahman Şahin e-mail: asahin84@windowslive.com

*Received Date:* 20.09.2018 *Accepted Date:* 13.11.2018

 $\odot$   $\odot$ 

Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International Licence measure and highly correlated with many dependent variables of a single tree. (Vanclay, 1994). Therefore; the DBH is the dependent variable which uses the most common numerous fields including the calculation of the tree volume, the identification of the stand structure, and the selection of the sample plots for the inventory (Dorado et al., 2006; MIsIr, 2010).

Many features such as height, volume, biomass, double bark thickness and crown wide can easily be calculated using the measure of DBH. Especially stand volume which is one of the most important variables in forest management is usually assessed based on the DBH and height of the tree (Rupsys & Petrauskas, 2010; Ogana, Osho & Varela, 2018), so DBH is an important parameter for the tree volume. The most commonly used variable DBH when estimating the tree volume in forestry (Kalıpsız, 1999). Therefore, the volume equations used the most common in the forestry is the single entry tree volume equations which depend on the DBH (Kalıpsız, 1999; Şenyurt, 2012).

## Table 1. The relationship studies between DST - DBH in Turkey

Tree species	Researchers
Calabrian pine	Uğurlu & Özer, 1977
Scots pine	Özer, 1981
Fir	Forestry Research Institute, 1981
Oriental beech	Forestry Research Institute, 1982
Black pine and Scots pine	Yavuz, 1996
Ash	Yavuz, 2000
Black pine, Cedar and Calabrian pine	Özçelik, 2005
Fir, Oriental beech and Black pine stands	Durkaya & Durkaya, 2011
Scots pine	Şenyurt, 2012
Oriental beech	Ercanlı et al., 2015
Chestnut	Sağlam et al, 2016
Red pine and Black pine	Sakıcı & Yavuz, 2016
Oriental beech and Kazdağı Fir mixed stands	Sakıcı & Özdemir, 2017

#### Table 2. Statistical information about sample trees

As a result of overturning, breakage, drying or the illegal cutting of trees, only the stumps remain in the forested areas, so it is necessary to know the DBH in order to estimate the tree volume separated from these areas. In such cases, it is necessary to use these stump dimensions to estimate the DBH and volume of the tree (McClure, 1968; Bylin, 1982; Kozak, & Omule 1992; Wharton, 1984; Chhetri, & Fowler, 1996; Corral-Rivas et al., 2007; Özçelik et al., 2010; Milios et al., 2016). That is why foresters are usually faced with the problem of determining and confirming the DBH of felled trees (Shrivastava, & Singh, 2003). Foresters who are usually confronted with the problem of determining the DBH of felled trees, can estimate the volume of felled trees. using the relationship model of DST-DBH (Diéguez-Aranda et al., 2003; Şenyurt, 2012). In this way the models estimating DBH using stump measurements will also benefit forest managers as well as researchers (Chhetri, & Fowler, 1996). The determination of DBH is possible by regression and correlation studies between DST values as independent variables and DBH as dependent variables. (Shrivastava, & Singh, 2003).

The studies on the relationship model between DST and DBH in Turkey were given in Table 1 (Uğurlu & Özer, 1997; Forestry Research Institute, 1981; Forestry Research Institute, 1982; Giray, 1982; Yavuz, 1996; Yavuz, 2000; Özçelik, 2005; Durkaya & Durkaya, 2011; Şenyurt, 2012; Ercanlı et al., 2015; Sağlam et al, 2016; Sakıcı & Yavuz, 2016; Sakıcı & Özdemir, 2017).

In this study, the aim was to model the regression analysis of the relationship between the DST and the DBH for all species separately in the triple mixed stands (Oriental spruce, Scots pine and Eastern Black sea Fir) of Artvin.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Material

Within the scope of the study, for the purpose of determining the relationship between the DST and the DBH; A total of 206 tree data were used from 23 different sample areas cut from the fully closed Oriental spruce-Scots pine-Eastern Black sea fir (SoPsFb) and Scots pine-Oriental spruce-Eastern Black sea fir (Ps-SoFb) triple mixed stands spreading in Artvin. In the triple mixed stands, the sample plots were selected from places where the three tree species were located and adjacent to each other. In

Tree species	Variable	n	Mean	Standard deviation	Minimum (cm)	Maximum (cm)
O. spruce	DST (cm)	69	27.2	9.6	9.3	57.1
	DBH (cm)	09	23.4	8.2	8.3	52.1
S. pine	DST (cm)	69	34.7	10.2	13.5	57.0
	DBH (cm)	09	29.8	8.6	10.9	44.0
E.B. fir	DST (cm)	68	27.3	10.3	10.5	56.7
	DBH (cm)	00	24.4	8.7	9.4	46.1

the triple mixed stands where sample areas were taken, almost equal number of trees were selected from each species, and statistical information on these sample trees is given in Table 2.

#### Method

Within the scope of the study, DST-DBH relationships for each species were investigated using DST and DBHs separately measured for Oriental spruce, Scots pine and Eastern Black sea fir species. According to Pond, & Froese (2014); choosing the most accurate model to estimate DBH from the DST is very important in terms of repositioning the tree, predicting the state of the tree before leaving the habitat, or estimating the volume of the tree separated from the forest area. For this reason, while the DST-DBH relationships were being investigated, the most appropriate regression models were used for the distribution of each tree species (modal 1-5; Table 3).

# Table 3. Mathematical expressions of the models selected for evaluation

Mathematical form	Model	
$dbh = b_0 + b_1 dst$	Linear	(1)
$dbh = b_0 + b_1 \ln(dst)$	Logarithmic	(2)
$dbh = b_0 + b_1 d_{st} + b_2 dst^2$	Quadratic	(3)
$dbh = b_0 (dst^{b1})$	Power	(4)
$dbh = e^{(b0 + (b1 / dst))}$	S-Curve	(5)

dbh: diameter at breast height, dst: diameter at sump height,  $b_{\rm g'}\,b_{\rm 1}$  and and  $b_{\rm 2'}$  regression parameters

#### Table 4. Success criteria of DST and DBH models

The regression analyzes of the study were made by using the SPSS statistical program (SPSS 19.0 Institute Ins., 2010) and the following five success criteria were taken into consideration in determining the success from the tested models (modal 6-10).

Adjusted Coefficient of Determination $(R^2_{\mbox{\tiny edj}})$	$R^2 adj. = 1 - \left( \frac{\sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \hat{y}_i)^2 \left(n - 1\right)}{\sum_{i=1}^n (y_i - \overline{y}_i)^2 \left(n - p\right)} \right)$	(6)
Root Mean Squared Error (RMSE)	$RMSE = \sqrt{\frac{\sum(y_i - \hat{y}_i)^2}{n-p}}$	(7)
Mean Error (ME)	$ME = \frac{\Sigma(\hat{y}_i - y_i)}{n}$	(8)
Mean Absolute Percentage Error (MAPE)	$MAPE = \frac{\sum  \hat{y}_i - y_i }{\sum y_i} \mathbf{x} 100$	(9)
Total Percentage Error (TPE)	$TPE = \frac{\sum \hat{y}_{i_1} - \sum y_i}{\sum y_i} x100$	(10)

Ethics committee approval is not required for this research.

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The adjusted coefficients of determination, standard errors, mean errors, mean absolute error percentages, total error percentages, significance levels and F ratios for the 5 different regression models tested in the study are in Table 4 and their coefficients are also given in table 5.

According to the results, the models that reflect best the relationship between the DST and the DBH are determined as power for Oriental spruce, quadratic for Scots pine and linear model for Eastern Black sea fir. These models are able to explain the

Tree species	Modal	R <sup>2</sup> <sub>adj</sub> .	R	RMSE	R	ME	R	MAPE	R	TPE	R	F	Р	ΣR
O. spruce	1	0.945	(3)	1.917	(3)	-1.0E-12	(2)	6.13	(2)	-4.5E-12	(2)	1180.38	0.000*<	(11
	2	0.891	(5)	2.712	(5)	-1.3E-12	(3)	7.98	(4)	-5.5E-12	(3)	556.55	0.000<	(20
	3	0.945	(2)	1.927	(4)	5.2E-13	(1)	6.17	(3)	2.2E-12	(1)	584.30	0.000*<	(11
	4	0.952	(1)	1.850	(2)	-0.07	(4)	6.08	(1)	-0.30	(4)	1363.69	0.000<	(12
	5	0.899	(4)	1.818	(1)	-0.27	(5)	8.28	(5)	-1.16	(5)	592.04	>000.0	(20
S. pine	1	0.960	(3)	1.716	(2)	-1.4E-12	(1)	4.34	(3)	-5E-12	(1)	1632.62	0.000*<	(10
	2	0.945	(5)	2.009	(4)	3.1E-12	(2)	5.04	(4)	1.1E-11	(2)	1172.73	0.000<	(17
	3	0.965	(2)	1.598	(1)	1.6E-11	(3)	3.97	(1)	-5.4E-11	(3)	946.46	0.000<	(10
	4	0.973	(1)	1.729	(3)	-0.02	(4)	4.30	(2)	-0.05	(4)	2434.01	>000.0	(14
	5	0.947	(4)	0.076	(5)	-0.16	(5)	5.67	(5)	-0.54	(5)	1218.78	>000.0	(24
E.B. fir	1	0.964	(3)	1.643	(3)	-3.2E-13	(1)	4.95	(3)	-1.3E-12	(1)	1818.06	0.000<	(11
	2	0.942	(5)	2.093	(4)	-1.5E-11	(3)	6.63	(4)	-6.1E-11	(3)	1094.96	0.000<	(19
	3	0.971	(2)	1.484	(1)	-2.8E-12	(2)	4.55	(1)	-1.1E-11	(2)	1104.13	0.000*<	(8
	4	0977	(1)	1.625	(2)	-0.02	(4)	4.82	(2)	-0.1	(4)	2806.05	0.000<	(13
	5	0.945	(4)	2.439	(5)	-0.20	(5)	7.23	(5)	-0.83	(5)	1146.22	0.000<	(24

\*There are meaningless parameter/parameters in these models

R<sup>2</sup><sub>adi</sub><sup>-</sup> Adjusted Coefficient of Determination; RMSE: Root Mean Squared Error; MAPE: Mean Absolute Percentage Error; TPE: Total Percentage Error; R: Range; ΣR: Total range
			Tree species							
		O. sp	ruce	S. p	ine	E.B. fir				
Model	Parameter	Value	р	Value	р	Value	р			
1	b <sub>o</sub>	0.798	0.257*	1.252	0.093*	1.781	0.000			
	b,	0.833	0.000	0.823	0.000	0.830	0.003			
2	b <sub>o</sub>	-46.861	0.000	-58.376	0.000	-43.842	0.00			
	b,	21.861	0.000	25.211	0.000	21.124	0.00			
3	b <sub>o</sub>	1.621	0.323*	-4.187	0.020	-2.004	0.077			
	p <sup>1</sup>	0.773	0.000	1.170	0.000	1.120	0.000			
	b <sub>2</sub>	0.001	0.577*	-0.05	0.001	-0.005	0.000			
4	b <sub>o</sub>	0.988	0.000	0.896	0.000	1.050	0.000			
	b,	0.959	0.000	0.988	0.000	0.952	0.00			
5	b <sub>o</sub>	3.968	0.000	4.183	0.000	3.995	0.00			
	b,	-20.923	0.000	-26.057	0.000	-20.261	0.00			

\*Shows meaningless parameter

O.spruce: Oriental spruce; S.pine: Scots pine; E.B. fir: Eastern Black Sea fir







Figure 2. DST – DBH relation for three species according to model results DST: diameter at stump height; DBH: diameter at breast height

Table 6. Models of relationship between DST and DBH according to tree species

Tree species	Model				
O. spruce	$dbh = 0.988 \times dst^{0.959}$				
S. pine	$dbh = -4.187 + 1.170 \times dst - 0.05 \times dst^2$				
E.B. fir	dbh = 1.781 + 0.830  x  dst				
O.spruce: Oriental spruce; S.pine: Scots pine; E.B. fir: Eastern Black Sea fir					

variability of the DBH in SoPsFb or PsSoFb triple mixed stands by 95.2% in Oriental spruce, 96.5% in Scots pine and 96.4% in Eastern Black sea fir.

The most successful models, which were determined at the results of sorting according to error values, are given below with their coefficients (Table 6). Additionally the relationship between the results of these models and their measured values are shown in Figure 1 and also the graphics of these models in Figure 2.

The distributions of standardized residuals, which are the difference measured between predicted values obtained from the selected models and the observed values, are shown in Figure 3 and also the distributions according to standardized predicted values of standardized residuals are shown in Figure 4.

#### CONCLUSION

As a result of tests and calculated error criteria, the models which have a suitable reliability level for fully stocked SoPsFb and PsSoFb triple mixed stands in Artvin were obtained. The



Figure 3. Distribution of standardized residuals for three species



Figure 4. Distribution of standardized residuals according to standardized predicted values

	O. spruce	S. pine	E.B. fir		O. spruce	S. pine	E.B. fi
dst (cm)		dbh (cm)		dst (cm)		dbh (cm)	
10	9.0	-	-	34	29.0	29.7	30.0
11	9.8	-	10.9	35	29.8	30.6	30.8
12	10.7	-	11.7	36	30.7	31.4	31.7
13	11.6	-	12.6	37	31.5	32.2	32.5
14	12.4	11.2	13.4	38	32.3	33.0	33.3
15	13.3	12.2	14.2	39	33.1	33.8	34.1
16	14.1	13.2	15.1	40	33.9	34.5	35.0
17	14.9	14.2	15.9	41	34.7	35.3	35.8
18	15.8	15.2	16.7	42	35.5	36.0	36.6
19	16.6	16.2	17.5	43	36.4	36.8	37.5
20	17.5	17.2	18.4	44	37.2	37.5	38.3
21	18.3	18.1	19.2	45	38.0	38.2	39.1
22	19.1	19.1	20.0	46	38.8	38.9	40.0
23	20.0	20.0	20.9	47	39.6	39.6	40.8
24	20.8	21.0	21.7	48	40.4	40.3	41.6
25	21.6	21.9	22.5	49	41.2	41.0	42.4
26	22.4	22.8	23.4	50	42.0	41.7	43.3
27	23.3	23.7	24.2	51	42.8	42.3	44.1
28	24.1	24.6	25.0	52	43.6	43.0	44.9
29	24.9	25.5	25.8	53	44.4	43.6	45.8
30	25.7	26.4	26.7	54	45.2	44.3	46.6
31	26.6	27.2	27.5	55	46.0	44.9	47.4
32	27.4	28.1	28.3	56	46.8	45.5	48.3
33	28.2	28.9	29.2	57	47.6	46.1	49.1

Table 7. Diameters at breast height (DBH) corresponding to the diameters at breast height (DST) for O. spruce, S. pine and E.B. fir

O.spruce: Oriental spruce; S.pine: Scots pine; E.B. fir: Eastern Black Sea fir; dbh: diameter at breast height; dst: diameter at stump height

adjusted coefficients of determination for the models obtained are above 95% and are similar to other studies. These developed models will serve as a tool for detecting the DBH values of Oriental spruce, Scots pine or Eastern Black sea fir which of felled trees from SoPsFb or PsSoFb triple mixed stands. Thus, the volume of felled trees will be able to be calculated. Lastly, through these models, the DBH-DST table, which is valid separately for the three types, was also created (Table 7). These models and the created table can be used in the range of 9-57 cm for Oriental spruce, 14-57 for Scots pine, and 11-57 cm for Eastern Black sea fir in the Oriental spruce, Scots pine and Eastern Black sea fir for triple mixed stands which are spread in the region of Artvin in Turkey. Apart from that, other models having a meaningful parameters will be alternatively preferred for stands where the selected models do not give proper results.

**Ethics Committee Approval:** Ethics committee approval is not required for this research.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

Author Contributions: Concept – A.G., A.Ş., A.K.; Design – A.Ş., A.K., A.G.; Supervision – A.Ş., A.K., A.G.; Resources – A.G., A.Ş., A.K.; Materials – A.G.; Data Collection and/or Processing – A.G., A.Ş., A.K.; Analysis and/or Interpretation – A.Ş., A.K.; Literature Search – A.Ş., A.K.; Writing Manuscript – A.Ş., A.K., A.G.; Critical Review – A.Ş., A.K., A.G.

Acknowledgements: This work was presented orally at the International Conference on Agriculture Forest Food Sciences and Technologies (ICAFOF 2017) and was printed in the symposium abstract book and then the study was revised after the statistical analysis of the study was elaborated.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

**Financial Disclosure:** This study was supported by the Scientific Research Projects Unit of Karadeniz Technical University under Project KTÜ 2009.113.001.6.

### REFERENCES

- Bettinger, P., Boston, K., Siry, J. P., Grebner, D. L., 2010. Forest Management and Planning. Academic press.
- Bettinger, P., Izlar, B., Harris, T., Cieszewski, C., Conrad, J., Greene, D., Mech, A., Shelton, J., Siry, J., Kane, M., Merry, K., Baldwin, S., Smith, J., 2018. Handbook of land and tree measurements. Harley Langdale, Jr. Center for Forest Business, University of Georgia, Athens, GA. 323 p.
- Bylin, C.V., 1982. Estimating dbh from stump diameter for 15 southern species. Res. Note 50-286. New Orleans, LA: U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Southern Forest Experiment Station: 3 [CrossRef]
- Chhetri, D.B.K., Fowler, G.W., 1996. Estimating diameter at breast height and basal diameter of trees from stump measurements in Nepal's lower temperate broad-leaved forests. *Forest Ecology and Management* 81(1-3): 75-84. [CrossRef]

- Corral-Rivas, J.J., Barrio-Anta, M., Aguirre-Calderón, O.A., Diéguez-Aranda, U., 2007. Use of stump diameter to estimate diameter at breast height and tree volume for major pine species in El Salto, Durango (Mexico). *Forestry* 80(1): 29-40. [CrossRef]
- Diéguez-Aranda, U., Anta, M.B., Dorado, F.C., Murias, M.B., 2003. Estimating diameter at breast height and stem volume from stump dimensions for six timber species in Galicia (Northwestern Spain). *Forest Systems* 12(2): 131-139.
- Dorado F.C., Diéguez-Aranda, U., Anta, M.B., Rodríguez, M.S., Gadow, K.V., 2006. A generalized height-diameter model including random components for radiate pine plantations in northwestern Spain. Forest Ecology Management 229: 202-213.
- . Durkaya, B., Durkaya, A., 2011. Relations Between Breast Height Diameter-Stump Diameter and Stump Height for Uludag Fir, Beech and Anatolian Black Pine Trees in Zonguldak-Ulus Forest Enterprize. *Kastamonu University Journal of Forestry Faculty* 11(1): pp. 9-17.
- Ercanli, İ., Gunlu, A., Başkent, E. Z., 2015. Mixed effect models for predicting breast height diameter from stump diameter of Oriental beech in Göldağ. *Scientia Agricola* 72(3): 245-251. [CrossRef]
- Forestry Research Institute., 1981. Forestry Research Institute Bulletin, No: 3, 4 and 5. Ankara.
- Forestry Research Institute., 1982. Forestry Research Institute Bulletin, March Research Bulletin, Ankara.
- Giray, N., 1982. Relationship of diameter at stump height, diameter at breast height, diameter at half the total tree height on trees. Forestry Research Institute Bulletin. July Research Bulletin, 28: 69-79.
- Kalıpsız, A. (1999), Dendrometer, İstanbul University Faculty of Forestry Publication, no. 3194-354, İstanbul.
- Kangas, A., Maltamo, M. (Eds.)., 2006. Forest inventory: methodology and applications (Vol. 10). Springer Science & Business Media. [CrossRef]
- Kozak A, Omule S.A.Y., 1992. Estimating stump volume, stump inside bark diameter and diameter at breast height form stump measurements. *Forestry Chronicle* 68(5): 623-627. [CrossRef]
- McClure, J. P., 1968. Predicting tree dbh from stump measurements in the southeast. U.S. For. Serv. Res. Note S.E-99: 4.
- Mısır, N., 2010. Generalized height-diameter models for *Populus* tremula L. stands. African Journal of Biotechnology. 9:4348-4355.
- Milios, E., Kitikidou, K. G., Dalakouras, V., Pipinis, E., 2016. Diameter at Breast Height Estimated From Stumps in Quercus Frainetto int. the Region of Evros in Northeastern Greece. *Cerne* 22(3): 337-344. [CrossRef]
- Ogana, F.N., Osho, J.S.A. Gorgoso-Varela, J.J., 2018. An approach to modeling the joint distribution of tree diameter and height data. *Journal of Sustainable Forestry* 37(5): 475-488. [CrossRef]
- Özçelik, R., 2005. Relationships Between the Diameter Stump Height (d0.30) and Diameter Breast Height (d1.30) for Pinus nigra, Cedrus libani, and Pinus brutia in Mut Forest Enterprise. Süleyman Demirel University Journal of Forestry Faculty 9(3).
- Özçelik, R., Brooks, J.R., Diamantopoulou, M.J., Wiant Jr, H.V., 2010. Estimating breast height diameter and volume from stump diameter for three economically important species in Turkey. *Scandinavian Journal of Forest Research* 25(1): 32-45. [CrossRef]
- Özer, E., 1981. Finding the diameter at breast height by taking advantage of the diameter at stump height in Scots pine. Forestry Research Institute Bulletin, Ankara. No: 53, Vol: (27) 20-23.
- Pond, N. C., Froese, R. E., 2014. Evaluating published approaches for modelling diameter at breast height from stump dimensions. *Forestry: An International Journal of Forest Research* 87(5): 683-696.
- Pretzsch, H., 2009. Forest dynamics, growth and yield. In Forest Dynamics, Growth and Yield (pp. 1-39). Springer Berlin Heidelberg. [CrossRef]

- Rupsys, P., Petrauskas, E., 2010. The bivariate Gompertz diffusion model for tree diameter and height distribution. *Forest Sciences* 56(3): 271–280.
- Sağlam, F., Sakıcı, O.E., Seki, M., 2016. Stump diameter and diameter at breast height relationship for Chestnut (Csatanea sativa Mill.) stands in Kastamonu coastal region. International Forestry Symposium (IFS 2016), 7-10 December 2016, Kastamonu, Turkey, 514-520.
- . Sakıcı, O.E., Yavuz, H., 2016. The relationship between diameter at stump height and diameter at breast height in Red pine-Black pine mixed stands, Scientific Research Symposium in Turkish World, 29-31.05.2016, Celalabat, Kırgızistan, 679-686.
- Sakıcı, O.E., Özdemir, G., 2017. Stump Diameter and Diameter at Breast Height Relationships for Oriental Beech and Kazdağı Fir at Mixed Stands in Karabük. *Kastamonu University Journal of Forestry Faculty* 17(2): 298-306.
- Shrivastava, M.B., R.A. Singh., 2003. Interrelationships among crown diameter, diameter at breast height and stump diameter of silver fir trees. Paper submitted to the XII World Forestry Congress, Quebec City, Canada. Available from: http://www.fao. org/docrep/ARTI-CLE/WFC/XII/0902-B4.HTM (accessed November 6, 2017).
- SPSS. Institute Inc., 2010. IBM SPSS Statistics 19 Core System User's Guide, SPSS Programming and Data Management, 426 s.
- Şenyurt, M., 2012. The Relationships Between Diameter Stump Height (d0.30) and Diameter Breast Height (d1.30) for Scotch Pine

(Pinus sylvestris (L.)) in West Black Sea Region. Artvin Coruh University Journal of Forestry Faculty 13(1): 79-87.

- Uğurlu, S., Özer, E., 1977. Finding the diameter at breast height by taking advantage of the diameter at stump height in Calabrian pine, Forestry Research Institute Bulletin, Ankara. Vol: 23 No: 1: 71-77.
- Vanclay, J.K., 1994. Modelling forest growth and yield: applications to mixed tropical forests. School of Environmental Science and Management Papers, 537.
- Wharton. E.H., 1984. Predicting diameter at breast height from stump diameters for Northeastern tree species. (Vol. 322) US Department of Agriculture, Forest Service Northeastern Forest Experiment Station.
- Yavuz, H., 1996. Relationships of diameter at the stump height-diameter at breast height-diameter at half of total tree height and calculation of bark volume relation to our Scots Pine and Black Pine tree species in Taşköprü Forest sub-district directorate. Karadeniz Technical University Faculty of Forestry Spring term seminars, Seminar No: 2: 67-75.
- Yavuz, H., 2000. Determination of the relationship between the diameter at stump height-the diameter at breast height for the Ash tree species. Karadeniz Technical University Faculty of Forestry Fall term seminars, Seminar No: 7: 10.

# Physical and mechanical properties of wood impregnated with quebracho and boron compounds

## Kebrako ve borlu bileşikler ile emprenye edilen ahşap malzemenin fiziksel ve mekanik özellikleri

Muhammed Said Fidan<sup>1</sup> , Hakan Adanur<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Forest Industry Engineering, Bursa Technical University, Faculty of Forestry, 16130, Bursa, Turkey <sup>2</sup>Department of Material and Material Processing Technologies, Karadeniz Technical University, Arsin Vocational High School, 61000, Trabzon, Turkey

#### ABSTRACT

In recent years, alternative natural impregnation materials are being sought as substitutes for chemical impregnation materials used for conserving wooden materials; therefore, such natural materials have acquired significance in the forest products industry. In this study, the boron compounds borax and boric acid, which are abundant raw materials in Turkey, and quebracho, a natural impregnation material, were used. For the impregnation process, aqueous solutions of 1%, 3%, and 5% boron compounds were utilized. The test samples were impregnated according to ASTM D 1413-76 principles. Oven-dry density, retention rate, bending strength, elastic modulus, compression strength parallel to fibers, bonding strength parallel to fibers, and screw holding strength tests of the impregnated samples were measured, and the results were compared with those of control samples. The retention, oven-dry density, comprehension parallel to fibers, and screw holding strength of the samples were found to be higher than those of the control samples, whereas bending strength, elastic modulus, and bonding strength parallel to fibers were lower. After impregnation, it was observed that there was a decline in strength values and a rise in retention rates with the increase in the concentrations of boron compounds. The values for samples impregnated with borax were higher than those for the samples impregnated with boric acid.

Keywords: Boron compounds, impregnation, natural impregnation materials, oriental beech, quebracho

### ÖΖ

Son yıllarda orman ürünleri sanayisinde önemli bir yer işgal eden ahşap malzemelerin korunmasında kullanılan kimyasal emprenye maddelerinin yerine alternatif doğal emprenye maddeleri aranmaktadır. Bu çalışmada, Ülkemizde hammadde olarak bol bulunan borlu bileşikler (boraks ve borik asit) ile doğal emprenye maddelerinden olan kebrako kullanılmıştır. Emprenye işleminde borlu bileşiklerin %1, 3 ve 5'lik sulu çözeltileri kullanılmıştır. Deney örneklerinin emprenyesi ASTM D 1413-76 esaslarına göre yapılmıştır. Emprenyeli örneklerin tam kuru yoğunluk, retensiyon miktarı, eğilme direnci, elastikiyet modülü, liflere paralel basınç direnci, liflere paralel yapışma direnci ve vida tutma direnci testleri yapılarak kontrol örnekleri ile kıyaslanmıştır. Sonuç olarak, yapılan testler sonucunda retensiyon, tam kuru yoğunluk, liflere paralel basınç ve vida tutma dirençleri kontrol örneklerinden daha yüksek çıkmıştır. Eğilme direnci, elastikiyet modülü ve liflere paralel yapışma dirençleri ise kontrol örneklerinden daha düşük çıktığı tespit edilmiştir. Emprenye sonrası deney örneklerinde borlu bileşiklerin konsantrasyonları arttıkça direnç değerlerinde düşüş, tam kuru yoğunluk ve retensiyon miktarlarında ise artış görülmektedir. Borlu bileşiklerden boraks ile emprenye edilen örneklerde değerler borik asit ile emprenye edilenlerden daha yüksek çıkmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Borlu bileşikler, doğal emprenye maddeleri, doğu kayını, emprenye, kebrako

#### INTRODUCTION

Wood as used in various areas is the only natural renewable raw material that doesn't damage the environment. The physical and mechanical properties of wood, its anatomic structure and chemical composition enable it to be used in a wide variety of products (Bozkurt and Erdin, 1997). Use

#### Cite this paper as:

Fidan, M.S., Adanur, H., 2019. Physical and mechanical properties of wood impregnated with quebracho and boron compounds. *Forestist* 69(1): 68-80.

#### Corresponding author: Muhammed Said Fidan

e-mail: said.fidan@btu.edu.tr *Received Date:* 

03.10.2016 Accepted Date: 18.12.2018

Content of this journal is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International of wooden materials has been sustained since the dawn of humankind. An organic living creature, wood is utilized in many areas and its use is increasing day by day. Some of the reasons for the use of wood in so many areas are: its high strength despite its lightness, its anatomic structure, its easily processable nature, its ability to hold screw and nail (Aslan, 1998; Hafizoğlu et al., 1994; Baysal, 1994). In addition to its many favourable features as stated above, it has certain undesirable properties. As an organic material, its inflammability, its natural vulnerability to destruction by insects and to decomposition by fungus, the fact that its size changes according to equilibrium humidity depending on the relative humidity & temperature of the weather, and its fading colour under the sun's rays are considered to be undesirable features of the wooden material.

Mankind understood that wooden materials need to be preserved in their usage areas centuries ago and thereby they started to take various precautions for this purpose. Archaeological excavations and inspections carried out on the ribs of sunken ships have revealed that the partial carbonization of the wood was one of the first precautions that was taken to preserve wooden materials 4000 years ago (Huş, 1977). Even though some wooden materials possesses a natural durability and show stability and strength in the face of external effects thanks to their own anatomic and chemical structure, they cannot endure outside weather conditions for a long period of time. Therefore, wooden materials are impregnated with several chemical substances, surface treatments are applied with various layering and preservative substances appropriate for usage area, or it is protected with non-chemical constructive precautions (natural, biological and alternative wood conservation) (Kurtoğlu, 1984). According to usage area, some processes like drying, impregnation and surface treatments are applied to increase the usage life of wooden materials by making them more durable against physical, chemical and biological factors. The most commonly applied protection method for wooden materials is to treat them with an appropriate chemical and method according to usage area Şen and Hafizoğlu, 2001). In the event that the wooden material is used without treating with such chemical substances with respect to its usage area, it is damaged due to impacts like insect, fungi, dampness, fire etc. Thereupon, it reguires repair, replacement and maintenance expense to avoid the early end of its economic life (Richardson, 1987; Yalınkılıç et al., 1995). With the intention of preventing the destruction of the wood by biological pests, it has been determined that impregnation with boron compounds will extend usage life with experiments (Winandy, 1990).

It is agreed that Boron compounds are the only impregnation material that demonstrates both insecticide and fungicide properties against insects and fungi destroying wooden materials. Boron compounds can also be used effectively against pests like termites and insects at the same time. When compared with traditional impregnation substances, boron compounds are responsible for lower levels of environmental damage, causing very small amounts of acute toxicity. Boron compounds are no more toxic than common salt to humans and animals, and they are colourless and odourless. They don't have corrosive effects and they are resistant to combustion. Nowadays, boron compounds are accepted as one of the safest chemicals utilized as a preservative impregnation substance. Since their negative effects on humans and environment are at minimum levels, their use is gaining more and more importance. Because they have less toxic properties than other impregnation materials containing heavy metals, boron compounds are considered to be the most significant impregnation materials of the future. Apart from their activities against pests like fungi and termites, usage areas of boron compounds multiply thanks to increasing the resistance to combustion (Lloyd, 1998; Kartal and Green, 2002; Yaşar and Atar, 2017).

Some boron compounds used in both the commercial sense and scientific testing with the purpose of wood protection, are boric acid, borax, sodium perborate, magnesium borate, ammonium borate, diammonium octaborate, triethyl borate, ammonium pentaborate, zinc fluorate, ammonium fluoborate, disodium octaborate and copper metaborate (Karayazıcı et al., 1980). Boron compounds are applied to solid wooden materials in impregnation processes with many compressed and unpressurised procedures.

There are tannins which have the potential to be used as biopreservatives. The word tannin is a rather broad term and covers compounds in various chemical compositions. Tannins have significant importance among phenolic substances which make up of 20-30% of wood. The most important part of phenolic substances is made up of a system known as lignin. Tannins are phenolic compounds that can be dissolved in phlobaphene and are a coloured substance, and lignin can be dissolved in water and organic solvents (Hafizoğlu, 1984). Tannins are amorphous substances and they also known as tannic acid. Their colours vary between light straw and dark mahogany. Tannins are water-soluble polyphenolic compounds, which are found intensely in high-rise structured trees like chestnut, oak, acorn, and sumac, their chemical structure varies widely and their molecular weight can reach up to 20000 daltons. Tannins, which can be found in bark, roots, leaves, fruit and seed parts of plants, display visual characteristics ranging from light yellow to white in colour, from shiny to matt and they have loose structured acrid tasting compounds (Khanbabaee and Ree, 2001). Tannins are found in many barks, some coniferous tree types, chestnut and oak trees. Tannins have protective features against fungal diseases of wood (Kırcı, 2000).

Impregnation is the process applied by various methods with the purpose of protection of wooden material, an anisotropic material, against numerous biotic and abiotic issues (Bozkurt and Erdin, 1997). The success and protection level of the impregnation process depends on the net dry impregnations substance adhesion to the wood (retention) and the penetration depth of the impregnation substance in the wood, along with the impregnation substance and the characteristics of the wood (Baysal et al., 2003). The natural durability classifications of wooden material according to weight loss: less than 5 years are referred as nondurable, between 5 and 10 years are less durable, between 10 and 15 years are moderate durable, between 15 and 20 years are durable, and 25 years and more are categorized as very durable class (Bozkurt et al., 1993). On the determination of this duration, the chemicals used in the impregnation process are as important as the properties of the wooden material. Each chemical used has different characteristics and impact areas. Therefore, the most suitable impregnation material for each condition should be chosen bearing in mind the impacts which will be encountered in the usage locations of the wooden materials (Yalınkılıç et al., 1995).

The purpose of this study, is to attempt to reduce the damage and adverse affects occurring in the environment as a consequence of impregnation processes utilizing boron compounds through the use of natural impregnation materials which do not harm nature.

#### MATERIALS AND METHODS

#### Material

In this study, the oriental beech, which is frequently used in indoor applications and has a wide distribution in Turkey, is used as a sample material. The oriental beech used in the preparation of samples was grown in the province of Gümüşhane in the Kürtün district in Alacadağ at about 1200 m altitude. Test samples were prepared from parts of the wood without defects (paying attention to fiber direction) and they were then dried until they reached air-dried moisture gradient (12%).

Quebracho, which contains plenty of tannins and is readily available commercially, is used as a natural impregnation substance. Quebracho extract is dark coloured and contains tannin in a ra-

## Table 1. Size and standards of test samples used fordetermining of the physical properties

Number	Test Name	Dimensions (mm)	Standard
1	Retention	20 x 20 x 30	<sup>1</sup> ASTM D 1413-07
2	Oven-Dry Density	20 x 20 x 30	<sup>2</sup> TS2472
			d tale and a dealer

<sup>1</sup>ASTM: American society for testing and materials; <sup>2</sup>TS: Turkish standards



Figure 1. Extract and wood of quebracho

tio of 80% (Figure 1). The colour darkens with contact with light. Quebracho settles quite easily. Its natural pH value is 4,9 (URL-1, 2015).

Quebracho was used in the impregnation process and the solution was prepared first. The solution was prepared by dissolving 5% mineral tannin in water with respect to weight quantity. The impregnation mix was prepared by adding boron compounds (in a concentration suitable for the conducted impregnation process), to the solution. Boron compounds borax (B) and boric acid (BA) were used in aqueous solutions in concentrations of 1, 3 and 5%. In the impregnation process, mixtures of natural impregnation materials and boron compounds were applied. The boron compounds used in the study was supplied by Kırka, Bigadiç and Emet facilities affiliated to Eti mining works.

#### Method

#### The Preparation of Samples

Oriental beech (*Fagus orientalis* L.) samples are prepared in accordance with TS standards at the Gümüşhane University Gümüşhane vocational school of higher education furniture and decoration workshop. For each test (retention, oven dry density, bending strength, elastic modulus, bonding strength parallel to fibers, screw holding strength, compression strength parallel to the fibers), 10 samples for each were prepared to use in the study with a total of 420 samples. Test samples were prepared, paying attention to fiber direction and that there weren't any flaws in the wood samples. Any samples not in accordance with required standards or having flaws were isolated and excluded. In this way, the aim was to prevent any errors that might have originated from flaws in the wood samples.

Applied test standards and dimensions of wooden material used in the determination of physical features are given in Table 1 and sample numbers tested are given in Table 2.

Applied experiment methods and dimensions of wooden material used in the determination of mechanical properties are given in Table 3 and sample number is given in Table 4.



Table 2. Amou	unt of test samples	used for determining of th	e physical propertie	S	
Physical Properties	Wood Species	Natural Impregnation Materials	Boron Compounds	Concentration (%)	Sample Numbers
Retention	Oriental beech	Qebracho	Boraks	1	p.p.1xw.s.2.xn.i.m.
Oven-Dry Dens	ity		Borik asit	3	<sup>3</sup> xb.c <sup>4</sup> .xc <sup>5</sup> xr <sup>6</sup>
				5	2x1x1x2x3x10=120

<sup>1</sup>p.p.: physical properties; <sup>2</sup>w.s.: wood species; <sup>3</sup>n.i.m.: natural impregnation materials; <sup>4</sup>b.c.: boron compounds; <sup>5</sup>c: concentration; <sup>6</sup>r: repetition

#### Table 3. Size and standards of test samples used for determining the mechanical properties

Number	Test Name	Dimensions (mm)	Standard
1	Bending Strength	20 x 20 x 360	TS 2474
2	Elastic Modulus	20 x 20 x 360	TS 2478
3	Compression Strength Parallel to the Fibers	20 x 20 x 30	TS 2595
4	Screw Holding Strength Tests	50 x 50 x 20	TSEN 13444
5	Bonding Strength Parallel to Fibers	20 x 15 x 150	<sup>1</sup> DIN 53225
<sup>1</sup> DIN: Deutsche	es institut für normung		

#### Table 4. Amount of test samples used for determining the mechanical properties

Mechanical Properties	Wood Species	Natural Impregnation Materials	Boron Compounds	Concentration (%)	Sample Numbers
Bending Strength	Oriental beech	Qebracho	Borax	1	m.p. <sup>1</sup> xw.s. <sup>2</sup> .xn.i.m.
Elastic Modulus			Boric Acid	3	<sup>3</sup> xb.c <sup>4</sup> .xc <sup>5</sup> xr <sup>6</sup>
Compression Strength P.F.				5	5x1x1x2x3x10= 300
Screw Holding Strength					
Bonding Strength P.F.					
<sup>1</sup> m.p.: mechanical properties; <sup>2</sup> w.s	.: wood species; <sup>3</sup> n.i.m.:	natural impregnation materials; '	b.c.: boron compounds;	<sup>5</sup> c: concentration; <sup>6</sup> r: repeti	tion

#### Table 5. Amount of impregnate

Wood Species	Natural Impregnation Materials + Boron Compounds + Concentration	Impregnation Number
Oriental beech	Qebracho + Borax + 1%	1
	Qebracho + Borax + 3%	1
	Qebracho + Borax + 5%	1
	Qebracho + Boric Acid + 1%	1
	Qebracho + Boric Acid + 3%	1
	Qebracho + Boric Acid + 5%	1

#### **Impregnation Process**

In this study, a total 6 impregnation process were conducted (Table 5). Cell method was chosen in compliance with ASTM D 1413 principles.

The samples prepared in impregnation process first were subjected to pre-combustion for 30 minutes in the impregnation mechanism, later to impregnation treatment for 30 minutes under pressure of 10 bars (Figure 2). The samples extracted from the impregnation mechanism were kept at a temperature of  $20\pm2$  °C and in a relative humidity of 65% for conditioning for a week and ensured to reach an equilibrium humidity of 12%. For the determination of retention and oven dry density, the samples were brought to oven dry condition again after impregnation and the essential measurements were carried out. Afterwards, the physical and mechanical tests were carried out on the oven dry samples. After impregnates samples, control samples were subjected to testing and the results were compared statically (Adanur, 2015).

#### The Determination of Physical Properties

#### **Retention Rate**

The impregnation of test samples was carried out according to ASTM D 1413–07 principles. The retention rate (R, kg/m<sup>3</sup>) of test samples was calculated using the following equation (Bektaş, 1997):

$$R = \frac{G \times C}{V} \times 10^3 \, (\text{kg/m}^3)$$



Figure 2. Impregnating device employed in the impregnation process

In this equation;

G = T2 - T1

T1 : the weight of test samples before impregnation (g)

T2 : the weight of test samples after impregnation (g)

- V : Sample volume (cm<sup>3</sup>)
- C : solution concentration (%)

#### The Determination of Oven-Dry Density

In the experiment to identify oven-dry density, the principles stated in TS 2472 standard were taken into consideration, wooden materials were prepared in sizes of 20x20x360 mm in accordance with the standard, then they were put in the drying oven. The temperature was gradually raised to 50 °C, 75 °C and 103  $\pm$ 2 °C, the samples were kept until their weight reached stability and the samples were brought to an oven dry condition. The samples taken from the drying oven were permitted to cool down by placing in the desiccator with silicon dioxide (silica gel), weighed in an analytic scale with a sensitivity of  $\pm$ 0.01 g, (M<sub>o</sub>) value and their sizes were measured using a digital caliper with a sensitivity of  $\pm$ 0.01 g, and their volumes were calculated. The oven dry densities (D<sub>o</sub>) were calculated using the equation below (Bektaş, 1997).

$$D_{o} = \frac{M_{o}}{V_{o}} (g/cm^{3})$$

In this equation; D<sub>o</sub> : The density in oven dry humidity (g/cm<sup>3</sup>) M<sub>o</sub> : The weight of sample in oven dry humidity (g) V<sub>o</sub> : The volume of sample in oven dry humidity (cm<sup>3</sup>)

#### The Determination of Mechanical Properties

#### The Determination of Bending Strength

For determination of bending strength, the principles stated in TS 2474 (1976) standard were followed and the test samples were prepared in 20x20x360 mm sizes in accordance with these standards. The dimensions of the test samples were determined by measuring with a digital caliper with a sensitivity of  $\pm 0.01$  g. The distances between the midpoints of the cylindric fulcrums, where the test items were placed, were set at 15 times (15x20 mm = 300 mm) the thickness of the test item. Loading was conducted uniformly with a constant fixed speed on the surface of the test item. The loading speed was set to 6 mm/min. Test speeds were set so that the test items would break after  $1.5 \pm 0.5$ minutes starting from loading on test items. The force measurements (Pmax) on the instant of breaking point were read and bending strength (oE) was calculated according to the formula below (Bektaş, 1997; Kasal et al., 2010).

$$\sigma_g = \frac{3.P_{max}.I}{2.b.h^2} (N/mm^2)$$

In this equation;

Pmax : The pressure applied at breaking point (N)

I : The space between fulcrums (mm)

b ; The width of test specimen vertical to annual rings (mm)

h ; The thickness of test specimen tangent to annual rings (mm).

When the static bending strength needed to be adjusted to a 12% moisture value, this figure was calculated using the following equation.

$$\sigma_{b12} = \sigma_{\rm E} \times \left[1 + \frac{\alpha}{W - 12}\right] (\rm N/mm^2)$$

In this equation;  $\alpha \ : \ 0.04 \ (correction \ factor \ for \ humidity \ amount) \\ W \ : \ the \ humidity \ amount \ for \ wood \ calculated \ in \ accordance \ with \ TS \ 2471$ 

#### The Determination of Elastic Modülüs

In this step, the elastic modulus for the difference of force applied to elastic deformation area ( $\Delta$ F) was calculated using the difference between deflections in samples ( $\Delta$ f) by means of the equation below (Bektaş, 1997).

$$E = \frac{\Delta \cdot F \cdot L^3}{4 \cdot b \cdot h^3 \Delta f} (\text{N/mm}^2)$$

In this equation;

 $\Delta F$ : the force equal to the difference between the arithmetic means of the lower and upper limits of loading at the elastic deformation area (N)

L ; The space between fulcrums (mm)

 $\Delta f$ : The deflection in net bending area, the difference between arithmetic means of deflection results measured at the lower and upper limits of loading (mm)

- b ; Section width of test item (mm)
- h ; section thickness of test item (mm)

When the pressure strength needed to be adjusted to a 12% moisture value, this figure was calculated using the following equation.

$$E_{12} = E \times \left[1 + \frac{\alpha}{W - 12}\right] (N/mm^2)$$

In this equation;

lpha~ : 0.02 (correction factor for the humidity amount)

W  $\phantom{i}$  : the humidity value for wood calculated in accordance with TS 2471  $\phantom{i}$ 

### The Determination of Compression Strength Parallel to the Fibres

TS 2595 (1976) was the basis for determining compression strength parallel to the fibres. Control and test samples were prepared from wooden material of the dimensions 20x20x30 mm. Before the experiment, the cross-sectional area where the force was to be applied was measured at 0.01 mm sensitivity (axb), the maximum force at breaking point (Pmax) was determined and the compression strength was calculated by the following formula (Bektaş, 1997).

$$\sigma_{WV} = \frac{P_{MAX}}{a.b} (N/mm^2)$$

In this equation;

 $\sigma$  w//  $\,$  : Compression strength parallel to the fibres (N/mm²) Pmax  $\,$  :The maximum load ( N)

a and b : Cross-sectional dimensions of the test piece (mm<sup>2</sup>)

When the pressure strength needed to be adjusted to a 12% moisture value, this figure was calculated using the following equation.

$$\sigma_{12} = \sigma_{W} \times \left[1 + \frac{\alpha}{W - 12}\right] (\text{N/mm}^2)$$

In this equation;

- $\alpha$  : 0.05 (correction factor for the moisture value)
- W : the moisture value of wood calculated in terms of TS 2471

#### The Determination of Screw Holding Strength

TS EN 13446 was taken as the basis for determining the screw holding strength. The screw holding strength was conducted in the radial direction. Wooden materials of dimensions 50x50x20 mm were prepared from the test samples. The midpoints of the cross sections of the prepared test samples were determined and screws were inserted in such a way so that 2/3 of the 35 mm screws would enter the wood. In this study, according to the principles frequently favored in the furniture industry and specified in TS 431, screws measuring 3.5x50 mm, made from low carbon steel, with a flat countersunk head, with a star twist and helical gear, were used. The thickness of the test pieces and the depth of penetration were determined by measuring with  $\pm$  0.1 mm sensitivity according to EN 325 (Perçin and Ayan, 2012).

#### The Determination of Bonding Strength Parallel to Fibres

The test specimens used in the test for bonding strength parallel to fibres were bonded with a high quality PVA based and D2 norm wood adhesive, resistant to outdoor conditions. The glue used was polyvinyl acetate (PVA) based - a white glue which is a strong glue that can be used in any kind of wood and becomes transparent when it is dry. It is in D2 norm and it is resistant to medium levels of humidity. It can be diluted with water, is ideal for framing works and has excellent adhesion strength. It is used in hardwoods, MDF, chipboard and any kind of woods where the purpose is to bond it to other materials of its kind. Approximately 10 minutes of application time is needed to ensure adequate adhesion (URL-2).

TS EN 205 was taken as the basis for determining the bonding strength parallel to fibres. The test specimens were prepared from wooden materials with dimensions of 20x15x150 mm. A constant pulling force was applied, homogeneous to the cross section of prepared samples, for 1.5-2 minutes. The maximum force (F) at the moment of breaking was determined by maintaining the application of force until the sample broke. Adhesion strength ( $\sigma$ Y) was calculated as follows (Uysal and Kurt, 2005).

$$\sigma_{\rm r} = \frac{F}{A} = \frac{F}{a \, {\rm x} \, {\rm b}} \, ({\rm N/mm^2})$$

In this equation;

 $\sigma Y$  : bonding strength (N/ mm<sup>2</sup>)

- F : force at the moment of breaking(N)
- A : bonding area (mm<sup>2</sup>)
- b : width of bonding surface (mm)
- a : the length of the bonding surface (mm)

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

#### **Physical Properties**

An analysis from statistical information is given average values are in Table 6, an analysis of the variance from statistical information on the determination of retention and oven dry density quantities of the experimental samples is given in Table 7, the least significant difference (LSD) is in Table 8, and graphical representations of results are in Figure 3.

As shown in Table 6, the highest average retention rate of samples in an air-dried state (12%) in test samples was 194.80 kg/m<sup>3</sup>

in samples impregnated with a 5% borax solution. It was found that the retention rate increased as the boron compound concentration increased in all impregnation processes that were carried out. In test specimens impregnated with quebracho - which is one of the natural impregnations - the density value in oven dry conditions was found to be 0.57 g/cm<sup>3</sup> in the impregnation with the highest 1% borax. The oven dry density value of the control samples was identified as 0.53 g/cm<sup>3</sup>. Full dry density values of the boron compounds impregnated with borric acid solutions. It was found that as the concentration of boron compound increased in the impregnation solution, the oven dry density values increased. In Toker's (2007) study, he impregnated oriental beech woods with various concentrations of borax and boric acid. Retention rates were found out to be 4.95 kg/m<sup>3</sup> with 1% boric acid concentration, 13.86 kg/m<sup>3</sup> with 3% boric acid, 26.69 kg/m<sup>3</sup> with 5% boric acid, 5.03 kg/m<sup>3</sup> with 1% borax, 15.20 kg/m<sup>3</sup> with 3% borax and 25.22 kg/m<sup>3</sup> with 5% borax. In this study also, the concentration of the boron compound and the retention rate increase in direct proportions. The results we obtained are consistent with this study. In this study Peker et al., 1999 found the retention rate to be 10.57 kg/m<sup>3</sup> in samples impregnated with (borax + boric acid) by impregnating oriental beech woods with boron compounds, phosphorus compounds, ammonium compounds and organic solvents.

#### Table 6. Amount of some physical properties of beech wood

				Boron Cor	npounds			
			Borax			Boric Acid		
Impregnation Materials	S.S.	1%	3%	5%	1%	3%	5%	Control
Qebracho			F	Retention Am	ount (kg/m³	<sup>3</sup> )		
	М	29.00	96.33	194.80	5.39	45.96	127.56	-
	Sx	3.10	11.53	13.76	2.51	4.36	12.08	-
				Oven-Dry De	nsity (g/cm³	)		
	М	0.57	0.56	0.55	0.53	0.55	0.56	0.53
	Sx	0.04	0.04	0.03	0.04	0.04	0.02	0.03

S.S.: Statistical Symbol, M:Mean, Sx:Standard Deviation

#### Table 7. Multivariate analysis of variance for the determination of the physical properties of beech wood

		Retention Amount				Oven-Dry Density			
Source of Varience	F. D.	S. S.	S. M.	F. V.	F. D.	S. S.	S. M.	F. V.	
Boron Compounds	1	33244.60	33244.60	396.36*	1	0.0034	0.0034	2.67	
Solution Concentration	2	211670.31	105835.16	1261.82*	2	0.0007	0.0004	0.29	
bc*c	2	4840.08	2420.04	28.85*	2	0.0054	0.0027	2.15	
Error	54	4529.25	83.88		54	0.0682	0.0012		
Total	59	254284.24			59	0.0777			

F.D.: Degrees of Freedom; S.S.: Sum of Squares; S.M.: Mean of Squares; F.V.: F Value; \*, \*\*: 1% and 5% significance level, respectively

### Table 8. Test results of LSD with physical properties of variable of impregnating agents, boron compounds and solutions concentrations

		Retention Ar	mount (kg/m³)	Oven-Dry Density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )		
Factor	Material	<sup>1</sup> M	<sup>2</sup> LSD	М	LSD	
Boron Compounds	Borax	106.71 a	4.7409	0.56 a	0.0184	
	Boric Acid	59.64 b		0.54 a		
Solution Concentration	1%	17.20 <sup>3</sup> c	5.8064	0.54 a	0.0225	
	3%	71.14 <sup>3</sup> b		0.55 a		
	5%	161.18 <sup>3</sup> a		0.55 a		

In his work, Gür (2003) impregnated the samples, which were prepared from scots pine and red pine woods, with the vacuum pressure technique using Tanalith C and vacsol WR impregnation materials. After the impregnation process, the samples' specific weight were found to increase. By impregnating scots pine and oriental beech woods with certain impregnation substances, the changes that occur in oven dry and air dry densities were investigated. As a result, the air dry density of scots pine was determined to be affected most in vacsol, styrene + MMA, and isocyanate while the oven air den-



Figure 3. The average values of physical properties of beech wood impregnated with guebracho and boron compounds

sity of scots pine was determined to be affected most by vacsol, isocyanate, paraffin + boric acid + borax and isocyanate (Örs et al., 1999). It is observed in literature that impregnated materials increase the density of wooden materials. Studies on beech species around the world indicate that (according to the density classes), air-dry density is between 0.50 - 0.69 g/cm<sup>3</sup> and that the beech enters the group of trees in medium density (Bozkurt and Erdin, 1990). In this study, it was determined that full dry density findings values were close to those in literature.



Figure 4. The average values of mechanical properties of beech wood impregnated with guebracho and boron compounds

				Boron Co	mpounds			
Impregnation Materials		Borax			Boric Acid			
	S.S.	1%	3%	5%	1%	3%	5%	Contro
Qebracho			E	Bending Stre	ngth (N/mm²	)		
	Μ	67.40	72.80	83.20	62.60	86.70	75.10	106
	Sx	8.68	9.05	9.43	13.21	12.03	13.73	15.5
				Elastic Mod	dulus (MPa)			
	М	8293	8968	9257	8596	9187	9283	10400
	Sx	821	913	935	1012	1183	1459	1460
	Compression Strength Parallel to the Fibers (N/mm <sup>2</sup> )							
	Μ	50.57	48.08	43.42	46.37	48.41	52.07	44.39
	Sx	1.66	2.93	6.09	5.59	2.30	1.97	3.74
ebracho			Screw	Holding Stre	ngth Tests (N	l/mm²)		
	Μ	297.40	239.30	264.90	281.80	235.70	234.30	199.36
	Sx	40.35	37.56	11.43	19.95	27.78	50.12	16.13
			Bonding	Strength Para	allel to Fibers	s (N/mm²)		
	М	4.11	3.73	4.09	4.86	4.44	3.92	6.65
	Sx	1.32	0.95	0.57	0.91	0.56	1.16	1.95

As a result of the variance analysis conducted, it was determined that the oriental beech samples impregnated with quebracho and boron compounds had a 1% significance level difference between retention rate and boron compounds and solution concentration (Table 7).

As can be seen from Table 8, the highest retention amount of the physical properties in the oriental beech was found 106.71 kg/m<sup>3</sup> in borax among boron compounds and to be 161.18 kg/m<sup>3</sup> in 5% concentration among solution concentrations. The highest oven dry density amount was found 0.56 g/cm<sup>3</sup> in bo-

rax among boron compounds and to be 0.55 g/cm<sup>3</sup> in samples impregnated at 3% and 5% among solution concentrations.

In beech samples impregnated with quebracho from natural impregnation substances, it is seen that the retention rates of boron compounds impregnated with borax are higher than boric acid. It has been observed that as the concentration of the boron compounds increases in all impregnation processes, the retention rate also increases. The highest retention rates were obtained at 5% concentration. Oven dry density values were found to be higher than those of control samples without im-

Table 10. Multivariate ana	lysis of variance for the determination of th	e mechanical properties of beech wood

	Bending Strength (N/mm <sup>2</sup> )					Elastic Modulus (MPa)				
Source of Varience	F. D.	S. S.	S. M.	F. V.	F. D.	S. S.	S. M.	F. V.		
Boron Compounds	1	1.67	1.67	0.01	1	484201.7	484201.7	0.24		
Solution Concentration	2	2787.63	1393.82	11.48*	2	7435143.3	3717571.7	1.82		
bc*c	2	1407.63	60.43	0.01*	2	198723.3	99361.7	0.05		
Error	54	6559.00	121.46		54	110080990.0	2038536.9			
Total	59	10755.70			59	118199058.3				
	Compr	ession Strengt	Screw Holding Strength Tests (N/mm <sup>2</sup> )							
Boron Compounds	1	38.08	38.08	1.38	1	4133.40	4133.40	0.94		
Solution Concentration	2	5.51	2.75	0.10	2	29738.80	14869.40	3.39**		
bc*c	2	424.78	212.39	7.68*	2	1830.00	915.00	0.21		
Error	54	1492.64	27.64		54	415117.00	3843.68			
Total	59	1961.01			59	518697.70				
	Вог	nding Strength								
Boron Compounds	1	2.77	2.77	1.94						
Solution Concentration	2	2.64	1.32	0.92						
bc*c	2	2.76	1.38	0.96						
Error	54	77.19	1.43							
Total	59	85.36								

F.D.: Degrees of Freedom; S.S.: Sum of Squares; S.M.: Mean of Squares; F.V.: F Value; \*, \*\*: 1% and 5% significance level; respectively

### Table 11. Test results of LSD with mechanical properties of variable of impregnating agents, boron compounds and solutions concentrations

Factor	Material	Bending Strength (N/mm²)		Elastic Modülüs (MPa)		Compression Strength Parallel to the Fiber (N/mm <sup>2</sup> )		Screw Holding Strength (N/mm²)		Bonding Strength Parallel to Fibers (N/mm²)	
		X <sub>ort</sub>	LSD	X <sub>ort</sub>	LSD	X <sub>ort</sub>	LSD	X <sub>ort</sub>	LSD	X <sub>ort</sub>	LSD
B. C.	Borax	74.47 a	5.71	8839 a	739.1	47.36 a	2.72	267 a	34.29	3.98 a	0.62
	Boric Acid	74.80 a		9019 a		48.95 a		251 a		4.41 a	
S. C.	1%	65.00 b	6.99	8445 a	905.2	48.47 a	3.33	290 a	41.99	4.49 a	0.76
	3%	79.15 a		9073 a		48.25 a		250 ab		4.09 a	
	5%	79.75 a		9270 a		47.75 a		238 b		4.01 a	

B. C.: Boron Compounds; S. C.: Solution Concentration; MPa: Megapascal; LSD: Least significant difference; a,b,c: Mean grouping

pregnation. The highest full dry density value was in samples impregnated with 1% borax (Figure 3).

#### **Mechanical Properties**

An analysis from statistical information is given mean values in Table 9, variance analysis related to bending strength, elastic modulus, compression strength parallel to the fibres, screw holding strength and bonding strength parallel to fibres are shown in Table 10, LSD test results in Table 11, and graphical representations in Figure 4.

In the impregnated test specimens, the bending strength in the case of air dry (12%) was found to be 86.70 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in samples impregnated with the highest 3% boric acid solution. In the control samples, the bending strength value in the case of airdry (12%) was found to be 106 N/mm<sup>2</sup>. The bending strength of the beech samples impregnated with the boron compound mixture and natural impregnation material was found to be lower than the control samples. In the impregnated test samples, the elastic modulus in the case of air dry (12%) was found to be 9283 MPa in samples impregnated with the highest 5% boric acid solution. In the control samples, the elastic modulus in the case of air dry was found to be 10400 MPa. The maximum value of the compression strength parallel to the fibres was found to be 52.07 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in samples impregnated with 5% boric acid. The compression strength parallel to the fibre values of the impregnated specimens were higher than the control samples. The average screw holding strength value was found to be 297.40 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in samples impregnated with the highest 1% borax. In all of the impregnation processes carried out, screw holding strength of the impregnated samples were higher than the control samples. In the control samples, the average screw holding strength value - in the case of air-dry (12%) - was found to be 199.36 N/mm<sup>2</sup>. However, in the bonding strength parallel to fibres it was found to be 4.86 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in samples impregnated with the highest 1% boric acid. In the control samples, the average bonding strength in the case of air dry was found to be 6.65 N/mm<sup>2</sup>. In all of the impregnated samples the bonding strength values came out lower than the control samples (Table 9).

Reductions in strength created by impregnation substances are related to their chemical structure and their fixation reactions with wood. The impregnation substances containing acidic chromium have a hydrolytic depletion reaction with wood sugars, thus forcing interaction with the cell wall materials. During this process, which is considered a fixation, metals are reduced to a less water-soluble form by oxidation of cell wall components. However, the temperature applied before impregnation and during the fixation process accelerates these hydrolytic reactions that occur in the wood, leading to increases and decreases in mechanical properties (Temiz et al., 2004).

Toker (2007) impregnated beech wood with different concentrations of borax and boric acid in his work and found that the bending strength decreases as the solution concentration increases. He found that while the average bending strength was 101 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in the non-impregnated control samples, it was 89.34 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in the specimens impregnated with borax solution and the average bending strength perpendicular to the fibres was 88 N/mm<sup>2</sup> in the specimens impregnated with boric acid solution. It has been reported that finding low or high values for bending strength may be due to the different materials used. In literature, studies show that the bending strength of the oriental beech wood varies between 100 and 150 N/mm<sup>2</sup> and the average value is around 120 N/mm<sup>2</sup> (Keskin and Togay, 2003). In this study, the bending strength of non-impregnated control samples was determined to be 106 N/mm<sup>2</sup>. This value was found to be in accordance with the literature.

The elastic modulus values of beech wood in literature were found to be as follows: Fagus orientalis (Europe) 16000 MPa (Güler and Bektaş, 2000), 15700 MPa (Bozkurt et al., 2000), 13082 MPa (Malkoçoğlu, 1994) Fagus orientalis (Andirin) 12750 MPa (Güler and Bektaş, 2000), Fagus orientalis (Iran) 11820 MPa (Güler and Bektas, 2000). In this study, elastic modulus of non-impregnated control samples was determined to be 10400 MPa.

The compression strength parallel to fibres values of beech wood were determined to be 57.2 N/mm<sup>2</sup> (Malkoçoğlu, 1994), 60 N/mm<sup>2</sup> (Bozkurt et al., 2000) and 62.9 N/mm<sup>2</sup> (Erdinler, 1999) in different studies conducted in literature. In the control samples, the compression strength parallel to the fibres value in the case of air dry (12%) was found to be 44.39 N/mm<sup>2</sup> - similar to the value in literature. The findings relating to the determination of compression strength parallel to the fibres which we obtained are similar to those in the work of Keskin.

Açıkel (2007) found out that if the screw holding strength is ordered from high to low according to the impregnation substance it is as follows: boric acid, borax, immersol-aqua and that in particular boric acid, borax and a boric acid + borax mixture have a greater effect on screw holding strength than other impregnation substances. According to the test results, the impregnation process increased the screw holding strength. This may be due to the fact that the impregnation substances enter the cell wall cavity in the tree and affect the contact surface area. It is seen that the screw holding performance values of wooden materials with a high density is high in literature. In this work too, the screw holding strengths increased. The screw holding strength of the impregnated beech samples is higher than the non-impregnated control specimens and shows similarities to the studies in the literature.

Altinok and others (2009) in their study found that borax decreased the bonding strength by 15.6% in PVAc glue, 21.5% in UF glue and 37.7% in PU glue. It is seen in studies in literature that there is a decrease in bonding strength in impregnated wooden materials with pressure applied impregnation methods. Many factors influence bonding strength such as the impregnation method, the amount of retention, and the nature of the impregnation material. In his work Rowell (2005) investigated the factors that influence the bonding strength of wooden materials. As a result of the study, it was determined that many factors influence bonding strength however the most signifi-

cant factors were wood, production method, glue and place of use.

As a result of the variance analysis conducted; it was determined that there was a difference of 1% significance between the solution concentration and the boron compounds \* concentration in the change in bending strength. There was a 1% significance level difference between the concentration and the boron compounds \* concentration at the parallel pressure strength. A difference in 5% significance was found between screw holding strength and solution concentration (Table 10).

The highest bending strength change was obtained as 74.80 N/ mm<sup>2</sup> in boric acid for boron compounds and as 79.75 N/mm<sup>2</sup> for samples impregnated at 5% concentration in terms of solution concentration. The highest elastic modulus values were obtained in specimens impregnated with boric acid at 9019 MPa in boron compounds and 5% concentration at 9270 MPa in solution concentration. The highest change in compression strength parallel to fibres was obtained in samples impregnated in 1% concentration with 48.95 N/mm<sup>2</sup> boric acid for boron compounds and with 48.47 N/mm<sup>2</sup> for solution concentration. The highest screw holding strength value was obtained in samples impregnated in 1% concentration with 267 N/mm<sup>2</sup> borax for boron compounds and 290 N/mm<sup>2</sup> for solution concentration. In the impregnated samples, the highest compression strength parallel to fibres values were obtained in 1% concentration with 4.41 N/mm<sup>2</sup> boric acid for boron compounds and with 4.49 N/mm<sup>2</sup> for solution concentration. It has been reported that finding low or high values relating to the determination of these strength values may be due to the difference in the materials used (Table 11).

As can be seen in Figure 4, the bending strength of the beech samples impregnated was found to be lower than the control samples. The average elastic modulus values were lower than the control samples and the increase in the elastic modulus values increased as the solution concentration increased. It was found that the compression strength parallel to fibres was higher than the strength control samples. In terms of solution concentration, the compression strength parallel to the fibres was determined in the boric acid samples with the highest concentration of 5%. In all of the beech samples impregnated with quebracho and boron compounds, the screw holding strength was higher than the control samples. All of the beech samples were found to have lower bonding strength than the control samples. It can be argued that this decrease is due to the fact that boron compounds negatively affect the chemical structure of the glue used, making it difficult for the glue to penetrate into the wood material, and it also adversely affects adhesion and cohesion forces between the layers (Özçifçi, 2005).

#### CONCLUSION

As a result of impregnations made, it was found that the retention rate of borax in boron compounds is higher than boric acid. According to this result, it can be said that borax is a better absorber than boric acid. The retention rates increased as the concentration of the boron compounds increased. The highest retention value was detected in samples impregnated with a solution of 5% concentration. This can be explained as the concentration of the boron compound increases, the amount of the substance bonding to the wood increases. As a result of the experiments, the oven dry density values of the impregnated samples were found to be higher than the control samples. This can be interpreted as the fact that the boron compounds used in the impregnation process have salt properties and thus increase the density of the wood material. The average oven dry density value was found to be higher in borax from boron compounds. It was seen that the increase in the boron compound concentration also increased the oven dry density value. It was found that the oven dry density values of the impregnated samples were higher than those of non-impregnated control samples, which is consistent with literature.

After the impregnation process, a general decrease was found in the bending strength perpendicular to the fibres. It was found that as the boron compound concentration increases, the increase in the bending strength parallel to the fibres of the test samples increases. This can be attributed to the impregnation salts in the crystal structure being placed between the micelles in the cell wall, resulting in a decrease in the bonding property of the material. The values in the elastic modulus were found to be lower than the control samples. It was found that in boron compounds values were lower than the control samples and compared to boric acid lower results were obtained from borax. As the solution concentration increased, the elastic modulus values increased. As a result of the experiments conducted, it was found that the compression strength parallel to the fibres were generally higher than the control samples. In the boron compound concentration, the highest value was found in boric acid at 5% concentration. As a result of the tests conducted, the screw holding strength was found to be higher in the impregnated samples than in the control specimens. It was found that borax in boron compounds has higher values than boric acid. As the concentration of the boron compound increased, a decrease in screw holding strength was detected. Despite this decrease, even the screw holding strength values in 5% concentration were higher than the control samples. As a result of the tests made, the bonding strength of the impregnated samples was found to be lower than the control samples. It was found that boric acid in boron compounds have higher results than borax. The highest value in boron compound concentrations was found at 1% concentration.

According to the results of the tests conducted, if we compare the boron compounds with each other, it is determined that in the samples impregnated with borax, retention, oven dry density and screw holding strength values were higher than boric acid, and elastic modulus and bonding strength parallel to fibres values were lower. If we compare the test results with the control samples, oven dry density, compression strength parallel to the fibres and screw holding strengths in the impregnated samples were higher than the control samples. Bending strength, elastic modulus and bonding strength parallel to the fibres were lower than the control samples.

Alternative impregnation materials, which do not harm nature and humans, should be sought instead of chemical impregnation materials used in the preservation (impregnation) of wood materials, which have occupied a prominent place in the global forest products industry in recent years. In this study, some properties of wood materials were tested by applying mixtures of natural impregnation substances that are rich in boron and tannin - which have enormous potential in Turkey - to wood materials. Thus, it was aimed to increase the use of these materials in the impregnation field and thus contribute to the country's economy and the environment.

In this study, quebracho was used as a natural impregnation material, and borax and boric acid were used as chemical impregnation substances. In works to be conducted later, it may be recommended using different boron compounds with different natural impregnation materials. In addition, this blend can be compared by determining the effects on the wood material by adding other ingredients.

The objective is to increase industrial use of the application of mixtures of boron minerals to wood materials, which have a great potential in Turkey, as well as natural impregnation materials rich in tannins. It follows that this will therefore contribute to the economy of the country.

In addition, natural impregnation materials which are not harmful to nature and human beings should be used rather than chemical impregnation substances used in the preservation (impregnation) of wooden materials – substances which have occupied an important place in the global forest products in recent years.

Peer-review: Externally peer-reviewed.

Author Contributions: Concept – M.S.F., H.A.; Design – M.S.F., H.A.; Supervision – M.S.F., H.A.; Resources – M.S.F., H.A.; Materials – M.S.F., H.A.; Data Collection and/or Processing – M.S.F., H.A.; Analysis and/or Interpretation – M.S.F., H.A.; Literature Search – M.S.F., H.A.; Writing Manuscript – M.S.F., H.A.; Critical Review – M.S.F., H.A.; Other – M.S.F., H.A.

Acknowledgement: This article covers a part of the master's thesis prepared by Hakan ADANUR between the years 2012 and 2015 in the Gümüşhane University Institute of Science and Technology Forestry and Environment Sciences Department in consultation with Assist. Dr. Muhammad Said FIDAN.

**Conflict of Interest:** The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

Financial Disclosure: The authors declared that this study has received no financial support. REFERENCES

- Açıkel, İ., 2007. Effect of Screw Retention Strength in Wood Materials of Impregnation Process. Gazi University, Institute of Science and Technology, Thesis of MSc, Ankara, 1-52 p.
- Adanur, H., 2015. Determination of Physical and Mechanical Properties Impregnating with Some Tannins and Boron Compounds of East beech (Fagus orientalis L.) Wood. Thesis of MSc, Gümüşhane University, Institute of Science and Technology, Gümüşhane, 77 p.
- Altınok, M., Özalp, M., Karaaslan, A., Perçin, O., 2009. Effects of Glues Modified with Borax on the Bonding Strength of Chestnut Wood (Castenea sativa Mill.). *Journal of Bartın Forestry Faculty* 11(15): 17-24.
- Aslan, S., 1998. Tree Pests, Protection and Impregnation Technique. Publication of KOSGEB, Ankara, 272 p.
- ASTM-D 1413, 2007. "Standard Test Method of Testing Wood Preservatives by Laboratory Soilblock Cultures", ASTM, USA, 1-9.
- Baysal, E., 1994. Effect of Some Physical Properties of Wood Calabrian pine of Several Boron and WR Composite. Karadeniz Technical University, Institute of Science and Technology, Thesis of MSc, Trabzon, 114 p.
- Baysal, E., Yalınkılıç M.K., Çolak, M., Göktaş, O., 2003. Combustion Properties of Calabrian pine (Pinus brutia Ten.) Wood Treated with Vegetable Tanning Extracts and Boron Compunds. *Turkish Journal* of Forestry 27(4): 245-252.
- Bektaş, İ., 1997. Variation According to Location and Technological Characteristics of Calabrian pine (Pinus brutia). Institute of Science and Technology, Thesis of PhD, İstanbul, 26-27 p.
- Bozkurt, A.Y., N. Erdin., 1990. Physical and Mechanical Properties in Woods Used in Trade. Journal of the Faculty of Forestry Istanbul University, İstanbul, 40 B (1): 6-24 p.
- Bozkurt, A. Y., Göker, Y., Erdin, N., 1993. Impregnate Technique. İstanbul University Press N: 71, Publication N: 3879, Publication Faculty of Forestry: 4135, İstanbul, 106-107 p.
- Bozkurt, Y., Erdin N., 1997. Wood Technology. İstanbul University, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul University Press and Film Center, 445, İstanbul, 372 p.
- Bozkurt, A.Y., Göker, Y., Erdin, N., 2000. Wood Anatomy. İstanbul Üniversity, Publication of Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul, 117-120 p.
- Erdinler, S., 1999. Türkish Furniture Foreign Trade. 1.International Furniture Congress and Exhibit, Proceedings, İstanbul, October 14-17 1999, 19-29 p.
- Güler, C., Bektaş, İ., 2000. The Relationship Between Elasticity Properties (Modulus of Elasticity and Static Bending Strenght) and Density of Eastern Beech Wood Naturally Grown in Andırın. Kahramanmaraş Sütçü İmam University Journal of Science and Engineering, 3 (2): 51-57 p.
- Gür, İ., 2003. Determination of the Impact on Some Mechanical and Physical Properties of Scotch Fir and Calabrian Pine of Impregnation Process. Gazi University, Institute of Science and Technology, Thesis of MSc, Ankara, 56 p.
- Hafizoğlu, H., Yalınkılıç, M.K., Yıldız, Ü.C., Baysal, E., Peker, H., Demirci, Z., 1994. Evaluation in Wood Protection (Impregnation) Industry of Boron Source in Turkey. Project Number: TÜBİTAK TOVAG- 87, 377 p.
- Hafizoğlu, H., 1984. Forest Side Products Chemistry and Technology Lecture Notes. Karadeniz Technical University, Faculty of Forestry, Trabzon.
- Huş, S. 1977. Wood Adhesive Book. Istanbul University, Faculty of Forestry, İstanbul. [Turkish]
- Karayazıcı, I., Nal, N., Celayir, F., 1980. Boron and Boron Compounds, Industrial Development Bank of Turkey, Chemical Sector Research Directorate, İstanbul, 193 p.
- Kartal, S.N., Green, F., 2002. Development and Application of Colori-

metric Microassay for Determining Boron-containing Compounds. Forest Prod J, 52.

- Kasal, A., Efe, H., Dizel, T., 2010. Determination of the Bending Strength and Modulus of Elasticity of Solid Wood and Laminated Veneer Lumber. *Journal of Polytechnic* Cilt:13 Sayı: 3 s. 183-190.
- Keskin, H., and A. Togay., 2003. Physical and Mechanical Properties of Laminated Wood Materials Made Up With the Combination of Oriental Beech Wood and Poplar Wood. Süleyman Demirel University Journal of Forestry Isparta 2: 101-114 p.
- Khanbabaee, K., Ree, T., 2001. Tanens: Classification and Definition. Nat. Prod. Rep., 18: 641–649 p.
- Kırcı, H., 2000. Paper Pulp Industries Lecture Notes, Karadeniz Technical University, Faculty of Forestry, Publication Number: 63, Trabzon.
- Kurtoğlu, A., 2000. Wood Material Surface Processing. İstanbul University, Faculty of Forestry, Department of Forest Industry Engineering, I:31-32, İstanbul.
- Kurtoğlu, A., 1984. Possibilities of Non-chemical Protection of Wood Products. Journal of the Faculty of Forestry Istanbul University, Number: B, İstanbul, 4(34): 27-29.
- Lloyd, J.D., 1998. Borates and their Biological Applications. The International Research Group on Wood Preservation 29th Annual Meeting, 14-19 June 1998, IRG/WP/98-30178,24pp, Maastricht, Netherlands.
- Malkoçoğlu, A., 1994. Properties Technology of Oriental beech (Fagus orientalis Lipsky). Thesis of PhD, Karadeniz Teknik University, Institute of Science and Technology, Trabzon, 154 p.
- Örs, Y., Atar, M., Peker, H., 1999., The Effects of the Intensity of Scocth Fir and Oriental Beech of Some Impregnated Materials. *Journal of Agriculture and Forestry* 23(5): 1169-1179.
- Özçifçi, A., 2005. Wood Glues. Unpublished Lecture Notes, Z.K.Ü. Faculty of Karabük Technical Education, Karabük.
- Peker, H., Sivrikaya, H., Baysal, E., Yalınkılıç, M.K., 1999. Static Bending Strenght of Wood Treated With Fire Reterdant and Water Repellent Preservation Chemicals. *Pamukkale University Journal of Engineering Science* 5(1): 975-982.
- Perçin, O., Ayan, S., 2012. Determination of Screw Withdrawal Strength In Heat Treated Wood Material. *Journal of Advanced Technology Science* 1(1): 57-68 p.
- Richardson, B.A., 1987. Wood Preservation. The Construction, Lan-

caster, England, 186 p.

- Rowell, R.M., 2005. Handbook of Wood Chemistry and Wood Composites. CRC Press, ISBN 0-8493-1588-3, New York, USA.
- Şen, S., Hafizoğlu, H., 2001. The Effects on the Environment of Some Chemicals Used in Wood Protection. National Industry – Environment Symposium and Gallery, Mersin, 25-27 April 2001, 753-758 p.
- Temiz, A., Yıldız, Ü.C., Gezer, E.D., Yıldız, S., Dizman, E., 2004. The Effect of CCA on The Mechanical Properties of Alder Wood. *Kafkas* University Journal of Forestry Faculty, 1 (2), 18-23 p.
- Toker, H., 2007. Determination of Effects of Boron Compounds on Some Physical Mechanical and Biological Properties of Wood. Thesis of PhD, Gazi University, Institute of Science and Technology, Ankara, 213 p.
- TS 2472, 1976. "Determination of Specific Gravity for Physical and Mechanical Testing in Wood", Standart of TSE, Ankara, 1-12 p.
- TS 2474, 1976. "Determination of the Static Bending Strength of Wood", Standart of TSE, Ankara.
- TS EN 13446, 2005. Wood-based panels Determination Of Withdrawal Capacity Of Fasteners, T.S.E. Standardı, Ankara.
- TS EN 205, 2004. "Bondings- Overlap Shear Strength of the Annexes With Cut-glued Determination of Wood Adhesives for Non-Structural Applications", Standart of TSE, Ankara, 1-7 p.
- TS 2595, 1976. "Compression Strength Parallel to Grain of Wood", Standart of TSE, Ankara.
- Uysal, B., Kurt, Ş. 2005. The Effect of Adhesion Strength of Wooden Material of Impregnated Materials Pithy Boron of Fire-retardant.
  Proceedings of I. National Boron Workshop, Ankara, 43 p.
- Winandy, J. E., Morell, J. J., 1990. Protection of Wood Design in Adverse Environments. In: Proceedings of I. Forest Product Journal, 354-359 p.
- Yalınkılıç, M.K., Baysal, E., Demirci, Z., 1995. Effects of Some Boron Compounds and/or Water Repellents on the Higroscopicity of Brutia Pine (Pinus brutia Ten.) Wood. *Pamukkale University Journal of Engineering Science*, 1: 2-3, Denizli, 161-168 p.
- Yaşar, Ş.Ş., Atar, A., 2017. Gas Emission Amounts Resulting from the Combustion of Some Wooden Materials Treated with Wood Preservatives. *Journal of Advanced Technology Sciences* 6(3): 503-514 p.