



CİLT/ VOLUME: 1 SAYI/ ISSUE: 2

TEMMUZ, 2019/ JULY, 2019

MUALLİM RIFAT EĞİTİM FAKÜLTESİ DERGİSİ (MREFD)
JOURNAL OF MUALLİM RIFAT FACULTY OF EDUCATION (JMRFE)

Yayın Kurulu/ Editorial Board

Editör/ Editor

Prof. Dr. Muhammet Ruhat YAŞAR

Editör Yardımcıları/ Associate Editors

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Mehmet Akif KARAMAN

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Yakup DOĞAN

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Alper YETKİNER

Dil Editörleri/ Language Editors

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Mehmet Akif KARAMAN

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Halil İbrahim SARI

Sekreteryaya/ Editorial Assistants

Arş. Gör. İlknur AKYILDIZ SARIBAŞ

Arş. Gör. Tansel TEPE

Yayın Danışma Kurulu/ Review Board

Doç. Dr. Fatih BEKTAŞ, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Doç. Dr. Metin AÇIKYILDIZ, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Doç. Dr. Mustafa CINOĞLU, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Ahmet TANHAN, Adıyaman Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Alper YETKİNER, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Mehmet Akif KARAMAN, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Muazzez HARUNOĞULLARI, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Ömer Faruk İNCİLİ, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Türkan ÇELİK, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Zeynel Abidin YILMAZ, Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi

İÇİNDEKİLER

Gökçe KURT, Lütfiye COŞKUN, Ayşe KILIÇKAYA

*The Quality Comparison of Turkish and American Picture Storybooks for Young
Children*

Sayfa 1-10

Murat YILMAZ, Münübe YILMAZ

The Effect of Education on American Muslims' Religiosity

Sayfa 11-23

Sachin JAIN, Vaibhavee AGASKAR, Shannon KAKKAR, Malvika BEHL

School Counselling in India

Sayfa 24-39

Yakup ALAN

İbrahim Müteferrikanın Bastığı Son Eser: Türkçe – Farsça Sözlük; Ferheng-İ

Şuuri (Lisan-ül Acem)

Sayfa 40-49

Editörden,

Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi Muallim Rifat Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi'nin çok değerli yazarları, hakemleri ve okuyucuları,

2019 yılında yayın hayatına başlayıp, ilk sayısını sizlerle buluşturduğumuz dergimizin ikinci sayısını da sizlere sunmaktan ötürü oldukça mutlu ve de gururluyuz. Sıfırdan var ederek oluşturduğumuz ve büyük emekler sonucu hazırlıklarını tamamladığımız dergimizin, ikinci sayısını da yayınladıktan sonra adımızı öncelikle ulusal ve daha sonra da uluslararası dizinlerde anılacak biçimde tanıtmak için elimizden gelen tüm gayretleri göstereceğiz. Dergimizin yayın hayatına başlamasından itibaren desteğini bizden esirgemeyen Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi Rektörü Prof. Dr. Mustafa Doğan KARACOŞKUN'a teşekkürü bir borç biliriz. İlk sayıda olduğu gibi bu sayıda da emekleri yadsınamayacak olan dergimiz editör yardımcıları Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Mehmet Akif Karaman'a, Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Yakup DOĞAN'a ve Dr. Öğr. Üyesi Alper YETKİNER'e ve dergimizin ilk sayısında editör yardımcısı olarak yer alıp görevini devreden, dergimizin kuruluş aşamasında emekleri ve özverili çalışmaları ile süreci hızlandıran Doç. Dr. Fatih Bektaş'a teşekkürlerimi sunarım. Ayrıca dergimizin her iki sayısında da dizgi ve düzenleme aşamasında emekleri oldukça fazla olan Arş. Gör. İlknur AKYILDIZ SARIBAŞ'a ve Arş. Gör. Tansel TEPE'ye teşekkür ederim.

Dergimizin ikinci sayısında huzurlarınıza dört farklı çalışma ile çıkmaktayız. The Effect of Education on American Muslims' Religiosity, The Quality Comparison of Turkish and American Picture Storybooks for Young Children, İbrahim Müteferrika'nın Bastığı Son Eser: Türkçe-Farsça Sözlük; Ferheng-i Şuuri (Lisan-ül Acem) ve School Counseling in India adlı çalışmaları ile ikinci sayımızda yer alan tüm yazarlara saygı ve şükranlarımı sunarım.

İlk iki sayısıyla huzurlarınıza çıkan ve adını farklı dizinlerde görmeye başlayacağımız dergimiz için siz kıymetli meslektaşlarımızı, eğitimcilerimizi, bilim merdivenlerini çıkmaya başlayacak sevgili öğrencilerimizi dergimizin yayınlanacak yeni sayılarında aramızda görmek istiyor, bizlere sunacağınız katkı ve destekten ötürü onur ve mutluluk duyacağımızı bilmenizi istiyorum.

Prof. Dr. Muhammet Ruhat YAŞAR



Okul Öncesi Çocuklarına Yönelik Türk ve Amerikan Resimli Öykü Kitaplarının Kalite Karşılaştırması¹

Gökçe KURT¹², Lütfiye COŞKUN², Ayşe KILIÇKAYA³

¹ İnönü University, Malatya

² Kilis 7 Aralık University, Kilis

³ Erzincan Binali Yıldırım University, Erzincan

MAKALE BİLGİ

Makale Tarihiçesi:

Alındı 25.02.2019

Düzeltilmiş hali alındı

14.06.2019

Kabul edildi

26.06.2019

Çevrimiçi yayımlandı

25.07.2019

ÖZET

Bu çalışmada, Türk ve Amerikan resimli hikâye kitapları bazı kalite özelliklerine göre karşılaştırılmıştır. Yazarlar, Erzincan, Türkiye ve Teksas ABD'deki on erken çocukluk eğitim merkezinden toplanan toplam elli resimli hikâye kitabını analiz etmiştir. Türk ve Amerikan resimli hikâye kitaplarının kalite özellikleri, bir ölçek ve yazarların ölçek maddelerine ilişkin kişisel hesaplarıyla analiz edilmiştir. İki ülkedeki resimli hikâye kitaplarındaki kalite özelliklerinin, ülkelerin sosyoekonomik yapısı ile bağlantılı olduğu ve çocukların resimli kitaplarının kalitesini okuldaki ve evdeki eğitim ve okuma uygulamaları doğrultusunda artırma önerileri getirildiği ortaya konmuştur.

© 2019MREFD. Tüm hakları saklıdır

Anahtar Kelimeler:

Çocuk edebiyatı, okul öncesi eğitimi, resimli öykü kitaplarının kalitesi

¹Bu çalışma ICEFIC 2015 International Congress on Education for the Future: Issues and Challenges kongresinde sözlü bildiri olarak sunulmuştur.

²Sorumlu Yazarın Adresi: İnönü Üniversitesi, Eğitim Fakültesi, Malatya
e-posta: dr.gokcekurt@gmail.com



The Quality Comparison of Turkish and American Picture Storybooks for Young Children⁴

Gökçe KURT¹⁵, Lütfiye COŞKUN², Ayşe KILIÇKAYA³

¹Inönü University, Malatya

²Kilis 7 Aralık University, Kilis

³Erzincan Binali Yıldırım University, Erzincan

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received 25.02.2019

Received in revised

form 14.06.2019

Accepted 26.06.2019

Available online

25.07.2019

ABSTRACT

In this study, the Turkish and American picture storybooks were compared according to some quality aspects. A total of fifty picture storybooks collected from ten early childhood education centers in Erzincan, Turkey, and Texas, U.S. were analyzed by the authors. The quality features of Turkish and American picture storybooks were analyzed through a scale and personal accounts of the authors regarding the scale items. It is revealed that the quality features in picture story books across two countries were interconnected with the socioeconomic structure of the countries and the suggestions were provided to raise the quality of children's picture books in line with the educational and reading practices at school and home.

© 2019JMRFE. All rights reserved

Keywords:

Children's literature, preschool education, quality in picture story books

Introduction

Books are a natural part of the educational process throughout one's life. Love for books is rooted in the very early years of life (Morrison, 2015). The early joyful encounters and experiences with quality picture books set the basis to improve the sense of literacy in the later life. Hence it is important to choose the books to improve the latter reading habits for young children (Gönen, 1993; Jalongo, 2004). The preschool teachers frequently use picture books during in-class activities, and young children select the picture books at the book corners/centers in their classrooms during the free times. Beginning from infancy, the parents have the chance to nourish their interactions with their babies through the picture books (Bus & van Ijzendoorn, 1988; Sénéchal, Cornell, & Broda, 1995). The teachers and parents with the well-established reading habits stand as the role models for young children. Through the interactive reading processes between the adults and children enriched with the open-ended questions and educational materials, youngsters' curiosity and creativity, developmental areas and early literacy skills could be supported (Ergül, Akoğlu, Sarıca, Tufan, & Karaman, 2015).

⁴This study was presented at the ICEFIC 2015 International Congress on Education for the Future: Issues and Challenges, May 13-15 2015, Ankara.

⁵Corresponding author's address: Inönü University, Faculty of Education, Malatya
e-mail: dr.gokcekurt@gmail.com

The fine motor skills (Jalongo, 2004), language skills (Sénéchal et al., 1995), pre-literacy skills (Bus & van Ijzendoorn, 1988; Mol & Bus, 2011), social skills (Bus & van Ijzendoorn, 1988), and math skills (Elia, van den Heuvel-Panhuizen, & Georgiou, 2010; Hong, 1996) in young children could be supported with the picture book related activities. Through picture books, the way of becoming literate adults is paved. The young children passing the time with the picture books learn to create time for books and develop a passion for the books in the future (Jalongo, 2004). The young children are acknowledged about the social roles and interactions through picture books. They recognize the children and families that are different from their own and enrich their social, personal, intellectual, and cultural perspectives (Morrow, 1983). Creating connections between the words and pictures is an integral part of picture book reading. The pictures help the children understand the text. Young children are better at understanding the complex situations through pictures rather relying on the long and detailed texts like adults (Fang, 1996). Hence the child's imagination and creativity are supported through pictures.

The quality of picture books affects the reading process of parents and teachers and in turn children's learning process (Sénéchal et al., 1995). There are some studies in the literature regarding choosing of the right books for young children depending on various quality criteria (Anderson, Anderson, Shapiro, & Lynch, 2001; Demircan, 2006; Dwyer & Neuman, 2008; Ersoy, Avcı, & Turla, 2007; Jalongo, 2004; Körükçü, 2012; Uluğ & Bayraktar, 2014; Veziroğlu & Gönen, 2012). It has been indicated that the Turkish picture books used in preschool education had some shortcomings in their interior (theme, topic, characters, language and style) and exterior (used material, size, weight, cover, binding, font size, layout and illustration) quality (Gönen, 1993). The literature review revealed that although the publications on the quality characteristics of picture books provide a solid foundation in choosing the right books for young children; there is no study conducted on the quality comparison of picture books used in the preschools in different countries. The most comprehensive research would be the comparison of picturing techniques and pictorial characteristics of picture books from 22 countries conducted by ÜnlüÇetin and Cir (2016). Hence, the purpose of this study was to examine the quality of picture books used in Turkish and American preschools on the same criteria, which would help to see the quality differences in two groups of picture books. Hence the selection of picture books from early childhood education centers in Turkey and the United States could help in forming ideas about the quality of picture books. In the quality assessment of picture books, some general criteria are used in the previous studies, appearing as interior and exterior features. The exterior features of picture books involved binding, cover, paper, page layout; whereas, the wording and literary style are involved in the interior features (Oğuzkan, 2006; Sever, 2010). In this study, the picture books were analyzed in the line of those criteria and also the reviewers' personal accounts helped in the detailing of analysis.

Method

Research design

In this study, the descriptive and qualitative analysis was used to analyze the picture books. A scale evaluating the quality features of the books and authors' accounts on those features was integrated into the analysis. The research design is a mixed method which involves the use of both qualitative and quantitative techniques (Burke & Christensen, 2012). One of the advantages of mixed method research is expanding the scope of research and providing more diverse and rich perspectives on the research problem (Creswell, 2009), which was detailed in the discussion. In this study, the evaluation of picture books was carried out with a Likert type scale, and the researchers' accounts on these items were reflected simultaneously.

Participants

The participants of this research were a total of fifty picture books conveniently selected from the five early childhood education centers in Erzincan and Denton in the fall semester of 2014. The sampling procedure was convenient because the books were collected from the schools that accepted to borrow their books to the researchers. The second author of the research collected the twenty-five books from five early childhood education centers in Denton, Texas where she studied during her doctoral education. The third author collected the twenty-five books from five early childhood education centers in Erzincan where she worked as a research assistant. The criteria for selecting the books were that the book should represent the Turkish and American child literature and should be a piece that is similar to the other books on the shelves. Considering this selection criterion, the sampling method could be called as typical sampling (Teddlie & Yu, 2007) that is to say; the selected books were representative of the Turkish and American child literature and similar to the other books in the book corners in the classrooms.

Instrument

In analyzing the books, an instrument was developed by the researchers depending on the previous literature (Al Otaiba, 2004; Anderson et al., 2001; Demircan, 2006; Dwyer & Neuman 2008; Ersoy et al., 2007; Jalongo, 2004; Ministry of National Education, 2013; Sever, 2010; Veziroğlu & Gönen, 2012). The authors developed the instrument analyzing the interior and exterior features of books and reviewed by two professors specialized in preschool education, and one professor specialized in children's literature. Considering the reviews of the experts, the necessary changes were made and the instrument was shaped. Using the instrument, each book was independently reviewed by the three authors of this research; hence three independent review forms were collected for each book. The two researchers collected the books in Denton and Erzincan, scanned the whole books and write down the texts in the books and sent the files to each other and to the first author via email.

The books in the sample were analyzed according to the exterior (dimension, paper, cover, binding, illustrations, page layout, and identity information) and interior characteristics (wording and literary style, subject, planning, and theme). The items were coded on a three-point Likert type scale (1=not appropriate, 2=somewhat appropriate, and 3=appropriate). The researchers also added their comments about each characteristic. Below are the numbers of characteristics analyzed with sample items.

Dimension (2 items). “When the teacher reads the book, the pictures and text should be seen by children.”

Paper (3 items). “The texture of the paper should allow the child to turn the page over.”

Cover (4 items). “The cover should be compatible with the subject.”

Binding (2 items). “The binding should protect the inner pages.”

Pictures (7 items). “The illustrations should be complementary to the text.”

Page layout (3 items). “The page layout should be comfy and appealing.”

Identity information (8 items). “The resume of the author(s) should be provided.”

Wording and literary style (13 items). “The wording should be simple and clear.”

Subject (8 items). “The subject should be appropriate for the child’s conceptual development of his age.”

Planning (2 items). “The events should be organized consistently.”

Theme (4 items). “The theme should provide universal values.”

Data analysis

The three researchers independently analyzed the whole books. Each picture book was read by each researcher and independently analyzed. A composite score for each book on each item was calculated by summing up the three scores and dividing it by three. The scores for each book again was calculated for the subscales, interior and exterior features and total score. The results are presented in Table 1.

Results

Table 1. The Mean Quality Scores of Turkish and American Picture Books

Subscales	Turkish sample			American sample			Subscales	Turkish sample			American sample		
Exterior	<i>n</i>	\bar{X}	<i>SS</i>	<i>n</i>	\bar{X}	<i>SS</i>	Interior	<i>n</i>	\bar{X}	<i>SS</i>	<i>n</i>	\bar{X}	<i>SS</i>
Dimension	25	8.34	.82	25	7.36	1.06	Wording	25	8.15	.81	25	8.73	.57
Paper	25	7.12	1.02	25	8.64	.62	Subject	25	8.02	1.04	25	8.12	.23
Cover	25	7.39	.9	25	7.84	.59	Plan	25	8.72	.83	25	8.88	1.12
Binding	25	4.16	.6	25	8.66	.71	Theme	25	7.02	1.88	25	7.9	.6
Pictures	25	8.75	.61	25	8.84	.4	Total (interior)	25	7.98	.84	25	8.43	1.59
Page layout	25	7.98	.91	25	5.96	1.15							
Identity info	25	5.97	.68	25	7.25	.67							
Total (exterior)	25	7.2	.42	25	7.83	.42							
Total (ext+int)	25	7.12	.5	25	7.64	.36							

In Table 1, it is seen that the total quality score is higher for the American books (7.64), compared to the Turkish books (7.12). The American books had higher scores on the total interior (8.43) and exterior scores (7.83) than the Turkish total interior (7.98) and exterior scores (7.20). Regarding the dimension and page layout of exterior qualities, the Turkish books had higher scores (respectively; 8.34 and 7.98) than the American books (7.36 and 5.96). Regarding the interior qualities, it is seen that the American books had higher scores than the Turkish books on each dimension.

Discussion

The researchers had a chance to closely examine the Turkish books in their childhood and American picture books during their educational experiences abroad. In initiating this research, the researchers had some pre-constructed ideas about the quality of American and Turkish picture books. They claimed that the American books had higher quality, especially in binding and paper quality and the subject and pictures were more creative than the Turkish books. The same reasons directing the researchers to conduct this research could also cause bias in analyzing the books. Also, the researchers were familiar with the Turkish culture and literary style which could be regarded as another bias that could limit the objectivity of the researchers.

When all the qualities are examined, the American books had higher scores than the Turkish books on each quality except dimension and page layout. It is much more possible for the young child to carry the Turkish books compared to the bigger American books. The majority of American books had hardcover and was relatively bigger than the paper covered Turkish books which could pose a disadvantage for the child's use. In the paper quality, it is seen that the majority of the Turkish books were pressed on thin, shiny and slippery papers; contrary to the quality criteria that the paper quality should allow the child to turn over the pages by himself and be matte. The shiny papers could restrain some children's sight during the large group readings, and the slippery quality of papers could give a hard time to the child in turning the pages by himself. Especially for younger children, the matte and thick pages could support the page turning process for little fingers.

It is seen that the majority of Turkish books were bound with staples and the cover was overly thin that is not appropriate to protect the inner pages resulting in lower average scores for the Turkish sample on the cover. The lower quality of binding and page were also detected in Turkish picture books (Gönen, 1993). Here, it must be noted that the purchasing power of the Turkish families are lower, thus the publishers choose the lower cost of binding and page quality. In the pictures dimension, both the American and Turkish books had almost scored full with a slight difference in favor of the American sample. It is explained by the authors that the pictures in the American sample are more artistic, creative and detailed that caused them scored slightly higher than the Turkish pictures.

In the page layout, the Turkish picture books had higher scores which are explained by the neat structure of the placement of texts and page numbers. The American books have authentic styles in the text placement and fonts which could heighten the child's attention to

the text (Fang, 1996). It was found in the research that page numbers were not used in any of the American picture books. The American books had higher scores in the identity information due to the detailed information about the publisher, author, and illustrator. Similarly, Körükçü (2012) pointed out the inadequacy of the exterior features in Turkish picture books for young children. Gönen (1993) also explained the deficiencies in the content, picturing, and other external features of the Turkish picture books and also the preschool teachers' incompetency in child literature.

When the interior qualities are examined, it is seen that the refined humorous style and length of sentences and paragraphs appropriate for young children caused the American books to get higher scores on wording than the Turkish books. In Turkish books, the instructional style seems stronger than the humorous style (Gönen, 1993). On the contrary, Veziroğlu and Gönen (2013) claimed that the objectives explained in the Preschool Education Program published by the Ministry of National Education (2013) were involved at a rate of 18.5% in 250 Turkish picture books. It is suggested that the humorous wording which is supported by the appropriate illustrations could support the child's creativity (Al Otaiba, 2004). It is important for one to gain pleasure in reading during adulthood. When children improve their emotional interactions with the books and learn while getting pleasure and fun, their motivations for further readings get stronger. Although there is a tendency in the U.S. that through the picture books the academic knowledge and skills could be thought to the children, the feelings of joy in reading picture books could support some particular skills such as problem solving, discussion, claiming new ideas, and fluency in reading and writing (Jalongo, 2004). It is revealed that the pleasure in reading in the early stages in life is essential in the development of reading habits (Uluğ&Bayraktar, 2014).

Tuğrul, Metin Aslan, Ertürk, and Özen Altınkaynak (2014) revealed that the book reading process was perceived as a "work" by the six years old attending the kindergarten. The young children perceived book reading as a work because of its teacher directed nature just as writing. Thus the reading process needs to be self-directed by the child so that the child enjoys reading and naturally improves his reading habits. Besides the joyful nature of the picture books, the richness of book centers at the preschools is important so that the child himself choose the books he wants to read and this prevents him from reading the same books again and again (Gönen, 1993). Külük (2013) emphasized the artistic and aesthetic content of the picture books is also effective on the development of a child's artistic taste. The artistic weakness in the Turkish picture books is another critique raised by the research (Gönen, 1993). Accordingly, comparably low quality in the general printing quality and exterior features of the Turkish books are observed in the study.

In this study, 25 Turkish and 25 American picture books were analyzed. From the analysis, it appears that the interior and exterior features of books differentiate by the social, cultural, and economic structures of the societies. In general, the cost of the American books is higher because of the high quality of exterior features whereas the financially convenient exterior features are followed in Turkish books. The American books are viewed as more creative, fun and artistic in pictures, wording, and subject, whereas the Turkish books are more organized, formal and instructive in pictures and wording style. Ünlü Çetin and Çir

(2016) also indicated that the variation in the picture books' picturing techniques was observable in different countries due to the social and economic differences.

Within the scope of those results, the following suggestions are provided. The Turkish books enriched with more creativity and sense of humor should create more interest in picture books and support the child's development in those areas. Also, the information provided about the authors and publishers should support their visibility both for the readers and the market. The quality hard covering and silk binding is mostly used in the American books heighten the prices for the readers but also enhance the second hand market for the picture books. The Turkish picture books mostly have a poor binding which result in fast tearing and wearing thus the second hand market is not developed especially for children's books and the books are conveyed to close friends or relatives after the first hand use. However, it is clear that the quality binding promotes the durability of the children's books. As understood from the analysis, although there are some quality differences in some dimensions, the mean scores are not that different in all dimensions. It is assumed that supporting the writers and illustrators' initiatives could result in more quality publications in Turkish child literature and develop the market in the future.

References

- Al Otaiba, S. (2004). Weaving moral elements and research-based reading practices in inclusive classrooms using shared book reading techniques. *Early Child Development and Care, 174*(6), 575–589.
- Anderson, J., Anderson, A., Shapiro, J., & Lynch, J. (2001). Father's and mothers' book selection preference for their four-year-old children. *Reading Horizons, 41*, 189–210.
- Burke, J., & Christensen, L. (2012). *Educational research: Quantitative, qualitative and mixed approaches*. (4th. Ed.) Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Bus, A. G., & Van Ijzendoorn, M. H. (1988). Mother-child interactions, attachment, and emergent literacy: A cross-sectional study. *Child Development, 59*, 1262-1272.
- Creswell, J. W. (2009). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative and mixed methods approaches* (3rd. ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Demircan, C. (2006). An investigation of the books in TUBITAK children library series according to their layout and content criteria. *Mersin University Journal of the Faculty of Education, 2*(1), 12-27.
- Dwyer, J., & Neuman, S. B. (2008). Selecting books for children birth through four: A developmental approach. *Early Childhood Educational Journal, 35*, 489-494. doi: 10.1007/s10643-008-0236-5.
- Elia, I., van den Heuvel-Panhuizen, M., & Georgiou, A. (2010). The role of pictures in picture books on children's cognitive engagement with mathematics. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal, 18*(3), 275-297.

- Ergül, C, Akoğlu, G., Sarıca, A. D., Tufan, M. & Karaman, G. (2015). Examination of shared book reading activities in kindergartens based on “dialogic reading”. *Mersin University Journal of the Faculty of Education*, 11(3), 603-619. doi: 10.17860/efd.88429.
- Ersoy, Ö, Avcı, N., &Turla, A. (2007). *Çocuklar için erken uyarıcı çevre [The early stimulative environment for children]*. İstanbul, TR: Morpa Publishing.
- Fang, Z. (1996). Illustrations, text, and the child reader: What are pictures in children’s storybooks for? *Reading Horizons*, 37(2), 130-142.
- Gönen, M. (1993). The examination of the qualities of fairy tales and storybooks used by kindergarten teachers for the five and six years old children. *TürkKütüphaneciliği*, 7(2), 83-88.
- Hong, H. (1996). Effects of mathematics learning through children’s literature on math achievement and dispositional outcomes. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 11, 477-494.
- Jalongo, M. R. (2004). *Young children and picture books* (2nd. Ed.). National Association for the Education of Young Children, Washington DC.
- Körükçü, Ö. (2012). An analysis of preschool education illustrated children’s books in terms of necessary qualities. *Trakya University Journal of Social Sciences*, 14(2), 243-254.
- Ministry of National Education (2013). Part 6: Children’s picture books. MoNE, Ankara. Retrieved from <https://tegm.meb.gov.tr/dosya/okuloncesi/Resimlicocukkitaplari0-36.pdf>.
- Mol, S. E., & Bus, A. G. (2011). To read or not to read: A meta-analysis of print exposure from infancy to early adulthood. *Psychological Bulletin*, 137(2), 267-296. doi: 10.1037/a0021890.
- Morrison, G. S. (2015). *Early Childhood Education Today*. (13th edition). New York, NY: Pearson.
- Morrow, M. L. (1983). Home and school correlates of early interest in literature. *Journal of Educational Research*, 76, 221-230. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/27539975>.
- Oğuzkan, A. F. (2006). *Çocuk edebiyatı [Child Literature]*. (8. Baskı). Ankara, TR: Anı Yayıncılık.
- Sénéchal, M., Cornell, E. H., & Broda, L. S. (1995). Age-related differences in the organization of parent-infant interactions during picture-book reading. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 10, 317-337.
- Sever, S. (2010). *Çocuk ve edebiyat [Child and literature]*. (5th Ed.). İzmir, TR: Tudem.
- Teddle, C., & Yu, F. (2007). Mixed methods sampling: A typology with examples. *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 1(1), 77-100.

- Tuğrul, B., Metin Aslan, Ö., Ertürk, H. G., & Özen Altınkaynak, Ş. (2014). Analysis of preschool teachers' and six years old children's views on play. *InönüUniversity Journal of the Faculty of Education*, 15(1), 97-116. doi: 10.17679/iuefd.05509.
- Uluğ, E. & Bayraktar, A. (2014).Determination of the required features of children's picture books.*Journal of Education and Future*, 6, 25-42.
- Ünlü Çetin, Ş, & Cır, Ö. (2016). An analysis of children's book from different cultures in terms of illustrations and visual features. *Başkent University Journal of Education*, 3(1), 1-12.
- Veziroğlu, M., & Gönen, M. (2012). Review of the eligibility of picture books to the acquisition of the preschool education program of the Ministry of National Education. *Education and Science*, 37(163), 226-238.



Eğitimin Amerikan Müslümanlarının Dindarlığına Etkisi

Murat YILMAZ¹, Münübe YILMAZ²,

¹Hitit Üniversitesi, Corum.

²Baylor Üniversitesi, Waco.

MAKALE BİLGİ

Makale Tarihi:

Alındı 16.06.2019

Düzeltilmiş hali alındı
27.06.2019

Kabul edildi

28.06.2019

Çevrimiçi yayımlandı
25.07.2019

ÖZET

Eğitim ve din kurumları, sosyal yaşamın iki temel ögesidir. Eğitim bugüne değin yaşamın çeşitli yönleri bakımından çalışılmış ve bireylerin davranışları, bakış açıları ve tercihleri üzerinde, yine bireylerin sosyoekonomik statüleri, evlilikleri, doğurganlıkları ve sağlıklarında meydana gelen değişimlere bağlı olarak eğitimin büyük bir etkisi olduğu ortaya koyulmuştur. Eğitim gibi, din de bireylerin tutumları, bakış açıları ve tercihleri üzerinde önemli bir belirleyici olarak kabul edilmektedir. Eğitim ve din arasındaki ilişkinin niteliğini açıklamak için, sosyolojinin kurucuları, Marx, Weber, Mill ve Durkheim gibi sosyal bilimciler, eğitim seviyesinin yükselmesinin dindarlıktaki düşüş ile ilişkisinin olduğunu savunmuşlardır. Onlar ülkelerin ekonomik olarak geliştiği ve eğitim seviyelerinin yükseldiği zaman dine duyulan ihtiyacın azalacağını öngörmüşlerdir. Bu öngörünün gerçekleşip gerçekleşmeyeceği hakkındaki tartışma halen devam etmekte olup, sosyal bilimciler arasında dinin geleceği konusunda bir fikir birliği mevcut değildir. PEW Amerikan Müslüman Anketi 2008'den elde edilen verileri kullanarak, bu çalışma, eğitim seviyesinin Amerikan Müslümanlarının dindarlığı üzerindeki etkisini inceleyerek mevcut tartışmaya katkıda bulunmayı amaçlamaktadır. Ampirik bulgularımız, eğitimin bazı dini ölçekler üzerinde olumsuz etkileri olmasına rağmen, bunun tüm dini değişkenler için geçerli olmadığını göstermektedir.

© 2019MREFD. Tüm hakları saklıdır

Anahtar Kelimeler:

Eğitim, Amerikan Müslümanlar, Dindarlık



The Effect of Education on American Muslims' Religiosity

Murat YILMAZ¹, Münübe YILMAZ²

¹Hitit University, Corum

²Baylor University, Waco

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received 16.06.2019

Received in revised

form 27.06.2019

Accepted 28.06.2019

Available online

25.07.2019

ABSTRACT

Education and religion are two fundamental institutions for social life. Education has been studied for various aspects of life and found that it has a vast impact on several mechanisms of individuals life in terms of their behaviors, perspectives, and preferences related to the changes on their socioeconomic status, marriage, fertility and health. Like education, religion has also considered as a significant determinant on individuals' attitudes, perspectives, and preferences. In order to explain the nature of the relationship between education and religion, social scientists including the fathers of sociology, Marx, Weber, Mill, and Durkheim have often argued the high level of education is more likely related to decline in religiosity. They predict that when countries develop economically and the levels of education rise, the need for religion will diminish. The debate about the prediction still going on and there is no consensus among social scientists about the future of religion. Using data from PEW American Muslim Survey 2008, this study aims to contribute to the existing discussion by studying the effect of schooling years on American Muslims religiosity. Our empirical findings suggest while education has negative effects on some religious measures; this is not valid for all religious variables.

© 2019 JMRFE. All rights reserved

Keywords:

Education, American Muslims, Religiosity

Introduction

This paper examines the relationship between the level of education and Muslim religiosity in the U.S by using PEW Muslim Survey 2007. Based on well-known secularization theory and existing data indications, most studies suggest that there is a negative relationship between educational attainment and religiosity and the most educated are the least religious (see, for example, (Greeley, 1973; Hastings & Hoge, 1976, 1981; Hoge, 1974; Moberg & McEnery, 1976; Stark, 1963; Thalheimer, 1973; Zelan, 1968). However, limited number of studies have found the reverse relationship that within denominations, there is a positive association between education and church attendance (Schwadel, 2011). For Mormons, this nature of the relationship is turned to be positive for other measures of

⁷Corresponding author's address: Hitit University, Divinity Faculty, Corum
e-mail: murat.yilmaz@hitit.edu.tr

religiosity suggesting higher education does not have a secularizing influence on Mormons (Albrecht & Heaton, 1998).

For this study, American Muslims are the study of analysis. To investigate Muslims in America has several advantages over to study the effect of education on Muslim religiosity since in other Muslim populated countries individuals have been facing other social problems such as violence, dictatorships, poverty which are the reasons for lack of educational opportunities for most of the individuals. Also, tradition and religion are intertwined in the Muslim populated countries which makes complex to analyze the influence of education over religiosity without the effect of tradition.

Theoretical and Empirical Background

After the arising of modernism, popular acceptance has been taken place that religion has been eroding by the impact of Education and modernity (Casanova, 1994). As founders of sociology, Comte, Weber, and Durkheim, in general, suggested that education will eventually diminish religion because of the secularization process (Schwadel, 2011). From a contemporary sociological perspective, Wilson (1982) elaborates the secularization thesis as a system that is against the notion of “ultimate salvation”. The possible reasons behind this conclusion can be explained by the functions of education over society. Education in the formal institutions primarily imparts knowledge scientifically (Evans, 2011), provides credentials that are significant for determinations of location in the stratification system (Collins, 1979), relates with supporting diverse opinions and environments (Balswick, Ward, & Carlson, 1975; Moiseyenko, 2005), encourages the self-control in social life instead of external control mechanisms (Fox, Payne, Priest, & Philliber, 1977; Meier, 1982). These functions are usually presented as negative factors for religious outcomes.

In terms of identifying the relationship between education and religion from the negative perspective, previous studies have displayed “the image of erosion”, and indicated that education erodes religious beliefs and attitudes in two ways; 1) Through familiarity with science and other cultures, 2) With being exposed to secular viewpoints (Johnson, 1997; Sherkat, 1998). Educational attainment usually is the main determinant for social mobility that changes individuals’ income and employment status, scientific viewpoints, and familiarity with other cultures (Hungerman, 2014). From the standpoint of explaining the association between education and religion, educational attainment also changes religious behaviors because of being exposed to secular viewpoints that usually accept traditional religious teachings as myths. Therefore, schooling becomes a generic explanation for the erosion of religions that social and psychological fundamentals of religious belief and religious practices have been lessened gradually. More specifically, longer engagement with educational institutions leads individuals to contact with different ideas, people and cultures that make individuals disengaged from their faith (Johnson, 1997). Glock and Stark argue this situation based on the view “the determinable prediction that men will tend to be either scientific or religious, and not both” (Glock & Stark, 1965). Thus, more educated people are less likely to believe in spirituals, miracles, heaven, devil, and the literal truth of the Bible (Glaeser & Sacerdote, 2001).

Furthermore, schooling years have a negative impact on religiosity and an additional year of schooling causes individuals to be non-affiliated. This is considered as a lifelong effect of secularization which education fades individuals' religious commitment (Hungerman, 2014; Petersen, 1994), belief in God (Johnson, 1997), belief in the Bible (Sherkat, 1998), belief in divine involvement and control (Schieman, 2010), and the frequency of prayer (Baker, 2008). Regarding some religious traditions, existing research examining religious groups and their educational attainment have reported for all religious traditions low educated people are more likely have a higher frequency of prayer and read religious texts except for Evangelical Protestants who have a high level of prayer with the highest levels of education (Chatters, Taylor & Lincoln, 1999; Petersen, 1994).

On the other hand, recent studies have also found a positive association between religious attendance and education by suggesting education has a positive effect on any form of social group membership (Glaeser, Laibson, & Sacerdote, 2002; Putnam, 2000). Particularly, it is reported that the main determinant of the direction of the relationship is moderated by religious tradition (McFarland, Wright, & Weakliem, 2011). Recent papers explain the positive link as theoretically usual since attending to religious organizations is a basic form of social interaction. Educational attainment builds social skills and promotes individuals to be involved in social groups and activities such as church attendance. Also, while religious attendance rises across individuals in the U.S, it declines across denominations (Glaeser & Sacerdote, 2001).

The existing discussion on the impact of education on religion presents a variety of explanations to reveal the bidirectional link. The most common of these concepts is network closure that individuals holding high network closure have better communication and social interaction skills that improve trust between group members (Blanchard, 2007; Coleman, 1988). Religious groups that have more intense network interactions provide surroundings that protect the members from being exposed to the other worldviews, the erosion of belief. These types of religious groups also mostly managed by highly educated people to deliver the messages of the God in a comprehensive way to the members and answer the challenging questions that need sophisticated answers that may come from the other worldviews (Wuthnow, 1994). Since religion can provide moral orders, self-discipline, coping strategies, social and organizational ties out of family which are the sources of pro-social and positive attitudes and behaviors, the high network closure surroundings could facilitate improved outcomes for the members (Smith, 2003).

Considering religious traditions and education level, prior studies have stated education is associated with higher prayer frequency for Evangelical and Black Protestants, but less frequent prayer with the nonaffiliated religious groups. While education also promotes the belief that the Bible is a book of fables for mainline Protestants and the nonaffiliated groups, it increases the level of accepting the Bible as inspired by God for Evangelicals and Black Protestants, Mormons, and Catholics (Albrecht & Heaton, 1998; McFarland et al., 2011).

Although numerous studies have analyzed the effect of education on religion, most of them have been conducted in Judeo-Christian societies in the West. Obviously, religion and education have interrelated social institutions, so religion also can have impacts on education too. Thus, because the tenets of any religion about education and science can be imparted from each other, the examination of the impact of education on Islam can be different than other religious traditions too. Al-Attas (1997) defines education as “something progressively instilled into man”. Both the verses of Quran and the Hadiths of Prophet Mohammad indicate the importance of education. The quotation from Al-Attas in the first world conference on Muslim education will be useful to understand the concept of education in Islam: “*Education should ... cater for the growth of ‘man’ in all its aspects: Spiritual, intellectual, imaginative, Physical, scientific, linguistic, both Individually and collectively and motivate all these aspects towards goodness and the attainment of perfection*” (Haw, 1998).

Considering the given bidirectional theoretical background, to explore the effect of education on Muslim religiosity this study presents a significant input to the existing literature. The following statements can be hypothesized based on the secularization theory in order to test the validity of the new challenging findings.

Hypothesis 1 Education has negative association with belief.

Hypothesis 2 Education reduces the religious practices.

Hypothesis 3 Education has negative relationship with the religious attendance.

Method

Data

This paper investigates the influences of education on American Muslims' religious beliefs, activities, attendance using data from Muslim Americans survey conducted in 2007 the Pew Research Center. The Pew Muslim American Study is administered by telephone at a national level. It has sufficient variables to measure religion from different perspectives in addition to various measures of personal values and demographic characteristics.

Dependent Variables.

The dependent variables are classified into three groups of religious measures: religious belief, religious behavior, and religious organization. First, we attempt to measure orthodoxy belief of Muslim respondents. Because the level of beliefs of Muslims is extremely high (more than 90% for each question), we create an index variable using four different belief questions that measure people's belief, believe in God, believe in the prophet, believe in hereafter and believe in angels (yes-no answers). For the faith of religious intensity, participants who answered “no” to at least one of each item were accepted as a “skeptical” group; whereas participants answering “yes” to all items were accepted as a “perfect believer” group expressed with “skeptical” (0) and “perfect believer” (1) (Cronbach's alpha=.70). This categorization can be accepted theoretically valid because to be a Muslim, people have to believe all these items at the same time. Second, this study utilizes two types of religious

behavior components as dependent variables. The first one is devotional activities that are necessary for being an ideal Muslim. The data has three items that respondents asked “Here are a few religious activities...for each one, please tell me if it is important to you or not: Giving charity, or zakat, fasting during Ramadan and Undertaking a pilgrimage to Mecca. The answers are ranged from very important to you, somewhat important, not too important, or not at all important. We recoded all three items as dummy variable very important vs. less than very important. Then, we follow the same creating an index procedure as we did in "perfect believer" variable in order to get an ideal type of devout Muslim (0 vs1) by gathering these three items together (Cronbach's alpha=.71). the new variable is called "servant" (1). Another religious practice component is the frequency of prayer. Respondents are asked the following questions “Concerning daily salah or prayer, do you, in general, pray all five salah daily, make some of the five salah daily, occasionally make salah, only make Eid Prayers, or do you never pray?” We recoded the categories as 5 times in a day (4), some daily (3), occasionally (2), never (1).The last religious measure is the religious service attendance that determines the mosque attendance of American Muslims. The respondents are questioned “On average, how often do you attend the mosque or Islamic center for salahand Jumah prayer? The answers are classified more than once a week, once a week for Jumah prayer, occasionally and never.

As a result, we have four different dependent variables in this study that the first is to measure belief; the next two are for religious activities, and the last one is for religious service attendance which represents three dimensions of religious belief, behavior, and belonging.

The combination of binary, cumulative and multinomial logistic regression models utilized to analyze the relationship between the dependent and independent variables because some dependent variables are two categorical that is most suitable for binary logistic regression, while some others have more categories which are more convenient for the cumulative and the multinomial level of analyses.

Independent Variables.

The degree level of education is used as the primary independent variable for this study. Education is recoded as a dummy variable into four categories (1=less than high school, 2=some college, 3=college, 4=graduate) based on respondents' educational degrees.

The other covariates are involved in all models to control for relevant correlations between the dependent and independent variables. In addition, a categorical family income variable is contained within the models to monitor for other aspects of social status, such as quality of the educational institution. Age is recoded into four categories. Dummy variables for female respondents and married respondents control for gender and marital status. Race is another categorical variable that has four attributions (white, black, Asian, other) that was created as dummy variable white vs. others. Finally, the variable, converts Muslims are included in the models to control possible differences between convert Muslims or Muslims who raised as Muslim.

Results

Table 1 demonstrates the univariate analyses of the individuals in the survey. The high percentages of belief of respondents can be clearly seen in Table 1. As 82% even after the index procedure. Over half of individuals think all religious practices are very important. The initial frequency tests indicate that the proportions of people who attend mosque or Islamic center are distributed evenly into the categories. Almost a quarter of respondents attend religious service once a week that is the biggest part of the distribution categories for this dependent variable. Remain percentages are more than once a week by 15.9%, once or twice a month by 10.4%, a few times in a year by 19.2%, seldom by 11.6% and never by 17.7%. As another measure of religious practice, 40 percent of people answered that they pray salah five times in a day. Only 12 percent of Muslim respondents never pray salah.

The mean of the primary independent variable, education is 2.45 which are more than some college. Also, the initial frequency test indicates 30 percent of respondents have less than college level of education, 20 percent of them have some college, 27 percent of them have college degree level and 24 percent of them have a graduate level of education. Table 1 exhibits that 53 percent of respondents are male, 67 percent are married and 17 percent of them converted to Islam.

Table 2 predicts the binary logistic regression models for belief and servant index variables. In the first model, the results indicate that education has no effect on people's

Table 1. Univariate Statistics of Individuals in PEW Muslim Study Survey 2007.

	N	Mean	StdDev	Min	Max
Dependent Variables					
Perfect believer	1050	0.825714	0.379536	0	1
Servant	1050	0.542857	0.498397	0	1
Attend	1044	1.388889	0.956439	0	3
Prayer	1033	2.921588	1.071408	1	4
Independent Variables					
Education	1031	2.458778	1.148236	1	4
Raised-Muslim	1048	0.170802	0.376515	0	1
Male	1050	0.528571	0.499421	0	1
South	1050	0.301905	0.459303	0	1
White	1030	0.334952	0.472203	0	1
Income	868	1.095622	0.782643	0	2
Marital status	1029	0.325559	0.468811	0	1
Age	1050	42.36857	15.85084	18	99

religious belief. Surprisingly, the model illustrates that White and raised-Muslim people more likely are more skeptic than non-Whites and converts by 37% and 34 respectively. Income also is another statistically significant negative predictor for belief. The second model illustrates that education has a negative effect on the sum of religious practices. Each unit increase in education, the odds of being a servant decreases by 14.2%. In this model, the other only significant variable is the race that white is negatively associated with being a servant by 42%.

Table 2. Binary Logistic Regression for Educational Effect on Belief and Pillars of Islam.

	Perfect Believer			Servant		
	b	EXP(B)	B	b	EXP(B)	B
Intercept	3.038		***	1.103		**
Education	-0.0831	0.92	-	-0.153	0.858	*
Raised-Muslim	-0.4609	0.631	*	0.0106	1.011	
Male	-0.2698	0.764	-	-0.1905	0.827	
South	0.174	1.19		0.1801	1.197	
White	-0.4155	0.66	*	-0.537	0.585	**
Income	-0.3725	0.689	**	-0.0518	0.95	
Marital	-0.389	0.678	-0.1	-0.2418	0.785	
Age	-0.00801	0.992	0.0596	-0.00486	0.995	
N	860			860		
R²	.05			.04		

*p <.05; **p <.01; ***p <.001

Table 3 shows the cumulative logistic regression for mosque or Islamic center attendance. The model indicates that there is no statistically significant relationship between educational attainment and religious attendance. In this model, the effect of being originally Muslim has a great impact on attendance as well as being male. Net of statistics, for respondents who raised as Muslims, the odds of being attender more than once a week is 48% higher than being never attender. In addition, white and age (possible curvilinear model controlled and has not existed, so it did not include in the model) have a negative effect on attendance.

Table 3. Cumulative Logistic Regression for Educational Effect on Attendance

		b	EXP(B)		B
Intercept	3	-1.1163		***	
Intercept	2	0.2716			
Intercept	1	2.4335		***	
Education		-0.0487	0.952		-0.0307
Raised-Muslim		0.3942	1.483	*	0.0851
Male		0.6234	1.865	***	0.1712
South		0.2582	1.295		0.0658
White		-0.7452	0.475	***	-0.1945
Income		-0.1672	0.846		-0.0723
Marital		-0.0496	0.952		-0.0128
Age		-0.0152	0.985	**	-0.1129
N		858			
R²		.10			

*p < .05; **p < .01; ***p < .001; The reference category is 0.

Table 4 exhibits the multinomial logistic regression models for prayer impact on schooling years. Because the score of odds assumptions are violated when cumulative logistic regression is used, the multinomial logistic regression was applied for this model. According to Table 4, education, male, white and marital status variables are significant predictors for at least one of three models. The interpretations suggest that each unit increase in education, the odds of never over 5 times prayer increases by 39% while each unit increase in education, the odds of occasional over 5 times increase by 21%.

Gender race and marital status are the significant covariates in the model suggesting that being male, white and married are favoring to pray less by comparing being female, non-white, and not married respectively. The odds of never prayer over five times daily prayer are

more likely 2.2 times effective for men than women; 4.3 times for whites than non-whites, and 2.7 times for married people than not married people to get more education.

Discussion

As discussed in the beginning of the paper, the previous studies have revealed various findings for the relationship between education and religion (Alam, Amin, & McCormick, 2018). This paper also contributes for this diversity. The belief and attendance variables are not under the effect of educational attainment as secularization theory suggested for Muslim sample in the U.S. While some studies found the positive relationship between religious service attendances in Christianity (McFarland et al., 2011), in this study we find no relationship between them. It is clear we have to consider the reality that the American Muslims are living in a Christian majority country which can makes some disadvantages to attend religious service especially after 9/11. Also, because in Islam women are not obligated to go mosque like men, it should be under consideration too.

This paper also demonstrates the negative relationship between education and the behavioral dimension of religion. It is obvious that secularization process has significant effects on Muslim individuals' religious behaviors. Because to believe something and to

Table 4. Multinomial Logistic Regression for Educational Effect on Daily Prayer.

	Never vs 5 times		Occasional. vs 5 times			Some daily vs 5 times			
	1 vs 4		2 vs 4			3 vs 4			
	b	Exp(B)	b	Exp(B)	b	Exp(B)			
Intercept	-3.561		-1.4		*** -1.302	**			
Education	0.328	1.389	**	0.196	1.216	*	0.071	1.074	
Raised-Muslim	-0.221	0.801		-0.1	0.905		0.274	1.315	
Male	0.833	2.299	**	0.712	2.038	***	0.381	1.463	*
South	-0.411	0.663		-0.15	0.862		-0.128	0.88	
White	1.441	4.225	***	0.04	1.041		-0.511	0.6	*
Income	0.469	1.599		0.226	1.253		0.091	1.095	
Marital	1.018	2.768	***	0.269	1.309		0.269	1.309	
Age	-0.008	0.992		-0	0.996		0.007	1.007	
N	852								
R²	.05								

*p < .05; **p < .01; ***p < .001; The reference category is 4.

practice it are different matters in their nature, the results mainly shows that schooling although does not affect the people's religious beliefs and service attendance, it reduces their religious practices which can be accepted the secularization thesis is on the stage for some of religious components.

The degree of religious beliefs, belongings and behaviors are significant determinants for religious groups in terms of their current and future positions in a society. Muslims are a small minority group in the U.S. This study explores the secularization effect on Muslim sample that helps to compare how educational effect distinguishes for Muslims in the U.S than general population. The findings illustrate that parallel findings with previous studies that examines American population (Alam et al., 2018).

It may be expected that; the schooling system should be more influential in the U.S. than other Islamic countries because public and most private schools facilitate secular environments for the students. As minorities, Muslims may have faced many challenging questions, worldviews and situations in the U.S. Therefore, future comparative studies can be useful indicators to examine this issue.

References

- Alam, I., Amin, S., & McCormick, K. (2018). Income, Education, and three dimensions of religiosity in the USA. *Eastern Economic Journal*, 44(4), 501–518. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41302-017-0101-6>
- Al-Attas, M. N. S. (1997). *The Concept of education in Islam: A framework for an Islamic philosophy of education*. Kazi Publ. Incorp.: Library of Islam Ltd.
- Albrecht, S. L., & Heaton, T. B. (1998). Secularization, higher education, and religiosity | religious studies center. In *Latter-day saint social life: social research on the LDS church and its members* (pp. 293–314). Retrieved from <https://rsc.byu.edu/>
- Baker, J. O. (2008). An Investigation of the sociological patterns of prayer frequency and content. *Sociology of Religion*, 69, 169–185. <https://doi.org/10.1093/socrel/69.2.169>
- Blanchard, T. C. (2007). Conservative protestant congregations and racial residential segregation: evaluating the closed community thesis in metropolitan and nonmetropolitan counties. *American Sociological Review*, 72(3), 416–433.
- Casanova, J. (1994). *Public religions in the modern world* (1st edition). Chicago, IL: University Of Chicago Press.
- Chatters, L. M., Taylor, R. J., & Lincoln, K. D. (1999). African American religious participation: A multi-sample comparison. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 38, 132–145. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1387589>
- Coleman, J. S. (1988). Social Capital in the creation of human capital. *American Journal of Sociology*, 94, S95–S120.

- Collins, R. (1979). *The Credential Society: A Historical sociology of education and stratification* (Third Printing Used edition). New York: Academic Press.
- Evans, J. H. (2011). Epistemological and moral conflict between religion and science. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 50, 707–727. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5906.2011.01603.x>
- Fox, W. S., Payne, D. E., Priest, T. B., & Philliber, W. W. (1977). Authority position, legitimacy of authority structure, and acquiescence to authority. *Social Forces*, 55, 966–973. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2577566>
- Glaeser, E. L., Laibson, D., & Sacerdote, B. (2002). An economic approach to social capital. *The Economic Journal*, 112(483), F437–F458. Retrieved from JSTOR.
- Glaeser, E. L., & Sacerdote, B. (2001). *Education and Religion* (SSRN Scholarly Paper No. ID 263258). Retrieved from Social Science Research Network website: <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=263258>
- Glock, C. Y., & Stark, R. (1965). *Religion and society in tension* (Pencil Margin Notes edition). Rand McNally.
- Greeley, A. M. (1973). The “religious factor” and academic careers: another communication. *American Journal of Sociology*, 78(5), 1247–1255.
- Hastings, P. K., & Hoge, D. R. (1981). Religious trends among college students, 1948–79. *Social Forces*, 60(2), 517–531. <https://doi.org/10.1093/sf/60.2.517>
- Hastings, P. K., & Hoge, R. (1976). Changes in religion among college students, 1948 to 1974. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 15(3), 237–249. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1386087>
- Haw, K. (1998). *Educating Muslim girls: Shifting discourses*. Buckingham England ; Philadelphia: Open University Press.
- Hoge, D. R. (1974). *Commitment on campus: Changes in religion and values over five decades*. Westminster John Knox Press.
- Hungerman, D. M. (2014). The effect of education on religion: Evidence from compulsory schooling laws. *Journal of Economic Behavior & Organization*, 104, 52–63. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2013.09.004>
- Johnson, D. C. (1997). Formal education vs. religious belief: Soliciting new evidence with multinomial logit modeling. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 36, 231–246. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1387555>
- McFarland, M. J., Wright, B. R. E., & Weakliem, D. L. (2011). Educational attainment and religiosity: Exploring variations by religious tradition. *Sociology of Religion*, 72(2), 166–188. <https://doi.org/10.1093/socrel/srq065>

- Meier, R. F. (1982). Perspectives on the concept of social control. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 8, 35–55.
- Moberg, D. O., & McEnery, J. N. (1976). Changes in church-related behavior and attitudes of catholic students, 1961-1971. *Sociological Analysis*, 37, 53–62.
<https://doi.org/10.2307/3710069>
- Petersen, L. R. (1994). Education, homogamy, and religious commitment. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 33, 122–134. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1386599>
- Putnam, R. (2000). *Bowling Alone: The Collapse and Revival of American Community*. New York, NY: Simon & Schuster.
- Schieman, S. (2010). Socioeconomic Status and Beliefs about God’s Influence in Everyday Life. *Sociology of Religion*, 71(1), 25–51. <https://doi.org/10.1093/socrel/srq004>
- Schwadel, P. (2011). The effects of education on Americans’ religious practices, beliefs, and affiliations. *Review of Religious Research*, 53, 161–182.
<https://doi.org/10.1007/s13644-011-0007-4>
- Sherkat, D. E. (1998). Counterculture or continuity? Competing influences on baby boomers’ religious orientations and participation. *Social Forces*, 76, 1087–1114.
<https://doi.org/10.2307/3005704>
- Smith, C. (2003). Theorizing religious effects among American adolescents. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 42, 17–30. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1468-5906.t01-1-00158>
- Stark, R. (1963). On the incompatibility of religion and science: A survey of American graduate students. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 3, 3–20.
<https://doi.org/10.2307/1385002>
- Thalheimer, F. (1973). Religiosity and secularization in the academic professions. *Sociology of Education*, 46, 183–202. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2112096>
- Wilson, B. (1982). *Religion in Sociological Perspective* (1 edition). Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Wuthnow, R. (1994). *By Robert Wuthnow - Producing the Sacred: An essay on public religion*. University of Illinois Press.
- Zelan, J. (1968). Religious apostasy, higher education and occupational choice. *Sociology of Education*, 41, 370–379. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2112158>



Hindistan'da Okul Psikolojik Danışmanlığı

Sachin JAIN¹, Vaibhavee AGASKAR², Shannon KAKKAR³, Malvika BEHL⁴

¹ PhD., LPC, NCC, University of Providence, Great Falls, MT

² PhD., NCC, New Jersey City University, Jersey City, NJ

³ PhD., LCPC, LMHC, NCC, The Chicago School of Professional Psychology, Washington D.C.

⁴ PhD., West Texas A&M University, Amarillo, TX

MAKALE BİLGİ

Makale Tarihiçesi:

Alındı 14.04.2019
Düzeltilmiş hali alındı
22.05.2019
Kabul edildi
23.05.2019
Çevrimiçi yayımlandı
25.07.2019

ÖZET

Okul Psikolojik Danışmanlığı Hindistan'da on yıldan fazla bir süredir ortaya çıkmasına rağmen, mesleğin halen alt tabakadaki bebeklik döneminde olduğu düşünülmektedir. Ek olarak, psikolojik danışma teorileri ve yapıları batılılaştırılmıştır ve bu nedenle kültürel açıdan yeterli değildir. Bu makale Hindistan'daki okul temelli psikolojik danışma tarihini ve politikasını ve psikolojik danışma mesleğinin, bakış açılarını nasıl şekillendirdiğini tartışmaktadır. Eğitim politikaları, okullarda kapasite geliştirmenin etkisi ve Hindistan'daki kriz sorunları Hindistan'daki birçok kültürel farklılık göz önüne alınarak ele alınmaktadır. Ayrıca, genel ve okul psikolojik danışmanlığı mesleklerinin geleceği de tartışılmıştır.

© 2019 MREFD. Tüm hakları saklıdır

Anahtar Kelimeler:

Okul Psikolojik Danışmanlığı, Hindistan, kültürel farklılık

⁸Corresponding Author's Address: Sachin Jain, Department of Counseling, University of Providence, Great Falls, MT
e-mail: sacedu@yahoo.com



School Counselling in India

Sachin Jain¹, Vaibhavee Agaskar², Shannon Kakkar³, Malvika Behl⁴

¹ PhD., LPC, NCC, University of Providence, Great Falls, MT

² PhD., NCC, New Jersey City University, Jersey City, NJ

³ PhD., LCPC, LMHC, NCC, The Chicago School of Professional Psychology, Washington D.C.

⁴ PhD., West Texas A&M University, Amarillo, TX

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received 14.02.2019

Received in revised

form 22.05.2019

Accepted 23.05.2019

Available online

25.07.2019

ABSTRACT

Despite the emergence of school counselling in India over a decade ago, the profession is still considered to be in its infancy on the sub-continent. Additionally, the theories and constructs of counselling are westernized and therefore not as culturally competent as they could be. This paper discusses the history and policy of school-based counselling in India and how it has shaped the perspectives of the counselling profession. Education policies, the impact of capacity building in schools, and crisis issues in India are covered taking in to consideration the many diversity issues in India. A future outlook for school counselling and the general counselling profession is also provided.

© 2019JMRFE. All rights reserved

Keywords:

School counselling, India, Diversity

Introduction

School counselling has emerged over a century ago as a result of various sociopolitical and cultural changes in the Western society such as United States. Similar sociopolitical cultural trends have shaped up school counselling or guidance all over the world including India (Akos, Jain & Gurjar, 2014). Counselling or school counselling in India is still in its infancy stage.

Modern day living, economic reforms, globalization, changes in the family system, increases in divorce rates, and single parenting has resulted in various emotional, social, vocational, and mental health problems in India for the last decade. These tremendous economic and social changes have had adverse effects on school-going children and adolescents, which led to an increase in suicide rates, enormous academic competitiveness, and, peer and parental pressure (Arulmani, 2007; Kodas & Kazi, 2014). Counselling at the school or community setting will be an external source of support for addressing various problems of school-going children and adolescents.

In 1993 Arulmani (2007) noted in a survey he conducted that only 5 percent of school principals believed counselling in schools was important. However, in 2000 for the same survey, 95 percent of school heads agreed that school counselling was not only important, but is an urgently required service. This is definitely a welcome change. According to Kodas and Kazi (2014), school counsellors can be very helpful to students and parents to cope with metamorphic economic and social changes in Indian society and to maintain their mental

health. However, available counselling services are based on Western approaches to psychology and anyone with little or no training can offer counselling services in India (Arulmani, 2007). This conceptual article will provide an overview of the history and policy of school-based counselling in India. The impact of school counselling on the overall counselling profession will be discussed, as well as education policies, capacity-building, and crisis issues in India.

History

According to the American School Counselling Association (ASCA), school counselling programs are “comprehensive in scope, preventive in design, and developmental in nature” (ASCA, 2012, p. 51). Likewise, recently, Indian School Counselling Association (ISCA) has developed a national model of Professional School Counselors which is influenced by ASCA and the British Association of Counselling and Psychotherapy (BACP).

Counselling and Psychotherapy is relatively new profession in India and has a very brief history. In terms of establishing school or community-based clinics, the first credit goes to Tata Institute of Social Science (TISS), to start their first field action project in 1937 by inaugurating the Child Guidance Clinic (CGC) at Wadia Hospital. Now known as Muskann, Centre for Child and Adolescent Guidance is still continuing outreach programs in school and communities to foster mental health in children (<http://www.tiss.edu/>). Around same year, Wadia hospital opened their school health unit and later in 1979, Niar hospital set up their own school mental health clinic (Kodas & Kazi, 2014). The efforts by government funded hospitals and Non-Governmental Organizations (NGO) to build up clinics dedicated to school mental health was mainly focused in urban areas with very limited resources. It is hard to pinpoint the official beginning of school counselors in the Indian school system. The following timeline will provide brief history of school counselling and education system of India.

Arulmani (2007) gave credit to the Acharya Narendra Dev Committee and stated that the Dev committee emphasized the importance of counselling and guidance in education as early as in 1938. Various committee such as the Mudaliar Commission (1952); the Kothari Education Commission (1964–66); the National Policies on Education, (1986 and 1992) have made recommendations for the formalization of counselling services to India at the national level. During 1960s and 1970s, guidance and counselling were considered as pillars of the education system and various guidance related services for students were offered by the Central Bureau of Educational and Vocational Guidance (CBEVG) and professional development activities were operated by the All India Vocational and Educational Guidance Association (AIVEGA). During that era, the number of school providing guidance service in one form or the other was 3000. However, most of these schools hired only a career master, who was responsible for disseminating vocational information.

Gradually interest in guidance and counselling related activities started to decline in 1980s and 90s and now again interest in counselling has sparkled around 2000. The Working Group on Adolescence for the 10th Five Year Plan has pushed for counselling services for

school going children and adolescents (Planning Commission, GOI). This report has suggested various interventions at the government and non-governmental level such as setting up counselling centers in school and other educational institutes, online counselling services and telephone helplines, and outreach activities for students, teachers and parents. They also made a strong recommendation to appoint qualified counselors at higher secondary schools and intermediate colleges. Secondly, the National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT, 2005), also recognized that guidance and counselling be made available in schools to deal with stress related problems and incorporate teachers and parents to lessen stress. They also emphasized on the teachers with a background in guidance and counselling to students in achieving educational, developmental and emotional needs and assisting them to prepare for future vocational life. During 2000, CBEVG delegated their work to regional and state level Institute of Guidance to help students in the choice of suitable educational curricula and career options (Kinara & Asha, 2008)

In 2001, the Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE), one of the largest education boards in India made it mandatory to have a trained school counselor in all their schools. They also started telephone counselling in various cities to provide help for students during examination time. They trained almost 40 principles and school counselors to provide tele-counselling for almost around the clock. According to Carson et al (2009), CBSE mandated hiring of 9,586 school counselors all over India at their schools. Although this will be considered as a positive change and now more students can use services provided by School Counselors, only 3% or less school-going children attend CBSE affiliated schools and the rest of the other school-going children are part of the State Education Board (Carson, Jain & Ramirez, 2009).

Further, The Ministry of Human Resources Development (MHRD), following a directive of the Supreme Court, appointed a R.K Raghavan committee in 2007 to recommend anti-ragging measures. The Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE) has adopted the guideline based on Raghavan committee report and encouraging an appointment of a full-time counselor at each level of schooling such as Primary, Upper-Primary, and Secondary/Senior. Every student at Secondary or Senior Secondary level must receive at least twenty sessions of psychological counselling in an academic year. Further, CBSE also encourages parents and teachers to be part of these sessions if required (Compendium of CBSE Circulars-II). As per the ASCA, school counselling programs are proactive and preventive in nature. On the contrary, the need for school counselling programs in India was mainly reactive and academic in nature. It is mainly considered in the context of preventive ragging in educational institutes in India. Venkatesan and Shyam (2015) conducted an exploratory cross-sectional study in the state of Karnataka in which the role and duties of counselor are still vague and undefined. A content analysis revealed that school counselors wanted to focus on student problems and issues but parents and teachers were keener on academic advising, student discipline, conflict resolution, crisis interventions etc. School administer were expecting school counselors to help them in admissions and staff development. Thus, it showed a disparity in perception of school counselors' role and responsibility.

Recently Goa became first state in India to implement School Mental Health Program. Under the Goa Education Development Cooperation Act (GEDC) 2003, 55 school counselors

were recruited in their 550 public (government and government aided) schools to provide individual and group counselling, awareness and outreach activities for students, teachers, and parents (<http://gedcgoa.org>). Hopefully, Goa becomes the model for all other states to implement School Mental Health Program.

While there are some efforts at the governmental level to boost the School Mental Health Programs, mental health-based NGO's have achieved a remarkable progress (Thara & Patel, 2010). Most of the mental health-based NGO's are based in urban metropolitan areas. Some of them have also started to branch out in the rural parts of India. The oldest Mental Health based NGO's are more active in the area of child mental health and providing services for various issues such as conduct disorder, hyperactivity etc. To name a few, Sangath Society (Goa), Umeed and the Research Society (Mumbai) offer outpatient and school-based services for various needs of children and adolescence (Thara & Patel, 2010). Carson et .al (2009) noted that parallel to the mental health NGO's, NGO's working for the prevention and treatment for HIV and AIDS area has also achieved an enormous progress and hired various counselors for their NGO's.

Crisis and Counselling Issues in India

The types and amounts of crises in India have greatly increased and changed over the course of the last decade. Natural disasters have led to some crises in mental health (Shah, 2013) although it is globalization that has led to many more concerns. Changes in globalization and family structure have led to an increase in suicide, domestic violence, AIDS/HIV, diversity issues, an increase in the gap between the poorest and the wealthiest, psychosis, and immigration as well as a host of common mental health issues (Aggarwal & Berk, 2015; Carson, Jain & Ramirez, 2009; Decker, Nair, Saggurti, Sabri, Jethva, Raj, Donata& Silverman, 2013; Dongre & Deshmukh, 2012; Jacob, 2008; Shrivastava, Johnston, Stitt, Thakar, Sakel, Iyer, Shah & Bureau, 2012). These changes have resulted in an increase in risk factors and a decrease in protective factors of religion and cultural identity (Nakassis, 2010), family structure such as parental involvement (Deb, Chatterjee& Walsh, 2010) and extended families (Census of India, 2011). Research in western society has connected these changes to rising rates of common mental disorders (Bor, Dean, Najman & Hayaatbakhsh, 2014). The number of people in the school-going age range of 10-19 years old is estimated to be at 243 million people, or 23% of the 1.2 billion people in India (India, UNDAF report, 2013-2017). This large facet of the population is being affected by the above changes and consequently by crises as well, and bringing them into the school systems. School counselors and professionals need to have an understanding of the growing crises currently in India in order to sufficiently understand and address issues in the school system.

Suicide has been a prevalent issue in India and is typically associated with farmers due to poverty (Dongre & Deshmukh, 2012) and adolescents due to school-related pressure (Jacobs, 2009; Shrivastava et al, 2012). The highest rates of suicide in India were reported in people under the age of 30 indicating that of that group the majority are most likely in school (Samuel & Sher, 2013). It is also important to note that suicide seems to correspond with literacy. For example, Kerala records the highest number of suicides at 32 people committing

suicide every day, but is also known for being India's first fully literate state (Samuel & Sher, 2013). According to the World Health Organization (2012), 804,000 suicides were recorded worldwide with 258,000 of them being Indian suicides. Young people between the ages of 15 and 29 are killing themselves at a rate of 35.5 per 100,000, which is the highest in the world according to the New York Times in an article titled "India's Mental Health Crisis" published in 2014. Parental pressure around academics in India is a concept widely recognized by research (Bertolote, Fleischmann, Leo, & Wasserman, 2004). The culture of education in India has been recognized as "fiercely competitive" due to the mass of India's population set against limited availability of resources including seats at prestigious universities, opportunities to immigrate, and careers. Self-expectation was also considered as a factor related to academic distress which could lead to suicide (Sarma, 2014). A study was conducted by Dongre and Deshmukh (2012) investigating farmer suicide in the north-eastern part of Maharashtra. They found the reasons for suicide in farmers included problems with crops, government apathy, environmental factors, family responsibility and stress, and debt. Suicide in India tends to be impulsive with 90% of adolescent suicides reportedly being in this group and related to stressful situations rather than an indicator of the presence of a mood disorder (Samuel & Sher, 2013). In fact, all of the adolescents in a study reviewed by Samuel & Sher (2013) reported experiencing negative life events including failing examinations. These high suicide rates in India are a concern for mental health professionals and could begin to be addressed in the school systems as a first line of defense. It was acknowledged in an article by Shrivastava et al., (2012) that education, meaning public education and school programs, have been found to be the best strategies in reaching out to people in the early phase of issues of a mental health nature in order to reduce stigma and raise confidence that these programs will provide help.

Until 2014, suicidal attempts were criminal activities leading to imprisonment or fine or both (Jain, 2014). Due to the stigma related to counselling in India, not a lot of students tend to open up about their ideations. With the lack of code of ethics related to dealing with any issue for school counselors in India, school counselors can provide students with information about the available crisis hotlines that will conduct suicide risk assessments with students and provide options for outpatient treatment. At the same time the parents can be informed about the student's ideations, with the permission of the student. Alongside this, for prevention, the school counselors in India can attain training in ways to deal with the academic stress and competition that students face in India and provide group classroom sessions and individual or group counselling sessions for students. The normalization of the academic pressure that students feel and peer-to-peer discussion on these issues, can be very helpful for students.

Domestic violence is another significant mental health crisis, estimating that 1 in 3 women face abuse in the form of physical or sexual violence at the hands of her partner (Decker et al, 2013). It is safe to assume that if 1 in 3 women are abused, that most likely they have children that are also experiencing the abuse either physically themselves or emotionally as they are forced to observe it at home. Globally, women tend to be reluctant to disclose abuse for fear of not being believed or being blamed for the abuse. Other reasons include the perceptions that violence is normal or not serious, fear of victimization, or threat of losing

children (Fanslow & Robinson, 2011; Miller et al., 2010). In a study conducted by Decker, et al (2013) it was found that over 90% of participants considered crisis counselling with safety planning as the most helpful intervention. Emergency crisis shelters were only endorsed by 64%, most likely reflecting social and cultural barriers as well as stigma and shame associated with going outside the familial unit. Local schools would be an informal source of support in which women could report the abuse. Trained school counselors would also be able to offer services to victimized children observing the abuse or experiencing it themselves.

The school counselor will be helpful for students, parents, and teachers by providing them with resources that they can use. These resources could include National Government Organizations (NGO's) and shelters for women. Police can be used as a resource but there have been incidences reported where women have been sent back home even after a domestic violence report (Venkatraman, 2015). Conducting psychoeducation groups and/or seminars for students and parents discussing domestic violence and its signs can be a powerful tool for school counselors to openly discuss this issue and remove the stigma. The school counselor will have to go through training to understand the process of working with students who have been victimized to domestic violence.

Natural disasters are a constant source of potential mental health crisis in India. Earthquakes, tsunamis, droughts, monsoons, floods, famine and other disasters regularly affect the sub-continent and therefore can throw communities into crisis. In one such instance, an earthquake struck Gujarat, affecting about 16 million people in 21 districts. In a study conducted by Shah, (2013), a practical manual for counselors on post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD) was developed and implemented for Gujarati survivors of the earthquake in order to help them manage their emotions and mental-health related problems due to this tragedy. The process was a success in that it helped to significantly reduce mental health symptoms of PTSD in a shorter amount of time. A holistic psychological intervention program can provide survivors with a significantly happier and less impaired future. The team found that empathy, listening and prayer along with modern medical care is all that is needed in this sort of crisis. This type of intervention program can help pave the way and raise awareness of the need and importance of mental health. There are now two departments of Psychiatry in medical colleges in the area of Kachchh that did not exist before the earthquake.

As school counselors could be a possibility to have a plan to prepare plans for the school and students in case of a natural disaster. This could include plans on preparing students, parents, and teachers for a natural disaster and planning the school's strategy of dealing with the disaster. The most important part of helping students deal with a natural disaster is providing normalcy in their day-to-day living. According to Melton (2007) interventions like providing crisis counselling, supporting parents, teachers, and other staff, informing media about the role of school counselors in such situations, and stabilizing the school environment. Melton (2007) also suggested identifying students who might need more intensive counselling and might have symptoms of PTSD to be referred to other sources.

The AIDS crisis is another major issue affecting the people of India. The sub-continent now has the largest number of people infected with HIV/AIDS in the world with an estimated 2.08 million people testing HIV positive (avert.org/hiv-aids-india.htm; Carson, Jain &

Ramirez, 2009). This epidemic is predominately concentrated in subgroups such as female sex workers, injected drug users, and heterosexual transmission with unprotected paid sex (Charles et al., 2013). Initially, when the cause of the transmission of AIDS was understood, lack of prevention initiatives and education were the main contributors to the continuous spread of the disease. Since the implementation of the Parent-to-Child HIV Transmission Program, more pregnant women are being tested in order to prevent the spread of the virus. These, along with other programs, are helping to reduce the spread of AIDS. The number of healthcare facilities is rising. There were only 67 HIV testing and counselling centers in 1997, and as of 2014 there are 15,000 of these sites around the country that have reached roughly 13 million general users. However, there is still many people in India that are living unaware of their symptoms. Barriers to antiretroviral treatment are enormous. Marginalized groups tend to be the main sufferers of HIV/AIDS and stigma and discrimination related to their status along with the diagnosis of HIV/AIDS compounds the problem, making it even more difficult for these groups to access treatment. Inadequate counselling services as well as inadequate knowledge about the disease and how to treat it contribute negatively to barriers (Chakrapani, Velayudham, Shunmugam, Newman & Dubrow, 2014). Education is the first line of defense for fighting the AIDS/HIV crisis in India.

American School Counselor Association stated that it is the school counselor's responsibility to support education efforts for HIV/AIDS or any other sexually transmitted disease and collaborate with the community to prevent the spread of these diseases (The School Counselor and HIV/AIDS/STD Prevention, 2012). If following ASCA's guidelines, it is the school counselor's responsibility to remove the stigma related to AIDS/HIV and engage in psychoeducation amongst students in school. The school counselor can also be a confidential source for students to be able to address issues regarding HIV/AIDS and attain resources that can help them like health information and counselling services. The biggest issue for school counselors in India is the lack of ethical guideline to be able to deal with certain situations. A school counselor might not know how to react when a student might have HIV/AIDS. The best stance for the school counselor is to be non-judgmental and accepting and try and help the student as deemed necessary by the student.

Impact of Capacity Building on School-Based Counselling in India

The impact of capacity building on school-based counselling issues in India cannot be overlooked as this seems to be a golden opportunity to demonstrate the needs and receive the services necessary to promote and implement school counselors across the subcontinent. When there is understanding of the obstacles that inhibit the growth and developmental goals of school counselling in India, then there can be opportunities to enhance the abilities that will allow counselors to achieve sustainable results. This needs to happen at three different levels: the professional level, the community level, and the governmental level.

At the professional level, the scope of practice of counselors needs to be defined more clearly with universities offering training for diplomas that is collaborative and consistent across the country with the same standards for all. A more linear process through degree programs would make it easier to understand how to obtain and practice as a school

counselor. It is also important to note here that the training needs to incorporate culturally sensitive practices rather than just a Westernized counselling approach, including utilizing the family, spiritual resources, yoga, traditional healers, or other culturally acceptable methodologies. Accreditation can soon follow. Once that is achieved, the standards for licensure can be regulated by a governmental licensing agency and it can be mandated that school counselors, as well as other professional counselors, need to be licensed in order to practice. The development of the Association of Indian School Counselors and Allied Professionals, which was launched in 2011 in collaboration with other counselling associations worldwide, is evidence of the dedication and interest of counselors to provide regulated services to the public. Their goals include collaborating with National Board of Education to develop a national model and national standards to help govern the profession.

Community understanding and involvement cannot go unnoticed, as the community will be the ones receiving the services. Western changes concerning public health only happened through social reform movements. Progressive groups within the public health movement advocated for reform. The problem in developing countries is that the general population tends to view mental health as an individual issue which limits their response to this major issue (Jacobs, 2007). The number one barrier to the community is attitudinal changes concerning stigma, skepticism, and caste. Stigma has been well established in the literature in regards to India and the general population seeking mental health services (Carson et al, 2009; Chakrapani et al, 2014; Decker et al, 2013; Jacob, 2008; Shah, 2013; Shrivastava et al, 2013). This stigma is not just centered on severe diagnoses of mental illness such as schizophrenia, bipolar disorder and others but extend to include common emotional or relational problems. The perception of people that admit to help-seeking behaviors is that they are weak, cursed, or contains a religious explanation such as karma. Similarly, there is a misperception that counselling services are only designed to serve the severely mentally ill rather than to help cope with common mental and emotional disorders (Carson et al, 2009). Skepticism about psychology and whether or not it is actually effective is another issue that professional counselors are struggling against, although this is obstacle is gradually being overcome as people begin to access and experience counselling for themselves (Decker et al, 2013; Shah, 2013). Caste is also an issue to access as such as mental health professionals gaining entry to particular villages or addressing all people in a more rural area at the same time (Shah, 2013). Psychoeducation is needed as part of capacity building to overcome these obstacles in the community.

Finally the government as well as non-governmental agencies, has to be integrally involved in providing funding, access, and policies to help govern and regulate professional counselling. The government of India did an admirable job in responding to the growing mental health crisis with the Mental Health Act of 1987; however it remains limited to the treatment of severe mental illness rather than issues related to the mental health of the general population such as suicidality, substance abuse, domestic violence, anxiety and other disorders (Jain & Sandhu 2014). Although there are wonderful initiatives in existence, the implementation is weak due to limited or untimely access issues. There is a call across mental health providers to make the funding issues less bureaucratic and easier to access from governmental and aid funding than it is from private agencies such as banks (Shah, 2013). In

relation to specifically school counselling, The Working Group on Adolescence for the 10th Five Year Plan made a strong argument for appointing qualified professional counselors in schools. The National Curriculum report also recognized the need not only for school counselors but for teachers with a background in counselling to help support the work that school counselors perform. Additionally, the Central Board of Secondary Education made it mandatory to have a trained school counselor in every one of the schools under their umbrella. These are welcome, and much needed changes throughout India. However the response to this need will be limited as there is a shortage of trained mental health professional in India (Barua, 2009).

This circle back around to professionals, which is the first level that change needs to occur at. However, the professional, community and governmental levels all have to work together in order to provide services in a timely and fluid manner for help-seekers. Until these three are able to work in conjunction, school based counselling in India will be inhibited. Thankfully, there is change occurring as obstacles are being overcome and growth is occurring allowing for the ability to meet this drastic need in the schools of India.

Training and Licensing for Counselors in India

According to Carson, Jain, and Ramirez (2009), degree programs in counselling, counselling education, and family therapy are mostly unaccredited. Most of the clinical psychology and counselling psychology programs in India are unaccredited (Raney and Cinarbas, 2005). Some programs such as Psychology Department of Mumbai and Delhi Universities are accredited by National Assessment and Accreditation Council (NAAC), which is an autonomous body established by University Grants Commissions (UGC) of India. NAAC was established in 1994 to ensure the quality of higher education in India by National Policy of Education (1986) and Plan of Action (POA-1992). Some universities and private organizations along with The National Council for Educational Research and Training (NCERT), a premier Government of India organization offers a one year postgraduate diploma in Guidance and Counselling. Some private universities also offer distance learning certificate course in counselling.

Currently, the first author of this book chapter i.e. Dr. Sachin Jain is facilitating the process to develop working relationship between NAAC and Council for Accreditation of Counselling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP, 2016). CACREP accredits graduate level counselling program all around the world. This relationship will strengthen the counselling profession in India by defining counselor's role, eligibility, training, and supervision. Currently, Veer Bahadur Sing Purvachal University in Jaunpur, India is the first program in India to have successfully completed the International registry of Counsellor Education (IRCEP) application (CACREP, 2016).

Licensing in India is not mandated for the professional practice of counselling, clinical psychology, or social work. (Juvva, Redji, & Koshy, 2006). There is a lack of certain requirement or regulations and lack of supervision in counselling field. According to Rehabilitation Council of India (RCI), clinical psychologist, vocational counselors,

rehabilitation social workers, rehabilitation psychologist, rehabilitation counselors can apply to register in the Central Rehabilitation Register. By January 2011, overall, 67,738 professionals and personnel are registered by RCI.

Future Outlook for India

The future outlook for India and the surrounding region is bright, as this nation is ready for trained counselors to begin serving the desperate need. Globalization along with modern day living that includes increasing pressures is forcing people in India to seek professional assistance for their emotional problems. The reawakening and significance of this profession is gain publicity in Indian media including newspapers and on various websites. Famous actors such as Aamir Khan have a dedicated website to addressing the mental health needs of the population as well as raising awareness in the movies he acts in such as “Taare Zameen Par”. There are numerous opportunities to develop this profession due to the large population size along with the significant advances being made. Counselling is urgently needed, and the general population is becoming more and more aware.

Model programs would best be created and supported by Non-governmental Organizations (NGO’s) that could be adapted for different circumstances. These organizations could also be crucial in helping to raise awareness about the value of mental health in the community (Carson et al, 2009). As Patel and Thara (2003) have noted, NGO’s can help to bring mental health services to local communities with less stigma than traditional psychiatric services. NGO’s can act as advocates, service providers, activists, researchers and training centers for issues involving mental health. What is central to the development of NGO’s is the community involvement and leadership. This collaboration between community, trained professionals, and NGO’s can be mutually beneficial in developing mental health as it is currently the least-developed area in health care in India (Carson et al, 2009).

One of the easiest ways to gain a foothold in the community is through career, guidance, and school-based counselling. Career counselling is already viewed as acceptable and helpful as Jain & Sandhu (2014) have noted. Pervin Malhotra is well-known as India’s top career counselor and has become an icon reaching an audience of more than 50 million people. It would be important to capitalize upon the acceptance of career counselling and an easy bridge to school-based counselling and its importance. The pressure to succeed academically in India starts at an extremely young age with the survival of an entire family often depending on a child graduating and getting a good “seat” at university. The need for school counselors cannot be overlooked, and school heads are now recognizing and supporting this need as reportedly 95% have agreed that school counselling is an immediately required service (Arulmani, 2007).

Professionals need to be ready to answer the call to service through ethical and regulated training. There is a call for counselor educators to appropriately train desiring students that needs to be answered. It is imperative that counselling begin to be regulated by a governing agency. Thankfully, the Counselling Associate of India (CAI) is in the process of drafting a code of ethics for counselors (Jain & Sandhu, 2014). In the meantime the

Association of Mental Health Counselors-India has adopted the ethical codes of the American Mental Health Counselors Association (AMHCA) to guide the scope of practice (Jain & Sandhu, 2014).

There are a number of challenges that is outlined in a recent article by Jain & Sandhu (2014) concerning the future of counselling in India. These include raising the awareness of the general public, the need for geographically accurate distribution of professionals, attraction of the Indian Diaspora to return to India in order to increase the number of professionals, setting licensure boards, evaluating training needs and improving opportunities for research. Although these may appear to be large obstacles, many of these issues are already being addressed, with the next step being implementation. This era has been designed the “golden age” and the “renaissance” of counselling in India by researchers Jain & Sandhu (2014). Now is the time to take action.

Further Research Scope for School Counselors

In this section, we will explore some of the key areas where school counselors needs to pay attention for future research directions. School counselling in India is relatively new and thus current school counselors has multiple roles and duties to prove the importance and efficiency of school counselling field. First, they need to pay attention on developing scope and role of a school counselor in India. As mentioned earlier in this article, Association of Indian School Counselors and Allied professional has been established in January 2011. Now, members of this organization need to formulate various task or work groups to establish ‘code of ethics’ for school counselors across Indian school system. They also need to pay attention to diversity in India and develop ‘Multicultural Competencies for School Counselors’. In collaboration with universities and colleges, there is also need to reform or bring uniformity in preparatory programs in School Counselling Education. Veer Bahadur Sing Purvachal University has successfully completed the International registry of Counsellor Education (IRCEP) application (CACREP, 2016). Curriculum develops by Purvachal University, IRCEP approved program will serve as an exemplary model for all other universities or colleges.

Secondly, school counselors’ needs to advocate the needs for mandatory school counselors in public and private school systems in India from elementary to high school level. The advocacy work to increase awareness and usefulness of school counselors needs to be in collaboration with Indian National Board of Education (NBE), and Indian Mental Health Policy makers, legislators etc. School counselors also need to push uniformity in educational system, accessibility of quality education and books to all, up to date curriculum, quality and training of teachers and other supportive staff such as counselors etc.

In addition to the above mentioned goals, school counselors need to involve in a holistic interventions for the needs of Indian school children. They need to merge western practices and indigenous practices such as yoga and meditation to help academic, social, emotional, and mental well-being of school children and adolescents. There is also need to invest in research especially evidence base practices to show the effective modality and approaches to deal with Indian children and adolescents unique issues. School counselors

need to be involved in prevention, creating awareness, intervention, and crisis-intervention work at the school and in community. To reduce stigma attach to mental health needs of Indian population and to help them to seek mental health professionals school consolors needs to offer psycho educational awareness programs to parents such as parenting skills in modern Indian family system, healthy relationships with family and friends, understating academic pressure and your child, child's skills and interest for future career choices etc. Facilitating such workshops and awareness programs will help parents to understand child's emotional, social, mental, academic needs of a child and adolescents. It will also help to gain a 'face" for school counselors in Indian educational system.

Considering the suicide epidemic in India, school counselors needs to create 'suicide prevention program' from middle school to high school. They also need intervention and awareness programs on helping victims of domestic violence, natural disaster crisis interventions, AIDS and HIV epidemic programs, and student with a gender identity and sexuality related issues.

References

- Akos, P., Jain, S., & Gurjar, S. (2014). School counselling in India. *Journal of Asia Pacific Counselling, 4*(2), 169-180.
- Aggarwal, S. & Berk, M. (2015). Evolution of adolescent mental health in a rapidly changing socioeconomic environment: A review of mental health studies in adolescents in India over the last 10 years. *Asian Journal of Psychiatry, 13*, 3-12.
- Arulmani, G. (2007). Counselling psychology in India: At the confluence of two traditions. *Applied Psychology, 56*, 69-82.
- American School Counselor Association. (2012). *The ASCA National Model: A framework for school counseling programs* (3rd ed.). Alexandria, VA: Author.
- Barua, A. (2009). Need for a realistic mental health program in India. *Indian Journal of Psychological Medicine, 31*, 48-49.
- Bor, W., Dean, A. J., Najman, J., Hayatbakhsh, R. (2014). Are child and adolescent mental health problems increasing in the 21st century? A systematic review. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Psychiatry, 48*, 606-616.
- Carson, D.K., Jain, S., & Ramirez, S. (2009). Counselling and family therapy in India: Evolving professions in a rapidly developing nation. *International Journal of Advanced Counselling, 31*, 45-56.
- Council for Accreditation of Counselling and Related Educational Programs (CACREP). (2016). *Directory*. Retrived on May 15, 2019 from <http://www.cacrep.org/directory/>
- Census of India (2011). *Vital Statistics*. Census of India. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://www.censusindia.gov.in/pca/Searchdata.aspx>

- Census of India (2011b). Houselisting and housing. Retrieved from <http://censusindia.gov.in/2011census>.
- Central Board of Secondary Education (CBSE).(2012). *Compendium of CBSE Circulars-II*. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from http://49.50.126.244/web_material/CBSE_Update%28Compendium_of_CBSE%20Circulars%29Vol-II.pdf
- Chakrapani, V., Velayudham, J., Shunmugam, M., Newman, P.A., & Dubrow, R. (2014). Barriers to antiretroviral treatment access for injecting drug users living with HIV in Chennai, South India. *AIDS Care* 26(7), 835-841.
- Charles, B., Jeyaseelan, L., Sam, A.E., Pandian, A.K., Thenmozhi, M., & Jeyaseelan, V. (2013). Trends in risk behaviors among female sex workers in South India: Priorities for sustaining the reversal of HIV epidemic. *AIDS Care*, 25(9), 1129-1137.
- Chopra, A. (2011). A career in counselling. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://www.Successcds.net/Articles/Career-in-Counselling.php>.
- Deb, S., Chatterjee, P., Walsh, K. (2010). Anxiety among high school students in India: comparisons across gender, school type, social strata and perceptions of quality time with parents. *Australian Journal of Educational Development and Psychology*, 10, 18-31.
- Decker, M.R., Nair, S., Saggurti, N., Sabri, B., Jethva, M., Raj, A., Donta, B., & Silverman, J.G. (2013). Violence-related coping, help-seeking and health-based intervention preferences among perinatal women in Mumbai, India. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 28(9), 1924-1947.
- Dongre, A.R., & Deshmukh, P. R. (2012). Farmers' suicides in the Vidarbha region of Maharashtra India: A qualitative exploration of their causes. *Journal of Injury and Violence Research*, 4(1), 2-6.
- Education Status Report – Uttar Pradesh. (2013). Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from [http://educationinnovations.org/sites/default/files/Status of Elementary Education in Uttar Pradesh.pdf](http://educationinnovations.org/sites/default/files/Status%20of%20Elementary%20Education%20in%20Uttar%20Pradesh.pdf)
- Education Commission Report, 1964-66. (1966). Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from http://www.teindia.nic.in/files/reports/ccr/KC/KC_V1.pdf
- Goa Education Development Corporation(GEDC) (nd/2003). *Promoting Excellenc in Education: Training*. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://gedcgoa.org/training>
- Gandhi, R. (2015). Vision and Mission of Rajiv Gandhi on Education and Youth Development.(n.d.). Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://inc.in/CongressSandesh/163/Vision-and-Mission-of-Rajiv-Gandhi-on-Education-and-Youth-Development>
- Gururaj, G. (2012). Suicide in India. In *Suicide from a global perspective: Psychosocial Approaches*, by Shrivastava, Amresh (Ed); Kimbrell, Megan (Ed); Lester, David (Ed),(pp. 181-194). Nova Science Publishers, Hauppauge, NY.

- India UNDAF. United Nation Development Action Framework 2013-2017 Report: 14.
- Indian Institute of School Psychology, School Counselling & Guidance(2015). *Indian School Counselors Association (ISCA)*. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from http://www.schoolcounsellorsindia.org/professional-counsellors/free_public.php.
- J&K government contemplating new education policy. (2013). Retrieved May 15, 2019 from <http://post.jagran.com/JK-government-contemplating-new-education-policy-1365146203>
- Jain, S. & Sandhu, D. (2012). Counselling in India. In T.H. Hohenshil, N.E. Amundson & S.G. Niles (Eds.), *Counselling Around the World: An international Handbook*. (pp. 87-96). American Counselling Association Press, VA.
- Kerala - Education. (2015). Retrieved May 15, 2019 from http://knowindia.gov.in/knowindia/state_uts.php?id=54
- Kodad, H.S., & Kazi, S.A. (2014). Emerging areas of counselling in schools in India. *International research Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(3), 44-47.
- Jacob, K.S. (2007). Public health in India and the developing world: Beyond medicine and primary health care. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, 61, 561-562.
- Jacob, K.S. (2008). The prevention of suicide in India and the developing world: The need for population-based strategies. *Crisis*, 29(2), 102-106.
- Juvva, S., Redij, S., & Koshy, M. (2006). Family therapy study group: The Mumbai experience. *Contemporary Family Therapy: An International Journal*, 28(1), 73-86.
- Miller, E., Decker, M.R., Raj, A., Reed, E., Marable, D., & Silverman, J.G., (2010). Intimate partner violence and health care seeking patterns among female users of urban adolescent clinics. *Maternal and Child Health Journal* 14, 910-917.
- National Assessment and Accreditation Council (NAAC).(nd), *Accreditation Status*. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from http://www.naac.gov.in/Universities_Colleges.asp
- Nakassis, C. (2010). *Youth and status in Tamil Nadu* (Doctoral Dissertation). University of Pennsylvania, Department of Anthropology.
- National Council of Educational Research and Training (NCERT) (2005). *National Curriculum Framework*. Retrieved online on May 15, 2019 from http://www.ncert.nic.in/rightside/links/nc_framework.html
- Rehabilitation Council of India (2014). *Categories*. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://www.rehabcouncil.nic.in/forms/Sublink1.aspx?lid=813>
- Planning Commission of Government of India (nd). Report of the group on adolescents for the tenth five year plan. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://planningcommission.gov.in/aboutus/committee/index.php?about=12strindx.htm>
- Patel, V. & Thara, R. (Eds.) (2003). Introduction: The role of NGO's in mental health care. In V. Patel & R. Thara (Eds.), *Meeting the mental health needs of developing countries: NGO innovations in India* (pp. 1-19). New Delhi, India: Sage.

- Rai, S. (2015). SmritiIrani says new education policy will be ready by 2015-end. *India Today*. Retrieved from <http://indiatoday.intoday.in/story/mail-today-education-conclave-2015-smriti-irani-hrd-ministry-education-sector-students/1/452769.html>
- Sarma, A. (2014). *Parental pressure for academic success in India*. (Doctoral Dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. UMI Number: 3633281
- Samuel, D., & Sher, L. (2013). Suicidal behavior in Indian adolescents. *International Journal of Adolescent Medicine and Health*, 25(3), 207-212.
- Shah, S. (2013). Holistic approach to community in crisis. *Psychiatric Clinic North America*, 36, 403-416.
- Shrivastava, A.K., Johnston, M., Stitt, L., Thakur, M., Sakel, G., Iyer, S., Shah, S. & Bureau, Y. (2012). Reducing treatment delay for early intervention: Evaluation of a community based crisis helpline. *Annals of General Psychiatry*, 11(20), 1-6. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1744-859X-11-20>.
- Swain, S., Mohanan, P., Sanah, N., Sharma, V., & Ghosh, D. (2014). Risk behaviors related to violence and injury among school-going adolescents in Karnataka, southern India. *International Journal of Adolescent Medicine and Health*, 26(4), 551-558.
- Raney, S., & Cinarbas, D. C. (2005). Counseling in developing countries: Turkey and India as examples. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, 27(2), 149-160.
- Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS). *Field Action Projects 2011-2012*. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from <http://www.tiss.edu/TopMenuBar/field-action/projects/field-action-projects-2011-2012#established-in-1937>
- Thara, R. & Patel, V. (2010). Role of non-governmental organizations in mental health in India. *Indian Journal of Psychiatry*, 52, 389-395.
- The Economics Times (2014). Government to focus on 100 districts to improve child sex ratio. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from http://articles.economictimes.indiatimes.com/2014-10-31/news/55631465_1_100-districts-village-level-child-development-maneka-gandhi
- The New York Times (2014). *India's Mental Health Crisis*. The opinion pages editorial. Retrieved on May 15, 2019 from http://www.nytimes.com/2014/12/31/opinion/indias-mental-health-crisis.html?_r=0
- Venkatesan, S., & Shyam, H.R. (2015). Professional Identity of School Counselors in India. *Journal of Indian Academy of Applied Psychology*, 41, 1, 25-36.



The Last Work Printed By İbrahim Muteferrika:

The Turkish - Persian Dictionary; Ferheng-i Suri (The Persian Language)

Yakup ALAN¹

¹ Kilis 7 Aralık University, Kilis

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:

Received 08.04.2019

Received in revised

form 14.06.2019

Accepted 16.06.2019

Available online

25.07.2019

ABSTRACT

The invention of writing is of critical importance for the human history. While reproduction of written works was carried out with various methods, the invention of printing press made writing become even more important. After its invention by Gutenberg in the 15th century, the first printing press in the Ottoman Empire was established by minorities in 1490s while the first Turkish printing house was established in 1728 by İbrahim Muteferrika. Many significant works were published in this printing house from its establishment to 1745. Among all books printed in various fields, three books were about language and grammar. One of these books is the Persian-Turkish Dictionary written by Hasan Suri; Ferheng-i Suri (The Persian Language). Considering that learning vocabulary is an essential element in learning languages, and use of dictionaries is one of the methods of learning vocabulary, Ferheng-i Suri is a precious work for language teaching. Qualitative research method and document analysis pattern as data collection method were employed in this study. The purpose of this study is to introduce the work under consideration to the world of science.

© 2019JMRFE. All rights reserved

Keywords:

İbrahim Muteferrika, Printing Press, Dictionary, Ferheng-i Suri

¹ Kilis 7 Aralık University, Muallim Rifat Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish Language and Social Sciences Education
e-mail: alanyakup@gmail.com



İbrahim Müteferrikanın Bastığı Son Eser:

Türkçe – Farsça Sözlük; Ferheng-İ Şuuri (Lisan-ül Acem)

Yakup ALAN¹

¹Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi, Kilis

MAKALE BİLGİ

Makale Tarihiçesi:
Alındı 08.04.2019
Düzeltilmiş hali alındı
14.06.2019
Kabul edildi
16.06.2019
Çevrimiçi yayımlandı
25.07.2019

ÖZET

Yazının keşfi insanlık tarihi açısından çok önemlidir. Yazılan eserlerin çoğaltımı farklı tekniklerle yapılırsa da matbaanın icadı bu keşfin daha fazla önem kazanmasını sağlamıştır. 15. yüzyılda Gutenberg tarafından icat edilmesinden sonra Osmanlı Devleti'nde ilk matbaa 1490'lı yıllarda azınlıklar; ilk Türk matbaası ise 1728 yılında İbrahim Müteferrika tarafından kurulmuştur. Kurulduğu yıldan 1745'e kadar çok önemli eserler bu matbaada basılmıştır. Basılan kitaplar farklı alanlarda olmakla beraber üç tanesi dil ve gramerle ilgili kitaplardır. Bu kitaplardan biri de Hasan Şuûri'nin hazırladığı Farsça-Türkçe sözlük; Ferheng-i Şuuri (Lisan-ül Acem)'dir. Kelime öğreniminin dil öğreniminde oldukça önemli bir husus olduğu ve kelime öğrenmenin bir yolunun da sözlük kullanmak olduğu düşünülürse Ferhenge-i Suûri, dil öğretimi açısından değerli bir eserdir. Yöntem olarak nitel yöntem, veri toplama yöntemi olarak da doküman analizi (incelemesi) deseni kullanılan bu çalışmanın amacı; eseri bilim dünyasına tanıtmaktır.

© 2019MREFD. Tüm hakları saklıdır

Anahtar Kelimeler:

İbrahim Müteferrika, Matbaa, Sözlük, Ferheng-i Suûri

Giriş

İnsanlığın icat etmiş olduğu yeniliklerin en önemlilerinden biri de şüphesiz ki matbaadır. Matbaanın icat edilmesinden önce insanlar farklı basım teknikleri kullanmışlardır; anca bu teknikler hem kullanılışları açısından hem ekonomik açıdan hem de hızları açısından matbaa kadar etkili ve önemli olmamışlardır. İlk matbaa MS 590'lı yıllarda kâğıdın da mucidi olan Çinliler tarafından icat edilmiştir. Ağaç oyma tekniği kullanılarak yapılan bu basit matbaa, teknik açıdan oldukça basittir. 9 ve 10. yüzyıla gelindiğinde ise Uygurlar ve Mısırlılar da matbaayı kullanmaya başlamışlardır.

Her ne kadar kendisinden önce daha ilkel ve kullanışsız formları olsa da modern anlamda ilk matbaa Alman mucit Johannes Gutenberg tarafından icat edilmiştir. 1447 yılında bulunan bu matbaada hareketli parçalar kullanılmaktadır. Tipo basım yöntemi kullanılan bu matbaada

¹ Sorumlu Yazarın Adresi: Kilis 7 Aralık Üniversitesi, Muallim Rifat Eğitim Fakültesi, Türkçe Eğitimi Ana Bilim Dalı
e-posta: alanyakup@gmail.com

çıkarılabilen demir harfler kullanılmaktadır. Kurulan bu matbaanın ilk eseri ise 42 satırlık bir İncil'dir.

Matbaanın bu gelişimine binaen Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda da ilk matbaa azınlıklar tarafından açılmıştır. Osmanlı'da azınlıkların kurdukları bu ilk matbaa İspanya'dan göç eden Yahudiler tarafından 1493/1495 yılında İstanbul'da açılmıştır (Altuntek, 1993). İlk matbaanın İstanbul'da açılmasından sonra birçok şehirde de matbaalar açılmaya başlanmıştır. İzmir, Edirne ve Selanik gibi şehirlerde de Yahudi azınlıklar tarafından matbaalar açılmaya başlanmıştır (Altuntek, 1993). Açılan bu matbaalarda Latince, İbranice ve Yunanca ve daha çok dini konuları barındıran eserler basılmıştır (Küçükcan, 2006).

Yahudilerin matbaa açmasını takip eden yıllarda, Yahudileri örnek alan Ermeniler de İstanbul'da 1567 yılında ilk matbaalarını açmışlardır (Küçükcan, 2006). Matbaacılığı Venedik'te öğrenen Sivaslı Apkar tarafından Kumkapı'daki kilisede kurulan bu matbaada ilk olarak Ermenice bir eser basılmıştır (Küçükcan, 2006) Ermenilerin matbaasından bir süre sonra da Rumlar yine İstanbul'da 1627 yılında matbaa açmışlardır (Adıvar, 1982).

Hem Avrupa'da hem de kendi topraklarında bu gelişmelerin yaşanmasından sonra Osmanlılar da matbaaya karşı ilgi duymaya başlamışlardır. Özellikle Paris sefaretine giden Yirmi Sekiz Mehmet Zade Çelebi Efendi'nin yanında götürmüş olduğu oğlu Sait Mehmet Efendi bu şehirdeki matbaaları incelemiş ve yararlarını kavramıştır. Daha sonra da ülkesine döner dönmez bu işin Osmanlı'da kurulması ve geliştirilmesi için kendisine yardımcı olarak İbrahim Müteferrika'yı seçmiştir (İskit 1939'dan Akt. Küçükcan, 2006).

Matbaanın icat edilmesin üzerinden yaklaşık 250 yıl geçtikten sonra ilk Türk matbaacısı İbrahim Müteferrika da kitapları basma yöntemiyle çoğaltmanın faydalarını anlatmak için bir risale yazmıştır. Vasilet-üt-tıbaa (1726) isimli bu tasarıda matbaacılık üzerine şu önerileri sıralamıştır:

1. Sözlük, tarih, coğrafya vb. kitapların basılması insanlar için yararlıdır.
2. İslam devletleri zamanında yazılmış eserleri basmak, bu eserlerin İslam coğrafyasında yayılmasını sağlar.
3. Basılmış kitapların el yazmalara göre daha okunaklı olması okuyucuya kolaylık sağlar.
4. Ekonomik açıdan matbaa yararlıdır.
5. Kitapların başına veya sonuna dizin koymak aranan bilginin kolayca bulunması sağlanabilir.
6. Matbaa kitapların ucuz olmasını sağlar ve herkes kitaba ulaşabilir.
7. Kitapların yayımı ile Müslümanlara hizmet edilmiş olunur.
8. Büyük kitapları yazarak çoğaltan hattatların sayısı oldukça azalmıştır.
9. Kitap sayısının artması kütüphanelerin kurulmasını sağlayacaktır. Böylece okuyup ilim yapan insan sayısı artacaktır.
10. Avrupa'da Arapça, Farsça ve Türkçe kitaplar basılmaktadır ancak bu kitaplar yanlışlarla doludur. Bu durum engellenmelidir.
11. Matbaanın kabul edilmesi eserlerin basılmasını sağlayacak ve devletin onurunu artıracaktır (Ersoy, 1959; Maden, 1980).

Sadrazam Nevşehirli Damat İbrahim Paşa'yı matbaanın gerekliliği konusunda ve kurulması için ikna etme niteliğinde yazılan bu layiha (tasarı) sonuç vermiş ve İbrahim Paşa

matbaaya sıcak bakmaya başlamıştır. Bu gelişmelerden sonra Şeyhülislam Abdullah Efendi'den de fetva alınarak 1728 yılında İbrahim Müteferrika tarafından ilk Türk matbaası kurulmuştur (Altuntek, 1993). Müteferrika matbaasının kurulmasından sonra basılan ilk eser Müderris Mehmet Efendi tarafından çevrilen ve Van kulu Lûgatı adıyla anılan Sıhah-ı Cevheri isimli eserdir. Bu eserden bin adet basılmıştır. İbrahim Müteferrika'nın matbaasında basılan diğer eserleri şöyle sıralamak mümkündür:

1. Vankulu Lûgatı (Cevheri) 31 Ocak 1729.
2. Tuhfet-ül Kibar fî Efsarülbihar (Kâtip Çelebi) 29 Mayıs 1729.
3. Tarihi Seyyah (Krusinski, Judas Thaddaeus Çev. Müteferrika) 26 Ağustos 1729.
4. Tarih-i Hind-i (Emir Mehmet bin Emir Hasan el-Mes'udi) 5 Nisan 1730.
5. Tarih-i Timur Gürgân (İbni Arabşah) 18 Mayıs 1730.
6. Tarih-i Mısır Kadim ve Mısır Cedid (Süheylî) 17 Haziran 1730
7. Gülşen-i Hulefa (Nazmizade Hüseyin Mürteza) 16 Ağustos 1730.
8. Gramaire Turque (Holderman, P. Jean-Baptiste) 1730?
9. Usûlü'l-Hikem fî Nizâmî'l-Ümem (İbrahim Müteferrika) 13 Şubat 1732.
10. Fuyuzat-ı Mıknatısiye (İbrahim Müteferrika) 27 Şubat 1732.
11. Cihannüma (Kâtip Çelebi) 3 Temmuz 1733.
12. Takvim-üt Tevarih (Kâtip Çelebi) 14 Haziran 1733.
13. Tarih-i Naima (Naima) 2 cilt. 1734.
14. Tarih-i Raşit (Vak'anüvis Raşit Efendi) 17 Şubat 1741.
15. Asım Tarihi (Çelebizade İsmail Asım) 17 Şubat 1741.
16. Ahval-i Gazavat-ı Der Diyar-ı Bosna (Bosnalı Ömer Efendi) 19 Mart 1741.
17. Ferheng-i Şuuri (Şuurî Hasan) 1 Ekim 1742 (Watson, 1968).

Matbaanın kurulmasından Müteferrika'nın vefatına kadar geçen 17 yıllık sürede toplam 23 cilt tutan 17 eser basılmıştır. Kitaplardan 11 tanesi tarih, üç tanesi dil ve gramer, kalan üçü de farklı bilim alanlarıyla ilgili kitaplardır. Müteferrika matbaasında basılan toplam kitap sayısı 13.200'dür (Watson, 1968).

Müteferrika matbaasında basılan son eser olma özelliğine sahip olan Ferheng-i Şuuri (Lisan-ül Acem) isimli eser matbaada basılan üç dil ve gramer kitabından biridir.

Hasan Şuuri Efendi

Aslen Halepli olan Şuuri Hasan Efendi Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun maliye kalemi memurlarındandır (Altuner, 1989). Hekimlik ve dilcilik gibi meziyetleri vardır. Tıp alanında oldukça önemli bir isimdir. Ta'dîlü'l-emzice isimli kitabı bu alanda döneminin en önemli kaynaklarındandır. Tıp bilimine getirmiş olduğu müzikle tedavi yöntemi oldukça önemli bir tekniktir (Turabi, 2011). Yazmış olduğu eserler hem dönemi açısından hem de günümüz açısından önemlidir. Bu eserlerden bazıları şöyle sıralanabilir:

1. Düstûrî'l-amelî
2. MürettebDîvân
3. Terceme-i Pend-i Attâr
4. Ta'dîlü'l-emzice

5. Ferheng-i Şuûrî

Amaç

Çalışmamızın amacı Hasan Şuûri tarafından kaleme alınan Ferheng-i Şuûri isimli eserin bilim dünyasına kazandırılmasıdır. Bu eserin tanıtılmasının ve bilinirliğinin sağlanmasının Türkçe-Farsça öğrenecek olanlara bir sözlük kazandırılması açısından yararlı olacağı düşünülmektedir.

Yöntem

Araştırma Modeli

İbrahim Müteferrika Matbaasında basılan son eser olma özelliği gösteren Ferheng-i Şuûri isimli kitabı inceleyen bu çalışma, nitel araştırma yöntemine göre tasarlanmış bir araştırmadır. Betimsel araştırmalar, ortaya çıkarılan bir durumu oldukça dikkatli tanımlar (Büyüköztürk vd., 2011, s. 21).

İncelenen Dokümanlar

Çalışmada, Müteferrika Matbaasında basılmış, Hasan Şuûri tarafından kaleme alınmış olan ve bir Farsça-Türkçe sözlük niteliği taşıyan Ferheng-i Şuûri isimli eser incelenmiştir.

Verilerin Toplanması ve Analizi

Bu çalışmada yöntem olarak nitel yöntem, veri toplama yöntemi olarak da doküman analizi (incelemesi) deseni kullanılmıştır. Doküman incelemesi, araştırılması hedeflenen olgu veya olgular hakkında bilgi içeren yazılı materyallerin analizini kapsar (Yıldırım ve Şimşek, 2008).

Veriler Ferheng-i Şuûri adlı eserden nitel araştırma yönteminin doküman incelemesi deseni kullanılarak elde edilmiştir.

Bulgular

Ferheng-i Şuûri

Ferheng-i Şuûri (Lisan-ül Acem) Hasan Şuûri tarafından yazılan Farsça-Türkçe sözlüktür. Bu eser Müteferrika matbaasında 1742 yılında iki cilt olarak basılmıştır. Eserin toplam sayfa sayısı 1836'dır. Hazırlanan bu sözlük kelime sayısı açısından da oldukça önemlidir. 22.500 civarında sözcüğü barındıran sözlük, 500 civarında İranlı şairin şiirleriyle de örneklendirilmiştir (Turabi, 2011). Türk matbaacılığının ilk ürünlerinden biri olan eser sadece 500 kopya basılmıştır. Her iki cilt de yaprakları altın ile süslenmiş çiçekli bir ilk sayfa ile başlamaktadır.

Eserin her iki cildi de duayla başlar. Eserin basılmasına vesile olanlara ve izin verenlere yapılan duadan sonra esrin mukaddime bölümüne geçilir. Bu kitap güzel bir mukaddime/ön söz, iki defter/bölüm ve bir hatime/sonuçtan oluşmuştur (Şuuri, 1742).

Mukaddimedede hecelemelerden oluşmuş harflerin içinde ve ekleri olan harflerin işlevleri, müstakil olarak ve dâhil olduğu cümle içerisinde neyi ifade ettiğinin kanıtlarıyla ve örnekleriyle zikir ve beyan edilmiştir.



Fotoğraf 1: Eserin Miftah/Mukaddime Bölümü

Giriş bölümünde yazar tarafından eser hakkında bilgiler verilmiştir. Ayrıca mukaddimededen sonra bir dizin de koyulmuş ve eserde aranılacak bilginin kolayca bulunması hedeflenmiştir.



Fotoğraf 2: Fihrist (2. Cilt)

Eser iki defterden oluşmaktadır. Bu defterlerden birincisinde atasözleri, terimler ve kalıp ifadeler üzerinde durulmuştur. Üzerinde durulan atasözü, terim ve kalıp ifadeler yine örnekleriyle verilmiştir. Ayrıca sözlük anlamı dışında işitmeye bağlı görünen anlamı da kastedilmiş ve bu da örnekleriyle belirtilmiştir. Birinci bölümde verilen örtülü atasözleri, terimler ve kalıplaşmış ifadeler ancak başlangıçta (mukaddime) hecelenen harflere riayet edilerek düzenlenmiştir.

اصطلاحیدر اصل معناسی ایشدی دیمکدر خواجه سلمان بیت مرار سنکه ترا تو به
 داده و کفتن * شتیدم آبت تو یوا الی الله از لب حور و رصد که خاک بی فتح کاف مجسی
 وانظهارها بله یعنی قالب انسان کذافی شرفنامه بی وقت بی زفا هرستد بودخی
 اصطلاحیدر خواجه حافظ بیت دور از رخ او دیدم از گوشه چشم * سیلاب سرشک
 آمد و طوفان بلارفت * و بر معناسی دخی ایلدی در کرد معنا سنه بودخی اصطلاحیدر
 ترکیب بوکا بکتر تعبیروار در ایو ایتدم ده جگ یوده یو وار دم در لوسینی اسفر نیکی بیت
 فلا وصف میان نازک جانان من کفتی * نکور فی حدیثی از میان جان من کفتی * بر معنای
 مصطلحی دخی جاری اولقدر مولانا شاهی بیت چو کلهک صنم چنیز رفت بر حقیقه ما * مکبر
 خرده بر ارباب عشق و عیب مکن بی رقم زد بی یعنی فرمان کرد مولانا ها تی بیت
 رقم زد در بارن سیمند هزار * که باشند فرمان بران بسار بی رقیبان راز بی یعنی عارفان
 وار باب مشاهدات غیبیه کذافی شرفنامه بی رنگ آزادان بی یعنی سیرت و روش مردمان
 احرار و جوانمردان ایضا منها بی رنگ آورد بی یعنی شیوه و ناز ایله فریب و بر بی کذافی جمع الفرس
 بی رنگ آورد بی یعنی خیل اولدی ابوالعالی بیت بحسن بکدمیش کل جولاف خوبی زد *
 بدید رنگ ورخ و عارض تو رنگ آورد بی رنگ شه زنگبار بی یعنی تاریکی و سیاهی شب کذافی
 شرفنامه بی رواق بیستون بی یعنی آسمان و افلاک ایضا منها بی روان آورد بی یعنی عاقل
 ودانا کذافی جمع الفرس بی روضه ترکیب بی یعنی قالب انسان کذافی شرفنامه بی بره
 بیشه به نیشه بی ایولکه ابلک کلکه کلک بومعنی ترکیب یولی یول ایله اورمانی بالته ایله در یولی
 ابوالعالی بیت دو ستار لطف باید دشمنان ترا تبع نیز * این مثل شدن بره بیشه به نیشه
 گفته اند بی خواجه ایله بی اشک یول دیمکدر بی سه سرشد بی خم سین ایله یولی طو توب
 کیندی ابوالعالی بیت شتید قیس کدر قنست مجل لیل * شاه است زه سپر و ونهاده در
 صحرا بی ره نورد بی غایت اشکون آت حکم فردوسی بیت چرا ننه کرکس اندر نبرد *
 چمانه چرمه ره نورد بی ره هوان نتوان رفت بی ز زالت و خواری ایتلک اولار کذافی
 شرفنامه بی باب الراء المکسوره بی رشته بانکشت بست * یعنی سپارش او تندی مولانا
 صائب بیت غافل مشوز مرکه که در چشم اهل هوش * موی سفید رشته بانکشت
 بستن است بی رشته بر آورد بی برکسنه سفرده خسته اولد قه ایراد ایدر لر ولایت بخارا ایله
 مخصوص بر علتد ساق انسا نده ظاهر اولور ایلک کی برنسنه در قطع اولنسه صاحبی
 هلاک اولور حالی اوزن قالسه کتد بکه اوزار لواحد من الشعرا بیت خور دآب بخارا
 کرفرشته * بر آرد پای خود در این رشته * شیخ سعیدی بیت یکی را حکایت کنند از ملوک
 که بیماری رشته کردش چو دوک بی رکاب کران کشت بی یعنی سوارشد و جلله کرد کذافی
 شرفنامه بی زندان ما کبیر بی یعنی اعجاب و قایق شناس ایضا منها بی زند عالموز بی
 مردلانیالی و فی قید خواجه حافظ بیت مامست و خراب و ز ند عالموزم * بامانشین
 و کره بد نام شوی بی برزی برزی بی یعنی مرحمت ایله حکیم خاقانی بیت ای فیض رحمت تو روان
 عاصیان را * برزی برزی بردل خاقانی از صفا بی ریش کاو بی یعنی ایله واجتی مولانا بلعی

Fotograf 3: Eserin İçinden Bir Sayfa

Eserin ikinci bölümü olan İkinci defter de isimlerden oluşmuştur. Cansız isimler, anlatılan, düşünülen, bağımsız (basit) ve birleşik kelimelerin sözlük anlamı, beyitlerden örnek verilerek Acem belagati ile açıklanmıştır.

Hatime/sonuç bölümünde yazılan matbu nüshanın yazılma sebebi, tasnifin nasıl yapıldığı, yazmaya başlama ve yazı işinin bitiriliş tarihi verilmiştir. Ayrıca toplu olan Farsça sözlüğü sarf etmeye ve toplamaya Arapça sözlükten, Farsça nezdinde gayet çok kullanılmış olan beyit ve güzel sözlerin anlamları, şahit gösterilen örneklerin adedi ve adı geçen nadir kitapta örtülü olan sözcükler yazılmış, temenni ve rica anlamında harfler satır haline getirilmiştir. Ama mukaddimeyi tertip etme yolunda oluşan basit harfler olduğu kadarıyla yazılmıştır. 500 kadar şairin beyitlerinden örnekler verilerek kaleme alınan eser 12 senede hazırlanmıştır (Turabi, (2011).

اصلن استفساروسمين استخبارا بدن اصلندن بغيروا كاهوموجيندن تاوقوف في انباءه اولنلره
جواب ويراوردكه بوندن اقدم كشيده سلايك تاليف ورسيداه حدوكتصنيف اولان لغت كتابلرينك
اكثري استشهدا ايله تحريرومجله مناسب ابيات ايرادي ايله تسطير اولنشد رازا مجمله ديار
رومه مستعمل وژد عرفاده شريف وتمد اولان بحال القرايب حايبي ولغت نعمة الله
اسكنها الله في مجبوحه الجنان كتابلري ابيات مستشهداته تاليف اولنشيدي مروا يامله
نجه بالفضل نادان وخرديو باي في اذعان ترك ابيات وقصرا شعرا بتمكله مذكو ركتابلري
اذعانلري كي خراب وادراكلري كي يباب البشار اول جهتن بوكتايك استساخنة طالب
واستكابه راغب اولان طالبان معرفت وماكان حسن همت بعينه نقل مسطرا يدوب بزيوت
وياخودر كنه نك حركت نسبن طي وقصرو قصم خفت ومختصر البزسه حق سبحانه وتعالى
توجهن راست وآسان ومرادينه وصول ايله مسرور وخذان واجر جزيل وثواب جليل احسان
ايله اكر وجه محررا ووزره ترك وطرح وقصرو حدف ايدرسه وزعجه اختصار وانتخاب قصد ايدرسه
دركاه واهب العطا يادن تضرع وتخي اولنور كه بو خصيصه مرام ومقصودينه ناييل ومراد
ومطلوبينه واصل اوليوبه لطايف معانيستندن بهر مند و متافع وقوا يئندن سود مند اوليه آمين
بحرمة محمد وآله الطيبين واجحابه الطاهرين والحمد لله وحده والصلاة والسلام على من لا نبي بعده

فقد تم اجلد الثاني من نسخة المطبوعة الملقبة بفرهنگ شعوري والمجامة بنوال
الفضلا ولسان العجمي من زين السنة للعلل واللام بلغة مخصوصة وعلم بالقلم
على يد الفقير ابراهيم من متفرق كان دركاه عالي المامور بعيل الطبع في دار الطباعة
المسورة في غرة شعبان المعظم سنة خمس وخمسين ومائة والف من هجرة
من له العز والسعادة والشرف في البلدة الطيبة المحمية
قسنطنية صانها الله تعالى عن انواع
آفات التكوينة والبلية

تاريخ نتم طبع كتاب لغته المحقر
اي خويش اين نسخه يا كبره وخوب كه لسان العجم اينجا مجموع
سجيه تا مئيش چونوال الفضلا فضلا را بد امل زين مدفوع
بهر بسيا ري اين نسخه ز بس كوشش افتاد وچنين شد مطبوع
ز اصطلاحات وكنيات و لغات خارج ازد فتاين نام مجموع
كس نمايد از ين حرف سقيم بود انكشت نهادن مرفوع
باچنين سحت و هموازي نقش كشت باصنعت طبش ممنوع
عاطف سا كفت بختش تا زنج
بسكه فرهنگ شعوري مطبوع
سنة ۱۱۰۰

Fotoğraf 4: Eserin Son Sayfası (2. Cilt)

Sonuç ve Öneriler

Matbaanın icadı insanlık tarihindeki en büyük çığırılardan biridir. Bilimin hızla ilerlemesi, insanların bilgiye daha kolay, ekonomik ve kısa sürede ulaşması gibi birçok kolaylığı getirmiştir. İbrahim Müteferrika'nın ilk Osmanlı matbaasını kurmasıyla da birçok eser daha hızlı ve ekonomik basılmıştır. Ayrıca basımı yapılan eserler el yazması eserlere göre daha çok sayıda çoğaltıldığı için gelecek nesillere ulaşması garanti altına alınmıştır.

Müteferrika matbaasında kısa sürede birçok eserin basılması sağlanmıştır. Bu eserlerden bir tanesi de Ferheng-i Şuûri'dir. İki ciltten oluşan bu eser Farsça-Türkçe bir sözlük niteliğindedir. Farsça öğrenmek isteyen Türklerin veya Türkçe öğrenmek isteyen İranlıların yararlanabileceği bir eserdir. Dil öğretiminin asli unsurlarından biri olan sözlükler yabancı dil öğrenmek isteyen bireyler için oldukça önemlidir.

1836 sayfadan oluşan bu eser yaklaşık 22.500 kelimenin anlamını, günlük dilde kullanımını örneklerle vermektedir. Eser bu özellikleri açısından önemli bir yere sahiptir. Bu eserin Arap alfabesinden Latin alfabesine çevirisinin yapılması Farsça ve Türkçe öğretimi açısından önem arz etmektedir.

Kaynakça

- Adıvar, A. (1982). *Osmanlı Türklerinde İlim*, İstanbul, TR: Remzi Yayınevi.
- Altuner, N. (1989). Safâî ve Tezkiresi, Yayımlanmamış Doktora Tezi, *İstanbul Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Eski Türk Edebiyatı Ana Bilim Dalı*.
- Altuntek, S. (1993). İlk Türk matbaasının kuruluşu ve İbrahim Müteferrika, *Hacettepe Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 10(1), 191-204.
- Büyüköztürk, Ş., vd. (2011). *Bilimsel araştırma yöntemleri*. Ankara, TR: Pegem Akademi Yayınları.
- Ersoy, O. (1959). *Türkiye'ye matbaanın girişi ve ilk basılan eserler*. Ankara, TR: DTCF.
- İskit S. R. (1939). *Türkiye'de neşriyat hareketleri tarihine bir bakış*. İstanbul, TR: İstanbul Maarif Vekillliği.
- Küçükcan, B. (2006) *Dünden Bugüne Matbaanın Serüveni*, Leman Şenalp'e Armağan. İstanbul, TR: TKD.
- Maden, S. (1980). İbrahim Müteferrika için bir yeniden değerlendirme. *Milliyet Sanat Dergisi*, 1, 86-91.
- Şuuri, H. (1742). *Ferheng-i Şuuri* (2. Cilt). İstanbul, TR: Darü't-Tıbaatü'l-âmire
- Turabi, A. H. (2011). Hekim Şuûrî Hasan Efendi ve Ta'dilü'l-Emzice adlı eserinde müzikle tedavi bölümü. *Marmara Üniversitesi İlâhiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 40(1), 153-166.
- Watson, W. J. (1968). İbrahim Müteferrika and Turkish incunabula. *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 88(3) 1968 436.
- Yıldırım, A. ve Şimşek, H. (2008). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri*. Ankara, TR: Seçkin Yayınları.