MUSICOLOGIST

International Journal of Music Studies

Masthead

Editorial Board

Table of Contents

Articles

GUZEL SAYFULLINA
gsayfi@gmail.com
orcid.org/0000-0001-6606-8604

Traditions of Sufi Dhikr in the Musical-Poetical Culture of Tatar Muslims

ABSTRACT

The subject of the dhikr remains one of the unexplored areas of the Tatar religious culture today. The 'Tatar dhikr' has received adequate attention from researchers neither as part of the normative liturgical ritual, nor in the context of the Sufi culture that existed in the past. To some degree, it can be explained by the influence of the atheistic campaign of the Soviet decades, which caused a decline in the existence of, as well as competence in, ritual practices.

At the present time, together with the return of many religious rituals to the life of the Tatar-Muslims, the dhikr has been re-introuced into the practice of normative service. Much less is known about the Sufi dhikr in the Tatar milieu, where the Yasawiya and the Naqshbandiya traditions were the most widespread. The handwritten and printed sources in Arabic script of the past are still waiting for special studies.

Against this background, the materials recorded by Tatar ethnomusicologists in the last decades of the 20th century seem to be especially important: there are texts that reflect the importance of the Sufi dhikr for Muslims and show its structural features. Towards the end of the 20th century, such texts entered the repertoire of Tatar folk monajats and were recited in the style of the monajats. To a certain extent, the study of such samples provides an idea of the forms of the dhikr in the Tatar culture of the past; particularly it shows their connection with the Yasawiya tradition, and as a whole, proves the persistence of Sufi traditions in the folk culture.

This paper is based on the survey of little-studied religious and historical sources, recordings, and interviews made during field trips in the 1990-2000s on the territory of the Republic of Tatarstan (Russia).

The theme of the *dhikr* today is one of the most frequently discussed subjects in connection with various aspects of Islamic culture: the practice of different Sufi *tarikats*, the specificity of rituals (correlation of the 'silent' and the 'loud' *dhikr*), the cultural traditions of 'folk Islam', as a subject of the source studies, and the studies on Islamic music.[1]

Such a remarkable increase of interest in this phenomenon is due, inter alia, to the increasing availability of Islamic ritual practice to the researcher, who as an outside observer, was previously deprived of such opportunities. The first descriptions of Sufi rituals, the photographs of dervishes, made by travellers and ethnographers in the past, were replaced by audio and video recordings of rituals and even concerts, meaning that researchers now had a chance to get a sense of the environment. Thanks to this, we know about the traditions of the *dhikr* in Central Asia, Africa, the Middle East, Turkey, the Caucasus, and number of other regions.

This information allows us to observe both the similarities and the differences between the various *dhikr* traditions, and not only in connection with the peculiarities of the ritual practice of different orders, or with the influence of local musical traditions. Different historical and cultural conditions, when the religious culture itself undergoes fundamental changes, which influence not only the traditions themselves, but their interpretation in a religious environment, are of special importance in this sense.

This is the case with the Volga Tatar Muslims who, together with other Muslim peoples of the former USSR, survived all stages of atheistic policy in the 20th century. The result of these policies was a gap in the continuity of religious knowledge, a gradual isolation from any textual information on the Arabic alphabet[2], and changes in the format of some rituals.

The post-Soviet period was the time characterized by the return of Islam to the Tatars' lives, and by the revival of Islamic culture in the Tatar society. But many factors show how different it became from what the religious culture of Tatar Muslims had been a

---

[1] Partly, these subjects are reflected in the Bibliography. See: Algar, 2013; Babajanov, 2008; Feldman, 1992; Papas, 2014; Sultanove, 2012; Togan, 1999. Among the last publications, the articles from the volume *The Music of Central Asia* (2016) can be mentioned: "Religious Music and Chant in the Culture of Sedentary-Dwellers" by Aleksandr Djumaev; Sufism and the Ceremony of Dhikr in Ghulja by Mukaddas Mijit.

[2] The Arabic alphabet served as the basis of Tatar literature for a millennium.

hundred years earlier.[3] For Muslims of new generations, the return to Islam begins with the study of the basics of normative worship, which, as observations show, is understood by them as the main meaning of 'being' in religion. Against this background, it is difficult to talk about the traditions that fully represented the diversity of manifestations of Islamic culture in previous periods of Tatar history, in particular, everything related to Sufism. Here we encounter a number of manifestations of a weak or distorted notion on the part of Muslims (and in general by modern Tatars) about this phenomenon,[4] or complete ignorance regarding the nature of Sufism.

Observations that "by the middle of the 20th century, there was no longer that environment ... which was vital for Sufism as a part of everyday life," enabled A. Bustanov, one of the most active investigators of modern Tatar Islam, to conclude that "in the twentieth century Sufism among the Tatars" died by itself" (Bustanov, 2016).[5]

If so, then, to what extent can we talk about the 'legacy' of Sufism in the culture of the Tatars today, and if it so, what are its manifestations?

The answer to these questions involves the study of both historical and long-unavailable theological materials,[6] and the still almost unexplored, folk textual (musical and non-musical) traditions, which seem to be an invaluable source in this sense.[7]

The subject of the *dhikr*, one of the main known 'signs' of Sufi practice, seems particularly important in this respect.

---

[3] On the level and content of the Tatar religious culture in the late 19th and early 20th centuries, in particular, one can judge from the activities of such intellectuals as A. Kursawi, Sh. Mardjani, M. Bigiev, G. Barudi, R. Fakhretdin and other thinkers, who made a special contribution to the development of world Islamic thought of this time,– a fact, which was repeatedly commented on in the modern Islamic studies. As Taufik Ibragim noted in a recent interview, "... the Tatar theology of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries stood at the most advanced positions in the Muslim world... We did not advance much in comparison with what was in it. It is absolutely relevant today..." (Ibragim, 2017).

[4] For example, an inability to comment on who the Sufis are. (From an interview with a sixty year old woman in a Tatar village in 1995: "Who was this Sufi-*babay*?" – "An educated old man; he also played violin..."), or hasty conclusions of some musicologists about "the influence of Sufism" on music of composers who were educated in the Soviet time.

[5] A similar remark was made by Th. Zarcone in his article "Sufi Lineages and Saint Veneration in Russia, Soviet Tatarstan and Central Asia in the 20th Century" (2002: 96).

[6] The processes of "return" (reprints to the modern Tatar alphabet and translations) of religious sources of the past and their study began in Tatarstan in the 1990s. An example is the volumes of *Anthology of Tatar Theological Thought*, one of which was specially dedicated to the subject of Islam and music (Sayfullina, ed., 2015).

[7] Among the first publications on this subject are works by G. Sayfullina (2005; 2009;2015); the collection of folk tunes and texts by G. Makarov, titled *In the company of dervishes* (2011).

This study is based on the survey of a number of religious sources (both from the pre-revolutionary and Soviet time), recordings, and interviews made during field trips beginning in the 1990s on the territory of Tatarstan and Russia, and materials of various poetic and musical folklore collections from these years.

Speaking about Sufi traditions in the Tatar environment, one must bear in mind that Islam was spread to the territory of the Volga-Ural[8] more than a thousand years ago, and until the 1920s-1930s, was the determining factor in the development of the Tatar culture.

The spread of Sufism is associated here with the influence of two Central Asian *tarikats*: *Yasawiya* (connected with the name of Ahmad Yasawi, a 12th century mystic leader who exerted a powerful influence on the Turkic-speaking world) and, later, *Naqshbandiya* (named after Baha' ad-din Naqshbandi, from the 14th cent.).[9] Historically interconnected, these brotherhoods differed in the type of *dhikr* practiced: the loud *dhikr* in the case of *Yasawiya,* and the silent *dhikr* in *Naqshbandiya*. The importance of this feature was also reflected in the names of the brotherhoods. As D. DeWeese writes: "the [*Yasawiya*] tradition is also called the 'Jahriyya', after the vocal *dhikr (dhikr-i jahri)* that was the hallmark of its mystical practice"; "... the Naqshbandi preference for the silent *dhikr (dhikr -i khafi)* led to the use of the term *khafiyya* to refer to the order". (DeWeese, 1996: 181-185).

It is noteworthy that the *Yasawiya*, which was not a structurally organized order,[10] and in the 18 -19th centuries gave way to the *Naqshbandiya*, had a strong influence on the folk Tatar culture, and traces of this influence can be detected to this day.[11]

As for the *Naqshbandiya*, its influence was largely reflected in the formation of the intellectual elite in the Tatar community. This is indisputably proven by dozens of works (both hand-written and published before 1917) of the Tatar *Naqshbandiya shaykhs*, which have survived to this day. It is known that all the major thinkers-

[8] Contemporary historians are unanimous in asserting that, with the official recognition of Islam in the Volga Bulgaria in 922, the ancestors of the Tatars were already familiar with the teachings of Islam long before.

[9] As of this moment, there are various publications on this subject: works by F. Koprulu (1918), H. Algar (1992), M. Kemper (1998), number of works by D. DeWeese, A. Rorlich (1983) and others.

[10] See works by D. DeWeese, in particular,the article in the Encyclopedic Dictionary "*Islam in the territory of the former Russian Empire*" (DeWeese, 2003).

[11] On this subject see: Sayfullina, 2015.

theologians of the late 19th and early 20th centuries were, to a certain degree, connected with the circles of the *Naqshbandiya*.[12]

Relying on various kinds of information, it can be assumed that the forms of *dhikr*, characteristic of both the *Yasawiya* and the *Naqshbandiya* practice, were in use at various times and with varying degrees of activity in the Tatar-Muslim environment.[13]

Does it mean, however, that the traditions of the *dhikr*, which were preserved up to the end of the 20th century, can directly be associated with the ritual practice of these orders?

It seems important to begin the answer to this question with a serious reservation. The fact is that the *dhikr* — as the remembrance of Allah in the form of certain verbal formulas in Arabic — has always been an important element of the normative worship (*namaz*), and as such is well known to every non-Sufi Muslim as well. Moreover, a number of phrases occur in both the *namaz* and in Sufi rituals (such as: *Tasbeeh* /'*Subhan Allah*'/ - Allah is Sublime; *Tahmid* /'*Al-Hamdulillah*'/ - all praise to Allah; *Takbir* /'*Allahu Akbar*'/ - Allah is Greatest; *Tahlil* /'La ilaha illa Allah'/ - There is no God but Allah).

---

[12] This fact was mentioned in many works. See, in particular, works by M. Kemper (1998), Th. Zarcone (2002).

[13] Probably, with the exception of *dhikr-I arra* / the 'saw dhikr' /, described in detail by A. Djumaev. (Djumaev, 2001). Among special works where the rules of the *Naqshbandiya* dhikr are discussed is the treatise "*Al-fawaid ak-muhima li-l-muridina an-naqshbandiya*" /Divine truths, comprehension of which is necessary for *murids* of the Sufi brotherhood of *Naqshbandiya*, together with the Thanksgiving to Allah and prayers) written by Zaynulla Rasulev in 1899 (Rasulev, 2001).

Photo 01. Performing namaz in the mosque. Or village, Tatarstan. Photo G. Sayfullina 2016

The idea of the *dhikr* as an element of normative worship was strongly supported by the information, which Muslims were receiving at lessons in numerous schools and madrassas that existed before the revolution throughout the territory of the Tatars' settlement. One of examples is the textbook of the outstanding teacher and public figure, A. Maksudi, '*Ghiybadate Islamiya*', which was published in Kazan in 1892 and was especially popular among the Tatars in the past. (It is worth noticing that the re-printing of this very book in 1989 was one of the first signs of changes in the then highly atheistic society).

Over the course of time, when Sufism as a social phenomenon was gradually forced out of the life of the Tatars due to the above-mentioned (and other) reasons,[14] the understanding of the *dhikr* in the folk environment began to be increasingly associated with the normative ritual. The author of the only book on *Tatar Islam of the Soviet time* wrote that "...the *dhikr* is still performed as a part of the rite of prayer in the Tatar

---

[14] Attitude to Sufism among the Tatars (and also to such its manifestation as '*Ishanism*') was often negative both in the pre-revolutionary period and after the revolution, both on the part of the authorities and on the part of the orthodox Muslim clergy. An evidence for this is the life of Zaynulla Rasulev, one of the most authoritative figures in religious circles in Russia of the turn of the century (See: Algar, 1992). An example of another kind is Zarif Mozaffari's book *Ishannar-dervishlar* (1931), written, undoubtedly, in line with the official anti-religious campaign. At the same time, in its own way, it still shows the existence of various forms of 'popular Sufism' in the Volga-Kama region of the early 20th century.

mosques" (Ishmuhametov, 1979:49). In the field interviews recorded in Tatarstan in the 1990s, elderly Muslims (still remembering pre-Soviet times) talked about the significance of the *dhikr*, referring to the remembrance of Allah through repetition of the prescribed formula phrases during daily prayer and not mentioning Sufi rituals.

The concept of the *dhikr* as only a part of the normative ritual has been asserted in recent decades, when, as it was said, elementary religious instruction was just beginning to develop in Tatarstan.[15] (In the framework of the general, not Sufi tradition, people still retain the custom of uttering the *dhikr* during religious holidays, primarily *Ramadan* and *Mawlud* / see below /).

So, what is the evidence of the forms of Sufi practice, and, in particular, the *dhikr* of the Tatars in the 20th century?

For me, this question first emerged in the analysis of ritual dedications (*baghyshlau*), pronounced after the recitation of the Koran, as well as in the study of the recited books of religious texts and folk *monajats,* which is, nowadays, the most popular genre associated with religious tradition.

Texts of *baghyshlau*, from field recordings of elderly Muslims, are surprising in terms of names, concepts, and vocabulary, which was quite incongruent with the verbal culture of the Tatars of the late 20th century. The gradual realization that here we are confronted with the pure manifestation of old Sufi traditions was, in due course, confirmed by comparing *baghyshlaus* with the texts of the *Khatm-hwajagan* practiced in the *Naqshbandiya*.[16]

Another kind of confirmation is the repertoire of the so-called tradition of 'book singing' - the most important layer of the Tatar religious folk culture of the late 19th - early 20th century. The review of the texts that were recited by Tatars-Muslims of this time shows that basically these were works, in one or another way (authorship, subject matter, vocabulary) associated with the Sufi tradition: *hikmets* by Ahmad Yasawi, the *Baqırghan*

---

[15] An example of a generalized, not connected with the Sufi interpretation, notion of dhikr can be the first post-Soviet special publication *The Treasury of Dhikr* - a kind of 'digest' of different (both Sufi and not-Sufi) sources on this topic. See: Yakupov, 2000.

[16] Of course, the folk tradition has made its 'adjustments' to the content of such texts. However, their connection can be seen in the structure of dedication, in the selection of mentioned names - a kind of *silsila* of revered shaykhs. See: Sayfullina, 2005. On the *naqshbandi* tradition of *Khatm-i hwajagan* among Tatars of Siberia see: Bustanov, 2011.

kitabı – a collection of poems of the Central Asian Sufi authors of the *Yasawiya* tradition of the 12 - 18 centuries, *Muhammadiya* by the Ottoman Sufi Muhammad Yazijoglu Celebi (15 century), and others.

True, for most of the Tatar-Muslim population of this time, their existence had functions that were no longer connected with the Sufi practice: they were primarily used for educational purposes. (I already referred to the Russian missionary S. Matveev, who at the end of the 19th century, noted differences in the use of Sufi verses in the Tatar milieu and in Central Asia, in connection with one of the books of Baqırghani: "For the *Mahommedans* of the Kazan land. The story of Suleyman [i.e. Baqırghani] serves as a religious-didactic reading for children, whereas in Central Asia, these verses are recited together with the poems of Hojja Ahmad Yasawi by the whirling dervishes in their praying sessions" (Matveev, 1895:34).

Testimonies of another kind on the importance of the Sufi component in the culture of the Tatars are given by folk *monajats* (a genre currently characterized by a wide range of content, including secular themes). Originally connected with the common Islamic literary tradition, a form of individual and very emotional address to God with repentance, the Tatar *monajats* accurately reflected the changes in the religious culture in the 20th century.[17] Recordings, made in the last decades of this century, indicate that with the disappearance of the opportunity to openly perform religious rites, *monajat* became the main form that absorbed the traditions of various textual rituals, including the *dhikr*. (There are examples when, both in popular culture and literature, *dhikrs* were simply called *monajat*).

The first thing that attracts attention when analyzing the Tatar *monajat*, is the abundance of texts on the importance of the *dhikr* as the remembrance of Allah as a whole.

---

[17] On the changes in the concept of monajat in Tatar culture see: Sayfullina, 2017.

One of the examples:

"… Allah" disä kemneng tele,   *chachak atar qaleb gőle,*

Zeker äiter anıng küngle.   *Äitik "Allah-Allah" diep!*

"Allah" disäng, kalbeng ülmäs,   *imanıngnıng nurı sünmäs,*

Qaberdä alar 'azab kürmäs.   *Äitik "Allah-Allah" diep…"*

                                            (Yaghfarov, 2000: 168)

/If the tongue of someone pronounce "Allah",   the flower of his heart will bloom,

His soul will keep performing dhikr.   Let's repeat "Allah-Allah"!

If you say "Allah", your heart will not die,   the light of your faith will not go out;

They will not suffer in the grave.   Let's repeat "Allah-Allah"!/

A further analysis of the *monajats* shows that a) many of them are, in fact, folklore variants of the above-mentioned book of Sufi texts and of their fragments; b) often, their vocabulary and structure repeat the texts, most likely used in rituals of the *dhikr*.

One of the direct indicators of the connection of such texts to the practice of the Sufi *dhikr* is the well-known word-formulas, connected with the name of Allah: *Allah, Allahu, Ya-Hu, Hu*. (Another 'Sufi element' of such texts is the mentioning '*pir*' or '*shaykh*' – the master of the author of the poem).

The greatest number of examples showing the connection of the *monajat* with Sufi primary sources is given by their comparison with the texts of *Baqırghan kitabı* - the old collection of poets of the *Yasawiya* tradition, which was ubiquitous in the Tatar-Muslim environment, thanks to the numerous publications in Kazan beginning from 1840.

The topic of the vital importance of uttering the *dhikr* for the Sufi, the use of typical formulas — phrases and words, a structure where the main principle is the regular repetition of special phrases, characterize many of the poems of the collection, especially those by Ahmad Yasawi, Suleiman Baqırghani, Shamseddin, and Qul Sharif.[18]

---

[18] The life time of Yasawi and his follower Baqırghani, according to the date of DeWeese, is not the 12th, as was previously assumed, but the 13th century; Qul Sharif, according to Tatar scholars, is a Kazan poet of the 16th century.

The 'trail' of these texts in the *monajats* can be seen in many details: in direct quoting of individual stanzas or lines, in their rephrasing, in how the images and vocabulary of the author's verses are 'fused' in folk speech.

One example is a text from the *monajat* collection of 2000, opening with a stanza of the poem by Qul Sharif on the topic of impossibility for the Sufi to ignore the *dhikr* '*Hu*':

> "*Hu-hu!" tiyu Hu qoshı,   aqar küzendin yashe,*
> *Kőyar eche häm tıshı;   ghafil torma, "Hu!" tigel.*
>
> /"*Hu-hu*!" talks the bird Hu,   tears run from eyes,
> Everything, what is inside and outside,   burn; don't be ignorant, repeat "*Hu*"/.
> <div align="right">*(Yaghfarov*, 2000: 99)</div>

It is interesting that the subsequent stanzas of the folk text to some degree depart from the author's idea, but a new refrain appears, which can be regarded as its own form of the *dhikr*:

> "*Hu-hu, Allahu,*
> *Allahı Rabbım, täübä Hu*" (*Yaghfarov*, 2000: 99)[19]

In the same collection, one can find a variant of the poem by Shamseddin, which could be evaluated as a *dhikr*, thanks to the repeated refrain *Singa saghınırmın, ai Allah:*

> "*Min üz bashım belän uilap, Singa saghınam, ai Allah!*
> *Ghonahlardan saqlanıp, Singa saghınam, ai Allah!*"
> <div align="right">*(Yaghfarov*, 2000: 110)</div>
>
> /Immersed in my thoughts, I long for you, *ai Allah!*
> Hiding from sins, I long for you, *ai Allah!*/

There are still many *monajats* (especially those that were recorded from the Muslims of older generations), which look like a *dhikr* both in structure and vocabulary, and are most likely associated with written originals whose authorship is yet to be determined. Below is an example of such a *monajat-dhikr*, with Arabic words in the refrain:

---

[19]*Täübä*– repentance.

"*Ya Rabbi, Sän belersen, mädät äilä Qıyamättä, Hu,*

Fighılana-zanubana mädät äilä Qıyamättä, Hu!" (Husnullin, 2001:164)

/Ya Rabbi, You know /everything/, help me at the day of *Qiyamat, Hu*,

Fighılana-zanubana, help me at the day of *Qiyamat, Hu*!/

An example with the refrain '*Ya-Hu*':

"*Hämde äitäm Singa, Rabbım,   Shőker qıldıng bezne mőemin,*

Yarattıng dine islamnıng,   Hämde äitäm Singa Ya-Hu…"

*(*Yaghfarov, 2000: 120)

/I praise You, my God,   /and/ thank You for you made us the believers;
You created the Islam religion,   I praise You, *Ya-Hu…*/

In general, based on the samples of this kind, one can note that here the main verbal elements (words and formulas) that characterize the Sufi rite are preserved, but how do they now correlate with the very idea of dhikr?

It seems that here we can observe one of the main results of the changes in religious culture of Tatars in the 20th century, namely, the change in the functions of using such elements.

If, in the past, the aim of the *dhikr* for a Sufi was a gradual rejection of one's own 'I'[20], then for Muslims of new generations this is one of the ritual forms of worship, for which they will receive some kind of reward (*sawap*). The terminology of the Sufi *dhikr* enters the texts simply glorifying Allah and the Prophet Muhammad, and even into other types of folk culture. (One such example is a lullaby based on words '*älli-hu, bälli-hu'*, recorded by the first Tatar composer and collector of folklore, Sultan Ghabashi (Ghabashi: n.d.); or the children's playing catchphrase «*Alla-hu! Alla-hu! Käjälärne talga qu!'*/ *Alla-hu! Alla-hu!* Drive goats to the willows!/ recorded in 1991, 2006, in the Baltach and Archa districts of Tatarstan). Here there is no question of correct breathing and necessary movements, which, according to Sufi canons, accompany the performance of a *dhikr*. As

---

[20] The essence of dhikr as a kind of "Sufi exercises" was formulated by Fritz Meier as follows: "The central focus and the high point of all these exercises was spiritual retreat during which the mystic withdrew from all external impressions and, inwardly as well, by means of concentration on a formula, sought to eliminate preoccupation with anything other than the idea of God". (Meier, 1999: 25).

an example, we can cite a text that has become especially popular in recent decades and is found in different regions with a Tatar-Muslim population. The core of this text is the *Tahlil*, the mentioned above phrase '*La ilaha illa Allah*', which takes a special place in Sufi rituals:[21]

> *"La ilaha illallahnı küp äitegez, mäläiklär,*
> *La ilaha illallahsız qabul bulmyi teläklär.*
> *La ilaha illallahnıng qaramaghyz äzenä,*
> *La ilaha illallahbyz mänge betmäshäzinä.*
> *La ilaha illallahbyz – ul bit Sirat baskychy,*
> *La ilaha illallahnbyz jide Tämugh yapkychy…"*

> /Repeat *La ilaha illallah* many times, angels,
> Without *La ilaha illallah* wishes are not accepted.
> Do not look at *La ilaha illallah* as at /something/ small,
> The treasury of *La ilaha illallah* is endless.
> *La ilaha illallah* - it is a step of the *Sirat* /bridge/,
> *La ilaha illallah* is a lock for seven *Tamugh* /Hell…/

<p style="text-align:right">(Yaghfarov, 2000: 127)</p>

Like the examples above, this text is interpreted by Muslims (as well as by modern researchers of Tatar folklore) as a *monajat* and is recited in the same performing tradition.

Figure 1: Monajat '*La ilaha illa Allah*' (Sayfullina, 2001)

---

[21] A description of the rules for the execution of *dhikr* with the *tahlil* formula can be found in a wide range of Sufi sources and research materials, in particular, in the works by J. Trimingham, F. Meier (1999), A. Papas (2014), A. Hismatulin (who mentions that "*tahlil* was adopted in some brotherhoods, including Naqshbandiya, as a collective form of dhikr". – Hismatulin, 1996: 79). Similar information, although with some irony, is given in the above mentioned atheistic edition *Ishannar-dervishlar* (Mozaffari, 1931).

As a whole, this style is characterized by the type of melodies which are similar to the so-called 'book tunes' (*kitap küe*) which serve as the basis for the recitation of books. Restrained, narrative, devoid of chanting and rich ornamentation, which distinguishes other Tatar songs, these tunes are not considered music by Muslims. (It is significant that they would never say 'singing *monajat*', but - 'uttering' or 'reading' *monajat*). In the popular culture of the 20th century, religious texts of this kind are predominantly performed without instrumental accompaniment.[22] For the most part, these are solo performances: a singer (as a rule, an elderly woman) recites, holding a written (handwritten or printed) text in her hands. However, with the return of Islamic traditions to the public space (in the form of open worship services and even concerts), group performance without a written text becomes natural.

Photo 02. Reciting monajats. Archa village, Tatarstan. Photo G. Sayfullina 1996

As a rule, the recitation of religious texts (both in groups and solo) can be observed at religious holidays, celebrations of which have become increasingly active in recent years. The most important of them are *Mawlud*,[23] when a cycle of texts is chanted in honor of the birthday of the prophet Muhammad, and, especially, at *Ramadan* (in Tatar

---

[22]Although from the historical sources we know about the facts of the performance of spiritual verses by Tatars with *daf* and *tanbur*.

[23] The tradition of celebration Mawlud in the Tatar-Muslim milieu is associated with the initiative of the above-mentioned *Naqshbandi* shaykh of the beginning of the 20th century Zaynulla Rasulev.

– *Ramazan*). It is noteworthy that it was the ritual of Ramadan celebration that proved to be a special factor contributing to the preservation of the *dhikr* tradition in the Tatar community, both in Arabic and Tatar.

In the days of Ramadan, it is recommended to conduct an additional prayer, *Tarawih*, within which, in particular, all the basic formulas of the *dhikr* are loudly repeated.

A special element in the celebration of Ramadan is the ritual of farewell to the holy month, called '*Alvidag*' (literally: farewell[24]). This is another example of the changes that have affected the perception of religious traditions among the Tatars in the 20th century. The recitation of the texts of '*Alvidag*' (both in Arabic and Tatar), possibly connected with the Sufi ritual, became a national tradition during Ramadan; however, according to expeditionary observations, and to some written materials, one can conclude that during the Soviet era, '*Alvidag*' was conceived in the context of the *monajats*.[25]

A couplet from the Tatar text of '*Alvidag'*:

> "*Kidarersan illa bezdan*
> *Barlyk hasrat, alvidag;*
> *Alvidagu, alvidagu, hush kildeng,*
> *Shahri Ramazan, alvidag.*
> *La ilaha illallahu,*
> *La ilaha illallah…*"[26]

> /You take away
> All sorrows, *alvidag;*
> *Alvidagu, alvidagu,* you were welcomed,
> *Shahri Ramazan, alvidag /*now farewell/.
> *La ilaha illallahu,*
> *La ilaha illallah…/*

---

[24] Another, less used term with the same meaning is *Alfiraq*.
[25]A noteworthy example: in the archive of the mentioned above composer Sultan Ghabashi, there is a recording of the melody that is titled by him 'Dhikr (*Alvidag*)'. Next to the title, is the pencil remark (made, apparently, by an employee of the archive): '*Monajat*' (Ghabashi: n.d.).
[26] Recorded from Minnebika Hazieva (b. 1920), Or village of the Baltach district, Tatarsan in 1995.

Figure 2: Alvidag (Nigmedzyanov, 1984: 113)[27]

Conclusion

The understanding of the *dhikr* as a remembrance of God, which is obligatory for every Muslim, remained at the basis of the attitude to this ritual for Tatars at different times, even in decades of atheism, when public forms of worship were persecuted. This explains the veneration of the *dhikr* (as evidenced by folklore texts) and the preservation of this tradition as part of everyday prayer.

Meanwhile, the gradual weakening and actual disappearance of Sufi culture by the end of the 20th century meant the disappearance of both the practice and the very idea of the Sufi *dhikr* for Muslims. Traditions associated with the forms of Sufi rituals of the past now find themselves in the 'field' of musical and poetic folklore, namely, in the repertoire and the style of chanted *monajats*. However, while preserving a number of structural elements of the *dhikr* (characterizing the formerly popular *Yasawian* texts), this genre is in no way connected with Sufi practice for performers. The same can be said about the *dhikrs* that sound during religious holidays — a tradition that has become increasingly popular in recent years, but is awaiting special research from these angles.

REFERENCES

Algar, Hamid. (1992). "The Last Great Naqshbandi Shaykh of the Volga-Urals Region" *Muslims in Central Asia. Expressions of Identity and Change*. Ed. by Jo-Ann Gross: pp. 112-133. Duke University Press.

Algar, Hamid. (1976). "Silent and Vocal Dhikr in the Naqshbandi Order" *Akten desVII Konggresses fur Arabistik und Islamwissenchaft* (Papers of the VII Congress for Arabic and Islamic Studies)*, Dietrich, Albert (Ed.), (*pp. 39-46.), Gottingen: Vandenhoek & Ruprecht

---

[27] The lack of text here is explained by the fact that for ethnomusicologists of the Soviet era, such a form was the only way to publish melodies related to religious rituals.

Babadjanov, Bakhtiyar (2008). "О видах зикра *джахр* у братств Центральной Азии" (About the types of *dhikr jahr* among the brotherhoods of Central Asia) *Собрание фетв по обоснованию зикраджахр и* сама' (A collection of fatwas on the rationale of dhikr *jahr* and *sama'*). Ed. Bakhtiyar Babadjanov, Saidakbar Muhammaddaminov: pp. 205-222. Almaty, Tashkent/Uzbekistan: Дайк-Пресс.

Baqırghan (2000) *Бакырган китабы. 12-18 йөз төрки-татар шагыйрләре әсәрләре*. (Baqırghan kitabı. Works of the Turkic-Tatar poets of the 12-18 centuries).Ed. F. Yahin. Kazan/Russia: Tatar Book Publications.

Bustanov, Alfrid. (2016). "Суфизм в России: proetcontra" (Sufism in Russia: proetcontra). *Реальное время* (Real Time), 31.10.2016. Retrieved from https://realnoevremya.ru/articles/46721

Bustanov, Alfrid. (2011). Накшбандийский обряд *хатм-и хваджаган* в Сибири (The Naqshbandi *hatm-I hwajagan* ritual in Siberia). Retrieved from http://dumrf.ru/islam/rites/2123.

DeWeese, Devin. (2003). "Йасавийа" *Ислам на территории бывшей Российской империи. Энциклопедическийсловарь*, Вып.4. ("Yasawiya". *Encyclopedic Dictionary Islam in the territory of the former Russian Empire)*. Ed. Stanislav M. Prozorov: pp. 35-38. Moskow/ Russia: Vostochnaya Literatura.

DeWeese, Devin. (1996). "The Mashā'ikh-i Turk and the Khojagān: Rethinking the Links between the Yasavī and Naqshbandī Sufi Traditions" *Journal of Islamic Studies*, 7(2): 180-207.

Djumaev, Alexander. (2001).: "Зикр в теории и практике Яссавийя" (Dhikr in theory and practice of Yassawi and Yassawiya). *Тамыр* (Tamyr). 2(4). Retrieved from *http://ru-sufi.livejournal.com/193507.html*

Djumaev, Alexander. (2016). "Religious Music and Chant in the Culture of Sedentary-Dwellers" *The Music of Central Asia*. Ed. Theodore Levin, Saida Daukeyeva, and Elmira Köchümkulova: pp. 379-398. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Feldman, Walter. (1992). "Musical Genres and Zikir of the Sunni Tarikats of Istanbul" *The Dervish Lodge. Architecture, Art and Sufism in Ottoman Turkey*. Ed. Raymond Lifchez: pp.187-202. California: California University Press.

Ghabashi, Sultan (n.d.). (Archive of the Institute of Language, Literature and Arts of the Academy of Sciences of Tatarstan Republic). Fond 60, register 1, the storage unit 4.

Hismatulin, Aleksey (1996). *Суфийская ритуальная практика (на примере братства Накшбандийа*). (Sufi ritual practice (the brotherhood of Naqshbandiyya). St. Petersburg/Russia: Petersburg Oriental Studies.

Husnullin, Kutdus (2001). *Мөнәҗәтләр һәм бәетләр: кәйләп укуга нигезләнгән жанрлар*. (*Monajats* and *bayets*: the forms based on chant). Kazan/Russia: Rannur.

Ibragim, Taufik (2017). Interview in «БИЗНЕС Online» (Business Online). Retrieved from https://www.business-gazeta.ru/article/344590 19.04.2017

Ishmuhametov, Zarif (1979). *Социальная роль и эволюция ислама в Татарии. Исторические очерки* (The social role and evolution of Islam in Tatarstan. (Historical essays). Kazan/Russia: Tatar Book Publications.

Kemper, Michael. (1998). *Sufis und Gelehrte in Tatarien und Baschkirien. Der islamische Diskurs unter russischer Herrschaft*. (Sufis and scholars in Tatarstan and Bashkortostan). Berlin: Klaus Schwarz Verlag.

Köprülü, Mehmed Fuad. (2006). *Early Mystics in Turkish Literature*. Trans., ed. and with an introduction by Gary Leiser and Robert Dankoff. Foreword by Devin DeWeese. Taylor & Francis e-Library. (Original work published 1918).

Makarov, Gennadiy. (2011). *Дәрвишләрнең сөхбәтендә. Бәетләр һәм мөнәҗәтләр*. (In the company of dervishes. *Bayets* and *monajats*) Kazan/Russia: Tatar Book Publications.

Maksudi Ahmadhadi. (1892). *Ghiybadate Islamiya.* Kazan/Russia: Publishing House of Brothers Karimov.

Matveev, Sergei. (1895). *Мухаммеданский рассказ о Св. Деве Марии* (Muhammadan story of St. Mary). Text and translation. Kazan/Russia: Printing House of the Imperial University.

Meier, Fritz. (1999). *Essays on Islamic Rituals and Mysticism*. (O'Kane, John, Trans.). Leiden/Boston/Koln: Brill.

Mijit, Mukaddas. (2016). "Sufism and the Ceremony of Dhikr in Ghulja" *The Music of Central Asia*. Ed. Theodore Levin, Saida Daukeyeva, and Elmira Köchümkulova: pp. 399-405. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Mozaffari, Zarif. (1931). Işannar-dərvişlər (The ishans-dervishes). Kazan/Russia: Janalif.

Nigmedzyanov, Mahmud. (1984). НигмедзяновМахмуд. Татарские народные песни (Tatar folk songs). Kazan/Russia: Tatar Publishing House.

Papas, Alexandre. (2014). "Creating a Sufi Soundscape: Recitation (dhikr) and audition (*sama'*) according to Ahmad Kāsānī Dahbıdı (d. 1542)" *Performing Islam*. 3: 25-43.

Rasulev, Zaynulla. (2001). "Божественные истины, постижение которых необходимо для мюридов Накшбандийа, славословия [Аллаху] и молитвы «салават» (1899)". (Divinetruths, comprehension of which is necessary for *murids* of the Sufi brotherhood of *Naqshbandiya*, together with the Thanks giving to Allah and prayers, 1899) Аль-Эрбили (al-Erbili). *Книга вечных даров. О достоинствах и похвальных качествах суфийского братства Накшбандийа и его Пути к Богу* (The book of eternal gifts. On the merits and meritorious qualities of the Sufi brotherhood of Naqshbandiya and his Path to God). (Ilshat Nasyrov, Trans.) Ufa/Russia: Kitab

Rorlich, Azade Ayse. (1983). "Sufism in Tatarstan: deep roots and new concerns" *Central Asian Survey,* II(4): 37-45.

Sayfullina, Guzel [audiorecorder]. (2001). Recitation of religious texts by Amina Ibrahimova, b. 1935, in the Cylna village. Tatarstan. [Audio field recordings of music]. July, 27, 2001. Amsterdam, The Netherlands: Private Collection.

Sayfullina, Guzel. (2005). *Багышлауга багышлау. Багышлау (посвящения) в контексте культуры народного ислама волжских татар* (Baghishlau – Ritual dedications in the context of the folk Islam of the Volga Tatars). Kazan/Russia: Iman.

Sayfullina, Guzel. (2009). "Категория «кэйле китап» в музыкально-поэтической культуре татар-мусульман" (The *küyle kitap* category in the musical-poetical culture of Tatar Muslims) *Музыка народов мира: проблемы изучения* (World music: problems of learning*)*. Ed. Violetta Yunusova and Alexander Kharuto: pp. 129-141. Moskow/Russia: Moscow state conservatory.

Sayfullina, Guzel. (2015). "Наследие Йасавийа в евразийском пространстве. Традиции волжских мусульман" (The Yasawiya legacy in the Eurasian space. Traditions of the Volga Muslims) *Ладовые коммуникации в евразийском музыкальном пространстве* (Mode communications in the Eurasian music space). Ed. Larisa Brazhnik: pp. 49-60. Kazan/Russia, Kazan state conservatory.

Sayfullina, Guzel. (2017). "Татарский мунаджат: трансформация жанра" (Tatar Munajat: transformation of the genre) *Музыка народов мира*. Вып. 2. *изучения* (World music.Vol. 2*)*. Ed. Violetta Yunusova and Alexander Kharuto: p. 219-234. Moskow/Russia: Moscow State Conservatory.

Sayfullina, Guzel. (ed.) (2015): *Антология татарской богословской мысли. Ислам и музыка. Х.-Г.Габаши, Р.Фахретдин, Г.Баруди, Х.Кильдебаки* (Anthology of Tatar Theological Thought. Islam and Music. H.-G. Ghabashi, R. Fakhreddin, G. Barudi, H. Kildebaki). Kazan/Russia: Tatar Book Publications.

Sultanova, Razia. (2012). "Yassavi *dhikr* in twenty-first century Central Asia: sound, place and authenticity" *Performing Islam,* 1(1):129-151.

Togan, Isenbike. (1999). "The Khafi, Jahri Controversy in Central Asia Revisited" *Naqshbandis in Western and Central Asia. Change and Continuity*. [Conference Held at the Swedish Research Institute in Istanbul] Ozdalga, Elisabeth (Eds.), (pp. 17-46). Istanbul: Swedish Research Institute.

Yaghfarov, Rasid. and Sadikova, Aysylu (Ed.) (2000). *Мөнәҗәтләр* (*Monajats*.). Kazan/Russia: Iman.

Yakupov, Valiulla., (Ed) (2000). *Сокровищница зикра* (Treasury of Dhikr). /Russia: Iman.

Zarcone, Thierry. (2002). "Sufi Lineages and Saint Veneration in Russia, Soviet Tatarstan and Central Asia in the 20th Century" *The Turks*, Ed. Hasan Celâl Güzel and C. Cem Oğuz, Osman Karatay: pp. 93-100. Ankara/Turkey: Yeni Turkiye.

ŞEBNEM SÖZER ÖZDEMİR
Düzce University, Turkey
sebnemsozerozdemir@yahoo.com.tr
orcid.org/0000-0001-5957-4306

Discovering One's Self Through Embodiment of Tradition in *Meşk*: An Analysis of the Mode of Transmission in Turkish Performative Traditions [1]

ABSTRACT

Meşk is a polysemic concept that originates from traditional Turkish music and denotes both an embodied mode of transmission and a participatory performance style that characterizes Turkish performative traditions. As a traditional mode of transmission, it is the face-to-face training method that is based on the pupil's faithful repetition/imitation of the master's performance. As a performance style, it combines repetition with innovation, as it is based on improvisation according to already existing traditional patterns. This idiosyncratic correlation between repetition and change in *meşk* produces a unique aesthetics, in which the performers search for the new that does not get old. This search is connected to the mystical teaching of tasavvuf that is particular to Turkish culture. Following tasavvuf's objective of discovering one's self through disciplining the soul by disciplining the body, the performers of Turkish traditions search for their selves through practicing the arts they try to master. In this manner, they act as a part of the traditional chain that maintains heart-to-heart transmission of spirituality.

---

[1] The article is based on the author's PhD dissertation, which was defended in 2016 in the program "Theatre Theories, Criticism and Dramaturgy" at Ankara University, Turkey. A first draft of the article is presented orally at *The International Federation for Theatre Research World Congress* in July, 2018 (Belgrade, Serbia).

Introduction

One of the most important factors that determine the characteristics of an art form is how it is transmitted. Thanks to scholars who have done research for many years on traditional performing arts of Asia, today it is a well-known fact that the transmission of these arts largely depends on culture-specific methods that prioritize face-to-face, live interaction between master(s) and pupil(s). In this mode of transmission, the pupils are supposed to learn an art by imitating/emulating the performance of their masters.

The focus of this study is the mode of transmission that is particular to the traditional performing arts of Turkey. The arts in question include practices of making music, singing, storytelling, dancing, drama, puppetry, and ritual, which co-exist in various combinations in different genres. These genres are *meddahlık* (urban-based one-man storytelling), *çadır hayal* (puppetry), *kol korçak* (hand puppetry), *karagöz* (shadow puppetry), *ortaoyunu* (urban-based theatre), *köçeklik/çengilik/curcunabazlık* (urban-based dances), rural-based theatre, rural-based dances, *semâ* (Mevlevi ritual), *semah* (Alawite ritual) (And, 2003; And, 2004), *musiki* (urban-based music and singing) (Behar, 2014), the tradition of *saz* (rural-based music and singing), and *âşıklık* (rural-based one-man storytelling with music and singing; minstrelsy) (Başgöz, 2008). Whereas today some of these genres are practiced only in a limited or revived context (*meddahlık*, *karagöz*) and some are not performed at all (*çadır hayal*, *kol korçak*, *ortaoyunu*, *köçeklik/çengilik/curcunabazlık*), other traditions are still living. As studying all these genres within the scope of this article is not reasonable, this research focuses on the genres of music —*musiki*, the tradition of *saz*, and *âşıklık*, which is closely related to and might even be considered as a part of the tradition of *saz*.

Although, in terms of transmission, Turkish performative traditions share basic features with other traditional performing arts in Asia, I would like to avoid the emergence of an orientalist approach that would melt all Asian culture in the same pot. Therefore, I focus on an emic concept that is used to denote the mode of transmission in question —*meşk*. *Meşk*, which is a word of Arabic origin, primarily denotes the face-to-face teaching method in Turkish traditional arts, in which the pupils are expected to observe and imitate/emulate their masters' art as it is. Traditionally, learning a

tradition from a master through *meşk* takes many years and demands a lot of patience from the pupil (Behar, 2014; Gill-Gürtan, 2011; Karahasanoğlu, 2012; Özcan, 2004; Serin, 2004). Nevertheless, *meşk* is a polysemic concept that implies more than just a teaching method or technique. In traditional Turkish music, which is at the focus of this study, it also denotes the actual performance itself, which is an all-encompassing event that does not exclude the teaching, but engrossingly includes the improvisatory creation. One of the most important characteristics of *meşk* as musical performance is being/doing together (Behar, 2014). This renders *meşk* a "participatory performance", which is defined by musicologist and anthropologist Thomas Turino as having "no artist-audience distinctions", so that in its purest realizations there are "only participants and potential participants" (2008: 28). *Meşk* is characterized by another important feature of the participatory performance as well —it is not/cannot be fixed or predetermined (Turino, 2008), as it is shaped by the conditions of here-and-now. In *meşk* performances, musicians improvise by selecting from a range of already-known repertoire of traditional patterns according to certain structural conventions, as well as the momentary actions/reactions of the participants (Behar, 2014).

It is intriguing that *meşk*, which is characterized by faithful repetition as a teaching method, also has space for improvisation and creation, and thus change and innovation as a performance style. Within the scope of this article, I would like to analyze this double-sided nature of *meşk* that is based on an elusive correlation between repetition and change. I argue that this correlation gives Turkish performative traditions their primary characteristics. The performers of these arts search for the new within what already exists. This search is also a search for one's self. Being effected by *tasavvuf* —a mystical Islamic teaching that is particular to Turkish culture— they try to discover their self not only as an artist in the tradition but also as a human being in the world. I argue that, in this manner, they act as vehicles for carrying and transmitting a specific kind of spiritual sensibility through embodying the tradition in *meşk*.

Oral or Embodied Transmission

The face-to-face, live mode of transmission from a teacher/master to a student/pupil is usually referred to as oral transmission in reference to theory of orality.[2] However, is this term really proper and sufficient for identifying the phenomenon that is being discussed? In their recent study on the transmission of Japanese music and dance, Bruno Deschênes and Yuko Eguchi (2018) raise this question. Putting emphasis on the fact that the transmission of these arts is based more on imitating a master corporeally rather than following verbal instructions, they suggest a new term that would include the concept of embodiment into theory of orality:

> There is much more to orality than the oral transmission of knowledge. The acting, moving, learning, feeling, and knowledgeable body play crucial roles beyond what is being transmitted. In fact, a large part of such knowledge cannot be simply put into words. It can be that the master possibly does not want to put it into words or that it is better learned without any verbalization, forms of theory, explanation, or rationalization. [...] Within this practice, the term "orality" is somewhat insufficient, or even inappropriate, because of its reference to the use of verbalization and rationalization. Instead, we suggest "embodied orality" as a more suitable term than "simple orality" (Deschênes and Eguchi, 2018: 59).

This attempt to re-define the term 'oral transmission' by the inclusion of embodiment is quite significant for the analysis of Turkish *meşk*, as it is also based on the pupils' imitation of what the masters actually do in front of them, rather than following certain instructions or explanations (Behar, 2014; Gill-Gürtan, 2011; Karahasanoğlu, 2012; Özcan, 2004).

Historically, *meşk* as a teaching method was first used in traditional calligraphy. In this context, it literally means a piece of calligraphy, which is given by the master to the pupil as a model for learning through imitation (Behar, 2014; Gill-Gürtan, 2011; Serin, 2004; Tüfekçioğlu, 2014). Although at first sight this might look like a literate teaching method, even in calligraphy *meşk* follows the basis of embodied orality; the pieces that are given to the pupils for practice are written by the masters in front of the pupils so

---

[2] When a musical tradition is in question, the studies might instead use the terms aural transmission or oral-aural transmission.

that they can observe how hand and brush move (Tüfekçioğlu, 2014: 112). Over time, the term has been employed by other art forms as well. In the musical context, *meşk* denotes teaching and learning without notation, but only by imitating/emulating the live performance of a master. During a usual *meşk* class in the tradition of *musiki*, the master performs certain musical pieces in front of the pupil, who is expected to listen attentively, then immediately imitate what the master just played/sung to the best of the pupil's ability. It is important to note that the pupils are not allowed to practice alone till the next *meşk* so that they will not learn the pieces incorrectly (Behar, 2014; Özcan, 2004). Nevertheless, this is not simply a superficial imitation of the master's art by the pupil. As Deschênes and Eguchi put forward,

> [i]n much Asian thought, a pupil does not simply imitate or reproduce what is being taught but reconstructs and reappropriates it as if discovering it within the body or, more specifically, the self. […] What one learns is not simply a technique but a way to imprint it within the body (2018: 72).

In other words, what a pupil learns from a master in face-to-face, live mode of transmission is how to 'embody the tradition'. What is expected from the pupils is not mechanically imitating what is being taught but internalizing it so that the tradition begins to live in their bodies. This process of embodiment, whose sine qua non condition is a direct, live interaction between master and pupil, includes the internalization of not only explicit artistic features, but also implicit aspects of an art form, which are connected to social, cultural, emotional, and even spiritual values and sensibilities. In the Turkish context, these implicit aspects are conceptualized as *âdâb*.

Embodiment of *Âdâb*

Âdâb is a polysemic concept in Islam that denotes "a quality conduct that is cultivated or learned" (Gade, 2007: 39) — in other words, knowing how to behave properly as a refined person. In the context of Turkish traditional arts, it additionally means specific rules and subtle nuances of an art (Bayındır, 1988). In fact, as a specific kind of behavioral knowledge, *âdâb* is closely related to embodiment. A Turkish idiom that is used to denote "know how to behave" is, "know how to sit (down) and stand (up)" (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019d).

This connection of *âdâb* with embodiment attracts the attention of anthropologist Rebecca Bryant (2005) in her article on the contemporary practice of the tradition of *saz* in the urban circles of Istanbul. Referring to her own apprenticeship of *saz* — general name given to musical instruments in Turkey, especially a stringed instrument (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019f)—, Bryant recounts that in this context learning music is strongly related to a process of constructing one's self or what she calls "empersonment":

> [L]essons were about much more than learning to play the saz; they were about learning to become the type of person who could play the saz. This is a process that I call here "empersonment", a process that is realized through a discipline by which one consciously and consistently imprints a practice on the body (Bryant, 2005: 223)

In order to elaborate on her argument, Bryant cites Ira Lapidus, who claims that *âdâb* "bears the meaning of the Latin, *habitus* —an acquired faculty, rooted in the soul" (Lapidus, 1984: 53, as cited in Bryant, 2005: 234). She states that, unlike Pierre Bourdieu's *habitus* that works at the unconscious level (Bourdieu, 1984: 466, as cited in Bryant, 2005: 237), *âdâb* implies a conscious disciplining of the soul through disciplining of the body with "constant practice and repetition" (Lapidus, 184: 55, as cited in Bryant, 2005: 234). This is, in fact, what ideally happens in *meşk*. As Bryant explains, "an important part of learning the saz involves memorization" but "that memorization is pointless without an aesthetic, within which the songs memorized can be decoded" (2005: 228). A good *saz* pupil does not just repeat, but acquires the aesthetic ability to hear what is coded in the songs, that is, "the sensibility through which the songs are produced" (Bryant, 2005: 234). This ability is acquired "precisely through the memorization of songs" (Bryant, 2005: 228). In short, according to Bryant, becoming a good *saz* player "implies acquisition of an aesthetic, embodiment of a practice, and expression of one's mastery of that knowledge in one's behavior" (2005: 234).

In her article on historical and contemporary forms of performing *meşk* in Turkish music, Denise Gill-Gürtan (2011) makes similar observations regarding her own experience of learning *musiki*. As she argues, *meşk*

implies much more than lessons bounded in space and time. Indeed, more than repertoire was to be learned [...], as apprentices were also taught style, taste, and how to live (Gill-Gürtan, 2011: 616).

In the past, the scope of *meşk* was not limited to the study of music. A student was also thoroughly schooled in ethics, culture, socialization, respect, style, and "how to be". Elements of this type of education are still present today, as two of my teachers insisted that I follow them to rehearsals, recording studios, and recitals to observe them and learn how to interact in diverse social settings. One teacher [...] demonstrated how important this "other" social education was by telling me that spending an hour drinking tea and talking with him was almost more important than spending an hour learning music from him (Gill-Gürtan, 2011: 620).

Apparently, here there is something that cannot be transmitted solely through teaching/learning musical pieces. In order to learn the tradition, the pupils are supposed to observe and emulate how the tradition is embodied by their masters beyond regular lessons, but in everyday life. Because, in this context, learning the tradition inevitably involves cultivation of one's self. This fact connects *meşk* to the teaching of *tasavvuf*. Echoing Bryant's (2005) and Gill-Gürtan's (2011) analyses of learning Turkish music as a process of empersonment*, tasavvuf* is essentially characterized by the intention of 'discovering oneself' or 'discovering one's self' as the ultimate purpose of a human being. Similar to other esoteric traditions, *tasavvuf* especially values face-to-face interaction between master(s) and pupil(s), as it supposes that the spiritual 'secrets' cannot be simply put into words or written down, but should be discovered by the devotees themselves in their own 'self'. That is why the followers of *tasavvuf* have developed certain bodily practices, which would work as vehicles for the pupils on their long path towards discovering one's self. Among them the arts of storytelling, music and dance play a prominent role. *Tasavvuf* is well-known for the special ritual called *semâ*, which is composed of praying, singing, music, and a special kind of whirling movement. It is important to note that specific lessons for teaching pupils how to perform *semâ* are also called *meşk* (Gölpınarlı, 2006).

This idea of self-cultivation or self-discovery in *tasavvuf* is largely embraced by traditional performing arts of Turkey. In his study that focuses on the ethics of *meşk* in *musiki*, sociologist Güneş Ayas points out that as a teaching system *meşk* aims to breed

not only a musician but also a "*kâmil insan*" (2015: 9) —a *tasavvuf* term, which can be translated into English as one "who has reached spiritual maturity" (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019c). The tradition assumes that this spiritual maturity would be acquired through performing music for years, if not decades or a whole life, so that the pupil would be able to fully embody the *âdâb* of *musiki* and eventually become a master. It is true that in the system of *meşk*, due to the faithful repetition of a master, the pupils learn first to play and/or sing in their masters' performance style. However, what is expected from them over time and eventually is creating their own original styles so that they can now be called a master (Ayas, 2015). In short, for becoming a master, a pupil is supposed to discover one's 'self' in the tradition itself. This is what Bryant (2005) calls empersonment. As she explains, the type of apprenticeship she describes

> entails a deliberate shaping of the self in the mold of traditional knowledge. [...] one empersons a body of knowledge that also contains a set of values, both ethical and aesthetic. As a person shaped by that body of knowledge, one works, lives, and innovates. [...]

> Hence, an aesthetics of self, as the self-conscious process by which one undertakes self-making, depends on empersonment, or the recursive techniques of apprenticeship through which one habituates oneself in a tradition (Bryant, 2005: 234).

In this sense, through *meşk* the pupil discovers one's self not only as an artist, but also as a human being. This renders the pupil a living vehicle for the transmission of not only an art but also the spirituality that is inherent in the art itself. This connection of transmission of traditional arts with the transmission of spirituality is summarized very well in a well-known Turkish idiom: "*Aşk olmadan meşk olmaz* (There can be no *meşk* without love)" (Behar, 2014; Gill-Gürtan, 2011). It is important to note that the precondition of discovering one's self in *tasavvuf* is filling one's heart with love, especially to God, and to act accordingly (Gölpınarlı, 2006).

Before going into the details of this phenomenon of spiritual transmission in *meşk*, I would like to discuss first why face-to-face interaction is a prerequisite for attaining artistic mastery in Turkish performative traditions. According to the bearers of traditional Turkish music, a notation is in no way sufficient for learning this art and the priority has to be given to taking *meşk* classes from a qualified master (Ayas, 2015;

Behar, 2014; Karahasanoğlu, 2012). One of the reasons underlying this claim is that the specific structure of Turkish music does not tolerate otherwise.

Makam: The Structure of *Meşk*

Turkish music is based on a specific structural system called *makam*, which is also known as *maqam* in the Arab world[3] (Özkan, 2003; Touma, 1971). According to this system, each musical piece has to belong to a *makam*, although there can be infinite pieces in a *makam* (Behar, 2014; Özkan, 2003).

The dictionary meaning of *makam* is "location", "station", and "position" (Uludağ, 2003). In music, this basically corresponds to the existence of a predetermined spatial organization, which is particular to each *makam* and should be followed by all musicians. As Palestinian composer and ethnomusicologist Habib Hassan Touma explains,

> [t]he development of a *maqam* is always determined by two primary factors: space (tonal) and time (temporal). The structure of a *maqam* depends upon the extent to which these two factors exhibit a fixed or free organization. The tonal-spatial component is organized, molded, and emphasized to such a degree that it represents the essential and decisive factor in the *maqam*; whereas the temporal aspect in this music is not subject to any definite form of organization. In this unique circumstance lies the most essential feature of the *maqam* phenomenon, i.e., a free organization of the rhythmic-temporal and an obligatory and fixed organization of the tonal-spatial factor (1971: 38).

These sui generis characteristics of *makam* system are often misunderstood by Western musicians. Touma points out how *maqam* "has sometimes been regarded as music improvised without form" as the musicians do not follow a score while performing (1971: 39). However, this is not improvisation in the Western sense, as the tonal-spatial structure of a *makam* is fixed. However, as no score is followed by the performers, unavoidably no presentation of a *makam* "can be identical to any other. Each time it is re-created as a new composition" (Touma, 1971: 47).

---

[3] This system is known as *mugam* in Azerbaijan, *shash-maqom* in Uzbekistan, *dastgah* in Iran, and *raga* in India (Özkan, 2003; Touma, 1971).

A similar correlation between definite patterns and free organization is also active in how a story is told in the tradition of *âşıklık*. As explained by Turkish folklorist and *âşıklık* expert İlhan Başgöz (2008), an *âşık* (storyteller; minstrel) never repeats a performance twice. This does not mean that they create new songs and new stories each time they perform. Rather these storytellers select from already existing traditional patterns and re-compose them according to the moment, that is, when, where, and to whom the story is told. As a result, although the basic structure of the story is the same, the text of the story is created during the performance itself, fading away into the memory of the *âşık* when the performance is over. This is true also for *ortaoyunu*, *meddahlık*, and *karagöz* traditions, as the performers create a new text in each performance by improvising according to the moment (And, 2004; Arıcı, 2011).

But if a *makam* or a story is re-created as a new composition/a new text each time it is performed, then what the pupil has to learn from the master are apparently not scores or texts, but how to accomplish recreation in each realization. Certainly, acquiring such a skill is not easy. In order to be a master, the pupils have to learn the subtle rules of the art they are practicing. In the context of Turkish music, one of these subtle rules is related to the progression of intervals in the *makam*s. Different from Western music, Turkish music has a microtonal structure and the location of frets might change microtonally when one moves between the intervals of a *makam*. These changes cannot really be notated, but have to be learned through live interaction with a master. The tradition of *musiki* calls this phenomenon *sır perdeleri* (Ayas, 2015: 90), which can be translated into English as "secret frets" or "frets of mystery" (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019e; *Sesli Sözlük*, 2019g). This naming is not innocent of reason, as *sır* (secret; mystery) is a very significant term in *tasavvuf* (Uludağ, 2003). In fact, many terms in traditional music, including *makam* itself have been taken from *tasavvuf* (Ayas, 2015: 84).

In *tasavvuf*, *makam* denotes the symbolic stages —or stations— of a dervish, which s/he should pass on the path towards self-cultivation. According to this esoteric teaching, each *makam* is related to a certain emotion and living through these emotions is quite necessary for a dervish (Gade, 2007; Uludağ, 2003). Not surprisingly, the tradition of *musiki*, which is considered by *tasavvuf* as an important vehicle for self-cultivation, relates each *makam* to a specific emotion as well. In his article on the effects

of *musiki* on human beings, religious music researcher Ruhi Kalender (1987) draws attention to how theoretical works of the past have considered certain *makams* as capable of generating certain emotions in the hearts of audiences. Nevertheless, as he points out, scholars of the past were not interested in the *makams* as tools of entertainment or enjoyment, but they aimed to understand and explain how the human soul is fondled by music so that it is reminded of its connection with the sacred world:

> [T]he soul comes to light through easily produced tunes and beautiful performance. Thus it remembers its relationship with the souls in the high rank and contiguity with the higher world. For this, it moves its body. It turns it like the heavens, at the same time it turns it to its source, from where it has come. As a matter of fact, Plato said [...]: when one listens to a musical work in its perfect form, s/he would be carried away and intoxicated due to the beautiful spiritual emotions it generates (Kalender, 1987: 361–362).

Considering all these facts about the *makam* system, it would be appropriate to argue that what is transmitted through *meşk* system in Turkish performative traditions is beyond artistic expertise, but involves a significant aspect of spirituality.

Heart-to-Heart Transmission of Spirituality

Although I have used it until now, the bearers of Turkish performative traditions do not, and probably would not use the term face-to-face for describing their mode of transmission. In the tradition of *âşıklık*, the interaction that is particular to the transmission of this art is considered as happening *sine*-to-*sine*.[4] Although *sine* basically corresponds to the breast in English, it also implies the inside of the breast, therefore the heart, both physically and metaphorically (*Büyük Türkçe Sözlük*, 2019b). An alternative to the term *sine*-to-*sine* is *gönül*-to-*gönül*. *Gönül* is an idiosyncratic Turkish word, which is extensively used in *tasavvuf* (Gölpınarlı, 2006; Kurnaz, 1996). Although the primary meaning of *gönül* is again, the heart, it also denotes the source of the feelings in the heart. Besides, in *tasavvuf*, it corresponds to the power in the depths of

---

[4] In her article on Iranian Azerbaijani *âşıklık* tradition, Charlotte F. Albright quotes the words of an *âşık* while describing how the transmission of a piece occurred: "He said that the poem had been handed down *sinah be sinah* (chest to chest, that is, orally) for years" (1976: 239). Azerbaijani *âşık*s perform in Azeri Turkish, which is very similar to Turkish that is spoken in Turkey.

the soul that would allow a person to connect with the world, other human beings, and God (*Büyük Türkçe Sözlük*, 2019a), as well as the location of love (Kurnaz, 1996). As mentioned earlier, love and having one's heart full of love has primary significance in *tasavvuf*. As a part of their self-cultivation process, the followers of *tasavvuf* are supposed to interact with everybody and everything around them with love and respect, that is, from their *gönül*. In this sense, acting from *gönül* and interacting with others *gönül*-to-*gönül* is a significant part of the *âdâb* of *tasavvuf* (Gölpınarlı, 2006).

This affective aspect in the *âdâb* of *tasavvuf* is substantially embraced by Turkish performative traditions. A perfect piece of evidence is that *âşık* means "lover" and being "in love" in Turkish (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019a). It is a term borrowed in the 16th century by Turkish storytelling tradition from *tasavvuf* (Heziyeva, 2010). Echoing the idiom "There can be no *meşk* without love", an *âşık* is assumed to sing and/or play from his/her *gönül*, that is, their heart full of love. This is also true for a master of *musiki* or the tradition of *saz*. The lyrics of the song called *Gönül Dağı* (The Mountain of *Gönül*; 1992), which is written and composed by a well-known 20th century master of the tradition of *saz* called Neşet Ertaş (1938-2012) tells us the secret that "*Kalpten kalbe giden bir yol vardır, görülmez / Gönülden gönüle gider yol gizli gizli* (There is a way from heart to heart, which is not seen / It goes from *gönül* to *gönül*)" (*TRT Nota Arşivi*, 2011). In this sense, it would not be wrong to say that according to the unwritten rules of its *âdâb*, participating with one's *gönül* is an indispensable precondition for *meşk*. To be a part of this specific performance, one has to not only know, but also embody this basic principle. This knowledge involves the embodiment of a traditional attitude as well.

The Quest for the 'Ancient Attitude'

Attitude —*tavır* in Turkish (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019h)— is another significant term that is particular to Turkish performative traditions, especially in the genres of music. Although it also denotes the performance style that is particular to a region or a context, *tavır* basically means the performance style of a master (Behar, 2014; Öztürk, 2002). In this manner, having an attitude is very much related to what Bryant (2005) calls empersonment. The masters of Turkish music are considered as having an attitude when they make the tradition their own. However, performing with an attitude should not mean being discordant with the tradition. In fact, each genre has its own

specific attitude to which all practitioners must conform, even if they perform with a personal attitude. Using *meşk* as a teaching method is quite significant for the transmission of this genre-specific attitude.

Ayas (2015) suggests that one of the important advantages of the system of *meşk* is providing the transmission of *tavr-ı kadim* —a concept that can be translated into English as "ancient attitude" (*Sesli Sözlük*, 2019b):

> *Kadim* is a tradition that is transmitted to today from master to pupil in a chain; its starting point, which was in the distant past, cannot be hunted out. […] here "*kadim*" is different from "old" in ordinary language and essentially means "the new that does not get old". The key concept of traditionalism is the "precedent". A new thing can only be made according to the precedent. This is the most important tension area between the traditionalist mentality that looks for a precedent in the past for any kind of innovation, and the modern mentality that goes in search of the new without any precedent (Ayas, 2015: 86).

This specific aspect of creating while repeating the precedent in Turkish traditional performing arts becomes most visible while a performer improvises in a *meşk*. As American ethnomusicologist Karl Signell points out, improvisation is an important aesthetic element in Turkish music:

> [E]very instrumentalist is judged by his ability to improvise. Alone and exposed during the solo <u>taksim</u> (improvisation), he must create an impromptu composition showing his own originality and flair for invention as well as correctly following the commonly understood guidelines for the stated <u>makam</u> (mode) (1974: 45).

Here the interesting point is that the performers are appreciated most when they find a balance between repetition and innovation. As Signell explains,

> [e]ach makam has associated with it a stock of commonly recognized characteristic motives and phrases. If the artist belabors the cliches in his taksim, he will be yawned at but accepted. If he can produce an original motive or phrase of some succinctness and beauty, he will be applauded and shown respect by his peers. The greatest compliment is given […] when a musician borrows another's phrase for his own taksim (1974: 47).

In other words, the musicians are most respected when they create something new according to a precedent. In fact, this is what is at the core of the traditional aesthetics in Turkish performing arts. What comes out in and through *meşk* is not simply a repetition of the old, but the creation of something that is new and old at the same time. This renders the centuries-old practice of *meşk* as an unending search for the new that does not get old. As Bryant sums up, in this context

> [t]radition, then, can be understood as a sensibility acquired through repetition, as one shapes oneself to become the type of person capable not only of further repetition but also, more importantly, of innovation (2005: 231).

Conclusion: Tradition Here-and-Now

Throughout this article, I aimed to display distinctive qualities of *meşk*, which is not only a mode of transmission, but also an idiosyncratic performance style that is particular to traditional performing arts of Turkey. I argued that Turkish performative traditions are shaped by these qualities to a great extent.

What characterizes *meşk* is the live, direct, largely embodied and highly affective interaction between its actors. The implicit purpose of such an interaction is disciplining the soul by disciplining the body so that the participants of *meşk* can discover their self not only as an artist, but also as a human being, as it is aimed in Turkish esoteric teaching of *tasavvuf*. This discovery, which is, in fact, a process of empersonment, is ensured by the transmission of *âdâb* (cultivated behaviour) through constant practice in *meşk*, as well as the employment of structural system called *makam*, which demands that the performers of *meşk* innovate while at the same time repeating what already exists as 'traditional'. In this sense, performing *meşk* might be considered as a ceaseless quest for the new that does not get old. According to the traditional perspective, the essential prerequisite for this quest to succeed is maintaining heart-to-heart transmission of unwritten, unspoken secrets in the arts in question, which can only be embodied and taught by a qualified master. This is how Turkish performative traditions have survived for centuries until today. Such a mode of transmission is certainly fragile, as it depends on living people, who must inevitably act here-and-now. Nevertheless, as there is no other way of transmitting the secrets in

question, it is very precious as well. *Meşk* is a phenomenon that cannot be spoken, written down and/or kept frozen in an archive. It would either happen here-and-now through heart-to-heart interaction between living people, or cease to exist.

This study attracts attention to all these idiosyncratic qualities of *meşk* with an aim of demonstrating its significance as an effective and powerful mode of transmission. As it is seen throughout the article, maintaining the vitality of *meşk* is crucial for the future of Turkish performative traditions. On the other hand, understanding its subtle qualities and displaying how it works would pave the way for its employment by non-traditional arts as well, as it can act as a model for embodied transmission. In this sense, the discussion in this article aims to contribute not only to researches on performative traditions, but also to innovative approaches in the transmission of contemporary performing arts.

REFERENCES

Albright, Charlotte F. (1976). "The Azerbaijani *Cāshiq* and His Performance of a *Dāstān*" *Iranian Studies*. 9(4): 220–247.

And, Metin. (2003). *Oyun ve Bügü: Türk Kültüründe Oyun Kavramı* (*Oyun* and *Bügü*: The Concept of Play in Turkish Culture). Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications. [Original work published 1974, İş Bankası Kültür Publications]

And, Metin. (2004). *Başlangıcından 1983'e Türk Tiyatro Tarihi* (The History of Turkish Theatre: From its Beginning to 1983). Istanbul: İletişim Publications.

Arıcı, Oğuz. (2011). "*Geleneksel Türk Tiyatrosunun Ölümü* (The Death of Traditional Turkish Theatre)" *İstanbul Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Tiyatro Eleştirmenliği ve Dramaturji Bölüm Dergisi* (Istanbul University Journal of Theatre Criticism and Dramaturgy). 19: 1-31.

Ayas, Güneş. (2015). "*Alâeddin Yavaşça ve Meşk Ahlakı: Yaşayan Bir Geleneğin Sosyolojik Analizi* (Alâeddin Yavaşça and the Ethics of *Meşk*: Sociological Analysis of a Living Tradition)" *Sosyologca*. 9: 81-96.

Başgöz, İlhan. (2008). *Hikâye*: *Turkish Folk Romance as Performance Art*. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Press.

Bayındır, Abdülaziz. (1988). "*Âdâb*" *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (TDV Islam Encyclopedia), Vol. 1, Ed. Mustafa Birol Ülker: pp. 334. Istanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Foundation.

Behar, Cem. (2014). *Aşk Olmayınca Meşk Olmaz: Geleneksel Osmanlı/Türk Müziğinde Öğretim ve İntikal* (There can be no *Meşk* without Love: Teaching and Transmission in Ottoman/Turkish Music). Istanbul: Yapı Kredi Publications. [Original work published 1988].

Bourdieu, Pierre. (1984). *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste* (Nice, Richard, Trans.) Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bryant, Rebecca. (2005). "The Soul Danced into the Body: Nation and Improvisation in Istanbul" *American Ethnologist.* 32(2): 222-238.

Büyük Türkçe Sözlük (Great Turkish Dictionary). (2019a, 10.12.2019). *Gönül.* Retrieved from
http://www.tdk.gov.tr/index.php?option=com_bts&arama=kelime&guid=TDK.GTS.558a5a54dd2a47.89688061

Büyük Türkçe Sözlük (Great Turkish Dictionary). (2019b, 10.12.2019). *Sine.* Retrieved from
http://www.tdk.gov.tr/index.php?option=com_bts&arama=kelime&guid=TDK.GTS.558a5a5be4ed00.97714534

Deschênes, Bruno; Eguchi, Yuko. (2018). "Embodied Orality: Transmission in Traditional Japanese Music" *Asian Music.* 49(1): 58-79.

Gade, M. Anna. (2007). "Islam" *The Oxford Handbook of Religion and Emotion*, Ed. John Corrigan: pp. 35–47. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Gill-Gürtan, Denise. (2011). "Performing *Meşk*, Narrating History: Legacies of Transmission in Contemporary Turkish Musical Practices" *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East.* 31(3): 615-630.

Gölpınarlı, Abdülbaki. (2006). *Mevlevi Âdâb ve Erkânı* (Mevlevi *Âdâb* and *Erkân*). İstanbul: İnkılap Kitabevi Publications.

Heziyeva, Şergiyye. (2010). "*Kars Âşıklık Geleneği ve Badeli Âşık* (Kars Minstrel Tradition and Minstrel with *Bade*)" *Atatürk Üniversitesi Türkiyat Araştırmaları Enstitüsü Dergisi* (Ataturk University Journal of Turkish Researches Institute). 44: 211-225.

Kalender, Ruhi. (1987). "*Türk Musikisi'nde Kullanılan Makamların Tesirleri* (The Effects of the *Makam*s used in Turkish *Musiki*)" *Ankara Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi* (Journal of the Faculty of Divinity of Ankara University). 29(1): 361-375.

Karahasanoğlu, Songül. (2012). "*Meşk*: The Traditional Teaching System of Turkish Music" *Journal of Teaching and Education*. 1(7): 165-170.

Kurnaz, Cemal. (1996). "*Gönül*" *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (TDV Islam Encyclopedia), Vol. 14, Ed. Mustafa Birol Ülker: pp. 150-152. Istanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Foundation.

Lapidus, Ira. (1984). "Knowledge, Virtue, and Action: The Classical Muslim Conception of *Adab* and the Nature of Religious Fulfillment in Islam" *Moral Conduct and Authority: The Place of Adab in South Asian Islam*, Ed. Barbara D. Metcalf: pp. 38–61. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Özcan, Nuri. (2004). "*Meşk-Musiki*" *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (TDV Islam Encyclopedia), Vol. 29, Ed. Mustafa Birol Ülker: pp. 374-375. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Foundation.

Özkan, İsmail Hakkı. (2003). "*Makam-Musiki*" *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (TDV Islam Encyclopedia), Vol. 27, Ed. Mustafa Birol Ülker: pp. 410-412. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Foundation.

Öztürk, Okan Murat. (2002). "*Anadolu Yerel Müziklerinde Geleneksel İcranın Vazgeçilmez Unsurlarından Biri Olarak 'Tavır' Kavramı Üzerine* (On the Concept of 'Attitude' as one of the Indispensable Aspects of Traditional Performance in Anatolian Local Musics)". *Halkbilimi: Orta Doğu Teknik Üniversitesi Türk Halk Bilimi Topluluğu* (Folklore: Middle East Technical University Turkish Folklore Club). 17: 13-17.

Serin, Muhittin. (2004). "*Meşk–Hat*" *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (TDV Islam Encyclopedia), Vol. 29, Ed. Mustafa Birol Ülker: pp. 372-374. Ankara: Türkiye Diyanet Foundation.

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019a, 10.12.2019). *Âşık*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/a%C5%9F%C4%B1k-nedir-ne-demek/

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019b, 10.12.2019). *Kadim*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/kadim-nedir-ne-demek/

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019c, 10.12.2019). *Kâmil*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/k%C3%A2mil-nedir-ne-demek

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019d, 10.12.2019). *Oturup kalkmasını bilmek*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/oturup%20kalkmas%C4%B1n%C4%B1%20bilmek-nedir-ne-demek/

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019e, 10.12.2019). *Perde*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/perde-nedir-ne-demek/

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019f, 10.12.2019). *Saz*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/saz-nedir-ne-demek/

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019g, 10.12.2019). *Sır*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/s%C4%B1r-nedir-ne-demek/

Sesli Sözlük (Voice Dictionary). (2019h, 10.12.2019). *Tavır*. Retrieved from https://www.seslisozluk.net/tav%C4%B1r-nedir-ne-demek/

Signell, Karl. (1974). "Esthetics of Improvisation in Turkish Art Music" *Asian Music*. 5(2): 45-49.

Touma, Habib Hassan. (1971). "The *Maqam* Phenomenon: An Improvisation Technique in the Music of the Middle East" *Ethnomusicology*. 15(1): 38–48.

TRT Nota Arşivi (TRT Notation Archive). (2011, 10.12.2019). *Gönül Dağı* (Mountain of *Gönül*). Retrieved from

http://www.trtnotaarsivi.com/thm_detay.php?repno=3717&ad=G%D6N%DCL%20DA%D0I%20YA%D0MUR%20BORAN%20OLUNCA

Turino, Thomas. (2008). *Music as Social Life: The Politics of Participation*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Tüfekçioğlu, Abdülhamit. (2014). "*Hat Sanatında Meşk ve İcâzet* (*Meşk* and Authorisation in the Art of Calligraphy)" *El Sanatları* (Crafts) 17:111-113.

Uludağ, Süleyman. (2003). "*Makam-Tasavvuf*" *TDV İslam Ansiklopedisi* (TDV Islam Encyclopedia), Vol. 27, Ed. Mustafa Birol Ülker: pp. 409-410. Ankara: Turkiye Diyanet Foundation.

MARIJA DUMNIC VILOTIJEVIC
Institute of Musicology SASA, Serbia
marijadumnic@yahoo.com
orcid.org/0000-0001-5132-0408

The Relation of Music Archiving and Intangible Cultural Heritage in Serbia[1]

ABSTRACT
Speaking from an ethnomusicological standpoint, this paper elaborates on the use of recorded sound and audio-visual material for the purpose of documenting particular musical elements in Serbia, according to the concept of UNESCO intangible cultural heritage. There is a difference between contemporary field recordings for archival purposes, according to the ICH concept, and the employment of already recorded historical legacy. Through the example of music elements from Serbian national register of ICH, this paper will raise the questions of ethnomusicological politics of field recording and digitization of archived historical recordings, as well as analyze the politics of heritage management. Based on ethnomusicological and archival experience, the aim of this paper is to offer a model of application of sound archive for the future, which can effectively contribute to the concept of intangible cultural heritage in Serbia.

Introduction — Ethnomusicology in Serbia

This paper deals with music archiving and intangible cultural heritage in Serbia from an ethnomusicological perspective. Ethnomusicology in Serbia has had a rich history, rooted in music folklore studies. Since the end of the 19th century, the urge for preservation of rural music forms, threatened by extinction, resulted in many collections of music scores, which were later supplemented with sound recordings, all for the sake of preservation, inspiration of composers, and scientific analysis.[2] Today there are various carriers based on that research tradition — wax plates, wire reels, reel tapes, cassettes — many of them are stored at the Institute of Musicology SASA, which is the repository for the most important documentary music recordings in Serbia[3]. The main content related to this approach is rural folk music of presumably ancient origins, so there are recordings of vocal and/or instrumental performances, mostly associated with local rituals. The digital age (from 21st century, political changes in the country, and increased following of professional literature in English) coincided with a strong anthropological turn in Serbian ethnomusicology, when the context of performance came into focus of the researchers. At this time, analogue recordings were digitized, and digital-born recordings — on mini-discs and SD cards proliferated. In Serbia, this approach, which treats music as and in culture, is characterized by the presence of numerous interviews as well as an increase in the number of video recordings of music and dance. In recent years, precisely from 2010, and to a larger extent from 2012, onward, UNESCO's concept of intangible cultural heritage has been strongly affecting Serbian ethnomusicology (cf. Dumnić, 2014; Zakić, 2015; Jovanović & Lajić Mihajlović, 2018), so the idea is to present how this development has influenced local music archiving (mostly audio). This paper's ethnomusicological perspective is important because in Serbia there is no specialized music archive, so music archiving in Serbia is closely connected to institutions where ethnomusicologists work — from recording, over to digitizing, archiving, cataloguing, to publishing.

Intangible Cultural Heritage in Relation to Serbian Music

Public institutions, whose archival work is analyzed, are: the Institute of Musicology of the Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts, and the Faculty of Music of the University of Arts (one is a research and the other, an educational institution, both very highly ranked in the country and important in Southeastern Europe). Questionnaires were also administered to referent ethnomusicologists (both affiliated at the Faculty) from non-government organizations which

---

[2] More about the history of ethnomusicology in Serbia in: Golemović & Rakočević, 2008.
[3] More in: Dumnić, 2010.

provided huge professional support for the inscriptions of ICH to national lists, such as the Serbian Ethnomusicological Society (SED), and Center for Research and Safeguarding of Traditional Dances of Serbia (CIOTIS). The author had correspondence with an ethnologist from the Center for Intangible Cultural Heritage, who has been one of the most involved professionals in implementation of this UNESCO concept since its beginning in Serbia.[4] All of them are based in Belgrade since music archiving, ethnomusicological scene, and ICH management are, for the most part, concentrated in the capital.[5]

As it is known, according to the 2003 Convention, intangible cultural heritage includes: "the practices, representations, expressions, as well as the knowledge and skills, that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage. ICH, which is sometimes called living cultural heritage, and is manifested inter alia in the following domains: oral traditions and language, performing arts; social practices, rituals and festive events; knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe; and traditional craftsmanship. Transmitted from generation to generation, and constantly recreated by communities and groups, in response to their environment, as interaction with nature, and their history, ICH provides people with a sense of identity and continuity. It also promotes respect for cultural diversity and human creativity" (UNESCO, 2003: Article 2). So far, in Serbia, the strategy for safeguarding these practices in Serbia is based on this:

> "UNESCO strategically focuses on the strengthening of capacities of various stakeholders for safeguarding ICH at the national level and effective use of opportunities and mechanisms of international cooperation, as defined in the Convention for the Safeguarding of the ICH, in order to promote mutual understanding of circumstances and challenges associated with policies for the safeguarding of ICH in the region, such as: national inventory policies, the process of revitalization of ICH, management of sustainable cultural tourism, the role and involvement of local communities, the transnational dimension of ICH, training and capacity building" (NKNS, 2015a).

In Serbia, ICH was ratified as a platform in 2010 (more about ICH in Serbia in: Lukić Krstanović, Radojičić, 2015). The elements related to music are: singing accompanied by *gusle*

---

[4] For helpful answers about particular issues related to my topic I am grateful to: Dr. Danka Lajić Mihajlović (Institute for Musicology SASA and National Committee for ICH, associate at inscription of *singing to the accompaniment of gusle* to UNESCO list of representative ICH), Dr. Selena Rakočević (Faculty of Music and CIOTIS, associate at inscription of *kolo, traditional folk dance* to UNESCO list of representative ICH), Saša Srećković (Ethnographic Museum and Center for ICH, coordinator for international cooperation and education), Dr. Mirjana Zakić (Faculty of Music and SED, initiator of numerous inscriptions to national list of ICH).
[5] There are other institutions which also have the material about music which later on was declared as ICH (e.g. Serbian Broadcasting Corporation, Museum of Vojvodina) and some private collections, but they are not dominantly dealing with ethnomusicology and/or ICH.

(Serbian: *певање уз гусле*), *groktalica* singing (Serbian: *грокталица*), clamor singing (Serbian: *певање из вика*), *kolo* dance (Serbian: *коло*), *rumenka kolo* dance (Serbian: *руменка*), bagpipe playing (Serbian: *свирање на гајдама*), pipe-playing practice (Serbian: *фрулашка пракса*), *kaval* playing (Serbian: *свирање на кавалу*), *ojkača* singing (Serbian: *ojкача*), urban songs from Vranje (Serbian: *врањска градска песма*), *lazarica* processions from Sirinićka župa (Serbian: *лазарице у Сиринићкој жупи*), singing along a bee swarm (Serbian: *певање уз ројење пчела*) (NKNS, 2015b). Inscribed into the UNESCO representative list are *kolo* and singing accompanied by *gusle* (UNESCO, 2017; UNESCO, 2018). Up to now, 'living practices' are imperative in the ICH policy in Serbia. The only thing about audio-visual documenting, which is officially important, is the video which supports UNESCO nomination, but because it is an object of particular production standards (in terms of video and sound quality, duration, direction etc.) and not viewed as designated for archival preservation, it is not problematized here.

Serbian administrative system related to the ICH (managed by the National Committee, the National Board, and the Center for ICH) is not oriented toward conservation and does not have particular requirements for music archiving — there is no strategy of audio and video field recording, gathering and use of historical records, archiving and publishing related to the ICH (of course, there are principles of audio and video recording and archiving of music practices adhered to by particular individuals and institutions — some of them are already proclaimed as ICH). Also, there are no technical standards when it comes to the quality of the medium of audio or video recording, its condition, duration, recording approach, and resolution. The reason for this condition may be the aforementioned imperative of 'living practices' for current ICH management in Serbia.

Influence the ICH Concept on Music Archiving

The aspects of ethnomusicological documentation of music related to the concept of intangible cultural heritage that we consider here are: field recording, archiving in the narrow sense — saving and cataloguing, digitization and availability. First of all, it must be said that the concept of ICH becomes very important in Serbian ethnomusicology, probably because it opened the opportunity for global promotion of national musical heritage — it influenced (but not radically changed) the terminology, research objectives and methodology, but also caused the rethinking of earlier research and audio collections. Several ethnomusicologists have conducted extremely important long-term research about particular elements, and there is new research about concrete ICH themes (e.g. Lajić Mihajlović, 2014; Ranković, 2013;

Ranković, Zakić, 2014; Zakić, 2010; Zakić, 2014). The opinion of the author is that in Serbia, this also provoked the return toward a folkloristic approach, in the sense that it puts an emphasis on musical structures and intensive repeated fieldwork with local community, and slightly shifts the focus from topics which were concerned with small-scale fieldwork, archival work, ethnomusicological problems typical for discourses of anthropology and cultural studies. In a way, it is perceived as a matter of personal and professional contribution to the national heritage on the national and international level. Of course, this approach has significant, even tangible results. Despite dealing with material traces, ICH may be based on the idea that there are cultural artifacts which are more valuable than others and that, as pure and unique examples, can be lost. There are significant contributions, which may upgrade professional approaches that support contemporary performances and the transmissions of knowledge among living communities, even when the ICH concept is also criticized — mostly because of its potential for commercial exploitation and isolationist adoption of particular forms.[6] In the general public, there are attempts of nationalistic instrumentalization of the Serbian ICH, but this does not reflect on archival practices. There are no results of combining ICH concept with music tourism in Serbia, but archiving itself is distanced from commodification, so there is no need here for this important debate in ICH field. What may be a real consequence of inefficacy in audio-visual archiving is the risk of reinventing the ICH element, so material evidence about particular heritage need to be available to experts and public.

Field recording is currently the most important audio and video documenting aspect of ethnomusicological work related to the ICH. In technical aspects, it means recording with a digital recorder (usually Zoom) in WAV format and with various cameras in JPG, MTS, MP4 formats of photo and video (the author does not have data about resolutions from all the recordings and there is no single standard used in Serbia, but it may be advised to harmonize approaches with standards in IASA TC-04, 2009 and IASA TC-06, 2018). Field recordings are conducted in various settings — from 'authentic' to stage performances, and interviews are recorded as well. This means that there are not only recordings of particular ICH elements, but also data about its context. The topics that are examined in the field are often chosen according to the ICH concept. Also, when it comes to documenting particular ICH elements, there are methodological approaches which imply: repeated fieldwork in the same areas (because of validation of representation or following the risk of endangerment), questions related to the ICH development, even gathering of written statements from local communities

---

[6] From very rich theoretical literature about ICH see: Smith, Akagawa, 2009; Lowthorp, 2013.

and interlocutors about safeguarding, but also recordings of safeguarding processes. The approaches to the elements of the ICH in need for urgent safeguarding and representative ICH are generally the same when it comes to ethnomusicological field recordings, but urgent safeguarding pays more attention in terms of frequency of professional monitoring of safeguarding (Mirjana Zakić, Personal e-mail communication, 15 September 2019). Also, ethnomusicological field recordings with archival purposes generally use the same approach to the elements on national and on UNESCO list.

There are no so much novelties related to ethnomusicological methodology of fieldwork,— there are recordings of particular music pieces, entire performances and events, interviews on the topic of the research problem at hand, which may be concerned with, e.g. variants of songs, gender roles, migrations etc. (it is not conducted only with the oldest musicians and about the oldest music as the most valuable). Of course, approaches to fieldwork are different in terms of vocal and instrumental practices, but there are no special approaches to particular ICH elements. What has changed is that special attention is paid if some element is endangered — so there is a need for very detailed and reconstructive examination; or representative — there is an imperative to promote it, to educate the local community and wider audience about it with concerts, and to inspire the process of guided tradition by ethnomusicological workshops. What is called here "guided tradition process" is one of the most important aspects of ethnomusicological fieldwork, and it relies on the principles of applied ethnomusicology.[7]

All major projects dealing with registered ICH research in the field are state-funded through particular projects, but it is often heard that the amounts are usually not enough; and numerous projects do not even get funding— some because of low quality, some because of limited amount available from the Ministry, some because they do not have obligatory administrative support (of Museum). On the other side, some projects, which are dealing with 'precious' forms of traditional and national practices/arts are funded, although they are not (yet) inscribed as ICH. Also, projects, which are supported are projects about live presentation and education — festivals and workshops. But when it comes to archiving and dissemination of audio and video material about the ICH, usually there is no financial support (except if it is part of the above-mentioned events).

---

[7] More about the complete system of sustainability of music as ICH from the perspective of applied ethnomusicology in: Schippers, 2015).

Archiving in a narrow sense (i.e. saving and cataloguing) is currently of secondary importance for the ICH in Serbia, but of course, there are efforts of particular institutions to save recorded materials about folk music in Serbia (and of Serbs outside the borders). Results for audio recorded music are so far available for the Institute of Musicology SASA (but other mentioned institutions have archives as well), and its mission is in accordance with IASA ethical standards and strategies (IASA TC-03, 2005), such as: its sound archive has tasks such as acquisition, documentation, access and preservation; it has sound and accompanying written information; it preserves carriers and contents; it advocates digitization without modifications; it is open for international cooperation. The Institute was officially directly involved in the inscriptions of *gusle*, *gajde*, *frula* on the national ICH list and of *gusle* on the UNESCO ICH list, so there are numerous historical recordings of these folk instruments (and sometimes accompanying singing, especially in the case of *gusle*). It also contains the recordings of other inscribed elements, such as urban song of Vranje, *kolo*, *groktalica*, *kaval*, but also recordings, which are in progress of inscription into the national list — the Serbian church chants. These recordings have been digitized by 2014, from wax plates, wire reels, and open reel tapes, in 44.1 kHz and 16 Bit resolution, in WAV format. Some of them — especially Vranje urban songs — are descriptively catalogued: there is data about each field recording (date, place, researcher, performer, title, note about genre) and digital copy (who digitized and catalogued the recording, technical notes, place of copy); unfortunately, there is still no coded metadata schema. Original carriers are saved in optimal conditions, and an additional two copies of the digital material are provided on external hard-discs. The Institute, with its sound archive, has important role in local applied ethnomusicology.[8] When speaking about the Institute's recordings of the ICH, interviewed researchers pay special attention to saving of the material, so ethnomusiologists usually have at least two copies of the (most important) material on external hard-discs (or other memory devices). When it comes to cataloguing, there is no unified data about the recordings, especially when it comes to digital-born files — the main purpose of written data (often in digital form) about field recordings is to be useful for research, so there are regularly notes about the date, place, title, instrument or genre, and performer(s). What is common for current archives is that there are no special approaches or notes related to the ICH.

The digitization of various forms of cultural heritage is the only aspect for which guidelines are provided by the Ministry of Culture and Media, but even those are still not mandatory. The

---

[8] More about the role of archives in applied ethnomusicology in: Lundberg, 2015.

recommended standard is: gramophone records (shellac, vinyl, lacquer discs, recorded on 78, 45, 33.3 rpm, regardless of content), reel tapes (from 1/4 to 2 inch, in speeds from 9.5 to 78 cm/s and others) and audio compact cassettes, should be 24 bit depth and 96 kHz sample rate in stereo WAV and/or FLAC format; and the guidelines for the copy are: 16 bit and 44 kHz, stereo, 128 kbps, WMA/MP3/AAC or OGG. The purpose of these guidelines is to set some standards and to enable the Ministry to choose which digitization projects it will support. Because this document is from September 2017 and in the form of instructions, it was not relevant for previously digitized items and there are no detailed mandatory standards and descriptions in Serbian based on the concept of IASA technical publications as referent literature (precisely IASA TC-05, 2014). All recordings submitted to the Center for the ICH as a part of documentation of a particular element on the national list, are digital.

Special attention should be devoted to the 'availability' of archived heritage — of historical recordings and of recently recorded audio and/or video musical material. It is important, to whom it is available — to researchers, management, local communities, performers, educators; but also how (i.e. in which form and under which conditions). First of all, it is easily accessible if it is digital and searchable — the first is not case with all historical recordings, while the second varies — usually, whole performances can be distributed and observed, and in the most cases there is some data about integral content. However, there are recordings, which are not catalogued (and none of the recordings have ICH-related catalogue comments, although their relevance increases) and that makes usage difficult. Dissemination of recordings is still conditioned by the policy of every particular holder. When it comes to the purposes of use, research is the main one. There is an increasing number of scholarly papers, which are dealing with the ICH audio and/or video recordings (e.g. Lajić Mihajlović 2016; Rakočević 2016). ICH management is not specially interested in this type of documentation, but it appreciates its existence. Performers who are interested in re-performing, and local communities involved in a particular ICH element, are welcomed by ethnomusicologists to access the material they recorded.

Ethnomusicologists, among them ones interested in the ICH, are using archived folk music materials for research, presentation, and education about musical practices viewed as ICH. All the consulted experts (as well as the author) claim that historical recordings from the archives can contribute to the revitalization (i.e. strengthening) and sustainability of ICH elements. What must be specially mentioned is the use of historical recordings, with the first claim being that they need to be published in order to be available to all interested individuals

— not only researchers, performers, and educators, but local communities as well, because they gladly use the publications and not documentary archives for rising awareness about the ICH.

The publication process from the ethnomusicological point of view implies the selection of recordings, critical-analytical introduction and comments, data, and illustrations about the performances (and of course, satisfactory sound quality). Research questions of the publication may be phenomena related to ICH concept, so there is an emphasis on the importance of safeguarding, explained by the efforts not only to capture particular moments of the ICH's existence, but to inspire performances in the future and expand hitherto available knowledge. What is suggested is that 'living tradition' can not be restricted by using historical recordings — it can be enhanced, meaning that performers and local communities may be educated to revitalize and sustain particular music and/or dance practices, which were previously researched and audio and/or video documented by ethnomusicologists, who can also provide information about whole adequate context, as well as guide the process of historically informed oral tradition; and for that purpose published archival recordings are the most convenient solution.

It is also worth mentioning that there is no education as such about conducting music ICH research, its implementation, and audio-video archiving. On the other hand, students are gaining knowledge about fieldwork and audio-video recording through experiences consisted of assisting their professors, but also about phenomena that are nowadays related to the ICH concept. Of course, professors use archived recordings in education very often, but the archives of faculties are not available for students and researchers non-affiliated with those institutions (neither to local communities and performers interested in the recorded ICH).

Concluding Remarks

This paper aimed to elaborate that audio-visual archives are places for diverse ICH research and preservation, with great potential for safeguarding, which needs to be adjusted to particular music and dance elements — in other words, that the ICH concept and music archiving should be interwoven. What should be of great professional importance is in domain of applied ethnomusicology — how to make the best from the field recording process, in terms of preservation of the ICH and of agency of living practitioners, how to contribute to sustainability of music practices, and finally the goal of giving back to the community whose heritage is audio/video recorded in the field recordings, with some basic instructions to cherish it properly. Also, it may be concluded that management structures of the ICH should

pay much more attention to making and using audio and video archives, i.e. that the industry around the ICH in Serbia must become more historically inclusive (not only ethnographic in methodology and museological in results). In technical terms, the above-mentioned standards of the International Association of Sound and Audiovisual Archives should be followed. What is relevant for ethnomusicology dealing with musical heritage and preservation of recorded sound, is to develop policies and methods which combine these approaches. This strategy should support field recordings, as well as publication of recordings, in order to make the ICH sustainable and to help local communities save their respect and knowledge about their own heritage. This would ideally be a combination of fieldwork and usage of historical recordings for information. Special attention should be devoted to archiving the digital-born recordings about the ICH and one way to promote it, may be to give recordings to the performers. Awareness about the importance of (research) archives and historical recordings must be increased, and on the other hand, archives need to preserve the continuity of the ICH not only in the ethnomusicological academic community, but also outside of it.

REFERENCES

Dumnić, Marija. (2010). "Project 'Digitization and Catalogization of Phonoarchive of the Institute of Musicology SASA': Experiences and Perspectives" *Pregled Nacionalnog centra za digitalizaciju*. 17: 39-44.

Dumnić, Marija. (2014). "Nematerijalno kulturno nasleđe i etnomuzikologija" (Intangible Cultural Heritage and Ethnomusicology). *Sabornik: Glasilo Sabora izvornog narodnog stvaralaštva.* 1(1): 17–19.

Golemović, Dimitrije; Rakočević, Selena. (2008). "Mapping the Past and the Future of Serbian Ethnomusicology and Ethnochoreology" *Vienna and the Balkans*, Ed. Peycheva, Lozanka; Rodel, Angela: pp. 88–95. Sofia: Institute of Art Studies BAS.

IASA TC-03, 2005: *The Safeguarding of Audio Heritage: Ethnics, Principles and Preservation Strategy*, Ed. Schüller, Dietrich. International Association of Sound and Audiovisual Archives.

IASA TC-04, 2009: *Guidelines on the Production and Preservation of Digital Audio Objects*, Ed. Bradley, Kevin. International Association of Sound and Audiovisual Archives.

IASA TC-05, 2014: *Handling and Storage of Audio and Video Carriers*, Ed. Schüller, Dietrich; Häfner, Albrecht. International Association of Sound and Audiovisual Archives.

IASA TC-06, 2018: *Guidelines for the Preservation of Video Recordings*, Ed. Fleischhauer, Carl; Bradley, Kevin. International Association of Sound and Audiovisual Archives.

Jovanović, Jelena; Lajić Mihajlović, Danka. (2018). "Exceptional Musical Heritage of Serbia / O izuzetnom muzičkom nasledju u Srbiji" *Serbia. Balkan Echo. A guide to exceptional roots music in Serbia. Music forms from the National registry of the intangible cultural heritage of Serbia / Serbia. Balkan Echo. Vodič za izuzetnu izvodnu muziku u Srbiji*, Ed. Đorđević, Oliver: 8–13. Beograd: World Music Association of Serbia.

Lajić Mihajlović, Danka. (2014). *Srpsko tradicionalno pevanje uz gusle: Guslarska praksa kao komunikacioni proces* (Serbian Traditional Singing Accompanied by the Gusle: The Guslar's Practice as a Communication Process). Beograd: Muzikološki institut SANU.

Lajić Mihajlović, Danka. (2016). "Towards the Audiovisual Ethnomusicology: The Contribution from the Research of Serbian Epics" *Music and Dance in Southeastern Europe: Myth, Ritual, Post-1989, Audiovisual Ethnographies*, Ed. Vlaeva, Ivanka; Mellish, Liz; Peycheva, Lozanka; Green, Nick; Dimov, Ventsislav: pp. 280–288. Blagoevgrad: University Publishing House

Lowthorp, Leah. (2013). *Scenarios of Endangered Culture, Shifting Cosmopolitanisms: Kutiyattam and UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage in Kerala, India*. PhD Dissertation, University of Pensilvania: USA.

Lukić Krstanović, Miroslava; Radojičić, Dragana. (2015). "Nematerijalno kulturno nasleđe u Srbiji: Prakse, znanja i inicijative" (Intangible Cultural Heritage in Serbia: Practices, Knowledge and Initiatives). *Glasnik Etnografskog muzeja.* (79): 165—278.

Lundberg, Dan. (2015). "Archives and Applied Ethnomusicology." *The Oxford Handbook for Applied Ethnomusicology*. Ed. Svanibor Pettan, Jeff Todd Titon: pp. 671—708. Oxford University Press.

NKNS. (2015a). *About the Intangible Cultural Heritage*. Retrieved from: http://www.nkns.rs/cyr/node/44.

NKNS. (2015b). *National Register of ICH*. Retrieved from: http://www.nkns.rs/en/elementi-nkns.

Rakočević, Selena. (2016). "Filming in the Field: Some Methodological Issues in Video Recording in Ethnochoreology." *Music and Dance in Southeastern Europe: Myth, Ritual, Post-1989, Audiovisual Ethnographies*, Ed. Vlaeva, Ivanka; Mellish, Liz; Peycheva, Lozanka; Green, Nick; Dimov, Ventsislav: pp. 261—270. Blagoevgrad: University Publishing House

Ranković, Sanja. (2013). "Vokalni dijalekti Srba u Vojvodini (Vocal Dialects of Serbs in Vojvodina). PhD Dissertation, University of Arts, Belgrade: Serbia.

Ranković, Sanja; Zakić, Mirjana. (2017). "Pesme za rojenje pčela u centralnom delu Kosova i Metohije (Singing along a Bee Swarm in Central Part of Kosovo and Metohija)" *Vlado S. Milošević: Etnomuzikolog, kompozitor i pedagog — Tradicija kao inspiracija: Tematski zbornik sa naučnog skupa 2016. Godine*, Ed. Marinković, Sonja; Dodik, Sanda; Panić Kašanski, Dragica: pp. 296–312. Banja Luka: Academy of Arts University of Banja Luka — Academy of Science and Arts of the Republic of Srpska — Musicology Society of the Republic of Srpska.

Schippers, Huib. (2015). "Applied Ethnomusicology and Intangible Cultural Heritage: Understanding 'Ecosystems of Music' as a Tool for Sustainability." *The Oxford Handbook for Applied Ethnomusicology*, Ed. Pettan, Svanibor; Titon, Jeff Todd: pp. 134-156. Oxford University Press.

Smith, Lauraja; Akagawa, Natsuko. (Ed.) (2009). *Intangible Heritage*. London/New York: Routledge.

UNESCO. (2003). *The Convention for the Safeguarding of Intangible Cultural Heritage*.

UNESCO. (2017). *Kolo, Traditional Folk Dance*. Retrieved from: https://ich.unesco.org/en/RL/kolo-traditional-folk-dance-01270.

UNESCO. (2018). *Singing to the Accompaniment of the Gusle*. Retrieved from: https://ich.unesco.org/en/RL/singing-to-the-accompaniment-of-the-gusle-01377.

Zakić, Mirjana. (2010). "Lazaričke pesme iz Sirinićke župe" (Lazarice Songs from Sirinićka Župa). *Kosovo i Metohija u civilizacijskim tokovima 2*, Ed. Valentina Pitulić: pp. 123–136. Kosovska Mitrovica: Faculty of Philosophy, University of Pristina.

Zakić, Mirjana. (2014). "Intercultural Communication and Multicultural Context: The Place of the *Kaval* in Serbian Musical Practice" *Terminology and theoretical approaches and crossing national boundaries/intercultural communication.* [Third Symposium of the ICTM Study Group

on music and dance in Southeastern Europe]. Ed. Ivancich Dunin, Elsie; Mellish, Liz; Opetcheska Tatarchevska, Ivona: pp. 269–278. Skopje: ICTM SG on Music and Dance in Southeastern Europe — National Committee ICTM Macedonia.

Zakić, Mirjana. (2015). "Delatnost Srpskog etnomuzikološkog društva na planu očuvanja i zaštite muzičkog folklore" (Activity of Serbian Ethnomusicological Society in Terms of Preservation and Protection of Musical Folklore). *Savremena srpska folkloristika II*, Ed. Đorđević Belić, Smiljana; Lajić Mihajlović, Danka; Radulović, Nemanja; Suvajdžić, Boško; Trubarac Matić, Đorđina: pp. 121–130. Beograd: Institute of Literature of Art, Serbian Folklore Association, Univerzitetska biblioteka

BELMA OĞUL
Istanbul Technical University, Turkey
belmak65@gmail.com
orcid.org/0000-0002-5042-6953

Where is the Homeland in My Music?: Interhomelands Migration*

ABSTRACT

There are different types of migration, however, new concepts and redefinitions of certain concepts are needed, because of the changing reasons for migration as well as various imaginings of the places and spaces in concrete and virtual terms. This paper coins the phrase 'interhomeland migration' as a type of migration through addressing how the concept of homeland is constructed through affect, and who constitutes this migrant type.

The data, obtained from fieldwork executed with those who identify themselves as Bosniaks (especially in Istanbul and nearby cities) since 2004 and with the Turkish-speaking people living in Bulgaria between 2013 and 201,5 is assessed by the means of analyses of both the discourses and various musical elements. In these examples, the affect of homeland is constituted by religion, flag, blood, land, especially fighting for the sake of this land, vague and non-objective nationalist concepts, shared historical and cultural background, such as musical values in addition to born and grown lands. Interhomelands migrant type experiences the affects containing contrasts all together such as feeling alike, feeling strange, feeling the belonging. These affects cause to uncover the similarities on the one hand and on the contrary to underline the dissimilarities on the other hand.

---

* This paper is the extended version of the presentation submitted in the 3rd International Music and Dance Studies Symposium in Trabzon in 17-20.10.2018

There are different types of migration, mostly defined according to borders or to reasons. It seems that we will experience mass movements of populations more frequently in the near future. Therefore, new concepts and redefinitions are needed for these different ways of mobilization, as well as replacements, since the conditions, legislations, and most importantly, the world order are changing.

Based on the studies of the Bosniak people living in Turkey conducted since 2004, and of the Turkish-speaking people living in Bulgaria between 2013-2015, I have realized that their discourses and the lyrics of their music reveal their emotions, which are related to their perception of homeland, while they are mentioning their cultural identity, as well as their migratory identity. The social identity and cultural identity are both composed of some elements in an alternating hierarchy according to various conditions. These elements may be language, religion, education, socio-economic conditions, state of politics, ethnicity, nation, and many others. The social identity is constructed through the relationship with other individuals, other groups of people, other institutions or nations and states, while cultural identity covers many qualifications, such as gender, language(s), religion, daily experiences, and so on. The hierarchically ordered elements of the identity of the Bosniak people living in Turkey and the Turkish-speaking people living in Bulgaria may change according to their homelands and various positive and negative emotions accordingly. Based on the idea that each being is somehow affected by the replacements due to the emergent confronted conditions, the emotions, which may be also politically manipulated, as Han (2019) argues, are very important to understand in which way these emotions are handled to survive.

While trying to understand the relationship between these emotions, migration, and homeland, I have realized that their migration category does not fit any formerly defined ones. Therefore, I have coined the term 'interhomeland' migration, corresponding to this situation. To expand on this interhomeland migration category, I discuss the concepts of migration and homeland, their components and imagination through music and emotion.

Migration and Homeland

Although migration stands as a conceptualization of macro-political (in which case we can treat politics as the management of emotions), the immigrant's status is micro-

political; therefore, immigration can be understood through individuals' own affections. Affects and emotions are assumed to vary from person to person within this micro-politic, which is ambiguous, intangible, and can exist at the same time with its contradictions. On the other hand, when the emotions are treated "as a kind of thinking" as Thrift (2004: 60) says, it can be argued that emotions connect the body and things through perception, feeling, expression and intersubjective transmission. Through the social exchanges of communities and individuals, emotions are shared, and convictions arise (see Lawler, 2001 for further discussion). Deleuze (2000: 11) stated that Spinoza thought "the idea comes before emotion", and "to love [we can also call affect in general] it is necessary to have an idea of what is loved, whether it is as much ambiguous or as much confused".

Therefore, an individual has an idea about migration as well as the place, where he or she comes or goes. With this idea, it can be said that positive emotions, such as excitement, pleasure, pride, gratitude, hope in the cases of not entirely forced migrations — depending on where they go — and negative emotions such as sadness, embarrassment, anger, and longing, in the cases of forced migrations are developed. On the other hand, the people who do not migrate, but experience their close friends' and relatives' migration, are affected by this abandonment. However, it is more common to experience both positive and negative emotions at the same time.

As Bayart's (1999) term "illusion of identity" emerges with convictions and emotions, so do the categories of migration. Ulus Baker (2012) mentions that the word conviction is synonymous with 'imagination' but not with 'doxa', and that Spinoza considers convictions as 'obligatory illusions' in Etika (2011). Regardless of the reasons and consequences, this categorization relates to place, which is established in the imagination and, by the obligatory illusions, is not a fixed and unchanging concept other than political reasons, but makes the homeland special, which is constructed and imagined by emotions. We can say that migration between the homelands or multi-homelands (Kaiser, 1994: 23) built in connection with these social and political convictions can be addressed through emotions in this context.

Both Bosnian people living in Turkey, and Turkish-speaking Muslim people living in Bulgaria, first immigrated to the Balkan region via Anatolia and the Northern Black Sea

region during different time periods, and then some of them, with various motives, started to migrate within the borders of today's Turkey starting in the 19th century onwards. The last wave of migration from the Balkans to today's borders was actualized by the Turkish-speaking people in 1989, and by the Bosniaks in early 1990's. Although their motives and the conditions of their migrations vary, both communities have common emotions constituted by their earlier social and political connections with the Ottoman State (Bosna and Herzegovina 1463-1878 and Bulgaria 1371-1878), later dispersed family members living both in Turkey and Bulgaria or Bosnia, Montenegro, Serbia. In other words, they consider themselves as sharing the same ancestry.

The fact that Islam and Turkishness are considered as equivalent in the Balkans gives the feeling of a common consanguinity, per se. The interchangeability of religion and ancestry is often encountered in everyday language, as well as in academic language[1]. Ancestry and consanguinity establish a relationship with the people who make up the imagined homeland. Although it is the subject of controversy that Bosnians are Slavic or Pechenegs from the Northern Black Sea or Turkish principalities from Anatolia, it is an emotional ancestry, not an ethnicity related to blood or language.

Being a cognate includes a broad meaning, extending from today's 'ruled by the same powers once upon a time', to those who have 'common values' of uncertain scope. Both the Bosniaks living in Bosnia and Herzegovina, Montenegro, and Serbia, and the Bosniaks who have migrated to Turkey's borders, bear emotions evoking homeland for all these countries and they mention them with a sense of longing and nostalgia. The same is true in the Bulgarian case. The dispersed family members also keep these emotions alive, both through individual relationships and the exchange of goods, for example the local food, or means of music recordings. Furthermore, these emotions are propagated through some symbols such as the flag, the blood, the earth, the land that has been fought for in music to achieve the imagination of the homeland and common positive and negative emotions.

Bosniaks, for example, had mixed feelings while they were migrating to their new homeland of Turkey, and they started longing for their former homeland after the settlement. They emerge in the discourses about migration constructed by the individual

---

[1] The book titled Imagining the "Turc" (Jezernik (ed.) 2012) can be given as an example.

and social emotions and political convictions. In addition to discourse, produced, performed, and consumed music is also a tool that helps identify the emotions about and symbols of the homeland.

Interhomeland

Homeland has been an ambiguous and non-objective nationalist concept constructed through emotions and symbols that stimulate them - such as the flag, blood, land, and especially the land that was fought for - with the nationalism and the nation-state relations since the middle of the nineteenth century.

Many Muslims in the Balkans, Turkey is being felt as an imaginary homeland, and if not, I am convinced that, at the very least, they sympathize with Turkey. This sympathy sometimes includes complaints such as "you left us here", referring to the period of the Ottoman state and admitting that Republic of Turkey is the continuation of the Ottoman state. In addition to the economic, political, and everyday relations, historically speaking in the words of *sevdalinka,* we can now see a visible proof that Turkey-produced television series are in great demand from the Balkan countries. From this, we can observe that the Muslims who migrated from the Balkans embrace Turkey, as well as their countries of origin, as homeland as seen in their musical practices.

In order to make sense of migration through emotions, immigrants can be considered as a social type. Baker (2012), who construct their social and cultural identity via many factors, one of which is the migratory factor, shared their discourses and musical practices with us during field research, which allows us to conceptualize interhomeland migration.

It can be said that migration is a set of affects based on belonging, alienation, and similarity. From this point of view, in order to become an immigrant, it may not be necessary to experience "its permanent movement from one place beyond symbolic or political boundaries to new settlements and societies" (Marshall, 1999: 685). Religion, land and place, blood, and other symbols are all factors found in the discourse, attached to interhomeland migration. Moreover, dedicated symbolic meanings of musical instruments can also be clues as to the type of migration.

When we look at the religious factor, Muslims in the Balkans, and migrants, what causes them to feel Turkey as a homeland, is the holiness referring to the religious feelings found within the meaning of the concept. One of the main reasons stated by the immigrants after 1945 was their inability to live their religion freely in their homeland, which was ruled by the socialist party thereafter. A person who came to Turkey in 1966 said "we would have been *gavur* (non-Muslim), therefore they do not send us to school. There were teachers, teaching us religion". So, he points out a threat posed by religious education at that time, while by saying that "At present, modern Islam is born in Bosnia. Religious education is given from the first grade". He argues that the conditions of the old homeland are improving (male participant, personal communication, 5 July 2006).[2] The higher visibility of religion was found not only in the field of education, but revealed by the increasing number of various Bosnian hymn groups performing in traditional manner, or in a symphonically arranged manner, which have triggered religious and 'patriotic' feelings. Since the 1980s, and more frequently after 1990s, ethnic and religious music production has grown and the NKNM[3], which initially emerged in the 1960s, began to include hymns and heroic songs. Other examples would be that the inclusion of these hymns into the repertoire of the 'Turbo-folk' artist Halid Beslic (for example, the O*j Zefire* Hymn). In the video clips from the countries of former Yugoslavia, weapons were used as decor for each country's own heroism during the 1992-1995 Bosnian war. The most visible reason of 1989 mass migration from Bulgaria to Turkey was also the pressure to convert the Muslim names and surnames into non-Muslim names.

On the other hand, being Muslims did not provide a direct acceptance by the inhabitants under the influence of the 1950's motto of 'One nation, one state, one language, one flag' and it took a long time to convince them that they are Muslims themselves due to a

---

[2] However, after the collapse of Yugoslavia, the Islamic Manifesto, which was written by the first President of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Alija Izzetbegovic in the early 1970s and only published in 1983, led to the revival of Islam in Bosnia. A different danger for the future years is ignored among the citizens of Bosnia-Sancak who receive different educations according to their identities such as Islam, Orthodox and Catholicism.

[3] Novo Komponovana Narodna Muzika (newly composed folk music) contains many different genres. Between 1960 and 1980, folk music pieces re-arranged through orchestration in pop and rock genres are called as 'neo-folk' and/or 'turbo-folk'. After 1990, the newly composed folk music is a combined form of folk music organized within the framework of commercial forms, values and techniques, similar to Western commercial dance music and MTV style performances. Prevailing styles in the world music market at that moment, such as Latin music or Indian music, influence turbo-folk as well as pop and arabesque music seen in Turkey. Especially for those who migrated to Turkey in the 1960s NKNM is considered as 'authentic'.

different language conversations. "We said let's go to Turkey, since it is a Muslim country. In Sancak, during Ramadan, everyone fasts, Muslim preachers visit the community. But we came here during Ramadan, everyone eats and drinks in the coffee shops. We were surprised whether we have come to Greece. They still called us *gavur* because we couldn't speak Turkish." (Hamit Albayrak, personel communication, 12 March 2006). Conversely, the language of the migrants from Bulgaria was Turkish; therefore, they were directly considered Muslim. On the other hand, Islam was not a criterion alone, but the common values imagined had to accompany religion. Thus, they did not prefer to migrate to other Muslim countries.

When we consider the land and place for the interhomeland migration, it is also an important factor for emphasizing the cultural identity. When Bosniaks emigrated to the Turkish border, they were placed in certain cities, and in new neighbourhoods in these cities, especially during the intense waves of immigration, in order to eliminate the domestic public's discomfort. The following migrants opted to settle in the same neighbourhoods. One of the cities with largest Balkan immigrant population is Istanbul, followed by Bursa, and as a region – Thrace.

Istanbul[4] was the capital city of the Ottoman Empire, even after the dissolution of the Ottoman state, and since it was seen as equivalent to the homeland, it is considered as the first place to settle down by the interhomeland migrants. In terms of the states established in this region, Istanbul has a different importance in almost all the centuries. With the passing of the Ottoman Empire, Istanbul became a different place for the people living in the region compared to the previous periods. Among Bosnians, the saying 'If Istanbul is destroyed one day, the Turks should not be upset; There is Sarajevo.' is very well known. However, at the same time, for Bosniaks, at the same time "Istanbul means immigration and separation" (Bayram, 2011: 55). In addition to the characteristics of Istanbul, the longing for Istanbul, the current political and social structure of the period are also included in *sevdalinka-s*. The most well-known of these are *U Stambolu Na Bosforu.* "The poet addresses the Ottoman sultan with the word pasha in this *sevdalinka*. He describes the death of the Ottoman sultan. It has been said for

---

[4] "The word Tsarigrad was used for Istanbul. In the Balkans, it meant 'the city of Caesar' originally, but later the tsar began to be used for the Ottoman sultans. Thus, Istanbul has always been the city of Sultans for Bosnians." (Bayram, 2011: 58)

Sultan Abdulmecid I. He is very sick and dying. He says that the servants remained faithful to him and that the sultan was very sad." (Bayram, 2011: 62)

Lyrics of *U Stambolu Na Bosforu*

U Stambolu Na Bosforu	l to the Bosphorus in Istanbul
Bolan Paša Lezi	Bolan Pasha lies in the tomb
Duša mu je na jeziku,	His heart in his mouth,
K Crnoj Zemlji Bježi	He escaped from the black earth
Dvori, ljubo, dvori, sejo!	Get ready my favourite, get ready Sejo!
Ko Mujezin Sa Minare	Like muezzin in the minaret
Uč'te Glasom svim	Read lush
Allah, Illalah, Selam alejkum!	Allah, Allah, may Allah bless you!
Dvorite, me službenici	Servants serve me
Što službiste Harem	Like the service in the harem
Svaki Od Vas neka Uzme	Everyone takes it from you
Jednu ženu barem.	One woman at least
İz Oka mu Suza Kanu	Tears are pouring from your eyes
i na Minder Mrtav Panu	Lifeless, fell on the mat
Stari Musliman	Old Muslim
Allah, Illalah, Selam alejkum!	Allah, Allah, may Allah bless you!
Kad je čula Pašinica	When the lady of Pasha heard
Za Tu Tužnu Vijest	That sad news
Da se Paša Preselio	That Pasha was dead.
Na taj drugi svijet,	Hereafter
İz Oka joj Suza Kanu,	Tears flowing from Pasha's lady
Pa na Minder Mrtva Panu	Lifeless fell on the mat
Ljubav Pašina	Pasha's lady
Allah, Illalah, Selam alejkum!	Allah, Allah, may Allah bless you!

The places and the constructions, which are the tangible heritage of the Ottoman State, are also symbols for the Turkish identity found in the Balkan countries. For example, *Yedi Kızlar Camii* (Mosque of the Seven Girls) is a well-known and enchanted mosque in Kirkovo-Bulgaria, with the sacred number seven in its name. The distant past — the epitaph of the mosque shows the foundation date as 1428 — legitimizes the rooted existence of the Turkish-speaking people. The tradition, Hıdırellez, is Islamicized, by reciting *Kuran* and *mevlid* to celebrate it in the mosque, which allows the mosque to

become a larger community place and refreshing memories related to the Ottoman period, both in terms of place, religion and land, for which blood is shed.

Yemen *Türküsü* (2015)

Erkek:	Man:
Alıverin püsküllü çantamı	Take my tassled bag
Takayım koluma	Let me hang it to my arm
Aman aman bedel de tutmuyor	Oh, can't even afford the paid military service
Gideyim yoluma	Let me go my way
Aman aman bedel de tutmuyor	Oh, can't even afford the paid military service
Gideyim yoluma	Let me go my way
Kız:	Woman:
Gel gitme gelin, eşim gel gitme	Don't go my dear spouse, don't go
Bu gece yatalım	Let's lay here tonight
Al çeyizimi satalım be babam	Take my dowry and let's sell it father
Yare bedel tutalım	Let's pay for my lover's military service
Al çeyizimi satalım be babam	Take my dowry and let's sell it father
Yare bedel tutalım	Let's pay for my lover's military service
Erkek:	Man:
Sesle ey garip anam sesle, Yemen'i sesle	Listen my poor mother listen, listen to Yemen
Yemen'den gönderdim kuruca güller kız elle mi besle	I sent dried roses from Yemen
Yemen'den yolladım kuruca üzümler kız elle mi besle	Does she feed with her hands
	I sent raisins from Yemen
	Does she feed with her hands
Kız:	Woman:
Şu karşıda görünen meralar otlu yapraklı	Those pastures seen over there are with grassand leaves
Benim de yârimi Yemen'e götüren soğuk toprak mı?	Is it the cold soil that takes my lover to Yemen?
Benim de yârimi Yemen'e götüren soğuk toprak mı?	Is it the cold soil that takes my lover to Yemen?

Similar narratives are seen among the Turkish people living in Bulgaria, in other words, dying and shedding blood for the land. Çanakkale *türküsü*[5] and Yemen *türküsü*[6] are in their repertoire and they connate their deep roots to the history of the Ottoman State, as well as Republic of Turkey, since the Çanakkale war is considered as a very early war of

---

[5] It is written for the Çanakkale (Dardanelles) war taken place in 1915-1916.
[6] It is written for the Yemen war taken place in 1914-1916.

independence. As a contemporary citizen of Bulgaria, being a part of the Ottoman past promotes the identity of Turkishness, as well Islamism and emotions of belonging with their heroic and brave roles in the wars.

Another reason why the Bosnians considered the Ottoman lands as homeland could be that the political and military importance of Bosnia and Herzegovina, as well as Serbia, was due to the them being border provinces of the Ottoman Empire, and the fact that many Bosniaks played important roles in the Ottoman Empire[7]. So, they served in the army and lost their lives for the state.

Balkan wars (1912-1913), the Çanakkale war (1915), the Cyprus Peace Operation (1974)[8], the Bosnian War (1992-1995) are found in the narratives and songs while the Balkan immigrants living in Turkey are articulating their bravery and devotion.

The symbols, such as the flag, the crescent moon and the star, and the fez are the other factors producing emotions and affects describing interhomeland migration. The importance of the flag in the creation of this emotion, was mentioned in an interview by one of the interlocutors. "[When we were at Sancak] we would carry both Turkish and Yugoslavian flags at weddings" (Abdi Bay, personel communication, 21 August 2006), which is also true for the Bosniaks living in Turkey, who carry the flags of Turkey and Bosnia and Herzegovina. The marks on the flag, in other words, the crescent moon and the star, are seen on many tombstones of Muslim people in Balkan countries. Another symbol is the fez, which is seen on album covers and on the stage performances of traditional music and Islamic hymns, and also used as a folk costume in the staged folk dances in Bosnia in order to evoke traditionalism and Ottomans.

Musical instruments are also used as musical and visual symbols among the interhomeland migrants. The music and musical instruments of the old homeland where the migrants were born, grew up, or never even been, from but where some of their

---

[7] For example, one of the grand viziers of the Ottoman Empire, Sokullu Mehmed Pasha who was converted to Islam, is likely to come across as carving in the pegbox of the *gusla*; such as many others, Hersekzade Ahmed Paşa (1497-1516), Damad İbrahim Paşa (1596-1601), Lala Mustafa Paşa (1580-1580), Malkoç Ali Paşa (1603-1604), Lala Mehmed Paşa (1604-1606), Derviş Mehmed Paşa (1606-1606), Kara Davud Paşa (1622-1622), Hüsrev Paşa (1628-1631), Topal Recep Paşa (1632-1632), Salih Paşa (1645-1647), Sarı Süleyman Paşa (1685-1687), Damad Melek Mehmed Paşa (1792-1794).
[8] For example; the name of Kamil Balkan from Dacic family, who immigrated to Turkey in 1967 and was killed in Nicosia during his military service in July 22, 1974, was given to a street and an elementary school in Yıldırım neighbourhood in Bayrampaşa district, where most of the population is composed of Bosniaks.

family members came from, "gives confidence to people because they refer to that place and they are happy in the society where music is performed" (Lomax, 1956: 48-50). Even the music, which is sometimes known as belonging to the homeland, but does not meet their taste of music, is perceived as a part of the society, to which they belong, revealing the feelings of nostalgia, and is enough for them to be happy. New arrivals cause to refresh the memories of the previous ones and renew the language they brought from the other homeland with new musical repertoire, along with the musical instruments. On the other hand, they are convinced that their memory misleads them, and that they could learn the 'real' tradition from the newcomers. For example, the accordion replaces the *davul-zurna* ensemble and the *saz* (see Talam, 2013), since the migrants of the 1950s brought the accordion and its music repertoire, which was very popular at that time in Yugoslavia. However, the *saz* is the symbol of Ottoman period for the ex-Yugoslavian people. The *gusla* is another musical instrument, with its accompaniment to the *epica*[9] genre, which express the emotions for the homeland and is typical for the Muslims of Bosnia and Herzegovina and its surroundings, as well as for Serbs and Croats. In the past, the urban Muslim population had a tradition of storytelling with music, but today, it is still preserved in Muslim villages. It is used as an oral history transfer, since it covers events such as epic poems, accompanied by music, heroism, tradition of telling legends, war, earthquake, fire, epidemic, famine, and drought. According to a a gusla maker in Istanbul, the peg box of the *gusla* is carved to show some symbols such as Fatih Sultan Mehmed, who was the conqueror of Bosnia and Herzegovina in 1463, and Atatürk. Jusuf Mehonjic from Sandzak, like other Muslim heroes, such as Reco, Dizdar Agha, and Musa Kesiç found in the *epica,* was also conveyed by the immigrants to Turkey, so that they keep the feelings alive against their former homeland. The migrants tell many stories about Jusuf Mehonjic and his heroism, proving that he is still considered a folk hero.

Finally, there are a number of *Sevdalinka* which express the migration and migration connotations. There are two examples below that are also known very well and performed by the Bosnian people living in Turkey. The first one is *Put putuje Latif-aga* which expresses the longing of two friends, who have settled in Bursa, for their

---

[9] Heroic songs, in other words *junacke pjesme* in Serbo-Crotian.

homeland. It is performed by many artists with different words, but the example here is taken from Safet Isovic (Various Artists, 2007).

Lyrics of *Put putuje Latif-aga*

Put putuje Latif-aga	Latif-Agha sets out
sa jaranom Sulejmanom.	With his friend Süleyman.
"Moj jarane, Sulejmane!	"My friend, Süleyman!
Je l' ti zao Banja Luke?	Do you feel sorry for Banja Luka?
Banjaluckih teferica	The countryside of Banja Luka
kraj vrbasa, aksamluka	Next to willow tree in the evening meeting
kraj vrbasa, asıkluka	Next to the willow tree, in times of love

The other example is the song called *Stari Aga* (Old Agha), which mentions longing for the homeland.

Lyrics of *Stari Aga*

Stari Aga, klonuo od bola	Elderly kneeling in pain with grief
gleda kule lijepog Istanbula	Looking at the towers of beautiful Istanbul
suza pece, staroga junaka	Old hero burns tears in his eyes
pozeleo rodjenog Sandzaka	He missed his birthplace Sancak
Eh kad bih ti moj Sandzaku ja mogao doci	Well if I could come to you my Sancak
Sjenickim poljima, kao nekad proci	If I could pass through the plains of Sjenica, as it once was.
ne bih vise pozelio anadolskog blaga	I wouldn't miss the beauties of Anatolia
dosao bih svom Sandzaku Zvizdic Hasanaga	Zvizdic Hasanaga would come to his own Sancjak
ostao bih u Sandzaku, Aga Hasanaga	Agha Hasanaga would stay in Sanjak
Nije Aga izgubio nadu	Agha did not lose hope
da se otme anadolskom blagu	Abandon the beauties of Anatolia
on ce doci voljenom Pazaru	He will come to his beloved Pazar (Novi Pazar)
makar odmah leg'o u mezaru.	Even if he's going to enter the grave at that moment
Nije Aga Bosnu zaboravio	
ni planine bosanskog bilajeta	
gdje je nekad mladost ostavljao	Agha did not forget Bosnia
ocevog i majcinog amaneta	He didn't forget its mountains.
	Once spent his youth
	His father's and mother's entrust

Conclusion

The homeland is not only a place of birth and living, but it is constructed by the imagination, depending on positive and negative emotions based on religion, the lands of a state, the shedding blood for the sake of these lands, symbols, consanguinity, and descendancy, by attributing sacredness. Migrants have mixed and contradictory feelings about the old and new homeland, since they are influenced by the emotions, caused by the similarities and differences within both homelands; therefore, they may feel the belonging to more than one homeland. So, we can call this kind of mobility the 'Interhomeland migration'. The interhomeland migrants construct their identities according to these feelings, produced in the old and new homelands, whether they are tangible or intangible. I hope, this term can be used for other migration events and diaspora studies, such as the migration of the *gastarbeiter* from Turkey to Germany or the exchange people from Turkey to Greece and from Greece to Turkey in 1923.

REFERENCES

Baker, Ulus. (2012). *Kanaatlerden imajlara: Duygular sosyolojisine doğru.* (From convictions to images: Towards the sociology of affect (. Istanbul: Birikim Publications

Bayart, Jean-François. (1999). *Kimlik Yanılsaması* (Illusion of identity). Istanbul: Metis Publications.

Bayram, Sibel. (2011). "Boşnak Şiirinde İstanbul" (Istanbul in Bosnian Poetry). *Yeni Türk Edebiyatı Araştırmaları Dergisi. 3(5): 53-68.*

Deleuze, Gilles. (2000). *Spinoza üzerine on bir ders*. (Eleven lectures on Spinoza). Ankara: Öteki Publications.

Han, Byung-Chul. (2019). *Psikopolitika: Neoliberalizm ve Yeni İktidar Teknikleri* (Psychopolitics: Neoliberalism and New Technologies of Power). Metis Publications.

Jezernik, Bozidar (ed). (2012). *Hayallerdeki "Türk"* (Imagining the "Turc"). İstanbul: Kitap Publications

Kaiser, Robert G. (1994). *The Geography of Nationalism in Russia and the USSR.* Princeton (N.J.): Princeton University Press.

Lawler, Edward J. (2001). "An Affect Theory of Social Exchange." *American Journal of Sociology*, University of Chicago Press. 107(2): 321-352.

Lomax. Alan. (1956). "Folk Song Style: Notes on a Systematic Approach to the Study of Folk Song". *Journal of the International Folk Music Council*, (8):48-50.

Marshall, Gordon. (1999). *Sosyoloji Sözlüğü* (Dictionary of Sociology). Ankara: Bilim ve Sanat Publications.

Spinoza, (2011). *Etika*. (Ülken, Hilmi Ziya, Trans.). Ankara: Dost Kitabevi Publications. [Original work published 1678]

Talam, Jasmina. (2013). *Folk Musical Instruments in Bosnia and Herzegovina*. New Castle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Thrift, Nigel. (2004). "Intensities of feeling: Towards a spatial politics of affect." *Geografiska Annaler*, 86B(1): 57–78.

Various Artists. (2007). *Sevdalinka – Sarajevo Love Songs.* (CD) Almanya: Piranha.

TAMAZ GABISONIA
Ilia State University, Georgia
tamaz.gabisonia@iliauni.edu.ge
orcid.org/0000-0001-8993-6662

Georgian Songwriter's Folk Song of Soviet Epoch as a Victim of "Authenticism"

ABSTRACT

Mass character and class reference of Soviet art quite easily echoed collective and national priorities of Georgian folk song. In addition, the authority of renowned singers and organizers of choirs was an important factor for preserving the originality in Georgian colonial cultural life, even before the establishment of Soviet Power. From the second half of the 19th century these popular leaders – choir masters – created their own versions of folk songs, as well as composed new songs, most of which, despite clear stylistic individualism, are considered 'true folklore' by the lovers of authentic folklore today.

However, the songs composed by well-known choirmasters in the second half of the 20th century, are demonstratively rejected by the folklore elite, including official structures, for being 'nonfolklore' and 'low quality'. But, stable popularity of these songs in cities and villages, provides very strong evidence of their artistic and stylistic relevance.

Thus, the policy of 'ignoring' could be attributed to the maximalist understanding of 'authentic' performance of folklore accompanying the national-independent movement in the 1980s, which introduced an important cultural phenomenon of 'revolutionary' protest in Georgian ethno-musical space. A similar tendency echoes the parallel realities of post-Soviet countries and today's fashionable 'taboo' of 'all things Soviet', regardless of the verbal thematic of the examples.

In the inertia of these vicissitudes, currently the practice of creating a song with ethnic coloring is dissociated from 'authentic' folk author-performers. But when it comes to the skill level and traditional style, this suggests mostly inadequate results in a banished, but free space.

The article discusses the boundaries and accessories of the concept of "folk song", its accordance with Georgian traditional musical style, and the problems related to this topic. Also presented is the classification scheme of Georgian musical styles based on contemporary data.

In addition to the formation of the civil consciousness, Georgian folk music and ecclesiastical chants serve as important factors for ethnic identification. Namely, in the second half of the 19thcentury, when the fight against Russian colonial policy ended unsuccessfully, preservation and development of Georgian culture, particularly, original Georgian song and chant became one of the major directions of self-preservation. This movement was largely presentational – expressed in activities on the stage, this trend has been the basic form of folklore life to this day.

It should be said that the establishment of Soviet Power changed the Government's attitude to Georgian folk song for the better. The ethnic component adjusted the role of a class component. The emphasis was made on people's, rural, and peasants' songs, which were presented naturally in an 'ethnic' aspect. 'National in form, socialist in content' – is the most adequate slogan in the time and place, where the two sides of the medal: ethnical and social are concurrently implied through the notion of 'among the people'. The ethnic side plays the role of the obverse: despite the fact that the state was proclaimed as a workers' and peasants' state, folk art of the working class was suppressed by that of the peasantry, as the latter was more traditional in agrarian Georgia. Accordingly, the music of the new times – Soviet music – was actually constructed within the folk-style framework.

The idea of Soviet art as artistic training of masses, i.e. its massive character, corresponded with the 'folk taste' of Georgian people. The main requirement for new or rearranged works – optimism saturated by the idea of Communism – also provided a place for old, traditional songs. The latter tendency made the 'democracy' of the Soviet Government 'transparent', and seemingly far from class and ethnic oppression. The motivation of folk performers – the pride aroused by the performance of national treasure before a large audience of fraternal nations (and on a narrow scale – healthy competition of Georgia's different regions at festivals or inspections) is truly noteworthy.

From today's perspective, this mass character had its advantages and disadvantages: on the one hand, it increased patriotic attitude to national song as compared to Tsarist times (folk choirs functioned in almost all large groups); new interesting genres were created (conversation of a young woman and man, eulogistic songs, potpourris); on the

other hand, the creative approach, rituals, genres, norms of individual, family, and ensemble performance were lost in mass choirs (sometimes with tens of members) during each performance. Today we can vaguely esteem the encouragement to create new – the choirmasters were obliged to eulogize new patriotic objects.

In this way, even though the leaders during this epoch imagined their times as 'paradise' for folk music, it was more of a 'purgatory' wherein folk music was 'wrapped' for stage performance. On stage, folk collectives gave initiative to a person. This is why the notion of 'author's song' (Gabisonia, 2014: 35) is topical for the new creations of the period. It is interesting that, from the Tsarist period, personal factors are better manifested in the arrangement of rural-style songs than in urban-style examples.

Can a 'songwriter's' (by person, author) song be folk? The notion of 'folk' is perceived as 'having shared, or collective authorship' and / or 'traditional folk style'. The social predicate of the first notion is smaller than the ethnic predicate of the other. At the same time, the criterion of 'folk' as a creative method (which today can also imply performance of popular traditional American jazz works by the Georgians, under 'folk') is less relevant today than the criterion of ethnic tradition formed in the diachrony of this method. Therefore, the notions of 'songwriter's' (i.e 'composed', author's') and 'folk' song are perfectly compatible, and both reflect individual creations based on the traditions of ethnic collective creativity.

'Songwriter's (author's) song without the predicate 'folk' implies the not-so-ambitious creativity of self-taught composers without the collective stylistic component. It should also be noted that the term 'author's song' often implies the songwriter's individual performance as well. But considering the Georgian tradition of joint singing, we, first of all, consider composing rather than performance.

As for the notion 'folk composer', it is somewhat delicate in relation to folklore. According to traditional accepted convention, the notion 'composer' denotes not only the person having academic education and / or professional composing technique, but the artist engaged in academic or elite professional music style in general.

So, who creates folk or songwriter's folk song? – the Choirmaster. This notion has been introduced to Georgian music from chant – the space of professional art, and well–adjusted to the function of a folk musician as a leader.

We can distinguish four stylistic directions of Georgian 'songwriter's folk song':

1. Songwriter's music created by Georgian choirmasters and adjusted to the traditional Georgian style. This tendency, originated in the second half of the 19thcentury, still continues. It is oriented towards traditional folk melodies, types of vocal movements and performance methods;

2. Soviet patriotic songs, with distinctive artistic means of expression and distinct enthusiastic style;

3. Folk-style songs composed by choirmasters, which create new standards and shape the melodies by using elements of Georgian intonation and articulation;

4. Folk-style songwriter's works created by self-taught performers, often enriched by modern electronic arrangements.

In this paper we focus on the third paragraph as a sort of 'oppressed' stratum. In the case of the first example in this list, the authors did not seek copyright, and these pieces are still considered folklore and are well–received by Georgian and foreign listeners. The second example is buried in oblivion for its ideological content, and the fourth one – even though not encouraged by the folklore community, is nonetheless able to attract a fairly large audience. It can be said that this modern self-taught songwriter's music is only a small share of the stylistic traits of Soviet songwriter's folk music, which it has inherited; it essentially replaces them with new artistic ideas, which are difficult to consider as a 'new, developed stage'.

Thus, we focus on the layer of the songwriter's folk songs from the Soviet era, imprinted by choirmasters' skillful individualism. Accordingly, they can be referred to as 'the songs of the Georgian choirmasters'.

From the four phases (Tsurtsumia, 2010: 625) of the development-mutation of Georgian folk song, this subtype – songwriter's folk song, with its original stylistics – can be distinguished as developing in parallel to traditional song.

It is noteworthy that one of the most adequate examples of Georgian songwriter's folk song is perhaps the most outstanding symbol of Georgian folk music – 'Suliko' with Varinka Machavariani-Tsereteli's 'Suliko'.

The number of connoisseurs of such songs has gradually decreased. The generation, which created and taught songwriter's songs, is mostly derogated; some of its representatives remain unmotivated today. However, these songs still retain some popularity, and the number of their listeners on the Internet serves as a testament to this. The segment of the 'choirmaster's songs' mostly encompasses vocal-instrumental educational folk groups surviving in the provinces.

Local direction of self-taught authors has a solid segment of admirers, which is manifested mostly in songs with simple structures accompanied by the panduri (Kenchiashvili, Kumsiashvili, the Gogochuri sisters). Due to the intolerant attitude of 'folklore legislators', such searches, or the abundance of artistic or expressive means are not distinguished in riches. However, there also are some improved arrangements easily projected on panduri, and some examples of modern popular music genres, on guitar.

In all the afore-mentioned directions, low quality 'Kitch' type songs, with temporary Schlager success (group Bani, trio Mandili, Elieshvili, the Zviadauri Sisters, and the Naqeuri Sisters) are still created alongside artistically interesting songwriter's songs. This is natural and we should not be shaken by such cases when criticizing this direction. In general, we consider 'parafolklore' (Gabisonia, 2014: 39) the topical term to denote this pseudo-folk kaleidoscope'. It should also be noted that there is a space of intersection for 'choirmaster's songs' and other songwriter's songs, based on folk motifs. One way or another, whether we want it or not, today such innovative style performers form a stylized portrait of the Georgian tributary of 'World Music' alongside traditional folk-style Georgian music. I agree with Anna Piotrowska, who notes that "authenticity of traditional music is reborn in the form of world music" (Piotrowska, 2010: 582).

From an axiological standpoint, the antipathy of folk tradition, appraisers of modern self-taught authors' songs are easily understandable, but what causes protestant attitude to choirmasters' songwriter's songs, which have better professional level and are closer to folklore tradition?

A large faction of the Georgian folkloristic 'establishment' does not consider songwriter's folk songs authentic. Some believe that the main disagreement between songwriter's folk songs and 'authentic' examples is their 'non-anonymity' and 'non-folk' style. Anonymity is often understood as forgetting only the author and not as the nescience of basic or primary author. However, even from this standpoint, many songwriter's songs are anonymous! As for the style, the main thing is that noticeable should be its growth from the tradition; 'propriety' or 'impropriety' of this branch, as 'canonical versions' (Garaqanidze, 2017: 79) can not be predicted.

The policy of 'ignoring' songwriter's songs can be attributed to the 'renaissance' of authentic folk performance accompanying the National-liberation movement in Georgia in the 1980s. Here, we imply the searches of Edisher Garaqanidze and his like-minded people from ensembles Mtiebi, Mzetamze and Anchiskhati, whose main priorities were to arouse interest to traditional repertoire, performer's status and method of performance.

It is not surprising that similar authentic trends are echoed in the realities of other post-Soviet countries, and coming from a nationalist, often anti-Russian sentiment, frequently forms a fashionable 'taboo' of 'all things Soviet'.

The apology of authenticity in the Georgian ethnomusicological space has introduced 'revolutionary' protest to many significant cultural phenomena. Oriental instrumental music (Duduki, Zarna, Doli), bayatis, and partially, city songs, are sacrificed to the ignorance caused by revolutionary maximalism. The 'Search for roots' obliges traditional music performers to create only versions of the existing examples. Novelty is measured by the presentation of melodious or harmonious multi-sound phrase in a new manner.

What did the folklore 'purists' forbid: authorship, style, or new form? Apparently, all three. But it is more likely that the followers of songwriter's song developed massive stylistics, which the 'authenticists' fought against. The main markers of those, who

deviated from the "path of Authenticity": mass character, performance of top voice parts by several singers, chromatic instruments, and songwriter's repertoire.

On the other hand, stage reproduction of authentic examples with the consideration of the conditions of indirect, natural development, does not reveal more legitimacy on the part of songwriter's song. Domestic attributes of the genre are lost in both; if here stylistic diversity flows from the diversity of dialects, there – it is formed by personal individualism, which is an immanent peculiarity of the postmodern epoch. The listener's emic factor is also to be considered: choirmasters', as well as self-educated songwriter's songs are clearly perceived as 'folklore' by their admirers. In general, identification of events in cultural mosaics is more relevant than their axiological consideration.

It is interesting that the personal factor is the most important in the surviving variants of Georgian chants. This refers to the Karbelashvilis' gamshveneba (prolongued singing of syllables), as well as to Khundadze's and Nikoladze's methods of vocal tuning and Nakashidze's consonants in the Shemokmedi mode (Gabisonia, 2015: 153).

The events parallel to 'folk authentization' developed in Georgian ecclesiastical music practice as well. Facing the traditions in this space was expected to result in a stricter, and more conservative approach to the heretofore existing practice, than in singing space. However, the severity of prohibitions in these two directions insignificantly differed from each other.

In 2003 the Synod of the Georgian Orthodox Church adopted the resolution that only traditional hymns should be chanted during the Divine Liturgy. This position slowly killed the eclectic 'Sioni' style, as well as the hymns composed by individual professional, and self-taught authors (Kechaqmadze, Kochlamazashvili, Berishvili, Garaqanidze). However, in this regard, the hymns composed by Patriarch Ilia II are, in fact, violators of this resolution. But the patriarch's practice has not been widely spread.

One way or another, the practice of songwriter's chants in Divine service has already suffered a failure in Georgian liturgical space, and seems to have no prospect in the near future either.

Earlier we identified traditionality and rural culture as the main criteria for the authenticity of Georgian folk song (Gabisonia, 2014: 28); traditionality is the main feature of folklore in general (Zemtsovsky, 1977: 71; Anikin, 1997: 225).

What are basic stylistic markers for songwriter's folk songs? First of all, expansion of melody under the conditions of homophony should be emphasized here. On the other hand, the repetition of the ending phrase is also noteworthy; it is also important to make a clear distinction between the parts of soloists and choir, and increase the size of the soloist's part; an important factor is also the instrumental accompaniment, which alongside adding folk timbre-rhythmic coloring to the piece, 'enriches' it with the colors of harmonic functionalism - most distinguished among them is major-minor alternation. From this standpoint, the alternation of major and minor sixths (rather than that of major and minor thirds) is very characteristic of this style, as are the elements of the so-called 'Pshavian mode' (Phrygian mode with a raised sixth). It can be said that the trend of hybridity, which started in Georgian folklore in the 19thcentury and developed in two directions - European and Asian, is presented in choirmasters' songs with the elements of European harmony.

In songwriter's songs the dominance of Eastern homophony over Western polyphony is significant. However, in both cases, the melody is on the foreground, indicating that for people polyphonic musical texture is not as topical as melody. And the basic sign of songwriter's songs is a long melody with dramaturgical order.

From the socio-genre point of view, songwriter's folk song puts the love theme on the front line. Patriotic motives are also ponderous.

What stylistic associations do songwriter's songs have with traditional Georgian folk songs? One of the most striking musical analogies here is the cadence on the fifth reaching the tonic of the sixth and seventh steps ('Georgian Dominant' Chkhikvadze, 1961: 8). This, as well as parallel movement of top voice-parts is characteristic of Georgian folklore of later time in general (Chkhikvadze, 1981: 4), where top voice-part determines major-minor mode.

From the timbre standpoint, one of the most significant features of such a song is the panduri – the truly most democratic Georgian instrument, which, for its function, can be

called 'Georgian Guitar' (in this sense the chonguri is less popular). The role of chromatic instruments is significant for the popularity of songwriter's songs. Traditional examples and innovative harmonic modulations can be easily performed on a chromatic panduri. Traditional and chromatic panduri and chonguri do not differ from each other in terms of sound, appearance, manner of playing and rhythmic configuration.

Not only chromatization, but also the creation of instrumental orchestras (Vashakidze's initiative in the 1930s-40s) established an exclusive, only 'creative machine' for folk music, where new ideas originated and old creative ideas were processed.

In general, it should be said that the development of distinctively ethnic Georgian song in Soviet Georgia was differentiated based on the performance location and types of performers, which resulted in the ramification into the following directions (the chronology is adhered to as much as possible):

•Songs for folk ensembles and choirs (D. Lolua, V. Simonishvili, A. Erkomaishvili, V. Mchedlishvili, Gr. Kokeladze);

•Songs for folk-style performers;

•Songs for a string-instrumental (guitar, panduri, chonguri) trio (quartet or duet): The Ishkhneli sisters, Mirianashvili, The Chikhladzes, I. Gurgulia, R. Sebiskveradze, N. Dughashvili, N. Gabunia, J. Sepiashvili, L. Gegelia, D. Turiashvili, I, Bobokhidze, E Chelidze;

•Songs for solo singers – R. Laghidze, G. Tsabadze, B. Kvernadze, V. Azarashvili, V. Durglishvili, N. Ergemlidze, J. Sepiashvili, Z. Mzhavia, etc.;

•Songs for films;

•Songs for vocal-instrumental ensembles – V. Durglishvili, A. basilaia, r. Bardzimashvili, S. Ebralidze, Kitishvili;

•Songs performed by songwriters ('bards') – I. Gurgulia, M. Menabde;

•Songs for academic performers;

•Folk- and ethno jazz/rock/electronic music (Kitiashvili, 'Orera', 'Shin', 'Egari', Machaidze, Dzodzuashvili).

Among the above-mentioned trends style crossing (fusion, cross-over, hybridization) tendencies are particularly noteworthy.

It is worth mentioning that with the exception of the last point on the list, pieces from each of these branches have the potential to become popular and gain 'folk' features. In this respect, and without regarding ethnic component, today's array of popular music encompasses the following directions:

•Authentic folk music (genres – Nana, feast - mostly urban, amusing);

•Reproduction of authentic folklore – stage folk music;

•Stage folk music in traditional style;

•Urban songs (Tsisperi trio, Simi, Porchkhidze, etc);

•'Panogh' music (baiatis, duduki);

•Oriental-style post-folklore (Chkheidze, Kikabidze);

•Post-folklore (Georgian and foreign pop-songs, 'Chanson');

•Georgian songwriter's folk song (old layer – Kevkhishvili, Arjevnishvili, Zakaidze, Psuturi, Erkomaishvili, Khatelishvili, and new layer – Kumsiashvili, Kenchiashvili, the Gogochuri sisters, the Zviadauris, the Naqeuris, Doiauri, etc);

•Georgian ethno-music (modern composed music, with the mix of fusion, jazz, rock and electronic music, etc).

To summarize, we would like to emphasize the following:

•The Soviet period created a new direction in Georgian folk music, which enriched its ethnic culture with artistic tendencies and interesting innovations;

•The pieces inspired by folk motifs, written by choirmasters and individual self-taught composers, popular among wide audiences, can be considered folk songs;

•The main stylistic feature of folk songs is distinctive individuality, with the emphasis on melodic development and harmonious innovations of the chromatic panduri;

•Georgian folk-musical society unjustly ignores songwriter's folk songs, which partly reduces the motivation to create of new folk pieces.

Finally, it should be said that Georgian songwriter's folk song is a worthy and artistically interesting part of Georgian culture, which needs more attention from both cultural officials and ethnomusicologists alike.

REFERENCES

Anikin, Vladimir. Prokopyevich. (1997). "Непостфольклор, а фольклор (к постановке вопроса о его современны хтрадициях" (Not 'post-folklore' but 'folklore' (to the question of its contemporary traditions) [Proceedings of the scientific-practice conference: Slavic traditional culture and the modern world]. Dobrovolskaya, Varvara Evgenyevna (Ed.), (pp. 224-240). Moscow: State Republican Center for Russian Folklore.

Chkhikvadze, Grigol. (1961). "თანამედროვე ქართული მუსიკალური ფოლკლორი." (Georgian Contemporary Musical Folklore). Tbilisi: Society for the dissemination of political and scientific knowledge of the Georgian SSR.

Chkhikvadze, Grigol. (1981-1982). "კრიმანჭული ქართულ ხალხურ სიმღერებში და მისი ნაირსახეობანი." (Krimanchuli in Georgian Folk Songs and Its Diversities). Tbilisi: Manuscript of Tbilisi State Conservatoire.

Gabisonia, Tamaz. (2014). "Критерии „аутентичности"в грузинском народном музыкальном исполнительстве" (Criteria of 'Autenticity' in Traditional Georgian Musical Performance). Belgrade: Musicology, a peer-reviewed journal of the Institute of Musicology of Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts.

Gabisonia, Tamaz. (2015). ავტორი ქართულ ეთნიკურ მუსიკაში. (The Author in Georgian Ethnic Music), The Issues of Performance Folk and Church Music. [Giorgi

Garaqanidze X International Festival of Folk and Church Music in Batumi]. Managadze, Khatuna (ed.), (pp. 145-163). Batumi: Music Faculty of Batumi Art State University.

Garaqanidze, Edisher. (2007). რჩეული წერილები. (Featured Letters). Manana Akhmeteli (Ed.). Tbilisi: Georgian Music Society.

Piotrowska, Anna. (2010) "World Music and Traditional Music. The Problem of Authenticity", [The Fourth International Symposium on Traditional Polyphony, Proceedings], Tsurtsumia, Rusudan, and Jordania, Joseph. (Eds.), (pp. 581-589). Tbilisi: International Research Center for Traditional Polyphony of Tbilisi State,

Tsurtsumia, Rusudan. (2010). "Georgian Polyphony in a Modern Socio-Cultural Context". (The Fourth international Symposium on Traditional Polyphony). Turtsumia, Rusudan and Jordania, Joseph (eds.), (pp. 622-636). Tbilisi: International Research Center for Traditional Polyphony of Tbilisi State Conservatoire.

Zemtsovsky, Izali. (1977). "Народная музыка и современность (К проблеме определения фольклора" (Folk music and modernity (On the problem of determining folklore)), Modernity and folklore: articles and materials. in Gusev, Victor and Gorkovenko, Aleksandr (comp.), (pp. 28-75). Moscow: Music.