

ISSN: 2980-3179

BİNGÖL UNIVERSITY

# Academic Journal of Philology

Year: 1

December 2023

Issue: 1



BİNGÖL  
UNIVERSITY

Published by Bingöl University Graduate School of Foreign Languages and  
Department of English Language and Literature

*Academic Journal of Philology*  
Volume/Cilt: 1 | Issue/Sayı: 1 | Year/Yıl: 2023

**Publisher / Yayınlayan**

Bingöl University Faculty of Science and Letters Department of English Language and Literature

Bingöl University Graduate School of Foreign Languages

**Owner / Sahibi**

*On behalf of Bingöl University*

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ahmet KAYINTU

**Editor in Chief / Baş Editör**

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ahmet KAYINTU

**Editorial Assistant / Yardımcı Editör**

Res. Assist. Adnan AYDINTÜRK

**Technical Editor / Teknik Editör**

Res. Assist. Murathan GÜNDOĞDU

**Editorial Board / Yayın Kurulu**

Prof. Dr. Hikmet TAN

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Önder ÇAKIRTAŞ

Assist. Prof. Dr. Özlem ULUCAN

Assist. Prof. Dr. Çilem AYDOĞDU

Assist. Prof. Dr. Yasemin BAYSAL

Assist. Prof. Dr. Ahmet KESMEZ

**Layout Editor / Mizanpaj Editörü**

Res. Assist. Yakup BOR

**Cover Design / Kapak Tasarımı**

Res. Assist. Murathan GÜNDOĞDU

**Correspondence Address / Yazışma Adresi**

Bingöl Üniversitesi Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulu Müdürlüğü 12100 - Bingöl

Tel.: 0 (426) 215 00 17 - 5363

E-mail: [philology@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:philology@bingol.edu.tr)

ISSN: 2980-3179

Mümin HAKKIOĞLU - Gümüşhane University

Aytaç ÖREN - Sağlık Bilimleri University

Vefa KOCA - Ağrı İbrahim Çeçen University

Mehmet AYDINTÜRK - Ağrı İbrahim Çeçen University

Yasemin BAYSAL - Bingöl University

Mustafa ALTUNBAY - Bingöl University

Mehmet Faruk ARAZ - Bingöl University

Zehra EKİNEKER GÜDER - Bingöl University

Mesut KİNEŞ - Siirt University

Muhammed Harun KAYA - Ağrı İbrahim Çeçen University

## About:

Academic Journal of Philology is an international academic journal published by the School of Foreign Languages and the Department of English Language and Literature at Bingöl University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, with the aim of presenting original, unpublished, and not-submitted-elsewhere works in the fields of linguistics, language education, world literature, and philology to the scholarly community. The journal welcomes submissions in the form of research articles, book reviews, compilations, and symposium evaluations, all contributing to the academic discourse in these specified areas. It is released three times a year, during the Spring, Summer, and Fall terms. The publication languages include German, French, Turkish, English, Persian, Russian, Kurdish, or Arabic. Article submission deadlines are as follows: the end of November for the Fall term, the end of February for the Spring term, and the end of July for the Summer term. Manuscripts submitted for publication undergo a thorough process, including initial screening, plagiarism detection, peer review, and language assessment. During the initial screening stage, if a submission does not pass after three evaluations, it is returned to the author and will not be reconsidered for the same publication term. Manuscripts that successfully pass the initial screening are subjected to the evaluation process under the double-blind peer review principle, involving at least two reviewers. The journal encourages contributions in various languages and ensures the quality and originality of the submitted works through a meticulous review process.

## Hakkında:

Academic Journal of Philology, dilbilimi, dil eğitimi, dünya edebiyatı ve filoloji alanlarında özgün, yayımlanmamış, yayımlanmak üzere başka yere gönderilmemiş, makale, kitap kritiği, çeviri, derleme ve sempozyum değerlendirmesi gibi çalışmaların bilim alemine sunulması amacıyla kurulmuş akademik bir dergidir. Academic Journal of Philology, Bingöl Üniversitesi Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulu ve Fen Edebiyat Fakültesi İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı bölümü tarafından Yaz ve Güz dönemi olmak üzere yılda üç defa yayımlanır. Yayım dili, Almanca, Fransızca, Türkçe, İngilizce, Farsça, Rusça, Kürtçe veya Arapçadır. Makale son kabul tarihleri, Güz Dönemi için Kasım ayı sonu, Bahar dönemi için Şubat ayı sonu, Yaz Dönemi için Temmuz ayı sonudur. Yayımlanmak üzere gönderilen makaleler ön kontrol, intihal taraması, hakem değerlendirmesi ile dil kontrolü aşamalarından geçirilmektedir. Ön Kontrol aşamasında üç defa incelendiği halde bu süreçten geçemeyen çalışma, yazara iade edilmekte ve aynı yayın döneminde tekrar işleme alınmamaktadır. Ön Kontrol aşamasını geçen çalışmalar ise çift taraflı kör hakemlik ilkesi çerçevesinde en az iki hakemin görev aldığı değerlendirme sürecine alınmaktadır.

## Editor's Note

We are pleased to present the first issue of Academic Journal of Philology, prepared by the School of Foreign Languages and the Department of English Language and Literature at Bingöl University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences. In this issue, we take joy in bringing together five research articles, produced with the contributions of expert academics in their respective fields. These original works are poised to make significant contributions to both the fields of English literature and language teaching. With the hope that each of these studies will contribute meaningfully to the realm of academia, we eagerly anticipate their impact on the academic community.

**Assoc. Prof. Dr. Ahmet KAYINTU**

*Editor in Chief*

## Editörden

Bingöl Üniversitesi Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulu ve Fen Edebiyat Fakültesi İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü olarak hazırladığımız Academic Journal of Philology'nin ilk sayısıyla karşınızdayız. Bu sayıda, alanlarında uzman bilim insanlarının katkılarıyla kaleme alınan beş adet araştırma makalesini sizlerle buluşturmanın mutluluğunu yaşıyoruz. Bu özgün çalışmaların hem İngiliz Edebiyatı hem de dil öğretimi alanlarında literatüre önemli katkı sağlayacağına inanıyoruz. Her bir çalışmanın bilim dünyasına katkı sağlaması dileğiyle...

**Doç. Dr. Ahmet KAYINTU**

*Baş Editör*

Contents / İçindekiler

Research Articles / Araştırma Makaleleri	Pages / Sayfalar
<b>Children in the Age of Multiculturalism: The Case Brick Lane and White Teeth</b> <i>Çokkültürlülük Çağında Çocuklar: Brick Lane ve İnci Gibi Dişler Örneği</i> <b>Ahmet KAYINTU</b>	<b>1-25</b>
<b>Memory, Loss, and Nostalgia in Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go and Atwood's The Handmade's Tale</b> <i>Kazuo Ishiguro'nun Beni Asla Bırakma Ve Margaret Atwood'un Damızlık Kızın Öyküsü</i> <i>Romanlarında Bellek, Kayıp ve Nostalji</i> <b>Yasemin BAYSAL</b>	<b>26-37</b>
<b>صورة العرب في شاهنامه الف</b> <i>Firdevsî'nin Şâhnâme'sinde Arap Tasavvuru</i> <b>Moustafa ALBAKOUR</b>	<b>38-55</b>
<b>The Significance of Vocabulary Knowledge in Reading Comprehension</b> <i>Okuduğunu Anlamada Kelime Bilgisinin Önemi</i> <b>Adnan AYDINTÜRK &amp; Mehmet TAKKAÇ</b>	<b>56-68</b>
<b>History and Memory in The Sense of An Ending by Julian Barnes</b> <i>Julian Barnes'ın Bir Son Duygusu Eserinde Tarih ve Hafıza</i> <b>Münevver BARTAMAY</b>	<b>69-76</b>

Makalenin Türü – Article Type: Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article

Geliş Tarihi – Date Received: 21.09.2023

Kabul Tarihi – Date Accepted: 23.10.2023

## Children in the Age of Multiculturalism: The Case of *Brick Lane* and *White Teeth*

*Çokkültürlülük Çağında Çocuklar: Brick Lane ve İnci Gibi Dişler Örneği*

*Ahmet KAYINTU\**

### Abstract

This article examines the question of how children reflect national and multinational identity in multicultural societies through Monica Ali's novels *Brick Lane* and Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. In these works, the course of changes in the attitudes of children and young heroes towards themselves, their nation, and others is discussed in the axis of a multicultural society. Multiculturalism, which is largely shaped by immigration, includes children in its scope, especially through encounters in educational settings. In this process, in which the school plays an extremely important role, children try to adapt to a multicultural society and overcome the problems they encounter with the choices of their parents and the opportunities offered by the educational environment. There are two main views on the education of children in multicultural societies. The first of these is that special education does not help the development of students in minority communities and their integration into the society they live in. Secondly, each of the groups is encouraged to explore the cultures of other groups individually and to gain common values based on respect and harmony. Although children seem to be free from the responsibilities of adults, they are faced with many obligations regarding both their own cultural peers and the cultural patterns of others, assuming that they are at an age and period where they can best adapt to their own cultural codes. Among them, they are expected to acknowledge differences and respect each cultural group, interact and empathize with them, work together, and overcome problems on the basis of living together.

**Keywords:** English Literature, Multiculturalism, *Brick Lane*, *White Teeth*, Immigration

---

\* Assoc. Prof. Dr., Department of English Language and Literature, Bingöl University, E-mail: [akayintu@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:akayintu@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0001-6539-0028

## Children in the Age of Multiculturalism: The Case of *Brick Lane* and *White Teeth*

*Çokkültürlülük Çağında Çocuklar: Brick Lane ve İnci Gibi Dişler Örneği*

Ahmet KAYINTU\*

### Öz

Bu makale, çok kültürlü toplumlarda çocukların ulusal ve çokuluslu kimliği nasıl yansıttığı sorusunu Monica Ali'nin *Brick Lane* ve Zadie Smith'in *White Teeth* adlı romanları üzerinden incelemektedir. Bu eserlerde çok kültürlü toplum ekseninde çocuk ve genç kahramanların kendilerine, uluslarına ve başkalarına karşı tutumlarındaki değişimin seyri ele alınmaktadır. Büyük ölçüde göçlerle şekillenen çok kültürlülük, özellikle eğitim ortamlarındaki karşılaşmalar yoluyla çocukları da kapsamına almaktadır. Okulun son derece önemli rol oynadığı bu süreçte çocuklar, ebeveynlerinin seçimleri ve eğitim ortamının sunduğu olanaklarla çok kültürlü bir topluma uyum sağlamaya ve karşılaştıkları sorunları aşmaya çalışırlar. Çok kültürlü toplumlarda çocukların eğitimi konusunda iki temel görüş vardır. Bunlardan ilki, özel eğitimin azınlık topluluklarındaki öğrencilerin gelişimine ve içinde yaşadıkları toplumla bütünleşmelerine yardımcı olmamasıdır. İkinci olarak, grupların her biri diğer grupların kültürlerini bireysel olarak keşfetmeye ve saygı ve uyuma dayalı ortak değerler kazanmaya teşvik edilir. Çocuklar, yetişkinlerin sorumluluklarından arınmış gibi görünseler de, kendi kültürel kodlarına en iyi uyum sağlayabilecekleri bir yaş ve dönemde oldukları varsayıldığında, hem kendi kültürel akranları hem de başkalarının kültürel kalıpları ile ilgili pek çok yükümlülükle karşı karşıya kalmaktadırlar. Bunlar arasında, farklılıkları kabul etmeleri ve her bir kültürel gruba saygı duymaları, onlarla etkileşime girmeleri ve empati kurmaları, birlikte yaşama temelinde birlikte çalışmaları ve sorunların üstesinden gelmeleri beklenmektedir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** İngiliz Edebiyatı, Çokkültürlülük, *Brick Lane*, *White Teeth*, Göç

---

\* Doç. Dr., İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü, Bingöl Üniversitesi, E-posta: [akayintu@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:akayintu@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0001-6539-0028



## Introduction

Of two novels, Monica Ali's *Brick Lane* offers a poignant exploration of the lives of Bangladeshi immigrants in London and the challenges they face in reconciling their cultural heritage with their new environment. Among the various elements that contribute to the richness of the narrative are the depictions of children. Children in *Brick Lane* are not merely secondary characters; they play a crucial role in reflecting and shaping the overarching themes of identity, cultural assimilation, and family dynamics. One of the prominent themes in *Brick Lane* is the clash between tradition and modernity. Through characters like Chanu and Nazneen, Ali illustrates the struggles of the older generation in adapting to the Western lifestyle. This tension is further highlighted by the experiences of their children, who often serve as symbols of cultural confluence. For instance, Shahana's exploration of fashion and identity signifies a generational shift and raises questions about cultural authenticity. Ali skilfully portrays the innocence of childhood and the loss of that innocence in the face of harsh realities. As the story unfolds, we witness the children, particularly Shahana and Bibi, gradually becoming aware of the complexities of their world. The juxtaposition of their innocence with the challenges they witness, such as domestic strife and racial tensions, contributes to the novel's emotional depth. On the other hand, Zadie Smith's debut novel, *White Teeth*, stands as a vivid exploration of multiculturalism, identity, and societal changes in London. Amidst the intricate web of characters and themes, children emerge as significant agents in conveying the complexities of cultural interactions and generational shifts. *White Teeth* presents a kaleidoscope of cultures, reflecting the diverse landscape of London. Children, like Irie and Magid-Millat, embody the intersection of various cultural influences. Their mixed heritage symbolizes the bridging of different worlds, portraying a sense of hybrid identity that challenges traditional notions of cultural purity. The novel's child characters are on a quest for identity, grappling with questions of selfhood, belonging, and heritage. Irie's journey to understand her roots and her struggle to reconcile her Jamaican and English heritage mirrors the larger theme of identity negotiation within the multicultural context of the novel.

Multiculturalism, which was put forward as a solution to the problems of living together and adaptation, is most effective in the lives of children. Among other definitions, Desai's (2006) approach to bridging multiculturalism and education merits special emphasis: Multiculturalism and education, which are quite different from each other but also have a very intricate relationship, can still meet on the same ground. According to one of them, the issue of multiculturalism in terms of education generally refers to children who are relatively disadvantaged and underrepresented compared to their peers in North America and Continental

European societies. In addition, it should be noted that it points to the literature and curriculum in which these children are the subject, and a general level of awareness about all these (p. 164). On the other hand, children's literature represents an appropriate method of instilling appropriate bourgeois values into learning by transforming it into a pleasant learning process, almost as a hobby. In this respect, children's literature undertakes a historical mission. However, another feature of children's literature is that it has significance in the internalization of principles such as purity, simplicity, transparency, and innocence, which are the most ideal values that give meaning and spirit to childhood, which is one of the most special and original periods of human life (Sreevinas, 2011, p. 321). So, together with children's literature, it can be much more complex and difficult to distinguish the different forms that multiculturalism takes in fields and environments based on practice, as well as the ways in which multiculturalism is theoretically quite different from each other, and sometimes even contradictory to each other. However, despite such difficulties, it is known that some of the multicultural education practices among university students are studied at a higher rate than others (Rosenthal & Levy, 2010). As for its relationship with literature election criteria for multicultural literature practically enhance cultural consciousness and sensibility, and frequently underestimate the dominance, spread, and diffusion of power (Ching, 2005, p. 129). In multicultural contexts, those who are the most fragile to vicissitudes of cultural and family life are children because children are expected to respect their cultural group and the cultural groups of others, play with people from different groups, work together, solve problems, and overcome obstacles. Moreover, their views on all social problems are never asked, and they have a responsibility to fully comply with the decisions taken. And most importantly, at the end of all these stages, it is never questioned how much impact it has on children's lives. One of the most critical problems children face is that they often do not receive the messages we want them to learn. In *Brick Lane*, while some characters struggle with their circumstances, others, like Shahana, exhibit a growing sense of agency and empowerment. Shahana's determination to pursue an education and challenge societal norms speaks to the transformative power of education and personal growth. Her journey becomes a beacon of hope, suggesting the potential for change and progress within the community. *White Teeth* explores the tensions between generations, often highlighting the disparities in values and perspectives. Children serve as catalysts for these clashes, questioning the beliefs of their parents and challenging established norms. Joshua Chalfen's rejection of his father's atheism, for instance, signifies the generational divide and underscores the evolving nature of beliefs across time. Children are often unaware of racist and sexist approaches and do not recognize stereotypes and prejudices.

However, if young children are repeatedly exposed to preconceived representations through words and pictures, there is a danger that such distortions may become part of their thinking. Even though children's culture may be a hypothetically unexplored point around multiculturalism in common, it can shed critical light on the flow of children's literature's work of colonizing and politicizing 'minorities'. In addition, by centering on children's writing, and especially following its advancement since the official usage of multiculturalism, where writing capacities as a social item that both reflects and shapes the culture of those who occupy it – "Customers" or beneficiaries can, in turn, play a part within the generation of culture and scholarly works (Carpenter, 1996, p. 1). Children are isolated from the more extensive society because of their age, interface, and typical disregard for adult conventions. Until they become completely working, competent grown-ups, they have to learn and internalize these conventions and be enculturated. But sometime recently and amid the acculturation preparation, children have more in common than with grown-ups who control them. Additionally, the dialect, religion, and social contrasts that adults must get over in arrange to share the same habitation are inappropriate for peers. In this manner, the children's reaction to their communal convention ties them together as an imperative gathering of individuals within a bigger society.

Children can socialize within the course of life that molds the more prominent societies of which they are a portion, in most of the schools and media in which they spend their lives, beginning with their family life. At the same time, children ought to learn to be individuals of both their own worlds and their brief era inside them. Whereas learning how to treat each other, children get to retain information and know the connections among conventions, desires, convictions, standards, values, and social parts. They acclimatize a vast number of unwritten rules overseeing social behavior. Sometimes, this learning adjusts to what grown-ups need from their children. It seems irrelevant to adults, and it goes against their wishes in some cases. Undoubtedly, numerous significant pressures between grown-ups and children have their roots within the competing needs of childhood and grown-up societies. Namely, educational activities, including learning and writing, are not for children. On the opposite, instruction and literature for children can also function as texts created by adults so that they can adopt the cultural, social, and moral values conveyed by adults to come in conjunction with grown-up endorsement.

To elaborate, the primary judgment which follows back to John Locke, still existing despite the restricting voices of twentieth-century psychoanalysts, identity scholars, geneticists, and teachers, is the presumption that children take what they are given and apply it, considering

children to be void of the ability to think, state of their mind and identity, that children are only beneficiaries of culture and, as such, exist in a pre-cultural circumstance or a pre-culture, instead of a social arrangement preparation Children are molded by creative manipulators of a dynamic web of concepts, actions, emotions, and products. Throughout the world, children's own culture is arguably the most suppressed cultural discourse. Concepts, oral traditions, material creations, and other cultural artifacts shared among children are either ignored or underestimated or considered temporary and insignificant phenomena.

### **Children and Multiculturalism**

Asian and black children born in Britain are caught between three societies and torn between counter-cultural relations. It is worth noting that such impacts of bi-culturalism exist in nearly all children. Although England has a unique culture, barriers to the integration of ethnic communities should be minimized and, if possible, eliminated by the host community, so that they can adapt to the social structure of the countries they migrate to. In a broad sense, it can be said that the children who are members of the working class today fit a trimodal plan of school adjustment. The importance of school in this context is undeniable, as immigrant children, through the trust they have in their parents, accept to be securely attached to a society they choose to join as a result of their parents' conscious choice. At this stage, school, as a meeting point where children establish a common bond with the society in question, constitutes the first step of this close bond (Suárez-Orozco, 2001, p. 345). Many such children do exceptionally well in school, beating native-born children in terms of grades, execution on standardized tests, and states of intellect toward instruction. In any case, others tend to achieve underneath their nearby-born peers. Another presupposition concerning children is that they do not have an essential culture of their claim or that their commitment is pointless given the wealth of multicultural fabric for grown-ups. Minority children cannot make their voices heard through their own perceptions since exceptionally few ethnocultural minorities have worked in peer groups that effectively transmit a wealthy culture from their legacy to another era. Instead, grown-ups educate their children on suitable traditions in domestic or corporate settings to raise legacy mindfulness. As a result, distributed works on multicultural childhood conventions are regularly pointed at grown-ups and, like UNICEF's book, *The World Recreations*, are worldwide in scope. Agreeing on one of the reports arranged by the Commission on Racial Balance (CRE), pronouncing that segregation against any individual on the premise of race, color, nationality, or root is illegal is one of the foremost vital works for the end of segregation, the advancement of correspondence and the advancement of great race relations and the interests of ethnic minorities within the nation. It is a vital open institution. Moreover, the report

pointed to contributing to the struggle about movement, social contrasts, and personality. It follows that both Asian and West Indian children may not be happy about this as they have a dual personality. Related to this moving and unreliable individual personality could be a strife between the viewpoints, propensities, and conduct anticipated by the family, by specialists at school, and by white and minority peer bunches (Home Affairs Committee, 1980-81, p. xiii).

The chief controversy about multicultural instruction has been among proponents of particularist and pluralistic education. Concurring with the primary bunch, it centers on instructing the culture in which the understudies have a place, whereas agreeing to the moment is characterized by social consistency and associating with other societies (Reingold, 2005). Advocates of particularist multicultural instruction accept that multicultural education obscures the social control structure segregating against lower-class individuals and marginalized ethnic minority bunches. So multicultural teaching based on partitioned educational modules should be favored for individuals of different sets. Defenders of pluralistic multicultural instruction, on the other hand, accept that particularism underpins an ethnocentric approach, as it is commonplace with his or her claim culture, in this way which contributes to separatism and social divisions. According to them, special instruction does not contribute to the instructive progression of minority understudies and their future integration into society. In contrast, pluralistic education empowers each group to know the cultures of other bunches and procure devices and values of uniformity and shared regard. This will assign an awareness exchange between different clusters (Haj Yahya, 2021, p. 3). Proponents of pluralistic multicultural instruction, on the other hand, accept that particularism bolsters an ethnocentric approach, in accordance with his or her possessed culture, hence contributing to separatism and social divisions. Children can create way better comprehension through presentation to and appreciation of conventions comparable to their peers but from other ethnocultural bunches is still unrecognized. From this perspective, excellent multicultural writing is informative in the broad sense. It is no more instructive than other excellent writing that tries to lock in children in individual improvement. The distinction is the request for comprehensiveness, particularly one that relates to different points of view and does not favor one party over the other. Whereas passing on a total picture of verifiable occasions and other societies, writing opens the plausibility of profound and complex reflections on who we are and how we are as countries and people. Hence, the standards that make writing less clearly instructional than nonfiction or ethical lessons (for instance, its inclination for feeling over truth) make it a suitable apparatus for educating children to investigate more extensive skylines. Such work welcomes individual development that leads to an understanding of diverse perspectives. However, it is contended

that social contrasts can be studied in a positive light. It was accepted that the more ethnic societies included in the British national culture, the more it would enhance and separate positively. In this way, British national culture compares a collection of an inborn culture and differing qualities of other societies. Furthermore, the Committee exemplified young Bangladeshi children born in Britain as carriers of two diverse communities: inborn and ethnic. Opposite the opinions that highlight racial impediments, this double social subject is not displayed as isolated between countercultural relations; on the contrary, it stands out as an elective picture of intercultural existential peace.

### **Children and Multiculturalism in *Brick Lane***

In his analysis of the novel *Migration and the Politics of Narrative Form: Realism and the Postcolonial Subject in Brick Lane*, Alistair Cormack contends Monica Ali's novel, *Brick Lane*, which was published in 2003 and is about Bangladeshi immigrants who have settled in London, was a huge success in both England and Bangladesh. The novel, which has a postcolonial character, offers an opportunity to reveal the interaction of these two phenomena, both in terms of understanding the dynamics of multiculturalism and in understanding the multifaceted nature of the element of migration in its historical context (2006, p. 695). According to Michael Perfect, Monica Ali utilizes patterns as contrasts with the aim to stress her main character's integration into the modern British community, and it is possible that the novel may well be construed as an example of multicultural Bildungsroman (2008, p. 1). In *Brick Lane*, young characters such as Nazneen's young girls Shahana and Bibi and Radia's children Tariq and Shelfari, representatives of the second generation, have been acclimatized into British culture. The battle for their characters is different from the fight for their guardians. Rather than attempting to blend in with the culture, they are trying to discover their claim space by taking advantage of the culture they grew up in and, to a few degrees, by receiving or dismissing their parents' culture. The struggle between these two-generation immigrants shapes the work. The matter has been tended to in family strife between Nazneen's young girls, Shahana and Bibi, and her father, Chanu. Shahana and Bibi became exceptionally well-familiarized with British society. Their characters are built concurring with British social standards. They do not have the feeling that they have a place in Bangladesh. Chanu strengthens his girls to remain associated with his domestic nation's culture. But that association appears futile to the young girls who cannot relate to the places or societies they do not know. As Nazneen's children grow up, we, as readers, see an attitude that is more critical and challenging to her environment, and traditions, and ultimately confronting a rupture for personal and social reasons stemming from Nazneen. Ali reshapes the creations of Nazneen's children, Bibi and Shahana, in both

traditional and Western settings to epitomize the changing energy of their family part, as they are second-generation children who do not have any knowledge of their own country, customs, and culture. They are clearly influenced by British culture. Chanu, having a certain understanding of Western culture, fails and finally says that he wants to return home once again, and tries to impose his Bangladeshi identity on his children. The balance between the instructive and the performative underlies the issues and pressures of Chanu as a first-generation migrant. In order to make up for his dissatisfaction with succeeding in English culture, he creates a mythic Bangladesh. He presupposes that the Bengali artist Rabindranath Tagore is “the genuine father of [the] country” (Ali, 2003, p. 147) and he demands that his uprooted young ladies learn to show Tagore’s piece “Brilliant Bengal” in orchestrating to induce it their roots. Similar to this thought of an instructive national culture is his over the best samples of Bangladesh's past: Chanu complains about his children's having no sense of their homeland’s authentic and social roots rather than being mindful of as it were starvation and surge in Britain, which he reviled as a cursed nation (Ali, 2003, p. 151). Bibi, especially Shahana, does not have to be held or acknowledge their residential nation. Nazneen thinks that Shahana did not ought to tune in to Bengali classical music. Her composed Bengali was staggering. She is required to wear pants. She loathed her kameez and demolished her entire closet by pouring paint on them. It was no challenge on the off chance that she may select between arranged beans and dal. Shahana did not care. Shahana did not get to return home (Ali, 2003, p. 144). As he is willing to prepare his children to lead a comfortable life in the country they live in, Chanu tries to raise them mentally, behaviourally, and culturally so that they can adapt to society and become a part of the social fabric. For this, they constantly learn the Qur’anic duas and a lot of prayers to cut the corn, cut their father’s nails and nose hair, turn the pages of their books and at the same time not forget their own culture. However, they have many other responsibilities that they still have to fulfill. Chanu and the children appear in a number of centers inside the story. The parent-child relationships depicted in *Brick Lane* offer a multifaceted exploration of familial dynamics. Nazneen's connection with her daughters evolves as she navigates her own identity crisis, leading to a deeper understanding of her role as a mother. Chanu's aspirations for his children, despite his own struggles, reflect the universal desire for a better future. Chanu overpowered his children with dreadful experience, beating his children with anything at hand, in fact, a banana peel. Ali says, “An instrument less whipping was a slip by of caring duty” (2003, p. 144). Bibi and Shahana are as reasonable as Nazneen, not permitted to converse in English or go out. Nazneen is their legend when she engages them in speaking English when Chanu is not around. As it is concluded in the novel,

due to the plans to move to Dhaka, Shahana runs absent, organizing to come back when she is twenty-five when the danger of organized social unions is over. Ali presents Bibi and Shahana as second-generation laborers who have acclimatized and stand up to their domestic character. In a holistic sense, Chanu emerges through the intersection of multiple representations. First of all, he represents the conflict between Western values and their claims. Secondly, he symbolizes the struggle to preserve his individual and social identity, character, and heritage. At the same time, since he is in a different country, he tries to adapt to this new society and struggles to do so without compromising his character and national identity. He is additionally concerned about his children's need for perception regarding what their characters are. Another concern is the emotions of distance incited by a society where prejudice is predominant and the marvelous battle to protect one's rational soundness while endeavoring to realize the leading for one's family (Ali, 2003, p. 92). As Campbell-Hall observes, this painful experience can often be overcome by the realization that one's life is in danger (2009, p. 174).

### **Children and Multiculturalism in *White Teeth***

Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* focuses on the more diverse and complex aspects of migration and investigates the complicated communication between a run of distinctive ethnicities that form modern British life and appear in varying situations and states of mind towards both Englishness and multiculturalism. As Nick Bentley puts it, *White Teeth*, on the other hand, is more shaped by negotiations on British national identity and multiculturalism and tries to present a model formed by a reformed sense of collective identity (2007, p. 485). The novel, among other things, also has a language loaded with metaphors. For instance, Teeth, which are used as a metaphorical reference to the fact that the characters in the novel are deeply connected to their own culture, society, and past, also has a functional use to express the lives of the first-generation immigrants and their children, the next generation, and the effects of migration on them. In addition, the book in question makes a comparison between immigrants and white characters implying racial superiority, and while the British lead their lives in a settled, worry-free, confident, and stable manner, immigrants and their families, on the contrary, are concerned about the situation they are in. Their anticipation and their passive and secondary position against the British emerge as a matter of experience (Braun, 2013, p. 1). The depiction of multicultural Englishness endeavors in many directions, one of which is by utilizing the multicultural country, uncovering it through individual anecdotes from characters with an assortment of ethnic societies and backgrounds. Smith is also resolutely in favor of perceiving each of these as a combination of different ethnic origins on their own, rather than as an indication of the inaccuracy of the old racial classifications describing Britain's ethnic



divisions. In *Identity: Community Culture, Difference* (1990), Jonathan Rutherford states that the emergence of an understanding of cultural diversity and difference, and a form of governance in England that considers differences and perceives them as wealth, has led to political actors who want to show themselves for a certain period of time, and to the left that dominates the ideological social democratic British tendency, which represents cultural differences at the same time. It is a critical response to those certain ideological circles (p. 20). In that sense, Smith's novel stresses that multiculturalism ought to acknowledge a blending of ethnicity recognized at the individual level instead of the country. At this level, each individual is both multicultural and multiethnic. Michael Perfect (2014) states that from another perspective, *White Teeth* can also be read as the story of random encounters of people with different origins, cultures, histories, and ways of believing, thinking, and living in a certain place and time. Although unexpected events and situations, and therefore crises and chaos, are experienced, we also witness that this situation is turned into an advantage by some people skillfully (2014, p. 78). This can be extraordinarily and deeply different from the indication of multiculturalism that demonstrates an organization of monoethnic people gathering together to form a multicultural country. This, furthermore, surpasses the thought of mixed characters, once more implying mixed distinctive races or racial entities. In spite of the novel's support of better approaches to the racial background, at the same time, it is significant to appear that the primitive thoughts considering ethnicity and tradition do not yield to change. The significance of the earlier experiences here often acts as an unfavorable effect on the reasonability of an emanant show of multicultural identity. The trouble of moving from the past results in perfection within the struggle between Magid and Millat towards the novel's conclusion and, to some degree, undermines the romantic thought of a peaceful multicultural country.

The novel focuses on first-generation immigrants such as Samad, Clara, and Alsana and their children, Irie, Millat, and Magid, separately. In *White Teeth*, in any case, there is complexity within the way Smith handles these issues, as the characters are of blended ethnicity. For a matter, Irie's mother is from Jamaica, and her father is English. Initially from East Bengal, Samad's child Magid, born in North-West London, is sent to Bangladesh to discover his original roots. Be that as it may, Smith negates an irresolute idea of personality that has been categorized from the beginning as blacks and whites. The novel, in turn, highlights the multi-layered nature of character arrangement in post-war London. *White Teeth* relates the lives of three couples, two of which are hitched: Among other people, Archie Jones, a lower-class Englishman, and Clara, his Jamaican spouse; and Samad and Alsana Iqbal, both of local Bengali Muslim legacy, their three English-born children (Irie Jones and Millat and Magid

Iqbal), and a family of middle-class Jewish knowledge, the Chalfant. First of all, this dialogue reveals some of the essential elements of a language, which are sometimes prominent and sometimes deliberately neglected, related to the actual functions of the dialect. However, it also points to the size and intensity of their efforts to be accepted as members and individuals of the society they live in, as an indicator of their effort to adapt from one country they migrated to another country they have just settled in. The scene presents a complex example of children forming an ethnic persona in a modern cultural and social setting, drawing on familiar social and cultural structures, among other dialects. By displaying an ethnic and etymological personality trait that does not actually belong to him or even to himself, Millat wants to preserve his Bengali identity, which he thinks is an expert, in his experience with the ticket officer. With his words and actions, he aims to prove that he is performing better than that ticket officer:

Millat spread his legs like Elvis and slapped his wallet down on the counter. “One for Bradford, yeah?”

The ticket man put his tired face close up to the glass. “Are you asking me, young man, or telling me?”

I just say, yeah? One for Bradford, yeah? You got some problem, yeah? Speaka da English? This is King’s Cross, yeah? One for Bradford, innit? . . .

That’ll be seventy-five pounds, then, please.

This was met with displeasure by Millat and Millat’s Crew.

You what? Takin’ liberties! Seventy – chaaa, man. That’s moody. I aint payin’ no seventy-five pounds!

Well, I’m afraid that’s the price. Maybe next time you mug some poor old lady, said the ticket man . . ., you could stop in here first before you go to the jewelry store.

“Liberties!” squealed Hifan.

“He’s cussin’ you, yeah?” confirmed Ranil.

“You better tell ‘im”’, warned Rajik.

The Crew, on cue: “Somoka mi!” (Smith, 2000, pp. 191-192).

Revealing some key components regarding the genuine execution of dialect, this scene moreover shows how the children endeavor to be acknowledged as individuals of the community in which they live. The scene unfurled over intricately accurately describes the concept of shaping a modern ethnic personality by utilizing other dialects and well-known

cultural structures. In his experience with the ticket man, Millat exerts an ethnic and etymological character that does not belong to him to preserve a sense of specialism and urge over the limitations forced upon him by his claimed Bengali English personality. In truth, he outperforms this – demonstrating that he is exceptionally aware of his performance – “Speaka da English?” (Smith, 2000, pp. 191-192). This phrase draws our attention to many details, among other things, in terms of the performance of the language used by the character. Accordingly, the person using the ethnic language will create a greater awareness by clinging to their own ethnic origins through this language, or will develop a different linguistic and ethnic category by giving up using this language and thus turning their backs on their own origins. Apart from these, there is another option: It can adopt another person’s ethnicity or create a new ethnicity of its own.

Millat Iqbal’s admiration for ‘gangster’ pictures, especially the ‘Mafia genre’, brings him to the summit of his fixation with the doomed, degenerate, deteriorated, hypersexual, savage state of Western capitalist culture and consistent individual flexibilities. And every time he opens the door, he cannot help repeating Good Fellas’ intro – ‘a car door, a car trunk, KEVIN’s auditorium door, or the door of his own house. While thinking about his past, Millat remembers that his dream was to become a gangster as a result of his search for identity (Smith, 2000, p. 35).

A long time afterward, Magid returns as a skeptic when his brother is involved with many Muslim fundamentalists. Although Magid and Millat are twins and therefore genetically very similar to each other in many respects, the existence of some contradictions is also surprising. First of all, the directions they take in life and the traces they leave on their bodies are extremely different, and this situation is surprising for both of them. The two brothers, who have not seen each other for a long time, start to watch themselves in front of the mirror with the excitement of their sudden encounter. But contrary to what they expected, facial features; All details such as nose structure, hair colors, jaw lines, and the shape of his eyes have taken extremely different forms. His brother could be a stranger to Irie (Smith, 2000, p. 382) and the indistinguishable twins got to be foes. Millat’s relationship with a periphery Muslim gather inevitably leads him to his act of household fear-based oppression when he endeavors to shoot Dr. Chalfen at the FutureMouse conference. Nor is he as the youngster radical in *White Teeth*: Dr. Chalfen’s possessive child, Joshua, moreover goes to the conference as a portion of an extraordinary creature rights group he has joined, one which plans to attack the disclosing and free Future Mouse. According to Leander Møller Gøttcke (2020), *White Teeth*, which can be read as an expression of a search for identity, presents the extremist identity orientation as a project

subject as an element that ensures historical continuity. The reason for this is exaggerated if examined closely, but because it provides the characters with an identity that functions as a safe haven, they are tempted to incorporate it into situations such as fundamentalism ( p. 221). Millat endeavors to set up a genuine affiliation with KEVIN, an Islamic bunch “he’s continually following the group’s writing, and we are told that Millat ‘knew that he was KEVIN’s huge try, and he is assumed to grant his best shot’ (Smith, 2000, p. 36) but it takes a long time to be given the group’s full acknowledgment (he tries, but this rejects, to take off from his exceedingly sexualized – and Westernized – sweetheart, and he finds himself “at a loss” at whatever point he tries to “get his head around the group’s composed rules” (Smith, 2000, p. 37). Considering Mill at’s separated identities and loyalties between KEVIN and the Raggastani – two bunches each differentiated from the other one in terms of messages, objectives, and indeed dialects –he chose to turn to the recitation of motion picture lines in arrange to persuade himself of the genuine nature of his Muslim dedication and his affiliation with KEVIN:

Speaks fuckin’ nice, doesn’t he? Sounds like a right fuckin’ Olivier. Queen’s fucking English and no mistake. What a nice fella. You’re the kind of clientele I could do wiv in here, Magid, let me tell you. Civilized and that. And don’t you worry about my skin, it don’t get anywhere near the food and it don’t give me much trouble. Cor, what a gentleman. You do feel like you should watch your mouth around him, dontcha. (Smith, 2000, p. 371)

Millat takes his relationship with KEVIN very seriously, reads the media organs of this group, closely follows their visual propaganda, and perceives KEVIN as a mechanism that functions as a great laboratory both for them and for himself. Accordingly, he tries to see to what extent the group in question has achieved the target it has foreseen for itself, as well as the chance of success. He is so focused on this goal that he sacrifices his relationship with his girlfriend for this purpose. All the characters within the novel, including Samad and Abdul-Mickey, have a few concerns regarding class and ethnic status. This can be generally reflected in their dialect utilization. Abdul-Mickey, for case, derides Magid’s standard dialect when he suddenly starts to feel that his compelling Cockney is substandard. Seeing a high-level social and instructive component in Magid’s Standard English and seeing that non-standard dialect—both ethnic tongues and Cockney use—would not give him distinction in London, where the novel takes place Abdul-Mickey surrenders to an inadequacy complex (Bhabha, 1994, pp. 26-33). Samad asks Mary how he suffers from the fragmentation of himself and others, a projection of his search for identity and confusion, and wonders what she thinks about it. Meanwhile, Mary is

busy crossing the main street, paying attention to the scurrying of people of various races, some black, some brown, some yellow, accompanied by bad smells down the High Street (Smith, 2000, p. 149).

However, in the changing times, many couples and first-generation children born in England have sought to get rid of their familial and social ties and are not willing to take the responsibility of cultural, traditional, and historical representation anymore. In addition, these typologies, which are the subject of significant debates in English literature, usually do not want or cannot wear this post, which focuses on a personality or 'otherness' (Dawes, 1999, pp. 18-24). The emergence of this social conflict coincides with the moment when Millat, Magid, and Irie, who are among the young characters of the novel, throw themselves out of a public transport vehicle. Meanwhile, while talking on the one hand, they clinch this moment by laughing sarcastically. In their view, all immigrants should return to their homeland (Smith, 2001, p. 163). The sentence spoken at this time is half-finished, so we cannot understand why they thought so. The author of the novel leaves us in a position where we can fit many thoughts into the missing sentence. The issue of the need for immigrants to return to their homeland may also stem from a suspicion of them in England that is never going to disappear. Therefore, from a point of view, this expression is also an expression of goodwill indicating that the peace that immigrants seek is not in England, but in the heart of their homeland. The fact that this is the oldest expression in the world does not reflect the claim that it encompasses reality in its entirety. Although the event itself is confined to a particular time and place, the narrator associates it with a long history of racial obsession. S Smith's description of Britain, although referring to a specific country, is generally applicable to societies in a similar situation. Smith's Britain is portrayed as limited to post-colonial features without an address.

The children in both books mirror cross-breed personalities. Irene Pérez Fernández (2009) argues that although Monica Ali aims to reach a conclusion about other immigrant communities and finally to reach a general, common judgment by revealing a cross-section of the Bangladeshi population in England, she gathers all immigrant communities in one denominator and puts them on the basis of their race and ethnicity. It is self-evident that homogenization is not possible. On the other hand, this situation reveals the existence of ethnic groups living in a metropolis like London and having different cultures, traditions, and lifestyles (p. 151). This influences the white British populace, who are constrained to meet Dark and Asians by the unused social conditions. Emotional changes due to the change of place stand out as elements that are frequently encountered in both books. All the characters share this common denominator to varying degrees. In addition, these ethnically different characters have to

discover they possess space in a topographical and national system that has long been developed in absolutely 'white' terms. Ali's and Smith's books do not depict characters with coordinated diasporic encounters in British colonial history, such as Nazneen in *Brick Lane*; and Path and Samad in *White Teeth*, second-generation workers who feel misplaced in a remote nation but are incapable of relating to it. These heroes live within the country where their parents originally had a place, thus requiring their claim reflection. In this sense, British-born Shahana, Bibi in *Brick Lane*, Path, and Irie, Millat, and Magid in *White Teeth* are constrained to rethink their character status inside a nonexistent community. Instead of distance, these books are seen to offer self-assurance dwelling. Modern hybridity is less about being "in-between" societies and more approximately the reality that culture is present (Upstone, 2007, p. 1). Be that as it may, George Mavrommatis (1994) contends that this specific in-betweenness of the British multicultural talk of the period contradicts Bhabha's (p. 212) concept of synergetic "in-between" societies. Appropriately, the previous position advocates division, whereas the last-mentioned talks more ideally around collaboration and interconnection (Mavrommatis, 2010, p. 576). In these books, which are similar in many respects, children as members of multicultural families stand out with their hybrid personalities. As a result of this situation and the influence of social conditions, the British population is under the influence of dark-skinned people and other Asians, as well. In both books, the characters feel the need to organize a different sense of character within the spatial space through spatial displacement. These characters, who have lived through all the processes, meet on a common denominator, albeit to varying degrees. Furthermore, these diverse characters belonging to ethnically diverse cultures must discover and be aware that they have space within a topographical and national system that has long been woven with racially 'white' terms. Rather, Ali's and Smith's books depict second-generation workers who feel they are misplaced in a distant nation but cannot relate to it, and characters who have had coordinated diasporic encounters in British colonial history, such as Nazneen in *Brick Lane* and Samad in *White Teeth* are treated in a different level. Despite the fact that their parents sometimes feel like immigrants and sometimes settled, and therefore cannot establish a stable relationship with the country they are in, children mostly feel they belong to the country they migrated to. These heroes, who live in the country they belong to, also feel themselves in their homeland. In this situation, British-born Shahana, *Brick Lane*'s Bibi, and *White Teeth*'s Irie, Millat, and Magid are forced to rethink their own development.

Smith's female characters, Nazneen, Razia, and Mrs. Azad, and their children's awareness of freedom opened up a certain level of autonomy in the face of some restrictive social and moral

norms that oppress society and impair individual development. Like Chanu in Brick Lane, Samad follows in the footsteps of his Brick Lane counterpart, Chanu, but desperately waits for Magid and Millat to learn about the culture, values, and social norms of Bangladesh, their homeland. Again, Samad, like Chanu, but not as overtly, feels deeply disappointed in England. Smith poignantly describes how immigrants wanted to adapt to England but failed to do so. Accordingly, the first barriers arise in terms of language. In an environment where even common words that can be a communication language are not found, everything and everyone is trying to navigate on a slippery ground. The most distinctive feature of individuals and societies is the lack of trust. She learns that the lawyer she works with is British. It turns out that the person she pays to work, who appears to be quite reliable from his manners and appearance, is a fundamentalist terrorist. These events, which disturb her and cause her to question herself, cause her to experience a deep crisis of confidence in England. So much so that from the moment she steps into this country, she feels as if she is negotiating with a devil, not with the officials and people representing the British state. For example, you face stamping when you hand your passport to officials. You want to work and earn money, and maintain a living in this country, but you are constantly faced with obstacles, you are discouraged and demoralized. And in the end, you are left with no choice but to return to your country in despair. You always feel lonely, desolate, cold because you are never welcomed here in a friendly way. Instead, you are only allowed tolerance. At the end of all this, you are transformed into an animal whose boundaries are clearly drawn, whose freedom is severely restricted, whose class and position are determined, and what to do and what not to do is clearly stated. With the education you have received and the change you have undergone at the end of it, you will never be in an equal position, as in the society you are in, you are forced to an inferior position like an animal. On the other hand, you cannot live in your own country because you have changed so much at the end of this training, because you have become unrecognizable anymore. After all, you do not belong in England, your country, or anywhere else. You are condemned to live as a homeless being, a being that does not belong anywhere (Smith, 2000, p. 407).

Within the rejection of “home,” there's a clear differentiation between the short talk of return and a new setting of having a place and milieu within the correct area. As Mümin Hakkioğlu puts it, “as a basic human need from past to present, home has been the subject of many disciplines such as culture, art, history, geography, sociology, psychology and architecture in a multidimensional framework where different perspectives come together and intersect with each other.” (Hakkioğlu, 2023, p.128). This modern character is stated in one articulation: “We

go on the Internet at school,' said Shahana, in English" said Shahana, in English" (Smith, 2000, p. 164). Shahana's remark highlights her universal culture, British etymological personality, and long-term liability. Just like the resistance of dark Britons within the 1980s, this Asian era soothes transient endorsement with rebellion. As Chanu observes, "We always kept quiet. The young ones don't want to keep quiet anymore" (Ali, 2003, p. 213). Their self-assurance permits subversion and reclamation: "Someone had written in careful flowing silver spray over the wall, Pakis. And someone else, in less beautiful but confident black letters, had added, Rule" (Ali, 2003, p. 194). In the same way in *White Teeth*, the old racist language has gone by; years of continuous and harsh criticisms have sapped viewers' confidence: "If you ask me," said one disgruntled OAP to another, "they should all go back to their own ...." But this, the oldest sentence in the world, found itself stifled by the ringing of bells and the stamping of feet until it retreated under the seats with the chewing gum (Smith, 2000, p. 142). Millat and Magid appreciate the method of demonstrating themselves by contradicting this bigotry through which they attempt to overcome the drawbacks they uncovered as modern pilgrims and receive a neo-colonial demeanor. Smith, who rarely refers to colonialism, asks us to respect the activities of children born in a colonial society who start life in another colonized society. However, it can be said that children bring almost a diverse energy. Whereas children claim transient objects, they are excluded from immigrants' requirements for more permanent claims. Without the concern of inhabitants, they do not claim the city itself since they now lead a comfortable life. Undoubtedly, in a strikingly brief sentence, standing disobediently at the start of a passage, we are told: "Now the children knew the city" (Smith, 2000, p. 151). In any case, the novel looks at how the foreigners overcame these questionable regions they uncovered and how they developed as people with transitive characters. Being in steady interaction with the two inverse societies they live, one physically and the other mentally influences them. It is now not conceivable to classify them as homogeneous. Their contrasts are strikingly uncovered through Irie, Magid, and Millat, who each goes through distinctive ways of self-discovery.

The novel reflects how shocking it is to try to change a character's resistance to change. It has once again been seen that the lives of second-generation children depend on the basic components of society and family. The children in both books - Shahana, Millat, and Magid - show up as self-confident characters. Magid, rejecting tradition, said, "I have to go to school. I don't have time to go to Mecca" (Smith, 2000, p. 132), indicating that he prefers British expectations to the traditional religious priorities of Bangladeshis. Millat, aware of his own cultural and spiritual values and the necessity of "purifying himself from the West" (Smith, 2000, p. 381), cannot prevent his religious ideals from being marred by Goodfellas (Smith,



2000, p. 382), and undeniably a return to one's own roots, a meeting of other factors with a return to the roots. Their new identity, which can no longer be contested, is the dark-skinned British. This situation can be characterized as an existential crisis, and therefore it cannot be explained by any myth or racial theory, nor is it possible to find a basis for it. Therefore, in both of the novels, the efforts of the immigrant characters to adapt to their new homeland and to integrate remain unrequited. The fear underlying Samad's concerns that Millat might fall into sexual perversion is more plausible to be understood as a peculiar fear of being an immigrant than a parent's inner impulse or natural reaction to their children. Samad asks: "What was the country doing to his sons, he wanted to know, what was it doing?" (Smith, 2000, p. 156). Here "assimilation" becomes "corruption" (Smith, 2000, p. 165). "Millat's crossing in this sense initially appears to work against Rampton's findings, which indicate that the use of the song (or, in Smith's case, film) signals a playful, almost humorous exchange" (Watts, 2013, p. 864). In *Brick Lane*, this is associated with a character, Tariq being ostracized from society on the grounds that he uses drugs. What is being "copied" by the association in London's different communities is "going to the bars, to nightclubs" (Ali, 2003, p. 23). When the Bengali spouses meet, they note it was interracial dating and liquor issues (Ali, 2003, p. 38). Such cynicism is not one or the other kept to specific segments of the populace nor focused as subjectively experienced, while Chanu leads the assault against "English schools." Moreover, in both writings, British beginning beliefs are eventually addressed. Reminding us of the anti-Muslim sentiment in North America and Continental Europe, Smith argues that Muslims in Britain have also been turned into a 'monster' by perception operations. It goes without saying that this perception remains a label that cannot be easily erased, that it is a rising barrier to the integration process of Muslims into the UK, and that it causes Muslims to lose their self-confidence and joy of life. However, despite the presence of all these anti-Muslim elements, we should not compromise on our efforts to live together, we should not lose hope in reconciling our differences, which are sources of wealth and opportunity, and remove the obstacles to reconciliation. Before *White Teeth*, Smith in her other prose writings tackled with the Muslim question in Britain, too. According to Hannah Kershaw, Smith, in *White Teeth* as well as in her articles, found that racism was more prevalent, especially in England and Europe, this situation of the British, being white-skinned as a source of superiority, the general themes that Smith discovered in *White Teeth*, in particular, it is aimed at moving away from the prevalence of racism and the society's understanding of Englishness as whiteness (Smith, 2021, p. 869). According to Smith, who is also aware of the anti-Muslim sentiment in England and does not hide it, even though a British Muslim has been turned into a 'monster' in the eyes of

some segments of society, in the mainstream media, we still show our determination and will to live together with our differences. We must not lose our hope. She also advises us to stay away from racism and racist policies as much as possible. In *White Teeth*, “Millat was not one or the other one thing nor the other, Muslim or Christian, English or Bengali; he lived among” (Smith, 2000, pp. 302-03), which underpins Bhabha’s both hybridity and unique hypothetical position — “Third Space” (Bhabha, 1994, pp. 36-38). The dangerous ground in terms of his social status communicates not a modern shape of having a place but distance and intercultural disarray. Homi Bhabha observes that “the notion of hybridity [...] is about the fact that in any particular political struggle, new sites are always being opened up” (Rutherford, 1990b, p. 216).

Irie, the girl of Archie Jones and Clara Bowden Jones and depicted as an overweight, uncertain youngster who has a solitary cherish for Millad Iqbal, too has issues with her claim racial personality. She tries to rectify her hair to meet Western excellence standards, is calm but keen and courageous, and is determined to discover her claim position within the world. In the long run, she chooses to end up a dental specialist at the recommendation of Marcus Chalfen but is additionally profoundly concerned with his claim family foundations and, for a brief time, lives with his grandma, Hortense Bowden. Irie’s disclosure of her Jamaican beginnings is characterized as “an intrinsic right to know where she came from” (Smith, 2000, p. 343) and migrating her position as a child of the Caribbean diaspora. Towards the conclusion of the novel, Irie gets pregnant by Millat or Magid Iqbal and inevitably gets included with Joshua Chalfen, with whom she is raising her child. Whereas pundits may take the truth that not one or the other of the novel’s characters nor the peruser will ever know whether Irie’s child’s father is Magid or Millat as affirmation that *White Teeth* celebrates the black, perhaps more fundamentally is their refusal to reveal which twin rises. History will defy science by not being traceable. Irie finds the thought of her untraceable, origin-less child strangely comforting. The organic father, Smith has all the generalizations of youthful British Asian men that they both exemplify – from the “nerd” to the dedicated mental (Magid) and the “rude boy” to the Islamic fundamentalist (Millat) – the new era. Smith’s broad utilization of generalizations as a portion of its endeavor to be comprehensive; is an encouragement to speak to the new generation, as numerous distinctive (and however commonplace) forms of white Britishness and non-white postcolonial foreigners blend into Britain as conceivable.

In *Brick Lane*, representing an Anglo-Asian identity, Razia, with a drug-addicted son and college student daughter, offers a more realistic view of multiculturalism and a more positive, if brutal, alternative to the discourse of displacement:

Assimilation this, the alienation that! Let me tell you a few simple facts. Fact: we live in Western society. Fact: our children will act more and more like Westerners. Fact: that's no bad thing. My daughter is free to come and go. Do I wish I had enjoyed myself like her when I was young? Yes! (Ali, 2003, p. 93)

Razia, on the other hand, gives the impression that she is caught between her own society and England as a Western society and makes her and her children a subject of comparison, but makes us think that she is far from making a healthy decision. She admits that there are marked differences between her own and her children's lives. On the one hand, she considers herself in a more fortunate position because she enjoys being an immigrant who has not been assimilated, alienated from her own traditions and culture, and has managed to live as a resident in England. Her children, on the other hand, are assimilated and in the middle of alienation, unlike her. More importantly, this process will not stop there, it will be carried to a further stage and their children will become more and more Westernized. It is here that we encounter a surprising change in Razia's attitude. Contrary to expectations, Razia states that she is satisfied with this situation, let alone complaining about it. In fact, she not only gives justice to his children, but also regrets that she is deprived of their feelings and experiences.

## **Conclusion**

In both books, children “are simply no longer able to recognize themselves in their children, nor can they identify the cause of the divergence, though they know it has something to do with the world outside (Covelo, 2017, p. 631). Ethnically diverse authors born in Britain experience disassociation and ambivalence even more since they occupy an in-between space where traditional cultural representations of Britain fail to encompass their ‘hybrid’ identity (Dutta, 2013, p. 2). In some respects, following Bauman's postulates, their identity status has to be seen as located in a continuum of opposed forces of belonging and exclusion. What is displayed as adversely within the encounters of British-borns is similarly reversible: for case, the social integration seen by Kerim as a misplaced personality can too be seen as a kind of certification of the different impacts of British youth:

When I was a small kid ... In case you needed to be cool you had to be something else – a bit white, a bit dark, a bit something. Indeed when it all took off, bhangra and all that, it was Punjabi, Pakistani, giving it all the state of mind. It wasn't us, was it? (Ali, 2003, p. 217).

In *White Teeth*, what Millat — “and not fair Millat but all the children” — represents is interpreted as a disappointment, as guardians inquire “what was off-base with all the children,

what had gone off-base with these, to begin with, relatives of the extraordinary ocean-crossing experiment?" (Smith, 2000, p. 189). However, what is 'wrong' is their self-perception of London with all its demeanors, as their claim.

Opinions of spatial separation, dis/encounters with their most speedy community or their family, and after that having to orchestrate a different sense of character interior their have the spatial zone to soak these books and are common to all the characters to differing degrees. Moreover, these ethnically distinctive characters are compelled to find they have spaces in a topographical and national diagram created for a long time because it was in 'white' terms. Temporal and spatial difference is rapidly throwing, developing, and transforming families, communities, families, and children in very different and diverse directions. This situation also transcends age and gender differences and becomes commonplace for all characters. In this sense, the British-born Shahana, Bibi, Irie, Millat, and Magid are compelled to re-define their character status interior an imaginary community that, in various cases, comes up briefly to supply positive referents for them. In such conditions, a couple of them got to turn their see to other geographical zones and other social orders to 'root' themselves in advanced British society. Concerning the educational modules and the put of distinctive communities within the educational modules, it is critical to note that the minor objective of instruction ought to be to teach all children and youthful individuals to be superior arranged for adulthood.

Even though life in an ethnically blended Britain brings with it numerous issues, in a way that does equity to the collected lavishness of England's national culture and creates regard for the societies and convictions of the distinctive bunches that live in this nation, or maybe the social orders that make up this nation. It appears much more significant in terms of the commitments it will make to. Moreover, this depends on the societies of their guardians and the culture of the nation they are now living in; it is the reflection of the more significant part of the culture and its own culture within society. If utilized practically, instruction programs can offer assistance to avoid any sense of distance.

## References

- Ali, M. (2003). *Brick Lane*. London: Doubleday.
- Bentley, N. (2007). Re-writing Englishness: Imagining the Nation in Julian Barnes's *England, England* and Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Textual Practice*, 21(3), 483-504.
- Bhabha, H. (1994). The Commitment to Theory. In *The Location of Culture*. Routledge.
- Braun, M. (2013). The Mouseness of the Mouse: The Competing Discourses of Genetics and History in *White Teeth*. *The Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, 48(2), 221-236.
- Campbell-Hall, D. (2009). Renegotiating the Asian-British Domestic Community in Recent Fiction. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 45(2), 171-179.
- Carpenter, C. H. (1996). Enlisting Children's Literature in the Goals of Multiculturalism. *Mosaic: A Journal for the Interdisciplinary Study of Literature*, 9(3), 53-73.
- Ching, S. H. (2005). Multicultural Children's Literature as an Instrument of Power. *Language Arts*, 83(2), 128-136.
- Cormack, A. (2006). Migration and the Politics of Narrative Form: Realism and the Postcolonial Subject in *Brick Lane*. *Contemporary Literature*, 47(4), 695-721.
- Covelo, R. (2017). The Genetic Fluke in Zadie Smith and Philip Roth: Order, Chaos and Utopia. *Neophilologus*, 101(4), 621-637.
- Dawes, K. (1999). Negotiating the Ship on the Head: Black British Fiction. *Wasafiri*, 14(29), 18-24.
- Desai, C. M. (2006). National Identity in a Multicultural Society: Malaysian Children's Literature in English. *Children's Literature in Education*, 37(2), 163-184.
- Dutta, S. (2013). Remapping Identity and Selfhood: Multiculturalism and Plurality in Monica Ali's *Brick Lane* and Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *The Criterion: An International Journal in English*, 4, 1-4.
- Fernández, I. P. (2009). Representing Third Spaces, Fluid Identities and Contested Spaces in Contemporary British Literature/Representando terceros-espacios e identidades fluidas en la literatura británica contemporánea. *Atlantis*, 31(2), 143-160.
- Gøttcke, L. M. (2020). The End and Continuation of History: Zadie Smith's Critique of Francis Fukuyama in *White Teeth*. *Critique: Studies in Contemporary Fiction*, 61(2), 219-235.

- Haj Yahya, A. (2021). Between Particularism and Pluralism: Children's Literature as a Multicultural Agent. *Social Identities*, 27(6), 660-681.
- Hakkioğlu, M. (2023). The Sense of Home and Memory in John Clare's Asylum Poems. *Cankaya University Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 126-141.
- Home Affairs Committee. (1981). Fifth Report from the Home Affairs Committee, Session 1981-1982 HC424: Racial Disadvantage.
- Kershaw, H. (2021). Remembering the Indian Mutiny: Colonial Nostalgia in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 57(6), 868-881F.
- Mavrommatis, G. (2006). The New 'Creative' *Brick Lane*: A Narrative Study of Local Multicultural Encounters. *Ethnicities*, 6(4), 498-517.
- Mavrommatis, G. (2010). A Racial Archaeology of Space: A Journey through the Political Imaginings of *Brixton* and *Brick Lane*, London. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 36(4), 561-579.
- Perfect, M. (2008). The Multicultural Bildungsroman: Stereotypes in Monica Ali's *Brick Lane*. *The Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, 43(3), 109-120.
- Perfect, M. (2014). Multicultural London in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* (2000): A Celebration of Unpredictability and Uncertainty? In *Contemporary Fictions of Multiculturalism* (pp. 76-114). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Reingold, R. (2005). Curricular Models of Multicultural Pluralistic Education—four Event Investigations from the USA Academy. *Dapim*, 40, 108-131.
- Rosenthal, L., & Levy, S. R. (2010). The Colorblind, Multicultural, and Polycultural Ideological Approaches to Improving Intergroup Attitudes and Relations. *Social Issues and Policy Review*, 4(1), 215-246.
- Rutherford, J. (1990a). *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference*. Lawrence & Wishart.
- Rutherford, J. (1990b). The Third Space: Interview with Homi Bhabha. In *Identity: Community, Culture, Difference* (pp. 207-221). Lawrence & Wishart.
- Smith, Zadie (2000). *White Teeth*. Vintage.
- Sreenivas, D. (2011). Telling Different Tales: Possible Childhoods in Children's Hybrid Literature. *Childhood*, 18(3), 316-332.

- Suárez-Orozco, M. (2001). Education: The Research Agenda. *Harvard Educational Review*, 71(3), 345-366.
- Upstone, S. (2007). "SAME OLD, SAME OLD" Zadie Smith's *White Teeth* and Monica Ali's *Brick Lane*. *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, 43(3), 336-349.
- Watts, J. L. (2013). 'We are divided people, aren't we?' The Politics of Multicultural Language and Dialect Crossing in Zadie Smith's *White Teeth*. *Textual Practice*, 27(5), 851-874.

**Makalenin Türü – Article Type:** Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article

**Geliş Tarihi – Date Received:** 27.09.2023

**Kabul Tarihi – Date Accepted:** 30.11.2023

**Memory, Loss, and Nostalgia in Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go* and  
Atwood's *The Handmade's Tale***

*Kazuo Ishiguro'nun Beni Asla Bırakma ve Margaret Atwood'un Damızlık Kızın Öyküsü  
Romanlarında Bellek, Kayıp ve Nostalji*

**Yasemin BAYSAL\***

**Abstract**

Regarding the recent literary works and theories, issues such as memory, loss, trauma, history and nostalgia have been studied owing to their historical and social significance. The publications of many books that are concerned with the subjects of memory, loss, and nostalgia have drawn attention in the last decades. From this point of view, the concepts of remembering, losing, and nostalgia are significant and functional through the works of both Kazuo Ishiguro and Margaret Atwood since the construction of these themes is crucial to their fiction. Their fiction is fundamental to carrying out the interactions and interrelations among these contemporary critical conceptions. Consequently, in this study, memory, loss, and nostalgia will be examined through Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go* and Atwood's *The Handmade's Tale* within the frame of the relationships between one another and the bodies of the narrators through these novels.

**Keywords:** Kazuo Ishiguro, *Never Let Me Go*, Margaret Atwood, *The Handmaid's Tale*, memory, loss, nostalgia

---

\* Assist. Prof. Dr., Department of English Language and Literature, Bingöl University, E-mail: [ybaysal@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:ybaysal@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0002-4292-0169



## Memory, Loss, and Nostalgia in Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go* and Atwood's *The Handmade's Tale*

*Kazuo Ishiguro'nun Beni Asla Bırakma ve Margaret Atwood'un Damızlık Kızın Öyküsü*  
*Romanlarında Bellek, Kayıp ve Nostalji*

**Yasemin BAYSAL\***

### Öz

Son dönemdeki edebi eser ve teorilerde, bellek, kayıp, travma, tarih, nostalji gibi konular tarihsel ve toplumsal önemi çerçevesinde sık sık ele alınmaktadır. Yine, son yıllarda, bellek, kayıp ve nostalji temalarına odaklanan pek çok kitabın yayınlanması dikkat çekicidir. Bu açıdan bakıldığında hem Kazuo Ishiguro'nun hem de Margaret Atwood'un eserlerinde hatırlama, kaybetme ve nostalji kavramları önemli ve işlevseldir çünkü bu temaların kurgulanması, adı geçen yazarların eserleri için çok önemlidir. Ishiguro ve Atwood'un özellikle, bellek, kayıp ve nostalji kavramlarını birbirleri ile ilişkilendirme biçimleri eserlerinin en dikkat çekici özellikleri arasında sayılabilir. Bu nedenle, bu çalışmada bellek, kayıp ve nostalji kavramları, Ishiguro'nun *Never Let Me Go* ve Atwood'un *The Handmade's Tale* adlı romanlarında, bellek, kayıp ve nostalji kavramları, başlıca karakterlerin geçmişleri, kayıpları ve bedenleri ile olan ilişkileri çerçevesinde incelenecektir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Kazuo Ishiguro, *Beni Asla Bırakma*, Margaret Atwood, *Damızlık Kızın Öyküsü*, bellek, kayıp, nostalji

---

\* Dr. Öğr Üyesi, İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü, Bingöl Üniversitesi, E-posta: [ybaysal@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:ybaysal@bingol.edu.tr),  
ORCID: 0000-0002-4292-0169

## **Introduction**

Due to their historical and social importance in the preceding century, topics including memory, loss, trauma, history, and nostalgia have been studied in contemporary works. Recently, there has been increased interest in the publication of numerous works that deal with the themes of nostalgia, loss, and memory. According to this viewpoint, Kazuo Ishiguro and Margaret Atwood's writings both make substantial and useful use of the ideas of remembering, losing, and nostalgia. As a result, in this study, the concepts of memory, loss and nostalgia will be explored in Ishiguro's *Never Let Me Go* and Atwood's *The Handmade's Tale* within the framework of the main characters' relationships with their past, losses and bodies.

## **Discussion**

*Never Let Me Go* describes a dystopian world where human clones are formed in order to donate their vital organs when they are young. The novel is narrated by Kathy that is a clone raised at Hailsham, a boarding school for donors. Kathy, the protagonist of the novel, is thirty-one, and she is about to begin her donations, and for eleven years, she has been working as a carer for clones that donate their organs. On the other hand, *The Handmade's Tale* also describes a dystopian world where fertile women are enslaved as the handmades to bear children for elite couples in the totalitarian state, the Republic of Gilead. Offred is the narrator and protagonist of the novel that is one of the handmades in Gilead. The handmades have lost all their rights and freedom, which they have during the period of pre-Gilead, and they are seen as "two legged wombs" to bear children for their commanders. Both novels are narrated in the first person point of view, and both protagonists of the novels narrate the events with flashbacks through the novels.

Concerning the issue of memory, the narrators of the novels revisit their pasts for various purposes. These purposes may contain their desires to think about their loss, their desires to forget and repress the past, or their nostalgic longings and desires to return to the past. In *Never Let Me Go*, the narrator, Kathy, revisits the past as being driven by nostalgic desire and longing to return to the past and to restore her destroyed world in the past. On the other hand, in *The Handmade's Tale*, the narrator, Offred, revisits the past in order to compare it with the future. In other words, unlike Kathy, Offred is not motivated by the nostalgic longing and desire to return to the past.

In *Never Let Me Go*, Kathy's early years at Hailsham is the central focus of the first nine chapters of the novel including a nearly idyllic picture of a happy childhood in an institution. Her narrative dwells on friendship, romance, fascination with teachers and a continuous rivalry for popularity via individual success. The students at Hailsham are slowly being made aware that they are different from other people. Hailsham manages to lodge itself in their memory as a place of happiness and innocence (Drag, 2014, p. 167). For instance, Kathy considers the period that she spent at Hailsham as "a kind of golden time" by confessing, "the earlier years—the ones I've just been telling you about—they tend to blur into each other as a kind of golden time, and when I think about them at all, even the not-so-great things, I can't help feeling a sort of glow" (Ishiguro, 2005, p. 77). Regarding Hailsham as the place of origin for Kathy, she does not have a family home or any parents. The guardians of the Hailsham, particularly the institution, serve as the substitution. Kathy establishes her identity via lessons, artistic activities, discussions, and sincere communication with fellow clones, so she feels a sense of unity with other clones. Consequently, Hailsham remains as a stable point of reference and basement for ethical preferences for Kathy (Drag, 2014, p. 170). In other words, Kathy creates her identity through Hailsham, the guardians, and the fellow clones there rather than a family home or parents.

Concerning the first-person narrative towards the past, *Never Let Me Go* is based on the activity of remembering the past; its dealing with nostalgia strengthens the importance of memory. Kathy chooses the most meaningful period of her life in order to narrate and mourn for its loss. Through the perspective of thirty-one-year-old narrator, Kathy revisits her childhood and adolescence to comprehend what she could not understand at that time. Kathy's remembering refers to a complex process of reconstruction determined by her present perspective. In harmonious with the paradoxical logic of nostalgic distance, she has revisited Hailsham by recalling her memories of it; meanwhile, she has detached herself from Hailsham by placing it on an unreachable pedestal (Drag, 2014, p. 166-7). Ishiguro depicts his narrator's perspective as her revisiting memories:

I won't be a carer any more come the end of the year, and though I've got a lot out of it, I have to admit I'll welcome the chance to rest—to stop and think and remember. I'm sure it's at least partly to do with that, to do with preparing for the change of pace, that I've been getting this urge to order all these old memories. What I really wanted, I suppose, was to get straight all the things that happened between me and Tommy and Ruth after we grew up and left Hailsham. But I realise now just how much of what

occurred later came out of our time at Hailsham, and that's why I want first to go over these earlier memories quite carefully. (2005, p. 37)

These lines emphasize the narrator's reconstruction of her memories through her present point of view by ordering all "old memories."

The significance of memory is based upon Kathy's capacity to keep Hailsham alive and to supply her and her friends with a basis of shared experiences that set up a foreground to protect and reinforce the loosened bonds between them. Memory becomes an ultimate retreat for Kathy when she is dispossessed of everything she has valued as memory remains the only refuge that is insensitive to the bleakness (Drag, 2014, p. 178-9). Kathy expresses all her losses that have remained in her memories: "I was talking to one of my donors a few days ago who was complaining about how memories, even your most precious ones, fade surprisingly quickly. But I don't go along with that. The memories I value most, I don't see them ever fading. I lost Ruth, then I lost Tommy, but I won't lose my memories of them. I suppose I lost Hailsham too" (Ishiguro, 2005, p. 286). It is obvious that Kathy loses everything that is valuable for her; indeed, they are not concrete for Kathy physically; however, she has possessed them in her memories. She experiences her closest friends' deaths, Ruth and Tommy that become ties to Hailsham, which means a sense of loss for Kathy. Nevertheless, she values her memories that she will not lose. On the other hand, Ishiguro reveals the unreliability of the narrator through the novel while depicting the narrator's memories. While narrating the events, Kathy uses expressions such as "Maybe I am remembering it wrong" (Ishiguro, 2005, p. 8) and "This was all a long time ago so I might have some of it wrong but my memory of it" (Ishiguro, 2005, p. 13). These expressions Ishiguro depicts his narrator who embraces her memories rather than repressing them; however, the narrator is aware of the possibility of being wrong owing to the unreliability and uncertainty of the memories.

Regarding *The Handmade's Tale*, Atwood depicts a totalitarian, theocratic regime that dominates the subjects by controlling time and history by means of memory. "Into the Memory Hole: Totalitarianism and Mal d'Archive in *Nineteen Eighty-Four* and *The Handmaid's Tale*," Finigan proposes that *The Handmade's Tale* is centrally concerned with dominating the subjects through the control of their experience of time, memory, and history. The protagonist of the story tries to establish her own archives in defiance of the authoritarian eradication of memory and public history. Offred, the handmaid, attempts to bolster the shattered past in the diaries and journals by attending to those fossilized remains that do persist, sedimented in memory, language, and materiality. She explicitly imagines them as records for a future history

beyond the regime's control (2011, p. 435). Finigan further explains that the totalitarian regime seeks to abolish the traces of the past as fast as possible. The physical and symbolic remnants of the “time before” are either renamed or destroyed (2011, p. 438). Atwood’s narrator, Offred, who has lost her own name and past, explains these changes: “There used to be an ice-cream store, somewhere in this block. I can’t remember the name. Things can change so quickly, buildings can be torn down or turned into something else, it’s hard to keep them straight in your mind the way they used to be” (Atwood, 1998, p. 190). These lines emphasize the changes that the totalitarian regime does in order to control and suppress public history and personal memory.

In terms of the relationship between memory and loss in *The Handmade’s Tale*, the control of the totalitarian regime threatens the narrator with the total loss of personal memory. The Gilead regime’s assault on personal and social memory has formed a chasm between the unstable signifier of Offred’s memories and the signified of past reality. All kinds of symbolic and actual violent applications such as the separation of families, the seizure of photographs and other mementos, the forbidding access to nearly every form of media, the rigid supervision of any social contact, the threat of torture and disappearance inosculate to erase the connection between past and present. Offred thinks, “I try to remember if the past was exactly like this. I’m not sure, now [...] somehow the mix is different. A movie about the past is not the same as the past” (Atwood, 1998, p. 306). Besides, it is more disturbing for Offred that her loved memories that are related to her husband and her lost daughter are gradually being erased. Shockingly, Offred considers herself an erased person from the memories of others as a victim of this erosion process (Finigan, 2011, p. 441). Offred considers that time “has washed over me” and “I am only a shadow now [...] a shadow of a shadow, as dead mothers become” (p. 296). In other words, the erosion process is not unilateral but mutual. The more Offred’s memories of the beloved fade away, the more she is also faded away from the memories of others.

The issue of loss is at the centre of not only Ishiguro’s *Never Let Me Go* but also Atwood’s *The Handmade’s Tale*. In *Loss: The Politics of Mourning*, Eng and Kazanjian describe loss as an “ongoing and open relationship with the past” that contain “bringing its ghosts and spectres into the present” (2003, p. 3). With regard to loss, in *Writing History and Writing Trauma*, LaCabra makes a distinction among loss, absence, and lack. Absence is more abstract than loss and is “not an event and does not imply tenses (past, present, or future)” (2001, p. 49). LaCabra (2001) clarifies the relationship between absence and loss:

When absence is converted into loss, one increases the likelihood of misplaced nostalgia or utopian politics in quest of a new totality or fully unified community. When loss is converted into (or encrypted in an indiscriminately generalised rhetoric of) absence, one faces the impasse of endless melancholy, impossible mourning, and interminable aporia in which any process of working through the past and its historical losses is foreclosed or prematurely aborted. (p. 46)

LaCabra further explains the contrastive relation between the indefiniteness of absence with both loss and lack's orientation towards a particular object. There is a clear distinction between the concepts of loss and lack as following: "loss is to the past, so lack is to the present" (2001, p. 49). Therefore, for both novels, it is possible to observe the categories of loss and lack towards specified objects for the narrators. Nakamura proposes, in *The Handmade's Tale*, Offred's losses transform into absence that leads her to the predicament of melancholy. Although she has clear memories of the past, she is unable to long for her past. What is traumatic to her is that she is unable to be nostalgic for her past. For instance, her husband is missing and she thinks that her daughter will not remember her. These objects of mourning have not yet been totally lost, which prevents Offred from pursuing the act of mourning (Nakamura, 2015, p. 123). On the other hand, in *Never Let Me Go*, Kathy's losses also transform into absence that leads to impossible mourning for her. As she has clear memories of past, and unlike Offred's situation, Kathy is able to long for her past. Kathy's separation from Hailsham becomes a traumatic loss, and this separation results in the nostalgic longing to return to her idealized world and her childhood in this idealized world. This nostalgic longing gives rise to her disappointment with her present life. Her disappointment with her present life can be called as lack at the present in accordance with LaCabra's clarification.

Within the frame of the notion of nostalgia, it is a culturally derived emotion, which dates back to the seventeenth century. As opposed to basic primary emotions like anger and fear, nostalgia is a secondary emotion that includes both positive and negative feelings. It is a personal contemplation of a valued experience in the past. In addition, it is an experience, which one does not expect to live again. Thus, not only a pain of loss but also a regretful kind of pleasure accompany the contemplation. Nostalgic considerations mourn for a loss; however, they also contain the acceptance of the loss, and this acceptance makes possible a pleasurable feeling along with a kind of regret. Briefly, nostalgia is a bittersweet emotion, which is consciously constructed and can be revealed when desired (Dickenson and Erben, 2006, p. 224). In other

words, nostalgia is composed of not only negative feelings that include a pain of loss but also positive feelings that contain a reflection when wanted.

The foregrounding issue that gives rise to nostalgic longing and desire is the experience of loss although the object of longing and desire, particularly the object of nostalgia, is exposed to the idealization. Within the frame of nostalgia, in “Nostalgia and Autobiography: The Past in the Present,” Dickinson and Erben (2006) explain the relation between the loss and childhood:

The central features of nostalgic feeling are the contemplation of an experience in the past that was valued and will not return, accompanied by a mourning of loss that is less anguished than the misery of grief. There is pleasure as well as pain in this contemplation, and –importantly– there is an acceptance of the loss, sometimes nearly amounting to a sense that the loss was deserved. Almost always the loss has some connection with childhood – the loss of the contemplator’s own childhood, or, and particularly in literary evocations of nostalgia, an imagined ideal childhood. (p. 228)

Concerning the primary characteristics of nostalgic feeling, Dickinson and Erben highlight that mourning of loss, pleasure, pain, and acceptance of loss. In *Never Let Me Go*, Kathy’s separation from Hailsham remains a loss, and this separation results in the nostalgic longing to return to her idealized world and her childhood in this idealized world. This nostalgic longing gives rise to not only acceptance of loss but also pleasure and pain. In *The Handmade’s Tale*, it is not observed a kind of loss that is related to an imagined childhood world or a sense of mourning for the past; moreover, Offred does not feel a sense of pleasure and pain for the past; however, Offred thinks, “We yearned for the future” (Atwood, 1998, p. 4). She mourns for the future, as nothing will be the same as the past.

With regard to the types of nostalgia, in *The Future of Nostalgia*, Boym categorizes nostalgia as reflective nostalgia and restorative nostalgia. While restorative nostalgia evokes the national past and future, reflective nostalgia evokes individual and cultural memory. In spite of their overlapping in the frames of reference, they do not overlap in their narratives and plots of identity. Restorative nostalgia is more about collective, pictorial symbols and oral culture, whereas reflective nostalgia moves toward an individual narrative, which is composed of details and memorial signs, constantly suspending homecoming. In some conditions, both can be seen in the same situations (Boym, 2001, p. 49). Regarding the kinds of nostalgia, in *Never Let Me Go*, Kathy’s devotion herself to look for and care for her childhood friends, healing old wounds, and strengthening the bonds of friendship may be seen as the traces of restorative nostalgia as Boym’s explanation as “a transhistorical reconstruction of the lost home (2001, p.

xviii). Kathy is aware of the impossibility of the return to Hailsham that has been abolished; thus, she tries to strengthen her relationships during Hailsham years. In *The Handmade's Tale*, Offred does not try to reconstruct her lost home; on the contrary, she wants to construct a future that will not be the same as the present; this kind of nostalgia can be called as reflective nostalgia because it moves towards an individual narrative, which perpetually suspends the return to home.

One of the most prominent issues in critical explorations of nostalgic longing is the complex connection between nostalgia and memory that is one of the central points in *Never Let Me Go*. Memory is regarded as complicit in distorting the past in accordance with the desired image (Drag, 2014, p. 138). Drag further proposes that Kathy's commitment to looking for her fellows may be interpreted as a nostalgic longing for an impossible return to a place and a time that no longer exists. Her pursuing Hailsham is not only metaphorical but also literal through her vivid memory which is never far from her consciousness (2014, p. 174). Ishiguro depicts her retrospective mood:

Driving around the country now, I still see things that will remind me of Hailsham. I might pass the corner of a misty field, or see part of a large house in the distance as I come down the side of a valley, even a particular arrangement of poplar trees up on a hillside, and I'll think: "Maybe that's it! I've found it! This actually is Hailsham!" Then I see it's impossible and I go on driving, my thoughts drifting on elsewhere [...] Not long ago I was driving through an empty stretch of Worcestershire and saw one beside a cricket ground so like ours at Hailsham I actually turned the car and went back for a second look. (2005, p. 6)

These lines emphasize Kathy's nostalgic longing and pursuing for Hailsham concerning her lively memories in spite of the fact that the return to Hailsham is impossible.

In confrontation with trauma, nostalgia is thought to divert the individual from the sustained wound and the emerging present crisis that draw their attention to fantasy and an imagined past (Su, 2005, p. 18). In *Never Let Me Go*, Kathy is separated from Hailsham and her fellows, so this is a traumatic loss for her. With the influence of nostalgia, she is kept away from her wound and crisis and moves towards a fantasy world that refers to her idealized childhood. For instance, Kathy hears that Hailsham is going to close and there are plans to sell the house and grounds to a hotel chain. She says: "But what'll happen to all the students?" by thinking about "all the students who'd grown up with" her and "were now spread across the country, carers and donors, all separated now but still somehow linked by the place" they had come from



(Ishiguro, 2005, p. 212). In other words, Kathy idealized Hailham as her origin as her imagined world because it was so important for Kathy's past and identity even though she left there a long time ago.

Through *The Handmade's Tale*, Atwood makes use of the past, present, and future thanks to nature of the speculative fiction and science fiction. Concerning nature of speculative fiction and science fiction, Roberts makes a connection between history and prediction. He explains: "SF does not project us into the future; it relates to us stories about our present, and more importantly about the past that has led to this present [...] SF is a historiographic mode, a means of symbolically writing about history" (Roberts, 2000, p. 35). Roberts relates this kind of fiction with history, particularly nostalgia. Within the frame of Atwood's usage of history and prediction, Nakamura proposes, "Atwood focuses on past things and events in creating her future world, in order to make her prediction more plausible. It should be noted here that the future is something embedded in the past, and Atwood's task is to (re-)discover it, not to create it [...] such nostalgic tendency can be detected on the level of form as well as on the level of content; the past serves as a place for hope (2015, p. 112). In other words, Atwood's utilizing nostalgia by means of history is emphasized in order to create her predictions about the future of the world.

Within the frame of the relation between nostalgia and trauma in *The Handmaid's Tale*, it is observed that there are two representations of nostalgia throughout the novel: forbidden nostalgia and inhibited nostalgia. Forbidden nostalgia shows how a dystopian government tries to suppress people's nostalgia, which is seen as a potential danger to power. On the other hand, when one's yearning for the past is obstructed by trauma or critical attitudes toward the past, it is known as inhibited nostalgia. The narrator's self-questioning over the yearning for the future that people once took for granted but are no longer permitted to have serves to further underline the melancholy tone. The object of nostalgia is a notion of the future rather than the specific items (Nakamura, 2015, p. 116-7). Both representations of nostalgia are observed in *The Handmade's Tale*. First, as the representation of the forbidden nostalgia, Offred's reaction shows the attitude of the regime to her past: "The kitchen smells of yeast, a nostalgic smell. It reminds me of other kitchens, kitchens that were mine. It smells of mothers; although my own mother did not make bread. It smells of me, in former times, when I was a mother. This is a treacherous smell, and I know I must shut it out" (Atwood, 1998, p. 62). It is obvious that the smell is nostalgic as it reminds the narrator of her memories. However, she recognizes that she must not remember that; therefore, this situation refers to the forbidden nostalgia for the

narrator. Second, Offred expresses at the beginning of the narration: “I remember that yearning, for something that was always about to happen and was never the same as the hands that were on us there [...] We yearned for the future. How did we learn it, that talent for insatiability?” (Atwood, 1998, p. 4). These lines highlight that the past and the future cannot be the same, so the narrator has strong feelings for the future which will not be the same as the past as the representation of inhibited nostalgia.

### **Conclusion**

In the dystopian world, the solutions of the regimes are different. In *Never Let Me Go*, the regime prefers investing in scientific technologies by creating clones for organ donations. On the other hand, in *The Handmade's Tale*, the regime prefers to restore the virtue of femininity by forbidding abortion rather than investing in scientific developments. However, whatever the solutions of the regimes are, they control not only the bodies of the human clones in *Never Let Me Go* but also the female bodies in *The Handmade's Tale* by suppressing their desires, rights, and expectations. Concerning the usage of memory in the novels, it is observed that Ishiguro depicts memories as comforting and soothing for his narrator, Kathy, whereas Atwood depicts memories as discomforting and unsettling for her narrator, Offred, making a comparison between the past and present. Besides, these narrators are described as unreliable narrators by the novelists owing to their uncertainties while narrating their memories. Within the frame of the relationship between memory, loss, and body, not only Kathy but also Offred exemplify historiless bodies. With respect to Kathy's conditions, Kathy loses everything that refers to her origin such as Ruth, Tommy and Hailsham, and it is obvious that she will lose her body when she starts to donate her vital organs. In Offred's situation, she also loses everything including her body, husband, daughter, mother, money, job, and freedom in order to keep her body for reproductive purposes since she is described as “two legged womb” (Atwood, 1998, p. 176). Concerning the notion of nostalgia, *Never Let Me Go* and *The Handmade's Tale* have been examined through the types of nostalgia and the representations of nostalgia. Through the types of nostalgia, in *Never Let Me Go*, Kathy's devotion herself to seek and care for her fellows, healing old wounds, and reinforcing the bonds of friendship can be seen as the characteristics of restorative nostalgia owing to the reconstruction of the lost home. In *The Handmade's Tale*, Offred does not try to reconstruct her lost home; conversely, she desires to construct future that will be different from the present; this type of nostalgia can be called as reflective nostalgia since it moves towards an individual narrative which permanently suspends the return to home.

## References

- Atwood, M. (1998). *The Handmaid's Tale*. Fawcett Crest Books.
- Boym, S. (2001). *The Future of Nostalgia*. Basic Books.
- Dickinson, H., & Erben, M. (2006). "Nostalgia and Autobiography: The Past in the Present." *Auto/Biography*. 14, 223–244.
- Drag, W. (2014). *Revisiting Loss: Memory, Trauma and Nostalgia in the Novels of Kazuo Ishiguro*. United Kingdom: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Eng, D. L., & Kazanjian, D. (2003). *Loss: The Politics of Mourning*. University of California Press.
- Finigan, T. (2011). "Into the Memory Hole': Totalitarianism and Mal d'archive in *Nineteen Eighty-Four* and *The Handmaid's Tale*." *Science Fiction Studies*. 38. 3, 435-459.
- Ishiguro, K. (2005). *Never Let Me Go*. Vintage Books.
- LaCapra, D. (2001). *Writing History, Writing Trauma*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press.
- Nakamura, A. (2015). "I'm a refugee from the past": The Function of Nostalgia in Margaret Atwood's *The Handmaid's Tale*. *Sanglap: Journal of Literary and Cultural Inquiry*. 2. 1, 111-127.
- Roberts, A. (2000). *Science Fiction*. Routledge.
- Su, J. J. (2005). *Ethics and Nostalgia in the Contemporary Novel*. Cambridge University Press

Makalenin Türü – Article Type: Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article

Geliş Tarihi – Date Received: 22.09.2023

Kabul Tarihi – Date Accepted: 11.12.2023

صورة العرب في شاهنامه الفردوسي

*Firdevsî'nin Şâhnâme'sinde Arap Tasavvuru*

*Arab İmagination in Firdevsî's Shâhnâme*

*Moustafa ALBAKOUR\**

### الملخص

حفلت شاهنامه الفردوسي بذكر العديد من الشعوب والملل، وأهم هؤلاء هم التورانيون والعرب. وعلى الرغم من وجود بعض الروابط الحسنة بين الإيرانيين والعرب في الشاهنامه فقد غلبت سمة الصراع والاختلاف بين الطرفين، فبدأ العرب منذ المرحلة الأسطورية إلى المرحلة التاريخية في الشاهنامه أحد أبرز أعداء الإيرانيين، وانتهت الشاهنامه بذكر حادثة انتصار العرب على الإيرانيين، وسقوط الإمبراطورية الساسانية على يد العرب المسلمين. وقد سعينا في بحثنا هذا إلى رصد أهم مظاهر حضور العرب في الشاهنامه، وعرضنا لطائفة من الآراء التي تناولت مسألة شعوبية الفردوسي وعنصريته تجاه الوجود العربي في إيران، وعداؤه لعرقهم ولغتهم ودينهم الإسلامي، وفصلنا في مدى أصالة بعض أبياته المسيئة إلى العرب من زيفها. وخلص البحث إلى أن التعرّف على سيرة الشاعر الفردوسي وفلسفته وفكره وعقيدته، وقراءة الشاهنامه بشكل كامل وعميق، والتعامل مع حوادثها ضمن إطارها التاريخي، قد يُبيد كثيراً من التُّهم الباطلة والأحكام المسبقة التي نُسجت حول هذا الشاعر والشاهنامه. ولعلّ غياب هذه النظرة العقلانية، علاوة على أسباب أخرى، أدّى إلى ظلم الفردوسي في كثير من الدراسات الإيرانية والعربية، وحرمان الناس من الفوائد الكثيرة لهذه الحماسة الإنسانية البديعة، وحبسها في إطار التعصّب والكراهية. إنّ هذا البحث محاولة لإنصاف هذا الشاعر وشاهنامته، والكشف عن بعض الأخطاء والتُّهم التي لصقت به عبر قرون طويلة.

الكلمات المفتاحية: الإيرانيون، العرب، القومية، الشعبوية، الشاهنامه، الفردوسي.

\*د. مصطفى البكور، عضو الهيئة التدريسية في جامعة أرتفين تشوروه، كلية الإلهيات، قسم اللغة العربية،  
ORCID: 0000-0001-9135-3511 [m.albakour1977@artvin.edu.tr](mailto:m.albakour1977@artvin.edu.tr)

## صورة العرب في شاهنامه الفردوسي

*Firdevsî'nin Şâhnâme'sinde Arap Tasavvuru**Arab İmagination in Firdevsî's Shâhnâme***Moustafa ALBAKOUR \*****Öz**

Firdevsî'nin *Şâhnâme*'si birçok topluluk ve millet hakkında ifadelerle doludur. Bu milletlerin en önemlileri Turan toplulukları ve Araplardır. *Şâhnâme*'de Araplarla İranlılar arasındaki bazı güzel bağlantılara dair sözler bulunmakla beraber, iki taraf arasındaki mücadele ve anlaşmazlık boyutu galiptir. Destan aşamasından gerçek tarih merhalesine kadar Araplar, İranlıların en bariz düşmanlarından birisi olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır. *Şâhnâme* Arapların İranlılara karşı kazanmış oldukları bir zaferi ve Sâsânî İmparatorluğunun Müslüman Arapların eliyle yıkılmasını anarak bitmektedir. Bu makalede *Şâhnâme*'de Araplara dair en önemli yansımaları tespit etmeye ve Firdevsî'nin Arapların İran'daki varlıklarına karşı göstermiş olduğu kavmiyetçi ve milliyetçi yaklaşım meselesi hakkındaki bazı görüşleri ele almaya çalıştık. Bunun yanında Araplara ve onların dillerine, benimsedikleri İslâm dinine karşı göstermiş olduğu hasmane tavrın sebeplerini ve eserde Araplar aleyhine serdedilen kötü içerikli beyitlerin kendisine ne kadar ait olup olmadığını da tespit etmeye gayret gösterdik. Araştırma, Firdevsî'nin kısa hayat hikâyesi, felsefesi, düşüncesi ve inancı ile *Şâhnâme*'nin kapsamlı ve derinlemesine bir incelemesini içermektedir. İlgili olaylar tarihi bağlamı içerisinde ele alınmakta, ilgili şair ve eseri *Şâhnâme* hakkında uydurulmuş daha önceki birçok yanlış hüküm ve iddiaları da nakzetmektedir. Bu şekildeki tarafsız akli yaklaşım olmaksızın ve önceden zikredilen diğer sebepler çerçevesinde meseleye yaklaşmak, İran ve Arap dünyasında ortaya konmuş birçok çalışmada Firdevsî'ye haksızlık yapılmasına sebep olmuştur. Bundan dolayı insanlar bu önemli insani duyguların büyük bir kısmından mahrum edilmekte ayrıca, taassup ve nefret duyguları içerisine hapsedilmektedir. Bu çalışmanın Firdevsî ve onun eseri *Şâhnâme*'ye yüzyıllarca atfedilen hata ve töhmetlerin ortaya çıkılmasına da vesile olacağı ümit edilmektedir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** İranlılar, Araplar, Mülliyetçilik, Şu'ûbiyye, *Şâhnâme*, Firdevsî

---

\* Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Temel İslam Bilimleri Bölümü, Artvin Çoruh Üniversitesi, E-posta: [m.albakour1977@artvin.edu.tr](mailto:m.albakour1977@artvin.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0001-9135-3511

صورة العرب في شاهنامه الفردوسي

*Firdevsî'nin Şâhnâme'sinde Arap Tasavvuru*

*Arab İmagination in Firdevsî's Shâhnâme*

**Moustafa ALBAKOUR\***

**Abstract**

Firdevsi's Shahnameh is full of statements about many communities and nations. The most important of these nations are the Turan communities and the Arabs. Although there are some good connections between Arabs and Iranians in Shahnameh, the dimension of struggle and disagreement between the two sides is victorious. From the epic stage to the real historical stage, the Arabs emerge as one of the most obvious enemies of the Iranians. The Shahnameh ends by commemorating a victory of the Arabs over the Persians and the destruction of the Sassanid Empire by the Muslim Arabs. In this article, we tried to identify the most important reflections on the Arabs in Shahnameh and to discuss some of Firdevsi's views on the issue of the Shu'ubi and nationalist approach to the presence of Arabs in Iran. In addition, we tried to determine the reasons for the hostile attitude he showed towards the Arabs and their languages despite their religion being the same and whether the bad couplets that were laid against the Arabs in the work belonged to him or not. The research concluded to know the biography of Ferdowsi as a poet, his philosophy, his thought and his belief. Reading the Shahnameh fully and deeply and dealing with its events within its historical framework may dispel many of false accusations and prejudice that were woven around this poet and his Shahnameh. And perhaps the absence of rational view in addition to other reasons were mentioned, led to the oppression of Ferdowsi in many Iranian and Arabic studies.

**Keywords:** Iranians, Arabs, nationalism, populism, Shahnameh, Ferdowsi

---

\* Assist. Prof. Dr., Department of Basic Islamic Sciences, Artvin Çoruh University, E-mail: [m.albakour1977@artvin.edu.tr](mailto:m.albakour1977@artvin.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0001-9135-3511.

لعلّه لا يوجد كتاب في اللغة الفارسية وآدابها وتاريخ الإيرانيين وحضارتهم قد نال عناية كبيرةً وحظي بأبحاث وفيرة كما هو شأن الشاهنامه للشاعر الحماسي الإيراني أبي القاسم الفردوسي، ولمّ لا، والشاهنامه مرآة حضارة الشعب الإيراني، وذكرى كفاحه والصراع مع الأعداء وصدّ المعتدين لتحقيق الاستقلال وتشكيل القومية الإيرانية. فالشاهنامه باختصار كتابٌ جامعٌ لثنى الخصائص الحضارية للإيرانيين في العصور القديمة؛ إذ يمكن من خلالها التعرف على تقاليدهم الاجتماعية وأخلاقهم ومظاهر تمدنهم وثقافتهم وأساطيرهم وفلسفتهم وأديانهم القديمة، وهي علاوة على ذلك كتاب جامع للغة ذلك الشعب ومفردات كلامه وأساليب تعبيرهم في أرقى صورة. والشاهنامه ليست كتاب إيران والإيرانيين فحسب، وإن كان ذلك هو محورها، فهي تضمّ علاوة على سيرة الإيرانيين، ذكرًا للعديد من الشعوب المجاورين من قبيل الترك والعرب والروم والهنود، وغيرهم من الشعوب ممن تفاعلوا مع إيران في ثنّى جوانب الحياة العسكرية والاقتصادية والاجتماعية وغير ذلك. وقبل التحدّث عن صورة العرب في الشاهنامه يجدر بنا التعريف بهذا المنظومة الحماسية وصاحبها الشاعر الفردوسي.

### الفردوسي والشاهنامه

الفردوسي هو أبو القاسم منصور (أو حسن أو أحمد) بن حسن (أو أحمد أو علي أو إسحاق) بن شرفشاه. وقد اشتهر بلقب الفردوسي نسبة إلى كلمة "الفردوس" بمعنى البستان أو المزرعة<sup>1</sup>.

تشير معظم الدراسات التي أنجزت حول الفردوسي تبعاً للقرائن الواردة في الشاهنامه إلى أن سنة ولادته تعود إلى عام 329 أو 330 للهجرة، ويرى بعضهم أنها كانت سنة 2324. وفي كتابه المشهور "چهار مقاله" (المقالات الأربع) ذكر النظامي العروضي السمرقندي أن الفردوسي كان من دهاقنة طوس، وكان ينتسب إلى قرية اسمها (باج) من نواحي طبران، وكان ملاًكاً للأراضي والمزارع، الأمر الذي جعله غنياً بما كان يجنيه من تلك الأراضي<sup>3</sup>.

وطبقة الدهاقنة أو الدهاقين التي ينتسب إليها الفردوسي طبقة قديمة من أشراف إيران ونجبائها في العصر الساساني، استمرّ نفوذهم في ظلّ الخلافة العربية حتى القرن الرابع أو الخامس الهجري. ووفقاً للإشارات الموجودة في كثير من التواريخ الإسلامية وبعض الأشعار الواردة في شاهنامه الفردوسي<sup>4</sup>، كانت هذه الطبقة صاحبة أملاك وثروات، وكانت تمثل نوعاً من الإقطاع الاقتصادي قبل الإسلام، لكن الأهم من ذلك أنهم كانوا يلمون بالتاريخ الإيراني وروايته بدقّة متناهية، وتدوينه اعتماداً على ما توافر من روايات ووثائق كانت موجودة في بلاط الساسانيين<sup>5</sup>.

ذبيح الله صفا، حماسه سرايي در ايران از قديمترين عهد تاريخي تا قرن چهاردهم هجري (تهران، چاپ پيروز، 1333ش) ص 171 فما يليها.  
- حسين رزمجو: قلمرو ادبيات حماسي ايران، ج 2 (تهران، انتشارات پژوهشگاه علوم انساني ومطالعات فرهنگي، 1381ش) ص 9.  
- محمد علي اسلامي ندوشن: چهار سخنگوی وجدان ايران (تهران، انتشارات قطره، چاپ اول، 1381ش)، ص 42-45.

بديع الزمان فروزانفر: سخن وسخنوران (تهران، انتشارات خوارزمي، چاپ دوم، 1350ش)، ص 45.  
نظامي عروضي سمرقندي، چهار مقاله، به اهتمام محمد قزويني، تصحيح: محمد معين (تهران، انتشارات ابن سينا، 1348ش) ص 75.

فردوسي، شاهنامه فردوسي، تصحيح جلال خالقي مطلق (نيويورك، 1366-1286ش)، مقدمه احسان يار شاطر، 4 دفتر 1، ص 21.

آرتور كريستن سن، ايران در زمان ساسانيان: تاريخ ايران سياسي تا حمله عرب ووضع دولت وملت در زمان ساسانيان، ترجمه رشيد ياسمي (تهران، دنياي كتاب معاصر، 1368ش)، وصفا، حماسه سرايي، 62-64.

في بداية حياته أمضى الفردوسي نحو عقدين من الزمن في مطالعة أخبار الإيرانيين ودراسة سيرهم قبل أن يفكر في رواية تلك الأخبار ونظمها، وألم بالمعارف الإسلامية وعلوم عصره وفلسفته، ومن جملة ذلك علوم العربية وفنون أدبها، علاوة على تبخره بالفارسية وأدبها. والحق أن منظومته الشاهنامة برهان قاطع على عمق معرفته وحكمته وقوة معارفه التاريخية والفلسفية والبلاغية وغير ذلك.<sup>6</sup>

في شباب الفردوسي كان يعيش شاعر اسمه الحقيقي، وقد شرع بنظم شاهنامة أو منظومة حماسية، لكنه قُتل في نحو عام 368 أو 369 للهجرة، ولم يكن قد نظم حينئذ أكثر من ألف بيت، فقرر الفردوسي إكمال عمله، وكان ذلك حين بلغ الأربعين من عمره، أي في حدود عام 370-371 للهجرة. واستطاع إنجاز هذه المهمة بعد حدود ثلاثين عاماً أي في حدود 401-402 للهجرة<sup>7</sup>، وقدم هذا السيف العظيم الذي بلغ نحو ستين ألف بيت إلى سلطان زمانه أبي القاسم محمود بن ناصر الدين سبكتكين الغزنوي (387-421هـ)، لكنه لم ينل مبتغاه من ذلك السلطان، ووقع خلاف كبير بينهما، لعل ظاهره مادي وباطنه قومي ومذهبي وغير ذلك<sup>8</sup>، فهجاه الفردوسي ومن ثم فرّ إلى مسقط رأسه حتى وافته المنية هناك سنة 411 أو 416 للهجرة<sup>9</sup>.

وقد وصف الفردوسي الشاهنامة ولخص مسيرة عمله الشاقة ومآلات جهوده بالقول: "لم أترك ممّا طالعت من أخبار ملوك العجم حديثاً إلا نظمتها، وفي سلّك البيان رصفتها. وكأني قد نشرت بهذا الكتاب السلاطين الماضين والملوك الأقدمين، بعدما طالت عليهم أوار الزمان، وطوي ذكرهم في تضاعيف النسيان. وها أنا، بعد خمس وستين سنة أنفقتها من عمري، قاعد حزينا كئيباً لا أرى سوى "أحسنّت" من أبناء الزمان نصيباً؛ ربّوا على الحقيقة أعناق البدر العتيقة، فعيل صبري وضاق صدري، وكم تعب تحملت، وكم غصص تجرعت حتى تسنى لي نظم هذا الكتاب في مدة ثلاثين سنة آخرها سنة أربع وثمانين وثلاثمائة، وهو يشتمل على ستين ألف بيت، وجعلته تذكرة للسلطان أبي القاسم محمود بن سبكتكين"<sup>10</sup>.

#### مصادر الشاهنامة

باختصار يمكن القول إن الفردوسي قد نظم حماسته الشاهنامة على أساس مصدرين أساسيين: الأول: شفاهي، والثاني مكتوب: أما المصدر الشفاهي فمرده إلى أن الفردوسي، كان ينتسب إلى طبقة الدهاقنة، وهي كما ذكرنا طبقة معروفة بتعصبها لتاريخ إيران، وتمسكها بالتقاليد والروايات القديمة والمفاخر الموروثة، ونقلها من جيل إلى آخر. وقد استند الفردوسي إلى تلك الروايات الشفاهية المنقولة عن مجموعة من رواة خراسان وسيستان وما وراء النهر، والتي ظلت حية لدى كثير من العائلات يتوارثها الأبناء عن الآباء. وقد كانت المعرفة الدقيقة بالأحاديث القديمة وحفظها ونقلها وروايتها من اختصاص طبقات معينة، يشكل معظم أفرادها الدهاقنة والأشراف والنجباء والموابذة، ولهذا فإننا نجد أن شعراء المنظومات الحماسية الإيرانية يكثرون من ذكر الدهقان والموبذ عند تناولهم لمآخذ رواياتهم. ويبدو أن الكتب القصصية والروايات وسير ملوك إيران القديمة قد ظلت محفوظة لدى تلك الطبقات يتناقلونها جيلاً بعد جيل<sup>11</sup>.

ذبيح الله صفا، تاريخ ادبيات در ايران، (تهران، انتشارات فردوس، 1369ش)، 1/ 463.<sup>6</sup>

نفسه، ص 472.<sup>7</sup>

نفسه، ص 479-482.<sup>8</sup>

نفسه، ص 485.<sup>9</sup>

قوام الدين الفتح بن علي بن محمد البنداري، الشاهنامة، صححها عبد الوهاب عزّام (جزءان)، (القاهرة، دار الكتب المصرية، ط1، 1350هـ/ 1932م) ج2، ص275-276.

ذبيح الله صفا، حماسه سرايي در ايران، ص 186.<sup>11</sup>



وأما المصادر المكتوبة التي أفاد منها الفردوسي في نظم الشاهنامه فأهمها كتاب "خوتاي نامك" أو "خداينامه" الذي دُون باللغة البهلوية في العصر الساساني<sup>12</sup>، وموضوعه التاريخ القومي والقصص والروايات الإيرانية عن الحقبة الأسطورية والحماسية والتاريخية منذ خلق العالم وأول ملك (وفق الرؤية الإيرانية القديمة) حتى آخر ملوك الدولة الساسانية يزدجرد الثالث (631-651 م)، ويعدّ بمثابة التاريخ الرسمي للإيرانيين وسجّل حماساتهم وأبطالهم وحروبهم وآدابهم وحكمهم وسننهم ومحاسنهم ومقابحهم، وقد ترجمه عبد الله بن المقفّع (106-142هـ) إلى العربية بعنوان "سير ملوك الفرس"، وشكّل البنية الأساسية لمصادر التاريخ الإسلامية المهمة في القرنين الثالث والرابع، بل ما تلاهما من التواريخ التي تناولت الحقبة الفارسية قبل الإسلام، سواء باللغة العربية أو الفارسية من مثل كتاب: عيون الأخبار لابن قتيبة، والأخبار الطوال لأبي حنيفة الدينوري، وتاريخ الطبري، ومروج الذهب، والتنبيه والإشراف للمسعودي، وسني ملوك الأرض لحمزة بن الحسن الأصفهاني، وغرر أخبار ملوك الفرس للثعالبي، والآثار الباقية للبيروني، ومجمل التواريخ والقصص وغير ذلك<sup>13</sup>. وعلاوة على كتاب خداينامه فقد اعتمد الفردوسي على مصادر مكتوبة أخرى من قبيل الشاهنامات المنتورة كشاهنامه أبي منصور، وشاهنامه أبي المؤيد البلخي، وشاهنامه أبي علي البلخي، وشاهنامه أبي منصور، وتعدّ الأخيرة من المصادر الأصلية للفردوسي في نظم الشاهنامه، ويضاف إلى ذلك بعض القصص والحكايات المتفرقة<sup>14</sup>.

### مراحل الشاهنامه ومضامينها

موضوع الشاهنامه هو تاريخ إيران القديم منذ مطلع حضارة العرق الإيراني حتى انقراض حكمهم على يد العرب المسلمين. وتعرض الشاهنامه لحكم خمسين ملكًا يمتدون على مدى أربع سلالات من الحكومات هي: البيشدادية، والكيانية، والأشكانية، والساسانية، ووفق ثلاث مراحل هي: الأسطورية، والحماسية أو البطولية، والتاريخية، وفيما يلي سرد مختصر لحوادث كل مرحلة وسماتها اعتمادًا على مطالعتنا للشاهنامه وتلخيص حوادثها:

### المرحلة الأسطورية

تمتد هذه المرحلة من بداية عهد الملك كيومرث فهوشنج وطهمورث وجمشيد والضحّاك إلى ظهور فريدون، وتتسم بأنها شهدت ظهور المظاهر الحضارية لدى الإيرانيين من قبيل: الحكومة، وتعريف الإنسان بالطعام والملبس والمسكن، واكتشاف النار وتعلّم الزراعة والجرف وغير ذلك من القيم والعناصر الحضارية. ولعلّ الصراع بين البشر والعملاقين يشكل الأساس الحقيقي لقصص الملوك في هذه المرحلة، وهذا النزاع دائمًا ما كان يُحسم في النهاية لمصلحة البشر، إذ استطاع طهمورث وجمشيد بما أوتيا من القوة أن يُسخرّا العفاريت لخدمة البشر وتعريف الناس بكثير من أسرار الحضارة، ولا سيما الخطّ وبناء المساكن.

تتسم مضامين هذا القسم من الشاهنامه بشدّة اختصارها وإيجازها، وتُظهر الشاهنامه أن ملوك هذه المرحلة ليسوا حكّامًا للعالم فحسب، بل هم أيضًا قادة البشرية نحو الحضارة، ومؤسسو أركانها من قبيل الطبقات الاجتماعية والملبس والمسكن والنار والأسلحة والخطّ. ولكن على الرغم من ذلك فلا يبدو في هذه المرحلة أي أثر للأبطال الكبار، فالشاهنامه تفتقد إلى القيمة الحماسية حتى أواخر عهد الضحّاك، على خلاف القيمة الأسطورية التي تطغى عليها.

<sup>12</sup> Moustafa Albakour, "Kitâbu Hüdaynâme beyne't-türâseyne'l-Fârisî ve'l-'Arabî". RTE Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi 22 (2022), 104-116.

محمد قزويني، بيست مقاله، ج 2 (تهران، دنياي كتاب، 1313ش)، ص3، الحاشية<sup>13</sup>.

ذبيح الله صفا، حماسه سرايي در ايران، ص204.<sup>14</sup>

وإذا عدنا المرحلة الأسطورية مرحلة صراع بين الخير والشرّ فيجب أن نعلم أن هذا الصراع قد توجّح في نهاية المطاف بانتصار الشرّ وهزيمة الخير، وذلك مع ظهور الضحّاك وغرق العالم في القهر والعذاب مدّة طويلة<sup>15</sup>.

### المرحلة البطولية / الحماسية

تبدأ هذه المرحلة بثورة قام بها البطل الشعبي كاوة الحدّاد على ظلم الملك الضحّاك<sup>16</sup>، وتنتهي بمقتل البطل رُسْتَم، وهي تمثّل بحق أهم أقسام الشاهنامه وأكثرها إثارة، وتجسّد الجزء الحقيقي للحماسة القومية الإيرانية، وتتضمّن أهم خصائص الشعر الفارسي الحماسي وأهم نماذجه ومضامينه.

إن أوّل أمر مهم تلا زوال سلطنة الضحّاك هو تقسيم العالم من قبل خليفته الملك فريدون بين أولاده: إيرج وسلّم وتور، وظهور ممالك إيران والروم وتوران (الترك)، ولعلّ من أبرز نتائج هذا التقسيم شروع الحروب الطويلة بين إيران وتوران إثر مقتل إيرج على يديّ أخويه تور وسلّم، ولهذا فإن معظم هذا القصص الحماسي في هذه المرحلة بل في الشاهنامه يتعلّق بصراع الإيرانيين مع التورانيين، والحروب الانتقامية بين الطرفين والحوادث الخارقة التي شهدتها هذه المرحلة.

تتضمن هذه المرحلة عددًا كبيرًا من الحكايات الحماسية وظهر فيها أهم الأبطال سواءً من الإيرانيين أو من أعدائهم، ولعل من تلك الحكايات: حكاية رستم مع البطل التوراني أفراسياب، ورستم وسهراب، وحكايات البطل سياوش، ورستم وخاقان الصين، وحرب رستم مع العفريت إكوان، وصراع بيژن مع الخنازير الوحشية، وهفتخان إسفنديار، ورستم وإسفنديار، وأخيرًا مقتل رستم الذي ينتهي به العصر البطولي<sup>17</sup>.

### المرحلة التاريخية

وهي القسم الثالث والأخير من الشاهنامه، وفيها تبدأ التصورات البطولية والقصص والشخصيات الخارقة للعادة بالزوال التدريجي، ويحلّ مكانها الشخصيات والأعمال التاريخية، وتكتسي الحماسة القومية الإيرانية حلّة واقعية وتصطبغ بالتاريخ. أوّل قصة مهمّة في هذا القسم من الشاهنامه هي قصة الإسكندر الذي يفتقد إلى الأصل الإيراني، ومن ثمة قصة أردشير بابكان الذي لا وجود له في التاريخ الحقيقي، وقصة شابور ذي الأكتاف، وقصة بهرام گور، ومجالس طرب أنوشيروان السبعة مع بزرجمهر، وحرب الخاقان مع أنوشيروان، وموعظة بزرجمهر، وقصة الشطرنج والنرد، وقصة ترجمة كليلة ودمنة، وتوقيعات أنوشيروان، وموعظة أنوشيروان، وأسئلة أنوشيروان للموابذة، وقصة الحدّاء مع أنوشيروان، وقصة بهرام جوبين، وقصة خسرو وشيرين، وقصص أخرى.

إن معظم هذا القصص يمتلك صبغة تاريخية، أو أن أبطالها الكبار قد انتخبوا من بين الشخصيات التاريخية، ولذا، ففي المرحلة التاريخية للشاهنامه تقلّ كثيرًا الأعمال الخارقة للعادة.

ويبدو من هذه العناوين أن القسم التاريخي للشاهنامه لا يتضمّن حروب الأبطال من أجل تأمين استقلال إيران والانتقام من الأعداء فحسب، بل يشتمل على موضوعات في السياسة والإدارة والحكم.

نفسه، ص 206-207.<sup>15</sup>

<sup>16</sup> Moustafa Albakour, "Arap ve Fars Kültürleri Arasında Efsaneden Tarihe Demirci Kâve ve ed-Dirafs el-Kâviyânî". Marifetname Dergisi 10/1 (Haziran 2023), 75-106.

نفسه، ص 208-211.<sup>17</sup>

يعرض العصر التاريخي لحملات أقوام ثلاثة هم الروم والترك والعرب، وعلى الرغم من تعدد جوانب الصراع التاريخي بين الإيرانيين وتلك الأقوام إلا أن الصراع الأكبر والحاسم كان بين الإيرانيين والعرب المسلمين في إبان عصر الفتوحات الإسلامية وحُكم الملك يزيد الذي انتهى بهزيمة الإيرانيين وانقراض حكمهم<sup>18</sup>.

هذه هي باختصار المراحل الثلاثة للشاهنامه، لكن المطالع للشاهنامه يجب ألا ينتظر رؤية أي حدّ فاصل بين هذه المراحل الثلاث، فهي متمازجة متداخلة؛ ولما تجد حدثاً في المرحلة الأسطورية أو التاريخية لا يحمل روحاً حماسية أو بطولية، كما أن تأويل بعض الرموز الأسطورية والحماسية غالباً ما يقود إلى مفاهيم ومعان تتسق ومنطق التاريخ وفلسفته، وهذا ما عبّر عنه الفردوسي نفسه في أثناء تناوله لأحد الحوادث العجائبية، حيث يقول:

تو این را دروغ وفسانه مدان به یکسان روشن زمانه مدان

از هر چه اندر خورد با خرد دگر بر ره رمز معنی برد<sup>19</sup>

أي: "لا تظنن هذا الكلام كذباً وخرافة أو مصوغاً بالسحر والأوهام، فكّل ما يتعارض مع العقل والحقيقة يمكن تأويله على سبيل الرمز والمجاز".

### الشاهنامه، كتاب ملوك إيران وسيرهم

إن أكثر الأبحاث العربية والإيرانية التي تناولت شاهنامه الفردوسي<sup>20</sup> تمحورت حول أحد هاتين القضيتين: الأولى هي حياة الفردوسي ولا سيما علاقته بالسلطان محمود الغزنوي وأسباب الخلاف بينهما، والتركيز على جوانب الصراع القومي والمذهبي بين الإيرانيين والترك، وظلم السلطان محمود للفردوسي. والثانية: هي الجانب الشعبي والقومي في الشاهنامه، وحروب الإيرانيين مع بقية الأمم والشعوب، ولا سيما مع العرب. وعلى الرغم من أهمية هاتين المسألتين وخطورتهما في الشاهنامه ومحوريتهما في هذا النوع من الآثار القومية، إلا أن من اللافت حقاً غياب الأبحاث العلمية الجادة التي تبحث في فلسفة الشاهنامه والمحطات الفكرية والأخلاقية التي حفلت بها الشاهنامه بعيداً عن الأحكام المسبقة والمشاعر العدائية. وإذا كان هذا الأمر مسوّغاً إلى حدّ بعيد في العالم العربي نتيجة عدم معرفة الباحثين والمفكرين العرب بلغة الشاهنامه ومضامينها، فينبغي له ألا يكون كذلك بين الباحثين الإيرانيين وكتّابهم، الأمر الذي يجعلني أصدر حكماً، وإن كان متسرّعاً، وهو أنّ الفردوسي وأثره المهم الشاهنامه الذي ولد غريباً في عصره وعانى من الجفاء وأهل الرياء، ما زال كذلك غريباً في أيامنا هذه، على الرغم من كلّ ما يشاغ حولهما من طقوس التقدير وهالات التقديس والتعظيم. ويبدو أنّ هنالك أسباباً كثيرة قادت إلى هذا المنحى، وحرقت الشاهنامه عن مسارها الإنساني ووجهتها العالمية عبر قرون طويلة، ولعلّ أهمها يعود إلى السبب الرئيسي الآتي وهو أن الشاهنامه لغة تعني كتاب الملوك، أو سيرة الملوك<sup>21</sup>، والملك كلمة قد لا تروق لكثير من الناس تبعاً للأبعاد السلبية التي تحملها، والتي ترسّخت في الأذهان عبر حقب طويلة، ولا سيما خلال العصور الإسلامية. ولعل هذا يقودنا إلى إثارة السؤال الآتي: إذا كان ذلك كما هو الحال الذي جعل الفردوسي ينظم سير ملوك إيران من الحقبة الأسطورية إلى طلوع فجر التاريخ الإسلامي؟ وما الأسس والمعايير التي اعتمدها في رؤيته للنظام الملكي؟ وهل الأهداف والغايات التي كان

السابق، ص 211-215.18

فردوسي، شاهنامه، خالقي، ج1، ص11.19

راجع مقالات كتاب: تميرم از این پس كه من زنده ام؛ مجموعة مقالات كنگره جهاني بزرگداشت فردوسي "هزاره 20 تدوين شاهنامه، (تهران، انتشارات دانشگاه تهران، 1369ش).

على اكبر دهخدا، لغتنامه (16 مجلداً)، (تهران، انتشارات دانشگاه تهران)، ج9، شاهنامه.21

ينشدها تتناسب وجهه المضني الذي استمر نحو ثلاثة عقود؟ وفي النهاية هل كان موفقاً في تشييد قصرٍ شامخٍ لا تؤثر فيه صروف الدهر وعواصف الأيام والقهر كما يدعي؟

يمكن القول إن أكبر الأخطاء التي وقع فيها كثيرٌ من قارئ الشاهنامه ودارسيها منذ عصر الفردوسي نفسه وحتى أيامنا هذه، هو الاستنباط المغلوط والنظرة القاصرة لكلمة (المَلِك) أو (الشاه)، وهذا ما أساء بالفعل إلى مقام الشاهنامه وتأثيرها ومكانتها الإنسانية الحقيقية، فمن غير الممكن لشاعر يقَدِّسُ قيمَ الدين الإسلامي الحنيف أن يُفني سني عمره العزيز في تدوين كتاب في "لهو الحديث"، أو "أساطير الأولين"، ومدح مجموعةٍ من الملوك المستبدين، كما يتهمه بعضهم. ولا يمكن أن يكون قصده إطلاقاً من نظم سير ملوك إيران تأييد النظام الشاهنشاهي البائد، وإحياء ذكرى ثلثة من الحكام الطغاة وتجديد رسومهم وتقاليدهم الدارسة. وهذه النظرة الخاطئة تجاه الفردوسي والشاهنامه ليست بالأمر الجديد، بل إنها تعود إلى أيام شاعرنا الفردوسي نفسه، لكنَّ شدتها وضعفها كانا مرهونين على الدوام بالظروف السياسية والاجتماعية لإيران عبر عصور عدّة ومراحل مختلفة، ولعلَّ أهمَّ الأسباب الكامنة وراء ذلك تعود إلى سيطرة العديد من الحكومات الخارجية على إيران، الأمر الذي دفع تلك الأنظمة إلى الطعن بالآثار والقيم التي تُثبِّرُ المشاعرَ الوطنية ضدَّهم، واستبدال الأفكار المخالفة للمشاعر القومية والحسَّ الوطنيِّ بها، منذرِّعين بالدين ووحدة الأمة الإسلامية، وكل ذلك من أجل إحكام السيطرة على ربوع إيران، وقد استغل بعض رجال البلاط هذه الظروف الجديدة ولا سيما الشعراء والكتّاب الناقمين على الفردوسي والحاسدين له، وراحوا يطعنون بالشاهنامه ويحرقون صاحبها<sup>22</sup>.

ولعلَّ الفردوسي نفسه لم يكن في عمله هذا مؤرِّخاً بالمعنى العلمي والاصطلاحي الدقيق لهذه الكلمة بقدر ما كان حكيماً وفيلسوفاً، ينشدُ من عرض سير هؤلاء الملوك وسرد الحوادث والوقائع السالفة أخذ العبر من التاريخ، والاتعاظ بالماضي كي لا تتكرر مصائب الماضي وحوادثه المريرة<sup>23</sup>.

وتبعاً لذلك يتأتى هذا السؤال المهم جداً: لمَّ سمى الفردوسي هذا الأثر بالشاهنامه؟ يمكن القول إن الفردوسي اعتمد سنة كانت شائعة في تلك العصور، وتقوم على تدوين المؤلفات التاريخية والأدبية وغير ذلك، وتصنيفها وفقاً للأنظمة والسلالات الحاكمة، ولو كانت التسمية انعكاساً للمضامين لكان الأجدُرُّ به تسميتها بعناوين أخرى من قبيل: بهلوان نامه، أو عشق نامه، أو وطن نامه، أو عدالة نامه، أو حكمة نامه، أو شعب نامه وغير ذلك.

من ناحية أخرى فإن كلمة "شاه" كانت في الأصل تحمل دلالاتٍ روحانيةً وقرسيةً خاصةً لدى الإيرانيين القدماء، فهم يعدُّون السلطة المثالية موهبةً وعنايةً إلهيةً كالنُبوة، يُنزِلها الله على صفوة خلقه. ويبدو أن وقوع السلطة في يد رجال مستبدين وطغاة متجبرين قد حطَّ من منزلة هذه الكلمة وقداستها، حتى أضحت اليوم في زمرّة المفردات المنبوذة، ومظهرًا للتفرعن والاستكبار أو الخنوع والانكسار. ولعلَّ أوَّل ما يتبادر إلى الذهن لدى سماع هذه الكلمة قوله تعالى:

﴿ قَالَتْ إِنَّ الْمُلُوكَ إِذَا دَخَلُوا قَرْيَةً أَفْسَدُوهَا وَجَعَلُوا أَعْرَآةَ أَهْلِهَا آذِنًا ۚ وَكَذَلِكَ يَفْعَلُونَ ﴾ (النمل/34)

### صورة العرب في الشاهنامه

تعرض الشاهنامه كما ذكرنا لروابط الإيرانيين مع عديد من الأقوام أهمهم الترك والعرب والروم، وقد بدا الصراع الإيراني التركي أطول أشكال الصراع في الشاهنامه، وشكّل أبرز وجوه المرحلة الحماسية في الشاهنامه والقيم البطولية. وأما الصراع الإيراني العربي فعلى الرغم من قلة حوادثه مقارنة بالصراع الإيراني التركي أو التوراني فقد كان الصراع الأهم والأخطر

حسين رزمجو، قلمرو ادبيات حماسي ايران، ج2، ص 103-108.<sup>22</sup>  
السابق، ص58.<sup>23</sup>

على الحكم الإيراني، حيث انتهى بإسقاط الإمبراطورية الساسانية، وتدمير أديانها ومذاهبها القديمة، وانتشار قيم الحضارة العربية الإسلامية في كل جوانب تلك الإمبراطورية الكبيرة.

وقد سبق الفتح العربي للإمبراطورية الفارسية غزوات عدّة للإمبراطورية الفارسية، ولعلّ أشهرها تلك التي قام بها الإسكندر الثالث المقدوني 336-323 ق.م للإمبراطورية الفارسية الأخمينية، وهزم الجيش الفارسي وتحطيم القوة العسكرية في عدّة وقعت حاسمة وفتح كامل تلك الإمبراطورية وتدمير عاصمتها برسبوليس. لكن يبدو أن ذلك الغزو لم يؤثّر كثيرًا في أسس الوجود الفارسي، أما الفتح العربي الإسلامي لإيران فكان تأثيره جوهريًا وجذريًا، فنسف أهم أسس الوجود الفارسي ولا سيما الدين واللغة والثقافة، وصبغ إيران بلون مختلف تمامًا عما كان سائدًا فيها طوال قرون عدّة. وعلى الرغم من محاولات المقاومة العسكرية والتمردات على الخلافة العربية الإسلامية، وكذلك عبر الأدوات الثقافية والفكرية التي عُرفت باسم (الشعبوية) فإن ذلك الفتح كان منعطفًا حاسمًا في حياة الإيرانيين وحضارتهم.

فكيف بدت ملامح الوجود العربي في شاهنامه الفردوسي، وما موقف الفردوسي مما جرى، وهو الشاعر الإيراني القومي الشيعي المتعصب لآل البيت، وقد نظم شاهنامته في أواخر القرن الرابع، في محيط عربي إسلامي في ظلّ سيطرة الغزنويين الترك من ذوي المذهب السنّي؟<sup>24</sup>

يمكن تقسيم العلاقات الفارسية العربية في الشاهنامه إلى قسمين: علاقات تعود إلى المرحلة الأسطورية، وعلاقات تعود إلى المرحلة التاريخية، وقد غلب عليها الصراع. ولعلّ حكاية الملك الأسطوري العربي الضحّاك تجسّد أبرز ملامح الصراع في الحقبة الأسطورية، وأما الحوادث التاريخية التي عرضتها الشاهنامه فأبرزها هزيمة الساسانيين في معركة القادسية، وسقوط الإمبراطورية الفارسية إلى غير رجعة، وثمة حوادث أخرى لکنّها لم تتغيّر كثيرًا في صبغة هذه العداوة والصراع بين الطرفين، فكيف تناولها الفردوسي؟

### الضحّاك؛ أسطورة العرب في الشاهنامه

يعدّ الملك الضحّاك من أوائل ملوك الحقبة الأسطورية في الشاهنامه كما مرّ معنا، وتجسّد حكايته أقدم مظاهر الوجود العربي في الشاهنامه عبر تسلّطه على إيران مدة ألف عام. وعلى الرغم من قِدَم حكايته و أسطوره إلا أنها مليئة بالرموز والمعاني العميقة، وأخطر ما فيها أنها ورّثت العداوة بين الأريين والساميين، أو بين الإيرانيين والعرب<sup>25</sup>.

ورد ذكر الضحّاك في مصادر عدّة من مصادر التاريخ العربية باسم بيوراسب أو الازدهاق، وتنسبه إلى اليمن<sup>26</sup>، وقد سرد الفردوسي حكاية الملك الضحّاك في الشاهنامه في نحو 500 بيت؛ فالضحّاك رجل عربي أغواه إبليس وصيّره مطيعًا له،

صفا، تاريخ ادبيات در ايران، 1/ 471-477، وحماسه سرايي در ايران، ص 186.24  
مقدّمة عزام على ترجمة البنداري، ص 88.25

أجمّل ابن خلدون بعض الآراء التي أوردها المؤرّخون حول الضحّاك، يقول: <sup>26</sup>  
"قال ابن الكلبي: إنّ طهمورث أول ملوك بابل وأنه ملك الأقاليم كلها وكان محمودًا في ملكه، وفي أول سنة من ملكه ظهر بيوراسب ودعا إلى ملة الصابئة. وقال علماء الفرس: ملك بعد طهمورث جمشيد، ومعناه الشعاع لجماله، وهو جمّ بن نوجهان أخو طهمورث، وملك الأرض واستقام أمره، ثم بטר النعمة وساءت أحواله فخرج عليه قبل موته بسنة بيوراسب، وظفر به فنشره بمنشار وأكله وشرط أمعاه. وقيل: إنه ادّعى الربوبية فخرج عليه أوّلًا أخوه أستوير فاخترقى. ثم خرج بيوراسب فانتزع الأمر من يده وملك سبعمائة سنة. وقال ابن الكلبي مثل ذلك

بيوراسب هو الازدهاك والعرب تسميه الضحّاك، وهو بصاد بين السين والزاي، وحاء قريب من الهاء قال الطبري:

وكاف قريبة من القاف وهو الذي عنى أبو نواس بقوله  
وكان منّا الضحّاك تعبه الـ ... جامل والجن في محاربهها

لأنّ اليمن تدعيه. قال: وتقول العجم إنّ جمشيد زوج أخته من بعض أهل بيته وملك على اليمن فولدت الضحّاك. وتقول أهل اليمن في نسبه الضحّاك بن علوان بن عبيدة بن عويج، وأنه بعث على مصر أخاه سنان بن علوان ملكًا وهو فرعون إبراهيم، قاله ابن الكلبي

ودفعه إلى قتل أبيه فأضحى ملكًا للعرب. وقد دعا الإيرانيون الضحَّاك إلى حكم مملكتهم فلبَّى نداءهم وأسر ملكهم المستبَدَّ جمشيد، ثم قتله شرًّا قِتْلَةً واستولى على إيران وحكم عشرة قرون أذاق الناس فيها ألواناً من العذاب والقتل<sup>27</sup>.

مما يستوقفنا في حكاية الضحَّاك، وبعيدًا عن قضية الصراع العربي الإيراني هو أن الفردوسي، على الرغم من أنه شاعر قومي حماسي متعصَّب لأمته وتاريخه، لم يدع الفرصة تمرّ من دون الثناء على الملوك العادلين، وهجاء الطغاة المستبدين، والانتصار للقيم والأخلاق النبيلة في المقام الأول وليس الأعراق، وما يؤكد ذلك أن بعض هؤلاء الملوك كان في البداية محبوبًا وممدوحًا لديه عندما كان مستقيمًا وعادلًا، لكن حين طغى وتجبَّر وانجرف وراء أهوائه وتكبَّر، وحاد عن طريق الحق ومنافع الخلق، راح يطعنه وينتفذه كما في قصة الملك جمشيد الإيراني السالف للملك الضحَّاك؛ فقد كان الملك جمشيد حاكمًا عظيمًا، تميَّز عصره بإنجازاتٍ حضاريةٍ كبيرةٍ جلبت السعادة والرفاهية والأمان للشعب، وحرَّر البلادَ من أشكال المرض والخوف والشرور، وخَلَفَ إرثًا معنويًا ونظامًا دينيًا وأخلاقيًا كبيرًا، لكنَّ هذا السجِّلَ الحافلَ بالإنجازات المهمة لم يشفع له ولم ينفذه إطلاقًا حين سكر بخمرة الغرور والجاه، وادَّعى الألوهية وتجبَّر، بعد حكم دام سبعة قرون، فسقط سقوطًا رهيبًا. واللافتُ أنَّ نهايته كانت على يد الضحَّاك العربي، إذ قتله شرًّا قِتْلَةً، وتربَّع على العرش مكانه. وكم كان الفردوسي جريئًا ومُنصفًا حين وصف هذه الحادثة من دون أدنى تعصَّب أو هوى، إذ يقول:

به ارّه ش سراسر به دو نيم كرد جهان را ازو پاک بی بيم كرد<sup>28</sup>

أي: "إن الضحَّاك قد نشر الملك جمشيد إلى قسمين، وطهر العالم منه وأمن الناس من الخوف".

لكن هذا الضحَّاك الذي كان سيفًا لإحقاق الحق والعدالة وقع هو الآخرُ في حبالِ الشيطان، وسقط أيضًا في الهوان كغيره من الظالمين المستبدين والطغاة المتجبرين.

على أن هذه العاقبة وسواها من الرموز التي تحملها قصة الضحَّاك الذي يُنسب إلى العرب غيبت مسألة لم يعنَ بها الرواة والباحثون كثيرًا، وهي أن مهراب ملك كابل يجعل من نسل الضحَّاك، وابنته وروذابة هي أم رستم بطل الأبطال، فالعرب بحسب الشاهنامه هم أحوال رستم؛ سيّد أبطال إيران<sup>29</sup>.

وهنا تجدرُ الإشارةُ إلى دور التجربة الحياتية والروحية للفردوسي في الشاهنامه، فهذه المنظومة ليست في الأصل سوى مجموعة من الحكايات الأسطورية أو الواقعية المتوارثة عن تاريخ إيران في العصور السابقة للإسلام، وهي في مجملها أشبه

---

بيوراسب بن رتيكان بن ويدوشتك بن فارس بن أفروال، ومنهم من خالف في هذا. ويزعمون: وأما الفرس فينسبونَه هكذا أنه ملك الأقاليم كلِّها، وكان ساحرًا كافرًا وقتل أباه، وكان أكثر إقامة ببابل

وقال هشام: ملك الضحَّاك وهو نمروذ الخليل بعد جمشيد، وأتته التاسع منهم، وكان مولده بدنياوند، وأنَّ الضحَّاك سار إلى الهند فخالفه أفريدون إلى بلاده فملكها، ورجع الضحَّاك فظفر به أفريدون وحبسه بجبال دنباوند، واتخذ يوم ظفر به عيدًا وعند الفرس أنَّ الملك إنما كان للبيت الذي وطنه أوشهك وجمشيد وأنَّ الضحَّاك هو بيوراسب خرج عليهم وبنى بابل، وجعل النبط جنده، وغلب أهل الأرض بسحره، وخرج عليه رجل من عامة أصبهان اسمه عالي، وبيده عصا علَّق فيها جرابًا واتخذها راية، ودعا الناس إلى حربه، فأجابوا وغلبه فلم يدع الملك، وأشار بتولية بني جمشيد لأتته من عقب أوشهك ملكهم الأول ابن أفروال، فاستخرجوا أفريدون من مكان اختفائه فملكوه واتبع الضحَّاك فقتله، وقيل أسره بدنياوند...".

عبد الرحمن بن خلدون، تاريخ ابن خلدون، تحقيق خليل شحادة وسهيل زكار، ج2 (بيروت، دار الفكر، 1421هـ/2000م) ص 183

<sup>27</sup> Moustafa Albakour, "Arap ve Fars Kültürleri Arasında Efsaneden Tarihe Demirci Kâve ve ed-Dirafs el-Kâviyânî". Marifetname Dergisi 10/1 (Haziran 2023), 75-106.

شاهنامه، خالقي، ج1، ص 52<sup>28</sup>

مقدمة عزام على ترجمة البنداري للشاهنامه، ص 88<sup>29</sup>.

ما تكون بالجسد الخاوي والهيكل العاري، فجاء الفردوسي لينفث فيها روح التوحيد والإيمان والحياة الإنسانية السامية، وجعلها حقاً منظومةً تعليميةً وتربويةً في المقام الأول قبل أن تكون أنشودةً حماسيةً شعبيةً أو مديحاً للملوك.

### العرب والقادسية؛ النهاية "الحلوة" للشاهنامه<sup>30</sup>

في نهاية الشاهنامه، وفي سياق حديث الفردوسي عن سيرة الملك يزديجرد آخر ملوك العجم، عرض الفردوسي رواية تاريخية تكاد تطابق ما ورد في معظم كتب التاريخ التي تناولت الفتح العربي الإسلامي لبلاد فارس، وما سبقه من مناوشات وسجلات ومراسلات بين الطرفين قبيل معركة القادسية، والحرب التي وقعت بينهما وأفضت إلى مقتل رستم قائد جيش يزديجرد الفارسي على يد سعد بن أبي وقاص، وهزيمة الجيش الفارسي، وهروب يزديجرد ومن ثم مقتله على يد أحد أبناء قومه، وانقراض الحكم الفارسي.

وفيما يلي نورد ترجمة البُنْداري<sup>31</sup> لتلك النهاية تتضمن رسالة أرسلها رستم إلى أخيه من قلب القادسية، ولعل اعتمادنا على ترجمة البنداري بسبب كون صاحبها لا يبعد كثيرًا عن عصر الفردوسي، وهو أول من ترجم الشاهنامه إلى لغة أجنبية، ولذا فترجمته البليغة للشاهنامه ذات مصداقية وأهمية كبيرة، على الرغم من لغتها العربية. يقول البنداري نقلًا عن شاهنامه الفردوسي:

"ولما تسنم يزديجرد سرير الملك، ولبس تاج السلطنة... بقي ينهي ويأمر... حتى أتت على ملكه ستة عشر عامًا، فأذن بناء الدولة الساسانية بالانقضاء، وتسلمت من المسلمين على قواعد ملكهم أيدي الانقضاء، وحينئذ امتلأ صاع ملوك العجم واشتعلت الأنوار الإسلامية فزحزت تلك الظلم، فأنفذ أمير المؤمنين عمر بن الخطاب رضوان الله عليه سعد ابن أبي وقاص رضي الله عنه لقتالهم. فلما بلغ ذلك يزديجرد جمع عساكر كثيرة خذلهم التوفيق، فجعلهم تحت راية رستم الذي سبق ذكره، وكان بهلوانًا شجاعًا وفارسًا مقدمًا، فجهزه بهم إلى القادسية حين وصلت إليها عساكر الإسلام. فالتقوا هناك وجرت بينهم وقعة عظيمة. وكانت الحرب بينهم أولًا سجلاً فقتل من الجانبين خلق كثير ثم ظهرت الغلبة الإسلامية. وكان رستم منجماً فرأى طالع الفرس منحوسًا، وعلم أن نعيمهم عاد بؤسًا. فكتب كتابًا إلى أخيه مشحونًا بالأسف والحزن، يذكر فيه أنه نظرت في أسرار الكواكب، واستشفقت أستار العواقب، فرأيت بيت ملك الساسانية خاليًا، ورسم سلطانها عافيًا... وكتب كتاباً إلى سعد بن أبي وقاص رضي الله عنه، على الحرير الأبيض وشحنه بالوعد والوعيد: .... فقد جئت في عساكر حفاة عراة بلا ثقل ولا رحل ولا فيل ولا تخت. ثم بلغ بكم الأمر من شريك ألبان الإبل وأكلكم أضياب القيعان إلى تمّي أسرة الملوك العجم أرباب التخوت والتيجان..."<sup>32</sup>

ثمة مثل من أشهر الأمثال الفارسية الشائعة يقول: "شاهنامه آخرش خوشه"؛ ويعني حرفياً: الشاهنامه آخرها حلو، وثمة<sup>30</sup> دلالات وتأويلات عدّة لهذا المثل، لكن بحسب الوقائع، وكما ذهب إليه حسن أنوري في معجمه عن الأمثال الفارسية "فرهنگ امثال سخن" فإن هذا المثل يُضرب تهكمًا، ويراد منه العكس أي إن نهايتها مرّة. وفي الأونة الأخيرة طُبِع كتاب جديد عن الشاهنامه بعنوان: "شاهنامه آخرش خوش است: من تأليف محمد ابراهيم باستاني پاريزي، تهران، نشر علم، 1399 هـ ش.

الفيقيه الأجلّ قوام الدين الفتح بن علي بن محمد البُنْداري (586-643 هـ) ولد في أصفهان وترعرع فيها، ثم انتقل إلى<sup>31</sup> دمشق سنة 614 هـ، واتصل بالملك العادل الأيوبي، الذي أمره بترجمة الشاهنامه إلى العربية، فقام بهذا العمل. وقد قام المرحوم الدكتور عبدالوهاب عزّام بطبع هذه الترجمة في مجلدين في القاهرة عام 1932م بعد أن قام بتصحيحها وإكمال نواقصها، وأضاف إليها مقمّمة مفصّلة في بيان خصائص الشاهنامه وشرح أحوال الفردوسي والبُنْداري. كما ذيل قصّة كلّ ملك من ملوك الشاهنامه بنبذة عن أساس أسطورته.

البنداري، ج 2، ص 265-268.<sup>32</sup>

والواقع أن هذه السطور تبدو منطقية في تقاليد الصراع والحروب القديمة، لكن أهم ما في تلك الرسالة وأخطر ما فيها هو البيتان اللذان أرسلهما رستم بن هُرمزد إلى سعد بن أبي وقاص يحقّر فيهما العرب المسلمين ويعيّرهم بفقرتهم وعُريتهم؛ "ثم بلغ بكم الأمر من شربكم ألبان الإبل وأكلكم أضباب القيعان إلى تمّني أسرة الملوك العجم أرباب التخوت والتيجان؟"<sup>33</sup>.

ولعلّ هذه الرسالة بشكل عام، وهذان البيتان بشكل خاص، قد أثارت في الماضي والحاضر كثيرًا من الجدل والمواقف بين العرب والإيرانيين، وقد تكون أحد أبرز أسباب انفضاض العرب عن العناية بهذا الكتاب والتقليل من احترامه، وعدّه وصاحبه نموذجًا بارزًا للشعبوية والأحقاد الفارسية على العرب ودينهم وقوميتهم وتراثهم، وفي المقلب الآخر ظلّت هذه الأبيات حيّة في أذهان الإيرانيين تعبيرًا عن نقيمتهم على العرب وحسرة على انقراض حضارتهم القديمة.

لكن هنالك كثير من الآراء حول أصالة هذه الأبيات وصحة نسبتها إلى الفردوسي نفسه دون سواه، وقد استقرّأتها في كتب وصفحات كثيرة وسمعتها في مناسبات وحوارات مختلفة، ولعلّه لضيق المجال بنا يمكن إجمالها بالآتي:

ثمة رأي ينكر وجودها تمامًا في أصل الشاهنامه ونسخها القديمة، وهو رأي يمثّله الدكتور جلال خالقي مطلق الذي صحّح الشاهنامه طيلة ثلاثة عقود ونصف اعتمادًا على أقدم نسخ الشاهنامه وأكثرها قيمة<sup>34</sup>، وقد أنكر في أكثر من مناسبة نسبتها إلى الفردوسي لعدم وجود هذه الأبيات في أيّ منها، ولكنه يرى أنها أضيفت إلى النسخ الجديدة من قبل بعض الشعبويين المدافعين عن إيران الناقمين على الوجود العربي في بلادهم، للتخفيف من جرح الكبرياء الفارسي. ورأى خالقي مطلق أن ازدياء الفردوسي للعرب كونهم يشربون لبن الإبل ويأكلون الضب لا ينسجم ومقام الفردوسي وشخصيته، على الرغم من أن هذه الثقافة والعادات موجودة لدى العرب، ووردت في كتب قبل الفردوسي، وفي بعض الأشعار العربية، وهي لا تعكس أيّة عنصرية وإهانة قوميّة.

ولعلّ رأي خالقي مطلق ليس جديدًا، فقد سبقه إليه ذبيح الله صفا، الذي رأى أن هذه الأبيات موجودة، ولكنها ليست للفردوسي بل منتحلة، ويرى صفا أن انتحال هذه الرواية أمر واضح تمامًا، ولا شك في أنها لُققت في القرن الرابع واشتهرت باسم رسالة رستم فُرُخزاد، أو أن مضامين جديدة عن العصر الإسلامي في القرن الرابع قد أضيفت إلى رسالة منسوبة إلى ذلك القائد، وذلك لأن أفكار الشعبوية الحادة تفوح بوضوح من جوانب هذه الرسالة، وكأنّ هذه الرسالة أو بعض أجزائها قد ظهرت نتيجة

هذان البيتان هما: <sup>33</sup>

"شبير شتر خوردين وسوسمار عرب را به جايي رسیده است کار که تخت فریدون کند آرزو تقو بر تو ای چرخ گردون تقو" ومعناها الحرفي: "لقد بلغت الوقاحة بالعرب، ممن يشربون لبن النوق ويأكلون الضبّ، أن يتمنوا تخت فریدون، فأفّ لك يا فلك السماء أفّ!"

هذه المخطوطات المهمّة وفق التاريخ الهجري هي:

1. نسخة المكتبة الوطنية بفلورانس بتاريخ 614 هـ / 1217م.
2. نسخة المكتبة البريطانية بلندن 675 هـ / 1276م،
3. نسخة مكتبة طوبقابوسراي بإستانبول 731 هـ / 1330م.
4. نسخة مكتبة لينينغراد 733 هـ / 1333م.
5. نسخة دار الكتب بالقاهرة 741 هـ / 1341م.
6. نسخة دار الكتب بالقاهرة 796 هـ / 1394م.
7. نسخة مكتبة جامعة ليدن 840 هـ / 1437م..
8. نسخة المكتبة الوطنية بباريس 844 هـ / 1441م.
9. نسخة مكتبة الفاتيكان 848 هـ / 1444م.
10. نسخة مكتبة أكسفورد 852 هـ / 1448م.
11. نسخة المكتبة البريطانية بلندن 891 هـ / 1486م.
12. نسخة المكتبة الحكومية ببرلين، بتاريخ 891 هـ / 1486م. وتوجد نُسخ غير أصيلة بحسب خالقي مطلق. راجع: شاهنامه فردوسي، تصحيح جلال خالقي مطلق، دفتر 1، صفحة سي وسه.



بعض الأهداف السياسية. وفي هذه الحال يكون من يظن نفسه من نسل الملوك الإيرانيين وجديراً بالإمارة على إيران وراء اصطناع هذه الرسالة أو أقسامها المذكورة. علاوة على ذلك فإن هذا الانتقاد الشديد للنفوذ الإسلامي والعربي والتركي في إيران يتسق وتعصب الزردشتيين آنذاك<sup>35</sup>، ولعلّ هذا سيكون مسوّغاً لورودها في ترجمة البنداري التي أنجزها في القرن السابع الهجري<sup>36</sup>.

وقد حاول علي شريعتي الفصل بين الفردوسي المسلم الشيعي المتعصب والشاهنامة الإيرانية القومية، فالفردوسي شارح للأساطير الإيرانية، وكتابه مظهر للثقافة الإيرانية، ولحن الشاهنامة إيراني، ولو لم تكن تعرف من صاحب الشاهنامة فسوف يكون الانطباع بأنها لشاعر زردشتي<sup>37</sup>.

وهناك من يرى أن هذه الأبيات كانت موجودة لكنها حذفت خوفاً من سطوة الحكام الغزنويين والعرب في عصر الفردوسي، لكنّها ظلّت متداولة شفهيّاً بين الناس. وهناك من يستشهد بأصالتها ووجودها اعتماداً على ورودها في ترجمة البنداري؛ الترجمة الأقدم للشاهنامة، وكذلك في نسخ قديمة أخرى كنسخة لينينغراد ونسخة القاهرة ونسخة إستانبول. وثمة من يرى أنه على الرغم من أن الفردوسي ناقل أمين فإنه كان بإمكانه ألا ينقل هذا النوع من الروايات والأخبار الفوّاحة بالعنصرية وتحقير العرب، لكن يبدو أن الفردوسي نفسه كان يؤيّد هذه الروح القومية، ويختبئ وراءها للتعبير عن تعصّب القومي الشديد لإيران وحسرتها على ماضيها، ونقمتها على ما آلت إليه الأمور في ظل الحكم العربي التركي لبلاد فارس، وبالتالي فعنصريّة الفردوسي وتعصبه وشعوبيته أمر طبيعي يتسق وطبيعة الشعر الحماسي، ولو لم يكن الفردوسي كذلك لانتفت عنه صفة الشاعر القومي والحماسي.

وثمة من يرى أن الفردوسي المعروف بإيمانه وورعه وشدة ولائه لآل البيت وهم من العرب، إنما أراد إيصال رسالة بخلاف ظاهر الأبيات، فقصدهم من خلالها تحقير ملوك فارس وإظهار فساد البلاط الساساني، عبر إبراز عظمة الإسلام وعزة الإسلام الذي جعل عربياً مسلماً بتلك البساطة يخترق البلاط الساساني ويهين كسرى، وفي النهاية يخرج وقومه منتصرين.<sup>38</sup> جدير بالذكر أيضاً أنني رأيت هذين البيتين في سيرة الأمير حمزة البهلوان بروايتها الفارسية المسماة "حمزه نامه" أو "قصة أمير المؤمنين حمزة"<sup>39</sup>، وقد كانا يتداولان بكثرة في تلك الحكاية الشعبية التي تتمحور حول الصراع القومي العربي الفارسي، وفتح بلاد فارس وتحطيم الإمبراطورية الكسروية، ولعلهما تسرباً من تلك القصة الشعبية إلى بعض نسخ الشاهنامة، أو خلطاً بين المتينين، وقد كانت حكاية حمزة تحظى بتفضيل وشعبية ورواج بين كثير من الشعوب الإسلامية شرقاً وغرباً. وعلى أية حال، فإن هذه الآراء التي تراوحت بين أصالة هذه الأبيات أو عدمها، وحقيقتها وانتحالها، وإيجابيتها أو سلبيتها قد أدت في نهاية المطاف إلى انحسار مكانة الشاهنامة اللانقطة في العالم الإسلامي، ولا سيما العالم العربي، وأدت إلى ضعف ذيوها وقلة نفوذها المطلوب كمنظومة حماسية عالمية خلافاً لسواها من الحماسات العالمية، وضاعت ثمارها الإنسانية والحضارية بسبب ذلك النقص القومي والشعوبي الذي يصرّ البعض عن قصد أو غير قصد على ترويجها والتبجح به في كل مناسبة، متناسياً أنه إذا كان من حقّ أيّ أثرٍ حماسيّ أن يُنمّي الروحَ الوطنية في نفوس شعبه وأمتة التي ينتمي إليها، ويبالغ في تصوير عظمة ذلك الشعب، فلا ينبغي لهذه السمة أن تكون مُناسبَةً لخلق الحساسيات والصراعات بين أقوام الحضارة المشتركة، وأبناء الدين الواحد والتاريخ المشترك، كما هو شأنُ العرب والإيرانيين.

صفا، تاريخ ادبيات در ايران، 1/ 194-195.<sup>35</sup>

ذبيح الله صفا، حماسه سرايي در ايران، ص 194-195.<sup>36</sup>

علي شريعتي، بازشناسي هويت ايراني - اسلامي، تهران، انتشارات الهام، چاپ چهارم، 1374 ش، ص 34.<sup>37</sup>

حسين رزمجو، انسان آرمانی وکامل در ادبيات حماسی و عرفانی فارسی، تهران، انتشارات امير كبير، 1381 ش، ص 75.<sup>38</sup>

Kadim Hikmet مصطفى البكور، داستان حمزة العرب وحمزه نامه در ادبيات عاميانه ی عربی و فارسی،<sup>39</sup> Dergisi, 7 (2022), 43-55.

## الوجود الاجتماعي للعرب في الشاهنامة

إن صورة العرب في الشاهنامة لا تقتصر على حكايتي الملك الضحّاك العربي الأسطوري ومعركة القادسية التاريخية، فثمة روابط إيجابية تجلّت بالمصاهرة بين الإيرانيين والعرب كزواج أبناء فريدون الثلاثة بثلاث بنات لملك اليمن، وهذا الزواج يجعل الدم العربي في ذرية إيرج وسلم وتور، أي في ملوك إيران وتوران والروم. وكذلك زواج زال بن سام من بنت مهرب ملك كابل العربي الأصل، ومن ثم إنجابها منها البطل الحماسي الأشهر في الشاهنامة وهو رستم، الأمر الذي يجعل العرب أحوال بطل الأبطال الإيرانيين.

وثمة زواج آخر بين الإيرانيين والعرب جاء إثر غزو كيكايوس بلاد اليمن ووقوعه في أسر ملكها، وتسمى اليمن في هذه القصة "هاموران" ولعلّها "حمير"، وهي الواقعة التي يفخر بها أبو نواس في قصيدته القحطانية المعروفة:

### وقاظ قابوس في سلاسلنا سنين سبعاً وقت لحاسبها

وكان من آثار هذه الغزوة أن تزوج كيكوس بنت ملك اليمن سودابه أو سودابه التي تعدّ أسوأ امرأة بين نساء الشاهنامة، ومن نتائج هذا الزواج مقتل البطل الإيراني البريء سيوش في أرض التورانيين، وانتهى الأمر بمقتلها على يد رستم انتقاماً لربييه سيوش<sup>40</sup>.

## الشاهنامة واللغة العربية

ثمة مسألة مهمة جدّاً عن صورة العربي وآثاره في الشاهنامة تتعلق باللغة العربية ومفرداتها في الشاهنامة، وما يشاع عن تعدّد الفردوسي عدم استخدام المفردات العربية واستبدالها بالمفردات الفارسية رغبةً منه في إلغاء اللغة العربية ومحو مفرداتها من ربوع إيران، والتصدّي لنفوذها وانتشارها بين الإيرانيين، فقصر استخدامه فيها على عشرات فقط من مفرداتها. والواقع أن هذا الأمر الذي أشيع عن الفردوسي كان عاملاً مهمّاً أيضاً من العوامل التي سبّبت نقمة العرب على الشاهنامة ومؤلفها ولا سيما في العقود الأخيرة.

وقد دافع بعض الباحثين الإيرانيين عن أسباب هذه الظاهرة اللغوية في الشاهنامة، وسعوا إلى تسويغها، وعدّوها مسألة بديهية لا تحتاج إلى كثير من البحث والتحقيق، ولعلّ من أبرزهم ذبيح الله صفا، حيث أورد مجموعة من المسوّغات والدلائل لهذه المسألة، منها:

أولاً، لأن مضمون الشاهنامة حماسي، وضرورات الشعر الحماسي القومي تتسق وهذا الاتجاه. وثانياً، لأن عصر الفردوسي، أي القرن الرابع الهجري، كان يتسم بضعف استخدام المفردات العربية في الشعر الفارسي، بخلاف القرون اللاحقة. فلو أننا نظرنا بالعين نفسها إلى أشعار تلك الحقبة لوجدنا أنها تتسم أيضاً بقلّة المفردات العربية، ومرّد ذلك إلى أن العربية لم تكن قد تسرّبت بعد إلى كيان الفارسية الدريّة الجديدة النشأة، ولم تكن قد انتشرت بعد في ربوع إيران ولغة الإيرانيين ومؤلفاتهم. وثالثاً، لأنّ مصادر الفردوسي التي نقل عنها بأمانة تتسم بهذه السمة، فانعكس أثر ذلك في الشاهنامة<sup>41</sup>.

## الخاتمة والنتائج

إن صورة العرب في الأدب الفارسي بشكل عام وصورة العرب في الشاهنامة بشكل خاص، أكبر وأوسع من أن تحصى في مقالة أو كتاب، فالروابط والصلات بين العرب والإيرانيين قديمة قديم تجاورهم وتاريخهم، ومتداخلة قدر تداخل حدودهم

مقدّمة عبد الوهاب عزّام، ترجمة البنداري، ص 88.40  
ذبيح الله صفا، حماسه سرايي در ايران، ص 280-282.41

وأعراقهم وأديانهم ولغاتهم، ولكن لا بدّ في الخاتمة من التركيز على مسألتين مهمتين لتناول هذا النوع من الأبحاث الخطيرة، وهما:

أولاً: إن جمع الروايات القومية الإيرانية القديمة ونظم الشاهنامات والأشعار الحماسية من قِبَل الشعراء الإيرانيين، سواء بالفارسية أو العربية، إنما جاء استجابة لظروف تاريخية بدأت في العصر الأموي وامتدت إلى العصر العباسي، وازدهرت في إيران في إبان حكم السامانيين (261هـ/ 875م - 389هـ/ 999م)، واستمرت طيلة القرن الخامس الهجري، ويجب أن تُحلَّل وفق سياقها التاريخي وظروف تلك المرحلة، سياسياً ودينياً واجتماعياً، ولعلَّ القيام بذلك سيسوِّغ لنا ازدهار الحماسة القومية الإيرانية في تلك المرحلة، ثم انحسارها وتحولها إلى حماسة دينية وتاريخية منذ القرن السادس، وذلك بعد سيطرة الحكومات التركية على إيران وتركيز سياستهم على الجانب الديني المتنافي مع المشاعر القومية والتعصّب، ثم اختلطت أعراق الترك والعرب والإيرانيين لئنهي تماماً فكرة التعصّب العرقي والتفاخر بالأجداد في إيران.

ثانياً، علاوة على القصور في مراعاة النقطة الأولى فإنَّ من أكبر الأخطاء الحكم على الفردوسي وشاهنامته من دون قراءتها كاملة، والتعامل مع الحوادث ضمن سياقها السابق واللاحق لا اجتزائها من سياقاتها، علاوة على ضرورة فهم فلسفة الفردوسي ومآربه وعقيدته، ولعلَّ معظم الأحكام الخاطئة التي أطلقت على الفردوسي وشاهنامته وآرائه مردّها إلى الجهل بهذا الكتاب ومؤلفه، والأحكام المسبّقة التي تراود أذهان الكثيرين.

إن القصور في مراعاة هاتين النقطتين قد أدّى إلى كثير من النتائج والاستنباطات المغلوطة وأنجز دراسات وأبحاث تعود في الغالب لأنصار التيار القومي والشعوبيّ في إيران تفوح في الغالب بمشاعر الكراهية والنفور تجاه العرب، وتعكسُ صورةً منحطّةً لهؤلاء في الشاهنامة، صورةً يبدو معظمها قاصراً، ويظنُّ في دائرة الانطباعات والمزاعم التي لا تمتُّ بأية صلة مباشرة للفردوسي نفسه وأثره الشاهنامة، فظلم الفردوسي مرتين؛ مرّة من قبل أبناء وطنه حين صُدِّر إلى العالم بصورة سلبية مغايرة للحقيقة، ومرّة أخرى في خارج إيران ولا سيما في العالم العربي والإسلامي حين صدّق الناس هذه المزاعم دون أن يكون لديهم أدنى اطّلاعات حقيقية عن هذا الأثر الإنساني، سواء بلغته الأصلية أو المترجمة.

في الختام يحسن بنا اختتام هذه المقالة بهذه الأشعار للشّيخ الأجلّ سعدي الشيرازي (-691 هـ) التي تعكس عمق نظرته تجاه الشاهنامة ومحبته للفردوسي، حيث يقول:

چه خوش گفتم فردوسی پاک زاد که رحمت بر آن تربت پاک

میازار موری که دانه کش است که جان دارد و جان شیرین خوش

سیاه اندرون باشد و سنگدل که خواهد که موری شود تنگدل<sup>42</sup>

والمعنى: "ما أجملَ قولَ الفردوسي طاهر النسب، رحمة الله على ترابه الطاهر:

(لا تؤذ نملة تحمل حبةً، فلها روح والروح طيبة حلوة.

فمن يُضيق على نملة فقلبه حجر، وأسود كالفحمة)".

سعدي شيرازي، شرح بوستان، محمد خزائلي، تهران، جاويدان، 1353ش، ص 180.42

## المصادر والمراجع

- ابن خلدون، عبدالرحمن، *تاریخ ابن خلدون*، تحقیق خلیل شحادة وسهیل زکار، بیروت، دار الفکر، 1421هـ/ 2000م.
- اسلامی ندوشن، محمد علی، *چهار سَخَنگوی وجدان ایران*، تهران، انتشارات قطره، چاپ اول، 1381ش.
- البُنْداری، قوام الدین الفتح بن علی، *الشاهنامه*، صحَّحها عبد الوهاب عزَّام (القاهرة، دار الکتب المصریة، ط1، 1350هـ/ 1932م.
- دهخدا علی اکبر، *لغتنامه*، تهران، انتشارات دانشگاه تهران.
- رمجو، حسین، *قلمرو ادبیات حماسی ایران*، تهران، انتشارات پژوهشگاه علوم انسانی و مطالعات فرهنگی، 1381ش.
- سمرقندی، نظامی عروضی، *چهار مقاله*، به اهتمام محمد قزوینی، تصحیح: محمد معین (تهران، انتشارات ابن سینا، 1348ش.
- شریعتی علی، *بازشناسی هویت ایرانی - اسلامی*، تهران، انتشارات الهام، چاپ چهارم، 1374 ش.
- شیرازی، سعدی، *بوستان (سعدی نامه)*، شرح بوستان، محمد خزائلی، تهران، جاویدان، 1353ش.
- سعدی شیرازی،
- صفا، ذبیح الله، *حماسه سرایی در ایران؛ از قدیمترین عهد تاریخی تا قرن چهاردهم هجری*، تهران، چاپ پیروز، 1333ش.
- فردوسی، ابو القاسم، *شاهنامه*، تصحیح جلال خالقی مطلق، مقدمه احسان یار شاطر، نیویورک، 1366-1286ش.
- فروزانفر، بدیع الزمان، *سُخَن و سَخَنوران*، تهران، انتشارات خوارزمی، چاپ دوم، 1350 ش.
- قزوینی، محمد، *بیست مقاله*، ج 2، تهران، دنیای کتاب، 1313ش.
- کریستن سن، آرتور، *ایران در زمان ساسانیان؛ تاریخ ایران سیاسی تا حمله عرب و وضع دولت و ملت در زمان ساسانیان*، ترجمه رشید یاسمی، تهران، دنیای کتاب معاصر، 1368ش.
- نَمیرم از این پس که من زنده ام؛ مجموعه مقالات کنگره جهانی بزرگداشت فردوسی "هزاره تدوین شاهنامه"، تهران، انتشارات دانشگاه تهران، 1369ش.

## Kaynakça

- Albakour, Moustafa. “*Kitâbu Hüdaynâme beyne't-türâseyni'l-Fârisî ve'l-'Arabî*”. RTE Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi 22 (2022), 104-116.
- Albakour, Moustafa. “*Arap ve Fars Kültürleri Arasında Efsaneden Tarihe Demirci Kâve ve ed-Dirafs el-Kâviyânî*”. Marifetname Dergisi 10/1 (Haziran 2023), 75-106.
- Bundârî, Kavâmuddîn el-Feth b. Ali el-. *eş-Şâhnâme*. nşr. ‘Abdulvehhâb ‘Azzâm. Kahire: Dâru'l-Kutubi'l-Mısriyye, 1. Basım, 1350 hş/1932.
- Dehhôdâ Ali Ekber. *Lugatnâme*. Tahran: İntişârât-ı Dânişgâh-i İrân, ts.
- Firdevsî, Ebu'l-Kâsım. *Şâhnâme*. nşr. Celâl Hâlikî Mutlak. İhsân Yâr Şâtır Mukaddimesiyle. New York, 1286 -1366 hş.
- Firûzânfer, Bedî'uzzamân. *Sôh u Sôhnôrân*. Tahran: İntişârât-ı Hôrezmî, 2. Basım, 1350h.
- İbn Haldûn, ‘Abdurrahmân. *Târîhu İbn Haldûn*. thk. Halîl Şehâde ve Süheyl Zekkâr. Beyrut: Dâru'l-Fikr, 1421/2000.
- İslâmî Nedûşen, Muhammed Ali. *Cehâr Sohengevî Vicdân-i İrân*. Tahran: İntişârât-ı Katre, 1. Basım, 1381 hş.
- Kazvînî, Muhammed. *Bîst Makâle*, 2. Cilt. Tahran: Dünyây-ı Kitâb, 1313 hş.
- Ruzmecô, Hüseyin. *Kalemrô-i Edebiyât-ı Hamâse-i İrân*. Tahran: İntişârât-ı Pejôhşegâh-ı ‘Ûlûm-i İnsânî u Mutâle’ât-ı Ferhengî, 1381 hş.
- Safâ, Zebîhullâh. *Hamâse-i Serâyî Der İrân ez Kadîmetrîn Ahd-i Târîhî tâ Karn-i Çehârdehem-i Hicrî*. Tahran: Pîrûz (?) Basımı, 1333 hş.
- Semarkandî, Nizâmî ‘Arûzî. *Çehâr Makâle be İhtimâm-ı Muhammed Kazvînî*. nşr. Muhammed Mu’în. Tahran: İntişârât-ı İbn Sînâ, 1348 hş.
- Şerî’atî, Ali. *Bâzişnâsî Huviyyet-i İrânî İslâmî*. Tahran: İntişârât-ı İlham, 4. Basım, 1374 hş.
- Şîrâzî, Sa’dî. *Bôstân-i Sa’dî (Sa’dînâme)*. açıklamak Muhammed Hazaili. Tahran: İntişârât-ı Javaidan yayınları, 13 53hş.
- “Hezâre-i Tedvîn-i Şâhnâme”. *Nemîrem Ezâyin Pes ki men zende em, Mecmû’a-i Makâlât Kongere-i Cihânî Bezregdaşt-ı Firdevsî*. Tahran: İntişârât-ı Dânişgâh-i Tahran, 1369 hş. Christensen, Arthur. *İrân Der Zemân-i Sâsâniyân: Târîh-i İrân-ı Siyâsî tâ Hamle-i ‘Arab u Vad-’i Devlet u Millet Der Zemân-ı Sâsâniyân*. trc. Reşîd Yâsmî. Tahran: Dünyây-ı Kitâb-ı Mu’âsır, 1368 hş.

**Makalenin Türü – Article Type:** Araştırma Makalesi / Research Article

**Geliş Tarihi – Date Received:** 23.10.2023

**Kabul Tarihi – Date Accepted:** 18.12.2023

## **The Significance of Vocabulary Knowledge in Reading Comprehension**

*Okuduğunu Anlamada Kelime Bilgisinin Önemi*

*Adnan AYDINTÜRK\**

*Mehmet TAKKAÇ\*\**

### **Abstract**

Reading comprehension is one of the most problematic areas in foreign language learning; therefore, it has been an area studied by scholars studying the role of reading skills since the 1950s. The students must be aware of the vocabulary items and not treat them as separate items. Learners need to comprehend the vocabulary within a broader sense rather than the isolated words, and grasp the sophisticated and the deeper meaning created.

The study was conducted in two language preparatory classes at Bingöl University in Türkiye. The participants of the study were selected from these two preparatory classes. For the current study, the data was collected both qualitatively and quantitatively. The study consists of seven instruments, which are a questionnaire, two pre-tests, two post-tests and two delayed post-tests. The result demonstrates that vocabulary knowledge plays a significant role in reading comprehension. A positive and meaningful correlation is detected between all reading comprehension tests and vocabulary knowledge tests applied in this study. The more the students learn the lexicon, the higher marks they get on the reading exams. This study focuses on the relationship between vocabulary knowledge and reading comprehension.

**Keywords:** Vocabulary Knowledge, Reading Comprehension, EFL, Bingöl University

---

\* Research Assistant, Bingöl University, Department of English Language and Literature, E-mail: [aydinturk@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:aydinturk@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0002-1157-5876

\*\* Prof. Dr., Atatürk University, Department of Foreign Language Education, E-mail: [takkac@atauni.edu.tr](mailto:takkac@atauni.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0001-5005-9164

## Okuduğunu Anlamada Kelime Bilgisinin Önemi

### *The Significance of Vocabulary Knowledge in Reading Comprehension*

*Adnan AYDNTÜRK\**

*Mehmet TAKKAÇ\*\**

#### Öz

Okuduğunu anlama, yabancı dil öğreniminde en sorunlu alanlardan biridir; bu nedenle 1950'lerden beri bilim insanları tarafından incelenen bir alan olmuştur. Öğrenciler kelime dağarcığı öğelerinin farkında olmalı ve bunları ayrı öğeler olarak ele almamalıdır. Belirtilen konuya ışık tutmak amacıyla yürütülen bu makale çalışması, Türkiye'de Bingöl Üniversitesi'ndeki iki yabancı dil hazırlık sınıfında yürütülmüştür. Çalışmanın katılımcıları bu iki hazırlık sınıfından seçilmiştir. Mevcut çalışma için veriler nicel olarak toplanmıştır. Çalışma; anket, iki ön test, iki son test ve iki gecikmeli son test olmak üzere yedi araçtan oluşmaktadır. Sonuç, kelime bilgisinin okuduğunu anlamada çok önemli bir rol oynadığını göstermektedir. Bu çalışmada uygulanan tüm okuduğunu anlama testleri ile kelime bilgisi testleri arasında pozitif ve anlamlı bir ilişki görülmektedir. Öğrenciler, sözlüğü ne kadar çok öğrenirlerse okuma sınavlarında o kadar yüksek puan alırlar. Bu çalışma, kelime bilgisi ile okuduğunu anlama arasındaki güçlü ilişkiye odaklanmaktadır.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Kelime Bilgisi, Okuduğunu Anlama, EFL, Bingöl Üniversitesi

---

\* Arş. Gör., İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü, Bingöl Üniversitesi [aydinturk@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:aydinturk@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0002-1157-5876

\*\* Prof. Dr., Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulu, Atatürk Üniversitesi, [takkac@atauni.edu.tr](mailto:takkac@atauni.edu.tr), ORCID: 0000-0001-5005-9164

## **Introduction**

While reading a text, learners need to know and apply some strategies and understand the meaning of the words from the context. Otherwise, reading will be very tough, and they may lose their motivation to read. Students must be aware of the vocabulary items and not treat them as separate items. Tremonti (1965) says that one of the commonly faced traits of poor readers is that they read the words for the sake of the word. Since the reader focuses on the meaning of the word, s/he misses the meaning of the context and cannot obtain the main idea of the text.

Similarly, Qian (1999) claims that vocabulary knowledge plays a significant role in readers' comprehension of a text. Schreiner (1988) defines the complexity of the reading comprehension process, referencing many other scientists who divide this process into sub-categories. These categories consist of some component skills. Some of them are vocabulary and structure knowledge, content/world background knowledge, formal discourse structure knowledge, and metacognitive knowledge. Significantly, vocabulary knowledge has a critical role in reading comprehension. It helps the readers to get active and have a detailed processing of meaning in multiple contexts. On the contrary, low vocabulary knowledge causes fear for the reader. A reader with poor vocabulary knowledge can fail to understand the intention of the text if there are several unknown words, illustrative examples or metaphors. Nation (2019, p.15) states that proficiency in language is associated with varying degrees of strength, detail, and fluency. Teachers aim to enhance students' vocabulary by using a holistic strategy in their language instruction. Furthermore, he emphasises that it is not crucial to possess extensive knowledge in all areas, since their significance may differ. Three crucial components of word knowledge that demand our attention are breathing, depth and fluency.

Reading comprehension is reading for meaning. It is essential while the readers assess their reading. Tremonti (1965) states that humans can comprehend what they read according to their precise perception of words and the meanings that emerge in their memory. One of the essential skills for academic learners of second languages is reading comprehension (Carrell, 1989). Because of the effect of audiolingualism, reading was generally taught to examine vocabulary and grammar in the texts (Silberstein, 1987). According to Silberstein, reading is an active process of comprehension. The reading process is very complicated, so many scientists have endeavoured to find out what the reading process is through some component skills. Grabe (1991) states that the researchers offer at least six types of general knowledge areas as a suggestion. Vocabulary and structural knowledge is one of the most significant of them.



Similarly, Barnett (1986) says that vocabulary development is a critical component of reading comprehension, claiming that vocabulary is an essential predictor of reading ability. Many scientists like Silberstein and Barnett demonstrate that there is a correlation between reading comprehension and vocabulary knowledge. Poor vocabulary knowledge is generally a remarkable matter for reading comprehension in ESL. A reader needs to look at a dictionary during the reading process. These words are defined as stopper words because they prevent the readers from reading fluently (Anders & Bos, 1986). According to Crow, “If proficient reading is an objective, proper vocabulary study is essential” (1986). Koda (1989) understands vocabulary knowledge as critical to reading ability. As understood from the research of Anderson and Freebody (1981), the readers can be fluent if they have a vocabulary knowledge between 10,000 and 100,000 in their first languages; however, this number is generally between 2,000-7,000 words in second language reading. Although the core words that are the most used might be useful while reading texts, it is not enough for readers who study English as a foreign language for academic purposes.

Therefore, what strategies and techniques the teachers and scientists use to get more comprehension in reading will be referred to in this study. Because since the 1980s, there has been a movement of research on reading comprehension. It is a general idea that the readers who use fewer techniques and strategies are ineffective in their reading comprehension. The readers who use strategies better are demonstrated as better readers (Carrell, 1989). Employing these strategies and techniques, the reading comprehension of the students increases thus and so.

## **Methodology**

### **Context of the Study**

The research design of the current study is an experimental research design. The study consists of seven instruments, which are a questionnaire, two pre-tests, two post-tests and two delayed post-tests. The Department of English Language and Literature has two preparatory classes. Nunan (1992) and Campbell and Stanley (1963) claimed that when it is not possible to assign subjects to experimental and comparison groups randomly, that is, in case of impossibility of conducting true experimental study, a quasi-experimental study can be conducted. Therefore, the quasi-experimental research design was preferred instead of the true experimental research design because the curriculum could not be intervened in the preparatory program. There was no alternative to apply random assignment.

## **Participants**

The participants of the study were selected from two preparatory classes of the Department of English Language and Literature at Bingöl University in Türkiye. The population of the study consists of students from the preparatory classes. The age average of the participants is twenty-two. The groups were formed as one control group and one experimental group. The background of all students is similar since all of them got similar points on the University Entrance Exam (LYS-DİL). The reliability and vitality of the study are higher as all the students are in the same class and take the same courses from the same lecturers using the same course materials. However, in further studies, the participants can be chosen from different grades to see if there is a correlation between the reasons and students' grades.

## **Instruments**

After identifying the problem of reading comprehension in the class, an inventory was initially employed for all students. Then, a pre-test was applied to understand the students' current level of vocabulary knowledge and reading comprehension prior to the study. Two weeks after the pre-test, a post-test and finally, a delayed post-test were applied to see the difference between the beginning and the result. In this way, the rate of vocabulary retention could be evaluated. All three tests contained the words that were taught in the lesson. Through the tests, the influence of vocabulary on the reading comprehension of the students could be evaluated. In the first weeks of the research, an inventory of the reading skills of the students prepared by the researcher himself was also conducted to the students to increase the value of validity of the results.

## **Procedure**

Firstly, the required permission was received from the ethical committee of the university for employing the related data collection instruments that were applied to the students in the English preparatory classes. Afterwards, the participants were informed about the context, aim and outcome of the study. The questions in the inventory were directed to the students in order. The answers obtained from the students were recorded by means of camera recordings. Following the answers of the participants, their thoughts were coded as being suitable with the used inventory, and it was talked about which reading techniques and methods could be implemented in future reading lessons. The inventory content was generally about which styles and materials the participants used if they could answer the questions about the parts that they read, and some such questions. Afterwards, two pre-tests were given to the students to determine what their level was. The content of the tests was chosen among the words taken

from their course books. In this way, the test was suitable for their English language levels. Shortly after the pre-test, the students in the experimental group were exposed to some special lexicons that were asked later in the post-test and the delayed post-test. From the beginning, the experimental group tried to employ some vocabulary learning techniques, such as workshops, guessing from the context, translation, use of synonyms and antonyms, online applications, and vocabulary teaching games.

### **Data Analysis**

For the current study, the data was collected quantitatively. In order to see the possible role of vocabulary knowledge on students' reading comprehension, an inventory prepared by the author himself was utilised. The results of the inventory were compared to the results of six tests. The relationship between the tests and the thoughts of the participants was analysed. Then, it was examined if there was a meaningful relationship or not. Moreover, the results of the pre-test, post-test and delayed post-test were computerised and analysed through the IBM SPSS Statistics 22 program to reveal the mean scores, percentages, and frequencies.

It was firstly decided whether the data obtained in this chapter were parametric or not and whether they coincided with parametric test assumptions. Various methods are used to study the normal distribution of the data results. The distribution point is defined as normal when the coefficient of Skewness and Kurtosis is between +2 and -2 (Cameron, 2004). In addition, Can (2016) stated that if the data number is over 30, the values are in the tendency of normal distribution. If Z-points obtained from the division of Skewness and Kurtosis values into standard errors range between +1.96 and -1.96, the distribution is accepted as normal. In addition, in the Q-Q graphic, that the points obtained from the data stand at the 45-degree line or close means that there is a normal distribution (Büyüköztürk, 2016).

### **Results**

This research aimed to discover the role of vocabulary knowledge in reading comprehension. The English level of the participants was deemed to be the same in the current sample. The outcomes of the exams and questionnaire performed for both groups were evaluated using the SPSS (Statistical Kit for Social Sciences) software in the outcome portion of this report. The results, the correlation among the variables, the results of the t-tests, and the frequencies were determined, and the items in the questionnaire were analysed in depth through the SPSS program.

The study population consisted of one experimental group and one control group. The experimental group comprised 30 (50%) students, and the control group consisted of 30 (50%)

students. The experimental group consisted of 10 male (33.3%) and 20 female (66.7%) students, and the control group consisted of 12 male (40%) and 18 female (60%) students. The participants in both groups were chosen from two preparatory classes of the Department of English Language and Literature at Bingöl University. They were randomly classified as “experimental and control groups.” The descriptive statistics for the number of participants in both groups are given in Table 1.

*Table 1.*  
*Frequency Values of “Experimental and Control Groups” According to Their Genders*

GROUPS	Gender	Frequency	Per cent	Total
Experimental Group	Male	10	33,3	30
	Female	20	66,7	
Control Group	Male	12	40	30
	Female	18	60	
Total		42	100	60

Two pre-tests were applied to determine both the vocabulary knowledge and reading comprehension level of the participants and to find out whether there was a substantial difference between the two classes. Table 2 displays the pre-test scores of the participants in the experimental and control groups. The results of the vocabulary knowledge pre-test showed that the mean was  $M=61,83$  for the experimental group and  $M=62,50$  for the control group. Also, the reading comprehension pre-test results showed that the mean was  $M=69,83$  for the experimental group and  $M=68,67$  for the control group. There was no statistically significant difference between the vocabulary and reading pre-test scores of the students in the groups according to the group variable [ $t(60)=-0,087, p>.05$ ]. Based on these results, it can be inferred that the initial vocabulary knowledge of the students in the two groups was similar to each other.

*Table 2.*  
*Mean of the Pre-Tests*

	GROUPS	N	M	SD	t	p	Cohen's d
Vocabulary Pre-Test	Experimental Group	18	61,83	14,70	-0,155	,877	-0,028
	Control Group	24	62,50	18,40			
Reading Pre-Test	Experimental Group	18	80	1,852	3,91	,000	1,193
	Control Group	24	70,542	1,852			

In the current study, in which the influence of vocabulary knowledge on reading comprehension was investigated, a paired sample t-test was performed to determine whether there was a difference between the means of the exam results before and after the application to the students in both groups. When Table 3 was analysed, it was found that the student scores that were initially similar to each other outscored the scores of the students in the experimental group. The results are given in Table 3.

*Table 3.*

*Comparison of Pre-test, Post-test and Delayed Post-Test Scores of both Groups*

Test	Groups	N	M	SD	t	p
Vocabulary Pre-Test	Experimental	30	61,83	14,70	-,155	.162
	Control	30	62,50	18,41		
Vocabulary Post-Test	Experimental	30	75,50	10,77	3,049	.175
	Control	30	66,17	12,84		
Vocabulary Delayed Post-Test	Experimental	30	84,83	8,55	6,958	.397
	Control	30	67,17	10,96		
Reading Pre-Test	Experimental	30	69,83	9,23	-,401	.097
	Control	30	68,67	12,99		
Reading Post-Test	Experimental	30	72,50	10,80	4,204	.016
	Control	30	70,47	15,22		
Reading Delayed Post-Test	Experimental	30	85,83	7,88	9,286	.800
	Control	30	72,80	9,03		

Table 3 reveals that the average score of the vocabulary knowledge pre-test of the students in the experimental group is 61,83, and the average score of the vocabulary knowledge post-test and delayed post-test of the students in the experimental group are respectively 75,50 and 84,83. There is a statistically significant difference between the post-test and pre-test scores of the students in the experimental group [ $t(30) = -,155, p < .05$ ]. Moreover, the average score of the reading comprehension pre-test of the students in the experimental group was 69,83, and the average score of the reading comprehension post-test and delayed post-test of the students in the experimental group were, respectively, 72,50 and 85,83. There is a statistically significant difference between the post-test and pre-test scores of the students in the experimental group [ $t(30) = -,401, p < .05$ ].

However, the results show that the difference is open in support of the experimental group. An improvement can be seen in the post-test and delayed post-test scores of the students in the experimental group, although the pre-test scores of both groups were almost the same at the beginning. When Table 3 is examined, it is found that there is no statistically significant difference between the pre-test scores of the students in both groups according to the group

variable [ $t(60) = -.155, p > .05$ ]. In light of these results, we can claim that the initial vocabulary knowledge of the students in both groups was equivalent to each other. The pre-test results show that there is a significant difference between both groups in the post-test and delayed post-test, although the level of both groups is very close to each other,  $p < 0,005$ . The mean of the reading post-test and delayed post-test for the experimental group is respectively  $M = 72,50$  and  $M = 85,83$ , while the mean for the control group is respectively  $M = 70,47$  and  $72,80$  [ $t(60) = 4,20, p > .05; d = 1,537$ ]. Cohen's  $d$  effect size calculated for the difference remarks a high effect size (Cohen, 1988). Based on these results, it can be said that the effect of vocabulary knowledge on language learners' reading comprehension is high.

To understand what the value level of reading is in the thoughts of the students, a questionnaire was submitted to them. Each item was firstly assessed individually and then as a member of their own groups. The frequency value of all items in the questionnaire is given in Table 4. Almost all items in which the mean for both groups were significantly similar; besides, the mean of all items is higher than 3 points on the scale of 5 point. Moreover, the questionnaire's reliability was calculated as .490. As well, the research benefitted from all items in the questionnaire.

*Table 4.*  
*The Mean of All Items in the Questionnaire Comparing "Experimental and Control Groups".*

	Groups	N	Mean	Std. Deviation
1. How many years have you been reading in English?	Experimental Group	30	4,07	,450
	Control Group	30	4,17	,648
2. I am good at reading books in English.	Experimental Group	30	4,03	,809
	Control Group	30	3,27	1,048
3. I stop reading books in English that sound too difficult to me.	Experimental Group	30	4,30	,651
	Control Group	30	4,43	,728
4. I stop reading because of looking at dictionary too often.	Experimental Group	30	4,50	,572
	Control Group	30	4,57	,679
5. I like buying books on various subjects.	Experimental Group	30	3,53	1,137
	Control Group	30	3,60	1,354
6. I believe it is boring to read.	Experimental Group	30	3,93	1,048
	Control Group	30	3,63	1,299
7. I read slower than other students in my class because of lack of lexicon.	Experimental Group	30	3,80	,925
	Control Group	30	4,03	,964

8. When I read alone, I understand almost everything that I read.	Experimental Group	30	4,03	,928
	Control Group	30	3,20	1,215
9. I comprehend what I've read in English perfectly.	Experimental Group	30	3,80	,887
	Control Group	30	3,10	1,094
10. I think my reading ability will improve if I improve my lexicon.	Experimental Group	30	4,47	,629
	Control Group	30	4,60	,621

By using this questionnaire, it was aimed at getting their views about reading books, especially after class, and to reveal if they read by heart or force. Yet, the main aim of the questionnaire was to reveal if the students could understand the relationship between vocabulary knowledge and reading comprehension. The answers given for the questions in the items 3, 4 and 10 are close to each other. Most students complain about the lack of lexicon during their reading process. 56 (93%) students believe that the more they improve their vocabulary knowledge, the more they comprehend the texts they read. Therefore, the item is the top-rated one in the questionnaire. Furthermore, when items 8 and 9 were analysed, it was found that a small number of the students claimed that they could understand the texts that they read perfectly. Besides, 45 (75%) students declared that they read slower than their friends since their lexicon level is not as high as their classmates.

### **Conclusion and Discussion**

This article demonstrates that vocabulary knowledge plays a significant role in reading comprehension. A positive and meaningful correlation is detected between all reading comprehension tests and vocabulary knowledge tests applied in this study. Vocabulary knowledge is fundamental since a lack of lexicon causes an important obstruction to comprehending the texts that the readers read. It may be possible to understand the meaning without grammar knowledge, yet it becomes impossible if the reader does not have enough vocabulary knowledge. Without adequate vocabulary knowledge, the readers cannot understand any text effectively, regardless of their grammar level.

The results of the tests showed that vocabulary knowledge contributes to the students to read and understand better the books that are taught in the courses. The more they learned the lexicon, the higher the points they got on the reading exams. Besides, according to the answers to the questionnaire, it can be said that they feel more confident when they have an extended vocabulary knowledge. They can challenge their reading anxiety either in or out of the class. For this purpose, in order to improve their reading skills, students have to learn both broad and

deep vocabulary. Concerning their lexical knowledge, it is recommended that the students who study EFL in academic studies should learn the words relevant to their academic fields. Despite the small scale population of this study, the results indicate that students can increase and improve their vocabulary and reading skills through pedagogical intervention with multiword units.

However, it should be noted that knowing an extensive vocabulary will not benefit the readers with a significant effect if their understanding is weak and narrow, even though breadth and depth are two linking elements of vocabulary knowledge. As a finding supporting this, it was seen in the study that although their number is not much, a few students whose vocabulary knowledge size is high could not take higher points in the reading exams. Depending on the result, it is asserted that the students have to improve both their reading skills and vocabulary knowledge.

Although this study provides valuable insights into the significance of vocabulary knowledge in reading comprehension, there are several avenues for future research that could build upon the findings. Firstly, the sample of this study consisted solely of some tests and a questionnaire, and only the participation of two classes, so it would be beneficial to extend this research to other age groups and demographics. In line with this purpose, the extent of the study and the instruments used in the study could be expanded to measure and generalise the problem of the study. Secondly, the study focused only on the words chosen for the study, but there are likely some other words and phrases that influence students' comprehension. Future research could select words in a dense and detailed way. Thirdly, while the study looked at the effects of vocabulary knowledge on reading comprehension in a relatively short term, it would be interesting to extend the research period of the study to analyse each alter in the students more carefully. Therefore, all the facts mentioned above are suggested to be applied in further studies in a healthy educational environment in every sense.



## References

- Anders, P., & Bos, C. (1986). Semantic Feature Analysis: An Interactive Strategy for Vocabulary Development and Text Comprehension. *Journal of Reading*, 29(7), 610-616. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/40029687>
- Anderson, R. C., & Freebody, P. (1981). *Vocabulary knowledge. Comprehension and teaching: Research reviews*. Newark, DE: International Reading Association.
- Barnett, M. (1986). Syntactic and lexical/semantic skill in foreign language reading: Importance and interaction. *Modern Language Journal*, 70, 343-349.
- Blachowicz, C. (1985). Vocabulary Development and Reading: From Research to Instruction. *The Reading Teacher*, 38(9), 876-881. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/20198963>
- Carrell, P. L. (1989). SLA and classroom instruction: Reading. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 9, 233-242.
- Crow, J. (1986). Receptive Vocabulary Acquisition for Reading Comprehension. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(3), 242-250. doi:10.2307/326940
- Dörnyei, Z. (2007). *Research Methods in Applied Linguistics: Quantitative Qualitative, and Mixed Methodologies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Grabe, W. (1991). Current Developments in Second Language Reading Research. *TESOL Quarterly*, 25(3), 375-406. doi:10.2307/3586977
- Grabe, W. (2004). Research on teaching reading. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 24, 44-69.
- Koda, K. (1989). The effects of transferred vocabulary knowledge on the development of L2 reading proficiency. *Foreign Language Annals*, 22, 529-540.
- Nation, P. (2019). *The different aspects of vocabulary knowledge*. The Routledge Handbook of Vocabulary Studies, ed. S. Webb. London: Routledge, 15–29.
- Silberstein, S. (1987). Let's take another look at reading: Twenty-five years of reading instruction. *English Teaching Forum*, 25, 28-35.
- Smith, F. (1971). *Understanding reading: A psycholinguistic analysis of reading and learning to read*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston Publishing Co.
- Tremonti, J. (1965). Reading: Improved Comprehension. *The Clearing House*, 39(6), 329-335.

Werner, H., & Kaplan, E. (1950). The Acquisition of Word Meanings: A Developmental Study. *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development*, 15(1), i–120.  
<https://doi.org/10.2307/1165550>

**History and Memory in *The Sense of An Ending* by Julian Barnes***Julian Barnes 'in Bir Son Duygusu Eserinde Tarih ve Hafıza***Münevver BARTAMAY\*****Abstract**

This study aims to examine *The Sense of an Ending* in terms of history and memory. Anthony Webster's and his friends' past and the life of Anthony, or Tony as his friends call him, and the lives of all other characters are told from Tony's perspective, so the reader has to depend on his memory to reach a conclusion. But his ideas and memories show no stability, and every clue about the past changes or refutes his previous view, and sometimes everything becomes blurry. In La Grange's words, the absence of documents leaves a gap in memory and causes some facts that are not at all certain to appear as if they were real. Tony recalls his memories and tells the events exactly as if they were real, but with each new document that emerges - Tony's letter, Adrian's diary - everything changes and requires a new perspective. The story may need to be rewritten from Adrian's or Veronica Ford's point of view, but ultimately it is true that each character's narratives will fill the gaps differently, because memory is subjective; hence it is unreliable.

**Keywords:** History, memory, unreliable memory, memories, sensing the end

---

\* Research Assistant. Dr., Department of English Language and Literature, Bingöl University, E-mail: [mbartamay@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:mbartamay@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID.

**Julian Barnes'ın *Bir Son Duygusu* Eserinde Tarih ve Hafıza**  
*History and Memory in The Sense of An Ending by Julian Barnes*  
**Münevver BARTAMAY\***

**Öz**

Bu çalışma, *Bir Son Duygusu* romanını tarih ve hafıza açısından incelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Bu romanda Anthony Webster'ın geçmişine ve arkadaşlarına dair bilgiler verilmekte, Anthony ya da arkadaşların deyimiyle Tony'nin hayatı ve diğer tüm karakterlerin yaşamı Tony'nin bakış açısıyla anlatılmaktadır, yani okuyucu bir sonuca varmak için onun hafızasına bağlı kalmak durumundadır. Ancak fikirleri ve anıları hiçbir istikrar göstermez ve geçmişle ilgili her ipucu önceki görüşünü değiştirir ya da yalanlar ve bazen her şey bulanıklaşır. La grange'in ifadesiyle belgelerin yokluğu hafızada boşluk bırakır ve hiç de kesin olmayan bazı gerçeklerin gerçekmiş gibi ortaya çıkmasına neden olur. Tony anılarını hatırlıyor ve olayları tam olarak gerçekmiş gibi anlatıyor ama ortaya çıkan her yeni belgeyle – Tony'nin mektubuyla, Adrian'ın günlüğüyle – her şey değişiyor ve yeni bir bakış açısı gerektiriyor. Hikâyenin Adrian'ın ya da Veronica Ford'un bakış açısından yeniden yazılması gerekebilir ama sonuçta her bir karakterin anlatılarının boşlukları farklı şekilde dolduracağı doğrudur, çünkü hafıza subjektiftir; dolayısıyla güvenilmezdir.

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** tarih, hafıza, hafızanın yanıltıcılığı, anılar, son duygusu

---

\* Dr. Arş. Gör., İngiliz Dili ve Edebiyatı Bölümü, Bingöl Üniversitesi, E-posta: [mbartamay@bingol.edu.tr](mailto:mbartamay@bingol.edu.tr), ORCID.

## History And Memory In *The Sense Of An Ending*

*The Sense of an Ending* was written by Julian Barnes in 2011 and got the Man Booker Prize the same year. It is narrated by Anthony (Tony) Webster and consists of two parts, which gives the early memories of his and his schoolmates Alex, Colin, and Adrian. In the first part of the novel, in a history course they are asked about the reign of Henry VIII and “history” by their lecturer Mr. Hunt. Adrian answers with Joseph Louis de Lagrange’s (French philosopher and mathematician) words: “history is that certainty produced when the imperfections of memory meet the inadequacies of documentation” (Barnes, 2011, p.17). In other words, this produced certainty is a product of uncertain or unreliable memory but somehow it manages to seem reliable or certain. It is a typical postmodern paradigm that history is never objective or fixed. In another lecture, Mr. Hunt asks definition of history and Tony Webster replies:

History is the lies of the victors, I replied, a little too quickly.

Yes, I was rather afraid you’d say that. Well, as long as you

remember that it is also the self delusions of the defeated.

Barnes echoes these lines via Webster again at the end of the novel, when he learns about his brutal letter to Adrian and its consequences at the end.

Adrian is the intellectual of that story and most of times, Tony is jealous of him, his confidence and wit. After highschool, only Adrian is able to go to Cambridge with a scholarship. Tony goes to Bristol and other friends to somewhere else. Most important components of Tony’s story are Adrian and Veronica. Veronica Ford is Tony’s girlfriend from his years in Bristol and seemingly she has a supercilious attitude towards Tony or Tony feels so; we cannot be sure at the end of the novel. She, many times repeats that Tony cannot get it, and never will do. Tony deduces so many things from her silence or a tic of her eye, or they are only Tony’s delusions. As Paul Ricoeur states that, “The constant danger of confusing remembering and imagining, resulting from memories becoming images in this way, affects the goal of faithfulness corresponding to the truth claim of memory” (Ricoeur, 2004, p. 7).

Tony spent a single weekend at Ford’s house and two of the images in Tony’s memory, at the very beginning of the novel, belongs to that weekend. Tony was introduced to Ford family and he had a sense of being disputed by Ford’s, the sense that he mostly felt when he was with Veronica alone. He remembers the location of the house as “smug” (Barnes, 2011, p. 26), the Ford family as arrogant and sneering that reinforces his sense about Veronica’s “sense of social superiority” (Barnes, 2011, p. 27). Her brother Jack cares nothing for Tony, nothing more than

an “object of mild curiosity” (Barnes, 2011, p. 27). Tony gets Veronica introduced to his friends, Alex, Colin, and Adrian. He says:

At first I was watching to see how my friends reacted to Veronica, but soon became more interested in what she thought of them. She laughed at Colin’s jokes more easily than at mine, which annoyed me, and asked Alex how his father made his money (marine insurance, he told her, to my surprise). She seemed happy to keep Adrian for last. I’d told her he was at Cambridge, and she tried out various names on him. At a couple of them he nodded and said, “Yes, I know the sort of people they are.” This sounded pretty rude to me, but Veronica didn’t take offence. (Barnes, 2011, p. 27)

He wants to be approved for his choice and they spend a day together. Veronica asks about her brother to Adrian, as he is in Cambridge too. Tony feels jealousy for the conversation between them but when Adrian says he had heard about what kind of people are Jack and his group are, Tony feels a kind of relief- what he perceived as an approval of his image about Jack. But forty years later when he writes to Jack to learn about Veronica’s address, Jack’s help makes him a bit surprised but still he cannot admit and portrays in his mind an adventurous retirement for Jack in the South Pacific. If Jack was so supercilious about him, after all why did he reply Tony’s request in such a normal way? But he hadn’t still forgot about brother Jack’s “supercilious wink” (Barnes, 2011, p. 106) or Veronica’s “eyebrow-above-the-spectacle-frame-tic” (Barnes, 2011, p. 34). Or are they all his delusions? As it is stated in the novel by Barnes, to detect the factual events it necessitates “to know the history of the historian in order to understand the version that is being put in front of us” (Barnes, 2011, p. 7). In other words it becomes a requirement to know Tony’s history documents and the story he narrated in the absence of the documents should be compared.

Tony is to reconcile the factual events and the story he created in his memory. Barnes practised the theory of Lagrange upon his characters’ private life, this is all to say, Tony created a story with his memoir but he confronted with many missing or misremembered parts. As Estefania Lopez-Deflory (2016, p. 159) argued, there is a “missing middle”, and it becomes a bit enlightened with documents written forty years earlier. First part of the novel ends with Adrian’s suicide and Tony narrates us a story in which he had no intervention, and Adrian’s so much busy mind may have chosen to deny the gift of life with his free will.

After Tony and Veronica’s break-up, he receives a letter from Adrian. He declares to Tony that he was with Veronica and he wanted Tony to know that if it was disturbing for him, so he would revise the situation. Tony mentions about a short note that he had written to him and

wishes happiness. He wrote another letter but the reader and perhaps Tony himself reads the letter forty years later, a letter that contains Tony's bad wishes for them and implicated that Veronica had some traumatic experiences and he wanted Adrian to ask about it to Sarah Ford, Veronica's mother.

Tony learns about all when Sarah dies and leaves five hundred dollars and Adrian's diary to him. But he cannot obtain the diary, and he learns that it was kept by Veronica. He tries to reach her and obtain the diary but Veronica refuses to give it to Tony. He sent her mails and she let him have a single page of the diary on which there were many formulations that he couldn't give the meaning. But the page ended with the line "So, for instance if Tony..." (Barnes, 2011, p. 6) and aroused his curiosity about if he had a role in Adrian's last months and his suicide. But Mrs. Ford had written that Adrian was happy in his last months in her letter and still there was a gap about "the middle" of the story to be explored. Veronica gave him his letter that he had written forty years ago, in which he had wished them the worst as a couple and a child that would be a vengeance of "time" upon them, in their first meeting forty years later. Tony demanded another meeting, and they had a lunch, Veronica asked for his life and Tony summarized his all life, his adventure of America, his marriage with Margaret and divorce, his only child Susie –now married and has two children – and his retirement. Veronica listened to him and left with no words about her life.

Tony requested for another appointment and she accepted. She took him at a station and got him to somewhere they met a group of people, with a caregiver. Tony could not give meaning to that strange meeting and he expected an explanation from Veronica but she didn't and he accused Tony of not understanding and getting, still. She got him out of her car and Tony began to inquire about that group of people. He went to the place they usually went and he had heard while he was in Veronica's car that, Friday was pub night for them. He continued to go there, and in the market he confronted with the "badge man" he saw before with whom Veronica talked. He saw him in the shop on the third Friday he went. The badge man was frightened of him and in the pub, the social carer warned him about not to disturb him. When the badge man took out his glasses, his eyes and physical appearance, all reminded Tony of Adrian and he assumed that he was Adrian and Veronica's son.

He remembered again what he wished to them in his forty years earlier letter and he felt his responsibility in Adrian's death. "So I don't wish you that. It would be unjust to inflict on some innocent foetus the prospect of discovering that it was the fruit of your loins, if you'll excuse the poeticism." Remorse, etymologically, is the action of biting again: "that's what the feeling

does to you.” And finally he deduced that Adrian was afraid of the responsibility of a pregnant girl and a baby, like Robson who committed suicide in their school years as a result of the same reason. That was another delusion of Tony: “Now I had some answers to the questions I hadn’t asked. She had become pregnant by Adrian, and—who knows?—perhaps the trauma of his suicide had affected the child in her womb.”

Tony wrote an apology message to Veronica, he declared that he had given up his will to get the diary and it was hers, as Adrian was her baby’s father. And she replied “You still don’t get it. You never did, and you never will. So, stop even trying.” For Tony she was still preserving her mysticism. He visited the pub again, this time the other social carer, tall young man, Terry, came to Tony’s table and he warned Tony about Veronica’s son. Terry was disturbed of Tony’s presence and he didn’t want to see Tony. In this conversation Tony learned that his name was Adrian and he was not Veronica’s son, but brother.

“Thus, how might you express an accumulation containing the integers  $b$ ,  $a_1$ ,  $a_2$ ,  $s$ ,  $v$ ?” And then a couple of formulae expressing possible accumulations. It was obvious now. The first was Adrian; and the other was me, Anthony—as he used to address me when he wanted to call me to seriousness. And  $b$  signified “baby”. One born to a mother — “The Mother” — at a dangerously late age. A child damaged as a result.

Now it became more clear for Tony and he had a responsibility in this chain, which Adrian had formulated in his diary. Until now, many forms of his personal history were recreated by his memory and with every document it took a more complex and different state. With the revelation of the events, totally different from its former versions, Tony’s memory becomes more unreliable to the reader and his obsessions about Veronica’s supercilious behaviours towards him becomes questionable. Was she really the person he revealed before? Or was Tony wrong in his evaluations towards Ford family? Sarah Ford was the only normal person in the family, according to his first perceptions about Ford family, but now it became blurred with the love triangle between Sarah, Veronica, and Adrian.

Julian Barnes was inspired by Frank Kermode’s *The Sense of an Ending: Studies in the Theory of Fiction* (1965). According to Kermode

men are born in medias res, as they jump into the middle of an ongoing world, and in medius rebus, since their lives are interrupted at a certain point in their middle. This emphasizes that human life is transitory, its lapse being only understood within a larger



frame of history that was going on before one's birth and will not cease after one's death. (Kermode, 1965, p. 7)

Adrian's life was cut in the middle and his story was lying between the story of Tony. It was necessary to undermine the middle of Tony's (hi)story. In the last period of his life, Tony was expecting a bit of rest, "However this assumption is soon refuted by means of a device labelled by Kermode as *peripeteia*, which consists of a disconfirmation of the predictable ending in fiction. In other words, a falsification of expectation so that the end comes as expected, but not in the manner expected" (López-Deflory, 2016, p. 161).

In Deflory's words, "past determines the present, and is thus projected onto the future, never ceasing to exert its influence" (2016, p. 161). The middle of Tony's story coincided with the end of Adrian's story and it projected onto the future with Adrian's son. At the end of the story, Tony repeats the answers given at the very beginning of the novel. "There is accumulation. There is responsibility. And beyond these, there is unrest. There is great unrest." And he remembers Adrian's definition of history, definition made by Lagrange. There was unreliability of memory and it was result of the unreliability of the self, as Barnes asserts that "memory is identity" (Barnes, 2011, p. 141). Through the end of the novel, history is redefined by Tony like that "History isn't the lies of the victors, as I once glibly assured Old Joe Hunt; I know that now. It's more the memories of the survivors, most of whom are neither victorious nor defeated."

## **Conclusion**

To conclude, the postmodern paradigm of history is applied to the characters' private lives, and as it echoes in these lines "You get towards the end of life – no, not life itself, but of something else: the end of any likelihood of change in that life. You are allowed a long moment of pause, time enough to ask the question: what else have I done wrong?" It gives the sense that no sole ending but every ending leads to a new change in life, a change that is a consequence of the previous one. It brings with it a chain of responsibility that will be revealed eventually despite all the delusions of the narrator.

## References

- Barnes, J. (2011). *The Sense of an Ending*, New York: Knopf.
- Kermode, F. (2000). "The Sense of an Ending." Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- López-Deflory, E. (2016). Beginnings, Middles, and Ends: A Kermodian Reading of Julian Barnes's *Nothing to be Frightened of and The Sense of an Ending*. *English: Journal of the English Association*, Volume 65, Issue 249, Summer 2016, 158–173, <https://doi.org/10.1093/english/efw014>
- Michael G., (2014) "The Oddness of Julian Barnes and The Sense of An Ending." *English: Journal of the English Association*, Volume 63, Issue 242, 1 September 2014, 225–240, <https://doi.org/10.1093/english/efu016>
- Ricoeur, P. (2004). *Memory, History, Forgetting*. (trans.) Kathleen McLaughlin & David Pellauer. Chicago & London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Shapiro, A.L. (1997). "Whose (Which) History is it Anyway?" *History and Theory*, Vol. 36, No. 4, Theme Issue 36: Producing the Past: Making Histories Inside and Outside the Academy. December