Litera

Indexing and Abstracting

Web of Science - Emerging Sources Citation Index (ESCI)

Scopus

TÜBİTAK-ULAKBİM TR Dizin

DOAJ (Directory of Open Access Journals)

ERIH PLUS

MLA International Bibliography

EBSCO Communication Source

EBSCO Central & Eastern European Academic Source

SOBİAD

CONTENTS / İÇİNDEKİLER

Research Articles / Araştırma Makaleleri

Heart of Darkness: The Fictive Bridge from Durkheim's *Homo Duplex* to Freud's Civilization's Discontents

Sinan GÜL[1]

[1]Assistant Professor, National Defense University, Department of Foreign Languages, Ankara, Turkiye

ORCID: S.G. 0000-0002-4529-6699

Corresponding author:
Sinan GÜL,
National Defense University, Department of Foreign Languages, Ankara, Turkiye
E-mail: sgul@kho.msu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

This essay undertakes an analysis of the underlying causes behind Kurtz's difficulties in Joseph Conrad's *Heart of Darkness*, primarily drawing upon the scholarly works of Emile Durkheim and Sigmund Freud regarding civilization and its discontents. Drawing from sociological and psychological concepts of the late nineteenth century and examining instances of alienation within industrialized society, the paper approaches Kurtz's issues of corruption through Durkheim's *homo duplex* and Freud's theory of psychological conflicts among the id, ego, and superego. Kurtz emerges as a construct and casualty of European society, burdened by its imposition of strict rules and regulations aimed at subduing primal desires and interests in favor of collective security, peace, and social order. Therefore, his liberation from the oppressive structures of European society in the Congo grants him the opportunity to expose his primal self, characterized by inclinations towards violence, debauchery, and transgressive behavior. The responsibility for transforming Mr. Kurtz into the ruler of the jungle cannot be placed solely on the natives, as the central culprit, as elucidated by Conrad's interventions in the text, is the European civilization that curtails and suppresses individual identities and desires. The essay portrays the prevalent discontentment and restlessness inherent in the early stages of industrial society through a combination of sociological and psychological elements and fictive characters.

Keywords: *Heart of Darkness*, Joseph Conrad, *Homo Duplex,* Civilization, Primal instinct

> *Mistah Kurtz – he dead*
> *A penny for the old Guy*
> (From T. S. Eliot's epigraph to *Hollow Men*)

Introduction

Conrad's problematic character "Mistah" Kurtz's adventures in the Congo have frequently been a subject of scrutiny in literary history. Although the uncanny habitat with its natives far from his civilized homeland, completely different from the men surrounding Kurtz's former life could easily be blamed for inflicting malice on him, it does not change the fact that he is a fabrication of the civilization from which he has descended. Therefore, this article argues that the discontent, which Freud and Durkheim associate with the concept of Western civilization, is the malignant force behind Kurtz's horror and terror. Kurtz represents the *homo duplex,* which indicates the dual combination of primitive and civil values within an individual; he is weary of his civilized part and enjoys his times in his *homo simplex,* which is dominated by his primordial self. The civilization that Kurtz comes from has repressed his primitive feelings and all these primal instincts have found a haven where social rules do not have the authority to restrict desires and temptations hidden in the sphere of the unconscious. In Freudian terms, Kurtz's liberation from the shackles of the superego has enabled him to let his id and ego run free in the wilderness of the Congo. His primitive form and actions can easily be a target for criticism and punishment under the norms of Western laws and regulations, but his real self, which has not grown authentic reactions hitherto due to the constraining filter of society, has revealed itself as a man of debauchery and extreme passions. In general, *Heart of Darkness* (1899) and Kurtz constitute a significant shift between Durkheim's positivist social facts and Freud's unconscious psychological sphere. Thus, this article scrutinizes the character of Kurtz through Durkheim's and Freud's studies and highlights the oppressive corpus of Western civilization, whose members have found it moderately preferable to release their primitive instincts in relatively undeveloped lands with a different culture in hostile and unbridled conditions. The focus of this study is on certain parts of Conrad's life, its impact on authoring his worldwide famous novel, *Heart of Darkness*, its significance within the philosophy and culture of modernism, Conrad's motives for creating his characters in the novel and its association with the philosophy and teachings of Emile Durkheim and Sigmund Freud.

Joseph Conrad

Having a variety of adventurous experiences in several countries, Conrad wrote plenty of stories about different figures and cultures. Born into a family of Polish gentry members in 1857, Jozef Teodor Konrad Korzeniowski grew up without his parents after his mother and father died of tuberculosis in 1865 and 1869, respectively. His father Apollo Korzeniowski was a national hero who influenced his son through his affection for revolutionary politics, literature, and adventures. Being exposed to the malignancy of Russian imperialism at an early age, Conrad left Poland at the age of 17 to pursue his maritime adventures rather than serve the Russian army. Conrad aspired to find an alternative country to continue his maritime training because France required him to obtain a passport from Russia, which refused to issue one because of his father's schismatic activities. Conrad's next destination was the British Merchant Marine Service where he passed the officer exam in 1880 (Peters, 2006, p. 26).

If we borrow theatre practitioner Konstantin Stanislavski's terms, Conrad's journey on a boat as an assistant captain to the Belgian Congo in May 1890 can be called the source for his emotional memory to pen certain books and short stories. For example, George Antoine Klein, who was an agent with a terminal disease, died on Conrad's boat, and he is often considered an inspiration for Kurtz (Peters, 2006, p. 28). Another living example for Kurtz was a British explorer, Henry Morton Stanley (1841-1904), who worked as an agent for King Leopold II to explore the rich materials of the region. He was successful in his mission because "he was an impatient, choleric egotist who bullwhipped his own men and shot hundreds of native Africans who stood in his way" (Bemrose, 1990). In contrast to Stanley's experiences, "Conrad found a great deal of greed, waste and chaos" during his experience in Africa" (Peters 2006, p. 4). At the end of 1894, Conrad ended his maritime career. He married Jessie George in 1896 and worked as a writer in England for the rest of his life. He completed seventeen novels, two memoirs, three plays, along with plenty of short stories and letters.

Although he was personally victimized by the aggressive policies of big empires, Conrad was never a "political" writer (Peters, 2006, pp. 1-2). Hence, rather than a didactic political style in his novels, he employed both an ironic tone and various combinations of narratives. Despite his respect for England and his fellow English writers, Conrad was always different as his international background, feeling of displacement and his 20 years of experience as a sailor overseas gained him a more cosmopolitan character than his peers. For example, his incomplete novel *Suspense and Rover* as well as short

stories "The Warrior's Soul" (1917) and "The Duel" (1908) have a lot of reflections from Napoleonic France. One of Conrad's other novels, *Under Western Eyes* (1911)*,* takes Russia and revolutionary politics as the basis of its plot. His other works such as *The Secret Agent* (1907), *The Informer* (1906) and *The Anarchist* (1906) also involve revolutionary figures and politics of his period.

Heart of Darkness

The peculiar combination of *Heart of Darkness* and Conrad's journey from oblivion to a success throughout the last century is quite remarkable in several aspects. After Conrad's death in 1924, for a long time, he was solely admired for being a writer of naval tales of adventure. Written in 1899 and well received by the public, *Heart of Darkness* had been classified among travel books until 1947 when M. D. Zabel made a critical study of Conrad's novels in his book *Portable Conrad* (Gorra, 2007, p. 550). Since then, Conrad's books, particularly *Heart of Darkness,* have become an indispensable part of most academic curricula. Its popularity and the special attention it has received have stemmed from the obscurity it formed by the darkness as the title suggests, and Conrad's never-ageing Shakespeare-like approach towards permanent human emotions on certain topics such as inflicting violence through various means, creating others and interacting with foreign cultures. Just like other masterpieces of twentieth-century literature, it is also well praised for the use of symbols and motifs. These elements have created a close language, which entitles the text to become responsive to all kinds of reading.

Conrad's approach in *Heart of Darkness* has garnered praise for a significant reason: the timing and circumstances under which it was written. It was the early 1900s, a time filled with chaos, largely influenced by the rise of heavy industry and the resulting societal changes. As industries grew and became more mechanized, people started questioning traditional beliefs. Ideas like women's rights, universal suffrage, democracy, and social justice began to challenge the status quo, leading to a shift in the intellectual and political landscape. *Heart of Darkness* can be seen as a product of this transformative period, tapping into a strong current of criticism and support for European practices. Advances in science and exposure to different cultures also played a part in undermining the certainties and absolute truths provided by the Christian Western world. Thus, civilization for Conrad is "both a hypocritical veneer and a valuable achievement to be vigilantly guarded" (Conrad, 1988, p. 68).

Some scholars like Harold Bloom attach the success of *Heart of Darkness* to "its own hopeless obscurantism" and they are right to point to the parts where Marlow has no idea about his murmurings. These parts are out of Conrad's control so they might be signs of weakness in terms of the novel's plot construction (Bloom, 2008, p. 12). Cedric Watts describes *Heart of Darkness* as "a mixture of oblique autobiography, traveller's yarn, adventure story, psychological odyssey, political satire, symbolic prose-poem, black comedy, spiritual melodrama and skeptical meditation" (Watts, 2012, p. 45). Furthermore, *Heart of Darkness* still "addresses problems that continue to make the headlines of our contemporary world, such as racial and gendered oppression, colonial and imperial power, material exploitations and genocidal horrors" (Lawtoo, 2012, p. 4). In essence, the novel continues to retain its appeal among scholars, garnering increasing attention and recognition. However, as its prophetic commentary has confounded many through its historical accuracy and cultural rectitude, others have acknowledged its quality in various themes and topics.[1]

One of the significant reasons for the evolution of Conrad and his works in the twentieth century is due to Chinua Achebe's notorious article "An Image of Africa" (1975) which turned the scale to the "imperialistic," "colonial" and "a bloody racist" (Achebe, 1978, p. 9) Conrad. Achebe criticizes Conrad for dismissing Africa as a place whose history and culture are deemed unworthy of mentioning. Instead of blaming the savages for Kurtz's deeds, Achebe's article seeks the origins for Kurtz's brutality within the flaws of imperial desires. Achebe later revised his harsh approach towards *Heart of Darkness* in his preface to the book and appreciated that "Conrad saw and condemned the evil of imperial exploitation but was strangely unaware of the racism on which it sharpened its iron tooth" (Achebe in Conrad, 1988, p. 262). Despite the allegations, the novel has manifested itself in different forms of culture. For example, F.F. Coppola's *Apocalypse Now* (1979) is loosely attached to Conrad's novel, and the fact that he chose *Heart of Darkness* as a metaphorical source to describe the horrors of the Vietnam War can easily relate to the fearful atmosphere and the indirect war as well as colonial criticism both the novel and the book share.

Heart of Darkness encompasses a plethora of intricacies pertaining to aspects both in support of and against colonialism. However, its essence primarily resides in the

---

1   The characteristic of *Heart of Darkness* can be ascribed to its status as a modernist novel. It exhibits an inherent openness to multiple interpretations, necessitating the reader's active engagement with the text to extract its intended significance. Put differently, the novel offers a plethora of possible meanings that are contingent upon the reader's interaction, thus exemplifying a crucial attribute of modernist literature.

depiction of oppressive mechanisms employed by civilization and the ensuing conflict between the civilized realm and alternative cultures. Conrad's conception of popular consent depends on popular methods of convincing people to be ruled, so he is aware of the social mechanism that oppresses people within the guise of behaviorism. For example, Conrad criticizes Russia for not having a monarchy that "has never been sanctioned by popular tradition, by ideas of loyalty, of devotion, of political necessity, of simple expediency, or even by the power of the sword" (Conrad, 1905, p. 47). In Conrad's view, a country must have certain methods such as "law, order, justice, right, truth about itself or the rest of the world" so that it can be capable of organizing the whole society. As an avid traveler, Conrad witnessed how "Europe, having gone a step or two further" (Conrad, 1905, p. 48) created a system that did not require coercive methods to produce public consent, manipulate people's lifestyles, and restrict unwanted activities. Conrad displays the risks of running such a system and country through a product of that society, Kurtz, and explains how so-called modern civilization can abuse the nature of humankind:

> The trouble of the civilized world is the want of a common conservative principle abstract enough to give the impulse, practical enough to form the rallying point of international action tending towards the restraint of particular ambitions. (Conrad, 1905, p. 54)

Restraining particular ambitions and oppressing certain feelings can create monsters when they are not controlled. In the beginning, the civilized world had difficulties in adapting social, cultural, and financial issues according to people's demands. If we look at the evolution of modern society, there are tracks of blood, revolution, violence and negotiations everywhere. Laws and regulations have been passed to fulfil people's expectations and adjust the definitions and limits of crime and punishment. Today, there are many venues or services in which an individual can release their adverse energies. In the realm of political history, the consequences of uncontrolled restraint of ambitions can be observed in instances of authoritarian regimes. When leaders suppress the ambitions and aspirations of their citizens, denying them the freedom to pursue their goals and dreams, it can breed resentment, frustration, and a sense of powerlessness among the population. Over time, these suppressed ambitions can fuel social unrest, protests, or even violent uprisings, as witnessed in various historical contexts, such as the Arab Spring movements in the early 2010s.

However, during the post-industrial era of the late nineteenth century, there was a preoccupation with establishing societal order, resulting in the neglect of individual losses. The capitalist system, as a sophisticated manifestation of industrialism, exhibits adaptability and self-improvement by addressing inherent flaws. Given its dynamic nature, a definitive form of oppression and relief for individuals does not persist. Consequently, individuals facing challenges abroad, such as soldiers returning from duty, now engage in treatment and rehabilitation programs. This is due to the recognition that involuntary or uncontrollable exposure to diverse cultures and countries can be detrimental to reintegrating into their previous domestic lives. This process requires a significant adjustment period to regain familiarity with their former routines.

Enlightenment and Society

The end of the nineteenth century witnessed profound transformations across the realms of individuality, society, and social institutions. Esteemed figures, through their notable literary works and associated social movements, exerted a substantial influence on the course of civilization during this pivotal era. Noteworthy examples abound, as a multitude of eminent thinkers challenged longstanding beliefs and conventional wisdom. Charles Lyell's groundbreaking publication *Principles of Geology* in the 1820s, for instance, scrutinized conventional notions of the earth's age, while Charles Darwin's *The Origin of Species* in 1859 contested the biblical narrative of human creation. Additionally, the writings of Karl Marx (*Das Kapital*, 1867), Emile Durkheim (*The Division of Labor in Society* and *The Rules of Sociological Method*, 1895), and Sigmund Freud (*Interpretation of Dreams*, 1899) held pivotal significance, profoundly influencing religious, financial, ideological, social, and psychological perspectives. These works, rooted in the principles of the Enlightenment, which espoused notions of liberty and independent thinking, were shaped by the transformative impact of the Industrial Revolution on society and modern life. As the individual increasingly disassociated from the lifestyle prevailing in tribal, pre-modern, rural, and pre-industrial settings, they embarked on a journey toward self-identity within a society being molded to conform to the burgeoning industrial way of life. While the aforementioned writers primarily conveyed their insights through non-fictional works, Joseph Conrad, in contrast, vividly portrayed the experiences of individuals navigating the complexities of this era of societal reform.

By incorporating Conrad into the discourse surrounding Western enlightenment, we encounter a writer who critically examines the practices of enlightened Europe

within foreign territories, exposing how self-centered individualism, disguised as malevolence, inflicted terror and harm upon cultures and individuals. Conrad's evocative depictions challenge the principles of positivism, presenting a mysterious realm that defies complete rational explanation. Within the depths of the dark jungle, not everything can be elucidated through reason alone; it thrives on a complex interplay of desires, fears, and primal instincts. Conrad's skepticism regarding the efficacy of positivist science finds resonance throughout his literary works:

> In *Victory*, Heyst comes to realize that human relationships, not facts, provide fulfillment in life. In *Lord Jim*, Marlow feels that only through understanding a fact's subjective context is knowledge perhaps possible. Conrad's questioning of Scientific Positivism is even more clear in "Heart of Darkness" and *The Secret Agent*. In "Heart of Darkness," Marlow presents the Belgian doctor who measures the heads of his patients as a fool, and in *The Secret Agent*, Conrad ridicules Positivism when Comrade Ossipon draws conclusions about Winnie Verloc's psychology based upon her facial features. (Peters, 2006, p. 30)

Conrad does not openly oppose positivism, but he highlights the subjectivity of knowledge to show the improbability of certainty on specific things. Conrad's frame narrative technique recounts Marlow's story, which is presented within a ship setting on the River Thames. Marlow, the protagonist, narrates his journey up the Congo River. This layered structure offers multiple perspectives, explores themes of exploration and imperialism, and delves into the darkness of human nature. The framing device adds ambiguity and subjectivity, engaging readers in a complex exploration of moral and psychological dilemmas. The multi-narrative technique that starts with Marlow and continues with his listeners creates a deliberate confusion about events and individual differences on narrative sequences. This is a significant theme that appears in some of his works as "a recognition of the illusory nature of Western ideals and the absolutes upon which it is based" (Peters, 2006, p. 69). The failure of an enlightened individual outside his habitat is a formulation in which Conrad expresses and reinforces the concept of the primitive self against the illusory nature of Western ideals.

Durkheim and *Homo Duplex*

In the late nineteenth century, most countries experienced a collective need for change across various domains, including production, government, social relations,

and cultural affairs, albeit with local variations. However, the integration into the new social regulations and principles posed significant challenges for many individuals (Berger, 2006, pp. 58-72). Émile Durkheim, in his 1897 book *Suicides*, conducted a methodical analysis of suicides as social phenomena. He associated the rise in suicide rates with heightened levels of anomie, resulting from the clash between the individual and society. Durkheim employed the concept of *homo duplex* to characterize the dual nature of individuals, consisting of instinctive drives and the moral and cultural elements instilled by society. Durkheim elucidates that "The entirety of the social environment appears to us as if inhabited by forces that, in reality, exist only within our consciousness" (Durkheim, 1912, p. 325). When the social environment fails to exert influence on an individual's consciousness, their primal instincts assume control, leading to a state of anomie characterized by weakened social ties within familial, religious, professional, and communal groups. Thus, in order to safeguard an individual's well-being, it is crucial to strike a balance in social regulations.

It is almost at the same period that Durkheim's nephew and student Marcel Mauss associated the concept of gift with its symbolic meaning in primitive societies as he displayed how modern society, despite its new institutions and methods, contains a perdurable connection to ancient and pre-modern societies. Durkheim analyzes the rising number of suicides to analyze the restless and unhappy state that European nations experience. The connection between Conrad and Durkheim originates from the mental alienation they both detect in certain individuals. Although Durkheim's analysis is mostly on the continent, Conrad expresses the situation of Europeans in Africa where their delirious actions are exempt from grave consequences like suicides. The implication for both suicides and extreme displays of hidden desires points to the social conditions that exceed an explanation of mental problems. In his letter to his friend Kazimierz Waliszewski, Conrad states, "In my case homo duplex has more than one meaning" (Najder, 1964, p. 240). Although Conrad's emphasis is on his state of duality, it is clear that he interpreted the term to illustrate the polyphony of identity as a "a "Polish gentleman-student; a sea-faring adventurer on French ships out of Marseilles; a British sailor who, by dint of his labors, attained the rank of captain in the Merchant Navy; a Congo River boatman caught in the sordid history of Belgian cupidity; and a lyrical master of English prose, the novelist Joseph Conrad" (Hampson, 2000, p. 188).

Durkheim employs the term monomaniac, coined by other scholars, to describe how people with certain obsessions can be disguised within society if that obsession

does not find any venues to reveal itself. When someone is inflicted with mental diseases, "its essential character is excessive exaltation or deep depression or general perversion" (Durkheim, 1897, p. 7). Since Durkheim points out that mental flaws cannot be localized, he associates suicides not with a distinct form of insanity but with the state of society; thus, Durkheim's theory, in a way, instructs readers that Kurtz's problems are not really related to his mental state, his melancholy, his maniacal or obsessive behaviors, but to an impulse growing gradually. Insanity might be the case for some, but the proportion of mental alienation from society requires an analysis of deterioration and degeneration that lead people to show signs of remoteness and desire to commit violence towards others or themselves.

Conrad's Response to the Transformation of Society

In addition to economic factors like wealth and velocity, the latter part of the nineteenth century witnessed the emergence of numerous hardships. These included inadequate infrastructure, substandard living conditions, poor hygiene, significant environmental challenges, and widespread pollution. The industrialized society also grappled with unfavorable working conditions, meager wages, and excessively long working hours. As a result, many individuals, driven by aspirations for a better life and easy prosperity, sought refuge in colonies where promises of affluence and ultimate freedom were enticingly presented (Berger, 2006, pp. 89-97). Kurtz, among the Westerners, chose to venture to the colonies due to the limited opportunities available to him in his homeland, despite possessing exceptional talents. Consequently, Conrad portrays Kurtz as harboring a profound sense of frustration, as he possesses a keen awareness of the advancements, atrocities, and events transpiring in his surroundings. After all, Conrad is a keen observer of "this age of knowledge" (Conrad, 1905, p. 34) that points out how "the psychology of individuals, even in the most extreme instances, reflects the general effect of the fears and hopes of the time" (Conrad, 1905, p. 34). While Conrad may be primarily recognized as a fiction writer, he has demonstrated his ability to critically examine the events and historical context of his time, setting him apart from the philosophers and positivist writers mentioned earlier:

> The end of the eighteenth century was, too, a time of optimism and of desperate mediocrity, in which the French Revolution exploded like a bombshell. In its lurid blaze the insufficiency of Europe, the inferiority of minds, of military and administrative systems stood exposed with pitiless vividness.

> And there is but little courage in saying at this time of the day that the glorified French Revolution itself, except for its destructive force, was in essentials a mediocre phenomenon. […] The degradation of the ideas of freedom and justice at the root of the French Revolution is made manifest in the person of its heir; a personality without law or faith, whom it has been the fashion to represent as an eagle, but who was in truth much more like a sort of vulture preying upon the body of a Europe which did indeed for some dozens of years resemble very much a corpse. The subtle and manifold influence for evil of the Napoleonic episode, as a school of violence, as a sower of national hatreds, as the direct provoker of obscurantism and reaction, of political tyranny and injustice, cannot well be exaggerated. (Conrad, 1905, p. 35)

Conrad's writings bear the imprint of his diverse multinational background and are uniquely influenced by the moral dilemmas prevalent in the nineteenth century. Through his works, he exposes the grim realities of the Manchurian War, employing vivid descriptions of brutality and murder to convey his profound disgust with the armies and nations that prioritize their interests at the expense of immense human suffering and financial resources (Conrad, 1905, p. 36). Conrad further highlights the pervasiveness of violence by discussing oriental despotism, which he perceives as distinctly non-European (1905, p. 43). He asserts that the remnants of despotism are evident in various aspects, such as the expressions of human needs, the tools of racial temperament, conquest, faith, and fanaticism (Conrad, 1905, p. 44). Through his critique of Russian expansionist policies, Conrad exposes the inhumane methods employed by powerful countries. Moreover, his trust in Western ideals and European countries is profoundly shaken as he confronts the harsh realities and moral failures in the African jungles. Overall, Conrad's writings offer a penetrating exploration of the moral quandaries and geopolitical dynamics of his time, revealing his deep-seated skepticism towards the actions and ideologies of both Eastern and Western powers.

Conrad holds the belief that any form of legal framework is destined to deteriorate into a state of oppression. He argues that systems designed to unify and consolidate individual ambitions and interests in service of a broader concept of the state ultimately lag behind the progress of ideas they themselves have set in motion. These systems fail to comprehend or endorse the direction in which these ideas are moving (Conrad, 1905, p. 46). Conrad's statement aligns with the theories of oppression and power put forth by scholars like Althusser and Foucault, who also emphasize the detrimental

impact of social order on individual agency. Incorporating Conrad's ideas into the works of these theorists would not seem out of place. Morgan Meis further highlights Conrad's focus on the experience of alienation amidst crowds, emphasizing the theme of individuals feeling disconnected and estranged from their social environments. This notion resonates with Conrad's exploration of the human condition in his writings:

> Conrad firmly believed that the more you peel away layers of civilization, the closer you come to the heart of the mystery. At the heart of the mystery is a truth, a truth of who we are, of the inner nature of human existence. But the darkness at the heart of that truth means that the closer you get the less you can see. The deepest truths are necessarily obscure. Conrad felt drawn to that mystery, to that truth, and to that darkness even as he was terrified and repelled. As a writer, he explored the push and pull of this compulsion over and over again. (Meis, 2013)

When Kurtz and other European individuals embark on a journey to the heart of darkness, they tap into their primal instincts, experiencing a profound connection with their id. This connection grants them an unrestrained freedom to indulge in primal emotions such as fear, violence, pleasure, and other raw sensations. In these moments, human instincts triumph over reason and civilized behavior, unhindered by societal observation. Paradoxically, while individuals may appreciate the freedom to unleash their primal forces and conform to societal norms, there is also a fascination with those who rebel against these norms. Sigmund Freud describes this process as the "unbridled gratification of all desires," which emerges as the most enticing guiding principle in life (1961, p. 22). However, Freud notes that this pursuit of unbridled enjoyment ultimately leads to self-punishment after only a brief indulgence (1961, p. 23).

In a Freudian interpretation, Conrad's journey to Africa can be seen as a metaphorical exploration of the unconscious mind, where unregulated and suppressed emotions are free from the constraints of Western civilization. Marlow's descent into the obscure depths of the unconscious triggers the awakening of repressed feelings and desires when he encounters the African natives, who simultaneously curse, pray, and welcome European visitors (Conrad, 1988, p. 78).

Furthermore, Freud's concept of the divided self, with its emphasis on the instinctual and anarchic id seeking gratification despite the opposing forces of the ego and superego,

finds resonance in the portrayal of Kurtz's savage indulgences in the Congo (Bloom, 2008, p. 25). Conrad delves into the psychological conflicts of the id, which encompasses libidinal and other desires, and the superego, representing internalized moral and societal standards (Abrams, 1993, p. 234). The colonial setting provides a conducive environment for colonizers to unleash their suppressed instincts through ruthless acts. In Freudian terms, he discusses various psychological mechanisms that individuals employ to avoid suffering due to their internal conflicts. He highlights the use of wit, slips of the tongue, sarcasm, and humor in Western civilization as daily tools of criticism and rhetoric, with roots dating back to Ancient Greece. However, in a land where communication barriers hinder the use of irony or sarcasm, violence becomes an inevitable means of expressing opinions and persuading others. Sublimation of impulses and instincts becomes possible only when external forces compel such restraint. Overall, Conrad's depiction of the African colony serves as a backdrop for the release of oppressed inner instincts and sheds light on the psychological dynamics explored by Freud, particularly the interplay between repressed desires and societal constraints.

What constitutes a point of difference between this essay's treatment of the subject and most other critiques, is the notion that Kurtz had been contaminated by the brutal nature of the "savages" whom he had intended to save. Conversely, Kurtz is a progeny of the capitalist society where he was educated to seek wealth, fame, and power through civil orders. The reason for Kurtz's journey is in a way to extend the area of European authority but also to escape from it. Sponsored by European colonial powers, Kurtz establishes his private power dominion where he is free to act as he wishes. The realm of the colony becomes an unrestricted paradise for the colonizer to be free of their unconscious. Again, in psychological terms, the unconscious, chained and blocked by the superego ever since it encountered the "social world," is released among colonized savages, as the rules of the civilized world do not permeate there. The authority that limits the actions and freedom of people's savage component has insistently been outlawed through the whole education system and other ideological state apparatuses in Althusserian terminology. The reason for and fear of obeying the whole network of rules is legitimized through the existence of another person from a similar background, or, similarly, a source of authority, whereas in colonies, or in the case of Kurtz, there is no one either to condemn or to stop his misdeeds. In a colony, the judicial and social authority is discursively transferred to the master and from that moment on, the master is identified as the source of authority.

Scholars have raised the question of whether the locals can be held solely responsible for the carnage and chaos that leads civilized individuals to devolve into unrecognizable beings. While the locals may bear some responsibility for the transformation, it is not in terms of individually embodying violence and extreme behavior. Rather, blame can be placed on the civilization itself, which failed to establish effective rules and regulations, or on the state of colonialism that bestowed certain privileged rights upon Westerners that the locals did not possess in their own countries. If a society lacks a foundation of moral codes and ethical principles, fear and discipline alone cannot maintain a standard where members respect each other's freedom and rights. Therefore, the absence of a properly structured and morally grounded society can be seen as the underlying cause of the breakdown of civility and the descent into barbarism. However, as Freud points out,

> To the Europeans, who failed to observe them carefully and misunderstood what they saw, these people [Africans] seemed to lead simple, happy lives, wanting for nothing such as the travellers who visited them, with all their superior culture, were unable to achieve. Later experience has corrected this opinion on many points; in several instances, the ease of life was due to bounty of nature and the possibilities of ready satisfaction for the great human needs, but it was erroneously attributed to the absence of the complicated conditions of civilization. (1961, p. 78)

Kurtz was one of those traders/colonizers who felt happy due "the absence of the complicated conditions of civilization," felt superior to the natives, and had great plans for happiness and humanity. Colonizers have always disguised their roles in occupied countries as liberators, altruists or missionaries who are there to bring peace, democracy or the true of message of the creator. However, through their methods, as seen in Conrad's representation of Africa and the white men, a darkness has prevailed over everyone, and primitive sides of individuals have taken over their journey. The continent where Marlow travels to find Kurtz symbolizes a passage to the dark sides of our consciousness where our primal feelings, fears and malicious desires are suppressed. What Marlow and Kurtz have discovered can also be easily called "horror" for many civilized members of society. Africa is after all a product of our civilization. If it lacks resources for its people, it is because of the slave trading, blood diamonds, child soldiers, colonialism and all the other unlawful actions of supreme countries. What Western countries have committed in all their colonies are still being experienced due to their atrocious results.

Kurtz: The King of Jungle

Heart of Darkness commences within the confines of England, where Marlow secures a position within one of the trading enterprises established in the colonial territories. During the medical assessment conducted by the doctor, in preparation for Marlow's forthcoming expedition to the Congo, a rather peculiar inquiry is made: "Ever any madness in your family?" (Conrad, 1988, p. 25) Marlow finds himself affronted by this line of questioning. It appears that the doctor's motive behind this rather unconventional query is rooted in a scientific pursuit, namely, the desire to conduct psychological research that unravels the driving forces behind one's inclination to undertake such an exceedingly perilous endeavor, ultimately leading to a transformative metamorphosis of their very being. However, this inquiry inadvertently serves as an additional means of scrutinizing those who engage in colonial activities, both departing for and returning from the colonies. Consequently, it becomes evident that even a seemingly innocuous voyage motivated solely by commercial interests possesses the potential to profoundly impact a civilized Western individual. This type of examination serves as a testament to the heightened likelihood of a consequential alteration in one's character. The prevailing circumstances serve to underscore the precarious disposition of Western individuals upon their encounter with societies perceived as more primitive in nature As John A. McClure points out, "When Marlow interprets Kurtz's fall […] he implicitly exonerates the African "savages" from primary responsibility. Instead, the responsibility falls primarily on European society, which legitimates avarice and domination, instead of instilling in men a clear conviction that these are dangerous appetites in need of constant surveillance" (1981, p. 136). Kurtz has been changed by his passions from an "emissary of pity, science, and progress," to someone who "lacked restraint in the gratification of his various lusts" (McClure, 1981, p. 139).

The previous captain, whom Marlow replaces, also had a similar attitude while he was in the Congo. Although he is "the gentlest, quietest creature that ever walked on two legs" (Conrad, 1988, p. 96), he beats a village chief to death in an argument over two chickens and is killed in return for his violent act. The colonizer, who is motivated by the pursuit of power and wealth, goes through a diabolic change. The savage component contained within every individual takes the opportunity of the absence of barriers for such an exhibition of power. Even a gentleman will have the drive to use violence in a momentary dispute within a colony's borders.

Kurtz is a perfect model of a nineteenth-century individual with highly respected aspirations in the beginning: he is an artist, a liberal, a social careerist, and he has the Victorian notion of bringing light to the undeveloped parts of the world (McClure, 1981, p. 136). However, the jungle whispers, "to [Kurtz] things about himself which he did not know, things of which he had no conception till he took counsel with this great solitude" (Conrad, 1988, p. 177). The path that takes Kurtz to his destruction emanates from the suppressive system, which pushes him to go to the Congo despite his talents. Marlow also reasserts that the failures in the industrial world drove Kurtz to the colonies: "he wasn't rich enough or something… it was his impatience of comparative poverty that drove him out there" (Conrad, 1988, p. 185). Unfortunately, his efforts to be a better person have failed on the encounter of the so-long suppressed id.

Kurtz's id and his unity with his tribe, therefore, can be considered as a rejection of Western materialism for a natural and uncomplicated life. Kurtz was not a native but an individual who lost his innocence in terms of nativity: "But his soul was mad. Being alone in the wilderness, it had looked within itself, and by heavens! I tell you; it had gone mad" (Conrad, 1988, p. 169). Despite living with natives, Kurtz did not accept the rules of the tribe. On the contrary, he perverted the customs of the tribe, made the ivory trade and colonialism flow, did not care about the natives, and simply, never adopted the positive virtues of the tribe. The things the wilderness whispered to him "echoed loudly within him because he was hollow at the core" (Conrad, 1988, p. 153).

Conrad also epitomizes Kurtz as a reflection of European society because "his mother was half-English; his father was half-French" and "all Europe contributed to the making of Kurtz" (Conrad, 1988, p. 98). The report that Kurtz wrote for the International Society for the Suppression of Savage Customs was "eloquent, vibrating with eloquence" (Conrad, 1988, p. 102). Everything seemed normal until Kurtz's nerves "went wrong" and he started dancing through unspeakable rites with the savages. His famous statement "Exterminate all the brutes" is also mentioned at the end of his report. However, having lived among the natives for a long time, Kurtz has clearly changed his side and joined the brutes. The transformation of a gentleman like Kurtz also manifests how he was inclined to change his nature. "The hollow at his core" was finally filled with his primordial self. In this respect, what Kurtz developed in the jungle is not an "unlawful soul" (Conrad, 1988, p. 144) but historical prudence (Singh, 1978, p. 52).

Kurtz developed other features, which are not deemed positive by Western society. As Marlow reports Kurtz's last moments, he realizes that the basic conflict of Kurtz is within himself: "No eloquence could have been so withering to one's belief in humankind as his final burst of sincerity. He struggled with himself, too. I saw it, I heard it. I saw the inconceivable mystery of a soul that knew no restraint, no faith, and no fear, yet struggled blindly with itself" (Conrad, 1988, p. 179). Kurtz employed violence to be a part of the native life and mirrored the pressure he had learned. He took the model of the system he knew best; he made sure that his subjects, ignorant of monarchies and imperialism, obeyed his orders. Both parties had a lot to learn from each other and the things that they learned changed everyone's perceptions. That might be the reason Kurtz did not hurry to return to Europe. Knowing the plight of daily life and its restraints, he felt happier and unrestricted in the Congo even though it eventually led to his destruction due to his inner conflicts. If he happened to return, he wished "to have kings meet him at railway stations on his return from some ghastly Nowhere, where he intended to accomplish great things" (Conrad, 1988, p. 135). However, when the Russian offers Kurtz to go back, he accepts, but "then he would remain; go off on another ivory hunt; disappear for weeks; forget himself amongst these people – forget himself" (Conrad, 1988, p. 151). In the heart of African darkness, Kurtz has discovered the hidden component of his being, no longer belonging to his former artificial and feigned world. Despite all the difficulties he encounters in the jungle, he prefers it to the comfort of England because he is happy. Freud associates this sense of happiness with the "indulgence of a wild untamed craving" and points out how "the irresistibility of perverted impulses, perhaps the charm of forbidden things generally" (Freud, 1961, p. 86) is related to the gratification of such desires in places without control and restriction.

Kurtz finds a gap within his order and evolves into a man well-respected by natives and Westerners alike. The Russian adores Kurtz, even beyond his fear of him, and praises his virtues. He "indignantly" protests to Marlow: "Mr. Kurtz couldn't be mad" (Conrad, 1988, p. 151). The jungle has a classless system, which forbids any inequality between the members. Enjoying the qualities of being a master, Kurtz realizes the discontented and unfair structure of the Western world. Marlow reasserts the fair pyramid of the jungle: "What did it matter what anyone knew or ignored? What did it matter who was manager?" (Conrad, 1988, p. 118) The Western qualities, which built a world of social strata, did not work in the jungle, stripping any person to the core of their own distinctive nature. Kurtz had different abilities, "he electrified large meetings. He had faith – don't you see? – he had faith. He could get himself to believe anything – anything. He would

have been a splendid leader of an extreme party" (Conrad, 1988, p. 119). Indeed, he was a man of extremes whose qualifications did not fit into the established system and was silenced and oppressed. Kurtz was defeated in England despite his talents and at last, he found a society where his virtues might be appreciated.

Conclusion

Despite the manifold negative attributes accompanying his expedition, Marlow rectifies the egocentric and primitive disposition of Kurtz when he discloses to Kurtz's Intended that his final utterance was her own appellation. Furthermore, Kurtz entrusts his written works to Marlow, tasking him with their conveyance to the Intended. Firmly resisting the constraints imposed by his organization's censorship, Marlow adamantly "refused to give up the smallest scrap out of that package," opting to personally deliver them to the Intended (Conrad, 1988, p. 146). In this manner, "Marlow becomes the keeper of the faith for civilization" (Golanka, 1985, p. 198). Upon his return to England, Marlow's objective is to reinstate the fabric of civilized society. Hence, he deliberately omits any mention of Kurtz's transformation, recollecting him as he was prior to his expedition, thereby subduing the illustrious instincts of the wilderness with the moral conscience of the urban environment. Kurtz's deviation from accepted social norms ought to be remembered in the context of his former conformity, while the remainder must be expunged from the collective memory of all.

Terry Eagleton points out that "Conrad neither believes in the cultural superiority of the colonialist nations nor rejects colonialism outright" and adds that "The message of *Heart of Darkness* is that Western Civilization is at base as barbarous as African society—a viewpoint which disturbs imperialist assumptions to the precise degree that it reinforces them" (Eagleton, 1976, p. 135). Conrad manifests this idea throughout the whole novel, but at the end, he directs his attention away from Western Civilization to Eastern meditative methods: "Marlow ceased, and sat apart, indistinct and silent, in the pose of a meditating Buddha" (Conrad, 1988, p. 185). Marlow's complete apprehension of his African encounter eluded him. Consequently, Conrad assumes control of the narrative's conclusion, effectively muting Marlow. According to Conrad, Marlow's enlightenment lies not in Western Enlightenment principles, but rather in the realm of meditation, as verbal expression fails to encapsulate the horrors he has borne witness to. Consequently, in order to fully grasp the magnitude of his expedition, an explanation rooted in meditation and humanism, such as Buddhism, proves more valuable than a

scientific or logical exposition. In conjunction with Conrad's solution, Freud also endorses such an ending in his book *Civilization and Its Discontents* (1930) through his Yogi friend's "practices of withdrawal from the world, concentrating attention on bodily functions, peculiar methods of breathing," which enabled him "to produce new sensations and diffused feelings in themselves which he regards as regressions to primordial, deeply buried mental states" (Freud, 1961, p. 5). The wisdom of mysticism trumps scientific advances in both writers' universes, but as Freud points out, the message is an "annihilation of instincts, as taught by the wisdom of the East and practised by the Yogi" (Freud, 1961, p. 6). The mastery over our instincts, often characterized by impulsive and reactive behaviors, lies within the realm of a meditative approach. This process, as both writers point out, can enable individuals to develop a deep understanding of their instincts, recognize their transient nature, and ultimately choose responses that align with their higher values and intentions.

Conrad's elucidation of instinctive desires, fears, and emotions in his text allows for contemporary relevance, resonating with our present era marked by numerous instances of supposedly civilized crews from Western nations who have failed to uphold their cultivated principles beyond their own domains. Kurtz's predicament can be traced back to the complexities of modern society, wherein the Congo serves as a sanctuary for an oppressed individual ensnared within the societal constructs built to ensure peace and security. Accounts from other travellers further unveil a blend of egoism and altruism tainted by acts of brutality and exposed desires. These instances vividly illustrate how the id and ego often surpass the superego, which fails to effectively disseminate beyond its familiar confines. Edward Said's concept of Orientalism aptly describes this experience, portraying the privileged Westerner in comparison to the oriental individual. Figures like Kurtz take this privilege and superiority to extreme lengths, subjecting the "other" to physical torture and abuse. While such acts may appear sporadic, they serve as fissures within the façade of Western civilization, which positions itself as superior to other cultures. Consequently, in the absence of the superego's influence, primal instincts prevail, resulting in a regression to basic human impulses.

In summary, Kurtz emerges as both a creation and casualty of European society and its prevailing structures. While ostensibly assigned with the colonial purpose of enlightening underdeveloped regions, his interactions with the indigenous inhabitants lead him to disengage from the values emblematic of Western civilization. Years of

indoctrination through formal Western education and immersion within the social framework have resulted in his subjugation, wherein his inherent instincts and motivations are forced to recede into the depths of his subconscious, mirroring the experiences of other members of civilized society. Through his encounters with the native population, Kurtz unveils the concealed facet of his dual nature, known as *homo duplex*, while concurrently experiencing liberation from authoritative constraints, thereby enabling the emergence of his primitive self. Consequently, Kurtz grapples with an internal conflict that ultimately precipitates his own demise. As such, attributing Kurtz's so-called madness solely to the actions of the natives would be misguided. Rather, the imperialistic Western civilization, characterized by its classist, racial, and other differentiating systems, bears the responsibility for dismantling the innate innocence of individuals. Conrad's portrayal effectively portrays the destructive underbelly of civilization, with Kurtz's downfall being a direct consequence of the darkness ingrained within him through Western indoctrination.

References

Abrams, M. H. (1993). *A Glossary of Literary Terms (6th ed.).* New York: Wadsworth Punlishing.

Achebe, C. (1978). An Image of Africa. *Research in African Literatures*, 7-32.

Berger, S. (2006) *A Companion to Nineteenth-Century Europe: 1789-1914*. London: Wiley-Blackwell.

Bemrose, J. (1990, December 17). *Heart of Darkness.* Maclean's https://archive.macleans.ca/article/1990/12/17/heart-of-darkness

Bloom, H. (2008). *Joseph Conrad's Heart of Darkness.* New York: Infobase Pub.

Conrad, J. (1905). Autocracy and War. *The North American Review, 181*(584), 33-55.

Conrad, J. (1988). *Heart of Darkness.* New York: Norton.

Darwin, Charles, and Leonard Kebler. (1859) *On the origin of species by means of natural selection, or, The preservation of favoured races in the struggle for life* . London: J. Murray,

Durkheim, E. (1951 [1897]). *Suicide, a study in sociology* (J. A. Spaulding, & G. Simpson, Trans.). London: Routledge.

Durkheim, E. (1938). *The rules of sociological method* (8th ed.). University of Chicago Press: Chicago.

Durkheim, E. (1964). *The Division of Labour in Society.* New York: Free Press.

Eagleton, T. (1976). *Criticism and Ideology: A Study in Marxist Literary Theory.* London: Verso.

Freud, S. (1961). *Civilization and Its Discontents.* New York: W W Norton.

Freud, S., 1997. *The interpretation of dreams*, Hertfordshire, England: Wordsworth Editions.

Golanka, M. (1985). Mr. Kurtz, I Presume? Livingstone and Stanley as Prototypes of Kurtz and Marlow. *Studies in the Novel*, 194-202.

Gorra, M. (2007). Joseph Conrad. *The Hudson Review, 59*(4), 548-565.

Hampson, R. (2000). *Cross-Cultural Encounters in Joseph Conrad's Malay Fiction*. Hampshire: Palgrave.

Lawtoo, N. (Dü.). (2012). *Conrad's Heart of Darkness and Contemporary Thought: Revisiting the Horror with Lacoue-Labarthe*. London: Bloomsbury Academic.

Lyell, Charles, Sir. (1830). *Principles of geology : being an attempt to explain the former changes of the earth's surface, by reference to causes now in operation* (v. 3). John Murray https://library.si.edu/digital-library/book/principlesgeolov3lyel

Marx, Karl. (1959). *Das Kapital, a critique of political economy*. Chicago: H. Regnery.

McClure, J. A. (1981). *Kipling&Conrad, The Colonial Fiction.* London: Harvard University Press.

Meis, M. (2013, April 15). *thesmartset*. https://www.thesmartset.com/article04151301

Najder, Z. e. (1964). *Conrad's Polish Background: Letters to and From Polish Friends.* (Z. Najder, Ed., & H. Carroll, Trans.) London: Oxford University Press.

Peters, J. G. (2006). *The Cambridge Introduction to Joseph Conrad.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Singh, F. B. (1978). The Colonialistic Bias of Heart of Darkness. *Conradiana: A Journal of Joseph Conrad*, 49-55.

Watts, C. (2012). Conrad's 'Heart of Darkness': A Critical and Contextual Discussion. *Conrad Studies*, iii-153.

The Questions of Artistic Detachment and Tranquil Recollection in Iris Murdoch's *The Sea, the Sea*

Barış METE[1]

[1]Assoc. Prof. Selçuk University, Department of English Language and Literature, Konya, Turkiye

ORCID: B.M. 0000-0001-7471-5058

Corresponding author:
Barış METE,
Selçuk University, Department of English Language and Literature, Konya, Turkiye
E-mail: bm@selcuk.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Iris Murdoch's 1978 novel *The Sea, the Sea* portrays an artist protagonist who mistakenly believes that it would be easy for him to detach from the glitter of life in London. After retiring from the theatre, the famous stage director and playwright Charles Arrowby decides to withdraw from what he has been accustomed to doing. He buys an old house in a coastal village where he thinks he will be able to recollect past emotions in tranquillity and write an autobiographical memoir. This is a clear reference to William Wordsworth's particular idea of poetry. Yet, this becomes Charles's most critical mistake as well, for life in the seaside village will bring him even more turbulence as he is away from the dazzling atmosphere of the theatre neither mentally nor bodily. His mind is always occupied with most of the names he has left behind in London. Besides, some of Charles's old friends who are seeking a chance for revenge for his past misdeeds come to the village in order to blackmail and threaten him. As if his troubles are not enough, Charles meets his teenage love in the village, which turns him into an example of the ridiculous character of the Aristotelian theory of comedy and further spoils his supposed tranquillity. This study thus examines the notions of artistic detachment and tranquil recollection as two Wordsworthian concepts misconceived by Murdoch's protagonist.

Keywords: Detachment, tranquillity, recollection, art, artist

Introduction

Iris Murdoch's fictional narratives are often famous for their meticulously conceived upper-middle-class male protagonists. Featuring the noble and chivalric nature of medieval courtly lovers who mostly serve to entertain the gentry (Tucker, 1986, p. 378), these protagonists are illustrated to be ageing but highly qualified men who typically choose to lead a quiet and tranquil life. Such a life is in direct contrast to what they had had when they were younger when problematic marriages, stormy love relationships, uneasy attachments, and troubled friendships had been the order of the day. The most

notable examples of these central figures in Murdoch's fictional oeuvre are the enchanter Mishca Fox of *The Flight from the Enchanter* (1956), the wine merchant Martin Lynch-Gibbon of *A Severed Head* (1961), the retired civil servant Hugh Peronett of *An Unofficial Rose* (1962) and the legal advisor John Ducane of *The Nice and the Good* (1968). Drawing on Murdoch's life and her profession as a novelist and philosopher, these protagonists are also said to be artists whose lives typically contrast with those of saints (Burke, 1987, p. 489). One of the best illustrations of these characters is the noted author and literary critic Bradley Pearson of Murdoch's 1973 James Tait Black Memorial Prize winner novel *The Black Prince*. The novel opens with the depiction of a married couple who have been in a turmoil of relationships. Bradley finds himself in the centre of these and seeks to evade whatever he considers could be threatening. These characters intend to keep themselves isolated from the people around who are their friends, partners, relatives and even lovers. They conceive of a new period of life in which they will enjoy being unattached and having no responsibilities although they will still remain indispensable elements of their conventional social circles.

Murdoch's 1978 Booker Prize winner novel *The Sea, the Sea* is no exception to this. Pursuing the same descriptive practice, the book presents an easily discernible Murdochian protagonist who discloses that he is fed up with what he believes his renowned name and prominent reputation have brought about. Murdoch's protagonist, who is the retired but very well-known stage director Charles Arrowby, considers that his life has been in a state of turbulence and chaos generated by the women with whom he has once had close relationships. This is exactly the same argument that Charles uses when he decides to detach himself from what he has been accustomed to doing in London, namely living in the dazzling atmosphere of the theatre. This was once the life of an outstanding young man who had been absorbed not only in the joy of art but also in the agony of greed, jealousy, and intrigue. Charles resolves to withdraw from the city which he believes to be a metaphor for what he wants to leave behind. He buys an old house named Shruff End by the sea, which lacks the satisfaction of a Kensington flat, and settles in a northern coastal village called Narrowdean in order to write a "novelistic memoir" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 257) – or, a diary, a journal, a novel – which is the impressive narrative of Murdoch's *The Sea, the Sea*.

Charles's memoir will be a work of art, for he has arranged that his narrative should be read as the confession of an artist who now lives alone. However, Charles's reference to epitomize the artist in seclusion is mostly a reference to the philosophy of art

accentuated in English literature by William Wordsworth in his Preface to the second edition of his 1798 collection of poems, *Lyrical Ballads*. As drawn up by Wordsworth in the late eighteenth century, a poetic composition is the outcome of the artist's recollection of his aesthetic background which is necessary to be remembered in moments of tranquillity. The particular problem for Charles arises here in the formulation of this aesthetic principle. Therefore, the main point of the argument in this study is to figure out how Charles falsely interprets Wordsworth's discussion about the process of artistic creation. It is proposed that almost the whole story Charles tells chronicles the reasons for and consequences of his misinterpretation of Wordsworth's idea of poetry. Wordsworth's definition relies not only on the artist's competence to look back on past experience, for "recollecting demands an inquisitive, sometimes a revisionary, backward look" (Corn, 1999, p. 359), but also on his strength to recollect the same experience in a peaceful mind, which hardly corresponds to Charles's artistic experience. In other words, the origin of Charles's inevitability to achieve tranquil recollection becomes not only the biggest question of his autobiographical narrative but also the initial inquiry made in this paper.

The Wordsworthian notion of artistic detachment would never be a complicated concept if it were regarded as the practice of seeking solitude. Charles believes that he has detached himself from what stands for the past, for he has left his city life behind and commenced living a new life in order to cook delicious food, swim every day, walk long distances and write an autobiographical memoir. It is from this moment on that he is going to have enough time to write an autobiographical account through which the reader will be given an authentic expression of his personal history. He assumes that he will be able to recollect the emotions on which his memoir as a work of art will be built. Nevertheless, this is where Charles's disillusionment surfaces. He is disillusioned since, as stated in Wordsworth's interpretation, emotions are recollected in the tranquillity of the physical environment in which the artist is experiencing the same mental state of peacefulness. In the case of Charles's experience, although he has abandoned the theatre, to his surprise, almost all the problematic names show up not only in Narrowdean but also in Shruff End. This practically means that Charles's "retirement is enlivened by a series of visits from past acquaintances from the stage and from his adolescent years" (Hoy, 1999, p. 598). The reappearance of his friends is disturbing since, for example, "Rosina tries to enact some vengeance for the way he has treated her by haunting Shruff End, Peregrine attempts to murder Charles for stealing his wife" (Bove, 1993, p. 85), which spoils his supposed tranquillity.

Charles's Inaccurate Interpretation of the Notions of Emotion, Recollection and Tranquillity

Concisely outlined, the relevance of both emotion and recollection of tranquillity should be illustrated within the key points of the discussions of Wordsworth asserted in his classic text, the Preface to *Lyrical Ballads*. As Wordsworth articulates, it is the accumulation and recollection of emotions which should set up the reason for all artful writing whether it is poetry or prose. According to Wordsworth, good poetry emanates not from preconceived notions and assumptions but from the way the poet feels and senses. The artistic expression of poetry is how the poet conveys his feelings through straightforward and uncomplicated language. Wordsworth argues that the poet's plain language animates all emotions. Any description of the poet in this medium of expression, which is his honest and unelaborated language, is a product of what the poet feels. As stated by Wordsworth, the poet is the one who is able to speak to man, the one who knows what human nature truly consists of. Wordsworth further claims that the poet has acquired enough knowledge of man to be expressed through his emotions and feelings. Wordsworth thus furnishes quite a precise definition of poetry. He asserts that "all good poetry is the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings" (1805, p. x-xi).

Wordsworth suggests that any work of art, literary works in particular, should be a product of the emotions of the artist. As a result, representational art in Wordsworth's opinion is associated with how the artist's senses operate and how his perceptions perform. Therefore, the point of discussion is that if Charles is to adhere to this principle, his memoir as a work of art will adopt the same exemplification. However, it should be noted that aesthetic formation is never reduced merely to the interpretation of the implications of emotions in the case of an artistic achievement. Creativity requires that the artist's recollection of emotions should be accomplished not only in environmental but also in mental tranquillity since Wordsworth "recognize[s] nature's power to quiet the mind [and] restoration through tranquillity" (Viscomi, 2007, p. 41). This is exactly why Wordsworth restates his notion of poetry in the later parts of his illustration where he builds up the proclamation asserting "I have said that poetry is the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings: it takes its origin from emotion recollected in tranquillity" (1805, p. l-li). Tranquillity holds so critical a position in Wordsworth's thought that it "is the condition for Wordsworthian sincerity and self-exploration" (Dickstein, 1987, p. 260). The origin of art is the remembrance of emotion and any recollection of emotion

correlates to the quality of tranquillity. It is to be asserted that as long as tranquillity prevails, the artist might be capable of performing a variety of aesthetic undertakings.

Charles's initial reference to Wordsworth is when he says early in his narrative, "[B]ut now the main events of my life are over and there is to be nothing but 'recollection in tranquillity'" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 2). Charles is so straightforward a narrator that it never takes a strenuous effort to comprehend the creative impulse his memoir will stem from. As Charles assumes that he is now in tranquillity, his mind will recollect whatever he needs as an artist to compose his memoir. However, his critical mistake and inevitable failure are foreshadowed here since he "is told that he has made his lifelong erotic obsession 'into a story, and stories are false'" (Gordon, 1990, p. 116). Besides, it is noticeable that Charles is being haunted by memories of an uneasy past in terms of the repetitive appearances in his mind of some of his friends' names. In other words, "Charles is unable to escape his past […] it revisits him in various forms as figures from the past disrupt his solitude by the sea" (Weese, 2001, p. 635). Moreover, it is ironic that Charles expects a period of tranquillity, for as it is argued here that "when many people go looking for beauty and tranquillity, their very search destroys precisely those qualities" (Thompson, 2007, p. 202). Even before these names appear, the entire image of the theatre, from which Charles's consciousness has never been disengaged, comes back. What has been disturbing Charles is neither the simplicity nor the plainness of the circumstances which characterise his life now but the question of what his friends are now thinking about him as a man who lives by himself in an old house in a remote village. Charles asks himself whether his new life was "to repent a life of egoism" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 2), and then answers his own question by saying, "[N]ot exactly, yet something of the sort. Of course I never said this to the ladies and gentlemen of the theatre. They would never have stopped laughing" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 2). Narrowdean where he claims, "I came here to solitude" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 230), has proved to be no different from London, for Charles has brought back vivid memories of several past events. Therefore, he cannot concentrate on the emotion recalled in tranquillity, but rather his "writing soon comes to focus on the events of the present rather than those of the past" (Mettle, 1991, p. 101). It is surprising to notice that Charles's past is still being set in the present, which has already impaired the meaning of tranquillity.

Charles enjoys being alone in Shruff End built upon rocks and he relishes the idea of being away from the crowd, yet there is an abundance of names with which his mind is occupied. He identifies himself through his references to the other names in the

theatre. He justifies his situation claiming that he is tired of the theatre. Yet, what follows is one of the best illustrations of how he still craves for recognition. Although those were his friends,

> but how few […] they really are after a lifetime in the theatre. How friendly and 'warm-hearted' the theatre can seem, what a desolation it can be. The great ones have gone from me: Clement Makin dead, Wilfred Dunning dead, Sidney Ashe gone to Stratford, Ontario, Fritzie Eitel successful and done for in California. A handful remain: Perry, Al, Marcus, Gilbert, what's left of the girls. (Murdoch, 1999, p. 16)

It is the tranquillity which is still premature. Charles has been experiencing a placid life; it has been a pastoral scene where he has been. His attention, however, has been drawn to the past, for he wishes there were at least some letters sent by his friends. Instead of tranquillity, it is the idea of remoteness that could illuminate his situation. Charles has misinterpreted the connotations of the term so much so that he has reduced it to some less laboriously demonstrable notion such as indolence and inactivity. Tranquillity involves silence. It requires more in terms of mental harmony and peace. However, Charles's mind has been occupied with recollecting memories which fill him with nostalgia.

Charles has lost tranquillity through a sequence of events, the first of which is his experience of some unusual appearances. There are other reasons, yet Charles's discomfort has been initiated by these inexplicable happenings. It is only after this that the other developments alter his innocently fashioned expectations of achieving his piece of mind. In addition to his encounters with the abnormal, Charles has had a lot of trouble with some old friends who have frequented where he has been living. There are some women who challenge Charles to acknowledge who he used to be in the past. Furthermore, Charles comes upon the woman who he was – and still is – in love with and wishes to marry, which throughout the whole narrative troubles him the most. In other words, the present is inhabited by the past considering the circumstances presently surrounding him, which will further be illustrated in the following chapters under a number of headings such as mysterious events, reappearances of old friends, and Charles's approach to the reality of love.

Charles's Experience of the (Un)natural as One of the Reasons for his Loss of Tranquillity

The very beginning of Charles's memoir introduces a bizarre incident "which was so extraordinary and so horrible that [Charles] cannot bring [himself] to describe it even now after an interval of time and although a possible, though not totally reassuring, explanation has occurred to [him]" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 1). Charles represents the incident as almost an unprecedented development; it is nevertheless not a "horrible experience" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 20). Even though it is not spelled out clearly, it is probably because of the presence of some seals swimming so close to Charles that his blurred vision generates olfactory hallucinations. It is at the end of his memoir that Charles is able to resolve the mystery and offer an explanation for the incident. However, it had come as a great shock; it was so unexpected that Charles felt the horror. He recounts the scene saying,

> [o]ut of a perfectly calm empty sea […] I saw an immense creature break the surface and arch itself upward. At first it looked like a black snake, then a long thickening body […] I could […] see the head with remarkable clarity, a kind of crested snake's head, green-eyed, the mouth opening to show teeth […] The head and neck glistened with a blue sheen […] I feared beyond anything. (Murdoch, 1999, p. 20-21)

The above experience, which portrays Charles as a character who "is also a victim of his own mind's creations" (Tucker, 1986, p. 382) is so unsettling that it leaves Charles with a puzzled mind which blocks any possibility of achieving the tranquil state of mind. Charles speculates that he must have visualized the sea serpent. Yet, he remembers every single detail of the ghastly animal. His conclusion is that "one does not 'simply' imagine anything so detailed and dreadful" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 22). Although Charles might be a "moderate drinker" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 22), he is "certainly not an unbalanced or crazily 'imaginative' person" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 22). What Charles saw might have been a rare species as yet undiscovered by scientists, which is a weak explanation of what happened. Besides, Charles might have been looking at an invertebrate, a worm in the water before he saw the monster. His explanation is that his retina enlarged the image of the tiny worm on the surface of the sea. It was thus a device comparable to that of motion picture photography. According to him, "it is possible, perhaps plausible, to conjecture that the sea monster which [he] 'saw' was a hallucination" (Murdoch,

1999, p. 23), which possibly resulted from his past experience of LSD. This is how Charles struggles to make up a logical explanation of what happened to him when he needs to remember the past in tranquillity. Charles's misinterpretation not only of emotion but also of recollection and tranquillity becomes discernible in every stage of his enterprise. His interpretation of artistic detachment and tranquil recollection of emotion proves too primordial to be proper.

Compared to the disorder above, the unexpected appearance of one of his old girl friends, Rosina Vamburgh, in his house disrupts Charles's supposed tranquillity more dramatically. This scene, very much like "[t]he house by the sea, the life of the theatre, erotic obsession, the contrast of simple and sophisticate, the artist and the ascetic soldier, the different women" (Conradi, 1990, p. 231), is interpreted as one of the themes of the narrative: "[t]he subject of penetrating Charles Arrowby's domain" (Morley, 2014, p. 33). It is indicated by some critics that Rosina could be associated with what Charles considers creepy, strange, unpleasant and perplexing. Whenever the main focus of interest is on Rosina, his narrative echoes the intensity and tension that Charles feels. The following sentences are some examples of how Charles commences the episodes where he is talking about Rosina: "[s]omething rather odd and distressing has just occurred" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 42); "[s]omething rather frightful happened last night" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 59); and "I was sitting writing […] late last night in my drawing room when something very disconcerting happened" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 74). Rosina becomes one of the most prominent justifications for Charles's inability to accomplish what he has conceived of. She is an intruder who has arranged a visit to Charles although she has never been invited.

This chapter analyses three separate incidents as further examples of the reasons for Charles's loss of tranquillity in which Rosina plays the leading role. Charles "realize[s] that [his] lovely big ugly vase [is] gone from its pedestal. It [has] fallen onto the floor and [is] broken into a great many pieces" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 43). What is signified by Charles as 'odd' and 'distressing' in this scene is the fact that there has been no intelligible reason why the vase has fallen onto the floor. Charles claims that "[t]he pedestal is perfectly steady and has not moved. There has been no wind, the bead curtain is motionless" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 43). He struggles to understand why it has happened. He considers that he is to blame, yet he does not remember if it had been his mistake: "I am reluctant to think that I am to blame and I am sure I am not" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 43). A broken vase is something plain and ordinary; it is quite commonplace. Indeed,

what puzzles him is the question he asks himself: "[h]ow can it have jumped off its stand?" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 43). There is no explanation for how it has happened.

Comparable to the broken vase, a mirror in Charles's house has mysteriously disappeared from the wall and fallen onto the floor. This is the large oval mirror in the hall which he has found himself 'attached' to and which, he says, "seems to glow with its own light" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 18). It was the shattering of the glass that had interrupted Charles's sleep early in the morning. What is 'odd' is that both the wire and the nail on the wall are undamaged. Might somebody have taken the mirror from the wall and dropped it onto the floor?

Charles has never had a superstitious mind. He says, "I have never suffered from night fears. I was never, that I can recall, afraid of the dark as a child" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 19). He has never regarded Shruff End with suspicion; he has never considered that the house might be haunted. Nevertheless, something inexplicable has happened again. This is the blurred image of a human face that Charles has seen looking at him in the mirror. Although the image has been unclear, he says he is "perfectly sure that he [has seen] a face looking at [him] through the glass of the inner room" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 74). This was so frightening that he sat "absolutely still, paralysed by sheer terror" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 74). Charles examines what might possibly explain the situation. According to him, one of the options is that "it was simply a reflection of my own face in the blackness of the glass" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 74). The other theory is that "[t]he window that gives onto the sea was uncurtained and there was an almost full moon. Could I have seen the moon reflected in the inner glass" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 74)?

These are all powerful ploys deliberately staged by a creative actress, Rosina Vamburgh, who "was a huge phenomenon" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 77), and "probably the most famous person in this book, after [him]" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 77). She acted thus in order to distract and plague not only Charles's life in Narrowdean but also his project to write his memoir in tranquillity. Among the other women of the theatre who had their love affairs with Charles, Rosina was the most burdensome. Charles is clear that it was not love; yet it was a "furious mutual desire for possession" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 77) which could characterize his ended relationship with Rosina. It becomes indisputable that what captivated Charles was his desire for Rosina especially when he recounts her kisses. Rosina wanted to marry Charles, which he dismissed. She broke up her marriage with Peregrine Arbelow, yet Charles "never had the slightest intention of marrying her.

[He] simply wanted her, and the satisfaction of this want involved detaching her permanently from her husband" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 78). As set here, Charles is a man who is still "[m]anically self-interested and untrustworthy" (Dipple, 1982, p. 275).

Rosina displays the demeanour of a venomous woman who had been beguiled into listening to Charles's pledges. Charles has overlooked his past involvement with Rosina, yet she has managed to retain an excellent memory not only of her marriage but also of her relationship with Charles. That is why Rosina first reminds Charles what he promised her. She says, "[Y]ou promised that if you ever married anybody you would marry me […] And you promised that if you ever settled permanently with anyone you would settle with me" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 113). She intimidates him and foreshadows Charles's eventual failure to accomplish his intention asserting "you will not live happily ever after" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 113).

Charles's memoir exemplifies even more illustrations of Rosina's disillusionment with her relationship with Charles. Whenever Rosina is the subject of his discussion, Charles frequently recalls hearing her accusing him of ruining her marriage. It becomes hurtful to listen to her as it causes emotional pain. Details arise when she says,

> [Y]ou wrecked my marriage, you prevented me from having children, for you I made a slaughter of all my friends. And when you'd begged me on your knees to leave my husband, and when I'd left him, you abandoned me […] Do you not remember what our love was like? Have you forgotten why you uttered those words? (Murdoch, 1999, p. 116)

After this vigorous confrontation, what becomes recognizable is the conclusion that there could be nothing more incongruous than any reference to tranquillity.

Rosina has broken into Charles's house. It was so unexpected to encounter her in his house that Charles is "still trembling and quickly digesting [his] fear. [He has] felt intense relief mixed with rising anger. [He has] wanted to curse aloud but […] remained silent, controlling [his] breathing" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 109). What Charles has felt is evidently outrage largely provoked by Rosina's distressing presence in front of him. It is at the same time fear and regret, for Charles has been unable to deny any of the details disclosed by Rosina. Whenever Rosina points out how Charles disappointed and victimized her, he acknowledges it. What has already become obvious is that, since

settling in Narrowdean, Charles has been unable to accomplish anything he set out to do in terms of his expectations of retiring to a tranquil life. It has turned into a disappointment for Charles to leave the theatre and to live in a small village. Charles believed the idea that leaving the theatre would grant him the tranquillity that he assumed he needed as an artist. But it never came true. Although her tone is ironic, Rosina is probably right when she wittily tells Charles, "I could have told you the country is the least peaceful and private place to live. The most peaceful and secluded place in the world is a flat in Kensington" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 111). Charles left his flat in Kensington, "where everything was under his control, where […] all went well for him" (Tucker, 1992, p. 164), and settled in Narrowdean presuming that it would be the peace and seclusion that he needed for tranquillity.

Charles's Confession of his Complete Disillusionment: "The Impossible Come True"

Rosina's temporary disappearance introduces into the scene the reappearance of Charles's lost love, Mary Hartley Smith. The phrase in the above subtitle is inspired by how Charles interprets this unexpected incident – his most unpredictable amazement in the whole story. It was so unpredictable that Charles is in a state of shock:

> [He] was paralysed. [He] cannot think why [he] did not fall to the ground, the revelation was, in its initial impact, so terrible. [He] grasped it first, [he did] not quite know why, in this way, not as something unwelcome or horrible, but purely as the impossible come true, like what we cannot imagine about the end of the world. (Murdoch, 1999, p. 119)

Charles considers Hartley "the most important" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 38) figure in his life. Hartley occupied so influential a status in his memories that her reappearance has rendered whatever Charles has had not only insignificant but also meaningless. From a moral perspective, this is the lost youth and innocence through which Charles craves to "recapture an idealized memory of the chastity and purity of an adolescent relationship" (Hague, 1984, p. 121). Earlier in the narrative Charles concludes that his memoir should never exclude Hartley although any remembrances of his memory of her have inflicted massive pain on him. It is painful for Charles to have lost Hartley, for their relationship was an experience beyond what love would describe. Charles says, "We were 'in love', that vague weakened phrase, cannot express it. We loved each other, we lived in each

other, through each other, by each other. We were each other" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 84). The relationship between Charles and Hartley is a sad story. It was once "pure joy" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 84), which had been overshadowed by Charles's extreme anxiety about losing her.

Charles's relationship with Hartley had been unsettled and problematic all along. It will be more comprehensible if this relationship were divided into three separate stages where the development of events is interpreted. The first part answers to who Hartley was and what she meant for Charles in her youth. Although Charles says it was love as they were in love, he illustrates Hartley as a young girl who mostly preferred keeping silent. She never spoke. Almost all the lyrical descriptions of those school years depict a Hartley who was not as overjoyed as Charles was. Hartley was his 'darling,' she was his 'Hartley,' she was the source of light, his 'daylight;' yet Charles "feared to lose the light and to be left in the darkness forever" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 85). It was Charles who was in love with Hartley; and Charles was only a 'child' when he dreamed of marrying her when they would be eighteen. What Charles feared was "a child's blind fear" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 85). Since Charles was a 'child,' Hartley became the ideal that he extolled. Charles idolized Hartley. It was his delight and satisfaction to watch Hartley participate in school athletics.

It is not surprising that "Hartley […] becomes for him a religion" (Tucker, 1986, p. 385). Charles's idealization of his love (i.e. Hartley) led him to attribute a spiritual characteristic to their relationship. He recites the opening lines of "Veni Creator Spiritus," when he recollects how he conceived that they were in Paradise, which was of great happiness. "I remember Hartley singing in church," Charles says, "her bright innocent lovely face raised up to the light, to God" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 85). Yet, Charles has introduced himself as a man who has no interest in religion. He is almost irreligious and asserts that he "acquired that vague English Christianity which disappears in adolescence" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 71). The most persuasive rationale for this change of behaviour is that Charles's ongoing glorification of Hartley compelled him to constitute a spiritual disposition in which he could avoid confronting his fear of losing her. Charles's uneasiness at the prospect of desertion was so considerable that he believed that his Christian faith could save his love. That is why Charles accentuates that they were devoted believers. He says, "We felt that we were dedicated people who would be protected by love" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 85).

Since Charles conceived of a beautiful girl, he wished to see Hartley as pretty as she could be. This is the reason why Charles portrays Hartley's expression through ambiguously specified descriptions. He claims that Hartley was beautiful "but with a secret beauty" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 86). He maintains the idea that Hartley was a beautiful girl though she "was not one of the 'pretty girls' of the school" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 86). However, there is no inconsistency here in what he has stated. Charles sculpts the physical characteristics of an average young girl into an aesthetically gratifying illustration. Hartley's face was colourless, it was very pale, yet he revises his descriptions further stating, "although she was so strong and so healthy" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 86). Charles had been moulding Hartley into the frame. Her face was finely shaped as well and she looked "like a young savage" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 86). She was so thin that she was almost fragile, yet she was "clean, and so strong" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 86).

Hartley's disappearance outlines the second stage that Charles was going through. Her withdrawal was so abrupt that any statement or comment about her causes Charles to be in intense emotional pain. From the moment that Charles identifies Hartley in Narrowdean, he has been recalling the memory of the past and giving intensely animated yet dramatic descriptions of his strong attachment to her. The relationship between Charles and Hartley was so fragile that he felt overwhelmed by agonies of uncertainty and suspense. Although Charles considered himself a man who was overjoyed to be with Hartley, he was going through a dreadful experience that would haunt him in the present. It is overtly expressed that it was love, yet Charles recognizes that "[e]xtreme love must bring terror with it, and great terror, like some kinds of prayer which lean upon the omniscience of the Almighty, has a vast unlimited all-embracing compass" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 87). Charles believed that his happiness would be cursed. He says, "I feared so many things, that she would die, or I would die, that we would be somehow cursed for being too happy" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 87). Hartley ended their relationship saying she had decided not to marry him. Charles briefly but effectively recounts what happened: "I lost her, the jewel of the world" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 87). It is mostly due to Charles's already-fashioned hopelessness that Hartley's sudden disappearance did not come as a surprise; it was what Charles had already been expecting.

Charles's Exemplification of the Aristotelian Idea of the Ridiculous

This chapter illustrates the final stage of Charles's relations with Hartley which draws overall conclusions about his state of mind. It is about how Charles rapidly grows into

a man who perfectly exemplifies Aristotle's notion of the ridiculous as an aspect of the comic character after he runs into Hartley in her old age many years after she left him. In the fifth chapter of his *Poetics*, Aristotle defines comedy as one of the two forms of human imitation. According to Aristotle, comedy as a form of dramatic art is "an imitation of people of a lower sort [characterized by] what is ridiculous" (2006, p. 25). Aristotle generally specifies by the ridiculous what is not serious and particularly "a deformity that is painless and not destructive" (2006, p. 25). Aristotle identifies the ridiculous character, as distinct from the tragic hero, not only with the low in importance, the unacceptable and unrespectable, but also with unwise and poor judgement. These features establish the most typical characteristics of the ridiculous character who represents the imitation of base action. The period between Charles's startling encounter with Hartley and the end of the story chronicles how Charles steadily develops into a ridiculous man whose behaviour has been appalling and unreasonable, more particularly, "inappropriate" (Lesser, 1980, p. 9). Elsewhere the Aristotelian concept of the ridiculous in character formation is related to "an error […] or ugliness […] which does not cause pain and is not destructive, is clearly related to the doctrine of the inappropriate or incongruous" (Golden, 1984, p. 287). Since the ridiculous character signifies absurdity and irrationality, Charles is said to address "the strategies of the madman because he has become one" (Moss, 1986, p. 229). Although Charles states that he is "over sixty years of age" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 4), he becomes a teenager when he speaks to Hartley. It has been more than forty years and Hartley is now a woman who is married to Benjamin Fitch. They have an adopted son. Charles is acting and talking as if these critical changes were meaningless. "Charles has patterned his life around the fantasy he has created and carried around with him for forty years – that of resuming his earlier relationship with [Hartley]" (Capitani, 2003, p. 103). This is how Charles speaks to Hartley: "[y]ou are my love, you are still that, you are still what you were for me" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 125). Charles's speech becomes increasingly irrational when he says, "'[w]hat shall we do?' […] when shall I see you […] can we meet in the pub, or would you come down to my house'" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 127). Charles's frequent assertions, his continual declarations and enquiries strengthen his image as an example of a ridiculous character.

Aristotle's idea of the ridiculous as the defining feature of the comic hero becomes obvious in Charles's character formation as the inevitable consequence of his obsession with Hartley. Murdoch interprets this alike, saying "Charles is suffering from a delusion that the first love is the great one and that people don't change" (Brans, 1985, p. 50). Charles's constant compulsion to be with Hartley is awakened when they meet in a church.

His obsession becomes uncontrollable, for "[a] chance meeting with the woman he loved and lost in his youth plunges his mind into chaos" (Nicol, 2004, p. 11). Charles concludes that Hartley must be an unhappy woman married to a strange man. It is Hartley's marriage that Charles is uneasy about. He has ludicrously deduced that "she must regret it so much, that wrong choice. She must have spent her life regretting that she had not married me" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 129), for "Charles is the most incurable of [Murdoch's] major egoists" (Gordon, 1995, p. 88). This is part of the ridiculous, namely Charles' decision that Hartley is an unsettled woman married to a man she does not love.

Charles has left his London flat and settled in a small village to live in tranquillity so that he could recollect his past and have a written record of his life. However, his unreasonable behaviour when he is with Hartley introduces the most farcical scenes and renders his intention impractical. Charles's obsession with Hartley seems ludicrous, yet he still provides self-serving rationalizations for his constant compulsion to be with her. He believes that "Hartley loved [him] and had long regretted losing [him]" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 170). He is ready to dismiss any objection against his assumptions about her. Although these are naïve assumptions based on nothing but his presumptions, Charles speculates more about Benjamin. According to Charles, Benjamin "was physically unattractive, with his unshapely sensual mouth and his look of a cropped schoolboy. And he was […] a barbarian and a bully. He was a tyrant, probably a chronically jealous man, a dull resentful dog" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 170). Charles concludes that it must be impossible for Hartley to have a happy life, a happy marriage. It is obvious that Charles has been convinced by his own delusions.

Charles strongly believes that his 'central question' has been answered. He is convinced that Hartley is unhappy. As his mind is restless and he is unable to be calm he tries to illustrate the situation through questions he asks himself. He wonders if she is too much in love with him, if she is jealous of his mistress that she most probably believes he has, if she was walking by Shruff End in order to spy on him when Rosina's headlights exposed her to Charles (Murdoch, 1999, p. 149). Despite the plethora of such promptly fabricated questions, Charles promises that he "shall rescue her and make her happy for whatever time remains to [them]" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 191), a plan which is seen to be an example of Charles's almost delusional thinking. According to this interpretation, Charles's intention is "less a reflection of a reasonable hope, however, than of outrageous fantasy" (Denham, 2001, p. 616). The best way for Charles to keep his promise is to marry Hartley. He has become unreasonable enough to ignore that Hartley is a married woman who says that she loves her husband. He is so preoccupied with the idea that

he has to save her from a husband who he believes is a brutal man. Although Hartley says that she is not the same person that Charles was in love with and that she is not the same Hartley but she has changed a lot, Charles unreasonably tells her, "I love you [..] You love me, you need me [..] Don't resist […] You're my wife now" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 229). These last remarks thoroughly epitomize the idiocy of the whole scene which has become an illustration of the Aristotelian idea of the ridiculous.

It is clear that the ridiculous is the inescapable development of the unreasonable attitude that Charles has taken since he saw Hartley in Narrowdean. His disproportionate excitement of and irrational reaction to Hartley's presence in the village has put him into a position which he confesses is "a comic one" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 257). Although Charles chooses to describe the scene as comic, the whole situation has become farcical due to its silly and unreasonable character. Charles's uncontrollable and violent behaviour is interpreted as "[a] ruling passion […] an idee fixe […] all so often the source of the ridiculous in a character" (Nevo, 1963, p. 330). The first example of the sheer absurdity of Charles's perspective is his exiting and often dangerous practices. As Charles is stuck to the idea that it now is practically impossible for him to be without Hartley, he goes to their house, hides in the garden, moves silently and sits down outside the window to eavesdrop on the conversation between Hartley and Benjamin, between the wife and the husband. He considers trying the same again, but he surprisingly says,

> I had no wish now to eavesdrop, indeed I had almost no curiosity left, so strongly did my mind shy away in horror from the interior of that house and of that marriage. I felt disgust with myself, with him, even with her. (Murdoch, 1999, p. 256)

This is not only how Charles acknowledges the idiocy of the way that he behaves but also how "he finds his first love whose life he disrupts with his egomaniacal pursuit" (Rowe, 2004, p. 92). It is so irrational that the whole picture has suddenly lost its significance. It now seems quite inconsequential, an interlude which Charles does not want to remember any more. He says when he gets home, "[t]he candles had fallen over again and burnt themselves out on the wooden top of the table, making long dark burns which remained there ever after to remind me of that terrible night" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 256).

When Charles discloses his secretive call to Hartley he emphasizes his insistence on the way that Benjamin talked to Hartley. He unabashedly condemns Benjamin, for he

considers that Benjamin must be the reason for Hartley's unhappiness. However, he is unable to calculate how Hartley would reply to his revelations. She is absolutely enraged at what Charles says he has done. She condemns him saying, "[h]ow can you – you don't know what you've done – how could you push in, spy on us like that – it was nothing to do with you – how could you intrude into secret things which you couldn't possibly understand? […]" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 328). Hartley's deep disappointment is unpredictable. She asserts, "[…] it's the wickedest vilest most hurtful thing anybody's ever done to me […] I'll never forgive you, never, it's like, it's like a murder, a killing […]" (Murdoch, 1999, pp. 328-29). Hartley's attitude to Charles's misconduct is so incalculable that she has lost all her charms, for she is now in a hysterical state and is unable to control her behaviour. She is crying, screaming and yelling at him. In addition, "when she cries we are constantly made aware of her otherness by Charles' description of her inhuman, animalistic wails" (Jordan, 2012, p. 367). Charles reports the significant reversal of Hartley's earlier disposition. He describes it by saying, "[h]er face was red, wild with tears, her mouth dribbling. Her voice, raucous, piercing, shrieked out […] a frenzied panic noise" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 329). For the first time in the narrative Charles experiences the worst displeasure ever. He acknowledges that he felt "horror, fear, a sort of disgusted shame, shame for [himself], shame for her" (Murdoch, 1999, p. 329). This is Charles's increasing disillusionment with Hartley. It makes sense that "[i]nsofar as all human beings are victims of illusions, Charles is typical" (Heusel, p. 70). It has never been so discernible in the story that Charles is so confused and depressed. No matter what it might cost, he wants her to stop; he wants to silence her. This reversal of the previous state of mind is only momentary. Having no alternative at all, Charles lures Hartley to Shruff End and imprisons her until he releases her after a period of time in which she has cried, wailed, shouted and fought. What Charles has done so far "makes a mockery of his original intention to retire to a lonely house by the sea to renounce the illusory world of the theatre" (Nicol, 2004, p. 137). His intention to detach himself from his former life is "incomplete" (Spear, 1995, p. 94).

Conclusion

Iris Murdoch's *The Sea, the Sea* is about an aging man's bitter disillusionment with himself as a retired actor, playwright and stage director. Charles Arrowby is a Murdochian upper middle-class male protagonist who is fed up with what his reputation as a well-known artist has brought about. The theatre has become so nauseating that Charles wants to settle in a coastal village and spend the rest of his time away from the troubles of the bustling city. As his city life is over, Charles believes that as an artist he needs to

recollect his past in tranquillity so that he can compose an autobiographical memoir which would give all the facts about his unsettled past. What becomes obvious at this point is his reference to Wordsworth's definition of poetry. Wordsworth concentrates on the artist (the poet) and wants to figure out the way that the artist as an individual perceives and senses the physical environment. Poetry for him is the product of emotion recalled in peace and tranquillity. Though aesthetic, this is a rather plain definition compared to the earlier interpretations made by critics of previous ages. Since Wordsworth provides an uncomplicated explanation, Charles does not quite understand the implication and wrongly assumes that he will easily be able to recollect his past. This is his biggest and most critical fallacy, especially regarding his casual and inaccurate approach to Wordsworth's formulation.

It is neither in the city nor on the stage but at his house in a seashore village where Charles is troubled the most. First it is the theatre and all the names of the artists he has worked with which never leave Charles alone. He repeats these names again and again in his mind as if he wants them to accompany him even in the village. Some of them make their appearances in his life again. But it is especially Rosina and Peregrine who return to blackmail him into admitting his mistakes. Rosina secretly hides herself in Shruff End and almost haunts the house, which terrorizes Charles. Peregrine tries to murder him claiming that Charles stole his wife from him. Charles's torment begins when he meets his teenage love Hartley in the village. Hartley's reappearance comes as a complete surprise which dramatically turns Charles's programme upside down. From the first moment that Charles sees Hartley in Narrowdean, she becomes a passion. She becomes the centre of his sexual attraction, love, hate and anger. Charles almost loses his mind when Hartley reminds him about the truth. She has a family; she is a married woman, and she has an adopted son. Nevertheless, Charles's obsession with Hartley blinds him. He turns into a man who can best be described as ridiculous. He is a man who is unreasonable and what he has done is inappropriate. It is unbelievable that Charles kidnaps Hartley and imprisons her. He is no more a grown-up who thinks logically, but a schoolboy who acts irrationally. These are all substantial instances of Charles's inability to achieve peace and tranquillity. He misinterprets both the implication of artistic detachment and the significance of tranquil recollection. He considers these terms to be simple and uncomplicated notions. As a result, Charles starts a spiritual journey towards a greater understanding of himself as an artist. However, he concludes that he has created an illusion about art, remoteness, feeling, and reminiscence.

References

Aristotle (2006 [1278]). *Poetics*. (J. Sachs, Trans.). Newburyport: Focus Publishing.

Bove, C. K. (1993). *Understanding Iris Murdoch*. University of South Carolina Press.

Brans, J. (1985). Virtuous Dogs and a Unicorn: An Interview with Iris Murdoch. *Southwest Review*, vol. 70, pp. 43-54.

Burke, J. J. (1987). Canonizing Iris Murdoch. *Studies in the Novel*, vol. 19, pp. 486-494.

Capitani, D. N. (2003). Ideas of the Good: Iris Murdoch's 'The Sea, The Sea'. *Christianity and Literature*, vol. 53, pp. 99-108.

Conradi, P. J. (1990). *Iris Murdoch: The Saint and the Artist*. Macmillan.

Corn, A. (1999). The Wordsworth Retrospective. *The Hudson Review*, vol. 52, pp. 359-378.

Denham, A. E. (2001). Envisioning the Good: Iris Murdoch's Moral Psychology. *Modern Fiction Studies*, vol. 47, 602-629.

Dickstein, M. (1987). Wordsworth and Solitude. *The Sewanee Review*, vol. 95, pp. 253-275.

Dipple, E. (1982). *Iris Murdoch: Work for the Spirit*. Methuen and Co. Ltd.

Golden, L. (1984). Aristotle on Comedy. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, vol. 42, pp. 283-290.

Gordon, D. J. (1990). Iris Murdoch's Comedies of Unselfing. *Twentieth Century Literature*, vol. 36, pp. 115-136.

----- (1995). *Iris Murdoch's Fables of Unselfing*. University of Missouri Press.

Hague, A. (1984). *Iris Murdoch's Comic Vision*. Associated University Press.

Hoy, C. (1999). Homage to Dame Iris Murdoch. *The Sewanee Review*, vol. 107, pp. 595-599.

Jordan, J. (2012). 'A Thingy World': Iris Murdoch's Stuff. *The Modern Language Review*, vol. 107, pp. 364-378.

Lesser, W. (1980). The Sacred and Profane Iris Murdoch. *The Threepenny Review*, vol. 3, pp. 9-10.

Mettle, D. D. (1991). *Sound and Sense: Musical Allusion and Imagery in the Novels of Iris Murdoch*. Peter Lang.

Morley, E. (2014). The Case of Murdoch and Canetti. In M. Luprecht (Ed.), *Iris Murdoch Connected: Critical Essays on Her Fiction and Philosophy* (pp. 29-44) The University of Tennessee Press.

Moss, H. (1986). Narrow Escapes: Iris Murdoch. *Grand Street*, vol. 1, pp. 228-240.

Murdoch, I. (1999). *The Sea, The Sea*. Vintage.

Nevo, R. (1963). Toward a Theory of Comedy. *The Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, vol. 21, pp. 327-332.

Nicol, B. (1996). Anticipating Retrospection: The First-Person Retrospective Novel and Iris Murdoch's 'The Sea, the Sea'. *The Journal of Narrative Technique*, vol. 26, pp. 187-208.

----- (2004). *Iris Murdoch: the Retrospective Fiction*. Palgrave.

Rowe, M. M. (2004). Iris Murdoch and the Case of Too Many Men. *Studies in the Novel*, vol. 36, pp. 79-94.

Spear, H. D. (1995). *Macmillan Modern Novelists: Iris Murdoch*. Macmillan.

Stevens H. B. (1995). *Patterned Aimlessness: Iris Murdoch's Novels of the 1970s and 1970s*. University of Georgia Press.

Thompson, W. (2007). Wordsworth, Landscape Architect. *The Wordsworth Circle*, vol. 38, pp. 196- 203.

Tucker, L. (1986). Released from Bands: Iris Murdoch's Two Prosperos in 'The Sea, The Sea'. *Contemporary Literature*, vol. 27, pp. 378-395.

----- (1992). Released from Bands: Iris Murdoch's Two Prosperos in The Sea, the Sea. In L. Tucker, (Ed.), *Critical Essays on Iris Murdoch* (pp. 161-175) G. K. Hall & Co.

Viscomi, J. (2007). Wordsworth, Gilpin, and the Vacant Mind. *The Wordsworth Circle*, vol. 38, pp. 40-49.

Weese, K. (2001). Feminist Uses of the Fantastic in Iris Murdoch's 'The Sea, The Sea'. *Modern Fiction Studies*, vol. 3, pp. 630-656.

Wordsworth, W. (1805 [1798]). *Lyrical Ballads with Pastoral and Other Poems Vol*. I. R. Taylor and Co.

A Comparative Analysis of *The Lonely Londoners* and *Wide Sargasso Sea* within the Context of Multiculturalism

Rabia AKSOY ARIKAN[1] , Evren BARUT[2]

[1]Asst. Prof., Department of Western Languages and Literatures, English Language and Literature, Çankırı Karatekin University, Çankırı, Turkiye

[2]Asst. Prof., Department of Translation Studies, Afyon Kocatepe University, Afyon, Turkiye

ORCID: R.A. 0000-0002-9074-7428; E.B. 0000-0002-0915-9603

Corresponding author:
Rabia AKSOY ARIKAN,
Department of Western Languages & Literatures, English Language & Literature, Çankırı Karatekin University, Çankırı, Turkiye
E-mail: rarikan18@gmail.com

Submitted: 18.05.2023
Accept: 23.10.2023

Citation: Aksoy Arikan, R., & Barut, E. (2023). A comparative analysis of *The Lonely Londoners* and *Wide Sargasso Sea* within the context of multiculturalism. *Litera, 33*(2), 373-393.
https://doi.org/10.26650/LITERA2023-1298111

ABSTRACT

The author Jean Rhys explored the concept of multiculturalism in her novel *Wide Sargasso Sea* (*WSS*) (1966), which presented a narrative of the protagonist's life in Jamaica and England. In contrast, Samuel Selvon depicted Caribbean immigrants' lives in England by integrating multicultural items into his novel, *The Lonely Londoners* (*TLL*) (1956). This study addresses the theme of multiculturalism in both *WSS* and *TLL* and reflects on the lifestyles and relationships of the characters within the context of multiculturalism in the Caribbean and England. To achieve this goal, a detailed analysis was conducted using a multiculturalist approach, grounded in selected examples extracted from both *WSS* and *TLL*. Both works of literature analyzed the influence of the dominant culture on an individuals' cultural facets, highlighting their ability or inability to adapt to the constraints of the host culture. In her work, Rhys highlighted the adaptation process and the discrimination experienced by white and black Creoles. Conversely, Selvon's narrative focused on class-based discrimination within a culture with undefined or shifting boundaries. This article provides an analysis of how the literary works reflect the difficulties faced by an individual when living in heterogeneous cultures, specifically cultural integration and discrimination. First, the definition of terms and a theoretical and literary framework are presented, then, a comparative analysis with selected examples from *WSS* and *TLL* is given in the study. Finally, the article argues that both works offer valuable insights into the struggles that individuals and communities in multicultural societies face as they negotiate the conflicts between cultural diversity and social cohesion.

Keywords: Multiculturalism, Acculturation, Discrimination, *The Lonely Londoners, Wide Sargasso Sea*

Introduction

When writing a novel that aims to reflect multiculturalism, it is crucial to depict a wide variety of cultures, traditions, and values within the narrative. One of the most important things that must be done to achieve this goal is to ensure that characters coming from various cultural traditions are presented in a manner that is accurate to their experiences rather than one that relies on generalizations or stereotypes. The novel should also investigate cultural conflicts, such as misunderstandings or confrontations arising from cultural differences. This can help readers gain insight into how cultural dimensions shape people's lives and interactions with one another. Thus, examples of cultural conflicts include misunderstandings and confrontations. Hence, celebrating cultural customs and traditions, such as those related to food, dress, music, and language, are also crucial in guiding readers in understanding the wide range of cultural items and comprehending the value of engaging in them. Furthermore, supporting intercultural exchange and interaction by creating flexibility for characters from different cultures to engage with and learn from is a strategy that assists in developing empathy and understanding among diverse cultures.

The literature concerning multiculturalism broadly encompasses themes such as acculturation, alienation, and identity crises, without delving into each topic sequentially or individually. For instance, acculturation occurs when members of society from different cultural backgrounds adapt to and accept aspects of the culture in which they are living. Multiculturalist literature reflects the challenges and complexities of acculturation, such as overcoming the difficulties that arise from attempting to keep one's cultural identity while also integrating into the culture of the dominant society. The sense of feeling alienated or detached from one's own culture or general society because of cultural diversity is referred to as "alienation." Furthermore, multicultural literature addresses this sense of alienation, including feelings of not belonging, exclusion from the dominant culture or society, or rejection by the culture or society. These feelings lead to a sense of alienation and isolation. A person has an identity crisis when they have difficulty developing a sense of who they are. This crisis often manifests as a quest to find this sense of self within their cultural identities. Multicultural literature explores the challenges individuals face when merging different cultural identities and values. It also delves into how these struggles influence an individual's perception of self and their place in society.

Prejudice is the discrimination of individuals or groups based on their cultural background or identity. This can be either intentional or unintentional. Multicultural literature should reflect the experiences of individuals subjected to discrimination and prejudice, as well as the effect these encounters have on the characters' sense of identity and where they belong.

This study delved into the themes of acculturation, alienation, discrimination, and identity crisis within multicultural literature, by examining Sam Selvon's *The Lonely Londoners* (*TLL*) and Jean Rhys's *Wide Sargasso Sea* (*WSS*). These novels skillfully portrayed the trials individuals face when navigating diverse cultural identities, offering keen insight into the multifaceted challenges of multicultural encounters.

Acculturation is a prominent issue in both novels, as the characters manage the complications of living in a new culture while preserving their cultural customs and values. This contrast created a challenging environment for the characters. The concerns and challenges faced by individuals who wish to adapt to a social culture while preserving their own cultural identities were brought to light in Selvon's description of West Indian immigrants living in London in the 1950s, which appears in *TLL*. In addition, Rhys's portrayal of Antoinette Cosway's struggle to reconcile her mixed-race identity with the cultural norms of Jamaica and England in *WSS* highlighted the difficulties of acculturation and how cultural identity could be both a source of conflict and strength. Both novels explored the concept of alienation as a primary focus, as the characters frequently experienced feelings of alienation from their own cultural backgrounds and mainstream culture due to the cultural differences between the two. Selvon's portrayal of Moses in *TLL* emphasized the isolation and alienation immigrants felt in London. Many immigrants felt like outsiders not only in their native country but also in the place they chose to make their new home. This was Antoinette's experience in *WSS* when she felt split between two cultures and not belonging to either of them exemplifies the sense of alienation that results from her challenges with cultural identity.

Multiple cultural identities caused the characters in both novels to struggle to determine who they were, which brings up another key theme: identity crisis. Selvon's character Galahad in *TLL* struggled to reconcile the demands of his West Indian culture with the opportunities and difficulties of living in London. Selvon's portrayal of Galahad brings attention to this struggle. Antoinette's struggle in *WSS* to embrace her mixed-race identity with the cultural norms of both Jamaica and England emphasized the

challenges of identity in the face of conflicting cultural expectations. The character Antoinette is ethnically mixed, of Jamaican and English descent. As a result of their cultural identities, the protagonists in both novels were subjected to prejudice and discrimination, not just from their communities but also from mainstream society. This made the theme of discrimination a prominent focus in both novels. The complexities of navigating a society that favors the dominant culture are vividly depicted in *TLL* by Selvon. The narrative keenly portrays the prejudice and discrimination that immigrants in London encounter. In *WSS* Antoinette experienced discrimination by the black and white communities in Jamaica which exemplifies how cultural identity is used to exclude and alienate individuals.

In conclusion, this study establishes a robust foundation for examining the multicultural narratives presented in *TLL* by Sam Selvon and *WSS* by Jean Rhys. Our analysis delves deeply into the central themes such as acculturation, alienation, and identity crises, and we acknowledge that the breadth of our multicultural approach imposes certain limitations on the depth of analysis. Nevertheless, we have carefully selected compelling narrative samples from both works to highlight a rich and nuanced exploration of these themes in the context of multicultural literature.

Literature Review

The intricate dynamics of multiculturalism and its tangible impact on an individual and a community are poignantly portrayed in the novels *TLL* and *WSS*. These novels, situated within diverse cultural contexts, offer rich grounds to explore themes such as identity crisis, acculturation, and the clash of cultural paradigms. A critical examination of multiculturalism in these narratives not only highlights the personal experiences of the characters but also casts light on larger societal trends and paradigms. Through a comparative analysis, this study sought to gain insights into the multifaceted and complex interplays of multiculturalism as depicted in these literary works. In order to provide a sound theoretical basis for an analysis, the researchers delved into various scholarly literature discourses that framed multicultural narratives and dynamics within a broader socio-psychological and philosophical context.

The concept of multiculturalism, complex and multi-faceted, has been the focal point of many scholarly analyses. Berry (1997) explored the nuanced processes of immigration, acculturation, and adaptation which offered an analytical lens through

which the character dynamics in *TLL* and *WSS* could be scrutinized. In Berry's theories, the characters' journeys were seen as attempts to negotiate and adapt to the diverse cultural spaces they inhabited. Understanding the shifts and transformations in multicultural discourses is vital. Gozdecka, Ercan, and Kmak (2014) delineated the trends and paradoxes moving from multiculturalism to post-multiculturalism, offering a critical framework that was employed to analyze the changing cultural dynamics portrayed in both novels, particularly focusing on the nuances of the characters' identity crisis as depicted. Scholarly discourse on multiculturalism is rich and varied. Bhabha (2003) presented a compelling analysis of post-colonial narratives, which are instrumental in understanding the underlying power dynamics and cultural negotiations portrayed in *WSS*. In a similar vein, studies like those by Şenduran (2021) and Şentürk (2020) delved deeply into the multicultural aspects of these novels, providing specific insights into the cultural dialogues and conflicts presented in them.

Analyzing the psychological underpinnings of multicultural experiences is equally significant. Works by Dovidio et al. (2010) and Schwartz et al. (2010) dissected the roles of prejudice, stereotyping, and discrimination in multicultural settings, offering a lens to analyze the complex interpersonal dynamics and internal conflicts that characters in both novels experienced. The discussion of acculturation measurement by Kim & Abreu (2001) presented pathways to understanding the acculturative processes that the characters underwent, like Antoinette's strive for assimilation in *WSS*. Furthermore, *the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (2020) offered a comprehensive understanding of the philosophy underlying multiculturalism, which provided a foundational backbone to any discussion pertaining to multicultural narratives. This resource, along with a meticulous analysis of Jean Rhys's work by Savory (2009), formed a robust scaffold to construct a nuanced literary analysis that intersected with multicultural theories. In synthesizing these resources, this literature review crafted a nuanced and holistic analysis of multicultural dynamics in *TLL* and *WSS*, bridging literary insights with scholarly discourse in the field of multicultural studies.

Theoretical Framework

Although multicultural demands entail a wide range of assertions about religion, language, ethnicity, nationality, and race, proponents of multiculturalism assume that "culture" and "cultural groups" should be acknowledged and accommodated. These categories are combined with or equated with the idea of acculturation due to the

fluidity and flexibility of the definition of culture. Differentiating and identifying different kinds of claims was crucial for better understanding the challenges at hand (Song, 2009, p. 177). Language and religious beliefs are commonly highlighted by marginalized groups in their appeals for enhanced cultural awareness. Minority groups consistently demand the freedom for self-government. Discussions of multiculturalism minimize the importance of race. While both antiracism and multiculturalism concentrate on the experiences of marginalization and opposition, antiracism places a greater emphasis on these aspects. In contrast, multiculturalism emphasizes success, a rich cultural life, and creative expression (Blum, 1992, p. 14).

The concept of multiculturalism is interpreted from multiple perspectives, highlighting its complex and multifaceted nature. Meer and Modood (2016) argued that many interpretations of "multiculturalism" contributed to further societal divides and deepened existing divisions. These interpretations varied, with some positing that it fostered moral hesitancy among the indigenous community, while others believed it detracted from addressing socioeconomic imbalances (Meer and Modood, 2016, p. 5). In this study, we navigated these complex discussions, focusing specifically on how these dynamics are represented and addressed in *TLL* and *WSS*, providing a nuanced exploration of multiculturalism in literary works.

Selvon's *TLL* and Rhys's *WSS* are analyzed from the perspective of multiculturalism since they both deal with the difficulties multiethnic communities have in establishing a sense of identity. In countries like England, Jamaica, and the West Indies, minorities that fail to assimilate and comprehend the values of their host society are more likely to resist and oppose those values than adapt to them. *TLL* depicts the conflict of ideals surrounding freedom and diversity problems in England. The narratives of Moses and other characters are influenced by the author's experiences of alienation and persecution as immigrants in England. While *WSS* used various perspectives presented by more than one narrator, including Antoinette and Rochester, to illuminate the complexities of culture. These complexities are based on various experiences and perspectives embodied by the characters of the novel. It is important to state that the multi-faceted problems of versatile multiculturalism depicted in these works cannot be simplified in bilateral categories such as "high class" vs "low class" or "rational" vs "irrational."

This is particularly evident in the interactions between Rochester and Antoinette in *WSS*. In a contemporary context, modernization, with an emphasis on individual

freedom and the influence of globalization, encouraged the unification of cultural boundaries. This phenomenon, in both novels, allowed central figures such as Antoinette and Rochester to achieve wider world views, facilitating encounters between the groups. However, this worsened feelings of alienation, identity crisis and rootlessness.

Methodology

This article argues that *TLL* and *WSS* presented distinct fictional worlds that depicted the transformation of relationships among culturally diverse individuals and groups as they underwent acculturation. Both novels include characters who decide to move to another country to try to better their lives through economic independence and individual freedoms. Acculturation, whether in England or the Caribbean, is crucial to prevent discrimination among people because of the prejudices against those facing identity crises. This contention is made both in England and in the Caribbean. Because of this, completely integrating into the host culture depends on one's ability to adapt to that culture. This study also addressed how efficient the procedures for acculturation were in promoting equality within the fictional worlds of these two novels.

Furthermore, this study centextualizes these themes within the framework of the novels. In the books, feelings of alienation and inequality experienced by individuals and groups are intricately intertwined with their socioeconomic conditions. The protagonists in *TLL* and Antoinette in *WSS* undergo profound transformations in their ethical perspectives. They grapple with regret over their choices, experience alienation from their respective cultures, wrestle with identity issues, and sense a disconnection from their roots. This study examines the role of acculturation and discrimination in shaping the portrayal of multiculturalism within the narratives of *TLL* and *WSS*.

Comparative Analysis of *TLL* and *WSS* within the context of Multiculturalism

This study looks at the various individuals and groups in *TLL* and the interconnection between Antoinette and other characters in *WSS* through the perspective of acculturation, alienation, identity crisis, and discrimination from a multicultural point of view. The characters in Selvon's and Rhys's novels grapple with the complexities of their mixed cultural identities, which subsequently lead to a profound sense of disconnection. Antoinette, as a white Creole woman, confronts enslavement and discrimination from

both the white and Black communities in Jamaica. This experience constituted a critical aspect of her challenge in assimilating into the dominant culture, which resulted in her tragic decline. The impact of Antoinette's hybrid Creole identity and her experiences of racial rejection from Black society in post-Emancipation Jamaica on her identity and the discrimination she encountered were analyzed.

At the novel's onset, Selvon depicted London as a lonely and secluded environment by employing specific vocabulary to draw the reader's attention. For instance, he used "One grim winter evening" to set the narrative's tone. Furthermore, he described the city as having an "unrealness" to it, with a fog that appeared to be in a state of unrest, and lights that were visible in an unclear manner, nearly as if the city was not London at all, but rather an unfamiliar location on a different planet (Selvon, 2006, p. 36). London is described in the following passage: "The houses around Harrow Road exhibit signs of age and weathering, with their old and grey exteriors and cracked walls like the final day of Pompeii. Notably, these houses do not have hot water and bath facilities" (Selvon, 2006, p. 73). The cited quotations, including the title *The Lonely Londoners*, suggest that readers are poised to encounter a narrative that portrayed a marginalized immigrant community struggling to reconcile reality with their aspirational desires initially manifested in the story. The narrative unfolds with an introductory sequence where Moses, the central figure, waits at the Waterloo train station, eager to greet a newcomer. A recurring theme in multicultural literature, evidenced here, is the protagonist's limited understanding of the experiences awaiting those who are newly arriving in London. Moses is portrayed as a prophetic figure in the novel, who assisted newly arrived immigrants in their transition to life in London. The narrative suggests that Moses is frequently approached by individuals seeking his guidance and assistance, particularly those from the West Indies. The character is depicted as preoccupied with financial matters, believing that money can resolve problems. This depiction of Moses highlights his role as a supportive and resourceful figure for those navigating the challenges of immigration. Despite expressing discontent with the current circumstances, Moses mitigated his sense of isolation by sustaining regular communication with fellow immigrants and staying informed about events in his country of origin.

Henry Oliver Esquire, Sir Galahad, was the first immigrant. He astonished Moses by presenting summer attire he carried with him. The contradiction of Galahad's experience of warmth in winter and cold in summer is a poignant and astute choice. It served as an image of the cultural disorientation and potential psychological distress commonly experienced by immigrants upon their initial arrival. The character Tolroy's family,

including the elderly Tanty, arrived and declared, "We have all come, Tolroy, as per Ma's request" (Selvon, 2006, p. 29). "Oh God, I am departing for England tomorrow" (Selvon, 2006, p. 29), demonstrated the character Lewis' desire to visit England after learning that the author received a weekly allowance of five pounds.

Selvon portrayed three discrete factions in his novel that embody diverse facets of the immigrant community. The initial cohort encompasses personages such as Tanty and Galahad, who try to navigate cultural customs and personal identity to sustain ties with their ethnic community while simultaneously assimilating into British society. The conduct of this group is visible in different situations throughout the novel. A reporter questioned Tanty about her first day in England to find out if she had previously been there. In response, Tolroy avoided a direct answer and posed a rhetorical question instead, "The gentleman asks me a good question, why I should not answer?" (Selvon, 2006, p. 31). Tanty was responsible for persuading shopkeepers to extend credit to customers, and she adeptly brought her cultural traditions to England. She asserted her authority by informing bakery staff that they were not providing bread in the manner she was accustomed to back home. "Kindly package it in a paper bag for me, please." (Selvon, 2006, p. 78-80). The statement posits that specific immigrant groups maintained their customs while concurrently seeking to assimilate into the dominant culture.

Another group of characters is introduced through the character known as Big City, who protested discriminatory comments made by white individuals, such as: "keep the Water White" (Selvon, 2006, p. 89). Big City represented a faction of immigrants who actively resisted racism in a similar fashion. They echoed the humorous and provocative slogan: "Keep the Water Coloured, No Rooms for Whites,' forming an anti-discourse against racism" (Selvon, 2006, p. 97). Selvon suggested that Caribbean people experienced racial discrimination in numerous ways, both overtly and covertly, which deprived them of fundamental rights such as employment, housing, marriage, and communication. One example is shown in the novel when Galahad was not allowed to communicate with a child because of his skin color, which illustrated the severity of racial discrimination that Black individuals faced in their British homeland:

> Mummy, look at that black man! A little child, holding on to the mother hand, look up at Sir Galahad. 'You mustn't say that, dear!' The mother chide the child. What a sweet child!' Galahad say, putting on the old English accent, 'What's your name? But the child's mother felt uneasy as they stand

up there on the pavement with so many white people around: "if they were alone she might have talked a little, ask Galahad what part of the world he come from, but instead she pull the child along and she look at Galahad and give a sickly sort of simile, and the old Galahad, knowing how it is, smile back and walk on. What it is we want that the white people and they find it so hard to give? (Selvon, 2006, p. 87)

According to Selvon, Galahad was aware that the challenges faced by his community were not due to their behavior or language, but rather due to their skin color. Selvon implied that immigrants try to assimilate into society by changing aspects of themselves, but they cannot change the color of their skin.

In *TLL*, certain Black characters felt a sense of resentment towards racist white individuals due to their exclusion from mainstream society. The male characters experienced a sense of ease and relative equality when they dated white women, as this provided an opportunity to feel accepted by a member of the white community, far from the racial discrimination they typically experienced, as seen in the following quotation:

that evening people in the tube station must be bawl to see black man so familiar with white girl [...] Galahad feeling good with this piece of skin walking with him." [...] By loving me (the white woman) proves that I am worthy of white love. I am loved like a white man. I am a white man. Her love takes me onto noble road that leads to total realization. I marry white culture, white beauty, white whiteness. When my restless hands caress those white breasts, they grasp white civilization and dignity and make them mine. (Selvon, 2006, pp. 29, 30, 31)

The last part of the quotation implies that being in a relationship with a white woman gave a sense of triumph and possession to the Black man. Selvon vividly portrayed scenarios where Black men engaged in relationships with white women. He emphasized the compassion these women showed towards the Black community. These compassionate figures include the English girl that Bart intended to marry, her understanding mother, and the mother of the child with whom Galahad sought to form a connection.

In Jean Rhys's novel, the protagonist, Antoinette, grappled with the complex and harrowing intersection of race, history, and identity in 19th century Jamaica. Antoinette

encountered challenges throughout the novel due to her racial and social background. She was marginalized and expelled from Jamaican society. Despite self-identifying as a Creole, a cultural integration of African, European, and Caribbean influences, she experienced a lack of acceptance from both the black and white communities. The historical milieu of Jamaica influenced Antoinette's experiences in the 19th century. The elimination of slavery brought about new power dynamics and tensions between former slaves and their enslavers. During these changes, Antoinette's family found themselves navigating through a chaotic period, struggling to adapt to the evolving social and economic landscape in Jamaica. Antoinette's challenges are interrelated with her parental psychological affliction and distressed background. Annette, Antoinette's mother, endured a history of colonial violence and abuse. This past left her grappling with deep emotional trauma and instability. The distressing memories of Annette's upbringing continued to haunt both her and Antoinette. Consequently, they both face ongoing struggles with their identities and a diminished sense of belonging. In Jean Rhys's novel, the character of Antoinette reflected the themes of slavery, gender dynamics, mental health issues, and racial tension as she lived her life in Jamaica. This vivid portrayal revealed her struggles with an identity crisis, which was a direct result of her complex position within the societal and cultural hierarchies of that time.

Inside Jamaica's complex racial landscape, the novel scrutinized the shifting dynamics and perspectives surrounding identity and socioeconomic status, as encapsulated by the derogatory term "white nigger." Black individuals referred to Antoinette as a "white cockroach," while British colonizers perceived her as a "white nigger." The protagonist, Antoinette, identified herself with the expression, "That is me," as conveyed through her voice. "Separately, it has come to my attention that some English women refer to us as "white nigger" (Rhys, 2001, p. 93). The phrase "pre-colonial Africans" was often used to describe individuals who resided in Africa before being enslaved by slave traders. The author reflected on identity, national affiliation, sense of belonging, and existential purpose. The author noted a significant presence of white individuals in Jamaica. People who identified as Caucasian and held a high socioeconomic status were often perceived to have substantial financial assets, potentially in the form of monetary reserves. Despite this apparent wealth, these individuals seemed not to acknowledge or notice the presence, attitudes, or behaviors toward Black people. The statement under discussion hints at a significant shift in societal perspectives. It suggests that the status historically ascribed to individuals of Caucasian descent has now become comparable to that of individuals

of African descent who were historically referred to as "niggers." This argument extends further to imply a potential reversal of established social hierarchies, with individuals of African descent now being perceived as superior to those Caucasians classified as "niggers" (Rhys, 2001, p. 22). The lines above brought to attention the persistent problem of economic and racial disparity in Jamaica. The depiction of white individuals in the novel as possessing "gold money" implied that they belonged to a privileged social stratum with access to abundant resources and influence, in contrast to the African American community, which lacked such advantages. This affirms that economic disparity constituted a concern in 19ᵗʰ century Jamaica and the allocation of riches was frequently disproportionate across racial boundaries. Furthermore, the assertion that the phrase "white nigger" could be regarded as a problematic oversimplification of the complex dynamics of race relations in Jamaica. The expression in question was traditionally used to denigrate individuals of African descent.

The negative language once used to insult individuals of African descent was now being aimed at those of Caucasian descent, which illustrated a concerning shift in racial dialogue; within this context, the novel examined the impact on the character of Mrs. Cosway, who found herself caught in the crosshairs of these evolving stereotypes. This development, despite its growing prevalence, threatened to perpetuate harmful racial stereotypes and fuel interpersonal conflicts. The author, Jean Rhys, ventured into an analytical exploration of topics such as alienation, cultural identity, and liminality. A focal point of this investigation was the character of Mrs. Cosway, a young woman perceived as having minimal societal value. She was depicted as indulgent and devoid of independence, characteristics believed to be widespread among individuals of European descent born in the Caribbean, and allegedly predisposed to insanity. Foreseeing the manifestation of this presumed inherent insanity, Mrs. Cosway opted for isolation, exhibiting reserved behavior, and abstaining from engaging in conversations, as corroborated by numerous accounts (Rhys, 2001, p. 57).

Antoinette's attempt to fit in with her local community was vividly portrayed through her symbolic clothing exchange with her friend Tia. Antoinette tried to overcome her status as a marginalized individual, striving to find a place in society where she could gain full acceptance from her peers. The struggle highlights the protagonist's efforts to assimilate into the cultural norms of the Black Caribbean population, exemplified through her relationship with Tia, a close childhood friend of Antoinette. One of the events in the novel involved Tia purloining Antoinette's clothes and their connection

to a swimming activity in a nearby lake. Tia discarded her tattered, soiled, worn-out dress in exchange for Antoinette's garments. According to Mary Lou Emery (1990), when Antoinette wore Tia's dress, she assumed the role as Tia's double, symbolically embodying Tia's identity (Rhys, 2001, pp. 52–53). The dress stood as a symbol of Antoinette's hidden longing to emulate Tia or embrace a Black identity. This representation aligned with Sue Thomas's concept of "cultural cross-dressing" in literature, a phrase denoting a conscious effort to navigate beyond the established boundaries of diversity (Thomas, 1994, p. 53). Wearing attire belonging to a different person could potentially facilitate detachment from one's cultural background. Antoinette's aspiration to imitate Tia and adopt her traditions through the act of "re-dressing" is interpreted as an endeavor to liberate herself from her wretched state of discrimination, which is attributable to the lack of a distinct identity. Antoinette's aspiration remained unfulfilled upon her return home. She met the disapproving gazes of English visitors in her abode, and her attire became damaged. Antoinette's current persona was no longer congruent with this revised sense of self. Antoinette faced a wardrobe predicament when her initial attire was purloined, and her replacement clothes were dirty and torn. According to Kadhim (2011), Antoinette struggled to find her ideal identity, which extended to her inability to conform to Caribbean culture (p. 592).

The occurrence of violence between Antoinette and Tia disrupted the notion of likeness between the two females. It emphasized the racial and cultural disparities that separated them. The symbol of Tia as a young Black girl exacerbates Antoinette's sense of being an outsider, and her affiliation with Jamaica further disintegrates as Tia hurls a stone at her. This symbolic shattering of the "looking glass" implies that Antoinette's endeavor to comprehend her identity through the mirror are futile. This character is required to explore alternative methods to resolve the discordant aspects of her identity and attain a deeper understanding of being. Antoinette acknowledges the presence of racial divisions between herself and Tia. Antoinette's racial identity as white positions her as a representative of the British colonizer.

Tia's racial identity as Black positions her as a representative of the colonized. Antoinette acquires this perception through her engagements with Tia. She comprehends that she is fundamentally in conflict with the Black community of Jamaica. The subject acknowledged the futility of aspiring to integrate herself with the Black Jamaican community. These conflicted feelings of hate and envy toward people of African descent make Antoinette's desire to integrate into the Black community more difficult. These conflicting sentiments

worsen her challenge in accepting her sense of self. Antoinette expressed her ambivalent feelings towards Tia: "Tia always had fires kindled for her, the jagged rock did not inflict any pain on her feet, and I never witnessed her shedding tears" (Rhys, 2001, p. 20). Furthermore, Antoinette utters, "Keep them then, you cheating nigger". In the novel *WSS,* Tia exhibited a strong sense of self-identity as a Jamaican of Black descent.

In the novel, *WSS*, themes of identity, belonging, and colonialism are explored. Antoinette's complex emotions towards Tia further estrange her from the Black community and reinforce the racial schism that separated her from them. Antoinette's complex dynamic with Christophine, her mother's African servant and confidant, demonstrated her ambivalent sentiments towards individuals of African descent. Following Antoinette's mother's rejection, Christophine assumed the role of Antoinette's exclusive provider of comfort and maternal affection. According to Drake (1999), Christophine served as a model for Antoinette, demonstrating qualities of female autonomy and confidence (p.195). Antoinette's perception of Christophine as a positive influence underwent a gradual transformation as she began questioning Christophine's ability to provide sound advice. Christophine's uncertainty about the existence of England served as evidence of Antoinette's perceived ignorance and stubbornness. Antoinette perceived her as an perceived her as an "ignorant, obstinate old negro woman, who is not certain if there is such a place as England" and a "damned black devil from Hell" (Rhys, 2001, p. 122) who unlike "other negro woman wore black or tied her handkerchief Martinique fashion" (Rhys, 2001, p. 18-19). This progression in Antoinette's perspective is a poignant reflection of the deeply ingrained prejudices and the complex interplay of identity and colonial legacy that pervaded the societal fabric depicted in the novel.

Antoinette's initial fascination with England was swiftly replaced by disappointment upon her arrival at Thornfield Hall. She was incredulous that this was the England she romanticized about and wondered if she had been transported to a different place entirely. She expressed her alienation and isolation with these quotations: "they tell me I am in England, but I don't believe them. We lost our way to England. When? Where? I don't remember, but we lost it" (Rhys, 2001, p. 162). Antoinette's idealized vision of England as a picturesque and appealing place was shattered when she was confronted with the reality of her surroundings. Antoinette quickly realized that England was in fact: "a cardboard world where everything is colored brown or dark red or yellow that has no light in it" (Rhys, 2001, p. 162). Antoinette's perspective changed as she recognizes

that her previous idealized image of England was no longer relevant, and she felt disconnected from it. Instead, she feels a stronger connection to her own island and its native people, despite the challenges she faced in her relationships with them. She perceives both England and her husband as unfeeling and uncomprehending.

In the novel, *WSS*, Antoinette's union with Edward Rochester signified her attempt to integrate into white society. This marriage influenced her to embody the characteristics linked with English women, including a heightened dependency on her spouse. This attempt at integration fostered a resilience to tolerate her husband's unfaithfulness. Despite being aware of his indiscretions, Antoinette chose to downplay the severity of his actions, steadfast in her decision to remain with him. This mindset was vividly captured in her resigned declaration: "But I cannot go. He is my husband after all" (Rhys, 2001, p. 99). Antoinette and Rochester did not initially intend to marry each other. However, they both perceived the potential benefits that such a union could offer. This matrimonial agreement was orchestrated by Antoinette's stepfather, Mr. Mason. He harbored aspirations of her marrying an Englishman, viewing it as a strategic move to ensure her future stability and facilitate her assimilation into English society. Additionally, the marriage secured the fortune that Mr. Mason planned to leave for her. "That won't be difficult. I want you to be happy, Antoinette, secure, I've tried to arrange, but we'll have time to talk about that later. (Rhys, 2001, p. 54). The marriage between Antoinette and Edward was advantageous for Edward as well, since he was the second son in his family and would not inherit his family's fortune, which would go to his older brother instead. Through this marriage Edward secured a decent fortune. Edward's rejection of Antoinette, a Creole, reflects the European-English society's attitude towards people with Black heritage. He evaluated everyone on the island based on English standards and considered only things and people that were English to be valuable. As a result, he did not view Antoinette (or anyone on the island) as truly English and said,

> I watched her critically. She wore a tricorne hat which became her. At least it shadowed her eyes which are too large and can be disconcerting. She never blinks at all it seems to me. Long, sad, dark alien eyes. Creole of pure English descent she may be, but they are not English or European either. And when did I notice all this about my wife Antoinette? After we left Spanish Town, I suppose. Or did I notice it before and refuse to admit what I saw? (Rhys, 2001, p. 61)

In the novel, *WSS*, Antoinette found herself rejected by the Black community on the island, prompting her to look for a new beginning in England. Holding onto the belief that England was the "mother country" of colonial settlers, she hoped that marrying an Englishman, like Edward Rochester, would allow her to assimilate into English society and establish a unique identity for herself. Her admiration for England was clear from the beginning of the novel, where we learned that her favorite image is associated with England;

> So I looked away from her at my favourite picture, 'The Miller's Daughter,' a lovely English girl with brown curls and blue eyes and a dress slipping off her shoulders. Then I looked across the white tablecloth and the vase of yellow roses at Mr. Mason, so sure of himself, so without a doubt English. And at my mother, so without a doubt not English, but no white nigger either. Not my mother. Never had been. Never could be. (Rhys, 2001, p. 32)

Antoinette's intense desire to assimilate into English culture was hampered by her fear and the uncertainty of this inhospitable place, which is reinforced by her English husband's attitude. The rejection Antoinette and her husband experienced from both their communities create a deep sense of alienation, which gradually undermined the marital relationship. This isolation compelled them to grapple with their dual white and black identities. However, Rochester manages to maintain a semblance of stability, largely because he had the opportunity to form his ethnic identity more firmly in England. Antoinette lacked a defined ethnic identity, so she succumbs to this feeling of isolation, and gradually descends into madness. The impact of alienation, identity crisis, and discrimination was evident in the deterioration of Antoinette's mind and her marriage with Rochester.

In contrast to *WSS* the British working class, in the *TLL* novel, were against Caribbean immigration to England. They believed that the opportunities in Britain were already limited and insufficient for the current population, which is why they resisted the influx of immigrants from the Caribbean.

> You are unwanted. You are here because some higher order officials let you stay, not because I want you… You only create problems. You want my job, you want my food, you want to live in my home, you want to use my school, my hospital, my stores. But don't take it personally; I have no quarrel with you as a person. It is immigration I cannot tolerate. (Selvon, 2006, p. 181)

This experience of unemployment for immigrants led to a sense of alienation for the characters in *TLL*, and some resorted to catching pigeons to survive. As one of the characters, Galahad, realized that British people do not value and protect the Black immigrant community as much as they do animals he draws a comparison;

> Him that he had was to try and catch a pigeon in the park to eat. It does have a lot them flying about, and the people does feed them with bits of bread. Sometimes they get so much bread that they pick and choosing, and Galahad watching with envy. In this country, people prefer to see man starve than a cat or dog want something to eat. (Selvon, 2006, p. 123)

This depicted scene was ironic because Galahad, who learned the rule of "survival of the fittest" from the British, ended up eating pigeons to survive like another character Cap. This rule also reflected the racial discrimination that the white working class showed towards Caribbean immigrants because they were afraid of losing their jobs to the newcomers who are willing to work for less. This discrimination led to feelings of inferiority and guilt among the characters.

Samuel Selvon vividly portrayed the experiences of the Black community in the United Kingdom, highlighting their resilience and adaptation efforts in an unfamiliar environment. The book chronicled the lives of the Caribbean characters, each representing different dimensions of acculturation, serving as a historical snapshot of migration from the former English colonies. Skillfully utilizing the West Indian dialect, Selvon encapsulated the sense of isolation and the challenges of integration and discrimination encountered by the immigrant population. The use of third-person singular verbs, particularly among Caribbean speakers, created a sense of community solidarity, which suggested that individual actions resonated as a representation of the collective community experience. This is further echoed in contrasting quotes within the narrative, such as "England is a bitch; there is no escaping it," and Lord Kitcher's optimistic proclamation, "London is the place for me" (Selvon, 2006, p. 34), offering a nuanced perspective on their complex emotions toward their new home in Britain. This novel reflected a shift in black British literary and artistic productions from a focus on asserting individual identity to a more collective identity. This change suggested how the British identity was being discussed or redefined in the context of multiculturalism.

Conclusion

These two novels demonstrate that societies, whether culturally homogenous or heterogeneous, cannot completely integrate with the dominant culture because of discriminatory attitudes and behaviors. Incorporating literature is widely regarded as an essential means for facilitating cultural assimilation. Multiculturalism is perceived as a limitation owing to the insufficient intercultural dialogue, integration, and critical analysis of novels from diverse backgrounds. This impedes the process of eradicating cultural distinctions within societies. The shifts in a characters' behavior and perspective stem from their inherited traits, prompting them to challenge the traditions that perpetuate these prejudices. The characters in *TLL* demonstrated a greater degree of dedication towards achieving equality and individuality as compared to Antoinette in *WSS*. Antoinette's attempts to assimilate were met with barriers from both ex-slaves and white English women. This resulted in her exhibiting less open-mindedness and rational thinking when compared to characters in *TLL*. Furthermore, Antoinette's historical background as the daughter of slave owners potentially restricts her ability to transcend her lived experiences and embrace a broader view of reality. In short, a linguistic disparity was observed between the two novels. The use of humor by Selvon in *TLL* from the perspective of liberal humanism established a connection between the characters. Rhys's harsh and resentful tone in *WSS* highlighted the dehumanization of Antoinette through a signification system that lacked meaning. Overall, the characters portrayed in *TLL* exhibit a heightened dedication to the host society's culture and a greater inclination towards social integration than those depicted in *WSS*. Antoinette's restricted exposure to literature interfered with her ability to integrate into the dominant culture, resulting in her husband's discrimination against her. The protagonists in both novels encountered challenges in adapting to a multicultural environment, adhering to their customary lifestyles, and exhibiting resistance towards one another. These situations posed an obstacle in acquiring cultural knowledge and hindered the development of a genuinely diverse community. The effectiveness of multiculturalism is contingent upon acculturation and the capacity to acquire knowledge from various groups. Furthermore, the field of literature has a crucial function in promoting comprehension and admiration within ethnically diverse societies.

TLL by Selvon depicted the challenges faced by West Indian immigrants in London after World War II as they endeavored to adapt to an entirely foreign culture while preserving their distinct cultural heritage. The protagonists depicted in the novel

felt estrangement and displacement as they faced the uncertainty between their previous life and the contemporary one in London. The protagonist, Moses, experienced a feeling of displacement as he tries to reconcile his Jamaican cultural identity with his existence in London. Likewise, Galahad, a character of interest, encountered prejudice and exclusion as a Black immigrant residing within a white society. Jean Rhys' novel, *WSS*, delved into the complex experiences of Antoinette Cosway, a Creole woman hailing from Jamaica who grappled with issues of identity and cultural dissonance while attempting to assimilate into English society. The novel depicts how Antoinette was subjected to discrimination and exclusion from the dominant social order because of her distinctive racial and cultural heritage. Antoinette's struggle with sense of self worsens under the dual pressures of conforming to the cultural norms of her Creole ancestry and the societal expectations of English culture.

The two novels also pointed out the effects of prejudice on a protagonists' existence. *TLL* by Selvon portrayed Black immigrants' discriminatory and suppressive experiences in post-world war London. The characters frequently experience derogatory remarks and preconceived notions based on their race, intensifying their isolation and detachment. Jean Rhys' novel, *WSS*, delved into the various forms of prejudice and discrimination experienced by Antoinette due to her racial and cultural heritage, emphasizing her exclusion from dominant societal norms. The analyzed novels underscore the importance of promoting empathy, understanding, and respect for cultural diversity. They also emphasize the need to address cultural biases and preconceived notions. This body of work illuminates the impacts of multiculturalism on individuals, spotlighting the trials that marginalized communities encounter while adapting to new environments. Consequently, a close examination of multicultural elements in literature can significantly foster social justice and equality by amplifying the voices of minority groups and challenging dominant cultural narratives. Therefore, it is vital to further explore multiculturalism in literary contexts to develop a more expansive understanding of the global community.

Both *TLL* by Sam Selvon and *WSS* by Jean Rhys are novels that, despite being written in a very distinct manner and set in vastly different times and places, share certain parallels. According to the findings of the study, the first similarity between the two novels is that they both investigate the lives of protagonists who are socially excluded and alienated from their own culture. While *TLL* examined the lives of West Indian immigrants living in London who were struggling to adapt to a new cultural environment,

WSS focused on the story of Antoinette, a Creole woman rejected by the society of Jamaica because she is of mixed ethnicity. *WSS* used a variety of narrators and points of view to investigate the complex relationship between identity, colonization, and power. On the other hand, *TLL* used a revolving narrator that spoke a combination English and Creole to depict the experiences of a variety of characters and their struggles with displacement.

To sum up, regarding multiculturalism, both *WSS* and *TLL* share similarities in examining alienation and displacement, using narrative structures, and critically analyzing dominant cultural narratives. Because of these similarities, both novels are significant works of literature that encourage readers to critically evaluate their preconceptions and prejudices about identity, culture, and power within their own lives.

References

Berry, J. W. (1997). Immigration, acculturation and adaptation. *Applied Psychology, 46*(1), pp. 5-34.

Bhabha, H. K. (2003). Signs taken for Wonders. B. Ashcroft, & G. Griffiths, *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader* , pp. 29-35. London and New York: Routledge.

Blum, L. A. (1992). *Antiracism, Multiculturalism, and Interracial Community: Three Educational Values for a Multicultural Society.* Boston: University of Massachusetts.

Deepa, H. & Tyagi, P. (2021). Identity Crisis in Kazuo Ishiguro's Never Let Me Go. *The Creative Launcher, 6*(4), pp. 193-197. doi:10.53032/tcl.2021.6.4.29

Dovidio, J. F., Hewstone, M., Glick, P., & Esses, V. M. (2010). Prejudice, stereotyping, and discrimination: Theoretical and empirical overview. J. F. Dovidio, M. Hewstone, P. Glick, & V. M. Esses (Dü) (Eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Prejudice, Stereotyping and Discrimination*, pp. 3-28. SAGE Publications.

Drake, S. (1999). Race and Caribbean Culture as Thematics of Liberation in Jean Rhys' *Wide Sargasso Sea*. J. L. Raiskin, *A Norton Critical Edition: WSS* (pp. 193-206). Norton.

Gozdecka, D. A., Ercan, S. A., & Kmak, M. (2014). From multiculturalism to post-multiculturalism: Trends and paradoxes. *Journal of Sociology, 50*(1), pp. 51-64. doi:10.1177/1440783314522191

Kadhim, N. J. (2011). Double exile: Jean Rhys's *Wide Sargasso Sea*. *Journal of College Of Education for Women, 22*(3), pp. 589-605.

Kim, B. S., & Abreu, J. M. (2001). Acculturation measurement: Theory, current instruments, and future directions. J. G. Ponterotto, J. M. Casas, L. A. Suzuki, & C. M. Alexander, *Handbook of multicultural counseling,* pp. 394-424. SAGE Publications.

Meer, N., & Modood, T. (2016). Interculturalism, Multiculturalism and Citizenship. N. Meer, T. Modood, & R. Zapata-Barrero, *Multiculturalism and Interculturalism: Debating the Dividing Lines*, pp. 27-52. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Miller, A. M., Sorokin, O., Wang, E., Feetham, S., Choi, M., & Wilbur, J. (2006). Acculturation, social alienation, and depressed mood in midlife women from the former soviet union. *Research in Nursing & Health, 29*(2), pp. 134-146. doi:10.1002/nur.20125

Modood, T. (2013). *Multiculturalism: A civic idea.* Cambridge: Polity.

Nortio, E., Niska, M., Renvik, T. A., & Jasinskaja-Lahti, I. (2020). 'The nightmare of multiculturalism': Interpreting and deploying anti-immigration rhetoric in social media. *News&Media, 23*(3), pp. 438-456. doi:10.1177/1461444819899624

Rhys, J. (2001). *Wide Sargasso Sea.* Penguin Books.

Savory, E. (2009). *Jean Rhys.* Cambridge: Cambridge Universtiy Press.

Schwartz, S. J., Unger, J. B., Zamboanga, B. L., & Szapocznik, J. (2010). Rethinking the concept of acculturation: Implications for theory and research. *American Psychologist, 65*(4), pp. 237-251. doi:10.1037/a0019330

Selvon, S. (2006). *The Lonely Londoners.* Penguin Books.

Song, S. (2009). The Subject of Multiculturalism: Culture, Religion, Language, Ethnicity, Nationality, and Race? B. De Bruin, & C. Zurn, *New Waves in Political Philosophy*, pp. 177-197. New York: Palgrave MacMillan.

----. (2020). Multiculturalism. In E. N. Zalta (Ed.). *The Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy*. Retrieved from: https://plato.stanford.edu: https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/multiculturalism/

Retrieved from: https://plato.stanford.edu: https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/multiculturalism/

Şenduran, E. D. (2021). Multiculturalism in Jean Rhys's *WSS* and E. M. Forster's Where Angels Fear to Tread. *OGU Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 22*(1), pp. 11-30. doi:10.17494/ogusbd.

Şentürk, S. (2020). The Representation Of Caribbean Immigration In Samuel Selvon's *The Lonely Londoners* (1956). *SDU Faculty of Arts and Sciences Journal of Social Sciences*(50), pp. 125-130.

Thomas, S. (1994). Difference, Intersubjectivity, and Agency in the Colonial and Decolonizing Spaces of Hélène Cixous's "Sorties". *Hypatia, 1*, pp. 53-69. doi:10.1111/j.1527-2001.1994.tb00109.x

Liquid Friendship in Brian Lobel's *Purge*

Mehmet ÜNAL[1] (ID)

[1]Research Assistant, Atatürk University, School of Foreign Languages, Department of English Translation and Interpretation, Erzurum, Turkiye

ORCID: M.Ü. 0000-0002-6857-2940

Corresponding author:
Mehmet ÜNAL,
Atatürk University, School of Foreign Languages, Department of English Translation and Interpretation, Erzurum, Turkiye
E-mail: mehmet.unal@atauni.edu.tr

ABSTRACT
The advent of technological advancements in contemporary society has had a profound impact on our lives by greatly facilitating various aspects of human life from communication to transportation and changing not only the media people utilize in their everyday lives but also their traditions, values, and relationships. Thus, these changes have sparked debate regarding the overall positive or negative implications of these developments as the dynamic nature of all kinds of human relationships in modern times varying from everyday relationships of friendships, partnerships and sexual encounters to kinship and family has increasingly begun to be characterized by transience, fragility, ambivalence and rapid change. These characteristics are attributed to the impact of modern technological advancements, namely the proliferation of social media applications. The purpose of this study is to examine how social media applications shape relationships today with a specific focus on Brian Lobel's *Purge* (2011) in light of Zygmunt Bauman's ideas of liquid modernity. Since Brian Lobel's *Purge* (2011) is a play about making the decision to end or maintain friendship through social media applications, it provides us with pertinent examples for scrutinizing the themes of transience, fragility, vulnerability and ambivalence that have become the hallmarks of the modern relationships in the age of liquid modernity.
Keywords: Social Media, Brian Lobel, Liquid Modernity, Zygmunt Bauman, Media Effects

Introduction

Internet and social media have become a ubiquitous presence in this age of technology and convenience. Especially during the COVID-19 pandemic, everything from work and education to social life has necessarily been carried on through the internet and social media. Even before the pandemic, the omnipresence of such technologies had already become difficult to ignore, so much so that it has rendered necessary for writers and artists to begin seriously considering their significance in terms of the effects they have over human relationships. As a natural result of the developments in virtual connectivity, human interactions have eventually taken on a new form defined by frequency, shallowness and transience. Due to the extensive global networks facilitated by social media applications, individuals are swiftly and

effortlessly able to establish new interpersonal connections like friendships and start new relationships (Ellison et al., 2011, p. 138). Unlike virtual ones, real relationships and friendships necessitate considerable investment of time and effort to start and maintain. Furthermore, in social media applications, users are allowed to choose friends by just scrolling individuals down, just like choosing a product from a catalogue. It has become possible to make hundreds or even hundreds of thousands of friends in a very short time and with very little effort. The significance of quantity has surpassed that of quality and terminating such a friendship does not present any consequential challenge, as suitable replacements can be readily found. Nowadays, how many friends, followers or subscribers a person has determines their popularity and acceptance in society (Bauman & Donskis, 2013, p. 109) Thus, in this age of internet and social media we live, the notion of friendship has been rendered devoid of its intrinsic meaning and has regrettably been reduced to mere numerical quantification.

Addressing the contemporary need to raise questions about the nature of friendship, New York-born, London-based performance artist Brian Lobel staged an "arts-meets-digital media show" (Leong, 2014) called *Purge*[1] in 2011. In this performance, random people from the audience voted on whether Lobel should keep or delete a Facebook friend based on a one-minute speech he gives about his connection with this Facebook friend. By putting his 1400 friends one by one to the vote of strangers, he has created a work which perfectly reflects and suits the dynamics of modern relationships, inviting thought about how we make friends and sustain friendships as well as what the meaning of the word 'friend' is in the age of technology.

Within this context, this essay discusses the nature of modern relationships, the digital transformation of intimacy and social media usage in Brian Lobel's *Purge.* Zygmunt Bauman's ideas of liquid modernity, particularly those based on the liquidity of modern relationships, which may be defined in terms of ambivalence and rapid change, will be utilized to scrutinize the present situation of modern friendship in *Purge*. Additionally, the motives and goals of social media usage in *Purge* will be examined under one of the media effects theories, 'uses and gratification', which suggests that people use media for their personal needs and purposes as opposed to the widely-accepted theories claiming that media uses and manipulates its audience. The place of social

---

1   Once *Purge* was completed after 9 days of performance over 50 hours, Lobel decided not to repeat the project and retired the project in 2011 by realising that it would be cruel to make his friends experience the same process again. Nevertheless, the project was repeated and recreated with its own ethics and process by different performers in various countries like France, Italy, Switzerland and U.S.A. from 2012 to 2015.

media in the life of Lobel and his friends will also be discussed through the 'dependency' theory. This is another media effects theory based on the thesis that while people utilize media of their own free will for their own needs, they may become totally dependent on it in time and begin to be controlled by the media influence. In addition to these theories, Jean Baudrillard's ideas on 'simulation' and 'simulacrum', identifying the reproduction of the things constituting reality, are also utilized here to examine the relationship between reality, virtuality and friendship in *Purge*.

Purge and Liquid Modernity

Lobel decided to create *Purge* because of some questions surfacing in his mind about his ex-boyfriend Grant. Lobel and Grant lived their relationship through social media and internet until Grant sadly died in 2010. It was only then he realized that "never once did [… Lobel] feel like the body or physical presence was missing—until, of course, he was gone" (Lobel, 2016, p. 15). The implication here is that messages and e-mails actually have the capacity to replace the body or the physical presence, eventually rendering it impossible for him to distinguish the 'real' from the 'digital'. This has indeed become a daily phenomenon for modern people. Since Lobel creates performances about bodies (politicized bodies, marginalized bodies, sick bodies, etc.), the issues that arose about Grant regarding corporeality via internet made him think about "how your body interacts with social media, and how your body relaxes with friends. So [… he has] been very interested in how we look at bodies, and how bodies look back at other people" (Hong, 2016). He then decided to collect in a file all of the messages and e-mails from Grant. During this process, he found out that Grant had unfriended[2] him on Friendster (a pre-Facebook social networking application) – the platform on which they shared their earliest messages, and this incident prompted him to reconsider the very notion of friendship:

> I knew clearly in my heart that we were best friends—but those pixels on the screen said we were not! And that got me thinking about why it is important or not to people. It was also a reflection of going through trauma and finding out who you can rely on, who your friends are, and what the word "friend" really means. (Hong, 2016)

---

2   "The term 'unfriend' was selected as the Oxford Word of the Year in 2009, defined as the action of deleting a person as a 'friend' on a social network site" (Chambers, 2013, p. 6).

Here Lobel questions the real meaning of friendship, the reliability of those whom he calls 'friends' as well as the place social media possesses in his life. This point also seems to mark the beginning of his initial thoughts that led to *Purge*.

Lobel's performances usually combine his private and personal stories with public narratives. So far, he has written mainly about illness, technology, nationalism, economy and sexuality. His 2003 performance piece *BALL* is about his experiences with metastatic testicular cancer, and in *Theatre and Cancer* (2019), which is an academic study, he shares his thoughts about the public perceptions and sensitivities related to cancer through his personal experience with the disease. *Purge* is, likewise, a performance in which Lobel tests the steadiness of his friendships through a public evaluation based on his personal experiences and views on his friends.

Apart from the fact that Lobel decided to create *Purge* in order to question the real meaning of friendship after figuring out Grant had unfriended him on a social media platform, he also enunciates another reason why he decided to create a performance based on social media:

> Perhaps the reason why this story is told via social media is because Grant and I lived our lives and our relationship through social media and internet communication. From our first Friendster messages, to obtaining celebrity gmail accounts for each other […], to constant messaging during the day, to stalking each other (and our current flings/boyfriends/partners), […] electronic communication suited us just fine. (Lobel, 2016, p. 15)

Lobel states that Grant lived in another city but it is not obvious whether it was temporary or permanent. Regardless, it seems that they needed to sustain their relationship and communication through social media and internet for some time due to the physical distance between them at the time. However, when Lobel's statements alongside his collection of Grant's messages and e-mails are taken into account, it can be suggested that he has become dependent on social media and internet as a result of having to use them out of necessity for a while. That means social media has replaced the need itself after a while, which is the main argument of the dependency theory, also known as the 'media system dependency theory' (MSD). First introduced by Sandra J. Ball-Rokeach and Melvin L. DeFleur in 1976, it proposes the idea that while people utilize media since they need it in the first place, in the course of time, they begin to utilize it because they become

dependent on it and begin to be controlled by it. Lobel states that he and Grant 'lived their lives and relationship through social media' and they constantly exchanged messages all day long. He also states that Facebook has become a part of his life (Dawn, 2016). His statements prove that Lobel has become dependent on social media as a result of permanent exposure to media for a long period of time. In this respect, it is not surprising that he decided to create a project closely related to social media as he claims to have practically 'lived through social media'.

Lobel started working on *Purge* by announcing the project to the people in his friend list through Facebook, which resulted in sixty-eight of his friends deleting him within an hour. Though not unexpected, this reaction apparently upset him:

> While I was bruised by the angry comments left on my Facebook Wall— 'Stupid and a waste of time.', 'Who the fuck is this person!'—for me it was worst when people silently deleted me. I took stock of some of the people who deleted me pre-emptively: my mentor, my favorite one-night stand in Chicago, a DJ I loved in Los Angeles, an activist I respected from South Africa… and they were gone. And even though I had caused them to do it—and, hell, I had even recommended that they Delete me if they didn't want to be part of the show—I was shaken. (Lobel, 2016, p. 17)

This was, in a sense, not very different from Lobel himself deleting a large number of his friends based on the votes of strangers. Yet, when he has experienced the same, it seems to have disturbed him as he has never contacted most of them again, thereby really ending the relationship and any hope of further interaction. Before the advent of the internet which then gave way to social media platforms and applications, it was quite a rare possibility for a person to end their relationship with such a large number of their friends in such a short time. Unfortunately, it has now become a high possibility with the 'great' convenience technology provides. Along with faster speed and higher comfort in transportation and communication, technology also provides us with the convenience of easily ending or starting relationships. The Polish-British sociologist Zygmunt Bauman, who is best known for his ideas on the changing nature of modern relationships, also touches upon this (dis)advantage or side effect of technology as follows:

> Unlike 'real relationships', 'virtual relationships' are easy to enter and to exit. They look smart and clean, feel easy to use and user-friendly, when

compared with the heavy, slow-moving, inert messy 'real stuff'. A twenty-eight-year-old man from Bath, interviewed in connection with the rapidly growing popularity of computer dating at the expense of singles bars and lonely-heart columns, pointed to one decisive advantage of electronic relation: "you can always press...". (2003, p. xii)

Both the pre-emptive deletion of people whom Lobel calls his friends and the purgation that Lobel made on Facebook during the performance of *Purge* show that virtual relationships are, indeed, easy to exit. In most cases, pressing the 'delete', 'unfriend' or 'unfollow' button will be enough to end a relationship in this age of internet since many maintain their communication and relationships solely through internet and social media platforms.

That the modes of modern relationships are likely to change in an instant is indicated by Bauman with the metaphor of liquidity. Bauman defines "Facebook as the embodiment of liquid friendship, that is, the weakening of human bonds, and social networks on the net as a new policy of inclusion and exclusion" (Bauman & Donskis, 2013, p. 132). Since friendships today are experienced in a more digitized form in social media applications, the very notion of friendship has also adapted to the easy-to-use feature of these applications. As a result, friendships automatically assume a level of simplicity. In this context, *Purge* proves that ending a relationship or starting a new one is as easy as pressing a button as Lobel's relationship has ended with most of the deleted friends[3] as a part of the performance. Friendships are, however, supposed to be pillared upon strong values such as compatibility, trust, honesty, sincerity, commitment and support. These characteristics do not seem to exist in virtual friendships, turning social media users into somewhat robotic humans. These robotic humans establish relations on the internet as if they were programmed to operate according to some criteria which are neither sentimental nor ironically rational but merely operational. In *Purge*, Lobel deletes his friends due to neither sentimental nor rational reasons but only based on the votes of strangers whose main concern is entertainment. Consequently, the quality and quantity of friendships on Facebook do not seem to be crucially important to Lobel as long as they serve the purpose of the performance. However, on most of the recently

---

3   Lobel has re-friended some of them after a while depending on whether they send a new friend request or a response to his message informing they have been deleted from his friend list as a result of his audience's votes in the performance. However, most of them did not recontact him probably because they took offence at what Lobel did on social media and ultimately terminated their relationship for real.

popular social media applications like Instagram and Twitter, the quantity of friends[4] has become something to be proud of and the determining factor of popularity even though the value attached to their quality still remains the same: 'insignificant'.

In spite of the fact that Lobel was uncomfortable with the reactions he received as a result of the announcement he made through Facebook, he states that it has been highly beneficial for him afterward:

> *Purge* was not nice, and I deeply regret that *Purge* caused such sadness or discomfort in a number of people… But for so many of the relationships that changed via *Purge*, nearly all of them changed for the better. Instead of friendships which lay dormant - determined by a Friend Request and Acceptance years ago, *Purge* ensured that each friendship was rigorously tested and considered. (Lobel, 2016, p. 20)

As testing the true meaning of friendship is the real motive behind the creation of *Purge*, it has apparently served its purpose with success. After testing the fragility of his relationships, he seems convinced that the people, who remained in his Facebook list, are his real friends. He explains his expectations from real friendships as:

> The greatest problem with social networking is not that friendships become digitized and simple, but that they become unused and taken for granted […] This isn't good enough for a friendship—a real friendship must be activated, wrestled with and celebrated. (Lobel, 2016, p. 20)

It seems like the ambivalent and inactive status of internet relationships is disturbing for Lobel. 'Real' social media friendships need to prove their 'solidity' or steadiness by being activated by *Purge* and then tested against public evaluation and purgation during the project. *Purge* in a way acts as a catalyst for the activation of his friendships which are 'wrestled with' through the announcement e-mail Lobel sent to his Facebook friends and also the vote in *Purge*. If they manage to pass this phase and prove their solidity, they deserve to be 'celebrated' as real friends and friendships, notwithstanding that the realness of these virtual friendships is extremely debatable as they basically exist in social media networks. Besides, the remaining friends may not actually be real

4   Users of these applications who are connected to each other's web are named as 'followers' instead of 'friends'.

friends as most of them are determined by random public votes. It can be nevertheless claimed that they passed the first stage by not pre-emptively deleting Lobel right after the announcement and accepting to be voted by strangers based on Lobel's one-minute speech defending them. Unlike actual friendships in real life, which are also tested against many odds, Lobel depends on the idea that real friends need to adhere to their friendship even if he may have hurt them with the project by testing them without a valid justification.

One of the reasons why Lobel and his friends, who pre-emptively deleted him, have become so swift to resolve to end their relationships might be that social media network, i.e., the digital environment, offers a variety of options for relationships, unlike the real environment. Bauman adverts to this aspect of social media as follows:

> [T]his is at any rate how one can feel when shopping for partners on the internet. Just like browsing through the pages of a mail-order catalogue with a 'no obligation to buy' promise and a 'return to the shop if dissatisfied' guarantee on the front page. (2003, p. 65)

The metaphor of online shopping also implies the commodification of relationships as if they were goods[5] to sell or buy and use or return if dissatisfied. Since there are plenty of options to have relationships of all sorts on social media applications, people are now freer to set their own rules in determining the terms of their relationships. 'Real' relationships like kinship or workplace relations over which people do not have much control most of the time, however, are compulsory as it is either not possible or easy to end one's relationship with their parents, siblings or boss without bearing the consequences. The relationships on social media networks, on the other hand, are more easily manageable since social media users are the ones who are in full control in terms of starting, preserving or ending them. In virtual relationships, as long as a relationship pleases them, they continue or else they may choose to quit.

Bauman uses the phrase 'top-pocket relationship' to define such relationships which continue as long as they are deemed necessary or comply with the criteria set by people who start these relationships in the first place:

---

5   Considering that it has been a prevalent practice to buy 'friends' and 'post likes' on Facebook (https://buyfbstore.com/product/buy-facebook-friend/) and 'followers' on Instagram and the like, it can be posited that this concrete phenomenon has evolved into actuality for quite some time, surpassing its initial metaphorical connotation.

> 'Top-pocket relationship' […] is so called because you keep it in your pocket so that you can bring it out when you need it […] 'Top-pocket relationship' is instantaneity and disposability incarnate. Not that your relationship would acquire those wondrous qualities without certain conditions having first been met. Note that it is you who must meet those conditions; another point in the 'top-pocket' relationship's favour, to be sure, since it is on you and only you that success depends, and so it is you and only you who is in control—and stays in control throughout the 'top-pocket' relationship's short life. (2003, p. 21)

Lobel's one-night stand in Chicago, for instance, silently deleted him as he was most probably no longer needed for her/him. Likewise, one of his friends, Kevin, with whom Lobel "used to live in the same apartment complex and have sex when his boyfriend was away on work trips" (Lobel, 2016, p. 34) seems to have deleted him for the very same reason. Lobel's other friends who pre-emptively deleted him seem very likely that they decided to end their relationship since either the idea of being involved in his project irritated them or they probably wanted to be in full control of their friendship. On the other hand, even though it looks like Lobel himself did not choose the ones to be deleted during *Purge* as strangers voted and he deleted accordingly, he was, nevertheless, in control of the final action. Not to mention the fact that he keeps some of his friends pre-emptively; he re-friends some of them either immediately or after a while even if the judges have voted to delete them. He likewise deletes some even though the judges have voted to keep them. In all cases, these online friendships can be considered as top-pocket relationships as they are preserved as long as they satisfy both sides; otherwise, one of the 'friends' ends the relationship considering that it is no longer beneficial or needed. Nevertheless, he places the blame of ending a relationship on the judges, which seems to make him feel less culpable for he defends himself this way: "I say—the panel deleted you! I didn't delete you. It's a very convenient way to not do it myself" (Hong, 2016). Lobel's words here elucidate that his sense of responsibility towards his friends has gone awry. The difference in the conditioning of human behavior in cyberspace is touched upon by the Slovenian philosopher, cultural theorist and psychoanalyst Slavoj Žižek:

> In VR [Virtual Reality], I can do it, act it out, without really doing it, and thus avoid the anxiety connected with the RL [Real Life] activity – I can do it, and since I know I'm not really doing it, the inhibition or shame is suspended. (1997, p. 177)

The virtual reality provided by the internet and social media applications enables its users to avoid responsibility for their actions because they do not believe they are doing it in real life. Lobel might have considered that ending a relationship on a social media application does not mean really ending it and since he lets strangers do it, he probably feels free of guilt and responsibility about their likely consequences.

Apart from the wide variety of options that social media provides for relationships, it also functions as a barrier between people enabling them to disregard the feelings of one another as in the case of *Purge*. Since interactions happen in digital space in social media, people do not witness body language, gestures and mimics showing such emotions as happiness, sadness, fear or disappointment. Although smiley faces like emoticons[6] and emojis[7] are utilized to express feelings on digital platforms, they cannot be substituted for real gestures and mimics by any means as smiley faces are not natural human reactions happening automatically. Icons representing human emotions and reactions are, however, typed optionally by users of social media if they prefer to show how they feel about something or else they can hide their real feelings by not typing those icons in if they prefer to. Gestures and mimics, on the other hand, are innate, intrinsic, highly unique and decisively inimitable reactions emerging out of one's control. In sum, the discrepancy between the experience of real feelings and the feelings suggested by the use of smiley faces proves that the latter cannot replace the former by any means as the former is unique and intrinsically inimitable. This apparent lack of experiencing real feelings in cyberspace seems to make it easier to disregard the feelings of the people who are on the other side of the screen on social media applications. When the messages included in *Purge* are taken into account, it is obvious that Lobel and his friends have communicated through Facebook messages and e-mails during the announcement of *Purge* and afterward. The virtual position they are in seems to have facilitated a mutual disregard for the feelings of one another as they do not witness the actual facial expressions, namely emotions and feelings of the other side at first hand while interacting through social media.

Social media applications do not offer text messaging as the only way of interaction between their users. Instant photo capturing and sharing, voice messaging and video

---

6   Emoticons are punctuation marks, letters, and numbers used to create pictorial icons that generally display an emotion or sentiment ("Emoticon" comes from: emotional icon) (Grannan, 2020).

7   Emoji (from the Japanese e, "picture" and moji, "character") are a slightly more recent invention. Not to be confused with their predecessor, emoji are pictographs of faces, objects, and symbols (Grannan, 2020).

calls are other features provided by these platforms as other means of communication. Even though these features are in a way akin to actual interaction (in that these features successfully transfer visual data containing gestures and mimics as well as audible data including intonation, stress and tone and sound of voice when compared to text messaging), the physical absence of both sides and the unmediatedness of the interaction only existing in actual face-to-face communications cannot be compensated by new features of these applications. Even if these features are developed to transfer feelings instantly as in science fiction movies, physical presence and unmediatedness will always remain irreplaceable. This lack is thoroughly experienced especially after humanity has been condemned to maintain their lives indoors in 2020 during the worldwide Covid-19 pandemic. The situation of people in 2020 in accordance with such precautions taken against coronavirus as wearing face masks, face shields and gloves as well as social distancing is surprisingly like a simulation of the lack in social-networking applications or vice versa, in that physical contact is missing on both occasions either because of gloves and social distancing or virtual space. Likewise, it is hard to show facial expressions and feelings in both cases as a consequence of the lack of visual data either because of masks or the virtual space itself.

All in all, it can be concluded that virtual interactions cannot totally replace actual ones as some of the features of actual interactions cannot be provided by virtual ones. Accordingly, the apparent lack of interpersonal emotion transfer and emotional interaction, physical absence and mediatedness of interaction in social media platforms seem to be some of the reasons why modern relationships have become so shallow, transient and rapidly changeable. These very reasons also appear to explain why starting and ending relationships have become so easy as in the case of *Purge*. Žižek correlates these side effects of virtuality with the perception of distance and presence:

> [T]he virtualization cancels the distance between neighbour and a distant foreigner, in so far as it suspends the presence of the Other in the massive weight of the Real: neighbours and foreigners are all equal in their spectral screen presence. (1997, p. 199)

In cyberspace constituted by the internet and social media, close and distant relations become even as they have the same virtual presence on digital screens. While the difference between what is close and what is distant vanishes, the close one may be perceived as if it were distant as a side effect. In other words, people who are far away

and difficult to interact with due to physical distance have become very close as if they were neighbors with the convenience of cyber technologies. However, people who are close seem to have, in a way, lost their advantage as their presence and value have become equal to those of foreigners. Accordingly, close relationships have been reduced to the level of distant relationships as they have lost their advantage of being close and available all the time and become equal to distant relationships in value since distant relationships are as close as the close relationships in their cyber presence and likewise available all the time. Although these (dis)advantages and side effects of social media usage have, for better or worse, changed the dynamics of human relationships, such transient relations are nevertheless likely to be preferred more than the actual ones on account of the fact that virtual ones spare people the 'trouble' of spending time and effort to make a relationship work. Lobel states this bare fact when he says, "There they are, in that digital space, just where you left them" (2016, p. 20). Even family relationships have begun to disintegrate just because modern individuals are not willing to make the effort when there are plenty of alternatives requiring rather less effort (or none at all) in the virtual space.

As social beings, humans have always been in need of each other if for nothing else but to satisfy their social needs like interacting with each other or forming communities. Over the course of time, especially after the establishment of the internet in the 1990s, these basic needs have begun to be met by digital or virtual environments and communities such as social media platforms and groups. This transformation has formed a vast field for communication and social sciences studies from then on. As opposed to a number of communication theories like the 'hypodermic needle' or 'magic silver bullet' theories suggesting that people have been used and manipulated by media, the 'uses and gratifications' theory developed by Elihu Katz and Jay Blumler (1974) suggests that people have begun to use social media platforms to gratify their needs, not the other way around. Some of the needs or motivations according to which people decide to use social media specified in the theory are passing time, companionship, escape (pressure or reality), enjoyment, social interaction, relaxation, information and excitement. Nevertheless, these motivations and needs seem to have even diversified over time. Lobel expresses his own motivation while explaining what *Purge* is about as: "Maybe it is a bit about social media, but only insomuch as contemporary beings discuss, share, enact and (potentially, hopefully) heal from grief on, via and through social media" (Lobel, 2016, p. 15). As a consequence of the loss of his friend, Lobel decided to create a performance about grief and created *Purge* with the purpose of

examining the meaning of friendship and loss in relation to his grief. His intention was to utilize Facebook as a distraction from his grief for "coming out of the thick haze of mourning" (Lobel, 2016, p. 20), in other words, healing from grief. *Purge* associate artist, Season Butler likewise explains the underlying motive behind the performance by associating the performance and the expected outcome of it with the vocabulary meaning of *Purge*: "*Purge* strongly connotes catharsis, maybe even a restorative one - violent in its throes, and then we feel better having released something, let something go" (2016, p. 24). The name of the performance connotes not only the release of feelings but also that of the relations and people, that is to say, letting them go as they are no longer needed or wanted. Butler also adverts to the 'restorative' effect of *Purge* thereby referring to Lobel's purpose in *Purge* which is to heal from his grief and restore himself even if it is at the expense of experimenting on his relationships with his friends and destroying them. Lobel is, therefore, likely to preserve his relationship with his friends as long as they are active and tested via *Purge* as well or else, he seems to end his relationship by showing *Purge* as an excuse for purging dormant friends from his life as an exercise of his healing session.

Lobel has also benefited from social media, namely Facebook and the people in his Facebook friend list, creating a performance out of it. It is obvious from the negative responses Lobel received to *Purge* that his Facebook friends, who pre-emptively deleted him, are aware of his underlying aim in his project: entertaining himself and strangers by utilizing his relationships at all costs. In most of the negative responses, his friends underline and criticize this very same issue. For instance, Lobel's friends who deleted him, Sandra and Jane, reproach Lobel in e-mails they sent as a response to his announcement about *Purge* for exploiting and abusing them:

> SANDRA
>
> Why can't you, Brian, be the one to decide on your own if we should be associated via this medium? But I get it, it's 'performance art' and you are using your Facebook friends as the raw materials. But I don't know… we're people. (Lobel, 2016, pp. 38-39)
>
> JANE
>
> [W]hat you're doing with Purge is interesting in theory. But in actual life, I think it's kind of fucked up and hurtful to your friends, to ask strangers to tell you whether to stay friends with them and to make a game out of it. (Lobel, 2016, p. 46)

Even though he has had his own reasons, it is a matter of fact that he uses Facebook and the people in his Facebook friend list for deriving a benefit from them by disregarding how they would feel or think about it. He therefore uses social media to gratify his own purposes and needs in the case of *Purge,* just like the uses and gratifications theory suggests.

Lobel shares most of the responses he received from his friends under pseudonyms either because they prefer him to do so or he cannot make contact with them to establish what they would rather have him do. The purpose of this practice is to protect personal privacy mentioned in many of the responses Lobel received as the primary concern about *Purge*:

<div align="center">EVAN[8]</div>

Essentially I feel quite strongly about privacy, particularly my own and I've spent a considerable amount of time ensuring my very compartmentalised life stayed as such. You are the only person I have encountered who has used reference to me in such a public context that has made me feel unhappy. (Lobel, 2016, p. 46)

Zack[9]:

[T]he internet is a strange enough place and privacy is hard enough to come by as it is… It's obviously not about not trusting you […] but I'd rather not have strangers looking at my info. (Lobel, 2016, p. 68)

Andrea:

I am going to put you on a limited profile[10] […] I do not feel comfortable with strangers viewing my complete profile. (Lobel, 2016, p. 75)

Although social media users seem to be very eager to socialize through social media applications, they are not completely comfortable with sharing their personal information—even their name—in public. Lobel, moreover, omits some parts from some of the e-mails and states that he "removed [them] in publication for privacy reasons" (2016, p. 74) as those parts most probably included such specific information

---

8   The names and pseudonyms used in the performance are given centred and in full capital letters.

9   Additional e-mails received after the performance are included in the published text as well as the ones used in the performance and the names and pseudonyms in the additional e-mails are given in lowercase letters as aligned on left.

10 "The person finds that, although a friend request is approved, he or she has limited access to what can be performed on the other's profile. Restricted access includes an inability to see others' comments, personal information, status updates, photos, videos, and write on the other's message board" (Tokunaga, 2011, p. 427).

as location, phone number or any sort of personal data which can possibly be abused by third parties. In other words, social media users feel secure and safe as long as their personal information is only shared with the people they know and trust, not with everybody. More importantly, some of Lobel's friends also mention that they are not only seeking security in their privacy but also in their relationships:

> The idea of me being discussed for my value (and then checking back to find I've been un-friended) doesn't really sit well with me […] I know I'm taking this too seriously, but at the moment I'm needing to feel secure in my friendships… (Lobel, 2016, p. 43)

Some of his friends seem to cherish their relationships existing in the virtual space as if they were not virtual but real and they are apparently apprehensive that they would lose their connection or relation with their friends thereby considering the project of *Purge* as insecure for their relationships. Apart from privacy and security, one of his friends, Evan, also alludes to an additional concern about their relationship with regard to *Purge*: 'not having control over' it. He expresses this concern by writing back to Lobel as: "I appreciate that knowing you has been a two-way relationship and I cannot have any control over how you choose to recall that relationship" (Lobel, 2016, p. 47). The implication here is that he has no control over their relationship as their expectation from it or understanding of it is different from each other's and he is apparently not pleased with the sudden turn which signals that Lobel's choices will determine the future of their relationship. Consequently, Lobel's friends who pre-emptively deleted him seem to preserve their friendships so long as their relationships are secure and private and they possess full control over their relationship by not letting anyone (like strangers in the case of *Purge*) intervene or Lobel take over the control. Privacy, security and having full control are the motivations that are likely to be the purpose that Lobel's friends seek in their virtual relationships.

As exemplified above, Lobel uses his Facebook friends as raw materials for the performance of *Purge*. He commodifies them in a way and disregards that they are real people with real feelings considering that "a performance about grief needs to feature real life stakes, real sadness, real anger, [and] real disruption" (Lobel, 2016, p. 21), and it has to be "a confrontation with loss, an affirmation of friendship and an acknowledgement of the precarious nature of our ties to other people" (Butler, 2016, p. 24). Although he decides not to repeat his performance becoming aware of the fact that it upset and

disturbed many of his friends, his decision about not repeating it does not really compensate for the fact that he has already caused a significant amount of dismay with a single performance. It may be a fact that virtual friendships are not perceived as profound relationships by most, however, Lobel seems to oversimplify the concept of friendship by his project for the sake of producing art as most of his Facebook friends are his real friends with whom he connects out of social media in real life and who take their relationships seriously.

One of his friends puts this situation into words when he writes "I guess I find it a bit cruel to play with people's emotions surrounding rejection in the name of art" (Lobel, 2016, p. 39). Another friend also criticizes the same issue by stating that she finds his project very hurtful for his friends as he asks strangers to determine the status of his relationships and 'makes a game out of it'. He seems to disregard all these reproaches and utilizes all the materials he gets from the responses he received in the creation of his project. He even ignores the request of his friend Evan, who asks him not to use anything related to him in the project:

> It is absolutely my wish that you do not use my profile, my name, a pseudonym for my name, this e-mail, or any part of this e-mail as part of the project […] [I]f you have any consideration for the integrity of that relationship, I would ask that you respect my wishes. (Lobel, 2016, pp. 46-47)

He uses his name or a pseudonym and the contents of his e-mail including the parts he asks Lobel not to share them. Furthermore, he reveals that one of his friends who deleted him had cheated on his boyfriend with Lobel when his boyfriend was away for work trips and also humiliates another friend just because he states he will delete and unfriend Lobel first: "[H]e was kept… but I decided to delete him a few days later. I just did not need that shit in my life" (Lobel, 2016, p. 40). All in all, he seems to adopt a disrespectful, pejorative and even vengeful attitude towards his Facebook friends, especially towards those who deleted him. He most probably considers that he has nothing to lose since they deleted him and proved their untrustworthiness so he has all the right to make them a part of his performance. The very attitude he adopts can be considered as a typical example of liquid relationships as Lobel and his friends have easily given up on each other as well as that of top-pocket relationship since Lobel ends his relationships after utilizing them, considering that they are no longer necessary.

In fact, there is also a possibility that Lobel might have used deliberate provocation in the performance to make a point about the current status of modern relationships by going beyond the bounds of decency. He might be pointing out the ultimate corruption in the relationships of the modern era by exaggerating his attitudes towards his friends to demonstrate the extremity of this corruption. By provoking the audience, Lobel might be aiming to incite criticism and discussion in order to raise awareness.

Lobel expresses what social media and his Facebook friends mean to him stating that "For me, Facebook is part of life, I don't distinguish (often) real-life friends from friends I connect with online" (Dawn, 2016). Elsewhere, he even claims that "It's almost immature to suggest there's a difference between the 'real' and the 'digital' anymore" (Wilkinson, 2013). From his statements, it can be concluded that in the hyper-reality in which Lobel lives, the digital as a representation or imitation of the original or real has become indistinguishable from the real just like Jean Baudrillard suggests in his ideas regarding 'simulation' and 'simulacra'. In this case, social media, namely Facebook, as a representation of social life, has eventually replaced Lobel's real social life and rendered it almost impossible for him to tell the difference. He may have provided these clarifications with the intention of justifying *Purge* and implying that his Facebook friends are as real as his real friends. The implication to be drawn here is that he values his Facebook friends as much as his real friends. He, nonetheless, makes the reader question his former clarifications in *Purge* when he states quite the opposite of what he has stated so far:

> [W]hat is spoken in the live performance is about digital connection and disconnection and shame and sharing between families, and the limits of sharing. While everyone else is able to be anonymized as part of this publication, it's impossible to do this with my mother, whom I adore. She is not a fictional mother, she's a real woman […] And she is not my Facebook friend. (Lobel, 2016, p. 41)

In direct contradiction to his former statements, Lobel himself differentiates between the real and the digital. Moreover, his mother is not his Facebook friend and therefore not closely related to either the matter at hand or the performance. In other words, he provides these explanations without any necessity, unlike the former ones which are very likely to be provided out of necessity for justifying *Purge* since he was accused of not caring for his Facebook friends' feelings on the grounds that they are not real or important. His inconsistency, which came out most probably as an ultimate side effect

of living so integrated with social media and virtual space and of heavy exposure to them, also reflects the mental confusion of modern individuals living in this relatively new system. In fact, he confesses that he is confused and his thoughts are likely to change while he is endeavoring to define real friendship:

> I guess that's how I currently define it, a definition which will, of course (as I learned from *Purge*) be different from everyone else and perhaps even to myself in the future. It is this ambiguity, this lack of definition, this lack of certainty, which brings me back, heartbreakingly, to Grant, to our relationship, to his death. (Lobel, 2016, p. 20)

The inconsistency between his statements should not be surprising after this assertion. It is very striking that the description of his thoughts ('will be different in the future') and the words he chooses to express his current situation ('ambiguity', 'lack of definition' and 'lack of certainty') connote the characteristics of liquid modernity which are rapid change, transience, and ambivalence.

Conclusion

Human behaviors and relationships constituting the building blocks of culture are influenced by all sorts of changes happening around them. As a natural result of technological and cyber developments, human life and interactions have become easier and faster, and have eventually taken on a new form by adapting to the 'simple and fast' features of these developments. If it is true that these applications provide easier and faster interactions between people, they also ultimately make their relationships simple, transient, fragile, ambivalent, and rapidly changeable. As a performative experiment, *Purge* allows us to observe this transformation in friendships that parallels the easy-to-use features of the applications in the cyber sphere. Zygmunt Bauman's ideas on liquid modernity also testify to the existence of an ultimate corruption in human relations as an inevitable consequence of the influence that modern technological enhancements have over people, and enable us to enunciate this corruption and transformation in a theoretical concept. The examination of *Purge* in the light of Bauman's ideas on liquid modernity shows that human beings in this modern age of technology have been gradually turning into robotic beings showing less and less human feelings. They are therefore losing their ability to empathize as they are adopting the characteristics of technological devices and these devices are functioning as a barrier to empathy since

actual face-to-face communication is an unmediated way of communication and apparently necessary for the maintenance and nourishment of the feeling of empathy.

Another determinant of lack of empathy apart from the mediatedness of internet communication is that internet users consider that they are not actually doing the things they do on the internet in real life, thereby avoiding the responsibility of their actions and behaviors. Thus, although they experience the fulfillment of their actions and behaviors, their conscience remains clear. Furthermore, such actions as starting or ending a relationship and telling one's thoughts about the other in the interaction on/through the internet are relatively easier and more effortless, as in the case of *Purge*.

Lobel had to sustain his relationship with his ex-boyfriend through social media and internet as they lived in different states, which has made Lobel dependent on social media. This is not different from the situation of many who have ultimately become dependent on social media after using it for a while. Despite the fact that technological devices have been invented to fulfill a need, they then become the need itself. The alarm of the ones whose smartphone battery is dead, the level of necessity felt by those who check their smartphones and social media accounts every ten minutes or the case of Lobel, who has practically lived his life through social media and internet, testify to this very fact.

One of the side effects of living so integrated with technology and social media is that the real and the digital become intertwined and then indistinguishable after a while, which is also expressed by Lobel: there is no difference between the real and the digital (Wilkinson, 2013). In fact, he seems to have repeatedly emphasized this conviction because he has been accused of not valuing his friends as 'real people with real feelings'. He nevertheless differentiates the real from the digital in *Purge* by stating that her mother is a 'real woman' and was accordingly not included in the performance. This inconsistency might be another side effect of this close integration with modern technologies and social media as 'inconsistency' connotes rapid change and transience, which are the mutual features of technology and liquid modernity.

Purge appears to be a performance in which Lobel makes use of social media and people in his social media network in the name of creating 'performance art' and as an exercise of his healing session for the loss of his ex-boyfriend by disregarding his friends' thoughts and feelings. While the foundation of the performance was to

scrutinize the meaning of friendship, it has ended up with the commodification of relations and people as well as the oversimplification of the concept of friendship. In fact, Lobel might be endeavoring to provoke his audience into critical thinking by exhibiting extreme behaviors towards his friends on social media with the intention of pointing out the ultimate condition modern relationships will eventually become. In this context, *Purge*, as a play about interactions on social media offering an environment where friendship relations are abstracted from such values as trust, sincerity, sympathy and commitment, is an important performative attempt in terms of revealing how the concept of friendship is perceived today or will be perceived in the near future.

Although *Purge* is a performance and work, containing data from 2011, about making the decision to end or maintain friendship through Facebook, and Facebook is assumed to be an unpopular application that has now been replaced by Instagram, Twitter and the like, Facebook still ranks first among social media applications worldwide with 2.963 billion monthly active users according to statistics as of January 2023 (Datareportal, 2023). The misconception that Facebook is obsolete and unpopular is due to the fact that the rankings and popularity of these social media applications exhibit variability across diverse countries. Therefore, it can be presupposed that these notions regarding the liquidity of social media friendship are also applicable to other social media platforms based on friendship or follower systems.

Much like anything created to promote self-image on the internet, modern relationships seem to have eventually taken on an artificial and hollow form. Human beings have begun to perceive each other as commodities whose quantity (in the form of friend lists, followers, etc.) is the only factor determining their value while the quality is insignificant due to the variety of options for relationships that social media provides. This situation is, surely, related to the capitalist system; mass production and consumerism give direction to our understanding of friendship. In social media, friends have also become, more or less, like mass-produced items and every single friendship eventually "becomes a quantifiable commodity" (van Dijck, 2011, p. 170) and we are trying to consume them as fast as possible. One moment we are looking overjoyed at a series of photos and exchanging numerous comments that contain exaggerated statements of endearment and the next moment we are deleting them because they forgot to click the 'like' button under a photo of ours.

While Lobel does not seem to be valuing the quantity and quality of friendships since his primary purpose appears to be to create art and heal from his grief through entertainment and distraction in *Purge*, the quantity of friendships is crucially important today in most social media platforms as the number of the relationships one has on social media accounts show their popularity. Although many do not know most of the people on their friend list on social media, they establish as many relationships as possible since it is effortless to do and they all are ironically listed under the friend category. This very fact also gives an idea about the meaning of relationships and friendship on social media. In this context, *Purge* serves as a mirror enabling us to see more clearly and evaluate the current condition of human relations in such an age obsessed with social media as ours.

References

Bauman, Z. & Donskis, L. (2013). *Moral Blindness: The Loss of Sensitivity in Liquid Modernity*. Polity Press.

Bauman, Z. (2003). Foreword. *Liquid Love: On the Frailty of Human Bonds*. viii-xiii. Polity Press.

Butler, S. (2020). Response from Season Butler, *Purge* Associate Artist. In B. Lobel's *Purge*. London: Oberon Books.

Chambers, D. (2013) *Social Media and Personal Relationships: Online Intimacies and Networked Friendship*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Datareportal. (2023). *The Latest Facebook Statistics: Everything You Need to Know*. Retrieved Jan 4, 2023, from https://datareportal.com/essential-facebook-stats

Dawn, T. (2016). *American Live Artist Brian Lobel Questions Why Purging Your Facebook Friends Is Art – Popspoken*. Popspoken. Accessed 21 May 2020. http://popspoken.com/arts/2016/03/brian-lobel-interview.

Ellison, N., Lampe, C., Steinfeld, C., and Vitak, J. (2011b) 'With a Little Help from My Friends: How Social Network Sites Affect Social Capital Processes', In Papacharissi, Z. (ed.), *A Networked Self: Identity, Community, and Culture on Social Network Sites (pp. 124-145)*. New York: Routledge.

Grannan, C. (2020). *What's the Difference Between Emoji and Emoticons?*. Accessed 10 November 2020. https://www.britannica.com/story/whats-the-difference-between-emoji-and-emoticons

Hong, G. (2016). *Purge - An Interview with Brian Lobel*. ArtHop. Accessed 11 April 2020. https://arthop.co/editorials/purge-interview-brian-lobel-nus-arts-festival-2016.

Leong, D. (2014). *Getting unfriendly*. R.AGE. Accessed 3 April 2020. https://www.rage.com.my/getting-unfriendly/

Lobel, B. (2016. *Purge*. London: Oberon Books.

Tokunagresa, R.S. (2011) 'Friend me or you'll strain US: Understanding negative events that occur over social networking sites', *Cyberpsychology, Behavior, and Social Networking*, 14(7–8), pp. 425–432. doi:10.1089/cyber.2010.0140.

van Dijck, J. (2011) 'Facebook as a Tool for Producing Sociality and Connectivity', *Television & New Media*, 13(2), pp. 160–176. doi:10.1177/1527476411415291.

Wilkinson, D. (2013). *Feature: Brian Lobel's 'Purge' – a space for dialogue*. A Younger Theatre. Accessed 3 April 2020. https://www.ayoungertheatre.com/feature-brian-lobels-purge-a-space-for-dialogue-facebook-performance/

Žižek, S. (1997). *The Plague of Fantasies*. London: Verso.

"Tempus Tacendi, Tempus Loquendi": Manifestations of Madness in "Canto 74"

Seda ŞEN[1] iD

[1]Assist. Prof., Başkent University, Faculty of Science and Letters, Department of American Culture and Literature, Ankara, Turkiye

ORCID: S.S. 0000-0001-8854-2733

Corresponding author:
Seda ŞEN,
Başkent University, Faculty of Science and Letters, Department of American Culture and Literature, Ankara, Turkiye
E-mail: sedasen86@gmail.com;
sedasen@baskent.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

On May 24, 1945, Ezra Pound was arrested for treason by the US Army authorities near Pisa and confined in a gorilla cage for two and a half weeks. He spent a total of 6 months in a prison camp. After being brought to America on December 21, 1945, he was declared medically unfit for trial and was committed to St. Elizabeths Hospital. However, there was a group of skeptical people who claimed that the poet was in fact quite sane. Studies about Pound's life after his imprisonment and years at St. Elizabeths portray the poet as either an old delusional man who was once a prominent poet or as a great schemer who followed the advice of his lawyer and faked madness. Pound's biographers pointed out that during his years at St. Elizabeths, the place became a literary mecca for aspiring poets, implying that the poet was in a rational state of mind. After more than 70 years since the poet entered the hospital, it is crucial to investigate not whether the poet was mad but rather how the poet's words in "Canto 74" were utilized as evidence to persuade the jury and doctors of his insanity. This article aims to analyze "Canto 74" in light of Foucault's approaches to madness and its relation to language. It further explores why *The Pisan Cantos*, which was declared the Bollingen prize winner in 1948, could be mistaken for the rambling manifestations of a madman.

Keywords: "Canto 74," Ezra Pound, language of madness, modernist poetry, poetry and madness

Introduction

Pound's journey from the United States to Europe and back again has been one of the most controversial topics in American literary history. A journey that started with a young, aspiring poet in search of a new poetics ended with charges of treason against the United States. This was prompted by his publications in support of fascism and his broadcasts on Radio Rome that favored Mussolini against American troops entering Italy. Pound returned to the US in 1945 as an old man, an ardent supporter of Italian Fascism, and an anti-Semite. Twenty-one years earlier, in 1924, Pound had gone to Rapallo with the aspiration to pursue his dream of an artistic revolution supported by the state as he believed that Mussolini would help him achieve his dream. His propaganda broadcasts on Radio Rome and publications supporting Mussolini's cause led to a total of 19 counts of treason. All of these charges were circumvented by his lawyer's argument that he was "unfit to stand trial." He was declared "insane" by a group of doctors, including Dr. Wilfred Overholser, the chief psychiatrist at St. Elizabeths (Chace, 1987, pp.134–138; Feldman, 2012, p.86; Torrey, 1984, p. 4). Most of the critical works about Pound's arrest in Italy, his imprisonment in a gorilla cage near Pisa, the charges of treason and hearing, and his institutionalization at St. Elizabeths Hospital in Washington DC. deal with similar questions: Was he guilty? Was he mad? Was he putting on an act? Was he treated? For his trial, Julian Cornell, his lawyer, presented the manuscripts of *The Pisan Cantos,* specifically "Canto 74," to claim that his verse was a manifestation of madness. Even though numerous poets and public figures questioned the controversial decision to use the poet's verse to declare him insane and unfit for trial, the court felt it was sufficient evidence to drop the charges and send Pound to St. Elizabeths Hospital.

Among Pound's biographies that narrate his life focusing on the relationships he had developed while at the hospital, Swift's recent work *The Bughouse: The Poetry, Politics and Madness of Ezra Pound* (2017) is the first study that provides a detailed analysis of Pound's medical documents and attempts to ascertain whether he was treated for any medical condition. This study also refers to Overholser's and Cornell's accounts at the time. However, none of these works directly examine the reasons behind Cornell's decision to use "Canto 74" as proof of Pound's insanity and how Pound agreed with this plea to use his poetry as proof since *The Pisan Cantos* was later awarded the Bollingen prize. The main question, then, becomes not whether Pound was insane but what in the poem convinced the jury and the doctors that he was insane. How does the text imitate the rantings of a madman in a way that it is perceived by the reader as

an account of a madman's point of view? Researching the alleged madness of Pound by using narratology and approaches to madness by Foucault and Feldman would illuminate why "Canto 74" could evoke the impression of a madman's rantings. This canto was presented as evidence of his madness by Pound's lawyer. However, by utilizing Foucault's approach to the language of madness as well as the narratives of madness in fiction, one may argue that the poetic style of Pound may be mistaken for a manifestation of madness.

Aim and Methodology

In *Language, Madness and Desire* (2015), Foucault claims that language and madness are linked to one another because both play with "signs that play with us" (Foucault, 2015, p. 38). This common point, where literature and madness intersect, could arguably be the reason why the language of the madman is similar to literature. Both rely on the creative mind. The audience, who is of sound mind, cannot comprehend the fictional, unreal tales spun by the madman and tries to determine whether what he/she hears is true or made up. This paper adopts Foucault's approach to the language of madness to argue that the ambiguity in the madman's language, which fluctuates between fact and fiction and speaking the truth or concealing it with made-up stories, can be identified as a stylistic element in Pound's "Canto 74." Pound's style is to employ contrasting, paradoxical phrases; fragmented images; allusions to literary works; and quotes from history and personal memories. These aspects form a collage that builds the vortexes in *The Cantos*. These vortexes construct multilayered meanings in the poem, which, to the untrained eye, could appear as illogical, fragmented ramblings of a madman.

It is highly unlikely that Pound had the intention of deliberately appearing insane when he was composing *The Pisan Cantos*. However, agreeing to his lawyer's proposition, as revealed in many of his biographies, indicates that he would consent to having his sanity questioned to avoid being charged with treason. In light of this, one may ask, why and how would one be regarded as insane, and what kind of utterance would register as the manifestation of a madman? This was arguably the ploy Pound's lawyer was aiming for. How would one perceive someone as mad, and would words be sufficient to determine whether a person was insane are questions that require contemplation. In Pound's case, could the way in which Pound was captured and declared insane and the years he spent in St. Elizabeths be regarded as a fictional narrative like the asylum

novel, which helped his case of being perceived as a madman, is another question to be raised. To seek an answer to this question, this article offers a brief overview of Pound's case and medical accounts by his biographers. In addition, using various theoretical discussions of the manifestations of madness, "Canto 74" is analyzed to determine whether Pound's poem may be mistaken for a madman's perspective and how the canto may be used as proof of insanity.

Ezra Pound's Arrest and Diagnoses

Daniel Swift remarks that when Pound was arrested, his initial psychiatric evaluation in Genoa presented no sign of "psychosis, neurosis or psychopathy"; however, he would be diagnosed with many other mental conditions over the years. He was said to have "delusions of persecution and grandeur" by Dr. Edgar Griffin in 1945. After seeing his medical files, Dr. Romolo Rossi diagnosed him as "manic depressive" in the 1960s and allegedly treated him, although the records have not been saved. During Pound's trial, four doctors, along with Overholser, came up with several possible terms, including "bipolar or manic depressive, [. . .] psychotic, paranoid, schizophrenic." Their diagnosis led to the decision that Pound was "of unsound mind," saving him from the death penalty (Swift, 2017, p. 171).

Even though the decision to institutionalize Pound for 12 years seems to be unanimous, evidence shows that many insisted that the poet displayed no signs of mental incapability. For instance, Dr. Marion King, the head of the prison medical service in Washington, agreed with the initial evaluation in Genoa that Pound did not exhibit indications of psychotic behavior. However, his evaluation was not included in the files presented to the court. Moreover, Dr. Addison Duval declared that he had only agreed to the insanity diagnosis because of Overholser, the head of the psychiatrist group (Swift, 2017, pp. 9–10). Furthermore, the Rorschach test conducted by Dr. Kendig reports that although Pound seems to have confined himself to a fantasy world rather than reality, his "pedantic" answers indicated no evidence of psychosis. Swift, the recent biographer of the poet, focused specifically on Pound's years at St.Elizabeths, and remarks that after reading his doctors' reports, it is hard to believe that Pound was genuinely insane (Swift, 2017, p. 160). Swift observes that considering the conspiracy theories about Pound's insanity and admission to St. Elizabeths over the years, the two scenarios agree that Pound is most likely sane:

The conspiracy theories told about Ezra Pound at St. Elizabeths run in two directions. In one, he is a traitor shielded by the hospital from the punishment which was his due; in the other, he is a fearless truth-teller punished for threatening to reveal all he knew. In one, Pound is the hero, wronged and justified. In the other, he is a trickster, mocking and weak. The two versions, however, agree upon their diagnosis: for in both, Pound is sane. (Swift, 2017, p. 172)

When his arrest, admission to St. Elizabeths, and the time he spent at the hospital are analyzed, one point that all biographers mention is the agreement between Pound and his lawyer on the plea of insanity. Pound's lawyer revealed, in his letters collected in *The Trial of Ezra Pound,* the true nature of Pound's supposed "insanity." In his letter to James Laughlin, Cornell admits to having conferred with Pound about pleading insane to have treason charges dropped. To this, Pound replied that the same thought had occurred to him as well (Swift, 2017, p. 9; Rushing, 1987, p. 121; Moody, 2015, p. 167).

I discussed with him the possibility of pleading insanity as a defense and he has no objection. In fact he told me that the idea had already occurred to him. In view of what we now know of his recent medical history, I think there is a good chance that such a defense might succeed. As you probably know, the trial of such an issue is almost always a farce, since learned medicos who testify for each side squarely contradict each other and completely befuddle the jury. It then largely becomes a question of the sympathy of the jury, assuming, of course, that there is no question of outright faking. (Cornell, 1966, p. 14)

It may be deduced from the above words that Cornell was formulating a defense that depended on convincing the jury as well as the doctors of Pound's forged insanity. In a letter to Dr. Wendell Muncie, Cornell provides a summary of Pound's achievements and writes that he "was stricken with violent terror and hysteria, and also affected with amnesia" due to his imprisonment in a gorilla cage near Pisa. Here, Pound spent weeks exposed to the harsh Mediterranean sun (Cornell, 1966, p. 32). Additionally, Cornell describes the state in which he found Pound upon his arrival:

When I asked him whether he wanted to stand mute or would prefer to enter a plea, he was unable to answer me. His mouth opened once or

twice as if to speak, but no words came out. He looked up at the ceiling and his face began to twitch. Finally he said he felt ill and asked if he could not go back to the infirmary. (Cornell, 1966, p. 32)

In addition to referring to Pound's arrival, Cornell attached excerpts from *The Pisan Cantos* to his letter, namely "Canto 74," to imply that the war and his imprisonment in Pisa had a lasting impact on the poet. He argued that the lines written by the poet revealed that he was unfit for trial (Swift, 2017, p. 71). At the time, the contents of "Canto 74" may have led the doctors to believe that Pound was indeed of unsound mind. However, Foucault's argument in *Madness and Civilization* that the language of madness can be forged and Felman's view in *Writing and Madness* that the language of madness bears contrasting, paradoxical statements provide insight into why the canto may have been perceived as a "narrative delirium" or a manifestation of madness. While writing *The Pisan Cantos,* Pound certainly did not seem to have the agenda of "forging" madness. It was only after Cornell's advice on pleading insane that Pound may have composed the poem to give the impression of the utterances of a madman, especially to those who were unfamiliar with his style. If this speculation is true, then one may claim that Pound was indeed not a madman but, as Mark Feldman describes in his article on Pound's legal case, "crazy like a fox," underscoring his scheming skills. In the third volume of his comprehensive biography on Pound, David Moody reveals that Cornell "unashamedly" falsified his accounts of Pound being unfit for trial (Moody, 2015, p. 184). Whether Pound helped Cornell build his case by providing him with *The Pisan Cantos* or not is a question that needs to be explored.

Textual History of *The Pisan Cantos* and Pound's Madness

For most of his literary career, Pound was working on composing the great epic of his time, which contained fragments of the best examples of human civilization. Pound's *The Cantos* is known for its long, intricate, and fragmented lines that are packed with heaps of images and texts from the past and the present, ranging in their subjects from history and myth to personal anecdotes. Time within *The Cantos* fluctuates from the Classical period to the twentieth century, and locations vary from the Far East Chinese dynasties to the house where Pound was born. The narratives of *The Cantos*, like the temporal and spatial fluctuations, are diverse; they range from fictional characters like Odysseus to contemporary political figures like Mussolini to Pound's accounts of the figures he had met in Europe and elsewhere. Because Pound's *The Cantos* contains such

accounts derived from his memory, at times, the line between fiction and reality is blurred, and history and myth transgress their boundaries, making it impossible to distinguish between fact and fiction. While one might be inclined to perceive these lines as authentic accounts of his life, given that they are recounted by various personae in the poem, it is equally plausible to read them as intentional constructions of fiction rather than accepting the confessional tone of the poem at its face value. Moody states that Pound could only be in his right mind when composing such an intricate and central part of *The Cantos*:

> There is an abundant yet controlled flow of material, made up of immediate and recollected and visionary experience. The language is consistently charged and layered with intricate meaning, and shaped into an ever-varying verse that is at once measured and free—the sort of verse in which every line-break is a discrimination. The entire sequence reads as free flowing natural speech, only heightened, concentrated, intensely energized; each line is separately formed, and yet fitted into an ongoing rhythm; and each canto finds its own definite form. The poet was evidently altogether in his right mind through those summer months; and still, only long practice in which acquired skills had become habitual, instinctive, could have enabled him to compose so well at such a rate, and in that place. (Moody, 2015, p. 135)

Viewed from this perspective, *The Pisan Cantos* may be erroneously understood as a poem written by a madman to an unfamiliar eye. In other words, Cornell could easily pass Pound's genius as a manifestation of his insanity.

Ronald Bush and David Ten Eyck observe that Pound suffered a mental breakdown during his arrest in Pisa, a period coinciding with the commencement of the composition of the Pisan sequence of *The Cantos* (Bush and Eyck, 2013, p. 122). *The Pisan Cantos* was first published in fragments in little magazines. The textual history of *The Pisan Cantos* reveals that although Pound started writing the poem while being held at the DTC near Pisa, hence the name *The Pisan Cantos*, he revised the manuscripts before they were published (Bush and Eyck, 2013, pp. 125–126). While there is no evidence of an intentional manipulation to plead insanity through his verse, the textual history shows that Pound was working on these cantos while his future was still uncertain, and he may have had the opportunity to tilt the scales to his advantage.

Language and the Construction of Insanity

Lars Bernaerts, Luc Herman, and Bart Vervaeck assert that an examination of the narratives of madness in fiction provides insight into the psychology of the literary characters and the writers' creative process and, therefore, "involves the wider domains of language and behavior" (Bernaerts et al., 2009, pp. 284–285). As they contend, mad narrators often signal an unreliable narration; however, mad narrators also encourage the reader to ask these questions: "Is the storyworld a mental projection? Is the main character [or narrator] truly mad?" (Bernaerts et al., 2009, p. 286). These were the very questions that critics raised during and after Pound's institutionalization, which further urges one to ask: If the madness of a poet can be proven through his poetry, could it also prove his sanity? What is more, what can it say about the distinction between fiction and reality? Can the written text prove that madness or sanity is constructed artificially, or effaced to disguise it? Since Cornell used "Canto 74" as proof of Pound's madness, suggesting that these were the true words of the poet rather than fictional constructs, can certain passages from "Canto 74" likewise prove that these are intentionally constructed manifestations of madness or examples of the narrative delirium forged by the poet? Shoshana Felman's definition of madness, rooted in a comparative discussion between Derrida's and Foucault's approaches to the language of madness, speaking and silence in relation to madness, seems to provide an answer to the present debate about madness and its position between reality and fiction:

> Madness can only occur within a world in conflict, within a conflict of thoughts. The question of madness is nothing less than the question of thought itself: the question of madness, in other words, is that which turns the essence of thought, precisely, *into a question*. (Felman, 2003, p. 36)

According to Felman, what is missing from the definitions of madness and the discussions about its position in literature is the boundary between reality and fiction or the end of thought and the beginning of madness (2003, p. 47). In light of her argument, the ambiguity of where reason ends and madness manifests itself in the utterances of characters demonstrates the fluid nature of the representations of madness. Therefore, the presence of conflicting thoughts may be one way of identifying madness, which may easily be constructed in fiction.

In "Fight Club and the Embedding of Delirium in Narrative," Lars Bernaerts discusses narrative delirium as a form of the manifestation of madness through a reading of Palahniuk's novel *Fight Club* (1996). According to Bernaerts, narrative delirium constructs a "delusional world" in which the narrator draws the reader in "by representing the delirium of the experiencing self without comment" (Bernaerts, 2009, p. 374). This type of narration, he argues, controls the dynamic of the text, creating "tensions and instabilities" that fluctuate between "mental representations of events and characters" (Bernaerts, 2009, p. 374). The narrative delirium

> takes shape when the narrator partly or fully relates the story from the perspective of a deranged character, regardless of whether the narrator himself is that character. The narrator displays the characters and events the way they are perceived and/or experienced by the mad subject. (Bernaerts, 2009, p. 374)

One of the defining features of "narrative delirium" is the creation of an alternative world as an interpretation and cognizance of reality by the mad subject, which is a form of the manifestation of madness. As such, the mad subject is convinced that his delirium sheds light on the "real, actual world" in which he has "deciphered" a secret code that proves "conspiracies and a national threat" (Bernaerts, 2009, pp. 377–379). Moreover, delirium is not only an interpretation of reality but also an alteration of reality as it becomes part of his understanding of the world around him. The delirium narrative helps the mad subject "to cope with the outside world and with himself," which typically includes psychotic themes and motifs like "persecution," "escape," "conspiracy," "threat," and "divine intervention" (Bernaerts, 2009, p. 383). As Bernaerts underscores, delirium may at times offer political asylum to characters, enabling them to symbolically escape from political oppression through institutionalization (Bernaerts, 2009, p. 384).

Accordingly, *The Pisan Cantos* registers as a delirium narrative. As *The Cantos* is made up of a palimpsest of texts, temporalities, and places, it may be regarded as a "delusional world" constructed by the poet. As Moody observes, the disassociated fragments especially present in the Pisan sequence are in fact "too dense, the ever-changing relations too fluid and complex, for deliberate analysis to do them any sort of justice. They need to be performed, and performed again and again, for their music to come clear" (Moody, 2015, p. 137).

Another reason Pound's poem might be viewed as a delirium narrative is the use of a wide range of topics, such as Confucius, the founding of the Bank of England, Italian politics, economic problems, his relationships with other people, including his wife Dorothy Shakespear and his mistress Olga Rudge (Swift, 2017, p. 33). Although these subjects may seem unrelated and take on the guise of the ramblings of a madman, they frequently appear throughout *The Cantos* and are juxtaposed to achieve layers of meanings, which was part of Pound's poetics.

One can argue that Pound's emphasis on the use of the vortex to compose great poetry imitates the delirium narrative. The language of the madman is interpreted as insane due to the lack of illogical, coherent statements and the use of dissociated images and fragmented utterances. Even though the use of the vortex and collaged fragments are not exclusive to *The Pisan Cantos*, the stylistic experimentation in these cantos is pushed to its limits. The magnified contrasts and the fragmented pieces of literature and history, as well as the poet's memory, are arranged in such a fashion that they imitate the "secret code" in which the madman speaks. The language in "Canto 74" remains caught between imitations of the utterances of the madman or the revelation of poetic genius.

The Manifestations of Madness: Silence and Language of the Madman in "Canto 74"

"Canto 74," which is the first of the *decad* of *The Cantos* entitled *The Pisan Cantos*, was composed during Pound's imprisonment near Pisa. Like in the rest of *The Cantos*, "Canto 74" presents numerous personae whose narratives blend into one another, obscuring the identity of the speaker. However, unlike the rest of *The Cantos,* "Canto 74" is unique in its use of complex characters, such as Odysseus, who oscillate between insanity and intelligence. Pound uses *The Odyssey* throughout *The Cantos*. However, in "Canto 74" specifically, the image of characters speaking and keeping silent is reiterated, as if the personae are reliving their decisions in life whether to speak up or remain silent. Such an example is Odysseus; in "Canto 74," he is presented in the moment when he reveals his true name to Polyphemus and where his cursed journey begins. Like in the previous cantos, Pound fuses the image of Odysseus, who reveals his true identity, with Wanjina and Ouan Jin who are also punished for speaking their minds. The personae in this section are compounded through the image of speaking and silent characters, which may be viewed as a metaphor for Pound's position since he believed that it was "speaking up" that led him into trouble.

> "I am noman [Odysseus], my name is noman"
> but Wanjina is, shall we say, Ouan Jin
> or the man with an education
> and whose mouth was removed by his father
>   because he made too many things
> whereby cluttered the bushman's baggage
> vide the expedition of Frobenius's pupils about 1938
>   to Auss'ralia
> Ouan Jin spoke and thereby created the named
>   thereby making clutter
>   (Pound, 1996, pp. 446–7)

The first line quoted is the sentence uttered by Odysseus, which is followed by the appearance of the Australian folkloric figure Wanjina and the reference to the life of Frobenius (Terrell, 1984, p. 365). A reader who is unfamiliar with Pound's technique might find these lines like the fragmented, unrelated ramblings of a madman. These utterances are presented in the form of run-on sentences, shifting between perspectives and subjects. These fragmented blocks called vortexes may be regarded as groupings of various themes and images, historical texts, and pieces of memory, converged to constitute a unified idea through a kaleidoscope of perspectives. In these lines, characters that represent silence serve as a means to establish the notion of persecution, one of the themes of delirium narratives. Odysseus declaring himself as no man, a nobody, to protect himself—an act of foresightedness in the poem—is interpreted as an act of silence by Pound. Alternatively, revealing Odysseus' true identity by declaring his name out loud after escaping the cave of Polyphemus is likened to the speech that resulted in Pound's imprisonment, the infamous radio broadcasts. Similarly, the image of Odysseus is parallel to Wanjina, who created the world by pronouncing the names of things. His father punishes him by closing his mouth. Ouan Jin is a man of letters, and Frobenius' life is cut short and his work is carried out by his students. In other words, the silencing of these characters by a "divine intervention" suggests that Pound saw the treason charges against him as an act of silencing truth, which in turn renders the fear of persecution. He declares in another line: "Tempus tacendi, tempus loquendi" (a time to speak, a time for silence) (Pound, 1996, p. 449).

According to Foucault, silence as well as speech may convince the audience of madness. That is, one is convinced of the insanity of the madman even before he speaks because the madman's delirium is rooted in his silence:

> We willingly believe that the madman is mad even before he begins to speak and that it's from the depths of this madness, of this originally silent madness, that he allows the obscure words of his delirium to rise up, belatedly in some sense, and circle around him like a swarm of blind flies. (Foucault, 2015, p. 25)

That is, madness reveals itself by what the madman utters or conceals, and the moment before he speaks, this potential is manifest in the eyes of the viewers who believe that the person across them is mad (Foucault, 2015, p. 25). "Tempus tacendi, tempus loquendi" (a time to speak, a time for silence), the lines in "Canto 74," may be interpreted in this manner to support the argument that this statement is telling of Pound's condition at the time. Speech and silence may be used and replaced with one another to hide or manifest madness. While speech can be used against the poet, as in the case of his radio broadcasts, to prove his guilt and insanity, silence may also be used against him to prove his innocence and insanity. In other words, silence, as well as speech, can be interpreted as madness depending on how the reader understands and analyzes them. While speaking may be linked with Pound's radio broadcasts on Radio Rome for which Pound was declared an enemy of the state and charged with treason, silence may render him an outcast in the same way that the madman becomes an outcast of the society. This is because when the poet is deprived of words, he ceases to be a poet and, like the madman, is denied of his existence.

Unlike the more organized blocks of ideas that are found in the previous cantos, the ones in *The Pisan Cantos* reveal a defeatist tone due to the lack of a coherent strain of images. Moreover, characters like Odysseus or Mussolini, who were associated with power and leadership, are described through the loss of their identities. For instance, "Canto 74" begins with the death of Mussolini, whom Pound admired as a great visionary leader.

> THE enormous tragedy of the dream in the peasant's bent
> shoulders
> Manes! Manes was tanned and stuffed,
> Thus Ben and la Clara *a Milano*
>   by the heels at Milano
> That maggots shd/ eat the dead bullock
> DIGONOS, Δίγονος, but the twice crucified
>   where in history will you find it? (Pound, 1996, p. 445)

In the poem, Mussolini is "twice crucified" and likened to Dionysus due to his double birth, and Pound calls it an "enormous tragedy" in history. Likewise, Dionysus, who is usually associated with euphoria and madness, is represented here as a diminished god (Pound, 1996, p. 445). Odysseus, another figure from Greek myths, whom Pound regarded as the first example of a "proto-Fascist leader," is repeatedly called ΟὝΤΙΣ, "No Man," in Greek (Flack, 2015, p. 105).

> a man on whom the sun has gone down 莫 ΟὝΤΙΣ
> . . .
> ΟὝΤΙΣ
> a man on whom the sun has gone down
> nor shall diamond die in the avalanche
> be it torn from its setting
> first must destroy himself ere others destroy him. (Pound, 1996, p. 450)

Odysseus is known as "the man of many wiles," which is a commendation of his intelligence and his scheming, sane mind. However, in "Canto 74," he is repeatedly portrayed in the moment of his loss of identity and revealing of his true name, as his trick against Polyphemus is reminded to the reader. In the famous scene in *The Odyssey*, Odysseus declares that he is "no man" upon being held captive in the cave of Polyphemus, Poseidon's son. By hiding his true self and symbolically giving up his identity, Odysseus protects himself and plans his escape. These examples may be regarded as representations of loss of identity: Mussolini's death, the double crucifixion of Dionysus, and Odysseus becoming "no man" strip them of their identities. These may be considered as forms of self-annihilation, suggestive of the poet's notions of failure or seeming failure as acts of protection and creating time to scheme a plan of escape. By portraying such characters, the poet presents to the reader a set of personae under the threat of destruction, which seems to align with the poet's personal life.

However, in the poem, with another allusion to Homer's *The Odyssey,* this "loss of identity" transforms into a temporary disguise. Throughout *The Odyssey*, Odysseus uses many forms of disguise and adapts to survive until the end, and when he finally reveals his true identity, he becomes the ruler of Ithaca after slaying the suitors. The reference that transforms the loss of identity from its negative meaning of failure into a hopeful temporary state of loss is achieved through an allusion to Circe. In *The Odyssey*, in Circe's house, Odysseus' men are captured after being poisoned and are transformed into

swine. The transformed men are only physically altered, but their intelligence remains human. This temporary "loss of identity" in the form of a physical disguise referred to in "Canto 74" (Pound, 1996, p. 456) may be likened to Pound's situation in which on the surface he accepts to "appear" mentally unfit while remaining sane and safe from being hanged for treason. The idea of disguising as a madman is not new, as Pound's ideal hero, Odysseus, also tries to fake his madness to avoid going to the Trojan War. If Pound was truly attempting to present himself as a madman through his verse, using the motif of disguise could be a means to convey this concept.

Another section in the poem that could be perceived as a manifestation of madness is seen in Pound's description of usury and economics, which is a frequent subject the poet discusses in *The Cantos*. According to Bernaerts, one of the themes of delirium narratives is the narrator believing he/she is part of a conspiracy and creating an alternative world in which he/she is aware of the secrets that remain undisclosed to other characters. As such, in "Canto 74," as well as other cantos and his essays, Pound believed that private investors and usurers were responsible for the deterioration of the economy, resulting in war.

> Robbing the public for private Individual's gain ΘΕⱯVLEIⱯ
> every bank of discount is downright Iniquity
> robbing the public for private Individual's gain
> (Pound, 1996, p. 457)

In the poem, he declares that private individual gain, which he associates with the Jewish community, is like Circe's poison, causing "petty larceny" that destroys the City of Dioce. Pound regarded this city to be the realization of his dream, aiming to establish a world in which writers and artists were supported by the government instead of such private investors. Pound's anti-Semitic views infiltrate into the poem's world, specifically in the City of Dioce. In such a world, the actual world is altered by the narrative created by the persona who believes that he has discovered the secrets to the causes of the Second World War. If paranoid statements, as Bernaerts claims, are one of the characteristics of the delirium narrative, Pound's lines quoted above exhibit an example of such a narrative by presenting a persona who feels paranoid, fears persecution, and knows about the conspiracy theories and the hidden secrets of the government.

Another characteristic of the madman's speech is his tendency to express non-consistent, conflicting ideas. According to Felman, the presence of contrasting statements

may be regarded as proof of madness, which seems relevant to the discussion of such dialectical conflicts in the poem (Felman, 2003, p. 36). While using binary opposites, oxymorons, and paradoxical statements cannot be considered as indications of a madman's speech, forcing these concepts to extreme limits could lead to such an impression. Similarly, Foucault underlines that madness manifests itself in binary oppositions:

> Madness, then, is not altogether in the image, which of itself is neither true nor false, neither reasonable nor mad; nor is it, further, in the reasoning which is mere form, revealing nothing but the indubitable figures of logic. And yet madness is in one and in the other: in a special version or figure of their relationship. (Foucault, 2015, p. 94)

In *Revels of Madness: Insanity in Medicine and Literature* (2002), Allen Thiher explores the narratives of madness from a narratological perspective. According to Thiher, the madman's perspective is a subject that narrative experimentations in modernism have frequently had to deal with (Thiher, 2002, p. 250). In addition, he claims that it is mainly "a response to madness," at times also including "the writer's own insanity" (Thiher, 2002, p. 251). Although he argues that there are various ways in which madness is manifest, one point may be adopted to the argument of Pound's *Pisan Cantos* as a manifestation of a madman:

> The fall into time is a destructive modernist possibility for living madness: madness also takes the form of nostalgia for the past as a present. It can take the form of death-oriented anguish about a continuity with the past after all relations to time have been severed. This theme of the past in the present is such a dominant modernist motif that it has led some theorists to consider the mad person's relation to time, in the form of regression, the key to all insanity. (Thiher, 2002, p. 277)

Thiher explicitly describes Pound's madness a "mimicked madness." Thus, one may argue that in light of his words given in the above quotation, Pound's personae in *The Pisan Cantos* may reveal a similar form of madness (Thiher, 2002, p. 250). *The Pisan Cantos*, more than any of the other cantos written at the time, was the most fragmented and contained some of the most extreme dialectical conflicts. As Moramarco observes, in *The Pisan Cantos,* the struggle between "order and chaos" seems to be predominant,

to which "building and demolishing" may be added as one of the prevailing dialectical conflicts (Moramarco, 1977, pp. 313–314). The use of these contrasting dynamics in the poem implies an unrelenting tension between the terms, which, to the unknowing reader, may present an endless inner conflict. As the structure of the poem indicates, the past and the present as well as power and submission are intertwined in *The Cantos*. That is, the theme of "the past in the present" already dominating the lines in *The Cantos* is pushed to the extreme so much so that it imitates the discordant utterings of a madman. This style, viewed together with the earlier autobiographical references in the poem, takes the form of a manifestation of madness, especially a mimicked one that exhibits the intentional subversions and mastery of Pound's style. Similar to the contrasting ideas and discordant utterances in the poem, Dr. Jerome Kavka, Pound's regular doctor at St. Elizabeths, observed in his meetings that Pound would speak in run-on sentences that expressed disconnected ideas brought together in a particular pattern (Swift, 2017, p. 70). Peter Morrall, in *Madness: Ideas about Insanity* (2017), refers to Foucault's case study of Pierre Rivière (1973) to contend that madness can indeed be fabricated. The complex steps of planning, executing the plan, and afterward pleading insanity in the case can be regarded as a process that can be fabricated. In the case of Pound, the poet's lawyer Cornell may have aided him to contrive "madness, badness, and normality" during his evaluation by the doctors (Morrall, 2017, p. 18). Dr. Kavka's familiarity with Pound's style suggests that if the doctors had been more acquainted with his verse, they might have understood—if at all present—that the "insanity" manifest in the poem was a construct.

In addition to Pound's *The Cantos* being presented as proof of his insanity during his trial, over the years, as if to present further hard evidence of his madness, his life in St. Elizabeths has been portrayed by biographers like that of an asylum novel. Miyatsu, in *Literatures of Madness,* defines the asylum novel as one in which "ostracized characters are thrown into community with other isolated and stigmatized figures, often against their will" (Miyatsu, 2018, p. 52). The biographies and conspiracy theories about Pound's life after his imprisonment in Pisa and the 12 years he spent in St. Elizabeths Hospital depict the poet's life as if it is a page-turner "asylum novel." Viewed from this perspective, Pound's stay at the hospital appears increasingly fantastical and fictional. Convinced by his lawyer to plead innocent by reason of insanity, Pound spent 12 years and 6 months in the mental institution. According to Rushing, Pound "allowed" himself to be declared "insane and incompetent" to avoid charges of treason (Rushing, 1987, p. 111). Many of his friends, including T. S. Eliot, Hemingway, Archibald MacLeish, and e. e.

cummings, tried to help him in the process as they were aware of the consequences of being charged with treason (Rushing, 1987, p. 119). In addition, Chace aligns with Torrey's perspective on the topic of Overholser's role in Pound's case. The head of St. Elizabeths knew that Pound was not insane but was in search of "a haven," and standing trial would mean the death penalty for the poet. As a result, Overholser acted as his savior at that moment (Chace, 1987, p. 138; Torrey, 1984, pp. 202–203). What Pound hoped to be just a few months of imprisonment turned into him spending 12 years in St. Elizabeths (Moody, 2015, p. 167).

Conclusion

Known as one of the most intricate sets of cantos Pound has written, and appreciated by Pound scholars as one of the most elaborate examples that demonstrate Pound's genius, "Canto 74" seems to also share common characteristics with what can be regarded as fictional manifestations of madness. This perceived similarity between the utterances of a madman and Pound's poetic style likely contributed to people's belief that the lines in "Canto 74" were proof of Pound's madness. The truth, however, seems to be the opposite. While the lines in "Canto 74" manifest Pound's stylistic experimentations to the extreme, as evidenced by the intricate layering of images and the presence of vortexes in the poem, the technique he employed could easily be misconstrued as illogical sentences uttered by a madman to the untrained eye. Thus, the pivotal question arises as to what extent Pound allowed his verse in "Canto 74" to be regarded as utterances of a madman, or did he write any lines to intentionally portray himself as insane to help his case? As Rushing remarks, for most people, *The Pisan Cantos* reveals the genius of Pound, demonstrating that such intelligence in poetry requires a sane rather than an incompetent mind (Rushing, 1987, p. 123). Although it seems unlikely that Pound may have composed his verse specifically to depict the characteristics of a madman, if indeed true, this would prove him as a schemer.

The image of the artist "swept along by the radical politics of his day," according to Mark Feldman, does not entirely portray the true story (Feldman, 2012, p. 84). Rather, he observes that the new data released by the FBI reveals that Pound's Radio broadcasts were only part of a greater agenda of his fascist ideology, and even before the war, his position was clear as evidenced by his various editorials in British and Italian fascist publications (Feldman, 2012, pp. 84–86). Even after spending more than a dozen years in St. Elizabeths, when he embarked on his journey back to Italy in 1958, Feldman notes

that Pound gave a fascist salute (Feldman, 2012, p. 88). He further reveals that during Pound's imprisonment in Pisa, the Department of Justice legal team regarded him to be "crazy like a fox," a term used to describe intelligence and scheming abilities that can be mistaken for insanity (quoted in Feldman, 2012, p. 89). In short, Feldman's article argues that besides being institutionalized for his propaganda against the US government, Pound ardently supported Italian Fascism. He was neither insane nor delusional and was saved from trial due to his great achievements as a poet (Feldman, 2012, p. 92). In light of Feldman's words, one may argue that although asserted by various sources that Pound was not in his right state of mind after his arrest in Pisa, it does not prove that his ideology was a result of his delusional state. By the same token, his lines written in Pisa, although to readers who are unfamiliar with Pound's style might appear as nonsensical, are arguably noted to be some of the most intelligently written lines of American poetry. Thus, one may claim that *The Pisan Cantos* does not illustrate a manifestation of madness per se but that of an even greater Odysseus-like dissimulator.

References

Bernaerts, L & Herman, L., & Vervaeck, B. (2009). Narrative threads of madness. *Style* 43(3), 283-290. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5325/style.43.3.283

Bernaerts, L. (2009) Fight club and the embedding of delirium in narrative. *Style*, 43(3), 373-387. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.5325/style.43.3.373

Bush, R. & Eyck, D. T. (2013). A critical edition of ezra pound's *pisan cantos*: problems and solutions. *Textual Cultures,* 8(2), 121–141. *Project Muse*, doi: 10.14434/tc.v8i2.13278

Chace, W. M. (1987). Ezra pound: 'insanity,' 'treason,' and care." *Critical Inquiry*, 14(1), 134-141. https://www.jstor.org/stable/1343575

Cornell, J. (1966). *The trial of ezra pound*. London, UK: Faber and Faber.

Feldman, M. (2012). The 'pound case' in historical perspective: an archival overview." *Journal of Modern Literature*, 35(2), 83-97. https://www.jstor.org/stable/10.2979/jmodelite.35.2.83

Felman, S. (2003) *Writing and madness: literature/philosophy/psychoanalysis*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Flack, L. C. (2015). "'The news in the odyssey is still news': Ezra Pound, W. H. D. rouse, and a modern odyssey." *Modernism/Modernity*, 22(1), 105-124. doi: 10.1353/mod.2015.0001

Foucault, M. (2015). *Language, madness and desire*. Minnesota: University of Minnesota P. (1988). *Madness and civilization: A history of insanity in the age of reason*. New York, NY: Vintage.

Miyatsu, R. (2018). 'Hundreds of people like me': a search for a mad community in *the bell jar*. In E. J. Donaldson (Ed.), *Literatures of madness: Disability studies and mental health*. London, UK: Palgrave.

Moody, D. (2015) *Ezra pound: Poet, a portrait of the man and his work, vol. III: The tragic years 1939-1972*. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.

Morall, P. (2017). *Madness: Ideas about insanity*. New York, NY: Taylor and Francis, Routledge.

Moramarco, F. (1977). Concluding an epic: The drafts and fragments of *the cantos*. *American Literature*, 49(3), 309-326. https://www.jstor.org/stable/2924984

Pound, E. (1996). *The Cantos of Ezra Pound*. New York, NY: New Directions.

Rushing, C. L. (1987). 'Mere words': The trial of ezra pound. *Critical Inquiry*, 14(1), 111-133. https://www.jstor.org/stable/1343574

Swift, D. (2017). *The Bughouse: The Poetry, Politics and Madness of Ezra Pound*. New York, NY: Penguin Vintage.

Terrell, C. F. (1984). *A Companion to the Cantos of Ezra Pound*. Oakland, CA: University of California Press.

Thiher, A. (2002). *Revels in madness: insanity in medicine and literature.* Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press.

Torrey, E. F. (1984). *The roots of treason: Ezra pound and the secrets of st. Elizabeths.* Lucas, KS: Lucas Books.

The Bounds of Translatorial Perspective in the Turkish Translation of Rita Mae Brown's *Rubyfruit Jungle*

Göksenin ABDAL[1]

[1]Asst. Prof., Erzincan Binali Yıldırım University, College of Foreign Languages, Erzincan, Turkiye

ORCID: G.A. 0000-0002-7122-0516

Corresponding author:
Göksenin ABDAL,
Erzincan Binali Yıldırım University, College of Foreign Languages, Erzincan, Turkiye
E-mail: goksenin.abdal@erzincan.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Queer translation brings new possibilities for expanding the definitions of gender identities and sexual orientations in the contexts of language. By adding alternative meanings to sexual expressions outside the heterosexual matrix, this type of translation has the potential to deconstruct the given categories of gender and sexuality in patriarchal culture. This is further enhanced by the collective ventures of literary agents publishing literary texts with queering perspectives in defiance of the aggression, stigmatization, and discrimination against sexually marginalized identities in society. This study aims to find answers to the question of how translatorial decisions affect the outlook of queerness in Yakut Orman, Dılşa Ritsa Eşli's 2021 Turkish translation of Rita Mae Brown's (1973) *Rubyfruit Jungle*, which is considered a reference book for queer literature in the Western world. This study is comprised of three parts. The first part provides an outline of the queer translation approach as a novel critique of the reflections of heteronormativity within translation practices in the target language, literature, and culture system. The second part presents a brief analysis of the implicit and explicit references to queerness in *Rubyfruit Jungle*, while the third part focuses on how the notion of queerness has been recreated in its Turkish translation *Yakut Orman* within the context of Démont's (2018) conceptualization of queer translation. Ultimately, Eşli is revealed to have given accurate depictions of the queer identity in some areas, but Eşli's queering perspective failed to reach its full potential due to the intense use of Démont's misrecognizing translation with the implication of the hegemonic heterosexual and/or male gaze in the Turkish version, resulting in a limited representation of queerness in the target context.

Keywords: Queer translation, Rita Mae Brown, *Rubyfruit Jungle*, *Yakut Orman*, Umami Kitap

Introduction

Starting with the cultural turn and its extended critiques of the widely accepted dichotomies of author/translator, source text/translation, and source culture/target culture (Hermans, 1985; Bassnett & Lefevere, 1990), feminist translations have brought forward the secondary position of female agents in the literary system. The collective efforts of feminist translation researchers have triggered debates on the marginalized position of women in literary genres, translations included, and contributed to changes in the definition of translation from a solely linguistic transfer to an act of resistance against the hierarchical ways of meaning making as imposed by the processes of male-dominant discourse production through linguistic materials in the patriarchal system. For Godard (1984/2022), translators with feminist perspectives may realize this move by attempting to "found a new concrete language in which to convey the realities of the female body, to enter into the fiercely contested terrain of the genders of language" (p. 15). Thus, feminist translators can be asserted to directly engage with hegemonic language contexts and to represent women's issues more transparently by inventing a new language beyond the hegemonic gender binary that has kept women in a lower position in the public sphere.

Chamberlain (1988) attributed such radical changes to reinterpretation of the roles of metaphorics between gender and translation in the makings of the "power relations as they divide in terms of gender; of a persistent (though not always hegemonic) desire to equate language or language use with morality; of a quest for originality or unity, and a consequent intolerance of duplicity, of what cannot be decided" (p. 465) This has turned feminist translation into a new paradigm with unrelenting attempts of feminist agents in "at least two directions at once: at conventional language use *per se* and at traditional views of translation" (Flotow, 1991, p. 81). In this way, they potentialize certain changes in the hierarchy of the source text over translation in the literary scene, as well as the misogynist statements against women in the public sphere with new critical grounds for eliminating such discriminatory discourses that are deeply rooted in social life.

The resistance against systemic views toward linguistic production helps extend these critical remarks with more egalitarian reflections of the sexually marginalized "other" in translation theory. In that vein, the queering perspectives within translation studies point to an overarching translation approach that rejects the prevalent outlook

on the sharply defined and divided areas of gender identity and sexual orientation, and undermining the queering perspective within translation studies may be set forth by rejecting the prevalent outlook on the sharply defined areas of gender identity and sexual orientation, as well as the demand "that sexual minorities identify themselves through usages of language that are easily recognized as expressions of their sexual identities" (Keenaghan, 1998, p. 282). In this respect, translators with queering perspectives create new possibilities against strict categorizations in patriarchal culture. For Harvey (2000), this is largely embodied if "this presents the reader with explicit accounts of homosexual experience and struggle" (p. 159). By doing so, the queer translation approach brings deconstructed and reconstructed manifestations of gender and sexuality to the target readership. Spurlin (2014) refers to the potentialities of this resisting move as noted below:

> These forms of translation constitute the possibility of a queer echo, an iteration not resulting in unity, equivalence, or exact repetition, but remaining in an imperfect relationship to the original source, ensuring that the very gap of difference and otherness is not elided, but remains "without limitations and without abjection" in a reciprocal process of intertextual illumination. (p. 210)

Thus, implying queerness or involving queer aspects in a translation stands out as a better way of representing the queer identity in literary contexts. This study aims to seek answers to this question with examples from the English and Turkish versions of Brown's (1973) pioneering queer novel *Rubyfruit Jungle*, published in a timeframe almost fifty years apart in each language. The next section discusses the theoretical aspects of the queer translation approach with regards to its potential for exposing the range of the hegemonic heterosexual gaze in the target system.

Queer Translation as a Way to Resist the Hegemony of Heterosexuality

Queer translation is deemed to be a mode of translation that resists the schematic ways of thinking restricted to the internalized categories of gender and sexuality outside of heterosexuality. As Burton (2010) implied, it stands out for being "*antihomophobic* in motivation and practice, and *destabilising* and *historicising* of gender, sex, and sexuality norms" (p. 55). In this way, it alloys and dislocates the situated knowledge practices

prioritizing heterosexuality by further incorporating the actualities of LGBTQ+ identities into meaning-making processes. This critical function forms potent bases for "the creation of epistemological and discursive spaces to think and represent same-sex desire, but also, beyond it, the emerging recognition, advocacy, and discursive codification of homosexual identity" (Breen, 2012, p. 8). Here, queer translation is accommodated as a knowledge production process directed toward equally representing non-heterosexual identities with an urge to make them more visible and recognizable in the public sphere.

In this manner, the queer translation practice facilitates new spaces of contact and encounter that help literary agents "touch, caress, fondle, inhabit, but never possess fully, another textual body always already foreign to the translator's own" (Spurlin, 2014, p. 213). In return, the practice also carves out negotiation spaces in which the stigmatized nomenclatures relating to the heterosexual matrix are brought up for discussion. For Baer (2018), such spaces substantially carry the traces of collectivity, as queer translation is a "complex act of cultural negotiation, resistance, and world-making" (p. 54) in such uncanny contexts. By doing so, queer translation leads to an activist mode of rewriting that encompasses the resisting ventures of the literary agents engaged with it. By virtue of its activist side, queer translation paves the way for an oppositional stance that "exposes the true nature of notions unquestioningly accepted, demonstrating a mode of resistance against strict gender divisions" (Chan, 2018, p. 107). Therefore, including queering perspectives in translations has the potential to interrupt the flow of exclusionary concepts and alter the gendered nature of language contexts by blurring or fluidizing how gender is classified in the target culture.

Here, gender studies scholar Evren Savcı's (2020) question clearly embodies how translators' ordeals appear to their minds on the grueling path upon which they embark during a translation task: "[H]ow do we understand translation not as a flawless bridge or as total impossibility but as a mode of analysis that opens up ways of seeing the very conditions under which it unfolds?" (p. 59) The suggested answer to this question may be the restriction of the social sphere to gender identities and/or the non-conformance of sexual orientations to the idealized gender image perpetuated by heteronormativity, which limits the presence and representation of LGBTQ+ realities in the contexts of languages. As such, the fact that translators resort to self-categorizations by "adopting a lesbian identity, itself a work of translation, in a culture in which there is no word for 'lesbian'" (Gairola, 2017, p. 73) does not seem surprising. Even though

self-categorization is positioned as a seemingly contradictory notion for the stability, consistence, and permanence of a gendered self, it aids in constructing "new stories, produc[ing] new meanings and possibilities, and re-semantici[zing] global LGBT terminologies" (Bassi, 2017, p. 239). By approaching gender roles with witteness and humor rather than solemnity, queering perspectives in translation make light of the firmly established and divided spheres of gender and sexuality by diminishing the distance between them (Chan, 2018). In this respect, queer translation helps explore alternating perspectives outside the binary gender regime with the will to deconstruct the political devices of power, morality, and intolerance in patriarchal culture.

These potentialities are also reflected in Marc Démont's (2018) conceptualization of queer translation. By presupposing the active participation of translators in meaning-making processes prevailing in the translation of queer texts, Démont refers to three different modes of translating: misrecognizing, minoritizing, and queering. For Démont, these modes operationalize as follows:

> Whereas the misrecognizing translation simply ignores queerness, the minoritizing translation congeals queerness's drifting nature by flattening its connotative power to a unidimensional and superficial game of denotative equivalences. In contrast to these two approaches, I argue that a specific "queering" stance can be developed in which queerness is, on the one hand, made salient thanks to a queer critique of existing translations, and on the other, is respected in its intangibility by developing techniques to preserve, using Kwame Anthony Appiah's expression, the thickness of queer literary texts. (p. 157)

In Démont's (2018) terms, misrecognizing translations refer to the exclusion of queer imagery from the translated version of the source text, while minoritizing translations substantiate the act of narrowing down and/or restricting the fluidity of gender and sexuality in the target language. However, the queering mode of translation highlights the queer outlook of the source text and may also include further queer aspects in the translated version.

By reflecting on a non-dichotomous understanding of meaning making in the translation process, this study utilizes Démont's (2018) conceptualization in the comparative analysis of examples from *Rubyfruit Jungle* and its Turkish translation,

Yakut Orman. The next section will briefly analyze the implicit and explicit references to queerness using reference to narrative elements from *Rubyfruit Jungle*.

Traces of "Queerness' in *Rubyfruit Jungle*

Rubyfruit Jungle, first published in 1973, is considered one of the reference books of queer literature in the Western world. The novel focuses on the life of Molly Bolt, from the discovery of her lesbianism in her early teenage years on into her adulthood. In the novel, Molly is depicted as a courageous character with an unyielding appetite for exploring sexuality, which she fearlessly shares with the people around her. Marginalized because of her frankness, and therefore at odds with her family, Molly gets a scholarship that allows her to depart her hometown and attend college in Florida. Although she manages to leave her town in a short time, school authorities force Molly to maintain so-called "decent" relations with her peers, which limits her freedom, much like in her family circle (Lorig, 2020). The aggression, stigmatization, and discrimination she faces in the school environment bring her to the edge of questioning her sexual orientation from time to time. By depicting Molly in such challenging situations in the novel, Brown largely answers the question of how the societal standards of heterosexuality shape what is considered normal by "demanding answers to questions heteronarratives neither highlight nor resolve" (Cooper, 2019, p. 5). In this way, Brown's novel turns into a statement against the repercussions of heteronormativity and the binary gender regime in literary narratives and storytelling.

Molly's relocation from Florida to New York to pursue a degree in film studies also changes her mentality regarding other LGBTQ+ people. She is taken aback each time she meets people who are rich and white but more closeted than her despite their privileges due to their race and social class. However, Molly becomes more and more self-contained, as she prefers "to dismantle social hierarchies rather than climb them, rejecting the discourses that construct her as 'queer' and as 'bastard'" (Saxey, 2005, p. 35). Molly's days in New York evoke in her the memories of her hometown and the struggles she has faced until the moment she returns to her hometown for a documentary project. This creates a tug-of-war between the pain of the past and the need to fit into a new and unfamiliar place in the present. Her journey back to her hometown to make a documentary movie about herself helps resolve this dilemma. In her family house, she gets the opportunity to prove "her resistance by refusing to knuckle under to the forces that constrain her, clinging to the goal of artistic achievement that she has set

herself" (Elliott, 2006, p. 106). These incidents form invisible bonds between Molly's past and present selves, which are notably reminiscent of the challenges the LGBTQ+ community faces in today's world.

Aside from the explicit queer themes surrounding Molly's experiences, the novel also has implicit references to non-heterosexual ways of meaning making. For instance, the term of rubyfruit in the title is based on a metaphor Molly uses while talking to her partner about the possible roots of her lesbianism. In the dialogue, Molly explains her attraction to women by drawing a comparison between rubyfruit and vaginas, because they "are thick and rich and full of hidden treasures and besides that, they taste good" (Brown, 1973, p. 178). Similarly, she resorts to saying "grapefruit freak" while describing the gayness of the person to whom her close friend Calvin is attracted. Molly uses the word "grapefruit" as an allusion to male genitalia to say that Ronnie Rapaport (the guy her best friend Calvin fancies) "gets his kicks out of being blasted with grapefruits" (Brown, 1973, p. 126) because he prefers having sex with men. In this sense, the identification of male and female genitalia with different exotic fruits is part of the queer politics prevailing in the choice of "fruit" being originally used to refer to a "gay man. Originally US or prison slang" in Polari [gay cant] (Baker, 2002, p. 30). By including gay females in the definition of 'fruit,' Brown openly queers the identificatory image underlying its semantics and expands the meaning of the word to include lesbianism, which encompasses the queering perspective of the author in the novel.

The implicit references in the novel are not limited to the identification of male and female genitalia with fruit. While describing the societal pressures on her sexuality, Molly asks "Why does everyone have to put you in a box and nail the lid on it?" (Brown, 1973, p. 95) and associates the obligation of concealing a sexual orientation with "being in the closet." In Molly's question, the word "box" relates to a coffin, and "lid' to a mortcloth, which parallels Baker's explanation of closet as "the status of a gay man or lesbian who is yet to declare their sexuality. Most likely from the American idiom *skeleton in the closet* meaning a secret, although the word has become widened to refer to other forms of secrecy" (Baker, 2002, p. 99). For Molly, being in the closet is equivalent to lying dead in a coffin, as clearly seen in her remonstration against the disregard for her sexuality in the public.

In the introduction of the 2015 reprint of *Rubyfruit Jungle*, Brown substantiates her initial claim for the queer outlook on the novel with her disbelief in binary categories as indicated below:

> There are no lower orders. There are no lesbians or transgender people or fill in the blank. There are only people, a wild mix of energy, different abilities, colors ranging from ebony to bleached white. We're everything and everybody. I don't even believe in male and female, it's a sliding scale and we are hag-ridden by a binary culture: male-female, black-white, straight-gay, rich-poor, and so it goes. The gradations are infinite and the silliest mistake of all is to define people by material possessions. It's even worse if people define themselves by money. (p. xiii)

These words summarize Brown's approach to sexuality and gender identity in society, which is supported by the queer potentialities of explicitly queer themes and implicit references to queerness in her novel. Thus, to assert that blurring the strict divisions among gender identities and sexual orientations accommodates a pioneering position to *Rubyfruit Jungle* in modern literature would not wrong. In this respect, seeing the publishing house *Umami Kitap* (henceforth Umami) disseminate the novel in the Turkish context due to the publishing house having been established to look "for togetherness, trying to bring the text before the reader without making it a *fait accompli*, from its voice to its temporality" (5Harfliler, 2021). As such, the decision to commission Dılşa Ritsa Eşli as a feminist lesbian translator (Ak & Çoban, 2022) seemingly fulfilled Umami's goals for creating more accurate depictions of queerness in the target system.

The next section will assess the question of how queering perspectives have been potentialized in the Turkish translation of *Rubyfruit Jungle*, translated *Yakut Orman*, with examples in light of Démont's (2018) conceptualization of queer translation strategies.

Translatorial Decisions in the Turkish Translation of *Rubyfruit Jungle*

The publication of the Turkish translation of Brown's *Rubyfruit Jungle* [*Yakut Orman*] has given rise to a wave of hope and solidarity among the LGBTQ+ community in Türkiye. Many supporting reviews were published on online news and book review platforms, giving a shoulder to Umami's brand-new publication, *Yakut Orman*. While the social media writer Esra Ece Kuleci (2022) defined the novel as a "book surrounded by such a great circle of love and solidarity by LGBTI+s and women" (2022) in *Aposto*, an online blog about art, culture, life, and literature, the LGBTQ+ activist and reporter Yıldız Tar (2021) perceived it as a "solid response to the heteronormative matrix with

the help of a circular wave of queerness" in *Kaos GL*, the pioneering LGBTQ+ journal in Türkiye. In this manner, the novel is framed as a "story of finding yourself, being yourself and coming of age" (Sebahat, 2022). The comments above imply the crucial role of literature and literary texts in establishing potent grounds of solidarity around the notion of queerness as a unifying motive of the movement for gender equality in an oppressive country such as Türkiye.

One can realize that the publisher Umami has also been critically acclaimed in the Turkish context, as seen from how its publishing activities have been received by the online culture and art platforms. The first interview with Umami's publishing team of Seçil Epik, Bike Su Öner, and Büşra Mutlu was conducted by *Bantmag*, a music, cinema and arts fanzine, just one month after the publication of the novel in Türkiye. In the interview, Umami is introduced as a daring publisher that "launched an exciting adventure to bring queer and feminist novels from the world literature into Turkish" (*Bantmag*, 2021). While referring to Umami as adventurous, *Bantmag* directly attracted attention to the taskof publishing the novel in the current political atmosphere and helped contextualize Umami as a pioneering agent of queer literature with such a bold move in the country. Furthermore, online feminist blog 5Harfliler's (2021) interview positioned Umami in a politicized context with its motive "that interrupts the publishing industry spinning around the wheel of market and patriarchy and invites the reader to join this action." In this way, the political agenda behind the founding of Umami is revealed, with an emphasis on its stance against the impact of the market economy and patriarchy in the Turkish publishing industry. In *Gazete Duvar*'s (2021) interview, art critic İlker Cihan Biner also discussed Umami in a politicized context with the implication of its status as "a network where literature, politics and social sciences come into contact in a queer and feminist perspective." Biner (2021) saw Umami's publishing activities as "not only as a fulfillment of moral responsibility for creating an alternating space for existence, actuality, and living, but also a breath of fresh air in the stifling political environment of the country." In this sense, a bond of communion was developed with Umami, bringing the possibility of perceiving it as an insider in the LGBTQ+ community in Türkiye.

Thus, the extensive use of implicit and/or explicit queer references in the source text and the positioning of its publisher, author, and translator as queer agents in the target system have created strong expectations for its Turkish translation to imply queerness, especially with the addition of positive comments from culture and art media in the target context. Therefore, making an in-depth analysis of Eşli's translatorial

decisions is a good idea for seeing whether these queer potentialities were actualized in the translation.

Queer footprints can be traced in *Yakut Orman*, the Turkish translation of *Rubyfruit Jungle*, that help build more egalitarian grounds for representing queerness among the target readers. The excerpt in Table 1 shows how the queering translation was operationalized in the context of *Yakut Orman*.

Table 1. Queering Translation in the Case of the Word "Fuck" in the Target Text	
Source Text	"I knew about <u>fucking</u> and getting stuck together like dogs and I didn't want to get stuck like that" (p. 45)
Target Text	*"<u>Düzüşmeyi</u> ve sokaktaki köpekler gibi birbirine geçmeyi biliyordum ama onlar gibi kilitlenip kalmak istemiyordum"* (p. 45)
Back Translation	"I knew how to <u>screw</u> and interlock like street dogs, but I didn't want to be locked up like them"

In Table 1, Eşli uses the word *düzüşme*[1] [screwing] in reply to "fucking" in the target text. While "to fuck" can be translated as *sikişmek*[2] [to dick], with *sik*[3] implying the male genitalia to be a "dick" in the target language, Eşli neutralized the word by interrupting the emphasis on the dominance of male genitalia in its context. With this decision, Eşli limited the impact area of hegemonic heterosexual gaze relating to the sexual intercourse context in the patriarchal culture and helped to imply the queerness of the target text. The next example of this mode of translation is the use of *Lubunca* [Turkish LGBT+ cant] words in the target text. As a common cant among the LGBTQ+ community in Türkiye, *Lubunca* "emerged as a coded language among the *köçek* [dancer boys] and *tellak* [bath attendants], people who were gay sex workers in the Ottoman Empire in the 16th century" (Erdem, 2019, p. 35). However, *Lubunca* became a jargon of resistance against public authorities by the trans sex workers who'd undergone violent persecutions in the 1980s (Kelavgil, 2021). In some parts of the target text, Eşli uses *Lubunca* terms and explains them with footnotes to bring the queer way of talking before the target readership. As such, footnoting turns the text into "an educational tool supported with scholarly research" (Flotow, 1991, p. 77) owing to its potentials to showcase how the LGBTQ+ community expresses themselves, making queerness more visible in return.

---

1   *Düzüşmek*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/d%C3%BCz%C3%BC%C5%9 Fmek-nedir-ne-demek/

2   *Sikişmek*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/siki%C5%9Fmek-nedir-ne-demek/

3   *Sik*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/sik-nedir-ne-demek/

In this respect, footnoting for *Lubunca* can be related to the mode of queering translation in Démont's (2018) model. The excerpt in Table 2 shows how this motive was potentialized in Eşli's translatorial decisions.

Table 2. Queering Translation in the Case of the Word "*Butchess*" in the Target Text	
ST	"Wonderful, I can be a <u>butchess</u>." (p. 104)
TT	"Harika, ben senin <u>butch leydin</u> olabilirim." (p. 102)
BT	"Wonderful, I can be your <u>butch lady</u>."

*I*n Table 2, Eşli uses the phrase *butch leydi* in exchange for "butchess" in the target text. With the addition of the feminine suffix "-ess", the word "butchess" derives from "butch,"[4] which means "aggressively masculine" (Baker, 2002, p. 91) in gay slang. In the footnote, Eşli explained it as "a reference to lesbians who tend to be masculine in terms of their external appearance. Even though it is a word related to lesbian culture historically, it is used by many people who position themselves in different parts of the spectrum of gender identity and sexual orientation" (Brown, 2021, p. 102). By adding *leydi* [lady] to the word, Eşli compensates for the suffix "-ess" and draws closer to the emphasis on "femininity' in the source text. In this way, Eşli surpasses its negative connotations and extends its meaning to lesbianism, which helps to position this decision in Démont's (2018) mode of queering translation.

Table 3. Queering Translation in the Case of the Phrase "*Pick Up*" in the Target Text	
ST	Lesbians don't <u>pick</u> each other up on the street (p. 125)
TT	*Lezbiyenler sokaktan <u>koli</u> yapmazlar* (p. 123)
BT	Lesbians don't make a <u>trick</u> on the street.

In Table 3, Eşli uses the word *koli* in exchange for "pick up" in the target text. While the term "pick up" refers to a trick ("a sexual pick up" [Baker, 2002, p. 206]) in gay slang, *koli* means "someone you have sex with" (Karaahmet, 2019) in Turkish *Lubunca*. Eşli explained this decision with a footnote, saying, "It refers to sex or someone you have sex with in *Lubunca*, a jargon used by the LGBTI+ in Türkiye" (Brown, 2021, p. 123). In this way, Eşli familiarizes the target readers with *Lubunca*, which serves to further reflect the queer way of life in the target text. Hence, this decision can also be included in the context of a queering translation.

4　Butch (2023, 6 April) *Dictionary.com*. Address: https://www.dictionary.com/browse/butch

Table 4. Queering Translation in the Case of the Word "*Hustle*" in the Target Text	
ST	Then I have to go out and <u>hustle</u> for a place to stay tonight (p. 129)
TT	*Sonra gece kalacak yer bulmak için <u>çarka çıkarım</u>* (p. 127)
BT	Then I <u>gazoopy</u> to find a place to stay overnight.

In Table 4, Eşli uses the phrase *çarka çıkmak* in exchange for "hustle" in the target text. The word "hustle" means "gazoopy" ("to perform sexually for money" [Baker, 2002, p. 131]) in gay slang. While *çarka çıkmak* is generally used as a connotation of prostitution in *Lubunca*, Eşli expanded its meaning, explaining it as "looking for sex with someone in *Lubunca*. It generally describes sex for money" (Brown, 2021, p. 127). Thus, Eşli eliminated the negative connotations in its definition and set fruitful grounds for eradicating the prejudice towards the context of *çarka çıkmak* in the target readership, which in return relates it with the queering translation.

Table 5. Queering Translation in the Case of the Phrase "*Chicken Queen*" in the Target Text	
ST	If you were a man, they'd call you a <u>chicken queen</u> (p. 146)
TT	*Eğer erkek olsaydın sana <u>mantici</u> derlerdi farkındasın değil mi*? (p. 144)
BT	Do you know they would call you as a <u>chicken hawk</u> if you were a man?

In Table 5, Eşli uses the term *mantici* for "chicken queen" in the target text. The phrase "chicken queen" is derived from "chicken hawk" ("one who prefers to have sex with young men" [Baker, 2002, p. 96]) in gay slang. Eşli's decision gives a feminine aspect to the term with the change of "queen" to "hawk" in the translation. Because *manti* means "young men who are 'not homosexual' but have sex with a homosexual man" (Karaahmet, 2019), Eşli positions *mantici* [*manti* maker] by saying "Chicken queen' refers to old gay men who prefer to have sex with young men in the English LGBTI+ jargon. In this text, the translation of *mantici* derives from *Lubunca*, as well. *Manti* refers to young man in *Lubunca*" (Brown, 2021, pp. 144–145). By actively operationalizing *Lubunca*, Eşli brings new possibilities for representing queerness in *Yakut Orman*, which is in line with the queering translation in Démont's (2018) model.

The second mode of translation in the context of *Yakut Orman* is the minoritizing translation. This mode of translation narrows down the conceptualization and representation of queerness in the target language, thus limiting the actualities of the queer identity within linguistic contexts. The excerpt in Table 6 indicates how this mode of translation was operationalized in *Yakut Orman*.

Table 6. Minoritizing Translation in the Case of the Word "*Queer*" in the Target Text	
ST	I'm very feminine, how can you call me a <u>queer</u>? (p. 94)
TT	*Baksana bana ne kadar feminenim, nasıl bana <u>lezbiyen</u> dersin?* (p. 92)
BT	See how feminine I am, how would you call me a <u>lesbian</u>?

In Table 6, Eşli uses the word *lezbiyen*[5] in reply to "queer" in the target text. While "queer" had become "a popular derogatory term for a homosexual by the early-mid twentieth century" (Baker, 2002, p. 183), its meaning has been extended to "[g]ay, lesbian, bisexual, transgendered, black, Latino, working-class or a combination of any or all of the above" (Baker, 2002, p. 183) thanks to theoretical expansions of queer theory. By reducing "queer" to "lesbian" in the target text, Eşli highlights lesbianism, excluding other sexualities from the scope of the translation. The main character of the text being lesbian contributes to the general outlook of the text before the target readership. However, this narrows down the context of queer as an umbrella term for all sexualities outside of heterosexuality. In this respect, this decision can be considered a part of the minoritizing translation in the target context.

Another example of this mode of translation is the lack of footnoting for words or phrases that may be difficult for the target readers to contextualize. This limits the representation of queer aspects of life and reduces the expansions of queerness before the target readership. The excerpt in Table 7 demonstrates how this decision was reflected in the context of *Yakut Orman*.

Table 7. Minoritizing Translation in the Case of the Phrase "*Golden Shower Queen*" in the Target Text	
ST	It hit rock bottom for me when she wanted to be told she was a <u>golden shower queen</u>. (p. 182)
TT	*Benim için seks hayatımızın dibe vurduğu nokta Polina'nın kendisine <u>"altın duş kraliçesi"</u> dememi istemesiydi.* (p. 178)
BT	The bottom of our sex life was when Polina asked me to call her as "<u>golden shower queen</u>.

In Table 7, Eşli uses the phrase *altın*[6] *duş*[7] *kraliçesi*[8] in reply to "golden shower queen" in the target text. The phrase "golden shower" refers to "the act of urinating on someone, for sexual gratification" (Baker, 2002, p. 137) in gay slang. Brown expands its meaning to

---

5   *Lezbiyen*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/lezbiyen-nedir-ne-demek/
6   *Altın*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/alt%C4%B1n-nedir-ne-demek/
7   *Duş*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/du%C5%9F-nedir-ne-demek/
8   *Kraliçe*. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/krali%C3%A7e-nedir-ne-demek/

lesbianism by involving "queen," ("any gay man" [Baker, 2002, p. 182]) in this context. Based on its definition in the English-Turkish dictionary,[9] Eşli made a direct transfer of the phrase without explaining it with a footnote. In return, the target readers are challenged to recontextualize the word and relate it to the general outlook of queerness in the target language. Thus, this decision can be evaluated in the scope of a minoritizing translation.

The third mode of translation in the context of *Yakut Orman* is the misrecognizing translation. This mode of translation potentially maintains hegemonic ideas centered around the notion of heteronormativity and thus serves to endanger queer imagery within linguistic contexts. The excerpt in Table 8 indicates how this is reflected in the target text.

Table 8. Misrecognizing Translation in the Case of the Word "*Fuck*" in the Target Text	
ST	Well, I ain't <u>fuckin</u>' unless you take every stitch off. (p. 61)
TT	*"Her şeyi çıkarmazsan seninle <u>sikişmem</u>."* (p. 60)
BT	I won't <u>dick</u> you unless you take everything off.

In Table 8, Eşli uses the word *sikişmek* in exchange for "to fuck" in the target text. As mentioned before, the word *sikişmek* [to dick] is based on the word *sik* referring to the male genitalia as a "dick" in the target language. By implying the impact area of male genitalia [*sik*], *sikişmek* reduces the scope of sexual intercourse to men's superiority over women, and thus has the potential to maintain the hegemonic heterosexual male gaze in translation. Here, Eşli did not limit the impact area of male hegemony but rather allowed it to become more visible. Thus, this decision can be seen as part of the misrecognizing translation in the target context.

Eşli's choice regarding the word *ibne* for "queer" constitutes another example of this mode of translation. The excerpts in Table 9 exemplify how this was operationalized in the target text.

---

9   Golden shower. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/golden%20shower-nedir-ne-demek/

Table 9. Misrecognizing Translation in the Case of the Word "*Queer*" in the Target Text

ST	He don't look no <u>queer</u> to me (p. 58)
TT	*Bana sorarsan hiç <u>ibne</u> gibi değil* (p. 57)
BT	If you ask me, he isn't like a <u>faggot</u> at all.
ST	"Well, we're just All-American <u>queers</u>. (p. 126)
TT	*Yüzde yüz Amerikan <u>ibne</u>leriyiz desene* (p. 124)
BT	Say, we are 100% American <u>faggots</u>.

In Table 9, Eşli uses the word *ibne* in exchange for "queer" in the target text. While Eşli has an intention to break the negative meaning of the word *ibne* by identifying it with the umbrella term "queer"[10] for all sexualities outside of heterosexuality, *ibne* is positioned as "a slang word used by sexist heterosexuals to describe gays, transvestites, and transsexuals" (Karaahmet, 2019) much like "faggot" ("a gay man, usually derogatory" [Baker, 2002, p. 117]) in gay slang. For this reason, the queering impact has been prevented due to the derogatory aspects of the word in the target culture. The word *lubunya* would be a better choice since it has the chance to "refer to LGBTI as a whole, much as the word '"queer' in English" (Karaahmet, 2019). Therefore, Eşli's decision can be contextualized within the misrecognizing translation.

The next example of this mode of translation is related to Eşli's translatorial decisions that have the potential to evoke traces of hegemonic masculinity in the target text. The excerpt in Table 10 shows how this was operationalized in the translation:

Table 10. Misrecognizing Translation in the Case of the Phrase "*Soft Rich Kid*" in the Target Text

ST	"You think I am a <u>soft rich kid</u> who's taking money from her lover instead of from doctor daddy" (p. 153)
TT	*"Doktor babası yerine sevgilisinin eline bakan zengin bir muhallebi çocuğu olduğumu düşünüyorsun değil mi?"* (p. 151)
BT	"Don't you think I am a <u>mamma's boy</u> who is relying on his lover's money instead of his doctor daddy's?"

In Table 10, Eşli uses the phrase *muhallebi çocuğu* for "soft rich kid" in the target text. The phrase *muhallebi çocuğu*,[11] a direct translation of mamma's boy, refers to "a boy or

---

10 Queer. (2023, 6 April). *Dictionary.com.* Address: https://www.dictionary.com/browse/queer

11 *Muhallebi çocuğu.* (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük.* Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/muhallebi%20%C3%A7ocu%C4%9Fu-nedir-ne-demek/

man showing excessive attachment to or dependence on his mother"[12] in the source language. In the Turkish context, this phrase often points to boys who are seen as more fragile than their peers, and thus discriminated against for not being adequately masculine in the school environment (Göregenli, 2009). As is seen, Eşli's decision does not neutralize or queer the negative aspects of meaning underlying the phrase but potentializes the dissemination of the hegemonic masculine gaze among the target readers. In this sense, this decision can be counted as an example of a misrecognizing translation in Démont's (2018) model.

Additionally, Eşli's choice regarding the word *homoseksüel* for homosexual can be seen as another example of this mode of translation. The excerpt in Table 11 shows how this translatorial decision was contextualized in the target language.

Table 11. Misrecognizing Translation in the Case of the Word "*Homosexual*" in the Target Text	
ST	"I – are all homosexuals as perceptive as you?" (p. 175)
TT	"Sen… Bütün homoseksüeller senin kadar bilinçli mi?" (p. 172)
BT	"You… Are all homosexuals as conscious as you?

In Table 11, Eşli uses the word *homoseksüel* for "homosexual" in the target text. Whereas the word "homosexual" generally appears in disparaging and offensive contexts while referring to people who are "sexually attracted to people of one's own sex or gender; gay,"[13] *homoseksüel* is not very frequently used among the LGBTQ+ community due to "its potentially negative meaning as a medical term reminding of the time when being gay was seen as a disease" (Kaos GL, 2020) in the target context. In this respect, this decision has been evaluated within the scope of a misrecognizing translation.

The last example of this mode of translation applies to Eşli's choice regarding the word *milli olmak* for the phrase "piece of ass" in the source text. The excerpt in Table 12 indicates how this was operationalized in the translation.

Table 12. Misrecognizing Translation in the Case of the Phrase "*A Piece of Ass*" in the Target Text	
ST	"Carl got the syphilis the first time he had <u>a piece of ass</u>" (p. 208)
TT	"*Carl 1919 yılında <u>milli olduğunda</u> bel soğukluğu kapmış*" (p. 206)
BT	Carl caught the syphilis when he <u>played for the national team in 1919.</u>

---

12   Mama's boy. (2023, 6 April). *Dictionary.com*. Address: https://www.dictionary.com/browse/mama-s-boy
13   *Homosexual*. (2023, 6 April). *Dictionary.com*. Address: https://www.dictionary.com/browse/homosexual

In Table 12, Eşli uses the phrase *milli olmak* in exchange for "piece of ass" in the target text. The phrase "piece of ass" directly means "sexual intercourse"[14] in the source language. However, *milli olmak* refers to "the first sexual intercourse a man has with a woman"[15] in the target context, which generally allows for "talking about sexuality as a legitimacy area for men" (Mutluer, 2015). In this case, the word *milli*[16] [national] moves the female subject to a secondary position, because *milli olmak* [to be a national] corresponds to representing the country in a sexualized context, in which having a superior position is made into a quality of honor and pride for men. Here, Eşli's decision potentially reconstitutes the hegemonic masculinity discourse with an emphasis on male supremacy in the contextualization of *milli olmak* within the target text. In this sense, this decision can be associated with the misrecognizing translation in Démont's (2018) model.

Conclusion

With all its theoretical and practical aspects, queer translation brings multivocal and egalitarian bases of representation to the LGBTQ+ community in the literary scene. By dismantling the dichotomies of male/female and heterosexual/non-heterosexual in society, queer translation further reflects the assigned nature of gender by blurring the strictly constructed boundaries between gender identities and sexual orientations. As such, it contributes to the deconstruction of exclusionary concepts related to hegemonic heterosexuality in the contexts of language. To that effect, this study has tried to unveil the manifestations of the queer perspective in Dılşa Ritsa Eşli's (2021) *Yakut Orman*, Turkish translation and Umami Kitap publication of Brown's (1973) *Rubyfruit Jungle*.

Eşli's translation in general has received positive remarks from the digital fanzines, online news agencies, and book review websites for substantially engendering a strong reaction against the hegemony of heterosexuality and a narrative for self-acceptance, complemented by its publisher Umami's position as a solidarity network for bringing queer and feminist novels before Turkish readership. These remarks serve to contextualize the Turkish translation of *Rubyfruit Jungle* as a literary work that disseminates the image of queerness to the target language and culture system. The portrayal of the novel as such readily suggests that Eşli has brought queering perspectives to the entire translation process.

---

14   Piece of ass. (2023, 6 April). *Dictionary.com*. Address: https://www.dictionary.com/browse/piece--of--ass

15   Milli olmak. (2023, 6 April). *Sesli Sözlük*. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/milli%20olmak-nedir-ne-demek/

16   Milli. (2023, 6 April). Sesli sözlük. Address: https://www.seslisozluk.net/milli-nedir-ne-demek/

In light of Démont's (2018) model, however, the comparative analysis of the Turkish and English versions of *Rubyfruit Jungle* [*Yakut Orman*] has shown Eşli to have limitedly contributed to the formation of queer imagery and the reflection of queerness. While Eşli did apply minoritizing translations by narrowing down the umbrella concept of queer to *lezbiyen* [lesbian], and the direct transfer of the phrase "golden shower queen" as *altın duş kraliçesi* [golden shower queen] without footnoting in the target text, Eşli's decisions regarding queering translation increased the opportunities for representing the knowledge practices peculiar to queerness with the help of *Lubunca* [Turkish LGBTQ+ cant] terms such as *koli* [trick] for pick up, *çarka çıkmak* [gazoopy] for hustle, and *mantici* [chicken hawk] for chicken queen in the translation. Even so, Eşli's frequent use of the misrecognizing translation mode significantly constructed, reflected, and maintained the hegemonic heterosexual gaze due to the sexist connotations of *ibne* [faggot] for queer, *sikişmek* [to dick] for fuck, *homoseksüel* for homosexual, *milli olmak* [to be a national] for piece of ass, and *muhallebi çocuğu* [mama's boy] for soft rich kid within the Turkish context.

All in all, one should never judge a translation by its cover. This is because the surrounding context around a translation may limit researchers' insights by leading them to a false impression that it readily underlines queerness in its entirety, much like the case of *Yakut Orman* in the Turkish context. While Eşli had portrayed the potential of queer ways of life with accurate indications of queerness in some parts of the translation, queering potentialities in the novel were not sufficiently fulfilled, and this paved the way for the creation of limited queering perspectives in the target language.

Against all odds, queer translation practices more or less serve to enlarge the restricted sphere of gender perception with the motive of giving space to offbeat voices despite the sharp discrepancies among gender identities and sexual orientations that are not equally favored in the social arena. Such initiatives contribute to reducing the influence of moralistic judgements and stigmatizations against the LGBTQ+ community among the target readership, especially in a conservative Islamist country such as Türkiye.

References

Baer, B. J. (2018). Beyond either/or: Confronting the fact of translation in global sexuality studies. In B. J. Baer & K. Kaindl (Eds.), *Queering translation, translating the queer theory, practice, activism* (pp. 38-57). New York, NY: Routledge.

Baker, P. (2002). *Fantabulosa: A Dictionary of Polari and Gay Slang.* London, the UK & New York, NY: Continuum.

Bassi, S. (2017). Displacing LGBT: Global Englishes, activism and translated sexualities. In O. Castro & E. Ergun (Eds.), *Feminist Translation Studies: Local and Transnational Perspectives* (pp. 235-248). New York, NY: Routledge.

Bassnett, S., & Lefevere, A. (1990). *Translation, History and Culture*. London, the UK: Printer Publishers.

Breen, M. S. (2012). Homosexual identity, translation, and Prime-Stevenson's Imre and the Intersexes. *Comparative Literature and Culture*, 14(1), 1-9.

Brown, R. M. (1973). *Ruby-Fruit Jungle* (4th Edition). Plainfield, VT: Daughters, Inc.

Brown, R. M. (2015). *Ruby-Fruit Jungle.* New York, NY: Bantam Books.

Brown, R. M. (2021). *Yakut Orman* (Dılşa Ritsa Eşli, Trans.). Istanbul, Turkey: Umami.

Burton, W. M. (2010). Inverting the text: A proposed queer translation praxis. *In other words: the journal for literary translators*, 36, 54-68.

Chamberlain, L. (1988). Gender and the metaphorics of translation. *Signs*, 13(3), 454-472.

Chan, L. T. (2018). Transgenderism in Japanese manga as radical translation: The journey to the West goes to Japan. In B. J. Baer & K. Kaindl (Eds.), *Queering translation, translating the queer theory, practice, activism* (pp. 96-111). New York, NY: Routledge.

Cooper, S. (2019). 'Us each other's people now': A critical analysis of the "queer' happy endings that subvert and reject the American heteronarrative in Rubyfruit Jungle and the Color Purple. *Assuming gender,* 8(1), 2-21.

Démont, M. (2018). On three modes of translating queer literary texts. In B. J. Baer & K. Kaindl (Eds.), *Queering translation, translating the queer theory, practice, activism* (pp. 157-171). New York, NY: Routledge.

Elliott, J. (2006). *Popular feminist fiction as American allegory: Representing national time*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.

Flotow, L. V. (1991). Feminist translation: Contexts, practices and theories. *TTR, 4*(2), 69-84.

Gairola, R. K. (2017). A manifesto for postcolonial queer translation studies. In O. Castro & E. Ergun (Eds.), *Feminist Translation Studies: Local and Transnational Perspectives* (pp. 70-79). New York, NY: Routledge.

Godard, B. (2022 [1984]). Language and sexual difference: The case of translation. In E. C. Karpinski & E. Basile (Eds.), *Translation, semiotics, and feminism: Selected writings of Barbara Godard* (pp. 10-17). New York, NY: Routledge.

Harvey, K. (2000). Gay community, gay identity and the translated text. *TTR, 13*(1), 137–165.

Hermans, T. (1985) *Introduction. The Manipulation of Literature: Studies in Literary Translation* (pp. 3-8). London, the UK: Croom Helm.

Keenaghan, E. (1998). Jack Spicer's pricks and cocksuckers, *The translator, 4*(2), 273-294.

Lorig, J. (2020). 'Just a couple of queer fish': The queer possibilities of Rita Mae Brown's Rubyfruit Jungle. *Contemporary Women's Writing,* 14 (2-3), 315–332.

Savcı, E. (2020). *Queer in translation: Sexual politics under neoliberal Islam.* Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Saxey, E. (2005). Lesbian bastard heroes: The uses of illegitimacy for modern lesbian fiction and identity. *Women: A cultural review,* 16(1), 33-51.

Spurlin, W. (2014). Introduction, the gender and queer politics of translation: New Approaches. *Comparative literature studies,* 51(2), 201-214.

Electronic Sources

5Harfliler. (2021, 13 October). Kuir ve Feminist Bir Aradalıkları Çoğaltmak İçin Bir Yeni Adres: Umami Kitap [Web log post]. *5Harfliler*. Retrieved from https://www.5harfliler.com/kuir-ve-feminist-bir-aradaliklari-cogaltmak-icin-bir-yeni-adres-umami-kitap/

Ak, N. B.; Çoban, G. (2022, 18 July). Kuir Edebiyata Selam [Web log post]. *Artdog Istanbul*. Retrieved from https://artdogistanbul.com/kuir-edebiyata-selam/

Bantmag. (2021, 3 October). Hoşgeldin Umami Kitap! [Web log post]. *Bantmag*. Retrieved from https://bantmag.com/hos-geldin-umami-kitap/

Biner, İ. C. (2021, 18 November). Kuir ve feminist bir ağ: Umami Kitap. Gazete Duvar. Address: https://www.gazeteduvar.com.tr/kuir-ve-feminist-bir-ag-umami-kitap-haber-1542022.

Erdem, A. M. (2019). İbne, gey, lubunya: A queer critique of LGBTI+ discourses in the new cinema of Turkey. *CUNY academic works.* Address: https://academicworks.cuny.edu/gc_etds/3100.

Göregenli, M. (2009). Gruplararası ilişki ideolojisi olarak homofobi. In Kaos GL (Ed.), *Anti-Homofobi Kitabı: Uluslararası Homofobi Karşıtı Buluşma* (pp. 9-16). Address: https://kaosgldernegi.org/images/library/2009antihomofobi-kitap.pdf.

Kaos GL. (2020). *Sıkça Sorulan Sorular.* Address: https://kaosgldernegi.org/images/library/2020sss10x14-web.pdf

Karaahmet, Y. (2019, 12 July). Lubunya [Web log post]. *60 Pages*. Retrieved from https://www.60pages.com/longreads/lubunya/

Kelavgil, A. (2021, 21 May). Lubunca üzerine notlar [Web log post]. *Kaos GL*. Retrieved from https://kaosgl.org/gokkusagi-forumu-kose-yazisi/lubunca-uzerine-notlar

Kuleci, E. E. (2022, 15 February). Kuir feminist yayınevi, Yakut Orman, mini bir festival [Web log post]. *Aposto*. Retrieved from https://aposto.com/i/kuir-feminist-yayinevi-yakut-orman-mini-bir-festival

Mutluer, N. (2015, 2 June). "Millî olmak': Cinselliğimizin milliyetçi sınırı [Web log post]. *Altüst*. Retrieved fromhttps://www.altust.org/2012/06/milli-olmak-cinselligimizin-milliyetci-siniri/.

Sebahat, J. (2022, 22 December). Yakut Orman: "İşin bu kısmı bitti". *K24*. Address: https://t24.com.tr/k24/yazi/yakut-orman-isin-bu-kismi-bitti,4029

Tar, Y. (2021, 23 October). Bahtının rüzgarına kapılmak: Yakut Orman [Web log post]. *Kaos GL*. Retrieved fromhttps://kaosgl.org/gokkusagi-forumu-kose-yazisi/bahtinin-ruzgarina-kapilmak-yakut-orman

The Centre-Periphery Dichotomy in Davor Špišić's *Vuk na snijegu* and Karin Peschka's *Autolyse Wien. Erzählungen vom Ende* and its Turns in Times of Crisis

Marijana MANDIĆ[1] , Sonja NOVAK[2] , Ljiljana PINTARIĆ[1]

[1]Research Assistant, Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences of Osijek, Osijek, Croatia

[2]Assist. Prof., Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences of Osijek, Osijek, Croatia

ORCID: M.M. 0000-0003-1456-8628;
S.N. 0000-0001-8598-8166;
L.P. 0000-0002-0329-3975

Corresponding author:
Sonja NOVAK,
Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences of Osijek, Osijek, Croatia
E-mail: snovak@ffos.hr

ABSTRACT

The paper examines the way how the culture of the city is represented in contemporary German and Croatian prose exemplified by Karin Peschka's *Autolyse Wien. Erzählungen vom Ende* [*Autolysis Vienna. Stories of the End*] and Davor Špišič's *Vuk na snijegu* [*Wolf in the Snow*]. The thesis of the paper is that Peschka's and Špišić's literary cityscapes of Vienna and Zagreb respectively are self-referential semiospheres or metaphors produced by their cultures, whose semiotic textual spaces are formed holistically as results of the geocultural and sociohistorical context of centrality (Vienna) and periphery (Zagreb), and the way they correlate and interchange. By applying a (post) structuralist, comparative and sociological approach, the paper analyses how the represented city space is reshaped in the dystopian and post-apocalyptic narratives to a state of unrecognizability and is reconstructed by means of reception, experience and knowledge of the readers, e. g. by the end of the short stories' collection *Autolyse Wien* Peschka's Vienna remains alive only in the characters' memories, while most parts of Špišić's Zagreb are altered in terms of their function, character, purpose, and accessibility. On the one hand, this results in the loss of the represented city's cultural and urban identity, and on the other, the dichotomy of centrality and periphery, the urban and the rural, the civilized and the wild, the cultured and the natural becomes blurred.

Keywords: Contemporary fiction, City, Semiosphere, Centre, Periphery

1. Introduction

Juri Lotman's notion of semiosphere underpins the following analysis of two urban narratives of Vienna and Zagreb, two capital cities whose urban culture has been strongly shaped by their interplay and relations throughout their shared socio-cultural and political history. The paper will investigate how the cultural features of the capital cities of Zagreb, Croatia and Vienna, Austria are presented in the prose works *Vuk na snijegu* [*Wolf in the Snow*] by Davor Špišić and *Autolyse Wien. Erzählungen vom Ende* [*Autolysis Vienna. Stories of the End*] by Karin Peschka, both of which can be considered as *mimesis,* a reflection and projection of their own current urban issues respectively. The aim of the paper is to examine how the literary urban spaces of both capital cities change in appearance, function, signification and positioning in terms of centrality and periphery. Namely, Vienna, as a well-known city has a long history of cultural, economic, administrative centrality, whereas Zagreb is a lesser known capital that has a more peripheral role on a larger, regional and European scale. The thesis of the paper is that Vienna and Zagreb as represented in the literary works function as self-referential semiospheres whose features of centrality and periphery change on several levels. Both prose works have their narrative set in capital cities that are the bearers of their surrounding cultural identity, and through Špišić's Zagreb dystopian or in Peschka's Vienna post-apocalyptic elements, they bring the culture of the space to an extreme change or disintegration, leading to the loss of the city's identity. The depicted cities represent a dichotomy within themselves that sways between the two extremes of centrality and periphery. This oscillation occurs on three levels. Firstly, this is evident in the plot setting in which the urban centres turn into spaces that do not bear cultured, civilized, urban features anymore. Secondly, it is evident on the title-text level, where there is a discrepancy between associations and expectations based on the title and the content of the literary works themselves. Thirdly, the extra-textual socio-cultural context and relationship between two prose works, where the Austrian capital Vienna represents a well-known centre, while the Croatian capital of Zagreb is compared to Vienna, somewhat peripheral.

There are several sociological dichotomies that support these arguments. Firstly, the centre (core)-periphery dichotomy in terms of the world systems approach. Immanuel Wallerstein's (1974) influential world system theory provides the structural explanation of regional developmental and economic imbalances between core, peripheral and semi-peripheral regions as parts of one interdependent economy system. The core/

periphery concept was first proposed in 1950s by Prebisch (ECLA; esp. Comisión Económica para America Latina y el Caribe – CEPA; as cited in Klimczuk and Klimczuk-Kochańska, 2019, p. 2), but the terminology of core and periphery had already been used in 1929 (Prebisch, 1929, as cited in Klimczuk and Klimczuk-Kochańska, 2019, p. 2). Core regions are highly economically developed and wealthy as a result of exploiting the periphery from which they draw resources such as cheap labour. Historically, especially as part of the Habsburg Monarchy, Vienna and Zagreb showed this type of relationship based on their interconnectedness not only through economical, but also sociocultural ties and cultural transfer, with Vienna being the core and Zagreb the periphery.

Secondly, to support the same argument, there is a centre-periphery dichotomy in terms of urban culture, which was employed by many theoreticians in an attempt to explain the differences in sociocultural development between cities that are geopolitically situated in regional/country centre and those situated peripherally. In those conceptualizations, centre/periphery power relations are interpreted as socio-spatial configuration that results in asymmetrical socio-spatial cultural development (Castells, 1997; Kühn, 2015; Scott and Soja, 1996; Shtern, 2018; Wacquant, 2008, as cited in Yavo-Ayalon, 2019, p. 463). Peripheral cities, in this kind of interpretive framework, only passively accept the influence of central cities as a source of cultural authority and legitimacy. Yavo-Avalon (2019) challenged this perception of culturally inferior periphery and concludes a case study with a notion that changes in sociocultural structure of periphery can overturn the centre-periphery power relations and can result in an erosion of the centre-periphery macrosocial structure. Such erosion of the centre-periphery structure will be shown in the analysis for the selected literary texts.

Thirdly, there is an urban-rural dichotomy in classical sociological approaches, such as that by Georg Simmel, who is well known for his early contribution to the debate about the characteristics of urban life versus rural life in *The Metropolis and Mental life* (1950). Simmel observes that the metropolitan individual is constantly exposed to a multitude of stimuli, and as a result, in need to protect himself from this intensification of nervous stimulation, the urban dweller creates a protective blasé attitude, characterised by a dulled sensibility for the differences between things (Boy, 2021). Simmel described the metropolitan individual as fundamentally different from one living in traditional, more peaceful, slower, rural way of life where much stronger social ties of a small community exist. This dichotomy (and the oscillation between) is obvious in the representation of Vienna as a rural space and Zagreb as highly urbanized.

Lastly, the interplay between the two poles of the urban-rural dichotomy in context of a rural-urban continuum concept needs to be explained in order to support the argument of lack of boundaries between the urban/central/cultured and the rural/peripheral/natural. Namely, more recent research on urban/rural dichotomy shifted from rigid rural-urban dichotomy to a more fluid concept of rural-urban continuum based on a notion that urban and rural communities can have different degrees of urban and rural characteristics simultaneously. The process of urbanization of the countryside happens parallel to the process of ruralisation of the city (Urbain, 2002, as cited in Woods, 2009, p. 853). Forms of social organisation and social interaction typical for urban places become adopted in rural settings, so a significant part of modern urbanity is now exercised in rural places, creating a phenomenon named *l'urbanité rurale* (Poulle and Gorgeu, 1997, as cited in Woods, 2009, p. 853).

The imagined space in both prose works refers not only to real spaces, but also represents some of the contemporary problems such as inflation, the war in Ukraine, or people's destructive behaviour towards nature. Juri M. Lotman believes that fictional space shapes "an infinite object" through "finite text" – in other words, reality (1977, p. 211). Research by Irena Malenica and Zdenka Matek Šmit showed that dystopia depicted in the Croatian novels of Josip Mlakić *Planet Friedman* (2012) and Edo Popović *Lomljenje vjetra* (2011) refers to the present and warns of distorted values of a new, threatening, disturbing and highly dehumanizing age (Matek Šmit, 2018, p. 345). The literary work can be understood as part of a sophisticated system of "extra-textual connections" that, with its "hierarchy of non-artistic and artistic norms on various levels", is systematized by the "experience of the artistic past" and forms a complex code that enables deciphering the information that is present in the text (Lotman, 1977, p. 295). This paper will show how the cultural features of recognizable extra-textual, 'real', empirical Zagreb and Vienna change in a dystopian and post-apocalyptically presented environment, with the dichotomies of central/urban/cultured/civilized versus peripheral/rural/natural/wild clashing and interchanging to a point of their borders and distinctions being completely blurred. The starting point of the research is the hypothesis that the cityscapes in Špišić's *Vuk na snijegu* and Peschka's *Autolyse Wien* are self-referential semiospheres of Zagreb and Vienna, which through a critical narrative towards contemporary urban problems, lead the culture of the imaginary space to disintegration, and thus, the city to change or loss of its identity.

2. Semiosphere, signs, centrality, periphery and the border

A city is defined by the characteristics of its material and immaterial urban culture. Lotman views culture as information that "depends on human consciousness" and is not transmitted through the genetic code (Zylko, 2001, p. 393). It is a system of signs that form a semiosphere. However, the semiosphere is not synonymous with culture, quite the contrary this term encompasses both "culture and its semiotic environment" (Nöth, 2006, p. 260).

Both represented cities are capitals: Zagreb is the capital of the Republic of Croatia, and Vienna of Austria. As such, they are the cultural, political, scientific and economic centres and are known as the largest cities within their country. Their identity and recognizability arises from the signs that are perceived by the senses and known or learned from experience. Juri M. Lotman (2005, p. 208) defines the semiosphere as a system of signs, as a "semiotic space, outside of which semiosis itself cannot exist" (p. 208). According to Lotman (2005), the boundary of the semiotic space serves as "the most important functional and structural position, giving substance to its semiotic mechanism" (p. 210). Signs can be understood as all the demarcations of urbanity and urban identity like language and its site-specific expressions like inscriptions or graffiti, spatial features like cultural heritage, architecture and the built environment that comprise the public space, social norms in the urban environment like mass gatherings and the connection of the dense urban community in certain parts of the city and the socioeconomic division between groups of inhabitants. Lotman's semiosphere includes "the larger framework that constitutes and creates culture as a whole" (Nöth, 2006, p. 260). The semiosphere is, therefore, not only created before but "is presupposed by cultural semiosis" (ibid). As segments of cultural semiosis, we can consider "textual space created in the arts, in myths, social codes, or ideologies", and a "metatextual space created in the form of cultural self-descriptions" (Nöth, 2006, p. 261). The culture of Zagreb is thus constituted by, e. g., the attitudes of its residents towards their city, their habits, and behaviours such as walking along Maksimir and shopping at the markets, Zagreb art, music, street and other artistic creations and, of course, places like the Zagreb Cathedral, the Art Pavilion, the Croatian National Theatre or Mark's Square, which is the seat of the Government of the Republic of Croatia. On the other hand, the music of Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart, Ludwig van Beethoven, the work of Gustav Klimt, places like Schönbrunn, St. Stephen's Cathedral, Votive Church, the Burgtheater, the Golden Quarter and other spaces clearly signal that it is the city of Vienna because they

form a known part of Viennese culture and identity. Such generally known and recognizable elements of the culture of a certain city are in literature changed into signs in the formation of self-referential semiospheres. By bringing together the metaphorical, literary and socio-cultural levels of these signs, a creative and logical structure of the world is created, which is, to the reader, recognizable and identifiable by senses and/or experience. By changing the genre of representation of the literary cityscapes of Zagreb and Vienna from realistic to dystopian and post-apocalyptic, both authors use the method of defamiliarization to produce new "perspectives on problematic social and political practices that might otherwise be taken for granted or considered natural and inevitable", and they do so "by focusing their critiques of society on spatially or temporally distant settings" (Booker, 1994, p. 19). In the novel *Vuk na snijegu*, Špišić criticizes precisely the class differences in society and the civil weakness that torment contemporary Croatian citizens. By placing these topics in a dystopian future, the reader moves away from his immediate reality and, through the time gap provided by defamiliarization and imagining the consequences of these negative practices, the reader expands his awareness of the problem. Like Špišić, Peschka also problematizes consumerism, but in Peschka's texts, the issue of neglecting care for the environment, taking nature for granted, and losing basic natural survival knowledge dominates. This brings us to the juxtaposition of the urban versus the rural and the border between them. The border, as one of the operating terms in Lotman's notion of the semiosphere, enables the establishment of contact with "non-semiotic and extra-semiotic spaces" (Lotman, 2005, p. 210):

> In the early years of 19th century culture, the "destructive" zone on the outskirts lay in direct contrast with the town centre, which embodied the dominant social structure, outskirts described, for example, in Tsvetaeva's poem ("Frontier Post") as part of the town, and yet belonging to that place, which destroyed the town. Its nature is bilingual. (Lotman, 2005, p. 211)

With the mechanism of the border, Lotman therefore divides the centre as a space of culture from the periphery, that is, a space of destruction and disorder. In other words, the border "separates the territory of one's own, good and harmonious culture from its bad, chaotic, or even dangerous anticulture" (Nöth, 2006, p. 255). The importance of the border is in its protection of "the system from undesired external influences" and in establishing "the semiosphere itself":

Moreover, since 'culture not only creates its internal organization but also its own type of external disorganization' (1984: 212), the self-construction of a semiosphere does not only extend to the construction of its own boundary, but also to the 'chaos' which surrounds it, a chaos which makes the own internal structure appear the more orderly. (Nöth, 2006, p. 260)

Therefore, the centre is defined as the urban and the cultured, whereas the periphery is defined as the rural, the natural. The analysis of the selected literary works shows how the relations between these two spheres change due to the method of defamiliarization, which is a common method in dystopian and post-apocalyptic literature, with the aim of highlighting contemporary societal problems.

3. Dystopian and post-apocalyptic modification of urban space

Demir Alihodžić and Selma Veseljević Jerković (2016) point out that "[t]he city´s reproduction of entropy arises from its function as a metonymy for civilization" (p. 78). Since the capitals are the centre of political, cultural, economic and other aspects of their state and can therefore be seen as the core from where all major decisions about the life of the state originate, the capitals described in the literary text can symbolically represent the state of the entire country. This argument is the second to support the claim that the dichotomy of centrality and periphery is in the chosen examples blurred or even disappears: the centre stretches its borders to represent the periphery and the periphery permeates the centre.

Apocalypse has become a standard term in popular literature for a global catastrophe that shatters the social order (Pommer, 2020, p. 16), bringing chaos and wilderness into the order of the urban centres. Similar to the post-apocalypse, dystopian narrative can also depict a chaotic environment and, as Patrícia Vieira (2020) claims, "dystopia [is] pre-eminently political literary genre […] that hinges upon societal criticism and a desire for social change" (p. 354). Dystopia does not actually insist on the contrast between a "better" (real) and a "worse" (dystopian) society, but a dystopian society develops as a gradation, emphasis or hyperbole of what is bad in empirical reality (Sumpor, 2021, p. 79). The same can be said for the post-apocalyptic genre; both genres create a warning effect through their narrative.

Analysing dystopian and post-apocalyptic novels for young people, Alexander Pommer (2020) finds out how both genres are primarily defined by their significant space (p. 30). In dystopias, it is a dystopian social space, and in post-apocalypses, it is a post-apocalyptic natural space (ibid.). Pommer (2020), however, distinguishes dystopian space from apocalyptic space in that dystopia is characterized by absolute control, while post-apocalyptic space defies all order (p. 29). The geography of the post-apocalypse belongs to nature, and the post-apocalyptic wilderness and landscape of ruins is an indicator of the victory of nature over society (Pommer, 2020, p. 29).

3.1. Dystopian Zagreb

Davor Špišić (born 1961), contemporary Croatian playwright, prose writer and screenwriter, imagines in his novel *Vuk na snijegu* the Republic of Croatia in 2035. In retrospect, the plot of the novel returns to 2017, when Danko and Milena met, 2019, when Vuk was born, 2022, when Vuk was three years old, 2032, when Croatia became one of the poorest countries in the Third World, and 2033 when the People's Salvation Government came to power. Past events, such as the burglary of two hungry men in a bakery in 2017, the insecure life of the Erceg family and Milena's walk to the hospital in 2019 explain how poverty was the cause of violence and general dissatisfaction in the city, which contributed to further negative circumstances. The narrator also talks about the insecurity of the past when he reveals that Milena is happy for not being fired as a pregnant woman and for receiving a full salary because this was not a common case for pregnant women in 2019. In 2022, however, the crisis expands from economic to political, and the reader learns about the Russian occupation forces that blew up the old Chernobyl reactor in Ukraine. Besides the fact that Špišić emphasizes the referential function of his literary work by placing his imaginary spatial narrative in a real city, real events such as the war in Ukraine and inflation are recognized through the description of the events that preceded the dystopian state, which strengthens the appellative function of the text. All these events, including the COVID pandemic, deepened the gap between the rich and the poor and encouraged the creation of a Zagreb in total crisis in 2035. The architecture of the city is described as extremely derelict residential buildings and neglected infrastructure where the protagonists, representatives of the working class, are located: "Muddy, rusty water runs from the faucet. The pipes in the whole neighbourhood have been rotten for ages"[1] (Špišić, 2022,

---

1   "Iz slavine nahrupi blatnjava hrđasta voda. Cijevi su u njihovom kvartu odavno istrulile svoje" All translations of the original texts into English have been done by the authors of this paper.

p. 26). As opposed to the insecure housing conditions of the working class, there are government institutions that are stable, even armoured to protect the ruling class: "A rain of stones came down on the armoured windows of the Banski dvori [Ban's Halls]"[2] (Špišić, 2022, p. 51). In addition, Zagreb is presented as a megacity with ten-storey buildings and the largest shopping centre in the Balkan. Thus, Zagreb develops to be an area dominated by capitalism. Consumption becomes the main priority of the city and overshadows all forms of culture, both social and material. Mass hunger that forces citizens to protest, theft and double jobs show Zagreb as a place of extreme socio-economic differences, and these differences are best manifested in the shopping centre *Baš Čelik*, which the poor class of the population is prohibited from entering. On the other hand, the prosperous part of the population worthy of moving around the area of the shopping centre throws away food and buys goods in a frenzy. Changes in the city landscape, attitudes towards culture and spatial behaviour occur with the change of the ruling elite. More precisely, the first thing that Ivan Tomanić's government (ironically named the People's Salvation Government) does after its establishment is shutting down the Ministry of Science, Education and Culture, which shows that education and culture have no place in this social structure. Instead of this, a new Ministry of Faith and Hope is formed, which protects the set of opinions formed and approved by Tomanić's politics. President Tomanić appears in person only once in the novel, and more often as a hologram in the middle of the city, peeking into the Ercegs' house and changing scenes. Sometimes Tomanić's hologram speaks with pressed lips, sometimes he is dressed as a military pilot or Santa Claus, and in one hologram appearance, he gave himself communion, which can be interpreted as an act of unlimited power in both the profane and sacral spheres. He is described as the supreme saviour, the greatest son of the nation, and he secures his position by propaganda and media control. The city's public space is thus dominated by advertising displays with luxuriously produced films about Baščelikovci as the entitled class (the inhabitants that are allowed to enter the *Baš Čelik* shopping centre) and Tomanić's holograms. The cult of his persona is depicted in an ornate stained-glass window that was installed over the facade of the fifty-storey skyscraper, which replaced the old Parliament building, with an allegorical depiction of his life from the cradle to his prime minister's title (Špišić, 2022, p. 47). The People's Forum – again an irony in the name given – is formed, which is a medium that knows how to please any government in order to receive financial support, which is then, in turn, used for corruptive purposes. The press in Špišić's Zagreb is therefore not free, and the restriction of freedom of speech and media freedom confirms that the

---

2   "Kiša kamenja obruši se na blindirane prozore Banskih dvora."

People's Salvation Government is implementing a totalitarian form of government. As typical themes of the dystopian genre, the system of oppression and terror over citizens, control of opinion and manipulation of the truth change the space of Špišć's Zagreb and define the dystopian landscape.

3.2. Post-apocalyptic Vienna

The Austrian contemporary author Karin Peschka (born 1967) creates a post-apocalyptic Vienna through the collection of short stories *Autolyse Wien*. By depicting the cityscape in ruins due to an unknown disaster, she defamiliarizes the real city space and creates a post-apocalyptic environment in which 31 stories told from the perspective of different Viennese people, 7 stories told from the first perspective and the story of the Viennese Child, which consists of the last 3 stories, unfold.

The post-apocalyptic narrative of each story - except for the last three stories about the Viennese Child - begins with a question about the city and pointing out some of its negative features: "Vienna? Has become unreachable."[3] (Peschka, 2017, p. 36) When asked about Vienna, Malik and Alisia say that it is empty, Olja says that it is desolate, Imre, Tyson and Goliath say that it has bled to death, while it has become unavailable to Ivelina. The beginning of each character's story suggests a threatening or uncertain spatial setting. Peschka places various characters in the destroyed and burned space of the metropolis. It is unclear exactly what disaster struck Vienna, only that the disaster struck suddenly and had catastrophic consequences for the city (Peschka, 2017, p. 36). After a disaster, chaos arises. The main bridge in Vienna, the Reichsbrücke, becomes a place where people jump to their deaths. Houses and shops are robbed. While some of the survivors collect food, pots and various other materials, others live like nomads or try to create order out of the chaos or simply think over their own death. For some characters, the disaster brings good changes, for example for Sebastian. Disappointed in life and himself - he was an alcoholic, lost his job - Sebastian intended to commit suicide, but the disaster prevented him from doing so, so he remains alive, weans himself from alcohol and starts eating healthy with apples and nuts he finds.

Similar to Špišić, Peschka also offers information about the past of the characters throughout the story. Through retrospection, certain elements of the crisis that could have preceded the disaster are shown. As possible reasons, Peschka identifies on the

---

3   "Wien? Unzugänglich geworden."

one hand the destruction of nature: "Earlier he threw burning cigarettes at the tree. He poured drain cleaner between the roots. "[4] (Peschka, 2017, p. 35) On the other hand, it might have been an economic crises: "For economic reasons, this would be a smart thing to do. […] Back to the childhood bedroom at the age of 38"[5] (Peschka, 2017, p. 23). In addition, similar to Špišić's novel, Peschka addresses the downsides of capitalism and society's orientation the need to fill voids by purchasing goods and spending uncontrollably are emphasized: in Anna's story, it is described that most customers who do not find the goods they were looking, do not leave empty-handed either (Peschka, 2017, p. 64). The catastrophe, however, brings the economic crisis to an end as money loses its importance in post-apocalyptic Vienna. Existence in the post-apocalyptic world is no longer ensured by earnings and profits, but by finding food and by possessing knowledge about nature and survival. However, when it comes to the past of the characters, not all stories are filled with crisis. Moreover, through a return to the past, the reader learns how the characters lived an ordinary life, as is lived in modern reality, which gives an insight into the average lifestyle of the Viennese. Before the disaster, Peschka's Viennese travel, use smart phones, walk through the Lobau, eat Langos in the Prater, etc. Through the descriptions of the previous lives of the characters, the reader recognizes Viennese culture, its social life and habits. By recalling places (signs, landmarks) such as Café Jenseits, Stephansdom, Karlskirche, Haas-Haus, Naschmarkt, Lainzer Tiergarten, Lasalle Street and other real Viennese places, the reader is made aware that these spaces are also an important part of Viennese culture. Moreover, all these customs and spaces are semiotic signs that together form the semiosphere of Viennese urban culture, giving this metropolis its identity:

> There was no more Stephansdom [St. Stephen's Cathedral] to orientate oneself, no more Haas House, no Michael's Church and the Plague Column on the Graben had also disappeared, because the Graben [the Grave] had defined itself in the real sense of the word and its name as such.[6] (Peschka, 2017, p. 9)

---

4   "Früher hatte er den Baum mit glosenden Zigaretten beworfen. Er hatte ihm mehrere Flaschen Abflussreiniger zwischen die Wurzeln gegossen."

5   "Aus Kostengründen wäre dies nur vernünftig […] Mit achtunddreißig zurück in das Kinderzimmer."

6   Es gab zwar keinen Stephansdom mehr zur Orientierung, kein Haas-Haus, keine Michaelerkirche, und die Pestsäule auf dem Graben war ebenfalls verschwunden, weil der Graben sich als solcher im eigentlichen Sinn seines Namens definiert hatte.

Vienna has become a city without a future, a ruined city. Beneath the collapsed Naschmarkt, along with the vegetables, lie dead people, and in the case of the Viennese Child, who survives the collapse of the house thanks to the dogs, not only is there no interest in the former culture of Vienna, but the Child cannot even pronounce Vienna. He thinks about why he would even talk and with whom. However, as Boguslaw Zylko (2001) states, while studying Lotman's cultural studies, the natural world is "culturalized" by naming, whereby parts of nature become ""humanized" and included in some of culture's languages" (p. 394). By forgetting and not naming the city, this cultured space returns to nature and loses its cultural meaning.

Nature, moreover, shows greater resistance to disaster than culture even though it had also been hit by the disaster, as evident in the broken trees, sudden weather changes and falling rusty rain. Nature was not completely destroyed and is recovering quickly:

> But it still enrages him, everything, the fact that this tree, all the trees here, simply continue to green regardless of the disaster, as if nothing had happened. Bushes, both beautiful and ugly, hedges, everything springs, even without the Horticulture Department to trim, to form the wild growing plants in the desired form.[7] (Peschka, 2017, pp. 47-48)

Furthermore, as time goes by, the nature grows even stronger. While before the disaster Gerrit believed that the city was the concrete, the earth belonged to trees, the disaster showed the fragility of the city, the central and the urban and its culture versus the strength of nature. It showed that the city in a time of total crisis is overpowered by nature, as can be seen in the descriptions of the ruins interwoven by flowers and grass. The lawn on Heldenplatz becomes a meadow, and rain begins to fall again on the parched land due to the dry period in the story of the Viennese Child. By recovering from the disaster, nature digests the urban space and erases the semiotic signs of the former city, of any sign of centrality, of a once very neat and cultured urban space.

3.3. The capitals as semiospheres amidst crises

By setting the action of prose works in capital cities, Špišić and Peschka place culture in the core of the semiosphere. Therefore, by analysing the cultural insignia of imagined

---

7   Aber wütend macht es ihn dennoch, alles nämlich, auch, dass dieser Baum, dass alle Bäume hier, ungeachtet der Katastrophe einfach wieder austrieben, frisches Grün ansetzten, als wäre nichts geschehen. Sträucher, prächtige wie hässliche, die Hecken, alles sproß, kein Gartenbauamt, um das Treiben zu stutzen, um das wild Wachsende in die gewünschte Form zu zwingen.

cities, the reader becomes familiar with the dominant system of semiotic signs of a certain country or region. Culture and identity are usually formed in relation to Others. This is where semiotic boundaries according to Lotman's theory are observed, and centre-periphery oppositions are especially important for the semiosphere. In Špišić's novel, the culture of the city is most clearly formed in the very centre of the semiosphere - in Zagreb, the capital of Croatia. Fleeing from Zagreb towards the state border, which is a rural area, the novel's protagonists enter the periphery. This area in relation to the centre can be described as empty and abandoned, inhabited by a few remaining people who live in misery and dream nightmares (Špišić, 2022, p. 171). In Peschka's collections of short stories, the semiotic boundaries are lost as a result of a disaster, so there are no longer any distinctions between city districts, borders and other city areas (Peschka, 2017, p. 95), which are a recognizable feature of Vienna.

In addition to blurring boundaries of the urban-rural and/or centre-periphery dichotomy on the content level, they are also observed at the title-text level. Namely, *Vuk na snijegu* [*Wolf in the Snow*] with its title, connotates nature, the wilderness, the periphery and the outside, while the plot is in fact set into a highly urban space, which normally connotates culture, order, civilization, development, and centrality. Since the setting of the novel is dystopian, it exhibits the features of wilderness in which one needs to struggle to survive. For these reasons, the urban centre is being abandoned and the characters flee outside of the city, crossing the borders of "culture" and the centre that is actually not the centre anymore. It is clear from the start that in this urban space, we actually encounter the chaotic circumstances in which a "civilized", "cultured" person has to survive as one would need to in nature. The title of Peschka's collection, on the other hand, evokes the image of Vienna as embodiment of culture, centrality, order, and civilization, whereas the process of autolysis connotates from the very beginning that this culture will be digested and transformed by the end and returned to nature, the 'uncultured', the rural and the peripheral. As the short stories show, the process of autolysis becomes more prominent towards the end of the collection, stronger, more visible; it progresses in terms of the changes visible in the city as the city itself degrades. In *Autolyse Wien*, the cultural geography of Vienna disappears with a catastrophe that triggers the return of the life of human civilization to the beginning, namely to the wilderness, where each character fights for his survival. Therefore, the boundaries of the semiosphere disappear. Thus, in Peschka's Vienna, the centre does not differ from the periphery and the rural and nature anymore, and the cultural semiosis of the former city cannot occur due to the city's inability to exhibit its recognizable

signs. The semiosis is impossible in the Austrian novel due to a disaster, and its signs remain only in the memories of those characters who once experienced it and who remember the destroyed spaces as spaces of culture, as buildings and streets that had their names. Špišić, on the other hand, plays with cultural semiosis and subjects it to government as a highly organized, civilized phenomenon, a controlled environment set usually in the centre, in the urban space. Ironically, this overkill of control as well as the change of subjects into oppressed, into consumers without freedom of creativity leads to the tragedy of culture, in Georg Simmel's sense, where the control of objective, or more strictly speaking, totalitarian culture over the subjective one is manifested (Lambropoulos, 2001, p. 241).

Comparing the novel that represents the space of Croatia with the one that represents the space of Austria, it can be noted that the space of Vienna and the signs of Viennese culture, considering the central importance of the Viennese metropolis throughout European history, are widely known, while Zagreb with its cultural signs is less well known. Therefore, compared to Croatia, Austria represents the centre, the territory of cultural development, while Croatia stands for the periphery. However, the artistic transformation of the Austrian and Croatian urban space puts them on a relatively similar level in terms of losing their centrality and becoming the periphery with its struggles.

In their novels, both authors create a metropolis in which the semiosphere of the city, or the sign system that gives it its identity, is doomed. The dystopian social mind in Špišić's novel, moreover, was secured primarily by the abolition of the Ministry of Science, Education and Culture, which shows this department, as well as the signs of the culture it represents, as threatening to the emerging political system. In addition, Zagreb public spaces, which can be recognized as the signs of the real city, in Špišić's fiction are repurposed to serve the People's Salvation Government. This can be seen in the use of the stadium for shooting people or in the change of the windows on Banski dvori, which is also the seat of the Croatian government in real life. In this dystopian city, the windows are armoured to protect the rulers from the masses, similarly to the real-life events when the Croatian government posted guards and fences in 2020-2022. The totalitarian government controls the culture of the city, changes and destroys it, and creates a new 'culture' that speaks in favour of the government. Democracy as a form of civilized, cultured social order turns into a totalitarian regime, more characteristic to less-developed, marginal or peripheral, if you will, societies in which disorder rules.

By constructing a dystopian Zagreb, Špišić shows that changing the political structure and neglecting subjective culture, as well as free education, which drives towards what can be described as uncivilized. Moreover, the absence of culture that would be free to question the system creates an extremely unfair oppressive system where the majority works for the minority and is punished in case of the slightest disobedience, similar to pecking orders in nature or to packs of, say wolves. The architecture of this dystopian Zagreb does not indicate preservation either, quite the opposite, the spaces inhabited by Špišić's characters are described as extremely old, in a state of decay, the settlement is overgrown with weeds, and piles of discarded antiquities are also mentioned. Consumption becomes the main priority of the city and overshadows all forms of culture, both material and immaterial, for which the city is known or by which it can be recognized.

The culture of the city in *Autolyse Wien*, on the other hand, is ruined due to the effects of a possibly natural catastrophe of unknown cause which, as the title of the collection of stories suggests, prompts the autolysis of the city: "I didn't know that each cell carries in itself the enzyme for autolysis. After death, a process of self-digestion begins, a self-dissolving. The dead matter eats itself up."[8] (Peschka, 2017, p. 100). Like a dead man, the dead city in Peschka's stories digests itself in such a way that grass grows out of concrete and nature replaces city structures. Nature proves to be more resistant to disasters than culture and means salvation for certain characters, and some characters like the Viennese Child fully adapt to life in the wild over time. Moreover, during the civilization, the Viennese child was diagnosed with a mental illness, the signs of which seem to disappear in the natural environment. In Peschka's post-apocalyptic space, the question arises whether Austria still exists, since no help comes to the Viennese after the disaster, and if we return to the claims of Alihodžić and Veseljević Jerković (2016) that the reproduction of the city's narrative is a "metonymy for civilization" (p. 78), it can be concluded that the fate of Peschka's imagined Vienna is shared by the entire imagined Austria, that is, that the catastrophe has the power to destroy signs of culture and identity on a global level. Namely, in Peschka's Vienna, the boundaries between the centre and the periphery of the metropolis become completely erased. Vienna is no longer a place of culture, a home of an urban civilization or the centre, but a place in which the ability to adapt to nature as well as natural knowledge are vital for survival, like in the wilderness:

---

8   "Ich wusste, jede Zelle trägt in sich das Enzym zur Autolyse. Nach dem Tod beginnt die Selbstverdauung, die Selbstauflösung. Das Abgestorbene frisst sich auf."

> Ferenc flipped through, compared and showed the father the picture, read: "Morus nigra, black mulberry." The father took the calendar away from Ferenc's hand, leaned over the page, put it against the faint light of the candle, took carefully one of the berries and looked at it closely.[9] (Peschka, 2017, p. 26)

Vienna therefore becomes a wilderness, devouring its own, original semiosphere. Spatial identity is lost due to the non-existence of borders with the Other, by which the specific semiotic signs of the city could be determined.

The urban and cultural degradation is noticeable in both prose works. Špišić's space is dominated by the wild construction of huge buildings, a passive attitude towards a decaying and derelict architecture, as well as the alienation of citizens for whom instead of an active social life, on the one hand, consumption becomes more important, while on the other hand, cultural social activities are not mentioned at all because the literary text is dominated by the characters' struggle with difficult socio-economic situation as well as government pressure. Špišić thereby shows what happens to culture and space when capitalism wins and when wrong politics comes to power.

4. Conclusion

A (post)structural and comparative analysis of the dystopian and post-apocalyptic elements in the imaginary space of capital cities of Zagreb and Vienna in *Vuk na snijegu* by Davor Špišić and *Autolyse Wien* by Karin Peschka has shown how the centre-periphery dichotomy changes amidst crisis, reflecting the socio-cultural and extra-textual context. Furthermore, the recognizable semiosphere of both 'real' cities completely changes along with the disappearance of the border between the centre and periphery, the urban and the rural, the civilized and cultured, and the uncivilized and natural. In the strategic use of dystopian and post-apocalyptic narrative methods, the recognizable, real-life signs of the urban culture of the represented cities remain solely in the memories of the characters that reflect the experience and knowledge of the reader.

---

9   Ferenc blätterte, verglich, zeigte dem Vater ein Bild, las vor: „Morus nigra, schwarze Maulbeere." Der Vater nahm Ferenc den Kalender aus der Hand, beugte sich über die Seite, hielt sie in das schwache Kerzenlicht, nahm vorsichtig eine der Beeren, betrachtete sie ausführlich.

The fluctuation of the centre-periphery dichotomy within the two represented cities themselves can be established at different levels. At the level of the plot setting, it becomes clear that Vienna and Zagreb as capital cities proverbially represent urban, cultured, civilized central spaces in their countries respectively. By the end of the texts, it is evident that the spaces have lost these features, and the natural, wild, uncultured has permeated these spaces, changing the signs that once made them recognizable. The semiospheres are dissolved through the processes of defamiliarization used in dystopian and post-apocalyptic narrative techniques, but reconstructed only through the characters' memories appealing to the readers' experiences and knowledge of the cities, again making the semiosis possible. This is what was meant by defining the cities in the selected works as self-reflexive semiospheres.

Secondly, the blurring of the boundaries between the urban-rural as centre-periphery dichotomy is evident on the level of title versus text content. It arises from the disagreement between the elements in Špišić's title that refer to nature (a wolf in the snow) and the plot setting, which is the Croatian capital and most developed city in the country, Zagreb. This Zagreb turns out to be a dystopian battleground of the ruling classes and the ordinary people, both of which are trying to survive under the totalitarian regime. Regarding Peschka's title-text disparity, the title immediately evokes a Central-European metropolis of Vienna, but is soon revealed as a space that has devoured itself and returned to nature.

This argument directs towards the third level of the inconsistent centre-periphery dichotomy arising from extra-textual historical and political context of the two cities and countries: the Austrian capital Vienna historically represents the cultural, administrative, economic, social, political centre, while Zagreb is, due to its relatively recent status of the capital city of Croatia as an independent state, compared to Vienna, somewhat peripheral. In Vienna, there is no more centre in terms of culture, economy, administration, etc., while Zagreb becomes the epitome of centrality: as the seat of Tomanić's supreme political power, as the shopping and capitalism centre in this part of Europe and a place of overkill in control altogether.

The research showed that Špišić's urban geography reflects a negative connection between culture, politics and economy, whereby the cultural aspects of the city become reduced, and culture can still be recognized only in the existence of rare buildings and spaces that were part of the city's identity in the past. Only by the remnants of these spaces, the reader can recognize that Špišić is talking about Zagreb. The auto-referential

semiosphere of Špišić's Zagreb has thus been changed to a large extent as a result of the rule of the People's Salvation Government, a totalitarian government that limited culture, abolished its ministry and transformed the city into a space of political propaganda. Although Zagreb is still a Croatian city and its geographical coordinates remain unchanged, its identity, which was reflected in the characteristics of its spatial landscape as well as the habits of its citizens, becomes lost in Špišić's novel. That which was once civilized and cultured is now uncivilized, aggressive and oppressive.

In Peschka's *Autolyse Wien*, cultural geography disappears with a catastrophe that triggers the return of the life of human civilization to the beginning, namely to the wilderness, where each character fights for his survival. Therefore, the boundaries of the semiosphere disappear and in Peschka's Vienna, the centre does not differ from the periphery, and the cultural semiosis of the former city is not possible anymore due to its post-apocalyptic signs. Moreover, the reader can conclude that the story is about Vienna only from the memories of the characters who remember the destroyed spaces as spaces of culture, as buildings and streets that had their own names, and through their interpretations of the ruins and the speech about what they once represented. Therefore, the culture of the city of Vienna remains preserved only in the memories of those characters who once experienced it, and with the appearance of a new generation that did not live in Vienna for a long period before the disaster, one notices not only indifference to material culture but also to language.

By blurring the boundaries and by constantly playing with the positioning of different narrative elements between the two parts of the centre-periphery dichotomy, the self-reflective semiospheres of Zagreb and Vienna are deconstructed. Both prose works set their narrative in capital cities that are the bearers of the country's cultural identity, and through dystopian or post-apocalyptic elements, they bring the culture of the space to an extreme change or disintegration, which not only means the loss of the city's identity, but also the identity of the entire country. Yet, the remnants of recognizable sign of the cities' urban culture do allow reconstruction and enable semiosis. The unrecognizable signs become recognizable in the social contexts that are reflected in the texts: the war in Ukraine or the overturning of political regimes in recent Croatian history in Špišić's novel, or the problems of megacities such as Vienna in terms of pollution, overpopulation or other forms of crises that may lead to catastrophes, as in Peschka's short stories.

References

Alihodžić, D., & Veseljević Jerković, S. (2016). *The boundaries of dystopian literature: The genre in context*. Tuzla: OFF-SET.

Booker, K. M. (1994). *The Dystopian Impulse in Modern Literature: Fiction as Social Criticism*. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press.

Boy, J. D. (2021). 'The metropolis and the life of spirit' by Georg Simmel: A new translation. *Journal of Classical Sociology*, 21(2), 188-202.

Klimczuk, A., & Klimczuk-Kochańska, M. (2019). Core-periphery model. Core-Periphery Model, In S. N. Romaniuk, M. Thapa & P. Marton (Eds.), *The Palgrave Encyclopedia of Global Security Studies* (pp. 1-8). Palgrave Macmillan, Cham.

Lambropoulos, V. (2001). On the Notion of the Tragedy of Culture. In J. P. Arnason & P. Murphy (Eds.), *Agon, Logos, Polis: The Greek Achievement and its Aftermath* (pp. 233-55). Franz Steiner Verlag.

Lotman, J. M. (2005). On the semiosphere. *Sign Systems Studies,* 33(1), 205-229.

Lotman, J. M. (1977). *The Structure of the Artistic Text*. (Ronald Vroon, Trans.). Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Malenica, I., & Matek Šmit, Z. (2018). Distopijsko tematiziranje budućnosti: od Zamjatina do Mlakića i Popovića. *Tabula,* (15), 332-348.

Nöth, W. (2006). Yuri Lotman on metaphors and culture as self-referential semiospheres. *Semiotica,* 161–1/4, 249–263.

Peschka, K. (2017). *Autolyse Wien. Erzählungen vom Ende.* Salzburg-Wien: Otto Müller Verlag.

Pommer, A. (2020). Düstere Städte und gefährliche Wälder Die Konzeption von Raum in dystopischen und postapokalyptischen Jugendromanen. *kids+media: Zeitschrift für Kinder- Und Jugendmedienforschung*, 10(1), 16-33.

Simmel, G. (1950). The Metropolis and Mental Life. In K. H. Wolff (Ed.), *The Sociology of Georg Simmel* (pp. 409-424). New York: The Free Press.

Sumpor, S. (2021). *Ironijske strategije distopije*. Zagreb: Leykam international.

Špišić, D. (2022). *Vuk na snijegu*. Zagreb: Hena com.

Vieira, P. (2020). Utopia and Dystopia in the age of the Anthropocene. *Esboços,* Florianópolis, 27(46), 350-365.

Wallerstein, Immanuel (1974). *The Modern World-System I: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century*. New York: Academic Press.

Woods, M. (2009). Rural geography: blurring boundaries and making connections. *Progress in human geography*, 33(6), 849-858.

Yavo-Ayalon, S. (2019). 'Enabling Periphereality': Artistic Trajectories in a Peripheral City. *Cultural Sociology*, 13(4), 461-482.

Zylko, B. (2001). Culture and Semiotics: Notes on Lotman's Conception of Culture. *New Literary History*, *32*(2), 391–408.

TANIM

İstanbul Üniversitesi, Edebiyat Fakültesi, Batı Dilleri Bölümü'nün yayını olan Litera: Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi – Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies, açık erişimli, hakemli, yılda iki kere Haziran ve Aralık aylarında yayınlanan, çok dilli bilimsel bir dergidir. 1954 yılında kurulmuştur.

AMAÇ VE KAPSAM

İstanbul Üniversitesi, Edebiyat Fakültesi, Batı Dilleri Bölümü'nün yayını olan Litera: Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi – Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies, açık erişimli, hakemli, yılda iki kere Haziran ve Aralık aylarında online olarak yayınlanan, çok dilli uluslararası bilimsel bir dergidir. 1954 yılında kurulmuştur.

Litera: Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi– Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies'in amacı, Batı dilleri ve edebiyatlarına odaklanılarak yapılan edebiyat bilimi, dilbilim, kültürbilimi, medyabilimi, çeviribilim ve dil öğretimi alanlarındaki disipliner ve/veya disiplinlerarası, kuramsal ve/veya uygulamalı çalışmaları yayımlamaktır; böylelikle alana ilişkin ulusal ve uluslararası camialarla entellüktüel bir platform oluşturmaktır.

Batı dilleri ve edebiyatlarına odaklanılarak yapılan çalışmalar derginin kapsamının ana alanını oluşturur. Dergi Batı dilleri, edebiyatları ve kültürleri ilgili tartışmaları içeren ya da bu tartışmalara odaklanan multidisipliner yaklaşımlara açıktır. Derginin hedef kitlesini akademisyenler, araştırmacılar, profesyoneller, öğrenciler ve ilgili mesleki, akademik kurum ve kuruluşlar oluşturur. Derginin yayın dilleri Almanca, Fransızca, İngilizce, İspanyolca, İtalyanca ve Türkçedir.

Litera tezden üretilmiş makale ve tam metni yayınlanmış bildirilerden oluşan makaleleri değerlendirme sürecine kabul etmemektedir.

EDİTORYAL POLİTİKALAR VE HAKEM SÜRECİ

Yayın Politikası

Dergi yayın etiğinde en yüksek standartlara bağlıdır ve Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ), Open Access Scholarly Publishers Association (OASPA) ve World Association of Medical Editors (WAME) tarafından yayınlanan etik yayıncılık ilkelerini benimser; Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing başlığı altında ifade edilen ilkeler için: https://publicationethics.org/resources/guidelines-new/principles-transparency-and-best-practice-scholarly-publishing

Gönderilen makaleler derginin amaç ve kapsamına uygun olmalıdır. Orijinal, yayınlanmamış ve başka bir dergide değerlendirme sürecinde olmayan, her bir yazar tarafından içeriği ve gönderimi onaylanmış yazılar değerlendirmeye kabul edilir.

Makale yayınlanmak üzere Dergiye gönderildikten sonra yazarlardan hiçbirinin ismi, tüm yazarların yazılı izni olmadan yazar listesinden silinemez ve yeni bir isim yazar olarak eklenemez ve yazar sırası değiştirilemez.

İntihal, duplikasyon, sahte yazarlık/inkar edilen yazarlık, araştrma/veri fabrikasyonu, makale dilimleme, dilimleyerek yayın, telif hakları ihlali ve çıkar çatışmasının gizlenmesi, etik dışı davranışlar olarak kabul edilir. Kabul edilen etik standartlara uygun olmayan tüm makaleler yayından çıkarılır. Buna yayından sonra tespit edilen olası kuraldışı, uygunsuzluklar içeren makaleler de dahildir.

İntihal

Ön kontrolden geçirilen makaleler, iThenticate yazılımı kullanılarak intihal için taranır. İntihal/ kendi kendine intihal tespit edilirse yazarlar bilgilendirilir. Editörler, gerekli olması halinde makaleyi değerlendirme ya da üretim sürecinin çeşitli aşamalarında intihal kontrolüne tabi tutabilirler. Yüksek benzerlik oranları, bir makalenin kabul edilmeden önce ve hatta kabul edildikten sonra reddedilmesine neden olabilir. Makalenin türüne bağlı olarak, bunun oranın %10'dan az olması beklenir.

Çift Kör Hakemlik

İntihal kontrolünden sonra, uygun olan makaleler baş editör tarafından orijinallik, metodoloji, işlenen konunun önemi ve dergi kapsamı ile uyumluluğu açısından değerlendirilir. Editör, makalelerin adil bir şekilde çift taraflı kör hakemlikten geçmesini sağlar ve makale biçimsel esaslara uygun ise, gelen yazıyı yurtiçinden ve /veya yurtdışından en az iki hakemin değerlendirmesine sunar, hakemler gerek gördüğü takdirde yazıda istenen değişiklikler yazarlar tarafından yapıldıktan sonra yayınlanmasına onay verir.

Açık Erişim İlkesi

Dergi açık erişimlidir ve derginin tüm içeriği okura ya da okurun dahil olduğu kuruma ücretsiz olarak sunulur. Okurlar, ticari amaç haricinde, yayıncı ya da yazardan izin almadan dergi makalelerinin tam metnini okuyabilir, indirebilir, kopyalayabilir, arayabilir ve link sağlayabilir. Bu "https://www.budapestopenaccessinitiative.org/translations/turkish-translation" BOAI açık erişim tanımıyla uyumludur.

Derginin açık erişimli makaleleri Creative Commons Atıf-GayrıTicari 4.0 Uluslararası ("https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/deed.tr" CC BY-NC 4.0) olarak lisanslıdır.

İşlemleme Ücreti

Derginin tüm giderleri İstanbul Üniversitesi tarafından karşılanmaktadır. Dergide makale yayını ve makale süreçlerinin yürütülmesi ücrete tabi değildir. Dergiye gönderilen ya da yayın için kabul edilen makaleler için işlemleme ücreti ya da gönderim ücreti alınmaz.

Telif Hakkında

Yazarlar dergide yayınlanan çalışmalarının telif hakkına sahiptirler ve çalışmaları Creative Commons Atıf-GayrıTicari 4.0 Uluslararası ("https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/deed.tr" CC BY-NC 4.0) olarak lisanslıdır. CC BY-NC 4.0 lisansı, eserin ticari kullanım dışında her boyut ve formatta paylaşılmasına, kopyalanmasına, çoğaltılmasına ve orijinal esere uygun şekilde atıfta bulunmak kaydıyla yeniden düzenleme, dönüştürme ve eserin üzerine inşa etme dâhil adapte edilmesine izin verir.

Hakem Süreci

Daha önce yayınlanmamış ya da yayınlanmak üzere başka bir dergide halen değerlendirmede olmayan ve her bir yazar tarafından onaylanan makaleler değerlendirilmek üzere kabul edilir. Gönderilen ve ön kontrolü geçen makaleler iThenticate yazılımı kullanılarak intihal için taranır. İntihal kontrolünden sonra, uygun olan makaleler baş editör tarafından orijinallik, metodoloji, işlenen konunun önemi ve dergi kapsamı ile uyumluluğu açısından değerlendirilir. Baş editör, makaleleri, yazarların etnik kökeninden, cinsiyetinden, cinsel yöneliminden, uyruğundan, dini inancından ve siyasi felsefesinden bağımsız olarak değerlendirir. Yayına gönderilen makalelerin adil bir şekilde çift taraflı kör hakem değerlendirmesinden geçmelerini sağlar.

Seçilen makaleler en az iki ulusal/uluslararası hakeme değerlendirmeye gönderilir; yayın kararı, hakemlerin talepleri doğrultusunda yazarların gerçekleştirdiği düzenlemelerin ve hakem sürecinin sonrasında baş editör tarafından verilir.

Hakemlerin değerlendirmeleri objektif olmalıdır. Hakem süreci sırasında hakemlerin aşağıdaki hususları dikkate alarak değerlendirmelerini yapmaları beklenir.

- Makale yeni ve önemli bir bilgi içeriyor mu?
- Öz, makalenin içeriğini net ve düzgün bir şekilde tanımlıyor mu?
- Yöntem bütünlüklü ve anlaşılır şekilde tanımlanmış mı?
- Yapılan yorum ve varılan sonuçlar bulgularla kanıtlanıyor mu?
- Alandaki diğer çalışmalara yeterli referans verilmiş mi?
- Dil kalitesi yeterli mi?

Hakemler, gönderilen makalelere ilişkin tüm bilginin, makale yayınlanana kadar gizli kalmasını sağlamalı ve yazar tarafında herhangi bir telif hakkı ihlali ve intihal fark ederlerse editöre raporlamalıdırlar. Hakem, makale konusu hakkında kendini vasıflı hissetmiyor ya da zamanında geri dönüş sağlaması mümkün görünmüyorsa, editöre bu durumu bildirmeli ve hakem sürecine kendisini dahil etmemesini istemelidir.

Değerlendirme sürecinde editör hakemlere gözden geçirme için gönderilen makalelerin, yazarların özel mülkü olduğunu ve bunun imtiyazlı bir iletişim olduğunu açıkça belirtir. Hakemler ve yayın kurulu üyeleri başka kişilerle makaleleri tartışamazlar. Hakemlerin kimliğinin gizli kalmasına özen gösterilmelidir.

YAYIN ETİĞİ VE İLKELER

Litera: Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi– Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies, yayın etiğinde en yüksek standartlara bağlıdır ve Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ), Open Access Scholarly Publishers Association (OASPA) ve World Association of Medical Editors (WAME) tarafından yayınlanan etik yayıncılık ilkelerini benimser; Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing başlığı altında ifade edilen ilkeler için adres: https://publicationethics.org/resources/guidelines-new/principles-transparency-and-best-practice-scholarly-publishing

Gönderilen tüm makaleler orijinal, yayınlanmamış ve başka bir dergide değerlendirme sürecinde olmamalıdır. Her bir makale editörlerden biri ve en az iki hakem tarafından çift kör değerlendirmeden geçirilir. İntihal, duplikasyon, sahte yazarlık/inkar edilen yazarlık, araştrma/veri fabrikasyonu, makale dilimleme, dilimleyerek yayın, telif hakları ihlali ve çıkar çatışmasının gizlenmesi, etik dışı davranışlar olarak kabul edilir.

Kabul edilen etik standartlara uygun olmayan tüm makaleler yayından çıkarılır. Buna yayından sonra tespit edilen olası kuraldışı, uygunsuzluklar içeren makaleler de dahildir.

Araştırma Etiği

Dergi araştırma etiğinde en yüksek standartları gözetir ve aşağıda tanımlanan uluslararası araştırma etiği ilkelerini benimser. Makalelerin etik kurallara uygunluğu yazarların sorumluluğundadır.
- Araştırmanın tasarlanması, tasarımın gözden geçirilmesi ve araştırmanın yürütülmesinde, bütünlük, kalite ve şeffaflık ilkeleri sağlanmalıdır.
- Araştırma ekibi ve katılımcılar, araştırmanın amacı, yöntemleri ve öngörülen olası kullanımları; araştırmaya katılımın gerektirdikleri ve varsa riskleri hakkında tam olarak bilgilendirilmelidir.
- Araştırma katılımcılarının sağladığı bilgilerin gizliliği ve yanıt verenlerin gizliliği sağlanmalıdır. Araştırma katılımcıların özerkliğini ve saygınlığını koruyacak şekilde tasarlanmalıdır.
- Araştırma katılımcıları gönüllü olarak araştırmada yer almalı, herhangi bir zorlama altında olmamalıdırlar.
- Katılımcıların zarar görmesinden kaçınılmalıdır. Araştırma, katılımcıları riske sokmayacak şekilde planlanmalıdır.
- Araştırma bağımsızlığıyla ilgili açık ve net olunmalı; çıkar çatışması varsa belirtilmelidir.
- Deneysel çalışmalarda, araştırmaya katılmaya karar veren katılımcıların yazılı bilgilendirilmiş onayı alınmalıdır. Çocukların ve vesayet altındakilerin veya tasdiklenmiş akıl hastalığı bulunanların yasal vasisinin onayı alınmalıdır.
- Çalışma herhangi bir kurum ya da kuruluşta gerçekleştirilecekse bu kurum ya da kuruluştan çalışma yapılacağına dair onay alınmalıdır.
- İnsan öğesi bulunan çalışmalarda, "yöntem" bölümünde katılımcılardan "bilgilendirilmiş onam" alındığının ve çalışmanın yapıldığı kurumdan etik kurul onayı alındığı belirtilmesi gerekir.

Yazarların Sorumluluğu

Makalelerin bilimsel ve etik kurallara uygunluğu yazarların sorumluluğundadır. Yazar makalenin orijinal olduğu, daha önce başka bir yerde yayınlanmadığı ve başka bir yerde, başka bir dilde yayınlanmak üzere değerlendirmede olmadığı konusunda teminat sağlamalıdır. Uygulamadaki telif kanunları ve anlaşmaları gözetilmelidir. Telife bağlı materyaller (örneğin tablolar, şekiller veya büyük alıntılar) gerekli izin ve teşekkürle kullanılmalıdır. Başka yazarların, katkıda bulunanların çalışmaları ya da yararlanılan kaynaklar uygun biçimde kullanılmalı ve referanslarda belirtilmelidir.

Gönderilen makalede tüm yazarların akademik ve bilimsel olarak doğrudan katkısı olmalıdır, bu bağlamda "yazar" yayınlanan bir araştırmanın kavramsallaştırılmasına ve dizaynına, verilerin elde edilmesine, analizine ya da yorumlanmasına belirgin katkı yapan, yazının yazılması ya da bunun içerik açısından eleştirel biçimde gözden geçirilmesinde görev yapan birisi olarak görülür. Yazar olabilmenin diğer koşulları ise, makaledeki çalışmayı planlamak veya icra etmek ve / veya revize etmektir. Fon sağlanması, veri toplanması ya da araştırma grubunun genel süpervizyonu tek başına yazarlık hakkı kazandırmaz. Yazar olarak gösterilen tüm bireyler sayılan tüm ölçütleri karşılamalıdır ve yukarıdaki ölçütleri karşılayan her birey yazar olarak gösterilebilir. Yazarların isim sıralaması ortak verilen bir karar olmalıdır. Tüm yazarlar yazar sıralamasını Telif Hakkı Anlaşması Formunda imzalı olarak belirtmek zorundadırlar.

Yazarlık için yeterli ölçütleri karşılamayan ancak çalışmaya katkısı olan tüm bireyler "teşekkür / bilgiler" kısmında sıralanmalıdır. Bunlara örnek olarak ise sadece teknik destek sağlayan, yazıma yardımcı olan ya da sadece genel bir destek sağlayan, finansal ve materyal desteği sunan kişiler verilebilir.

Bütün yazarlar, araştırmanın sonuçlarını ya da bilimsel değerlendirmeyi etkileyebilme potansiyeli olan finansal ilişkiler, çıkar çatışması ve çıkar rekabetini beyan etmelidirler. Bir yazar kendi yayınlanmış yazısında belirgin bir hata ya da yanlışlık tespit ederse, bu yanlışlıklara ilişkin düzeltme ya da geri çekme için editör ile hemen temasa geçme ve işbirliği yapma sorumluluğunu taşır.

Editör ve Hakem Sorumlulukları

Baş editör, makaleleri, yazarların etnik kökeninden, cinsiyetinden, cinsel yöneliminden, uyruğundan, dini inancından ve siyasi felsefesinden bağımsız olarak değerlendirir. Yayına gönderilen makalelerin adil bir şekilde çift taraflı kör hakem değerlendirmesinden geçmelerini sağlar. Gönderilen makalelere ilişkin tüm bilginin, makale yayınlanana kadar gizli kalacağını garanti eder. Baş editör içerik ve yayının toplam kalitesinden sorumludur. Gereğinde hata sayfası yayınlamalı ya da düzeltme yapmalıdır.

Baş editör; yazarlar, editörler ve hakemler arasında çıkar çatışmasına izin vermez. Hakem atama konusunda tam yetkiye sahiptir ve Dergide yayınlanacak makalelerle ilgili nihai kararı vermekle yükümlüdür.

Hakemlerin araştırmayla ilgili, yazarlarla ve/veya araştırmanın finansal destekçileriyle çıkar çatışmaları olmamalıdır. Değerlendirmelerinin sonucunda tarafsız bir yargıya varmalıdırlar. Gönderilmiş yazılara ilişkin tüm bilginin gizli tutulmasını sağlamalı ve yazar tarafında herhangi bir telif hakkı ihlali ve intihal fark ederlerse editöre raporlamalıdırlar. Hakem, makale konusu hakkında kendini vasıflı

hissetmiyor ya da zamanında geri dönüş sağlaması mümkün görünmüyorsa, editöre bu durumu bildirmeli ve hakem sürecine kendisini dahil etmemesini istemelidir.

Değerlendirme sürecinde editör hakemlere gözden geçirme için gönderilen makalelerin, yazarların özel mülkü olduğunu ve bunun imtiyazlı bir iletişim olduğunu açıkça belirtir. Hakemler ve yayın kurulu üyeleri başka kişilerle makaleleri tartışamazlar. Hakemlerin kimliğinin gizli kalmasına özen gösterilmelidir. Bazı durumlarda editörün kararıyla, ilgili hakemlerin makaleye ait yorumları aynı makaleyi yorumlayan diğer hakemlere gönderilerek hakemlerin bu süreçte aydınlatılması sağlanabilir.

YAZILARIN HAZIRLANMASI VE YAZIM KURALLARI

Dil

Dergide Türkçe, İngilizce, Almanca, Fransızca, İtalyanca ve İspanyolca makaleler yayınlanır. Makalede, makale dilinde öz ve yanısıra İngilizce öz olmalıdır. Ancak İngilizce yazılmış makalelerde geniş özet istenmez.

Yazıların Hazırlanması ve Gönderimi

Aksi belirtilmedikçe gönderilen yazılarla ilgili tüm yazışmalar ilk yazarla yapılacaktır. Makale gönderimi online olarak ve https://litera.istanbul.edu.tr/tr/tr/_ üzerinden yapılmalıdır. Gönderilen yazılar, yazının yayınlanmak üzere gönderildiğini ifade eden, makale türünü belirten ve makaleyle ilgili bilgileri içeren (bkz: Son Kontrol Listesi) bir mektup; yazının elektronik formunu içeren Microsoft Word 2003 ve üzerindeki versiyonları ile yazılmış elektronik dosya ve tüm yazarların imzaladığı Telif Hakkı Anlaşması Formu eklenerek gönderilmelidir.

1. Çalışmalar, A4 boyutundaki kağıdın bir yüzüne, üst, alt, sağ ve sol taraftan 2,5 cm. boşluk bırakılarak, 12 punto Times New Roman harf karakterleriyle ve 1,5 satır aralık ölçüsü ile ve iki yana yaslı olarak hazırlanmalıdır. Paragraf başlarında tab tuşu kullanılmalıdır. Metin içinde yer alan tablo ve şemalarda ise tek satır aralığı kullanılmalıdır.

2. Metnin başlığı küçük harf, koyu renk, Times New Roman yazı tipi, 14 punto olarak sayfanın ortasında yer almalıdır.

3. Metin yazarına ait bilgiler başlıktan sonra bir satır atlanarak, Times New Roman yazı tipi, 10 punto ve tek satır aralığı kullanılarak sayfanın soluna yazılacaktır. Yazarın adı küçük harfle, soyadı büyük harfle belirtildikten sonra bir alt satıra unvanı, çalıştığı kurum ve e-posta adresi yazılacaktır.

4. Giriş bölümünden önce 200-250 kelimelik çalışmanın kapsamını, amacını, ulaşılan sonuçları ve kullanılan yöntemi kaydeden makale dilinde ve ingilizce öz ile 600-800 kelimelik İngilizce genişletilmiş özet yer almalıdır. Çalışmanın İngilizce başlığı İngilizce özün üzerinde yer almalıdır. İngilizce ve makale dilinde özlerin altında çalışmanın içeriğini temsil eden, makale dilinde 5 adet, İngilizce 5 adet anahtar kelime yer almalıdır. Makale İngilizce ise İngilizce genişletilmiş özet istenmez.

5. Çalışmaların başlıca şu unsurları içermesi gerekmektedir: Makale dilinde başlık, öz ve anahtar kelimeler; İngilizce başlık öz ve anahtar kelimeler; İngilizce genişletilmiş özet (makale İngilizce ise İngilizce genişletilmiş özet istenmez), ana metin bölümleri, son notlar ve kaynaklar.

6. Araştırma makalesi bölümleri şu şekilde sıralanmalıdır: "Giriş", "Amaç ve Yöntem", "Bulgular", "Tartışma ve Sonuç", "Son Notlar", "Kaynaklar", "Tablolar ve Şekiller". Derleme ve yorum yazıları için ise, çalışmanın öneminin belirtildiği, sorunsal ve amacın somutlaştırıldığı "Giriş" bölümünün ardından diğer bölümler gelmeli ve çalışma "Tartışma ve Sonuç", "Son Notlar", "Kaynaklar" ve "Tablolar ve Şekiller" şeklinde bitirilmelidir.

7. Çalışmalarda tablo, grafik ve şekil gibi göstergeler ancak çalışmanın takip edilebilmesi açısından gereklilik arz ettiği durumlarda, numaralandırılarak, tanımlayıcı bir başlık ile birlikte verilmelidir. Demografik özellikler gibi metin içinde verilebilecek veriler, ayrıca tablolar ile ifade edilmemelidir.

8. Yayınlanmak üzere gönderilen makale ile birlikte yazar bilgilerini içeren kapak sayfası gönderilmelidir. Kapak sayfasında, makalenin başlığı, yazar veya yazarların bağlı bulundukları kurum ve unvanları, kendilerine ulaşılabilecek adresler, cep, iş ve faks numaraları, ORCID ve e-posta adresleri yer almalıdır (bkz. Son Kontrol Listesi).

9. Kurallar dâhilinde dergimize yayınlanmak üzere gönderilen çalışmaların her türlü sorumluluğu yazar/yazarlarına aittir.

10. Yayın kurulu ve hakem raporları doğrultusunda yazarlardan, metin üzerinde bazı düzeltmeler yapmaları istenebilir.

11. Yayınlanmasına karar verilen çalışmaların, yazar/yazarlarının her birine istekleri halinde dergi gönderilir.

12. Dergiye gönderilen çalışmalar yayınlansın veya yayınlanmasın geri gönderilmez.

Kaynaklar

Kabul edilmiş ancak henüz sayıya dahil edilmemiş makaleler Early View olarak yayınlanır ve bu makalelere atıflar "advance online publication" şeklinde verilmelidir. Genel bir kaynaktan elde edilemeyecek temel bir konu olmadıkça "kişisel iletişimlere" atıfta bulunulmamalıdır. Eğer atıfta bulunulursa parantez içinde iletişim kurulan kişinin adı ve iletişimin tarihi belirtilmelidir. Bilimsel makaleler için yazarlar bu kaynaktan yazılı izin ve iletişimin doğruluğunu gösterir belge almalıdır. Kaynakların doğruluğundan yazar(lar) sorumludur. Tüm kaynaklar metinde belirtilmelidir. Kaynaklar alfabetik olarak sıralanmalıdır.

Referans Stili ve Formatı

Litera: Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi-Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies, metin içi alıntılama ve kaynak gösterme için APA (American Psychological Association) kaynak sitilinin 6. edisyonunu benimser. APA 6.Edisyon hakkında bilgi için:
- American Psychological Association. (2010). Publication manual of the American Psychological Association (6th ed.). Washington, DC: APA.
- http://www.apastyle.org/

Kaynakların doğruluğundan yazar(lar) sorumludur. Tüm kaynaklar metinde belirtilmelidir. Kaynaklar aşağıdaki örneklerdeki gibi gösterilmelidir.

Metin İçinde Kaynak Gösterme

Kaynaklar metinde parantez içinde yazarların soyadı ve yayın tarihi yazılarak belirtilmelidir. Birden fazla kaynak gösterilecekse kaynaklar arasında (;) işareti kullanılmalıdır. Kaynaklar alfabetik olarak sıralanmalıdır.
Örnekler:

Birden fazla kaynak;
(Esin ve ark., 2002; Karasar 1995)
Tek yazarlı kaynak;
(Akyolcu, 2007)
İki yazarlı kaynak;
(Sayıner ve Demirci 2007, s. 72)
Üç, dört ve beş yazarlı kaynak;
Metin içinde ilk kullanımda: (Ailen, Ciambrune ve Welch 2000, s. 12–13) Metin içinde tekrarlayan kullanımlarda: (Ailen ve ark., 2000)
Altı ve daha çok yazarlı kaynak;
(Çavdar ve ark., 2003)

Kaynaklar Bölümünde Kaynak Gösterme

Kullanılan tüm kaynaklar metnin sonunda ayrı bir bölüm halinde yazar soyadlarına göre alfabetik olarak numaralandırılmadan verilmelidir.

Kaynak yazımı ile ilgili örnekler aşağıda verilmiştir.

Kitap

a) Türkçe Kitap
Karasar, N. (1995). *Araştırmalarda rapor hazırlama* (8.bs). Ankara: 3A Eğitim Danışmanlık Ltd.
b) Türkçeye Çevrilmiş Kitap
Mucchielli, A. (1991). *Zihniyetler* (A. Kotil, Çev.). İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları.
c) Editörlü Kitap
Ören, T., Üney, T. ve Çölkesen, R. (Ed.). (2006). *Türkiye bilişim ansiklopedisi*. İstanbul: Papatya Yayıncılık.
d) Çok Yazarlı Türkçe Kitap
Tonta, Y., Bitirim, Y. ve Sever, H. (2002). *Türkçe arama motorlarında performans değerlendirme.* Ankara: Total Bilişim.
e) İngilizce Kitap
Kamien R., & Kamien A. (2014). *Music: An appreciation.* New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Education.

f) İngilizce Kitap İçerisinde Bölüm

Bassett, C. (2006). Cultural studies and new media. In G. Hall & C. Birchall (Eds.), *New cultural studies: Adventures in theory* (pp. 220–237). Edinburgh, UK: Edinburgh University Press.

g) Türkçe Kitap İçerisinde Bölüm

Erkmen, T. (2012). Örgüt kültürü: Fonksiyonları, öğeleri, işletme yönetimi ve liderlikteki önemi. M. Zencirkıran (Ed.), *Örgüt sosyolojisi kitabı* içinde (s. 233–263). Bursa: Dora Basım Yayın.

h) Yayımcının ve Yazarın Kurum Olduğu Yayın

Türk Standartları Enstitüsü. (1974). *Adlandırma ilkeleri.* Ankara: Yazar.

Makale

a) Türkçe Makale

Mutlu, B. ve Savaşer, S. (2007). Çocuğu ameliyat sonrası yoğun bakımda olan ebeveynlerde stres nedenleri ve azaltma girişimleri. *İstanbul Üniversitesi Florence Nightingale Hemşirelik Dergisi, 15*(60), 179–182.

b) İngilizce Makale

de Cillia, R., Reisigl, M., & Wodak, R. (1999). The discursive construction of national identity. *Discourse and Society, 10*(2), 149–173. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0957926599010002002

c) Yediden Fazla Yazarlı Makale

Lal, H., Cunningham, A. L., Godeaux, O., Chlibek, R., Diez-Domingo, J., Hwang, S.-J. ... Heineman, T. C. (2015). Efficacy of an adjuvanted herpes zoster subunit vaccine in older adults. *New England Journal of Medicine, 372,* 2087–2096. http://dx.doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa1501184

d) DOI'si Olmayan Online Edinilmiş Makale

Al, U. ve Doğan, G. (2012). Hacettepe Üniversitesi Bilgi ve Belge Yönetimi Bölümü tezlerinin atıf analizi. *Türk Kütüphaneciliği, 26,* 349–369. Erişim adresi: http://www.tk.org.tr/

e) DOI'si Olan Makale

Turner, S. J. (2010). Website statistics 2.0: Using Google Analytics to measure library website effectiveness. *Technical Services Quarterly, 27,* 261–278. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/07317131003765910

f) Advance Online Olarak Yayımlanmış Makale

Smith, J. A. (2010). Citing advance online publication: A review. *Journal of Psychology.* Advance online publication. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/a45d7867

g) Popüler Dergi Makalesi

Semercioğlu, C. (2015, Haziran). Sıradanlığın rayihası. *Sabit Fikir, 52,* 38–39.

Tez, Sunum, Bildiri

a) Türkçe Tezler

Sarı, E. (2008). *Kültür kimlik ve politika: Mardin'de kültürlerarasılık.* (Doktora Tezi). Ankara Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.

b)Ticari Veritabanında Yer Alan Yüksek Lisans Ya da Doktora Tezi

Van Brunt, D. (1997). *Networked consumer health information systems* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses. (UMI No. 9943436)

c) Kurumsal Veritabanında Yer Alan İngilizce Yüksek Lisans/Doktora Tezi

Yaylalı-Yıldız, B. (2014). *University campuses as places of potential publicness: Exploring the politicals, social and cultural practices in Ege University* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from Retrieved from: http://library.iyte.edu.tr/tr/hizli-erisim/iyte-tez-portali

d) Web'de Yer Alan İngilizce Yüksek Lisans/Doktora Tezi

Tonta, Y. A. (1992). *An analysis of search failures in online library catalogs* (Doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley). Retrieved from http://yunus.hacettepe.edu.tr/~tonta/yayinlar/phd/ickapak.html

e) Dissertations Abstracts International'da Yer Alan Yüksek Lisans/Doktora Tezi

Appelbaum, L. G. (2005). Three studies of human information processing: Texture amplification, motion representation, and figure-ground segregation. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B. Sciences and Engineering, 65*(10), 5428.

f) Sempozyum Katkısı

Krinsky-McHale, S. J., Zigman, W. B. & Silverman, W. (2012, August). Are neuropsychiatric symptoms markers of prodromal Alzheimer's disease in adults with Down syndrome? In W. B. Zigman (Chair), *Predictors of mild cognitive impairment, dementia, and mortality in adults with Down syndrome.* Symposium conducted at American Psychological Association meeting, Orlando, FL.

g) Online Olarak Erişilen Konferans Bildiri Özeti

Çınar, M., Doğan, D. ve Seferoğlu, S. S. (2015, Şubat). *Eğitimde dijital araçlar: Google sınıf uygulaması üzerine bir değerlendirme* [Öz]. Akademik Bilişim Konferansında sunulan bildiri, Anadolu Üniversitesi, Eskişehir. Erişim adresi: http://ab2015.anadolu.edu.tr /index.php?menu=5&submenu=27

h) Düzenli Olarak Online Yayımlanan Bildiriler

Herculano-Houzel, S., Collins, C. E., Wong, P., Kaas, J. H., & Lent, R. (2008). The basic nonuniformity of the cerebral cortex. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 105,* 12593–12598. http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0805417105

i) Kitap Şeklinde Yayımlanan Bildiriler

Schneider, R. (2013). Research data literacy. S. Kurbanoğlu ve ark. (Ed.), Communications in Computer and Information Science: Vol. 397. *Worldwide Communalities and Challenges in Information Literacy Research and Practice* içinde (s. 134–140) . Cham, İsviçre: Springer. http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-03919-0

j) Kongre Bildirisi

Çepni, S., Bacanak A. ve Özsevgeç T. (2001, Haziran). *Fen bilgisi öğretmen adaylarının fen branşlarına karşı tutumları ile fen branşlarındaki başarılarının ilişkisi.* X. Ulusal Eğitim Bilimleri Kongresi'nde sunulan bildiri, Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi, Bolu

Diğer Kaynaklar

a) Gazete Yazısı

Toker, Ç. (2015, 26 Haziran). 'Unutma' notları. *Cumhuriyet,* s. 13.

b) Online Gazete Yazısı

Tamer, M. (2015, 26 Haziran). E-ticaret hamle yapmak için tüketiciyi bekliyor. *Milliyet.* Erişim adresi: http://www.milliyet

c) Web Page/Blog Post

Bordwell, D. (2013, June 18). David Koepp: Making the world movie-sized [Web log post]. Retrieved from http://www.davidbordwell.net/blog/page/27/

d) Online Ansiklopedi/Sözlük

Bilgi mimarisi. (2014, 20 Aralık). Vikipedi içinde. Erişim adresi: http://tr.wikipedia.org/wiki/Bilgi_mimarisi

Marcoux, A. (2008). Business ethics. In E. N. Zalta (Ed.), *The Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy*. Retrieved from http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/ethics-business/

e) Podcast

Radyo ODTÜ (Yapımcı). (2015, 13 Nisan). *Modern sabahlar* [Podcast]. Erişim adresi: http://www.radyoodtu.com.tr/

f) Bir Televizyon Dizisinden Tek Bir Bölüm

Shore, D. (Senarist), Jackson, M. (Senarist) ve Bookstaver, S. (Yönetmen). (2012). Runaways [Televizyon dizisi bölümü]. D. Shore (Baş yapımcı), *House M.D.* içinde. New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting.

g) Müzik Kaydı

Say, F. (2009). Galata Kulesi. *İstanbul senfonisi* [CD] içinde. İstanbul: Ak Müzik.

SON KONTROL LİSTESİ

Aşağıdaki listede eksik olmadığından emin olun:

- ● Editöre mektup
  - ✓ Makalenin türü
  - ✓ Başka bir dergiye gönderilmemiş olduğu bilgisi
  - ✓ Sponsor veya ticari bir firma ile ilişkisi (varsa belirtiniz)
  - ✓ İngilizce yönünden kontrolünün yapıldığı
  - ✓ Kaynakların APA6'ya göre belirtildiği
  - ✓ Yazarlara Bilgide detaylı olarak anlatılan dergi politikalarının gözden geçirildiği
- ● Telif Hakkı Anlaşması Formu
- ● Daha önce basılmış ve telife bağlı materyal (yazı-resim-tablo) kullanılmış ise izin belgesi
- ● Kapak sayfası
  - ✓ Makalenin türü
  - ✓ Makale dilinde ve İngilizce başlık
  - ✓ Yazarların ismi soyadı, unvanları ve bağlı oldukları kurumlar (üniversite ve fakülte bilgisinden sonra şehir ve ülke bilgisi de yer almalıdır), e-posta adresleri
  - ✓ Sorumlu yazarın e-posta adresi, açık yazışma adresi, iş telefonu, GSM, faks nosu
  - ✓ Tüm yazarların ORCID'leri
- ● Makale ana metni
  - ✓ Makale dilinde ve İngilizce başlık
  - ✓ Özetler 200-250 kelime makale dilinde ve 200-250 kelime İngilizce
  - ✓ Anahtar Kelimeler: 5 adet makale dilinde ve 5 adet İngilizce
  - ✓ İngilizce olmayan makaleler için (Örn, Almanca, Fransızca vd dillerdeki makaleler) İngilizce genişletilmiş Özet (Extended Abstract) 600-800 kelime
  - ✓ Makale ana metin bölümleri
  - ✓ Finansal destek (varsa belirtiniz)
  - ✓ Çıkar çatışması (varsa belirtiniz)
  - ✓ Teşekkür (varsa belirtiniz)
  - ✓ Kaynaklar
  - ✓ Tablolar-Resimler, Şekiller (başlık, tanım ve alt yazılarıyla)

İLETİŞİM İÇİN:

Editör : Özlem Karadağ
E-mail : okaradag@istanbul.edu.tr
Tel : + 90 212 455 57 00 / 15861
Web site: http://litera.istanbul.edu.tr
Email : litera@istanbul.edu.tr
Adres : İstanbul Üniversitesi
Edebiyat Fakültesi
Batı Dilleri ve Edebiyatları Bölümü
Ordu Cad. No: 6 34134, Laleli
İstanbul-Türkiye

DESCRIPTION

Litera: Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies - Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi, which is the official publication of Istanbul University, Faculty of Letters, Department of Western Languages is an open access, peer-reviewed, multilingual, scholarly and international journal published two times a year in June and December. It was founded in 1954.

AIM AND SCOPE

Litera: Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies - Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi, which is the official publication of Istanbul University, Faculty of Letters, Department of Western Languages is an open access, peer-reviewed, multilingual, scholarly and international journal published online two times a year in June and December. It was founded in 1954.

Litera - Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies publishes disciplinary and/or interdisciplinary, theoretical and/or applied research articles that focus on Western languages and literatures in the following fields: literary studies, linguistics, cultural studies, media studies, translation studies, and language teaching. The objective of Litera is to publish scientific articles from both international and national communites and provide an intellectual platform for literary and cultural studies.

Western languages and literatures are the main fields of the journal scope and journal welcomes articles from . Multidisciplinary approaches that focus on or include discussions of Western literatures and cultures are encouraged. The target group of the Journal consists of academicians, researchers, professionals, students, related professional and academic bodies and institutions. It publishes articles written in Turkish, English, French, Italian, German, and Spanish.

Litera does not consider duplicate publication and/or partial reuse of theses, dissertations, and previously published conference papers for evaluation/publication, reuse is not allowed.

EDITORIAL POLICIES AND PEER REVIEW PROCESS

Publication Policy

The journal is committed to upholding the highest standards of publication ethics and pays regard to Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing published by the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), the Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ), the Open Access Scholarly Publishers Association (OASPA), and the World Association of Medical Editors (WAME) on https://publicationethics.org/resources/guidelines-new/principles-transparency-and-best-practice-scholarly-publishing

The subjects covered in the manuscripts submitted to the Journal for publication must be in accordance with the aim and scope of the Journal. Only those manuscripts approved by every individual author and that were not published before in or sent to another journal, are accepted for evaluation.

Changing the name of an author (omission, addition or order) in papers submitted to the Journal requires written permission of all declared authors.

Plagiarism, duplication, fraud authorship/denied authorship, research/data fabrication, salami slicing/salami publication, breaching of copyrights, prevailing conflict of interest are unethical behaviors. All manuscripts not in accordance with the accepted ethical standards will be removed from the publication. This also contains any possible malpractice discovered after the publication.

Plagiarism

Submitted manuscripts that pass preliminary control are scanned for plagiarism using iThenticate software. If plagiarism/self-plagiarism will be found authors will be informed. Editors may resubmit manuscript for similarity check at any peer-review or production stage if required. High similarity scores may lead to rejection of a manuscript before and even after acceptance. Depending on the type of article and the percentage of similarity score taken from each article, the overall similarity score is generally expected to be less than 10%.

Double Blind Peer-Review

After plagiarism check, the eligible ones are evaluated by the editors-in-chief for their originality, methodology, the importance of the subject covered and compliance with the journal scope. The editor provides a fair double-blind peer review of the submitted articles and hands over the papers matching the formal rules to at least two national/international referees for evaluation and gives green light for publication upon modification by the authors in accordance with the referees' claims.

Open Access Statement

The journal is an open access journal and all content is freely available without charge to the user or his/her institution. Except for commercial purposes, users are allowed to read, download, copy, print, search, or link to the full texts of the articles in this journal without asking prior permission from the publisher or the author. This is in accordance with the "https://www. budapestopenaccessinitiative.org/read" BOAI definition of open access.

The open access articles in the journal are licensed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International ("https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/ deed.en" CC BY-NC 4.0) license.

Article Processing Charge

All expenses of the journal are covered by the Istanbul University. Processing and publication are free of charge with the journal. There is no article processing charges or submission fees for any submitted or accepted articles.

Peer Review Process

Only those manuscripts approved by its every individual author and that were not published before in or sent to another journal, are accepted for evaluation.

Submitted manuscripts that pass preliminary control are scanned for plagiarism using iThenticate software. After plagiarism check, the eligible ones are evaluated by Editor-in-Chief for their originality, methodology, the importance of the subject covered and compliance with the journal scope.

Editor-in-Chief evaluates manuscripts for their scientific content without regard to ethnic origin, gender, sexual orientation, citizenship, religious belief or political philosophy of the authors and ensures a fair double-blind peer review of the selected manuscripts.

The selected manuscripts are sent to at least two national/international referees for evaluation and publication decision is given by Editor-in-Chief upon modification by the authors in accordance with the referees' claims.

Editor-in-Chief does not allow any conflicts of interest between the authors, editors and reviewers and is responsible for final decision for publication of the manuscripts in the Journal.

Reviewers' judgments must be objective. Reviewers' comments on the following aspects are expected while conducting the review.

- Does the manuscript contain new and significant information?
- Does the abstract clearly and accurately describe the content of the manuscript?
- Is the problem significant and concisely stated?
- Are the methods described comprehensively?
- Are the interpretations and consclusions justified by the results?
- Is adequate references made to other Works in the field?
- Is the language acceptable?

Reviewers must ensure that all the information related to submitted manuscripts is kept as confidential and must report to the editor if they are aware of copyright infringement and plagiarism on the author's side.

A reviewer who feels unqualified to review the topic of a manuscript or knows that its prompt review will be impossible should notify the editor and excuse himself from the review process.

The editor informs the reviewers that the manuscripts are confidential information and that this is a privileged interaction. The reviewers and editorial board cannot discuss the manuscripts with other persons. The anonymity of the referees is important.

PUBLICATION ETHICS AND PUBLICATION MALPRACTICE STATEMENT

Litera: Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies - Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi is committed to upholding the highest standards of publication ethics and pays regard to Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing published by the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), the Directory of Open Access Journals (DOAJ), the Open Access Scholarly Publishers Association (OASPA), and the World Association of Medical Editors (WAME) on https://publicationethics.org/resources/guidelines-new/principles-transparency-and-best-practice-scholarly-publishing

All parties involved in the publishing process (Editors, Reviewers, Authors and Publishers) are expected to agree on the following ethical principles.

All submissions must be original, unpublished (including as full text in conference proceedings), and not under the review of any other publication synchronously. Authors must ensure that submitted work is original. They must certify that the manuscript has not previously been published elsewhere or is not currently being considered for publication elsewhere, in any language. Applicable copyright laws and conventions must be followed. Copyright material (e.g. tables, figures or extensive quotations) must be reproduced only with appropriate permission and acknowledgement. Any work or words of other authors, contributors, or sources must be appropriately credited and referenced.

Each manuscript is reviewed by one of the editors and at least two referees under double-blind peer review process. Plagiarism, duplication, fraud authorship/denied authorship, research/data fabrication, salami slicing/salami publication, breaching of copyrights, prevailing conflict of interest are unnethical behaviors.

All manuscripts not in accordance with the accepted ethical standards will be removed from the publication. This also contains any possible malpractice discovered after the publication. In accordance with the code of conduct we will report any cases of suspected plagiarism or duplicate publishing.

Research Ethics

The journal adheres to the highest standards in research ethics and follows the principles of international research ethics as defined below. The authors are responsible for the compliance of the manuscripts with the ethical rules.

- Principles of integrity, quality and transparency should be sustained in designing the research, reviewing the design and conducting the research.
- The research team and participants should be fully informed about the aim, methods, possible uses and requirements of the research and risks of participation in research.
- The confidentiality of the information provided by the research participants and the confidentiality of the respondents should be ensured. The research should be designed to protect the autonomy and dignity of the participants.
- Research participants should participate in the research voluntarily, not under any coercion.
- Any possible harm to participants must be avoided. The research should be planned in such a way that the participants are not at risk.
- The independence of research must be clear; and any conflict of interest or must be disclosed.
- In experimental studies with human subjects, written informed consent of the participants who decide to participate in the research must be obtained. In the case of children and those under wardship or with confirmed insanity, legal custodian's assent must be obtained.
- If the study is to be carried out in any institution or organization, approval must be obtained from this institution or organization.
- In studies with human subject, it must be noted in the method's section of the manuscript that the informed consent of the participants and ethics committee approval from the institution where the study has been conducted have been obtained.

Author Responsibilities

It is authors' responsibility to ensure that the article is in accordance with scientific and ethical standards and rules. And authors must ensure that submitted work is original. They must certify that the manuscript has not previously been published elsewhere or is not currently being considered for publication elsewhere, in any language. Applicable copyright laws and conventions must be followed. Copyright material (e.g. tables, figures or extensive quotations) must be reproduced only with appropriate permission and acknowledgement. Any work or words of other authors, contributors, or sources must be appropriately credited and referenced.

All the authors of a submitted manuscript must have direct scientific and academic contribution to the manuscript. The author(s) of the original research articles is defined as a person who is significantly involved in "conceptualization and design of the study", "collecting the data", "analyzing the data", "writing the manuscript", "reviewing the manuscript with a critical perspective" and "planning/conducting the study of the manuscript and/or revising it". Fund raising, data collection or supervision of the research group are not sufficient roles to be accepted as an author. The author(s) must meet all these criteria described above. The order of names in the author list of an article must be a co-decision and it must be indicated in the Copyright Agreement Form. The individuals who do not meet the authorship criteria but contributed to the study must take place in the acknowledgement section. Individuals providing technical support, assisting writing, providing a general support, providing material or financial support are examples to be indicated in acknowledgement section.

All authors must disclose all issues concerning financial relationship, conflict of interest, and competing interest that may potentially influence the results of the research or scientific judgment.

When an author discovers a significant error or inaccuracy in his/her own published paper, it is the author's obligation to promptly cooperate with the Editor to provide retractions or corrections of mistakes.

Responsibility for the Editor and Reviewers

Editor-in-Chief evaluates manuscripts for their scientific content without regard to ethnic origin, gender, sexual orientation, citizenship, religious belief or political philosophy of the authors. He/She provides a fair double-blind peer review of the submitted articles for publication and ensures that all the information related to submitted manuscripts is kept as confidential before publishing.

Editor-in-Chief is responsible for the contents and overall quality of the publication. He/She must publish errata pages or make corrections when needed.

Editor-in-Chief does not allow any conflicts of interest between the authors, editors and reviewers. Only he has the full authority to assign a reviewer and is responsible for final decision for publication of the manuscripts in the Journal.

Reviewers must have no conflict of interest with respect to the research, the authors and/or the research funders. Their judgments must be objective.

Reviewers must ensure that all the information related to submitted manuscripts is kept as confidential and must report to the editor if they are aware of copyright infringement and plagiarism on the author's side.

A reviewer who feels unqualified to review the topic of a manuscript or knows that its prompt review will be impossible should notify the editor and excuse himself from the review process.

The editor informs the reviewers that the manuscripts are confidential information and that this is a privileged interaction. The reviewers and editorial board cannot discuss the manuscripts with other persons. The anonymity of the referees must be ensured. In particular situations, the editor may share the review of one reviewer with other reviewers to clarify a particular point.

MANUSCRIPT ORGANIZATION

Language

Articles in Turkish, English, German, French, Italian and Spanish are published. Submitted article must include an abstract both in the article language and in English, and an extended abstract in English as well. Extended abstract in English is not required for articles in English.

Manuscript Organization and Submission

All correspondence will be sent to the first-named author unless otherwise specified. Manuscpript is to be submitted online via http://litera.istanbul.edu.tr/en/_ and it must be accompanied by a cover letter indicating that the manuscript is intended for publication, specifying the article category (i.e. research article, review etc.) and including information about the manuscript (see the Submission Checklist). Manuscripts should be prepared in Microsoft Word 2003 and upper versions. In addition, Copyright Agreement Form that has to be signed by all authors must be submitted.

1. The manuscripts should be in A4 paper standards: having 2.5 cm margins from right, left, bottom and top, Times New Roman font style in 12 font size, line spacing of 1.5 and "justify align" format. For indented paragraph, tab key should be used. One line spacing should be used for the tables and figures, which are included in the text.
2. The title of the text should be centered on the page, in lower-case letter, bold, Times New Roman font and 14 font size.
3. Information about the author is to be written on the left part of the page skipping one line space after the title, and it should be in Times New Roman font, 10 font size, with one line spacing. After indicating the name of the author in lower-case letter and surname in capital letter, the title, affiliation, and e-mail address should be included.
4. Before the introduction part, there should be an abstract of 200-250 words both in the language of the article and in English. An extended abstract in English between 600-800 words, summarizing the scope, the purpose, the results of the study and the methodology used is to be included following the abstracts. If the manuscript is in English, extended abstract is not required. Underneath the abstracts, 5 keywords that inform the reader about the content of the study should be specified in the language of the article and in English.
5. The manuscripts should contain mainly these components: title, abstract and keywords; extended abstract (If the manuscript is in English, extended abstract is not required), sections, footnotes and references.
6. Research article sections are ordered as follows: "Introduction", "Aim and Methodology", "Findings", "Discussion and Conclusion", "Endnotes" and "References". For review and commentary articles, the article should start with the "Introduction" section where the purpose and the method is mentioned, go on with the other sections; and it should be finished with "Discussion and Conclusion" section followed by "Endnotes", "References" and "Tables and Figures".
7. Tables, graphs and figures can be given with a number and a defining title if and only if it is necessary to follow the idea of the article. Otherwise features like demographic characteristics can be given within the text.
8. A title page including author information must be submitted together with the manuscript. The title page is to include fully descriptive title of the manuscript and, affiliation, title, e-mail address, ORCID, postal address, phone and fax number of the author(s) (see The Submission Checklist).
9. The scientific and legal responsibility for manuscripts submitted to our journal for publication belongs to the author(s).

10. The author(s) can be asked to make some changes in their articles due to peer reviews.
11. A copy of the journal will be sent to each author of the accepted articles upon their request.
12. The studies that were sent to the journal will not be returned whether they are published or not.

References

Papers accepted but not yet included in the issue are published online in the Early View section and they should be cited as "advance online publication". Citing a "personal communication" should be avoided unless it provides essential information not available from a public source, in which case the name of the person and date of communication should be cited in parentheses in the text. For scientific articles, written permission and confirmation of accuracy from the source of a personal communication must be obtained.

Reference Style and Format

Litera: Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies - Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi complies with APA (American Psychological Association) style 6th Edition for referencing and quoting. For more information:
- American Psychological Association. (2010). Publication manual of the American Psychological Association (6th ed.). Washington, DC: APA.
- http://www.apastyle.org

Accuracy of citation is the author's responsibility. All references should be cited in text. Reference list must be in alphabetical order. Type references in the style shown below.

Citations in the Text

Citations must be indicated with the author surname and publication year within the parenthesis.

If more than one citation is made within the same paranthesis, separate them with (;).

Samples:

More than one citation;
(Esin et al., 2002; Karasar, 1995)
Citation with one author;
(Akyolcu, 2007)
Citation with two authors;
(Sayıner & Demirci, 2007)
Citation with three, four, five authors;
First citation in the text: (Ailen, Ciambrune, & Welch, 2000) Subsequent citations in the text: (Ailen et al., 2000)

Citations with more than six authors;
(Çavdar et al., 2003)

Citations in the Reference

All the citations done in the text should be listed in the References section in alphabetical order of author surname without numbering. Below given examples should be considered in citing the references.

Basic Reference Types

Book

a) Turkish Book
Karasar, N. (1995). *Araştırmalarda rapor hazırlama* (8th ed.) [Preparing research reports]. Ankara, Turkiye: 3A Eğitim Danışmanlık Ltd.
b) Book Translated into Turkish
Mucchielli, A. (1991). *Zihniyetler* [Mindsets] (A. Kotil, Trans.). İstanbul, Turkiye: İletişim Yayınları.
c) Edited Book
Ören, T., Üney, T., & Çölkesen, R. (Eds.). (2006). *Türkiye bilişim ansiklopedisi* [Turkish Encyclopedia of Informatics]. İstanbul, Turkiye: Papatya Yayıncılık.
d) Turkish Book with Multiple Authors
Tonta, Y., Bitirim, Y., & Sever, H. (2002). T*ürkçe arama motorlarında performans değerlendirme* [Performance evaluation in Turkish search engines]. Ankara, Turkiye: Total Bilişim.
e) Book in English
Kamien R., & Kamien A. (2014). *Music: An appreciation.* New York, NY: McGraw-Hill Education.
f) Chapter in an Edited Book
Bassett, C. (2006). Cultural studies and new media. In G. Hall & C. Birchall (Eds.), *New cultural studies: Adventures in theory* (pp. 220–237). Edinburgh, UK: Edinburgh University Press.
g) Chapter in an Edited Book in Turkish
Erkmen, T. (2012). Örgüt kültürü: Fonksiyonları, öğeleri, işletme yönetimi ve liderlikteki önemi [Organization culture: Its functions, elements and importance in leadership and business management]. In M. Zencirkıran (Ed.), *Örgüt sosyolojisi* [Organization sociology] (pp. 233–263). Bursa, Turkiye: Dora Basım Yayın.
h) Book with the same organization as author and publisher
American Psychological Association. (2009). *Publication manual of the American psychological association* (6th ed.). Washington, DC: Author.

Article

a) Turkish Article
Mutlu, B., & Savaşer, S. (2007). Çocuğu ameliyat sonrası yoğun bakımda olan ebeveynlerde stres nedenleri ve azaltma girişimleri [Source and intervention reduction of stress for parents whose children are in intensive care unit after surgery]. *Istanbul University Florence Nightingale Journal of Nursing, 15*(60), 179–182.

b) English Article

de Cillia, R., Reisigl, M., & Wodak, R. (1999). The discursive construction of national identity. *Discourse and Society, 10*(2), 149–173. http://dx.doi.org/10.1177/0957926599010002002

c) Journal Article with DOI and More Than Seven Authors

Lal, H., Cunningham, A. L., Godeaux, O., Chlibek, R., Diez-Domingo, J., Hwang, S.-J. ... Heineman, T. C. (2015). Efficacy of an adjuvanted herpes zoster subunit vaccine in older adults. *New England Journal of Medicine, 372,* 2087–2096. http://dx.doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa1501184

d) Journal Article from Web, without DOI

Sidani, S. (2003). Enhancing the evaluation of nursing care effectiveness. *Canadian Journal of Nursing Research, 35*(3), 26–38. Retrieved from http://cjnr.mcgill.ca

e) Journal Article wih DOI

Turner, S.J. (2010). Website statistics 2.0: Using Google Analytics to measure library website effectiveness. *Technical Services Quarterly, 27,* 261–278. http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/07317131003765910

f) Advance Online Publication

Smith, J. A. (2010). Citing advance online publication: A review. *Journal of Psychology.* Advance online publication. http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/a45d7867

g) Article in a Magazine

Henry, W. A., III. (1990, April 9). Making the grade in today's schools. *Time, 135,* 28–31.

Doctoral Dissertation, Master's Thesis, Presentation, Proceeding

a) Dissertation/Thesis from a Commercial Database

Van Brunt, D. (1997). *Networked consumer health information systems* (Doctoral dissertation). Available from ProQuest Dissertations and Theses database. (UMI No. 9943436)

b) Dissertation/Thesis from an Institutional Database

Yaylalı-Yıldız, B. (2014). *University campuses as places of potential publicness: Exploring the politicals, social and cultural practices in Ege University* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from http://library.iyte.edu.tr/tr/hizli-erisim/iyte-tez-portali

c) Dissertation/Thesis from Web

Tonta, Y. A. (1992). *An analysis of search failures in online library catalogs* (Doctoral dissertation, University of California, Berkeley). Retrieved from http://yunus.hacettepe.edu.tr/~tonta/yayinlar/phd/ickapak.html

d) Dissertation/Thesis abstracted in Dissertations Abstracts International

Appelbaum, L. G. (2005). Three studies of human information processing: Texture amplification, motion representation, and figure-ground segregation. *Dissertation Abstracts International: Section B. Sciences and Engineering, 65*(10), 5428.

e) Symposium Contribution

Krinsky-McHale, S. J., Zigman, W. B., & Silverman, W. (2012, August). Are neuropsychiatric symptoms markers of prodromal Alzheimer's disease in adults with Down syndrome? In W. B. Zigman (Chair), *Predictors of mild cognitive impairment, dementia, and mortality in adults with Down syndrome.* Symposium conducted at the meeting of the American Psychological Association, Orlando, FL.

f) Conference Paper Abstract Retrieved Online

Liu, S. (2005, May). *Defending against business crises with the help of intelligent agent based early*

warning solutions. Paper presented at the Seventh International Conference on Enterprise Information Systems, Miami, FL. Abstract retrieved from http://www.iceis.org/iceis2005/abstracts_2005.htm

g) Conference Paper - In Regularly Published Proceedings and Retrieved Online

Herculano-Houzel, S., Collins, C. E., Wong, P., Kaas, J. H., & Lent, R. (2008). The basic nonuniformity of the cerebral cortex. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 105,* 12593–12598. http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0805417105

h) Proceeding in Book Form

Parsons, O. A., Pryzwansky, W. B., Weinstein, D. J., & Wiens, A. N. (1995). Taxonomy for psychology. In J. N. Reich, H. Sands, & A. N. Wiens (Eds.), *Education and training beyond the doctoral degree: Proceedings of the American Psychological Association National Conference on Postdoctoral Education and Training in Psychology* (pp. 45–50). Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

i) Paper Presentation

Nguyen, C. A. (2012, August). *Humor and deception in advertising: When laughter may not be the best medicine.* Paper presented at the meeting of the American Psychological Association, Orlando, FL.

Other Sources

a) Newspaper Article

Browne, R. (2010, March 21). This brainless patient is no dummy. *Sydney Morning Herald, 45.*

b) Newspaper Article with no Author

New drug appears to sharply cut risk of death from heart failure. (1993, July 15). *The Washington Post,* p. A12.

c) Web Page/Blog Post

Bordwell, D. (2013, June 18). David Koepp: Making the world movie-sized [Web log post]. Retrieved from http://www.davidbordwell.net/blog/page/27/

d) Online Encyclopedia/Dictionary

Ignition. (1989). In *Oxford English online dictionary* (2nd ed.). Retrieved from http://dictionary.oed. com

Marcoux, A. (2008). Business ethics. In E. N. Zalta (Ed.). *The Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy.* Retrieved from http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/ethics-business/

e) Podcast

Dunning, B. (Producer). (2011, January 12). *inFact: Conspiracy theories* [Video podcast]. Retrieved from http://itunes.apple.com/

f) Single Episode in a Television Series

Egan, D. (Writer), & Alexander, J. (Director). (2005). Failure to communicate. [Television series episode]. In D. Shore (Executive producer), *House;* New York, NY: Fox Broadcasting.

g) Music

Fuchs, G. (2004). Light the menorah. On *Eight nights of Hanukkah* [CD]. Brick, NJ: Kid Kosher.

SUBMISSION CHECKLIST

Ensure that the following items are present:

- Cover letter to the editor
  - ✓ The category of the manuscript
  - ✓ Confirming that "the paper is not under consideration for publication in another journal".
  - ✓ Including disclosure of any commercial or financial involvement.
  - ✓ Confirming that last control for fluent English was done.
  - ✓ Confirming that journal policies detailed in Information for Authors have been reviewed.
  - ✓ Confirming that the references cited in the text and listed in the references section are in line with APA 6.
- Copyright Agreement Form
- Permission of previously published copyrighted material if used in the present manuscript
- Title page
  - ✓ The category of the manuscript
  - ✓ The title of the manuscript both in the language of article and in English
  - ✓ All authors' names and affiliations (institution, faculty/department, city, country), e-mail addresses
  - ✓ Corresponding author's email address, full postal address, telephone and fax number
  - ✓ ORCIDs of all authors.
- Main Manuscript Document
  - ✓ The title of the manuscript both in the language of article and in English
  - ✓ Abstracts (200-250 words) both in the language of article and in English
  - ✓ Key words: 5 words both in the language of article and in English
  - ✓ Extended Abstract (600-800 words) in English for the articles which are not in English
  - ✓ Main article sections
  - ✓ Grant support (if exists)
  - ✓ Conflict of interest (if exists)
  - ✓ Acknowledgement (if exists)
  - ✓ References
  - ✓ All tables, illustrations (figures) (including title, description, footnotes)

CONTACT INFO

Editor : Özlem Karadağ
E-mail : okaradag@istanbul.edu.tr
Phone : + 90 212 455 57 00 / 15861
Web site : http://litera.istanbul.edu.tr
Email : litera@istanbul.edu.tr
Address : Istanbul University,
Faculty of Letters
Department of Western Languages and Literatures
Ordu Cad. No: 6
34134, Laleli
Istanbul-Turkiye

İstanbul University
İstanbul Üniversitesi

Journal name: Journal of Language, Literature and Culture Studies   **Copyright Agreement Form**
Dergi Adı: Litera: Dil, Edebiyat ve Kültür Araştırmaları Dergisi   *Telif Hakkı Anlaşması Formu*

Responsible/Corresponding Author *Sorumlu Yazar*	
Title of Manuscript *Makalenin Başlığı*	
Acceptance date *Kabul Tarihi*	
List of authors *Yazarların Listesi*	

Sıra No	Name - Surname *Adı-Soyadı*	E-mail *E-Posta*	Signature *İmza*	Date *Tarih*
1				
2				
3				
4				
5				

Manuscript Type (Research Article, Review, etc.) *Makalenin türü (Araştırma makalesi, Derleme, v.b.)*	

Responsible/Corresponding Author:
Sorumlu Yazar:

University/company/institution	*Çalıştığı kurum*	
Address	*Posta adresi*	
E-mail	*E-posta*	
Phone; mobile phone	*Telefon no; GSM no*	

The author(s) agrees that:

The manuscript submitted is his/her/their own original work, and has not been plagiarized from any prior work,

all authors participated in the work in a substantive way, and are prepared to take public responsibility for the work,

all authors have seen and approved the manuscript as submitted,

the manuscript has not been published and is not being submitted or considered for publication elsewhere,

the text, illustrations, and any other materials included in the manuscript do not infringe upon any existing copyright or other rights of anyone.

ISTANBUL UNIVERSITY will publish the content under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International (CC BY-NC 4.0) license that gives permission to copy and redistribute the material in any medium or format other than commercial purposes as well as remix, transform and build upon the material by providing appropriate credit to the original work.

The Contributor(s) or, if applicable the Contributor's Employer, retain(s) all proprietary rights in addition to copyright, patent rights.

I/We indemnify ISTANBUL UNIVERSITY and the Editors of the Journals, and hold them harmless from any loss, expense or damage occasioned by a claim or suit by a third party for copyright infringement, or any suit arising out of any breach of the foregoing warranties as a result of publication of my/our article. I/We also warrant that the article contains no libelous or unlawful statements, and does not contain material or instructions that might cause harm or injury.

This Copyright Agreement Form must be signed/ratified by all authors. Separate copies of the form (completed in full) may be submitted by authors located at different institutions; however, all signatures must be original and authenticated.

Yazar(lar) aşağıdaki hususları kabul eder

Sunulan makalenin yazar(lar)ın orijinal çalışması olduğunu ve intihal yapmadıklarını,

Tüm yazarların bu çalışmaya asli olarak katılmış olduklarını ve bu çalışma için her türlü sorumluluğu aldıklarını,

Tüm yazarların sunulan makalenin son halini gördüklerini ve onayladıklarını,

Makalenin başka bir yerde basılmadığını veya basılmak için sunulmadığını,

Makalede bulunan metnin, şekillerin ve dokümanların diğer şahıslara ait olan Telif Haklarını ihlal etmediğini kabul ve taahhüt ederler.

İSTANBUL ÜNİVERSİTESİ'nin bu fikri eseri, Creative Commons Atıf-GayrıTicari 4.0 Uluslararası (CC BY-NC 4.0) lisansı ile yayınlamasına izin verirler.

Creative Commons Atıf-GayrıTicari 4.0 Uluslararası (CC BY-NC 4.0) lisansı, eserin ticari kullanım dışında her boyut ve formatta paylaşılmasına, kopyalanmasına, çoğaltılmasına ve orijinal esere uygun şekilde atıfta bulunmak kaydıyla yeniden düzenleme, dönüştürme ve eserin üzerine inşa etme dâhil adapte edilmesine izin verir.

Yazar(lar)ın veya varsa yazar(lar)ın işvereninin telif dâhil patent hakları, fikri mülkiyet hakları saklıdır.

Ben/Biz, telif hakkı ihlali nedeniyle üçüncü şahıslarca vuku bulacak hak talebi veya açılacak davalarda İSTANBUL ÜNİVERSİTESİ ve Dergi Editörlerinin hiçbir sorumluluğunun olmadığını, tüm sorumluluğun yazarlara ait olduğunu taahhüt ederim/ederiz.

Ayrıca Ben/Biz makalede hiçbir suç unsuru veya kanuna aykırı ifade bulunmadığını, araştırma yapılırken kanuna aykırı herhangi bir malzeme ve yöntem kullanılmadığını taahhüt ederim/ederiz.

Bu Telif Hakkı Anlaşması Formu tüm yazarlar tarafından imzalanmalıdır/onaylanmalıdır. Form farklı kurumlarda bulunan yazarlar tarafından ayrı kopyalar halinde doldurularak sunulabilir. Ancak, tüm imzaların orijinal veya kanıtlanabilir şekilde onaylı olması gerekir.

Responsible/Corresponding Author; *Sorumlu Yazar;*	Signature / *İmza*	Date / *Tarih*
		…….../…….../……………