Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies

AIMS AND SCOPE

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies is a scientific, open access, online-only periodical published in accordance with independent, unbiased, and double-blinded peer-review principles. The journal is official publication of Ataturk University School of Foreign Languages and published annually in September. The publication languages of the journal are Turkish (and other Turkic language), English and French. The journal publishes original articles, reviews, care reports, and letters to the editors that are prepared in accordance with ethical guidelines. The aim of Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies is to publish peer-reviewed, open-access research that focuses on narrative, language studies, and related interdisciplinary fields. The journal encourages a broad spectrum of scholarly work, encompassing topics like narrative techniques, linguistic analyses, and the intersection of literature and culture. Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies is currently indexed **in MLA.** The editorial and publication processes of the journal are shaped in accordance with the guidelines of the Council of Science Editors (CSE) Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), European Association of Science Editors (EASE) and National Information Standards Organization (NISO). The journal is in conformity with the Principles of Transparency and Best Practice in Scholarly Publishing (doaj.org/bestpractice).

Disclaimer

Statements or opinions expressed in the manuscripts published in the journal reflect the views of the author(s) and not the opinions of the editors, editorial board, and/or publisher; the editors, editorial board, and publisher disclaim any responsibility or liability for such materials.

Open Access Statement

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies is an open access publication, and the journal's publication model is based on Budapest Access Initiative (BOAI) declaration. All published content is available online, free of charge at https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/melius. The journal's content is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial (CC BY-NC) 4.0 International License which permits third parties to share and adapt the content for non-commercial purposes by giving the appropriate credit to the original work.

You can find the current version of the Instructions to Authors at https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/melius/writing-rules

AMAÇ VE KAPSAM

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies*; bağımsız, tarafsız ve çift-kör hakem değerlendirme ilkelerine bağlı yayın yapan, Atatürk Üniversitesi Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulu'nun açık erişimli bilimsel elektronik yayın organıdır. Dergi, Eylül ayında olmak üzere yılda bir sayı olarak yayınlanmaktadır. Derginin yayın dilleri Türkçe (ve diğer Türk dilleri), İngilizce ve Fransızcadır. Dergi, etik kurallara uygun olarak hazırlanmış özgün makaleler, derlemeler, bakım raporları ve editörlere mektuplar yayınlar. Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies'in amacı anlatı, dil çalışmaları ve ilgili disiplinlerarası alanlara odaklanan hakemli, açık erişimli araştırmaları yayınlamaktır. Dergi, anlatım teknikleri, dilbilimsel analizler ve edebiyat ile kültürün kesişimi gibi konuları kapsayan geniş bir yelpazedeki bilimsel çalışmaları teşvik etmektedir. Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies* **MLA'de** *indekslenen bir dergidir. Derginin editöryel ve yayın süreçleri Council of Science Editors (CSE), Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE), European Association of Science Editors (EASE) ve National Information Standards Organization (NISO) kılavuzlarına uygun olarak biçimlendirilmiştir.* Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies *dergisinin editöryel ve yayın süreçleri, Akademik Yayıncılıkta Şeffaflık ve En İyi Uygulama (doaj.org/bestpractice) ilkelerine uygun olarak yürütülmektedir.*

Sorumluluk Reddi

Dergide yayınlanan yazılarda ifade edilen ifadeler veya görüşler, editörlerin, yayın kurulunun ve/veya yayıncının görüşlerini değil, yazar(lar)ın görüşlerini yansıtır; editörler, yayın kurulu ve yayıncı bu tür materyaller için herhangi bir sorumluluk veya yükümlülük kabul etmemektedir.

Açık Erişim Bildirimi

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies dergisinin *yayınlanma modeli Budapeşte Açık Erişim Girişimi (BOAI) bildirgesine dayanan açık erişimli bilimsel bir dergidir. Derginin arşivine https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/melius adresinden ücretsiz olarak erişilebilir.* Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies *içeriği, Creative Commons Alıntı-Gayri Ticari (CC BYNC) 4.0 Uluslararası Lisansı ile yayınlanmaktadır.*

Yazarlara Bilgi'nin güncel versiyonuna https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/melius/writing-rules adresinden ulaşabilirsiniz.

Contact (Editor in Chief) / İletişim (Baş Editör)

Alper TULGAR
Atatürk University, School of Foreign Languages, Erzurum, Türkiye
Atatürk Üniversitesi, Yabancı Diller Yüksekokulu, Erzurum, Türkiye
✉ alper.tulgar@atauni.edu.tr
✉ melius@atauni.edu.tr
🌐 https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/melius
☎ +90 442 231 46 75

Contact (Publisher) / İletişim (Yayıncı)

Atatürk University
Atatürk University, Erzurum, Türkiye
Atatürk Üniversitesi Rektörlüğü 25240 Erzurum, Türkiye
✉ ataunijournals@atauni.edu.tr
🌐 https://bilimseldergiler.atauni.edu.tr
☎ +90 442 231 15 16

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies

CONTENTS / İÇİNDEKİLER

Research Articles / Araştırma Makaleleri

Melius: Journal of Narrative and Language Studies

La Compensation Identitaire Culturelle : Le Cas des Tatars de Tachkent dans l'Ouzbékistan Post-Soviétique

Kültürel Kimlik Telafisi: Post-Sovyet Özbekistan'da Taşkent Tatarları Örneği

Mizuki Sakurama-Nakamura [1] iD
[1] Chuo Gakuin University, Faculty of Liberal Arts, Chiba Prefecture, Japan

ABSTRACT

Cette étude ethnographique examine le maintien et la transformation de l'identité tatare à Tachkent, Ouzbékistan, dans le contexte post-soviétique. Malgré la perte progressive de la langue tatare, la communauté préserve une identité ethnique distincte à travers divers marqueurs culturels. Le concept de « compensation identitaire culturelle » est proposé pour expliquer comment, face à la perte d'un marqueur identitaire majeur, d'autres pratiques culturelles sont investies d'une signification accrue. La cuisine traditionnelle, les noms tatars et la réinvention de célébrations comme le Sabantuy jouent un rôle crucial dans ce processus. L'étude révèle une flexibilité identitaire caractérisée par la capacité à naviguer entre différentes identités culturelles, illustrant une forme de « cosmopolitisme vernaculaire » adapté au contexte post-soviétique. La réinvention des traditions est analysée comme une adaptation créative plutôt qu'une fabrication artificielle, remettant en question la dichotomie entre tradition authentique et inventée. Ces observations soulignent la nécessité de dépasser les modèles essentialistes de l'identité ethnique et d'adopter une approche plus dynamique et contextuelle. L'étude contribue à la compréhension des dynamiques identitaires dans les sociétés post-soviétiques et, plus largement, dans les contextes de migration et de minorités ethniques. Elle met en évidence la résilience et l'adaptabilité des identités minoritaires face aux changements sociopolitiques.

Keywords: Tatars, Ouzbékistan, identité ethnique, minorité, post-soviétique

ÖZ

Budunbilmsel bu çalışma, Sovyet sonrası bağlamda Özbekistan'ın Taşkent şehrinde Tatar kimliğinin korunmasını ve dönüşümünü incelemektedir. Tatar dilinin giderek kaybedilmesine rağmen, topluluk çeşitli kültürel göstergeler aracılığıyla belirgin bir etnik kimliği korumaktadır. Önemli bir kimlik belirtecinin kaybı karşısında diğer kültürel uygulamaların artan bir öneme sahip olduğunu açıklamak için "kültürel kimlik telafisi" kavramı önerilmektedir. Geleneksel mutfak, Tatar isimleri ve Sabantuy gibi kutlamaların yeniden yorumlanması bu süreçte çok önemli bir rol oynamaktadır. Çalışma, farklı kültürel kimlikler arasında geçiş yapabilme yeteneğiyle karakterize edilen bir kimlik esnekliğini ortaya koymakta ve Sovyet sonrası bağlama uyarlanmış bir "yerel kozmopolitizm" biçimini göstermektedir. Geleneklerin yeniden yorumlanması, yapay bir üretimden ziyade yaratıcı bir uyarlama olarak çözümlenen ve "özgün" ile "icat edilmiş" gelenek arasındaki ikiliği sorgulamaktadır. Bu gözlemler, etnik kimliğin özcü modellerinin ötesine geçme ve daha devimsel ve bağlamsal bir yaklaşım benimseme ihtiyacını vurgulamaktadır. Çalışma, Sovyet sonrası toplumlardaki ve daha geniş anlamda göç ve etnik azınlık bağlamlarındaki kimlik dinamiklerinin anlaşılmasına katkıda bulunmayı amaçlamaktadır. Ayrıca, azınlık kimliklerinin sosyo-politik değişimler karşısındaki direncini ve uyarlanabilirliğini ortaya koymaktadır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Tatarlar, Özbekistan, etnik kimlik, azınlık, Sovyet sonrası

Introduction

L'effondrement de l'Union soviétique en 1991 a profondément transformé le paysage ethnique de l'Asie centrale, entraînant des mouvements de population massifs et une redéfinition des identités nationales et des appartenances ethniques. Dans ce contexte, l'Ouzbékistan, pays multiethnique, a connu des changements significatifs dans sa composition démographique et ses dynamiques interethniques. Parmi les nombreuses minorités présentes sur le territoire de l'Ouzbékistan, les Tatars occupent une place particulière, à la fois par leur histoire ancienne dans la région et par leur statut de minorité dispersée sans territoire titulaire en Asie centrale.

La présence tatare en Asie centrale, et particulièrement en Ouzbékistan, remonte bien avant l'époque soviétique. Depuis le XVIIIe siècle, des marchands et des intellectuels tatars jouaient un rôle important dans les échanges commerciaux et culturels le long de la Route de la Soie (Frank, 2012). Au XIXe siècle, avec l'expansion de l'Empire russe en Asie centrale, de nombreux Tatars sont venus en tant qu'intermédiaires entre les autorités russes et les populations locales, contribuant ainsi à la diffusion de l'islam réformiste et de l'éducation moderne dans la région (Khalid, 1998). Cette longue histoire de présence et d'influence tatare en Ouzbékistan a jeté les bases d'une communauté bien établie et respectée, dont l'identité allait connaître une profonde transformation par l'expérience soviétique et post-soviétique.

D'après les données du recensement soviétique de 1989, environ 468 000 Tatars vivaient en Ouzbékistan, constituant la quatrième plus grande communauté ethnique du pays après les Ouzbeks, les Russes et les Tadjiks (Gorenburg, 2006). Cependant, les années 1990 ont vu un exode massif des populations non ouzbèkes, y compris une part importante de la communauté tatare. Malgré cette diminution démographique, une communauté tatare significative persiste en Ouzbékistan, particulièrement dans la capitale, Tachkent.

Cette étude a pour objectif d'analyser les dynamiques de l'identité ethnique des Tatars de Tachkent dans le contexte post-soviétique. Plus spécifiquement, nous cherchons à comprendre comment cette communauté maintient et négocie son identité tatare dans un environnement où la langue tatare n'est plus couramment parlée. Quels sont les marqueurs culturels et sociaux qui permettent aux Tatars de Tachkent de se distinguer des autres groupes ethniques, notamment des Ouzbeks et des Russes ? Comment l'identité tatare s'articule-t-elle avec l'identité nationale ouzbèke et l'héritage soviétique ?

En nous appuyant sur une approche ethnographique et des entretiens approfondis, nous examinerons les stratégies identitaires déployées par les Tatars de Tachkent, en accordant une attention particulière au rôle de la mémoire collective, des pratiques culturelles et des réseaux sociaux dans le maintien de la « tatarité » (sentiment d'appartenance tatare, en anglais « tatarness ») en l'absence d'une utilisation quotidienne de la langue tatare.

Cette étude s'inscrit dans le cadre plus large des recherches sur les minorités ethniques en Asie centrale post-soviétique et aspire à contribuer à une meilleure compréhension des dynamiques de construction et de préservation de l'identité ethnique dans des contextes de changement social et politique rapide.

Cadre théorique et revue de littérature

L'étude de l'identité ethnique des Tatars de Tachkent s'appuie sur un cadre théorique qui conjugue aux théories constructivistes de l'ethnicité et aux approches de l'identité sociale.

Le concept d'ethnicité, tel que développé par Barth (1969), met l'accent sur les frontières entre les groupes plutôt que sur le contenu culturel de ces groupes. Selon cette perspective, l'identité ethnique est construite et maintenue à travers les interactions sociales et les processus de différenciation. Dans le contexte post-soviétique, Brubaker (1996) a souligné l'importance de considérer l'ethnicité comme une catégorie pratique, une forme d'action collective plutôt qu'une entité fixe.

La théorie de l'identité sociale, développée par Tajfel et Turner (1979), offre un cadre complémentaire pour comprendre comment les individus construisent leur identité en relation avec leur appartenance à des groupes sociaux. Cette approche est particulièrement pertinente pour examiner comment les Tatars de Tachkent maintiennent une identité distincte dans un contexte où ils sont numériquement minoritaires.

Les études sur les minorités ethniques en Asie centrale post-soviétique ont mis en lumière les défis auxquels ces communautés sont confrontées dans la construction et le maintien de leur identité. Laitin (1998) a examiné les stratégies linguistiques et identitaires des populations russophones dans les anciennes républiques soviétiques, soulignant la complexité des choix identitaires dans un

contexte de changement politique.

Dans le cas spécifique de l'Ouzbékistan, plusieurs chercheurs ont étudié les dynamiques identitaires des minorités ethniques. Megoran (2017) a analysé les politiques d'identité nationale en Ouzbékistan et leur impact sur les relations interethniques. Laruelle (2007) a examiné la situation des Russes en Asie centrale, y compris en Ouzbékistan, mettant en évidence les stratégies d'adaptation et de négociation identitaire de cette communauté.

Cependant, les études spécifiquement consacrées à la communauté tatare d'Ouzbékistan restent limitées. Les travaux de Yanova (2010) sur l'histoire des Tatars en Ouzbékistan constituent une exception notable, mais ils se concentrent principalement sur la période soviétique. Des recherches plus récentes, telles que celles de Khalilova (2018) sur les activités culturelles des Tatars de Tachkent et de Gabdrakhmanova et Sagdieva (2019) sur la formation de l'identité des Tatars de Tachkent, ont apporté de nouvelles perspectives.

Khalilova (2018) a décrit en détail les activités du centre culturel tatar de Tachkent depuis les années 1990, soulignant son importance dans le maintien de la langue et de la culture. Gabdrakhmanova et Sagdieva (2019), quant à eux, ont démontré que le processus de formation de l'identité diffère selon les générations parmi les Tatars de Tachkent.

Bien que ces études aient mis en lumière les efforts et les défis liés au maintien de l'identité tatare dans l'Ouzbékistan contemporain, elles n'ont pas suffisamment exploré les processus de négociation identitaire dans la vie quotidienne, ni les interactions avec d'autres groupes ethniques, notamment les Ouzbeks. Notre étude se distingue des recherches précédentes en se concentrant sur ces aspects et en proposant une analyse plus complète.

Notre étude vise à combler cette lacune en examinant comment les Tatars de Tachkent négocient leur identité ethnique dans le contexte post-soviétique ouzbek. Nous nous appuierons sur ces cadres théoriques pour analyser les stratégies identitaires déployées par cette communauté, en portant une attention particulière aux marqueurs culturels et sociaux qui permettent le maintien d'une identité tatare distincte en l'absence d'une utilisation quotidienne de la langue tatare.

Méthodologie

Cette recherche s'appuie sur une approche ethnographique, combinant observation participante et entretiens informels, menée de manière intermittente entre 2013 et 2024 au sein de la communauté tatare de Tachkent. Ces recherches ont été approuvées par le comité d'éthique de la recherche de l'Université Chuo Gakuin (numéro d'approbation R6-002, date d'approbation le 23 mai 2024).

La position unique du chercheur, d'origine d'Extrême-Orient avec une grand-mère tatare et une maîtrise du tatar, du russe et du japonais, a offert une perspective à la fois interne et externe sur la communauté étudiée.

Ma position d'insider-outsider (Kanuha, 2000) a présenté à la fois des avantages et des défis pour cette recherche. En tant que descendant de Tatars et locuteur du tatar, j'ai pu établir rapidement un rapport de confiance avec les participants, accédant à des informations et des nuances culturelles qui pourraient échapper à un chercheur extérieur. Cependant, cette proximité a également nécessité une vigilance constante pour éviter les biais potentiels et maintenir une distance analytique.

Par exemple, lors d'une discussion sur la perte de la langue tatare, j'ai dû consciemment mettre de côté mes propres sentiments sur la question pour permettre aux participants d'exprimer librement leurs perspectives, qui différaient parfois des miennes. Cette position m'a également permis de naviguer entre les différentes générations de la communauté tatare, comprenant à la fois les références culturelles soviétiques des plus âgés et les influences globalisées des plus jeunes.

Néanmoins, mon statut d'universitaire formé au Japon m'a parfois positionné comme un outsider, ce qui a encouragé les participants à expliciter certains aspects de leur culture qu'ils auraient pu considérer comme évidents pour un insider complet.

L'observation participante a été réalisée lors d'événements communautaires tatars, tels que les célébrations du Sabantuy, les mariages et les rassemblements informels. Cette immersion a permis de saisir les nuances des interactions sociales et des pratiques culturelles qui contribuent au maintien de l'identité tatare à Tachkent.

L'analyse des données s'est inspirée de l'approche de la théorie ancrée (Glaser et Strauss, 1967), permettant l'émergence de thèmes et de catégories à partir des données recueillies. Une attention particulière a été portée aux marqueurs identitaires mentionnés par les participants

et aux stratégies de maintien de l'identité tatare en l'absence d'une utilisation quotidienne de la langue.

Résultats

L'analyse des données recueillies a permis d'identifier plusieurs thèmes clés relatifs à l'identité tatare à Tachkent : les marqueurs culturels, le rôle de la mémoire collective, et les stratégies de négociation identitaire dans le contexte ouzbek post-soviétique.

Marqueurs culturels de l'identité tatare

Malgré la perte progressive de la langue tatare comme moyen de communication quotidien, plusieurs marqueurs culturels restent essentiels dans la définition de l'identité tatare à Tachkent.

Cuisine tatare

La cuisine traditionnelle tatare émerge comme un élément central de l'identité. Guliya (née en 1958, entretien du 3 mars 2023) exprime :

« Même si nous ne parlons plus tatar tous les jours, nous gardons notre cuisine. Chak-chak, ochpochmak, gubadiya - ces plats sont notre façon de rester tatars. Quand nous les préparons, c'est comme si nous parlions notre langue avec nos mains. »

Cette métaphore de la « langue des mains » illustre comment la pratique culinaire devient un vecteur de transmission culturelle en l'absence de la langue. Lors d'une observation participante pendant la préparation d'un repas familial le 9 octobre 2013, j'ai pu constater comment une grand-mère (née en 1950) enseignait à sa petite-fille (née en 2006) les techniques de préparation du chak-chak, un dessert traditionnel tatar. Les gestes précis, les explications sur la consistance de la pâte, tout cela constituait un véritable langage non verbal de transmission culturelle.

Le chak-chak, un dessert fait de pâte frite et de miel, revêt une importance symbolique particulière. Comme l'explique Aliya (née en 1970, entretien du 5 mars 2018) :

« Le chak-chak… c'est notre histoire, notre identité. Quand je le prépare avec mes petits-enfants, je leur raconte comment ma grand-mère me l'a appris. C'est une façon de transmettre notre culture, même si nous ne parlons plus tatar à la maison. »

De même, l'ochpochmak, un chausson triangulaire farci de viande et de pommes de terre, est décrit par plusieurs

participants comme un « emblème culinaire » de leur identité tatare. La préparation et la consommation de ces plats deviennent des actes de réaffirmation identitaire, particulièrement importants dans un contexte où la langue n'est plus le vecteur principal de la culture.

Ces pratiques culinaires s'inscrivent dans ce que Sutton (2001) appelle la « mémoire incarnée » (embodied remembering), où les gestes, les odeurs et les goûts deviennent des véhicules de transmission culturelle. Dans le cas des Tatars de Tachkent, la cuisine devient un langage à part entière, capable de communiquer et de maintenir une identité distincte en l'absence d'une pratique linguistique quotidienne.

Noms et prénoms tatars

L'utilisation des prénoms et noms de famille tatars joue un rôle crucial dans le maintien de l'identité ethnique à Tachkent. Cette pratique s'inscrit dans ce que Bourdieu (1991) appelle le « capital symbolique » (symbolic capital), où le nom devient un marqueur de distinction culturelle et sociale. Malika (née en 1969, entretien du 2 mars 2024) explique :

« Quand j'ai nommé ma fille Alsu en 1990, c'était un acte conscient. Je voulais qu'elle porte un nom tatar. C'était ma façon de lui donner des racines. »

Ce témoignage illustre comment le choix du prénom devient un acte de transmission culturelle, particulièrement significatif dans les années suivant l'indépendance de l'Ouzbékistan. Des prénoms comme Ildar, Ilgiz, Aydar, Rishat pour les garçons, et Alsu, Aygul, Lyaysan, Guzel pour les filles, sont devenus plus fréquents. Robert Akhmetov (né en 1980, pseudonyme, entretien du 10 mars 2024), père de deux enfants, partage :

« Mon nom de famille, Akhmetov, pourrait être ouzbek ou tatar. Mais j'ai choisi des prénoms clairement tatars pour mes enfants : Ilgiz et Lyaysan. C'est une façon de marquer notre différence tout en restant intégrés. »

Cette stratégie de « marquage subtil » par le choix des prénoms permet aux Tatars de maintenir une distinction culturelle tout en évitant une marginalisation potentielle dans la société ouzbèke.

Cependant, cette pratique n'est pas uniforme au sein de la communauté. Certaines familles, particulièrement celles issues de mariages mixtes, optent pour des prénoms plus neutres ou internationaux. Dina (née en 1984, entretien du 15 mars 2024), mariée à un Ouzbek, explique

:

« Nous avons choisi Kamila pour notre fille. C'est un prénom qui fonctionne bien en tatar, en ouzbek et en russe. Nous voulions qu'elle puisse naviguer facilement entre ces différentes identités. »

Les noms de famille, quant à eux, jouent un rôle crucial dans la transmission de l'identité tatare. Les suffixes caractéristiques comme « -tdinov », « -ullin », ou « -dzhanov » pour les hommes, et « -tdinova », « -ullina », ou « -dzhanova » pour les femmes, sont des marqueurs clairs de l'origine tatare. Cependant, certaines familles ont choisi d'adapter leurs noms au contexte ouzbek. Almaz Karimov (né en 1992, pseudonyme, entretien du 15 janvier 2014) raconte :

« Mon grand-père s'appelait Karimullin. Dans les années 60, il a changé notre nom en Karimov pour se rapprocher de la forme ouzbèke. C'était une façon de s'intégrer tout en gardant notre racine tatare. »

Cette adaptation des noms de famille illustre ce phénomène où les individus ajustent stratégiquement leurs marqueurs identitaires en fonction du contexte administratif et social.

Il est intéressant de noter que certains jeunes Tatars choisissent aujourd'hui de revenir aux formes originales de leurs noms de famille. Ainsi, Danis Nasibullin (né en 1989, pseudonyme, entretien du 8 mars 2023) a récemment changé son nom de « Nasibov » à « Nasibullin », expliquant :

« C'est ma façon de revendiquer pleinement mon héritage tatar. Dans l'Ouzbékistan d'aujourd'hui, je sens que c'est possible et même valorisé. »

Ces choix onomastiques reflètent les processus complexes de négociation identitaire des Tatars de Tachkent, illustrant comment les noms et prénoms deviennent des sites de résistance, d'adaptation et d'affirmation culturelle dans un contexte post-soviétique en évolution.

En conclusion, le choix des prénoms et l'utilisation des noms de famille tatars à Tachkent représentent une forme de « politique du quotidien » (Pruvost, 2021), où l'affirmation identitaire se joue dans les décisions les plus intimes et personnelles. Cette pratique illustre la capacité des Tatars à maintenir et à réinventer leur identité ethnique dans un contexte post-soviétique complexe.

Rôle de la mémoire collective

La mémoire collective, notamment liée à l'histoire de la migration tatare en Ouzbékistan, joue un rôle crucial dans le maintien de l'identité. Les récits familiaux de déplacement et d'adaptation sont fréquemment évoqués comme source de fierté et de résilience. Damir (né en 1951, entretien du 15 janvier 2014) raconte :

« Mon grand-père est venu ici dans les années 1920, fuyant la famine. Il a travaillé dur, a aidé à construire Tachkent. Nous sommes tatars, mais aussi une part de cette terre. Notre histoire est ici maintenant. »

Ces narrations illustrent ce que Halbwachs (1950) appelle les « cadres sociaux de la mémoire », où l'histoire familiale s'entrelace avec l'histoire nationale pour créer un sentiment d'appartenance complexe.

Lors d'une réunion familiale à laquelle j'ai assisté le 16 mars 2018, j'ai observé comment les anciens racontaient aux plus jeunes l'histoire de leur installation à Tachkent. Les photos jaunies étaient sorties, les anecdotes partagées, créant un véritable rituel de transmission de la mémoire collective. Cette pratique semblait renforcer le sentiment d'appartenance à la communauté tatare tout en soulignant leur enracinement dans l'histoire de l'Ouzbékistan.

Négociation identitaire dans le contexte ouzbek

L'identité tatare à Tachkent se négocie constamment par rapport aux identités ouzbèke et russe dominantes. Cette négociation se manifeste de diverses manières. Larisa (née en 1984, entretien du 13 mars 2018) témoigne :

« À la maison, nous sommes tatars. Au travail, je parle russe. Dans la rue, j'utilise l'ouzbek. C'est comme si je changeais de costume plusieurs fois par jour. »

Certains participants expriment une anxiété quant à la « dilution » de leur identité tatare, tandis que d'autres voient cette multiplicité comme une force. Lors d'un entretien le 16 mars 2022, Rinat (né en 1995), un jeune entrepreneur, a exprimé :

« Notre capacité à naviguer entre différentes cultures est un atout. Cela nous rend plus adaptables, plus ouverts d'esprit. C'est un avantage dans le monde d'aujourd'hui. »

Les relations avec la majorité ouzbèke et la minorité russe sont généralement décrites comme positives, bien que complexes. De nombreux Tatars se positionnent comme un « pont » entre ces communautés, tirant parti de

leur multilinguisme et de leur familiarité avec différentes cultures. Azat (né en 2000, entretien du 15 mars 2023) explique :

« Nous, les Tatars, nous comprenons à la fois la mentalité ouzbèke et russe. Cela nous permet de naviguer facilement entre ces communautés. »

Cependant, certains participants ont également évoqué des tensions, notamment concernant les opportunités professionnelles. Plusieurs ont mentionné une pression croissante pour maîtriser l'ouzbek, perçue comme nécessaire pour l'avancement professionnel.

Réinvention des traditions

Face à la perte de certains marqueurs traditionnels, notamment la langue, la communauté tatare de Tachkent s'engage dans un processus de réinvention des traditions (Hobsbawm et Ranger, 1983). Le Sabantuy, fête traditionnelle tatare, est réinvesti d'une signification nouvelle. Kamil (né en 1973, entretien du 20 juillet 2013), organisateur communautaire, explique :

« Avant, le Sabantuy était une fête agricole. Maintenant, c'est notre façon de dire "nous sommes là". Nous invitons nos amis ouzbeks, russes. C'est tatar, mais c'est aussi un pont entre les cultures. »

Cette réinvention illustre comment les pratiques culturelles sont adaptées pour répondre aux besoins d'affirmation identitaire dans un contexte minoritaire, tout en servant de plateforme pour la négociation des relations interethniques.

Lors de ma participation à un Sabantuy à Tachkent le 9 juin 2013, j'ai observé comment cet événement, autrefois centré sur les traditions agricoles tatares, s'était transformé en une célébration multiculturelle. Des stands présentaient non seulement la cuisine tatare, mais aussi des plats ouzbeks et russes. Les compétitions traditionnelles tatares côtoyaient des performances de danses ouzbèkes et de chansons russes. Cette évolution reflète la stratégie d'intégration adoptée par la communauté tatare, qui cherche à maintenir son identité distincte tout en s'inscrivant dans le paysage multiculturel de l'Ouzbékistan contemporain.

L'analyse de ces résultats révèle une dynamique complexe où l'identité tatare à Tachkent se maintient à travers une combinaison de préservation sélective de marqueurs culturels, de mobilisation de la mémoire collective, et d'adaptation créative aux réalités du contexte

post-soviétique ouzbek. Cette identité apparaît comme flexible et résiliente, capable de se réinventer tout en maintenant un sentiment de continuité avec le passé.

Discussion

Les résultats de cette étude mettent en lumière la complexité et la flexibilité de l'identité tatare dans le contexte post-soviétique de Tachkent. Ils nous permettent d'approfondir notre compréhension des processus de maintien et de transformation de l'identité ethnique dans des situations de minorité.

L'identité sans langue : au-delà du paradigme linguistique

L'un des aspects les plus frappants de cette étude est la persistance d'une forte identité tatare malgré la perte progressive de la langue tatare comme moyen de communication quotidien. Ce phénomène remet en question l'idée largement répandue selon laquelle la langue est le pilier central de l'identité ethnique. Dans le cas des Tatars de Tachkent, nous observons ce que nous pourrions appeler une « identité post-linguistique », où d'autres marqueurs culturels prennent le relais pour maintenir et exprimer l'ethnicité.

Cette observation nous amène à proposer un nouveau concept théorique : la « compensation identitaire culturelle ». Ce concept décrit le processus par lequel, face à la perte d'un marqueur identitaire majeur (ici, la langue), une communauté investit d'autres pratiques culturelles (cuisine, célébrations, noms) d'une signification identitaire accrue. Cette compensation n'est pas simplement un remplacement, mais une réorganisation dynamique du système identitaire, où les éléments restants sont chargés d'une valeur symbolique plus intense.

Ce phénomène fait écho aux travaux de Fishman (1991) sur la revitalisation des langues minoritaires, mais dans notre cas, il s'agit plutôt d'une revitalisation de l'identité elle-même à travers d'autres canaux culturels. Comme le souligne Smolicz (1981), certains éléments culturels peuvent devenir des « valeurs centrales » (core values) pour un groupe, jouant un rôle crucial dans le maintien de son identité. Dans le cas des Tatars de Tachkent, nous voyons comment la cuisine, les noms, et les célébrations traditionnelles réinventées ont pris ce rôle de « valeurs centrales ».

Négociation identitaire et « cosmopolitisme vernaculaire »

La flexibilité identitaire observée chez les Tatars de

Tachkent, illustrée par la métaphore du « changement de costume », fait écho au concept de « cosmopolitisme vernaculaire » (vernacular cosmopolitanism) proposé par Bhabha (1996). Ce concept décrit la capacité des individus à naviguer entre différentes identités culturelles tout en maintenant un ancrage local. Dans le cas des Tatars de Tachkent, nous observons une forme de cosmopolitisme adapté au contexte post-soviétique, où la multiplicité identitaire devient une ressource pour la survie et l'adaptation culturelle.

Cependant, contrairement à la vision souvent idéalisée du cosmopolitisme, nos résultats montrent que cette flexibilité identitaire est aussi source de tensions et d'anxiétés. Comme le souligne Larisa (née en 1984) : *« Parfois, je me demande si à force de changer de costume, je ne vais pas finir par oublier qui je suis vraiment. »* Cette observation rejoint les travaux de Brubaker et Cooper (2000) sur les limites du concept d'identité et la nécessité de considérer les processus d'identification plutôt que des identités fixes.

Le cas des Tatars de Tachkent illustre ce que Vertovec (2007) appelle la « super-diversité », où les identités se construisent à l'intersection de multiples appartenances et affiliations. Cette super-diversité se manifeste non seulement dans la capacité à naviguer entre différentes identités culturelles, mais aussi dans la façon dont ces identités s'entremêlent et se recombinent pour créer de nouvelles formes d'identification.

Réinvention des traditions et authenticité

La réinvention des traditions, comme observée dans la célébration du Sabantuy, s'inscrit dans le cadre théorique proposé par Hobsbawm et Ranger (1983). Cependant, notre étude montre que ce processus n'est pas simplement une fabrication artificielle de traditions, mais une adaptation créative qui puise dans un répertoire culturel existant pour répondre aux défis du présent.

Cette observation nous amène à nuancer la dichotomie souvent établie entre tradition « authentique » et tradition « inventée ». Dans le cas des Tatars de Tachkent, la réinvention des traditions apparaît comme un processus authentique d'adaptation culturelle, illustrant ce que Sahlins (1999) appelle « l'indigénisation de la modernité » (indigenized modernity).

Le Sabantuy réinventé à Tachkent peut être vu comme un « espace social transnational » (transnational social spaces) au sens de Faist (2000), où différentes identités et cultures se rencontrent et se négocient. Cette transformation d'une fête traditionnelle en un événement multiculturel illustre la capacité des Tatars à maintenir leur spécificité culturelle tout en s'adaptant et en s'intégrant dans leur nouveau contexte national.

Implications théoriques et pratiques

Ces résultats ont des implications importantes pour notre compréhension des dynamiques identitaires dans les sociétés post-soviétiques et, plus largement, dans les contextes de migration et de minorités ethniques. Ils soulignent la nécessité de dépasser les modèles essentialistes de l'identité ethnique et d'adopter une approche plus dynamique et contextuelle.

Sur le plan pratique, cette étude suggère que les politiques visant à soutenir les minorités ethniques devraient prendre en compte la diversité des marqueurs identitaires au-delà de la seule langue. Elle souligne également l'importance de créer des espaces permettant l'expression et la négociation des identités multiples dans les sociétés pluriethniques.

Conclusion

Cette étude sur l'identité tatare à Tachkent dans le contexte post-soviétique a mis en lumière les processus complexes de maintien et de transformation de l'identité ethnique dans une situation minoritaire. Nos résultats principaux peuvent être résumés comme suit :

1. L'émergence d'une « identité post-linguistique » où, malgré la perte progressive de la langue tatare, d'autres marqueurs culturels comme la cuisine, les noms, et les célébrations traditionnelles réinventées jouent un rôle crucial dans le maintien de l'identité tatare.

2. Le développement d'une flexibilité identitaire, caractérisée par la capacité à naviguer entre différentes identités culturelles (tatare, ouzbèke, russophone) selon les contextes, illustrant une forme de « cosmopolitisme vernaculaire » adapté au contexte post-soviétique.

3. Un processus de « compensation identitaire culturelle », où la perte de certains marqueurs identitaires traditionnels est compensée par l'investissement accru dans d'autres pratiques culturelles.

4. La réinvention créative des traditions, comme le

Sabantuy, qui devient un espace de négociation identitaire et de dialogue interculturel.

Ces observations nous ont conduits à proposer le concept de « compensation identitaire culturelle » comme cadre théorique pour comprendre comment les communautés minoritaires maintiennent leur identité face à la perte de marqueurs traditionnels majeurs.

Cette recherche contribue à la littérature sur les identités ethniques en contexte post-soviétique en soulignant la résilience et l'adaptabilité des identités minoritaires. Elle remet en question les approches essentialistes de l'identité ethnique et souligne l'importance de considérer les processus d'identification comme dynamiques et contextuels.

Cependant, notre étude présente certaines limites. Concentrée sur la communauté urbaine de Tachkent, elle ne peut prétendre représenter l'expérience de tous les Tatars d'Ouzbékistan. De plus, la nature qualitative de l'étude limite la généralisation des résultats.

Pour les recherches futures, il serait intéressant d'explorer comment ces dynamiques identitaires se manifestent dans d'autres communautés tatares de l'ex-URSS, permettant ainsi une analyse comparative. Il serait également pertinent d'examiner comment les nouvelles générations, nées après l'indépendance de l'Ouzbékistan, négocient leur identité tatare dans un contexte de mondialisation croissante.

En conclusion, cette étude souligne la complexité et la fluidité des identités ethniques dans le monde post-soviétique. Elle met en évidence la capacité des communautés minoritaires à réinventer leur identité tout en maintenant un sens de continuité culturelle. Ces observations peuvent informer non seulement notre compréhension théorique des processus identitaires, mais aussi les politiques visant à soutenir la diversité culturelle dans les sociétés multiethniques.

References

Barth, F. (1969). *Ethnic groups and boundaries: The social organization of culture difference*. Little, Brown and Company.

Bhabha, H. K. (1996). Unsatisfied: Notes on vernacular cosmopolitanism. In L. Garcia-Moreno & P. C. Pfeiffer (Eds.), *Text and nation: Cross-disciplinary essays on cultural and national identities* (pp. 191-207). Camden House.

Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of theory and research for the sociology of education* (pp. 241-258). Greenwood.

Brubaker, R. (1996). *Nationalism reframed: Nationhood and the national question in the new Europe*. Cambridge University Press.

Brubaker, R. (2002). Ethnicity without groups. *European Journal of Sociology, 43*(2), 163-189.

Brubaker, R., & Cooper, F. (2000). Beyond "identity". *Theory and Society, 29*(1), 1-47.

Faist, T. (2000). Transnationalization in international migration: Implications for the study of citizenship and culture. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 23*(2), 189-222.

Fishman, J. A. (1991). *Reversing language shift: Theoretical and empirical foundations of assistance to threatened languages*. Multilingual Matters.

Frank, A. J. (2012). *Bukhara and the Muslims of Russia: Sufism, education, and the paradox of Islamic prestige*. Brill.

Gabdrakhmanova, G. F., & Sagdiyeva, E. A. (2019). Tatary sovremennogo Tashkenta: etnicheskaya identichnost' v kontekste sotsial'nykh transformatsiy [Les Tatars de Tachkent moderne: L'identité ethnique dans le contexte de la transformation sociale]. *Etnograficheskoye obozreniye, 1*, 79-96.

Glaser, B. G., & Strauss, A. L. (1967). *The discovery of grounded theory: Strategies for qualitative research*. Aldine.

Gorenburg, D. (2006). Soviet nationalities policy and assimilation. In D. Arel & B. A. Ruble (Eds.), *Rebounding identities: The politics of identity in Russia and Ukraine* (pp. 273-303). Woodrow Wilson Center Press.

Halbwachs, M. (1950). *La mémoire collective*. Presses Universitaires de France.

Hobsbawm, E., & Ranger, T. (Eds.). (1983). *The invention of tradition*. Cambridge University Press.

Kanuha, V. K. (2000). "Being" native versus "going native": Conducting social work research as an insider. *Social Work, 45*(5), 439-447.

Khalid, A. (1998). *The politics of Muslim cultural reform: Jadidism in Central Asia*. University of California Press.

Khalilova, L. R. (2018). Natsional'no-kul'turnaya zhizn' tatar

g. Tashkenta v 1990–2017 gg. [La vie nationale-culturelle des Tatars à Tachkent en 1990-2017]. *Aktual'nyye problemy regionovedeniya i naukovedeniya*, 199-206.

Laitin, D. D. (1998). *Identity in formation: The Russian-speaking populations in the near abroad*. Cornell University Press.

Laruelle, M. (2007). The return of the Aryan myth: Tajikistan in search of a secularized national ideology. *Nationalities Papers, 35*(1), 51-70.

Megoran, N. (2017). *Nationalism in Central Asia: A biography of the Uzbekistan-Kyrgyzstan boundary*. University of Pittsburgh Press.

Pruvost, G. (2021). *Quotidien politique: Féminisme, écologie, subsistance*. La Découverte.

Sahlins, M. (1999). What is anthropological enlightenment? Some lessons of the twentieth century. *Annual Review of Anthropology, 28*(1), i-xxiii.

Smolicz, J. J. (1981). Core values and cultural identity. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 4*(1), 75-90.

Sutton, D. E. (2001). *Remembrance of repasts: An anthropology of food and memory*. Berg.

Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (1979). An integrative theory of intergroup conflict. In W. G. Austin & S. Worchel (Eds.), *The social psychology of intergroup relations* (pp. 33-47). Brooks/Cole.

Vertovec, S. (2007). Super-diversity and its implications. *Ethnic and Racial Studies, 30*(6), 1024-1054.

Yanova, D. R. (2010). Istoriya tatarskoy diaspory v Uzbekistane v XX veke [Histoire de la diaspora tatare en Ouzbékistan au 20e siècle]. *Molodyye vostokovedy stran Sodruzhestva Nezavisimykh Gosudarstv*, 193-206.

Yusupova, G. (2018). Cultural nationalism and everyday resistance in an illiberal nationalising state: Ethnic minority nationalism in Russia. *Nations and Nationalism, 24*(3), 624-647.

Feminist Utopian Imaginaries in "Herland"

Herland'de Feminist Ütopyaci İmgeler

Yasemin BOZ iD

¹ Haliç University, School of Foreign Languages, Istanbul, Türkiye

ABSTRACT

The intersection of speculative fiction and feminist discourse has produced a rich and varied corpus of work that questions established conventions and imagines alternative worlds. *Herland*, a novella by Charlotte Perkins Gilman, is considered a classic in this genre because it provides a sophisticated examination of gender issues via the prism of utopian fiction. This study attempts to shed light on how Gilman uses speculative fiction to envision a society free from patriarchal tyranny and gender inequality by examining the novella's themes, narrative structure, and characters. The study aims to show how speculative fiction may be a viable vehicle for communicating feminist ideas of social change by closely examining *Herland* in the context of feminist literature and utopian thought. It will also examine how the novella presents a society free from patriarchal forces in order to demonstrate Gilman's innovative strategy for questioning gender conventions and promoting equality, cooperation, and respect for all. The research intends to offer insight on the transformational possibilities of imagining new societal arrangements that promote inclusivity and empowerment by examining themes connected to gender dynamics and social structures in *Herland*. The study aims to present *Herland* as a trailblazing example of feminist utopian literature that still sparks debates about gender, power, and societal change.

Keywords: Feminist literature, utopian fiction, Herland, Charlotte Perkins Gilman, gender dynamics

ÖZ

Spekülatif kurgu ile feminist söylemin kesişmesi, yerleşik gelenekleri sorgulayan ve başka dünyalar hayal eden zengin ve çeşitli bir çalışma külliyatı üretmiştir. Charlotte Perkins Gilman'ın kısa romanı *Herland*, bu türde bir klasik olarak kabul edilir çünkü toplumsal cinsiyet meselelerinin ütopik kurgunun prizması yoluyla sofistike bir incelemesini sağlar. Bu çalışma, kısa romanın temalarını, anlatı yapısını ve karakterlerini inceleyerek Gilman'ın ataerkil tiranlıktan ve cinsiyet eşitsizliğinden uzak bir toplum tasavvur etmek için spekülatif kurguyu nasıl kullandığına ışık tutmaya çalışmaktadır. Bu çalışma *Herland*'i feminist edebiyat ve ütopik düşünce bağlamında yakından inceleyerek spekülatif kurgunun toplumsal değişime ilişkin feminist fikirlerin iletilmesinde nasıl uygun bir araç olabileceğini göstermeyi amaçlamaktadır. Bu çalışma, Gilman'ın toplumsal cinsiyet sözleşmelerini sorgulamaya ve eşitliği, iş birliğini ve herkese saygıyı teşvik etmeye yönelik yenilikçi stratejisini göstermek amacıyla kısa romanın ataerkil güçlerden arınmış bir toplumu nasıl sunduğunu inceleyecektir. Bu araştırma, *Herland*'deki cinsiyet dinamikleri ve sosyal yapılarla bağlantılı temaları inceleyerek kapsayıcılığı ve yetkilendirmeyi teşvik eden yeni toplumsal düzenlemeleri hayal etmenin dönüşümsel olasılıkları hakkında fikir sunmayı amaçlamaktadır. Bu araştırmanın amacı *Herland*'i, hâlâ cinsiyet, güç ve toplumsal değişime ilişkin tartışmalara yol açan feminist ütopik edebiyatın çığır açan bir örneği olarak sunmaktır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Feminist edebiyat, ütopik kurgu, Herland, Charlotte Perkins Gilman, toplumsal cinsiyet dinamikleri

Introduction

The merging of a feminist dispute with speculative fiction has created an abundant as well as different corpus of work that think of various other social facts as well as obscures approved conventions. Herland composed by Charlotte Perkins Gilman is thought about as traditional in this area given that it provides an informative examination of women's concerns through the prism of utopian fiction. By dissecting the novella's subjects, story framework, and personalities, one can explore exactly how Gilman utilizes speculative fiction to picture a culture lacking gender-based inequality and fatherlike injustice. This research tries to clarify how speculative fiction might be a reliable device for producing and expressing feminist suggestions of social improvement by putting the novella within the bigger structure of feminist literary works as well as utopian reasoning. It likewise will analyze Charlotte Perkins Gilman's Herland as an item of feminist utopian fiction that concerns gender standards coupled with offering an alternate culture without patriarchal impacts. Furthermore, it will certainly concentrate on styles connected to gender characteristics, social framework, and the opportunity of brand-new setups that stress equal rights, and partnership, with regard for each other. An American feminist author as well as social reformer Charlotte Perkins Gilman is popular for her advanced operation in doubting gender standards, and advertising women's legal rights. Gilman was a reputable author, speaker, as well as protestor who used her work to highlight social justice, gender oppression, and women's financial freedom. Gilman's individual experiences with monitoring of the oppression and restraints that women sustained in the late 19th as well as very early 20th centuries worked as the structure for her solid feminist sights. Gilman advertised social and financial adjustments that would certainly enable women to achieve equal rights and self-sufficiency to progress women's financial freedom and freedom. Her fiction additionally often reflected her feminist objectives as well as sights; for instance, Herland discovers concerns of psychological health and wellness, and gender discrimination through the opportunity of alternating social frameworks that position a greater top priority on women's firm and freedom. Her work remains to be an effective homage to the constant defense of social justice and gender-equal rights, as well as her feminist sights and the assistance of women's legal rights remain to motivate academics as well as protestors today. Herland is an item of feminist utopian fiction that envisions a globe run by women. The 1915 publication, which is embedded in a relaxed, separated neighborhood where women are the only residents analyzes concerns of gender, culture coupled with authority. Gilman inquires about traditional gender standards and offers a vision of a culture in which women are the only ones who produce and lead a calm egalitarian area with this imaginative story. Additionally, she supplies a helpful evaluation of gender characteristics as well as a social framework highlighting the opportunity for replacement systems that put a greater top priority on equal rights, collaboration, and regard for each other. The tale supplies an effective objection to the restrictions and oppressions produced by traditional gender standards by showing a globe without fatherlike pressures.

Methods

The method for analyzing Charlotte Perkins Gilman's "Herland" involves several basic steps. The historical and cultural context of the late 19th and early 20th centuries, emphasizing the social norms and gender roles of the period, are identified. Key themes such as gender equality, social justice, and critique of patriarchy, examining how these themes are interwoven throughout the narrative are identified and explored. The novel's plot structure and narrative style to understand how Gilman constructs her feminist ideas through speculative elements are analyzed. A detailed character analysis, focusing on Herland's women and their resistance to traditional gender roles are conducted. "Herland" is situated within the larger framework of feminist literature and utopian thought, and compared to other works in the genre to highlight its unique contributions. The critical reception of "Herland" over time, noting important debates surrounding its themes is explored. Finally, the findings, emphasizing the importance of "Herland" as a pioneering work of feminist utopian fiction and considering the enduring legacy of Gilman's ideas in modern feminist discourse are summarized.

As Zhou (2014) states, the word "feminist utopia" first occurred in the 1980s. The feminist utopian novels refer to those revealing feminist thoughts, reflecting the spirit of utopia and concerning the woman and human future, with the novel as the carrier." (p. 313). Herland's representation of an all-female world addresses gender equality rights and styles of female empowerment. It discovers utopian culture in addition to a social framework, using a photo of a pleasant world. The focus on being a mother as well as the mother's impulse as crucial parts of culture's worth and framework is a reccurring motif throughout the novella. The society of this excellent country positions a high worth on intellectual searches as well as long-lasting discovering education and learning, and expertise are similarly

substantial motifs of Herland. Standard concepts of gender and power connections are tested by the story's representation of gender functions in this kingdom of women. "The danger is quite the other way. They might hurt you. If, by any accident, you did harm any one of us, you would have to face a million mothers." (Gilman, 2008). By examining the duties and partnerships between women in this utopian country, Gilman offers a different picture of a culture where gender equality is achieved, while also being skeptical of paternal institutions. The lack of standard sex power structures as well as divides is an important element of gender functions in the utopian culture represented in the story. The girls of Herland can split works as well as commitments extra relatively many thanks to this sprucing up of gender functions. The women in this tale exist as independent, self-confident people who do not depend on men for their joy or enjoyment. Team effort, regard for each other, as well as uniformity specify the communication among women. The exam of gender duties in Herland culture overall stresses Gilman's cutting-edge examination of replacement social plans that position costs on women's freedom, equal rights, and cooperation. The women's personalities exist as solid, self-dependent with independent people with a good deal of firmness in their neighborhoods. The writer uses a picture of a culture in which women have the flexibility to pick their courses in life by representing the women of this utopic nation. Unlike in patriarchal nations where women's bodies are regularly objectified and suppressed by men, Herland's women are responsible for their reproductive procedures. Furthermore, the women's personalities are represented as involved participants in their neighborhood in all locations of life, consisting of works, institutions, and federal government. The girls display a solid feeling of sisterhood and unity using their call with each other, which provides the self-confidence to accept each other to attain their mutual purposes. According to Eskelinen, Lakkala, and Laakso (2020, p. 5), "Utopias assume an objective and coherent, and unavoidably dogmatic system of 'moral truths'." The author's feminist ideal, based on her depiction of a world in which women are appreciated for their individuality, resilience, and contributions to society, is emphasized through the evaluation of women's personalities and land. An additional crucial technique that Gilman tests patriarchy is by testing well-established power structures of power that cause concern for man authority and control. The absence of guys in the nation likewise functions as a review of the unsafe effects that patriarchal establishments carry on both genders. "The tradition of men as guardians and protectors had quite died out. These stalwart virgins had no men to fear and therefore no need of protection." (Gilman, 2008). The writer highlights the

opportunity of a much more equivalent not to mention simply social order where individuals are valued for their capabilities and personality instead of their gender by representing a globe lacking the influence of poisonous manliness and gender-based oppression. The publication tests developed power structures of power by highlighting the worth of compassion, area, along teamwork in producing a simpler culture. The women of the land placed the good of the team before the passions of the specific producing a feeling of unity with a connection that exceeds traditional concepts of a power structure as well as authority. The land offers a different photo of a culture where gender-equal rights, teamwork, as well as shared, regard are crucial merits so providing an efficacious objection to patriarchy as well as old power frameworks. Intersectional sights on gender, race, and course likewise have a huge influence on just how the culture operates in the novella. The depiction of a culture in which gender-equal rights have been achieved however various other kinds of injustice based upon race with course are not especially resolved is an additional essential part of intersectionality in the book. Despite being solid along independent in their gender functions, the women of the country are all revealed as white coming from a comparable socioeconomic course.

The novel's feminist perspective is a question addressed, as are the intersections of interests that shape the experiences of the protagonists, given the lack of racial and class diversity in the country. The absence of male figures generates a distinct vibrant in which gender standards are tested yet racial along with class-based power frameworks are not seriously analyzed. Due to their typical advantages of race as well as course, women can flourish in a patriarchal society, however their experiences are restricted. This intersectional point of view stresses just how essential it is to think about just how numerous injustices engage and affect individuals' daily experiences. Herland is a nation where women are completely equivalent regarding power as well as authority. Since there are no males in the culture, women are free to understand their possibilities without being limited by their gender. As an example, the girls have progressed levels in numerous techniques, including scientific research, education and learning, national politics, and workmanship. They challenge the traditional concept of manly superiority by presenting physical power. The locals cohabit in harmony combining their resources with abilities for the good of all. The girls have the utmost pertain to every various other's uniqueness as well as point of view. They utilize treatments for getting to an agreement not to mention having honest discussions to choose as a team making certain that

everyone's viewpoint is valued as well as listened to.

The nation positions a wonderful top priority on education and learning, as well as it has a considerable system in position to sustain its residents' growth of important reasoning capabilities as well as intellectual progression. From a very early age, kids get an education and learning in a range of subjects, consisting of scientific research, literary works, background and principles. Inquisitiveness, expedition, and continual understanding are very valued. As an example, the lead character, Vandyck Jennings, is surprised by the state-of-the-art training methods made use of in the country, where youngsters discover useful experiences as well as appealing courses that satisfy their special rate of interests as well as abilities. Herland stays consistent with the setting and takes part in lasting source monitoring as well as farming. The people decrease its environmental impact and put a high concern on eco-friendly conservation. The women produce sophisticated farming techniques that allow them to generate huge quantities of food while keeping the all-natural honesty of the land. They put a high worth on biodiversity preservation and utilize natural farming methods. As an example, the women have wisely developed a watering and dirt enrichment system that ensures their land's productivity without the demand for dangerous chemicals or undesirable farming strategies. The women in the nation have a profound recognition of sociological characteristics as well as human feelings along psychological knowledge is extremely respected. Taking care of problem resolution calls for empathy and a level of sensitivity, with a commitment to comprehending each other. As opposed to making use of pressure or hostility, conversation, as well as arbitration are made use of to fix differences. As an example, the women delicately stroll Vandyck Jennings with their customs as well as ideas when he initially faces social mistaken beliefs in the location motivating compassion and intercultural understanding.

Herland's women have accessibility to a detailed and advanced instructional system which has caused their high degree of education and learning. The tale likewise highlights just how vital education and learning are for motivating imagination, important reasoning as well as individual development. In this nation, education and learning concentrate on creating social obligation, compassion, and psychological knowledge along with understanding purchase. Here, a personalized education and learning method is developed with an experiential approach, taking into account each student's interests and difficulty level. It is motivated for youngsters to follow their interests and find out throughout their lives. The writer draws a contrast between Herland's modern-day instructional approaches as well as the extra conventional and limiting academic methods that are usual in his culture via the number of Vandyck Jennings, that he initially sees and after that joins Herland's instructional treatments. Herlandic interaction is personified by visibility. Herland sights interaction as a way of understanding sharing, partnership growth as well as problem resolution. Women can interact in a manner that is distinct from various other societies where social links are often made complex by power characteristics as well as gender characteristics. Women converse on an equal opportunity taking into consideration each other's point of view as well as collaborating to fix issues. Herland's social material focuses on neighborhood which offers its locals a sensation of assistance, identification and coming from. Herland's women stay in close-knit teams that are specified by teamwork, and assistance with typical suitables. In Gilman's picture of Herland, individual desires are considered versus the higher great developing a solid feeling of relationship as well as interdependence among the populace. In Herland's neighborhood, partnerships can foster mutual trust and compassion can ensure the absence of competition, problems, and power structures. The visitor can discover the transformational power of the area in forming people with structure and social uniformity with the personality of Vandyck Jennings that in the beginning makes it hard to value Herland's public principles. An idealized human being that is very closely knotted with the native environment is engagingly revealed via the picture of ecological durability coupled with consistency. Most importantly, Herland's acceptance of a healthy and balanced nature reflects a deep commitment to ecological sustainability. By committing to actions that prioritize preservation of environmental integrity, Herland homeowners protect the long-term well-being and vitality of the environment. For instance, the neighborhood participates in lasting farming using strategies that increase dirt fertility along cultivating biodiversity while staying clear of the reduction of natural deposits or damaging impacts on the environment. The concentration on lasting food manufacturing suggests an expertise in the connection between ecological wellness as well as human health which is a basic suggestion in the present ecological dispute. Additionally, Herland's approach to ecological durability integrates all elements of day-to-day living, not simply farming tasks. Society highlights small amounts as well as simpleness denying inefficient coupled with extreme consumerism for an extra lasting as well as all-round lifestyle. Individuals of Herland reveal excellent respect for the Earth's minimal sources as well as an understanding of their task to future generations by decreasing their ecological impact. Herland is a prime

instance of cohabiting with nature; it spreads out a profound sensation of regard with appreciation for the in as well as outs coupled with appeals to the native environment. Due to society's solid incorporation into the land individuals feel deeply affixed to the atmosphere, which highlights the requirement to guard the setting for both the advantage of the here and now as well as future generations along with for its inherent worth. This unified coexistence with nature highlights exactly how all life is adjoined as well as just how essential it is to cultivate reciprocatory communications with the non-human globe.

Three male scientists-- a jeologist, a sociologist and a biologist—carry out a study exploration in the story. The novella places the issue of abortion on the front of civil liberties and convenience. "Even if a woman has the right to abortion, she is still seen as a "baby killer" by society." (İkiz, 2008, p. 95). "As acceptance or denial of someone into a group, a culture, or a society depends on certain normative expectations and societal responsibilities, disclosing various intersecting factors enables one to become aware of the fabricated nature of gender." (Atasoy, 2020, p. 662). The story is about the approval, rejection, or monitoring of these three researchers regarding the nation they run into in the nation controlled by the matriarchal order. All the female personalities show manly attributes and physical looks in Herland. This makes it arguable exactly how close it is to extreme feminist beliefs that arise in America. "In 1970s, feminist utopias became very popular in American Literature." (Önay, 2008, p. 10). Extreme feminists criticize organic distinctions between males as well as females for the constraints as well as exploitation of women. They wrap up that extreme feminists are completely opposed to the concept of family members that the social framework itself is currently genderist as well as that the household organization is the key resource of dispute between males and females. No such family members exist in the novella considering that whatever is communally taken care of by women. When a child is birthed every person in the neighborhood consisting of the females, is answerable for the child's growth. "They are completely the opposite of "the angel in the house" since they are not only physically but psychologically strong and as free as birds in their peaceful and flourishing land in every respect." (Özyön, 2020, p. 346). Extreme feminists protest discrimination based upon course in any kind of kind. They intend to eliminate gender-related classification as well as provide women control over their sexuality. Seizing the means of recreation is needed for this. That is, "Parthenogenetic births of women may be interpreted as a rejection of male superiority in sexuality, and after the girls marry the male visitors, they reject non-productive sexual

relations." (Önay, 2008, p. 75). Exactly how will every one of these objectives become a reality? By starting a mother's system in contrast to the patriarchal. This is extreme feminism's objective. It is unsuitable for a woman to have manly attributes and to appear like a man in such circumstances; among things Fawles criticizes is this. This is exactly how the suggestion of a "strong woman" is represented since the women there have a macho look and qualities. The three guys think that a nation can never be comprised completely of women given that such a location might never ever be civilized as well as able to grow. It is men that develop people assist in nature establish structures and make it feasible for you to duplicate. The only point the males listen to when they undergo this exploration procedure is recognizing that this is a remarkable location, however, it is a tricky area. As a result, when they are most likely to discover this area they assume that guys will certainly exist.

"Only women there—and children," Jeff urged excitedly.

"But they look—why, this is a civilized country!" I protested. "There must be men."

"Of course there are men," said Terry. "Come on, let's find 'em." (Gilman, 2008).

According to them, because there are youngsters as well as males are required for the birth of kids an order cannot be developed when it comes to males. Nonetheless, since anything is attainable, one can consider this tale from every angle since it is a utopian tale. The area referred to as Herland was populated by men too; it did not simply show up by itself. This is a culture where enslavement exists. Men may be identified as servants or cost-free. They locate themselves in a situation where the variety of guys is progressively declining as a result of long-term disputes. Servant males comprise most of the staying populace as well as the state battle on cost-free individuals. They additionally begin seeking to be the proprietors of women. These free and servant men are stranded outside the boundary after a catastrophe. Because of its severe closure, the supposed "country of women" is tough to go into and leave. The populace of the country of women begins to increase as time takes place. So just how does this come out? Nature compensates women immediately as quickly as they discover to cohabit in harmony with it. Every woman delivers as she ends up being a mom. They all end up being moms although not every one of them delivers. If you end up being a mom and dad that kid is entirely your own; yet if the kid is birthed right into you, that kid ends up being the kid of every woman, and kids describe all women

as moms. For males, this is considered as a civil atmosphere. Despite innovation, nature stays pure as well as homes exist quietly with the native environment. Getting rid of the false dichotomy between nature and masculinity would certainly be adequate to develop a perfect country. Among one of the most apparent circumstances of this among the incredible motifs that have been informed for a long period is the Demeter story, which is about a fertility siren additionally a mom who enjoys her child very much. Providing as well as increasing are additionally linked to our communication with nature. Mother's is related to kindness, concern and the reality that all caring collaborations communicate. As a result of this, every person has had the ability to experience the sensation of mother which is one-of-a-kind to the country of women and they have additionally developed a human being that is so huge and outstanding that it can be located all over. This is the result of a scenario that has been suffered by earlier tales and has lingered today. "When a woman chose to be a mother, she allowed the child-longing to grow within her till it worked its natural miracle. When she did not so choose she put the whole thing out of her mind, and fed her heart with the other babies." (Gilman, 2008).

An additional essential aspect of this optimal system is freedom. Stated in different ways, literary works function as a lorry for revealing the initiatives made to persuade women that they are equally as efficient in developing people as men and that a system of self-reliance exists within the system. While guys are applauding exactly how well-run and civil the work environment is they are additionally trying to subjugate every woman which can result in harsh objection of maleness in the work environment. It is possible that they are trying to work out authority over the whole area and may try to seize control of the federal government. With this power vibrant, it is fairly basic to recognize just how women subdue men. Highly opposing these standards related to males, women pass through the opposing side. To safeguard their order, they are participating in a fight one-on-one at fantastic individual danger. "We had weapons, just as they did, but we didn't want to shoot." (Gilman, 2008). According to Gilman, a country consisting completely of women would certainly be the cleanest, bluest, as well as the greenest area on Earth. A woman is a person who recognizes even more with the land and the native environment, and who deals with difficulty in protecting her region. This is the reason that women go to the leading edge of ecological activities today. "Although the women have no weapons, they have the power to make the three men obey them and do what they want from them. Their not having weapons goes by the peaceful atmosphere on the land." (Özyön,

2020, p. 93). If they conserve nature from man's intrusion the women's very own body will certainly additionally be conserved from this intrusion, and this has taken its area in the literary works as ecofeminism. The style of feminist utopian writing has arisen as a way of analyzing traditional gender duties and social conventions. This sort of work often thinks of alternative worlds or futures in which social justice and gender-equal rights are offered top priority. Charlotte Perkins Gilman's Herland, which pictures a culture composed completely of women that have established a relaxed as well as unified human being, is among the initial instances of feminist sci-fi. The styles of feminist sci-fi, as well as utopian literary works have occurred as a means to doubt traditional gender duties as well as social standards. They give a powerful online forum for visualizing and diving into various other futures in which social justice as well as gender-equal rights are crucial concerns. These categories regularly check out different backgrounds or cosmos in which social justice, and gender-equal rights are significant issues. Fiction authors in this style utilize their contacting envisioned worlds where gender-equal rights are valued and where power characteristics, as well as social frameworks are resolved. The literary categories of utopian as well as feminist sci-fi offer visitors the possibility to envision alternating situations where a culture that is a lot more simply coupled with fair. These styles give online forums for going over intersectional problems concerning sexuality, and gender. They additionally offer authors a system to picture people who stand up to different types of discrimination along oppression, allowing a much more comprehensive and different depiction of voices from the margins. Feminist scientific research fiction and utopian literary works are included in bigger conversations regarding social justice and equity by imagining cultures in which these converging identifications are identified and valued.

Discussion & Conclusion

The story's representation of the best culture is noted by its commitment to gender-equal rights, education and learning, sustainability, participating areas, psychological knowledge, and unified cohabitation. With the aid of these parts, the writer develops a brilliant photo of a suitable culture that inquires about gender stereotypes and supplies suggestions for brand-new social frameworks as well as social criteria. She likewise highlights area, education, learning, and interaction as the essential foundation of a perfect culture, revealing just how these elements sustain the strength, consistency, with wellness of Herland's residents. To sum up, the novella provides a suitable culture with a solid structure in eco-friendly treatment and regard

for the native environment. It does this by offering an engaging representation of ecological sustainability as well as consistency. It additionally motivates consideration of present ecological concerns with the possibility of producing even more resistant as well as lasting neighborhoods by showing Herland's sustainable way of living with relaxed coexistence with the native environment. The author's intersectional perspectives on gender highlight the complexity of power and opportunity and prevent visitors from considering exactly how individuals' experiences in culture are formed through the merging of their identities. Gilman's publication tests visitors to consider just how fascism is adjoined and just how vital it is for feminist as well as social justice activities to resolve several kinds of inequality via the intersectionality lens.

References

Atasoy, E. (2020). An intersectional reading of Charlotte Perkins Gilman's Herland: Challenging dichotomies. *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 21, 660-668. https://doi.org/10.29000/rumelide.835834

Eskelinen, T., Lakkala, K., & Laakso, M. (2020). Introduction: Utopias and the revival of imagination. In T. Eskelinen (Ed.), *The revival of political imagination: Utopia as methodology* (pp. 3-19). Zed Books.

Gilman, C. P. (2008). *Herland*. The Project Gutenberg. https://www.gutenberg.org/cache/epub/32/pg32-images.html#link2HCH0001

İkiz, S. S. (2008). Joanna Russ's The female man: Towards a feminist revolution. *Pamukkale Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 1(2), 87-99.

Önay, F. Ş. (2008). *Two feminist utopias: Herland and Woman on the edge of time* (Master's thesis). American Studies.

Özyön, A. (2020). A comparative analysis of feminist approaches to all-female worlds in Charlotte Perkins Gilman's Herland and Joanna Russ's "When It Changed." *Atatürk Üniversitesi Edebiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 64, 91-105.

Özyön, A. (2019). *Herland* by Charlotte Perkins Gilman. *Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları*, 19, 345-347.

Zhou, S. (2014). *Feminist utopia: A new viewpoint of interpreting British and American literature*. Atlantis Press.

Exploring Womb Envy in Angela Carter's *Shadow Dance*

Angela Carter'ın *Shadow Dance* Romanında Rahim Kıskançlığı Kavramı

İsmail Onur SONAT[1]

[1]School of Foreign Languages, Haliç University, İstanbul, Türkiye

ABSTRACT

Angela Carter's first novel, *Shadow Dance*, published amid the emergence of second-wave feminism in the 1960s, is a literary testament to the changing gender dynamics in that chaotic period. In the text, Carter crafts a tale that exposes the themes of misogyny, patriarchal domination, and gender-based violence. This novel is of particular importance in the context of second wave feminism, which coincided with the widespread availability of the contraceptive pill in the Western world. In this exploration of Carter's work, the concept of "womb envy" emerges as a central theme, highlighting the deep anxiety underlying the male psyche. Carter's characters, Morris and Honeybuzzard, are portrayed similar images of these anxieties and desires, expressed in their so-called creative practices. Morris seeks to emulate women's creativity through painting, while Honeybuzzard plays the role of a bad mother who controls and punishes his/her children. When their attempts to imitate women's fertility fail, they often resort to violence against women in the brand new world of contraceptives. Thus, the text serves as a mirror to the changing feminist discourse of the time, emphasizing the interdependence of women's agency, identity, and men's responses to with these changes. By addressing the complex interplay between gender dynamics, this paper provides insight into *Shadow Dance* in relation to its thematic depth and enduring relevance in the study of gender relations and women's rights.

Keywords: Angela Carter, womb envy, *Shadow Dance*, gender, psychoanalysis

ÖZ

Angela Carter'ın 1960'larda ikinci dalga feminizmin ortaya çıkışı sırasında yayımlanan ilk romanı *Shadow Dance*, bu kaotik dönemde değişen cinsiyet dinamiklerinin edebi bir yansımasıdır. Metinde Carter, kadın düşmanlığı, ataerkil tahakküm ve cinsiyete dayalı şiddet temalarını açığa çıkaran bir olay örgüsü yaratmıştır. Bu roman, Batı dünyasında doğum kontrol hapının yaygın olarak kullanılmasıyla yükselen ikinci dalga feminizm bağlamında özel bir öneme sahiptir. Carter'ın metninin bu incelemesinde, "rahim kıskançlığı" kavramı ana tema olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır. Carter'ın karakterleri Morris ve Honeybuzzard, sözde yaratıcı pratiklerinde ifade edilen bu kaygı ve arzuların benzer sembolleri ile betimlenir. Morris resim yoluyla kadınların yaratıcılığını taklit etmeye çalışırken Honeybuzzard çocuklarını cezalandıran kötü bir anne rolünü üstlenir. Kadınların doğurganlığını taklit etme çabaları başarısızlıkla sonuçlanan bu karakterler kadına karşı şiddete başvurmayı seçerler. Dolayısıyla metin, zamanın değişen feminist söylemine bir ayna görevi üstlenir; kadınların kimliğinin ve erkeklerin bu değişikliklere verdiği tepkilerin karşılıklı bağımlılığını vurgular. Cinsiyet dinamikleri arasındaki karmaşık etkileşimi ele alan bu makale, *Shadow Dance*'in tematik derinliği ve cinsiyet ilişkileri ve kadın hakları araştırmalarındaki kalıcı önemi açısından yeni bir anlayış sağlar.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Angela Carter, rahim kıskançlığı, *Shadow Dance*, toplumsal cinsiyet, psikanaliz

Introduction

A woman is not born, but rather, she is carved into one. Published during a tumultuous period in the 1960s when the second-wave feminism emerged in the West, Angela Carter's debut novel *Shadow Dance* (1966) reflects the apparent shifts taking place in relation to gender dynamics through her carefully crafted depictions of misogyny, patriarchal dominion, and gender-based violence. The second-wave feminism emerged shortly after the approval and widespread distribution of the contraceptive pill in the West. This development, which allowed women to have a say over their bodies and the decision of whether to bear children, is closely linked to female agency and identity. Of course, the uproar caused by patriarchal institutions in response to women's control over their sexuality can be scrutinized through extensive scholarly research, but Carter's own interpretation based on her observations regarding the origins of subjugation and oppression of women pinpoints a deep-seated anxiety in the male psyche: "womb envy." *Shadow Dance* focuses on two male characters, Morris and Honeybuzzard, who are both preoccupied with anxieties related to their power to create and procreate, as well as the destructive urges that accompany these abilities. For Morris, the artist figure in the text, the act of painting holds the possibility to gain access to the realm of creation in the way women biologically do, whereas for Honeybuzzard, it is puppetry that gives him the pleasure of maternal control. He treats Ghislane, the girl with whom he has a sexual relationship, as a human-doll. He believes he can give life to her or discard her in a way that only a sexually liberated woman can in the post-contraceptive pill world. Seemingly, in his twisted mind, he plays the role of a controlling and reprimanding surrogate mother to her. Thereupon, in the light of womb envy, in *Shadow Dance*, the characters of Morris and Honeybuzzard represent two ostensibly distinct, yet remarkably similar projections of anxieties and desires related to the possession of female sexuality in their so-called creative pursuits that desperately attempt to mimic female fecundity. However, the text highlights that these men's attempts of mimicry more than often resort to hatred, perverse urges, or even violent acts towards women upon the realization of their lack of womb.

Womb Envy and its Reflections in Angela Carter's *Shadow Dance*

According to Sigmund Freud, the psychosexual development of women begins when a young girl realizes her mother, her first love-object "lacks a penis and as a result of this castration she feels hostile towards the mother" (Bayne, 2011, p. 151). This shocking realization turns into what he calls "a narcissistic wound" (p. 151) also known as "penis envy". However, numerous scholars such as Karen Horney, Erich Fromm and Felix Boehm have demonstrated that a male version of penis envy that is driven by the desires of "being sexually complete" (Bayne, 2011, p. 153) also exists. From an early age in boys 'psyche a "regressive yearning for the nourishing, sheltering womb may emerge" (Eschbach, 2008, p. 63). Horney introduced the term "womb envy," suggesting that men experience a form of envy toward women due to their unique ability to give birth, which reflects deeper psychological dynamics regarding gender and creation (Bayne, 2011, p. 152). This envy, she believes, is the cause of the undisputed misogyny that lies in the foundation of patriarchal societies where women are often devalued, as "devaluation of an envied object is a typical defensive maneuver" (Lerner, 1974, p. 542). This notion of devaluation, however, can easily turn into feelings of intense hatred, hostility and violence. As Eva Feder Kittay (1984) explains, womb envy in men prevents them from fully appreciating the joy of witnessing life's emergence and reliving the precious moments of nurturing a child. Their destructive actions, driven by anger and unsuccessful attempts at gratification, only result in renewed heightened fury:

Envy of the woman interferes with the gratification of seeing life emerge and empathetically reliving the best moments of symbiosis and the experience of parental power and generosity available in nurturing a child. But the destruction of life does not yield the sought-after gratification. Since the transposition of values has been accomplished to deal with the envy, and since there is anger at the failure of gratification, the destruction is renewed, fueled now with greater anger. (1984, p. 120)

On the other hand, in her research paper that focuses on the development of the wish for a child in young boys, psychoanalyst Edith Jacobson (1950) points out that "creative work quite normally is the main channel for sublimation of feminine reproductive wishes in men" (1950, p. 142), linking artistic tendencies in men to the fact that they are biologically unable to give birth. Horney suggests that men's desire to create "is precisely due to their feeling of playing a relatively small part in the creation of living beings, which constantly impels them to an overcompensation in achievement" (p. 61). Similarly, Sherry B. Ortner (1974), using Simone de Beauvoir's seminal work *The Second Sex* (1953) as a framework, suggests that culture limits women to the realm of reproduction, while providing men the freedom to express

their creativity through technology and symbols. This causes men to create long-lasting and transcendent objects, whereas women create perishable human beings (p. 75). According to van Leeuwen (1966), the more men acknowledge their positive desire to create life and emphasize their contributions, the less likely they are to exert power through destructive inventions. However, men's envy of female body may lead to "marital difficulties, abortion wishes, mutilation fantasies" (p.54). Therefore, one can argue that womb envy can manifest itself in both creative and destructive ways.

Accordingly, the cover of the Penguin US edition of *Shadow Dance* that was illustrated by Roxanna Bikadoroff, an artist whose surrealist works have been closely associated with Carter, highlights the blend of creativity and destruction in its male characters. On this cover image, Morris holds a paintbrush, while Honeybuzzard wields a knife. When juxtaposed, these two male characters, who serve as doubles of each other in the text, are exposed as two sides of the same coin. Yet, there is one difference: Honeybuzzard can act out the desires that Morris only fantasizes about. What connects these desires is the fact that they both stem from a shared origin, which can be summarized as womb envy. Throughout the novel, both men try to merge with the womb "in order to claim this primordial, protected, and exclusive space for oneself" (Eschbach, 2008, p. 63).

For example, Morris, who is described as "a bad painter" (Carter, 1966, p. 6), is aware that he does not have any talent, but his frustration in the face of being unable to create art transforms into a misplaced hostility against Ghislaine. Likewise, during their first encounter after her assault, he is mocked by Ghislane for being poor. "Always pennyless, poor Morris" (p. 1), as Ghislane calls him, is not on equal footing with her regarding finances. Ghislane says, "I have a lot of money, Morris, if you would like me to buy you a drink" (p. 3) displaying a sense of superiority that makes him uncomfortable. Additionally, the text tells the reader that Morris is obsessively angry with Ghislaine because she previously made fun of him during a brief sexual encounter. In other words, his financial, sexual and creative insufficiencies run parallel to each other. Morris's attempts at claiming this exclusive feminine space result in intrusive thoughts where he can symbolically penetrate her body and possess it. For example, the text informs the reader that Morris has dreams in which he "was cutting Ghislaine's face with a kitchen knife. The knife was blunt and kept slipping. Her head came off in his hands, after a while, and he cut her into a turnip lantern, put a candle inside and lit it through her freshly carved mouth" (p, 178).

Not only does this dream reveal his frustration with his sexual dysfunction, as the knife as a phallic symbol that functions as a substitute for his penis, but it also exposes his desire to possess Ghislaine's body through imagery such as turnip lantern that evokes womb due to its shape and connection to containment and protection. Furthermore, the transmutation of his sexual feelings into murderous ones also validates Kittay's aforementioned remarks postulating that womb envy carries the potential for morphing into violent behavior.

It should also be noted that, in the very first description of Ghislaine that focalizes on Morris includes the information that she smells like "chemical contraceptives and her own sexual sweat" (p. 5), associating this newfound female agency in the '60s with artificiality and promiscuity. If women are, suddenly in charge of their own bodies when it comes to reproduction, men lose the sole sexual advantage they have over them. In that sense, for the first time "the Jewish myth of creation, whereby Eve is from a rib of Adam" (Bayne, 2011, p. 156) that designates Adam as superior is challenged. However, this sexual liberation of women is employed to oppress and devalue them, as evidenced by Morris's attitude towards Ghislaine and Edna.

Likewise, in the scene where Honeybuzzard attacks Ghislane, we can see that in a symbolic way he gains temporary access to the female body through penetrating it with a knife. The narration describes Honeybuzzard's enigmatic appearance by referring to his "androgynous face […] hard and fine and inhuman; Medusa, marble, terrible" (Carter, 1966, p. 183), hence for a split second he can pass as a woman. However, he is referred to not only as Medusa, but also as a marble, possibly alluding to a beheaded statue of the snake-haired Gorgon in classical mythology, exposing that his transformation is merely an imitation, a sculptor's artifice. Some of the most famous statues of Medusa depict her head in Perseus's hands, signaling the idea that there is a man holding the likeness of a woman. From this perspective, Medusa becomes a mask for Honeybuzzard akin to countless masks in the shop that he wears, rendering his attempt to imitating femininity pointless and abortive.

Honeybuzzard's prosthetic efforts of merging with the womb can also be observed in the text's illustration of his bedroom. Indeed, this room is the locus of penetrative sexual acts with which he can possess women's bodies and tap into female power, making it a place where a form of symbiosis happens between both sexes. All the details about the room in Carter's text turn the room into a metaphor for the womb. For example, this walled womb

contains a bust of Queen Victoria, but this bust is wearing one of Honeybuzzard's "ubiquitous false noses" (p. 176), once again associating his fleeting fusions with femininity using a mask. The inclusion of Queen Victoria is curious, as in the "mad dream of Victoriana" (p. 87) these characters live, she both embodies a revered feminine energy and a time for England when societal rules strictly dictated what women could or could not do. Besides, there is also "a jar containing a pickled foetus" in the room (p. 176). Usually displayed in sideshows and circuses, this object seems peculiar even for a man like Honeybuzzard, who is widely known for his eccentricity. However, it completes the image of the room as a maternal space for him. This pickled foetus, dead and kept in a jar, becomes a surrogate child for Honeybuzzard in this context. By preserving this dead baby in a womb-like object, he can pretend to have given birth and experienced the power of female reproduction.

While the umbilical affiliation between Honeybuzzard and the foetus signifies the latter's desire to give birth, his relationship with Ghislaine signifies a performance of a make-believe version of motherhood. Since Ghislaine is a compliant figure who obeys what Honeybuzzard says, he can impose a disturbing sense of motherly authority over him. This desire to associate himself with an authoritative femininity is made explicit in the scene where he piles his hair on top and envisions himself as "a virgin schoolteacher, mistress of math or classics, withering as if pressed between textbooks in some ivied, select girls 'boarding school" (p. 124). In this vision he can discipline the female body and make sure that they cannot escape from the confinement that the boarding school walls bring. A toymaker, puppeteer, performer, Honeybuzzard concentrates solely on domination, and his behavior towards Ghislaine is also an indicative of it. For him, Ghislaine is nothing but a doll to play with and discard whenever he feels frustrated; a grotesque patchwork Venus with stitches created by an aggressive Botticelli, a stone-cold and lifeless Galatea without Athena's animating touch to his murderous Pygmalion, the horrifying bride-to-be for the monster of Victor Frankenstein. He seems to be proud of his so-called creation, as he was able to turn a beautiful girl into "a Halloween mask" (p. 145) and a "vampire woman" (p. 40). His mutilation and the subsequent murder of Ghislaine, in this context, functions as a coalescence of the acts of creation and destruction. After all, Honeybuzzard takes full responsibility for the creation of this "ravishing automaton" (p. 7), therefore he has no reservations about her destruction.

According to Madeline Klein (1957), there are six markers of womb envy in men: "1) idealization of the object

of the desire, 2) devaluation of the object, 3) devaluation of the self, 4) appropriation, 5) stirring up envy in others, 6) stifling feelings of love and corresponding intensifying hate" (Bayne, 2011, p, 153). When one takes into account the treatment of Ghislaine, Edna and Emily by Morris and Honeybuzzard, it becomes clear that Carter's text showcases all of these markers. For example, in her initial state where she is described as "sweet, white, innocent and childish like ice cream" (Carter, 1966, p. 7) Ghislane's idealization by men is obvious. Prior to her mutilation she "used to look like a young girl in a picture book" (p. 2) that resembled "moonlight on daisies" (p. 3). However, after Honeybuzzard's attack that scars her and turns her into a grotesque figure like "the bride of Frankenstein" (p. 34), her devaluation by the anxious psyches of Morris and Honeybuzzard begins. Once she loses her beauty, she becomes "a horror movie woman" (p. 6). Although we cannot say that Honeybuzzard displays any signs of devaluation of the self, considering Honeybuzzard and Morris are the doubles of each other, Morris becomes the former's devalued and inferior alter ego who wears his insecurities on his sleeve. Moreover, there are examples of appropriation in the text such as Honeybuzzard's use of several expressions at the end of his sentences that are traditionally associated with femininity such as "darling" (p. 45) and "dear" (p. 78). Similarly, Honeybuzzard's dominance especially in his interactions with women causes envy in Morris because he can, albeit for a limited amount of time, "possess" female body either through sexual acts or penetrating and carving them with his knife. Finally, both Morris and Honeybuzzard display stifling feelings of love and intensifying hate, as their fantasies range from fervent dreams of sexual dominance to graphic visions of murder.

As *Shadow Dance* is a novel which primarily focuses on an apparent crisis in masculinity in the characters of Morris and Honeybuzzard, it is by no means a surprise that female characters are repeatedly victimized, exploited, or backgrounded. Ghislaine, the main target for gender-based violence related to womb envy, pays the ultimate price for her compliant attitude towards male dominance with her life. In a similar vein, Edna, Morris's wife, showcases a meek and passive attitude all through the novel. She believes "husbands were a force of nature or an act of God" (p. 45) and does not seem to have problems with her role as someone "docile and obedient because that was how wives should be" (p. 46). However, she eventually is able to escape from the shackles of her marriage. It should be noted that there is only one prominent woman in the text who is reminiscent of the emerging second-wave feminism: Emily. Although she starts out as another subservient girl in

the first parts of the novel, she gradually becomes increasingly in tune with her own power. Her display of "remarkable confidence in resisting the male attempts to belittle women" (Ramesh, 2011, p. 2) makes her a subversive female character. In accordance, at the end of the novel, Emily becomes the one who cuts the umbilical link between Honeybuzzard and his distorted version of a baby by destroying his pickled foetus. Similarly, she also gets rid of the strange objects in his womb wall of a room including the bust of Queen Victoria, which "throws light on her rejection of the past and its patriarchal perversities" (p. 2). Furthermore, despite being pregnant, she makes it clear that keeping the baby is her own decision. In this context, Emily emerges as a personification of the envy-inducing womb that can give life or take it away, a neo-New Woman who can shatter the glass ceiling of the Victorian age, a poster child for female defiance in the post-contraceptive pill climate of the '60s.

Conclusion

Overall, Angela Carter's *Shadow Dance* serves as a reflection of the changing gender dynamics and the subsequent reactions by men who feel threatened by the emergence of female empowerment during in the 1960s. Through her portrayal of misogyny, patriarchal dominion, and gender-based violence, Carter captures the societal transformations occurring at the time. Central to these transformations was the advent of the contraceptive pill, which granted women the ability to assert control over reproductive choices. However, she also illuminates a fundamental anxiety deeply rooted in the male psyche, which psychoanalysts call "womb envy". By delving into the concept of womb envy, this paper aimed to expose the prevalent anxieties and desires associated with the possession of female sexuality. Ultimately, Morris and Honeybuzzard resort to hatred, perverse fantasies, and even violent acts towards women when confronted with the realization of their own lack of the reproductive potency of the female body. Thus, their so-called creative pursuits, while initially driven by a longing to give birth, eventually give way to the destructive forces of misogyny and violence.

References

Bayne, E. (2011). Womb envy: The cause of misogyny and even male achievement? *Women's Studies International Forum*, 34(2), 151-160.

Carter, A. (1966). *Shadow Dance*. Heinemann.

Eschbach, C. L. (2008). Toward an understanding of womb envy: Developmental and clinical perspectives. In L. Wurmser & H. Jarass (Eds.), J*ealousy and Envy — New Views about Two Powerful Feelings* (pp. 49-74). Taylor & Francis.

Jacobson, E. (1950). Development of the wish for a child in boys. *The Psychoanalytic Study of the Child*, 5, 139-152.

Kittay, E. F. (1984). Womb envy: An explanatory concept. In J. Trebilcot (Ed.), *Mothering: Essays in Feminist Theory* (pp. 94-128). Rowman and Allanheld.

Klein, M. (1957). *Envy and Gratitude*. Tavistock Publications.

Lerner, H. E. (1974). Early origins of envy and devaluation of women: Implications for sex role stereotypes. *Bulletin of the Menninger Clinic,* 38(6), 538-553.

Ortner, S. B. (1974). Is female to male as nature is to culture? In M. Z. Rosaldo & L. Lamphere (Eds.), Woman, culture and society (pp. 67-87). Stanford University Press.

Ramesh, R. (2011). Interrogation of patriarchal codes and misogynistic fantasies in Angela Carter's *Shadow Dance*. *Indian Streams Journal*, 1(5), 1-4.

van Leeuwen, Kato (1966). Pregnancy envy in the male. *The International Journal of Psycho-Analysis*, 47, 319–324.