

SAYI 37 • 2011

OSMANLI ARAŐTIRMALARI
THE JOURNAL OF OTTOMAN STUDIES

İSAM 

kaynaklara hasredilmemesi gerekirdi. Çalışmada Webb'in Amerika'da yaşadığı her bölgenin siyasî, dinî, coğrafi, kültürel yapısı ve döneminin entelektüel arka planını yansıtmaması bakımından ele aldığı Mark Twain ya da Pulitzer gibi isimlere dair uzun bahislerin -ki bu tafsilâtı açıklamaların eserin genel özelliği olduğu söylenebilir- eserin akıcılığını olumsuz yönde etkilediğini düşünmekteyiz. Yine kitabın muhtelif yerlerinde mesela yazarın Webb'in günlüklerinde Hindistanlı Müslümanlardan Budruddin Kur ve Hassan Ali için kullandığı ırkçı ifadeleri, Webb'in yaşadığı ve yetiştiği dönemdeki ırkçı tavırlar içerisinde değerlendirerek bir tür meşrulaştırma veya aklileştirme edası veren izahlar getirmeye çalışması zorlama olarak gözükmektedir (s. 136). Ayrıca Webb'in Amerika'da hiçbir Müslüman çevre ile irtibat içerisinde olmaması -ki o dönemde özellikle de New York'ta göçmen Müslümanların oluşturdukları cemaatlerin bilinmesine rağmen⁸ hakkında kendisinin yeni bir cemaat oluşturma çabası içerisinde olduğu yorumu dışında herhangi bir incelemeye yer verilmemesi de eserde muallakta kalan bir noktadır. Tüm bunlara karşılık sonuçta yazar tarafından da kabul edilen kaynak problemi başta olmak üzere eserdeki tüm sınırlılıklar, vefatından sonra unutulmaya yüz tutan Webb ve mirasına yönelik ilgiyi canlandırma gayretinin gölgesinde kalmaktadır. Ayrıca sadece bu çalışmada verilen matbuâta dair bilgilerden bile müstakil incelemelerin ortaya çıkacağı âşikâr olmakla birlikte, eserin gelecekte Webb'e dair daha mufassal çalışmalar için emsâlsiz bir kaynak teşkil ettiği kanaatindeyiz.

Şeyma Turan

Seyfi Kenan (ed.),

Erken Klasik Dönemden XVIII. Yüzyıl Sonuna Kadar Osmanlılar ve Avrupa: Seyahat, Karşılaşma ve Etkileşim / The Ottomans and Europe: Travel, Encounter and Interaction from the Early Classical Period until the End of the 18th Century,

İstanbul: İSAM Yayınları, 2010), 672 p.

The volume *Osmanlılar ve Avrupa: Seyahat, Karşılaşma ve Etkileşim/The Ottomans and Europe: Travel, Encounter and Interaction* is a book that was generated from an international conference hosted by the İslam Araştırmaları

8 Detaylı bilgi için bk. Seyfi Kenan, "Amerika'da Müslüman Cemiyetlerin Doğuşu: New Yorklu Müslümanların Dinî-Sivil ve Eğitsel Kurumlaşma Süreci", *İslâm Araştırmaları Dergisi*, sayı 11, 2004, s. 105-130.

Merkezi (İSAM) in November of 2006 in İstanbul. The volume's editor, Seyfi Kenan, is also the author of the opening article, and he explains the objectives of the conference and the book. In his view, scholars have become increasingly interested in exploring the theme of relations between the Christian West and Islamic world in the wake of the events of September 11th. Those events, along with the subsequent wars in Afghanistan and Iraq, seemed to lend credence to Samuel Huntington's theory of the "Clash of Civilizations" as the primary dynamic of global relations in the post-Cold War World. For Kenan and the other contributors, the emphasis on conflict between civilizations elides a history that is far more complex than an inventory of perpetual warfare. Kenan starts by observing that the ongoing transactions between Western Christendom and the Islamic world have frequently been those of peaceful exchange. Warfare was ubiquitous, but so was commerce, and the exchange of ideas and technology.

A number of the articles address the shared heritage of classical learning that joined Christians and Muslims in conversations across borders in the Middle Ages. Süleyman Dönmez explores how Thomas Aquinas wrestled with the intellectual legacy of Ibn Rushd in producing his own ideas about the place of reason within faith. Saira Malik's work investigates the writings of Theodoric of Freiberg on the optics of the rainbow, concluding that just as the Arabs appropriated and added to the canon of scientific knowledge they received from the Greeks, Europeans of the Middle Ages also appropriated and contributed to the corpus they received from the Arabs. The article of Fuat Aydın seeks to demonstrate that a number of European polemical arguments against the Islamic faith derived from the circulation of al-Kindi's *Risale* in Europe. Together, the three articles present some sense of the terms in which these interfaith conversations were conducted. While they would quarrel over some aspects of theology, both Christians and Muslims found the terminology and concerns of this conversation to be recognizable and significant.

On the matter of theological difference, several articles attest that even though religious rivalries flourished in the medieval and early modern periods, adherents of different faiths showed an ongoing desire to engage with one another's beliefs. For instance, Mahmut Aydın's contribution focuses on the fifteenth-century Cardinal Nicholas of Cusa. The cardinal wrote of an imaginary colloquium between a delegation of Christians and Muslims, wherein after much debate all present agree that different rites can still share a common faith between them. The idea that Muslims and Christians could and should debate the truth of their respective faiths was not peculiar to Nicholas of Cusa.

As Mustafa Daş's article shows, there was wide interest in such debates. In particular, Daş describes the theological debate at Ankara between the Byzantine emperor Manuel Palaiologos II (1391-1425) and Hacı Bayram Veli. This debate is all the more interesting when one considers that the emperor was in Ankara as an ally of the forces of the Ottoman Sultan Bayezid II, as both leaders were intent on conquering the minor Beyliks of Anatolia. That this debate took place as a friendly and polite event between allies in an interfaith military might be surprising to those who imagine that theological debate was largely acrimonious and a sign of mutual bigotry.

As other articles remind us, philosophy and theology were not the only items being transmitted between the Muslim and Christian shores of the Mediterranean. In particular, Sicily emerged in several articles as a uniquely positioned conduit between two worlds. Mehmet Azimli's essay expounds the view that the Norman conquest of Sicily led to a number of Islamic cultural influences on Europe. According to Azimli, the Norman kings adopted the royal ceremonies, clothing, and architecture of the Muslim kings they had displaced. They continued to rely on Muslims to administer the island, and transmitted Islamic music, art, literature and practical knowledge such as silkworm cultivation to the rest of Europe. Similarly, İshak Keskin points to the role that Sicily played in relaying administrative techniques to Europe. He notes that Islamic Spain and Sicily had inherited the bureaucratic and archival practices of the Ummayyads and Abbasids, in particular the use of paper records. It was these that Hohenstaufen rulers of Sicily introduced into European usage.

A great many articles in this collection note the value of accounts left by Italian travelers in the Ottoman Empire, several of which are illustrated. Kemal Beydilli describes the early fifteenth-century account of Cristoforo Buondelmonti, who visited Istanbul and the Aegean islands. Frederica Broilo compiles a detailed picture of Istanbul's architecture from Venetian accounts. These descriptions are particularly valuable for buildings which are no longer standing, such as the Old Palace. Anthony Welch describes the wanderings of Ambrosio Bembo across Syria, Iraq and Iran. Italians were sometimes friends and sometimes foes of the Ottomans, and this duality is noted in articles by Brian Becker, Mirella Galetti, and Barbara Karl. While Becker investigates the secret codes of the Genovese developed while defending their rule over Chios from Ottoman incursions, Galetti and Karl show how the display of objects or paintings with an Islamic theme was a normal part of diplomacy and status building for Italians in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Two papers also surveyed the representation of Muslims and Turks in the literatures of southern

Europe, especially Spain. Özlem Kumrular notes that while negative images of Muslims, Turks and the prophet Muhammad prevail in sixteenth-century Spanish writings, this may have something to do with the particular rivalry between the Ottomans and the Spanish in that century. This interpretation is corroborated by the work of Pablo Mart n Asuero, who notes that the Spanish image of Turks changed quite a bit after Spanish and Ottoman relations entered a new and peaceful phase in the late eighteenth century.

The volume includes several articles that address the reception of European technologies in the Ottoman Empire, in particular in the eighteenth century. Mehmet Alaadin Ya ıncaya presents a comprehensive survey of the Europeans who came to the empire in that period to train troops or rebuild fortifications and harbors, drawing attention not only to the likes of Baron de Tott, but also remarking on the contributions of numerous lesser known figures. G bor  goston makes an important revision to our understanding of Ottoman military capabilities in this period, arguing that the Ottomans were not outgunned or overwhelmed by new technology in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Rather the balance of military power began to shift towards Europe in the eighteenth century largely because of its increasingly successful bureaucratization of war. In terms of Ottoman receptiveness to other aspects of European technology, James Redman presents an overview of theories about the relatively late Ottoman adoption of the printing press. He concludes that resistance stemmed largely from the ulema, who had a vested interest in the continuance of scribal culture. On the other hand, Malissa Taylor concludes that both Christians and Muslims had a number of anxieties about print in the early modern period that restrained its usage, and that these fears extended beyond elites on all sides of the Mediterranean.

The volume's studies on late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries present quite a contrast with those from earlier periods. If one compares the activities of European collectors of Islamic products and antiquities like the Medicis with those surveyed by Frederik Thomasson in the later period, the differences are striking. The extraction of antiquities from the Ottoman domains, Thomasson shows, fanned European rivalries and provoked debate about how the monuments of classical antiquity were to be preserved. It was, as Thomasson shows, the preservation of the Hellenic monuments that concerned Europeans rather than say, those of Egypt. This observation points to the complexities of the European appropriation of the Hellenic past as its own, and its consequences for Greeks and Turks alike. On this topic, Dimitris Michalopoulos goes as far as to say that the cause of Greek independence was embraced by European powers primarily

to stop a potentially strong and unified Greek-Turkish state from emerging as a result of the Ottoman reform movement of the early nineteenth century. Another article testifying to the rise of new ways of viewing the Ottoman domains in Europe, is Selma Zecevic's identification of the nineteenth century as the time when Europeans began to refer to Bosnia and Bosnians as "Oriental" and in bad need of civilizing.

Perhaps the greatest drawback to the collection is that it reinforces a familiar chronology. The volume's contributors suggest that in the Middle Ages, finished goods, knowledge and influence were all going one way: from east to west. By the end of the early modern period, the reverse appeared to be true. In all probability the next frontier in these kinds of discussions is to upset the narrative of a Middle East that transmits its superior learning to Europe in the Middle Ages, only to have Europe return the favor in the eighteenth century. It is also surprising how amenable the authors accepted the idea of a European/Ottoman distinction when the content of many articles could easily be seen as evidence for Fernand Braudel's thesis of Mediterranean unity. Notably missing from the volume was discussion of France, given its long and important strategic partnership with the Ottoman Empire. Of the contributors, only Viorel Panaite's essay on the development of capitulations in the sixteenth century touched on the role of this key Ottoman ally.

When one considers the international climate at the time when these papers were written, it would seem fair to conclude that this book have emerged into an entirely different world. Does anyone still insist today, in the wake of the Arab Spring, that a clash of civilizations defines the relations between the Middle East and the United States? The volume's focus on interregional exchange is no longer a hard sell in a world of revolutions attributed in no small part to technologies like facebook and twitter. One article, written by Angelika Hartman, argues that Europe's construction of an Islamic other is based on memories of conflict such as the Crusades. She points out that one could just as easily see the Crusades as an era of unprecedented European and Islamic cooperation and commerce as one of military enmity. The call to remember a history of making common cause as well as war is likely to find a receptive audience at present.

Malissa Taylor