



Review Article

Agenda: Environment! Critical evaluation of the thesis on the right to environment in Turkey

Tuğba CANBULUT*¹, Afranur Kısa²

¹ Istanbul University Institute of Social Sciences Political Science and Public Administration Doctorate Program Student and Research Assistant at Istanbul University-Cerrahpaşa Faculty of Health Sciences Department of Social Work, İstanbul, Turkey (ORCID Number: 0000-0002-0055-1684)

² Turkish Red Crescent Social Worker, Ankara, Turkey (ORCID Number:0000-0002-5677-1694)

Abstract

This article includes a content analysis of master's and doctoral theses on environmental right, environmental law and climate crisis. In this context, 47 theses accessed through the Turkey's national thesis database were examined. In the content analysis, the contributions of the theses evaluated to the environmental sensitivity agenda were discussed. The conclusions reached in this context are as follows: It is an issue that can be handled within the framework of both third and fourth generation rights of the environment, both cultural and universal dimension of the environment should be handled together, national and international legal system should be shared on the environment, local and central governments and international institutions on environment and organizations need a common point of view, environmentally sensitive perspective should not include gender-age-class discrimination, education systems should be created from eco-friendly curricula, the importance of environmental impact assessment should be understood, and the capacity needs to be professionally developed, concerns that might arise from environmental destruction in the new environment It is essential to be added to their agenda.

Received

11 September 2020

Accepted

07 December 2020

Keywords

Right to Environment
Environmental Law
Gender
New Generation Rights
EIA

GÜNDEM: ÇEVRE! TÜRKİYE'DE ÇEVRE HAKKI BAĞLAMINDA YAZILMIŞ TEZLERİN ELEŞTİREL İNCELENMESİ

Özet

Bu makale, çevre hakkı, çevre hukuku ve iklim krizi ile ilgili yüksek lisans ve doktora tezlerinin içerik analizini içermektedir. Bu kapsamda Türkiye'nin ulusal tez veri tabanından erişilen 47 tez incelenmiştir. İçerik analizinde, değerlendirilen tezlerin çevre duyarlılığı gündemine katkıları tartışılmıştır. Bu bağlamda ulaşılan sonuçlar şu şekildedir: Çevrenin hem üçüncü hem de dördüncü nesil hakları çerçevesinde ele alınabilecek bir konudur, çevrenin hem kültürel hem de evrensel boyutu birlikte ele alınmalı, ulusal ve uluslararası hukuk sistemi çevre konusunda paylaşılmalı, çevre konusunda yerel ve merkezi yönetimler ve uluslararası kuruluşlar ortak bir bakış açısına ihtiyaç duymalı, çevreye duyarlı bakış açısı cinsiyet-yaş-sınıf ayrımcılığını içermemeli, eğitim sistemleri çevre dostu müfredattan oluşturulmalıdır. Ayrıca çevresel etki değerlendirmesinin önemi anlaşılmalı ve kapasitenin profesyonelce geliştirilmesi gerektiği, yeni çevrede çevresel tahribattan kaynaklanabilecek endişelerin gündemlerine eklenmesi esastır.

Anahtar Kelimeler

Çevre Hakkı
Çevre Hukuku
Toplumsal Cinsiyet
Yeni Nesil Haklar
Çevresel Etki Değerlendirme
(ÇED)

Introduction

Science researches do not have any restrictions on subject selection. However, there are certain issues that need to be sensitized. Environmental awareness is one of them. It is important to feel the environmentally sensitive steps of people in scientific research on the environment, not only against the environment, but also as part of the process of shaping, not the owner or manager of the environment. It is a responsibility to consider environmental sensitivity as a methodological requirement in any academic study.

The environment can be seen as a set of components. From this point of view, the purpose of this article, which examines master's or doctoral theses based on scientific research or reviews on environmental rights and environmental law, is to show which topics the contribution of these theses to environmental studies is focused on. These are almost the first completed scientific work of a beginner researcher. Examining these contributions may also put the state of higher education processes in environmental themed studies. Undoubtedly, this study does not only include a case and content assessment. At the same time, it tries to make a critical analysis of environmental studies.

In this context, this article starts with a conceptual section that brings environmental definitions, environmental rights assessments and legal processes and some current environmental themed work issues with the support it receives from the literature. Afterwards, the findings section is included in the quotations from the theses examined. Then, the article includes the criticism of theses on the environment in the conclusion and evaluation section. With the belief that scientific knowledge will progress cumulatively, it should be emphasized that this criterion is shaped by the knowledge of academic literature.

Conceptual Frame

The concept of "environment", which is closely related to the existence of living things and forms the basis of this study, has been defined as the integrity of natural, social and cultural external factors that are effective in the development of life by the Turkish Linguistic Society [1]. In another sociological definition, "The environment, in its most general sense, is all of the external conditions that affect and are affected by human beings" [2]. The environment, which includes all these external factors, at the same time, it is an abstract concept influenced by social events.

The environment, which interacts with people, has been perceived as a problem and a concept that can be developed by people in time and has started to be discussed in a scientific way with resources such as law, economy and non-governmental organizations. For example, according to (The Black Sea Environment Association) KAÇED, one of the Non-

Governmental Organizations in Turkey that want to draw attention to the abuse of the environment, the environment has been defined as ecosystems, which are formed by all living things, the mutual and continuous relations of living things and living and non-living beings [3].

The problem of depletion of natural resources affecting the environment and its components can be caused by issues such as mutual interaction and relationships, destruction of the environment, and the problem of zoning caused by urbanization. It is possible to define environmental problems in the form of "malfunction or irregularity that hinders the functioning of the surrounding nature system in a healthy way" [1].

Environmental problems concern individuals who live with it and impose certain responsibilities and rights along with them. "Man is a social entity. But his passions can make him forget his obligations to other citizens. In this case, the legislative political and civil laws remind him of his obligations" [4].

Therefore, it is thought that it will be in the human interest to protect the environment against increasingly important environmental problems and rights and responsibilities are imposed on individuals in order to protect the environment. Examination of the rights and responsibilities regarding the environment has brought the concept of "environmental right" to the agenda.

"The subject of the right to the environment is the environment in which life takes place, its purpose is to protect and improve the environment, where human beings and all living beings maintain their lives. The right to life only makes sense in an environment in which people can develop their material and spiritual existence and live a healthy life, and therefore every threat to the environment also threatens the right to life. At this point, the right to environment can be accepted as a precondition for the right to life to be realized" [5].

The speech and classification of human rights first started in the seventeenth century, emerged with the political concerns of individuals and this led to the birth of personal, political and legal rights, which are considered as the first and first generation rights that prioritize the protection of the individual from violations of the state. The rights that arise about how people live and work together constitute the second generation rights, which are social rights, economic rights and cultural rights [6].

"Third generation human rights, also called solidarity rights, include problems that all humanity can solve if they come together, or that individual people or countries cannot overcome. In this context, the common basis of solidarity rights is the right to life for everyone living today and for future generations. By their very nature, these rights gain

meaning with the joint efforts and solidarity of individual individuals, individual communities, public and private organizations, and states” [5].

Since the subject of the fourth generation rights is not human, it is questioned whether it can be considered as human rights. The transfer of Aykul [7] follows:

“The Right to Ecosystem: It is an abstract right that expresses the right to exist, renew and improve itself, and the right subject is that ecosystem.

The Right of the Future (Unborn) Generations: An abstract right that is the next generation (unborn), which expresses the right of future generations to be born in a healthy functioning ecosystem and a world order in health, prosperity and peace, and the right subject is the next (unborn) generations. .

City (in) Right: The city, which is a phenomenon that blends buildings with health, education, safety, business life, transportation, communication, energy, water and waste systems, green texture, history, culture and art, and living and lifeless, is healthy, happy in it. It is a right that accepts the city as a whole as an abstract rights subject, together with people living in prosperity and peace, and their existing ecosystem.

This is due to the realization of the abstract and "non-human" rights that can be demanded by people during the time we are in. It is precisely for this that it should now be accepted as a fundamental and new right to humanity, with the fourth generation rights.

The right to environment, concretely stated in the Stockholm Declaration published at the United Nations Environment Conference in 1972 for the first time in the world, is not actually the subject of human rights even though it is accepted among the third generation rights and therefore it is the subject of the fourth generation rights. "The owners of the right to the environment are beneficiaries who can" demand respect "for this right, but those who have the right to live in a healthy and balanced environment are not just people" [5].

Undoubtedly, the theoretical approach of the environment goes back to the 1970s. It is important to talk about Chicago School here.

According to Wiley [8] social theory seems to work like this: Theorists select facts to fit ideas and ideas to fit facts. In this article, researchers has selected the environmental facts and has tried to fit the ideas of Chicago School especially within the ecology.

Wiley argues that, in the social sciences, a paradigm or leading theory must fit not only the facts of the discipline but also the political forces of any given time period. Politics do not change or distort the facts. But they give emphasis and priority to some issues and facts over others. He tries to show the political background of the Chicago School to have a deep

understanding of the scientific arguments. By his references, it can be said that, ecology is an issue not only scientific but also political.

According to Kaya, although the Chicago School's studies started within the concept of the problems of the Chicago City, then it spread out to all urban studies. She also argues that, it spread out not only for structure of urban but also the social effects of the urbanization on human life. Some topics were organized in the field of social work, migration studies, environment etc. For his article, the environment part of the Chicago School is important.

According to Wahl-Jorgensen [9], the Chicago School understands the community as a networked ecology.

Since the environment is a multi-disciplinary subject, environmental-themed studies can be found in different fields. It is also important to talk about examples of literature that address current topics of the environment. Sustainable development and environment relationship, environmental impact assessment, climate crisis, ecological footprint, eco anxiety are concepts that can be briefly addressed in this context. According to Lane [10] The truth is: a) global warming is driven by an incredibly insatiable need for energy; b) Global coordination does not work—transaction costs and defection; c) Country resilience is lower than many believed, as Nature has the upper hand. These points are often bypassed by natural scientists, but they can be stated clearly in the social sciences.

Protecting the environment is not generally a need, as a healthy functioning ecosystem is essential for the survival of the human race; It is a necessity [11]. Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) is one of the EU's environmental policy implementation tools, with Free Access to Environmental Pollution Information, Eco-label for Eco-Friendly Products, the LIFE Program and Environmental Audit (Eco-audit). EIA is a procedure that allows the environmental impact of these decisions to be taken into account before the decisions are made. This process includes the analysis of possible environmental impacts, their identification in the report, the public consultation about the report, the consideration of the comments and the report in question when making the final decision, and informing the public about the decision [12].

Lane [10] makes an argument about “WE” to emphasize the importance of climate crisis: “So, can “WE” stand up against global warming, with global coordination and policy-making and implementation? No, because there is behind the “WE” a great multitude of different actors with opposing interests: civil society organizations, governments, business, financial institutions, and ordinary people. Some groups in the set of humans make money on global

warming, whereas other groups loose assets. Some rise their voice, while others look the other way”.

About human influence on climate, a current article mentions coming down to one thing: what volume of carbon dioxide and other greenhouse gases is pumped into the atmosphere. This means that ramping up renewables to meet energy demand simply isn't enough. Reducing carbon emissions means making painful choices: halting new investments in the exploration and production of fossil fuels, and then closing down existing facilities. It won't be easy, but eventually that is a story that must be told [13].

“As caring professionals we cannot countenance current policies that push the world's most vulnerable towards environmental catastrophe. We are particularly alarmed by the effects of rising temperatures on health and heed predictions of societal collapse and consequent mass migration. Such collapse risks damage to physical and mental health on an unprecedented scale.” [14].

Panu [15] mentions about climate anxiety and eco-anxiety: “Climate anxiety can be a problem if it is so intense that a person may come paralyzed, but climate anxiety is not primarily a disease. Instead it is an understandable reaction to the magnitude of the environmental problems that surround us. Climate anxiety can often be an important resource as well, but this entails that a person finds, along with others, a) enough time and space to deal with their emotions and b) enough constructive activity to help mitigate climate change”.

Methodology

This study examined various aspects of the graduate thesis, which was held in Turkey in the context of Ecology.

“The decisions made at any stage of the research process are not independent from the decisions made in its early stages. In other words, as soon as the research question is clearly defined, the sample design will be partially determined” [16]. Having a question in mind is the most necessary thing to do a research. The research question of this study is how ecology is handled in Turkish social science studies. By asking such a question, it is aimed to reveal the awareness of social science studies against the concept of ecology.

This article was made by using content analysis through the master's thesis (doctorate) on ecology in social sciences. Content analysis is a technique that allows working without affecting social behavior. In the deep it means that it has no direct effect on people. It includes the collection and analysis of the content in written, visual and audio documents. “In content analysis, the universe can be limited to four basic approaches; where, when, with which vehicle and in what matter. The evaluation of the entire universe or choosing a sample from it

depends on the size of the universe, the need for generalization, and the findings such as precise, valid and reliable” [16].

In this context, in the research, a total of 47 master's and doctoral thesis studies in the context of ecology were examined. It is important to reach documented messages objectively. Thus, the data is taken from Turkey's National Thesis Center. As the data collection, some keywords are used to obtain the most suitable data for this article. Keywords "right to environment", "environmental law", "climate crisis". The search is done in Turkish and English. Theses examined in the research have been reached as a result of the joint work of the researchers, and thesis studies to be examined in consensus have been determined. In the process of analyzing the data on the mentioned theses and interpreting the findings, attention was paid to the stages of coding and category development.

The Findings

These data are collected for the study from the Higher Education Council of Turkey Thesis sharing pages are in the context of the climate crisis, environmental rights and environmental law. A content analysis has been made on these theses. Total 47 theses are examined. 4 of these theses are doctoral and 43 master's theses.

First of all, it is important to share the several coding revealed from the scans. These codes are live in harmony in nature, renewable energy, organic agriculture, gender bias, sustainable development, role of some kind of administrative sanctions/judiciary/officers, role of both local governments, environmental impact, ecological balance. It is impossible to say that each thesis has one concept at all, because these concepts are intertwined, related to each other and cannot be evaluated alone.

It is important to highlight that Turkey has its indirectly met with rights to environment with 1961 Constitution. It is argued that, the right of the environment has been constitutional assured with the statement the state is responsible for ensuring that everyone can live in physical and mental health and receive medical care.

It is seen that thesis mostly focuses on the responsibilities of authorities mention that sharing of the responsibilities and making contracts about environmental actions is a necessity:

“At the end of the study, it is possible to say that local governments alone cannot carry out adequate and necessary works in protecting and developing the right to environment. Although there are important duties of the central administration at the national level, it can be stated that they have to shift some of these duties to local administrations in order to perform them locally” (M 1, 2019).

“The differences between the national laws of the states and international law, the low number of sanctions limit the possibilities of solution. The freedoms granted by the constitutions should be guaranteed with the right to information, participation and application.” (M 12, 2011).

There are some debates about sustainable development in the thesis. Some of them see the process as a human centered.

“Sustainable development approach is built on the need to protect the environment in order to ensure sustainable development. The essential value of the environment is ignored, and the environment is wanted to be protected with a human-centered approach” (M 2, 2016).

“The precautionary principle created by the environment-centered approach of the sustainable development approach represents a different perception of human and other living creatures, between human and natural environment, the natural environment and the human environment, as well as the relationships that are inherent in the environmental integrity resulting from the interaction of these elements. To put it briefly, this understanding is the expression of the fact that despite the environmental deterioration, the economic development is unsustainable, the world does not rotate on an axis where human beings are located, and that every living and inanimate being is not positioned around human economic expectations.” (M 34, 2006).

To strengthen the idea of human centered, one of the thesis addresses the issue differently:

“Actions against the environment do not directly affect people, such as actions against life, body immunity or property, at first glance. However, while these actions directly affect the environment and its elements to which human life depends, in fact, it directly affects body integrity, right to life, property rights and other rights.” (M 17, 2007).

There are some concepts focus on the necessity of multi discipliner studies in the topic of environment.

“Law is an important instrument for the protection of the environment, but it is not sufficient alone. Environmental protection is an objective that can be achieved through interdisciplinary solidarity” (M 2, 2016).

The relation between sustainability and the education is also seen as an important in human right concepts in the thesis:

“A more effective understanding of education and training is needed to create sustainable environmental awareness in students and increase the level of awareness” (M 4, 2020).

Thesis focuses on the environment as an international issue are also found.

“The right to environment as an independent article in the ECHR will ensure a stronger defense and protection of the right on a national and international scale” (M 5, 2019)

“Finally, the international community has a high expectation of establishing a binding environmental contract. As a problem that transcends borders, the protection of environmental problems with an international mechanism will be the biggest step in the name of a solution for the environment worldwide. In this context, the establishment of an international environmental court will crown this step” (M 6, 2019)

“That the level of environmental rights in Turkey to discuss what took place over social movements reacted to the establishment of nuclear power plants. Due to the fact that environmental problems do not limit, international treaties and conventions have been accepted as a tool in environmental protection. Turkey does not take part in the Aarhus Convention which is known as Environmental Issues in Access to Information, Public Participation in Decision-Making and Judicial Application. It should be seen a major deficiency” (M 10, 2016).

“When the law of sustainable development in Climate Change and the social, economic response mechanisms to it are established; when the world of idealism that established its dynamics on the realities exhort the nations states to abandon their Real Politics, we would claim to the Future of the Earth to —Our Future” (M 25, 2008).

“While a general definition that all disciplines agree on exactly what the environment means has not yet been reached, environmental issues and effective protection of the environment have prevented the concept of the environment as the environmental problems have become more and more self-evident. As a result, it is seen that trans boundary damages are accepted as indisputable in the international arena, and the young law branch of the concept is well established in international environmental law, and important developments are experienced in issues such as preventing and eliminating damages.” (M 30, 2010).

To underline the effects of the international concepts, international NGO's are also taken serious:

“NGOs in Turkey remained at a very limited level of cooperation with other international NGOs in the fight against nuclear. Alternative energy policies sensitive to the environment and people should be adopted with rational approaches.” (M 10, 2016).

“It is a shortcoming that there is no central organization that will collect and direct all environmental studies as well as the environment is related to all aspects of life. Because the environment is an issue that remains within the working areas of almost all international organizations.” (M 29, 2018).

Public participation is also seen as important as the NGO issues in another thesis.

“There is also a close link between the principle of public participation and other international environmental law principles. As an example of this close relationship, we can give the principle of sustainable development and prevention. The fact that development can only continue in a healthy environment expresses the relationship between the role of the people in environmental protection, sustainable development and the principle of public participation. The fact that non-governmental organizations are included in the definition of people in the international environmental protection agreements that are the source of national environmental policies of the states will enable them to use environmental procedural rights that constitute the principle of participation of the public. These elements, which constitute the principle of public participation, are also called environmental procedural rights.” (M 28, 2018)

They usually highlight the importance of the awareness of the relation between capitalism and environment.

“The principle that every nation that exists in international relations keeps its own interests superior, leaves the environmental problems that are globalized and even beyond the earth unresolved. Environmental problems, which are a reflection of mental pollution despite environmental conferences, will continue to the limit that production consumption patterns threaten the dominant economic order, and then, with the conceptual screenings such as sustainable development, green economy, environmentalist economy, it is not for the continuation of the economic system of nature and human beings. workarounds will be proposed. However, atomic bombs dropped on Hiroshima and Nagasaki not only killed the environment, but also killed all humanity.” (M 5, 2019)

“It is very sad to face the fact that the steps taken for environmental protection, the methods followed for the implementation of environmental law, and the main aim in meeting environmental demands is the maintenance of the systematic structure with the target of consumption, which is the cause of environmental problems already experienced rather than environmental protection.” (M 26, 2019).

“In this context, a point of view that deserves everything with the ambition of winning will see the pollution of the environment as systemic casualties, and will prioritize the satisfaction of its own pleasure now, rather than the rights that the future generations have gained or should benefit. In which case, how and to what extent can the right to nature and environment be protected, which is the common asset of all living things, as the person who becomes over-individualized in today's dominant capitalist system always tries to maximize his own benefit

as homo-economicus and in this case the whole society is selfish in his own interest?" (M 5, 2019).

Furthermore, such as capitalism, gender is also seen as a way of social inequality in the environmental issues.

"The climate crisis is a problem that affects the whole world and its roots are based on unequal social relations. The climate crisis, which is shaped on the basis of social injustice, is not a gender neutral crisis considering the different needs of women and men. Especially women in poor and developing countries, which make a living from natural resources, are affected more disproportionately from the crisis and their capacity to cope with the crisis faces social, economic and even political barriers." (D 4, 2019).

There is also one thesis highlighting the importance of sustainability not in the concept of capitalism but also in ecological awareness.

"In this study, the concept of "eco-village", which offers an alternative to sustainable living spaces, is discussed. Eco-villages are living spaces where people live in harmony with nature, use renewable energy, make organic agriculture, and have social relations with people." (M 44, 2019).

For protection of the environment, there are some national legal rules in most countries. Some thesis gets these rules as a hope while some other thesis focuses on the environmental law of Turkey and claims it is not sufficient:

"However, if we say it with a hopeful approach towards the future, it should be considered as an important development for the beginning to organize the acts of causing zoning pollution as a crime in the Turkish Criminal Code, even though it is limited to unlicensed or unlicensed construction" (M 15, 2008).

"Environmental law is one of the searches for a solution to increasing environmental problems...Ensuring the effectiveness and increasing the effectiveness of administrative sanctions will be possible with the administration's frequent enforcement activities. If a violation is detected while conducting an audit, sanction decisions should be made and implemented in a uniform manner without any hesitation." (M 26, 2019).

"Addressing environmental protection in the context of administrative law and taking measures with legislation for protection did not work... The applicability of the criminal law norms protecting the environment passes through the awareness of individuals on this issue. Because, in environmental crimes, damage often does not occur immediately, as in traditional crimes, and this prevents many times the importance given to them." (M 8, 2016).

“In addition, it was concluded that environmental legislation could not be applied due to reasons such as confusion between institutions, weak sensitivity of the people to the environment and inadequate enforcement power of laws.” (M 35, 2006).

“It is difficult to say that measures and sanctions are often effective. As a matter of fact, sometimes the administration appears as a polluter.” (M 17, 2007).

There is also a thesis focusing on another country’s environmental law. It has similar finding with Turkey’s environmental law.

“Existing legal mechanisms are insufficient to protect the environment. The Malawi legal system largely uses criminal sanctions as a default method to protect the environment. Criminal sanctions play an important role in trying to protect the environment. However, these criminal sanctions are not flexible enough to deal with any environmental crime. The solution to having effective environmental protection is to bring administrative sanctions as an alternative to criminal sanctions. Violating environmental law is generally not considered a moral mistake and "real" crimes are prioritized.” (M 27, 2019).

Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) is also evaluated in some thesis:

“Thanks to the "Environmental Impact Assessment", which is a reflection of the "prevention principle" in environmental law, environmental pollution has been tackled before it is born. The “Environmental Impact Assessment”, which serves to ensure the right to the environment by enabling people to live in a healthy environment, also serves the purposes of natural law, environmental ethics, religions and basic international texts related to the environment.” (M 11, 2011).

“Environmental impact assessment, for example, is perhaps the most well-known and studied environmental information gathering technique and is a view of the prevention principle and the precautionary principle that requires action before environmental damage occurs. Environmental information collection, distribution, analysis systems should be established and specialists should be trained to ensure the operation of these systems.” (M 32, 2009).

“EIA, which reconciles the economy and the environment through law, has fulfilled the purpose of environmental law to the extent that it can shift its hand towards maximum protection of the environment, that is, it has been effective. Only in this way can the EIA procedure be considered a tool that can be used in favor of the environment. Apart from this, although an approach is suitable for the technical dimension, function or setup of the EIA, it will not function other than a minimum contribution to the purpose of environmental protection.” (D 2, 2007).

Table 1. Gender Distribution of Master/Doctoral Thesis Writers

Sex/degree	Master	Doctoral
Women	20	3
Men	23	1
Total	43	4

Source: <https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/>

Table 2. Distribution of Master/Doctoral Theses by years

Years	Number of thesis
2020	1
2010-2019	20
2000-2009	12
1990-1999	13
(Older)-1989	1
Total	47

Source: <https://tez.yok.gov.tr/UlusalTezMerkezi/>

Discussion and Results

Environment really matters! It should be seen as the real agenda. One of the important reports about the environment is the Brundtland Report: “The Brundtland (Our Common Future) Report, prepared in 1987 with a group from around the world, addresses the interrelationship of the environment and economic problems, and clearly highlights the link between the protection of the environment and development, which is also among the new generation rights. Proposing that the current connection should be a universal solution in order to protect the rights of present and future generations, the concept of sustainable development is defined as “ensuring the needs of the present generation and the rights of future generations to meet their own needs” [17]. This article tries to make the environment the real agenda.

This article analyzes the content of master-doctorate thesis written about the environment in Turkey. The keywords used in the analysis are environmental law, environmental right and climate crisis. The importance of this study is to see how the environment takes place in academic research at higher education level.

At the end of the study, data on the issues addressed while working on the environment were obtained. These data include:

- Environmental issue should take place in the field of national and international law,
- The number of civil actors working on the environment should be increased,

- Everyone working on the environment and every institution should have common roofs,
- Multidisciplinary studies should be agreed on the environment,
- It should be accepted that the environment cannot be discussed separately from class and gender relations,
- Environmental education should be included in national education curricula,
- The environmental impact assessment should be included in the discussions.

Therefore, this study provided the opportunity to see the issues that should not be ignored while working on the environment.

As Conrad and Barker [18] have pointed out any policy response to a problem is determined by how the problem is defined in the first place. There may not be universally agreed-upon definition of environment. Due to diversity of experience of environment, all these experiences are exactly needed to be taken universally. Surely, there are lots of ways to be in universal, but for this essay to be online open access is seen as an extremely important way and necessity.

First of all, the importance of discussing the environment in micro and macro dimensions should be mentioned based on the data of this article and the literature. The environment should be considered as a process and structure that should be handled with universal principles, taking into account the social, economic and cultural characteristics of small geographical regions. Cultural meaning of the environment can not be denied. Therefore, researches regarding to social construction and cultural meaning of environment are needed to be allowed and possible to study. Therefore, the concept of boundary in the environment is both present and absent.

Secondly, as mentioned before, this research is an online content analysis. It is very important in this respect that theses examined during the research are available online. The fact that the theses examined before the study were not accessible online, especially before 2000, caused the data to be used from them to be insufficient. The research was carried out in a pandemic process in which face-to-face communication between people became almost impossible or access to printed texts became absolutely impossible. In any study, the need to access accessible texts was felt deeply in this process. The fact that the study is about the environment adds a special importance to the increase of onlineization. Although most of the theses reviewed are related to national environmental law, the emphasis is placed on the fact that no rights or laws can remain purely regional / national when it comes to the environment. For this reason, it is significant to make any work on this subject easily accessible in the

universal field. Due to diversity of experience of environment, all these experiences are exactly needed to be taken universally. Surely, there are lots of ways to be in universal, but for this essay to be online open access is seen as an extremely important way and necessity.

Thirdly, it is important to discuss in detail the issue of any environmental work not from a single discipline. The right to the environment is undoubtedly a matter to be addressed from the legal background. However, it is critical to evaluate the conditions for the creation and acquisition of this right in more than one area, from rural-urban studies to architecture, from public policies to all living and inanimate, to management programs, from politics to sociology, from physics to philosophy. For this reason, it is essential that a multidisciplinary perspective is always kept in the pocket and accepted as a starting point. The fact that the academic theses examined within the scope of this research have been carried out by academicians from different fields and that they are very close to each other in terms of content is an indicator of many disciplines.

Fourthly, undoubtedly, the discussion of ecology without addressing capitalist relations and class inequalities can result in an incomplete assessment of the issue. There can be no endless growth in the limited resource world. It is about political ecology in this regard. More economic freedom requires more development, it is important not to ignore its negative effects on the environment. Capitalism is incompatible with environmentalism. Moreover, it refuses to cover environmental policies for the environment. By doing this, it also struggles with the idea of equality.

The fifth case to mention is that any research, regardless of its subject, should be methodologically constructed gender-sensitive. Only one study that conducted the discussion of gender and ecology together was found among the theses examined within the scope of this research. Neither methodological fiction of any other thesis nor gender sensitivity was found in its content. However, the unequal situation created by climate crises in the social sphere continues its effectiveness when it comes to gender.

A target audience defined for the environmental right cannot be mentioned. The interlocutors of the environment are all actors who share it personally and publicly. This is a cycle. These actors cannot be separated as human or non-human and they are not separated from each other by criteria such as class, culture, gender or age. In this context, it should be remembered that there are many children who break the belief that the environment is not related to children. Equipping the education system, which is one of the social systems in which children are in this order, with the right to the environment, will also ensure the purification of the environment from the age hierarchy. The results of this study are that the education system

becomes environmentally sensitive, educational materials prioritize the environment, and the right to environment is a part of the curriculum.

Another important part of the study is about the environmental impact assessment. The importance of environmental impact assessment is undeniable as a system that is based on reporting the environmental impacts of the projects planned to be realized. It is important to redefine the impact and use area of environmental impact assessment and to ultra-professionalize the EIA team. There are also many trending topics that are not included in the theses examined within the scope of this study, but which the literature on the environment touches on. In addition to themes such as age, gender, class, it can be suggested that studies on environmental actors' relation to eco-anxiety become thesis topics. Discussing the consequences of turning the environment into a cause of concern is seen as a legal and political issue as well as psycho-social.

It is essential to say that the fact that a significant part of this study was prepared in the pandemic process affecting the world was effective in determining the content and discussion points of the study. It should be underlined that academic discussions are context dependent. In addition, this study aimed to address an environmental debate that has evolved from the Chicago School's urban field research to political ecology. It is hoped that this goal will contribute to research on environmental rights.

References

1. <https://sozluk.gov.tr/>, 10.09.2020.
2. Olgun, H., Işık, V. (2017). Environmental Rights As Human Rights And Its Place In Turkish Law
3. <http://www.kaced.org/tr/insan-haklari.html?sayfa=447>, 10.09.2020.
4. Göçmen, D. (2018). What is the law? What kind of system is law?, *Genç Hukukçular Topluluğu Konferansı*, https://www.academia.edu/38810329/Hak_Nedir_Hukuk_Nas%C4%B1l_Bir_Sistemdir
5. Dadak, K. (2015). The Environmental Right As a New Generation Right. *Uyuşmazlık Mahkemesi Dergisi*.
6. The evolution of the human rights, *Bilgi Üniversitesi İnsan Hakları Merkezi*, https://insanhaklarimerkezi.bilgi.edu.tr/media/uploads/2015/08/14/pusula_bolum4_insanhaklarininevrimi_istanbulbilgiuniversitesiyayinlari.pdf

7. Aykul, Ö. (2017). Fourth generation rights or sustainable living rights, <http://ekoIQ.com/2017/11/06/dördüncü-kuşak-haklar-ya-da-sürdürülebilir-yaşam-haklari/>
8. Wiley, Norbert. (2011). The Chicago School: A Political Interpretation. Blue Ribbon Papers: Interactionism: The Emerging Landscape Studies in Symbolic Interaction
9. Wahl-Jorgensen, K. (2016). The Chicago School and Ecology: A Reappraisal for the Digital Era. *American Behavioral Scientist*.
10. Lane, Jen-Erik. (2018). Climate Crisis And The “We”: An Essay in Deconstruction. *Journal of Economics and Public Finance* ISSN 2377-1038 (Print) ISSN 2377-1046 (Online) Vol. 4, No. 3, (Pp. 208-222). www.scholink.org/ojs/index.php/jep
11. Özsoy, E., Dinç, A. (2016). Sustainable Development and Ecological Footprint. *Finans Politik ve Ekonomik Yorumlar*. 53/619. Pp. (35-55).
12. Ökmen, M., Demir, F. (2015). Participants Environmental Impact Assessment And Usak Province Representative in Turkey, *Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 27. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/dpusbe/issue/4769/65614>
13. Climate talks are not enough. Editorial. *Nature*, (2018). <https://www.nature.com/articles/d41586-018-04925-4>. Updated. 4.4.2020.
14. Doctors against climate catastrophe. *The Guardian* <https://www.theguardian.com/environment/2019/jun/27/doctors-against-climate-catastrophe>.
15. Panu, P. (2019). Climate Anxiety. Helsinki: MIELI Mental Health Finland.
16. Koçak, A. Arun, Ö. (2006). Sampling Problem in Content Analysis Studies. *Selçuk İletişim Dergisi*, 4, 3. (Pp. 21-28).
17. Aksu, C. (2011). Sustainable Development and the Environment. http://cevre.mf.duzce.edu.tr/Dokumanlar/cevre_mf/Dosyalar/SÜRDÜRÜLEBİLİR%20Kalkınma%20ve%20Çevre.pdf
18. Conrad P., Barker KK. (2010). The social construction of illness: key insights and policy implications. *J Health Soc Behav*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022146510383495>

Thesis

Açıkalm, N. (2004). Sustainable development-The rule of volunteer organisations in the application of the right of environment

Akaltun, E. (1994). The functionality of environmental rights (evaluation of Turkey)

Akıncı, M. (1994). The development of environmental law in Turkey, adequacy and effectiveness

- Aksoy, S. (1999). Environmental law in European Community and Turkey
- Bektaş, V. (1995). Contribution of the administrative judiciary in the development of Environmental Law
- Belen, B. (2020). Determination of the knowledge, attitude and behavior of secondary school students about sustainable environment
- Binali, A. (2008). The sustainable development in International Law International Environmental Law on climate change
- Bozkurt, E. (2019). Comparison of Istanbul and Berlin within the scope of the right to environment
- Bulut, A. E. (2019). Administrative sanctions in Turkish Environmental Law
- Ceyhan, H. (2019). Iranian implementation in Lake Urmia within the frame of environmental rights
- Ceyhan, İ. (2008). The protection of the right to environment in the Turkish Penal Code with no: 5237 (Crimes against environment)
- Civanoğlu, A. (2006). The precautionary principle of Environmental Law
- Dabak, F. N. (1998). Protection of cultural and natural assets in Turkish Environmental Law
- Demiral, O. (2011). Right to environment as a human right
- Eldelekli, B. (2011). Environmental rights from Environmental Law perspective
- Elevli, Ö. (2019). The relationship between growth and environmental right in the light of case examples of The European Court of Human Rights: An examination for the period of 2000-2012
- Ersoy, A. (1992). Protection of the right to the environment in the socio-economic decisions of political governments
- Ertan, B. (1991). The development of environmental rights in Turkey
- Ertürk, C. (2018). Public participation in international environmental law principles and reflection in national law
- Güleç, H. B. (1995). The powers and responsibilities of the civilian administration in Environmental Law
- Güneş, Ş. (2000). New trends in international environmental law; Black sea environmental program
- Gürpınar, E. (1988). The concept of "ecological balance" in environmental law and protection of this balance
- Kayan, R. B. G. (2007). Environmental right and crimes against the environment in Turkish criminal code

- Kovancı, E. (2019). Climate crisis in the context of gender discussion and Turkey
- Marşoğlu, H. A. (2019). Investigation of Ithaca eco-village according to sustainable design criteria in the framework of climate crisis
- May, E. S. (1997). Subsidiarity and shared responsibility for European Community Environmental Law
- Mutlu, L. (2011). Environmental rights and environmental impact assessment
- Nagiyeva, A. (2001). Environmental rights according to the solution of problems caused by urban land unearned income
- Onuk, N. B. (2007). The development of the European Union's Environmental Law
- Özbudun, A. (2009). Environmental information in International Environmental Law
- Özdek, E. Y. (1992). The right to environment
- Phiri, J. R. (2019). Effectiveness of environmental law in Malawi: The use of administrative sanctions in environmental protection
- Saygılı, A. (2007). Environmental impact assessment in environmental law
- Semiz, Y. (2016). The right to environment and the approach of European Court of Human Rights to the right to environment,
- Sürmeli, İ. (2016). Anti nuclear movements in Turkey within the axis of environmental right
- Tangör, N. B. (2006). Functionality of environmental law: The case of Mersin
- Tansu K. S. (2009). Environmental right and the role of local governments the protection of environmental right in Turkey
- Taş U. E. (2016). Exploring secondary school students' mental models of 'both the natural and artificial environment
- Taştekin, An. (1999). The Right of Environmental
- Tokuçoğlu, M. B. (1991). Environmental Law in terms of service defect
- Topçuoğlu, M. (1995). Environmental right and judicial protection in terms of freedom of private enterprise
- Turpancı, A. (2018). Role of international organizations on development of Environmental Law
- Tursun, D. D. (2010). Environment and environmental right in council of state decrees
- Yağlı, A. (2007). Bergama-Ovacık gold mine right to the environment-administrative responsibility
- Yavuz, Y. (2016). Intentional or negligent offences against environment under the Turkish Penal Code no 5237 in the context of right to environment

Zilic, L. (2018). The right to a clean and healthy environment in the jurisprudence of European Court of Human Rights and European Court of Justice