| Research Article / Araştırma Makalesi|

A Latent Native Speakerism in ELT in the Private Sector in Turkey: A small scale content analysis

Türkiye'de Özel Sektörde İngilizce Öğretiminde Gizil Bir Anadil Konuşuru Yönelimi: Küçük ölçekli bir içerik analizi

Züleyha Ünlü[1]

Abstract

Purpose: The doubling share of private education institutions in the education sector between 2010 and 2017 reveals that these institutions also have a determining effect in the field of teacher training. This study aimed at examining the English language teacher employment approaches of private education institutions through job postings and understanding the approaches to the identities of the English language teachers to be employed in these institutions.

Design/Methodology/Approach: This qualitative study examining 141 online job postings by private educational institutions in Turkey utilized the principles of content analysis. The job postings reviewed are to employ the English language teachers.

Findings: The study showed that the native speaker orientation in the employment of the English language teachers in the private sector persists at different layers as traditional native speakerism (first layer) and latent native speakerism (second layer). In light of the findings, this study showed that the English language teachers whose native language is not English are perceived in a secondary position despite the pluralism and diversity in the field.

Highlights: Native speakerism in the Turkish private sector existed in two layers. At Layer 1, latent native speakerism, a new form of native speakerism, was found. Although latent native speakerism foregrounded traditional native-speakerism, it disguised this orientation in the so-called expertise-oriented requirements. This layer is directly visible and a hidden version of the traditional native speakerism. At Layer 2, which is the source and the sub-layer of Layer 1, the presence of traditional native speakerism was found to persist. The findings are important in showing that with the rise of neoliberal educational policies, thus the increasing share of the private educational sectors, further studies are needed to reveal how the dichotomy can be overcome via a potential collaboration between teacher training programs, policymakers, and stakeholders.

Öz

Çalışmanın amacı: Özel eğitim kurumlarının, 2010-2017 yılları arasında eğitim sektöründeki payını ikiye katlaması, öğretmen yetiştirme alanında bu kurumların da yön verici bir etkiye sahip olduğunu ortaya koymaktadır. Bu çalışmada, özel eğitim kurumlarının İngilizce Öğretmeni istihdamı yaklaşımlarının iş ilanları aracılığıyla incelenmesi ve bu kurumlarda istihdam edilecek İngilizce öğretmenlerinin kimliklerine yönelik yaklaşımlarının anlaşılması amaçlanmıştır.

Materyal ve Yöntem: Nitel desenli bu çalışmada, Türkiye'de iş ilanı sitelerinde yayınlanan 141 iş ilanı üzerinde içerik analizi yapılmıştır. İncelenen iş ilanları, çeşitli özel kurumlarda istihdam edilecek İngilizce öğretmenlerine yönelik ilanlardır. İncelenen iş ilanları, çeşitli çevrim içi platformlardan elde edilmiştir.

Bulgular: Çalışma, İngilizce öğretmenlerinin özel sektörde istihdamında anadil konuşuru yöneliminin, gizil anadil konuşuru (birinci katman) ve geleneksel anadil konuşuru (ikinci katman) olarak farklı katmanlarda hala sürdüğünü göstermiştir. Bulgular ışığında, bu çalışma anadili İngilizce olmayan İngilizce öğretmenlerinin alandaki çoğulculuk ve çeşitliliğe rağmen ikincil konumda algılandığını göstermiştir.

Önemli Vurgular: Türkiye'de özel eğitim sektöründe anadil konuşuru yönelimi iki katmanda ortaya çıkmıştır. 1. Katmanda, Geleneksel anadil konuşuru yöneliminin yeni bir biçimi olan gizil anadil konuşuru yönelimi gözlemlenmiştir. Gizil anadil konuşuru yönelimi, geleneksel anadil konuşurunu öne çıkarsa da sözde uzmanlık odaklı gereksinimlerle bu yönelimi kamufle etmektedir. Bu katman, doğrudan gözlemlenebilen katmandır ve geleneksel anadil konuşuru yöneliminin örtülü bir halidir. 1. Katmanın besleyicisi ve alt katmanı olan 2. Katmanda ise geleneksel anadil konuşuru yönelimi varlığı tespit edilmiştir. Bulgular, neoliberal eğitim politikalarının ivme kazanması ve dolayısıyla özel eğitim sektörünün büyümesiyle birlikte, öğretmen yetiştirme programları, politika yapıcılar ve paydaşlar arasında potansiyel bir iş birliği yoluyla ikilemin nasıl aşılabileceğini ortaya çıkarmak için daha fazla çalışmaya ihtiyaç olduğunu göstermesi açısından önemlidir.

[1] Züleyha Ünlü, Tokat Gaziosmanpaşa University, Faculty of Science and Letters, Western Languages and Literatures Department, Tokat, TURKEY
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9119-7042

INTRODUCTION

Native speakerism/culturism was first coined by Holliday (2005) to define the ideology that prioritizes 'so-called native speakers' and their cultures as the ultimate model to teach the English language. Later, the concept of native versus non-native speaker has frequently been examined by various studies in the literature in the English language teaching field. However, few studies examined the relationship between neoliberal economic policies and their reflections on native speakerism in Turkey. Therefore, this paper reveals the lines of debate about the issue and presents the current understanding while also revealing findings from small-scale data to indicate that the dichotomy has been changing towards a 'latent native speakerism', a new form of traditional native speakerism, as a result of neoliberal educational practices.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Neoliberalism is defined in various ways; however, the majority of the scholars stated that 'neoliberals strive to extend market principles to all social spheres' (Perisic, 2021, p. 3). Additionally, the logic behind neoliberalism is the government resemblance to a corporation, which necessitates that 'its priorities should also be those of a corporation: efficiency, productivity, and growth' (Perisic, 2021, p. 4). This economy-oriented principle of neoliberalism has re-defined 'human beings and their environments' as 'mere capital' (Clymer, Alghazo, Naimi, & Zidan, 2020, p. 211). More specifically, ''homo oeconomicus'' has emerged with an orientation towards participating in the market competition via its continuously developing portfolio (Brown, 2015; as cited in Clymer, Alghazo, Naimi, & Zidan, 2020, p. 211).

In addition to its impact on the perceptions of humans in society, neoliberalism has shaped how education is conducted across the world via the marketisation of education. The reflections of neoliberalism on education have been observed in three major ways: a) selling services to schools, b) selling services within schools, and c) selling the schools (Bayram, 2017; Hirrt, 2007). It is obvious that the marketing of education has consequently re-defined the roles of all participants of education. Students have been set as ''consumers rather than learners'' (Desierto & De Maio, 2020, p. 148). Similarly, ''teachers are considered as economic units who can be dispensed with at short notice to maintain profit margins'' (Barnes & Kniest, 2019; as cited in Desierto & De Maio, 2020, p. 148). This situation, as a result, has led teachers to ''work towards particular types of professional practice based on trends and standards generated by global and domestic institutions'' without reflecting on global inequalities (Çiftçi & Karaman, 2021, p. 18). In terms of the native speaker versus non-native speaker debates, neoliberalism has presented itself via language ideologies that label languages as 'foreign language' in different contexts (Bacon & Kim, 2018). These labels assume that the recruitment of 'native speaker' teachers is a necessity as the underlying agenda is marketable education (Bacon & Kim, 2018).

In the field of English language teaching, the use of such labels, however, sparked long-term arguments that problematised these labels. One major argument against native speakerism has been about who to be defined as a native speaker. For example, finding the criteria unclear, Liu (1999), Rampton (1990), and Jin (2005) defined this labelling as inadequate and misleading. Rampton (1990) also explained that these labels are more focused on the biological origins of a person rather than the sociological aspect and make the mistake of reducing the language to a criterion for social identification, forgetting its communicative role. Similar concerns were raised by Singh (1998) who claimed the label was based on nationality, and by Kubota and Lin (2006) who claimed that the label was based on the ethnic background rather than linguistic proficiency. Lowe and Lawrence (2018, p. 163) underlined that the label is 'a socially constructed category that is applied to a wide range of political, social and cultural traits.'. Davies (2003, p. 8) also highlighted that the term itself contains racist assumptions that could lead to the exclusion of 'speakers of certain varieties of a language or highly proficient non-native speakers.'. Likewise, Holliday (2018) defined native speakerism/culturism as racist for two reasons: First, native speakerism assigns certain ways of behaving to people, which is accepted racist in critical sociology. Second, the marketing of native speakerism leads to an implicit association of native-speaker teachers with 'whiteness', categorising 'non-white teachers who have spoken English from birth either implicitly or explicitly as non-white' (p. 2). Likewise, Çelik (2006) suggested that identifying a person as a native speaker of a language does not necessarily create the natural ability to use that language. Parallel to these statements, Menard-Warwick (2008) argued that these labels overlook the cultural, intercultural, national and international identities of teachers of English.

Other studies highlighted that native speaker-oriented attitudes may lead to problems in practice (Mackenzie, 2020). From the perspectives of teachers, for example, Liu (1999) claimed that being a native speaker of a language did not necessarily show whether a teacher could meet the linguistic and cultural demands of her/his learners. Similarly, by creating the illusion that the most efficient language teacher is a native speaker of English, this dichotomy downgrades the non-native English speakers to a secondary position, which might negatively influence their performance (Çelik, 2006), and lead to the ''internalization of the superiority of the native counterparts'' by some non-native speaker language teachers, and an 'imposter syndrome' according to other scholars (Bernat, 2009, p. 1; Mackenzie, 2020, p. 5). Holliday (2018, p. 1) also stated that ''The Othering of teachers who are labelled 'non-native speakers' result in a cultural disbelief, not believing in their ability to teach English''. Parallel to these arguments, others claimed that the labelling may lead to 'self-discrimination' (Reves & Medyges, 1994), described as ''being overly self-conscious towards language usage errors'' (Lowe & Pinner, 2016, p. 42).

Several suggestions have also been made to leave the native/ non-native labelling. For example, TESOL International Association[2] and BAAL[3] have banned the use of 'native speaker' label (Holliday, 2018). Likewise, Blair (2015, p. 99) recommended removing the ''nativeness, ownership, and idealised pedagogical standards.''. Others highlighted modelling bilingual or multilingual speakers as the target instead of 'native speakers' (Pakir, 2009). Finally, several scholars recommended ''native speaker English should no longer inform educational materials and learning strategies, and should instead promote global and local cultures in ELT content'' (Baker, 2012; McKay, 2002; as cited in Boonsuk & Ambele, 2019). Clymer, Alghazo, Naimi and Zidan (2020) also suggested that more attention be paid to raising learners' awareness about the issue.

However, with the rise of neoliberalism, despite this long-term problematisation of native speakerism/culturism, studies show that the dichotomy continues to exist. Examining the issue from students' perspectives on CALL, for example, Clymer, Alghazo, Naimi and Zidan (2020, p. 209) found that the majority of the student participants ''deeply internalised the logic of neoliberalism'' and carried ''native-speakerist/culturist perceptions.'' More specifically, their findings indicated that students displayed ideas representing an 'Anglophone neoliberal order' where US or British cultures are the norm to be learnt. Others examined the issue from the perspective of recruiters. Rivers (2016) indicated that various terms including 'native speaker, near-native, or native level' are still persistent to indicate the expected level of language across the job advertisements. The study conducted by Kiczkowiak (2020) on the attitudes of recruiters also highlighted how the recruiters still regarded being a native speaker as an important criterion. Mackenzie (2020) also examined the job ads in Colombia and found that nearly half of the 95 job ads contained discrimination. Others (Mahboob & Golden, 2013; Ruecker & Ives, 2015; Selvi, 2010) also showed that the term native speaker appeared among the recruitment criteria in the job advertisements they examined. Regarding the tendency to prefer native speaker English language teachers over non-native English language teachers, Floris and Renandya (2020, p. 5) argued that ''discriminatory attitudes and practices continue to exist to please parents and students and to secure businesses.''

In the context of Turkey, neoliberalisation of education meant more privatisation across educational institutions. In the review study conducted by Bayram (2017), for example, it was found that the number of private schools in Turkey almost doubled between 2010 and 2017, which was one of the consequences of neoliberal educational policies. The increase in the privatisation of educational institutions also has implications for the debates on native versus non-native speaker language teachers' dichotomy. Focusing on the issue in Turkey, Tezgiden-Çakçak (2019, p. 1) coined the concept of 'pseudo-native speakerism' and indicated that private schools in Turkey ''present local non-native English-speaking teachers with high linguistic capital as native English-speaking teachers.'' Furthermore, Tezgidan-Çakçak (2019, p. 1) found that local English language teachers were asked to ''lie about their personal and linguistic backgrounds and to behave as if they are monolingual'' English language speakers. Other studies focusing on native speakerism across job advertisements in the Turkish educational context also exist. For example, Selvi (2010) examined job announcements from various sources around the world including Turkey, and found that 60.5% of job announcements required native speakers and displayed multifaceted discriminatory hiring practices. Similarly, Yaman and Şahin (2019, p. 5) analyzed 173 job advertisements in Turkey to reveal the ''details concerning the employment of English language teachers by the private sector in Turkey''. The results indicated that only 34 of the job advertisements required native speaker English language teachers. The same study found that the examined job advertisements had requirements about having a degree or certificate as well as other special requirements (e.g., holding a Master's degree). Notwithstanding being important in terms of revealing the tendency towards native speakerism, the study by Yaman and Şahin (2019) did not prioritize understanding how native speakerism emerged in job advertisements. Likewise, although the studies by Selvi (2010), Tezgiden-Çakçak (2019), and Yaman and Şahin (2019) enabled a closer look at the issue of native speakerism in Turkey, and job advertisements, they did not evaluate the findings in the light of neoliberalism. Additionally, as has been stated by Selvi (2021, p. 63), the research on native speakerism in Turkey ''is still in its infancy in many ways''. This is because the majority of the existing studies ''are conceptualized within a relatively outdated view on the teachers' professional identity, lacking theoretical depth and methodological rigor, adopting a rather fixated approach in instrumentation, and investigating the same stakeholders (i.e., teachers and students)'' (Selvi, 2021, p. 63). Thus, in an attempt to present a fresh conceptual perspective towards the issue, this study is the first to examine how native speakerism across job announcements in Turkey relates to neoliberalism. To this end, focusing the issue from the perspective of the English language teacher recruitment practices in Turkey, with the increased privatisation of education, the study collected data from major job ads websites in Turkey to answer the following research question via content analysis:

a) What requirements are presented for the English language teachers in job announcements published between February 2021 and May 2021 in Turkey?

METHOD/MATERIALS

This qualitative study was conducted on job advertisements in Turkey. The job advertisements were collected from the major job-hunting websites in two phases: February 2021 Phase and May 2021 Phase.

These job advertisements were for native speaker English language teachers to work in Turkey. In February, 64 advertisements for native speaker language teachers from various websites were collected to be analysed. The websites were Yenibiriş, Kariyer.net, Indeed, Linkedin, Sahibinden.com, Superproof.com, and CareerJet. These websites were selected since they were the

2 Teaching English to the Speakers of Other Languages International Association
3 British Association for Applied Linguistics

only ones with published job announcements for native speaker English language teachers. Other major job-hunting websites were also examined; however, they did not contain any announcements for native speaker English language teachers to work in Turkey at the time of the study. In May, the second round of data collection was conducted across the same major job-hunting websites. 77 advertisements for native speaker language teachers were gathered for analysis.

Qualitative content analysis (Bowen, 2004) was conducted on the job announcements. The content analysis was completed through the stages of ''skimming (superficial examination), reading (thorough examination) and interpretation'' (Bowen, 2004, p. 32). Once the analysis was completed, themes across the job ads were established. These themes were later ''edited, re-organised, and grouped together'' to better show the relationship between them (Boonsuk & Ambele, 2019, p. 3).

Also, Taguette, a computer-assisted qualitative data analysis software, was utilised to conduct the data analysis, which facilitated the whole procedure.

In terms of the credibility and dependability of the themes that emerged via the analysis, the study followed the strategies recommended by Lincoln and Guba (1985). Two of these strategies are prolonged engagement and peer debriefing. Prolonged engagement is defined as ''spending sufficient time in the field to learn the culture, test for misinformation provided the distortions'' (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 301). In this study, prolonged engagement was achieved through the fact that the study was conducted in two phases: Phase I being in February, and Phase II being in May. Prolonged engagement helped the researcher increase the range and number of the data, which led to the establishment of logical links between the data and the codings (Ünlü, 2015).

The second strategy to ensure credibility and dependability was peer debriefing. Peer debriefing is defined as ''the process of exposing oneself to a disinterested peer in a manner paralleling an analytic session and for the purpose of exploring aspects of the inquiry that might otherwise remain only implicit within the inquirer's mind'' (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 308). In this study, sharing the analysis and the codes with colleagues, experts in qualitative research, ''provided a check against biases within the analysis'' (Barber & Walczak, 2009, p. 6).

FINDINGS

Stage 1: Skimming, Reading and Creating Themes

The analysis of job advertisements presented findings to understand the current status of native speakerism. Accordingly, the content analysis showed that the job advertisements published in Turkey consisted of two major parts: a) Prioritization of native speaker English language teachers, b) Balancing the call with professional and personal qualities.

In the part, Prioritization of native speaker English language teachers, job advertisements described their needs for language teachers while also attempting to define who would be a native speaker (e.g., Job Ad#1). However, these sections displayed an ambiguous view of native speakers. Likewise, a Westernized perception of native speakers was observed in the advertisements, which indicated a discriminating perception (Job Ads#1, 2, 3, 4). Examples of these are presented below:

Table 1. Descriptions of Native Speaker English Language Teachers in Job Advertisements

Job Advertisements	Descriptions
1	United States of America to be citizen, Canada to be citizen and European countries citizen
2	''European / Native English-Speaking Countries, or the ones speak with a clear and distinct accent.''
3	''Native English speakers from English-speaking countries'' ''Uk/Usa/Australian/ Canadian citizenship''
4	''For native instructor, British or American accent is required''
5	''We are seeking for native speaker English teachers who would like to work part time at our schools''
6	''A native speaker of English''
7	''Native speaker of English''
8	''We urgently need native speakers.
9	''Native English Teachers will be recruited.''
10	''Native Level English A MUST''
11	''Native speaker teachers''
12	''Native English Speaker; American, Canadian, British, Australian or New Zealander''

In the second part, Balancing attempts with professional and personal qualities, the job advertisements presented other requirements from the candidates, mostly highlighting the level of expected expertise from the candidates. The table below details how job advertisements balanced their prioritisation of native speakers with additional requirements about level of educations, having additional certificates, and so forth. Each theme is further explicated after the Table 2.

Table 2. Balancing Attempts with Professional and Personal Qualities

Professional Qualities	Personal Qualities
Level of education (n=82)	
Having certificates (n=64)	Interpersonal Relations (n=10)
Knowledge about technological tools (n=14)	Result oriented (n=32)
Pedagogical Training (n=16)	Having ease with adapting to different cultures (n=31)
Teaching Experience(n=24)	

Expected professional qualities were found to be level of education, having certificates, knowledge about technological tools, pedagogical training, and teaching experience. Regarding the level of education, a university degree in a foreign language teaching area, or at least having BA in an English-related area was requested. It was found that MA, MS or PhD degrees were also stated as acceptable degrees. In several advertisements, candidates who are students, or graduates of BA, MA, MS, or PhD degrees were also invited. The job advertisements also necessitated having a certificate in CELTA, DELTA, TEFL, or TESOL[4]. The third quality was knowledge about technological tools. Although the advertisements did not specify what these skills were, candidates with a strong background in utilizing technology for academic, and administrative purposes, or with knowledge about educational technologies were preferred. Another professional quality was pedagogical training. The advertisements usually stated that candidates should have either pedagogical training or a certificate in CELTA, DELTA, TEFL, or TESOL. Finally, having at least 2 years of experience was listed among professional qualities. Depending on the type of the advertising institute, an experience with exam preparation (e.g., TOEFL or IELTS), or a specific learner group (e.g., preschooler, adults) was also specified.

As for personal qualities, these included interpersonal relations, being result oriented, and adaptation to different cultures. Interpersonal relations included good communication and teamwork skills. The qualities of being result-oriented or having ease with adapting to different cultures were frequently listed on the job advertisements; however, no details on these qualities were presented.

Stage 2: Relating and Interpretation of the Themes

As this stage, the researcher attempted to relate the emerging themes with each other to better display the relationship among them. In the end, two layers, Layer 1 and Layer 2, were established to describe the current attitudes towards native speakerism. Layer 1, also defined as traditional native-speakerism, showed native speakers as the ideal for language learners. It is traditional in the sense that the 'native speakerism' at Layer 1 protected its features that existed for a long time without any change. For example, that job ads listed specific countries reflected traditional native speakerism, which attributed the ownership of the English language to specific countries.

As for Layer 2, also described as latent native speakerism, a cautious approach towards the dichotomy was displayed while creating a new discourse about native speakerism. At this point, knowing what latent means would ease understanding the latent native speakerism as well. In Collins Dictionary, latent is described as ''something which is hidden and not obvious at the moment, but which may develop further in the future.'' (Collins Dictionary, 2021). In the context of this study, the argument for latent is that the long-term native versus non-native dichotomy is creating a new form. The label kept some of its original functions (e.g., dividing language teachers as native versus non-native language teachers) while also losing, gaining or exchanging some of its traditional features (e.g., highlighting expertise together with native speakerism). More importantly, however, the label is still there but is disguised behind the expertise. Both layers and the relationship among them is shown below (Figure-1):

Figure 1. Layers of Native Speakerism in the Context of Recruitment

DISCUSSION

This study was conducted to explore what requirements were presented for the English language teachers in job announcements in Turkey. Content analysis on the 141 job announcements for English language teachers was conducted. The findings indicated that native speakerism existed at two levels in job announcements. At Layer 1, traditional native speakerism persisted with the prioritization of 'native' speaker English language teachers. At Layer 2, latent native speakerism, a new form of native speakerism, emerged with the so-called expertise-oriented requirements with the disguised native-speakerism. The existence of these levels supports the literature by showing labels 'native speaker, near-native, or native level' are still persistent to indicate the expected level of the language across the job advertisements (Rivers, 2016). Similarly, the findings support Kiczkowiak (2020), Mackenzie (2020), Mahboob and Golden (2013), Ruecker and Ives (2015), and Selvi (2010) who found that recruiters regarded native speakerism as an important criterion to be recruited.

The findings on the traditional native speakerism are in line with the arguments indicating that the distinctions between native and non-native speakers were made according to nationality, biological origins, or ethnic background (Kubota & Lin, 2006; Rampton, 1990; Singh, 1998). For example, when prioritizing native speakers, it was frequently observed that job advertisements specified the countries of preferences as New Zealand, Australia, UK or USA. In that regard, the job advertisements left out speakers of certain varieties of the English language as well as highly proficient non-native speakers (Davies, 2003). Similarly, the findings show that racism lingers across job announcements, thereby in educational settings, by assigning certain roles to the people from the specific countries while also building an underlying connection between whiteness and native speaker teachers (Holliday, 2005).

The existence of latent native speakerism expands the literature by showing that employing parties indeed took the cultural, intercultural, national and international identities of teachers of English into consideration as has suggested earlier by Menard-Warwick (2008). However, displaying a latent character via 'balancing attempts with professional and personal qualities', this orientation presents so-called native speaker language teachers as homo oeconomicus who need to present a developing portfolio towards expertise. For example, job advertisements show that private educational institutions created an illusion that their focus was on expertise (e.g., the level of education, having certificates, knowledge about technological tools and so forth). This superficial attempt towards expertise presents a market competition to the so-called native speakers as well (Brown, 2015; as cited in Clymer, Alghazo, Naimi, & Zidan, 2020, p. 211; Perisic, 2021) while also leaving out other highly proficient 'non-native speakers of English'. The emphasis on 'being native speaker' in the job advertisements also supports the literature in that students are regarded as consumers (Desierto & De Maio, 2020), whose demands, instead of learning needs, must be satisfied. Likewise, the existence of latent native speakerism has supporting implications for the arguments on teachers' ''working towards particular types of professional practice based on trends and standards generated by global and domestic institutions'' without reflecting on global inequalities (Çiftçi & Karaman, 2021, p. 18). Therefore, it could be argued that latent native speakerism would unavoidably radicate the existing inequalities. All in all, as Clymer, Alghazo, Naimi and Zidan (2020) indicated earlier, latent native speakerism carries the logic of a deeply internalised neoliberalism in an attempt to please the customers of the private sectors (Floris & Renandya, 2020).

In the context of Turkey, the existence of latent native speakerism supports the earlier findings highlighting the tendency towards native speakerism (Selvi, 2010; Yaman & Şahin, 2019). More importantly, presenting a fresh conceptual perspective on the issue, the existence of latent native speakerism could be interpreted as a consequence of neoliberal educational policies that have led to more privatization across educational institutions. The doubling of private educational institutions in Turkey (Bayram, 2017), and the resulting latent native speakerism, could multiply the instances of practices similar to 'pseudo-native speakerism' across private educational institutions in the future (Tezgiden-Çakçak, 2019).

The findings of this study are important in reminding that native/non-native labelling be dropped across all professional contexts as has already been suggested by various organisations like TESOL and BAAL as well as by several scholars (Blair, 2015; Holliday, 2018). Additionally, these findings show that a longitudinal and comprehensive study in different contexts is needed to reveal the dynamics of the latent native speakerism to better inform the field against the potential impact of this new form of native speakerism. This is because the increasing trend in the privatisation of education in Turkey, as Bayram indicated (2017), also suggests that latent native speakerism will continue changing into new forms.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Native speakerism has a long-debated phenomenon in the field of English language teaching. This article presented that several attempts have been made to prevent any dichotomy from persisting in the field among language teachers. However, as has been shown in the literature review, the rise of neoliberalism across the educational fields influenced the emergence of native speakerism in different forms. The content analysis of the job advertisements gathered from online job-hunting platforms also supported the literature by presenting the existence of a disguised version of traditional native speakerism in the job advertisements of private education institutions. The latent native speakerism is a form of traditional native speakerism disguised in professional requirements. The concept has been explored within this small-scale study, which indicates that latent native speakerism has an unexplored potential for the field. Therefore, further studies are needed to be conducted from various perspectives (e.g. students, teachers, parents, the administrations of private sectors, and so forth) to better understand the dynamics of the concept. Also, further studies would certainly reveal how the dichotomy can be overcome via a potential collaboration between teacher training programs, policymakers and stakeholders.

LIMITATIONS

This study is the first step to explore latent native speakerism in relation to neoliberalism in education. Different methods of data collection including interviews with employers in private educational institutions could also contribute to the understanding of the concept of latent native speakerism. Future studies, therefore, could be conducted over an extended period to present other features of latent native speakerism and show how/whether the employment practices of recruiters display certain characteristics over time.

Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Funding

The author(s) received no financial support for the research, author-ship, and/or publication of this article.

Statements of publication ethics

I/We hereby declare that the study has not unethical issues and that research and publication ethics have been observed carefully.

Examples of author contribution statements

Dr. Züleyha Ünlü conceived of the presented idea. Dr. Züleyha Ünlü developed the theory and performed the analysis. Dr. Züleyha Ünlü verified the analytical methods.

Researchers' contribution rate

The study was conducted and reported with equal collaboration of the researchers.

Ethics Committee Approval Information

No data has been collected from any human participants in this study. Thus, no ethical permission has been sought.

REFERENCES

Bacon, C. K., & Kim, S. Y. (2018). "English is my only weapon": Neoliberal language ideologies and youth meta-discourse in South Korea. *Linguistics and Education, 48,* 10-21. 10.1016/j.linged.2018.09.002

Barber, J. P., & Walczak, K. K. (2009). Conscience and critic: Peer debriefing strategies in grounded theory research. In *Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association*, San Diego, CA.

Bayram, A. (2018). The reflection of neoliberal economic policies on education: Privatization of education in Turkey. *European Journal of Educational Research, 7*(2), 341-347. 10.12973/eu-jer.7.2.341

Bernat, E. (2009). Towards a pedagogy of empowerment: The case of 'Impostor Syndrome' among pre-service non-native speaker teachers (NNSTs) of TESOL. *English Language Teacher Education and Development Journal, 11*.

Blair, A. (2015). Evolving a post-native, multilingual model for ELF-aware teacher education. In Y. Bayyurt & S. Akcan (Eds.), *Current perspectives on pedagogy for English as a Lingua Franca. Developments in English as a Lingua Franca [DELF)* (pp. 89–102)*, (5)*. Berlin: De Gruyter Mouton.

Boonsuk, Y., & Ambele, E. A. (2019). Who "owns English" in our changing world? Exploring the perception of Thai university students in Thailand. *Asian Englishes*, 1–12. 10.1080/13488678.2019.1669302.

Clymer, E., Alghazo, S., Naimi, T., & Zidan, M. (2019). CALL, Native-Speakerism/Culturism, and Neoliberalism. *Interchange,* 1-29.

Collins Dictionary. (n.d.). Latent. In *Collins Dictionary.* Retrieved May 30, 2021, from https://www.collinsdictionary.com/dictionary/english/latent

Çelik, S. (2006). A concise examination of the artificial battle between native and non-native speaker teachers of English in Turkey. *Kastamonu Education Journal 14*(2), 371-376.

Çiftçi, E. Y., & Karaman, A. C. (2021). Rethinking the value (s) of short-term youth mobility: Neoliberal ideals and counterhegemonic possibilities. In D. Cairns (Ed.), *The Palgrave handbook of youth mobility and educational migration* (pp. 441-452), Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan.

Desierto, A., & De Maio, C. (2020). The impact of neoliberalism on academics and students in higher education: A call to adopt alternative philosophies. *Journal of Academic Language and Learning, 14*(2), 148-159. Retrieved from https://journal.aall.org.au/index.php/jall/article/view/731

Dewaele, J.-M. (2017). Why the Dichotomy "L1 Versus LX User" is Better than 'Native Versus Non-native Speaker. *Applied Linguistics,* 1-6. 10.1093/applin/amw055

Floris, F. D., & Renandya, W. A. (2020). Promoting the Value of Non-Native English-Speaking Teachers. *PASAA: Journal of Language Teaching and Learning in Thailand, 59*, 1-19.

Hirtt, N. (2007). What's Common between 'Business in Schools' and 'Education Business'? *European Educational Research Journal, 6*(1), 115-121. 10.2304/eerj.2007.6.1.115

Holliday, A. (2005). *The struggle to teach English as an international language.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Holliday, A. (2018). Native-Speakerism. *The TESOL encyclopaedia of English language teaching,* 1-7.

Jin, J. (2005). Which is better in China, a local or a native English-speaking teacher? *English Today, 21*(3), 39-46.

Kiczkowiak, M. (2020). Recruiters' Attitudes to Hiring 'Native' and 'Non-Native Speaker' Teachers: An International Survey. *TESL-EJ, 24*(1).

Kubota, R., & Lin, A. (2006). Race and TESOL: Introduction to concepts and theories. *TESOL Quarterly, 40*(3), 471-493.

Liu, J. (1999). Nonnative English-speaking professionals in TESOL. *TESOL Quarterly, 33*(1), 85-102.

Lowe, R. J., & Lawrence, L. (2018). Native-speakerism and 'hidden curricula' in ELT training: A duoethnography. *Journal of Language and Discrimination, 2*(2), 162-187.

Lowe, R. J., & Pinner, R. (2016). Finding the connections between native-speakerism and authenticity. *Applied Linguistics Review, 7*(1), 27-52.

Mackenzie, L. (2020). Discriminatory job advertisements for English language teachers in Colombia: An analysis of recruitment biases. *TESOL Journal.* 10.1002/tesj.535.

Mahboob, A., & Golden, R. (2013). Looking for native speakers of English: Discrimination in English language teaching job advertisements. *Voices in Asia Journal, 1*(1), 72–81.

Menard-Warwick, J. (2008). The cultural and intercultural identifies of transnational English teachers: Two case studies from the Americas. *TESOL Quarterly, 42*(4), 617-640.

Pakir, A. (2009). English as a lingua franca: Analyzing research frameworks in International English, world Englishes, and ELF. *World Englishes, 28*(2), 224–235.

Perisic, A. (2021). How to Get a Life: Humanities Education in the age of Neoliberal Exhaustion. *Critical Education, 12*(3). 10.14288/ce.v12i3.186626

Rampton, B. (1990). Displacing the 'native speaker': Expertise, affiliation, and inheritance. *ELT Journal, 44*(2), 97-101.

Reves, T., & Medgyes, P. (1994). The non-native English speaking EFL/ESL teacher's self-image: An international survey. *System 22*(3), 353-367.

Rivers, D. J. (2016). Employment advertisements and native-speakerism in Japanese higher education. In F. Copland, S. Garton, & S. Mann (Eds.), *LETs and NESTs: Voices, views and vignettes (pp. 68–89)*. British Council.

Ruecker, T., & Ives, L. (2015). White native English speakers needed: The rhetorical construction of privilege in online teacher recruitment spaces. *TESOL Quarterly, 49*(4), 733–756. 10.1002/tesq.195.

Samimy, K.K. (2008). The voice of a native speaker in the land of non-native English speakers. *TESOL Quarterly, 42*(1), 123-132.

Selvi, A. F. (2010). All teachers are equal, but some teachers are more equal than others: Trend analysis of job advertisements in English language teaching. *WATESOL NNEST Caucus Annual Review, 1*(1), 155–181.

Selvi, A. F. (2021). A scoping review of the "NEST/NNEST studies" in Turkey: A country in focus. *Abant İzzet Baysal Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 21*(1), 54-73. 10.17240/aibuefd.2021.21.60703-780084.

Singh, R. (1998). *The native speaker: multilingual perspectives.* New Delhi: SAGE Publications.

Yaman, İ., & Şahin, M. (2019). An Investigation into the Employment of English Language Teachers in the Private Sector in Turkey. *Journal of Language Research*, *3*(1), 1-13. Retrieved from
https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/jlr/issue/50599/640435

Tezgiden-Çakçak, Y. (2019). A new trend in Turkey's EFL market: Pseudo-native-speakerism. *NNEST Newsletter,* Retrieved from: http://newsmanager.commpartners.com/tesolnnest/issues/2019-11-07/1.html