# Heterotopias and Confrontations: Cinema and Literature as the Mirrors of New Visions of Turkey[1]

Berkant Çağlar[*]
Melike Futtu[**]

## Abstract

Turkish society is continuously exposed to various processes of social transformation. These transformations can be evaluated as the reflections of the internal and external changes with economic, political, social and cultural dimensions. Neoliberalism, globalization, political Islam and identity politics might be seen as the main phenomena that determine the forms of social changes in Turkey. These wide arrays of changes have unsurprisingly found their reflections in many different spheres of cultural production. New Turkish Cinema and Contemporary Literature of Turkey have been prominent ones among these spheres. For instance, unlike the Yeşilçam Cinema, The New Turkish Cinema has problematized and revealed the previously ignored subjects of Turkish cinema through creating new narratives. At this juncture, this study is aimed to examine the changing structure of Turkey by considering categories of class, gender and ethnicity under the grand concept of space. The theoretical framework is constituted by Michel Foucault's notion of heterotopia and Richard Sennett's notion of confrontation to extensively address the issue of space in Turkey. The study used the focus group technique to get other opinions on exemplifying cases.

**Key Words:** New Turkish cinema, contemporary literature of Turkey, heterotopia, confrontation, space.

## Introduction

This study is aimed at comprehending and discussing Turkey in a position of change by referring to the concepts of "New Turkish Cinema" and "Contemporary Turkish Literature" under the grand notion of "space". It should be stressed that our research project has two

---

[*] Berkant Çağlar participated to the ICSC 2015 as a undergraduate student of the Media and Communication Department, Izmir University of Economics. He is now MA Student of Sociology Department, Boğaziçi University. caglar.berkant@yahoo.com
[**] Melike Futtu participated to the ICSC 2015 as a undergraduate student of the Media and Communication Department, Izmir University of Economics. She is now MA Student, of Film Studies Department, Eötvös Loránd University. melikefuttu@gmail.com

significant aspirations. The main motivation of this study is to appreciate and position Turkey rather than understanding cinema and literature in the Turkish context. Besides, conceptualizing the space discussion in contemporary Turkey is another motivation to locate in this research. Therefore, this study is designed to discuss the changing structure of Turkey hand in hand with the phenomenon of space.

The reasons of change are due to a number of different internal and external coerces in Turkish history. For instance, the *coup d'etat* of 1980 broke down the power of the "leftists" in Turkey and the created proper environment for the switch to neoliberalism. In particular, after 1980, alterations started to be more numerous and ambiguous as they triggered radical moments. For instance, those alterations created new cultures in the cities. There is no doubt that arabesque music and its culture were reflecting the changing positions in Turkish society. Neoliberalism, identity politics, rise of political Islam, globalization, transnationalism launched new understandings and possibilities regarding Turkish society. This process led to question modernity by creating different dissents and new projections. New cultures and identities voiced their demands in public and political spheres. Keyman and Koyuncu (2005) pointed out that:

> "It has become apparent that in the 1990s the strong state faced a serious difficulty to respond to the new societal problems and demands, especially those articulated of identity-terms and asking for the protection of social and political rights, as well as the recognition of the ethnic and religious differences (2005: 109)."

These demands are quite recognizable in different cultural texts. New Turkish Cinema as a movement emerged to reject the fundamentals of Yeşilcam Cinema and to transmit the challenges of adjustments going on in the society. As Arslan (2009) suggests, following the rapid transformation of society since the 1990s, the new cinema of Turkey has been heterogeneous, reflecting a multitude of voices and viewpoints. Unlike Yesilçam, the new cinema of Turkey has been no longer limited by a narrowly defined notion of 'Turkishness'. (2009: 94). On contrary, contemporary Turkish literature did not emerge as an alternative to Turkish literature, but put forward new voices and cultures in itself. In respect to this positioning of cinema and literature, this study strongly argues that dynamics of change can be traced in these cultural texts.

The conceptualization of "change" is extensive to conduct a deep research. Thus, the study attempts to limit change with categories of class, gender and ethnicity by considering their relationality with space in selected texts. The study is elaborating these categories by

utilizing some concrete examples to point out what has been changing in Turkey regarding space.

This study was inspired by critical social theory in order to discuss the concept of space. At this juncture, the theoretical background discusses the notions of "heterotopia" by Michel Foucault and "confrontation" by Richard Sennett, where they comprehensively discussed space considering its social, historical, political and cultural phases. The study used three literary and three cinematic works to discuss concrete changes of Turkish society. These literary and cinematic works were examined in accordance with theoretical concepts. In addition to the conceptualization of heterotopia and confrontation, debates on contemporary Turkey are also integrated into the study. After   conceptual analysis, the study applied focus group technique as a method to verify its findings.

This study includes five main steps. This theoretical article is only expressing three stages of the project that include literature review, theoretical textual analysis and preliminary findings of the focus groups. Yet, as an ongoing project, the analysis of focus groups will be elaborated and compared with theoretical textual analysis in the future. In fact, we strived to find out an experimental way of presenting data of the focus group results. Therefore, they were recorded by cameras to be transformed in a video project. In the final stage, all the findings of the research will be demonstrated in an exhibition to share the results with public.

**Methodology**

The study applied a focus group method after its theoretical textual analysis where we conceptualized the study regarding social, political, historical and cultural processes of space in a position of change in Turkey. This method makes it possible to discuss other people's opinion, ideas and reflections regarding selected examples of cinematic and literary works. Focus group researchers' encourage participants to discuss amongst themselves: asking questions, exchanging anecdotes, and commenting on each others' experiences and points of view. At the very least, research participants create an audience for one another (1999: 4). In this respect, the focus group technique is appropriate as a theoretical background because Richard Sennett's idea of confrontation is one of the key notions of the study. Therefore, it was possible to create the realm of focus group as a confrontation sphere. The main purpose in deciding for the focus group technique was to empower participants to exchange their value system along with discussion during the process of focus group. Also, by this means the very idea of confrontation became possible in our research.

The participants of the focus groups were selected with reference to their demographical backgrounds. It was important to have different people who represent various ethnicity, gender and class categories. They were also limited by being university student from different universities and educational levels in Izmir. Yet, their previous experiences regarding selected examples were not considered. After the plot study, two focus groups were conducted. In total, 11 participants took part to the study. Six of the participants were women and five of them were men. Five undergraduate, five master students and one doctorate student from highly dispersed and plural educational background participated to the study. Participants were studying in the areas of design studies, media and communication, neuroscience, political science, architecture, psychology, fashion business, archaeology and software engineering.

In the focus group process, they were encouraged to interpret three videos and three literary passages by expressing their own ideas. Those materials are chosen from our examples. The idea behind that was to go beyond talking practices because as Sanders and Williams (2003) stated "the visual nature liberates people's creativity from the boundaries of what they can state in words. Together, the ambiguity and the visual nature of these tools allow people much room for creativity, both in expressing their current experiences and ideas and in generating new ideas" (2003: 147) We claim that visual component of the study enables participants to be more active and makes it easier to generate ideas during the focus group process.

Apart from voice recordings, the study is extensively recorded by three video cameras to create different clips by taking participants' consent for future exhibition of study. One of the threats was that people might feel insecure due to the existence of cameras. Yet, the place of the focus group was designed to make them comfortable with visual stuffs. In addition, this peculiarity suggests constituting visual narration along with the article of the study. No longer, the study is not only dealing with words, but also visual elements and languages. Besides what they said, this recording choice of study enables us to be more aware of people's feelings by realizing their body languages and facial expressions that depicted in videos.

## Conceptual Framework

"The space in which we live, which draws us out of ourselves, in which the erosion of our lives, our time and our history occurs, the space that claws and gnaws at us, is also, in itself, heterogeneous space… We live inside a set of relations that delineates sites which are irreducible to one another and absolutely not superimposable on one another" (1984: 3)

At first glance, the notion of space is quite broad. It is more complex than it is predicted, because as an abstract notion, it can be defined, rejected or constructed in reference to ways of looking or approaching. It includes both positive and negative possibilities since it both increases creativeness and provides an open sphere for contributions and changes. Inconvenient characteristics of space make it harder to draw meaningful and apprehensible narration. In addition to this, plurality, irreducibility and relationality of the space give it heterogeneous features. Therefore, it enables confrontations, bargains, interactions, or whatever one wants to say to attribute an emancipatory potential to space. We do not attempt to negate space. Yet, it is quite significant to realize that space has both boundaries and a liberating spirit. In this research, we do not only conceptualize space as a notion, but also we surround with it because of its commonness in daily life. In conjunction with this, the study is an attempt to discover liberating possibilities and senses of space by reflecting its dimensional ways.

The issue of space is considerably interdisciplinary. Space is never really defined and constructed in a rigorous theoretical fashion… The term space is qualified in innumerable ways: "social", "political", "conceptual", "radical democratic" and so on (2006: 110). It is studied by different disciplines such as architecture, sociology, linguistic, philosophy, geography, history, media and so forth. Therefore, discussions of space are suggesting an extensive corpus for thinking. There are a number of important scholars who discussed its complexity and broadness in detail. For instance, Simmel, Harvey, Laclau, Benjamin, Lefebvre, Heidegger, Certeau, Derrida, Focault, Soja, Sennett among others. Yet, the source of this study is deriving from social theory in order to comprehend and analyze its social meaning by considering its other forms. In relation to that, the subject is specified by mainly works of Foucault who introduced the concept of 'heterotopia' in space discussion.

**Heterotopias of Foucault**

Foucault (1984) expressed heterotopias with six principles by tracing their historical roots. These principles are not totally separate. On contrary, as Foucault emphasized, they are "irreducible" to each other and they are relational. In this regard, Bonazzi notes that heterotopias belong to each and all human groups but manifest itself in different forms… "Heterotopicality" is linked to spans of time (2002: 43). Issuing of the time is occupying important position in Foucault's term. Heterotopias are most often linked to slices in time-which is to say that they open onto what might be termed, for the sake of symmetry,

heterochronies (1984:6). By saying that, one of the main contributions of Foucault is his awareness about the relationship between time and space, rather than rejecting it. In this discussion, time has a role that embodies space by considering its existence in reality.

> "In every culture, in every civilization, real places- places that do exist and that are formed in the very founding of society- which are something like counter- sites, a kind of effectively enacted utopia in which the real sites, all the real sites that can be found within the culture, are simultaneously represented, contested, and inverted. Places of this kind are outside of all places, even though it may be possible to indicate their location in reality… Contrast to utopias, heterotopias." (1984: 4).

Foucault makes easier to comprehend abstract notion of heterotopias by contrasting it with utopia. On the contrary of utopias- as an unreal ones- where functions of utopia are various and include compensation in the form of daydreams and fantasies, critiques of existing conditions and the capacity to provoke the desire for transformation (2006: 82).

## Sennett's discussion on confrontation

> Question of difference is how people portray themselves to others, not, as it were, in the centers of places, but at the edges… Dead edges where one community, one difference, meets another… The place where it really matters- not where you meet a whole lot of people like yourself but where you are reluctant to meet those who are unlike you (2002: 386).

Apart from Foucault, the study is applying Richard Sennett's idea of confrontation in the city. In fact, the term confrontation is our attribution because it might be expressed with different words such as facing, touching, meeting, interaction by referring Sennett's different choices. Understanding Sennett enables us to discover that space can be conceptualized as a liberating notion with exchange between individuals. Although Sennett gives city and public realm prominence in his discussion, this study is designed by approaching space as more multifaceted. It will put together a different comprehension of spaces by combining relational spaces of heterotopia and confrontations at the same time. In particular, with the contribution of Sennett, the study will aim to find out the moments of interaction that have a potential on emancipation. As Sennett (2002) expressed, cities we know now tend to be much more outward than inward- differences tend to separate and they are not edges between communities which can be made interactive, as there is too much space between them (2002: 386- 387). That is to say, huge space or lack of interaction between different spaces could be completed by calling interaction and by creating dialogues through margins and edges.

Thereby, the main question of the study is a simple one. How do the works of Foucault and Sennett relate with space and the changing position of Turkey? Space has the capability to intersect different characteristics of a changing society. In this respect, if Turkish society is conceptualized as a changing unity in relation to the influences of globalization, neoliberalism, political Islam, identity politics and transnationalism, it might be understood by using space discussions.

Class, gender and ethnicity within the framework of space might specify the subject. The reason behind this is that space is able to either enlarge or limit these different categories. For instance, when Cihan Tuğal attempted to understand transformation of everyday life in the conservative district of Sultanbeyli in İstanbul, he figured out that Islamic reorganization of space in this district casts a doubt on conceptual separations between identity-creation and strategy, and culture and structure. The specific architectural layout forged by Islamic mobilization is a part of identity formation (2009: 443).

It can be realized that space is still too extensive for analyzing categories deeply. The study will be narrowed with specific samples under the categories of New Turkish Cinema and contemporary Turkish literature. In this way, selected samples of movies and literary works will be discussed within the context of relational spaces of heterotopias and confrontations in literary and cinematic spaces. This micro level might be projected to comprehend dynamics and patterns of Turkey in macro level.

**Framework of conceptual analysis**

The focus group study required the collection of the selected sample in one place. The selection process of participants was quite difficult, as it was important to choose the most representative examples in terms of issue of changing regarding class, gender and ethnicity under the grounded title of space. As an example, three movies and literary works are applied to study to evaluate and discuss ongoing Turkey and its components.

Cases for the cinematic works are "Voice of My Father" (Babamın Sesi/ 2012), directed by Orhan Eskiköy and Zeynel Doğan; "Majority" (Çoğunluk/ 2010) by Seren Yüce; "Journey to the Sun" (Güneşe Yolculuk/ 1999) of Yeşim Ustaoğlu. In addition to that, the study is examined literary works of "The Auteur of Insect Bites" (Sinek Isırıklarının Müellifi/ 2011) by Barış Bıçakçı; Mine Söğüt's " Five Sevim Apartment" (Beş Sevim Apartmanı/ 2003) and Mahir Ünsal Eriş's "We were beautiful As We were" (Olduğu Kadar Güzeldik/ 2013).

## Class in cinematic and literary space

The issue of class is undermined in the contemporary neoliberal world, so as to ignore the existence of class-based inequalities. For instance, Harvey (1991) attempts to identify the way of such undermining in his outstanding analysis about postmodernism. He tries to illustrate changing social patterns regarding class discussions. For example, rise of 'aesthetics' as oppose to 'ethics' is one of the result of those changing processes, as he says. Such analysis on class has a potential to reveal out how stratification mechanisms work hand in hand with empowering upper classes and financial elites. At this juncture, Turkey as one of the developing countries is weakened by the threat of ignorance on class discussion where no longer inequalities are legitimately concealed through different strategies by the hegemonic classes.

In brief, the construction of class in Turkey might be discussed through the foundation of the Turkish Republic with the transition of non-Muslims to state elites. Yet, Turkey in the beginning of its national history implied strong developmental policies, but a multi-party system changed this situation. Also, switching to neoliberal policies in the 1980s made certain that Turkey is now positioned strongly within the capitalist regimes.

Neoliberal policies fundamentally changed the positioning of classes in Turkey. As Phipps noted that neoliberalism has become hegemonic as a system of political and economic organization, while neo-conservatism infuses our popular legitimization of religious fundamentalism. (2014: 9). It can be observed that middle classes share different characteristics, since they compose very distinctive figures within themselves. In addition, social processes determine the composition of the lower classes where they encounter with rapid urbanization, ignorance and elimination of the worker's rights in accordance with neoliberal policies. Also, neoliberal policies and traces of the "Turkish modernization project" constitute the empowerment of political Islam, which was formed by the *petite bourgeoisie* in Anatolia and strengthened Islamist middle classes in metropolises. As Özcan and Turunç notes that in the 2000s, the ruling party AKP (Justice and Development Party) modified the 1990s ruler party Refah Parti (Welfare Party)'s political platform to accommodate the ambitions of Anatolian business groups and their middle class allies (2011: 70). In this context, after 80's, political Islam accompanid by neoliberal policies started to dominate economic realm. Apart from economic context of political Islam, it was also crucial element in cultural and social spheres. For instance, Nilüfer Göle (1998) attempts to illustrate how opressed Islamists social groups started to rebel against secular policies of Turkish Republic

and created new ways of resistance and life styles. Therefore, headscarf become one of the significant cultural element that signifies opressive policies of the Republic.

The film "Journey to Sun" by Ustaoğlu transmitted the story of the lower class urban poor in İstanbul. Lower class positioning is affiliated with different contexts such as possessing a Kurdish identity or politicized urban poorness. In fact, urban is illustrated as a space, which has potential to create moments of confrontation because the movie narrates a story of the Kurdish urban poor Barzan migrated from Zorduş, Iraq, and the Turkish urban poor Mehmet from İzmir, Tire. The story stressed that the common sense of the ordinary Turkish citizen assumes Mehmet is a pure Kurdish guy owing to his appearance and manners. Mehmet is compulsorily politicized when he is confronted with the sufferings of his friend Barzan due to his Kurdish identity. Mehmet also suffered a lot because of his bodily appearances. Istanbul makes such confrontations possible with creating exchanges between different individuals at the edges. The confrontation between them was highly valid since it creates potentials where no longer Mehmet needs to emphasize his Turkish identity by comprehending the sufferings of Kurds in Turkey. As Sennett (2002) suggested "self-dramatization as a principle of creating a public life… to focus on territory- on the issue of boundaries rather than centers and to focus on the peculiar balance between theatricality and disorder in public space itself" (2002: 386).

Therefore, self-dramatization of Mehmet is practiced so as to stress emancipatory potentials on the edges. This circumstance might also be seen in the concrete environment of Turkey during these times, as Turkey witnessed widespread social unrest as the urban poor became increasingly politicized throughout the 1970s. The professional middle classes and the urban youth combined their forces with the lower stratum against social injustices and inequitable wealth distribution (2011: 76).

In addition to emphasis on the lower classes, the condition of the middle classes is quite necessary for cinematic and literary spaces because they took place in such texts. As stated before, the middle-class has different compositions in Turkey. One can be conceptualized as a project so as to embrace and perform middle class values for individuals. On the other hand, it is constituted by political Islam where religious norms and belief systems are practicing within wider context.

> "The self 'becomes a reflexive project' involving 'the strategic adoption of lifestyle options' related to a planned 'trajectory', all geared to maintaining a meaningful biographical narrative. In fact, 'life-plans are the substantial content of the reflexively organized trajectory of the self'. In Ulrich Beck's words, 'biographies become self-reflexive; socially prescribed biography is transformed into biography that is self-produced and continues to be produced" (2007: 47).

As Adams pointed out that self become reflexive and include self-produced biographies of individuals. Those words are also reflecting positioning of middle classes in Turkey, in where they create identities, reflect social conditions and concern to be been middle. The character Cemil in "The Auteur of Insect Bites" is highly aware that he is a member of the middle class life. Despite his awareness on class positioning, he continues to suffer repressive forms of being middle classness as Bıçakçı (2013) noted:

> "He was a tense, unhappy man in his twenties. He was living his life tuned to outside sounds rather than to his inner voice. When he listened to his inner voice, other found him childish. Some even thought that he was a diluted mad man… In his forties, he became a quiet and calm man who fed his obsessions as if they had been his pets, prepares jams in the right season, willing to help older women. And the reason for housing estates was to meet the housing needs of this kind of people. New roads connected to Istanbul. Road, new bus and minibus lines were introduced, and private public busses started running. Metro should be here soon" (2013: 85)

Bıçakçı's protagonist Cemil is formed to illustrate this middle-class repression. At the same time, he attempted to construct his own biography because he quitted his job to escape from explicit oppression of being middle class. He prefers to stay at home and he writes. Yet, he is not still emancipated to possess his own biography because social structures are attached to him, too. Therefore, one of the general discussions of sociology reappears. Cemil's bodily practices are formed to show us the inconsistency of structure and agency. Cemil's class situation makes it possible to create a project in terms of his bodily life. As Shilling notes, powerful classes have time and capital to threat and project their bodies (Shilling, 1993). In this respect, Cemil has a time and required sources to threat his body.

In fact, Cemil is consciously or unconsciously influenced by values of middle and upper classes with respect to their life projections; so that he imprisons himself to the home. In one manner, he triumphed to protect himself from the harsh structure of the middle class life. On the other hand, he contributed to the production of different ways of maintaining middle 'classness' through his life projection. He missed the different possibilities of confrontation by choosing home as a living space. His house is fictionalized as such a heterotopia owing to loosing continuity of time. Somehow, he realized that he is experiencing different forms of discontinuities. For instance, he had an anxiety when his clock breaks down. At this juncture, despite his realization on oppression of continuity in his daily life, he cannot discover a breathing space by letting himself to the heterotopia.

In brief, issuing class in a concrete way, is highly limited especially when it comes to the experiences of lower classes. Yet, middle classes occupy both cinematic and literary texts extensively. Lower classes appear in the edges in where they have more potential on different

confrontations. Middle class is quite plural rather than to suggest one way of understanding contemporary Turkey. In general, upper classes exist in different texts whereby cases of study are focused on to reveal out more about lower and middle classes in cinematic and literary spaces.

**Gender and its relations with space: Contingency, relationality, heterogeneity**

The concept of gender is a highly dispersed issue within the expansion on theoretical discussions of feminist scholars. Yet, issuing of gender is both undermined and re-evaluated by inversion and contributions of number of different theoreticians such as post-structuralists, post-modernists that bring into existence queer theory, post-feminist psychoanalysis and performance theories. Also in the area of gender studies, where literature is truly extended and intense, it is possible to trace gender practice in daily life, because it is quite concrete to realize that society transmits and reflects gender in different manners. Rather than conceptualizing gender as a constant phenomenon, it is profoundly contingent in a sense that it evokes itself by suggesting various ways of performing and practicing sexuality. Besides, the discussions on masculinity are beneficial to create awareness about what's the circumstance of men. Masculinity studies is also suggesting that masculinity is in crisis where men are argued to experience uncertainties in their masculine identities associated with social roles, sexualities, work and family relations, as a result of material and discursive shifts in gender relations. (2014: 303). Therefore, gender studies are quite fruitful when it comes to its broadness and its various levels of discussions.

Gender is intersecting by space and time, because practicing gender necessitates different level of interaction. Space potentially suggests different levels of interaction. Besides, it can be reformulated by considering flow of time where time potentially speeds off space or withdrawing space. In our study, space is designed to comprehend possible occurrences of heterotopias and confrontations at the death edges/spaces. Furthermore, how both space and gender are produced within their relationality by social exchanges. 'Social relations stretched over space', places are unbounded, open, porous, fluid entities, rather bounded, fixed and stable bundles of attributes. Space is continuously produced through the dynamic interconnections between and among places and social relations. (2005: 142)

> "Turkey is working through a democratic paradox where expansion of religious freedoms accompanies threats to gender equality. The religiously rooted government in power does not challenge the prevailing legal framework. However, the intertwining of religion and politics both at the level of political and civil society, independent of the legal framework, sanctions societal norms legitimizing gender inequality" (2009: 3).

In addition to that, this study problematizes the gender issue with considering construction of masculinity and femininity by realizing its social, cultural and political context. The discourse on transformation, which is conceptualized as development in the utterances of government, does not appreciate while certain individuals are performing their gender. In relation to that, we discuss also the inconsistency regarding dominant discourses and practices of daily life whether comes into surface or not.

Gender is political by its existence owing to the politicized situation of it, where government's disciplinary body politics aim to control and make passive not only the woman body but also the ignored subject position of lesbians, gays, bisexuals and transgenders (LGBT). Also the possibilities of different manners in respect to perform sexuality are disregarded. The political history of the 2010s includes lots of cases that explain how the woman body is subject to control. For instance, in 2012 the previous Prime Minister Recep Tayyip Erdoğan attempted to prohibit abortion. This is an explicit evidence of the disciplinary power of the government through sexuality. Also, the positioning of men regarding gender should be answered and taken into consideration. Is there a masculinity crisis in Turkey? It is debatable whether such a crisis exists in Turkey. Rather, internal contradictions in the construction of masculinities in the context of social change and the ambivalences and conflicts produced in the process are more typical dynamics in Turkey (2014: 303).

In general, it might be argued that gender inequality is extended in Turkey through power relations. It appeared as body politics of the government officials. These repressed individuals can be traced in contemporary literature of Turkey and in the New Turkish Cinema. We consistently encounter gender in different forms. It was sometimes the signifier of violence, life biographies, madness, or even characters suffered a lot owing to compulsion of becoming a man within the framework of masculinity. One can argue that for the majority of men, their experiences of relational contexts with their parents, their children, and their spouses are likely to engender tension (Boratav et al., 2014).

The father in "Majority" creates tension with his manner in accordance with middle class values that aim to establish nationalist discourse to empower discourse of masculinity and military nationalism towards his son Mertkan. It can be seen that he explicitly exercises practices of masculinity over Mertkan while he implements these values towards his wife implicitly. Besides, Mertkan is a son of a middle class family in Turkey where he is weakened due to projections of his class and its obligations, requirements and tasks.

Apart from movies, gender is directly visible in literary works as well. For instance, narrations of Mine Söğüt in "Five Sevim Apartment" convinced its reader to suppose that gender display has harsh implications in daily life. For example, one of the characters acts as a man owing to her father's desire to have a son. Elif created a story in her mind to characterize herself as a boy, where she might make her father to feel as he has a son.

> "During the day Elif was traumatized, beaten. At night, she was raised, hearing male lies, in the warm embrace of her father's limitless love. Haydar got off so much on this decietful game, he neither quit drinking nor gave up on fooling himself. Throughout the years he spent his days disgusted with Elif and his nights enjoying the pleasure of male discourse with his son Yunus. Even if she found her husband's losing himself in such a soothing game every night a bit weird, Kader looked on in unconscious equanimity" (2003: 98).

Elif is only one of the characters in "Five Sevim Apartment" in which they were imprisoned by Doctor Samimi to reveal both their nonexistence and existence by reflecting their unconsciousness of the individual or unconsciousness of the Dr. Samimi. Heterotopia exists in the stories as a centre that collects these people who share gender based difficulties in somehow in their biographies.

In conclusion, the fragmentation of gender in the examples includes much more moments that differentiate practices of gender in the context of Turkey in a position of change. Yet, it is nearly impossible to cover all the distinctiveness that is depicted in the texts. This part aimed to illustrate only a small side of it. These examples are sharing commonness of the gender in the texts. Gender is socially constructed so as to point out ongoing oppression, violence, masculinity crisis, and an instrument for disciplinary body politics where such subjects are exposed to change and regulation. Also, space is created in different levels of interaction and possibilities regarding gender because of contingency and relationality, heterogeneity of space and gender.

## Deconstructive and integrative aspects of ethnicity

The discourse policy of Turkish Republic is historicallyabout different ethnic identities that always pronounced in a form of positive sense. Most of the time, it was affiliated with the plural social form of Ottoman society. The question can be raised so as to interrogate if there is a real ethnic plurality in Turkish society or is it formed by ignorance, or is it concealed by written history and inventions through lack of confrontations either between different edges or peripheries and center to terminate possibility of reconciliation.

Soja (2011) summarized Foucault work in the area of history by emphasizing the relationship between space, knowledge and power. It might be crucial to comprehend the compositional position of space in the process of creation of the past, the present and history. The question is simple: Is it valid to discuss space as integrative or deconstructive for Turkish territories? As Soja reminds us, Foucault had other things in mind. He takes an integrative rather than a deconstructive path holding on to his history but adding to it the crucial nexus that would flow through all his work: the linkage between space, knowledge and power (2011: 16).

When we answer the question in terms of Turkish context, space can be both deconstructive and integrative. For instance, in our case it is possible to realize that these ambiguous circumstances are multilayered. This situation is existent due to the disruptive moments of the time where it breaks down links and historicizes its topics. Foucault's argument here takes a new turn. "...this devaluation of space that has prevailed for generations' (2011:20). "Voice of My Father" can be understood by this differentiation of devaluation of the space as suggested by Foucault because the movie focuses on an old-aged woman who denies to confront with her past while her son is confronting their Alevi- Kurdish identity. Space is concretely formed by the existence of heterotopia that is located in a rural area in which an old-aged woman, Base, is still decided to live there while her son is rejecting this. Besides, the past historicizes itself with the findings of voice recordings between family members. This generation gap and differentiation should be emphasized in order to comprehend the liberating potential of space and family members. Base is eliminating the possibilities of confrontation both insisting on to live at her heterotopia and not reluctant to listen to voice records so as not to face with the coerced past.

However, Base's son is liberated with the existence of space and its attributions by discovering the voice recording. In contrast, Base's positioning on heterotopia can be easily understood. She finds out her past and memories there. Spaces are often charged with memories of other visual orders, with presences of the past thereby unsettling their current meaning as underutilized space (2013: 217-218). Apart from the acceptable reason of memory, this space in the form of heterotopia includes such boundaries. Yet, these boundaries can be also conceptualized to attribute positive meaning to it as Blandy and Sibley (2010) suggested:

> "The term 'boundary' itself has a number of meanings: a frontier or border, a dividing line or threshold; and can as well be used to refer to extremities and confines, limits and peripheries. The dichotomous nature of physical boundaries was noted by Marcuse (1994), their contradictory

elements providing protection and shelter while simultaneously confining; increasing a sense of security while exacerbating loss of trust; and denying access to some while enabling the greater enjoyment of the insiders."(2010: 277)

Literature can voice possibilities, but it can also embody possibilities. Form is very important here, the construction of prose is powerful in shaping knowledge and creating meaning (2009: 441). Therefore, it might propose different understanding regarding to ethnicity. There is no doubt that there are lots of examples to discuss ethnicity.

> "He started walking towards the square. I passed the health center and arrived at the start of the bridge… I was going to walk to Bandırma-Erdek junction, and I was going to wait for a car coming from Erdek. I looked around me, and I saw the yellow lights of a taxi in a street beside the ruined Armenian building" (2014: 36).

For instance, the story of the Greek family and immigrants is depicted in the centre of the stories. Yet, we aim to discuss in which condition ethnic identities of Greek, Armenian or other minorities are used as a tool for narration. This circumstance is indicating that they exist in such spaces, but these expressions are only limited to a few words and not to be subjected to be significant components of the narration. In other words, they simply reified those subjects by putting them to the edges.

> "Bandırma Junior High School is a beauty founded on the shore, as if they wanted to encourage children to study. They said it used to be the house of an Armenian doctor. After it was handed over to the Ministry of Education, they just expanded it a little bit. But this renown doctor of Bandırma must be an unaccommodating man as he built his house on the shore, as well as beside the square."( 2014: 76)

Also, this reification intent leads to the aestheticization of the space. For instance, such houses most of the time are described in terms of how beautiful they are. The intent is to normalize their disappearances in the present time because it is possible to search for answers for where they are or why they abandoned their houses. This situation disempowers individuals' confrontation with their identities because of the construction of Turkish national identity politics succeeds properly.

To sum up the section on ethnicity, it might find out concretely both in cinematic and literary spaces. In the cinematic works, ethnicity is mostly issued by Kurdish identity with its political roots. However, movies are expressing both confrontation moments and existential potentials of the heterotopias. Literary spaces are more abstract and blurred to express ethnicities and most of the time is used as a small component of the narration by concealing exercised politics of the Turkish Republic. Therefore, characters suffer to create confrontational spaces in the literary works.

**Preliminary Findings from the Focus Group Research**

During the study, participants were shown six samples from cinematic and literary works, which are supporting the findings of the theoretical conceptual analysis of the study. We asked certain questions to them, in accordance with our previous analysis, in order to stimulate their discussions and feedbacks.

The focus groups should be distinguished among each other as they did not respond to the same questions in the same way. Yet, participants of two focus groups mostly covered issues that were emphasized in our theoretical textual analysis regarding the selected examples.

In the theoretical textual analysis, we decided to make an in-depth research. Thus, we particularly focused on the selected examples under the categories of ethnicity, gender and class. For instance, the case of "Five Sevim Apartment" was analyzed by considering the category of gender. Yet, it was not meant that "Five Sevim Apartment" does not include issues of ethnicity and class. The reason behind this was to give more depth to the research. The participants revealed this intersectionality between categories. For example, while they were discussing ethnicity in "We were Beautiful As We were" they also pointed out depicted class issues in there.

**Findings on Class**

We mainly planned to conceptualize the issue of class with respect to "Journey to Sun" in the process of the focus group. Previous analysis regarding Turkey stressed affiliation of lower classes with Kurdish identity in cities. Besides, appearances and manners of individuals determine way of attitudes towards those subjects. Cities are mostly defined as a confrontational area that creates emancipation and exchange between different agents by politicizing its figures.

> "They might have had a conversation because they felt close to each other both socially and ethnically. The fact that they came to Istanbul, the big city, might have gathered the characters together. What do you mean by saying "ethnically"? The fact that they are Kurdish. They came from the South East. Do you think that the characters are Kurdish? I don't have a definite judgment but, given their dialect, I think they have somewhat close ethnical origins. Also, from the class perspective, there is the possibility that they gather together as the oppressed people of the big city."

After showing a short scene from "Journey to Sun", we asked participants to answer what can be the possible circumstances that promote companionship between Mehmet and

Berzan. We expected that they will figure out that their class was the trigger that enables them to have this friendship. As stated before, Mehmet was not a Kurdish guy, but because of his manner and appearance, nearly all of the participants supposed that their Kurdish identity constructed this relation. In fact, their pointing out might be understood by considering complex issue of immigration in Turkey. As Buğra (2007) reminds us that Kurdish people came to cities without pledges where they might feel more secure with previous comers to the cities. This situation led to links between ethnic identity and class structure, but occurred in a more compound system (2007: 46). Their urban poorness allows this abrupt amity. Afterwards, it is important to emphasize that participants realized importance of urban poor identity might be effective for this friendship, too. This finding is crucial to understand one more time that those positioned in the lower classes generally welcome minority groups in cities.

**Findings on Gender**

Gender is a widely discussed topic because of the amount of research in this area and the concrete forms in daily life. We conceptualized repressive gender norms regarding Mine Söğüt's "Five Sevim Apartment", where she narrated the suffering of Elif as an undesired and unforeseen girl. We directly asked participants what they were thinking about gender roles in the text that they read during the focus group. In fact, it is difficult to generate this question because they gave ambiguous answers. The first group had difficulties to realize the gender of Elif and the end of the discussion was blurred. On contrary, the second group quickly commented and revealed out that Elif shares complex gender identity due to his father's desire to have a son.

> "If we think of it as symbolically, is there a chance that the day refers to something else? I think here there is a duality of night-day, woman-man. Man is matched with night, and woman with day. Also there is the emphasis on the household work in connection with day. Do men have the man banter at night? Manhood is night… Night is more of a man's thing. Night symbolizes danger. And only men can come over the danger. I could match such a duality from this kind of perspective."

Time and space relationship was significant in the textual analysis by referencing Mine Söğüt's story and notion of heterotopia. Elif reflects different gender roles by considering day and night duality. Also, she was surrounded by the space or heterotopia where she practiced losing the sense of absolute time. Johnson (2006) emphasized that the

space in which we live is a set of relations cut through with time. It is the space in which we are 'drawn outside ourselves' and 'the erosion of our life'. (2006: 78). In this regard, participants described a troubled and distressed environment of the gendered social system by commenting its coercive functions and disciplinary body politics towards characters.

**Findings on Ethnicity**

The Analysis on ethnicity started with the discussion of the ethnic plurality discourse of the Turkish Republic because the state has always been proud of being plural. As many scholars have stressed, Turkish society failed to preserve plural social forms. Mills indicated that Istanbul's city landscape is directly changed by immigrants and "Turkification" politics of the state. It disrupted ethnic minorities and it led to loss of cosmopolitan spirit of the city (2006: 375)

Kurdish identity is broadly discussed by research that discusses their existence in cinematic space. Yet, for the literary works, our aim regarding ethnicity was to think about disappearance of different ethnic groups and their current situation in contemporary Turkey. Therefore, one of the literary works of the analysis "We were Beautiful As We were" was discussed in the focus groups. We selected a passage from the story of Malibu that narrates about an old-Armenian houses in Bandırma. We encouraged the participants to discuss why the owner of the house does not live there anymore and how it was transformed to a public school.

> "6-7 September is when non-Muslims left the country. This is the first thing that this brings to my mind. During the Ottoman Period or the early years of the Turkish Republic, people with different ethnical origins lived together but then they had to go, they had to migrate. 6-7 September had probably more to do with Greek people. It didn't have anything to do with Armenian people. I thought of it as all non-Muslims. It might be the developments in 1915 as well. In their time, non-Muslims are depicted as rich and having a great life here. I don't think Armenian people had any problems in that time. As far as I know, the problems were in the east."

Participants correspondingly linked Armenian identity with possession of upper class positioning. Also, they realized that they are no more living there because of the harsh implications of Turkish Republic. We previously evaluated that in literature there are lots of reification procedures towards different ethnic identities and their wealth. Participants also touch this issue of marginalization of ethnic identities because of their wealth.

**Conclusion**

In this research, we attempted to figure out that Turkish society is continuously changing. These elements of alterations were traced by referring to cultural outputs of cinema and literature. These instruments of change were highly apparent in those cultural texts. Conceptualizations of Foucault and Sennett were used to embody the issue of space, and its relationality to Turkey. Relationality and irreducibility are also pointed out in categories of class, gender and ethnicity.

In this regard, it is important to emphasize that both theoretical textual analysis and preliminary findings of the focus groups showed that these categories are not separable from each other. It means that class, gender and ethnicity are intersecting their features. For instance, Kurdish identity is politicized by urban poorness in the cinematic space. Likewise, repression of gender is empowered by the existence of harsh nationalist discourses. In conjunction with this, identity politics are occupied agendas of political and public spheres in Turkish society. It should be interrogated that if a certain situation continues, will identity politics still be powerful in future when this complex and relational framework is considered.

In addition to this, space cannot be distinguished by the existence of time. This heterogeneous relation between time and space is a core issue to understand the reasons of this complex relationality and irreducibility between class, gender and ethnicity. Heterotopic feature in the cinematic space is not freely constituted by the existence of time. In fact, this space becomes possible and establishes its manifestation in reality by this ambiguous relationship between time and space.

This analysis benefited from two focus group studies. These groups enabled this study to be more dimensional and wide-ranging. Future research has certain potentials to intensify this topic regarding relationality of space, gender, ethnicity and class in the changing position of Turkey. Research accurately focused on the current time in Turkey by considering processes of neoliberalism, globalization and identity politics. Yet, future research might concentrate only on a certain phenomenon of the changing structures of Turkey. The research revealed that identity politics and neoliberalism are important signifiers of these alterations. Therefore, another study could figure out these phenomena of neoliberalism and identity politics more explicitly by applying it to the general framework of ongoing Turkey.

**Bibliography**

Adams, M. (2007). *Self and Social Change.* Wiltshire: Sage.

Arat, Y. (2009). *Religion, Politics and Gender Equality in Turkey.* Heinrich Böll Foundation.

Arslan, S. (n.d.). The New Cinema of Turkey. *New Cinemas: Journal of Contemporary Film*, 95.

Bıçakçı, B. (2013). *Sinek Isırıklarının Müellifi.* İletişim Yayınları.

Blandy, S., Sibley, D. (2010). Law, Boundaries and the Production of Space. *Social & Legal Studies*, 277.

Bonazzi, A. (2002). Heterotopolgy an Geography: A Reflection. *Space and Culture*, 43.

Bondi, L. (2005). Troubling Space: Making Space, Doing Space. *Group Analysis*, 142.

Boratav, H. B., Fisek, G. O., & Ziya, H. E. (2014). Unpacking Masculinities in the Context of Social Change: Internal Complexities of Identities of Married Man in Turkey. *Men and Masculunities*, 303.

Buğra, A. (2007). Poverty and Citizen Ship: An Overview of the Social-Policy Environment in Republican Turkey. *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 46.

Eriş, M. Ü. (2014a). Benim Adım Feridun. In M. Ü. Eriş, *Olduğu Kadar Güzeldik* (p. 36). İletişim Yayınları.

Eriş, M. Ü. (2014b). Malibu. In M. Ü. Eriş, *Olduğu Kadar Güzeldik* (p. 73). İletişim Yayınları.

Foucault, M. (1984). Of Other Spaces: Utopias and Heterotopias., (p. 9).

Göle, N. (1998). Modernleşme Bağlamında İslami Kimlik Arayışı. In S. Bozdoğan, & R. Kasaba, *Türkiye'de Modernleşme ve Ulusal Kimlik.* Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları.

Harvey, D. (1991). *The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change.* Wiley-Blackwell.

Howarth, D. (2006). Space, Subjectivity and Politics. *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political*, 110.

Keyman, F. E., Koyuncu, B. (2005). Globalization, Alternative Modernities and the Political Economy of Turkey. *Review of International Political Economy*, 109.

Kitzinger, J., Barbour, R. S. (1999). Introduction: the challange and promise of focus groups. In R. S. Barbour, & J. Kitzinger, *Developing Focus Group Research* (p. 4). Sage.

Johnson, P. (2006). Unravelling Foucault's 'different spaces'. *History of the Human Sciences*, 78, 82.

Mills, A. (2006). Boundaries of the nation in the space of the urban: landscape and social memory in Istanbul. *Cultural Geographies*, 375.

Özcan, G. B., Turunç, H. (2011). Economic Liberalization and Class Dynamics in Turkey: New Business Groups and Islamic Mobilization. *Insight Turkey*, 70.

Phipps, A. (2014). *The Politics of the Body: Gender in a Neoliberal and Neoconservative Age*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Sanders, E., Williams, C. (2003). Hernessing People's Creativity: Ideation and Expression through Visual Communication. In J. Langford, & D. McDonagh, *Focus Groups* (p. 147). Taylor&Francis.

Sassen, S. (2013). Does The City Have Speech? *Public Culture, 25*, 217,218.

Saunders, A. (2009). Literary Geography: Reforging The Connections. *Progress in Human Geography*, 441.

Sennett, R. (2002). Reflections on the Public Realm. In G. Bridge, & S. Watson, *A Companion to the City* (p. 386). Wiley-Blackwell.

Shilling, C. (1993). *The Body and Physical Capital.* Sage.

Söğüt, M. (2003). *Beş Sevim Apartmanı.* İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları.

Soja, E. W. (2011). History: Geography: Modernity. In E. W. Soja, *Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Social Theory* (p. 16, 20). Verso.

Tuğal, C. (2009). Transforming Everyday Life: Islamism and Social Movement Theory. *Theory and Society*, 443.