

TRAKYA BÖLGESİ TOPRAKLARININ BİTKİYE YARAYIŞLI FOSFOR DURUMUNUN BELİRLENMESİNDE DEĞİŞİK KİMYASAL EKSTRAKSİYON YÖNTEMLERİNİN KARŞILAŞTIRILMASI

Korkmaz BELLITURK¹, Fatma DANISMAN¹, Nazlı BALDAN PAKDİL², Fuat YILMAZ³

Tel: + 90 282 293 14 42 Fax: + 90 282 293 14 54, E-mail: fuaty@tu.tzf.edu.tr

¹Department of Soil Science, Faculty of Agriculture, Namik Kemal University, 59030-Tekirdag/Turkey.

Tel: + 90 282 293 14 42 Fax: + 90 282 293 14 54, E-mail: korkmaz@tu.tzf.edu.tr

²Department of Environmental Engineering, Dokuz Eylul University, Kaynaklar Campus, 35160, Buca-Izmir/Turkey

Tel: +90 232 412 7140 Fax: + 90 232 453 11 43, E-mail: nazli.baldan@deu.edu.tr

³Department of Agricultural Economics, Faculty of Agriculture, Namik Kemal University, 59030-Tekirdag/Turkey.

Tel: + 90 282 293 14 42 Fax: + 90 282 293 14 54, E-mail: fuaty@tu.tzf.edu.tr

Alınış: 15 Eylül 2006

Kabul Ediliş: 6 Haziran 2007

Özet: Bu araştırmanın amacı; Tekirdağ iline ait farklı kimyasal ve fiziksel özelliklere sahip toprakların fosfor durumunu biyolojik yöntem olarak seçilen Neubauer fide yöntemine göre saptamak ve bu toprakların bitkiye yarayışlı fosfor miktarının belirlenmesinde 3 farklı kimyasal ekstraksiyon yöntemleri (1- Suda çözünebilir P, 2- Asit florürde çözünebilir P, 3- Sodyum bikarbonatta çözünebilir P) içerisinde biyolojik yöntemle en yüksek ilişkiyi verebilen yöntemi seçmektir. Bu amaçla Tekirdağ ilinden 0-20 cm derinlikte 26 adet toprak örneği alınmıştır.

Sera denemesi, Neubauer fide yöntemine ve tesadüf blokları deneme desenine göre 3 tekrarlamalı olarak yürütülmüştür. Deneme bitkisi olarak çavdar (*Secale cereale L.*) kullanılmıştır.

Deneme topraklarının yarayışlı fosfor kapsamalarını belirlemede kullanılan kimyasal yöntemlerden uygun olanının seçilmesinde biyolojik (standart) ölçüt olarak bitki P içeriği, bitki P alımı ve kuru madde üretimi temel alınmıştır.

Denemede kullanılan kimyasal ekstraksiyon yöntemlerinin tümü ile çavdar bitkisinin kuru madde miktarları arasında herhangi bir ilişki bulunamamıştır.

Araştırma sonuçlarına göre, sadece suda çözünebilir fosfor yöntemi ile bitki P içeriği ve bitki P alımı arasında önemli ilişkiler bulunmuştur (sırasıyla $r=0.374^*$, $r=0.342$). Suda Çözünebilir P yönteminin Trakya Bölgesi topraklarının fosfor tayini için en uygun yöntem olduğu ortaya çıkmıştır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Çavdar, ekstraksiyon yöntemi, Neubauer fide yöntemi, yarayışlı fosfor.

A Comparison for Different Chemical Extraction Methods in Determining the Available Phosphorus Existence for Plants at Soils in Thrace

Abstract: The purpose of this study is to determine the phosphorus status of soils of Tekirdag province that have different chemical and physical properties according to the Neubauer seedling method which is selected as a biological index method and to select the method which gives highest relationship from the 3 different chemical extraction methods (1- Water soluble P, 2- Soluble P in acid fluoride, 3- Soluble P in sodium bicarbonate) for determining the available phosphorus amount. For this purpose 26 samples of soil are collected from 0-20 cm depth in Tekirdag.

The greenhouse study has been performed in accordance to the Neubauer seedling method and a completely randomized block desing with 3 replications. The rye (*Secale cereale L.*) has been selected as the test plant.

In order to determine the most suitable chemical method, the dry matter yield, phosphorus content and total phosphorus uptake of the test plant has been taken as the biological (standard) criterion.

No relationship has been found between any of the chemical extraction methods and dry matter yield of rye plant in this study.

According to the research results, significant relationships have been found only with the water soluble phosphorus method and phosphorus content and total phosphorus uptake of the test plant (respectively $r=0.374^*$, $r=0.342$). Method of P soluble in water is found to be the most appropriate method in determining the phosphor in soils of Thrace region.

Keywords: Available phosphorus, extraction method, Neubauer seedling method, rye.

Introduction

One of the most lacking plant nutrients for the soils of our country is phosphorus which is to be added by fertilizing. Also phosphorus is an essential nutrient for living creatures. There's no element as important as phosphorus for the plants except nitrogen. It is known that phosphorus found in all living cells has a great role in photosynthesis, in synthesis and analysis of carbohydrates and in energy transportation inside the cell. The phosphorus which is mostly occurred in young portions such as flowers and seeds is utilized for new cell formation (Yurtsever, 1973).

Many methods are being used in determining the phosphorus quantities of soils. In selection of one of these methods generally pH values of soils is being considered. According to the pH values; method of soluble in acid flour for acid soils, method of soluble phosphorus in water for natural soils and method of soluble phosphorus in "sodium bicarbonate" are commonly used. In situations where the soils have different pH values this discrimination is not taken into account and for soils of that region, routine methods is used. In Thrace soils which has several different pH values are exists. As a result of this statement the most appropriate P analysis method will be determined by the method of Neubauer seedling.

The factors such as clay type and amount, organic matter content, Fe, Al, CaCO₃ and pH levels affect the phosphorus availability and holding. For that reason, information about the phosphorus behavior in soils leads the way in using the phosphorus fertilizers (Velayutham, 1980).

It is now inevitable to increase the possibility to take the highest crop from unit area because of the problems about the depletion of agricultural areas, the continuous reduction in rural population, the increasing of world population, the famine and inadequate nourishment in the developed and developing countries. For that reason, the irrigation, mechanization, good seedling, insecticiding and farmer education factors, the fertilizer usage is also very important. Fertilizers are one of the most important production inputs which increase the agricultural efficiency (Yilmaz, 2004).

Thrace is a region where the soil is used effectively. %20 of the fertilizers consumed in Turkey is used in this region. Most of the phosphorus fertilizers used in Marmara Agricultural Region between 1972 and 2000 have been consumed in Tekirdag county (22 246 ton P₂O₅/year) (Eyupoglu, 2002).

In a research performed in Tekirdag county with 20 soils it has been determined that %45 of the soils contain excessive phosphate (Belliturk ve Saglam, 2005).

Neubauer has made a study for determining the seedling method and the method which gives the highest relationship with 9 different chemical extraction methods in determining the beneficial phosphorus amount of Erzurum-Daphan plain soils. At this mentioned study, none of the chemical extraction methods related with the biological methods (Yildiz et al., 2003).

Eleven extraction methods were used in an experiment conducted in Erzurum region. No significant correlation coefficients (r) were determined between the extraction method and Neubauer seedling method. The reason of this result was the high level available K contents of soils (Akman and Yildiz, 1999).

In this study, it is aimed to select the most proper method for determining the suitable phosphate amount in agriculture cultivated Tekirdag soils.

Material and Method

The research has performed in 26 soil samples which show different textures and taken from 0-20 cm depth of various locations in Tekirdag before the cultivation and fertilization in 2004-2005 wheat and sunflower season. The physical and chemical analyses of the soils have been made at the Thrace University Tekirdag Agriculture Faculty Soil Department laboratories. The pH, salinity, organic matter, CaCO₃ (Saglam, 2001; Kacar, 1995) and texture analyses (Tuzuner, 1990) have been made in soil samples. MSTAT computer software has been used in statistical analysis of data obtained in trial.

Methods Used to Determine the Available Soil Phosphorus

a. Biological Method: Neubauer seedling method has been used as a biological method for determining the phosphorus contents of the soil samples in conformity with its rules (Saglam, 2005). That method is widely used as a standard method for calibrating the chemical extraction methods. For the application of Neubauer seedling method, 100 mature rye seeds of which their weights measured are cultivated in glass pots with a mix of 100 g soil and 300 g sand. In parallel with this, rye seeds with the same weight are left for breeding in pots containing 400 g sand. Approximately after 18 days growth, the root and shoots of plant are processed to chemical analysis and their phosphorus (or potassium) contents are determined. The difference between the contents of plants cultivated in soil and plants cultivated in sand gives the phosphorus amount taken by the plant from the soil. Then, the decision about the soil's fertilizer necessity is reached by considering the phosphorus amount taken by the plant from the soil (Saglam, 2005).

The phosphorus in rye plant was determined with the vanadomolybdophosphoric yellow color method after digested nitric-perchloric acid mixture (Kacar, 1972).

b. Chemical Extraction Methods: Three different methods have been used for determining the phosphorus amount in soils. These methods were summarized briefly below:

Water Soluble P Method (Bingham method): Air dried 5 g soil samples are filtered after shaken 5 min with 50 ml pure water. In this method which is developed by Bingham (1962), the phosphorus transferred to water that treated as extract solution is measured by molybdophosphoric blue color method.

Acid-Fluoride Soluble P Method (Bray and Kurtz No.1 Method): Air dried 1 g soil sample are filtered after shaken 1 min with 7 ml extract solution (0.03 N NH₄F+0.025 N HCl). In this method which is developed by Bray and Kurtz (1945), the phosphorus joined to water that treated as extract solution are measured colorimetrically by molybdophosphoric blue color method.

Sodium Bicarbonate Soluble P Method (Olsen Method): Air dried 5 g soil sample are filtered after shaken 30 min with 100 ml 8.5 pH extract solution (0.5 M NaHCO₃) . In this method which is developed by Olsen et al. (1954), the phosphorus amount dissolved to water that treated as extract solution are measured by molybdophosphoric blue color method.

Table 1. Some physical and chemical properties of soil samples.

Soil No	pH (1/2.5 H ₂ O)	Salt (%)	Organic Matter (%)	CaCO ₃ (%)	Structure			Class
					Clay (%)	Silt (%)	Sand (%)	
1	6.50	0.01	1.16	0.00	27.53	39.63	32.83	CL
2	6.57	0.01	1.40	0.00	18.09	14.33	67.58	SL
3	7.43	0.02	2.16	0.00	43.13	4.27	52.60	SC
4	8.01	0.03	1.65	16.80	38.02	48.05	13.93	SiCL
5	5.40	0.01	0.95	0.00	8.46	10.07	81.47	LS
6	7.82	0.01	0.69	2.00	32.19	4.24	63.58	SCL
7	7.98	0.02	2.01	9.21	21.33	52.29	26.38	SiL
8	7.96	0.01	1.73	8.80	37.52	43.29	19.19	SiCL
9	6.69	0.02	1.51	0.00	39.41	6.16	54.43	SC
10	7.98	0.04	0.99	12.41	23.14	35.13	41.73	L
11	6.74	0.01	1.32	0.00	38.26	35.73	26.01	CL
12	7.82	0.03	0.98	2.00	25.67	46.29	28.05	L
13	8.20	0.02	1.00	7.21	30.10	47.54	22.36	CL
14	8.22	0.02	1.03	10.00	37.87	34.69	27.44	CL
15	6.65	0.01	1.26	0.00	22.41	36.94	40.65	L
16	7.16	0.02	1.09	0.00	17.44	24.45	58.10	SL
17	7.56	0.03	0.41	2.97	30.90	24.25	44.85	CL
18	7.58	0.03	1.77	9.48	31.53	42.47	26.00	CL
19	6.73	0.01	1.70	0.38	27.19	14.47	58.34	SCL
20	7.70	0.02	1.26	1.44	34.15	34.92	29.92	CL
21	7.20	0.02	2.49	0.39	29.73	39.87	30.40	CL
22	7.94	0.02	1.65	5.46	34.01	37.51	28.48	CL
23	7.63	0.02	0.79	14.75	9.23	28.84	61.93	SL
24	7.68	0.02	1.96	1.92	25.32	18.38	56.30	SCL
25	7.38	0.02	1.01	0.19	16.50	23.54	59.96	SL
26	7.30	0.01	1.41	0.38	20.78	18.04	61.18	SCL
Min.	5.40	0.01	0.41	0.00	8.46	4.24	13.93	
Max.	8.22	0.04	2.49	16.80	43.13	52.29	67.58	

Results and Discussion

Some Physical and Chemical Properties of Soil Samples: Some Physical and Chemical Properties of the studied soils were given in Table 1. The pH values of soil samples vary from 5.40 to 8.22. Considering the % salinity values of soil samples, all of them are in salt-free class (% salt = 0.00-0.15), (U.S. Soil Survey Staff, 1951). The % CaCO₃ of the soil samples vary from % 0.00 to % 16.80. The organic material contents of soils vary from % 0.41 to % 2.49. Though organic matter content of 6 soils are < % 1.0 these are classified as “very low”, organic matter content of 17 soils vary % 1.0-2.0 these are classified as “low” and organic matter content of 3 soils vary % 2.0-3.0 these are classified as “middle” (Eyupoglu, 1999). According to these results, approx. %90 of soils are lack of organic material. Similar results have been confirmed with the studies made by Belliturk and Saglam (2005). When the texture classes of soils were examined, it seems that they range widely.

Results Obtained From Chemical Extraction Method: The phosphorus contents of Tekirdag soils found using various chemical extraction methods were given in Table 2. When Table 2 examined, it could be seen that the phosphorus contents determined by the water soluble phosphorus method vary from 0.132 ppm to 17.382 ppm. The lowest value have been got from 17 numbered soil and the highest value from 5 numbered soil. The phosphorus amounts determined by the NaHCO₃ soluble phosphorus method vary from 5.462 ppm to 46.154 ppm. The lowest value have been got from 20 numbered soil and the highest value from 16 numbered soil. The phosphorus amounts determined by the acid-fluoride soluble phosphorus method vary from 0.224 ppm to 18.219 ppm. The lowest value have been got from 20 numbered soil and the highest value from 5 numbered soil.

Table 2. Available phosphorus contents (ppm) obtained with different chemical extraction methods from soil samples

Soil No	Chemical Extraction Methods		
	Water Soluble Phosphorus Method (ppm P)	Soluble Phosphorus Method in Acid Fluoride (ppm P)	Soluble Phosphorus Method in Sodium Bicarbonate (ppm P)
1	4.460	8.466	3.420
2	6.107	22.121	4.821
3	14.638	24.852	11.156
4	1.647	6.554	1.289
5	17.382	40.419	18.219
6	0.846	12.836	0.617
7	2.722	18.571	0.785
8	1.555	27.310	1.794
9	1.166	25.671	3.476
10	2.790	23.213	0.561
11	3.682	17.752	5.214
12	3.339	6.554	0.729
13	2.127	17.205	1.514
14	2.516	29.768	0.448
15	10.749	19.663	7.232
16	17.153	46.154	10.707
17	0.132	12.563	1.794
18	0.232	12.836	1.177
19	1.192	14.747	7.960
20	0.331	5.462	0.224
21	0.662	37.415	2.298
22	0.331	10.651	2.242
23	0.629	12.836	0.617
24	0.497	21.575	0.448
25	2.319	32.499	14.463
26	0.596	35.777	3.756
Min.	0.132	5.462	0.224
Max.	17.382	46.154	18.219

Greenhouse Study Results:The dry matter weights (g/pot), phosphorus contents (%) and phosphorus uptakes (mg/pot) of the rye plant cultivated in Tekirdag soils according to Neubauer seedling method were given in Table 3.

It has been determined that dry matter weights of rye plant cultivated in treatment soils according to Neubauer seedling method vary from 3.75 g/pot to 4.45 g/pot, and the phosphorus uptakes vary from 57.3 mg/pot to 114.1 mg/pot.

Table 3. Biological criteria of rye plant according to Neubauer seedling method.

Soil No	Dried Matter Yield (g/pot)	Phosphorus Content in Plant, (%)	Phosphorus Uptake by Plant, (mg/pot)
1	4.02	2.67	107.3
2	3.95	2.63	103.9
3	4.45	2.45	109.0
4	3.85	2.39	92.0
5	3.99	2.86	114.1
6	4.05	2.32	93.9
7	3.78	2.75	104.0
8	4.36	2.57	112.1
9	3.95	2.42	95.6
10	4.25	1.68	71.4
11	4.40	2.50	110.0
12	4.14	2.71	112.2
13	3.95	2.51	99.2
14	3.92	2.39	93.7
15	3.76	2.44	91.7
16	3.78	2.53	95.6
17	3.75	2.28	85.5
18	4.25	2.28	96.9
19	4.30	2.60	111.8
20	3.98	1.97	78.4
21	4.35	1.96	85.3
22	4.44	1.29	57.3
23	3.85	2.42	93.2
24	4.08	1.46	59.6
25	4.15	1.38	57.3
26	4.10	2.54	104.0
Min.	3.75	0.85	57.3
Max.	4.45	2.86	114.1

Relations Between Chemical Methods and Biological Check Values: The values belonging to relations between chemical methods and biological check values have been given in Table 4 for choosing the most proper chemical method using for determining the beneficial phosphorus amounts in Tekirdag soils.

Table 4. Correlation coefficient between chemical methods and biological criteria (r).

Biological Criterion	Chemical Extraction Methods		
	Water Soluble Phosphorus Method	Soluble Phosphorus Method in Acid Fluoride	Soluble Phosphorus Method in Sodium Bicarbonate
Dried matter yield (g/pot)	-0.144 #	0.023 #	0.069 #
Phosphorus content in plant, (%)	0.374 *	0.038 #	0.130 #
Phosphorus uptake by plant, (mg/pot)	0.342 *	0.043 #	0.156 #

*: 0.05 significant #: insignificant

As seen in the Table 4, a negative relation ($r = -0.144$) between dry matter weight (g/pot) of rye plant and water soluble phosphorus method has been determined which is statistically non-significant. Positive relations ($r = 0.023$ and $r = 0.069$) between dry matter amount (g/pot) of rye plant and acid-fluoride soluble phosphorus method has been determined which are also statistically non-significant. In a similar study performed in Erzurum-Daphan plain soils, 9 various chemical extraction methods have been studied and determined that none of these methods are statistically in relation with mentioned standard methods. (Yildiz et al., 2003).

An $r = 0.374$ positive relation between phosphorus content of rye plant and water soluble phosphorus method has been determined which is statistically significant ($P < 0.05$). An $r = 0.038$ and $r = 0.130$ positive relations between phosphorus content of rye plant and NaHCO_3 and water soluble phosphorus methods have been determined which are statistically non-significant.

An $r = 0.342$ positive relation between phosphorus intake of rye plant and water soluble phosphorus method has been determined which is statistically significant ($P < 0.05$). An $r = 0.043$ and $r = 0.156$ positive relations between phosphorus intake (mg/pot) of rye plant and NaHCO_3 and water soluble phosphorus methods have been determined which are statistically non-significant.

As to Table 4, none of the three chemical extraction methods used in the study about the dry material efficiency of rye plant have given a relation between mentioned standard methods. But, positive relations have been obtained in phosphorus soluble method when P content and P intake biological check values were chosen as criteria.

It has been determined by the researchers who studied on determining the most proper method for Mediterranean region soils and compared various methods that water soluble P method could be applied for the regional soils successfully (Kacar et al., 1976).

According to research results, available P content is sufficient level in experiment soils and appliance of the water soluble P method could be applied successfully for determining the beneficial P content of regional soils. For obtaining the highest yield from the sustainable agriculture and fertilization, it is vital to determine the phosphorus fertilizer with the proper analysis method.

REFERENCES

- AKMAN, I. and YILDIZ, N. Evaluation of potassium status of Daphan plain soils and suitability of different chemical methods used to determine plant available soil potassium of this soils. Atatürk Univ. Journal of Agricultural Faculty, 30 (1): 15-24, 1999.
- BELLITURK, K., SAGLAM, MT. A Research on the Urea Hydrolysis Rate in the Soils of Turkey. Pakistan Journal of Biological Sciences. 8 (3): 446-449, 2005.
- BINGHAM, FT Chemical soil tests for available phosphorus. Soil Sci. 94, 87-95, 1962.
- BRAY, RH, KURTZ, LT. Determination of total, organic and available forms of phosphorus in soils. Soil Sci. 59, 39-45, 1945.
- EYUPOGLU, F. Fertility States of Turkish Soils. General Directorate of Rural Services. Soil and Fertilizer Research Institute. Technical Publication No: T-67, General Publication No: 220, Ankara, 1999.
- EYUPOGLU, F. Fertilizer Requirement, Consumption and Future for Turkey. General Directorate of Rural Services. Soil and Fertilizer Research Institute. Technical Publication No: T-2, General Publication No: 2, Ankara, 2002.
- KACAR, B. Chemical Analysis' of Plant and Soil: II. Plant Analysis'. Ankara University Agricultural Faculty Publications: 453. Application guide: 155, Ankara, 1972.
- KACAR, B., AMIN, SM, CELEBI, G, TURAN, C. A research on the phosphorus state of Antalya coast region soils and methods to determine the available phosphorus in these soils. TUBITAK-Research Group of Agricultural and Forestry Serial No: 42, Ankara, pp. 1-100, 1976.
- KACAR, B. Chemical Analysis' of Plant and Soil: III, Soil Analysis'. Ankara University, Agricultural Faculty, Education Research and Development Publications No:3, Ankara, pp.706, 1995.
- OLSEN, SR, COLE, CV, WATANABE, FS, DEAN, LA. Estimation of available phosphorus in soils by extraction with sodium bicarbonate. U.S. Dept. Of Agric. Cric. 939, Washington D.C., USA, 1954.
- SAGLAM, MT. Methods of Soil and Water Analysis. Trakya University Agricultural Faculty of Tekirdag Publications, Publication No:189, Handbook No: 5, Tekirdag, 2001.
- SAGLAM, MT. Fertilizers and Fertilization (7th edition). Trakya University Agricultural Faculty of Tekirdag Publications No: 149, Study Book: 74, Tekirdag, 2005.
- TUZUNER, A. Handbook of Soil and Water Analysis. Ministry of Agriculture and Village Work, General Directorate of Rural Services, Ankara, 1990.
- US SOIL SURVEY STAFF. Soil survey manual. Agricultural Research Administration. U.S. Dept. Agriculture, Handbook No: 18, U.S. Govt. Print. Office Washington D.C, 1951.
- VELAYUTHAM, M. The problem of phosphate fixation by minerals and soil colloids. Phosphorus Agric., 77: 1-8, 1980.
- YILDIZ, N, BILGIN, N, AKSU, E. Evaluation of phosphorus status of Erzurum-Daphan Plain soils. GAP III. Agricultural Congress, 02-03 September, Sanliurfa, pp. 583-586, 2003.
- YILMAZ, H. Developments in fertilizer production, consumption and foreign trade in Turkey. Turkey's 3rd National Fertilizer Congress, Agriculture-Industry-Environment, 11-13 September, Tokat, pp.35-46, 2004.
- YURTSEVER, N. Economic phosphorus fertilizer amounts for wheat plant in Thrace region's conditions according to the soil analysis'. Soil and Fertilizer Research Institute, No:26, Ankara, 1973.