



Copyright © 2018 Republic of Turkey Ministry of Youth and Sports

<http://genclikarastirmalari.gsb.gov.tr/>

Journal of Youth Researches • August 2018 • 6(15) • 191-207

ISSN 2147-8473

Received | 04 July 2018

Accepted | 16 July 2018

Reproduction in Ethiopian Education: The Role of High School Civics and Ethical Education Textbooks

*Amina Menur Mudesir**

*İsmail Doğan***

Abstract

Meaningful education is essential for everyone and has a great responsibility of nation building. The purpose of this study is to examine the role of high school (from grade 9-12) civics and ethical education textbooks in reproduction of Ethiopian education. The pattern of social identities such as gender, culture and religion is not equally represented in civic and ethical textbooks. The education system has generally resulted in reproducing existing patterns of the educational inequalities such as enrolment and the outcomes of education. Specifically, females and Muslim societies are generally having very low percent of enrolment from primary to university education and few people work as highly skilled professionals. To conduct this study, the researcher used qualitative research methodology like semi-structured interview and document analysis methods. The presence of different identities in textbooks is important from both the educational and sociological stances. The personalities presented can influence all students in their socialization process. In the textbooks, the existing patterns have a problem of consistently revealing some social identities and unrepresenting or ignoring other social identities. In order to have equal representation and avoiding biases of gender, cultural and religious diversity in school curriculum, the educational planners should revise the existing textbooks.

Keywords: Educational Reproduction, Representation, Gender, Culture, Religion, Textbook, Socialization.

* Doctoral Student, Ankara University, Institute of Educational Science, Ankara. aminamenur12@gmail.com

** Prof. Dr. Ankara University, Faculty of Education Sciences, Ankara, idoğan0616@hotmail.com



Copyright © 2018 T.C. Gençlik ve Spor Bakanlığı
http://genclikarastirmalari.gsb.gov.tr/
Gençlik Araştırmaları Dergisi • Ağustos 2018 • 6(15) • 192-207

ISSN 2147-8473
Başvuru | 04 Temmuz 2018
Kabul | 16 Temmuz 2018

İNCELEME / ARAŞTIRMA

Etiyopya Eğitiminde Yeniden Üretim: Lise Yurtaşlık ve Etik Eğitimi Ders Kitaplarının Rolü

*Amina Menur Mudesir**
*İsmail Doğan***

Öz

Anlamli eğitim herkes için vazgeçilmezdir ve ulus inşasında büyük sorumluluk alır. Bu çalışmanın amacı, Etiyopya eğitiminin yeniden üretilmesinde lisenin (9-12. Sınıf) yurtaşlık ve etik eğitim ders kitaplarının rolünü incelemektir. Yurtaşlık ve etik ders kitaplarında toplumsal cinsiyet, kültür ve din gibi sosyal kimliklerin örüntüsü eşit olarak temsil edilmemektedir. Eğitim sistemi genel olarak eğitimdeki eşitsizliklerin mevcut örüntüleri yeniden üretme ile sonuçlanmıştır, örneğin kayıdı ve sonuçlar. Özellikle, kadınlar ve Müslüman toplumlarda genellikle, ilköğretimden üniversiteye kayıt olma oranının çok düşük olduğunu ve çok az sayıda kişinin yüksek vasıflı profesyoneller olarak çalışmakta olduklarını belirtmektedir. Bu çalışmayı yürütmek için araştırmacı, yarı yapılandırılmış görüşme ve belge analizi yöntemleri gibi nitel araştırma yöntemleri kullanmıştır. Ders kitaplarında farklı kimliklerin bulunması, hem eğitim hem de sosyolojik örneklerden önemlidir. Sunulan kişilikler, tüm öğrencileri sosyalleşme sürecinde etkileyebilir. Ders kitaplarında, mevcut örüntülerde bazı sosyal kimlikleri tutarlı bir şekilde ortaya koyma ve temsil edilmeyen diğer sosyal kimlikleri yok sayma sorunu vardır. Eğitim müfredatında toplumsal cinsiyet, kültürel ve dini çeşitliliği eşit temsilde bulunmak ve önyargılardan kaçınmak için eğitim planlayıcıları mevcut ders kitaplarını gözden geçirmelidir.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Eğitimde Yeniden Üretim, Temsil Etmek, Toplumsal Cinsiyet, Kültür, Din, Ders Kitabı, Sosyalleştirme.

* Doktora Öğrencisi, Ankara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, Ankara. aminamenur12@gmail.com

** Prof. Dr. Ankara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi, Ankara, idogan0616@hotmail.com

Introduction

Meaningful education is essential for everyone and has a great responsibility of nation building. Education plays a vital role in behavioural, social, cultural and economic development of all people. It provides social, cultural, economic benefits for individuals and society at large. Many educationalists also pointed out that education is central to the well-being of the society in which they live. As it is known, the right to education is regarded as universal and inviolable. Education is a primary human right and promotes individual freedom and empowerment and yields important development benefits. Ensuring respect for the right to education without discrimination of any kind on any grounds will help all students to rich the desired future opportunities. Respecting differences of students in regarding gender, cultural, religious and linguistic identity needs to be reconciled with the universal and diversity right to education as part of a broader set of human rights (UNESCO, 2005:2012:2017).

But unjust school curricula and educational policies through which is maintained create barriers to educational success for underprivileged society. I believe that Ethiopian education serves the needs of existed structure, in that it is set up to reproduce and sustain existing dominant stratification and yet unable to avoid systemic biases against students with different backgrounds. In addition, the education system has generally resulted in reproducing existing patterns of the educational inequalities such as enrolment and the outcomes of education. Specifically, females and Muslim societies are generally having very low percent of primary to university enrolment and people as working highly skilled professionals. The impact can be seen in many areas, including employment, education and public life.

In Ethiopia, unequal gender relations have continued to favour the success of male students throughout the school system. This success is manifested through the sustained higher number of male students in the classrooms, particularly in universities and other institutions of higher learning such as teacher colleges and technical education institutes. It is also evident in the makeup of teaching and administrative personnel, the overwhelming majority of whom are male. Although there has been a considerable increase in the number of female students of late, the overall male/female ratio is still heavily skewed toward the male population.

Hence, every child irrespective of social background (e.g. gender, culture and/or religion) should be granted equal educational opportunities. However, in school curriculum it helps to some of the nation, gives strong identity building and for the others it undermines systematically. Thus, I claim that textbooks misrepresent and overlook some social identities. Then again, Ethiopian school curriculum's bias for different social identities and the hidden dimension of school textbooks should not be permitted to remain hidden. As to many researches confirmation, educational reproductions result from a disregard of social, cultural, and religious diversity realities that exist in any country. I argue that

in Ethiopia, the secondary school Civic and Ethical Education (CEE) textbooks do not recognize to the existing realities regarding gender, cultural and religious equality and continue to perpetuate the reproduction of education. Thus, the main objective of this study is to examine how educational reproduction is occurring through the representation of social identities like gender, culture and religion in civic and ethical education textbooks (grade 9-12). I believe that these research findings shed light on the importance of gender, culture and religion representation in textbook reform and revision. I did the research only on secondary school CEE textbooks and all school textbooks shall be seen from the representation of all social identities in country for better development of students.

The Ethiopian Federal Democratic Republic is located in the north-eastern part of Africa. The second African country has a population of approximately 96,633,458, and more than 80 different ethnic groups and 80 local languages. It is one of the multi-ethnic and multilingual nations and its economy is almost entirely dependent on agriculture (Central Central Statistics Agency (CSA), 2014). There are different religions in the country. According to CSA's 2007 data and Central Intelligence of America (CIA) religion in Ethiopia is composed of Orthodox Christians (43.5%), Muslims (33.9%), Protestant Christians (18.5%), traditional (2.7%), Catholic Christians (0.7%), and 0.6% of the society follows other religions. Ethiopia is also known in worldwide by its site of the first Hijra in Islamic history and the oldest Muslim settlement in Africa at Nejashi. It has the largest number of UNESCO world heritage in Africa and the one of the sources of Nile River. Therefore, socio-cultural diversity is one of the important features of Ethiopian society. Its people are categorized into a number of regions, ethnic groups as well as religions. All groups have their own specific cultures, customs, and local languages.

Review of Literature

Textbooks in Reproduction of Gender, Culture and Religion

Textbooks continue to be one of the primary sources of curriculum content used in the classroom for most teachers and students. Textbooks also play a dominant role in shaping students' worldviews. Consequently, curriculum, as embodied in textbooks, tends to transmit the values, knowledge, and ideologies of the dominant group, and supports the status quo (Apple, 2004:2012). The set of organized activities that take place in schools as formal education are intended to transmit skills, knowledge, and values. To transmit knowledge and culture, the school curriculum is prepared knowledge, skill and values in textbooks (Abdi and Cleghorn, 2005). Schools teach children to be functionally literate, providing them with the general knowledge they will need to take part in society, and to work (Apple, 2004:2012).

According to Apple (2004), textbooks have to play dominant roles in the transmission of knowledge and culture to students. The structure, content, narratives, representation of people and events in textbooks are the central source in transmitting knowledge

and culture to students. However, if the content of textbooks misrepresents or omit some social identities, it can lead children to believe that the available knowledge in the textbooks is true and feel isolated (UNESCO, 2017). Likewise, students unlikely to acquire any sense of identity or feel alienation. As example, when students only have access to textbooks that represent females, in limited social and occupational roles or provide, entirely invisible through their absence, gender role stereotyping ideologies are reproduced through the instructional curriculum (Lindsey, 1997).

The content textbooks are biased in favour of knowledge constructors (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1990). Regarding this, many research findings demonstrate that there is a critical link between the representation in textbooks and social reproduction to the benefit of the dominant groups. As a concrete example to gender, cultural and religious reproductions, we can see the distribution of school personnel, and the treatment of females and males in textbooks. Many research findings on school textbooks reveal a pervasive ideology and the legitimacy of the masculinity (Arnot, 2002).

Mostly, the classroom instruction is based on textbooks (Apple, 2004; Arnot, 2002), and the greater portion of all learning activities is determined, defined, directed and controlled by teachers (Freire, 2005). The contents of the textbooks perpetuating gender, cultural and religious inequities (Bourdieu and Passeron, 1990) which is similar to the existing in society. Thus, students continuously learn directly and/or indirectly powerful messages about separate and unequal opportunities based on gender, culture and religion through the books they read, to the role models they see, to the way they are treated in classrooms (Arnot, 2002; UNESCO, 2006).

Textbooks are the commonly used as a source of knowledge by students. The presentations of different social identities are biased. Teachers and textbooks are especially important in analysing gender, cultural and religious inequities in education because they are the most pervasively constant factors in the educational process.

Gender, Cultural and Religious Responsive Textbooks

Responsive school textbook is a textbook that responds to the concerns, aspirations, and interests of both genders, diverse cultures of the society, and different religions. It enables students to identify and connect within their culture and school's social environment. A responsive textbook enables each and every student to feel that he or she is rightly and indiscriminately a part and parcel of the school environment (Race, 2011; Wright, Singh and Race, 2012). It does not only give comfortable environment that provides equal voice to each and every student and also facilities to account for every students' religious, cultural and linguistic needs in proportion to those provide to the dominant groups (Schroeder, 2011; Abdi and Cleghorn, 2005). From the feminist theorists' side, they argue about the focus on how gendered knowledge and experience are produced in school textbooks. In their stance, gender inclusive and balanced textbooks are essential (Arnot, 2002).

The textbook has an instrumental role to play in fostering tolerance and promoting human rights and is a powerful tool for transcending cultural, religious and other differences. A responsive textbook takes gender, cultural and religious identities into consideration. It involves breaking gender stereotypes not only in textbooks but in teachers' attitudes and expectations. Multi-cultural and multi-religious approaches in education in which, religion and culture are recognized as an integral part of a student's cultural identity (Race, 2011).

Among other reasons, the sociological studies of the textbooks are encouraged to focus on the role of knowledge developers, codes of practice at school, the balancing of social inclusion, and the dominant elements of the curriculum. The nature of a textbook content (what is actually included, how, and why) is very important since students come to understand themselves and others in a pluralistic society (Doğan, 2012b). School textbooks may seem like a straightforward matter, but it is too complex when we ask whose knowledge is taught in school, who decided what is to be taught at what level, to whom? Hence, filtering the textbook content and teaching strategies through students' cultural frames of reference will help to provide culturally responsive setting for all students (Abdi and Cleghorn, 2005, p.7).

The planning and implementation of textbooks have historically been influenced, therefore, the present debate of what should be included in textbooks continues to prevail. The selection and organization of the knowledge for school textbooks is in the hands of the dominant groups (males) (Gramsci, 1971). Moreover, these groups have written the textbooks according to what they have believed and this would comply to the social and educational setting.

Teachers' backgrounds (gender, cultural, religion, linguistic, and ethnic) play critical roles in the education of students, particularly students of the marginalized (UNESCO, 2006). The idea is that for some groups of students their gender, cultural, religious characteristics are more consistent with the culture, norms, and expectations of the school and teacher. Those students have greater opportunities for academic success than the students whose cultures are less consistent with the school and teachers' culture (Anyon, 2006). The school and teachers' culture is very important for diverse students. Likewise, many researchers affirm that teachers are not only curriculum implementers but also indirectly they are curriculum developers. Moreover, in effective and culturally responsive classrooms the social interaction of the teacher and student is fair and mutually respectful.

Cultural differences have indubitable influence on students' success in schools. Many scholars argue that school textbooks should recognize and respect students home and community cultures, and help to narrow the gap between life in school and the real society. Culturally responsive textbook contents can be derived from the real society's life experiences, histories, cultures, perspectives, contributions, and issues of diverse groups. However, the most common material used in classroom is textbooks, their content and quality is very important (Kim, 2013).

Respecting diversity ensures the equality of opportunity of all children. With responsive textbooks, we can meet the need of children from diverse social class, religion, and culture (Inglis, 2008). For instance, a responsive textbook towards gender has the endeavour to promote gender equality in enrolment and achievement, to try to eliminate gender stereotypes within textbooks and teaching and to socialize girls and boys in a non-violent school environment and to respect for each other's' rights, dignity, and equality (UNESCO, 2005, p. 78). Many writers pointed out that providing and implementing culturally responsive textbooks can make schooling more interesting, more comprehensible, and ultimately more meaningful to all students (Grant and Lei, 2008; Race, 2011; Gay, 2010).

Presentation of Identities in Textbooks

Education is a key vehicle for forming individual for real world. In Ethiopia and most of the world, textbooks are the main resource for teaching and learning in education system. Textbooks are instruments used in the classroom by teachers and students as a source of knowledge in the formal education. It also teaches students how to approach and interpret knowledge. Formal education is one means of promoting equality of gender, culture, religion and all diversity through textbooks. On the other hand, culture is the central idea of citizenship and identity for social cohesion. Education has a major part to play in shaping cultural exchange. Schools are the first places for diverse societies, mutual understanding and building of the society. However, textbooks may help or deny cultural development of students (UNESCO, 2017). Biased in textbooks can be a problem since it contributes to stereotypical and negative perception. If the textbooks have biased or inappropriate illustration about different identities, students can be led to develop narrow view of their country or the world. On the other hand, raising awareness, fostering understanding and respecting gender, different culture and religion in the textbooks help for mutual understanding of the students.

As it is known, textbooks are key mechanisms of socialization that introduces values and norms for students, for instance, different gender roles (Lee, 2011). Moreover, textbooks have a potential to expand, reproduce, socialize and also strengthen social identities of students (Yaqin, 2002). Textbooks serve as means to facilitate the representation of contents about gender, culturally and religiously diverse people. In school textbooks what is represented is the re-representation of the real life of the society. In simple way, Hall (1997) explained representation of meaning creation and transfer of meaning about reality to the reader.

Research Methodology

This article employs qualitative research approach. Qualitative research helps to have detail descriptions of the research (Creswell, 2013, Doğan, 2012a). For this study, qualitative data was used in order to examine how the reproduction of education is continued through Civics and Ethical Education textbooks. To conduct the research,

document analysis, semi-structured interview and focus group discussion are employed. Furthermore, to keep the validity of the study and minimize biasness, I, the researcher used guide line and check list put by UNESCO's Making Textbook Content Inclusive (2017), Guidebook on Textbook Research (Pingel, 2010) and Washington Models for the Evaluation of Bias (2009) and to collect data from one CEE curriculum expert, 17 semi-structured interview with teachers and focus group discussions are used. For the analysis of qualitative data, face-to-face interviews and focus group discussion are categorized and interpreted. Textbooks are analysed to determine how gender, cultural and religious diversities are represented. In order to analyse narrative text, the visual analysis, picture or illustration of people in the textbook are tabulated based on gender, cultural and religious identities. The pictures of people and names of people who most or least appear in the textbooks are counted. Whose knowledge is in curriculum documents? Whose knowledge seems the predominant? Who appears but to a lesser extent? Who is absent? How often do the identities appear in visuals? What roles are taken? How is the balance of representativeness kept? Who are either misrepresented or underrepresented? All these details of analysis are carried out.

Research Findings

The main aim of Civics and Ethical Education is to produce effective and active citizens who will take their own citizenship required code behaviour and citizenship responsibility. By the same token, if it is implemented in appropriate manner, citizenship education is a good facilitator for acquisition of knowledge, skill, values, norms, and attitudes that encourage students to challenge stereotypical and biased thoughts and prejudices towards gender, religion, culture and other social identities. It helps students to develop national and international understandings and shall be designed to promote democracy, human rights and intercultural awareness. But on the contrary, the Ethiopian secondary school civics and ethical education textbooks are found to be in opposite condition. Thus, the representation of different social identities in textbooks impacts positively and negatively to students' perceptions of their own and identities of others. The tables depict the frequency of the representation of social identities like gender, culture and religion in narrations and illustrations in four CEE textbooks.

The textbooks examined are written by men, there is no women participation. As well, they chose to construct sentences that reflected gender stereotypes against women. The textbooks need to provide equal education and job opportunities, but it continues to reinforce gender-biased stereotypes, which let the women to make vicious circle. As a result, women produce themselves and especially the most drawbacks belong to the Muslim women. I found that women suffered from low visibility.

Gender inequality is unjust for women, men, and the societies at large. Many research findings suggests that it can be reduced through education. The general finding is that the kind of bias in textbooks is unfriendly to gender, cultural and religious equality in the

education of students and it will impact negatively on their whole development. However, the kind of unfairness in textbooks does not only present inequality in the representation of women and also presents different cultural and religious groups unfairly.

The examined CEE textbooks numerically weighted more men than that of women characters in active narration and illustration. This is what we call it bias. Bias in general may be identified by determining whose interest is being portrayed and whose interest is being omitted. As well, bias occurs when a gender male or female is not included properly in the textbook or when males are named more than females in the textbook and vice versa. In the examined CEE textbooks, men appeared 174 times but women only 91, mostly men are depicted in occupational roles in both narration and illustrations but women are passive and continue to be undermined, affecting female students' future life chances. The other interesting point, there are 4 women and 29 men examples presented most western and some African heroes or leaders are presented and again no Muslim hero or a leader. The summarized presentation of gender in the textbooks are listed in Table 1.

Table 1, The representationnames in narration of CEE textbooks

Gender 9		Grade				Total
		10	11	12		
Female	Muslim	5	2	1	0	8
	Non-Muslim	19	12	7	2	40
	Total	24	12	8	2	48
Male	Muslim	6	4	1	1	12
	Non-Muslim	33	36	11	9	89
	Total	39	33	12	10	94
Foreigner Female	Muslim	0	0	0	0	0
	Non-Muslim	0	1	1	2	4
	Total	0	1	1	2	4
Foreigner Male	Muslim	0	0	0	0	0
	Non-Muslim	7	4	4	14	29
	Total	7	4	4	14	29

The textbooks mostly depicted women as a mother of having at least two children, poor and in some places where they are represented as primary school teachers and nurses. Moreover, in the narration part instead of chairperson, it is written as chairman. Women are mostly given as example of secondary school student. But men are medical doctors, farmers, secondary school teachers, manual workers, scientists and human right strugglers. Women are passively presented in most group pictures. Men are depicted as doing but women as watching, in four textbook you can find the picture below as an example and Table 2 is a summary of all group pictures.



Source: Grade 9 and 11 CEE textbooks (p.11 and p. 76 respectively)

Table 2, Group Pictures/Illustration

Pictures/Illustration	Grade				Total
	9	10	11	12	
Female	18	7	7	7	39
Male	22	10	10	9	51
Female and Male together	33	29	21	23	106

The study also found that men are represented as independent but women are presented as dependent, mostly poor mother. Women are shown as having irregular income and suffering and struggling to make a living. But both gender must be depicted as dependent/independent, positive/ fearful, active/passive, intelligent, emotional, gentle and caring for others. Nonetheless, in four CEE textbooks have explained about gender equality but it fails to give one good example about women with a good job. The picture below is also an example of gender inequality, male students are at the front and girls sit at the back.



Source: Grade 9 CEE textbook, p.8.

Men are depicted as having high professional roles and responsible citizen, at work place, as writers, journalists, artists, judges, politicians, medical doctors, leaders, heroes, forest expert, soldiers, manual workers, high school teachers, farmers, government officers, and bank clerks. But women are shown as athletes, road cleaners, nurses, leader (only one example), clerks, cashiers, farmer (only one), raped by men (two cases), acid victims, lab technicians, secretaries, pilot (only one), and mostly as poor and hopeless mothers. Generally, they also demonstrate that women's stereotypical roles were related to house work, motherhood and childcare. On one narration you can see double discrimination. In narration a male doctor and a woman nurse, and in the same narration a Muslim pregnant woman. Such kind of stereotypical gender portrayed in textbooks can lower female students' engagement in the classroom and limit their expectations in education and in life. The picture also depicts only male judges.



Source: Grade 9,10,11 and 12 CEE textbooks (p.57, p.61, p.44, and p.47 respectively)

Mostly women are depicted only in family relation and as mothers. As an example, for citizen's responsibility lesson all textbooks depict a mother having two children and also she is pregnant for the third time. The texts may give other good examples like female university teachers or doctors instead of female road cleaners.

Specifically, Muslims are presented in poor, only in passive, stereotyped personal characters and there are no occupational roles, and only as students in narration and illustration.

Among the interviewees, one is a directorate of director of civics and ethical education at the ministry of education of Ethiopia. I asked him about where are the Muslim male or female good role models as representatives for Muslim students in the textbooks, interviewed head of civics and ethical education replied as

Up to now we have done many researches to improve the textbooks regarding gender and culture in some level, but we didn't consider about identities for Muslims in details. After now we will think about it.

As to the CEE representative at the Ministry of Education of Ethiopia confirmed, there are different researches which had been done on CEE textbooks regarding gender and cultural but not religion. For the question of where are the good and positive models and examples for Muslims students, he replied that “up to now we didn’t see the textbook from this direction and we will think about it in the future”. Thus, until this research is done, as the CEE representative, no one is not asking about the presentation of Muslims in the textbooks. Moreover, in the textbooks there is no Muslim (women or men) character that depicts the role in the society as government worker or skilled person.

Likewise, most interviewed secondary school CEE teachers also confirmed that textbooks have many drawbacks for Muslim identities. As an example one teacher is replied as

All students must learn citizenship with the same feeling and see themselves as part of the society. But in the textbooks there are only northern leaders, more northern cultural heritages, northern male names as good responsible personalities and all given portrays are males.

In the CEE textbooks I found that women and men are represented very differently throughout the four textbooks, thus textbooks reinforce gender, cultural and religious stereotypes and role stratification.

In the pictures, illustrations and narrations of gender representation in CEE textbooks, I found that males are active and females are passive, for example, in all textbooks men plant trees and a woman stands and watches. The highest position of women is still depicted as secondary school students and commonly associated with housework, as a mother but men as working outside, women are more passive, men are more active; women are less frequently mentioned than men in both the narrations and illustrations.



Source: Grade 9,10,11 and 12 CEE textbooks (p.89, p.90, p.75, and p.81 respectively)

The other important point of this study found is that no balanced age groups are presented. There are all age groups presented for non-Muslims and there is one man and no women adults as examples for Muslims students. Among 281 portrays in four textbooks only 26 are Muslims and 21 of them are high school students, one shopkeeper, one pregnant woman, one exam cheater and no hero at all. Likewise, it could be argued that the textbooks do not depict any Muslim women wearing the headscarf or hijab as killed persons. In the textbook there are only 4 Muslim school girls in group picture and they wear hijab at school. It should be mentioned that Muslims are not significantly visible in all CEE textbooks and these create a sense of discrimination to Muslim students.

Regarding cultural heritages, the northern Ethiopian cultural heritages presented in broad scope than other part of Ethiopia. For instance, the picture of Lalibela Orthodox Christian Church portrayed for five times in four CEE textbooks, but only one Masjid for Muslims and no Protestant or Catholic churches are depicted. This is a cultural hegemony and dominance in the textbooks and misrepresents other societies. But all cultural groups should be portrayed in appropriate proportions. Furthermore, all identity groups shall be portrayed in different settings and different range of dressing according to their ethnic and religious culture. The portrayed cultural heritages are summarized in Table 3 below.

Table 3, Cultural Heritages representation

Cultural Heritages	Grade				Total
	9	10	11	12	
Aba Jifar (Muslim King palace)	-	1	-	-	1
Axum (Ancient Orthodox Church Monuments)	1	-	-	-	1
Harar Wall	-	1	-	-	1
Gonder Castle	1	-	-	-	1
Konso Settlement	1	-	-	-	1
Laibela (Ancient Orthodox Church)	1	1	1	2	5
Sheikh Hussein (Muslim's Heritage)	1	-	-	-	1
Sof Omar Caves	-	1	-	-	1
SuseniousCastele	-	-	1	-	1
TiyaTikil Stones	-	1	-	-	1
Victory Monument	-	1	-	-	1

Curriculum may perpetuate bias by presenting only one interpretation of an issue, situation, or group of people. Such accounts simplify and distort complex issues by omitting different perspectives. Concerning teachers' opinions about textbooks, all interviewed Civic and Ethical Education teachers (17 in number) from 12 different schools have the same stance to the reformation of the textbooks. They do agree that the textbooks have less content in citizenship lesson and have very few representation of Muslim society.

In conclusion, as to my observation, the textbooks do not have a balanced, fair and accurate view of all social identities. In other words, Muslim societies are under-considered in school textbooks and to make a balance in the textbooks, the writers should approach from multiculturalism framework for the responsive and inclusive school textbooks.

Discussion

After the 1994 Education and Training Policy (ETP) of Ethiopia were formulated, school textbooks were reformed for several times to minimize gender discrimination but untouched the cultural and religious parts. This study found that textbooks show systematic discrimination in three main areas: gender, cultures and religions. However, if the school textbooks address only some selected society as a model for multi-cultural and multi-religious society, then it may be expected that the forgotten society's students will find themselves in education as discriminated and unable to benefit from schooling (Nash, 1990) and continue to reproduce themselves for generations.

I argue that textbook writers do not represent the Muslim population significantly in the textbook knowledge. This condition leads to the Muslim students to alienation from the normative schooling process. The alienation of students from school is done by its hegemonic feature to students to assimilate the existing norms and an explicit rejection of their norms (Butin, 2005). Consequently, the curriculum development and policy planning are designed to have their students work to catch up to the norm that is ironically their cultural frames of male and non-Muslim.

The personalities presented as lessons can influence male and female students in their socialization process. Students are socialized into the existing patterns of education system. The existing patterns in the textbooks have a problem of routinely give good social status for some social identities, and very selective towards other social identities (Kelly, 2004). In practice in Ethiopia, many students (like females, from south and Muslims) do have a problem of lack of good model personalities who can reinforce them for good future. As to my findings, particularly Muslim societies are presented in a biased and distorted way and there is no enough success in the narrations of Muslim model in textbooks. Nevertheless, there is a lot of knowledge available about Muslim culture but the writers assimilate Muslims into the dominant culture. For instance, in grade 9, on page 134, it explains about "Tezkar" as Ethiopian culture, but it is only Orthodox Christian event which is a ceremony after a person dies.

Nevertheless, it is no longer to tolerate the inequity of having half of society functioning as itself and asserting its superiority. Hence, balancing the social identities in narration and illustration in all textbooks is a must for nation building. It is evident that a proper education can help healing the systematic discrimination of social groups. Therefore, the

textbooks should be developed in the sense of different groups of the entire societies of Ethiopia. All children should have a positive sense of their own identity. To explore more, Durkheim confirmed that education shall develop the similarities between students and binding them with a shared view, form a more solid and harmonious society.

In summing up, in textbooks, there are no significantly mention in the narrative, pictorial or/and illustrative content of textbooks about Muslims. For a typical example, in grade 9 CEE textbook, among 39 male names in narration there are only 5 Muslim names appeared and one is presented on page 126 negatively as follow and no such examples is presented for others.



Source: Grade 9 CEE textbook, p.126

It is obvious that textbooks play an important role in shaping and socializing students. Moreover, the details of the school textbooks get used to construct social identities for students. The textbooks should be presented in each child's positive social identities rather than misrepresenting. The contents must be presented from various perspectives and angles for all social identities (from positive/negative or/and dependent/independent sides) in order to be accurate and complete. Therefore, textbooks which addresses multicultural knowledge's present the real life the society that offers various identities, interests, attitudes, and experiences that will determine the position of all students. However, without recognizing every societies of Ethiopia, the educational enrolment of the unrepresented or misrepresented students will continue wane.

Multicultural education is a sound educational pedagogy and practice that requires the collective representation of gender, cultures, race, ethnicity, religious groups and all social identities as significant to the production of knowledge (Swartz, 2005). Correspondingly, multicultural education promotes equity of representation, an inclusion and non-hegemonic knowledge production and the implementation respects the potential of each student. Hence, the implementation of multicultural education denies the textual dominance of any cultural or religious group in the knowledge production process.

Conclusions and Recommendations

The main aim of Civics and Ethical Education is to produce effective and active citizens, who will take their own citizenship required code of behaviour and citizenship responsibility. By the same token, if it is implemented in appropriate manner, citizenship education is a good facilitator for acquisition of knowledge, skill, values, norms, and attitudes that encourage students to challenge stereotypical, biased thoughts and prejudices towards gender, religion, culture and other social identities.

But in this study, the Ethiopian secondary school civics and ethical education textbooks found to have in less representation of women, some cultural and groups and Muslim students. The findings show that there is imbalance between male and female representations in the narration and illustrations. There are biased allocations of male and female main characters. In addition, Muslim character occurrences among male/female characters are not divided proportionally in the narration in the textbooks. Hence, efforts need to be made to combat gender, cultural and religious biases in the textbooks for true educational outcomes and it will help to break the pattern of the reproduction of Ethiopian education. In order to have an equal representation and avoid biases of gender, cultural and religious diversity in school textbooks, the textbook writers must revise the existing educational materials. Scholars in the field have responsibilities to address all group identities that are absent, negated, and omitted.

References/Kaynakça

- Abdi, A.A. & Cleghorn, A. (2005). *Issues in African education: Sociological perspectives* (eds), New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Anyon, J. (2006). Social class, school knowledge, and the hidden curriculum: Re- theorizing reproduction. In Weis, L., MCarthy, C., and Dimitriadis (eds), *Ideology, curriculum, and the new sociology of education*, Revisiting the work of Michael Apple (pp. 37-45), New York: Routledge
- Apple, W. M. (2004). *Ideology and curriculum*, 3rd ed. New York: Routledge.
- _____. (2012). *Education and power*, 2nd ed. New York: Routledge.
- Arnot, M. (2002). *Reproducing gender? Essays on educational theory and feminist politics*, London: Routledge Falmer.
- Bourdieu, P. (1990). *The logic of practice*, (trans. R. Nice). Cambridge: Polity.
- Bourdieu, P. & Passeron, J. (1990). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*, California: Sage.
- Butin W. D. (2005). Identity (re)construction and students' resistance. In Butin W.D. (ed) *Teaching social foundations of education: Context, theories, and issues* (pp. 109- 126), New Jersey: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Central Statistics Agency. (CSA, 2014). Data Retrieved, February 19, 2017,17:35 [http://www.photuis.com/countries/ethiopia/society/ethiopia_society_ethnic_g roups_ethni-171.html](http://www.photuis.com/countries/ethiopia/society/ethiopia_society_ethnic_groups_ethni-171.html)
- Creswell, J. (2013). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches*, Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Doğan, İ. (2012a). *Sosyoloji, kavramlar ve sorunlar*, 12. Baskı, Ankara: Peygam Akademi.
- Doğan, İ. (2012b). *Eğitim sosyolojisi*, 2. Basım, Ankara: Nobel

- Freire, P. (2005). *Pedagogy of the oppressed* (30th Anniversary ed.) (Tran. Ramos, B.M), New York: Continuum.
- Gay, G. (2010). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice* (2nd ed.). New York: Teachers College Press.
- Gramsci, A. (1971). *Selections from the prison notebooks*. New York: International.
- Grant, A.C. & Lei, J. (2008). *Global constructions of multicultural education: Theories and realities*, Mahwah: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Hall, S. (1997). The work of representation. In Stuart Hall(ed.) *Representation: Cultural representations and signifying practices*, (pp.1374). London: Sage.
- Inglis, C. (2008). *Planning for cultural diversity*, Paris: UNESCO.
- Kelly, V. (2004). *The curriculum theory and practice*, (5th ed.), London: Sage
- Kim, Y. (2013). *Multicultural education in social studies textbooks in South Korea and the United States: A comparative analysis*, PhD Dissertation, College of education, University of Washington.
- Lindsey, L. (1997). *Gender roles: A sociological perspective*, 3rd ed. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.
- Ministry of Education (MoE). (2007). *Civics and ethical education student textbook grade 9*, India: Laxmi _____, (2007). *Civics and ethical education student textbook grade 10*, India: Laxmi. _____, (2007). *Civics and ethical education student textbook grade 11*, India: Laxmi. _____, (2007). *Civics and ethical education student textbook grade 12*, India: Laxmi.
- Nash, R. (1990). Bourdieu on education and social and cultural reproduction Roy source: *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, Vol. 11, No. 4, pp. 431-447. Published by: Taylor Stable URL: Accessed: 20/01/2016 00:10, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1392877>
- Pingel, F. (2010). *UNESCO guidebook on textbook research and textbook revision*, 2nd revised and updated edition, Paris: UNESCO.
- Race, R. (2011). *Multiculturalism and education: Contemporary issues in education studies*, London: Continuum.
- Schroeder, C. (2010). *Diverse by design: Literacy education within multicultural institutions*, Logan: Utah State University Press.
- Swartz, E. (2005). Multicultural education: From a compensatory to a scholarly foundation. In Grant, A.C. (ed.), *Research and multicultural education: From the margins to the mainstream* (pp. 31-42), London: The Falmer Press.
- UNESCO. (2005). *Education for shared values for intercultural and interfaith understanding*, France: Author. _____, (2006). *The impact of women teachers on girls' education: Advocacy Brief*, Bangkok: Author. _____, (2017). *Making textbook content inclusive, A focus on religion, gender and culture*, Paris: Author, Retrieved from <http://www.unesco.org/open-access/terms-use-ccbysa-en>
- Washington Models for the Evaluation of Bias Content in Instructional Materials, (2009). Retrieved from, <http://www.k12.wa.us/Equity/pubdocs/WashingtonModelsfortheEvaluationofBias.pdf>
- Wright, H., Singh, M. and Race, R. (2012). *Precarious international multicultural education: Hegemony, dissent and rising alternatives*, Rotterdam: Sense.
- Yaqin, L. (2002). Socialization of the gender role as seen from Bao Bao's family classroom. *Chinese education and society*, 35(5) 1422. doi:10.2753/CED10611932350514Z