



The Idea of Death in the 19th Century Spiritualism as Hybridity

19. Yüzyıl Ruhçuluğunda Melezlik Olarak Ölüm Düşüncesi

Burak Bayülgen¹ 

Geliş Tarihi (Received): 31.01.2022

Kabul Tarihi (Accepted): 27.04.2022

Yayın Tarihi (Published): 30.04.2022

Abstract: Spiritualism in the 19th century has become a phenomenon which was adopted widely by the society to deal with the fear of self's own and loved ones' death. The essential figures of spiritualism have constituted their doctrines which suggested the survival of death and the possibility of communicating with spirits both in the afterlife and on Earth based on this fear. According to spiritualists, the clergy of the nineteenth century have not given satisfying answers about the life after death. The clergy also remained silent in the social and political injustices and became more dogmatic and manipulative in order to keep their power. Therefore, the doctrines of spiritualists who dealt with death have taken free stands against the social, religious and political injustices at the same time. These free stands have also taken places in the literature of the century. This article has firstly examined how the idea of death has been evolved from commune to individual. Then, what Helena Petrovna Blavatsky, Allan Kardec and Aleister Crowley suggested about death has been evaluated starting with the pioneer of spiritualism, Emanuel Swedenborg. It has been concluded that spiritualism formed a hybrid structure by standing in-between life and death.

Keywords: Spiritualism, Death, Life After Death, The 19th Century

&

Öz: 19. yüzyılda ruhçuluk bireyin kendi ve sevdiklerinin ölümü korkusuyla başa çıkabilmesinin bir yolu olarak toplumda yaygın biçimde görülmüş bir fenomendir. Dönemin önemli ruhçu figürleri ölümden kurtuluşu öneren öğretilerini bu korkuyu temel alarak oluşturmuşlar ve ruhların hem öte alemde hem de yeryüzünde insanlarla iletişim kurabileceklerini savunmuşlardır. Ruhçulara göre 19. yüzyılın ruhban sınıfı ölümden sonraki yaşama dair yeterli bir tatmin sağlayamamakla birlikte sosyal ve politik adaletsizliklere karşı da sessiz kalmış, daha baskıcı ve çıkarıcı davranarak kendi iktidarlarını korumuşlardır. Bu nedenle ölüm ile ilgilenen ruhçuların öğretileri aynı zamanda toplumsal, dini ve siyasi adaletsizliklere karşı özgür tavırlar almışlardır. Bu özgür tavırlar dönemin edebiyatında da karşılık bulmuştur. Bu makalede öncelikle ölüm düşüncesinin komünden bireye dek nasıl değiştiğine bakılmış, ardından dönemin önde gelen ruhçuları olan Helena Petrovna Blavatsky, Allan Kardec ve Aleister Crowley'nin öğretilerinde ölüm üzerine neler önerdikleri bu akımın kurucusu olan Emanuel Swedenborg'dan başlanarak incelenmiştir. Bu inceleme doğrultusunda ruhçuluğun ölüm ile hayatı bir araya getirerek melez bir yapı kurduğu sonucuna varılmıştır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Ruhçuluk, Ölüm, Ölüm Sonrası Yaşam, 19. Yüzyıl

Atıf/Cite as: Bayülgen, B. (2022) The Idea of Death in the 19th Century Spiritualism as Hybridity, Abant Kültürel Araştırmalar Dergisi, 7 (13): 19-32.

İntihal-Plagiarizm/Etik-Ethic: Bu makale, en az iki hakem tarafından incelenmiş ve intihal içermediği, araştırma ve yayın etiğine uyulduğu teyit edilmiştir. / This article has been reviewed by at least two referees and it has been confirmed that it is plagiarism-free and complies with research and publication ethics. <https://dergipark.org.tr/pub/akader>

Copyright © Published by Bolu Abant İzzet Baysal University, Since 2016 – Bolu

¹ Dr, burakbayulgen@gmail.com, ORCID: 0000-0003-3200-2679.

Introduction

This article has focused on how the idea of death in the 19th century has been considered in the 19th century spiritualism. It has been mentioned that spiritualism was not an autonomous field but an aggregation of fulfilling the inadequacies to assert (i) what happens after death, (ii) if heaven or hell exist and (iii) if a spirit survives. The doctrines of Emanuel Swedenborg, Helena Blavatsky and Aleister Crowley have tried to cope with death. Their assessments have asked the same questions by foregrounding the social, political and religious panoramas of the 19th century. The panorama has depended on how Swedenborg constituted a communal doctrine in the 18th century, while Allan Kardec's approach was based on moral and wisdom, and Blavatsky's was a collective democratisation of the regressed primitive spirits. On the other hand, Crowley whose doctrine's context has been formed in the 19th century, reduced the term commune to self. Thus, all of these names' doctrines have been regarded as forms of reactions against the outer environment. They liberated their disciples from the authoritative attitudes of the Church and from the introvertive force of the political environment while the Church and the political power imposed their dominances. The imposing of the political power necessitated such oppositions and regressions to enunciate itself as the civilized and the idea of death has taken shapes in spiritualism as hybrid.

The reception of death has been evolved in the 19th century in comparison to the 18th century. Death has been taken as a communal concept which meant to return to nature in the 18th century. The reception of death in the 19th century has been differentiated as a shift from commune to individuality (Meinwald, 1990: 1). It has necessitated to discuss what are the ideas of commune and individualism in death, how they were assimilated to the spiritual field as a contend of Reason, Ego and Will, and if these ideas had a correspondence in the political and spiritual panorama.

Death as a communal and individual concept

The idea of commune in death could be premised within a Hegelian dialectic. The dialectic consists of three stages: (i) Death as an alien force, (ii) death as the master, (iii) death as the practice of everyday live in community and in religion (Adkins 2007, p. 106). It is needed to compromise death as an alien force within the dialectic: Life is independence without absolute negativity. Death is a negation without independence (Adkins, 2007: 78). Hegel calls this negation "life" or "life-system". The consciousness's place in life and life-system is an independency in which the consciousness reveals itself in recognition (Adkins, 2007: 90). Desire is the persistence of overcoming life by the self-consciousness. But, death is the end of the development of consciousness. This independency could also be demonstrated within the master-slave dialectic: When the master threatens his servant to work for him, the servant faces the fear of death. When the servant masters the work he has done for the master, it is the fear of death which motivates him. Then, the master who has not worked is independent on nature but still dependent on the slave's work. The freedom of the master relies on his dependency on the servant. Death is an alien force in which the master is risking his life by forcing his servant to work, so that the servant would depend on the master. Death is the motivation for both the master and the slave in the negation (Adkins, 2007: 92). The negation provides an advantage for the slave for he shall not be killed to maintain the dialectic. Nevertheless, the selfness is not the whole system that refers to its own death. Instead the system is built on community and the values of it which regards death as the advocator of the community. There are two terms in Hegel's terminology: (i) Human Law, (ii) Divine Law. The first one governs the community while the latter governs the family. The interrelation of these two terms are straightforward. The continuity of the community depends on being a faithful servant for it. Such cases like wars make the citizen feel that he is for the benefit of the community. Even the relation with other citizens would not succeed unless the death is not recognised. Therefore, the feeling of death should always be present. It simply means that one must die to preserve the community (Adkins, 2007: 92-95).

The relation of the community with the family is the necessity of creating individuals who dissolves into the family in terms of ethics. The individual's acts should be free for the wealthiness of the community. A citizen should serve the states as a free choice. Therefore, sacrificing himself should be a free act. The burial rituals of the dead is to officialize the dead's free choice in an ethical order which transcends belonging to the nature as a decaying substance. This is why the burial rituals are divine laws. The community shall master death rather than being mastered by it (Adkins, 2007: 102). The community structures death in a way that it becomes the primary principle for an ethical order. The term "revealed religion" displaces death from being the master. Death is a process in revealed religion which makes it an everyday practice. The revealed religion makes the community see God which points at an universality which is "the death of death" or the resurrection (Adkins, 2007: 78).

The reception of death has been evolved from a communal idea to an individual idea in the 19th century. The term "individual" refers to self, its existence, beingness and consciousness, as a Heideggerian term "being-in-the-world" which means the recognition of the own state of mind of the self. Therefore, the reception of death needs to be recognised by another Heideggerian term "being-towards-death" from which the self can not separate itself. Heidegger's primary term "Dasein" refers to all of these two terms which can not be isolated from equipments that surround itself. And Dasein is always ahead of itself within care and concern. Dasein does not exist as a point in an absolute space. It has a world of its own and death is one of the conditions for the possibility of this kind of world (Adkins, 2007: 41). Simon Critchley categorises four conditions of death: (i) Being-towards-death is non-relational. It is certain and insurmountable. It could only be known by the relation of self with death. (ii) Death is certain and beyond any doubt. (iii) Death is uncertain. It is impossible to know when it will occur. (iv) Death is impossible to be defeated (Critchley, 2009: 1). Heideggerian term "angst" refers to anxiety in which the death could not be experienced by the death of another but by the angst of the self's own death. Furthermore, angst is the disappearance of fall which means that the consumption of living under the knowledge of death is liberatory rather than terrifying (Çüçen, 2003: 78). Dasein's "being-itself" is an anxiety. There are another two Heideggerian terms which are (i) to-face-itself and (ii) to-be-authentic which unearth the fall of Dasein to a world of everydayness. Dasein and the disappearance of fall rely on angst. Dasein understands its being as being-in-world. The freedom of choosing the possibilities of Dasein's existence resides in angst (Çüçen, 2003: 77). Heideggerian death could not be experienced by the death of another. On the other hand, the thematic notion of death is the need of pain (Critchley, 2009: 1). Dasein's straightforwardness is shaped by the death of a loved object. Being-towards-death is not only the fear of dying but also the ravage of Dasein in pain. Therefore, the idea of death is not passed into Dasein if there is not a lost object (Critchley, 2009: 1). The loss manifests itself in two ways: (i) Mourning, (ii) Melancholia. The association of these two terms rely themselves on the Ego and libidinal form as parts of a structure which is to impel the loss onto another object both as libidinal and identificational. Mourning is thus appertaining to replacement (with another object) as it is consciously aware of the loss as much as it needs to replace it. On the other hand, melancholia is in relation with the loss as "incorporated" which means that the loss within the unconscious is not replaced by another object but instead, is identified with the Ego. The main difference between melancholia and mourning is that, in mourning, the displacement of the loved object and the loss of it unearths a free link and space to focus on and to be replaced by the other object even though the process is painful. That process is provided by "introjection". According to Sigmund Freud, introjection functions as:

"The ego makes it easier for the object to be given up or renders that process possible. It may be that this identification is the sole condition under which the id can give up its objects. At any rate the process, especially in the early phases of development, is a very frequent one, and it makes it possible to suppose that the character of the ego is a precipitate of abandoned object-cathexes and that it contains the history of those object-choices" (Freud, 2010: 3963).

The Ego is reproaching itself as the lost object for having harmed the ego in the first place. The more the Ego makes itself suffer, the more the lost object atones for its misdeeds (Adkins, 2007: 4). Therefore, mourning is admissible until the loss has been replaced by a new object. The place for fantasy has been termed as “crypt” by Nicolas Abraham and Maria Torok. They define “crypt” as “it represents the space of fantasy in which the surrounding topology remains undisturbed” (ibid.). Another term is the “intrapsychic tomb” which is another admissible space as long as the place of fantasy has not been distracted by outer environment. Abraham and Torok underlies the function of the “intrapsychic tomb” as it has been “built during cases of melancholia, has several features worth noting. First, it means to avoiding mourning, or a way to circumvent loss without going through anticathexis (ibid.).

The spiritualist approach on loss emanates from the discontentment of what has existed after death. Blavatsky earnestly suggests that the melancholy is the result of the same discontentment. Therefore, Blavatsky despises both melancholia and the process of introjection. Swedenborg in the 18th century, Blavatsky and furtherly Crowley in the 19th and early 20th century tackled the life after death as a precision, and agglomerated religion, ancient philosophy with science and spiritualism to constitute their doctrines. Each of their doctrines have referred to Reason, Ego and Will. The utilization of Will has been clarified especially in Crowley’s teachings. Furthermore, Swedenborg’s assessment on heaven and hell resembles Meinwald’s statement in which the spiritual approach of death in the 18th century was rather communal, while it evolved through an individual idea in the 19th century. Swedenborg revealed that each spirit would belong to a community in heaven. On the other hand, Crowley’s teachings which were clarified in the beginning of the 20th century placed a premium on the Will as it refers to self and its significance in the Cosmos.

Swedenborg’s assessments on the afterlife, heaven, and hell

Swedenborg’s declarations on death and afterlife in the 18th century were assertive. Swedenborg locates the humankind in the center of the creation of heaven and hell both physically and spiritually. The final task would not be completed without the physical essence of the humankind (Swedenborg, 2018: 10). He states that neither an angel nor spirit would have existed without the humankind who had been the seedbed of “new heaven” and the aim of the creation of it (Swedenborg, 2018: 14). The humankind has been created for heaven and the earthly world has been created for the humankind (Swedenborg, 2018: 13). Swedenborg complains that the Christian world is unaware of the fact that the humankind is the center of heaven and hell (Swedenborg, 2018: 14). Heaven’s beauty comes from the humankind and heaven takes the form of people. Swedenborg states that:

“People who do not know the mysteries of heaven may believe that angels exist apart from us and that we exist apart from angels, but I can solemnly testify on the basis of all my experience of heaven and my conversations with angels that no angel or spirit exists apart from humankind and that no human being exists apart from angels and spirits” (Swedenborg, 2018: 10).

Swedenborg asserts that these kinds of statements were all revealed to him by the angels who have always accompanied people who comprehended The Word (The Genesis) profoundly with goodness and truth even though most of the people were oblivious to them. Swedenborg states that he was affiliated with the angels firmly who manifested him the state of soul, its form, living space and activities in heaven. He was revealed and witnessed that the clothing, consciousness and dwellings are just the same as the earthly world. There is still The Word in heaven and there are still worshipping, churches and monasteries, neighbourhoods and communities. The only difference between heaven and Earth is that these elements are all in ideal form and what has hidden in heart is revealed (Swedenborg, 2018: 56). The deeds, desires and wishes are responded in terms of where to live in, being rich and wealthy, sharing the common ground and belonging to a community. Swedenborg also schematized the layers in heaven in which the center belongs to the Reformists who comprehended The Word. Each reformist country or community have taken paths over the cardinal points as The Germans built a community in the North of heaven, The Swedes and The Danes in the West, The Dutch in the East and South, and The British in the middle

(Swedenborg, 2018: 48-49). The next layer which surrounds the center belongs to the Catholics, the following layer belongs to the Muslims and the rest belongs to a variety of other religions (Swedenborg, 2018: 58).

Swedenborg's main complaint is the imperceptiveness of the Church which does not refer to the ontological state of it but to various teachings, organizations and temples. (Şendoğan and Seçkin, 2016: 95). The leitmotif of the Church in Swedenborg is the clarification of the symbolic meaning of The Word befitting to its real teaching apart from the concrete and literal utilization. Swedenborg's apprehension is that if The Word has been utilized literally, it would lead the Reason to such ignorance, heresy and lies (Swedenborg, 2018: 14). The Reason and Will have a specific notion in Swedenborg's spiritual teaching. The Reason is the door of faith and the Will is the receiver of love. If the Reason believes in The Lord and adopts His faith, and if the Will takes the love of The Lord, a person unites with Him. Those who unite with Him with love and faith will never die (Swedenborg, 2018: 39). Swedenborg explains how the angels were confused when they have discerned the unawareness of the Christian world about heaven as:

“Angels are utterly astounded that this is what the Christian world believes, and even more astounded that people know absolutely nothing about heaven even though this should be central to what the church is teaching. Because this kind of ignorance has become dominant, angels rejoice at heart that it has now pleased the Lord to reveal a great deal about heaven and also about hell and by this means to dispel—as much as possible—the darkness that has been increasing every day because the church has reached its end” (Swedenborg, 2018: 39).

The above explanation of Swedenborg reveals why the Church and the Christian world have taken The Word literally and failed to comprehend the symbolic meaning of it. Swedenborg claimed to be accentuated the heaven's dependency on people which committed that anybody who died have already gone to heaven or hell and become a part of a community. On the other hand, the Church's statement was the impenetrability of soul neither to heaven or hell before The Last Judgement. Thereby, the Church has been insufficient to declare the interdependence of heaven on people as Swedenborg claimed to be. Swedenborg's role in spiritualism took a stand against the misinterpretation of The Word and offered what he has witnessed and been revealed to him. He explains that there has been two Last Judgements which were firstly The Flood and secondly the presence of The Lord on Earth (Jesus Christ). He heralds that the third of The Last Judgement has taken place in the middle of 1757 and been completed by the end of the year (Swedenborg, 2018: 46). Swedenborg underlies that none of The Last Judgements have occurred Earthly but celestially. Swedenborg utilizes the two Last Judgements in terms of the declination of a heavenly church (an ideal form of church in heaven) whose judgement has been completed during The Flood. The new churches which were established after The Flood were called as The Ancient Church and The Hebrews Church whose declination and judgement has been completed during the coming of The Lord on Earth. And, the final church is The Christian Church whose judgement has been completed according to Swedenborg's assertion in 1757. The third Last Judgement which was completed in 1757 also comprises Muslims. The first declination is the Fall from Eden and the second is symbolised and evaluated with Babylon and Babylonians. Swedenborg uses the word “Babylon” both historically and symbolically. “Babylon” means the authoritarian power structure of The Church which undertakes the punishment and forgiveness at its will. The authoritative attitude of The Church delegates itself as The Lord and steals the duties which have belonged to The Lord. Above all, The Church keeps the truth and fears of the revelation of any parts of the truth (Swedenborg, 2016: 128). The Church which has hidden the truth especially harasses Blavatsky. Her statement is that the ancient cultures have already reached out the divine truth in terms of philosophy, science and religion. The reason why the 19th century people could not achieve the divine truth is the the Church who has neglected all of their philosophies of ancient cultures and imposed such arbitrary and political attitude.

The possibility of communicating with spirits in terms of morals and wisdom

Kardec who was a strict skeptic in his early life has become the former of the spiritism (a field that based on observation and morals) in 1854 after he has attended effectual and elucidatory seances. Kardec's main position in spiritism has managed to associate the spiritual intellectualism with morals. His deep endeavor was to establish a spiritual genuine in educational and scientific research. The stages of a spirit in the spatium have material grounds. The attachment to the material desires envisages an unconscious stage where the imagery that surrounds the spirit corresponds with the deeds of the material world. That does not render a spirit to recognize the imagery which surrounds itself. This means that a spirit has been required to undergo a progression starting from an "envisagement by itself" to the "phase of conscious envisagement". This is the progress of recognition of the outer environment in the spatium (Ruhselman, 1990: 24-25).

The phases of the spirits in spatium have been hierarchized in three orders: (i) The imperfect spirits who belong to the lowest class, (ii) Good spirits, (iii) Pure Spirits who dwell in the highest class. The imperfect spirits have been assorted to five classes which advance from the tenth class to sixth. The tenth class features the impure spirits who are attached to evilness and betrayal. The ninth class features the frivolous spirits who are ignorant and acrimonious. The eighth class features the false scholars' spirits who suppose that they know much more than they really know. The seventh class features neutral spirits who do not act neither good nor bad. The six class features the boisterous and disruptive spirits who mostly manifest themselves through rappings, knockings and moving the objects. The second order is the good spirits which advances from the fifth to second class. The fifth class is the benevolent spirits who acts kind and protect people. The fourth class is the scholarly spirits who are involved in science and knowledge for the benefit of the mankind without any feelings of ambitions. The third class is the wise spirits who are not totally reached at the infinite knowledge but still have a huge wisdom to behave morally. The second class is the superior spirits who incorporate knowledge, wisdom and goodness with themselves. The first order is the pure spirits who dwell in the class in which the progression of the spirit is complete and absolute. The pure spirits do not manifest themselves to the mediums who manipulate the reality for the sake of greed. The pure spirits manifest themselves to the people who willingly want to reach at the truth about spirits. The important case in these orders is the possibility of communication with the spirits. The communication should be under the conditions of morals in which a sincere medium can channel a pure spirit while an impostor can only communicate with an impure spirit. Besides an impure spirit manipulates the truth and gives answers for the need of ambitions (Kardec, 1893: 40-47).

The manipulation of reality had correspondences in spiritual approach too in terms of mediumistic frauds and exploitativeness. Kardec's March 1859 article in the light of an intellectual character of a medium states that "the medium that could turn their faculties into a profession is in the first row of the self-serving mediums, offering what is typically called sessions or paid consultations" (Nirun, 2016: 74; Kardec, 1859a: 56-57). Kardec's statement does not only correlate the spiritual intellectualism with morality but also with faculty. His February 1859 article in "The Spiritist Review" depicts that the agnosy of a medium could result with frivolously which means an incompetent communication with spirits. Spirits are also in perfect and imperfect form and any self-absorbed deeds of a medium could result with inviting the weak spirits. The same February 1859 article ascertains the mediumistic faculties:

"Although the faculty is not an exclusive privilege, it is certain that it finds refractory minds, at least regarding the meaning given to that faculty. It is also certain that it is not exempt of hurdles to those endowed by such faculty: it can be altered and even be lost, and frequently be a source of grave disillusiones" (Kardec, 1859b: 31).

The role of a medium seminates its roots to the 20th century. Bedri Ruhselman who was the forerunner spiritualist of Turkey has founded "Metapsişik Tetkikler ve İlmi Araştırmalar Cemiyeti" in 1950. His mediative affiliations with credible mediums resulted in receiving declarations from the spirit world. A medium could be a natural-born while some of his/her faculties could evolve over time. Sevgi Çağıl, who

was a disciple of Ruhselman emphasizes the position of a medium both as his/her task and character. Ata Nirun's interview with Çağl asserts the mediumistic faculty and character as:

"Mediums are generally thought as people who announce the unknown. That's not true. Medium is also a person with frailty who gets angry when appropriate, loves or rages. But a medium is a different person who can find the point of knowledge while in spiritual connection and who can communicate properly from that channel of knowledge. Medium is only different in that moment. When that moment is over, s/he is no longer different than others" (Nirun, 2016: 210).

It is contradictory to concede a medium. A discredit for a medium does not necessarily come up from the sceptic sphere but also from the spiritualists' themselves. A 1956 statement of Lütfü Kuday exposes how mediumistic faculties could be deceptive. Kuday states that:

"The mediums who play roles in spiritualist experiments are mostly ignorant or uneducated people. They always have the excitement but also the fear. Therefore, they would not dare to continue the experiment. Some of them, put themselves in great danger because of their curiosity. They force themselves to widen their experiments and try to go on until the end of the experiment. But, this time, they exceed their powers and limits" (Nirun, 2016: 136).

A medium could be correlated with excitement, curiosity, miserliness and greed for fame. A straggling from the main compartment of a medium legitimizes fraudulence. Spiritualism's core attitude against fraudulence is the necessity of isolation from any personal greed to disseminate a declaration concerning any human beings. Ruhselman's leading position in spiritualism receives support from his confidential mediums. Ruhselman received declarations from a spiritual guide named Önder in September 1958 over the mediumship of Attila Güyer and those declarations lasted in July 1959 which constituted "İlahi Nizam ve Kainat" or simply "Bilgi Kitabı". The book has been deferred to be published and kept in notary for fifty-four years under the bailee of Güyer, Metin Sakik and Hüsrev Bilgiöglü.

Blavatsky and theosophy's readoption of the ancient cultures

Blavatsky substantiates the discontentment of spiritual truth as melancholy which is the result of an inadequacy to explain what lies beyond death. She paraphrases from Thomas Browne as "it is the heaviest stone that melancholy can throw at a man, to tell him that he is at the end of his nature, or that there is no future state to come, unto which this seems progressive, and otherwise made in vain" (Blavatsky, 2013: 39). The religious degeneracy had already designated fields to focus on in the 17th century such as Robert Burton who studied the anatomy of melancholy. The degeneration of religious deeds and ecclesiastics has accused the melancholy by God and Burton has avoided melancholy by studying the anatomy of it. His research field has also become his liberation (Burton, 2016: 46). The discontentment shall not only be attributed to the authoritative and arrogant presence of The Church but also to materialism which claims that nothing would exist or be at present without matter (Blavatsky, 2013: 31). The contradiction between theology and science necessitates the spiritualists to fight against the both. Blavatsky exemplifies the confliction and emphasize on the role of a Theosophist as:

"There is a personal God, and there is a personal Devil!" thunders the Christian preacher. "Let him be anathema who dares say nay!" "There is no personal God, except the gray matter in our brain," contemptuously replies the materialist. "And there is no Devil. Let him be considered thrice an idiot who says aye." Meanwhile the occultists and true philosophers heed neither of the two combatants, but keep perseveringly at their work. None of them believe in the absurd, passionate, and fickle God of superstition, but all of them believe in good and evil" (Blavatsky, 2013: 38).

Blavatsky accommodates The Church with materialism for they both reject or disregard the ancient wisdom. Materialism simply rejects any esoteric teachings because of its "factual" claim against the "superstitious", and The Church rather disregards the esoterism since Blavatsky believes that the ancient wisdom has already gained knowledge of a spiritual truth which The Church is insufficient to declare.

Theosophy detaches itself from the conflictions between The Church and materialism and suggests to be competent on the wisdom of ancient civilizations since they comprise the spiritual and scientific together to unravel any mysteries. And, Blavatsky shares Hargrave Jennings's excitement in regard of building the Great Pyramids where "the knowledge was at the highest" than a modern man could comprehend (Blavatsky, 2013: 37). The Ancient Egypt's success in civilization kept pace with the affirmative geographical conditions of Nile River Valley which paved the way for agriculture, irrigation, mining, architecture and artefact. The accommodation to the geographical conditions draws a comparison with zoroastrianists who attributed a sacred value to fire which convenienceed and civilized the early life skills. The abundance of product which was the result of a facultative irrigation and mining prospered the social welfare of Ancient Egyptians who were also benefited from the opportunity of establishing affirmative diplomatic relations, armament and acculturative expansion (Büker, 2019: 23-24). Amenhotep III who reigned between 1386 BC.-1349 BC. portrays how visionary diplomacy and diplomatic relations provided such wealth in society as much as in arts and culture. There was only one campaign during the reign of Amenhotep III which was to suppress a revolt in Nubia during the fifth year of the reign of the Pharaoh (Büker, 2019: 25). Cengiz Büker reviews that the spiritual notions of Ancient Egyptians differ from Mesopotamia and other middle-eastern civilizations in terms of attributing deities to the pharaohs rather than assimilating them as the messengers of gods. The pharaohs were gods' themselves. Büker states that it was this attribution which caused an intense interest; or moreover an obsession for death and what lies beyond it (Büker, 2019: 18). One significant point coheres with the spiritualist claim which is the dwelling of spirits as they please within two realms; both afterlife and on Earth. There is also a process of Judgement in which the dead gives an account of fourthy-two sins and resurrects within the two realms which is far from reincarnation. The rambling of the soul within the two realms is the rebirth which is the result of a life fairly and rightly lived. (Büker, 2019: 9-10) The prayers read after during the process of death and after dead overemphasizes how death was accepted. Two examples of prayers to come forth by day and live after death are as follow:

"Oh thou Only One, who shinest from the Moon, let me come forth amid that train of thine, at large, and let me be revealed as one of those in glory. And when the Tuat is opened to the gods, let N come forth to do his pleasure upon earth amid the Living" (Renouf, Naville, 1904: 11).

In addition to that, the prayers continue as:

"Oh Tmu, who proceedest from Ur-henhenu, who art resplendent as the Lion-faced, and who strewest thy words to those who are before thee; Here cometh the faithfull. O ye seamen of Ra at the gloaming of the day, let N live after death, like Ra daily. Here the helmsman: As Ra is bom from Yesterday, so he too is born from Yesterday, and as every god exulteth in lifethy words. o shall N exult even as they exult in life" (ibid.).

The detachment of spiritualism from the bilateral confliction of The Church and materialism takes on a new meaning by attributing value to the Ego. Blavatsky's treatment is the reciprocalness of the Reason, the finite Mind. Blavatsky insists that the Ego is free from the limited self, beyond the Reason and strict logic since the Reason can not perceive God and furtherly rejects Him. On the contrary, the Ego has a grasp of comprehending God, and the longing for God is an endowment of the Ego (Blavatsky, 2019: 38-39). Blavatsky's emphasizing of the Ego refers to the position of self before the time/space which would furtherly generate the doctrine of the occult practices which is especially significant in Crowley's philosophy.

The will according to Aleister Crowley

Crowley, who was a magister and a well-known occultist of the late 19th century and the first half of the 20th century offered the term "will" instead of "ego", as the center of his doctrine named as Thelema. Tim Maroney's specification of Thelema is as simple as "(...) the goal of the path is always the same, to be the most oneself that one can be, to know who you really are and to let that eternal self or True Will be the

guiding force in life" (Maroney, 2002: 4). Crowley insists that it is the will which constitutes the spiritual essence of the human, but should not be considered as a sentimental nor intellectual personality (Maroney, 2019: 1). The will has also been bestowed to man and was designated before or during the birth. The will has a major task within the Cosmos. Maroney mentions the pivotal position of the will within the Cosmos as:

"All the wills are magically arranged so that there is no conflict between them, just as (so it was believed in Crowley's day) the stars are arranged so that they never collide. The personal will and the will of all are mystically joined as a whole which is also the basis of individuality in a paradoxical way. Collision between wills would indicate that one or the other person was not doing their True Will" (Maroney, 2002: 1).

The doctrine of Crowley's Thelema appears in his "The Book of Law" which was dictated to Crowley in Egypt, 1904 by a deity named "Aiwass" who refers to self "I was"; therefore "I am". Kenneth Anger states that "Aiwass" refers to Lucifer as a combination of self and will (Grant, 2000: 0:16:40). "The Book of Law" reinterprets three Egyptian deities who are i) Nuit who is the symbol of the time/space, perpetuity and everlasting potential. ii) Hadit who is the symbol of the hidden individuality in each Men and is the motive of leading to what Man has willed. iii) The forms of Horus which were bred from the unity of Nuit and Hadit as a) Ra-Hoor-Khuit who bears the role of a warrior and conqueror and b) Hoor-Paar-Kraat who is the infant form of Horus (Maroney, 2019: 6-7). These deities and their roles in Thelema constitute the Crowleian holy trinity. The graduality of the progress of the will has been emblemized in "The Book of Law" with The Tree of Life which served as a basis in The Hermetic Order of the Golden Dawn wherein such literary figures like Arthur Conan Doyle, William Butler Yeats and Bram Stoker were members. Crowley was a contentious member of the Golden Dawn and Koray Saridoğan explains that the names who provided references on Doyle's initiation all disliked Crowley and he was referred as the main effect in the collapse period of the Order (Saridoğan, 2018: 31). The Tree of Life was the process of progression starting from the material world to the ultimate level called as Kether. Maroney explains that The Tree of Life has two roles which are being the map of spiritual progression and being used as an ordination in which each level contains all the symbols and ideas of religions and occultism (Maroney, 2019: 11).

Thelema's goal required rituals, meditations, astral journeys and revelations with both higher and lower degree spirits (Maroney, 2019: 13). These rituals were involved in sex practices which constituted contradictive discourses on the 19th century ethics and moral values. Maroney states that the 19th century readopted the Pagan values, and sexuality became apparent consequently in arts and spiritualism. (Maroney, 2019: 18-19). Crowley's Thelema was an opposition between dogmas and individual ideas. His ideas on sexuality shared similarities with writers like Victoria Woodhull, H.G. Wells and Richard Payne Knight as they claimed that the religions were based on a phallic level. Therefore, Crowley condemned Christianity for infesting the self, forbidding sexuality and mortifying the human body which resemble animals. Christianity affronted the female body as abject and Crowley responded to that by promoting feminism and regarding each women and men as stars. Moreover, Crowley was a sex addict and his sex rituals promoted liaison (Maroney, 2019: 20-21). He took sexuality as an adventure and he experienced homosexual intercourses. Maroney also states that there was not only a shift in sexual discourses in the 19th century but also in drug use which was assimilated by spiritualists as a mediator rather than an ultimate goal in seances and rituals. Maroney adds that Blavatsky was also among these drug users (Maroney, 2019: 23). "Aiwass" also referred to Lucifer but the positions of Crowley in Thelema, and Blavatsky in Theosophy display the roles of good and evil as an inadequacy to declare a particular evil or the opposite. The good and evil were rather transitional. The deeds of doing evil is the generalization of The Devil who has been personalized and attributed to the concept of evil universally. Russell states that "the Devil is a figure that we invent in order to project our own vices upon something external. It is we who are the source and center of evil, not he" (Russell, 2019: 187). Thus, the evil deed is as specific as to do harm consciously and to feel joy as a result of the deed done to the opponent. The personification of evil

has a hybrid nature as an attribution to both abundance and punishment. Russell terms this hybridity as “Promethean” which has risen from the oppositional political panorama of the coloniser Europe in the 19th century. The Great Britain has a very crucial role in terms of colonization. By the year of 1851, The Great Britain has already governed Canada, Australia, New Zealand, Caribbean Islands and India wherein the raw materials of these territories have fueled the British Industry (Lupi 2019, p. 6).

The hybridity in spiritualism and literature as Promethean

A proper justification for the political order was the immortalization of the ancestor identities to propose taking immortality as what has remained after death. The political order relied on the divinity of death on the mortality of the ancestors. The ancient cultures were soothed by the spiritual existences of their ancestors. Such private spaces have been formed as “homes” as people built their houses on the remains of their ancestors which likewise enunciated poverty (Kerrigan, 2017: 114). The agglomeration of incorporation is apparent in the funeral procession of The Duke of Wellington in November, 1852. The extravagancy of people’s reverences to their national hero varied from social positions to economic statuses, but all the participants of this multi-layered procession had significances in the totality of the funeral procession (Cadwallader, 2008: 9-11). The tendency to attend the funeral did not distinguish the rights of the public to mourn varying from the communal to individual. It is not only the religious deeds but both a collective and individual scope. The reverence to death is also the rectification of the possibility of an afterlife which allowed to exaggerate mourning. The introversion of the dependence on the afterlife assumed not to endanger the dominancy of the political. The political superiority of ancestor identity has been structured from what has remained out of being regressed. Theosophy asserted that the primitive spiritual guidance of the world -enslaved, colonized or regressed- were existingly multitracked. This is the exact spiritual construction of regression which has been a reaction against the political order. Similarly, Doyle has explained that all the disciples of Shakers had Indian guides who have manifested themselves as a tribe rather than solitary (Doyle, 1926: 31). Theosophy sealed off the anthropoid identities of spiritual entities which were called as “Diakkas”, “Bhuts” and “Elementals” and ascribed them a mediatorship where they manifested themselves materially and disruptively (Manning, 2018: 67, 86). Theosophy’s statement is that “[it] also made a kind of simultaneously orientalist and yet anticolonial critique, promoting Eastern spirits to positions of authority” (Manning, 2018: 68). Paul Manning’s statement relies on the hybridity of these spiritual guides who dwelled in both spiritual and material world rather than a certain geographical location. Manning paraphrases from Shane McCorristine as: “Ghost stories exchange the haunted domestic space for a cosmopolitan imperial space in which the metropole is haunted by anxieties about a “vast geographic diaspora of potentially dying British persons” in the colonies” (Manning, 2018: 79). This calls forth the pine for the own citizens (in the colonies) of The Great Britain who took no account of the colonized. Death subsumed the regressed and interfered the living regressor or the one who fought against it. Patterson who is a spiritualist never pronounced the term “death” or announced the dead as “dead”, instead, he expressed death as the “passing to the spirit” and the deceased as the one who “passed to the spirit”.

The term “Promethean” embodies the hybridity which constitutes a reaction to the political order in a spiritual sense. The Promethean figures were significant especially in the poems of William Blake and Lord Byron as the forms of liberatory spiritual democratisations in faith, science, and sexuality. The revolutions of 1798-1848 with the rise of pragmatism and materialism downshifted the orthodox discourse of the Catholic Church (Russell, 2019: 261). On the other hand, Blake and Byron granted an enormous place for feelings and emotions against a determinist reason in which the conflicts between good/evil, God/Devil were transitional. The collaboration of reason and feelings manifested themselves in artistic expressions. The emigration from rural to cities, the idea of revolution against an oppression and the conflicts between science/faith constituted such nonconcurrences that the literary environment of Romanticism righteously comprised them all and preferred to portray them into the medieval environment from the perspective of their progressive world. Gothic fictions constituted the haunting ghosts which would furtherly be adopted and theorised as telepathy, especially by SPR (The Society for Psychological Research) who documented the

spiritualist phenomena in "The Phantasms of The Living". The manifestations of the moribund to the remaining required to bring forward detailed research without even hesitating a skepticism about the time/space of these manifestations. Romantic writers adopted supernaturalism to portray subjectivities on religious and anti-conservatist discourses. There was no longer a pantocrator God nor an antipodean Devil. The literary works of Blake and Byron framed the interchanging position of God and The Devil. The omnipotence of God became interpretable as the enforcement of His strict rules in an unemancipated act of free will while The Devil liberated the discourse of fall as the enlightenment of free will which realised to interrogate and inspire arts, philosophy and science. The visualization of evil's hybridity has been encoded in Blake's lithography in which The Devil has been portrayed as a handsome man who was clasped by a snake. Russell states that "the Devil is a figure that we invent in order to project our own vices upon something external. It is we who are the source and center of evil, not he" (Russell, 2019: 187). The acts of sacrificial deeds, rebellion and free choice did not seem apparent to be accredited specifically to God or the Devil. Blake's poems attributed importance on the synthesizing of these oppositions which have been required to make progress. His syntheses were the allegorizing of the oppositions in which he defended and agglomerated social, national and sexual equality. Blake wrote his poem "America: A Prophecy" in 1793 which has been followed by "Europe: A Prophecy" in 1794. Both poems depict how Blake was assailed with doubts about the violence, political and military progressions occurring in America and plague, hunger, disasters, fear and imprisonment in Europe. Blake represented American revolution under Orc's personality who is the spirit of rebellion. Orc fought against the spirit of Europe; Urizen who represented the fallen world. Urizen is the virile representation of reason, order, architecture, construction and horizon who is the fallen and demonized embodiment of God. Los is the opposition of Urizen who represents literature and poetry in terms of creative imagination (Ökten 2014, pp. 9, 10, 55, 93). Blake's poems oppose the conservatism which block the progress. Urizen's three daughters represent the parts of a human body while his four sons represent the four elements. Thiriel represent the Air, Utha represent the Water, Grodna represent the Earth and Fuzon represent the Fire. Enitharmon who represent spiritual and moral beauty and emanated from Los generated five children who all represent the sentimental values. Ocalytron symbolizes the feminen rage, Elynitria is the permissive wife, Oorthoon is the repressed love, Bromion is the virile mind and Rithrah is the virile rage. Blake's distraction from the contradictory image of the Revolution presented the liberalism as an imperial and industrial wealthiness. The ostensible wealthiness did not reckon the increase in population, mechanization of the laborer, inequality of income and pollution (Marshall 2019, pp. 15, 40). The Romantic poets chose to portray the figure of Prometheus rather than God or The Devil since "Satan was ambitious, envious, aggressive, and vengeful as well as a rebel (ibid.). Moreover, Prometheus was an exact representation of the poet's himself who acted his sacrificial deeds for the love of humanity while his rebellious acts could have been ascribed to evil (Russell, 2019: 188).

The portrayal of Prometheus unveiled the acts of sexual independencies within public and sparked off a future revealment of spiritual arcanums. The former was socially extinguished in Byron's time while the latter was supposed to be hermetically sealed. Byron was the influential figure of presenting the exoticness of the Orient where he recklessly poetized his homosexual intercourses throughout his journeys in his poem "Childe Harold's Pilgrimage". Byron's repudiation in aristocracy designated his acts as the promoter of liberation which harassed aristocracy. Seniha Gülderen-Krasniqi and Salih Okumuş state that: "Byron showed impact with his works as much as with his personality. Being a free thinker, supporter of liberation movements in Europe and not rarely rebellious of English life-style gave him the status of an outsider and struggling character" (Gülderen-Krasniqi and Okumuş, 2014: 197). The publication of his poem "Childe Harold's Pilgrimage" and of his sexual intercourses in his work attracted a great deal of attention that Byron was today declared as the first superstar with a tagline "sex, drugs and revolution" (Waldman, 2009: 0:1:42). The Promethean representation of Byron was his seductive and aristocratic charisma even though he was excluded from aristocracy. His rebellion resides in his literary works as much as they evoke his own scandalous acts as what have been poetized. Byron's image was also Promethean. Polidori who was

regarded as the author of the first vampire fiction "The Vampyre" validates Charles E. May's assessment on short fiction which he states that the visions or miracles rise from "the extraordinary confluence of events which could not be foreseen or controlled" (May, 1991: 4). Lord Ruthven who was fictionalized by Polidori as the charming and seductive aristocratic villain of the high society was the portrayal of Byron's own image. It was Ruthven's unforeseen deeds which ascribed a supernatural on Byron rather than a supernatural inferred on him. The portrayal of Byron by Polidori also resembles the mediumistic seances of Blavatsky in which she characterizes the vampire elementaries with a metaphor of "fall upon the people like a cloud or a big octopus, and disappear within them as if sucked in by a sponge" (Manning, 2018: 87). Ruthven who was half dead/half alive and also a benefactor as much as his seductiveness disappeared within his victims as parts of his social standing, his liberal actions, his financial income, his good looks. Ruthven manifested himself where his mediatory existence overlapped with thought, material and spiritual. Vampiric supernatural was only a handicap to legitimate his acts. Blavatsky's elemental entities which had the capacity to manifest themselves within an etheric ocean has been metaphorized in Polidori's work in relation with his real life. His fiction was first published under the name of Byron since Polidori was not known within literary scene and the amount of sales has concerned the publisher. It was critically acclaimed and defended by Byron that the actual writer was Polidori. Nevertheless, Polidori has remained his state under the shadow of Byron. Ruthven's vampiric existence did not only haunt a fictitious Aubrey but also Polidori as Byron dwelling within an imaginary realm. Byron who fell upon Polidori like a cloud or a big octopus was represented as a disruptive manifestation of a vampiric elementary.

Conclusion

This article has examined how spiritualists accessed death in the 19th century. It has been stated that accessing death has been evolved from communal to individual and been developed from the fear of someone's and especially individual's own death. Therefore, spiritualists contextualized death in terms of a "survival" rather than a loss. Spiritualists claimed that there has been a life after death and the dead could still guide or communicate with the living. These claims were different than the holy scriptures since the clergy in the 19th century were rather hypocrites. That's why the evaluation and intermingling of death with spiritualism have constituted such reactions against the political and social inequalities and injustices while dealing with the fear of death. The preservation and the continuity of the political order have resided in the necessity of an individual's death. The immortality of soul has necessitated mortality. Spiritualism has defended that life and death were interlaced with each other. "Passing to the spirit" was the "survival of death" which meant that spirits dwelled both on Earth and in afterlife. Hence, it has been possible to communicate with spirits. This approach has avoided such oppositions of life/death, God/Devil, Good/Evil and stated that these oppositions were rather transitional than the prevailing of a single side. For this reason, this article has evaluated the term "Promethian" which has been coined by Russell in terms of how the transition functioned in the doctrines of Blavatsky, Kardec, Crowley who managed to design spiritual beliefs and oppose the social and political injustices by this hybridity. The hybridity has functioned for faith since ancient civilizations and the attribution of superstitions to these civilizations was rather religious and political injustice. That's why these spiritualist figures have consolidated the terms Reason, Ego and Will which enabled religious, social, political and also sexual liberations in order to reject dogmas, religious and political corruptness. Therefore, it has not been a coincidence that these consolidations were responded by such literary figures as Blake and Byron who manifested liberations against imposed regulations and mentioned how distinct regions agglomerated the embracement of spiritualism for the hybridity.

Reference

Adkins, B. (2007). *Death and desire in Hegel, Heidegger and Deleuze*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

- Blavatsky, H. P. (2019). *Gizli Öğreti 2. cilt: Bilim, din ve felsefenin sentezi*. R.S. Uğurlu (Tr.) İstanbul: Mitra.
- Blavatsky, H. P. (2013). *Isis unveiled: A master key to the mysteries of ancient and modern science and theology* Vol.1. Mass Market Paperback.
- Burton, R. (2016). *Melankolinin anatomisi*. M. Tokmakçıoğlu (Tr.) İstanbul: Aylak Adam (original publishing date 1621).
- Büker, C. (2019). *Mısır'ın ölümler kitabı: Gün ışığına çıkma kitabı*. İstanbul: Okyanus Yayıncılık.
- Cadwallader, Jen (2008). *Spirit photography: Victorian culture of mourning*. Modern language studies. 37 (2). pp. 8-31.
- Çüçen, K. (2003). Dasein'in varlığı olarak kaygı. *Heidegger'de varlık ve zaman*, İstanbul: Asa Kitabevi, pp: 78-85.
- Critchley, S. (2009). *Being and time: Death, Guardian*, [online] 13 July 2009, <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/belief/2009/jul/13/heidegger-being-time> [accessed 5 May 2019].
- Doyle, A. C. (1926). *The history of spiritualism*, London: Cassell & Co., Ltd.
- Freud, S. (2010). *Freud: Complete works*. Smith, I. (Ed.) [online] <https://holybooks.com/sigmund-freud-the-complete-works/> [accessed 5 May 2019].
- Grant, G. (Director) (2000). *Aleister Crowley: The other Loch Ness Monster* [Film]. UK: Celtic Broadcasting, BBC Scotland.
- Kardec, A. (1859a). Self serving mediums. *The spiritist review - The Journal of Psychological Studies*. March, pp. 56-57.
- Kardec, A. (1859b). Hurdles to the mediums. *The Spiritist Review - The Journal of Psychological Studies*. February, pp. 31-35.
- Kardec, A. (1893). *Spiritualist philosophy, The spirits' book*. Boston: Colby And Rich.
- Kerrigan, M. (2017). *Ölümün tarihi*. S. Erduman (Tr.), İstanbul: Paris (originally publishing date 2017).
- Krasniqi, S. G., Okumuş, S. (2014). A Study of Lord Byron's the Turkish tales in terms of Orientalism. *Türk Dili ve Edebiyatı Dergisi*. 49 (49): 195-214.
- Manning, P. (2018). Spiritual Signal and Theosophical noise. *Journal of Linguistic Anthropology*, 28 (1): 67-92.
- Maroney, T. (2019). *İradenin buyurduğunu yap: Aleister Crowley üzerine altı ders*. B. Tanyeri (Tr.), İstanbul: Subyayın.
- Maroney, T. (2002). *Do what thou wilt*. Introduction to Crowley, [online] http://tim.maroney.org/CrowleyIntro/Do_What_Thou_Wilt.html [Accessed: 26 April 2021].
- Marshall, P. (2019). *Bir anarşist olarak William Blake*. E. Acar (Tr.), İstanbul: Subyayın.
- May, C. (1991). *Edgar Allan Poe: A study of short fiction*. Boston: Twayne Publishers.
- Meinwald, D. (1990). *Memento mori: Death and photography in 19th century America*, [online], UCLA University, <http://vv.arts.ucla.edu/terminals/meinwald/meinwald7.html> [accessed 18 February 2019].
- Nirun, A. (2016). *Ruhlar: Dünyada ve Türkiye'de ruhçuluk*. İstanbul: Wizart Edutainment.
- Ökten, K. (2014). Önsöz, *William Blake: Vahiy kitapları*. İstanbul: Pinhan Yayıncılık, pp. 9, 10, 55, 93.

- Renouf, P. Le Page, Naville, Edouard (1904). *The Egyptian Book of the dead: Translation and commentary* Vol.1. London: Society of Biblical Archaeology.
- Ruhselman, B. (1990). *Metapsişik Tetkikler ve İلمي Arařtırmalar Derneęi, Ruhlar arasında*. İstanbul: Ruh ve Madde Yayınları.
- Russell, J. B. (2019). *Mephistophelers: Modern dünyada şeytan*. E. Çelik (Tr.) Ankara: Panama Yayıncılık.
- Sarıdoęan, K. (2018). Ünlü Okültist Aleister Crowley ve onun Anti-Sherlock detektifi Simon Iff. *Edebiyat Gizemleri*. Antalya: KalemKahveKlavye, pp. 26-31.
- Swedenborg, E. (2016). *Evren ve dünyaları, Son yargı günü*. Ed. Şendoęan, N., Mavi Kalem Yayınevi.
- Swedenborg, E. (2018) *Last judgement/supplements*. G.F. Dole, J.S. Rose (Tr.), Pennsylvania: Swedenborg Foundation.
- Hill, M. (Producer), Michael Waldman (Director) (2009). *The Scandalous adventures of Lord Byron* [Film]. UK: Blast Film Producton for Channel 4.