# NONFULL-RANK FACTORIZATIONS OF ELEMENTARY 3-GROUPS 

Sándor Szabó<br>Received: 10 July 2007; Revised: 27 September 2007<br>Communicated by Stephen J. Pride


#### Abstract

If a finite elementary 3-groups is a direct product of two of its subsets that contains the identity element such that one of the factors has three or nine elements then one of the factors does not span the whole group. This is an extension of two earlier results.


Mathematics Subject Classification (2000): Primary 20K01; Secondary 05B45, 52C22, 68R05
Keywords: factorization of finite abelian groups, periodic subsets, full-rank subsets, full-rank factorization, exact cover algorithm.

## 1. Introduction

Let $G$ be a finite abelian group. We will use multiplicative notation in connection with abelian groups. The identity element of $G$ will be denoted by $e$. Let $A_{1}, \ldots, A_{n}$ be subsets of $G$. The product $A_{1} \cdots A_{n}$ by definition is equal to

$$
\left\{a_{1} \cdots a_{n}: a_{1} \in A_{1}, \ldots, a_{n} \in A_{n}\right\}
$$

If the elements on the list

$$
a_{1} \cdots a_{n}, a_{1} \in A_{1}, \ldots, a_{n} \in A_{n}
$$

are distinct, then we say that the product $A_{1} \cdots A_{n}$ is direct. If the product $A_{1} \cdots A_{n}$ is direct and is equal to $G$, then we say that the equation $G=A_{1} \cdots A_{n}$ is a factorization of $G$.

If $e \in A$, then we say that the subset $A$ is normalized. A factorization is called normalized if each of its factors is a normalized subset. Let $\langle A\rangle$ be the smallest subgroup of $G$ that contains $A$. In other words let $\langle A\rangle$ be the span of $A$ in $G$. A normalized subset $A$ of $G$ is called a full-rank subset if $\langle A\rangle=G$. A subset $A$ of $G$ is called periodic if there is an element $g \in G \backslash\{e\}$ such that $A g=A$.

If the finite abelian group $G$ is a direct product of its cyclic subgroups of orders $t_{1}, \ldots, t_{n}$, then we say that $G$ is of type $\left(t_{1}, \ldots, t_{n}\right)$. Let $p$ be a prime. If $t_{1}=\cdots=$
$t_{n}=p$, then $G$ is called an elementary $p$-group. The number $n$ is called the rank of $G$.

Let $G$ be an elementary 3 -group of rank $k$ and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$. It was shown that if $k=4$ or $k=5$, then one of the factors is not a full-rank subset of $G$ in [6] and [1] respectively. In these cases one of the factors must have at most 9 elements. One might wonder if these results hold in general for each elementary 3 -groups regardless of the rank of the group with the extra condition that $|A|$ is 3 or 9 . The main result of this note gives an answer to this question in the affirmative. An example, exhibited in [5], shows that if $|A|=|B|=27$ then, there is a normalized factorization $G=A B$ of an elementary 3-group of rank 6 such that $A$ and $B$ are full-rank subsets of $G$.

## 2. Lemmas

Let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of the finite abelian group $G$. Suppose that the factor $B$ is periodic with period $d$. Set $H=\langle d\rangle$. There is a subset $D$ of $B$ such that the product $D H$ is direct and is equal to $B$. From the factorization $G=A B=A D H$ by considering the factor group $G / H$ we get a factorization

$$
\begin{equation*}
G / H=(A H) / H \cdot(D H) / H \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Lemma 1. If $G=A B$ is a full rank factorization then so is (1).

Proof. Assume that $G=A B$ is a full-rank factorization of $G$. First we will show that $(A H) / H$ spans $G / H$. We would like to verify that for each element $g H$ of $G / H$ there are elements $a_{1} H, \ldots, a_{s} H$ of $(A H) / H$ and integers $\alpha(1), \ldots, \alpha(s)$, such that $g H=\left(a_{1} H\right)^{\alpha(1)} \cdots\left(a_{s} H\right)^{\alpha(s)}$. Since $\langle A\rangle=G$, for each $g \in G$ there are elements $a_{1}, \ldots, a_{s}$ of $A$ and integers $\alpha(1), \ldots, \alpha(s)$, such that $g=a_{1}^{\alpha(1)} \cdots a_{s}^{\alpha(s)}$. So

$$
\begin{aligned}
g H & =a_{1}^{\alpha(1)} \cdots a_{s}^{\alpha(s)} H \\
& =\left(a_{1}^{\alpha(1)} H\right) \cdots\left(a_{s}^{\alpha(s)} H\right) \\
& =\left(a_{1} H\right)^{\alpha(1)} \cdots\left(a_{s} H\right)^{\alpha(s)}
\end{aligned}
$$

This means that $(A H) / H$ spans $G / H$.
Next we will show that $(D H) / H$ spans $G / H$. We would like to establish that for each element $g H$ of $G / H$ there are elements $d_{1} H, \ldots, d_{s} H$ of $(D H) / H$ and integers $\beta(1), \ldots, \beta(s)$ such that $g H=\left(d_{1} H\right)^{\beta(1)} \cdots\left(d_{s} H\right)^{\beta(s)}$. Since $B=D H$ spans $G$, for each $g \in G$, there are elements $d_{1}, \ldots, d_{s} \in D, h_{1}, \ldots, h_{s} \in H$ and integers
$\beta(1), \ldots, \beta(s)$ such that $g=\left(d_{1} h_{1}\right)^{\beta(1)} \cdots\left(d_{s} h_{s}\right)^{\beta(s)}$. Therefore

$$
\begin{aligned}
g H & =\left(d_{1} h_{1}\right)^{\beta(1)} \cdots\left(d_{s} h_{s}\right)^{\beta(s)} H \\
& =\left[\left(d_{1} h_{1}\right)^{\beta(1)} H\right] \cdots\left[\left(d_{s} h_{s}\right)^{\beta(s)} H\right] \\
& =\left(d_{1}^{\beta(1)} H\right) \cdots\left(d_{s}^{\beta(s)} H\right) \\
& =\left(d_{1} H\right)^{\beta(1)} \cdots\left(d_{s} H\right)^{\beta(s)} .
\end{aligned}
$$

This means that $(D H) / H$ spans $G / H$.
Lemma 2. Let $G$ be a finite abelian 3-group. Let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$, where $|A|=3$. Then either $\langle A\rangle \neq G$ or $\langle B\rangle \neq G$.

Proof. Let $G$ be a finite abelian 3-group and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$ with $|A|=3$. In order to prove the lemma assume on the contrary that $\langle A\rangle=\langle B\rangle=G$. Among the counter-examples we choose one for which $|G|$ is minimal.

Since $G=A B$ is a factorization of $G$ and $|A|=3$, it follows that $|G|=|A||B| \geq$ $|A|=3$. If $|G|=3$, then $|B|=1$ and so $B=\{e\}$. Now $\langle B\rangle \neq G$. Thus in the remaining part of the proof we may assume that $|G| \geq 9$.

Let $A=\{e, a, b\}$. Suppose first that $|a| \geq 9$. By Lemma 3 of [4], in the factorization $G=A B$ the factor $A$ can be replaced by $A^{\prime}=\left\{e, a, a^{2}\right\}$ to get the factorization $G=A^{\prime} B$. The factorization $G=A^{\prime} B$ is equivalent to that the sets

$$
\begin{equation*}
e B, a B, a^{2} B \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

form a partition of $G$. Multiplying the factorization $G=A^{\prime} B$ by $a$ we get the factorization $G=\left(A^{\prime} a\right) B$. This factorization is equivalent to that the sets

$$
\begin{equation*}
a B, a^{2} B, a^{3} B \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

form a partition of $G$. Comparing the partitions (2) and (3) gives that $B=a^{3} B$. This means that $a^{3}$ is a period of $B$. Set $H=\left\langle a^{3}\right\rangle$. There is a subset $D$ of $B$ such that the product $D H$ is direct and is equal to $B$. From the factorization $G=A B=A D H$ by considering the factor group $G / H$ we get the factorization (1). The order of $G / H$ is smaller than the order of $G$. By the minimality of the counter-example, either $(A H) / H$ or $(D H) / H$ does not span $G / H$. On the other hand by Lemma $1,(A H) / H$ and $(D H) / H$ are full-rank subsets of $G / H$. This contradiction shows that $|a|=3$. By symmetry we may assume that $|b|=3$ also holds.

If $b=a^{2}$, then $A$ is a subgroup of $G$. Namely, $A=\langle a\rangle$. Now $\langle A\rangle$ has three elements and so it cannot be equal to $G$ which has at least nine elements. Thus
we may assume that $b \neq a^{2}$. There is an element $d \in G \backslash\{e\}$ such that $b=a^{2} d$. By Lemma 3 of [4], in the factorization $G=A B$ the factor $A$ can be replaced by $A^{\prime}=\left\{e, a, a^{2}\right\}$ to get the factorization $G=A^{\prime} B$. The factorization $G=A B$ is equivalent to that the sets

$$
\begin{equation*}
e B, a B, a^{2} d B \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

form a partition of $G$. The factorization $G=A^{\prime} B$ is equivalent to that the sets

$$
\begin{equation*}
e B, a B, a^{2} B \tag{5}
\end{equation*}
$$

form a partition of $G$. Comparing the partitions (4) and (5) gives that $a^{2} B=a^{2} d B$ and so $B=B d$. This means that $d$ is a period of $B$. Let $H=\langle d\rangle$. There is a subset $D$ of $B$ such that the product $D H$ is direct and is equal to $B$. From the factorization $G=A B=A D H$ by considering the factor group $G / H$ we have the factorization (1). Using the minimality of the counter-example this leads to a contradiction.

This completes the proof.

The anonymous referee of the paper has pointed out that Lemma 2 holds for each finite abelian groups not only for 3 -groups as stated. By Lemma 1 of [3] if $|A|=3$, then $A$ or $B$ must be periodic without the assumption that $G$ is a 3-group and the rest of the proof follows roughly as given above.

## 3. Computations

Suppose we are given a finite abelian group $G$ and a normalized subset $A$ of $G$ such that $|A|$ divides $|G|$. The problem is to find each normalized subset $B$ of $G$ for which $G=A B$ is a factorization of $G$. Here $B$ is a factor complementing $A$ and so we can call this problem the complementer factor problem. The fact that $G=A B$ is a factorization of $G$ is equivalent to that the sets $A b, b \in B$ form a partition of $G$. This suggests the following solution to the complementer factor problem. Let us form the family of the subsets $A g, g \in G$. Then look for members of this family that form a partition of $G$. One can generate all possible partitions of $G$ in a systematic manner. We will refer to this way of solution as the exact covering method. The method first was used in [2] to study factorings of elementary 2-groups.

Lemma 3. Let $G$ be an elementary 3-group of rank 6 and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$, where $|A|=9,|B|=81$. Then either $\langle A\rangle \neq G$ or $\langle B\rangle \neq G$.

Proof. Let $G$ be an elementary 3-group of rank 6 and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$ such that $|A|=9,|B|=81$. In order to prove the claim of the lemma assume on the contrary that $\langle A\rangle=\langle B\rangle=G$. Since $A$ spans $G$ we can choose a basis $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{6}$ of $G$ such that

$$
A=\left\{e, x_{1}, \ldots, x_{6}, a, b\right\}
$$

where $a, b \in G$. Set $d=x_{1} \cdots x_{6} a b$. We claim that $d=e$. In order to prove the claim assume on the contrary that $d \neq e$. By Lemma 1 of [1], $d$ is an element of the Corrádi subgroup of $A$. If $d \neq e$, then by Lemma 2 of [1], $d$ is a period of $B$. Set $H=\langle d\rangle$. There is a subset $D$ of $B$ such that the product $D H$ is direct and is equal to $B$. From the factorization $G=A B=A D H$ by considering the factor group $G / H$ we get the factorization (1). The rank of $G / H$ is 5 . By Theorem 1 of [1], either $(A H) / H$ or $(D H) / H$ does not span $G / H$. By Lemma 1, this is a contradiction. Thus $d=e$ and consequently $b=\left(x_{1} \cdots x_{6} a\right)^{-1}$. In other words one can compute $b$ if one knows $a$.

Let

$$
\begin{gathered}
a=x_{1}^{\alpha(1)} \cdots x_{6}^{\alpha(6)}, b=x_{1}^{\beta(1)} \cdots x_{6}^{\beta(6)} \\
w(a)=\alpha(1)+\cdots+\alpha(6), w(b)=\beta(1)+\cdots+\beta(6)
\end{gathered}
$$

where $0 \leq \alpha(i), \beta(i) \leq 2$. We call $w(a), w(b)$ the weight of the elements $a$ and $b$ respectively. We may assume that $w(a) \leq w(b)$ since this is only a matter of interchanging $a$ and $b$. We may assume that $\alpha(1) \leq \cdots \leq \alpha(6)$, since this is only a matter of permuting the elements $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{6}$. There are

$$
\binom{3+6-1}{6}=\binom{8}{6}=\binom{8}{2}=28
$$

choices for $\alpha(1), \ldots, \alpha(6)$. However some of these choices can be discarded.
In the $\alpha(1)=\cdots=\alpha(6)=0$ case $a=e$ would appear in $A$ twice. In the $\alpha(1)=\cdots=\alpha(5)=0, \alpha(6)=1$ case $a=x_{6}$ would appear in $A$ twice. In the $\alpha(1)=\cdots=\alpha(6)=2$ case $b=e$ would appear in $A$ twice. In the $\alpha(1)=1$, $\alpha(2)=\cdots=\alpha(6)=2$ case $b=x_{1}$ would appear in $A$ twice. We also have to discard the cases when $w(a)>w(b)$. We are left with 13 cases listed in Table 1. The exact cover algorithm provided 27336 possible complementer factors $B$ to $A$. An inspection revealed that none of these is a full-rank subset of $G$.

Lemma 4. Let $G$ be an elementary 3 -group of rank 7 and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$, where $|A|=9,|B|=243$. Then either $\langle A\rangle \neq G$ or $\langle B\rangle \neq G$.

Table 1. Choices for $a$ and $b$ and the number of solutions for $B$.

| $a$ | $b$ | number of $B ' s$ |
| :--- | :--- | ---: |
| 011112 | 211110 | 2760 |
| 011111 | 211111 | 2760 |
| 001122 | 221100 | 864 |
| 001112 | 221110 | 864 |
| 001111 | 221111 | 72 |
| 000222 | 222000 | 72 |
| 000122 | 222100 | 72 |
| 000112 | 222110 | 2760 |
| 000111 | 222111 | 72 |
| 000022 | 222200 | 5760 |
| 000012 | 222210 | 2760 |
| 000011 | 222211 | 2760 |
| 000002 | 222220 | 5760 |

Proof. Let $G$ be an elementary 3 -group of rank 7 and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$ such that $|A|=9,|B|=243$. In order to prove the claim of the lemma assume on the contrary that $\langle A\rangle=\langle B\rangle=G$. Since $A$ spans $G$ we can choose a basis $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{7}$ of $G$ such that $A=\left\{e, x_{1}, \ldots, x_{7}, a\right\}$, where $a \in G$. Set $d=x_{1} \cdots x_{7} a$. In the way we have seen in the proof of Lemma 3 we can establish that $d=e$. Consequently $a=\left(x_{1} \cdots x_{7}\right)^{-1}$. In other words $a$ can be computed. The exact cover algorithm gives 158760 possible solutions for $B$. An inspections shows that none of these is a full-rank subset of $G$.

## 4. The result

We are ready to prove the main result of the paper.

Theorem 1. Let $G$ be a finite elementary 3-group. Let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$, where $3 \leq|A| \leq 9$. Then either $\langle A\rangle \neq G$ or $\langle B\rangle \neq G$.

Proof. Let $G$ be a finite elementary 3-group and let $G=A B$ be a normalized factorization of $G$, where $3 \leq|A| \leq 9$. In order to prove the theorem assume on the contrary that $\langle A\rangle=\langle B\rangle=G$. Among the counter-examples we choose one with the smallest possible $|G|$.

If $|A|=3$, then by Lemma 2, either $\langle A\rangle \neq G$ or $\langle B\rangle \neq G$. Thus for the remaining part of the proof we may assume that $|A|=9$.

Let $k$ be the rank of $G$. Since $|A|=9$, it follows that $k \geq 2$. If $k=2$, then $|B|=1$ and so $B=\{e\}$. Now $\langle B\rangle \neq G$. Hence we may assume that $k \geq 3$. If $k=3$, then $|B|=3$ and by Lemma 2 , either $\langle A\rangle \neq G$ or $\langle B\rangle \neq G$. Thus we may assume that $k \geq 4$. The $k=4$ case is settled in [6]. The $k=5$ case is settled in [1]. The $k=6$ case is settled in Lemma 3. The $k=7$ case is settled in Lemma 4.

Suppose that $k=8$. Now since $\langle A\rangle=G$ we can choose a basis $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{8}$ of $G$ such that $A=\left\{e, x_{1}, \ldots, x_{8}\right\}$. Set $d=x_{1} \cdots x_{8}, H=\langle d\rangle$. Clearly $d \neq e$. By Lemma 1 of [1], $d$ is an element of the Corrádi subgroup of $A$ and by Lemma 2 of [1], $B$ is periodic with period $d$. There is a subset $D$ of $B$ such that the product $D H$ is direct and is equal to $B$. From the factorization $G=A B=A D H$ we get the factorization (1). By Lemma 1 we get that $(A H) / H$ and $(D H) / H$ both span $G / H$. On the other hand the rank of $G / H$ is 7 and so by Lemma 4 , either $(A H) / H$ or $(D H) / H$ does not span $G / H$. This contradiction gives that $k \geq 9$. However in this case $A$ does not have enough elements to span $G$. This completes the proof.

## References

[1] P. R. J. Östergård and S. Szabó, Elementary p-groups with the Rédei property, Internat. J. Algebra Comput., 17 (2007), 171-178.
[2] P. R. J. Östergård and A. Vardy, Resolving the existence of full-rank tilings of binary Hamming spaces, SIAM J. Discrete Math., 18 (2004), 382-387.
[3] A. D. Sands, On the factorisation of finite abelian groups, Acta Math. Acad. Sci. Hungar., 8 (1957), 65-86.
[4] S. Szabó, Abelian groups that cannot be factored without periodic factors, Rendiconti del Seminario Matematico dell' Univ. di Padova, 116 (2006), 261-269.
[5] S. Szabó, Constructions related to the Rédei property of groups, J. Lond. Math. Soc., 73 (2006), 701-715.
[6] S. Szabó and C. Ward, Factoring groups having periodic maximal subgroups, Bol. Soc. Mat. Mexicana, 3 (1999), 327-333.

## Sándor Szabó

Institute of Mathematics and Informatics
University of Pécs Ifjúság u. 6
7624 Pécs, Hungary
E-mail: sszabo7@hotmail.com

