

# History of Western Academic Reaserchs on Yārsān 1836-2020

# Tarîxa Xebatên Akademîk ên li Rojava ku li ser Yarsanan Hatine Kirin 1836-2020

### Alireza Zahedi MOGHADAM\*

MOGHADAM, Alireza Zahedi (2022). "History of Western Academic Reaserchs on Yārsān 1836-2020", Nûbihar Akademî, no. 17, p. 117-126, **DOI:** 10.55253/2022 nubihar.1125648

Genre/Cure: Research Article/ Gotara Lêkolînî

Received/ Hatin: 03/06/2022

Accepted/ Pejirandin: 26/06/2022

Published/ Weşandin: 30/06/2022

Pages / Rûpel: 117-126

ORCID:

0000-0002-9893-4463

Plagiarism/Întîhal: This article has been reviewed by at least two referees and scanned via ithenticate plagiarism website./ Ev gotar herî kêm ji aliyê 2 hakeman ve hatiye nirxandin û di malpera întîhalê ithenticate re hatiye derbaskirin.

#### **ABSTRACT:**

The Yārsān (Yāresān or Yāristān) or Ahl-i Haqq or Ahl-e Haqq (Believers of the Truth) are a religious minority in Iran whose traditions and beliefs have received some attention from academics over the last century.

This article gives a brief overview of the history of Yārsān studies and its developing from the beginning till 2020 and researchers' efforts to understand their beliefs along with a brief critique of their attempts.

**Keywords:** Yārsān, Ahl-i Haqq, Kurdish religions, Kurdish beliefs, academic reaserches.

#### **PUXTE:**

Yārsān (Yāresān an Yāristān) an Ehl-i Haqq an Ehl-e Haqq (Bawermendên Rastiyê) kemîneyeke dînî ye li Îran û Îraqê ku kevneşopî û baweriyên wan di sedsala borî da bala akademîsyenan kişandiye.

Ev meqale bi kurtî li ser dîroka lêkolînên Yārsān û pêşveçûna wê ji destpêkê heya sala 2020an e. Herwiha di vê meqaleyê de hewldanên lêkolîneran ên ji bo têgihiştina vê baweriyê û bi kurtî rexneya li ser van hewildanên wan jî hatiye qalkirin.

**Peyvên Sereke:** Yarsan, Ehl-i Heqq, dînên Kurdan, bawerîyên Kurdan, lêkolînên akademik.

<sup>\*</sup> Dr., Katholische Schule Boni II Göttingen, alireza.zahedimoghadam@gmail.com

#### 1. INTRODUCTION

According to the Geranpayeh (2006: 4): "The religion of the Yārsān is an Iranian religion that has its own peculiarities in its sacred poems and speeches, songs and rituals in the Middle East. The oral literature of the Yārıstān, which also includes the description of their rituals, is in Gūrānī, in Handed down in Persian and in Loric as well as in a Turkish dialect."

#### 2. HISTORY OF RESEARCH

The first notes about Yārsān in the European languages can be found in the travel reports of travelers to the Orient in the 19th century (Sheil,1856: 199.) and (Layard, 1853: 216).

Some called the group Ali Illahi. The word means "One who believes that 'Ali is God". Such ideas are not accepted by orthodox Muslims; the Yāresān were often referred to as "extreme Shia" (Ghullāt).

Of all the reports, Rawlinson's report is the most important. This is because Rawlinson described the sacred places and villages of Yārsān in his report, and we know, thanks to his report in 1836, that the belief in Yārsān was not only among the Kurds, but also among the Loren, who lived a nomadic life, was widespread (Rawlinson, 1939: 36).

Comte J.A. de Gobineau was the first person to attempt to look at the Yārsān in an academic way (1922). After the Sheil and Layard, Taylor mentioned the Ali Illahis in his travelogue (Taylor, 1865: 28-29).

Isabella Lucy Bird was another person, that she mentioned the Ali Illahis in his travelogue and called them the continuation of the Jews (Bird, 1891:85-86). After her Walter b. Harris in his travelogue, referred to the Ali Illahis as a mysterious sect and cult with mixed up belives of Judaism and Paganism and Islam (Harris,1896: 271-272).

The next important author was Professor Valentin A. Zhukovskij, who had written about Ali Elāhi in his works.

At the very beginning of the 20th century (1904-1908), while working in the consular department in Tabriz, his student Vladimir Minorsky, wrote a report on Ahl-i Haqq, which translates into German "Materials for the Study of the Persian Sect". "People of Truth" or "Ali Elāhi" was called, and in "Works of Eastern Studies of the Lazarevskij Institute of Eastern Languages" Issue XXXIII 1911,, Материалы для изучения персидской секты" "Люди истины in". "Труды по востоковедению, издаваемые Лазаревским Институтом Восточныхязыков" was published (Geranpayeh, 2006: 6).



Almost simultaneously with Minorsky, another Russian orientalist, Vladimir Alexeyevich Ivanow, started his research on Ahl-i Haqq. The two have attempted to detail Yārsān beliefs from a variety of sources of information, including personal observations and limited textual evidence (Kreyenbroek, 2020: 2). Apparently, Minorsky had access to a collection of religious texts drawn from a Yāresān community. He called them *Ketāb-e Saranjām* (Ivanow, 1953: 24-25 and Geranpayeh, 2006: 6-7 and Kreyenbroek, 2020: 2).

The text was probably written in 1843 and had 136 pages. He has never been published and his dating has never been verified.

Ivanov published,"The Truth-Worshippers of Kurdistan: Ahl-i Haqq Texts" in 1953. The book includes,"*Tazkere-ye A'lā*", that belonged to the Persian-speaking Ahl-i Haqq community, and also a "*Resāles*" that was written by a Khāksār-Dervish, initiated by the Yārsān (Kreyenbroek, 2020: 3).

Like Gobineau, Stead held that the origin of the Ali-Elahis was not Islamic, but probably Jewish or Christian (Stead, 1932: 184-189).

Minorsky was the first person to use the term "religion" for the Yārsān, thus calling them a religion in their own right (Minorsky, 1960: 260–263). He and Stead have shown that the Yārsān community consists of diverse religious groups whose beliefs sometimes differ.

A small group of the Yārsānen worship Ali, which is why some researchers have classified them among the "extreme Shi'ites" (Moossa, 1988: 185-194 and 245-255), where the majority rather maintains an old Iranian tradition.

In the Guran region, the Yārsān worshiped Seyyed Rostam, the grandson of Seyyed Brāke, as the incarnation of God (Stead, 1932: 184-189). At the time when Minorsky started working as a diplomat in Tabriz and Seyyed Rostam Heydarī Gūrān was the religious authority for some Guran tribes, Hājj Ne'matollāh Mokri Jeyhunābādi also lived as a reformer in the Ahl-i Haq community. He has attempted to openly explain and reinterpret the teachings of Yārsān in his written works. His views were not accepted by the majority of religious authorities and they recognized him as a heterodox among the Yārsānes. Although his views did not affect the Gurānas his teachings through his son and successor, Nur-Ali Elahi, and also his grandson, Dr. Bahram Elahi, found new believers among the non-Kurdish population in Iran and also among Europeans. The Book of Hājj Ne'matollāh, Forqān al-Akhbār ("Criterion for distinguishing the traditions"), has been mentioned as a source since 1927 (Membrado, 2014) and has the understanding of Minorsky over Yāri Religion significantly influenced (Kreyenbroek, 2020: 4) Another important text from him, Shāhnāme-ye Haqiqat, (such as "The Great Epic of Truth"), was later published by Mohammad Mokri (Mokri, 1966). The old traditional texts were not published in print until long after his passing. In the 1960s, Mohammad Mokri was a well-known researcher in the field of Yārsāns studies. Presumably he belonged to the followers of Nur-Ali Elahi. He published many writings from the Yāri tradition separately, not as a daftar or collection of texts (Mokri, 1967, 1974, 1977).

The music in the tradition of the followers of Nur-Ali Elahi was studied by Jean During, who had close ties with this Ahl-i Haqq order (During, 1989a, 1989b: 27-41).

Hamzeh'ee has shown the correlation between Yārsān and Zoroastrianism in his work (Hamzeh'ee, 1990) but he has not considered the heterogeneity of the Yarsan (Kreyenbroek, 2020: 4).

Despite differing traditions from Yārsān, there is at least one tradition that emphasizes the importance of pre-Islamic elements in their worldview. This was not studied by any western academic until 1990.

"The first evidence of the strong Yari tradition in the Guran region came in the early 1990s with the work of Van Bruinessen and Mir-Hosseini (Mir-Hosseini, 1994b: 463–481 and 1996: 111–134)." (Kreyenbroek, 2020: 4)

Around the same time, Kreyenbroek has pointed out similarities between Zoroastrianism Yezidism and Yārsān. (Kreyenbroek, 1992: 57-79, 1995b: 13-14, 1996a: 84-110, 1998: 163-84). The research in this Area has been enriched with the works of Kreyenbroek (Kreyenbroek, 2002b: 260-277, 2010a: 70-88, Kreyenbroek, 2014: 3-11, 2017: 55-64) and van Bruinessen (van Bruinessen, 2009: 51-58, 2014: 6-41, 2017: 65–93) and Shahab Vali (2011) in 21st century.

Kreyenbroek has attempted to point out similarities between the cosmogony of Roman Mithraism and the cosmogony of the Yārsān. According to his master theorem, aspects and elements of Mithraism from an Iranian religious tradition, but not belonging to Zoroastrianism and common in western Iranian regions, now encompassing the Kurdish lands, are said to survive in Yārsān and other religions of that region. He has also pointed out the similarities between Yezidiism, Yāresān and Alevism.

Mehrdad Izady claims that all these traditions (Yezidism, Yāresān and Alevism) go back to a "Cult of Angels".

Later, Lawrence K. Robert in his article "The Cults of the Angels: The Indigenous Religions of Kurdistan" (http://www.academia.edu/10772192/The Cults of the Angels The Indigenous Religions of Kurdistan) also pointed out the similarities between Yezidism Yāresān and Alevism.

Shahab Vali has examined doctrinal and mythological aspects of the Yārsān religion through a study of the last sacred texts in relation to the pre-Islamic religions of Iran (Vali, 2011). After that he examined the religious literature of the Yārsān in four articles. (Vali, 2012, 2014: 30-35, 2016: 113-119, 2017).



## Table 1: The Historical Researches of The Yārsān

Date	Historical Research
1836	Rawlinson
1853	Austen Henry Layard
1856	lady Mary Leonora Woulfe Sheil, Sir Justin Sheil
1859	Gobinaeu
1865	Taylor
1891	Bird
1896	Harris
1858 - 1918	Zhukovskij
1904-1908	Minorsky (Work in Tabriz)
1911	Minorsky
1920	Minorsky
1920-1974	Nur-Ali Elahi, Reform
1921	Minorsky
1927	Forqān al-Akhbār ("Criterion for the distinction of traditions") from
	Hājj Ne'matollāh
1928	Minorsky
1932	Stead
1948	Ivanow
1953	Minorsky
1953	Ivanow
1954	Minorsky
1960	Minorsky
1966	Mokri
1967	Mokri
1974	Mokri
1977	Mokri
1988	Moossa,Matti
1989	During
1990	Hamzeh>ee
1992	Van Bruinessen
1992	Kreyenbroek
1994	Mir-Hosseini
1995	Kreyenbroek
1995	Van Bruinessen
1996	Kreyenbroek
1996	Mir-Hosseini
1998	Kreyenbroek
2002	Kreyenbroek
2006	Geranpayeh

2009	Van Bruinessen
2010	Kreyenbroek
2011	Vali
2011	Robert L. K
2012	Vali
2014	Kreyenbroek
2014	Vali
2014	Van Bruinessen
2014	Membrado
2016	Vali
2017	Vali
2017	Kreyenbroek
2017	Van Bruinessen
2020	Kreyenbroek

#### 3. CONCLUSION

As can be seen, Yārsān's studies have had various dimensions throughout history, from travelers reports to academics attempts to introduce Yārsān's beliefs and literature and sociological researchs. These researchs also has their weaknesses. Many of these travelers and researchers were interested to find their own belief, subjective interests or point of view in the beliefs of Yārsān.

Those who consider Yārsān to be a continuation of Judaism or Christianity are in this group. Another group interpreted Yārsān's beliefs and texts, and this made their researchs subjective.

Another group used the phenomenological method of religion studies according to the principle of empathy only and disregard the principle of epoch, that they led to an uncritical researchs on Yārsān's believe and text.

#### Notes:

- 1. Comte Joseph Arthur de Gobineau (14 Juli 1816 13 October 1882) French diplomat and traveller.
- 2. Valentin Aleksejevič Žukovskij (1858 1918) Russian professor of Iranian studies.
- 3. Vladimir Fedorovich Minorsky (1877 1966) the Russian diplomat and orientalist.
- 4. Wladimir Ivanow; November 3, 1886- June 19, 1970, Russian orientalist.
- 5. A Shi'a Sufi order residing in Iran and Iraq.
- 6. (1855-1934) was the religious leader of the Gūrāns from 1872 to 1934.



- 7. Hājj Neʿmatollāh Mokri Jeyhunābādi(1871-1920) Mystic and author of the Ahl-i Haqq order.
- 8. Nur-Ali Elahi (1895-1974) was an Iranian spiritual thinker, musician, philosopher and judge of Kurdish descent who dedicated his life to exploring the metaphysical dimension of human beings.
- 9. Religion of the Yārsāns.

#### 4. BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Austen H. L. (1853). *Discoveries in the Ruins of Nineveh and Babylon: With Travels in Armenia and Babylonia*, digitalised, 2010, Published Cambrigde University.
- Bird, Isabella Lucy. (1891). *Journey in Persia and Kurdistan*, Vol.1, London, John Murray.
- During, J. (1989). *Musique et Mystique dans les Traditions de l'Iran*, Paris, Téhéran: Institut français de recherche en Iran.
- During, J. (1989b). *'The sacred music of the Ahl-i Haq as a means of mystical transmission'* in: G.M. Smith and C.W. Ernst, *Manifestations of Sainthood in Islam*, Istanbul, The Isis Press.
- Ivanow, W. (1948). 'An Ali-Ilahi Fragment', Collectanea I, Leiden, Brill.
- Ivanow, W. (1953). The Truth-Worshippers of Kurdistan: Ahl-i Haqq Texts, Leiden, Brill.
- Geranpayeh, B. (2006). *Yānstān die Freunde der Wahrheit: Religion und Texteeiner vorderasiatischen Glaubensgemeinschaft*, Dissertation zur Erlangung des philosophischen Doktorgrades an der Philosophischen Fakultät der Georg-August-Universität Göttingen.
- Gobinaeu, J.A. de. (1922). *Trois ans en Asie*, 1855 à 1858, 2 Vols, (veröffentlicht 1859), Paris.
- Hamzeh'ee, M.R. (1990). *The Yaresan: a Sociological, Historical and Religio-historical Study of a Kurdish Community*, Berlin, Klaus Schwarz Verlag.
- Harris, Walter B. (1896). From Batum to Baghdad via Tiflis, Tabriz, and Persian Kurdistan, London, William Blackwood and Sons.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (1992). 'Mithra and Ahreman, Binyamin and Malak Tāwūs: traces of an ancient myth in the cosmogonies of two modern sects' in: Ph. Gignoux, Recurrent Patterns in Iranian Religions; from Mazdaism to Sufism, Paris, Association pour l'avancement des Études Iraniennes.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (1995b). 'Ahl-i Haqq', in: J.R. Hinnells, A New Dictionary of Religions, Oxford, Cambridge, MA: Blackwell Publishing.

- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (1996a). 'Religion and religions in Kurdistan', in: Kreyenbroek and Allison, Kurdish culture and identity, London, Atlantic Highlands, N. J.: Zed Books.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (1998). 'On the Study of Some Heterodox Sects in Kurdistan' in: M. van Bruinessen and J. Blau, *Islam des Kurdes*, Paris, Institut national des langues et civilisations orientales.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (2002). Millennialism and Eschatology in the Zoroastrian Tradition, in: Millennialism and Eschatology in the Zoroastrian Tradition, in: Amanat, Abbas: *Imagining the End*, Tauris, New York.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (2002b). 'Modern Sects with Ancient Roots: the Yezidis and Ahl-e Haqq of Kurdistan', in: Ph. Godrej and F. Punthakey Mistree, *A Zoroastrian Tapestry: Art, Religion & Culture*, Ahmedabad, Mapin Publishing.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (2010a). 'Orality and Religion in Kurdistan: the Yezidi and Ahl-e Haqq Traditions', in: Kreyenbroek and Marzolph, Oral Literature of Iranian Languages: Kurdish, Pashto, Balochi, Ossetic, Persian and Tajik: Companion Volume II: History of Persian Literature, London, Tauris.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (2010b). 'Zoroastrianism under the Achaemenians: a Non-essentialist Approach', in: J. Curtis and St. John Simpson, The World of Achaemenid Persia: History, Art and Society in the Ancient Near East, London and New York, Tauris.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (2014). 'The Yāresān of Kurdistan', in: Kh. Omarkhali, Religious Minorities in Kurdistan: Beyond the Mainstream, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. (2017). 'Some Remarks on the Early History of the Ahl-e Ḥaqq', in: Sh. Raei; Islamic Alternatives: Non-Mainstream Religion in Persianate Societies (Gottinger Orientforschungen, III. Reihe: Iranica), Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag.
- Kreyenbroek, P.G. and Kanakis, Y. (2020). *'God First and Last': On the Religion and Music of the Yaresan of Guran.* (Vol.1), Wisbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag.
- Mardūkh Kurdestānī, M. (2000), Tārīkh-i Mardūkh, Tehran, Karang.
- Minorsky, V. (1920). *'Notes sur la secte des Ahlé Haqq'*, Revue du Monde Musulman 40/41. Paris, E. Leroux.
- Minorsky, V. (1921). '*Notes sur la secte des Ahlé Haqq II*', Revue du Monde Musulman 44/5. Paris, E. Leroux.
- Minorsky, V. (1928). 'Etudes sur les Ahl-i Haqq', RHR 97.
- Minorsky, V. (1943). 'The Guran', BSOAS 11.
- Minorsky, V. (1953). 'Verses in Turkish' in: Ivanow; The Truth-Worshippers of Kurdistan: Ahl-i Haqq Texts, Leiden, Brill.
- Minorsky, V. (1954). 'Un Poème Ahl-i Haqq en Turk' in: F. Meier, Westöstliche Abhand-



- lungen Rudolph Tschudi zum siebzigsten Geburtstag überreicht von Freunden und Schülern, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag.
- Minorsky,V. (1960). 'Ahl-i Ḥak̞kַ', in: Encyclopaedia of Islam (New Edition), Leiden and London.
- Membrado, M. (2014). *Hājj Ne'matollāh Mokri Jeyhunābādi (1871-1920) and His Mystical Path within the Ahl-e Haqq Order*, in: Khanna Omarkhali, 2014. *Religious Minorities in Kurdistan: Beyond the Mainstream* (Studies in Oriental Religions), Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag.
- Mir-Hosseini, Z. (1994a). 'Inner truth and outer history: the two worlds of the Ahl-i Haqq of Kurdistan', *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 16, Cambridge University.
- Mir-Hosseini, Z. (1994b). 'Redefining the truth: Ahl-e Haqq and the Islamic Republic', *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 21 (2), London, Taylor & Francis, Ltd.
- Mir-Hosseini, Z. (1996). 'Faith, ritual and culture among the Ahl-e Haqq' in: Kreyenbroek and Allison.
- Mokri, M. (1966). *Shāh-nāma-ye Haqiqat/ Le Livre des Rois de Vérité*, Téhéran : Département d'iranologie de l'Institut franco-iranien de recherche ; Paris : A. Maisonneuve,
- Mokri, M. (1967). *Le Chasseur de Dieu et le Mythe du Roi Aigle (Dawray Dāmyārī)*, Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- Mokri, M. (1974). Cycles des Fidèles Compagnons à l'époque de Buhlûl (Appendice: Dawray Buhlûl), Contributions scientifiques aux études iraniennes, Paris.
- Mokri, M. (1977). La grande assemblée des Fidèles de Vérité: au tribunal sur le mont Zagros en Iran (Dawray-Dīwanay Gawra), Paris, Klincksieck.
- Momen, M. (1985). *An introduction to Shi*'i *Islam: the history and doctrines of Twelver Shi*'ism, New Haven, Yale University Press.
- Moosa, M. (1988). *Extremist Shiites,The Ghulat Sects*, New York. Syracuse University Press.
- Rawlinson, M. (1939). 'Notes on a March from Zohab to Kirmanshah, in the Year 1836', Journal of the Royal Geographical Society, London, Wiley.
- Robert, L.K. "The Cults of the Angels: The Indigenous Religions of Kurdistan" http://www.academia.edu/10772192/The\_Cults\_of\_the\_Angels\_The\_Indigenous\_Religions\_of\_Kurdistan
- Sheil, M. L. W. (1856). *Glimpses of Life and Manners in Persia*, London, William Clowes and Sons.
- Stead, F.M. (1932). THE ALI ILAHI SECT IN PERSIA, in The Muslim World, 1932. Volu-



- me 22, Issue 2, London, Wiley.
- Taylor, J. G. (1865) "Travels in Kurdistan with Notes of the Source of the Eastern and Western Tigris and Ancient Ruins in their Neighbourhood", *Journal of the Royal Geographical Society of London*.
- Vali, Sh. (2011). *Les Yârsâns: Aspects Mythologiques Aspects Doctrinaux*, Saarbruecken, Editions universitaires europeennes.
- Vali, Sh. (2012). La littérature religieuse des Kurdes Yarsan', *Etudes Kurdes* no XI: La Littérature Kurde, no 11, Paris, Harmattan.
- Vali, Sh. (2014). Şubat-Mart. "Yarsan ve Yezidi Kürtlerin Yazılı Edebiyatı", Kürt Tarihi, sayı 11.
- Vali, Sh. (2016). "Nasandina Gişti ya Edebiyata Dînî ya Kurdên Yarsanî", (Werger ji Frensî- Sevda Orak Reşitoğlu), Nûbihar Akademi, jimar 5, sal 3.
- Vali, Sh. (2017). "Ehl-i Hak Kürtlerin Dini Edebiyatı", Kürt Edebiyatı, Yazarlar: Joyce Blau, Sandrine Alexie, Shahab Vali, Amr Taher Ahmed Ahmad, Hashimzadeh, Estelle Amy de la Bréteque, Geoffrey Haig, Mustafa Dehqan, Fransızcadan Çeviren: Heval Bucak, Avesta Yay, İstanbul.
- van Bruinessen, M. (1992). 'Haji Bektash, Sultan Sahak, Shah Mina Sahib a various avatars of a running wall', Turcica XXI-III, Peeters Publishers.
- Van Bruinessen , M. (1992). *Agha, Shaikh and State*, Zed Books Ltd, London and New Jersey.
- van Bruinessen, M. (1995). 'When Haji Bektash Still Bore the Name of Sultan Sahak: Notes on the Ahl-e Haqq of the Guran District' in: A. Popovitch and G. Veinstein, Bektachiyya: études sur l'ordre mystique des Bektachi et les groupes relevant de Haji Bektach, Istanbul, Isis.
- van Bruinessen, M. (2009). 'Ahl-i Ḥaqq', in: K. Fleet, G. Krämer, D. Matringe, J. Nawas and E. Rowson, *The Encyclopedia of Islam*, Third Edition, Leiden and London.
- van Bruinessen, M. (2014). 'Veneration of Satan among the Ahl-e Haqq of the Gūrān region', *Fritillaria Kurdica: Bulletin of Kurdish Studies* 3/4, Kraków, Section of Kurdish Studies, Department of Iranian Studies Institute of Oriental Studiesof Jagiellonian University.
- van Bruinessen, M. (2017). 'Between Dersim and Dālāhu: Reflections on Kurdish Alevism and the Ahl-e Ḥaqq Religion', in: Sh. Raei, Islamic Alternatives: Non-Mainstream Religion in Persianate Societies (Göttinger Orientforschungen, III. Reihe: Iranica. Neue Folge, Band 16), Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz Verlag.